# A gendered analysis of the casualisation of teachers' work in a transitional society, Durban, South Africa. 1993-4

Ву

Sharon Edigheji

1998

# A gendered analysis of the casualisation of teachers' work in a transitional society, Durban, South Africa. 1993-4

by

### Sharon Edigheji

A dissertation in partial fulfilment of the requirements for degree of Masters in Education in the Department of Education in the Faculty of Education at the University of Natal (Durban)

December 1998

# **Declaration**

I hereby declare that all the material incorporated into this thesis is
my own work except where specific reference is made by name or
in the form of a numbered reference. The work contained has not
been submitted for a degree at any other university.

Signed:		 	 	 
Ü	Sharon			

#### Acknowledgments

There are many people to thank for encouraging me during this long journey as a parttime student.

A very special thanks to my daughter, Rosanne, who blossomed like a rose into a beautiful young woman during the five years that it has taken to write this thesis. To her I dedicate this thesis.

To my family, especially Mom, Dad, Lindy and Delia, I say thank you for your continued love and support.

My sincere appreciation to my supervisor, Prof Robert Morrell, for his patience and academic guidance over this long intense period --- your critical and useful comments have enriched the quality of this study.

I also thank all the contract teachers, both men and women, who participated in the research process -- You have given me insights into the world of your work. Thanks also to the members of SADTU -- without your assistance I would not have been able to provide insights into contract teaching.

Special words of gratitude to Cynthia le Grange, Paul Lundall and Jeanne Gamble for your friendship, mentoring and encouragement. -- you are worthy friends, in the past and now. Thank you for inspiring me to complete this project despite my feelings of marginalisation from academia.

Finally, Omano Emma Edigheji, my partner, you deserve many praise songs during this arduous, intense but intellectually stimulating period of writing the thesis -- I say a sincere thank you. Your emotional support and intellectual stimulating exchanges during the long winter months in Trondheim will never be forgotten. It is your continued love that gave me strength and the tenacity to complete thesis.

I declare that this is my own work, both in concept and execution. Sources have been acknowledged. The usual disclaimers apply.

Sharon Edigheji

#### **Preface**

Five intense and challenging years of my life have passed in writing this thesis. From the summer of 1993 through to the winter of 1998 spans the period from the conception of the topic to the completion of this thesis. This period also coincides with some of the most profound developments in the process towards the democratisation of education in South Africa.

The thesis explores the changing nature of teachers' work in the period of political transition. It focuses on how women teachers, who numerically dominate the teaching profession on the one hand, but also make up the highest proportion of under-qualified teachers on the other, are being confronted with contractual forms of employment. Therefore this thesis looks at the gendered nature of contract teaching within the context of the political transition towards democracy in South Africa.

In order to contextualise this study I wanted to define what it meant to be living during a period of political transition. I offer the following explanation. In conventional terms a political transition means moving from situation A to situation B, thus moving from one political context considered by the majority of South Africans as illegitimate, stagnant and conflictual to something new, challenging and acceptable to the populace. The transition in South Africa has created changes at many levels of societal institutions. The Apartheid education system has been dismantled and a new system with a strong legitimate democratic character has been established. Notwithstanding the many changes, no one, especially the teachers interviewed were able to anticipate what substantive democracy would be as a lived-reality. In spite of these positive changes, at both societal and educational levels, contract teachers were anxious whether the

democratic dispensation would bring an end to the temporary nature of their employment status.

As stated earlier, this research has spanned a considerable length of time. As I show in more detail in Chapter Three, the data gathering for this study was done just before democratic elections in 1994. The research findings were written up during 1994. This was on the eve of the first non-racial, democratic elections. The transitional period is of particular interest for two reasons. First, the period was characterised by policy and economic flux on the eve of the formal abolition of racially defined institutions. It was a period when society was in flux. Although formal Apartheid still existed on the statute books, many institutions had started dismantling the overt aspects of racial segregation. Second, the interregnum, before the establishment of a non-racial democracy was tempered by anxiety and scepticism that the basic human right to work might not become a reality for the many unemployed men and women, especially for temporary teachers.

My interest in this research topic was motivated by a number of factors. These factors ranged from both personal/familial links with the teaching profession and academically motivated interests. My own personal aspirations to theorise my experiences as an activist working in community organisations on women's issues was the main reason for enrolling for the course in Woman's Studies at the University of Natal (Durban). My special interest in marginalised women and their modes of survival, which often included sex work, as a form of paid employment, was my original research topic.

As my research on sex workers progressed, I encountered the problem of access to respondents. This problem was compounded by the fact that as a woman of mixed-descent, from the former Coloured Labour Preferential Area of the Western Cape, I was a newcomer to the region with very few community or grassroots social networks. This

meant that it was difficult to enter the social networks that would have guaranteed access to women who were engaged in commercial sex work. I subsequently changed my topic but wanted to retain a focus on women's issues.

The casualisation of teachers' work came to my attention through discussions with female friends who were teachers. Although some of them were qualified teachers they could only find contract teaching positions within the schools governed by the House of Representatives. I was told that because of the contractual nature of their work, they were forced to seek new contracts at the end of each school year and could therefore not develop a career path. Indeed, my friends told me that they had poorer conditions of service when compared to their tenured colleagues.

These discussions reminded me of conversations with my maternal grandmother who had trained as a teacher in the 1920s but could not secure permanent employment in the Western Cape. As a woman of mixed descent, she trained at the Zonnebloem Training College (one of the oldest Anglican teachers' training colleges in the Western Cape) along with sons and daughters of African leaders. Until her death in the early 1970s, she was angry that she was forced to resign her teaching post when she married because the 'marriage bar' prevented her from teaching.

Although my grandmother decried the fact that her teaching career came to an abrupt end because of her gender coupled with racial background, she at all times stressed the importance of education to the grandchildren (including myself) as a vehicle for combating societal norms that oppress women. As I grew up, I was caught in the contradiction that women including my grandmother, were discriminated against because of their gender, yet she continued to emphasise the importance of education.

The conversations with my friends not only reminded me of the experiences of my grandmother but also drew my attention to the existence of temporary teachers. These similar experiences spanning two generations of women motivated me to research, at least descriptively, the working life of temporary teachers from a gendered perspective.

The conversations, capturing the experiences of two generations of teachers, gave me valuable insights into the impact of racially defined education policy and the influence of patriarchy in a society. The two, gendered and racial policies, have intertwined and permeated every facet of South African society. Consequently, people have come to see themselves primarily in racial, ethnic and gender terms. In the conversations with me, these women teachers described themselves in racial and gendered terms. Their conversations illustrated how race and gender influenced their positions within South African society. This reminded me of the words of the writer, Edward Said (1993) who said that 'labels like coloured, woman or Christian, or South African are no more than starting points' (Said 1993: 410). Often these labels are instruments used to subjugate people through the denial of persisting continuities of long traditions, sustained habitations, national languages and cultural geographies which are part and parcel of these processes. It was these conversations that drew my attention to the evidence of casualisation of teachers' work. Thereafter, I sought a supervisor interested in providing guidance and supervision on teacher education with a focus on women teachers.

This thesis on the casualisation of the teaching seeks to describe this phenomenon from a gendered perspective. In particular, it focuses on how contract employment affects women teachers' work. The aim is not to assess teachers' competence but to describe the obstacles that the lack of tenure creates for the teaching labour process. It is argued that the lack of tenure erodes teachers' autonomy over the teaching labour process. More importantly, my contention is that the lack of tenure prevents the formation of important

relationships, which must exist between teachers, their pupils and colleagues for effective learning to occur. Teachers and pupils form relationships of trust, respect and mutual understanding for learning to take place in the classroom. A similar situation exists between colleagues when they plan lessons, set and grade examinations, etc. For teaching to move beyond a process where teachers provide information towards a learning/teaching paradigm, the teacher/pupil relationship becomes an important ingredient for the teaching labour process to be a success. It is argued that contractual forms of teaching prevent the formation of the teacher-pupil relationship. This is because the rapid change over from one school to another by temporary teachers makes it difficult to establish a group dynamic, with peers and pupils alike, that engenders trust and respect for effective teaching and learning.

Writing the thesis as a part-time student certainly proved to be very challenging for me. Completing the thesis has also taken me to different places. After gathering the data, I returned from Durban in 1995 to live in Cape Town. I lived there until 1997 writing the thesis as a part-time student. For the first part of 1998 I lived in Johannesburg while I wrote the historical section of the thesis. Since June, I have lived in Trondheim, Norway, using the tranquillity of the Nordic scenery to theorise my topic and complete the thesis.

These developments, that is, working as an activist in full-time employment (from 1995 to 1998) building gender sensitive organisations, as well as writing the thesis as a part-time student were at times exciting and on other occasions, intense and over-awing. It is this marginalisation from academia, which gave my full-time employment and part-time academic studies both form and essence. It is from this position of marginality that I offer my contribution towards the production of knowledge on gender in education, especially on black women who continue to find themselves excluded from the conventional world of work.

#### Abstract

This thesis describes the casualisation of teachers' work (in Greater Durban) during the period of the democratic transition in South Africa. It provides evidence that contract teaching exists among men and women teachers employed in primary and secondary schools. These teachers are relegated to the secondary labour market with low income, poorer working conditions and lack of job security.

It begins by adopting an electic theoretical approach, combining labour process and interactionist theories, to understand teachers' work. From this eclectic theoretical perspective, it is argued that contract teachers control and influence over their work is considerably eroded by the casualisation of the teaching labour process. However, unlike existing international studies, it is argued that casualisation of teaching in the Durban area serves not only as a deskilling process for most contract teachers but also as a reskilling process for a few. Furthermore, this study shows that contract teaching has a gendered dimension. Not only because women teachers are mostly affected by casualisation of teaching but that it tends to relegate women to the primary school system where they teach young children. It is therefore argued that the casualisation of teaching extends women's mothering role into the classroom.

The historical basis for casualisation of teaching, in South Africa, especially its gender dimension is a result of the 'Marriage Bar 'of 1912, the legacy of the Bantu Education

system and the non-standardisation of teachers' qualifications until the 1980s, as well as the education policy flux during the period of political transition.

Because contract teaching has existed over a long period, it has to be acknowledged as a sub-category of the national teaching corps. This means that the contribution of contract teachers towards the formation and transformation of the capacity to learn should not only be recognised and accordingly rewarded by education authorities but that casualisation of teaching should constitute an area for further academic research.

## **Table of Contents**

		Page no.
Prefac Abstra		i iii ix xi
Chap	oter One: Introduction	
1.1 1.2 1.3 1.4 1.5	Introduction Background to the study Historical and geographical context of the study A review of the literature on teachers' work in South Africa Presentation of the chapters	1 2 4 6 9
Chap	oter Two: Theoretical approaches to teachers' work: a gendered perspective	
2.1 2.2 2.3 2.3.1 2.3.2 2.3.3 2.4 2.5 2.6	Introduction Defining teachers' work Theoretical approaches to teachers' work Functionalist perspective Interactionist perspective Conflict or critical perspective Contract teaching: the casualisation of teachers' work The gender dimension of casualisation of teachers' work Conclusion	12 12 15 15 16 19 22 24 27
Chap	oter Three: Research Methods	
3.1 3.2 3.3 3.4 3.5 3.6	Introduction Objectives Theoretical framework Research methods Sampling method and Sample size Analysing the data	28 28 29 30 32 34
3.7	Delimitations and limitations of the study	35 36

# Chapter Four: An historical background to the casualisation of teachers' work: A gendered perspective

4.1	Introduction	37
4.2	Women's unequal access to teacher training	38
4.3.1	Attempts to standardised teachers' qualification	
	Developing an accreditation system: 1930-1960s	40
4.3.2	Standardisation of teachers' qualifications post -1976	43
4.4	Cultural and political attitudes reinforce women	
	teachers' subordination	44
4.5	Conclusion	46
Chap	oter Five: Research Findings	
5.1	Introduction	48
5.2	Profile and location of contract teachers	48
5.2.1	Gender Profile	49
5.2.2	Types of contract employment	50
5.2.3	Years of teaching experience	53
5.2.4	Qualifications of the respondents	53
5.3	Contract teaching: the erosion of teachers' autonomy	
0.0	over the labour process	55
5.3.1	Impact of casualisation on the autonomy and control	
0.0.1	of teachers' work	55
5.3.2	Contract teaching as job discrimination	58
5.3.3	Contract teaching as a work opportunity	59
5.4	Informal recuitment methods for contract teachers	60
5.5	Contract teachers-pupil relationship	62
5.6	Contract teachers' collegial relationship	64
5.7	Gender bias of contract teaching	67
5.8	Conclusion	70
Chaj	pter Six: Interpretation of Research Findings	
6.1	Introduction	71
6.2	Context of the study	71
6.3	Interpretation of research findings	73
6.3.1	Casualisation: Erosion of autonomy and intensification of	
	teachers' work	75
6.3.2	Teaching as a social process:	
	contract teachers/pupil/collegial relationships	78

6.3.3	Feminisation of contract teaching Conclusion	79 80
Cha	pter Seven: Conclusion	
<ul> <li>7.1 Introduction</li> <li>7.2 Restating the research question and summary of findings</li> <li>7.3 Framework for recognising contract teachers' work</li> <li>7.4 Conclusion</li> </ul>		82 83 85 86
Bibli	iography	87
App	endices	93

#### **Chapter One**

#### Introduction

Applying gender analysis to teachers' work ... means calling attention to the obvious and subtle ways in which cultural belief about women and men influence the nature of teachers' work and the perceptions others hold of it (Acker 1996: 114).

#### 1.1 Introduction

Feminist researchers have repeatedly asked 'do women choose professional careers which reproduce their socialised roles as carers of families or are these career patterns determined by institutions and societal structures? This pertinent question has elicited various responses from feminists and non-feminists alike. In a country like South Africa where gender and racial oppression are intertwined, the responses of women in general have diverged considerably based on ideological persuasions, class background and racial origins. These divergent views have resonated in the discussions on the career choice of women teachers. A study by Pahliney (1991) for example indicates women of Indian descent regard their profession with the same pride as their male counterparts. According to Pahliney, women teachers regard teaching as a career. In contrast, Shepherd (1992) in her study of white women student teachers demonstrates that teaching is regarded as a bridge towards motherhood thus perceiving teaching as a part-time career. Her study shows that women student teachers felt that women's natural place is in the home as a wife and mother and that teaching suits this natural order.

Irrespective of one's opinion on this controversial topic, it is important to realise that women's choice of career should not be limited or confined to the sphere of education. Nor should one understand women's experiences as pupils in school as determining their career choices. Rather one should seek an explanation outside the boundaries of education as a socialising force and perhaps more importance should be placed on the role of cultural norms

and traditions in reinforcing women's subordination. I therefore argue that culture<sup>1</sup> and other social factors constitute important elements in understanding women's role perceptions of themselves. Consequently, an understanding of the role of women teachers in South Africa should be situated within the cultural norms that permeate this society and its influence on the teaching labour market.

An important backdrop to these debates is the reality of the labour market and women's position within this structure. Historically, teaching and nursing in South Africa were the only professions available to women, especially black women (See Chapter 4). Wider employment opportunities for men have contributed to the overrepresentation of women in these professions. Statistics on women teachers indicate that they make up 64% of the teaching corps<sup>2</sup>. While they constitute the majority of the teaching corps, they are not adequately represented in the top echelons of the teaching hierarchy nor do they all enjoy tenure. Men and women teachers are differently located in the internal teaching labour market and the primary school system is highly feminised<sup>3</sup>. Women make up 73.5% of all teachers in the primary school system (Wolpe et al 1997: 82). Thus, unlike their male counterparts, the majority of women are located in the lowest strata of the school system where they carry responsibilities for divergent functions within the school and have different kinds of rewards for their contributions. While women enjoy a high representation in the teaching profession, they are usually managed, directed and controlled by male education authorities.

#### 1.2 Background to the study

Until recently, in South Africa, teachers roles were very poorly defined by education authorities. In addition, the lack of a coherent national accreditation system made it difficult for teachers to define their status. The fragmented teacher qualification system resulted in a lack of a professional norm, which has a direct link to the historical development of teacher education. From 1983, the official teacher qualification was established as a matriculation certificate plus three years of teacher training. Because of the history of Apartheid education,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Geertz defines culture as an historically transmitted pattern of meanings embodied in symbols, a system of inherited conceptions expressed in symbolic form by means of which men communicate, perpetuate and develop their knowledge about the attitudes towards life (Geertz (1973: 89) cited in Shweder and LeVine 1984.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Statistics on the national teaching corps in South Africa are taken from Hall and Hofmeyr (1995).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The primary school system is feminised - i.e. women dominate this sector. See Chapter 4 for historical reasons and Chapter 2 for a theoretical understanding.

many black women teachers did not have these qualifications and remain underqualified.

Consequently, they were not eligible for tenured posts. Women teachers especially black women teachers were encouraged by education authorities to take training courses which did not provide entry to further career development. This became a racial and gendered form of exclusion to career mobility, thus creating a pool of contract teachers with lower salaries and poor working conditions. In particular, the National Party government policy encouraged black women to qualify as junior primary school teachers, due to several reasons, including the need to keep the cost of black education down in favour of white education. As Budlender (1997) notes:

In 1953, the government decided that employing women teachers at primary school was one way to cut the costs of African education. Women were encouraged to enter primary teaching. Men were explicitly discouraged from teaching at primary level through financial and other disincentives. Primary schools teacher training facilities were closed to men (Budlender 1997 cited in Wolpe et al 1997: 82)

Put differently, budgetary allocation became a mechanism to reinforce the racial and gender imbalances in education. As a result, 40% of all women teachers, particularly black teachers are underqualified and hold short-term contractual or temporary appointments (Hofmeyr and Hall 1995). Because of the temporary nature of their work, they are excluded from leadership and decision-making positions.

On the contrary, while male teachers make up 36% of the national teaching corps, they hold 58% of principal posts, 69% of deputy principal posts and 50% of head of department posts (Wolpe et al 1997: 82). This sexual division of labour in education in general and the school in particular confine women teachers to the classroom while men hold decision-making positions as senior teachers and education administrators. This likely accounts for why there are more women contract teachers than men.

In spite of the existence of contract teachers within the teaching corps in the Greater Durban area of KwaZulu/Natal in particular and South Africa in general, existing studies have not recognised or defined them as a sub-category whose conditions of employment requires analytical understanding. Similarly, there has not been any study in South Africa that analysed how the employment status of contract teachers impact on their ability to control and influence their work. Nor has there been any study that highlights the gendered nature of contract teaching. It is this void that this exploratory study intends to fill.

#### 1.3 Historical and geographical context of the study

This research investigates the phenomenon of contract teaching, especially among women teachers employed in schools in Greater Durban, Kwazulu/Natal. Kwazulu Natal was one of the four provinces in South Africa. Like all education institutions in South Africa, the schools were classified according to race and ethnicity based on the population who resided in a given geographical region. Apartheid policy for education established five education departments. The House of Assembly for white schools, The House of Delegates for Indian schools, The House of Representatives for Coloured schools, the House of Education and Training for African schools (for Xhosa-speaking pupils) and the Department of Education and Culture for African schools (for Zulu-speaking pupils). These were the five different racial departments that existed in Kwazulu/Natal during the period of the transition.

It should be reiterated that this research was conducted during 1993/4, a particular historical conjuncture in South Africa, when formal Apartheid had not been abolished but was in the process of being dissolved. This created confusion and uncertainty. In the interregnum, many changes were implemented. Government subsidised<sup>4</sup> white schools opened their doors to feepaying pupils of other race groups. Furthermore, under-utilised or unutilised schools for whites were made available to provide schooling mainly for blacks. In other words, this research project was conducted in the twilight years of Apartheid. The anticipated arrival of an ANC-led government and the attendant democratisation of social institutions raised many expectations. One such expectation was that the abolition of Apartheid would bring about opportunities for teachers, especially women contract teachers.

The context in which the research was conducted has changed considerably. Many of the original reasons for women's teachers' subordinate position have been addressed. Women teachers now have access to social benefits equal to their male counterparts. As Chapter 4 will illustrate, all married women have enjoyed permanent status since the mid-1980s. Since

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> In 1991 the House of Assembly's Minister of Education, Piet Clase, opened white schools to other races. Schools had to select a particular model by which desegregation occurred. Model A was a private school. Model B schools were empowered to determine school entrance where Model C schools were state-aided.

1995, married women teachers qualify for housing subsidies and enjoy maternity leave regardless of marital status (Budlender 1996).

Despite these improvements, contract teaching still exists in the new South Africa. It has been reported that at the end of 1997, 70 000<sup>5</sup> temporary teachers were threatened with dismissal. The number of teachers facing retrenchment was later reduced to 43 000 but temporary teachers appeared a soft target for provincial departments (Skinner 1998: 13). For the Kwazulu/Natal (KZN) region, 7 300 temporary teachers were dismissed on 30 March 1998<sup>6</sup>. Many women and men contract teachers are located in farm and rural settlement schools, areas of greatest disadvantage.

National statistics indicate that women numerically dominate teaching. It is therefore not surprising that teachers most affected by contract forms of employment are predominately women. However, of concern in this research is the gender implication of this form of casualisation. First, some of the teachers affected are heads of households and breadwinners. Second, these teachers would also be members of families containing several unemployed members (Chisholm 1998a: 8). Third, while women are over-represented amongst the ranks of teachers whose work is being casualised, they are under-represented in the top echelons of the teaching hierarchy. It is in this respect that I focus on the gender dimension of the casualisation of teaching.

The phenomenon of contract teaching and the casualisation of teachers' work remain a burning issue for teachers, education researchers and policy makers. If the picture painted above is a snapshot into the situation of temporary teachers, then it is correct to assert that teachers' work is vulnerable to casualisation. This thesis seeks to describe casualisation of teaching 'and related professions as part of a world-wide phenomenon where contract employment of professional workers (especially women) have become more flexible, more temporary and in effect more casual' (Aziz 1990: 38).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Chisholm (1998a) suggest that 60 000 teachers were threatened with dismissal in 1997.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Available literature did not provide a gender breakdown of this figure.

#### 1.4 A review of the literature on Teachers' work in South Africa

In South Africa, the research on the organisation of teachers' work especially of women teachers is in its infancy and has not yet been theorised. Most research on teachers rather than examine the organisation of teachers' work or the possible changes to this process has focused on its political nature. It conceptualised teachers as political actors in a racially classified schooling system. Emphasis was placed on teachers' political activity either as supporters or opponents of the Apartheid State and its education policy (Hyslop 1989; Mda 1989; Moll 1991). However, recent studies by (Truscott 1992; Kotecha 1992; Wolpe et al 1997) on gender in education have gone beyond an overtly 'political' focus and provide insights into our understanding of teachers' work. Although these studies do not focus on the organisation of teachers' work per se, they do provide insights into women's subordinate position in teaching. It is for these reasons that little is known about teachers' work, which is an effect of the research interests pursued under Apartheid. I will now proceed to review the existing literature with the aim of providing insights into how they view the role of teachers.

Research into education focussed on Apartheid and its effect on the education system. A review of the major texts can be divided into two dominant themes, broadly classified as reproduction and political education theories. The large body of literature in the aftermath of the 1976 Soweto student boycotts and crisis in education from 1984-1986 fall within the education reproduction theory<sup>7</sup>. They were primarily concerned with an analysis of Apartheid education, its effect on the schooling system and subsequently its abolition.

Kallaway's (1984) *Education and Apartheid*, an anthology of essays falls within this category. It focused on the origins of black education and its relationship to Apartheid policy. In particular, the essays examine black education within the realm of political economy against the background of the crisis of capitalism within the Apartheid framework. As the Enslin

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> According to Wolpe and Unterhalter (1991: 4) reproduction theorists see education 'as an essential mechanism for the reproduction of specific components of white domination ... particularly the reproduction of the rigidly segregated occupational structure in which blacks were virtually excluded from all job categories except that of unskilled labourer and the maintenance of ideologies of white superiority'. They argue further that education should be seen as an 'agent of transformation of the stratification system and the redistribution of occupational opportunities' (p3).

(1984) article in this collection aptly illustrates, the central focus of research was on the political role of teachers and not teaching as a labour process, especially how the political changes affect the re-organisation of teachers' work.

An equally important contribution, along the same theme, is the collection of articles by Nkomo (1990) *Pedagogy for Domination*, which examined the foundation of Apartheid education and critiqued the education reforms that emanated therefrom, against the backdrop of policy for post-Apartheid South Africa. This collection did not address issues related to teachers or their work but drew attention to the impact of Apartheid education on social processes such as the development and reinforcement of consciousness and identity within the school system and broader society.

Also, the Nasson and Samuel (1990) collection of essays, *Education and Poverty*, focuses on state educational neglect in its endeavours to promote Apartheid policies and ensuing poverty of black communities. Similarly, Alexander's (1990), *Education and the Struggle for National Liberation in South Africa*, provides insights into the pervasive effects of Apartheid ideology on education. Like all the literature already reviewed these two collections did not focus on teachers' work.

The studies that focus on teachers' work treat this issue cursorily. The studies by Hyslop 1990 and Moll 1991 discussed the political role of teachers' and their organisations as actors within and outside the schooling system. A synopsis of authors' views is captured by Hyslop (1990) when he notes that:

... both politics and economics have had a significant impact on South African teachers' decisions to collaborate or resist. The dialectic of resistance or acquiescence has been influenced by material changes in teachers' living standards, conditions of service, and so forth. But also highly important has been the political context, especially the state of mass opposition to Apartheid (Hyslop 1990: 93).

The significance of these studies is that they draw attention to the political struggle by black teachers (and students) to transform an education system that was meant to perpetuate racial segregation both in the schooling system and society at large, as well as the bureaucratic controls over teachers' work. Teachers developed alternative (civic and political organisations) and professional organisations (trade unions) to contest the changes to the organisation of their work. However, these studies did not examine teachers' work as a

collective bargaining issue. Rather they investigated the political role played by teachers as combating oppressive social roles and the state's attempt to bureaucratise their work. Consequently, education researchers did not explore the impact of state bureaucratisation on the re-organisation of teaching.

The studies by Wolpe and Unterhalter (1991) give primacy to the political role of education in their critique of reproduction theory but in the process they overlook the impact of education reforms on teachers' work. Instead, they focus on the wider socio-political context, which influenced changes in education. In challenging earlier studies like Kallaway (1984) and similar others, they argued that the reproductive role of education is not given but is a subject of contestation between various actors in society. They stressed that this role is dependent on the outcome of that contestation. In addition, they opined that it is problematic to see education and educational qualifications as being the only agent of exclusion. According to them, there are other powerful social mechanisms of exclusion such as gender, religion and class. Consequently, they opined that the role of education couldn't be weighed in isolation from these other social structures. Wolpe and Unterhalter, in particular, critiqued education researchers for failing to analyze the link between educational reform and other social conditions, which pervaded society. If education researchers had followed through this trajectory and focussed on the school as a workplace, I am of the opinion that researchers (including Wolpe and Unterhalter) would have taken cognizance of teachers' work as a labour market process<sup>8</sup>.

The lack of research into teachers' work is only surpassed by the gender blindness of most literature on women in education. Truscott (1992) picks up this issue, noting that most of the existing literature, with the exception of Morrell (1991), has been dominated by the questions of race and class without integrating a gender analysis<sup>9</sup>. According to her, these studies failed to provide a feminist analysis in which to understand the various discriminatory practices against women, either as pupils/students or as teachers. As for the latter, she draws attention to unequal pay, poorer working conditions and other discriminatory career practices against women workers, including teachers. She highlighted the fact that because of the gender-blindness of the existing literature, these authors failed to recognize the struggles of women

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> As from 1986, according to them, there was a shift in the historiography of education from reproduction theory to theories of social context.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Truscott acknowledged that most of these studies referred to women in passing. In other words, gender issues were not a dominant theme of these studies.

to transform the school system in particular and society in general. Her study addressed the lacuna of gender in education. In summary, Truscott showed the 'subordinated role of women in the labour market and the family that lies at the heart of understanding women's subordination in education - whether as students or teachers or educationists' (Truscott 1992: 9).

In effect, the major studies have overlooked the impact of Apartheid education on the organisation of teachers' work especially that of women teachers. Similarly, the school as an organisation within the context of the workplace remains under-researched and undertheorised. It is this void that I wish to fill in undertaking this research. In the chapters that follow I describe the teaching labour process and how the segmentation of the teaching labour market engenders different working conditions for those located in the primary labour market on the one hand and the secondary labour market on the other. As I will demonstrate, contract teaching is part of the secondary labour market with its associated poor working conditions including the erosion of contract teachers ability to control or influence the organisation of their work. There is a gender dimension to the casualisation of teaching. Not only do women constitute those whose work is being casualised, but that the reorganisation of teaching is also being done by men who occupy decision-making positions. This is coupled with the fact that women contract teachers are relegated to the lowest strata of teaching hierarchy -- the primary school system where they are expected to extend their mothering role into the classroom.

#### 1.5 Presentation of the chapters

Chapter 2 theorises the casualisation of teachers' work. It begins with a definition of teachers' work and proceeds with a discussion of the three sociological approaches; functionalist, interactionist and critical education theories, which have been applied to the study of teachers' work. Each of these theories is described as a basis to understand the casualisation of teachers' work. Finally, the chapter provides an analysis of the casualisation of teachers' work, followed by a gender analysis of this emerging trend in teaching. This analysis provides a framework to understand how casualised teaching has become women teachers' work.

Chapter 3 describes the research method and strategy employed in seeking evidence on the casualisation of teachers' work, especially amongst women teachers, in the Greater Durban area of Kwazulu/Natal in particular and South Africa in general. In spite of the presence of contract teachers, existing studies have not recognised or defined them as a sub-category whose conditions of employment require analytical understanding. Similarly, there has not been any study in South Africa that analysed how the employment status of contract teachers impacted on their ability to control and influence their work.

In researching this topic, I explain the choice and application of qualitative research methods to describe the experiences of both men and women teachers employed in four of the five education departments in the Greater Durban area. By describing their different views, I use contract teachers' experiences to develop themes to reflect how contract employment affects their access to tenured posts.

Chapter 4 provides an historical background for the casualisation of teachers' work in the Greater Durban area. I identify three critical phenomena to explain how this process comes about. The first criteria, is the qualification system which emerged as the Apartheid schooling system was established and developed. The skewing of certification and lack of a national norm for teacher training were two main causes for the rise of a racially differentiated teacher training system.

The second criterion identified is the education authority's ability to discriminate against women who married. Until the mid-1980s, all married women were placed on temporary contracts without service benefits. These criteria make up the subject of this chapter.

The third criterion is the decision by the National Party government through the promulgation of the Bantu Education Act (no 47) of 1953 to confine African women to the primary school system. This forced African women teachers to carry the financial burden of the expansion of the formal school system.

**Chapter 5** presents the findings of the study conducted on contract teachers in four of the five education departments in the Greater Durban area. First, the chapter presents a profile of teachers who were interviewed. It then examines the different strategies teachers used to find work. The second aspect being described is contract teachers' expectations that contract

employment will lead to full-time work. Interview data revealed that some teachers regarded contract teaching as an opportunity while others felt that it was a major constraint towards developing a career path. Thirdly, and most importantly, are teachers' descriptions of how contract teaching prevents them from developing relationships with pupils and colleagues.

Finally, interview data is presented on the different methods contract teachers have developed to find employment. While there is an explicit and formal employment procedure, contract teachers have set up an alternative employment network.

Chapter 6 interprets the research findings of the study and provides an analysis of the work of contract teachers and the relationship between teaching experience, qualifications and biological age. By invoking labour process theory, the chapter examines how and why the autonomy of teachers' work is being eroded. Moreover, this chapter raises question about the gate-keeping function that casualisation of teaching engenders. It is argued that contract teaching diminishes teachers' ability to control or influence their work.

**Chapter 7** provides some concluding remarks and reconceptualises the thesis. It offers reasons why some teachers enjoy contract teachers while others prefer tenured posts. Finally, the chapter makes recommendations for recognising the employment needs of contract teachers and posits a scenario for future research.

#### **Chapter Two**

# Theoretical Approaches to Teachers' work: a gendered perspective

#### 2.1 Introduction

In this chapter, I seek to theorise the casualisation of teachers' work. I begin with a definition of teachers' work. I then proceed with a discussion of the three sociological approaches: functionalist, interactionist and critical theories, which have been applied to the study of teachers' work. I describe each of these theories as a basis to understand the casualisation of teachers' work. Thereafter, I analyse the casualisation of teachers' work, followed by a gender analysis of this emerging trend in teaching. This provides an eclectic theoretical framework to understand how casualised teaching has become women teachers' work.

#### 2.2 Defining teachers' work

I will adopt an eclectic theoretical approach, which combines the concepts of autonomy and deskilling of the labour process theory on the one hand, and interactionist concepts which emphasize relationships that exist among teachers and between teachers and pupils on the other. This approach will provide the framework for defining teachers' work. The definition of teachers' work is offered to illustrate how the casualisation of the teaching labour process undermines the functions performed by teachers. What follows in the remainder of this section is this definition.

Robert Connell (1985) has made a major contribution to our understanding of the characteristics of teachers' work. He describes teaching as a social process and that teachers

are involved in the social production of the capacities for labour. In his words, 'Teaching is a labour process with an intangible object - the minds of pupils' (Connell 1985: 70).

The specification of teachers' work is the curriculum. It is both a definition of the pupil's learning and of the teacher's work. Teachers' daily engagement with the curriculum content enhances pupils' capacity to learn. One major characteristic of teachers' work is that it involves teaching lessons to pupils in the classroom. It is this engagement and the teachers' ability to encourage pupils to learn that is the objective of the teaching labour process. It is the interaction with the curriculum content via the complex teacher - pupil relationship that determines the capacity for learning.

Teachers' interaction with the curriculum content is not only a technical but also a professional and intellectual process. Getting pupils to learn is a highly complex process, involving emotional relationships, intellectual interaction, group dynamics and exercise of practical judgement in a constantly changing context (Seddon 1994). Teachers' work thus involves the engagement with the curriculum content both as an intellectual and as a practitioner (Connell 1985). There are several ways to describe this relationship. First, as a practitioner executing the curriculum, each teaching subject requires planning and sequencing of lessons, preparing handouts and physical materials. This process involves a teacher participating in curriculum meetings with colleagues teaching the same subject. It is also an individual process whereby a teacher plans and schedules lessons for a specific class (Seddon 1994).

Second, a teacher is required to teach lessons. Often it requires research in addition to what is provided in the curriculum. Teaching a lesson may also require the preparation of worksheets. The presentation is the one activity whereby a teacher and the pupils establish a dialogue about the topic. This communication encourages learning to take place.

Third, an important component of the teaching process is the management of the class by the teacher while lessons are being taught. Teachers supervise pupils' lessons through the completion of worksheets, reading sessions and self-study.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> These theoretical approaches, including the functionalist theory are the subject of the next section.

The fourth aspect of teachers' work is that teachers undertake the mapping of a pupil's capacity for learning. This is done through organising and grading of tests, setting major examinations and keeping class records.

Apart from these standard tasks performed by teachers, they also carry out responsibilities that ultimately impact on their pupils' occupational destination. Thus, through their intellectual engagement with the curriculum, teachers' communicate values, knowledge and power relationships that underpin society. Teachers may choose to transmit curricular knowledge that either supports or undermines the dominant ideologies<sup>11</sup>. Teachers' pedagogical styles and practices are influenced by the material conditions of their own lives and the resources, both symbolic and material, available at the schools where they teach. Consequently, the knowledge and perspectives teachers communicate to their pupils is not neutral or technicist.

Collegial relationships constitute the fifth aspect of teachers' work. Teachers liaise with each other to exchange ideas, concerning content and pedagogy about the subjects they teach and to monitor their pupils' progress.

Besides teaching tasks, there is a wide-range of school-related duties which teachers undertake. These include extra-curricular activities such as sport, cultural activities and community-related duties. Although these interactions take place outside the classroom, they are a crucial component to the development of the pupil (Ginsburg 1995).

It is clear from the foregoing that teachers' work constitutes a strategic component of the large-scale process of social change. Lawn's summation of the impact of teaching is germane in this respect. He argues that teaching has social effects beyond educational ones into other spheres such as politics, culture and economics (Lawn 1995). The teaching labour process also has an impact on and a relationship to the reorganisation of the national curriculum. Therefore, when examining the social construction of teachers' work, cognizance must be taken of the fact that teachers' work may be a contested terrain among teachers on the one

14

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Jansen (1990) cites how some educators in South Africa promoted racist stereotypes and ideologies in their classrooms, while others sought to redefine curriculum context away from its racist, sexist, and classist bias to the emancipatory goal of social relevance, political liberation and social equality (Jansen 1990 cited in Ginsburg 1995).

hand and between teachers and education authorities<sup>12</sup> on the other. One example of this contestation is that while teachers are interested in and want to influence education policies in areas such as the schooling system, its funding, expansion or decline of resources, the education authorities regard this as the usurpation of their right to manage. This contestation, Lawn argues, is because teachers are both agents of social reproduction and transformation, as well as the 'low status operatives in education' (Lawn 1995: 117). He describes the contestation as the political nature of teaching.

I have gone into great detail to provide a comprehensive definition because it constitutes a benchmark to assess whether casualisation undermines teachers' work.

#### 2.3 Theoretical Approaches to Teachers' Work

In theorizing teachers' work, I will draw on standard sociological theories, which have been applied over the years to the study of teachers' work. Three sociological approaches, which have been adopted for the study of teachers' work, are functionalist, interactionist and conflict theories (Acker 1996). Scholars who prefer maintaining tight disciplinary boundaries might frown at an inter-disciplinary approach but, as Acker notes, work that cuts across disciplines has an enriching capacity. She argues that the appropriation of these sociological theories to the study of teachers' work will enhance our understanding of the latter. It is in this regard that one appreciates the writings of Connell (1985 and 1997) on teachers' work, which can be situated within labour process and interactionist theories. His emphasis on the emotional and caring roles of teachers and the relationship it engenders with the pupils illustrates this point. I will elaborate on Connell's works in a later section. I will now proceed briefly to discuss the various sociological approaches applied to the study of teachers' work.

#### 2.3.1 Functionalist perspective

Functionalist theory dominated American sociology in the 1950s and 1960s. It was applied to the study of teachers in general and women teachers in particular. The major theme of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> I should note here that parents also try to influence the curriculum, which implicitly impacts on teachers' work.

functionalist framework was that teaching was an extension of women's mothering role into the classroom. Women teachers in this perspective serve as mothers and help to ease the transition of the child from the home to the school (Parsons 1961). Put differently, women as mothers are seen as the most appropriate carers and educators of young children. Functionalists such as Robert Dreeben (Dreeben 1973 cited in Acker 1996) argue that women teachers' work is shaped by internal and external factors. The internal factors include the authority relations in schools and school systems while external factors include societal perception of women's mothering role.

The functionalist also tried to assess whether teaching was a profession or an occupation. They drew up a set of typically functional characteristics of a profession which included a specialised knowledge base, service to society, long formal preparation, commitment to remain within the ranks and autonomous control over the work processes. To them, teaching like nursing and social work did not meet this test because of the numerical dominance of women and bureaucratic control. Women, they argued, move in and out of teaching as they prioritize their family responsibilities, especially the mothering role, over their career. If this were extended to the casualisation debate, functionalists would support part-time positions for women teachers. A major implication of this theoretical perspective is that functionalists blamed women for the perception that teaching was not a profession but an occupation. Consequently, functionalists advocated more supervision and bureaucratic control of teachers<sup>13</sup>.

Functionalists looked at how the different functions and structures of the school operate as a system to achieve the function of social reproduction. However, functionalists do not examine the activities of the actors within the school as an organisation or a workplace.

The functionalist perspective has major implications for the discourse on the casualisation of teachers' work. Functionalists would support the increasing bureaucratic control which casualisation engenders. A major reason for this assumption is that functionalists see teaching as an occupation that requires supervision with strong bureaucratic controls.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> See Acker 1996 for a summary of the functionalist perspective on teachers.

#### 2.3.2 Interactionist perspective

The interactionist theory is the second sociological tradition that has been applied to the study of teachers' work. This approach originated from the sociological studies conducted at the University of Chicago in the 1970s. The interactionist study of teaching as work provides insights into the career, work and occupations of teachers who operate pragmatically and survive amid conflicting pressures in the everyday performance of their work (Atkinson 1983 in Acker 1996). The central theme of the interactionist approach is that it stressed the individual teacher's actions as she interacts with the school structures. It emphasized that teachers are constrained by their work contexts. Symbolic interactionists stressed the individual teacher's perceptions and interpretation of their work, roles and relationships with colleagues and pupils. Emphasis is placed on concepts of teacher selves, commitments, careers, identities, strategies, subcultures and cultures to theorise or interpret teachers' work.

This approach is very popular because it provides a basis for understanding how teachers communicate with colleagues and pupils. Interactions with peers and pupils alike, from this perspective, constitute a major component of teachers' work. It is in this regard that one can see the importance of Connell's (1985) emphasis on the caring and emotional aspects of teaching and the way teaching shapes teachers.

Unlike the functionalists who examine the various structures within the school system, interactionist theorists look at how individual teachers make and reproduce meaning in their work. Interactionist theory has however been criticised for prioritizing individual teachers' interpretations and actions while 'neglecting power, context and change' (Acker 1996: 106). In other words, interactionist theory failed to take cognizance of the political, economic and social contexts within which teachers' work functions. Consequently, interactionists do not conceive of teaching as part of the labour process (the subject of the next section) or as an issue for collective bargaining. However, recent works by interactionist theorists such as Hargreaves (1994) have attempted to address these limitations by focusing on 'the disjuncture between modernist efforts to reform schooling through controlling teachers' work and the reality of schooling in a postmodern society' (Hargreaves cited by Acker 1996: 107).

Another shortcoming of the interactionist approach to the study of teachers' work is that it tends to categorise teachers in general terms and as a homogenous group. In the process, it

ignores the question of gender and whether there are tenured or part-time teachers with different conditions of work. Put differently, interactionists do not explain whether women and men or tenured and part-time teachers experience their work differently or not <sup>14</sup>. Lastly, interactionists do not provide insights into how teachers gain access to teaching and whether there are different forms of employment status.

In spite of these shortcomings, interactionist theory has given us a foundation for understanding the interactions that occur among teachers on the one hand and the group dynamics between teachers and with pupils on the other. This emphasis on social interaction between actors within the school system is the major contribution of the interactionist school to the debate on casualisation of teaching. The emphasis on interaction provides an easy benchmark to assess whether casualisation of teaching undermines or reinforces the relationships between actors in the school, which is crucial for teaching to take place.

The relevance for the debate on the casualisation of teachers' work is that interactionist theory examines how human agency interacts with the school structure. Interactionist theorists provide useful insights because the relational aspect of schooling is highlighted as a major component of teachers' work. In the process of casualisation, teachers' relationships are affected because of the short-term nature of contract employment.

A shortcoming of interactionist theory is that it does not view teaching as work or as part of a labour process. Because of the emphasis on relationships within the school, it does not examine how teachers gain access to teaching. Nonetheless, its major usefulness is that it provides a benchmark to assess how teachers' work is undermined or reinforced by casualisation. Put differently, it provides the arena to focus on the different interactions that take place between the various actors within the school system.

18

There are a few exceptions such as Connell (1985). That Connell integrates gender into the education discourse might explain the fact that his theoretical work falls broadly within critical theory.

#### 2.3. 3 Conflict or critical perspective

The third sociological approach that has been utilised in analysing teachers' work can be generally referred to as critical education theory. Critical education theory explores the pressures towards proletarianisation on teachers, which threaten their status as professionals (Connell 1985; 1995; Apple 1986; Lawn and Ozga 1988). This theory stems from the studies on labour process (e.g. Braverman 1974) which states that under capitalism, the accumulation process undermines the control that workers have over their work. Similarly, Braverman asserts that the imperative of capitalist accumulation also engenders the fragmentation of work and causes the worker to be alienated from it. Put differently, labour process theorists present 'the impact of top-down reforms as deskilling, an example of the economy-wide dynamic by which paid work is sub-divided, information and control are concentrated amongst managers and most employees are redirected to the mechanical execution of detailed work' (Seddon 1994: 6133).

Braverman (1974) describes the struggles at the workplace around the definition, fragmentation and dilution of skills, as well as its remuneration. It is this thesis that has been extended by critical education theorists to the study of teachers' work.

Critical education theorists like Connell, Lawn, Apple and Ozga see teaching as a labour process and the school as a conflictual workplace. This is premised on the assumption that education is a social process and that teachers' engage in the social production of the capacities for labour. Furthermore, the school system is seen as the producer of the human capital required by the economy, in the form of a trained and differentiated workforce. In this context, teachers are regarded as the specialised workforce producing the larger workforce. Critical education theory, more especially labour process theory, describes the changing nature of teachers' work. In particular, it describes the micro-politics of teachers' work and the contestation over the organisation of the labour process. Like other labour processes, the conceptualization of skill within teachers' work is complex and contested. Skill implies a relationship to the process of conception and the execution of a work process. A skill is a creation of labour control over the workplace and the job content (Ozga 1988).

In the organisation of the labour process, as Ozga notes, skills are socially constructed by a set of rules and regulations relevant to a particular craft. Skill is also recognised in technical attributes, specialized tasks, career structures and scale posts, reflecting the increased intervention by the education authority, consistent with the changing nature of the labour process in factories or offices as workplaces. Apple (1986) and Lawn and Ozga (1988) have applied this version to teaching. According to them, like other labour processes, teachers' work has witnessed tendencies towards 'technical control procedures' and the schools have been marked by management styles which entail task allocation, detailed curriculum control and text selection. The curriculum, they argue, is shaped by bureaucratic control defining teachers' competence and pupils capacity to learn. Consequently, it replaces the volition and skills which teachers have traditionally utilised in their tasks (Apple 1986,1993). Seddon concurs when he notes that 'the teachers' craft has been replaced by a battery of technical procedures **imposed by external forces outside the school'** (Seddon 1994: 6133) (emphasis added). Thus, unlike the interactionist thesis, critical education theory stresses the impact of external forces on teachers' work.

The reorganisation of teaching has occasioned what Apple refers to as *intensification* of teachers' work. This means that teachers are pressurised to undertake more work in the same amount of time. This is a mechanism to extract more labor at a reduced cost aimed at increasing productivity. In the long-run this is a counter-productive measure in that teachers resort to 'cutting corners, destroying sociability and leisure, and displacing goals away from providing quality service to simply getting done' (Densmore (1987), Apple (1986) cited in Acker (1996)). Intensification of teachers' work means that teachers have lost considerable autonomy over their work as education authorities exercise greater control. Overall, this process has occasioned the deskilling of teachers' work and also serves to dislocate the structure of teachers' occupational identity and culture.

Feminist researchers (Acker (1996), Connell (1985), Ozga, (1988)) utilizing critical education theory have highlighted the gender dimension of the reorganisation of teachers' work. When these researchers looked at the social composition of teaching, they revealed the numerical dominance of women. This has been described as the 'feminization' of

teaching<sup>15</sup>. They argued that it is mostly women teachers whose work is affected by the reorganisation of teaching. Although they acknowledged that this process has engendered job dilution and has become a means of simplifying and standardizing job tasks, they point out that there is a gendered aspect to this reorganisation. This is because in most instances dilutees are women who are employed when the labour process has been deskilled. Furthermore, it is plausible to state that the predominance of women in teaching, especially primary schools, means that the reorganisation of teaching will affect more women because of their numerical dominance. The reorganisation of the teaching labour process introduces women as collective employees that perform subordinated functions. For example, women are mainly classroom teachers while a small percentage of women, and mainly men hold senior teaching and decision-making posts.

Critical education theorists like Acker (1994) and Apple (1986) have drawn our attention to the fact that it is largely men who carry out the reorganisation of a largely female work force. In their view, it is women's occupations that are more prone to reorganisation. Women teachers have had to struggle long and hard to achieve recognition and improvement to their working conditions and status within teaching.

Another unfortunate trend of the feminization of teaching is that 'teaching like mothering provokes social expectations for altruism, self-abnegation, and repetitive labour. This view is similar to the functionalist perspective that sees teaching as a bridge towards motherhood. It shares with women's work in the home a lack of boundaries' (Acker 1996: 122). Thus, the continuity of the mothering culture is invoked when understanding women's predominance in teaching.

Another important aspect of this reorganisation which critical education theorists highlight is the trend towards short-term contract or temporary appointments for teachers. Aziz (1990) refers to this phenomenon as the casualisation of teaching.

The importance of labour process theory for this research topic is that it provides the basis for understanding the reorganisation of teaching, which engenders casualisation. A consequence of casualisation is the erosion of contract teachers' autonomy over their work. Although all teachers are affected by the intensification of work as a result of the increased bureaucratic

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> See Danylewycz and Prentice (1986) for criticism of this assertion.

control over the curriculum, contract teachers are most adversely affected. This is because they are employed to teach lessons organised and administered by their tenured colleagues. Contract teachers do not participate in meetings with colleagues where decisions are made about the curriculum or related duties. Therefore, another significance of labour process theory for this study is that it provides a theoretical basis to understand the alienation of casualised teachers from the conception of their work and the deskilling process that it entails. In the next section, I interrogate this phenomenon in detail.

## 2.4 Contract teaching<sup>16</sup>: the casualisation of teachers' work

This section focuses on the casualisation of teachers' work, especially its gendered nature. It utilizes aspects of interactionist and critical education theories, especially the relational aspect of the former and concepts of work intensification, job dilution and loss of autonomy of the latter, as theoretical insights into the casualisation of teachers' work.

In her study of academics in Britain, Aziz (1990) reported a trend towards flexible, short-term contract appointments of University staff. She also indicated that this phenomenon, short-time contract appointments, was beginning to occur in teaching as a result of the top-down reorganisation of the education system. Aziz refers to this development as the casualisation of teaching. Teachers on short-term contracts have a different set of working conditions from their tenured colleagues. As Loveys (1988) notes, contract teachers are poorly rewarded and lack the working rights of tenured teachers.

According to Loveys, there are two categories of contract teachers, each with its unique working conditions. The first category are those he referred to as **relief teachers**<sup>17</sup>. These teachers usually replace absentee teachers or those on sick leave. These teachers provide lessons and do basic curriculum work while the regular teacher is away. As a result they are told by the principal to enjoy the time spent with the pupils.

The second category is on fixed term contract or **temporary teaching**. These teachers are usually employed for a longer period, ranging from one term to one academic year. This

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> The term contract or temporary teacher is used interchangeably in this study. It represents teachers without tenure.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> This category of contract teachers is not entitled to paid sick leave. It is similar to category of substitute

group of contract teachers is expected to integrate themselves into the school environment and to establish stable relations, as quickly as possible, with the pupils (Loveys 1988: 184). Because each school has its own culture, the socialization process is always very difficult for temporary teachers. As Trotter and Wragg (1990) cited in Husen and Postlethwaite (1994)<sup>18</sup> note, contract teachers' lack knowledge of the school environment, their colleagues and pupils. This disadvantages contract teachers in the new school setting. Consequently, shortterm contract appointments undermine one of the central elements, collegial relations, which the interactionist school emphasised as a major component of teaching.

Loveys opined that understanding the school structure is vital to the teacher's integration process. Often teachers integrate into school structures because the pedagogical styles are similar to their own practices. Contract teachers strategies to adapt to changing school environments are viewed by school authorities and peers alike as conforming to a set of norms determined by the cultural values of that particular school, which temporary teachers have no or little influence over.

According to Loveys, contract teaching is essentially a 'holding position' in the classroom. According to him, like teachers with tenure, temporary teachers provide lessons. But unlike the former, contract teachers have little influence on the curriculum or work relations within the school. For example, they are not in a position to determine which subjects they teach. Notwithstanding these factors, when changes are introduced to the curriculum, contract teachers experience work intensification similar to their tenured colleagues. Because they are more prone to the vagaries of intensification, they experience more job dilution and loss of autonomy. For example, they are made to teach subjects for which they are not trained. One could therefore conclude that casualisation confirms labour process theory which stressed that the reorganisation of teaching not only intensifies teachers' work but also fragments the teaching labour process -- separating the planning from the execution of lessons.

Furthermore, unlike those with tenure, there is no formal probationary period for contract teachers. There is however an unofficial probation, which takes place through consultations

teacher employed in the South African education system.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Husen and Postlethwaite (1994) point out that the problems associated with substitute teaching are: 'having no lesson plans or poor lesson plans left for them, teaching outside their area of certification or expertise and being given little or no information about the students, especially pupils with learning difficulties'

with the principal or the head teacher of a particular subject. Similarly, they receive very little support from their tenured colleagues. The integration process is made all the more difficult as contract teachers have very little knowledge of the school environment. In addition, these teachers are reluctant to seek support from those with tenure. This reluctance stems from the fact that they do not want to be perceived as being incompetent and unprofessional by their tenured colleagues.

In conclusion, the reorganisation of the teaching labour process creates a new category of teacher with different working conditions and less autonomy or control over their work. One implication of casualisation is that the quality of the teaching-learning paradigm is lost in the constantly changing nature of their work. Lastly, because contract teachers are not in a position to build stable and trustworthy relationships with their pupils or colleagues as they constantly seek to renew their contract or secure employment elsewhere, they are unable to exercise one major component of teachers' work -- good pupil/teacher/collegial relationship.

## 2.5 The gender dimension of casualisation of teachers' work

In this section I build on the concept of casualisation by discussing human capital and segmented labour market theories to contexualise the gender dimension of the casualisation of teachers' work. I discuss these theories as a backdrop to understanding the gender dimension of contract teaching.

Theorists on women's participation in the economy have shown that women enter the labour market on a different basis from men. The first theory is based on the human capital or rational choice theory linking wage levels to the levels of human capital which education, training and skill embody in an individual (Sinclair 1991). This theory suggests that jobs and pay levels reflect the individual investment in time spent on education and training in preparation for future careers. The assumption is that women choose careers requiring less investment or training unlike their male counterparts (Beechey and Perkins 1987 cited in Duffy and Pupo1992). In other words, the argument is that women have a lower average level of skill than men do due to lower levels of education. Consequently, women are said to be paid lower wages because of their lower education qualification (Sinclair 1991). Human capital theorists have argued that the majority of women do not hold decision-making

positions because they prioritised their family commitments over their career advancement. They go further by invoking traditional views that women's dual roles account for gender inequality in employment.

Human capital theory has come under sharp criticism from feminist scholars. These scholars point out that even when women have training and education qualifications similar to their male counterparts, they have been denied employment and positions commensurate with their skills and qualification. They argued that women are relegated to ghettoised positions, outside the circles of managerial and decision-making and power (Duffy and Pupo 1992). Loveys (1988) has shown that the majority of contract teachers are women 19. His study indicates that women teachers took short-term contracts to 'keep in touch' with teaching with a view towards re-entering the classroom on a full-time basis. Another reason was that many women who are mothers had taken time off to care for their young children (Loveys 1988: 180). This argument, according to feminist researchers, misses the point, as it tends to reinforce the sexual division of labour in which women do the bulk of unpaid work. Also it overlooks the fact that the reproductive role of women, caring and mothering, is not a question of choice and hence women have to combine this role with that of their productive roles. The net effect is that women are disproportionately disadvantaged when benefits reflect work-related inequality (Orloff 1993).

Lemmer (1989) has provided an alternative yet equally important explanation for the subordinate role of women in society. She argues that an understanding of women's role should be located within cultural and social institutions of a particular society. It is these societal attitudes that shape and influence women's subordinate position within the sphere of employment. Cultural perspectives entrench and sharpen the contradictions of women's subjugated position in a society. Writing on South Africa, Lemmer has drawn our attention to what she refers to as the 'conjugal attitudes toward women's role' (1989: 35). In this context men are regarded as the household head and 'breadwinner' of the family, which it is argued entitles them to higher wages and better conditions of service<sup>20</sup>. Women's careers are thus seen as being secondary. Hence when they take on paid employment they are confronted with various discriminatory practices such as lower pay and poorer conditions of service.

<sup>19</sup> Aziz also shows that the majority of academics on contract appointments are women mostly below 30 years of age.

age.

This overlooks the fact that women are increasingly becoming household heads and breadwinners of their families.

Lemmer therefore argues that the subordinate roles of women lie within beliefs, values and culture of a society. Women and men are socialised within these norms<sup>21</sup>.

Labour market theory has been utilized increasingly by scholars, especially feminists, to explain the subordinated role of women in the labour market. The labour market, it is argued, is constituted by two segments; the primary and secondary sectors (Evetts 1988). The distinction between these two sectors is in terms of the conditions of work. Primary sector occupations are stable, well paid with career structures and good working conditions. Unlike the primary sector, the secondary sector jobs offer 'only part-time, intermittent employment, relatively low earnings, no job security or promotion prospects' (Evetts 1988: 189). Access to work is determined by a segmented labour market where the employment for men or women is based on the demand for particular occupations. Using this approach, Evetts categorised teaching as a primary sector occupation with two divisions, namely upper and lower.

As Duffy and Pupo (1992) have shown in their study, women numerically dominate the secondary sector. Jobs in this sector are unstable and not regarded as skilled work. Primary sector occupations, in contrast, develop internal labour markets where competition for promotion to the upper primary sector is restricted to those already in the primary sector occupation (Evetts 1988). The internal labour market constitutes a career structure whereby some members can progress and achieve promotion.

For employers there are definite benefits in maintaining a differentiated workforce. For instance, the employment of a sizeable part-time workforce is a cost saving device by employers and acts as a mechanism to discourage unionisation by workers as part-time workers are difficult and expensive to organise (Duffy and Pupo 1992).

In order to apply this to the study of teachers' work in general and casualisation of teaching in particular, I will appropriate and critique Evetts' work. She classified teaching as belonging to the primary sector employment. This is because, according to her, 'teaching offers relatively high wages, good working conditions, responsibility over the work in the classroom and employment stability' (Evetts 1988: 189). She draws our attention to the internal hierarchies that have developed in the teaching primary labour market, namely upper primary sector and lower primary sector made up of educational management (including

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Women are increasingly challenging these cultural norms.

headteachers) and classroom teachers respectively. Unlike the former, the latter have less variety in their work, no control over other teachers and less opportunity for individual initiatives beyond the classroom.

Evetts' categorisation of teaching within the primary labour market with two sub-divisions is very problematic. She does not fit contract teachers within any of these two categories in spite of the fact that she acknowledges their existence, as well as their deplorable conditions of service. Consequently, I argue that within teaching there are three categories of teachers. The first two are those identified by Evetts. The third are contract teachers, which I situate within the secondary labor market. As the definition by Evetts above indicates, those in this group only have part-time positions and comprise mostly of women<sup>22</sup>. Consequently, contract teachers are relegated to the lowest strata of teaching, which bears no professional status and has little prestige.

### 2.6 Conclusion

I have adopted an eclectic approach, combining labour process and interactionist perspectives, to theorise the casualisation of teaching. Casualisation refers to a process where teachers are employed on short-term contracts. It engenders the reorganisation of teachers' work resulting in deskilling, loss of autonomy, fragmentation and the intensification of work processes for teachers without tenure. These are mainly women teachers who are relegated to the secondary teaching labour market with lower wages and poorer working conditions. This eclectic approach to understanding casualisation of teachers' work implies that there exists a group of teachers, who are mainly women, that are being deskilled owing to several factors including cost-saving devices. Not only do they have little or no negotiating power over their conditions of service but also have very little control over the organisation of their craft. It is this eclectic approach based on critical education theory, especially labour process theory that frames the rest of thesis.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Duffy and Pupo (1992) agree that the secondary sector is made up of mainly women.

## **Chapter Three**

### Research Methods

### 3.1 Introduction

In the Greater Durban area of Kwazulu/Natal (KZN) in particular and South Africa in general, there exist within the national teaching corps a category of teachers with short-term contract employment, with lower salaries and poor conditions of employment. In spite of the presence of this group of teachers, existing studies have not recognised or treated them as a sub-category whose conditions of employment require analytical understanding. Similarly, there has not been any study in South Africa that analysed how the employment status of contract teachers impact on their ability to control and influence their work. It is this void that this exploratory study intends to fill.

### 3.2 Objectives

The objectives of this study are to:

- 1. show evidence of contact teaching in the Greater Durban area, KZN;
- 2. describe the experiences of contract teachers with the aim of assessing how casualisation impacts on their work;
- 3. assess the impact of casualisation on the autonomy of contract teachers' work and
- 4. highlight the gendered nature of casualisation.

#### 3. 3 Theoretical framework

To understand the casualisation of teachers' work, I adopt an eclectic theoretical approach, which combines labour process and interactionist theories. The former, as espoused by Connell (1985, 1995), Apple (1986) and Lawn and Ozga (1988) to explain the changes to the teaching labour process. This is because it provides insights into how teachers' work is being re-organised as part of the labour process. The reorganisation of the teaching labour process is a deskilling process that involves a loss of teachers' autonomy over their work. In addition, labour process theory provides a framework to examine the school as a workplace and teachers' work as part of the labour process. The latter, that is, interactionist theory highlights the relationships between the teacher-pupil on the one hand, and teacher-teacher relations on the other. This engagement with pupils and peers alike gives meaning to the teaching process.

The core of the teaching labour process is getting pupils to learn. This is a highly complex process, involving emotional relationships, intellectual interaction, group dynamics and the exercise of practical judgement in a constantly changing context (Seddon 1994). Teaching is difficult to pin down as work because it is a labour process without a clearly defined object – the minds of pupils (Connell 1985).

Teaching is vulnerable to reorganisation because of its links to the wider socio-political changes within society, for example the rationalisation of the education budget. Put differently, wider social changes affects the organisation of teachers' work by introducing contractual forms of employment into the teaching labour market or what I refer to as the casualisation of teaching. In effect, the reorganisation of teaching and its effects on the teaching labour market provide a theoretical insight into the casualisation of teaching. As will be demonstrated in the remaining parts of this thesis, casualisation of teaching shapes how contract teachers engage with the curriculum, as well as their interaction with peers and pupils alike. It also occasioned intensification of work, as well as a loss of contract teachers' autonomy over their work.

### 3.4 Research Methods

In this research, contract teachers is the category of analysis<sup>23</sup>. In order to gain insights into the nature of casualisation and its effects on contract teachers, I chose a structured and openended, semi-structured questionnaire. The structured questionnaire<sup>24</sup> was used to elicit empirical information to develop a profile of contract teachers. To frame the questionnaire, I engaged in a participant conversation with a teacher activist<sup>25</sup>. Based on this conversation, I formulated the questionnaire along several themes: length of service, type of employment contracts and whether it is mostly men or women teachers that are affected by contract employment. The themes from the participant conversation provided the basis for developing a profile of contract teachers. Stressing the importance of this research method Casey (1995) notes:

During interviews, the use of participant-structured conversations highlighted the role of the teachers. The social relations of research are transformed when teachers are presented as subjects in their own right, not as mere objects of research. Teachers can be seen as authors of their own lives, and in their roles as educators, as co-authors of their students' lives as well. (Casey 1995: 86).

Initially, I planned to sample teachers without tenure, both male and women, but soon realised that the random sample yielded more women contract teachers. Additionally, I realised that there were several categories of contract teachers in the formal school system. After piloting the questionnaire, the different categories were disaggregated and the questionnaire format was reshaped and honed to capture these phenomena. The three categories of contract teachers that became evidenced are casual, substitute and fixed contract teachers.

Furthermore, I realised that after the piloting phase, the gendered nature of casualisation was not highlighted. Consequently, the questionnaire was restructured to address this aspect -- the gendered dimension of contract teaching. If the questionnaire were left in its original format, it would have meant overlooking the plight of 'the invisible woman teacher' who constitutes the majority of contract teachers, as well as condoning the dominant 'sex-blind' research

<sup>-</sup>

When I piloted the questionnaire with a group of six contract teachers employed in the HOR schools, participants asked which category of women in the teaching hierarchy was being researched. Unlike teachers with tenure, these women considered themselves discriminated against and were eager to have their employment status highlighted in the research process. Ref T15.

The structured questionnaire appears as Appendix 2.

The interviewee was the SADTU Gender Co-ordinator for Kwazulu/Natal at the time of the interview. The South African Democratic Teachers' Union (SADTU) is the trade union representing progressive teachers living in Kwazulu/Natal.

practice. Making women contract teachers central to the research process is to make their conditions the centre of analysis. A feminist researcher, Westkott (1979) stressing the centrality of women in the research process notes that:

Women studying women reveals the complex way in which women as objects of knowledge reflect back upon women as subjects of knowledge. Knowledge of other and knowledge of the self are mutually informing because self and other share a common condition of being woman (Westkott 1979: 140).

I therefore had to address my own subjectivity in this research process by reminding myself that women researchers documenting women's issues assist in the elimination of women's marginalisation from the production of knowledge. Developing and producing knowledge by women in academia challenges the dominant views that men centred themselves within the universe and see everything in relation to them<sup>26</sup>. The starting point became the acknowledgment that women's experience of patriarchal society is personal and political (Acker 1996:57). Consequently, I restructured the questionnaire to ensure that both the public (work-life) and private (childbearing) roles of women teachers are emphasised, especially how casualisation impacts on these roles. I hoped this perspective would indicate that women and men teachers make career choices but these choices are made within socially defined limits and opportunities of the teaching labour market.

The structured questionnaire was complemented by an open-ended and semi-structured questionnaire<sup>27</sup>. This qualitative research method was used to provide information on the quality of working life and social histories of contract teachers. Because there is very little documentary evidence of women's experience of being a contract teacher, the open-ended interviews facilitated an in-depth discussion and understanding of the subject matter. Bailey (1987) concurs that open-ended questions are used for complex questions that cannot be answered in few simple categories but require more detail and discussion. In addition, open-ended interviews are used to elicit the respondent's unique views, philosophy or goals.<sup>28</sup>

There were three phases to the research process. The *first phase* was conducted in October 1993. This included the participant conversation, which assisted with the design of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> The purpose of this research method is not to dispute whether men are capable of doing feminist research, it is rather an attempt to define the research process as an attempt to improve women's lives.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> The interview schedule appears as Appendix 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Bailey (1987: 121) says that open-ended questions are preferred wherever accuracy and exhaustive detail are more important than time or simplification of coding and data processing.

questionnaire. It also included the design, piloting and finalisation of the format of the questionnaire. The *second phase* was conducted from November to February 1994 when I interviewed a random sample of teachers and principals at the schools initially sampled for in-depth interviews. Each in-depth interview took one hour and was tape-recorded. Therefore, phase 2 (data gathering) was conducted during the last quarter of 1993 and the first quarter of 1994. In the *third phase* I wrote up the research findings and completed the thesis in 1998.

## 3.5 Sampling method and Sample size

According to an education planner<sup>29</sup> and some of the principals in the sample, 10% of the staff complement of any school do not enjoy tenure. Permanent staff members on maternity leave, study leave, sabbatical or compassionate or sick leave are replaced by contract teachers for the period that they are away.

A random selection of schools in the Greater Durban Area was made. Schools were chosen on the basis of their geographical location. The geographical location of schools conformed to racial policies of Apartheid that teachers are located in schools for pupils of the same racial origin as themselves. Consequently, teachers were interviewed on the assumption that white teachers were located in the schools of the House of Assembly (HOA), African teachers in the schools of the Department of Education and Training (DET). Similarly, it was assumed that Coloured teachers were located in the schools of the House of Representatives (HOR) and Indian teachers in the schools of the House of Delegates (HOD).

The HOD's schools where interviews were conducted were located in the Indian residential areas of Austerville, Chatsworth, Durban Central, Phoenix and Merebank. Teachers in coeducational high schools were interviewed. Contract teachers' in the HOR schools were located in the Coloured residential areas of Clare Estate, Overport, Sydenham and Wentworth were interviewed. These were co-educational public schools. Both primary and high schools contract teachers were interviewed. Similarly, contract teachers in HOA schools located in the white residential areas of Glenwood, Mayville and Umbilo were interviewed. These contract teachers taught in Model C schools -- two primary schools, a single sex boy's high

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Personal Communication with SADTU Co-ordinator Southern Natal Region, 9 September 1994.

school and a co-educational high school. The last group of contract teachers interviewed was in three DET schools located in the African residential areas of Umlazi, Chesterville, and Lamontville.

The contract teachers who make up this sample were employed in two types of schools. First, Government subsidised schools under the HOD, HOR and DET. Pupils of Indian, African and mixed descent make-up the school populations. Government schools employ teachers whose salaries are paid for the by state. Second, semi-private schools under the House of Assembly. These schools are known as Model C. The state employs teachers based on the number of pupils enrolled and the student/teacher ratios. The board of governors or the school management committee appoints additional teachers from fees paid by parents. Teachers employed by the management of the school can be employed hourly or on a monthly basis.

The 8 principals who were interviewed were located in some of these schools that made up the sample.

Between 3 and 12 contract teachers, both male and female, were interviewed at each school. They constituted all the contract teachers in the affected schools. In all, a random sample of 96 contract teachers, 70 women (72%) and 26 men (28%) were interviewed<sup>30</sup>. 30 of these 96 contract teachers were employed as substitute teachers while the remaining 66 were employed as temporary teachers.

Conversations with each contract teacher revealed that s/he was employed in a post that had been designated as permanent, although these posts are occupied in a temporary capacity. None of these teachers were serving probationary periods and those who had one-year employment contract (temporary teachers) appointments had not applied for short-term contracts, that is, as substitute teachers.

The research took the following process. At each school requests were made to interview contract teachers irrespective of sex<sup>31</sup>. To conduct interviews two strategies were deployed

<sup>30</sup> 96 contract teachers completed the questionnaire. 28 of this sample participated in indepth interviews.

Members of the Gender Committee of SADTU Southern Natal Region assisted with the administration of 30% of the questionnaires. Their assistance ensured the selection of schools were random.

for gaining access to contract teachers. First, SADTU members who taught at these schools helped secure access to contract teachers. The second strategy was to obtain permission from principals to interview contract teachers and where possible, interviews the principals as well. The size of the sample was determined by the time available for conducting the interviews and the cost of doing the research. Due to the fact that I wanted to get a representative sample, which covered the racial and gender demography of teachers in Kwazulu/Natal, I adopted random sampling to achieve this goal. My research schedule allowed three months for the interviews. This period co-incided with the end of school year and the beginning of the new academic school year, the period when contract teachers would be seeking new contracts. Because of the anxiety this process entailed, contract teachers were more eager to speak of their experiences at this time.

### 3.6 Analyzing the data

On completion of phases 1 and 2, the next step was to analyze and code the data according to categories. Uniform coding was carried out with respect to all data, regardless of the technique(s), which were used for data collection. A content analysis was done by carefully identifying the status of the contract teacher. Categorizing the respondent as a substitute or temporary teacher, length of services, qualifications, gender, etc. made it possible to contrast their experiences.

The open-ended questions and in-depth interviews were tape-recorded. On completion these were transcribed and categorized according to the established themes. The in-depth participant interview was also classified. Each statement was classified according to the source and social setting. The next step was to check the relationship of each respondent's perspective and match them to the emerging categories. I then proceed to classify the categories of statements into two broad areas: positive and negative responses. The frequencies of positive responses were counted as advantages or opportunities while the negative responses were counted as constraints or disadvantages. Where consensus could not be reached, these views have been presented accordingly in Chapter 5.

The primary sources were complemented by secondary sources. In particular, it draws on two national studies by Hofmeyr and Hall (1995) and Wolpe et al (1997). These combined (the

primary sources and the national studies) provide a broader perspective into the casualisation of teachers in the Durban area during the period of the democratic transition.

The findings of this research have a major theoretical implication. It shows that, unlike labour process theory which sees casualisation only as a deskilling process for all workers, the casualisation of the teaching labour process creates a re-skilling process for a small number of contract teachers. This means that casualisation as a monolithic, deskilling process needs to be qualified.

### 3.7 Delimitations and Limitations of the study

The *first limitation* is that the existing literature has not recognised or treated contract teachers as a sub-category within the teaching corps, as a result there were few precedents to draw on. In addition, the sample size is small. As such, the research findings cannot be generalised. Nonetheless, the research provides evidence of contract teaching in South Africa, as well as insights into the experiences of contract teachers. Indeed it provides evidence that casualisation exists among underqualified teachers and that it now exists amongst qualified teachers as well.

The *second limitation* is that the sample was gathered within a particular historical period (1993-4) while the research findings were written up in another (the post-democratic election period). Amongst education authorities in general and contract teachers in particular, in the 1993-4 period, there were anxieties whether the democratic dispensation would bring with it better working conditions for the latter, or indeed provide them opportunities for tenured posts. Although there have been some positive changes in the education sector which impacts on the working conditions of contract teachers since the democratic elections, the findings of this research should be viewed within the historical context in which the data was gathered. In other words, the research findings are without prejudice to the changes that have occurred since May 1994.

The *third limitation* is that because I depended on principals' permission to interview contract teachers, only 96 respondents of the original sample of 120 contract teachers were interviewed. This was because some principals, especially in the DET schools were reluctant to have their staff participate in the interviews. The principals in the Department of

Education and Culture's schools rejected applications to have contract teachers on their staff participate in the study.

The *fourth limitation* is that, because of the unsettled political situation in the townships, it was unsafe to travel alone or enter some of the schools. Similarly there were other security problems in some of the schools such as burglaries. Consequently, in some instances, I was escorted to some of the schools to conduct the interviews. This impacted on the research process as some of the interviews were conducted in an unsettling environment for both the researcher and the respondents.

The *fifth limitation* is that tenured teachers were not interviewed to contrast their views to those of contract teachers, as well as provide further insights into the research question. This was because at the time of conducting the interviews, the researcher did not envisage that the views of tenured teachers would enrich the quality of the study.

The *sixth limitation* is that the random sample yielded more women than male respondents. As a result, on some issues, the views of male contract teachers were not reflected.

The *seventh limitation* is that the views of pupils taught by contract teachers were not included in this research. This oversight denied pupils the opportunity to express their views of being taught by a contract teacher today. This aspect would have provided insights into the way in which and the extent to which learning takes place when the complex teacher/pupil relationship does not exist

#### 3.8 Conclusion

Through the use of open-ended and semi-structured interviews complemented by secondary literature, the research provides insights into the nature of casualisation of teachers' work including its gendered dimension. Furthermore, unlike existing studies, the research recognises and defines contract teachers as a sub-category within the national teaching corps. Lastly, the research challenges existing theories, which sees casualisation as a deskilling process for all workers. Alternatively, it shows that the casualisation of the teaching labour process is a re-skilling process and provides work opportunities for a small number of contract teachers.

## **Chapter Four**

# A historical background to the casualisation of teachers' work: a gendered perspective

#### 4.1 Introduction

Apartheid education policy was founded on the principle of Christian National Education, which emphasised the superiority of the Afrikaner race. Because of this ideological undertone of racial inequality, the implementation of Apartheid education policy took many forms: segregated schooling was legislated for Africans in 1953, Coloureds in 1963 and Indians in 1965. This provided an ideological cornerstone for the social segregation, economic exploitation and political oppression of these groups, calibrated according to their location within the racial hierarchical social system (Nkomo 1990). Because of this emphasis on racial superiority, the Nationalist government channelled more resources to white education than to the education of any of the other race groups. Apartheid policy was also reflected in the denial of equal access to training resources for teachers depending on their racial classification.

The result is a fragmented qualification system, which developed for teachers along racial lines. From the 1950s through to the 1970s, there were different teacher qualification requirements set by the various racially defined education departments. African teachers were encouraged to obtain teaching certificates with as little as a formal Standard 6 certificate, while white teachers entered teacher training institutions with a School Leaving or Matriculation Certificate (Budlender 1996). Until 1983, there was no national standard governing teacher qualifications. Consequently, many black educators have been teaching without the relevant qualifications.

This chapter examines the history of the casualisation of the teachers' work as it developed during the Apartheid era. It begins by examining the four factors, which serve as a background for the casualisation of teachers' work. The **first** factor was the fragmented

teacher training qualification system. The **second** factor was the unequal conditions of employment. The **third** factor was the political decisions such as the *marriage bar* of 1912 and the Bantu Education Act in 1953. These factors resulted in a gendered hierarchy in teaching that relegated women teachers, especially black women, to the lower strata of teaching.

## 4.2 Women's unequal access to teacher training

From its formation, the education system in Natal<sup>32</sup> has been racially segregated and directed primarily towards white education. In the first few years of Natal as a colony, there were very few women teachers. Indeed, the first woman teacher was employed in 1847 in a white government school. She was offered 'the situation of teacher of a Free School, with a salary of £75 per annum' (Vietzen 1973: 20). Apart from state schools, women teachers were however employed by 'ladies' academies' or in private schools. These women teachers had little formal training beyond their own schooling (Vietzen 1973: 326). They drew on their own classroom experiences as the only form of preparation for teaching practice. These factors made their employment positions very tenuous because there was no established system of education to recognise teachers' qualifications in the Province of Natal. Vietzen captures the British influence on women's education when she says 'Victorian man, in Natal as in England, liked his women to be respectable and good, accomplished and socially competent; where necessary, practical, but certainly not scholarly' (Vietzen 1973: 23). At this time women's education emphasised languages, music, sewing and drawing skills and was not meant to prepare them for a teaching career.

Vietzen (1973) study shows that the first teacher-training courses for white women were offered at the Maritzburg High School for Girls (Vietzen 1973:313) which was established in February 1894<sup>33</sup>. And in 1904 the Third Class Teachers' Certificate was introduced for white

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Natal became a colony of Britain in 1845. It became part of the Union of South Africa in 1910 and later part of the Republic in 1961. Each of these stages was accompanied by shifts in government responsibility for education provision, policy and financing. In each of the stages government education policy encouraged the employment of white women teachers in white girls-only schools because this promoted the separation of the sexes. In contrast, the development of black co-educational primary schools but secondary education had separate schools for boys and girls. This is a legacy which continues in present day Natal.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> The first government boys' high school in Natal was opened in 1863. In 1914 the 'Girls Model School' became the Durban High School for Girls.

women who were enrolled on teacher-training courses. Unlike their male counterparts, women entering teachers' colleges did not require a matriculation certificate. When the Natal Teachers' Training College was established in 1909, women who had only completed the Third Class Teachers' Certificate were denied admission. This was because they lacked the relevant entrance qualification, a matriculation (matric) certificate. Because of this more men were admitted to the teacher's training colleges as they had the relevant matric certificate (Blampied 1989).

The training of African women teachers took a different contour. As Hartshorne (1992) notes, English speaking church missions played a major role in teacher's training for Africans in Natal. Many mission schools were provided with grants-in-aid<sup>34</sup> but the sums tended to be minimal (Hughes 1990: 199). Initially, mission education aimed to train African girls as 'Christian wives and domestic servants' (Gaitskell 1988: 159). In addition, the brightest girls were to be trained as teachers, wives of teachers and preachers (Gaitskell 1988).

The American Board Missionaries established the Inanda Seminary in 1869 as one of the first teacher's training institutions in Natal. Initially it was established as a boarding school for daughters of African Christian converts because, at the time, teaching and nursing were the two professions open to black women. To enter teaching, black women adopted two strategies. They either enrolled for a teacher-training course at institutions such as Inanda Seminary, or they acquired learning by doing -- by teaching in the classroom.

At the Inanda Seminary, most women were trained as general teachers and sewing mistresses. The curriculum emphasised domestic education and sewing, similar to that of white women teachers. By 1885, some 66 African women teachers had successfully completed their studies at the Inanda seminary. A year later, the syllabus was changed and teacher's training was upgraded. It was only in 1900 that the students of the seminary sat for the Third Class Government Teachers' Certificate, the recognised qualification for black teachers<sup>35</sup> (Hughes 1990). The education of these African women prepared them to teach only in the primary school system.

39

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Grants-in-aid system was a government subsidy paid to a school for every pupil who enrolled at a government school

<sup>35</sup> From 1909 teacher education was transferred to Adams College.

From the narrative above, two points are clear amongst others. First, it shows a historical development of teachers' education in Natal. Second, it shows that there were no uniform accreditation system as there existed different teaching qualifications between male and female teachers on the one hand, and between White and African teachers on the other. Hartshorne (1992) highlighted a separate but related point. He notes that there was 'little formality or uniformity of curriculum, examination and qualifications existed in African teacher's training until the early years of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, so there were considerable differences between institutions and amongst the four territories' (Hartshorne 1992: 222). For example, the absence of a widespread system of African secondary schools meant that teacher training schools were the only options available for African students to further their education beyond elementary school. This had the effect of racialising teachers' certificates because African women teachers received a Third Class Teachers' Certificate equivalent to Standard 4. In contrast, Coloured, Indian and White women teachers received certificates after three years of teacher-training equivalent to Std 8. (Hartshorne 1992: 226). The absence of a uniform system of teacher qualifications made it considerably easier for government to constrain black women's mobility through the different sectors of the education system.

# 4.3.1 Attempts to standardise teachers' qualifications: Developing an accreditation system (1930-1960s)

By 1936, in Natal province (like in the Cape Province), there was a slow movement towards the co-ordination and standardisation of teacher training courses. This however had the adverse effect of further entrenching the marginalization of women teachers. For instance, the higher primary teachers certificate courses were developed and standardised for male teachers while the lower primary teaching certificate was restricted to women (Hartshorne 1992). Put differently, the standardisation, which encouraged African women to enter the post-Std 6-certificate programme further entrenched the relegation of African women to the lower primary school system. It is worth noting that, the upgrading of qualifications in order to standardise the accreditation process became a double-edged sword. For example, the women teachers who qualified with a post-Std 4 (Third Class Certificate) certificate before the 1930s were rendered underqualified when the post-Std 6 certificate was introduced.

This gender implication of the shifting qualifications for teaching, in Natal, became evident in several ways than one. For example, when in 1937 the Education Commission recommended that principalships should be open to both white men and women, there were few white women teachers eligible for principalship. This was because the majority of white women only had two years of teachers training compared to their male counterparts with four-year training certificates (Blampied 1989). In effect, access to promotion continued to be influenced by the skewing of career development based on educational qualifications, which in turn were gendered and racially biased.

Blampied identified two factors that prevented promotion opportunities for white women in the teaching hierarchy. **First**, women did not work for long enough periods to acquire the relevant experience necessary to rise to senior positions. **Second**, female teachers were discouraged from writing the matriculation examination. As a result, white women teachers were less qualified and experienced than their male counterparts, a situation that restricted their eligibility for promotion based on merit (Blampied 1989: 15).

However, there was no uniformity in teachers' qualification even at this period. At the same time -- until 1951, most African education in Natal, became increasingly dependent on state funds for teacher training and salaries, in spite of the fact that it remained in the hands of the missionaries (Gaitskell 1984). It was during this period that the Nationalist Party government in its attempt to meet the labour needs of commerce recognised how the lower educational standards of black teachers impacted on the learning needs of the potential labour force.

In addition, the lack of standardisation facilitated the implementation of Christian National Education (CNE) that promoted racial segregation in favour of white education. Towards this end, the Bantu Education Act was enacted with the aim of entrenching inferior education for Africans by establishing a centralised Bantu Education Department. As a result of this Act, there was the massive expansion of schooling for Africans. This in turn resulted in a massive demand for African teachers since the new system reserved posts in African schools for African teachers.

To meet the increased demand for African teachers, according to De Vries (1989), the Apartheid government deliberately kept the entry-level qualifications lower for black teachers. For amongst other reasons, this was intended to save costs of training African teachers and to pay them lower salaries.

Mkhize (1989) states that the supply of African teachers failed to keep pace with the rapid increase in pupil enrolment. This was because the lack of school facilities, large classes and increasing double shift classes of African pupils, in most parts of the country, had the effect of not only increasing the workload but also creating education ghettos for unqualified teachers. Hartshorne (1992) notes that the early years of Bantu Education witnessed a drop in student teachers' enrolment, from 5899 in 1955 to 3697 in 1961. The closure of the missionary institutions and the uncertainty faced by the other colleges was the major reason for this drop. In effect, this rapid expansion of the schooling system created large numbers of unqualified African teachers. It was only in 1970 that enrolment figures for student teachers began to show a substantial increase. Enrolment figures for primary school teachers increased twofold and there was a 10-fold increase in enrolments for secondary teachers (Hartshorne 1992). Nonetheless, a large percentage of the African teaching corps remained unqualified, especially those who worked in the farm schools under the DET<sup>36</sup>.

For teachers of Indian descent, teacher training facilities were marginally<sup>37</sup> better than those provided for their African counterparts. In 1951 Springfield Training College was opened in Durban to offer the higher primary certificate and secondary teachers' training course. By the time the Department of Indian Affairs was handed responsibility for teacher training in 1965, two diploma courses were offered based on compulsory entrance qualification of Std 10. For Coloured teachers Bechet High School offered teacher-training courses.

<sup>36</sup> Hartshorne (1992) pointed out that in certain Bantu homelands, the farm schools under the DET had a large percentage of unqualified African teachers.

Selected secondary schools in Durban and Pietermaritzburg offered teacher training until 1930 when Sastri College was established. From 1936, the University of Natal instituted classes for Coloured and Indians wishing to study for degrees prior to taking the university-based higher diploma in education.

## 4.3.2 Standardisation of teachers qualifications post - 1976

From 1977, all colleges of education offered a three and four year diploma for teachers (Behr 1988). These reforms came in the wake of the 1970s student unrest and the acknowledgement by the state that black education was in crisis. The education reforms instituted, as a result, the De Lange Commission (1981) which heralded a new direction for education with its emphasis on 'expanding technical and industrial training, on boosting vocational education, on instituting universal, compulsory school attendance, on upgrading worker efficiency and promoting skills production and on the need to drastically improve linguistic proficiencies...' (Nasson 1990: 152). The idea of equal but separate education for all was the main thrust of the De Lange Commission. One of the recommendations of the De Lange Commission was parity in salaries for all teachers with similar qualifications. Parity in salaries was to be linked with qualification.

In 1983, education authorities announced that the national norm for all teachers was to be set at Standard 10 plus three years of professional training (M+3) (Government White Paper 1983 cited in Hofmeyr et al 1993). This policy decision on teacher qualifications rendered the majority of African teachers underqualified. This was because, at the time, about 80% of African teachers possessed only a Std 8 qualification plus one or two years of professional training (Mhkize 1989: 53).

As a result, 42% of all teachers in 1985 were undertaking in-service training to obtain a qualification to conform to the state's definition of a qualified teacher (SAIRR 1986 cited in De Vries 1989). The need for a better-qualified national teacher corps, especially the modernisation of black education was essentially to meet the needs of commerce and industry. Between 1988 and 1992, concerted attempts by education institutions were made to reduce the number of underqualified teachers. This led to a 'certificate paper chase' by teachers and it had the effect of shifting their goal in education from teaching pupils to that of passing their own examinations (De Vries 1989). A consequence of the implementation of a national teaching norm was a reduction of the underqualified teachers from 50% to 38.4% within four years (1988 to 1992). This was done through various incentive schemes including the provision of up-grading programmes (Hofmeyr et al 1993).

Shortly before the restructuring of the education system in 1994/5, according to Hofmeyr and Hall (1995) 36% of all teachers were un/underqualified. They also indicated that 40% of all women teachers were underqualified. Most of the un/underqualified teachers were African (60%) and located in primary schools. At the same time 21% of African secondary teachers were un/underqualified (Hofmeyr and Hall 1995: 31).

These historical events have impacted on the feminisation<sup>38</sup> of schooling in general and the primary school in particular. In 1991 there were 6:1 female to male teachers and this rose to 8:1 in 1995 (Chisholm 1998a: 7). Although the numbers of underqualified teachers decreased from 38.4% in 1992 to 36% in 1995, these figures disguised the continuing, extreme inequalities between black and white teachers. In Kwazulu/Natal, statistics indicated that more than 40% of all teachers had five years or less teaching experience. Thus, large numbers of unqualified and inexperienced female teachers are located in the African school system (Chisholm 1998a: 7).

I proceed with a further explication of how cultural factors and education policy that impacted on casualising women teachers' work.

# 4.4 Cultural and political attitudes that reinforce women teachers' subordination

South African women, especially black women, have used teaching as an avenue to enter the world of work. Women are clustered in occupations like teaching, nursing and librarianship. These are traditionally female occupations where women are numerically the majority, although not as a homogenous group in terms of access to power, status and privilege. These occupations reflect the role of women, especially black women, as that of nurturers and caregivers. This view is reinforced, according to Truscott (1992:16), because society expects men to carry the responsibility in the world of paid employment and for men to act in positions of authority and responsibility. As a result, when women enter the formal labour market they are employed in work akin to their societal role. Thus, even in professions where women are numerically dominant, they are still relegated to the lowest strata within these professions.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Feminisation of primary school teaching is as a result of an explicit political decision. See later section.

Women's societal roles as nurturer, caretaker, mother figure and disciplinarian were reproduced or institutionalised within the formal schooling system, especially in the primary school phase where their work has little or no prestige. A gender analysis of teaching evokes feelings that teaching for women is akin to mothering. The development of a cult of maternal nurturance within the school system impacted adversely on women teachers' career opportunities. The first was the decision by education authorities to deny married women teachers access to tenured posts through the 1912 Regulation 4 of Notice 206 of the Natal Provincial Gazette. It states that '(A)ll women teachers must vacate their appointments on marriage' (Blampied 1989: 13). The implication of this law was that married women were denied permanent employment. Upon return to work, they were employed as contract teachers. In effect, the marriage bar laid the foundation for the casualisation of married women teachers' work. It therefore restricted access to tenured posts and career development to male and single women teachers.

These women contract teachers had to renewed their employment contract annually and were not entitled to service benefits such as housing subsidies, pension funds, medical aids and maternity rights nor were they eligible for promotion. These discriminatory practices were applied to all married women teachers. In Kotecha (1992) words,

The conditions of service for women teachers in all departments have disadvantaged women ... Discriminatory conditions of service diminishes the general status of women teachers as professionals; the outdated notion that women teach because it is 'a fill-in' job rather than a life-long career like men...(Kotecha 1992: 8).

The second reason was the legislation of the Bantu Education Act of 1953. The Bantu Education Act placed African education in the hands of the central government. A consequence of this Act was that the education authorities actively discouraged men from teaching at primary school level. According to Budlender (cited in Kotecha 1992), men were 'fired or phased out' of the primary teacher system. The few who remained to teach in primary schools did so on the condition that they accepted lower pay. In other words, the Act restricted African women to teach in primary schools, which is the lowest stratum of the schooling system. The lot of black female teachers was worse because they were 'made to carry the burden of... Bantu education as well as pay the price for the expansion of black schooling at the expense of their salaries and working conditions' (Truscott1992: 18). The

### words of H. F. Verwoerd illustrates this point. According to him,

As a woman is by nature so much better fitted for handling young children, and as the great majority of Bantu children are to found in the lower classes of primary school, it follows that there should be far more female than male teachers. The department will therefore.... Declare the assistant post in... primary school to be female teachers' posts... Quota will be laid down at training schools as regards numbers of male and female candidates respectively which may be allowed to enter for these courses.... This measure will, in the course of time, bring about considerable saving of funds which can be devoted to... more children at schools (quoted in Behr 1988: 179).

These two laws, the 'Marriage Bar' and the Bantu Education Act, achieved their aim of producing large numbers of teachers to fill the primary school system.

However, the education ministry over time, incrementally conceded tenure to married women who were suitably qualified. In 1970, the HOA granted permanent positions to white women teachers and in 1977 the HOD granted the same for Indian women. Similarly, in 1980, the DET extended the right to permanent teaching positions to African women teachers. Coloured women were the last category of teachers' to enjoy such rights as the HOR only extended it to them in 1984. These concessions were made within the confines of equal but separate educational departments. Service benefits were not automatically extended to women teachers. It took years of struggle, and only after the enthronement of formal democracy (in 1995), before women were granted maternity leave and pension fund benefits.

In contrast, African men entered training institutions with higher entrance qualifications, which enhanced their opportunities for career advancement to senior positions at the expense of their female counterparts. For example, by 1988, the concept of incremental improvements in the conditions of service resulted in 50% of all black male teachers being placed on par with their white male and female counterparts (Mkhize 1989). Consequently, a gender hierarchy existed where only 4% of all women teachers were principals compared to 11% of all men teachers by the time of the democratic election in 1994 (Wolpe et al 1997).

### 4.5 Conclusion

This chapter has provided a historical background to the casualisation of teachers' work. The absence of a standardised qualification system, 'the Marriage Bar' and the Bantu Education act serve as a background to the casualisation of teachers' work. not only in Durban but the whole of South Africa.

## **Chapter Five**

## **Research Findings**

### 5.1 Introduction

In this chapter I present the findings of my research to show evidence of contract teaching as women teachers' work. As indicated earlier, the sample size of the research is small and therefore cannot be generalised. It nevertheless provides useful insights into the phenomenon of contract teaching. The research findings based on interviews with men and women contract teachers are complemented by national statistics published by the National Teacher Audit (Hofmeyr and Hall 1995) and GETT (Wolpe et al 1997). Additionally, the opinions of the principals and male teachers provided a counterpoint or a comparative benchmark by which to evaluate the norms of women teachers. Together, the research findings and the national studies provide insights into casualisation of teaching.

In the first section of this chapter I develop a profile of the contract teachers that I interviewed. In the second section, I present the different views of teachers employed in the four racially defined education departments. The primary purpose for presenting the data in this format is to reflect the paradox of contract teaching for these teachers. I also present their views with the aim of highlighting how casualisation impacted on the pupil/teacher relationship. I contrast/complement these views with those of principals<sup>39</sup>.

### 5.2 Profile and location of Contract Teachers

At each of the schools that were chosen as part of the random sample, I requested interviews with both men and women teachers who had contract employment<sup>40</sup>. Although there were no

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Henceforth, all interviews with principals will be prefixed with P.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Principals were reluctant to show me the list of teachers on the staff. Therefore, the teachers interviewed are those presented to me as the entire complement of temporary teachers at each school I sampled. As indicated in

national statistics for contract teachers, some principals and a planner told me that 10% of the teaching corps at each school held temporary posts. According to them this figure is prescribed for public schools in South Africa. These are temporary posts occupied by teachers who are on maternity, sick leave or on sabbatical. Tenured teachers often take early retirement during the school year or resign at short notice and are replaced by contract teachers until the position is advertised in the Government Gazette. Education authorities employed both tenured and contract teachers in government schools. From the interviews conducted with contract teachers employed in government schools, only one teacher said that she occupied the post of a teacher on sabbatical<sup>41</sup> while the others held posts designated for tenured teachers.

However, the Model C schools sampled had a different set of employment conditions. Although the majority of teachers employed at Model C schools were tenured, there existed a second category of teacher who holds contract posts, ranging from one hour to one academic year. The School Management Board and the HOA education authorities employ the former and the latter respectively (The conditions of employment of these teachers will be discussed in detail in Section 5.2.2).

Contract teachers, in this sample, were located in both the primary and secondary schools. 22% and 78% of these were located in primary and secondary schools<sup>42</sup> respectively. These contract teachers, in line with apartheid policy, were employed in schools meant for pupils with the same racial background as themselves<sup>43</sup>

## 5.2.1 Gender profile

Of the 96 contract teachers interviewed there were more women than men on contract, 72% were and 28% respectively. Table 1 indicates where men and women contract teachers, in the

Chapter 4, I interviewed from 3 to 12 teachers in each school.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Interview with Language teacher employed in DET School. Interview conducted on 18 February 1994. Ref T8. Ref T8 means that a contract teacher in the DET school was interviewed. Henceforth, all interviews with contract teachers are prefixed with T.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> The figures reveal that the majority of high school teachers in this sample were located in the HOR. The majority of primary school teachers were located in the HOD.

<sup>43</sup> There were two exceptions to this racial allocation of contract teachers. The first instance was an Indian Male

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> There were two exceptions to this racial allocation of contract teachers. The first instance was an Indian Male teacher who taught Art in a Model C School located in the white suburb of Sherwood Park. The second example is an Indian female teacher who taught Physical Science at a Boys' High School located in the white suburb of Glenwood.

sample, were located. As shown in Table 1, the HOR and DET schools had the largest and smallest number of women contract teachers respectively<sup>44</sup>. At the same time, the HOR and DET schools had the largest and smallest numbers of male contract teachers respectively.

Table 1: Gender breakdown

Gender	HOA	HOD	DET	HOR	Total %
Male	6.25	8.26	3.08	10.41	28
Female	18.28	20.39	11.69	29.5	72

This research on contract teachers indicates that there were more women than men with contractual appointments. This should not be surprising because the majority, 64%, of the national teaching corps is women teachers (Hofmeyr and Hall 1995). It is therefore logical that women teachers would be mostly affected by casualisation. The national statistics also indicate that the bulk of underqualified teachers are women. Indeed, 40% of all women teachers are underqualified (Hofmeyr and Hall 1995: 31). The national studies did not, however, indicate the number of qualified teachers who hold contract posts. In addition, it should be observed that underqualification should not be conflated with casualisation.

Chisholm's study shows that in 1997, 60 000 temporary and substitute teachers employed nationally faced the prospect of unemployment. Most of these teachers, according to Chisholm, were women teachers located on farm or rural settlement schools (Chisholm 1998a: 8).

## 5.2.2 Types of contract employment

Two categories of contract teachers emerged from the interviews conducted. The first category is *temporary teachers*. This group of teacher has a one-year fixed term contract. Temporary teachers are not able to determine which subjects they teach. This decision is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> As indicated in Ch 3, if the entire sample of 120 contract teachers had been interviewed then the DET sample would have been larger. Therefore, the % of women contract teachers employed in DET schools would have been larger, possibly reflecting the national statistics on African women being the most underqualified of the teaching corps.

made based on the academic needs of the school and the ability of the teacher to negotiate, based on teaching experience and knowledge of the subject. But once employed they are expected to perform duties similar to those with tenure. The largest numbers of temporary teachers in the sample were located in the HOD (22) followed by the HOA (20), the HOR (13). and the smallest number was found in the DET (11). The second category of teacher is referred to as substitute teachers (or locum tenens). These teachers were employed for a period ranging from one day to one term. They were employed to replace teachers on shortterm leave of absence. Substitute teachers had no lesson plans and have very little knowledge of the pupils before accepting the contract. They were in a holding position. As such they were required to teach lessons according to the prescribed syllabus handed to them by the principal. In this research, the HOR's schools had the highest number of substitute teachers -- 20 followed by the HOD (6) while the DET and HOA 's schools had the lowest number (1) each. Within this group, there is also a sub-category of teachers employed by the School Management Board. These are substitute teachers who were located in HOA schools, which were government subsidized Model C schools. These teachers were employed on an hourly basis<sup>45</sup>. Two of the contract teachers interviewed were employed on hourly basis.

Table 2. Number of teachers on temporary contracts

Department	Temporary	Substitute	School funds
HOA	20	1	2
HOR	13	20	0
HOD	22	6	0
DET	11	1	0

For the purposes of clarity I will be referring to these different categories as contract teachers in the remainder of this study.

As indicated earlier, not all the contract teachers employed occupied posts of teachers on sabbatical or sick leave. Most of the contract teachers in the sample held teaching positions that were meant for tenured teachers. Put differently, contract teachers who were suitably qualified occupied tenured posts in a temporary capacity. One principal said 'principals use

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> No temporary or substitute teachers employed by the School Management Board were interviewed as part of this sample.

their discretion to place teachers on contract posts even when such positions were designated permanent posts'46. Most of the respondents said they accepted contract posts with the hope of securing permanent positions once they had served a probationary period. These teachers were however very insecure and uncertain about the possibility of securing a tenured post. The anxiety and insecurity of these teachers is well articulated by one of the female respondents when she lamented:

I often am very threatened because I feel that I am under constant surveillance by the principal who is waiting for me to do something wrong so he can terminate my appointment. In such a working environment you loose your confidence and this affects your performance<sup>47</sup>.

A great deal of uncertainty existed amongst contract teachers employed in the DET schools. Most contract teachers lacked information on the status of posts and often made career changes based on inaccurate information they received from education authorities. For example, a male teacher 'had been unaware that the post he occupied for the past four years was held by someone else'. This teacher only became aware that he occupied a temporary post because SADTU carried out an investigation into the large number of temporary teachers in that school. In the course of the investigation it was discovered that he also occupied someone else's post. Since receiving that information he noted, 'I come to school everyday with the fear that the permanent teacher will return and that my job is gone. How am I supposed to perform my duties under such stressful work conditions'48? A female teacher with contractual employment expressed similar anxiety about her position. For two years she has been occupying the post of an acting head of department who is male. She feared that as long as the post of the acting head of department is not confirmed, her position hangs in the balance<sup>49</sup>. This job insecurity affected teachers in all the racially defined education departments. In spite of these insecurities, most of the teachers accepted contract posts because, they said, it was generally better to have a teaching post with insecure work conditions than to remain unemployed. Most respondents said they would prefer tenured posts, if they were given a choice.

The explanation for the presence of contract teachers by most of the principals in the sample is that they were unaware of the status of some of these posts -- whether they were tenured or not. This according to them, was because in the period of the transition, education policies

<sup>46</sup> Principal employed in HOR school. Interview conducted on 2 February 1994. Ref P 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> A woman teacher at a boys high school in HOA. Interview conducted with teacher C on 21 February 1994. Ref T4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Interview with Male teacher employed in DET School. Interview conducted on 25 February 1994. Ref T11A

including those that regulate teacher/pupil ratios were changing rapidly, of which principals said they were not duly informed<sup>50</sup>.

## **5.2.3** Years of teaching experience

Table 3 indicates that teachers with contract forms of employment were mostly newly qualified and had less than 5 years of teaching experience. Surprisingly, the HOD schools sampled had the least experienced contract teachers - 86% of respondents in these schools had less than 5 years experience. At the same time, 4% of interviewees in HOD schools had more than 26 years teaching experience.

Table 3: Number of year's service

No. of years	HOA	HOD	DET	HOR
Less than 5 years	48%	86%	75%	61%
6-10 years	22%	7%	17%	27%
11 - 15 years	9%	4%	8%	6%
16-20 years	17%	0%	0%	6%
21-25 years	4%	0%	0%	0%
26 - 30 years	0%	4%	0%	0%

Table 3 further indicates a considerable percentage of inexperienced teachers. This is confirmed by the national study, which shows that 40% of teachers in

Kwazulu /Natal, Mpumalanga and the Eastern Cape have five or less years teaching experience (Hofmeyr and Hall 1995). This relationship between qualification and number of years of teaching experience will be explained in Chapter 6.

## 5.2.4 Qualifications of Respondents<sup>51</sup>

A Matric certificate plus three years of teacher training has been the official teaching qualification since 1983. As it is shown in Table 4, the majority of the respondents in this

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Interview with male teacher employed in DET School. Interview conducted on 25 February 1994. Ref T11A

Deputy Principal employed in DET School. Interview conducted on 18 February 1994. Ref P7 and Principal employed in DET school. Interview conducted on 18 February 1994. Ref P 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> About 8% of the respondents did not reveal their qualifications.

sample are qualified with the HOR and HOA having the largest number of qualified teachers. In terms of racial categories, it was the coloured and white contract teachers who were the most qualified, in this sample.

**Table 4: Qualifications of Respondents** 

Categories of qualification	НОА	HOD	DET	HOR	Total
Teaching diploma	19	16	7	33	75
Underqualified	3	7	4	0	14
Total number of respondents	22	23	11	33	89

The low levels of qualifications by black teachers in general and African teachers in particular have been a major concern for academics and teachers alike. De Vries (1989) notes that the Apartheid government deliberately kept the entry-level qualifications lower for black teachers to save costs of training thus paying low salaries to African teachers. This situation according to him accounted for the fact that 42% of teachers in African schools in 1985 were un/underqualified. Recent studies have revealed that a third of the total national teaching corps are un/underqualified. As indicated earlier, the bulk of women teachers are underqualified. (Hofmeyr and Hall 1995: 31). The racial discrepancy in qualifications was a result of Apartheid policies by which unequal funding was provided for the different racial groupings. Put differently, depending on where a teacher was situated on the racial ladder, s/he had access to resources accordingly. Within this racial framework, white teachers' training had the best provision and African teachers' training the worst.

In summary this study, based on interviews with 96 contract men and women teachers located in four of the five education departments based in Durban shows that:

- 1. there are more female teachers with contract employment than men, and
- 2. the largest number of underqualified teachers are employed in the African schools, and
- 3. The majority of contract teachers were qualified but had less than five years teaching experience.

# 5.3 Contract teaching: The erosion of teachers' autonomy over the teaching labour process

In this section I draw on the qualitative interviews to present insights into the working world of the respondents. I contrast the views of teachers employed in the four racially defined education departments in order to assess whether there were similarities or differences based on racial classification. The section examines three aspects of contract work as a form of discrimination for some teachers and an opportunity for work for others. First, contract teaching is a form of deskilling of the teaching labour process, which in particular, reduces the autonomy and influence teachers have over their work. The second aspect highlighted is the gendered nature of contract teaching. The third aspect is the conditions of work.

Lastly, I present contract teachers' views of their employment status as an opportunity to earn a steady income and diversity of skills. This is the paradox of contract teaching. That is, while some contract teachers see it as a form of discrimination, others regard it as an opportunity.

I should reiterate that because of the size of the sample, it is not possible to generalise. Nonetheless, it provides insights into the world of work of contract teachers.

# 5.3.1 Impact of casualisation on the autonomy and control of teachers' work

Most of the respondents pointed out that contract teaching impacted adversely on their work. They viewed contract teaching as a form of job discrimination. In several ways they show that contract teaching has become a form of deskilling in the teaching labour process, which in particular reduces the autonomy and influence that teachers have over their work.

Most contract teachers felt that both their appointment and the allocation of teaching subjects were made in an arbitrary and undemocratic manner. Most of the respondents accepted any post and subject offered to them because they felt that getting a job was better than being

unemployed. Because of their desperation to find teaching work they agreed to teach subjects for which they did not have expertise. These teachers said that they needed a teaching post because it would provide them with an income to fend for themselves and their families.

These contract teachers taught various subjects at different times of the academic year. The case of an HOD female teacher aptly illustrates this point. Her speciality was Home Economics for pupils in secondary schools. Within one academic year, she taught different subjects at two different schools. In the first six months, she taught Home Economics and Lifeskills to high school pupils. In the 7<sup>th</sup> month, she taught music, communication and deportment. In August, she moved to a primary school where she taught English, Art, Lifeskills and guidance' Commenting on how this process impacted on the teaching labour process, she said,

I think not teaching my subject consistently has set me back a bit. Having to teach other subjects, I haven't kept abreast with developments in my subject, as I would have to if I had taught my subject. I became detached from Home Economics for a while.

The experience of a male contract teacher in DET School supports this viewpoint. He had this to say,

Over the past four years I taught at four different high schools. I taught Biology and Physical Science for approximately four months before taking up a post at another high school. At the second school I taught Physical and General Science to junior pupils for six months. In 1992, I moved to the third school as a Mathematics teacher. Since 1993, I was employed in the fourth school to teach Physical Science to Std 9 and Mathematics to junior pupils. This is now my second year in this school and I am teaching Mathematics and General Science. Stanford Science 1993, I was employed in the fourth school science 1993, I was employed in the fourth school to teach Physical Science to Std 9 and Mathematics and General Science.

He expressed frustration for teaching different subjects to different grades of students and the impact of this on his work. He said that initially he disliked having to change over from one school to another as it prevented him from building relationships with his pupils. Now he feels uneasy about the change in subjects because he has not had an opportunity to teach the same class for two consecutive years. Most of the contract teachers said that the rapid changeover of schools and subjects was disorientating. As a result they could not get to grips with any particular subject. The lack of specialisation, they said, affected their chances of securing a tenured post.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Interview with Home Economics teacher employed in HOD school. Interview with Teacher no. 2 conducted on 24 February 1994. Ref T13

Some of the respondents however pointed out that teaching subjects for which they were not qualified broadened their knowledge. They further observed that when a teacher had consecutive contracts, s/he teaches all the time, hence the development and accumulation of teaching skills. Although this was seen as a means toward acquiring teaching experience, it was associated with a loss of specialist knowledge and skill. This, they observed ultimately disadvantaged them<sup>54</sup>.

Overall, teaching subjects for which they did not hold expertise eroded teachers' ability to influence the content of the curriculum. Because of the short-term nature of contract work, most teachers said they were excluded from subject/curriculum planning meetings. As a result they said they were unable to influence teaching methods or assignments related to their subject. Also they said that they lose skills in the course of teaching several subjects unrelated to their specialisation. This is in addition to increasing workloads. According to them, one reason for this they have to stand in at short-notice for tenured teachers who become ill or go on compassionate leave. As one teacher noted:

I have to teach several subjects to different classes when any of the tenured teachers go on short-leave of absence. There are days when I teach all day. I teach these subjects with very little preparation. What bogs me down is the amount of work you have to do even at a short notice<sup>55</sup>.

The experience of another respondent is also illustrative. She said:

I had the experience where the senior teacher who was pregnant<sup>56</sup> left in the last term. I had to set six examination papers and read the novel. She hadn't left a draft of the examination papers for English literature and language<sup>57</sup>.

The short-term nature of the contract does affect the craft of teaching as contract teachers employed at short notice combat the status of being presenters of information. According to them, unlike their tenured colleagues, syllabi/subjects are handed to them, irrespective of their specialisation. Most respondents said they did not form part of the departmental planning team and have very little influence in shaping the curriculum. As a result they had to find innovative teaching methods to ensure pupils' engagement with the curriculum.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Interview with Teacher employed in DET School. Interview conducted on 25 February 1994. Ref T11A.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Interview with teacher employed at HOR School. Interview with teacher no. B conducted on 25 January 1994. Ref T13.

<sup>55</sup> Interview with teacher employed in HOD school. Interview conducted on 28 February 1994. Ref T7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> The department has particular rules on the length of service for women who are pregnant. If a woman teacher does not satisfy those regulations the education department will deny leave payments, etc.

## 5.3.2 Contract teaching as job discrimination

At the time of conducting this research there were several racially defined education departments. The employment of contract teachers followed the procedure laid down by particular departments<sup>58</sup>. Contract teachers applied for posts advertised in the Government Gazette or local newspapers. Unlike their tenured counterparts, contract teachers did not receive service benefits such as housing subsidies, medical aid, maternity leave and pension<sup>59</sup>.

Respondents said that their accumulated teaching experience or qualifications were not taken into consideration by principals when an appointment was made. A woman employed in an HOD school lamented:

I have to pick up the pieces where someone else left off. Because teachers are resigning they leave administrative duties like setting examination papers for the new teacher. Principals employ me because they realise I am desperate to work <sup>60</sup>.

Another female contract teacher in an HOD school had similar experiences to share. She qualified as a teacher four years ago. Within this period, she had taught as a locum tenens for three years in six different schools. The longest period she stayed in any particular school was less than three months. Commenting on the conditions of service, she said,

The conditions of service are not good because you lose out on your salary. They (the education administration) only pay you for the days you go to school. If you are sick or you are absent because your child is ill, there is no-work-no-pay<sup>61</sup>.

Some respondents who have held tenured posts said they accepted contract posts after a break in service. Resigning from a teaching post is considered termination of a tenured post. On their return to teaching, experienced and qualified teachers entered the school system as new recruits. As one male teacher puts it:

I resigned after five years of teaching. When I returned after a break, I began as a contract teacher. That is why I do not have tenure today 62.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Interview with teacher employed in HOD school. Interview conducted on 10 February 1994. Ref T5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> This procedure has changed since the introduction of the Education Labour Relations Councils (1994).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Since 1995 these discriminatory practices have been removed.

Interview with teacher employed in HOD school. Interview conducted on 10 February 1994. Ref T5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Interview with teacher employed in HOD school. Interview conducted on 23 February 1994. Ref T10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Interview with male teacher employed in HOD school. Interview conducted on 25 February 1994. Ref T12A

Before, the implementation of the Labour Relations Act (1997), education authorities could transfer a contract teacher without giving the incumbent prior notification. In turn, teachers could request a transfer to another school. One respondent said:

I applied to be transferred to another school because I thought the position was a permanent one. On transfer I worked at the school for two years before I was informed that I occupied another teacher's post<sup>63</sup>.

## 5.3.3 Contract teaching as a work opportunity

There were however, some respondents who regarded contract teaching as an opportunity to gain teaching skills, accumulate work experience and earn an income. A few contract teachers said they preferred part-time to full-time teaching. A female respondent employed by the Management Committee of an HOA school said she enjoyed contract teaching because it enabled her to spend more time with her children, as well as supplement the family income. In her words:

I teach classes in the morning while my children are in pre-school. I would prefer to be at home caring for them. I also supplement our family income so being unemployed is not a major financial blow<sup>64</sup>.

Another female teacher expressed similar views. According to her:

When my children are at primary school and finish their day at 2 o'clock... then I will definitely take a permanent post. But at the moment, they're still small. They're in pre-school, so right now I would rather be with them'65.

Other respondents, both males and females, said that part-time teaching kept them abreast of new developments in their subject area, more so as they have to meet with the head of department when subjects were being assigned to them.

<sup>64</sup> Interview with teacher employed by Management Committee, HOA School. Interview with teacher A conducted on 2 February 1994. Ref T 14A.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup>Interview with teacher employed in DET school. Interview conducted on 18 February 1994. Ref T8.

<sup>65</sup> Interview with teacher employed by Management Council in HOA school. Interview with teacher A

#### 5.3.4 Informal recruitment methods for contract teachers

Most respondents said they had followed the departments' rules in applying for vacant posts. Eleven principals were interviewed for their opinions on the hiring of contract staff<sup>66</sup>. These views are contrasted to those of contract teachers.

Interview data indicates that principals have developed their own criteria for appointing contract teachers. Principals considered themselves and the school as being disadvantaged when hiring a short-term contract teacher, especially substitute teachers. Principals opined that these teachers lack motivation and commitment to teaching. Principals distinguished between teachers employed in the various education departments. For principals in the HOD and HOR schools, contract teachers were unable to integrate into the life of the school. In contrast HOR and DET's principals said contract teachers in their schools had no difficulty with social integration but as pedagogues they had different teaching styles which adversely affected pupils' ability to learn.

In spite of principals' formal and informal recruitment styles, many respondents said they could not secure employment because meritocracy was not the only criteria for appointment. Respondents spoke of the various methods of recruitment, which existed. One method of recruitment was through personal contact. That is, a teacher, tenured or contract, would hear about a vacant position and would inform a friend or colleague accordingly. Teachers acting on information gained from this informal network will arrive at a school, which supposedly has a vacancy, to present their academic credentials.

One of the respondents had this to say:

The education department thinks a teacher must drift around and there's a lot of nepotism. Getting a job is about whom you know. If you have a friend or an uncle in the department you have access to a permanent post. If you don't know anyone in the administrative sections of the HOD, you are stuck in a rut.<sup>67</sup>

conducted on 4 February 1994. Ref T6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> The primary criterion for hiring a contract teacher is because a vacancy exists. Secondly, principals do not consider the gender of the teacher but told me they preferred the best applicant for the post.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup>Interview with a speech and drama teacher. The interview was conducted on 10 February 1994.

The teacher employed at a HOR school confirmed this practice when she spoke of her experience. She said her father was a friend of the principal where she taught. It was after he telephoned the principal that she was offered the post. She said:

Well, my dad phoned Mr. X who asked which subjects I could teach and whether I had teaching experience. Based on the response to the questions, I was given a teaching post for general science<sup>68</sup>.

Most of the respondents said that this type of recruitment becomes a particular form of favouritism -- a job for the pals. A teacher employed at a particular school informs the principal that a suitably qualified teacher is seeking short-term employment. This personal contact gave the candidate an advantage over the other applicants when the formal applications are reviewed<sup>69</sup>. Principals confirmed this practice because they employed the contract teacher whom they thought would make the best contribution to the school. As one principal notes, principals had the discretion to employ teachers to short-term contract posts without necessarily advertising such positions. This, according to him, gave the principal the leeway to employ whoever s/he considers suitable. He said favouritism is not unlikely under such circumstances<sup>70</sup>.

Another recruitment method was headhunting of student teachers in their final year of teacher training. A student teacher was asked to present her credentials and when a short-term vacancy arises, the principal asked her to apply for the post.

Teachers on short-term contracts have to re-apply for their posts at the end of the term. A woman teacher said

I pestered the department for a post. I consider myself fortunate to get one because, this time, I called on the education authorities five times until they gave me a post<sup>71</sup>.

Other teachers said that principals promised posts at the end of each academic year. But, with the rapid changeover of senior personnel, these teachers were unable to make good the promise because new principals were unaware of the informal arrangement made by his predecessors.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Interview with teacher employed in HOR School. Interview conducted on 25 January 1994. Ref T 11

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup>Interview with a speech and drama teacher. The interview was conducted on 10 February 1994.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Interview with principal employed in HOR school. Interview conducted on 25 January 1994. Ref P3. Teacher employed at HOD school. Interviewed with teacher no. A on 23 February 1994. Ref T 10

#### 5.4 Contract teacher-pupil Relationship

Embedded in the notions of belonging and the role of the educator as being influential in determining the pupils' ultimate employment destination, is the belief that teachers must establish relationships with pupils. In this section, I demonstrate that education is social process and teachers' relations at work are important to this process. For the purposes of clarity, it is also stressed that, 'teachers' work consists of creating complex changes in children's cognitive understandings and skills on the one hand and developing characters on the other' (Metz 1988: 108). Metz further notes that teachers find themselves in a paradoxical situation of dependence on their pupils. This is because, although teachers exercise authority over their pupils, they are at the same time vulnerable to pupils' cooperation and interest in the classroom. In examining the organisation of teachers' work therefore, special attention is given to the teacher-pupil's relationship. How do contract teachers experience this relationship?

Majority of respondents observed that because of the short stay in any particular school, it was difficult to integrate themselves into the school environment. It was particularly difficult to establish the complex teacher-pupil relationship that facilitates learning. It was even more acute for some temporary teachers who stayed for a shorter period -- between one hour and one school term. As one of the temporary teachers put it,

I find it difficult to establish good relationships with the pupils because I am in a school for a term or less. As you know, it takes time for pupils to establish rapport with a new teacher. Gaining their confidence takes time. As a substitute teacher, I realised that it is when I am about to gain the confidence of pupils that the contract is near expiry. This is very demoralising for me<sup>72</sup>.

#### Another contract teacher had this to say:

Pupils get used to one teacher, you develop a rapport with your pupils and that obviously is broken with the changing of teaching staff. You only have three months to develop your own rules and regulations and that are difficult. Having to do this at every school makes it all the more difficult.<sup>73</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Interview with speech and drama teacher employed in HOD school. The interview was conducted on 10 February 1994. Ref T5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Interview with teacher employed in the HOR. Interview conducted on 25 January 1994. Ref T 11

As a result, some of the teachers said that the short-term nature of contract teaching made them anxious and sometimes reluctant to establish nurturing and caring relationships with pupils. 90% of the respondents echoed these concerns in different ways. They spoke of being 'burnt-out' and anxious about having to prove themselves all the time in order to gain the confidence of their pupils.

It is not only teachers who form relationships but pupils also seek out their teachers in order to form relationships with them<sup>74</sup>. Respondents said that pupils showed concern about their welfare and whether they would return for the next school-term. Pupils were curious about the employment status of their teachers. They asked questions about who would teach them once their class teacher has left.

Another teacher said her role was not about education, it was a question of relationships with pupils. It was about getting pupils interested in the teacher. One of the major problems about being part-time is that teachers cannot build this relationship, she observed. She went further to say that the rapid changeover of staff

affects them because our school policy is that if you teach a certain standard you will remain with them for the entire year. If possible I will get a chance to teach this class until matric<sup>75</sup>

An Indian contract female teacher employed at a HOA school had this to say,

I teach pupils of different racial classification all the time. The best judges of a teacher are the pupils. If you can win their confidence and gain their trust it makes the work so easy. The pupils are the first to pick it up<sup>76</sup>.

Sharing her academic experiences and undertaking extramural activities with the pupils arouses their interests' in particular subjects. As a mentor, she says

I communicate and commit myself as a person to developing the relationship. I believe this shared and mutual respect facilitates the educational process<sup>77</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Interview with teacher employed in the HOR. Interviewed conducted with teacher A on 25 January 1994. Ref T12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Interview with teacher employed in the HOR. Interview conducted with teacher B on 25 January 1994. Ref T

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Interview with Indian teacher employed at HOA School. Interview conducted on 2 February 1994. Ref T14
<sup>77</sup> Interview with speech and drama teacher employed in HOD. Interview conducted on 10 February 1994. Ref T5

Like teachers with tenure, contract teachers combine extra-mural activities with classroom responsibilities. About 10% of respondents said they experienced no difficulties in establishing relationships with their pupils. These contract teachers said they used extra-mural activities as a vehicle to gain the confidence of their pupils. A woman teacher in an HOA boys' school aptly articulates the views when she observed that

I never allow outside pressures to get to the classroom. I participate in sporting activities with the pupils. I consider it as a mechanism to communicate with my pupils. I gain their confidence in a more relaxed atmosphere of the sportsfield<sup>78</sup>

A male teacher who taught technical subjects to junior high school pupils' shared a similar view. He said he had very co-operative pupils because they had chosen the technically oriented subjects and enjoyed learning. He therefore did not have problems establishing relationships with the pupils he taught for that academic year.<sup>79</sup>

In summary, most contract teachers said that the short-term nature of their employment made it difficult to establish good relations with their pupils, a few others said they established good relations with their pupils through extra-mural activities.

# 5.6 Contract teachers' collegial relationship

Most respondents said the rapid change over of schools brought with it new surroundings and new people, both colleagues and pupils. Respondents observe that this was very stressful process but at times challenging. The rapid change over from one school to the other, respondents said, was a very disarming process because they had to adapt to the norms, traditions and values of each particular school. This included building working relations with their new colleagues.

Most of the respondents said it was not only forming new work relations at a very rapid rate that was stressful but the knowledge that they entered the school on an unequal footing to that of their tenured colleagues. Some respondents said the allocation of subjects reflected their subordinated position among the staff because they had the subjects the tenured staff refused

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Interview with teacher employed in the HOA. Interview conducted with teacher no. B on 21 February 1994. Ref T4

to teach. A respondent employed in an HOD school summed it up thus:

I have a fruit salad of subjects. I teach English, Geography, Accountancy and Business Economics to Std. 6 and 7. Because I teach the subjects which the tenured staff refused to teach, they look down on me<sup>80</sup>.

Respondents said teaching subjects for which they did not hold expertise always made them feel inadequate. They also spoke with dissatisfaction of being excluded from the departmental curriculum/subject planning. Subject heads or heads of departments made decisions and allocated duties, which contract teachers, could not decline. Their exclusion from these meetings and the allocation of tasks to them from such a process became a source of tension between contract teachers and their tenured counterparts. New work relations were affected by contract teachers' feelings of inadequacy. Tenured colleagues also frowned upon teachers who teach subjects outside of their training.

Respondents spoke about the challenges of forming new work relations but abhorred the questions about their work status by colleagues. As one of the contract teachers pointed out,

Immediately I introduce myself, the question that follows is, is it permanent? Then you have to explain. For the first year of teaching that was okay. But everytime you have to explain it becomes embarrassing<sup>81</sup>

These types of reactions not only affected the relationship with colleagues but also impacted on how contract teachers regard themselves. One contract teacher succinctly captured this observation.

It does affect your self-esteem that you are temporary. In that case you are pointed out. Surely my colleagues must have thought ... why is this person temporary for such a long time. Maybe, they think I am inadequately trained and that might be the reason why I am not tenured. Tenured staff has negative attitudes towards someone who is temporary. 82

Respondents' feelings of self-worth and academic expertise were shaken by the reactions of their colleagues. A Science teacher employed by the DET echoed this view<sup>83</sup>. He said,

I am as professionally qualified as my colleagues are but by the virtue of the other teachers being permanent staff, they consider themselves better qualified.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Interview with teacher B employed in HOR School. Interview conducted on 25 January 1994. Ref T12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Teacher employed in single sex girls' HOD school. Interview conducted on 28 February 1994. Ref T 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> Teacher employed in HOR School. Interview conducted with teacher no. 1 on 25 January 1994. Ref T12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> Teacher employed in HOR School. Interview conducted with teacher no. 1 on 25 January 1994. Ref T12

This compounded their integration into the new school environment. As a teacher of Arabic languages at an HOD school reported,

I often feel disillusioned and I do not interact with pupils or colleagues because my self-esteem is low. I just present my lessons and wait for the closing time each day so that I can go away from this unfriendly workplace.<sup>84</sup>

Despite these insecurities, some respondents spoke of colleagues assisting them to integrate into the new school environment. They said that professional relationships and teamwork were very important to a teacher's success at the school. According to a woman respondent employed in an HOR school,

Moving from school to school is not such a problem because I do not have family commitments. I think where the problem does come in is meeting new staff every time because part of your success at school is the new teacher working as part of a team. 85

However some respondents said they were reluctant to seek assistance because their colleagues might consider them incompetent and unprofessional. Many respondents said they relied on their acquired expertise in a subject because if they produced good results, it may lead to securing a tenured post. The male Art teacher of Indian descent taught at a Model C school knowing that he was a contract teacher. He said,

The principal told me that I am employed for one year. Both the principal and I regard this as a probationary period that would provide access to a permanent post. 86

Respondents said colleagues respected contract teachers who improved their qualifications. A teacher employed in the HOR School said,

If you obtain a degree so that colleagues know you're developing a career. Somewhere along the line an opening will come up and if you do have the qualifications and necessary experience the opportunity will arise.<sup>87</sup>

A central theme that dominated respondents' views of their interaction with colleagues was that the relationship was far from cordial. They could not freely discuss and consult with tenured colleagues because of the fear of being perceived or labeled as incompetent, ill - prepared and at worst, inferior.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Teacher employed in DET School. Interview conducted with teacher on 25 February 1994. Ref T 11A

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> Teacher employed in HOD school. Interview conducted with teacher A on 25 February 1994. Ref T12A

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> Teacher employed in HOR School. Interview conducted with teacher A on 25 January 1994. Ref T11

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Interview with Indian teacher employed at HOA School. Interview conducted on 2 February 1994 Ref T 14
 <sup>87</sup> Interview with teacher employed in HOR School. Interview conducted with teacher no. A on 25 January 1994. Ref T11

### 5.7 Gender bias of contract teaching

Women respondents spoke about the discriminatory practices of contract teaching. These respondents said that principals considered contractual forms of employment as women's work. Principals were said to give preferential treatment to male teachers when employing permanent staff. A factor that was taken into consideration in this respect was that men were seen as the head of the household, hence they deserved tenure with its better conditions of service, including housing subsidies and access to promotion posts. According to one of the female respondents,

The permanent posts were given to men because they were considered the breadwinners. The principal has told me that I don't need the security because I have a husband who supplies the security 88

Although most of the male contract teachers see themselves as the breadwinners of their household and accepted temporary positions to fend for their families, they however did not consider it a major factor that influenced principals in offering them employment. As one of the male respondents put it, 'If his principal considered his performance adequate and competent, he would be recommended for a tenured post'89.

Because of the high representation of women in teaching, it was mainly women who faced retrenchment or transfer. Before the implementation of the Labour Relations Act (1997), education authorities could transfer a contract teacher without giving the incumbent prior notification. Also a teacher could also be dismissed with only 24 hours notice. In turn, contract teachers could request a transfer or resign to work at another school. One woman respondent said:

I applied to be transferred to another school because I thought the post was a permanent one. On transfer I worked at the school for two years before I was informed that I am occupying another teacher's post<sup>90</sup>.

Given the choice, the majority of respondents would prefer the job security of tenured posts. But, this was not a unanimous view held by all respondents. There were a few teachers who preferred contract employment. As stated earlier, two women teachers employed by the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> Interview with teacher employed at HOA School. Interview with Teacher no. A conducted on 21 February 1994. Ref T 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Interview with male Indian teacher employed at HOA school. Interview conducted on 2 February 1994. Ref. T

Management Committee at an HOA school preferred the flexibility of contract teaching.

Women contract teachers said with frustration that they were placed in a holding position in the classroom while suitably qualified male teachers were provided promotional opportunities. A female language teacher employed in a DET School provides insights into how individual women teachers feel about their situation,

The post I occupy is for another teacher who is holding an acting head of department post. He has been acting since I arrived two years ago. When his post is advertised, I will apply for his post. If he fails I will be without a post<sup>91</sup>.

This female substitute teacher taught woodwork because that was the only subject available. She had trained to teach General Science to high school pupils.

... Faced with the prospect of being unemployed I taught woodwork and used the opportunity for learning new skills and different pedagogical methods<sup>92</sup>.

Another women teacher has held a temporary post for the past six years because she felt that a suitably qualified male teacher had not applied. She said,

My position is hanging in the balance because as a woman at a single sex boys' school, there is a perception by the principal and male colleagues that I do not provide an adequate role model for boys<sup>93</sup>.

At this school, women held 20 of the 50 posts. Not surprisingly, all the female teachers held temporary positions. The explanation was that 'the principal said we would remain on temporary contracts because the school required male role models',94.

It was a common employment practise for married women teachers with children to be placed on a renewable contract instead of being offered a tenured post. A teacher employed on an hourly contract said,

The department considers child-rearing the responsibility of the individual teacher. Employing me creates a saving for the department because they do not have to pay service benefits of medical aid, housing subsidies and pension fund contributions<sup>95</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup>Interview with teacher employed in the DET School. Interview conducted on 18 February 1994. Ref T9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Teacher employed at DET School. Interview with teacher no. A on 18 February 1994. Ref T 8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Interview conducted on 25 January with teacher no. B at HOR School. Ref T12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Interview with teacher employed at HOA School. Interview with Teacher no. B conducted on 21 February 1994. Ref T 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Interview with teacher employed at HOA School. Interview with Teacher no. C conducted on 21 February 1994. Ref T 4.

<sup>95</sup> Interview with teacher employed by Management Committee of HOA School. Interview conducted on 4

Women teachers who apply for tenured posts after taking leave of absence to have children face many discriminatory practises. This woman teacher employed in an HOA School had applied for a permanent post. She said,

My four years at this school are seen as a probationary period. I taught for seven years in a permanent post at a high school. I left to have children and on my return I was placed on contract for four consecutive years. Oh, I have to prove myself all the time. I think its worse since it's a boy's' school. You have so much more opposition to fight against. You continually have to prove yourself.

Female respondents said that the education authorities viewed career breaks for childbearing in a punitive light. Until the mid 1980s, there were few employment benefits related to childbearing and women teachers were relieved of their duties without statutory protection that the post would be available on their return. Overtly gender-discriminatory provisions, which put women at a financial disadvantage, have been removed. However, many respondents said principals still covertly implemented these discriminatory practises by preferring male teachers for tenured posts.

A respondent<sup>97</sup> said 'these sexist practices were not peculiar to temporary teaching because the ideology of the male breadwinner was pervasive in all the employment practices. Principals who provided male oriented criteria for hiring teachers' confirmed this view<sup>98</sup>. Consequently, married women on short-term contracts did not receive social benefits like maternity leave. Respondents who were married women teachers said their conditions of employment lacked social benefits or statutory protection and they were paid for the days that they worked. As the HOD teacher said earlier, a teacher is only paid for the days that s/he is at school. If s/he is ill or absent because her child is ill then she is not paid<sup>99</sup>.

February 1994. Ref T6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Interview with teacher employed at HOA School. Interview with Teacher no. 2 conducted on 21 February 1994. Ref T 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Interview with teacher employed in Language teacher employed in DET school. Interview conducted on 18 February 1994. Ref T16

Informal criteria have been established based on principals' experience of hiring contract teachers. The criteria are based on academic excellence, record of good service (preferably unbroken service) and merit. These are concepts, which are not gender neutral. Firstly, principals seek appointment based on the teachers' qualifications, performance and contribution to the life of the school. Secondly, teachers must also have high academic standards including planning, preparation and presentation of lessons, the use of teaching aids and good relationships with pupils. In addition, teachers must engage in extra-curricular activities at the school and conform to the culture of that particular school. The three criteria mentioned are highly subjective and open to individual interpretation of a teacher's performance.

The role of the male household head was a dominant theme throughout the interviews. Men had access to tenured posts with associated benefits and promotion posts because their careers were not disrupted by their childrearing roles. However, most male respondents said with equanimity that they did not think that they would be shown preference should a vacant tenured post exist. In contrast, a small group of male contract teachers said that unlike their female colleagues they had been asked by principals to apply for vacant tenured positions.

#### 5.8 Conclusion

The findings of the questionnaire and interviews conducted with 96 contract teachers employed in four of the five racially defined education departments have been presented and a profile of contract teachers has emerged. While these findings are not generalisable because the sample is small, nonetheless they do provide insights into a group of professional teachers who have become marginalised from the mainstream of the formal education system. Two types of contract teachers were interviewed: temporary teachers who were employed on annual contracts and substitute teachers who were employed on contracts ranging from one hour to one school term. The research findings indicate that the majority of teachers were qualified with less than 5 years teaching experience. This finding coincides with the National Teacher Audit which states that 40% of teachers in Kwazulu/Natal have less than 5 years teaching experience. However, the findings indicate that many contract teachers have accumulated teaching experience and skill. The findings reveal an inherent gender bias against women teachers. When tenured women teachers take a career break to have a family they re-entered the school as a new recruit. While this overt form of gender discrimination was eliminated in mid 1980s, women contract teachers still do not have statutory protection. According to respondents, married women teachers remain on contract because principals prefer to have men in tenured posts. Consequently, contract women teachers have poor working conditions and associated social benefits. They have no choice in the allocation of teaching subjects and often accept the subjects the tenured staff refuse to teach. Because many teachers accumulated classroom teaching experience over a long period of contract employment, this skill is lost in rapid change from one school to the other.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Interview with teacher employed in HOD school. Interview conducted on 23 February 1994. Ref T10

# **Chapter Six**

# **Interpretation of Research Findings**

#### 6.1 Introduction

In this chapter I interpret the findings of the research on the casualisation of teachers' work from a gender perspective. The chapter is divided into two sections. In Section one, I reiterate the socio-political context in which the study was conducted as a background for the interpretation of the research findings. In Section two, I interpret the research findings and the impact of casualisation on teachers' ability to control the organisation of their work.

# 6.2 Context of the study

Global studies indicate that contract employment is becoming a dominant form of non-standard employment for workers in both developed and developing countries. This form of employment affects all levels of the workforce across occupations as a result of the flexibilisation of the labour market. This phenomenon has affected the organisation of work in both the private and the public sectors. In the era of globalisation where cost recovery informs the provision of public goods, casualisation impacts adversely on the organisation of teachers' work. This is because contract teachers do not enjoy the same status and work conditions as their tenured colleagues. Casualisation embodies flexible employment standards and reorganises the teaching labour process in a manner that reduces teachers' autonomy to control their work. It also dilutes and fragments the teaching labour process and replaces it with a battery of technical procedures imposed by external forces outside the school.

Before assessing the impact of casualisation on teachers' work, I should once again reiterate

the socio-political context in which the study took place to serve as a background to understand the interpretation that follows. The research was conducted in a transitional period when formal Apartheid had not been abolished but at the same time some of its overt and rigid features were being deracialised. With respect to the education sector, the period was characterised by uncertainty. This is because while the various racially defined education departments still existed, the formal schooling system was being reorganised to admit black children into the government subsidised Model C and former HOA, HOR and HOA schools. In addition, under-utilised white schools were being allocated to black schools that experienced over-crowding.

Since the research was conducted (before the 1994 democratic elections), significant policy changes have been initiated and implemented by the Government of National Unity (GNU) which have transformed the South African education system. For example, in contrast to conditions in the pre-election period, formal racial and gender discrimination has been abolished. One example of the consequences of this development is that women teachers now receive maternity benefits, which in effect recognises their childbearing role.

Similarly, unlike in the past, qualified women teachers who held tenured posts now receive service benefits equal to their male counterparts. However, teachers without tenure, both qualified or underqualified, still do not enjoy the same employment conditions as their colleagues with tenure. These teachers remain in contract posts with the same poor working conditions. As of November 1997, about 60 000 casualised teachers were confronted with the prospect of dismissal. By 30 March 1998, 7 300 of these teachers had been dismissed (Skinner 1998). Skinner notes that, casualised teachers appear to be a soft target for provincial education departments that have overspent on their budgets. Contract teachers serve as a buffer, taking the brunt of redundancies or reductions in the school complement. With the central government focus on fiscal restraint and the consequent reduction in the budgetary allocation for education, contract employment of teachers has always been a permanent feature of the South African education system and it will continue to generate controversy between teachers, their union and education departments.

However, the existing literature has not recognised or analysed contract teaching as a sub-category within the national teaching corps. Although this study cannot prove that casualisation has increased, it shows evidence, based on the interviews with 96 men and

women contract teachers in schools situated in Greater Durban area, that contract teaching exists in South Africa, amongst both qualified and unqualified teachers.

Be that as it may, in the process of re-organising the education system in the early 1990s, there were hopes (amongst teachers) that they would be given more recognition, pay and job security, especially tenured posts. This small study suggests that such hopes were misplaced. It suggests that with the education budget stretched to the limit and unable to pay for the existing teacher corps, it is likely that

- (a) In the short-term, contract teachers will lose their jobs or be made unstable which is an effect of the volatile education job market.
- (b) In the medium-term, contract teaching will remain in independent (private) and public (former Model C and government) schools. This is also a consequence of on-going broader economic volatility and the failure of the education budget to meet the existing teacher wage packet.

# 6.3 Interpretation of research findings

The study found, in a small, randomly selected sample, that the teachers' affected by the casualisation of teaching were mainly qualified women teachers with less than five years teaching experience. Most had the relevant qualifications for a tenured post but could not secure tenured positions because of the gendered nature of the teaching labour market, which favoured male teachers in tenured positions. Similarly, the reorganisation of the teaching labour market, which emphasises fiscal restraint, has meant that a group of teachers are placed in temporary positions as a cost-saving device by education authorities. As Chisholm (1998a) points out, casualisation of teaching is a result of education governing bodies and education departments attempt to deliberately keep budgetary costs down.

The research findings indicate that two forms of contracts exist: temporary and substitute. Within the category of substitute teaching, there is a sub-category of hourly paid teachers employed by the Model C schools. Contract teachers, mostly women, have poor conditions of service with less security than tenured posts. Put differently, the conditions of employment

that emanate from casualisation are highly exploitative -- lowly paid wages and poor conditions of employment. Thus, casualisation and feminisation of teaching have becomes a means for cost saving by employers. In addition, feminisation became a vehicle for confining mainly black women teachers to the primary school system.

Although casualised teachers have been historically located in the lower primary school system (Truscott (1992) Kotecha (1992)) this study had a greater number of contract teachers in secondary schools -- 78% and 22% contract teachers are located in secondary and primary schools respectively. The discrepancy between the research findings and historical evidence is informed by the randomness of the sample, which was skewed towards more high school temporary teachers. The assumption is premised on the fact that international studies on casualisation of work in general and teaching in particular, show a correlation between casualisation and feminisation whereby women are located at the lowest levels -- the primary school system (Loveys 1988). However, in the South African scenario, this was not the case. This can be attributed to the political flux and chaotic nature of the education system during the period of transition. Consequently, the feminisation of the primary school system as a result of Apartheid government's education policy continues to exist today. However, feminisation should not be conflated with the casualisation of teachers' work.

The findings complement national statistics (Hofmeyr and Hall 1995) to the effect that there are more unqualified women than male teachers. The lack of qualifications should not however be conflated with the phenomenon of casualisation. This is because casualisation affects both qualified and unqualified teachers. Indeed, the majority of teachers whose work has been casualised are qualified teachers, according to the findings of this research. One reason for this phenomenon is the historical legacy of the marriage bar, which changed the employment status of women teachers on marriage. As a result, qualified married women teachers re-entered teaching as contract teachers. As shown in Chapter 4, this was a major reason why many women teachers held contract positions. A second reason for this was the cultural belief that men are the breadwinners, hence school authorities preferred giving men teachers tenured posts because they were considered the household head. A third reason is that the transition towards one non-racial education department created uncertainty in the racially defined education departments. Because of the flux in education policy, individual principals could not guarantee that all the teaching posts would be retained. Therefore, qualified teachers occupied tenured posts but on a temporary contract. A fourth reason is that

salaries in Kwazulu Natal take up 90% of the education budget and this has meant that many posts were either vacant or only occupied temporarily. As a result many qualified teachers were employed on short-term contracts.

# 6.3.1 Casualisation: Erosion of autonomy and intensification of teachers' work

Teachers are charged with providing their pupils with the educational knowledge, which ultimately determines their occupational destination. As argued in Chapter 2, teaching is a joint labour process of the teacher and pupil that transforms the latter's capacity for learning. In other words, for learning to take place, both the teacher and pupil have to engage with the curriculum content. The reorganisation of teaching has diluted and fragmented the autonomy of teachers' work. Put differently, casualisation entails school authorities bureaucratic control over the curriculum. In addition, a teacher's autonomy or ability to control the teaching labour process depends, in part, on whether s/he is able to influence the curriculum process 100.

Contract teachers have little control over the curriculum because of the short-term and consequent disruptive nature of contract teaching, which excludes them from planning processes that take place in the school. Unlike their tenured counterparts, casualisation erodes contract teachers' autonomy over their work as they often teach subjects for which they are not specialised. In addition, these teachers, especially those with hourly or daily employment, teach lessons based on a prescribed lesson plan and timeframe. Loveys' (1988) describes them as being in a 'holding position' in the classroom. Also, this process tends to undermine casualised teachers' efforts at skill accumulation, as contract teaching becomes a mechanism, which excludes them from the permanent labour market or teaching positions. As the evidence in the preceding chapter indicates, this limits their negotiating capacity not only over the nature of their work but the conditions of service. As a result contract teachers 'pick up the pieces' or accept subjects which tenured teachers refuse to teach.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> In Chisholm's (1998b) study she examines the conditions of working life for teachers during the Apartheid era and concludes that white teachers were able to influence the curriculum because their work environment was more supportive and conducive to learning. Black teachers relationships with education management was more authoritarian and hierarchical. Thus, black teachers had few opportunities to influence the curriculum process.

It should however be observed that in the reorganisation of teachers' work, tenured teachers also experienced a deskilling process. For example, they spend less time in the classroom and more time on administrative tasks, including arranging lessons for their contract colleagues.

Casualisation is a paradoxical phenomenon because while it entails a deskilling process for the majority it simultaneously provides the accumulation of skills for a minority. The flexibilisation of work that casualisation of teaching engenders enabled some teachers to acquire skills and experience – teaching multiple subjects and developing a diversity of skills. For those whose contract spans one academic year, they exercise some control over the teaching labour process including the syllabus. This group of casualised teachers systematically plan their subject for the period of the contract. In spite of this, they do not enjoy the continuity of planning which takes place over two years in the case of senior high schools pupils who prepare for matric examinations.

The net effect of casualisation on teachers' work is that it erodes their autonomy by alienating teachers from the conception and design of the labour process. Casualised teachers become implementers of a prescribed curriculum and executors of a battery of technical procedures, according to Apple (1986 cited in Acker 1996).

Apple further argues that contract teaching should be seen as a process of 'intellectual deskilling' (Apple 1988: 106). According to him, those who see contract teaching as a process of skill diversification miss the point. This is because casualisation is a mechanism whereby 'mental workers are cut off from their fields **or subjects** and again must rely even more heavily on ideas and processes provided by the experts' (Apple 1988: 106) (emphasis added).

Even for those who accumulate experience through contract teaching, they are disadvantaged because of the lack of or absence of a formal probationary period. Although those with accumulated experience are easily rehired when vacancies for contract positions arise, all contract teachers are nonetheless disadvantaged because of the lack of formal mechanism for the recognition of skills acquired through contract teaching.

Contract teachers are also confronted with an increased workload, in the same amount of time and at lower wages than their tenured colleagues. As noted earlier, some of these teachers are employed to teach subjects outside of their specialisation. This becomes a means of job intensification as they have to rapidly learn new subject content and pedagogical methods in order to meet the prescribed deadlines set by the education authorities. They are also employed at short notice to teach classes of tenured colleagues who are absent in an emergency or on compassionate leave. In some instances, as indicated in Chapter 5, these teachers are left with no lesson plans and are often called on to set assignments/quarterly test even when they had not taught that particular section of the syllabus. Intensification of work has not only become a means of extracting more labour at a reduced cost from contract teachers but also a mechanism for education authorities to control their work. Apple (1986) says the intensification of teachers work not only leads to a loss of sociability by contract teachers but also becomes a mechanism for them to cut corners by reverting to banking methods of education in order to get the work done. Getting the work done becomes more important than what was done or how one got there. Put differently, intensification which casualisation engenders, substitute quality of teaching for the quantity of teachers' work. Because of the increasing technicisation and the intensification of the teaching act, the creativity and human volition of the contract teacher is undermined and lost.

Intensification of work has its own gender dimension as women teachers' position is further subordinated within the school as a workplace thereby reinforcing the patriarchal power relations in the schooling system. This is because it is mostly male principals and male dominated education authorities that allocate tasks/teaching assignments to contract teachers who are mostly women. Casualisation becomes a means for the reinforcement of the sexual division of labour whereby women contract teachers are assigned to teach at the lowest strata of the schooling system where they provide emotional security and caring supports for their pupils. Commenting on the gender implication of job intensification, Apple (1986) notes, that women contract teachers spent more time at home and school on prescribed technical tasks and consequently lesser time on their domestic labour. This according to him generates tension between paid and unpaid work.

The casualisation of teachers' work has a racial dimension as well. As stated earlier, black teachers had very little influence over the curriculum unlike their white counterparts who through departmental meetings and access to citizenship were able to influence the outcome

of curriculum reforms (Chisholm 1998b). However, the majority of tenured teachers, irrespective of racial classification, have some measure of autonomy over their work. This comparison highlights the subordinate position of contract teachers in the school hierarchy.

# 6.3.2 Teaching as a social process: Contract teacher/pupil/collegial relationships

As noted in Chapter 2, teaching is a social process and teachers are involved in the social production of the capacities for labour. Teachers' interaction with the curriculum content occurs through a complex teacher-pupil relationship. This relationship in turn determines the capacity for pupils to learn. Therefore any analysis of teachers' work must be cognisant of this social aspect of teaching. This relationship, as well as teacher-teacher relations constitutes the focus of this section.

Teachers are placed in a paradoxically dependent relationship on their pupils. On the one hand teachers manage the class, on the other hand they have to motivate the pupils to ensure their co-operation and participation in lessons. For contract teachers, this relationship is frustrating because they have to win the pupils' confidence and establish rapport in a very short space of time. For example, substitute teachers have three months or less to teach in a particular school. Within this time, not only do they have to plan and teach lessons but they also have to gain the confidence of their pupils for effective learning to take place. The rapidity with which they move from one school to the other and from subject to subject makes it almost impossible for the establishment of the requisite teacher-pupil relationship. As noted in Chapter 5, some contract teachers were reluctant to establish nurturing and caring relationships with pupils as a result of their rapid dislocation and employment instability. It could therefore be argued that casualisation alienates a category of teacher from the school environment. Nonetheless, some contract teachers develop innovative mechanisms, through extracurricular activities, to establish and consolidate classroom relations with the pupils.

Most contract teachers consider themselves to be role models for the pupils they teach. Nonetheless, the rapid changeover from school to school made it almost impossible for most contract teachers to establish or perform these roles. Connell (1985) notes that teachers derive pleasure from their relations with the pupils, which is an extrinsic motivation for

teachers. That contract teachers are unable to establish meaningful relationships with pupils means that they are prevented from enjoying one of the benefits of teaching. The demotivation that results impacts adversely on the pupils as well. As noted in the preceding chapter, pupils were anxious that their learning would be affected if their contract teacher were not re-appointed.

The casualisation process also impacts on teacher-teacher relationships. Contract teachers perform the same duties as their tenured colleagues and this is done at a rapid pace. As a result, contract teachers have little choice in the nature and form of the collegial relationship. This is because tenured colleagues have greater access to departmental decisions on the curriculum and they are familiar with the learning histories of the pupils they teach. This places contract teachers in a vulnerable and dependent position in relation to their colleagues. Furthermore, because of the rapidity with which they move from school to school and the intensification of their workload, it becomes difficult to reflect on the culture of a particular school or build a network of collegial relationships. This further alienates them from the school environment. When the cultural norms and traditions are unknown, contract teachers withdraw into themselves and in the process they are unable to share their rich experiences and ideas with their colleagues. That their tenured colleagues further questioned their status and competence creates a sense of alienation for contract teachers. Lastly, contract teachers' vulnerability increases because the principal's decision to renew their contract is somewhat influenced by these collegial/pupil relationships.

## **6.3.3** Feminisation of contract teaching

Casualised teachers enter the teaching labour market in a subordinated position. As I argued in Chapter 2, unlike their tenured colleagues, contract teachers enter the workplace as part of the secondary labour market with poor working conditions, intermittent employment, no job security or promotional prospects. Chapter 4 documents the feminisation of the primary school system as a result of Apartheid education policies. This study has highlighted the gender dimension to this process, what I call the feminisation of casualisation. This is because women numerically dominate the secondary teaching labour market. That teaching is feminised is one plausible reason for the numerical domination of women in casualised teaching posts.

Because of the low labour market status of contract teachers they are not rewarded within the context of a family wage. Education authorities continue to see men as breadwinners and household heads. As a result male teachers are preferred for tenured positions while women contract teachers are paid "individual" rather than "family" wages. Education authorities continue to see female contract teachers' income as a secondary wage in the family. The lower income is justified by education authorities that define their work as a fill-in-job. Another reason for the lower salaries is the lack of recognition by education authorities of the reproductive role of women contract teachers. For example, the substitute teachers are only paid for the number of days they work. This means that when a woman contract teacher takes leave of absence or compassionate leave for family reasons, she loses her income for that period. The lack of maternity leave and medical aid for female contract teachers means that a career break for childbearing becomes a private, personal responsibility as they have no statutory protection.

Because of the flexibilisation of the teaching labour market, woman contract teachers combine low paid work with unpaid family work. In other words, women contract teachers are in a conundrum between paid work and family life. Although female contract teachers contribute towards the family income, the insecure nature of their work makes it unlikely that they would be able to alter the sexual division of labour at home or within the school as a workplace. Writing on the theme of part-time work in general, Duffy and Pupo (1992) argue that contract work provides women with a sense of financial freedom and some leeway to negotiate the sexual division of labour in the home. This limited financial freedom translates into some sense of social freedom. Nonetheless, Duffy and Pupo criticise contract work because it perpetuates women's economic dependence on their spouses, which by extension reinforces the patriarchal family relations.

#### 6.4 Conclusion

This research suggests that teachers' work is vulnerable to casualisation. The group of contract teachers sampled are qualified but relegated to the secondary labour market with poor conditions of service, lack of job security and lower income. Contract teaching deskills a group of teachers and thereby widens the gap between those with tenure and those without. The former has better opportunities for career development unlike the latter who have very limited career prospects.

Contract teaching has become a means for education authorities to extract the same amount of work from teachers at a lower rate of pay, and at the same time exclude them from the primary teaching labour market. It could also be argued that the flexibilisation of teaching divide the teaching corps. On the one hand, there is a group of secured and highly paid teachers contrasted by an another group of teachers with low pay and poor working conditions.

In conclusion, casualisation of teaching entraps women in gender ghettos of the labour market where they earn low salaries and work under poor conditions of service such as lack of maternity leave, housing subsidies and medical and pension benefits. While contract teaching tends to give women contract teachers some sense of financial freedom, they are nonetheless unable to alter the patriarchal relations in the family, school and society.

# **Chapter Seven**

#### Conclusion

I think temporary teachers have been a burning issue for a very, very long time...particularly for SADTU here in Southern Natal. We've come up with very interesting statistics where we found that teachers have been temporary for something like about 13 or 14 years<sup>101</sup>.

#### 7.1 Introduction

This research on contract teachers' work, conducted during the interregnum towards political democracy, shows that different types of employment contracts exist in the teaching labour market. Although the dominant form of employment for teachers is a tenured position, the flexibilisation of the teaching labour market has introduced short-term contract employment for a small but significant numbers of teachers. This category of teachers is lowly paid, with poor working conditions and lack job security. The introduction of short-term contract employment for a group of teachers re-organises the teaching labour market. This creates a gendered division of labour between males who dominate the primary teaching labour market and females who dominate the secondary teaching labour market. Although the re-organisation of the teaching labour market erodes both tenured and contract teachers' autonomy over their work, the latter is most adversely affected. This is because contract teachers, unlike tenured teachers, do not participate in departmental meetings where decisions are made to implement the re-organised curriculum.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Personal communication SADTU member, October 1993.

# 7.2 Restating the research question and summary of findings

In spite of the presence of contract teachers within the teaching corps in the Greater Durban Area, Kwazulu/Natal in particular and South Africa in general, existing studies have not recognised or defined them as a sub-category of teachers whose conditions of employment requires analytical understanding. Furthermore, there has not been any study that analysed how their employment status impacts on their ability to control and influence their work. Nor has there been any study that highlights the gendered nature of contract teaching. This research fills this void by providing evidence of contracting teaching in the Greater Durban Area, as well as provides insights into the employment conditions of those affected by casualisation.

The findings revealed that a group of teachers both qualified and unqualified who are affected by this phenomenon. However, this study showed that it was mainly qualified women and men teachers with less than five years teaching experience that were most affected. There are two categories of contract teachers --namely **temporary** and **substitute**, with varying access to the teaching labour market. The former appears to be in a more advantageous position because their employment contract spans an entire academic year. Because they accumulate teaching in the course of their contract, they have the advantage of being re-employed by principals who prefer to hire contract teachers who have developed classroom-teaching skills. Unlike the former, substitute teachers have less bargaining power to negotiate new contracts because of the shorter nature of their contract. Consequently, they have to find several short-term contracts in order to accumulate work experience.

The policy flux and uncertainty in education system during the period of transition resulted in the creation of contract employment for qualified teachers. This research suggests that the reorganisation of teaching make teachers work vulnerable to casualisation. The reasons for this were discussed in detail in Chapter 6. Contract teaching is not a new phenomenon in the Durban area. In fact, it has existed for more than 40 years, pre and during the Apartheid era. The introduction of the 'marriage bar' of 1912 and the Bantu Education Act of 1953 confined women, especially black teachers, to contractual forms of employment. These laws contributed to the feminisation of the primary school system and the relegation of women to the secondary teaching labour market.

These factors, in effect casualised all married women; in particular the majority of black women teachers whose lower qualifications confined them to the primary school. While this overt gender discrimination has been eliminated, the legacy of Apartheid continues to disadvantaged contract teachers who have not upgraded their qualifications to meet the national teaching norm. Effectively, teachers without the relevant qualifications were considered underqualified and not eligible for tenure. Casualisation of teaching in this particular form therefore continues to exist, even today.

This research also shows that because of women's numerical dominance in teaching, women teachers are mostly affected by casualisation. This is coupled with the fact that, from the women respondents' point of view, principals prefer male teachers for tenured posts and therefore allocate contract positions to women.

A clear distinction must however, be made between Apartheid education legislation and the policy flux during the transition period. In the process of establishing a non-racial education system there was uncertainty as to whether there would be work for all teachers. As a result, principals kept qualified teachers in contract posts.

This study also provides rich insights into the experiences of contract teachers. On the one hand, casualisation is advantageous to a few contract teachers -- a source of income, keeping them in touch with their subject and acquiring multiple skills. In addition, contract teaching also allows them to spend more time with the family. Alternatively, casualisation is disadvantageous to most contract teachers. They are relegated to the secondary teaching labour market, with lower pay, poorer conditions of work and lack of job security. In addition, it erodes their control over the teaching labour process.

This research also show that, the school as a workplace has at least **three** categories of teachers --- **tenured teachers**, **substitute teachers** and temporary teachers, or broadly speaking two groups of teachers -- tenured and contract. For the school management, the employment of contract teachers provides new possibilities for creating this category of employees who perform similar duties, in the same amount of time but with lower income and different rewards.

The non-provision of sick, holiday and pension benefits for contract teachers enables education authorities to allocate resources within the budget for that particular school or the system at large. The provision of these benefits for some employees creates distinct advantages for the education authority because it develops notions of loyalty amongst tenured staff. The more favoured position of tenured staff creates the danger that they may identify more closely with the education authority in periods of education reform, thus overlooking the solidarity that is required to eliminate the hierarchy that has emerged amongst teachers.

## 7.3 Framework for recognising contract teachers' work

To overcome, these inequalities, I propose the following accreditation process:

- (a) For contract teachers who are qualified, a point system should be developed to quantify their work experience. Their experience should substitute the probationary period that leads to a tenured post.
- (b) For underqualified contract teachers, two steps are proposed towards a tenured post. The first step is that their work experience should be quantified and matched to the number of courses required for a teacher's diploma. For example, five years of teaching experience should be equivalent to a three-year training course. The second step is for contract teachers' to take an in-service course, that provide them with specialist training. This specialist knowledge should create opportunities for a tenured position. Any one of these steps should be considered equivalent to a diploma in teaching thus placing contract teachers on the ladder towards a tenured post.
- (c) Contract teachers should be registered with a specialist employment bureau, which should cater for their particular needs as teachers. This will distinguish between teachers who choose contract employment and those who wish to enter a probationary period that leads to a tenured position.

This framework is offered with the realisation that contract teaching not only deskills teachers' work but also widens the gap between tenured and contract teachers. This framework for recognising contract teaching is proffered with the knowledge that the

discussion (in Chapter 4) on upgrading of qualifications as a method of guaranteeing employment has inherent limitations. This is because having the relevant qualification does not guarantee good teaching skills. It is against this background that the proposals for recognition are made.

#### 7.4 Conclusion

This study has shown evidence of the existence of contract teaching as a sub-category within the teaching corps in the Greater Durban area. Also, it highlights the gendered dimension of casualisation of teaching. In addition, the research challenges existing theories by showing that although casualisation of the teaching labour market adversely affects most contract teachers, it does offer work opportunities, albeit for a short-period. Therefore, a framework has to be established that recognises contract teachers' work experience. This means that the role and contribution of contract teachers towards the formation and transformation of the capacities for labour should not only be recognised and rewarded accordingly by education authorities but that casualisation of teaching should constitute an area of further research.

# **Bibliography**

Acker, S (1996) Gender and Teachers' Work. Review of Research in Education. No.21 1995-1996.

**Acker, S** (1994) Gendered Education, Sociological Reflections on Women, Teaching and Feminism. England. Open University Press.

**Alexander, N** (1990), Education and the Struggle for National Liberation in South Africa. Cape Town. Buchu Press.

Apple, M (1993) Official knowledge. New York. Routledge

**Apple, M** (1988) Work, class and teaching in Schoolwork: Approaches to the Labour *Process of Teaching*. England. Open University Press, England

Apple, M (1986) Teachers and texts. New York. Routledge

Althenbaugh, R. J (1995) 'The Irony of Gender' in Ginsburg (1995) The Politics of Educators' Work and Lives. New York. Garland Publishing, Inc.

Aziz, A (1993) 'Women in the UK Universities - the Road to Casualisation?' in Striver (eds) In Storming the Tower. Kogan Page. London

Bailey, K.D (1987) Methods of Social Research. New York. The Free Press

Behr, A (1988) Education in South Africa: Origins, Issues and Trends: 1652-1988, Cape Town. Academia.

**Blackledge, D and Hunt, B** (1945) Sociological Interpretations of Education. Washington. Croomhelm.

**Blampied de Blancpie B, L** (1989) The History of white women's entry into teachers in Natal. Master of Arts, Women's Studies, University of Natal, Durban. Unpublished thesis. Durban

**Bozzoli, B** (1983) 'Marxism, Feminism and South African studies', in *Journal of South African Studies*, 9(2): 139-71

**Budlender**, D (1996) The Women's Budget, Cape Town. Idasa

Casey, K (1996) The New Narrative Research in Education in Review of Research in Education No. 21, 1995-1996

Casey, K (1986). Teacher a Mother: Curriculum theorising in the Life History of the

Contemporary Women teachers' in Cambridge Journal of Education, 20,3

Chisholm, L (1998a), Feminisation of the Teaching Profession. Quarterly Review of Education and Training in SA. Vol. 5 No. 2. February 1998. Johannesburg

Chisholm, L (1998b) The Democratisation schools and the Politics of Teachers' Work in South Africa, Paper delivered at a conference in Arena, San Diego.

Christie, P and Collins, C (1984) Bantu Education: apartheid Ideology and Labour Reproduction in Kallaway (1984) Education and Apartheid. Johannesburg. Ravan Press

Cock, J (1980) Maids and Madams: Education for Domesticity. London. Women's Press

**Connell, R. W** (1995) Transformative Labour: Theorizing the Politics of Teachers' Work, in Ginsburg (1995) *The Politics of Educators' Work and Lives*. New York. Garland Publishing, Inc.

Connell, R.W (1985) Teachers' Work. Australia. Allen and Unwin Inc.

**Danylewyz, M and Prentice, A** (1986) revising the history of teaching: A Canadian perspective. *Interchange* 17(2): 135-46

De Lyon, H (1989) Women teachers working for equality. England. Open University Press.

**Densmore, K** (1987) Professionalism, proletarianisation and teachers' work in Popkewitz (eds) *Critical studies in teacher education*. London. Falmer Press.

**De Vries, P** (1989) South African Black Teachers and the Academic Paper Chase in *British Journal of Sociology of Education*. Vol. 10 no. 4 1989

**Dove, L.A** (1995) The Work of Schoolteachers as Political Actors in Developing Countries in Ginsburg (1995), *The Politics of Educators' Work and Lives*. New York. Garland Publishing, Inc.

**Drebeen, R** (1973) The school as a workplace in Travers (ed) *Second handbook of research on teaching*. Chicago. Rand McNally.

**Duffy, A and Pupo, N** (1992) Part-time Paradox: Connecting Gender, Work and Family. Canada. The Canadian Publishers.

Enslin, P (1990) Science and Doctrine: Theoretical discourse in South African Teacher Education in Nkomo (1990) *Pedagogy of Domination*. New Jersey. African World Press, Inc.

Enslin, P (1984) The Role of Fundamental Pedagogics, Education in Kallaway (1984) Apartheid and Education - The Education of Black South Africans. Johannesburg. Ravan Press

Evetts, J (1988) The Internal Labour Market for Primary Teachers in Acker (1988), *Teachers*, Gender and Careers. England. Falmer Press.

Gaitskell, D (1988) Race, gender and imperialism: a century of black girls' education in South Africa in Mangan J.A (1988) 'Benefits Bestowed'? Education and British Imperialism. London. Manchester University Press.

**Ginsburg, M.B** (1995) *The Politics of Educators' Work and Lives*. New York. Garland Publishing, Inc.

**Grace, G and Lawn, M** (1991) Teacher Supply and Teacher quality: Issues for the 1990s. London. Multilingual Matters.

**Grace**, **G and Lawn**, **M** (1987) *Teachers: The Culture and Politics of Work*. London. Falmer Press.

**Grant, R** (1988) Alternative Model of 'Career' in Acker (1988) *Teachers, Gender and Careers.* England. Falmer Press.

**Hartshorne, K** (1992) *Crisis and Challenge in Black Education 1910-1990*. Cape Town. Oxford University Press.

Hill Collins, P (1991) Learning from the Outsider Within: The Sociological Significance of Black Feminist Thought in Fonow (eds) 1991 Beyond Methodology: Feminist Scholarship as Lived Research. Bloomington. Indiana University Press.

Hoden, I. E (1997) Missionary Enterprise in African Education: The co-operating Lutheran Missions In Natal, South Africa, 1912-1955. Norway. Allservice A/S.

**Hofmeyr, J et al** (1993) *Teacher Salaries in South Africa: A Policy Perspective.* Johannesburg. Education Policy and System Change Unit.

**Hofmeyr, J and Hall, G** (1995) The *National Teacher Education Audit. Synthesis Report.* Johannesburg.

**Horowitz, F** (1995) Flexible work practices in South Africa: economic, labour relations and regulatory considerations in *Industrial Relations Journal* 26:4. South Africa.

**Hyslop, J** (1990) Teacher Resistance in African Education from the 1940s to the 1980s in Nkomo (1990), Pedagogy *of Domination*. New Jersey, USA. African World Press, Inc.

**Hughes, H** (1990) 'A lighthouse for African womanhood': Inanda Seminary, 1869-1945 in Walker (1990) *Women and Gender in SA*. Cape Town. David Phillip.

Husen, T and Postlethwaite, T.N (1994) The International Encyclopedia of Education (2<sup>nd</sup> edition) New York. BPC Wheatons Ltd.

Kallaway, P (1984) Apartheid and Education, Johannesburg. Ravan Press.

**Kotecha, P** (1992) *An Overview of the position of women in education*. National Education Policy Investigation. Johannesburg.

**Kraak, A** (1993) Affirmative Action and the Dilution of Segmented Labour Markets. University of Western Cape, October. (Unpublished paper).

Lane, M.M (1991) Die Vrou in the Onderwys, Department of Education and Culture. March. Unpublished paper. Cape Town.

Lawn, M and Ozga, J (1988) The educational worker? A reassessment of teachers in Ozga (1988) in *Schoolwork: Approaches to the Labour Process of Teaching*. England. The Open University Press.

**Lemmer, E. M** (1989) Invisible Barrier: Attitudes toward women in South Africa, in *South African Journal of Sociology*, 1989. No. 20(1)

Little, J.W. and McLaughlin, M.W (1993) Teachers' Work, Individuals, Colleagues and Contexts. New York. Teachers College Press.

Loveys, M (1988) Supplying the demand? Contract, mobility and institutional location in the changing world of the supply teacher, in Ozga (1988) Schoolwork: Approaches to the Labour Process of Teaching. England. Open University Press.

Mda T, V (1989) Teachers' Attitudes towards Evaluation of their Performance: A study of teacher perceptions in the Thokoza and Vosloorus Areas. Unpublished M. Ed thesis. University of Witwatersrand. Johannesburg.

Malherbe, E G (1925) Education in South Africa Vol. 1. 1652-1922. Cape Town. Juta

Malherbe, E.G (1965) Education in South Africa Vol. 11. 1923-1975. Cape Town. Juta

Marks, S (1994) Divided Sisterhood. Johannesburg. Witwatersrand University Press.

Marks, S (1987) Not Either an Experimental Doll. London. The Women's Press.

Mkhize, M. G (1989) The Professional and Academic Upgrading of Black Teachers in Natal and Kwazulu, Unpublished thesis, University Durban Westville. Durban.

**Moll, I** (1991) The South African Democratic Teachers' Union and the politics of teachers unity in South Africa, 1985-1990 in Unterhalter and Wolpe (1991), *Apartheid Education and Popular Struggles*. Johannesburg. Ravan Press.

Morrell, R (1992) Gender in the Transformation of South African Education in *Perspectives in Education*, Vol. 13, no. 2.

**Morrell, R** (1991) Gender and South African Education: Is there space on the Agenda, unpublished paper presented at the Gender in Southern African Conference, University of Natal, Durban.

Narsi, H (1990) Status of Women teachers in schools and teacher organisation in *Teachers' Journal of the Teachers Association of S.A.* 30.3

Nasson, B and Samuel, J (1990) Education - From Poverty to Liberty. Cape Town. David Philip.

**Nkomo, M** (1990) *Pedagogy of Domination: Toward a democratic education in South Africa.* New Jersey, Africa World Press, Inc.

Orloff, A.S (1993) Gender and the Social Rights of Citizenship in *The Comparative Analysis* of Gender Relations and Welfare State in American Sociological Review, no. 58

Oram, A. (1989) A Master should not serve under a mistress: Women and men teachers' 1900-1970 in Acker (1988) *Teachers, Gender and Careers*. United Kingdom. Falmer Press.

Ozga, J (1988) Schoolwork: Approaches to the Labour Process of Teaching. England. England. Open University Press.

**Pahliney, K** (1991) An Investigation of Gender discrimination against South African women educators of Indian descent, Unpublished MA. Thesis, University of Natal, Durban.

**Parsons, T** (1961) The school class as social system in Halsey (1961) Education, *economy* and society. New York. Free Press.

Redclift, N and Sinclair, M.T (1991) Working women, International perspectives on labour and gender ideology. New York. Routledge.

Rees, T (1992) Women and the Labour Market. London. Routledge.

Said, E (1993) Culture and Imperialism. New York. Alfred A. Knopf

Salaman, G (1982) Working. London. Open University Press.

Sayedwa, S (1975) Black women in Professional Roles in South African Outlook.

**Seddon, T** (1994) Teachers' Work and Political in Husen and Postlethwaite (1994) *The International Encyclopedia of Education* (2<sup>nd</sup> edition) New York. BPC Wheatons Ltd.

Shipman, M.D (1988) Sociology of the School. London. Longmans.

**Shepherd, M.B** (1992) Entering the teaching profession as a woman: some student perceptions. Master of Arts (Women's Studies) University of Natal, Durban.

Shweder, R.A and Le Vine, R.A (1984) Culture Theory: Essays on Mind, Self, and Emotion. New York. USA. Cambridge University Press.

Simon, A and Beard, A (1986) Discriminatory factors affecting women teachers in Natal in *Perspectives in Education* Vol. 9,1

**Skinner, K** (1998) Education Crisis Deepens in *South African Labour Bulletin Vol.* 22 no. 3 June 1998. Johannesburg. Umanyano Publications.

**Skinner, K** (1997) SADTU Fights back in *South African Labour Bulletin Vol.* 21 no. 1. Johannesburg. Umanyano Publications.

**Soobrayan, P.B** (1991) A study of the political attitudes and aspirations of teachers: The case of Coloured teachers in the Greater Durban area. Masters of Education, University of Natal, Durban.

**Te Groen, S.M.** (1989) Demand for equality in education and the influence of the 'hidden curriculum' in formal education on the role expectancy of white women in South Africa in the *South African Journal of Education* Vol. 9,3

The Transvaal Educational News (1987) Comment Redundant! in The Transvaal Educational News, June/July 1987

**Truscott, K** (1992) Gender in Education, National Education Policy Investigation. Johannesburg.

**Vietzen, S** (1973) A History of Education for European Girls in Natal with Particular Reference to the establishment of Some leading schools 1837-1902. Pietermaritzburg. University of Natal Press.

Westkott, M. (1979), Feminist Criticism and the social sciences, in Objectivity and Truth in Fonow and Cook (eds) *Beyond Methodology: Feminist Scholarship as Lived Research*. Bloomington. Indiana University Press.

Witz, A (1992) Professions and Patriarchy. London. Routledge.

**Wolpe, A** et al (1997) *Gender Equity in Education. Report of the Gender Equity Task Team.* South Africa. Department of Education.

**Wolpe, H and Unterhalter, E** (1991) *Apartheid Education and Popular Struggles*. Johannesburg. Ravan Press.

Wood, S (1982) The Degradation of Work. London. Anchor Press.

# **Appendix One**

# Open ended questionnaire

Contract teachers were asked the following questions:

- 1. Has there been any consequences, both negative and positive for you as a temporary teacher?
- 2. Has your status as a contract teacher affected your relationship with the pupils in the classes you teach?
- 3. Has your status as a contract teacher affected your relationship with your colleagues?

# **Appendix Two**

# Questionnaire

Where empty boxes are provided, please indicate your answer with an 'X' in the box.

Section	n A:	Personal	Details	

1.	Post held in				
	HOA	HOD	DET	HOR	Kwazulu

2. Is your appointment (mark the most appropriate education qualification)

Temporary	
Temporary substitute	
Other	

3. How many years have you held your present post?

Less than one	2-5	6-10	11-15	16-20	20 plus	
year						

4. Sex

Male	Female

5. Age

Jnder 20	21-25	26-30	31-35	36-40	41-45	46-50

6. Which type of accommodation applies to you?

Ownership	Rented	Lives with relatives	

7.	Marital status	

Married	Divorced	Single	Living	Widow	Widower	
			together			



Yes	No

9. Do you think we should have a family code where both parents are equally responsible for raising the children?

Yes	No

### Section B: Work Experience

10. How many years of teaching experience?

Less than	6-10	11-15	16-20	21-25	26-30	31-35	36-40	
5 years								l

11. Have you applied for promotion?

1	Yes	No	

12. Were you successful in your last application?

Yes	No

13. Where did the majority of your teaching take place during 1993?

٠.	and and smile and a first the smile and a				
	Junior Primary	Senior Primary	Junior Secondary	Senior Secondary	
				-	

# Section C: Levels of Qualifications?

17. Is your salary paid by the department?

14.	What are your present teaching qualifications?		
14.1	1 Professional qualifications?		
	Teacher diploma  Diploma for Educators of Adults		
	Other		
14.2	Academic qualifications?		
	Bachelor Degree in Education		
	B. Paed. Degree		
	Honours Degree		
	Masters Degree		
	Other		
15. Wł	nich subjects do you teach?		
	English	Afrikaans	
	Mathematics	Biology	
	History	Science	
16. For	which pay category do you qualify?		
	A C	B D	

Yes

E G F

Other

No

18 Is	your salary paid from school funds	?	
		Yes	No
Section	n D: Benefits		
19. Ha	ave you forfeited leave pay?		
		Yes	No
20. D	old this leave relate to maternity lear	ve?	
		Yes	No
21. D	o you thnk men should take patern	ity leave?	
		Yes	No
Section	n E: Career Development		
22.	Does the following apply to you?		
22.1	I am entitled to a housing subsidy	when I am employed	by the department?
		Yes	No
22.2	I only receive a percentage of the	full pension benefits?	
		Yes	No
22.3	I have to apply for a teaching pos	t at a different school	every year?
		Yes	No
22.4	Since the birth of my child/ren I h	nave worked at a differ	rent school every year?
	•	Yes	No
22.5 *			
22.5 A	s a single parent I am not entitled to	o maternity benefits?  Yes	No

23.	List what you consider to be some of the advantages and disadvantages to the Education Department for having temporary teachers on the school staff?
23.1	Advantages:
23.2	Disadvantages:
24.	Do you wish to upgrade your qualifications? If yes, what are your reasons?
	If no, what are your reasons?
25.	Do you see upgrading your qualifications as part of a career path towards a permanent appointment?
	If yes, how?
	If no, why?

# **Appendix Three**

#### List of contract teachers interviewed

- 1. Interview conducted with Teacher A, teaches Afrikaans in HOA school. Interview conducted on 21 February 1994. Ref T 4
- 2. Interview conducted with Teacher B, teaches Mathematics in HOA school. Interview conducted on 21 February 1994. Ref T4
- 3. Interview conducted with Teacher C, teaches Mathematics in HOA school. Interview conducted on 21 February 1994. Ref T4
- 4. Interview conducted with Speech and Drama teacher employed in HOD school. Interview conducted on 10 February 1994. Ref T5
- 5. Interview conducted with Teacher employed in Management Council post in HOA school. Interview conducted on 4 February 1994. Ref T6
- 6. Interview conducted with Teacher employed in HOD school. Interview conducted on 28 February 1994. Ref T 7
- 7. Interview conducted with Language Teacher employed in DET school. Interview conducted on 18 February 1994. Ref T8
- 8. Interview conducted with Technical drawing teacher employed in DET school. Interview conducted on 18 February 1994. Ref T9
- 9. Interview conducted with General science and Biology teacher employed in HOD school. Interview conducted on 23 February 1994. Ref T 10
- Interview conducted with General Science teacher employed in HOR school. Interview conducted on 25 January 1994. Ref T 11
- 11. Interview conducted with Teacher A, Geography teacher employed in HOR school. Interview conducted on 25 January 1994. Ref T12
- 12. Interview conducted with Teacher B, Language teacher employed in HOR school. Interview conducted on 25 January 1994. Ref T12
- 13. Interview conducted with Teacher C, Language teacher employed in HOR school. Interview conducted on 25 January 1994. Ref T12
- 14. Interview conducted with Teacher 2, Economics teacher employed in HOD school. Interview conducted on 24 February 1994. Ref T 13

- 15. Interview conducted with Maths and Science teacher employed in DET school. Interview conducted on 25 February 1994. Ref T 11
- 16. Interview conducted Arabic and History teacher employed in HOD school. Interview conducted on 25 February 1994. Ref T 12A
- 17 Interview conducted with Teacher A, employed at primary school in HOA. Interview conducted on 2 February 1994. Ref T 13A
- 18. Interview conducted with Teachr B employed in primary school in HOA. Interview conducted on 2 February 1994. Ref T 13A
- 19. Interview conducted with teacher employed by Management Committee in HOA school. Interview conducted on 2 February 1994. Ref T14A
- 20. Interview conducted with Art teacher employed in HOA school. Interview conducted on 2 February 1994. Ref T14
- 21. Interview conducted with group of 6 teachers in HOR school. Interview conducted in November 1993. Ref T 15
- 22. Interview conducted with Language teacher employed in DET. Interview conducted on 18 February 1994. Ref T 16
- 23. Interview conducted with primary school teacher employed in HOA. Interview conducted on 2 February 1994. Ref T 17

# **Appendix Four**

## List of interviews with Principals and SADTU representatives

#### 1. List of interviews with Principals

Interview conducted with principal employed in HOR school. Interview conducted on 2 February 1994. Ref P 1

Interview conducted with principal employed in DET school. Interview condcuted on 18 February 1994. Ref P 2

Interview condcued with principal employed in HOR school. Interview conducted on 25 January 1994. Ref P3

Interview conducted with principal employed in HOA school. Interview conducted on 1 February 1994. Ref P 4

Interview conducted with principal employed in HOA school. Interview conducted on 10 February 1994. Ref P 5

Interview conducted with principal employed in HOR school. Interview conducted on 25 January 1994 Ref P 6

Interview conducted with deputy head employed in DET school. Interview conducted on 18 February 1994. Ref P 7.

Interview conducted with principal employed in HOD school. Interview conducted on 25 February 1994. Ref P 8

#### 2. List of interviews with SADTU representatives

SADTU Gender Co-ordinator interview conducted November 1993 and September 1994. SADTU Regional Organiser interview conducted on October 1993