

DEMOCRACY, POWER AND THE ORGANIZATION
OF EDUCATION PROJECTS

BENJAMIN PHILIP PARKER

1994

UNIVERSITY OF NATAL
PIETERMARITZBURG

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the Department of Philosophy,
University of Natal in 1994.

PREFACE

I hereby state unambiguously that the whole thesis, unless specifically indicated to the contrary in the text, is my own original work.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To Peter Derman, Clive Poultney and Peter Wakelin for introducing me to and teaching me about Mboza and Maputaland. To Roger Deacon for a long period of creative collaboration and, in particular, for our joint papers in which many of the ideas and arguments in chapter eight first appeared. To James Moulder for being supportive and providing excellent guidance when it was needed most. To Mahmood Mamdani who introduced me to the riddle of the "not-civil" as a way to understand the state in Africa. To the Chairman's Fund Educational Trust whose generous funding of the Mboza Village Education Project provided the context for the empirical work described in chapter seven. To my family, Diane, Francis and Christopher who have had to live with this for as long as I have.

ABSTRACT

THE election of a Government of National Unity in April 1994 heralded the end of apartheid education and the transition to a post-apartheid society. This thesis engages with the problems of planning and managing organizational change within the South African education system. I focus on the concept of governance as one way of explaining education system change.

PART one begins with an introduction which explains what I am going to do. Chapter two describes the history of education for whites from 1910 to 1990. Chapter three describes the history of education for Africans from 1910 to 1990. I use the work of Archer (1979) to analyze this history of segregated and unequal education. Part one ends with the construction of an analytic framework with which to illuminate those structural characteristics which are likely to remain unchanged for at least ten years. I argue that the governance structures of apartheid education are likely to persist, although in a modified form.

ALTHOUGH I make reference to various indicators of inequality, my primary focus is on the institutional forms of governance that were used to produce and maintain apartheid education. By 1994,

South Africa had a traditional western schooling system with a weak penumbra of industry training and non-governmental organization based adult basic education. The schooling system consumed about 25 billion Rand a year or approximately 20 percent of the state budget, and employed about 350,000 people. The sheer mass of the system promoted an inertia that encouraged persistence of the status quo and mitigated against change. This inertia was strengthened by the dominant discourses and the inequalities embedded in existing economic, social and political power relations, institutions and practices.

PART two describes and analyses six major education policy initiatives produced from 1990 to 1994. Chapter four begins with an examination of the Educational Renewal Strategy, the National Education Policy Investigation and various reports on Lifelong Learning, Higher Education, Open Learning and Distance Education. I then analyze, in detail, two major policy documents produced by the African National Congress in 1994: the Policy Framework for Education and Training and the Reconstruction and Development Programme. I use the work of Archer (1988) to elaborate on the analytic framework that I developed in part one. I analyze the values espoused and forms of governance proposed by the policy documents and draw the conclusion that, by 1994, two competing education discourses had emerged: a development discourse and a

democratic discourse. Archer provides the basis for an illuminative framework with which to analyze the situational logics that makes these discourses competitive. These discourses have their roots in different conceptions of the form of power in the state and in different interpretations of six core values: development, democracy, equity, efficiency/effectiveness, redress, unity/nation-building.

I argue that, by 1994, a new consensus about how to govern education in the post-apartheid social order had emerged. It was based on the dominance of a development discourse and the existing pervasiveness of a large interventionist, authoritarian, paternalistic and administrative state. By contrast, the democratic alternative, which had been strongly espoused in the 1980s, received little attention. The desire for democracy was subordinated to the apparent necessity for economic growth. The clearest indications of a democratic discourse are in the few places where attention is paid to the education and training of people living in the rural areas.

CHAPTER five analyses rural education policy. The "rural" is conceptualized as the necessary "other", that which is different from and excluded by the urban dominated development discourses and practices of the emerging national education and training

system. I use rural education policy as a means of grounding, and giving substance to, the analytic framework.

PART three applies the analytic framework, developed in parts one and two, to the problems of rural education. Chapter six provides an overview of farm and rural schooling in KwaZulu-Natal. Chapter seven provides a brief case study of an education project which attempted to create a Community Learning Centre in a remote rural area of KwaZulu-Natal. This serves to remind us of how difficult it is going to be to change the education system in a way that benefits rural people. Drawing on recent theories about development, democracy and education I argue for an alternative change strategy for rural education. This alternative would seek a democratic oriented lifelong learning system based on open learning, distance education and Community Learning Centres under the direct control and ownership of local governing bodies.

PART four switches the focus away from the systemic issues of governance and values, the politics of pedagogy, towards the intersubjective relations of power between teacher and student, the pedagogical as political. The switch in vantage point corresponds to a shift from predominantly descriptive analysis to the construction of a theoretical perspective. Both shifts remained rooted in their origins. The theory remains grounded in

the context provided by the descriptions; and the analysis of pedagogies is grounded in the explanation of values and governance. A distinction is drawn between traditional, vanguard and orthodox discourses about the pedagogic relation, all of which are then characterized as being forms of a modern orthodox discourse.

HAVING examined the ways in which pedagogic power operates in modern education to (re)produce subjects and knowledges, I explore the possibility of a paradoxical discourse premised on both the necessity of subject-identities and the impossibility of their completeness. As with Archer (1979 and 1988) in previous chapters, I borrow a variety of ideas from diverse theorists to construct a perspective of education as a dynamic and paradoxical tension between subjection and refusal. An analogy is drawn between the paradoxical nature of human subjects, of education and of nation-building. I then argue for the deliberate setting into place of a structural opposition between two parts of a unified education and training system. On the one hand, a schooling system for general education provided by a large development administrative state. On the other hand, a lifelong learning system based on distance education, open learning and Community Learning Centres under the control of local democratic governing bodies.

I conclude by arguing for a conception of governance as a paradoxical exercise which is riven by contradictions and tensions. Using this conception of governance, it may be possible to nurture an understanding of the South African education system, our national education project, as being a paradoxical amalgam of persistence and change, democracy and development, subjection and refusal.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page	
Part One		
Chapter One:	Introduction.	13
Chapter Two:	White schooling: 1910 to 1990.	28
Chapter Three:	African schooling: 1910 to 1990.	73
Part Two		
Chapter Four:	Education policy debates: 1990 to 1994.	156
Chapter Five:	Rural education policy.	231

Part Three

		page
Chapter Six:	Rural schooling.	277
Chapter Seven:	The Mboza Village Education Project.	322

Part Four

Chapter Eight:	Development, democracy and power.	362
Chapter Nine:	Conclusion.	440
Bibliography.		450

Analytic Table of Contents

Part One

Chapter One: Introduction

Chapter Two: White Schooling: 1910 to 1990

- 2.1 Introduction
- 2.2 An illuminative framework
- 2.3 The South Africa Act of 1909
- 2.4 The centralization of power
- 2.5 Language policy
- 2.6 Restrictive strategies and political manipulation
- 2.7 The Broederbond and Christian National Education
- 2.8 The "Stop-Go" pattern
- 2.9 An analytic framework
- 2.10 An attempt to decentralize
- 2.11 Conclusion

Chapter Three: African schooling: 1910 to 1990

- 3.1 Introduction
- 3.2 Indigenous and colonial education
- 3.3 Church and provincial schooling
- 3.4 Apartheid and Christian National Education
- 3.5 From decentralization to centralization
- 3.6 Apartheid education in the territories
- 3.7 The emergence of resistance
- 3.8 June 1976
- 3.9 People's education
- 3.10 Discourses about South African education
- 3.11 Archer and Africa
- 3.12 Conclusion

Part Two

Chapter Four: Education policy: 1990 to 1994

- 4.1 Introduction
- 4.2 Archer: an analytic framework
- 4.3 Education policy before and after 1990
- 4.4 Six education policy investigations
- 4.5 The Education Renewal Strategy
- 4.6 The National Education Policy Investigation
- 4.7 The Congress of South African Trade Unions
- 4.8 The Union of Democratic University Staff Associations
- 4.9 The South African Institute for Distance Education
- 4.10 The African National Congress
- 4.11 Six fundamental values
- 4.12 Conclusion

Chapter Five: Rural education policy

- 5.1 Introduction
- 5.2 Development and democracy
- 5.3 Development

- 5.4 Democracy
- 5.5 The Reconstruction and Development Programme
- 5.6 The RDP and rural education policy
- 5.7 Conclusion

Part Three

Chapter Six: Rural schooling

- 6.1 Introduction
- 6.2 "Rural"
- 6.3 Farm schools
- 6.4 Community schools in the territories
- 6.5 Schooling in KwaZulu
- 6.6 The economic context of rural schooling
- 6.7 Governance in KwaZulu
- 6.8 One education system in KwaZulu-Natal
- 6.9 Conclusion

Chapter Seven: The Mboza Village Education Project

- 7.1 Introduction
- 7.2 Schooling in Maputaland
- 7.3 Schooling at Mboza
- 7.4 The Mboza Village Project
- 7.5 The Mboza Village Education Project
- 7.6 The demise of the Mboza Village Education Project
- 7.7 Conclusion

Part Four

Chapter Eight: Development, democracy, power and education

- 8.1 Introduction
- 8.2 Power and pedagogy
- 8.3 Three discourses
- 8.4 Modern western education
- 8.5 Education, identity and governance
- 8.6 Education, paradox and difference
- 8.7 Subjection and refusal
- 8.8 Conclusion

Chapter Nine: Conclusion

A note on terminology

The racial categories used in the text reflect part of the reality of apartheid society and their use is unfortunately necessary in a text of this nature. The author rejects the racism implicit in such categorization. To be consistent the term "black" refers collectively to all racially oppressed groups in South Africa, ie Africans, Indians and coloureds. I have opted to call those areas set aside by the 1913 and 1936 Land Acts, together with further consolidations, "territories". This term is used rather than "homelands" to indicate their colonial and pre-apartheid roots.

A List of Acronyms

ABET	Adult Basic Education and Training
ANC	African National Congress
CDC	Central Development Committee
CLC	Community Learning Centre
CNE	Christian National Education
CORD	Centre for Community Organization, Research and Development
COSAS	Congress of South African Students
COSATU	Congress of South African Trade Unions
DET	Department of Education and Training

ERS	Education Renewal Strategy
ETC	Education and Training Committee
GNU	Government of National Unity
INLOGOV	Institute for Local Government
IPET	Implementation Plan for Education and Training
KDEC	KwaZulu Department of Education and Culture
LAPC	Land and Agricultural Policy Centre
MVEP	Mboza Village Education Project
MVP	Mboza Village Project
MDM	Mass Democratic Movement

NEC	National Education Crisis/Coordinating Committee
NEPI	National Education Policy Investigation
NEUSA	National Education Union of South Africa
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NTB	National Training Board
PFET	Policy Framework for Education and Training
PTSA	Parent-Teacher-Student Association
QUANGO	Quasi-Autonomous Non-Governmental Organization
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
RESA	Research and Education in South Africa

SACHED	South African Council for Higher Education
SACP	South African Communist Party
SADTU	South African Democratic Teachers Union
SAIDE	South African Institute for Distance Education
SAIRR	South African Institute of Race Relations
SPCC	Soweto Parents Crisis Committee
UDF	United Democratic Front

CHAPTER ONE

Introduction.

THE election of a Government of National Unity (GNU) in April 1994 and the inauguration of President Mandela heralded the possibility of significant change in the South African education system. For the first time, after more than forty years of apartheid education and three hundred years of colonial education, it is possible for South Africans to plan and manage a national education system designed to meet the basic learning needs of everyone, and to promote development and democracy.

ONE task of the GNU is to manage the transition from apartheid education to an education guided by and promoting the values of development, democracy, efficiency, equity, redress and nation-building. The complexity and uncertainty of this task, let alone the fiscal and political constraints, poses a serious challenge not only to the GNU but also to diverse interest groups and stakeholders. Although there has been a plethora of policy conferences and reports, little attention has been paid either to the management of change (the implementation of policy) or to the

theoretical analysis of change. This thesis constructs a theoretical perspective, or an analytic framework, which explains the management of change in the education system as a paradoxical exercise in governance.

THE concept "governance" is used to refer to some of the ways in which power relations are structured in the organization of education. It is often assumed that education implies governance in, at least, two important senses. Firstly, an education system as a large-scale social project requires planning and management by some form of government. Secondly, the pedagogic relation between master and student is a power relation requiring both governance of the student by the master and the increasingly autonomous self-governance of the student. This thesis reconceptualizes these assumptions.

AN education system is an amalgam of persistence and change. In order to understand the possibilities for change in the future it is necessary to predict what is likely to persist from the past. The construction of a new education system does not begin in a void, nor on the ashes of the apartheid system. The governance relations that pervaded apartheid remain embedded in the system

inherited by the GNU. Changing these power relations is one crucial aspect of the transition to a post-apartheid education system.

BY 1994, there were approximately ten million students in the South African schooling system. Eighty percent (8 million) of this total were African. The largest department was the Department of Education and Training (DET) with 2.3 million students; the ten territorial departments had a total enrollment of 5.7 million. Five percent of African students were enrolled at state-aided farm schools and fifty-eight percent at rural community schools in the territories. The importance of schooling in the territories is highlighted by the 1991 African matriculation results. Out of a total of 281,000 candidates, 200,000 (seventy-one percent) were in the territories.

IT is difficult to calculate accurately the number of people of school going age who were not attending school because of the unreliability of demographic data and education statistics. The following calculations are based on the assumption that 20 percent of the African population were between the ages of six and twenty and could be regarded as school-goers.

1920	1,250,000
1930	1,500,000
1940	1,700,000
1950	1,800,300
1960	2,250,000
1970	2,000,000
1980	2,250,000
1990	1,800,000

IN a country where, in 1985, no less than one-third of black children under 14 were estimated to be malnourished and underweight for their age, it is not surprising that the attrition and drop out rates were also very high. Of every 100 children who started school in 1969, only 4 had matriculated by the end of 1978. The comparative figure for whites was 69. Of all those African children who left school in 1982, more than half had got no further than standard 2 (Nwaiia, 1993: 40). In the rural areas of the territories, the three major reasons for the high drop out rate were the sheer cost of education from the family's point of view; the rising opportunity cost of earnings foregone or labor not undertaken as children grow older;

classroom places were simply not available for all children who entered school to go on up the ladder (Wilson and Ramphele, 1989: 138ff).

AS a consequence rates of illiteracy are high, with estimates of the number of illiterate people varying between forty and sixty percent of the total population. In the rural areas of the territories the illiteracy rate is often as high as eighty percent. As Wilson and Ramphele note:

For a country whose industrial revolution has been underway for a full century and where more than half the population is urbanized, the degree of illiteracy is staggering (1989: 138).

The massive inequalities that separate African and white schooling can also be seen clearly in differences in educational qualifications at the highest level of certification: 68 whites per thousand have degrees compared to only 1 per thousand for Africans (Krige, 1994: 191). By 1994, South Africa had a traditional western schooling system with a weak penumbra of industry training and non-governmental organization based adult basic education. The schooling system consumed about 25 billion Rand a year or approximately 20 percent of the state budget, and

employed about 350,000 people. The sheer mass of the system promoted an inertia that encouraged persistence of the status quo and mitigated against change. This inertia was strengthened by the dominant discourses and the inequalities embedded in existing economic, social and political power relations, institutions and practices. To explain why the South African education system looked like this in 1994 it is necessary to explore the colonial and apartheid origins of the system.

IN part one I explore the development of South Africa's unequal and segregated education systems for whites and Africans from 1910 to 1990. Although I make reference to various indicators of inequality, my primary focus is on the institutional forms of governance that were used to produce and maintain apartheid education. Using definitions and distinctions borrowed from the work of Archer (1979), I construct a systemic perspective of the structural dispositions of South Africa's schooling system as they developed from 1910 to 1990. Although worthy of study in their own right, I appropriate Archer's distinctions and definitions for use only as an illuminative framework with which to organize my material. I do not evaluate her theories and explanations in the light of competing theories and explanations.

CHAPTER two is a description of the governance of white schooling from 1910 to 1990. I show that there was a constant centripetal tendency with power being concentrated, first, in provincial governments and then, later, in national government. Increasingly education was organized within a large administrative state dominated by bureaucrats. After 1948, this institutional structure was complemented by a powerful ideological discourse: Christian National Education (CNE). One consequence was a strong emphasis on conformity and the homogeneity of white South Africans. This building of a national identity for whites was continuously undermined by diverse divisions. Of particular importance was the division between English and Afrikaans speaking South Africans. On the basis of this description, I elaborate Archer's (1979) explanation of education system change and construct an analytic framework which I use to illuminate key aspects of the governance of white education.

CHAPTER three follows the same pattern as chapter two, but with a focus on education for African South Africans. Beginning with a brief account of indigenous, missionary and colonial education, I describe the introduction and consolidation of apartheid

education. In contrast to white schooling, the introduction of apartheid led to resistance by African students, parents and teachers. This resistance culminated in the unbanning of the liberation movements and the release of Mandela and other political prisoners in early 1990.

THE National Party, after its accession to power in 1948, began centralizing and concentrating power at the national centre with the intention of ultimately devolving it to independent African states. The goal of apartheid education was for all African education to take place in the territories. The means to achieve this included destroying the influence of missionary education by centralizing power at a national level. The next step was to delegate power to tribally based regional authorities. Once these had been successfully established, all powers over, and responsibility for, education could be devolved from the national white government to the newly independent African territories. Although the plan failed, the appropriate governance structures were set into place. One consequence of this was the existence of nineteen education departments in April 1994.

PART one ends with some speculative predictions about those structural characteristics of African and white schooling that

are likely to persist in the future. Although part one is predominantly descriptive, my use of Archer (1979) enables me to analyze the descriptions and produce an explanation of those organizational structures and relations which will influence patterns of persistence and change (Watzlawick et al, 1974).

PART two builds on the groundwork laid in part one by describing and analyzing the dominant policy proposals for changes in governance relations. I examine six major policy proposals on education produced from 1990 to 1994. The 1991 Educational Renewal Strategy (ERS) produced by bureaucrats within the existing system. The 1993 National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI) produced by the National Education Co-ordinating Committee (NECC). The 1993 Framework for Lifelong Learning produced by the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU). The 1993 policy proposals for higher education produced by the Union of Democratic University Staff Associations (UDUSA). The 1993 report on Open Learning and Distance Education produced by the South African Institute for Distance Education (SAIDE). The 1994 Policy Framework for Education and Training (PFET) produced by the African National Congress (ANC). Other policy documents with implications for education were produced by the Institute for

Local Government (1993) and the Land and Agricultural Policy Center (1994). The intentions of the ANC in respect of education reform in 1994, as the senior partner in the Government of National Unity, were spelt out in the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) and the Implementation Plan for Education and Training (IPET) and the "White Paper" on Education and Training in a Democratic South Africa (M of E, 1994).

CHAPTER four uses an analytic framework adapted from another study by Archer (1988). And, once again, the aim is to use her ideas to illuminate what is happening in South Africa rather than to engage her in a debate. I analyze the values espoused and forms of governance proposed by the policy documents and draw the conclusion that, by 1994, two competing education discourses had emerged: a development discourse and a democratic discourse. Archer provides the basis for a framework with which to analyze the situational logics that makes these discourses competitive. These discourses have their roots in different conceptions of the forms of power in the state and in different interpretations of the six core values. I argue that, in consonance with the elite-pacting nature of the GNU and the interim constitution, a consensus (a new hegemonic articulation) has emerged. It is based

on the dominance of a development discourse and the existing pervasiveness of a large interventionist, authoritarian, paternalistic and administrative state. The democratic alternative, which had been strongly espoused in the 1980s, has received little attention in the policy debates. The desire for democracy has been subordinated to the apparent necessity for economic growth premised on our ability to compete in the global marketplace.

THE clearest indications of a democratic discourse are in the few places where attention is paid to the education and training of people living in the rural areas. Chapter five examines these policy proposals on governance of rural education and gives substance to the tension between development and democracy discourses. I conclude part two by drawing out those proposals, contained in the RDP and IPET, most supportive of a democratic discourse. Using the descriptions and analysis contained in parts one and two, I construct a "most likely" scenario by spelling out the historical legacy which provides the context; the situational logics which provide the "rules of the game"; and a profile of the main actors (Sunter, 1987: 14; Wack, 1985: 139 and 150). In part three I argue that one consequence of this scenario will be

the continued exclusion from educational opportunities of those people living in poverty in rural areas.

PART three begins with a brief history of rural education in South Africa. Chapter six begins with an overview of schooling on predominantly white owned commercial farms. I then look closely at the governance of community schools in the rural areas of KwaZulu. Drawing on the work of Mamdani (1993 and 1994), the "rural" is conceptualized as the necessary "other", that which is different from and excluded by the urban dominated development discourses and practices of the emerging national education and training system. I argue for the importance of a democratic oriented lifelong learning system – based on open learning, distance education and Community Learning Centres (CLCs) under the direct control and ownership of local governing bodies – as an alternative change strategy for rural education.

CHAPTER seven provides a brief case study of an education project which attempted to create a CLC in a remote rural area of KwaZulu-Natal. The example of Mboza serves to remind us of the extremity of the neglect of, and inequality produced by, apartheid education in educational provision in a remote rural

area. It also serves to remind us of how difficult it is going to be to change the existing system in a way that benefits the people of Mboza. The very neglect of education at Mboza makes it a crucial test case of the new post-apartheid system. The earlier chapters both explain why Mboza was neglected and why it is likely to continue to be neglected. They also offer an alternative possibility. Chapter seven demonstrates that this alternative could be viable if a democratic discourse and lifelong learning system were to be created in the rural areas.

PART four switches the focus from the systemic issues of governance and values, the politics of pedagogy, towards the intersubjective relations of power between teacher and student, the pedagogical as political. The switch in vantage point corresponds to a shift from predominantly descriptive analysis to the construction of a theoretical perspective. Both shifts remained rooted in their origins. The theory remains grounded in the context provided by the descriptions; and the analysis of pedagogy is grounded in the explanation of values and governance. A distinction is drawn between traditional, vanguard and critical discourses about the pedagogic relation, all of which are then characterized as being forms of a modern orthodox discourse.

IN each of the previous chapters, I use an analytic framework to illuminate key paradoxes, contradictions and tensions that bedevil any education project: from a small village community education project to the whole of the national system. The exposure of what is often obscured by the dominant discourses illuminates the nature of governance as a paradoxical project in the management of planned change: a nature almost universally characterized as benevolent. Perhaps more than any other social activity, education represents belief in the possibility of progress. When it fails, the remedy is usually more education.

CHAPTER eight directly challenges this modernist myth. I begin with an examination of the ways in which pedagogic power operates in modern education to (re)produce subjects and knowledges. I explore the possibility of a paradoxical discourse premised on both the necessity of subject-identities and the impossibility of their completeness. As with Archer (1979 and 1988) in previous chapters, I borrow a variety of ideas from diverse theorists – Adorno, Habermas, Foucault, Laclau, Mamdani and Žižek – to construct a perspective of education as subjection and refusal. An analogy is drawn between the paradoxical nature of human subjects, of education and of nation-building.

I conclude chapter eight with an argument for the deliberate setting into place of a structural opposition between two parts of a national education and training system. Between a schooling system for general education provided by a large development administrative state and a lifelong learning system, based on distance education, open learning and CLCs under the control of local democratic governing bodies. At the same time, paradoxical discourses must be created which contain contradictory perspectives. In this way, I conclude, it may be possible to nurture an understanding of the South African education system, our national education project, as being a paradoxical amalgam of persistence and change, democracy and development, subjection and refusal.

CHAPTER TWO

Schooling for whites: 1910 to 1990.

2.1 Introduction

ALTHOUGH her work cannot be applied to South Africa without considerable qualification, I want to use concepts from Archer's (1979) account of systemic structural change in the educational systems of England, Denmark, Russia and France to illuminate the development of the schooling system in South Africa. She warns against generalizing her findings beyond her detailed descriptions of four European countries and interpreting her sociological descriptions in a normative manner. In particular, she is tentative about the relevance of her findings to educational systems in developing countries:

... (this study) seeks to account for the autonomous emergence of this macroscopic change as the result of group interaction in countries where it cannot be attributed to external intervention, via conquest, colonization, or territorial redistribution (Archer, 1984: 14).

THIS cautionary note is particularly apposite in the case of South Africa which has experienced the imposition of a variety of imported educational influences:

There is perhaps no country in the world where the educational system has had so many buffetings and tamperings from without as the education of South Africa. At no period was education to any extent the spontaneous expression of the ethos, or genius, of the people. To a very large extent her educational system has been the resultant of successive impositions of systems or bits of systems from without (Malherbe, 1925: 7).

IN chapter three I will show that the history of African education in South Africa does not follow the patterns of education system change described by Archer, providing confirmation of her warning. In this chapter, I intend to show that the history of white schooling in South Africa does provide positive confirmation of Archer's (1979) theories. I will return to this question of corroboration at the end of chapter three.

ARCHER (1979) presents a detailed theory of structural change which attempts to avoid the pitfalls of reification, voluntarism and determinism by locating change within temporal cyclical sequences of structural conditioning - social interaction - structural elaboration (Archer, 1988: 304). Structures are not things in themselves but are the products of, and conditioning influences on, social interaction. Archer's theories are important contributions to social theory but they raise problems

about ontological commitments and epistemology that are beyond the scope of my present concern with education system change in South Africa and not with the consistency and coherence of Archer's theories. What follows, then, is not an examination of Archer's theories but a borrowing of her definitions, distinctions and questions. I do not attempt to apply Archer to the South African situation as in, for example, the work of Lee (1990) where her theories are given a normative status and used to make predictions.

ARCHER is both modest and clear in her aims. She is not presenting a comprehensive theory of change in educational systems but is providing an account of the way in which there is a structural conditioning of social interaction:

... what is presented does not constitute a complete theory of educational change. What are being traced through are the effects of structural conditioning on HOW social groups bring about educational change and the imprint of this on resulting patterns of change. Such a theory cannot itself explain the composition and characteristics of social groups at any time, or their norms and values, for this requires general theories about social structures and cultural systems (Archer, 1979: 619).

2.2 An illuminative framework

ARCHER makes a distinction between the structure of educational provision BEFORE and AFTER the emergence of a national education system. A national state education system is:

... considered to be a nationwide and differentiated collection of institutions devoted to formal education, whose overall control and supervision is at least partly governmental, and whose component parts and processes are related to one another (Archer, 1979; 54).

THE period before the emergence of a state system is characterized by change through conflict, the period after by change through negotiation. In most European countries, and in those countries colonized by European countries, the first formal schools were owned and controlled by the church. The church dominated its schools and defined education in relation to its own goals (Archer, 1979: 64).

ALTERNATIVE conceptions and provision of education arose from the actions of assertive groups, particularly the emerging middle classes: merchants, manufacturers, and public servants, whose needs were not being met by the church schools. The number and variety of these alternatives depended on the social distribution

of resources and values and the patterning of vested interests in the existing form of educations (Archer, 1979: 3). For an assertive group to challenge the monopoly of the church required both the ability to invest considerable economic resources in schooling and the construction of an alternative legitimating ideology.

ARCHER draws a distinction between two kinds of conflict which occurred prior to the emergence of state systems in her four examples. The social distribution of resources and values led to the assertive groups in England and Denmark engaging in substitutive strategies, and in France and Russia to restrictive strategies:

Instrumental activities can take two different forms - substitution or restriction... substitution consists in replacing the supply of educational facilities... by building and maintaining new schools and recruiting, training, and paying new teachers to staff them. Restriction ... consists in removing some of the facilities owned by the dominant group, or preventing it from supplying these resources to the educational sphere. Thus the monopoly is devalued coercively, buildings may be appropriated, educational funds confiscated, or personnel excluded from teaching and administration (Archer, 1979: 106/7).

RESTRICTIVE and substitutive strategies structurally condition the education system after the emergence of a national state

system. Restrictive strategies lead to centralized systems and substitutive strategies lead to decentralized systems:

Because substitutive strategies mean that various groups come to own and control independent networks, of differing size and importance, the types of action and interaction which link education to the polity are quite different from those which characterize systems with restrictive origins. There, a political elite sought financial support to develop national education; here, educational entrepreneurs seek political support to consolidate their control. There educational systems developed centrifugally, by governmental initiatives spreading outwards; here, they emerge centripetally, from peripheric innovations which converge on government. The difference between these processes is, metaphorically, the difference between imperialism and confederation. In the former, a powerful elite founds a national education system in order to serve its various goals; in the latter, educational networks already serving different goals become incorporated to form a national education system (Archer, 1979: 161).

2.3 The South Africa Act of 1909

THE key date for the emergence of a national education system for whites in South Africa is 1909 when the South Africa Act of 1909 laid down in clause 85(iii) that the provincial councils would be entrusted with all education other than higher education (Behr, 1988: 59). There is a strong similarity between the 1909 constitution and the interim constitution of 1994 in regard to

the distribution of education powers between the national and provincial governments. In both cases, the agreement on the distribution of powers to the different levels of government was partly a response to a demand for decentralization emanating from powerful entrenched interests in the KwaZulu-Natal region. In 1909, the case for significant provincial powers was put by Sir Frederick Moor, the Prime Minister of Natal; in the four years of negotiation prior to 1994, the case was put by the head of the KwaZulu government Chief Minister Buthelezi.

THE South Africa Act of 1909 brought into a Union the four previously self-governing colonies of Natal, Cape, Transvaal and Orange Free State. The key difference between the two constitutions was the exclusion of Africans from citizenship by the 1909 Act. The national unitary state created in 1910 recognized only white South Africans as citizens, although there were a few exceptions protected by anomalous provisions of the former colonial laws. This exclusion of the majority of the population from citizenship in the new state led to the formation of the African National Congress in 1912. The 1909 Act created an initially weak unitary state bifurcated between a modern civil state for white citizens and a refined form of colonial indirect rule for African subjects (Mamdani, 1987 and

1993). One of the effects of this bifurcation on African schooling was that the emergence of a state schooling system was delayed until 1953.

IN order to achieve a Union, rather than a Federation, the Act gave considerable powers to a second-tier government of provincial councils, particularly in education. The Act created a hierarchical divide in the system between the universities and the schooling system with the universities being controlled by central government and the schools by the provincial councils (NATED 02-170, 1988: 1). Each of the former colonies had proto-state systems of education in place and the Act brought into being a semi-decentralized national system thereby allowing the provinces the right to maintain their existing educational policies:

Very little change was brought about in the internal administration of the respective education departments of the four colonies when they were merged into the Union of South Africa (Malherbe, 1925: 398).

PRIOR to 1910, the pattern in each colony was one of gradual centralization through restrictive strategies employed by the colony governments to take control and ownership of what had been church controlled schools (a similar strategy was followed after

1953 in African schooling) (Behr, 1984: 3-20). Each of the provinces had a semi-centralized system of education with varying degrees of decentralization depending on the existence and vigour of local and district school boards. Natal had the most centralized system with few school or district boards and the Cape the most decentralized system with the highest number, and the most vigorous, school and district boards. The Union Act allowed the existing decentralization of administrative and organizational control at colony/provincial level to continue but increased the degree of centralization at the provincial level by removing the powers of school and district boards:

The Provincial system has succeeded in smothering a great deal of that local initiative which was originally present... School boards... have become bodies robbed of all powers of importance (Malherbe, 1925: 455/6).

THE concentration of power at the provincial level in what was to become an increasingly centralized national state created a constant tension between the provincial authorities and the central government. The source of the tension lay in the constitution of the Union and the division of responsibilities contained in the Union Act in which the balance of power was weighted in favor of central government. The provincial councils

were subordinate to the executive, legislature and judiciary of the Union and any ordinance passed by the provincial councils had to be consistent with the legislation of the parliament of the Union and were subject to the approval of parliament.

2.4 The centralization of power

THE tension between the central government of the Union and the provincial councils is reflected in the number of commissions appointed over the years to refine the division of responsibilities in respect of education - nine commissions were appointed between 1910 and 1960. The division was never simple or clearcut although the general thrust was towards control of norms, standards and finances being vested in the centre and administrative control in the provinces. The Financial Relations Act of 1913 provided for the financing of the provinces on a 50/50 formula with the central government contributing an equal amount to that contributed by the province from provincial taxes. The central government subsidy granted to the provinces was used to cover the costs of education, health and roads. This system of financing enabled the provinces, who only had to provide half the monies for any expenditure, to expand their schooling systems. By

1922, South Africa was spending more on the education of each white child than any other country for which statistics were available (Malherbe, 1925: 411).

THE 50/50 formula favoured the richer provinces and lead to a drain on the finances of the central government and the formula was replaced in 1925 when school attendance was introduced as the basis for subsidy (Malherbe, 1977: 578). This also proved to be unsatisfactory as the provinces felt they were now receiving too little money from the central government, largely because expenditure on health and roads was increasing rapidly due to urbanization and industrialization with a consequent decline in expenditure on education (Malherbe, 1977: 580). In 1945, the 50/50 formula was reintroduced and remained in force until 1972 when, following the recommendations of the Schumann commission, the subsidy was allocated according to a more complex formula incorporating the needs and the taxable capacity of each province (Malherbe, 1977: 589). Throughout this period, there was a continual decrease in the effective decision-making powers of the provinces as the central government legislated tighter and tighter constraints on educational expenditure (Malherbe, 1977: 576ff).

THE complexity of this intertwining of centripetal and centrifugal forces can be seen in the contradictory opinions of two of the most eminent of South Africa's historians of education. For Behr:

The divided control of education in the course of time lead to each province going its own way. There was no co-ordination in respect of policy (1984: 21).

FOR Malherbe:

Not only has there grown up a certain amount of uniformity among the provinces with regard to school practice, curricula, certification... but the Union Government itself has gradually brought more and more educational functions under its own jurisdiction (1925: 437).

The complexity is best summed up in this remark by Malherbe:

... the demarcation between the education functions of the Union and those of the Provinces has become vaguer and vaguer - until in the end it seems to exist... merely in the Minister's head (1925: 433)

THE emergence of a state education system for whites in South Africa combines features of both sides of Archer's dichotomy between restrictive and centralized systems (Russia and France)

or substitutive and decentralized systems (England and Denmark). The system had both centripetal and centrifugal forces present and centralized and decentralized structural characteristics. However, contra Behr, it is possible, using Archer's distinctions, to assert that the dominant tendency was towards centralization. The four colonies each had centralized systems of education which carried over into the provincial systems. This is most apparent in the lack of local and district levels of financing and governance powers (Malherbe, 1925: 409). The unification and systematization characteristic of a centralized national system is apparent in the gradually increasing centralization of control at the national level over financing, administration, pedagogy and curricula, as the provincial tax bases were eroded and by the establishment in 1918 of the Joint Matriculation Board to control national standards of certification.

TWO important features of the national education system for whites were, firstly, the lack of clarity over responsibility for vocational and technical education; and, secondly, the medium of instruction. The Union Act of 1909 was ambiguous as to where the responsibility lay for technical and vocational education. The result was a system of dual administration with most technical

and vocational education being provided by the central government in schools and colleges parallel to the provincial schools (Malherbe, 1977: 200ff). The provincial schooling systems pursued a mainly academic curriculum culminating in a matriculation examination geared towards university entrance (Behr, 1984: 28). The situation was clarified in 1955 when all vocational schools and technical colleges, including those previously owned and controlled by the provinces became the responsibility of central government. In 1967, the Educational Services Act transferred the responsibility for all full-time vocational education back to the provinces. This uncertainty as to control, ownership and responsibility resulted in a serious devaluing of technical and vocational education. By 1970, just under nine per cent of the white school population was receiving technical or vocational education (Malherbe, 1977: 198). This lack of technical and vocational expertise and infrastructure has serious consequences for the policies of the GNU. I will return to this in chapter four when I examine the strong emphasis on the importance of skills-based education and training in technology, mathematics and science in education policy discourses.

2.5 Language policy

THE question of which language or languages should be used as the medium of instruction has been, and will continue to be, one of the most controversial issues in South African education. For white South Africans the major conflict has been between the use of English or Afrikaans. Prior to 1910, the dominant medium of instruction in the colonies of the Cape and Natal was English; in the Orange Free State and the Transvaal it was Dutch. After 1910, the Union government was concerned to encourage the development of a single nation and saw bilingualism as an important element in this process. This led to a policy which encouraged the use of the mother-tongue as the medium of instruction within bilingual schools. Depending on the proportion of English and Dutch/Afrikaans speaking students, a school would be classified as either a parallel-medium or dual-medium school. A school could only use a single medium if the overwhelming majority of its students used the same mother-tongue (Malherbe, 1977: 30). However, the bitterness of the Anglo-Boer war and the significance of Afrikaans to the building of an Afrikaner nation led to increasing pressure for the establishment of single-medium schools. In 1925, Afrikaans became an official language in the civil service and by the late 1930s the use of Afrikaans as a

medium of instruction in single-medium schools was linked to the development of Christian National Education (CNE) as an essential feature of the development of an Afrikaner nation:

Language became the warp of the growing national consciousness, the symbol and expression for social and political independence. Part of the cultural struggle was a growing determination to have the principle of mother-tongue instruction set in the matrix of the education of "het volk", the people (Behr and Macmillan, 1971: 58).

AFTER the election of the National Party government in 1948, there was rapid movement towards single-medium schools and by 1958 less than three per cent of the white secondary student population were in dual-medium schools (Malherbe, 1977: 110). The consequence of this shift was to separate English and Afrikaans speaking students into:

... two distinct universes of discourse in which they figuratively (if not literally) do not talk the same language (Malherbe, 1977: 70).

THERE were two distinct phases in language policy: from 1910 to 1948 the dominant policy was for dual-medium schools; and from 1948 to the present for single-medium schools. In both phases the language policy was determined by central government with little

autonomy allowed to the provinces. In the first phase the central government intended to use schools to create a single national identity. In the second phase the central government attempted to use language as a key part of the construction of a volk, conceived as an exclusive nation of white Afrikaners. Both phases are examples of the increasing control of the central government over the schooling system: a process which utilized financial control as a lever to exert ideological control over the provision, curriculum and pedagogy of the school.

2.6 Restrictive strategies and political manipulation

IN Archer's terms the growth of the white schooling system followed an increasingly restrictive strategy. From the beginning, with the emergence of church schools in the Western Cape as part of colonial administration and settlement, to colony governments, to provincial councils to national government, the tendency has been towards the centre: to the increasing hegemony of an assertive national state. This process was given rapid momentum after 1930 by the increasing use of the state as the primary mechanism for a massive affirmative action programme for poor, mainly Afrikaans speaking, whites. As a consequence, by 1994, more than fifty per cent of the workforce was employed by

the state or by parastatals in a large administrative and bureaucratic state.

RESTRICTIVE strategies, for Archer, lead to strongly unified and systematized educational provision with a clearly defined hierarchy dominated by the centre. Substitutive strategies lead to systems with more space for interaction and exchange at the local level between diverse social groups. In the former ownership and control are vested in the centre, in the latter they are diffused through the system (Archer, 1979: 173-183):

... restrictive competition was seen to have shaped a centralized educational system whereas substitutive competition fostered the emergence of a decentralized one. The two types of system were shown to have considerable differences in terms of their administration (unification), internal organization (systematization), diversity of activities (specialization), and separation from other parts of society (differentiation) (Archer, 1979: 244).

AFTER the election of the National Party government in 1948, the power of the provincial authorities was further undermined although it took 19 years before centralization was consolidated by the National Education Policy Act of 1967. The Act provided a legislative framework for the governance of a national system with power concentrated in a strong administrative centre and a

value framework based on Christian National Education (CNE) (Malherbe, 1977: 141). Despite the title of the Act, it was only concerned with education for whites:

It would seem... that the Act would have been more accurately named, had it been called simply The White Persons' Education Act (Malherbe, 1977: 142).

ANOTHER 21 years passed before the remaining powers of the provincial education authorities were finally removed by the abolition of the provincial councils in 1986 and by the incorporation of the four provincial education departments, as regions, within one national system through the Education Affairs Act of 1988. This final consolidation of the centralization of the education system for whites took place within the framework and principles of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Act of 1983. This Act, together with the National Policy for General Education Affairs Act of 1984 created a distinction between "own affairs" and "general affairs" (NATED 02-300, 1991: 3ff; and NATED 02-170, 1988: 6ff). These two Acts provided the structure within which the white "population group" had a single centralized education system separated from the education systems of other "population groups". Under the Acts an "own affair" is described as a matter which affects a population group in

relation to the maintenance of its identity, way of life, culture, traditions and customs (Hartshorne, 1992: 16). Education at all levels was an own affair within the cultural and value framework of a specific group (NATED 02-300, 1991: 3). Although an own affair, the education system for whites had to be consistent with the norms and standards specified in the General Education Affairs Act of 1984. These norms and standards related to financing, syllabuses, certification, and professional recognition of, and salaries for, teachers. The Act also provided a set of general principles for education which included a commitment to equal opportunities and standards; recognition of that which is common and that which is diverse in the religions, cultures and languages of the different population groups; and, a commitment to state responsibility for the provision of formal education (NATED 02-300, 1991: 4). Within the scope of these general norms, standards, and principles, the education system for whites was autonomous, centralized and separated from the thirteen education departments that catered for the other "population groups".

THE restrictive origins and growing centralization of the white schooling system were reflected in the shift in power to the centre of the educational system, particularly, after 1948. By

1990, the national education system for whites was predominantly a schooling system owned and governed by a large administrative state. As is the case in Archer's examples of France and Russia the centre of the education system was co-terminous with the centre of the political system embodied in the state, and resulted in political manipulation being the dominant form of educational change. In centralized systems interaction is:

... centripetal in nature, for the negotiation of change depends upon the aggregation of grievances, the acquisition of political sponsorship, and the percolation of these demands into the central decision-making arena (Archer, 1979: 271).

THE social interaction that constitutes political manipulation is conditioned by the structure of political decision-making and by the structure of educational interest groups. In South Africa, the development by the central state of the white schooling system towards a centralized, homogeneous, unified model with strict hegemonic control of curricula and pedagogy was largely completed by 1990. The conflict over the division of power between provincial and central administrations had been settled decisively in favour of the central state. For educational change:

... the vital aspect of political systems is how broad or narrow, open or closed, accessible or inaccessible are their structures in nature. This will exert a direct effect on political manipulation, for... it helps to determine how much educational change is negotiated, what kinds of change are negotiable, and who can engage in negotiations (Archer, 1979: 275).

ARCHER draws a distinction between the framework of the state (within which elites are recruited, and within which they work, shaping policy and making decisions) and elite relations of solidarity or disunity (Archer, 1979: 275). The framework and the elite relations within it determine who has access to the political centre and what kind of educational demands can be negotiated. The National Party victory in the 1948 election:

... marked a decisive shift in the balance of forces in the South African state. Though often depicted as 'anti-capitalist' paradoxically it was precisely this new ruling party... which was able to secure the conditions of rapid accumulation... enabling all capitalists to intensify the exploitation of African workers and to raise the general rate of profit (O'Meara, 1983: 247).

THE National Party held power continuously from 1948 to 1994. This enabled it to establish a large administrative state schooling system within which decision making was tightly controlled at the centre and a value system maintained that promoted consensus among the elite. The roots of the National

Party and part of the explanation of its ability to dominate South African politics for so long can be found in the political debates and activities of the 1930s. The development of a Christian Nationalism with which to forge Afrikaner unity and a multiple class alliance between poor whites, white workers, small and large-scale capitalists and farmers on the basis of membership of a new common nation (volk) are a tribute to the policies of the Broederbond, the organizational capacity of church and cultural organizations, and the insecurity experienced by many Afrikaans speaking people following the Anglo-Boer war and the traumatic changes in the economy before World War 2.

2.7 The Broederbond and Christian National Education

THE Broederbond was an organization with membership being restricted to "... financially sound, white, Afrikaans speaking, Protestant males over twenty-five years old" (O'Meara, 1983: 63). The differing European roots and languages of the original settlers, their dispersion over the sub-continent and their differing religious and political beliefs had resulted in diverse, fractious and independent communities whose only common denominators were the newly emerged Afrikaans language and Calvinism. As an elite secret vanguard movement the Broederbond

was able to resolve conflicts behind closed doors and to construct an ideology and a political and economic movement that forged a new nation (Malherbe, 1977: 663). The central tenets of Afrikaner Christian Nationalism were the absolute sovereignty of God; culture as a divine product which together with race, history and fatherland distinguished the various nations from each other; the nation as the primary social unit from which all individuals drew their identity (O'Meara, 1983: 68).

THE foundations laid by the Broederbond enabled the National Party to construct an organic relationship between the Afrikaner people and the state with an organizational strength based on linguistic and cultural exclusivism and the sense of identity it evoked among Afrikaners (Stadler, 1987: 65). This amalgam bore fruit in 1948:

The English establishment was dealt a severe blow. Soon after taking power, the government put into operation a three-pronged programme to further the interests of Afrikaner nationalism. New discriminatory laws, the bureaucracy and parastatal sector was enlarged in order to generate Afrikaner employment opportunities and a variety of welfare programmes were launched to redistribute wealth and uplift the poor (mainly Afrikaner) white population (Terreblanche and Natrass, 1990: 12).

AFTER 1948, the National Party government was able to exercise power in a very effective and ruthless manner and to regard the state as its own (Yudelma, 1984: 285). The impact of this on the white schooling system was most apparent in the new organization, curricula and pedagogy the central government forced onto the provincial departments. During the 1930s a clear policy of Christian National Education was formulated by the Broederbond:

The exponents of Christian National Education believe that God ordained that there should be an Afrikaner nation with a land and language of its own and a religion based on orthodox Protestant-Calvinist principles. Furthermore, education must ensure that every individual is moulded in the image of God, so that he can be 'fully equipped for every good work'. 'National' is seen as love for one's own culture and heritage. Christian and national go hand in hand, and the school is the heart of national life (Behr, 1988: 98).

Central to the definition of the nation, and of the policy of Apartheid, was the racial division between nations. For Malan, The leader of the National Party in 1948:

The deep-rooted colour consciousness of the white South African... rises from the fundamental differences between the two groups white and black. The difference in colour is surely the physical manifestation of the contrast between two irreconcilable ways of life, between barbarism and civilization (quoted in Magubane, 1979: 254).

IN white schooling, this exclusivist definition of the nation led to the reversal of the trend towards dual-medium schools and the re-establishment of separate unilingual English and Afrikaans medium schools (Malherbe, 1977: 107). The implications for African schooling were that it should be in the mother-tongue; not be funded at the expense of white education; not prepare Africans for equal participation in economic and social life; preserve the cultural identity of the African community; be organized and administered by whites (Enslin, 1984: 140).

IN 1945, Langeveld published "Beknopte Theoretische". This marked the beginning of a concerted attempt by Afrikaner intellectuals to develop a theoretical justification for the racism of Apartheid education which led to the construction of a "science of education" named Fundamental Pedagogics (Beard and Morrow, 1981; and Enslin, 1984). Despite its theoretical contradictions and lacunas, Fundamental Pedagogics became the dominant influence on the curricula and pedagogy of South African schooling to the extent that, by 1990, approximately 80 per cent of all teachers had been trained within this tradition. The effect on the curricula is evident in the textbooks prescribed for use in the schools. Du Preez (1983: 71) identified twelve key archetypes

that were prevalent in the textbooks used in schools in the 1970s and 1980s. They are:

Legitimate authority is not questioned.

Whites are superior; Blacks are inferior.

The Afrikaner has a special relationship with God.

South Africa rightfully belongs to the Afrikaner.

South Africa is an agricultural country; the Afrikaners are a farmer nation (Boerevolk).

South Africa is an afflicted country.

South Africa and the Afrikaner are isolated.

The Afrikaner is militarily ingenious and strong.

The Afrikaner is threatened.

World opinion of South Africa is important.

South Africa is the leader in Africa.

The Afrikaner has a God-given task in Africa.

THE textbooks were often written by the same people who designed the syllabi and reflect clearly the policy of CNE and Fundamental Pedagogics (Taylor and Methula, 1993: 302). The pedagogue is the

representative of God and is in a position of undisputed authority over the student (Parker, 1981: 23). Despite the exclusivity of CNE there was little resistance to its implementation from English-speaking whites.

THE lack of effective school boards or district councils and poor parent association mobilization prevented English-speaking white parents from active participation in the system beyond the raising of school funds. For English-speaking teachers, forced to register with a racially defined teacher organization, active participation within the system was possible only within tight constraints. Even after the founding of non-racial teacher unions in the 1980's, white teacher involvement in resistance was confined to those working in African schools or teaching at universities and colleges. The white school students showed very little resistance to a highly authoritarian style of pedagogy and a racist-sexist curriculum that attempted to construct rigid subject-identities for the students. The language divide did mark a cultural difference, expressed most clearly in the claim to an English liberalism which did result in some insignificant opposition. Many of those whites most concerned about education became involved in trying to remedy the inequities of the system for Africans. This displacement of the activities of white,

predominantly English, liberals had the paradoxical consequence of promoting the continued importation of and addiction to "foreign", predominantly western, models of education. This addiction undermined any attempt to develop an indigenous education system based in African tradition and culture. The privileging of white education as a desirable goal and inequality as the primary deficit of African education confirmed the racist stereotypes of white superiority and African inferiority. In their opposition to apartheid education these liberals (typified by the South African Institute for Race Relations) perpetuated the racism they purported to oppose. The only sustained resistance to the white system came from university students at the English speaking liberal universities, symbolized at its best by the National Union of South African Students.

THE white schooling system was racially homogeneous, divided linguistically into English and Afrikaans schools, financed and strongly influenced from the centre, with a second-tier level of centralization in the provincial councils. Given the system's restrictive origins and the primacy of political manipulation as the most effective means of educational change it is no surprise that there was unequal access to the levers of change between English-speaking and Afrikaans-speaking whites.

2.8 The "Stop-Go" pattern

IN her analysis, Archer distinguishes between three archetypal forms of the state:

An impenetrable political centre - only sub-sections of the governing elite will be able to negotiate educational demands by political manipulation.

A semi-permeable political centre - sub-sections of the governing elite together with government supporters will be able to negotiate educational demands by political manipulation.

An accessible political centre - sub-sections of the governing elite, governmental supporters and governmental opponents will all be able to negotiate educational demands by political manipulation (Archer, 1979: 279).

THE other major factor conditioning political manipulation is the structure of educational interest groups. In centralized systems

the ability to influence political manipulation reflects the social distribution of political power. The more political muscle an educational interest group can wield the more success it can achieve in manipulating the political centre. The role of values and ideologies is more important in political manipulation than in the exchange-based negotiations of internal initiation and external transaction because, in providing legitimation, they have a direct influence on the distribution of political power:

Specific patterns of interaction (i.e. observed in a particular country during a given period) are held to derive from the combination of the two factors already outlined - the penetrability of the political centre and elite relations within it, and the superimposition and organization of supportive and oppositional interest groups in education (Archer, 1979: 284).

CHANGES in a centralized educational system follow a very different pattern from that prevalent in decentralized systems:

... demands for change have to be accumulated, aggregated and articulated at the political centre... if successful, they are then transmitted downwards as polity-directed changes... Patterns of change therefore follow a jerky sequence in which long periods of stability (i.e. changelessness) are intermittently interrupted by polity-directed measures. This has been termed the "Stop-Go pattern" (Archer, 1979: 617).

FROM 1948 to 1990, the National Party and the Afrikaner volk were able to create a system of education for whites that functioned largely as intended and remained in the "Stop-mode". The dominance of a single set of beliefs together with a united national economic and political movement held education within a single frame, although within this frame the system was rapidly modernized. For members of the volk there was good access to the centre, but this was rarely utilized given the dominant ideology with its emphasis on subservience. For other whites, the centre was impenetrable; even for English-speaking capital there was almost no access.

PART of the power of apartheid lay in the symbiotic relationship between capital and the state (Yudelman, 1984: 7). If having to submit to CNE was part of the cost of doing business in South Africa then it had to be borne. By the early 1960s:

... draconian security legislation seemed to have broken the back of mass resistance and created the conditions of stability which led to a sustained economic boom from 1963 to 1972, and a rate of return on invested capital which was the highest in the world (O'Meara, 1983: 247).

IT was only after 1976 that cracks began to appear in the hegemony of Afrikaner control of white schooling. Initially,

these were merely divisions within the ruling elite but they reflected the disintegration of the Afrikaner unity forged by Christian Nationalism in the face of crises in capital accumulation, legitimation and increasing internal resistance. Slowly the impenetrable centre became semi-permeable, particularly after 1985. It was only in 1993, however, that the political centre became accessible in the constitutional negotiations at the World Trade Centre and with the establishment of a National Education and Training Forum with representatives of more than sixty educational interest groups.

2.9 An illuminative overview

A national education system for whites in South Africa emerged in 1910. Prior to the emergence of the national state system in 1910, the dominant form of interaction in the schooling system was restrictive conflict between local councils and the colony governments that led to the creation of centralized systems in each of the four colonies:

THE post-emergence system began as a loose amalgam of four centralized systems. From the centre or the top it would appear as being decentralized into four separate systems; from the

bottom or the periphery it would appear to be centralized towards provincial councils with an increasingly powerful centre lurking behind them. In the period from 1910 to 1990 the system became increasingly centralized, largely on account of the financial control exercised by the centre and, from 1948, the desire of the National Party Government to implement Christian National Education, build a "volk" and implement an affirmative action policy for Afrikaners.

ARCHER'S research showed a strong connection between restrictive strategies and a centralized state system, and substitutive strategies and a decentralized system. This can be represented as:

restrictive

centralized

high	high	low	high
unification	systematization	specialization	differentiation



substitutive

decentralized

low	low	high	low
unification	systematization	specialization	differentiation

ARCHER'S analysis suggests that the restrictive nature of the dominant patterns of conflict in South Africa be followed by the emergence of centralized provincial education systems with an emphasis on unification and systematization. The trend towards growing centralization was reinforced at national level by the use of the central state, and especially the education system, as the primary instruments in a massive affirmative action programme for Afrikaans speaking whites that by the 1960s saw them dominating the state, and beginning to exercise significant financial power. Where the South African case differs significantly from Archer's examples is the degree of internal organization, or systematization within the system. The encompassing by the central state of the provincial departments through a restrictive strategy produced a high level of unification, low specialization, high differentiation but only a low level of systematization. Each of the provincial departments maintained different organizational styles.

BY 1990, there was a centralized state education system for whites, with an additional ten per cent of white students in private schools. In 1990, there were approximately one thousand private schools in South Africa with a total student population of about two hundred and fifty thousand. Of these, about two

hundred and thirty are schools with predominantly white student populations. These schools receive a government subsidy of between fifteen and forty-five per cent of running costs (SAIRR, 1990: 804; Christie, 1990: 1; Muller, 1992: 344). In 1988, there were about ninety two thousand white students in private schools out of a total white student population of nine hundred and fifty thousand, that is, about ten per cent of white students attend private schools (Muller, 1992: 343).

THE private school sector is made up of three very different kinds of schools: English speaking schools modelled on the British public school; church schools; independent schools catering primarily to African students. The vast majority of private schools are church schools. The significance of the private schools is that they were the first schools to de-segregate and accept students on a non-racial basis and to engage in the development of curricula aimed at meeting the needs of a post-apartheid South Africa (Christie, 1990: 136). Their importance to the education system as a whole is not great because they do not provide a model applicable to all schools. Muller has shown that respectable returns on investments in private schooling are achieved only at a cost six or seven times greater than those in the existing provision of education for

Africans (Muller, 1992: 352). Such an escalation in costs rules out any notion that privatization may provide an appropriate alternative model to the existing system.

2.10 An attempt to decentralize

FROM the period of Union in 1910 through to 1990 the central government worked towards increasing its control and ownership of the education system for whites. In 1990, the Minister of Education and Culture in the House of Assembly, announced that from the beginning of 1991 all schools for whites would have to choose between three models. Model A required the school to become a private school, owned and controlled by parent bodies, with state funding reduced to 45 per cent of operating costs. Model B gave parents increased control over schools, particularly over admissions policies, while maintaining full state ownership and funding. Model C converted the school into a semi-private school "owned" by a parent elected governing body who exercised control over school fees and funds, admissions and with some influence on staff appointments. Model C offered devolution of some aspects of governance, finance and administration (of the cultural aspects) to the institutional level. The effect of these changes on schooling was circumscribed by continuing state

control of pedagogy and curricula and of the administration and payment of the majority of staff. In effect, the regional and national departments continued to exercise control, predominantly through financial means and through the administrative control of the principal.

AT the beginning of 1992 all schools for whites were informed that they would become model C schools unless a majority of parents chose to opt for models A and B. However, models A and B schools would receive significantly less state funding than model C schools. The cumulative effect of these models was to turn state schools into semi-private schools with parents being given increased control and ownership in return for increased direct financial costs.

THE persuasion of schools into adopting model C represented a significant shift towards the creation of a decentralized system with the locus of power for daily organizational and some administrative decisions devolving to the school level, while financial power and control of the teachers, curriculum and certification remained centralized at the national level. In theory, the few remaining provincial level powers were redistributed to the institutional level creating a two level bi-

polar system with key powers located at national level and powers affecting the organization and culture of the school being located with the principal and parents at the institutional level. In practice, the uncertainty generated by the national negotiations in the period between 1990 and 1994 lead to the status quo pre-1990 being maintained in the belief that a new democratic government would introduce major changes to the education system.

THE decentralization of financial control is impossible unless there are regional, district and local forms of revenue collection. Since 1910, South Africa has had a strongly centralized national system of taxation. The creation of Joint Services Boards in 1989 marked a significant shift towards district level forms of collection although these have not yet affected education beyond the building of a few schools. The models did shift part of the financial burden for education onto white parents. From 1910 onwards, public government schooling for white children was free. From 1990, the state contribution was limited to a specific amount based on different formulas for the four models with the amount of state subsidy varying according to the degree of local control. The more autonomous the school, the more parents paid.

HAVING taken 40 years to create a centralized system, the National Party government suddenly changed tack and began a rapid decentralization from the centre in a top-down fashion. The unique nature of this change is made clear by Archer's observation that:

... no governing elite voluntarily renounces a centralized educational system (Archer, 1979: 787).

The reasons for, and implications of, this policy change will be explored later in chapter four.

2.11 Conclusion

BY 1990, the education system for whites had a high degree of unification (national norms, standards and financing), a low level of systematization (different organizational styles), a low level of specialization (diversity of activities) and a high level of differentiation (separation from other parts of society). Apart from systematization, the other characteristics are in keeping with Archer's observations about the structural characteristics of centralized systems. The centralized administration of the system that had been achieved by 1990, was

partly undermined by the continued existence of the provincial departments in the form of regional departments enabling different organizational cultures to continue to exist. The low level of specialization is to be expected; apart from the private schools and the few technical and vocational schools, the schooling system was geared towards a limited academic curriculum, with certification allowing little specialization. The South African schooling system for whites always had a high degree of separation (differentiation) from other parts of society. Its governance hierarchy was vertical, authoritarian and autonomous of other local or district governance structures.

USING Archer's distinctions illuminates the key structural features of the education system and, in particular, the way in which governance of the system has been effected. Apartheid education for whites produced a large centralized administrative state schooling system. There was little provision of literacy or other forms of Adult Basic Education and Training (ABET). The increasing concentration of power at the national centre was used to produce a uniform and authoritarian schooling system which maintained a fairly high quality of provision for white students.

IN spite of Archer's warning against applying her theories in post-colonial situations, the white schooling system appears to

confirm Archer's theory. A restrictive strategy followed by centralization; political manipulation as the dominant form of change; an impenetrable political centre and the persistence of a "Stop-Go pattern". But, suddenly, in 1990 this is reversed and the state attempts to decentralize power to the institutional level. That it failed to do so is testimony not to the predictive power of Archer's theory but to the accuracy of her observation that structural characteristics tend to persist. This applicability should not lead us to forget that the white schooling system was the system of the colonizers and that its pervasive presence prevented the emergence of an indigenous African system of education.

THE white schooling system was part of the totalizing project of apartheid. Its racial exclusivity was premised on its difference from the "other" of African schooling. Diversity and difference are usually associated with decentralization of governance powers. It is one of the peculiarities of apartheid that a strong centralized state was used to create a society segregated by racial difference. The attempt by the National Party government to "administer" racist inequalities resulted in a form of governance characterized by a bureaucratic organizational culture which I will examine in more detail in chapter eight.

THE governance of education for Africans since 1953 has displayed a similar concentrating of power through a restrictive strategy employed by central government. The objective of the "grand plan" of apartheid education was a phased process of social engineering. The dissolution of the powers of the churches over schooling. The concentration of power at a national centre followed by its devolution to ten independent and self-governing states. By 1990, although African education was divided into eleven separate departments producing a very low level of systematization, power was still concentrated primarily at the centre. The dominant features of African education were, also, high unification, high differentiation, low specialization and low systematization. The emergence of these characteristics, however, did not follow the patterns described by Archer.

BEFORE describing African education from 1910 to 1990, it is worth listing the eight most important features of the white education system to structurally condition possibilities for change in the future:

The separation of an education system for whites from the education systems for Africans, Indians and coloureds and its legislative consolidation as an "own affair".

The large centralized administrative structure.

The division into unilingual Afrikaans and English schools.

The lack of district and local levels of governance.

The evacuation of powers from the provincial level, predominantly to the national level, although some powers were redistributed to the institutional level after 1990.

The high differentiation between the education system and other social structures and institutions.

The largely academic curriculum of most schools.

The pervasive influence of Fundamental Pedagogics and Christian National Education in the training of teachers, and in curricula and textbooks.

CHAPTER THREE

Schooling for Africans: 1910 to 1990.

3.1 Introduction

PRIOR to 1953, schooling for Africans was provided, in the main, by the churches. There were some provincial schools and the state did provide small subsidies to church schools but, on the whole, the state did not accept responsibility for provision of African schooling. The Bantu Education Act of 1953 did acknowledge the responsibility of the state for African education albeit as a cornerstone of apartheid. This chapter explores the development of schooling for Africans with its origins in missionary education and a context of colonialism and apartheid.

AGAIN using Archer (1979) as an illuminative framework, I concentrate on those structural characteristics of the system most closely associated with governance. On the surface, 1953 appears to mark the emergence of a state schooling system for Africans. Before 1953, in Archer's (1979) terms, African education was marked by substitutive conflict which, in her examples, leads to a decentralized state. In the case of African education in South Africa this was not the case. The National

Party government introduced a highly restrictive strategy and a rapid process of centralization.

THERE was little overt resistance to missionary education but the advent of apartheid education was immediately met by resistance. This initial resistance had dissipated by 1960 and there was a lull until 1976. After June 1976 there was sustained resistance not only to apartheid education but to the whole ensemble of political, economic and social institutions, beliefs, values and practices that constituted apartheid. In Archer's examples, after a national state schooling system has emerged conflict is replaced by negotiation. The conflict and violence which permeated African schooling imply that, by 1990, a national state schooling system for Africans had not yet emerged. The history of African schooling appears not to corroborate Archer (1979) and reinforces her injunction to beware of applying it to colonial and post-colonial schooling. Nevertheless, using her distinctions and definitions provides a useful analytic framework for discerning how the state governed education for Africans.

THIS chapter provides a description of African schooling in South Africa. By the end of this chapter I will have provided an overview of African and white schooling from 1910 to 1990 that

examines the way in which governance structures and organizational practices have developed and are likely to persist into the foreseeable future.

3.2 Indigenous and colonial education

THE provision of schooling for Africans has its roots in the colonial conquest of South Africa and in the subsequent large influx of missionaries. By 1900, there were more missionaries in South Africa than any other country in Africa. The colonial conquest of South Africa was neither rapid nor total but rather the slow undermining of traditional indigenous social relations by a process of attrition (Stadler, 1987: 36). Many Africans maintained their traditional political, cultural and economic relations up to the end of the nineteenth century. The missionaries major role in this process of attrition was through the provision of mission schools, although at no time did these schools provide formal education to more than a small minority.

THE nature of the traditional indigenous form of education has been described by Keto as providing African youth with an education in which:

They were introduced gradually to the world around them until they reached puberty. At that point a formal intensive learning process lasting up to six months was carried out in the initiation ritual. Lessons in manners, roles, responsibilities, values and history accompanied the test of endurance and the ability to bear pain... There was always a congruent relationship between the training and the lifestyle which the young people encountered when they left "school". The society that controlled these schools also influenced the life chances of the students who graduated from them (1990: 20).

In Archer's (1979) terms, indigenous education had low unification, low systematization, low differentiation and low specialization. In some sense there was a loose system of community governed (owned and controlled) indigenous education, but it was not a state education system.

THE advent of colonialism and, in the twentieth century, the modernization of economic and social relations in South Africa ruptured this congruent relationship and displaced the control of the indigenous society over the life chances of the students. The mission schools provided an opportunity for the few to obtain the sort of education which could improve their life chances by giving them access to employment in the new order (Molteno, 1984: 48; Jones, 1970: 47).

THE goals of missionary education prioritized evangelism and conversion to Christianity. The unintended consequences, however, were very different in that the schools inculcated eurocentric values and encouraged the consumption of goods manufactured outside the traditional African economy. The government of the Cape colony, realizing the value of these aspects of missionary education, began to subsidize mission schools from 1855 (Malherbe, 1977: 538). The curriculum emphasized the inferiority of African people and the importance of obedience, humility, patience and passivity (Molteno, 1984: 56). Manual work was combined with a classical European academic curriculum and religious education. The emphasis was on achieving functional literacy in English and becoming numerate (Christie, 1985: 65). Successful students could aspire to employment as ministers of religion, clerical workers and teachers, while less successful students could become servants. The privileged few who went on to secondary education received a sound academic education with the same syllabus and certification given to white South Africans. Those few who had access to these schools tended to be active believers in a particular religion or members of existing elites, such as tribal authorities. The educated African elite, often the sons of existing tribal elites, were employable within the apparatus of colonial society. The uneducated African masses were

restricted to employment as unskilled labour in the mines and on the farms.

IN each of the colonies there was a slight but gradual increase in central government control of mission schools prior to 1910 (Keto, 1990: 25). The schools were administered, owned and mostly controlled by the churches who had borne ninety per cent of the costs up to 1910 (Malherbe, 1977: 540). The Union Act of 1909 placed all matters affecting Africans under the control of the central government except for education where control and financing was vested in the provincial councils (Behr, 1984: 175). From 1910 to 1953, the mission schools were administered and controlled jointly by the churches and the provincial councils (NATED 02-170, 1988: 3). Although the schools were owned by the churches they were subsidized, firstly, by the provincial councils, and then, from 1926, by the central government (Malherbe, 1977: 543; Hunt Davies Jr, 1984: 130).

3.3 Church and provincial schooling: 1910 to 1953

BY 1910, the colonies of the Cape and Natal had set up a small number of schools and some schools had been built by local communities, but the vast majority of schools were church schools. The financing of all schools was determined by the amount raised by taxation on Africans. The development fund and the actual grant given to each province was based on what had been spent by the province in the past. As Malherbe notes, this is a principle:

... which has repeatedly been applied when devising future educational provision for education, namely, to base such a grant on what had actually been spent in the past, rather than on what should be spent in terms of the future educational needs of a group (1977: 542).

IN 1926 education was allocated one-fifth of the amount raised in taxes, but the proportion was increased regularly until 1943 when the whole amount was allocated to education (Jones, 1970: 53). The total amounts remained small and inadequate and the provision of schooling grew slowly. By 1935, the state was spending forty times as much on each white child in school as on each African child in school and seventy per cent of African children never attended school (Behr, 1984: 178; Molteno, 1984: 69).

TWO important features of the pattern and development of schooling for Africans in the period from 1910 to 1953 were, firstly, the minimal nature of provision and, secondly, the emergence of a division between schooling in the white areas of South Africa and in the African areas which were later to become the territories. Both features were linked to the political and economic development of South Africa. By 1910, the mining industry was established as the dominant sector in the South African economy. The mines required a cheap and controllable unskilled labour force. The needs of the mines were congruent with the concerns of the other significant sector of the economy, agriculture, where white farmers felt threatened by the growing productive capacity of the African peasantry (Bundy, 1988: 134). The Glen Grey Act of 1894 in the Cape colony and similar provisions in the other colonies, placing restrictions on land tenure and the imposition of hut and poll taxes, created the conditions for the mines to recruit migrant wage labourers and begin a process of destabilizing the rural African areas (Stadler, 1987: 39):

Access to land was made more difficult; taxes, rents and other fees were raised; the control of various forms of "squatting" was intensified (Bundy, 1988: 240).

THE 1913 Natives Land Act and the 1936 Development Trust and Land Act restricted African ownership to thirteen per cent of the total land of South Africa. Those Africans who had acquired freehold title to land outside the designated areas prior to the Acts were regarded as "black spots" to be removed (Platzky and Walker, 1985: 83). In the white rural areas the effects of the Acts were to transform a squatter peasantry who, although obliged to pay ground rent, had been able to produce agricultural surpluses and profits into wage labourers with few rights (Stadler, 1987: 53). In the designated African areas, the reserves or territories:

Areas that had been able to provide for themselves and in favourable seasons to export foodstuffs, were being reduced to a state of precarious self-reliance or already to a dependence upon imported food and the remittance of wages by migrant labourers (Bundy, 1988: 221).

THE myth that migrant labourers had access to land, on which their families were supposed to produce the means of their own subsistence, helped the mines to pay low wages and to avoid any increases in wages in real terms between 1910 and 1973 (Stadler, 1987: 40). Mining dominated the economy until the mid 1930s and:

The institutional racist barriers imposed to regulate labor relations in the mines were generally extended to almost all spheres of economic, social and political life, including education (Cross and Chisholm, 1990; 46).

IN the mid 1930s the central government began to provide subsidies to the agricultural and manufacturing sectors. South African agriculture has always faced difficult conditions. Only about fourteen per cent of the land is arable, the climate is erratic with regular droughts, and long distances between farms and markets increase costs. The provision of subsidies favoured those farmers with resources to make use of them and increased the degree of stratification between a small elite of successful farmers and a larger group who found it increasingly hard to make a profit. For the latter group, in particular, the ability to pay low wages to what was essentially coerced labour was an important competitive advantage (Stadler, 1987: 51). Mining and agriculture were structured on the division between a large unskilled, uneducated and cheap African labour force and a semi-skilled and skilled white elite. As a result of these policies only a small number of mine, factory and farm schools for Africans were built before 1953.

BY 1935, there was a small urban African population outside of the mines. Most towns and cities had adjoining townships (locations) which supplied domestic labour and a small industrial workforce. The urban African population began to grow with the expansion of the manufacturing sector following the introduction of government subsidies. South Africa's involvement in the Second World War boosted the growth of the manufacturing sector and of a semi-skilled African workforce. The availability of work in urban areas and the continuing deterioration of conditions in the countryside increased the rate of urbanization significantly. By 1943, manufacturing had become the dominant sector of the economy and there was a significant urban African working class living permanently, but precariously, in the metropolitan areas (Cross and Chisholm, 1990: 54; Stadler, 1987: 57). The provision of education in these urban areas was largely at the primary level through community schools built by local people but administered by the province.

THE creation of a bifurcated state in the Union Act of 1909 made Africans the subjects of a Minister of Native Affairs in the national government, an ultimate sovereign or chief, who acted as the "in persona" representation of the state. The exclusion of Africans from citizenship in the civil society, economy and state

left them subject to three distinct forms of governance. On white farms, factories and mines they were virtual slaves, living at the whim of the white owner of the land; near the towns and cities, hostels and townships they were ruled by the local white town or provincial council and subject to South African law and police; in the territories, a system of chieftainship and tribal authorities was entrenched with almost total control of the daily lives of people within their areas, subject to the supervision of a district magistrate who played a role similar to that of the colonial district commissioner.

ONE consequence of these economic and political forces is reflected in the distribution of the African population in 1950 (the figures have been rounded off to the nearest whole number) (Platzky and Walker, 1985: 18):

	WHITE AREAS		AFRICAN AREAS
	URBAN	RURAL	%
1950	25	35	40

The provision of schooling does not reflect this demographic distribution largely because of rapid urbanization and overall

neglect. Of the total African schoolgoing population only forty-one per cent attended school giving a total enrollment of about 740,000 students (Graaf and Gordon, 1992: 215; Horrell, 1968: 154; Behr, 1984: 188). Of these 740,000 students, approximately 35 per cent were in urban schools, 15 per cent in farm schools and 50 per cent in territorial schools. By 1950, there were approximately 7,000 schools for Africans of which 5,000 (71 per cent) were mission schools. In the white urban areas, the majority of schools were community schools, with a few mine and factory schools. In the white rural areas farm schools catered for about twenty-five percent of the children of school-going age; in 1950, there were 1,125 farm schools of which 940 were mission schools. In the African territories the majority of schools were mission schools albeit with a significant minority of community schools.

IF one compares the situation in 1950 with that of 1926 it is clear that there was a significant increase in the provision of schooling. In 1926, there were 2,702 missionary schools with a total pupil enrollment of 215,956 and only 68 community and territorial schools with a total pupil enrollment of 7,710 (Behr, 1988: 96). This growth took place within the framework of a low level of financing and helps to explain why the financing formula

was the subject of scrutiny and regular changes. From 1930 to 1940 expenditure by the central government rose from 1.2 million to 2 million Rands. In 1945, the financing formula was changed again with responsibility for funding reverting back to the Consolidated Revenue Fund producing a sharp increase in expenditure: by 1950 expenditure totalled 11.6 million Rands. Malherbe puts this increase in perspective when he notes that by 1974:

If one adds up the amount of money which the state spent on the education of the Bantu (i.e. on four-fifths of the Republic's population) during the sixty-four years since the formation of the Union in 1910 it will amount to a smaller figure than the amount spent on defence in one year (1975) (Malherbe, 1977: 602).

BY 1953, there were four types of schooling for Africans, all of which were subsidized by central government:

MISSION schools, administered jointly by the respective missionaries and the provincial councils;

COMMUNITY schools which were built by the local community, but staffed by the province and controlled by a combination of elected school committees, the bureaucracy of the provincial department, and traditional tribal authorities;

STATE schools which were built and staffed by the province, and controlled by nominated school boards and the bureaucracy of the provincial department;

FARM, FACTORY and MINE schools (not owned by the churches), which were built by the owner and staffed and administered by the province;

MOST of the schools were primary schools. Of the forty-one per cent of the school-age population that attended school, about fifty-four per cent completed four years of schooling, twenty-eight per cent completed seven years, seven per cent completed ten years, and only one per cent completed the full twelve years (Behr, 1984: 188). The curriculum of the primary schools was determined by the provincial authorities in the case of territorial and community schools and by the missionaries in the mission schools with the approval of the provincial authorities. In the small number of secondary schools the syllabus was the same as in white schools and matriculants wrote the examination of the relevant provincial authority, that is according to geographic location and not race (Cross and Chisholm, 1990: 50).

THE geographic distinction between urban and rural areas marks a significant difference between the life-chances, risks and opportunities of the people in the different areas and the kinds of schools to which they had access. Africans in the urban areas were the group being incorporated most rapidly into modernity and the majority of their schools were community schools. They were employed in the manufacturing and domestic sectors, were politicized and involved in the running of their schools. The group living on white farms and working in the mines were coerced wage labourers under the almost total supervision of farm and mine owners. They had few schools and very little influence on those schools. The third group living in the territories were subject to the tribal authorities, struggling to produce a subsistence living and most of their schools were owned and controlled by the churches. The large number of different churches involved in mission schools created a situation where:

School control by religious bodies had created a multiplicity of administrative units of very unequal size and efficiency, and with widely different conceptions as to the aims and purposes of education (Eiselen Commission quoted in Behr, 1984: 180).

THE dominant features of schooling for Africans from 1910 to 1953 were the segregation of the administration of African schools

from the administration of white schools; a centralized system of financing; decentralized administrative control through the four provincial councils; the majority of schools were owned by the churches; the majority of schools were primary schools with very few students completing the full twelve years of schooling. There was also a distinct difference in governance, finance and provision between African schools in the white urban areas, the white rural areas, and the African territories.

THE right to education, even if understood as a second generation right, is understood to imply some responsibility on the part of the state to provide at least some minimum of basic education. By denying Africans the right to citizenship of South Africa, the Union Act of 1909 allowed the national and provincial governments to neglect the provision of education to their African subjects. It was not their responsibility.

IN Archer's terms the dominant structural characteristics of schooling for Africans prior to 1953 were low unification and systematization, a middle level of specialization and a middle level of differentiation. Archer associates low unification, low systematization, low differentiation and high specialization with decentralized systems of education. While some degree of

unification and systematization was produced by centralized financing, the decentralization of administrative control to the four provincial councils and the nature of their joint control with the different churches undermined any centripetal tendency. In addition, there were significant differences between the provinces in curricula and certification. The nature of competition between the provincial schools and the church schools was substitutive rather than restrictive; the only restrictions imposed were implemented through a laissez-faire inspectorate who ensured a minimal compliance to the provincial syllabi. By 1953, no national system of schooling for Africans had emerged and the dominant form of conflict was substitutive.

ARCHER'S analysis suggests that the substitutive nature of the dominant patterns of conflict between church and state schools would be followed by the emergence of a decentralized education system for Africans with a high degree of specialization and low degree of differentiation. Instead, the introduction of apartheid education in 1953 saw the application of a highly restrictive strategy leading to centralization. For Archer, decentralized systems require both substitutive origins and a decentralized process of education system change which relies predominantly on exchange based interaction between teachers, the state and

external investors and stakeholders (employers, unions, churches and other interest groups). The political manipulation characteristic of centralized systems assumes a far less significant role. The poverty of provision of African education, the lack of education and training for teachers and the lack of resources available to external stakeholders combined to prevent the emergence of exchange based alternatives to political manipulation.

FROM 1953, the state pursued a restrictive strategy to sweep away the structural characteristics of a decentralized system and to concentrate power at the centre with the objective of then decentralizing power to the territorial level. This is similar in form, though not in content, to the actions of the Government of National Unity in 1994 when it created a new national ministry of education and training thereby creating a twentieth education department. Once again, the objective of the new ministry is to incorporate all the other ministries into one unified centralized ministry which will then reallocate powers to the nine provinces.

3.4 Apartheid and Christian National Education

THE election of the National Party government in 1948 and the subsequent propagation and implementation of apartheid together with a rapid increase in industrialization and urbanization marked the beginning of a period of change for the country as a whole and for African education in particular. The Eiselen Commission was appointed in 1949 to draw up a plan for African education. Its findings were presented in 1952 and became the basis of the Bantu Education Act of 1953 (Behr, 1988: 35). The Eiselen Commission found that the primary motivation for seeking access to schooling was economic and this was reflected in a tremendous drive for certificates and a strong aversion to any education specially adapted for "the Bantu" (Behr, 1984: 179). The Africans wanted the same schooling as that given to the whites because any differences would impair their opportunities in the work-place. Despite these findings the commission maintained that:

Bantu education does have a separate existence, just as, for example, French education, Chinese education, or even European education in South Africa (Quoted in Behr, 1988: 34).

THE intentions of Verwoerd, the Minister of Native Affairs, in promulgating the Act were clear. Education was to be one of the cornerstones of apartheid, for which much of the foundation had already been laid in the Land Acts and the different non-civil forms of government to which Africans were subjected. The other cornerstones were the Population Registration Act, the Group Areas Act and the Separate Amenities Act. While these latter acts dealt with the physical concretization of apartheid the role of education was to produce the right mental attitudes, dispositions, knowledge and beliefs and the appropriate types of skill:

It is the policy of my Department that Bantu Education should have its roots entirely in the Native areas and in the Native environment and in the Native community... The Bantu must be guided to serve his own community in all respects. There is no place for him in the European community above the level of certain forms of labour... Up till now he has been subjected to a school system which drew him away from his own community and practically misled him by showing him the green pastures of the European but still did not allow him to graze there (Quoted in Malherbe, 1977: 546)

THE Bantu Education Act placed control of African schooling under the central government. The Division of Bantu Education, however, was divided into six regional divisions to ensure that "... homogeneous population elements were grouped together" (Behr,

largest territories in the thirteen per cent of the land reserved for the African population. The Act structured the schooling system for those Africans living in the territories without recognizing the demographic reality that sixty per cent of the African population was living in the white areas. The effect of the Act was to bring about the closure of the majority of the church schools, to strictly peg the financing of African schooling to a very low level (less than 10 per cent of the amount spent on a white pupil), and to ensure rigid control of what was taught in the schools. The system of financing reverted back, once again, to the 1926 formula with the result that per capita expenditure on African schooling declined from 1953 through to 1969, when the formula was changed again (Malherbe, 1977: 552).

OF the 5,000 mission schools operating in 1953 only 700 catholic schools remained in 1959 (Christie and Collins, 1984: 162). Most churches chose to close their schools rather than become instruments of apartheid education. The catholic schools continued without state aid, effectively becoming private schools although still obliged to implement the curricula and syllabi designed and designated by central government. Most of the other mission schools were turned into community schools; by 1960,

seventy-five per cent of all African schools were community schools (Behr, 1984: 187). The destruction of the missionary schooling system was based on the belief that they were:

Nothing less than an instrument in the hands of liberalism... Native education has achieved nothing but the destruction of Bantu Culture... nothing beyond succeeding in making the Native an imitation Westerner (Botha quoted in Malherbe, 1977: 546).

DESPITE racist intentions, Botha paradoxically describes missionary education with remarkable accuracy. Apartheid was as much a rejection of western Enlightenment values of liberty, equality and democracy as it was an affirmation of the superiority of white Africans over black Africans. Botha correctly rejects the destruction wrought on indigenous African education by missionaries, unfortunately he did so for the wrong reasons. Segal (1993) provides an analysis of these reasons by exploring the fear of "the other" that lay at the heart of CNE. Segal attacks what he sees as a logical fallacy at the heart of CNE. He appropriates Plato's ideas that fear can bewitch us and cloud our judgment and that justice, which allows for harmony within and between individuals and civil society, requires the overcoming of fear.

SEGAL argues that CNE is bewitched by fear and assumes fear to be a necessary condition of existence for any people/community/volk whose identity is weak and put at risk by the presence of "the other" (Segal, 1993: 36ff). Segal concludes that CNE was irrational because it failed to question this assumption which took the form of a tautology (Segal, 1993: 40). In Archer's terms, as I will make clearer in chapter four, the discourse of CNE contains a contradiction between the necessity of justice for collective survival and the assumption of fear of "the other" as a necessary condition for the survival of an "endangered community". Whether or not it was logically consistent, CNE did have a dramatic impact on education for Africans.

THE 1953 Act made all education for Africans the responsibility of the Minister of Native Affairs who had wide powers and almost total control over the African population. Education was administered by a division of Bantu Education within the Department of Native Affairs. The powers of the Minister of Native Affairs were rooted in the 1909 Union Act and the 1927 Natives Administration Act. Under the Union Act, all matters relating to the African population, except for education, became the responsibility of the Minister. The 1927 Act made the Minister the supreme chief of all Africans to whom traditional

tribal chiefs owed allegiance (Stadler, 1987: 129). The 1951 Bantu Authorities Act made traditional chiefs elements in, and instruments of, the bureaucratic hierarchy of the Department of Native Affairs. The 1953 Bantu Education Act removed the anomaly of provincial control over education for Africans and consolidated the powers of the Minister of Native Affairs. Those schools falling within a territory became subject to the territorial government with its basis in the tribal authority system, ensuring at the local level that chiefs and tribal authorities would exercise significant control over the building, location and administration of community schools.

THE new system of African education was now rigidly separated from the systems for whites, coloureds and Indians. The Matriculation examination which previously included all candidates was separated now along racial lines (which is why one can accurately identify the number of African matriculants from 1950 onwards). There were six categories of schools (adapted from Malherbe, 1977: 554):

Community schools in white urban areas: built by local communities, but now subsidized by the state on a Rand for Rand basis; controlled by elected committees and the state bureaucracy; running costs fully subsidized by the state.

Community schools in the territories: built by communities under the control of, and on land "owned" by, the local chief and tribal authority, but now subsidized on a Rand for Rand basis by the state through the territorial government; controlled by a school committee, the chief and tribal authority, and the territorial bureaucracy; running costs subsidized by the state.

State schools in the white areas: built by the provincial authorities and now maintained and staffed by the state; controlled by the state bureaucracy advised by a nominated school board; running costs fully subsidized by the state.

State schools in the territories: built by the provincial authorities and now maintained and staffed by the central state through the territorial government; controlled by the territorial bureaucracy advised by a nominated school board; running costs fully subsidized by the state.

Farm, mining and factory schools: built by the owner, with a limited state subsidy; controlled jointly by the owner and the state bureaucracy; running costs fully subsidized by the state.

Private schools: mainly Roman Catholic church schools; no state aid.

BY 1960, the approximate distribution of the enrollment between the schools was:

	%
community schools	75
state and territorial schools	12
farm, mine and factory schools	9
private schools	4

3.5 From decentralization to centralization

IN marked contrast to the quiescence of white schooling, the development of the state schooling system for Africans after 1953 saw the forced implementation of apartheid education being strenuously resisted. In Archer's examples of England and Denmark the substitutive origins conditioned the emergence of decentralized systems in which the dominant forms of educational change were internal initiation and external exchange instead of conflict or political manipulation. The source of internal initiation is:

... the school, the college and the university. It can be brought about on a small scale by independent initiative in a particular establishment, and on a much larger scale by collective professional action (Archer, 1979: 240).

External transaction is:

... usually instigated from outside educational boundaries by groups seeking new or additional services... it is a form of negotiation which is open only to those groups which have substantial resources at their disposal (Archer, 1979: 240/2).

BOTH internal initiation and external exchange depend on three factors: the development of a strong semi-autonomous body of professional educators who have the status, expertise and resources to provide leadership in educational innovations; a strong private sector with sufficient resources outside the control of the state to finance innovation; and a source of alternative values and ideologies which can legitimate the innovations. Both forms of change are a consequence of social interaction through negotiation based on exchanges. For example, an exchange of educational expertise and human resources for material resources (Archer, 1979: 408). Political manipulation is only used in decentralized systems either as a last resort when internal initiation and external exchange are not producing the desired results or by the marginalized members of the society who do not have the resources to engage in the exchange based forms of negotiation. Political manipulation tends to be unsuccessful as a form of change in decentralized systems because it requires a strong centre to implement the changes. In decentralized systems negotiating power reflects the social distribution of material resources:

... change is never-ending, it is constantly being initiated, imitated, modified, reversed and counteracted at the level of the school, the community and the nation... it is usually undramatic, frequently indefinite and community specific and local in application... This has been termed the "Incremental pattern" (Archer, 1979: 617).

IN contrast to the "Stop-Go pattern" of change dominant in centralized systems, the "Incremental pattern" characteristic of decentralized systems will result in an ever widening distribution of vested interests in the control and ownership of educational resources (Archer, 1979: 789). This distribution will continue to reflect the unequal distribution of material resources and expertise within the broader society:

... the degree of concentration (of resources) affects two basic aspects of educational interaction. Firstly, it influences the steepness of the gradient between elites and masses and hence their respective opportunities to participate effectively in processes of negotiation. Secondly, it follows that the degree of concentration also helps to determine the volume and kinds of educational demands which can be negotiated from different parts of society (Archer, 1979: 401).

The extreme inequalities in ownership of, and access to, material and human resources between African masses and white elites undermined the potential for exchange based negotiations and an "Incremental pattern" of change. The lack of citizenship

prevented Africans from engaging in the political manipulation that took place at the centre of the system within an impenetrable state. This exclusion of Africans from participation in the governance of the education system and from the planning and implementation of change continued with the creation of apartheid education.

It is often claimed that the primary consequence of the Bantu Education Act of 1953 was to centralize the education system for Africans (Behr, 1984: 181; Macmillan, 1977: 545). However, the centralization was undertaken with the specific intention of creating a decentralized system divided into ten separate, independent and autonomous sub-systems. The enduring centralization was an unintended consequence that resulted from the failure of apartheid to overcome the demographic, economic and political realities of South Africa. The continued existence of the Department of Education and Training, and its strong influence over the territorial departments were a testimony to the failure of apartheid to socially engineer a completely segregated society.

In Archer's examples, after the emergence of a national state system, the conflict between dominant and assertive groups over

ownership and control of education is replaced by a negotiating process that is characterized by either political manipulation or internal initiation and external exchange. In South Africa, after 1953, the African system was characterized clearly by conflict between dominant and assertive groups and not by either form of negotiation. What was born in 1953 was not a national system. The key date for the emergence of a national education system was in 1993 with the formation of the National Education and Training Forum. The forty years between was a period of chaos and disaster. Apart from a brief lull in the 1960s, the African education system was a site of conflict. On the one side there was an aggressive state armed with a powerful set of values, a significant resource base, a unified folk of loyal citizens, and an overtly racist educational policy. On the other side of the conflict was the majority of the population who lacked a material resource base, but had the numbers and a strong set of values to maintain a powerful oppositional movement.

GIVEN the substitutive nature of educational conflict prior to 1953 there was the possibility of a decentralized system emerging, but the dominant forms of social interaction in a decentralized system, internal initiation and external exchange, were lacking. In 1953, some of the conditions for exchange-based

negotiations existed in the community schools in the urban areas and in the church schools. There was a nascent professional teachers movement, active involvement by parents in the urban community schools and a vigorous private sector with the required material resources. The private sector, however, was not allowed, by law, to finance African education, although, when given the chance to after 1972, there was significant investment which by 1990 was approximately 1 billion Rand a year. The possibility for exchanges led to direct funding of buildings and infrastructure and indirect funding of NGOs and university-based initiatives which increased the possibilities for internal initiation. It is possible, that under favourable circumstances the African schooling system could have developed in a decentralized manner.

FURTHERMORE, the existence in the period after 1970 of considerable private sector investment, a rapid proliferation of NGOs (to an extent where they undertook much of the In-Service Education and Training (INSET) of teachers) and the emergence of the South African Democratic Teacher's Union (SADTU), are strong evidence of a capacity for exchange-based negotiations. The failure of internal initiation and/or external exchange to bring about significant systemic change prior to 1990 were a consequence of the extremely steep gradient of wealth and power

between elites and masses. The marginalized majority of the population did not have the resources to engage successfully in exchange-based negotiation; nor did they have the power to force entry into the impermeable political centre of the system.

3.6 Apartheid education in the territories

THE governance structures of education for Africans were part of the overall structure of apartheid. In 1955, the report of the Tomlinson Commission provided a comprehensive framework for apartheid. The report argued that there was no middle course between complete integration and complete racial separation and that the former course was unacceptable because whites would never voluntarily abdicate their power and be subject to government by an African majority. To make apartheid work it would be necessary to modernize agriculture and to create a modern industrial economy in the territories which would provide employment for a rapidly growing population. If viable territorial economies were not created then the urban African population in the white areas would continue to grow. The National Party government accepted the segregationist principles of the report but not the economic implications. This failure to create viable economies in the territories proved the report

correct: the urban African population continued to grow despite a panoply of laws to force the African population into the territories.

THE political structure of the territories was based on the Bantu Authorities Act of 1951 which instituted a system of tribal authorities at the local level. These became the basis for a regional authority which, in turn, became the basis for a territorial authority creating within each territory a three tier system of government which, initially, was subject to the direct control of the central government. The 1959 Promotion of Bantu Self-Government Act and the 1971 Bantu Homelands Constitution Act transformed the territorial authorities into semi-autonomous self-governing territories with the possibility of becoming technically independent states. By 1990, the only territories to have followed through the process to independence were Transkei, Bophutatswana, Ciskei and Venda. Those that chose to remain at self-governing status were KwaZulu, Kangwane, KwaNdebele, Gazankulu, Qwa-Qwa and Lebowa. The original six regions of the Division of Bantu Education were increased to ten by the "discovery" of new tribes living in the Ciskei, Venda, Kwandebele and Qwa-Qwa.

THE 1970 Bantu Homelands Citizenship Act deprived all Africans of citizenship in South Africa and made them citizens of one or other of the territories. In an attempt to move Africans back into the territories some 3.5 million people were relocated through forced removals and the percentage of the African population living in the territories rose to 53 per cent by 1980 (Platzky and Walker, 1985: 9). About 1.1 million were removed from white farms and the remainder from the urban areas. The Group Areas Act of 1950 and the use of influx controls, pass laws and anti-squatting measures had a direct effect on the demographic distribution of the African population which is reflected in the following figures (Stadler, 1987: 122; Hindson, 1987; Platzky and Walker, 1985: 18):

	WHITE AREAS		AFRICAN AREAS
	URBAN	RURAL	%
	%	%	
1950	25	35	40
1960	30	31	39
1970	28	25	47
1980	27	20	53

THE Bantu Education Act of 1953 was concerned primarily with the education of Africans in the territories and was administered through territorial structures. As the territories became self-governing, from 1968 onwards they assumed administrative control of education in much the same way as provincial councils had control of white education in the provinces (NATED 02-300, 1991: 2). The Division of Bantu Education, which became a separate department in 1960, remained responsible for control of finances, examinations, syllabi, curricula and teaching standards. The self-governing territories were responsible for the everyday administration of the schools, including the appointment of teachers and the provision of buildings and resources (Behr, 1984: 184).

THE four territories that chose to become "independent" were given complete control over their education systems, although they were dependent for their finances on the South African government through aid from the Department of Foreign Affairs. If apartheid had been successful then all Africans would have been in the territories and, once all the territories were independent, the Department of Bantu Education would have ceased to exist. Although the 1953 Act did not cater for Africans in the white urban and farm areas, the Department of Bantu Education did

continue to provide schooling for Africans in these areas. In an attempt to encourage students to seek schooling in the territories very few secondary schools were built in the urban areas before 1970 and most farm schools provided only junior primary schooling.

THE period from 1953 to 1960 saw the continuing collapse of agriculture in the reserves, the development of secondary industrialization, particularly in the manufacturing sector, and rapid urbanization. Within education:

By bringing in the bulk of urban African youth into a few years of basic schooling, Bantu Education provided a mechanism of social control which could be used to fight the rising tide of crime and potential militancy, and at the same time generate a semi-skilled workforce (Hyslop, 1986: 10).

THERE was a massive increase in primary schooling in the urban areas and the drop out rate halved between 1958 and 1962. This is noteworthy because it is the period immediately following the introduction of apartheid education and the resistance this generated which included a boycott of schools and the formation of the ANC's cultural clubs. In the territories there was a slow and steady expansion of primary schooling. Although secondary schools were supposed to be built in the rural areas this only

happened on a small scale. Despite the expansion, expenditure on education for Africans was pegged to revenue raised from taxes on African earnings plus an amount from the general revenue fund of 13 million Rand. This arrangement remained in force until 1972. As a result per capita expenditure fell from about 17 Rand in 1955 to about 12 Rand in 1960.

3.7 The emergence of resistance

THE seven years of transformation, from 1953 to 1960, from a mission-dominated decentralized system to a state controlled centralized system were marked by attempts to organize collective forms of resistance. The resistance was largely organized by the ANC and implemented by parents and, to some extent, teachers. The major issue of contention was the curriculum. Little was said about the provision of physical facilities and the quality of teachers. Education was seen to be an appropriate point at which to attack the implementation of apartheid as a whole. The parents would suffer no immediate economic consequences as they would if they went on strike. Education was a very emotive issue and the organizers believed that it was possible to create an alternative system of education through the ANC's cultural clubs. By 1960, the resistance had crumbled and the central state's control of African schooling had become hegemonic.

HYSLOP (1986; 1987a and b) provides a useful account of how the role of urban schooling changed between 1940 and 1976. Hyslop argues that the cheap labour power thesis put forward in the mid 1970s by Wolpe and Legassick had two central tenets:

The continuation of pre-capitalist forms of agricultural production in rural areas permitted the establishment of a low wage migrant labour system.

Apartheid was an instrument to maintain cheap labour, founded on migrancy.

Hyslop uses Hindson's work on influx control (Hindson, 1985) to argue that, by the 1950s, influx controls were being used to reproduce specialized types of labour power, rather than a single form of cheap labour power. Hyslop argues that education was an important element in the creation of social divisions and stratification between urban and rural people and between different types of rural people. This was the time of South Africa's greatest economic boom and the period of the most concerted efforts at social engineering to bring about apartheid. Primary schools continued to grow, but the confinement of secondary schools, technical schools and training colleges to the territories resulted in a slow growth in secondary student numbers. The percentage of secondary school pupils grew from 2.9

per cent in 1961 to 4.5 per cent in 1971. But, by 1971, there were only 20 schools for Africans in the urban areas which went up to Standard Ten with another 74 schools offering Standard Eight.

BY the end of the 1960s the boom was over. Partly because of the restructuring that took place during the boom, but mainly because a recession forced capital into a period of intensive accumulation with the reinvestment of profits into technology to improve productivity. Capital now required increased numbers of clerical and semi-skilled technical workers. At the same time the financial situation in African schooling was extremely parlous. In the 1960s South Africa experienced rapid modernization during a period of sustained economic growth. Christie and Collins (1984) and Chisholm (1984) have argued that African schooling served the needs of the economy by producing an unskilled and semi-skilled workforce that was suitable for the needs of industry, mining and agriculture. Four points are of relevance here:

State expenditure on African schooling remained pegged at approximately 13 million Rand until 1968.

The bulk of this was spent in the territories; schools in the urban areas were built, in the main, by communities.

Until the mid 1970s growth was predominantly at primary level.

Until the end of the 1960s Bantu education met the labour needs of the South African economy.

THE consequences of these policies were aggravated by the rapid increase in the numbers of young people of school going age. The situation would have been parlous with a stable population, but the demographic escalator turned the schools into major pressure points. The litany of inadequacies has become well known:

Too few classrooms and schools.

The poor quality and condition of the classrooms.

Untrained and uneducated teachers.

Few textbooks and little stationery.

Few libraries and laboratories.

Little in the way of resources for extra-mural activities.

THE low level of quantitative provision directly influenced the qualitative dimension of education. The qualitative dimension was influenced also by the ideology of apartheid in its manifestation in the administrative bureaucracy, pedagogy and curriculum. The bureaucracy, the organizational culture which dominated the administrative structures and institutions of education, was a key determining agent. All senior posts were held by whites, predominantly Afrikaans-speaking, and there was an almost total concentration of power in the central offices in Pretoria. Control was exercised through the administrative structures, certification, pedagogy and the curriculum. A strict hierarchy ensured obedience to one's superior with coercion provided by the threat of lack of promotion or the loss of employment. The behaviour of students in the classroom was controlled by excessive use of the sjambok (cane). The syllabi were determined by subject committees in Pretoria with the prescribed textbooks

often being written by members of the subject committees. Classroom teaching was controlled by the use of detailed syllabi, schemes of work and daily work books which were subject to regular inspection. Teachers were the subjects of a highly authoritarian system of control and so it is not surprising that they controlled and taught their pupils in a similar authoritarian manner.

3.8 June 1976

THE events that lead to the insurrection of June 1976 have their origins in both the legacy of the history of African schooling and the social and economic context of the years from 1960 to 1976. By 1968, tensions and strains were becoming evident in the relationship between apartheid and capitalism. The economy required more skilled workers due largely to the increase in the manufacturing sector. The growing numbers of urbanized Africans were threatening to become uncontrollable. In 1968, a new system of financing was introduced and total expenditure rose sharply, from 55 million Rand in 1970 to 97 million Rand in 1973. This was supplemented by investments from the private sector after 1972: between 1972 and 1974, 40 new secondary schools were built in Soweto. These changes in policy lead to a rapid increase in the

student population and particularly in the higher primary and secondary school population (Hyslop, 1987).

HYSLOP (1986) offers two major causes for the breakdown of the system in 1976. Firstly, there were the strains in the system generated by rapid expansion particularly at secondary level. This was aggravated by the decision to do away with the thirteenth year of schooling, in the form of a two year Standard Five, resulting in two cohorts seeking places in Standard Six. Secondly, political strains, exemplified by the Afrikaans language issue, arose within the bureaucracy.

RESEARCH on Education in South Africa (RESA) (1988b and c) and Wolpe (1991a and b) put greater stress on the political repression of the 1960s and give a greater role to Black Consciousness. They argue that the very conditions that furthered the aims of monopoly capital - political repression, economic expansion and educational segregation - also nurtured student opposition in the form of Black Consciousness. This opposition, with its emphasis on the "human-ness" of being Black, was an important source of inspiration for the students of the 1970s and helps to explain the focus of the 1976 resistance on issues of content rather than inferior conditions and facilities.

THE dominant features of the 1976 resistance are worth noting because they represent the nascent organizational practices, values and beliefs that develop into the people's education movement of the 1980s:

The resistance was initiated by the students and largely controlled by them.

The influence of Black Consciousness.

The major issues identified by the students were the use of Afrikaans as a medium of instruction, corporal punishment, sexual harassment of female students by male teachers, the necessity of having to buy their own textbooks which were provided free to white students (Kane-Berman, 1978).

The demand for an education equal to that being provided for whites.

AS in the 1953 to 1960 period, there was a distinct process of change taking place within African schooling from 1968 to 1976. This time the process of state-controlled reform was met by

sustained resistance. In the earlier period, the resistance had been largely confined to the Eastern Cape and parts of the Transvaal. While a nuisance, it did not seriously affect the implementation of apartheid education. In 1976 the resistance spread throughout the country and, linked to growing worker militancy, brought about a situation which demanded a change in strategy on the part of the government. At the macro level the context within which schooling was situated had changed dramatically from the 1950s. South Africa had undergone a process of rapid modernization which was distorted by apartheid. Pockets and corridors of urbanized and industrialized modern sectors of the economy were interwoven with underutilized and increasingly unviable white farmlands and enclaves of totally dependent reservoirs of surplus labour, riven by poverty. The rise of trade unions after the Durban strikes of 1973 was a harbinger of increasing worker militancy. The material conditions in the urban townships had been deteriorating rapidly and, combined with the harassment of the police and the bureaucracy of apartheid, made life very difficult. All of these processes and events combined to create fertile conditions for resistance.

THE spark of resistance lay in the students and to begin with their demands were specifically educational. The demands put

forward at the time reflect a rejection of the authoritarian life world of Bantu Education (corporal punishment and sexual harassment), the curriculum (the use of Afrikaans and racism), and the economic (free textbooks). The importance of 1976 is that it marked a radical disjunction in the process of change within the system of schooling for Africans. While the specific changes from 1953 to 1976 were peculiarly South African in their apartheid forms, the quantitative changes were very similar to the development of mass schooling in most industrializing countries.

3.9 People's education

FROM 1976 onwards the process of change was less and less well managed by the state which was under increasing pressure from capital as the conditions for accumulation deteriorated. The need for more technical and scientific skills in the workforce grew. The rapid development of student organization and its alignment with the ANC enabled the students to maintain a fairly constant series of boycotts. The consequence for African schooling was a rapid deterioration in the "culture of learning" as teaching and learning became increasingly laissez-faire and schools were exposed to increasing violence.

IT was only in 1979, with the promulgation of the Education and Training Act, that the necessity of providing schooling for Africans in the urban and farm areas of white South Africa was given legal recognition. The National Party government saw the 1979 Act as a commitment to equal but separate education (Behr, 1984: 200). The Department of Education and Training (DET), which succeeded the Department of Bantu Education, was given the responsibility of education for Africans in the white areas and for control over finances, examinations, syllabi, curriculum and teaching standards in the self-governing territories. In 1990, the DET was responsible for the schooling of 1.8 million African students in the white areas of South Africa making it the country's single largest education Department. The anomalous nature of the Department's position became apparent in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Act of 1983 and the National Policy for General Education Affairs Act of 1984 in terms of which the education of Africans in the territories was to be an "own affair" while the education of Africans in the white areas was to be a "general affair" under the control of the DET.

IN 1983, the state attempted a comprehensive reform of the political terrain with the institution of the tri-cameral

parliament and the national security system. A "total strategy" of cooption and repression followed which was met by sustained national resistance. By 1985, the United Democratic Front (UDF) and the Congress of South African Students (COSAS) had helped create a climate in which many students believed the collapse of the state was imminent. The effect of this on students was to provide a rationale (liberation before education) for a total boycott of schooling. It was within this context that people's education emerged, linking educational struggles to the national liberation struggle.

THE National Education Crisis Committee (NECC) provided both a vision of a future education system which could be realized within the context of a national democratic state and the basic principles on which strategies for contesting apartheid education could be based. These principles required the democratization of school structures and the development and implementation of new curricula which would embody the values outlined in 1955 in the freedom charter:

The Doors Of Learning And Culture Shall Be Opened!

The government shall discover, develop and encourage national talent for the enhancement of our cultural life;

All the cultural treasures of mankind shall be open to all, by free exchange of books, ideas and contact with other lands;

The aim of education shall be to teach the youth to love their people and their culture, to honour human brotherhood, liberty and peace;

Education shall be free, compulsory, universal and equal for all children;

Higher education and technical training shall be opened to all by means of state allowances and scholarships awarded on the basis of merit; Adult illiteracy shall be ended by a mass state education plan;

Teachers shall have all the rights of other citizens;

The colour bar in cultural life, in sport and in education shall be abolished. (Suttner and Cronin, 1986: 265).

PEOPLE'S education reinterpreted these values to produce a core set of principles which could unite diverse people into one educational movement. When the NECC emerged in 1985, bringing together students, teachers, parents, workers, churches and universities, there was an urgent need for organization (Kruss, 1988: 40). Under the rallying call of "People's Education for People's Power" attempts were made to coordinate and direct parent, teacher and student organizations into a nationally coordinated movement of Parent-Teacher-Student Associations (PTSAs):

In People's Education the struggle for change is a struggle for fundamental, qualitative change, whereby both black education for domestication and white education for domination will be superseded by a non-racist and democratic people's education for both national liberation and social emancipation (Mashamba, 1991: 27).

EMBEDDED in people's education was a vision of education that went far beyond schooling, that must "... rather be envisaged as a process of life-long education embracing all members of society" (Mashamba, 1991: 15).

THE strategies involved in the implementation of people's education required the direct contestation of the schooling system, thereby enabling the development of people's power through an evolving feedback strategy. The gaining of a space, enabling the delivery of a tangible benefit, would strengthen organization and enable the contestation of further space. Central to the concept of people's education was the intertwining of educational, economic, social and political goals. These goals were clustered around the relationship between education and democracy:

The ideals, values and principles of collective action, accountability, mandates, mass participation and people's power, in contrast to individualism and self-centredness, and undemocratic and authoritarian practice, are clearly manifest (Mashamba, 1991: 22).

IN his address to the 1985 National Consultative Conference on the crisis in education, when the term "People's Education" was given its first public airing and definition, Mkatshwa pointed to three examples of alternative education (SPCC, 1986: 12):

The alternative schools set up by Elias Wellington Buthelezi in the Eastern Cape in the 1920s.

The ANC's cultural clubs set up in the 1950s.

The "awareness programmes" of the committee of 81 during the school boycotts of 1980.

THERE are other examples in South Africa's history of alternative education (Bird, 1984; Kane-Berman, 1978), but in focussing on these programmes Mkatshwa is making a didactic point. These programmes failed and they failed for different reasons which, taken collectively, are the reasons why most attempts to create alternative education are failures. Buthelezi's American School Movement was based on the principles of Marcus Garvey. Edgar (1984: 185) summarizes these principles as being the upliftment and liberation of blacks, the renaissance and reassertion of

black culture and values, the material advancement of blacks, and the importance of unity. The resonance with principles of the Black Consciousness movement of the 1970s is obvious, and this resonance extends to the fate of both movements. The movement to establish the schools was directed against the inferior quality and the indoctrinating agendas of the mission schools and was linked to other forms of social protest against the economic and agricultural impoverishment that was taking place at the time (Edgar, 1984: 188; Bundy, 1988). The condemnation of missionary education is similar to that of Verwoerd and Botha, although the reasons for the condemnation are as different as racial oppression and liberation. Apartheid education was not eurocentric. I will explore the eurocentric/africanist debate in more detail in chapter eight.

EDGAR claims:

Most American schools operated for only a few years before inadequate funds and lack of qualified teachers forced them to close. All in all, they had limited success in deflecting the entrenchment of mission and government-controlled education (1984: 188).

The American School Movement, like Black Consciousness in the 1970s, was based on the charisma of strong personalities (Buthelezi, Biko) and suffered from the lack of a coherent analysis of the socio-political and economic context in which it was situated; from a lack of strong organizational structures and from inadequate financial and human resources. The importance of both movements should not be underestimated and, in particular, their challenge to the hegemony of colonial consciousness and the consequent enslavement of the minds of the oppressed is of significance to later events.

THE culture clubs of the ANC, established in the 1950s were also an attempt to establish alternative schools. Called cultural clubs because it was illegal to establish alternative schools, the clubs were a part of the protest mounted by the ANC against the statutory consolidation of apartheid, which included the Defiance Campaign and the 1955 Congress of the People which produced the Freedom Charter (Lodge, 1983). The ANC had opposed the 1953 Bantu Education Act through various unsuccessful representations to the government. As the Act was being implemented in 1955 the ANC tried to organize a national boycott and to provide an alternative through the culture clubs. The clubs enjoyed limited success in the East Rand and the Eastern

Cape, but by 1960 they had disappeared. The failure of the clubs was linked to the lack of financial and human resources and to organizational weaknesses in the ANC. Suitable buildings were difficult to find, teachers could not be paid adequate salaries, there was insufficient expertise to develop a curriculum and not enough money to provide materials.

THE Alternative Education programme run by the students of the Committee of 81, together with sympathetic teachers and students from universities and colleges was confined largely to the Western Cape (Molteno, 1984 and 1987). The programme took the form of political education sessions intended to raise the consciousness of school students and to contribute to the development of organizational structures. Molteno describes how, once again, the lack of human and financial resources weakened the effectiveness of the programme and how students gradually lost interest and became more concerned about examinations as the programme failed to provide a viable alternative.

MKATSHWA uses these examples to make the following points:

The importance of an alternative curriculum, of a different content. For Buthelezi the curriculum propagated the importance of black culture and values; for the ANC it was freedom from apartheid indoctrination, and for the Committee of 81 the need for political education.

The importance of different methodologies. In the case of the ANC the use of drama, songs, games and stories; for the Committee of 81 the use of discussion groups, films and songs.

The difference in governance. In the first two examples ownership and control rested with parents and teachers, in the third with students.

The first two examples are attempts to provide alternative schools, the third to provide an alternative programme within the existing school system.

All three attempts were failures because they lacked the human, organizational and financial resources to provide a viable alternative.

THE importance of Mkatshwa's address was that it laid a foundation that was to be built upon at the second conference, which took place three months later. It left its mark on the opening address by Sisulu (1986), and in the resolutions of the two conferences and the policies and practices of the NECC. People's education did not attempt to provide alternative schools but rather contested the existing schools, turning schools into "sites of struggle". People's education recognized that the provision of schooling was such a massive enterprise that only the state had the necessary financial resources to organize and control a schooling system. Extra curricula alternative programmes were feasible but:

To realise a truly alternative education programme, one which educates politically, prepares for the future and opens horizons, it needs to be both general and political (Mkatshwa, 1986: 14).

TO be successful such a programme required financial resources and skilled and politicized teachers. However, this was a necessary but not a sufficient condition. The programme had to be a part of a comprehensive assault on apartheid. Change in education was not seen in isolation but as part of the total transformation of South African society. For Mkatshwa:

To achieve fundamental change we need to be organised. Our forces need to be gathered together and harnessed in the most effective way possible... So we are speaking of consciousness, mobilisation, organisation and discipline and finally, struggle (1986: 7).

AT the second National Consultative Conference in March 1986, Sisulu expanded on this conception of the relationship between educational and social transformation:

The struggle for People's Education can only be finally won when we have won the struggle for People's Power (Sisulu, 1986: 107).

and:

I want to emphasise that these advances were only possible because of the development of democratic organs, or committees, of people's power. Our people set up bodies which were controlled by, and accountable to, the masses of people in each area... we must stress that there is an important distinction between ungovernability and people's power. In a situation of ungovernability the government doesn't have control. But nor do the people... there is a power vacuum. In a situation of people's power the people are starting to exercise control (Sisulu, 1986: 104).

FOR Sisulu, the struggle for people's education was part of the struggle for national liberation. In this sense people's

education could only be achieved when national liberation had been achieved. But he was also clear that:

We are not poised for the immediate transfer of power to the people... we are however poised to enter a phase which can lead to the transfer of power. What we are seeking to do is to decisively shift the balance of forces in our favor (Sisulu, 1986: 98).

If liberation was not imminent then slogans such as "Liberation before Education" were dangerous in so far as they implied that the youth did not need to worry about their own schooling and that the schooling system could be left to rot. Sisulu argued that education reforms initiated by the state or by private enterprise, such as private schools, were to be treated with suspicion. Reforms in education were not necessarily part of people's education even if they were made in response to demands of the people. Reforms in education were only part of people's education if they were brought about through the democratic organs of people's power: Student Representative Councils, Teacher Unions and Parent Teacher Student Associations. Legitimacy lay in democratic accountability. The democratization of governance was central to the project of people's education. The authority of the state was illegitimate and had to be replaced by democratic forms of governance before the process of

planned change towards an emancipating and empowering education system could begin. The first step was to create organizations which could participate in PTAs in a disciplined and effective manner.

FOR Sisulu, the importance of the National Education Crisis Committee was that it represented a national alliance between different sectors: parents and workers, teachers and students. Within each sector there would be disciplined organizations capable of raising the consciousness of their members and mobilizing non-members and able to implement the mandates of their members. Sisulu saw this notion of organization as being especially important for teachers. Teachers were a key element in the design and implementation of people's education, but to play their correct role they needed to be organized into a national progressive union. Existing teacher organizations, constructed along racial and regional lines, together with the ambiguous class position of teachers and the uncertainties of their allegiance had resulted in teachers being perceived as agents of the state. It is within this context that we need to interpret the resolutions of the first conference in which a vision of people's education was formulated. People's education was education that:

Enables the oppressed to understand the evils of the apartheid system and prepares them for participation in a non-racial democratic system.

Eliminates illiteracy, ignorance and exploitation of one person by another.

Eliminates capitalist norms of competition, individualism and stunted intellectual development, and replaces it with one that encourages collective input and active participation by all, as well as stimulating critical thinking and analysis.

Equips and trains all sectors of our people to participate actively and creatively in the struggle to attain people's power in order to establish a non-racial democratic South Africa.

Allows students, parents, teachers and workers to be mobilized into appropriate organizational structures which enable them to participate actively in the initiation and management of People's Education in all its forms.

Enables workers to resist exploitation and oppression at their workplace.

ON the process of implementation it was stated that:

All student-teacher-parent and community based organizations must work vigorously and energetically to promote People's Education.

All programmes must enhance the organization of all sections of our people, wherever they may be.

The programme must encourage critical and creative thinking and working methods.

The programme must promote the correct values of democracy, non-racialism, collective work, and active participation.

THE two conferences, in December 1985 and March 1986, represented a high point in the struggle for people's education. There was a sense of optimism that there was a real possibility of implementing people's education. This optimism was based on three key perceptions.

FIRSTLY, the overall level of conflict between the state and the national liberation movement in the period from 1984 to 1986 had never before reached such high levels, and the level of organization was greater than ever before. Students were organized nationally through COSAS and many communities, particularly in the urban areas, were organized into civic associations which were co-ordinated nationally through the UDF. And in 1985, workers formed the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU) creating a national union with a membership of 750,000.

SECONDLY, the conferences and the creation of the NECC indicated that there was a strong national alliance emerging between the different sectors which could organize a national co-ordinated effort to transform education as part of an overall process of social transformation.

THIRDLY, the moment seemed propitious; education was generally acknowledged to be in crisis as the schooling system was failing to satisfy everyone's expectations. From the state's point of view the system was no longer functioning as a controlling, indoctrinating mechanism contributing to the maintenance of

apartheid. The system was no longer meeting the needs of capital which increasingly required an educated workforce. Teacher's morale was low and their dissatisfaction high; students were overwhelmingly antagonistic towards schooling, and parents increasingly sympathetic to their children's demands.

UNDER the banners of the UDF, and later the Mass Democratic Movement (MDM), a hegemonic concept of the people was articulated in which:

... 'people' refers to an alliance of social forces arraigned against apartheid, informed by the ideals of non-racialism and democracy, and within which the working class is identified as the leading force (Mashamba, 1991: 11).

The optimism of 1985 was dashed with the imposition of the State of Emergency and the use of the security forces to repress the various organizations. The state's response effectively prevented the implementation of people's education and it becomes a matter of speculation as to how effective the programme may have been in its attempt to transform education. Throughout the period of repression, from 1986 to 1990, the slogan " People's Education for People's Power" maintained an almost mythological allure that acted as a guiding light for debates about educational

transformation and the framework for various attempts at transformation.

AFTER the repression and restriction of the NECC in 1986, the evolution of people's education became a largely academic exercise. In the words of Unterhalter and Wolpe:

... the struggle for education has taken a step back to the pre-National Education Crisis Conference position in the sense that it postpones the transformation of the education system in the image of people's education until the apartheid system has been displaced by a national democratic state. It does this by identifying the acquisition of skills and professionalism with People's Education (Wolpe, 1991b: 82).

The situation was made more serious by what Hartshorne called, so aptly, "a cumulative breakdown of the learning environment" (Hartshorne, 1989: 82). This breakdown was largely an urban and peri-urban phenomenon, although, after 1987, in Natal-KwaZulu it spread into some rural areas as schools were drawn into the conflict between the ANC and Inkatha (Hart and Gultig, 1989; Soobrayan, 1991). The access, cooperation and coordination that had existed prior to 1986 disintegrated into fragments:

Due to the determining role of the war on African schooling in Natal, it is clear that the education crisis will continue unless the political situation is radically transformed... The scale at which the movement of students is taking place takes the problem

beyond individual students to a situation where the social environment of whole communities and the educational environment of whole schools are severely disrupted. This problem becomes even more acute when viewed through the lens of an ill-equipped, under-supplied and crisis-ridden education system (Soobrayan, 1991: 36/7).

3.10 Discourses about South African education

IN the period from 1986 to 1989 people's education moved from the streets and schools to the universities and NGOs. The schools and classrooms became increasingly dysfunctional as apartheid education disintegrated and fragmented, while the apartheid state used massive coercion to maintain the status quo. It was the nature of an alliance like the NECC that it contained different tendencies that understood people's education in different ways. Muller (1987) distinguishes between a liberal and radical perspective within the NECC. The liberals were more concerned to put the education show back on the road, while the radicals remained more concerned about transformation. At this point it is possible to distinguish three distinct discourses about education in South Africa (Wolpe, 1991a and b).

Fundamental Pedagogics and Christian National Education as "Volks Education": this discourse claimed to be a neutral, objective, value free science and provided a theoretical and moral justification for segregated education. For Fundamental Pedagogics, education was culturally specific and the process of education had to maintain a strong authoritarian relationship between teacher and learner. The necessity of cultural specificity was grounded in the relativism of world views arising from different languages and traditions. The right of the Afrikaner to practice CNE was complemented by an equal right for each racial/cultural/linguistic group to practice their own education. Within each practice, the process of education would be the same: it would embody a relationship of authority between the teacher and the learner that ensured that the learner became an adult in the same mould as the role models to which she was exposed.

A liberal position: this was the dominant oppositional discourse and is best exemplified by the publications of the South African Institute of Race Relations and academics from the English speaking universities. This discourse focused primarily on the inequality of segregated education which it characterized as immoral, irrational and indoctrinatory (Kallaway, 1984): immoral

because separate had not been equal; irrational because Bantu Education impeded the process of modernization and shackled the economy; indoctrinatory because of the racial content of the curriculum. Liberals believed that education was the key to social transformation. Equal access to education of the same quality would create social mobility and a growing economy which would enable the least well off to satisfy their aspirations.

A broadly marxist/socialist position: this discourse was best represented in Kallaway (1984) and the writings of a small group of English speaking academics. Education was a functional mechanism to reproduce the capitalist and racialist relations of production which were dominant in South Africa. It was this discourse which had the most resonance with the activists who lead the resistance to Bantu Education and the construction of people's education.

BUILDING on these three discourses, Wolpe (1991a and b) argues for a fourth discourse which conceptualizes education as a terrain of struggle defined by internal and external structures and conditions. Utilizing this perspective, he argues that each of the discourses contains a central thesis about the relation between education and the social system.

THESIS one: Education plays the fundamental role in the structuring and hence the re-structuring of the system of social stratification (the conservative/liberal position).

THESIS two: Education is the instrument of social reproduction. In class and racially structured societies the education system functions directly and without contradiction to reproduce the dominant class and racial structures of domination, subordination and exploitation (the marxist/socialist position).

THESIS three: The relationship between education and the social system is not a theoretical pre-given but is contingent upon the concrete conditions of the social formation including the education system itself. As such it may be simultaneously both functional for the system of domination and in contradiction to it. Furthermore, the education struggle may take on different forms and achieve a different significance according to the concrete conditions in which it occurs (the post-marxist position) (Wolpe, 1991b).

FOR Wolpe, the onset of repression in 1986 resulted in a regression within people's education. The dominance of thesis

three gave way to a re-emergence of thesis one: a movement from a nuanced, evolving discourse that was closely linked to a counter hegemonic war against apartheid to a more conservative/liberal position. Wolpe's account is supported by the proceedings of the third National Consultative Conference held in December 1989 and by a paper by Cloete (1990) which analyzed the discourse of a meeting held in January 1990 by the Soweto Concerned Parents Committee. At both the conference and the meeting the dominant concern was with restoring discipline in the schools and demanding equal access to the same quality of education as enjoyed by whites. The liberal position and its interpretation of people's education was articulated by a broad range of people including members of the DET, capital and the private schools, and some members of the NECC.

FOR Wolpe and others (Kallaway, 1984; Muller, 1987), the key problem with the liberal position was that it isolated education from its social context and saw educational transformation as being separate from and prior to social transformation. This was seen as contradictory. How was equal access to education to be achieved? For the critics of the liberal position, equal education was a necessary condition for an equal society and an equal society was a necessary condition for equal education. Or,

alternatively, you could not have equal education in an unequal society, nor could you have an equal society with unequal education. By separating educational transformation from social transformation, the liberals were unable to provide an adequate account of either. This contradiction was compounded by the empirical evidence from those societies which had espoused a commitment to liberal education. The experience of liberal, capitalist societies, like England and America, is that however close they may come to achieving the ideal of equal education the structures of social stratification remain largely unaffected. A person's occupation correlates more closely with the socio-economic position of her parents than it does with the education she received.

THESIS two is flawed on account of its inability to explain the types of resistance to African education that emerged in South Africa and because, like the liberal position, it separated educational and social transformation on the grounds that social transformation must precede educational transformation. Such a view was embodied in slogans like "liberation now, education later" and was associated with the tactics of the boycott and stayaway. From this perspective, reform is unacceptable and change must be total. No remnant of apartheid education should

persist. This strategy was self defeating, as change of something is always relative to the persistence of something else. If one changes everything there will be nothing left to change – an extreme version of Archer's "Stop-Go pattern".

THESIS three, for Wolpe, represents the most sophisticated account of the relation between education and the social system. These discourses and theses become crucial to the policy discourses that emerged in the period from 1990 to 1994, and will be pursued in more detail in chapters four and eight.

3.11 Archer and African education

BY 1990, the education system for Africans was divided structurally into:

The Department of Education and Training: responsible for education for Africans in urban and rural white areas; and for the finances, examinations, syllabi, curricula and teaching standards of the six self-governing territorial departments;

The six self-governing territorial departments: responsible for the everyday administration of their systems;

The four independent territorial departments: responsible for all aspects of their education systems, but dependent for their finances on the South African government.

CONGRUENT with the dual nature of the colonial and apartheid state prior to 1990, there developed a dual schooling system. Before 1953, the predominantly church schools coexisted with provincial and tribal authorities. After 1953, the state, having removed provincial control, exercised a strongly coercive restrictive strategy that saw the establishment of a hybrid system with the three sub-systems corresponding to the three forms of political power. The DET schools were controlled directly by the central national government. The self-governing territories were a form of indirect rule, in which the power of the central government over the education system within that area was mediated by the territorial government and tribal authorities. The independent territories, also an example of indirect rule through tribal authorities, were in a similar position to the provincial councils after 1910, without financial control and subject to considerable influence from the central government, but capable of some autonomy.

REFLECTING back on Archer's (1979) examples we can see that, by 1990, African education as a whole bore the marks of its dual origins. The substitutive origins were apparent in the low level of internal organization, with most administrative powers allocated to the different territorial departments each with their own organizational cultures. The effects of the restrictive strategy after 1953 were apparent in the high level of differentiation between the education system and other parts of society; the unification apparent in the nationally centralized control over funding, certification, curricula and pedagogy; and the low level of specialization within the system.

The specialization that was present before 1953 was largely destroyed by the implementation of the Bantu Education Act. Schooling in the territories was incorporated into the developing administrations that represented the latest form of the tradition of indirect rule begun by the colonies, continued by the union and transformed by the Republic (Mamdani, 1994). The most significant form of specialization that was developed after 1953 was in the use of the mother tongue as the medium of instruction up to the end of the fourth year of schooling. In each of the ten territorial departments a different language was used as the

departments corresponded, in their geographical placement, to different language groups (as was the intention of the original regions of the Division of Bantu Education). This specialization was replaced by uniformity as all eleven departments used English as the medium of instruction from the fifth year of schooling onwards.

THE existence of mother tongue education in the primary schools in all the major South African language groups provides South Africa with a strong foundation for a multilingual society. The need for each territorial Department of Education and Culture to produce syllabi and textbooks required language boards to determine the syntax and vocabulary and a local publishing industry to produce texts. It was partly this foundation of a strong literate as well as oral language usage that enabled the interim constitution of 1994 to declare South Africa a multilingual society with eleven official languages. Given the value placed on the use and development of African languages for the development of a non-western, African identity this strong potential for multilingual schooling could be an important part of the post-1994 education system.

THE policy of the National Party government of transferring responsibility and accountability to territorial and tribal

authorities while maintaining tight control of provision, pedagogy and curricula was similar to that of those colonial governments in other African countries where the education system became an instrument of colonial administration, enabling and controlling the cultivation of an elite, often drawn from existing tribal hierarchies. The development of a mass schooling system for Africans beginning in 1953 was also similar to experiences elsewhere in post-independence Africa:

Let us remember that formal education on this continent was a state initiative. Schools and universities were never created by communities; rather, they were extensions of the state (Mamdani, 1993: 11).

For Mamdani, the development of state schooling systems in post-independence Africa was often marked by the training of "...cadres of "civilization" who came to organize political life in most independent African states after independence" (1993: 11). These cadres were subjected to a schooling in which they were not taught:

... a sense of the history of their communities, but to erase any trace of that history. Against the "backwardness" that local communities were said to signify, schools and universities claimed to hold the torch of "progress" (Mamdani, 1993: 12).

THIS tendency of schooling to be an instrument of modernization was also apparent in South Africa, although in a different form. Despite the avowed intentions of Verwoerd to use the schooling system to domesticate the African population into subjugated non-citizens the overwhelming effect of the system was to produce growing numbers of increasingly articulate young people who resented being given an education that was not "modern" and "progressive".

THE Freedom Charter calls for the doors of learning and culture to be opened and defines education in a clearly modern way: education shall be free, compulsory, universal and equal for all children (Suttner and Cronin, 1986: 265). From the early days of resistance to apartheid education there was a consistent valorization of schooling as a "good", as being the gateway to a modern life. An ideal was constructed that emphasized the benefits of a modern eurocentric schooling system which was seen as having a strong positive causal effect on both one's own work prospects and the economic development of the society. This ideal played an important role in the mobilization of resistance, but its very power as a symbol restricted questioning of the value-system of eurocentric schooling, apart from some criticisms which emanated from the black consciousness and Africanist movements.

By 1994, the dominance of a liberal discourse with its modernist and Enlightenment assumptions was clearly apparent in the Policy Framework for Education Training (PFET) (ANC, 1994a) and the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) (ANC, 1994b). The marginalization of Africanist discourses is promoted by the eurocentric assumptions of the liberal discourse. To be anti-apartheid is also to be anti-African nationalism.

ARCHER'S (1984: 14) warning against the danger of applying her work to colonial and post colonial education systems makes good sense in the case of African schooling in South Africa. The sudden introduction of a restrictive strategy and the reversal of centrifugal tendencies are counter to Archer's examples. The corroboration of Archer provided by white schooling and the lack of corroboration provided by African schooling are indicative of the structural and racial duality that has been institutionalized into South African schooling. This duality between the schools of the colonizers and the schools of the colonized is part of the larger political, administrative, legislative and economic heritage bequeathed to Africa by Europe.

REMOVING the racism is not going to be easy, overcoming the structural heritage poses a paradox. By 1990, apart from a lower

level of systematization, African schooling was structurally similar to white schooling. This will make the amalgamation of all 19 departments into one national and nine provincial departments a fairly easy task. The dominance of a liberal discourse with its assumptions of Enlightenment and modernity will promote unification. It is the very ease of the task that should cause concern. People's education was defined as the opposite of apartheid education. The transformation from apartheid education to people's education must surely involve dramatic changes. Given that the dominant structural features of apartheid education will continue to persist, what will change?

3.12 Conclusion

THE restrictive strategy employed by the central government was intended to bring about ten autonomous centralized systems but what had emerged by 1990 was a hybrid national system, with distinctive sub systems that were financed differently and which exercised different degrees of autonomy. National unification lay primarily in the areas of finance, certification and the setting of national norms and standards.

FOR Archer (1979), the transition to a national state system is marked by a shift from conflict to negotiation as the primary

form of educational interaction. Education for Africans was characterized by intense conflict, particularly in the urban areas, into the early 1990s. By this criteria, a national state schooling system for Africans had not emerged by 1994. The endemic conflict within the African schooling system and its racial separation from other systems, meant that by 1994 a national education system for all her people had not yet emerged in South Africa.

BY 1994, the dominant tendency within South African education was towards centralization, with a minor discord of decentralization at the provincial and territorial level. South Africa had five distinct state schooling systems: one for whites beginning in 1910; one for Africans in the territories beginning in 1953; one for Africans living in the urban areas which emerged formally in 1979; one for "coloured" people" and one for "Indian people" which emerged formally with the introduction of the tricameral constitution of 1983 (previously they were controlled and owned by the provinces). Using Archer's schema we can categorize South Africa's education system(s) in 1994 as having a high degree of unification - the most important administrative powers were centralized: finance, certification, national norms and standards. A low degree of systematization - different provincial

and territorial departments that were inefficient and ineffective. A low degree of specialization – most students were subjected to the same pedagogy and curriculum (predominantly authoritarian and academic), with little space for a diversity of activities. A high degree of differentiation – the education system was separated and isolated from other parts of society. This differentiation was apparent in the curricula, pedagogy and governance of the system.

OF the vast range of curricula (over 1,400 in 1990), most had a strong academic bias with an emphasis on "knowledge that" as opposed to "knowledge how" and inculcated through rote-learning. This academic bias and its particular apartheid content were a result of the dominance of Afrikaans speaking intellectuals and universities in the production of curricula, syllabi and textbooks within the tight hegemonic discourse of Fundamental Pedagogics based on a strong authoritarian approach with very unequal power relations between teacher and pupil. The teacher was responsible for moulding the child into an adult. The pedagogy and curricula became increasingly dysfunctional in relation to economic, social and political needs from the 1960s onwards. Governance was both hierarchical within the bureaucracy and separated from other government functions, with the education

ministry acting in isolation from other ministries, preventing coordination of education with health, social welfare, development, agriculture, housing, electricity, etc. This high degree of differentiation was partly offset in the 1980s by the growth of a strong NGO sector which forged a link between local capital, foreign funders, oppositional educationalists and the education systems.

CHAPTERS two and three have described the historical development of the structural characteristics of South African schooling up until 1990. I have tried to provide a clear picture of what exists and what is likely to persist. It is now time to look towards the future by examining the policy proposals produced in the period between 1990 and 1994. These policy proposals represent the perspectives on persistence and change to which the major stakeholders and interest groups in education subscribe.

PART TWO**CHAPTER FOUR****Education Policy: 1990 to 1994.****4.1 Introduction**

THE most explicit statements of proposals for changes to apartheid education are to be found in the education policy documents produced by major stakeholders or interest groups from 1990 to 1994. Although there has been a spate of policy forums there have been few attempts (Wolpe, 1991a and b; Taylor et al, 1990; NEPI, 1993a) to provide a theoretical framework to analyze policy debates in South Africa. I will explore the reasons for this lack of attention later in the chapter. In chapters four and five I will, once again, spend time describing and summarizing policy documents. The intention is to ground my analysis in the stated intentions of major policy actors.

IN part one I used historical descriptions as a ground upon which to base an analysis of the structural characteristics of governance. The central feature of governance, highlighted by the

use of Archer's (1979) concepts, was the institutional form and location of power. Archer constructs a dichotomy between systems in which power is concentrated at the centre (centralized) and systems where it is dispersed towards the periphery (decentralized).

I begin part two by borrowing another analytic framework from Archer (1988) to organize and illuminate my description of policy. I then focus on the impasse which entrapped people's education and apartheid education into a "no-win" situation. I describe six major policy documents concentrating on those parts which address governance and values. Using Archer, I then analyze these values and concepts of governance and show that there is a contradiction running through the documents which has its roots in the earlier impasse. In part two my intention is to provide an outline of an analytic framework that helps us to discern potential problems in governance proposals. In chapter eight I will expand considerably on this outline.

IN chapters two and three I argued that colonial and apartheid education was riven by oppositions and contradictions. At the structural level, they produced two distinct forms of governance. In Mamdani's (1987 and 1984) terms white schooling was a form of

"direct rule" for citizens to whom the state recognized a responsibility. African schooling in the territories was a form of "indirect rule" for the subjects of traditional tribal authorities.

THE emergence of a GNU presages a period of change. In Archer's terms, the "Stop-Go pattern" of centralized apartheid education has been stuck in "Stop" for forty years and is about to experience a rapid "Go". Not all changes can be planned, but it does help to have a plan to direct change towards a beneficial goal. This chapter looks at policy documents as statements of plans.

4.2 Archer: another analytic framework

IN chapters two and three I organized my descriptive material with the help of an analytic framework borrowed from Archer (1979). In order to organize my description of education policy discourses and to prepare for my later analysis and argument, I want to borrow from Archer (1988) again. At the heart of a policy discourse lie key assumptions or commitments which embody the core values of those who use the discourse. Archer (1988) provides us with tools to "map out" these values and the

relations of contradiction and consistency between them. Once again, my concern is not to do justice to the detail and elegance of Archer's theory but to utilize a set of ideas to organize my material. I use Archer as a short cut to a useful theoretical perspective within which to embed my description.

ARCHER (1979 and 1988) argues that structure and culture are analytically separate. She believes that:

... as in everyday life, the two (structure and culture) are indeed fused together in one sense - we often meet them and treat them as an amalgam. Thus, on entering a school, for example, one does not separately and self-consciously encounter a social organization and its cultural contents... but social organization and cultural organization are analytically separable. ... it becomes possible to assert that discursive struggles are socially organized and that social struggles are culturally conditioned (Archer, 1988; 305).

Archer is concerned not to reify structure and culture or to imply that they can be ontologically separated; but she does claim that they can be analytically separated and treated as relatively autonomous: that it is possible to separate out and to study the interplay between interests and ideas (Archer, 1988: ix). The raw materials for such an account are social groups. The key to explaining persistence and change lies in:

... how the social (or sectional) distribution of interests and of power actually gel with the situational logic of the Cultural System (or subsystem) at any given time (Archer, 1988: 188).

The Cultural System is a product of socio-cultural interaction but once it has emerged it has properties of its own and can causally influence subsequent socio-cultural interaction (Archer, 1988: 107). The Cultural System is the propositional register of a society at a given time and it is composed of items to which the law of non-contradiction can be applied (Archer, 1988: xvi).

ARCHER argues for the efficacy of causal relations in socio-cultural interaction. She locates causality both in the structures that provide the context of interaction and in the situational logic constituted by the logical relations between propositions affirmed by social actors. To avoid falling into either an overly deterministic or overly voluntaristic conception of human nature Archer conceives of structure and culture as causally under-determining social interaction. Whatever the structural conditioning or situational logic of the context, her actors could have done otherwise, although it is unlikely that they would have done. The logical relations between our most important ideas embroil us in particular situational logics in

much the same way that uttering a sentence involves us in the grammar of language (Archer, 1988: 40).

FOR Archer the most important logical relations are those of consistency (complementarity) and contradiction (Archer, 1988; 105):

... to uphold ideas which are embroiled in a contradiction or enmeshed in complementarities places those who do so in different action contexts where they are confronted with different situational logics... such relationships have their own dynamics, rooted in different material interests, producing various forms of social stratification and different ideal interests, such as ethnic, religious or linguistic divides (which are ideational but not propositional) (Archer, 1988: xx).

A contradiction exists if two items are logically inconsistent with one another (Archer, 1988: 136). A complementarity exists if two items are logically consistent with one another (Archer, 1988: 235). There are many consistencies and inconsistencies between items in the Cultural System which go unrecognized and many which, although recognized, do not have any significant effect on socio-cultural interaction. It is when particular contradictions or complementarities "map onto" conflictual or orderly relations at the socio-cultural level that they become significant (Archer, 1988: xix). There is a two way interplay

between the Cultural System and socio-cultural interaction. The logical relations between Cultural System items can have a causal influence on socio-cultural interaction and socio-cultural interaction can causally influence which logical relations become significant (Archer, 1988: 244).

IN chapter eight I use Foucault's (1984b) concept of discourse in a way that is consistent with my use of Archer's concept of the Cultural System. The Cultural System is one part (that part containing the propositional register) of a discourse in the sense I borrow from Foucault. I also interpret Foucault's concept of a discursive formation as being consistent with Archer's account of the causal relations between her two levels. Similarly I understand both of them to be using the concept of a social institution as an organizational amalgam of structure and culture.

A simple classificatory schema

Cultural System Level

LOGICAL RELATIONS

contradiction

item A

item B

consistency

Socio-Cultural Level

CAUSAL RELATIONS

conflictual

group X

group Y

orderly

OF the possible permutations between A, B, X and Y, I make use of two. I describe the period before 1990 as one where:

X believes A and Y believes B. A and B are in contradiction (they cannot both be true). X and Y are in conflict with each other. The two levels "fit together" and mutually support the promotion of conflict and opposition (An extreme case would be if B were the negation of A).

In the period after 1990, I argue for a shift in the relations between A, B, X, and Y from contradictory to consistent and from conflictual to orderly.

USING this classificatory schema, it is possible to "map out" the values and the relations between them which were present in South African policy discourses about education.

3.3 Education policy before and after 1990

BROADLY and before 1990, policy discourses were riven into two broad blocs. On the one hand there was a commitment to unity, identity and equality and, on the other hand, a commitment to diversity, difference and inequality. Corresponding to these two discursive formations there were two social movements - the "people" and the apartheid state. The two triadic sets were related internally as complementarities and externally as contradictions. If the one were true then the other was false. The conflict, both discursive and social, took the form of a classic Hegelian Lord-Bondsman dialectic. Thesis and antithesis defined both themselves and each other as the opposite, the negation:

... each must aim at the death of the other, as it risks its own life thereby... the other's reality is presented to the former as an external other, as outside itself; it must cancel that externality (Hegel, 1969: 46).

Biko makes the point:

The overall analysis therefore, based on the Hegelian theory of dialectic materialism, is as follows. That since the thesis is a white racism there can only be one valid antithesis, i.e. a solid black unity, to counterbalance the scale (Biko, 1978: 65).

IF the pre-1990 period was a dialectical conflict, then the 1990 to 1994 period was one of synthesis and syncretism as the two opposing movements reached agreements for partial and temporary solutions to the "problem-ridden" situation. The mutual enemies recognized their dependence and moved from war to negotiation. There was a reinterpretation of the traditional values moving from competitive contradictions to the construction of contingent complementarities. There was a sinking of differences. A new discursive formation emerged in synchrony with the construction of the interim constitution and the government of national unity. Syncretism at the Cultural System level mapped onto a social compact on the socio-cultural level. This triple congruence, between ideas, between movements, and between ideas and movements opened the way for a period of fluidity and change in the dominant discourses and in the relations between them.

IN the negotiations that took place in South Africa between 1990 and 1994, leading to an interim constitution and a Government of National Unity, a general vision of a post-apartheid South Africa emerged. In addition to the process of negotiation over the constitution, government and elections, there was a plethora of policy activities addressing the economy, education, housing,

land, development, security, health and welfare. In each area groupings composed primarily of people from NGOs, the unions, the universities, civil and political organizations, attempted to formulate policies appropriate to a new government dominated by the tripartite alliance (ANC, COSATU and the South African Communist Party [SACP]). Simultaneously, the National Party through its access to the state bureaucracy, was able to produce, and in some cases attempt to implement unilaterally, its own plans.

MOVING from war to negotiation, from authoritarian rule to democracy is no easy task. As the AK 47 became the dominant ikon of conflict, so too the forum became the dominant ikon of negotiation. For a forum to work there has to be a binding agreement, an area of consensus, at the very least over how to resolve disagreement. Agreement on a set of constitutional principles for a Government of National Unity required agreement on a basic set of values and rules to inform the design and development of the new institutions and practices of governance.

PRIOR to 1990 and the move from war to negotiation, the value systems of the two major hegemonic blocs were in clear contradiction. Reaching agreement on a single set of values

(embodied in the interim constitution and the bill of rights) required commitment to some common values overcoming the previous oppositions and contradictions.

FEBRUARY 2 1990 should not be regarded as a rupture with the past, but it does provide a convenient marking of a change in the process of change. Prior to this date, change in South Africa was framed by the opposition between the state and the people. The stark opposition of the two hegemonic blocs was reflected in an understanding of change as a replacement of what existed by its opposite, an affirmation of the negation of apartheid as a utopian alternative. After February 2 1990, change became more ambivalent and uncertain: the two hegemonic blocs were partially displaced by a flux of multiple alliances and oppositions both within and between the two blocs. Political and policy discourses were shaped by the looming prospect of a new government. In stark contrast to the 1980s when policy and planning for a new democratic state were daydreams, and the dominant objective was opposition to the state, the period from 1990 to 1994 was framed by the need to have plans to guide the actions of an ANC-led government.

IN the midst of a liberation struggle the overwhelming policy imperative was defeat of the enemy; debate and action was focused

primarily on strategy; the how of daily resistance. This focus on strategy, the problem-solving activities of a revolutionary struggle, was made possible because of common agreement on the values and principles which informed a broad array of allies in the struggle. The eminence of the enemy in the guise of the state enabled the construction of stark dichotomies (people/state, comrade/enemy), based on similar value systems, within which strong and stable identities were constructed in the social institutions and practices of everyday life.

THE emergence of policy discourses in the 1980s, outside the realm of the apartheid state, was characterized by an uneasy tension between a present necessity for confrontation with the apartheid state and the uncertainty of planning for reconstruction in the future. Not surprisingly, given the importance of the "young lions" in the making of ungovernable townships, education policy discourse of the time reflected this tension acutely. The people's education embodied in the work of the NECC and progressive teacher, student and parent organizations reflected the need for strategic struggles in schools for control of schools, and the need for a policy discourse about the future of the education system - evident in the establishment of Education Policy Units based for safety in

the universities, but owned and controlled jointly by the university and the NECC.

THE everyday exigencies of mass popular resistance to the state in the 1980s resulted in the hegemony of a discursive formation within the liberation movement which emphasized the negative. People's education was against the evils of the apartheid system and for the elimination of illiteracy, ignorance, exploitation, capitalist norms of competition, individualism and stunted intellectual development. The alternative vision of what education should be like was based on the principles of a unitary system, democratization, non-sexism, free and compulsory education, redress for rural areas and squatter communities (Perry, 1991).

- * THE path to this utopia was through the development of collective input, active participation, critical thinking and analysis. To ensure that this happened, people's education was committed to equipping and training the people to actively and creatively participate in appropriate organizational structures. People's power was not just political power. The need for practical and technical skills, and the creation of a critical consciousness to enable people to participate effectively in their own governance were recognized (Mashamba, 1991: 43/4).

SISULU'S paper (1986) conceives of the shift from negative resistance to the construction of a positive alternative as a three-step movement: from state power to ungovernability to people's power/government. The attempts to put this into practice, in the period from 1986 to 1990, were scattered and partial with little possibility of fulfillment. Similarly, in contraposition, the state was unable to restore legitimacy or control in most of the schooling system.

THAT this vision represented a crucial part of the resistance is indisputable, but it was also self-defeating. Not only was the liberation movement constrained by the coercive counter-measures of the state, but the vision was only attainable if it already existed. To achieve people's education required the active participation of parents, teachers, students and civil organizations in appropriate organizational structures. But without control of the institutional powers and resources of the state it was impossible to implement people's education. The contradiction is clear: to implement people's education presupposes democratic governance; to achieve democratic governance requires the (people's) education of the people.

BY 1990, it was not only the state that was at an impasse with regard to education, but also the liberation movement:

February 2nd 1990 made us witness to the rupture of the oppositional symbolic order. The state refused its 'historically assigned' role and assumed another, returned in fact to the buried and displaced terms of liberal pragmatism (Morphet, 1990: 98).

One consequence of this impasse was a serious breakdown of a schooling system already in a parlous condition. In the period from 1990 to 1994, education policy discourses continued to reflect the earlier tensions. On the one hand, there were continuing crises requiring short-term responses: teacher's strikes, student boycotts, the disintegration of quality resulting from under-provision and poor quality provision, and increasing violence. On the other hand, there was the need to plan the transformation of the existing system into a people's education system.

THE existing education system in 1990 was, predominantly, a traditional western schooling system, with a weak penumbra of industry training and NGO based adult basic education. The schooling system consumed about 21 billion Rand a year or approximately 20 percent of the state budget, employed about 350,000 people and provided schooling for, approximately, 12

million students. The sheer mass of the system promoted an inertia that encouraged persistence of the status quo and mitigated against change. This inertia was strengthened by the dominant discourses and the inequalities embedded in existing economic, social and political power relations, institutions and practices.

4.4 Six education policies

IN the period from 1990 to 1994, there were six major policy proposals on education: the 1991 Educational Renewal Strategy (ERS) produced by bureaucrats within the existing system; the 1993 National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI) produced by the NECC; the 1993 Framework for Lifelong Learning produced by the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU); the 1993 policy proposals for higher education produced by the Union of Democratic University Staff Associations (UDUSA); the 1993 report on Open Learning and Distance Education produced by the South African Institute for Distance education (SAIDE); the 1994 Policy Framework for Education and Training produced by the African National Congress. Other policy documents with implications for education were produced by the Institute for Local Government (1993) and the Land and Agricultural Policy Centre (1994). The

intentions of the ANC in 1994, as the senior partner in the GNU, in respect of education reform were spelt out in the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) and the Implementation Plan for Education and Training (IPET).

ALL of this policy work took place within a context of uncertainty and increasing violence. It was only with the agreement on an interim constitution, and a government of national unity in late 1993, that the likely nature of the new governance institutions and practices began to emerge. Even after the elections in April 1994, and the inauguration of the government of national unity, there was still considerable ambiguity and uncertainty, particularly over the distribution of powers to the different institutions and levels of government.

THE first clear and stable intersection between the different values and interests came with the establishment of the National Education and Training Forum in 1993. Here the National Party government participated in, and was partially bound by the decisions of, a forum consisting of representatives from approximately sixty organizations constituting:

... a consensus-seeking mechanism for addressing the crisis in education, and for creating stable conditions for the restructuring of education and training into a single national system (ANC, 1994: 4).

THE negotiating position of the broad alliance clustered around the ANC was articulated most clearly at a National Education Conference held at Broederstroom in 1992. The continuing destruction of the culture of learning, and the imminent demise of apartheid required active intervention in the state's administration of education. The NEC produced a code of conduct to govern the behaviour of teachers, students and parents by spelling out their respective rights, responsibilities and duties, and provided a set of principles for the future education and training system:

The state has the central responsibility for education and training.

Education and training shall be provided to all on a democratic and unitary basis, without any discrimination on the grounds of race, gender, class and age.

Education shall be extended to all disadvantaged groups including women, adults, students, youth and rural communities, in order to redress historical imbalances.

Education shall be integrated within a coherent and comprehensive national development policy.

The provision of education and training shall be linked to the development of human resources within national development aimed at the restructuring of the economy, redistribution and the democratization of society.

Education shall be based upon the principles of co-operation, critical thinking and civic responsibility, and shall equip individuals for participation in all aspects of society (NEC, 1992).

4.5 The Education Renewal Strategy

THE negotiating position of the National Party Government was best expressed in the ERS. The central question that permeates the ERS is "How to accommodate diversity in an educationally acceptable manner, without prejudice?" (Garbers, 1992). The ERS proposed that the new system should provide freedom of choice, equal opportunities, a balance of commonality and diversity (CHED, 1991a: 20/1). There should be a balance between administrative centralization and decentralization with maximum devolution of power to the community or individual institution. This would enable schools to be differentiated according to values, locale, religion, language, culture – in fact, any criteria except race. The only power to remain centralized would be the maintenance of national norms and standards (CHED, 1993a: 21/3). This would result in a decentralized system unified by co-ordinating structures at central level (CHED, 1991a: 26/32).

ADVOCATING decentralization was a significant shift from the previous emphasis where inequalities and different racial identities were imposed from the centre. Broadly, the ERS was an attempt to ensure the persistence of unequal power relations through decentralization and privatization to the local

institutional level, relying on the geographical distribution of populations and institutions to provide existing school boards control over sufficient local educational institutions to ensure the maintenance of educational privileges. Given the history of unequal provision between the different racially and geographically defined sub-systems, decentralization would appear to be an appropriate strategy for the preservation of privilege, particularly if the collection and distribution of financial and other resources is placed under local governance. The danger of such a strategy was that it ignored the history of unequal provision and the consequent low capacity on the part of the majority to effectively govern their own schools (Sayed and Kulati, 1992).

THE ERS believed the curriculum should be renewed in a "scientifically responsible manner" and there should be a paradigm shift from university-oriented education towards more vocationally-oriented education with a high degree of flexibility and mobility within the system (CHED, 1991b: 6/7). Curricula should provide for specialization in terms of the learner's interest, ability and aptitude. There should be horizontal (choice of subjects) and vertical specialization (choice of standard) with most forms of delivery being divided into modules

with much of the provision being through distance learning and community learning centres (CHED, 1991B: 45/6; CHED, 1993a: 31/2). The values that lie at the core of the curriculum should include equal opportunities for education; recognition of the religious and cultural ways of life and languages; a balance between the needs of the individual and those of society (the demands of economic development), and should take into account the person power needs of South Africa (CHED, 1991b: 7).

THE significance of the ERS lay in its being a well formulated expression of the dominant discourse within the bureaucracy, and a management plan which the bureaucracy, with the support of the National Party government, continued to implement unilaterally where and when it was able to do so and most obviously in the form of model C schools. The ERS was committed to a system with a high level of specialization (maximum diversity) and a low level of differentiation (closely linked to civil society and the market), and a low level of unification and systematization - the characteristic features of a decentralized system.

IF the ERS represented the discourse of the reforming apartheid state, then the ANC's "A Policy Framework for Education and Training", released in January 1994, represented the discourse of

the tripartite alliance. Produced by the Centre for Education Policy Development this document drew on the work of three earlier policy initiatives: the National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI), the COSATU proposals for training and adult basic education, and, to a lesser extent those NGOs and state institutions addressing distance education, lifelong learning and tertiary education; such as the South African Institute for Distance Education (SAIDE) and the Union of Democratic University Staff Associations (UDUSA).

4.6 The National Education Policy Investigation

NEPI drew a distinction between three phases of the policy cycle, and restricted itself to the first phase: analyzing different policy options; proposing and advocating one policy option above the others; and planning the implementation of one policy option (NEPI, 1993a: 5). The ANC's policy framework completed the second phase and the CEPD's Implementation Plan for Education and Training completed the cycle. There still remained the gap between the policy cycle and actual implementation that would mark the emergence of a new national education system. Bridging this gap, connecting policy decisions and plans with the existing system and bringing about a transformation of the existing system

in the direction of the policy vision, requires that the vision offer a coherent discourse to inform the processes of change and a form of governance capable of implementing the changes. Unfortunately, the vision provided by the ANC Policy Framework contained too many contradictions and obscurities to provide such a coherent vision. The contradictions and obscurities arose from the different origins of the different sections of the report. There were three different conceptions of education operating in the document:

The dominant conception was apparent in the sections on schooling and had its origins in NEPI.

A strong competing conception appeared in the sections dealing with training and adult basic education with their origins in COSATU.

The third conception was that of open lifelong learning, primarily through distance education, which had its clearest exposition in the work of SAIDE.

NEPI saw itself as a movement within civil society which it understood as the:

... domain of organized special interests, such as, the trade unions, co-operatives and community-based organizations, private sector organizations, the civic associations, and a host of special interests: education, sporting, cultural, and religious (NEPI, 1993a: 8).

THE structures, processes, debates and conclusions of NEPI can be seen as attempts to come to grips with multiple tensions in a variety of policy domains: conceptual, political, administrative and personal. There was a deconstruction of the people/state dichotomy and the reconstruction of a new synthesis in which conflicts between people and contradictions between concepts were to be resolved by reasoned argument and negotiation in a variety of different forums. Forums are:

... sites where the civic intellectual and political functions can engage with each other... as essentially mechanisms of mediation (Muller and Cloete, 1991: 37).

The concept of forums was central to the conception, process and products of NEPI as a large-scale project to take forward the project of people's education, to recreate the earlier moments of a unifying alliance between intellectual and activist, but with a changed purpose, a shifting of focus from resistance to reconstruction of the existing education system.

THE most important shift in focus was that the state was no longer the target; the daunting and malicious other had been replaced:

... this investigation is not directed towards the state, and treats the state's policies as themselves representing the views of a powerful set of interests (NEPI, 1993a: 4).

The purpose of the forums was no longer the construction of a counter-hegemony in a win-or-lose conflict with the state but the clarification of possible alternatives to the present system for use by political actors committed to the five principles of non-racism, non-sexism, democracy, a unitary system and redress (NEPI, 1993: 51). NEPI showed a nuanced cognizance of the multi-faceted nature of this project, of the need to replace previous binary oppositions with new conceptualizations that offered the possibility of resolving conflict through a process of rational compromises.

THE careful structuring of the NEPI reports as a movement from what exists to what is possible affirmed a belief that it was possible to resolve conceptual and political disagreements in a progressive manner through rational discourse. The Framework

Report provides a rearview mirror of how this process of reconciliation and mediation unfolded during the course of NEPI and, in particular, how the concepts of articulation and forums characterized the processes and the products of NEPI. The processes were based on forums intended to join together (articulate) academics and activists; the products/reports prioritized forums as the primary sites of decision-making. Articulation (in Archer's terms, a combination of high unification and low differentiation) between different parts within the system, and between education and other parts of society, was seen as the guiding principle of education system change.

THE purpose of the Framework Report as a guide to reading NEPI was to show the possibility of translating the conceptual options of NEPI into political positions. The distillation of the four systemic features of finance, organization, differentiation and articulation provides a "lens through which to assess potential options" (NEPI, 1993: 23). The need for such an instrument arose from NEPI's conceptualization of itself as an intellectual project within civil society, as an attempt to provide a rational perspective that avoided the advocacy associated with political bargaining. This distinction between discursive options and

political positions is apparent in the framing of the conclusions of NEPI as options with a variety of tensions, inconsistencies and contradictions between them. NEPI was not so naive as to believe these options were neutral or objective; they were grounded in the values embodied in the five principles. The role played by these principles within NEPI was that of having:

... kept us honest, by serving as a constant reminder of the human communities to which the policy discourse is ultimately addressed (NEPI, 1993: 40).

In so far as NEPI had a vision of an ideal future system based on the five principles, its central characteristics would include a high-skill development path which requires:

A strong state - which can push through vigorous social programmes.

A strong civil society - where interest groups can and do press their claims and priorities.

Government by consensus and social partnership relations.

A clear economic growth path.

An efficient bureaucracy.

A good-quality basic education system

The provision of quality basic education will be constrained by:

Low levels of well trained teachers.

Low planning and administrative capacity.

Low curriculum development capacity.

Low capacity for rapid infrastructural development (NEPI, 1993a: 24/5).

THE values that lie behind this vision were embedded in the discourse that developed within NEPI over the nature of, and the relations between, the five principles. In the Framework report which provided a closing analysis of this debate, the key tension was understood to lie between the demand for equity and the need for development. The former had its roots in the history of resistance to apartheid education and signifies the importance of redressing past inequalities. As a crucial tenet of people's

education, equity represented the elimination of capitalist norms of competition and individualism and a rejection of the unequal differences of apartheid. Within the NEPI reports, the emphasis was on the quantitative aspects of finance and provision (NEPI, 1993a: 12/3). This emphasis on equality (or the eradication of inequalities based on race, sex, wealth, and ethnicity) was itself a shift from the emphasis within people's education in the 1980s on democracy. Within people's education the primary emphasis was on democracy, with equality being aligned with a liberal perspective (associated with the South African Institute of Race Relations and the Democratic Party).

THE particular concept of development that was taken to be in tension with equity can be understood as economic growth and the integration of South Africa into a world economy dominated by a global capitalism fractured by extreme inequalities of wealth and power (NEPI, 1993: 24). This integration is necessary if we are to increase our collective wealth as a nation; but it has the consequence of requiring the allocation of scarce resources to groups privileged by their existing position (class, race, gender, region) in relation to the economy.

THIS concept of development is biased towards a new form of dependency theory in which the development of the people of South

Africa is dependent on our ability to modernize our economy and our education system. As Wolpe (1992) has noted, the question of education and training as a necessary aspect of economic development was not addressed sufficiently by people's education; by contrast, in the Framework Report the pendulum swings the other way and the need for differentiated allocation of scarce resources in pursuit of development becomes the privileged side of the dichotomy (NEPI, 1993: 22).

THIS triple shift in focus from democracy to equality/equity to development and the underlying assumption of conflictual dichotomies are traces of the earlier dichotomy between the people and the state and their presence is indicative of NEPI's location in the space between the old and the new (Muller and Cloete, 1991: 38). In Archer's (1988) terms, the shifts that occurred in the relations between values, understood as items in the Cultural System, were in concordance with the shift from conflict to negotiation at the socio-cultural level.

GOVERNANCE was seen as promoting a balanced distribution of powers between different levels of the system (NEPI, 1993a: 154). The concept of democracy that emerges from NEPI distinguishes representative democracy and participative democracy. The former

is understood as the requirement that a unitary democratic state and state education system represent the aspirations of the majority. The latter is understood as consisting of direct participation at local and institutional levels operating through regional and national civil society associations, as well as through a general obligation on the state to consult and inform people (NEPI, 1993a: 15). Two approaches to education system governance are proposed. There is a systemic perspective in which change takes place through negotiation between interest groups participating in a network of consultative councils (a form of centralized political manipulation resonant with the elite-pacting form of negotiation). There is also a school governance perspective in which key social forces (such as PTAs and unions) participate in boards at each level of governance and are responsible for both policy formulation and implementation. This is a decentralized form of governance, but with the emphasis on political manipulation at the local level rather than the internal initiation and external exchange present in Archer's (1979) examples (NEPI, 1993a: 163). The Framework Report sees a tension between these two forms that can be resolved only by an "...optimal distribution of power and functions to the different levels in the system" (NEPI, 1993a: 154).

NEPI argued that since actual outcomes will be determined by political processes it was not possible to determine the optimal distribution of powers but only to make "apparent the kinds of choices that have to be made" (NEPI, 1993: 26). Broadly, the choices lay between the two poles of a means-end continuum:

Means-based models will emphasize equity, while ends-based models will stress development. Some kind of trade-off is inevitable (NEPI, 1993: 37).

From this perspective, equity expresses the needs-based popular demands of people's education, and development signifies the actual means for satisfying them in a negotiated restructuring of apartheid education within restrictive economic and political conditions. The way forward provided by the Framework Report is to synthesize the contradictions into a means-end continuum and, on the basis of extensive research and consultation, produce options that broadly lie within the continuum. The binary oppositions and violent confrontation of the old order have been displaced by changing contradictions into continuums and force into rational persuasion.

THE means-end continuum is an example of the concept of articulation which is used to refer to relations and divisions

between concepts; the intellectual and political realms; interest groups in civil society; and structures and processes within the education system. Articulation is also a key to the intellectual culture of NEPI. One of the original foundation stones of NEPI was the articulation between the intellectuals in the research groups and the people's education committees of the NECC and their development of an Education Charter. This public discourse was intended to ensure that the final reports reflected a discursive engagement between those engaged in education in the classrooms and on the streets and the predominantly university-based intellectuals.

THE failure of this particular conception of joining (articulating) the research and development legs of the NECC within the research groups of NEPI reflected the disintegration of the type of community-based organizations (strong PTsAs) necessary for the consultative forums to be as democratically inclusive as possible with the result that the public discourses that emerged remained confined to a broad grouping of intellectuals from the universities, trade unions, and NGOs. This disintegration was linked clearly to the violence, but there was also a shifting away from the unifying homogenizing myths of the pre-1990 period and their replacement by shifting, multiple interest groupings associated with different value systems.

THE policy challenge:

... is to find ways of maximizing development while improving equity, to manage differentiation in such a way that the social programme of education equity is not seriously compromised (NEPI, 1993: 21).

The options at the end of each report are particular choices constructed from the perspective of each research group's interpretations of the means-end continuums. The role of the NEPI intellectual was clear: intellectual clarification of articulating relations and their application to the many dimensions of an education system was intended to facilitate the political articulation of these tensions within the appropriate forums of the political realm. For NEPI, the contours of an ideal system were clear:

Articulation becomes the most important means for facilitating equity under conditions of differentiation (NEPI, 1993: 19).

THE surest guarantee of a transformation of the education system that will satisfy the needs of the poor lies in the development of an articulated system of governance that ensures the maximum participation of all interested parties in education decision-

making. Over any particular issue the tension between means (equity and democracy) and ends (development and efficiency) can best be adjudicated within a public forum where partial resolutions will emerge from temporary agreements.

AN appropriate example of such an adjudication could be drawn from an adapted version of Moulder's (1991c) indices of inequality in which a formula for the allocation of financial resources to an educational unit can be worked out taking due account of issues of redress/rectification. Democracy is promoted by the adjustment of the formula on an annual basis through a forum open to public scrutiny and participation. This picture of education decision-making forums and, particularly the discourse-framing role of the intellectual, reflected a belief in the power of discourse to produce a form of reason that promoted a progressive development towards a just society:

The focus of investigation shifts... to communicative rationality... and what is paradigmatic for the latter is... the intersubjective relations that speaking and acting subjects take up when they come to an understanding with one another about something (Habermas, 1983: 392).

I will return to the importance of rationality to the negotiation process and to governance in chapter eight. The central role of the concepts of articulation and forums within NEPI was the source of its greatest strength and its most severe weakness. What NEPI silenced, what was not articulated, were the voices of those most likely to be excluded from the new system of education: rural people, women and unemployed youth. To be heard in the forums of NEPI one had to have either acknowledged intellectual skills or to be a representative of an organization with sufficient policy-making capacity to influence deliberations. An example of this occurred in the Adult Basic Education research group where the powerful influence of COSATU's organizational and research capacity dominated the final report to the detriment of the perspectives of the National Literacy Co-operative which represented a larger but marginalized constituency.

ONE dangerous tendency of NEPI lay in its eurocentric assumption that the new South Africa will be a civil society, based on the values of the enlightenment, within which education system change is dominated by a "mechanism of change" which privileges "the interaction of educationally dominant and assertive groups" (Archer, 1984: 60). The inherent weakness of this assumption in

the context of South Africa was evident in the failure of the link to the people's education commissions and the Education Charter campaign and in the failure to address the educational needs of those in South Africa who are part of a not-civil society. The NEPI reports pay little attention to the education of the unemployed (with the exception of the Adult Education report) and to education in rural areas.

4.7 The Congress of South African Trade Unions

COSATU made an important contribution to NEPI in the areas of human resource development and adult basic education; but its major contribution came through its work on the National Training Board (NTB). The values and governance structures for a new education and training system were spelt out in two documents: COSATU (1993) and NTB (1994). The 1993 report provided a brief description of four values: equity, efficiency, development and democracy and the relations between them. Equity is defined primarily as the overcoming of inequality in the provision of training through a just allocation of resources; efficiency lies in the efficient delivery and utilization of resources; development is understood as a strategy for economic growth; democracy refers to both the construction of democratic

governance structures and people's participation in those structures. There was a strong emphasis on the role of training and adult basic education as central to building the capacity necessary for achieving political democratization and economic growth.

FOR COSATU (1993 and 1994), education and training policies should be decided upon and governed from national central government level with provincial and local government tiers responsible only for implementation and delivery. All governance structures must be representative, accountable and transparent. The most important aspect of their proposed framework is the integration of education and training. COSATU argues against the traditional understanding of two ladders, one for education and one for training, with occasional bridges between them. Instead, they argue for a unified, multi-path approach to education and training. This model puts forward a nationally unified system built around three principles. These are:

A single department for education and training with statutory advisory bodies.

A single qualification structure based on a competency approach.

A curriculum system which is based on articulation and equivalency between different learning contexts and outcomes.

FOR COSATU, education and training cannot be seen separately from a strategy for economic growth and political democratization in which people participate actively in the economy and in their own governance to ensure equal access and redress for past inequalities:

The strategic challenge for the country is how to keep up with the technologies which will influence its competitive position (NTB, 1994: 53).

COSATU proposed that a national curriculum framework should be built around the notion of a core curriculum; empower individuals, individually and collectively, to design their own futures; integrate academic, vocational, scientific, technological and industrial skills; promote critical thinking; allow for flexibility; recognize prior learning and experience; allow for vertical and horizontal mobility; embrace all learners at all levels and be non-racist and non-sexist (COSATU, 1993).

Education and training must empower the individual, improve the quality of life and contribute towards development targets in the national economic plan through a national qualification framework (NTB, 1994: 86).

COSATU'S proposals on the linking of education and training and the maximizing of mobility through assessment and certification based on competency, became central pillars of ANC policy (1994a).

THE key to a national qualifications framework is the ability to articulate different forms of learning through the specification of outcomes-based criteria (NTB, 1994: 95/97). Governance structures will institutionalize organizational ties between decision-makers in the economy and education and training through a network of statutory councils and representative forums (NTB, 1994: 100/105). The focus of the COSATU recommendations is on training, and particularly on workplace-based training. Little mention is made of schooling, but there is a recognition of the importance of ABET although there is little detail on its provision (NTB, 1994: 148).

4.8 The Union of Democratic University Staff Associations

THE Union of Democratic University Staff Associations (UDUSA) subscribed to a similar set of values as part of a framework for higher education (UDUSA, 1993). Equity is understood as going beyond the formal (constitutional and legal) declaration of equality which does not address the legacy of social and structural inequalities in education. Equity is seen as a useful analytical and mobilizing tool with strong connotations of fairness, impartiality and distributive justice (UDUSA, 1993: 17/18).

DEMOCRACY is defined by five criteria:

Representivity - the meaningful participation of organized constituencies.

Accountability - the requirement to demonstrate responsible action to internal and external constituencies and stakeholders.

Transparency - access to information and openness about decision-making procedures.

Freedom of association and academic freedom – the right of teachers, researchers and students to pursue knowledge without fear of interference or prosecution.

Autonomy – within a national framework each institution must have the right to make a range of decisions such as the spending of its budget, who it admits, appoints, etc. (UDUSA, 1993: 18).

IN place of COSATU's value of efficiency, UDUSA posits effectiveness. An organization or system is effective if it achieves the best or most desired outcome as economically as possible, given the social and political goals set by the system. This requires that each educational institution must be efficient in the sense of achieving those outcomes determined by national policy at the lowest possible cost, and it must achieve a set of objectives which are the best or most appropriate for that institution (UDUSA, 1993:19).

DEVELOPMENT is understood as growth together with change. Growth by itself is insufficient to redress the inequalities of the past. Change is social, cultural, economic, qualitative and quantitative. It should activate all sectors of society and

include economic restructuring and human resource development. And all these dimensions should be bound together by the ultimate aim of equity. For UDUSA there can not be a single construction or deconstruction of development. Thus, for example, modernization has a light and dark side and its results have been good and bad. In order for there to be a material improvement in the conditions of life of the majority of the population it will be necessary to become economically competitive in the global market by developing flexible indigenous technologies and adopting new forms of participatory and multi-skilled work organization (UDUSA, 1993: 10; Singh, 1994).

THE 1993 report argues for a dialectical approach to the set constituted by the four values and their relations which acknowledges both the tensions and linkages between them (UDUSA, 1993:21/22). Thus, for example educational equity should not only be about access to more material resources but also about empowerment and the strengthening of agency and autonomy among those who have suffered educational inequality. The commitment to equity, then, must include both empowerment and redistribution. In this way, equity and democracy can begin to interact (UDUSA, 1993:17/18). For UDUSA, the future system of governance must allow for the fullest participation of civil society through the

representation of organizations in decision-making structures which are independent of the state and yet capable of directly influencing state policy formation (UDUSA, 1993: 4/5).

4.9 The South African Institute for Distance Education

APART from these four major education policy initiatives, there were a number of others dealing with different aspects of the education system. Of interest here, because it reappears in the ANC (1994) proposals, is the work on distance education and open learning put forward by SAIDE. The values subscribed to in the report include access and redress; opportunity; development; democracy; and efficiency (Swift, 1993: 3/6). These values are bound together by a vision of a future democratic South Africa as an open learning society in which access to knowledge and learning is increasingly open to all people at all times and on their own terms. This cannot be realized by a system of school-based provision using traditional classroom methods. Swift claims that the weakness at the core of the existing system, and of policy initiatives such as the ERS and NEPI, is that they operate with a conception of schooling and of the role of mass communications in education as dependent on the speaking teachers:

... who need captive audiences and certain kinds of buildings in which to organize the learning of their pupils (Swift, 1993: 22).

A democratic society requires a system of open learning in which opportunities for learning are not dependent upon attendance at fixed times and places. Learning opportunities will have to be designed using a range of media to replace or augment the speaking teacher as deliverer of the syllabus:

... South Africa has not the time to recapitulate the historical development of the educational systems of the North in which increasing wealth made possible the expansion of education via escalating numbers of increasingly expensive teachers (Swift, 1993: 22/23).

TO achieve this vision education and training must be delivered through multi-media, open entry institutions with the infrastructure and capacity to provide student support and courses designed as high quality learning environments. The financial implication of high quality preparation of courses is that initial expenditure is very high. Low unit costs are then brought about by very high student numbers (Swift, 1993: 1).

FOR Swift:

South Africa has an opportunity to leap straight to a twenty-first century solution. This would require that the media - print and electronic - be included within a holistic design for a new educational dispensation (Swift, 1993: 22).

What does an open learning system look like? The ANC's answer is:

Open learning describes an approach which seeks to remove all unnecessary restrictions to learning. ...to do so, we must stop thinking of education as something that occurs within the walls of a school and can only be done by the talking teacher. It requires that we set up structures and conditions which enable learners to learn where, when, what and how they want to. Importantly it is not only a matter of access. It must offer quality learning that brings a reasonable chance of success (ANC, 1994: 73).

THE new education system should provide general schooling, training and adult education as an integrated system in which the emphasis is on:

A balanced curriculum developed for all learners in a variety of learning contexts: students within formal institutions, workers in industry or (others) through CLCs.

A society whose government provides every citizen free access to information sources and resource-based learning facilities (ANC, 1994: 79/80).

IN order to overcome the deficiencies of existing provision in rural areas in an efficient and effective manner that ensures democracy and equity it will be necessary to integrate closely the delivery of general, further and adult basic education. This is to be done through community learning centres and distance education:

The state will regard rural schools as community learning centres oriented around the social, educational health, and recreational needs of the broader community (CEPD, 1994: 12).

DISTANCE education is structured learning where student and teacher are separated by space and time. It is a way to develop and distribute teaching materials, to link different media and to plan various kinds of support for the learner. It requires that the learning environment be well designed to meet the needs and problems of the learners. Distance education provides the techniques of educational design and provision that make open learning practically possible. For SAIDE and the ANC, open learning and distance education are the only feasible approaches to meeting the needs of vast numbers of South Africans who were systematically deprived of educational opportunity in the past (the issue of redress) while at the same time providing

opportunities for the cohorts of youth coming up through the educational system (the issue of access). It, furthermore, offers many methods for improving the quality and scope of the traditional schooling system (ANC, 1994: 73).

4.10 The ANC's Policy Framework for Education and Training

The ANC's "Policy Framework for Education and Training" combines these policy positions (excluding the ERS) together in an attempt to provide a comprehensive picture. Schools (NEPI), lifelong training and adult basic education (COSATU), higher education (UDUSA) and distance education and open learning (SAIDE) are the core components of a lifelong learning system which will meet the ANC's obligation to provide education as a basic human right:

The right to education and training should be enshrined in a Bill of Rights which should establish principles and mechanisms to ensure that there is an enforceable and expanding minimum floor of entitlements for all.

All individuals should have access to lifelong education and training irrespective of race, class, gender, creed or age.

Lifelong education should be underpinned by the following values:

The development of human potential, so that every person is able to contribute freely to society, advance common values, and increase socially useful wealth.

The realization of democracy, so that independent, responsible and productive citizens will be enabled to participate fully in all facets of the life of their communities and the nation at large.

The reconciliation of liberty, equality and justice, so that citizens' freedom of choice is exercised within a social and national context of equality of opportunity and the redress of imbalances.

The pursuit of national reconstruction and development, transforming the institutions of society in the interest of all, and enabling the social, cultural, economic and political empowerment of all citizens (ANC, 1994: 3).

THESE goals and values express a vision, from which flow the following principles:

The state has the central responsibility in the provision of education and training.

The provision of education and training shall be planned as part of a coherent and comprehensive national social and economic reconstruction and development programme, including a national strategy for the development of human resources, and the democratization of our society.

A nationally determined framework of policy and incentives shall ensure that employers observe their fundamental obligation for the education and training of their workers.

Education and training policy and practice shall be governed by the principle of democracy, ensuring the active participation of various interest groups, in particular teachers, parents, workers, students, employers and the broader community.

In the process of ensuring education and training for all, there shall be special emphasis on the redress of educational inequalities among historically disadvantaged groups such as youth, the disabled, adults, women, the unemployed and rural communities.

There shall be mechanisms to ensure horizontal and vertical mobility and flexibility of access between general formative, technical, industrial and adult education and training in the formal and non-formal sectors.

There shall be nationally determined standards for accreditation and certification for formal and non-formal education and training, with due recognition of prior learning and experience.

The education process shall aim at the development of a national democratic culture, with respect for the value of our people's diverse cultural and linguistic traditions, and shall encourage peace, justice, tolerance and stability in our communities and nation.

Education shall be based upon the principles of co-operation, critical thinking and civic responsibility, and shall equip individuals for participation in all aspects of society (ANC, 1994: 3/4).

THE vision presented by the ANC is one of a nationally integrated system linking one level of learning to another and enabling learners to progress to higher levels from any starting point in the education and training system. Learning and skills which people have acquired through experience and informal training will be formally assessed and credited towards qualifications. The central features of the system are ten years of free and compulsory quality general education leading to a General Education Certificate; a three phase adult basic education and training programme providing an alternative route to the General Education Certificate; a three year post-compulsory stage leading to a Further Education Certificate; a higher education sector including universities, technikons and colleges; a training sector providing an alternative route to further and higher education; and educare.

GOVERNANCE at all levels of the integrated national system will maximize democratic participation of stakeholders, including the

broader community, and will be orientated towards equity, effectiveness, efficiency, accountability, and the sharing of responsibility. The values embedded in the governance structures include:

The structure of the education and training system and its governance will aim at nation-building and the eradication of racialism, tribalism, ethnicity and gender considerations as the basis of educational organization.

As much decision-making and executive responsibility will be devolved to local and institutional governance bodies as they can sustain, in order to secure their full participation in the transformation and efficient management of the system.

The system of governance in education and training will ensure a balance between the responsibilities of national and provincial governments in relation to their legislatures, and popular participation in policy development and implementation through structures of governance and consultation, in order to ensure the most effective combination of responsiveness and accountability at each level of the system.

The structures, processes and styles of the education and training bureaucracy will need to be transformed and reoriented to greater efficiency, public accountability and transparency.

Although the report proposed four levels of governance – national, provincial, local and institutional – the IPET and the RDP inserted a district level for rural areas between the provincial and local levels.

EDUCATION is to be a concurrent function of central government and the nine provinces; they will share responsibility for ensuring that education policy formulation and the provision of education is fair, efficient and directed towards the promotion of human development in all its aspects. The Ministry of Education and Training will be accountable, through the Minister, to the National Assembly. It will be responsible for overall co-ordination of education financing, including equitable systems of budgetary provision, grants, subsidies and intra-governmental transfers for education and training purposes. Its responsibilities will also cover policy frameworks and guidelines for the entire system including early childhood educare, adult

basic education and training, special education and the library and information service; the national qualifications system; the national curriculum framework; norms and standards; management information systems; planning and financing processes, including fiscal equalization; conditions of service of education personnel; industrial relations in education and training (public employees only); a national quality assurance system, including the monitoring of redress; and, the national higher education system, including teacher education.

THE ministry will work in close co-operation with the statutory councils and boards at national and provincial level. In order to ensure maximum democratic participation in governance, these councils and boards will include, at all levels, representation of stakeholders such as organizations of teachers, students, parents, organized labour, business, and disabled people amongst others, which will be mandated by, and accountable to, their respective constituencies.

PROVINCIAL education authorities will be accountable to provincial legislatures in respect of their responsibilities regarding the administration of education and training in the province, and for funds allocated from the provincial fiscus.

They will observe national policy in respect of qualifications, curriculum, policy framework and guidelines, norms and standards, planning and financing processes.

PROVINCIAL authorities will be responsible for implementation of national policy; adaptation of national policy in line with provincial needs; provisioning and delivery of general and further education; employment of staff; school mapping and specification designs; school construction and maintenance; development of delivery systems; allocation and management of resources; information collection and management; quality assurance system.

THE local, or district level in rural areas, will be responsible for management and administration of all pre-higher education levels of the education and training system; appointment of teachers/educators; development of administrative and financial support services; development of extra-mural support services including psychological, cultural and recreational services; distribution and co-ordination of human and material resources to schools, ABET and educare in the locality within the framework of the national goals of redress, democracy and nation-building.

AT the institutional level, governance structures must take into account the extreme complexity of the existing formal situation and the virtual absence of effective participatory governance in African schools. The governance structures of all schools should include parents, teachers and students (the latter at secondary level) as the elected representatives of the constituent groupings, together with representatives of the wider community served by the school (ANC, 1994: 23/27).

IN 1994, there were five dominant systems of institutional governance categorized according to different forms of financing:

State schools for whites, mostly of the Model C type had powers that included prescribing compulsory school fees; determining admission policies, selecting staff and appointing additional staff who were paid from school funds; selecting and purchasing resources.

State schools in the departments of education and culture in the tricameral houses of Delegates and Representatives had parent elected committees that were advisory in relation to school uniforms and voluntary school funds.

State schools for Africans had school management committees of elected parents and the principal that were largely discredited and hardly functioned.

State-aided farm schools gave farm owners the power to establish or close a school, appoint staff and determine access.

Community schools in the rural areas of the territories tended to give the traditional tribal authorities greater authority than government departments to establish schools and administer funds.

IN the territories land was allocated by the tribal authority, and in many cases, the costs of building schools was borne by the community under the supervision of the chief and the district magistrate. The principals were not accountable to school committees, and because of illiteracy and disempowerment, school committees had little authority. Power relations were extremely male dominated and hierarchical.

THE governance institutions of the apartheid system failed to achieve effective community support, had limited parent

participation, had a record of incompetency, inefficiency and corruption, and excluded teachers and students. They contributed to poor school administration and were one of the most significant factors causing inferior schooling for Africans in South Africa (ANC, 1994: 20/21).

The ANC report is committed to providing everyone with access to a lifelong learning system within which anyone can proceed to a higher level, or move to a different part of the system; creating governance structures that ensure the maximum participation of all interested parties in both the formulation and implementation of policy through the allocation of different powers to the different levels and the sharing of responsibility; the realization of a set of values including democracy, development, equity, efficiency/effectiveness, redress and unity/nation-building.

THE report argues for a general core curriculum focusing on the skills necessary for an understanding of, and participation in, the structures and institutions of a developing democratic society (ANC, 1994: 68/90).

The national core curriculum for the General Education Certificate and the Further Education Certificate will:

Promote non-racist and non-sexist values.

Prepare individuals for the world of work and social and political participation in the context of a rapidly changing and dynamic global economy and society.

Develop the necessary understanding, values and skills for sustainable development and an environment that ensures healthy living.

Promote unity in diversity through a flexible framework which allows for the accommodation of cultural, provincial and local differences and needs.

Be learner-centred and non-authoritarian and encourage the active participation of students in the learning process.

Stimulate critical and reflective reasoning and develop problem-solving and information-processing skills.

Foster self-discipline.

Problematize knowledge as provisional and contested (ANC, 1994: 68/9).

THE curriculum will be based on an outcomes approach and will have three basic learning aims:

Application of a skill, both practical and intellectual.

Understanding the principles underpinning an activity.

The ability to transfer both the skill and the knowledge to another context.

MECHANISMS for articulation and equivalence between contexts will be based on statements that link knowledge to skills and understanding to application. Articulation points will be the correspondence between phases in the school context and levels in adult and youth education (ANC, 1994: 99/100).

THE curriculum will be oriented towards individual development (moral, intellectual, aesthetic, psychological); knowledge about work; social participation. The core curriculum will include two or more South African languages; mathematics, science and technology, studies of society, art, music, drama, physical education and life skills. The emphasis will be on developing the

capacity of learners to think independently and creatively, to solve problems and to communicate and apply their knowledge (ANC, 1994: 98). The difficulties of constructing a curriculum which meets all these criteria and is competency-based and outcomes-oriented are not addressed. Assessment and evaluation practices will be diagnostic with the focus on identifying learner problems, as well as monitoring learner progress and teacher effectiveness (ANC, 1994: 70/1).

THERE is agreement amongst most of the policy proposals on the importance of a multilingual approach. The ANC envisages a time when all educational institutions will be implementing multilingual education (ANC, 1994: 61). All South Africans should be given access to, and be expected to learn, at least two South African Languages of which one is an African language (ANC, 1994: 65).

THE report is committed to the introduction of a reception year for five year olds at the beginning of their schooling. There are 6.5 million infants and children between 0 and 6 years old in South Africa - 17 per cent of the total population. About 5.5 million are African - 3 million in urban and metropolitan areas, 2 million in rural homesteads and three quarters of a million on

farms and forest stations. Only 9 per cent have access to private or public educare facilities (ANC, 1994: 93/5).

IN many ways the PFET is a summative document. It constructs an incorporative consensus, continually straddling the previous contradictions and oppositions. It is for democracy and development, equity and efficiency, unity and redress. It provides a vision of an education system which transcends the conflict of the past. The Lord and the Bondsman have entered civil society.

AT the heart of the proposals for governance there lies, in Archer's (1988) terms, a set of values bound by relations of consistency and mutual dependency. The structural and cultural institutions and practices proposed by the PFET attempt to transform apartheid education into people's education by the setting of goals or a vision to which people should aspire. The end of education is featured clearly as a harmonious utopia of agreement. Dewey (1897 and 1939) offered a similar account of education planning as an exercise in liberal pragmatism.

4.11 Six fundamental values

THE six most important common values to have emerged by 1994 were equity, efficiency/effectiveness, democracy, development, redress, and unity/nation-building. There were multiple relations of consistency and contradiction between these values depending on the particular interpretations being placed on them. Equity and development could be interpreted as being in a constraining contradiction. For example, Wolpe (1992) argues that demands for equity will result in an allocation of resources to meet basic needs (general education) away from the tertiary sector causing a decline in our technological competitiveness and economic development with the consequence of a downward spiral with ever fewer resources to allocate. Equity will bring legitimacy and poverty; development will bring an improved quality of life and a lack of legitimacy. On the other hand, for UDUSA, the two values were bound together as concomitant complementarities - they were consistent and dependent. Meeting basic needs will boost both demand and productivity, thus improving economic growth rates and thereby providing the resources for further development.

ONE consistent interpretation of these values as presented in the PFET and the RDP is:

EQUITY: improved distribution of educational resources to disadvantaged communities.

EFFICIENCY/EFFECTIVENESS: efficient delivery and utilization of resources maximizing rates of return on educational investment; achieving the most desired outcome as cost-effectively as possible, given the social and economic goals set by the system.

DEMOCRACY: construction of democratic governance institutions and practices and people's participation in these institutions and practices. Governance institutions and practices should be representative, accountable, and transparent, with substantial freedom of association and institutional autonomy.

DEVELOPMENT: a strategy for economic growth and integration into the world market with quantitative and qualitative economic social and cultural changes.

REDRESS: addressing the legacy of social and structural inequalities through fair and impartial measures of distributive justice with corrective actions being taken in the short term, particularly, with respect to funding.

UNITY/NATION-BUILDING: a single national system of lifelong learning that overcomes discriminatory differences based on race, gender, location, language, ethnicity, religion, disability, and age and which nurtures a common national identity.

THIS interpretation embodies a synthesis between, on the one side, the values of the National Party and its allies and, on the other, the values of the ANC and its allies broadly corresponding to the political synthesis embodied in the GNU. The key systemic characteristics or dispositions of a new national education system, using Archer's terms, based on these values should include:

Democratic governance with maximum decentralization of power to the local level. Planned education system change should take place through political manipulation, internal initiation and external exchange, with the an increasing emphasis on the latter two.

A high level of unification through a national system of certification, financial collection and allocation. The redistribution of revenue from wealthier to poorer areas with subsidies determined according to a democratically constructed formula that takes into account the need for redress of past inequalities. The monitoring and evaluation of performance.

A low level of differentiation so that education will be closely linked to other parts of society, especially the economy, and government and will be embedded in the everyday context of the learner.

A high level of systematization between the different parts of the system, promoting equitable access to educational opportunities, and flexible learning paths and exit points.

A high degree of specialization ensuring that there are diverse ranges of different educational activities catering to the needs of the learners and of the society.

Pedagogy and curricula that promote skills and knowledge appropriate to productive activities in the global marketplace and to participation in the collective governance of the society and which contribute to personal and social development.

Assesment based on outcomes-based criteria.

WITHIN Archer's classificatory schema, these systemic features are a blend of characteristics associated with both centralized and decentralized systems. This could be a virtuous blend of the positive characteristics from the two sides of Archer's dichotomy. The negative features of centralized systems - low specialization and high differentiation - and of decentralized systems - low unification and low systematization - are all replaced by their opposites. It would be most ironic if the extremes negatives of apartheid education could be succeeded by such an ideal system. This affirmation of the negative reflects earlier habits of understanding the ideal education system as the negation of apartheid education. This possibility is counter to Archer's examples. But it is not a counter-example as Archer makes the caveat that education system change in colonial and post-colonial countries will probably be different from her

analysis. The primary reasons for this exception lies in the synthetic and syncretic nature of the policy discourses from 1990 to 1994, and the existing structural characteristics embedded in the system by apartheid which will continue to persist.

IN creating a national education system South Africa has the "structural" potential to meld these features in an innovative way because of the unusual mixture of substitutive and restrictive origins, and she has the "cultural" potential because negotiation has become the dominant form of interaction and education discourses have become syncretic and synthetic. The conflict grounded competitive contradictions of pre-1990 have given way to internally concomitant and externally contingent complementarities.

REALIZING or implementing this vision, achieving the end of education, requires changing the dominant structural characteristics in the existing system. The system will have to move from:

low systematization to high systematization

high differentiation to low differentiation

low specialization to high specialization.

The one characteristic that will remain the same is that of high unification.

THE primary value of using Archer as an illuminative framework is that she helps to provide a clear picture of the situational logic that operates within South African policy discourse. We can "map" this situational logic onto the relations of conflict and cooperation between groups at the socio-cultural level. And when this analysis is linked to the structural characteristics described in chapters two and three it is possible to construct a detailed scenario of the forces of persistence and change within South African education.

4.12 Conclusion

THE primary intentions of the ANC's PFET are to transcend the contradictions of the past and overcome the oppositions that fracture post-apartheid South Africa. Unfortunately, good intentions are not a replacement for coherence and consistency. There are two distinct and plausible interpretations of the governance proposals and value commitments at the heart of the ANC's policy documents. The ambiguity on which the different interpretations are built lies in the form of the state embedded in the education system. The ideal and counterfactual vision presented in the documents requires both centralization of power to achieve high unification and high systematization and decentralization of power to achieve low differentiation and high specialization (Bunting, 1994). Broadly, the tension is between "centralized/administrative" and "decentralized/participatory" models of governance.

CHAPTER five examines this tension by looking at the policy proposals for rural education of the PFET and the RDP. Chapters two, three and four have described the education system from a macro perspective, as a whole. The next three chapters look at

one particular part of the system. That part which has, historically, been most neglected. This change in vantage point is intended to highlight an opposition and a contradiction. An opposition between two social groups: urban people and rural people. A contradiction between the values of development and democracy. The inequalities between white schooling and African schooling are at their sharpest in rural areas. The neglect and marginalization of rural education in the past poses a stark challenge to the capacity of the new education system to deliver on the promises of the PFET and the RDP.

CHAPTER FIVE

Rural Education Policy.

5.1 Introduction

TO assume that the contradictions, oppositions, tensions and conflicts of the past can disappear through an act of collective transcendence or amnesia is naive. The tensions between the different interpretations of values and governance are especially problematic. At the structural or practical level in the distribution of powers and the construction of a new system of governance. At the Cultural System or discursive level in the displacing of contradictions by consistencies.

GOVERNANCE powers are to be distributed between four levels: national, provincial, local (or district) and institutional. The most important powers - finance, certification and norms - are to be shared between the national and provincial governments, with the district, local and institutional levels being responsible for administration and implementation (ANC 1994: 23/27). What is not clear is whether the ANC is proposing to "devolve" power by moving it out of the administrative bureaucracy of the state and into the hands of democratically elected institutional, local and

district committees which would operate largely outside the control of national and provincial government. Or, whether the intention is to "delegate" power by shifting its configuration within the bureaucracy (predominantly, from the national centre to new provincial centres, and to a lesser extent the local and institutional level). Or, to "privatize" power by divesting it into the hands of an enterprise owned and controlled by individuals. Or, even, to "concentrate" power by accumulating it at the national and provincial levels (Rondinelli et al 1983: 13ff). These diverse forms of institutionalized power relations are central to governance. A particular conception and practice of governance will distributed and concentrate power in different ways. Who makes decisions, how are they made and where are they made are key questions that must be answered in any discussion of governance.

THE dominant interpretation of the six values contained in the PFET (1994) emphasizes the consistency and dependency between development and equity and privileges development. It is possible to construct an alternative view which returns to the earlier tension between apartheid and democracy. One consequence of the negotiation process, with its emphasis on elite-pacting, and the policy debates with their emphasis on development, has been a

weakening of the democratic vision and impulse of the 1980s. This is apparent in the system of proportional representation used in the April 1994 elections of national and provincial politicians. Under a system of proportional representation politicians only have a diluted version of accountability to their voters. This weakening of democracy is aggravated by tight constraints on the power of the GNU to effect education system change. The two most important constraints are constitutional guarantees. Firstly, the security of employment given to civil servants employed before April 1994 and, secondly, protection of the powers and functions of governance bodies that existed prior to April 1994 (Interim Constitution, 1994: Page 174, Section 247)

5.2 Development and Democracy

THE two dominant constellations (Adorno, 1973: 162) or interpretations of the core values are divided by their alignment along two axes: one oriented toward development, the other toward democracy. The development discourse favours the delegation of power within a unified system directed by a partnership between the national government, the provincial governments, business, the trade unions, and major civic organizations. Within the constraints provided by development imperatives, the national and

provincial centres will attempt to achieve equity, through an effective and efficient redress of past inequalities and unity through nation-building. The transparency, legitimacy and accountability of the state required by democracy will be weakly articulated in the forums, through the election of provincial and national politicians, and through the courts and the media.

THE democracy discourse would favour an overriding devolution of power to democratically elected bodies at the institutional, local and district levels, with the powers of the provincial and national levels being restricted to the coordination and funding of the education system. Within the constraints provided by the directives emanating from diverse localities, the national and provincial governments would pursue an equitable, efficient and effective development path and promote unity and nation-building.

THE development discourse "maps" onto a large administrative state with power concentrated at the national and provincial centres. The democratic discourse "maps" onto a minimal state with power deconcentrated into multiple points. The development discourse conceives of the state as having a responsibility to meet the basic needs of all its citizens. The means to achieve this lie in a large state within which governance is understood

as administration and power is delegated. The democratic discourse places the responsibility for meeting basic needs on the citizen who bears those needs. The democratic discourse favours the devolution of power to the local and institutional level, thereby creating a minimal state whose primary functions are confined to protection and redress rather than the provision of a panoply of services (Nozick, 1974: 88ff).

THE development discourse is associated with an emphasis on the legitimate authority of the state and weak forms of representative democracy. The democracy discourse is associated with an emphasis on the autonomy of the individual (Wolff, 1970: 3ff). Wolff (1970) demonstrates the contradiction that exists between the concepts of authority and autonomy when they are given mutually exclusive definitions. He first defines authority as "...the right to command, and correlatively, the right to be obeyed", and then, following Kant, he defines autonomy as a combination of freedom and responsibility:

The autonomous man, insofar as he is autonomous, is not subject to the will of another. He may do what another tells him, but not because he has been told to do it. He is, therefore, in the political sense of the word, free (Wolff, 1970: 14).

AN autonomous person will refuse subjection to an authority. An authority will view an autonomous person as an anathema, as someone who refuses to acknowledge her obligation to obey. If we were to assume that autonomy and authority are equally desirable then we would face, in Archer's terms, a situational logic riven by contradiction.

5.3 Development

THE dominant model of education system governance in South Africa, from 1910 to 1994, concentrated power primarily at the provincial and national levels in state ministries of education which were separated from other government departments. There was a powerful hegemonic discourse based on the apartheid ideologies of Fundamental Pedagogics and Christian National Education. The conjunction of a tight set of inequitable and undemocratic values with a strong interventionist state ensured that education policy was implemented by the administrators within the system. The responsibility for education system change was given to the bureaucrats.

IF a development-oriented, power concentrating state emerges then even if significant powers are delegated to the local and

institutional level they will be given to professional civil servants and not democratically elected bodies. This would ensure that the education ministry remains a hierarchical institution, largely autonomous, at all levels, from other government services. As in the past, there will be a strong drift towards centralizing and concentrating power as the bureaucrats look upwards and inwards for authority and accountability. The only significant differences between the past and the future would lie in the increased role of forums, at each of the five levels; in the assertive actions of organized groups of citizens participating in policy formulation; and, in the increased accountability of the government through democratic institutions, such as a universal franchise, regular elections, freedom of speech and association, a bill of rights and a constitutional court. On this scenario, high unification is likely to persist, but systematization, high specialization and low differentiation are unlikely to emerge.

GIVEN the tendency for structural dispositions within a system to persist, it is likely that the existing low levels of systematization, embedded in the different geographically located departments with their different traditions of governance, will continue. The development state, particularly with its emphasis

on policy-making and monitoring forums, implies the dominance of political manipulation as the primary form of education system change and favors the persistence of a large and pervasive state which is given the primary responsibility of delivering the public services which will promote reconstruction and development, thereby meeting the basic needs of the people including the provision of education.

THE development state is similar in form, although not in content, to the social engineering of apartheid education. When the PFET and RDP are placed within the frame provided by the interim constitution, the likelihood of the dominance of a centripetal drift of power is increased. Especially when attempts to bring about a significant change in the existing powers of governance bodies (governing bodies of model C schools, chiefs and tribal authorities, farmers) could be met by litigation in the constitutional court.

THE division of powers between the national and provincial levels in the PFET and RDP resembles the 1910 constitution. In particular, the location of primary responsibility for financing, certification and norms at national level will probably lead to conflict between the national and provincial governments similar

to that which took place between 1910 and 1986. Once again, from the bottom, from the institutional level, the system will appear centralized; but, from the top, from the national level, the system will appear decentralized into nine provincial governments. The most significant change could lie in the shifting of the dominant concentration of power from national to provincial level, at least for the provision of general education through the schooling system. For this to happen there would need to be a clear distribution of revenue collection and allocation powers between the two levels with the major powers going to the provincial level.

ANOTHER source of conflict could be over the distribution of powers between the institutional level and the provincial level. On a development model the district level and the local level are given minimal powers. They are merely administrative arms of the provincial ministry of education. Given the relative autonomy of the provincial and national ministries of education from the other ministries within the government, and that the district and local levels of governance are located in administrative offices of the ministry, not in democratically elected district and local government bodies, there could be conflict between the provincial ministry and the existing governing bodies at an institutional

level (model C committees, chiefs and tribal authorities, farmers). This conflict, however, is unlikely to be sustained. In 1994, institutional governing bodies are not democratically elected by all stakeholders but represent the interests of privileged, minority elites (white parents and farmers, traditional tribal authorities). The provincial ministry, provided it is supported by the national ministry, will be able to overcome any resistance at the institutional level through its control of finance, certification, norms and standards, although its actions may be slowed down by litigation in the constitutional court.

GIVEN a development state, then, the most likely outcome is a vertically integrated ministry of education with governance powers allocated primarily to the provincial and national levels. At all levels the ministry of education will be separated from participatory democratic forms of district and local governance. On this scenario, the primary locus of education system change will be at provincial and national level. Some influence will be exerted by advisory and monitoring forums and by PTAs. The key to planned education system change in the future will be the penetrability of the state at provincial and national level. To whom, then, does the state listen?

THE key structural characteristics desired by a development state are low differentiation and high specialization, which, in Archer's (1979 and 1984) analysis, are characteristics of decentralization and of external exchange and internal initiation. Given the administrative structures and bureaucratic culture of the development state, the achievement of low differentiation and high specialization will happen only if the forums come to exert significant influence at all levels; that is, if political manipulation occurs at all levels, not only at national and provincial levels.

ON a development-oriented interpretation of governance it is possible, although unlikely, that the existing system will move in the direction of the vision espoused in the PFET and RDP. Given its previous record, it is more likely that the existing system with its structural characteristics of high unification, low systematization, high differentiation and low specialization with the primary locus of power at the provincial and national centres and with political manipulation being the dominant form of change, will persist.

IN Archer's (1979 and 1988) terms the development state at the socio-cultural level can be aligned closely with, or "mapped

onto", a particular interpretation of the six values at the Cultural System level. This interpretation has its roots in the policy discourses of NEPI, UDUSA and COSATU. The six values are split into two groups; in the first group, development, efficiency/effectiveness, and unity/nation-building are bound together as concomitant complementarities (they are consistent and mutually dependent). In the second group, democracy, equity and redress are related to each other as concomitant complementarities. The two groups are related as contingent complementarities (they are consistent with each other, but not mutually dependent).

NEPI offered a stronger version of this interpretation arguing for a tension between the two groups: the first group are the ends, the second group are the means, and between the two there is a continuous shifting tension in which the first group should dominate. For NEPI, then, the relation between the two groups is closer to that of a contradiction. A choice has to be made, a position taken, a balance agreed. By prioritizing development, efficiency/effectiveness, and unity/nation-building this development discourse supports a development state as a necessary condition for the achievement of these values. Above all, development is emphasized as being the most important value. The

relegation of democracy and equity to a secondary position is seen as a necessary sacrifice to be made for the sake of economic, social and personal development. There is a "trade-off" between greater efficiency for less equity, and greater development for less democracy (Sachs, 1992: 4)

THIS conjunction of a development discourse and a development state is likely to be the foundation of a new hegemonic discursive formation because of its syncretic value. It has the ability to act as a point of agreement, of unification, as both a rational product of negotiation and the prior assumptions within which negotiation is conducted. The most significant other interpretation of the values, espoused in the ERS, are not in contradiction with this set - their relation is one of contingent complementarity. The emergence of this new hegemony will be supported at the socio-cultural level by the congruence between the governance of a development state and the ERS-type values subscribed to by the existing bureaucratic management.

WITHIN the development discourse it is not possible to bind the six values into a set of concomitant complementarities. On the contrary, the most plausible interpretation is one in which democracy and equity are interpreted as inconsistent with a

strengthening of development and nation-building. The privileging of a development discourse and its association with a development state has been a common feature of Western modernity since the 19th century when:

... the social construction of development was married to a political design: excising from society and culture an autonomous sphere, the economic sphere, and installing it at the centre of politics and ethics. That brutal and violent transformation, first completed in Europe, was always associated with colonial domination in the rest of the world (Esteva, 1992: 17).

I will return to this association of development with Enlightenment ideals of progress, economic modernization and the growth of an administrative state in chapter eight.

5.4 Democracy

THE likely dominance of a development state and discourse does not preclude the possibility of the existence or emergence of different sets of values and concepts of governance nor of people who contest the dominant model of governance and values. However, providing a development interpretation is easier than providing an alternative interpretation. The development model is grounded in the past and present education system structures and

discourses, while an alternative has a stronger counterfactual nature: there are few opportunities for references to indigenous examples.

THE production of alternative structural characteristics - participatory forms of governance with power devolved maximally to the local and institutional levels - and a different discourse with a different set of values emphasizing democracy and equity presupposes a radical change. A negation of the existing system. Once again the pursuit of the ideal becomes an affirmation of the negative. One way of exploring these possibilities is from the perspective of those most likely to benefit least from the development discourse and state. The perspective of those who have historically suffered the most inequitable and undemocratic conditions and have benefited least from development, efficiency/effectiveness, redress, and unity/nation-building - and who are likely to continue to benefit least - is that of the rural poor. It is ironic that the most clearly spelt out version of a participative, democratic and equitable alternative is in those sections of the RDP and PFET which deal with rural education.

5.5 The Reconstruction and Development Programme

EDUCATION policy discourses from 1990 to 1994 paid little attention to education provision for those living in poverty in the rural areas. The ANC was one of the few policy actors to have made specific recommendations on rural education (ANC, 1994: 102/3; RETT, 1994; Parker, 1994b; Deacon and Parker, 1994c). Under these proposals the state must assume full responsibility for, and control of, the provision of education and training in rural communities. This must be done in the context of addressing socio-economic conditions in rural communities through a sustainable development programme. Where possible, schools will operate as CLCs with a range of after-school activities linked to the social, educational, health and recreational needs of the community, and to rural development projects (CEPD, 1994: 12).

THE general policy aims of the ANC for rural education include:

Redressing the legacy of apartheid.

Redressing gender inequalities.

Creating a democratic participative system of education to ensure that education policies match the evolving social and economic needs of the communities.

Confronting the exploitation and the harassment of rural community members.

TO achieve these aims it is assumed that affirmative action is required in the short to medium term, and that the role of the state is critical as the only form of social organization which has the capacity to address the issues of land, finance, governance, and the socio-economic conditions of people living in rural areas. The state guarantees ten years of free and compulsory schooling and an equitable distribution and effective utilization of human and natural resources for rural development with the active participation of rural communities. To ensure this, rural education is considered a special issue within the NETF because the system of governance differs from that in urban areas and the legacy of underprovision suggests that special attention has to be paid to entitlement and redress (CEPD, 1994: 1/2).

IN 1993, there were approximately 11 million people living in poverty in the rural areas of South Africa. Meeting the basic

needs of these people is the first priority of the ANC's Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP):

Attacking poverty and deprivation must... be the first priority of a democratic government... A programme is required that is achievable, sustainable and meets the objectives of freedom and an improved standard of living and quality of life for all South Africans within a peaceful and sustainable society (ANC, 1994: 4).

THE six principles that make up the political and economic philosophy that underlies the whole RDP are an integrated and sustainable programme based on:

A people driven needs based process.

Peace and security for all.

Nation building.

This requires:

The linking of reconstruction and development and the democratization of the society (ANC, 1994: 4/5).

THE concept of development contained in the RDP emphasizes that development is not about the delivery of goods to a passive citizenry. It is about the active involvement and growing empowerment of the people in the process of improving their quality of life. The RDP integrates growth, development, reconstruction and redistribution into a unified programme (ANC, 1994: 4ff).

THE RDP is intended to provide access to jobs, land, housing, employment and modern and effective services like electricity, water, telecommunications, transport, health, education and training (ANC, 1994: 6). Achieving these goals requires the active involvement of people in the formulation and implementation of state policy and action:

... organizations within civil society that participated in the development of the RDP will be encouraged to be active in and responsible for the effective implementation of the RDP (ANC, 1994: 1).

The RDP is not to be a top-down authoritarian process but a bottom-up democratic process. Education and training are seen as central to creating the participation, knowledge and skills which are necessary conditions for reconstruction and development and the building of a democratic society.

THERE are four key programmes that make up the RDP:

Meeting basic needs.

Developing human resources.

Building the economy.

Democratizing the state and society

MEETING basic needs is the responsibility of the state. Jobs, land, housing, water, electricity, telecommunications, transport, a clean and healthy environment, nutrition, health care and social welfare are all listed as basic needs (ANC, 1994: 7). The dominance of a development discourse is apparent in the assumptions of state responsibility and the transparency of needs. The RDP gives only a "thin" description of basic needs, thereby ignoring the possibility of conflict over the interpretation of needs. Fraser (1989) argues there should be a democratic, accountable and transparent process of needs interpretation. By ignoring the difficulties of needs

interpretation the RDP further weakens its democratic credentials. Illich (1992) notes:

... the human phenomenon is no longer defined by what we are, what we face, what we can take, what we dream; nor even by the modern myth that we can produce ourselves out of scarcity; but by the measure of what we lack and, therefore, need. And this measure, determined by systems theory thinking, implies a radically new conception of nature and law, and prescribes a politics more concerned with the provision of professionally defined requirements (needs) than survival, than with personal claims to freedom which would foster autonomous coping (Illich, 1992: 99).

IN 1994, the per capita gross national product was more than 8,500 Rand placing South Africa as an upper middle income country. This disguised the very high degree of inequality reflected in South Africa's Gini coefficient which is one of the highest recorded of any country: 17 million people, out of a population of approximately 40 million, were surviving below the minimal living level (ANC, 1994: 14). The RDP argues that the economy is in a deep structural crisis of which the main characteristics are unequal distribution of income and wealth; regional disparities; exports reliant primarily on unbeneficiated minerals and to a lesser extent agriculture; a stagnating economy with investment dropping and incomes declining (ANC, 1994: 75).

THE dependence on mineral exports and an excessive concentration of economic power in the mining and financial sectors has resulted in a small number of very large conglomerates dominating the production, distribution and financial sectors. Over-production of manufactured goods for the wealthy has produced a manufacturing sector characterized by low wages, low productivity, high costs of imported machinery, and a low level of exports (ANC, 1994: 76). The agricultural sector is in deep trouble, experiencing a serious fiscal crisis, high personal tax rates, and large budget deficits (ANC, 1994: 7.7).

THIS economic scenario implies that the state will have difficulty in fulfilling its responsibility of satisfying basic needs. It is at this point of economic weakness that the RDP turns to the democratic discourse as a way to devolve or transfer the responsibility for development. The RDP requires a dynamic balance between government intervention, the private sector and civil society with transparent, participatory and accountable policy procedures (ANC, 1994: 80/81). In the case of the rural areas:

... to correct the history of underfunding, misuse of resources and corruption... substantial transfers of funds from the central government to the rural areas will be required, targeted to meet the needs of the rural poor (ANC, 1994: 84).

THE objectives of the state's rural development policy will be to coordinate the activities of the relevant democratic government institutions, and to pass much of the control of democratic government-funded services to the rural people for whom they are intended (ANC, 1994: 85). The most effective way of overcoming poverty and meeting basic needs is to enable people to improve their own quality of life by giving them control over their own lives in a context of national economic growth (ANC, 1994: 15).

FUNDS will be controlled by a local government composed of elected councillors. The state, through the district councils, will appoint community development officers to support capacity building promoting the development of human capabilities, abilities, knowledge and know-how (ANC, 1994: 59/85).

A new national human resource development strategy based on the principles of democracy, non-racism, non-sexism, equity and redress will be put in place (ANC, 1994: 60). In order to ensure that:

... the people shall govern... Reconstruction and Development require a population that is empowered through expanded rights, meaningful information and education, and an institutional network fostering representative, participatory and direct democracy (ANC, 1994: 119/120).

THE strategy for achieving this is to ensure the maximum participation of civil society: trade unions, sectoral social movements, NGOs, civics, mass organizations, etc. which as institutions should be accountable, transparent, and democratic (ANC, 1994: 131). To achieve this the structures and functions of government should be modernized to become efficient and effective, responsive, transparent and accountable. Thus, for example, the security forces should be transformed from agents of oppression into servants of the community (ANC, 1994: 120).

THE importance of democratic participation in the defining of needs, planning to meet those needs and delivering the required services is acknowledged by the RDP. There is recognition that for development to happen there must be democratic participation. Meeting basic needs requires a material improvement in the quality of everyday life, particularly for the rural poor. The RDP acknowledges that development delivered by the state, however benevolent, tends to produce a dependency which undermines the productivity essential to economic growth and sustainable development. In Wolff's (1970) terms, on the one hand, productivity and economic growth require autonomy: people who can make decisions and take responsibility. Autonomy requires direct

participatory democracy. On the other hand, development assumes the authority of the state who knows best and takes responsibility for meeting the basic needs of the poor. This authority contradicts or denies autonomy and democracy. Development, like economic growth, requires and rejects democracy.

This impasse is similar to that encountered by people's education at the end of the 1980s. Liberation required education and education required liberation. So too development requires democracy and democracy requires development. The contradiction between democracy and development at the Cultural System level is not a contingent but a necessary contradiction. Democracy and development are mutually implicated. When NEPI (1993) concludes that a choice or "trade-off" must be made between the two, it implies that there is a dichotomy and that it is possible and desirable to affirm one side and negate the other. Affirming either the negative or the positive is to assume that the contradiction can be transcended, the dichotomy dissolved, the opposition overcome. Contingent contradictions can be displaced, but a necessary contradiction is insoluble. Development assumes democracy and vice-versa (Zizek, 1991: 99ff).

5.6 The RDP and rural education policy

IN this section, I am going to offer an interpretation of rural education policy contained in the PFET (1994), RDP (1994) and in the reports of the governance working group of the Rural Education Task Team of the IPET (Lawrence, 1994; Marcus, 1994; Parker, 1994a and b). In order to provide a stark contrast with the development discourse I will construct a democratic perspective of rural education.

THE RDP takes a broad view of education and training, seeing it not only as something that happens in schools or colleges, but in all areas of our society – homes, workplaces, public works programmes, youth programmes and in rural areas (ANC, 1994: 8). Education and training are seen as necessary conditions for social and economic development because they are the most effective means for:

... empowering individuals to actively participate in all aspects of society, as citizens in the democratic process, and in the economy. The latter requires that the education and training system addresses three issues: first, the need for equity and redress; second, the need to continually upgrade skill levels in line with the rapidly changing dynamic nature of the world economy and universal knowledge base; third, to recognize the validity and interdependence of all forms of knowledge and the value of prior learning and

experience by integrating the education and training systems (or general and vocational systems) under a single national credit-based qualification framework... The system will be learner-centred and achievement-led (ANC, 1994: 15).

IN 1994, about 15 million Black adults (over one-third of the population) were illiterate and had little or no education. Less than 1 per cent of the education budget was spent on ABET and provision tended to be small-scale, uncoordinated and lacking any national standards or framework. The eradication of illiteracy was seen as:

... a pre-condition for the full democratization of our society. The elimination of illiteracy must provide adults with the foundation for access to lifelong learning, to enable them to adapt and contribute to the processes of social and economic development in a rapidly changing global order (ANC, 1994: 87).

The ABET division of the national Ministry of Education and Training should be responsible for national curriculum frameworks, including materials development; national qualifications, accreditation and certification structures for learners and educators; financial frameworks; and delivery systems. Provincial, district and local authorities should be responsible for the provision, implementation and delivery of ABE in partnership with employers, the organized labour community,

NGOs, higher education institutions and provincial training centres. State facilities, schools and community centres should be made available for conducting ABET classes. These facilities should, where possible, operate as CLCs with a range of activities relevant to the social, educational, health and recreational needs of the community. The latter will ensure that ABET is linked to broader social and economic development projects. Workers, including farm and domestic workers, will have the right to paid time-off during working hours to attend ABET classes (ANC, 1994: 88/9).

IF we interpret the RDP within a democratic discourse and state, then the new system should be based on a partnership between central and provincial governments, local and district councils, organized labour, employers, non-governmental organizations, parents and students. Central and provincial government will provide overall co-ordination of education financing, and district and local government will have responsibility for its management. A revenue-sharing formula should be sought which guarantees as a minimum, before the need for redress is taken into account, an equal state subsidy to all children for the duration of compulsory schooling and promotes efficiency and fairness in the allocation of public resources to schooling,

whether in departmental, state-aided, or community-managed schools. Subsidies must be tied to explicit indicators of need and linked to appropriate checks on quality and performance. There should be a devolution of responsibility to the level where resources are actually used and can most effectively be managed (ANC, 1994: 40-44).

THE 1993 reports from the Land and Agricultural Policy Commission (LAPC) and the Institute for Local Government (INLOGOV) proposed that a new system of district and local government accommodate central efforts to equalize service provision and access to resources, and mediate local priorities and concerns (LAPC, 1994: 1/7). The existing governance structures in the rural areas of the territories were linked to land tenure relations. In 1994, the dominant forms of land tenure relations included:

Communal land communities governed by hereditary tribal authorities; appointed tribal authorities; appointed chief's councillors.

Rural informal settlements governed by elected community authority; self-appointed warlord; no authority structures.

Commercial farms governed by farm owners and Regional/Joint Services Councils/Boards.

Peri-urban and semi-urban communities governed by civic associations; provincial administrations.

Freehold communities governed by civic associations; hereditary tribal structures; no authority structure.

Labour tenants governed by farm owner; hereditary chieftancy; appointed tribal authority.

Trust land and state land governed by provincial administrations or national departments.

Rural towns governed by municipalities (INLOGOV, 1993: 3).

IN place of these multiple governance relations, a two tier system of government was proposed for rural areas, which recognizes the existing social and economic linkages between the hinterland and urban settlements, and allows for a measure of redistribution at a sub-provincial level. District councils will be large enough to ensure effective representation of rural

interests, undertake efficient service delivery, and have sufficient administrative capacity and financial resources. The primary tier will consist of a diverse range of local authority structures, from large municipalities in the secondary cities to smaller local authorities in peripheral areas and, where these are not feasible, village committees and management boards should be established.

PRIMARY local authorities will have concurrent powers with the district council, and where they are unable to deliver the requisite services these are to be provided by the district council. The following specific functions are proposed for district councils: primary health care; primary and secondary education; bulk and reticulated water supply; district roads; land allocation and zoning; district level planning; promotion of economic development; welfare; waste management; recreation; revenue collection (INLOGOV, 1993: 5).

LOCAL authorities will be constituted on the basis of democratic representation, using a ward based, proportional representation or mixed electoral system according to local preference. District councils should have both direct and indirect representation. Indirect representation will allow traditional tribal authorities

and rural lobbies and advisory groups to represent special interests.

THE reports recommend that traditional tribal authorities, recognized by and instituted in accordance with indigenous law and legislation, should continue to exist and exercise their powers and functions in terms of indigenous law and as regulated by enabling legislation. The traditional leader of a traditional tribal authority within the area of jurisdiction of an elected local government will be an ex-officio member of the local authority and will be eligible to be elected for any office. Traditional tribal meetings shall be called to decide on and deal with customary, traditional and related matters, but public services should be democratic and accountable (INLOGOV, 1993: 8/9).

IN order to overcome the deficiencies of existing provision in rural areas in an efficient and effective manner that ensures democracy and equity it will be necessary to integrate closely the delivery of general, further and adult basic education into a lifelong learning system in which there is sufficient differentiation to be appropriate in different contexts (urban/suburban/farm/rural) and to different people (class,

gender, age, language); an equitable distribution of resources; and, the promoting and sustaining of participatory democratic practices and discourses. The report of the governance working group of the Rural Education and Training Task Team of the IPET report (Parker, 1994c) recommends that this be done at national and provincial levels through a single ministry of education and training and at the local level through CLCs which will be sites of multiple education delivery which are:

Structurally linked to local or district government.

A base for NGOs and Community Based Organization (CBOs).

Owned and controlled by the local or district council and managed by a school board in cooperation with the provincial and national Ministry of Education.

Assisted by district education and development officers.

Responsible for coordination of joint ventures between CBOs and service organizations and for reducing levels of isolation, improving the delivery of services, education programmes and resources thereby improving the quality of classroom teaching.

A site where the organizational capacity of the community is promoted.

AT the national and provincial level the Rural Education Task Team (RETT) report for the IPET proposes the establishment of Rural Redress Councils (RRCs) to ensure that the interests of people living in rural areas are adequately represented (RETT, 1994). Membership of the council should include representatives of relevant ministries, councils, institutes and boards, as well as all divisions within the Ministry of Education and elected representatives of rural CBOs and NGOs. The RRC should have representation on other relevant bodies. The RRC will be responsible for:

The transfer of ownership of land and schools and of governance from farmers, chiefs and tribal authorities to the state and community.

The design and implementation of a revenue-sharing formula which guarantees at least an equal state subsidy to all children for the duration of compulsory schooling and promotes efficiency and fairness in the allocation of public

resources to schooling, whether in departmental, state-aided, or community-managed schools and to further and adult education. In the short term future, community-managed schools in the rural areas and state-aided farm schools and community learning centres should be given additional subsidies as a form of redress for past inequalities.

The representation of rural organizations (local farmer's committees, CBOs and NGOs, education and training committees) either directly or through district and regional associations, at all levels on relevant forums, councils, institutes, boards and committees

Ensuring that an African perspective in relation to land, norms, values and traditions is reflected in the formulation and implementation of curricula through the national and provincial institutes for curriculum development (ANC, 1994: 27; Jacklin, 1994; Parker, 1994b).

CENTRAL to this plan is the appointment of appropriate district and local education and development officers who will play an accessing, coordinating and training role. Institutional staff will be appointed by and be accountable to the school board which

in turn will be accountable to the local council and the provincial Ministry of Education. Apart from the more normal role of CLCs as schools providing for general and further education, they will be the primary sites for ABET and further education. The community learning centre represents a merging of education, training and development. The establishment of CLCs, probably under the initial authority of the district council, would be the most appropriate place to begin the process of building democratic local governance structures.

GIVEN the interwoven nature of political and administrative power under traditional tribal authorities, and the almost total power of white commercial farmers over their workers and schools, the creation of democratic structures of governance for education will both provide experience of democratic processes and actively seek to improve people's capacity to participate in democratic structures. At the same time, the training provided through the CLC will promote the ability of people to engage in small-scale productive or service activities (Parker, 1994a and b).

THE pedagogy and curricula of the CLC will be based on an open learning approach with a strong emphasis on distance education. Open learning describes an approach which seeks to remove all

unnecessary restrictions to learning. Education is not something that occurs only within the walls of a school, or that can be done only by the speaking teacher. It provides structures and conditions which enable learners to learn where, when, what and how they want to. Distance education is structured learning where student and teacher are separated by space and time. It is a way to develop and distribute teaching materials, to link different media and to plan various kinds of support for the learner. It requires that the learning environment be well designed to meet the needs and problems of the learners. Distance education provides the techniques of educational design and provision that make open learning practically possible (SAIDE, 1993; Parker, 1994a and b).

THE success of a lifelong learning system based on open learning, distance education and CLCs in the rural areas will depend on making education a public service with educational planning a part of an holistic approach to development planning that integrates all public services (health, social welfare, agriculture, land, environment, etc.). To achieve this integrated system it will be necessary for there to be close articulation between:

The governance of education and local and district government.

The divisions of the national and provincial ministries of education (general education, further education, higher education, adult basic education and training) and other relevant ministries (health, agriculture, welfare).

The constellation of forums, institutes, Boards, and Councils which surround the Ministry at national and provincial level, and provide a means for stakeholder participation.

UNDERSTANDING education as a public service requires that the governance of education be closely linked to all other governance structures. The structures proposed for, and the distribution of powers between, the national, provincial, district and local levels of government provide the formal means for building a democratic society. Democratic structures at district and local level require structures that can both accommodate central efforts to equalize service provision and access to resources, and mediate local priorities and concerns.

DISTRICT councils, through their education and training committees, will be responsible for:

Ensuring that educational resources within the district (schools, colleges, universities, teachers, text books, equipment, recreational facilities, radio, television, printed media) are appropriately located, distributed equitably and used efficiently and effectively; this includes programmes developed by community organizations, NGOs, education and training committees, etc.

The planning and executing of school and CLC building programmes.

Ensuring that education is integral to development strategies in the district.

LOCAL councils, through their local education and training committees, will be responsible for:

The management and administration of all pre-higher education levels of the education and training system.

Appointment of teachers in cooperation with institutions.

Development of administrative and financial support services.

Development of extra-mural support services including: career guidance, cultural and recreational services.

Distribution and co-ordination of human and material resources to schools and CLCs in the locality within the framework of the national goals of development, equity, efficiency, redress, democracy and nation-building.

AT the institutional level, the new system of governance must take into account the extreme complexity of the existing formal situation and the virtual absence of effective participatory governance in rural schools. The governance structures of all schools and CLCs will include a school board consisting of parents, teachers and students as the elected representatives of the constituent groupings, together with representatives of the wider community served by the school or CLC, including traditional authorities and farmers (Lawrence, 1994; Marcus, 1994; Parker, 1994b).

IN schools on white commercial farms, the learning community will control the CLC. The board will be composed of farm workers, farmers, traders, or any other strata of people resident in commercial farming areas as long as they are involved in the learning centre as learners, teachers, facilitators or parents of students (Marcus, 1994). The principal or director will be an ex officio member of the board.

THE major pitfalls that threaten this vision lie in the areas of integration and participation. It is going to be difficult to integrate:

General schooling and further education on the one hand with ABET and lifelong learning on the other.

The governance of education and training with local and district government.

Local and district government with traditional tribal authorities.

DEVELOPING people's capacity and motivation to participate in democratic structures, in a lifelong learning system, and in reconstruction and development will be a long, slow and difficult process. Although the state is given the primary responsibility for implementation, this "state" is interpreted as being a "participatory democratic" state in which the governing structures will assure sufficient participation by stakeholders to ensure joint responsibility (Parker, 1994a and b).

5.7 Conclusion

TO shift to a participatory democratic form of education system governance would require the dispersion of the existing hierarchic autonomous bureaucracy into institutional, local and district government structures. The balance of power would shift to the district, local and institutional levels; and the powers of the provincial and national ministries would be limited to the coordination, monitoring and evaluation of the system in regard to financing, certification, curricula, teacher training and the management of the higher education sector.

THIS decentralized governance structure would promote internal initiation and external exchange as professional educators and

administrators become accountable to their local communities and as unions and business build on their already considerable involvement in education and training. This in turn would promote low differentiation and high specialization. The displacement of a dominant central locus of power (at the national or provincial level) by dispersed multiple loci of power enables a form of participatory democratic political manipulation.

IN the development state model political manipulation is primarily an activity of elites. In South Africa, the massive inequalities in the distribution of resources promotes the consolidation of elite-pacting as the dominant form of political manipulation. In the participatory democratic model, the multiplicity of local governance structures, and their public nature arising from their location as a public service, promotes mass participation by all stakeholders. The primary functions of the provincial and national government become the redistribution of financial resources and maintaining sufficient unification and systematization within the system to ensure that the education and training system is efficient, effective, and promotes development, redress, unity and nation building.

IN contrast to the hegemonic discourse of development, the democracy discourse emphasizes the six values bound as

concomitant complementarities: they are consistent and mutually dependent. These two interpretations of governance and values represent the interests of different groupings at the socio-cultural level. The development model favors urban-based, development oriented elites capable of pacts and agreements through centralized political manipulation. The democracy model favors the rural poor. Given the dominance of the former interpretation it is likely that the interests of the rural poor and the democracy discourse will both be marginalized. The hegemony of the development discourse will discount and subordinate the values of equity, redress and democracy.

IN chapters two and three I showed how, at a structural level, there has been an ongoing duality in the history of South African education. In the African and white schooling systems; in the direct rule of white citizens and the indirect rule of African subjects; in the contradictions between apartheid and democracy and the opposition between the people and the state. In chapters four and five I showed how two education policy discourses emerged between 1990 and 1994 which reflect these dualities. The development discourse, the discourse of needs, is conjoined with a modern conception of the state as large, interventionist and administrative. The assumptions about governance within the

development discourse have strong similarities to those of apartheid. Both assume that the state has the primary responsibility to organize society and that progress can be socially engineered and administered.

BY contrast the democracy discourse, the discourse of desires, is conjoined to more anarchic conceptions of democracy. Emphasis is placed on the importance of autonomy and direct, participatory forms of governance. Self-governance is better than state-governance. An alternative democratic vision is available in the RDP, but it is likely to be suppressed and marginalized by the development state. If democracy is a necessary condition for development in rural areas, then without it the endeavors of a development state are likely to fail.

Given that the clearest expression of a democracy discourse lies in those areas of the policy documents that deal with rural education, and that the rural poor are the most likely not to benefit from the education system, and that the democracy discourse would appear least appropriate in rural contexts (because of existing governance practices and value commitments), it makes good sense to examine the possibility of education system change in rural areas in more detail. Part three (chapters

six and seven) offers a test case for governance proposals by focusing in chapter six on the general systemic features of rural education in South Africa and then, in chapter seven, by examining a particular case study. The purpose of this excursion into "rural" is on the one hand, to establish to what extent development and democracy policy discourses are likely to benefit the poor in rural areas. On the other hand, the purpose is to ground the analysis of the paradox of governance which takes place in part four in an existing situation. In chapter seven I show how the issue of governance was central to an education project in a remote rural area, and how the project was bedeviled by an impasse similar to that encountered by people's education.

PART THREE**CHAPTER SIX****Rural schooling.****6.1 Introduction**

THE rural areas of South Africa, and particularly of KwaZulu-Natal, are an appropriate place to ground discussions of development and democracy. The concept of development is closely associated with Enlightenment, modernity and the growth of urbanized and industrialized nation states in the West (Esteva, 1992). Initially the idea of development was linked to a sense of progress observed in the history of the nation. Given, perhaps, its most extreme form in Hegel's concept of "Geist", development was linked to the belief that there was a "right" way of managing the social order. Since about 1945, the idea of development has been given substance in comparisons between the economic indicators of income, education, health, welfare, etc. In comparisons between the West and the "rest", the idea of development is primarily about those higher up the ladder provided by the indicators helping those lower down. Diverse theories of development (modernization, underdevelopment,

community-based, and systems theory) attempt to explain what causes the relation of inequality and how it may be overcome. Increasingly development has become a form of planned progress aimed at improving the economic position of the poor. The majority of South Africa's poor live in the rural areas, making them primary targets of development.

DEMOCRACY presupposes the existence of a civil society in which both states and citizens have rights and responsibilities. The history of governance of rural people has been of a "not-civil" variety (Mamdani, 1994). The rural areas are the least democratic parts of South Africa and pose the severest challenge to the construction of a civil society. Part three re-examines the problems of governance raised in parts one and two, but now in a context provided by rural education. In this chapter I provide an overview of schooling in the predominantly white commercial farming areas of South Africa and in the rural areas of the territories. In chapter seven I provide a case study of an NGO based education project in a remote rural area of KwaZulu.

6.2 The rural areas

SOUTH Africa's history of colonialism, internal colonialism and apartheid has produced a myriad of divisions between people marking lines of inequality constructed with racial, class, gender and geographic stereotypes. By 1990, the primary geographic division was between those living in, or near, urban agglomerations and those living in rural areas. This geographic fault line signifies both inequalities and differences based on unequal access to resources and wealth; subjection to different forms of political, judicial, institutional and administrative power; and cultural differences that reflect different mixes of predominantly modern, western urban beliefs and practices and predominantly traditional, African rural beliefs and practices. Lying underneath these differences and inequalities are a common identity constituted within the economic marketplace and the boundaries of the South African nation-state, identities marked by the concepts of owner, worker, citizen and subject.

IN 1980, 46 percent of the population was in the rural areas of the African territories; 7 per cent in the urban areas of the African territories; 20 per cent in the commercial farming areas of white South Africa; 27 per cent in the urban areas of white South Africa (Wilson and Ramphele, 1989: 17).

IN economic terms, the urban/rural distinction corresponds to a enormously unequal gap between the rich and the poor. The richest 20 per cent of the population own 75 per cent of the wealth and the bottom 40 per cent of the population earn only 8 per cent of the income. By 1990, about 15 million people in South Africa were living in poverty of whom about 11 million lived in the rural areas of the African territories. The number of destitute persons in the rural areas - defined as those living in households with no visible means of support from remittances, local jobs, land, cattle, pensions or other transfer payments - was approximately 1.5 million (Wilson and Ramphela, 1989: 17ff). It is estimated that by the year 2000, more than 50 per cent of the African population will still be living in the African territorial areas as defined by the 1913 and 1936 Land Acts and subsequent consolidations (Graaf, 1992: 1).

MAKING an analytical distinction between the two concepts "urban" and "rural" is not meant to imply that there are two separate unrelated worlds, and, in particular, that there are two separate economies. In so far as economic relations and activities in rural areas are different from those predominant in urban areas, this should be understood not as a consequence of separation or

fragmentation, but rather of the adaption of economic relations and activities to specific material conditions within a system of ever increasing concentric circles in which the immediate local economy nestles within a web of interconnected district, provincial, national, regional and global economies. In addition to economic and geographic perspectives on social structures and relations, the concept "rural" should include political, legal, administrative and cultural perspectives.

ANY clarity and stability implied by the dichotomy is destabilized by the intensifying pervasiveness of market-based economic relations within an increasingly global economy and, in the case of South Africa, the contested but dominating hegemony of western political and cultural values, institutions and practices. It is not my intention to reify "rural". Rural people do not live beyond the market, nor do they inhabit the margins of the market, if these metaphors are understood to imply that the presence of market-based economic relations is somehow weaker. Within this analysis rural people are constituted and deconstituted, liberated and oppressed, included and excluded within global and national economic, political and cultural relations.

THE importance of attempting to ground a theoretical/textual analysis in a particular rural perspective lies in the contrapointing of a systemic perspective with the particularity of experience in a locale dominated by the consequences of systemic relations. The particularity of the rural in South Africa arises from two main sources: its geographical location away from urban infrastructure; and, the constitutional, judicial, administrative and political hegemony of a tribal authority system shaped by colonialism and apartheid within which rural people are subjected to chiefs, in a form of political power that Mamdani describes as "Indirect Rule" (Mamdani, 1994). Indirect rule in South Africa, and particularly in KwaZulu-Natal, fuses political, administrative, judicial and executive powers together in the hand and gaze of the chief (Mamdani, 1987: 90). The most important power of the chief is control over the use of the land under the "customary" system of communal land tenure.

THERE are two distinct kinds of schools in rural areas in South Africa: farm schools on predominantly white commercial farms, and community schools in the territories. By 1994, a fairly extensive literature on education for Africans on farms and in peri-urban areas had emerged (Ardington, 1989; Gordon, 1987; Gaganakis and Crewe, 1987; Graaff, 1986, 1987, 1989; Krige, 1989; Nasson, 1988;

Marcus, 1994). A smaller body of literature exists on education in the rural areas of the territories (De Clercq, 1986; Graaff and Lawrence, 1986; Lawrence, 1994 ; Jacklin, 1994; Gordon, 1994; Parker, 1989; Deacon and Parker, 1993a, 1994b,c,d). The Institute of Education, at the University of Bophuthatswana, which produces the journal "Matlhasedi", has played an important role in developing a rural perspective in South African education research.

6.3 Farm schools

THE conditions in farm schools were largely determined by their location on white commercial farms. The 1980s was not an easy decade for white agriculture. Krikler estimates that in 1987 the collective national debt of white farmers was in excess of 14 billion Rand. A foreclosure on farming debt would ruin approximately 25 per cent of the 60,000 white farmers and convert about eighty rural towns and villages into "ghost towns" (Krikler, 1987: 96). The reasons for this parlous situation lay in the historical manipulation of agrarian conditions by the state and in the uneven development of capitalist relations of production in the agrarian sector (Morris, 1987).

FARMERS formed an important element of support for the Nationalist Party up until the 1980s (when most of them deserted to the Conservative Party) and, in return, were the beneficiaries of large subsidies. This allowed unprofitable farmers to continue on the land with the consequence that by 1983, 50 per cent of farmers were responsible for less than 10 per cent of agricultural production. Conversely, the 10 per cent of farmland owned by large scale agribusiness was responsible for 50 per cent of the country's agricultural production. The creation of wage labour through the abolition of labour tenancy, a process which continued into the 1970s, created a two million strong agricultural proletariat (Krikler, 1987: 102, 111). The unprofitability of a large number of the farms, and the nature of production costs in which the majority of items were fixed, lead to attempts to minimize labour costs. This resulted in poor working conditions, low wages, and little interest, or investment, in schooling for farm workers.

UNTIL 1994, governance of farm schools on predominantly white commercial farms was the responsibility of the DET. The DET governed in what may be characterized as a laissez-faire manner leaving provision, ownership and control with the farmer. The farm owner had the power to establish or close a school, appoint

staff and determine access. By 1991, there were 480,000 African students enrolled at 5,728 farm schools. Seventy-one percent of all DET schools were farm schools, although only twenty percent of the enrollment was on farms. This was an indication of the small size, usually one or two classrooms, of most farm schools. Ninety-seven percent of the total enrollment at farm schools was in primary school and seventy-three percent of the total enrollment was in standard 2 or below.

THE DET estimated that 33 per cent of children of school going age did not attend school. However, Ardington (1989) calculated that, in Natal, the figure could have been as high as 56 per cent. Marcus estimated that less than 50 per cent of primary school-going and about 1 per cent of secondary school-going age cohorts were catered for (Ardington, 1989: 45; Marcus, 1994).

IN 1985, in Natal, there were 759 DET schools, of which 664 were in rural areas; 609 of these were farm schools. Thus, 82 per cent of DET schools in Natal were farm schools; only 4.2 per cent of these schools provided any secondary education. In 1985, there were 235,428 African people between the ages of 5 and 15 in Natal and of these, 185,988 (79 per cent) were in the rural areas. 44 per cent of the 5 to 15 age group were attending school in the

rural areas compared to 98 per cent in the urban areas. Only 4 per cent of rural pupils were in secondary school compared to 29 per cent of urban pupils (compared to 42 per cent of white pupils). The consequences of this underprovision were that 43 per cent of Africans in Natal had no education compared to 13 per cent of whites (most of whom would be in the under 5 age group). (Ardington, 1989: 35; Krige, 1989: 181).

BEHIND these statistics lies a grim reality of an extremely poor quality of education in farm schools. There is general agreement on the primary characteristics of farm schooling:

Low levels of funding.

Inefficient and ineffective governance and administration.

A severe shortage of classrooms and teachers.

Overcrowded classrooms.

Underqualified and poorly motivated teachers.

Inappropriate curricula and pedagogy - which promote inequality and inferiority

An extreme scarcity of educational resources.

A context of extreme deprivation in the material conditions of everyday life. These include low wages, poor housing and health, restricted mobility, no electricity and few recreational facilities.

ALL these conditions were, directly or indirectly, related to economic and governance factors. Ardington points out that:

There is no system for the provision of education for blacks in rural areas and what education there is has developed in a haphazard fashion. There is no formula to which the Department might plan for the provision of education in rural areas and there has been no overall plan; no attempt to rationalize the placing of schools or staff according to demands or needs, no concentration on areas where facilities are most urgently required - simply a response to individual initiative (Ardington, 1989: 37).

OVERCROWDED classrooms and the shortage of classroom space arose because schools and classrooms were built only on the initiative of the farmer and, while subsidized, there was no motivation, beyond philanthropy, for the farmer to build classrooms. For the parents and pupils:

At the level of concrete, immediate and familial social experience, investment in farm schooling is not a self evident paying proposition for poor households (Nasson, 1988: 23).

IN her work on farm schools in peri-urban areas, Gordon (1987) found that parents were willing to make major sacrifices for their children's education. In some cases, they spend 50 per cent of household income on schooling. Similarly, pupils were motivated to stay at school seeing education as the key to better employment in the urban areas (Gordon, 1987: 89). The reason for this discrepancy in attitudes probably lay in the different contexts of rural and peri-urban farm schools, with peri-urban students and parents being made more susceptible to the lure of the school's modernizing myths by their proximity to urban areas. The strong migration of people into peri-urban areas was already a mark of their movement away from the traditional political, economic and social relations of rural South Africa towards the modern, but peculiarly South African, economic relations of the market place, the governance relations of civil society and the social relations of urban culture.

IN his analysis of farm schools, Nasson emphasizes the similarities of rural farm schools to institutions like prisons and mental asylums: institutions which are characterized by the

extreme regulation of workers' lives and their complete isolation from independent identities and alternative social visions. Farm workers, and their children, were trapped in a world in which the farm owner had almost absolute coercive and ideological control (Nasson, 1988: 13).

WHILE Graaff disagrees with the emphasis that Nasson puts on the ideological control of the farmer, he does agree with the importance of the material conditions in the explanation of the poor quality of farm schooling:

It is not the farmer's control over the minds and behaviour of his farm workers which is important. It is the many ways in which he and his peers help to construct the environment in which farm children grow up. That means the wages he pays, his labour relations, workers' chances of promotion, their extramural weekend activities etc. These things appear to be more important than the number of children sitting in a classroom, teacher qualifications or the number of textbooks (Graaff, 1989: 13).

THE world of the farm worker and her family is highly work centric and authoritarian:

They are absorbed by and contained in power relations which systematically subsume their needs and wants to the demands and authority of the farmer (Marcus, 1994: 1).

THE ANC policy proposals for education provide a clear plan for the transformation of farm schools from a neglected and impoverished sector into a fully functioning part of a lifelong learning system. At their most optimistic (RETT, 1994), the policies promise significant changes: ownership of the land on which community learning centres will be built should be transferred from the farmer to the local or district council; public access (roads and footpaths) will be guaranteed; children will be entitled to ten years of free and compulsory education, and there will be provision of adult basic education and further education for all people.

IN the early stages, finances will be controlled by the national government. To what extent powers of taxation and distribution will be transferred to the provincial, district and local level is uncertain and, if the past is repeated, will be the subject of conflict and negotiation for a long time to come. Given the strong affirmative action approach embedded in the policy documents, with their strong emphasis on redress for past financial inequalities, and the recommendation concerning the establishment of a Rural Redress Council (RETT, 1994), it is likely that farm schools and community learning centres will be

given equal per capita funding plus some form of extra redress funding.

ACCESS to more funding is a necessary condition for improving the quality of farm schools; it is, however, not sufficient. The capacity to use funding efficiently and effectively, in a democratic and equitable manner, is dependent on forms of governance and administration, of curricula and pedagogy, that are themselves the product of a successful education system. Escaping this catch-22 is the single greatest challenge facing farm schools. How can illiterate and innumerate people with no experience or knowledge of governance and administration, and of democratic organization, begin to exercise control over their own education? The problem is exacerbated by the particularly oppressive power relations that exist on white commercial farms. It is virtually impossible for people who have had almost no space for free action, and little collective experience of it in the last one hundred years, to enter into the kinds of power-relations that characterize the organization of education without already being educated and/or trained in some way.

MARCUS (1994) argues that the starting point must be to develop and encourage the participation of those who are most unfamiliar

with education and with participating in governance structures and least likely to come forward. CLCs should stimulate the process of capital formation, especially human and institutional capital, and become a principle channel through which rural people will be able to establish a meaningful voice within the education sector – and beyond. To achieve this CLCs will need to overcome two obstacles: authoritarian and exclusionary practices which effectively prohibit meaningful participation of all parties, and the absence of resources and supports. Emphasis should be placed on:

Translating existing local survival strategies generated in response to a past hostile environment into development strategies in a new and enabling environment (Marcus, 1994: 5).

THIS requires integrating the delivery of education into the delivery of other public services to farm-dwelling people. The construction of viable local and institutional governance for education, and the achievement of a good quality lifelong system, depends on the creation of the kind of general enabling environment envisaged in the RDP. The existence of schools on farms may provide a suitable starting point for the initiation of the broader process of reconstruction and development; but only if the provision of public services breaks with the tradition of

paternal and authoritarian power relations that have bound farm people into a form of virtual slavery.

CHANGING control of the provision of services from a malevolent to a benevolent authority will not, of itself, alter the paternalism of existing power relations, nor the lack of skills required to make use of increased access to resources. To some extent the improvement in material conditions that should flow from the RDP - better housing, electricity, health, welfare, water, sanitation etc. will have an educational impact of their own; but whether this is sufficient for sustainable improvement in the quality of life will depend on people's capacity to maximize their use of these resources and services and to assume responsibility for the management of their delivery. An important element in the organization of farm people into active organizations will be the intervention of the unions. In 1994, labour legislation was extended to farm workers, including the right to membership of a union. Given their organizational capacity, the COSATU unions should be able to exploit the protection and opportunities contained in the legislation to both improve the material conditions of the workers and provide them with training in, and experience of, collective purposive action.

EVEN under the most favourable circumstances of economic growth and political and social development, it will probably take fifteen to twenty years before efficient local government and an effective lifelong learning system are in place in commercial farming areas. At the heart of rural education, development and reconstruction in South Africa is the question of control of public services. Who controls the delivery of education on commercial farms? Given a significant decrease in the controlling powers of the farmer, where is power relocated and accumulated?

GIVEN the existing system, as well as the dominant trends in both policy discourses and the form of the state, control of CLCs on or near farms is likely to reside in state institutions as part of a national lifelong learning system, with power being concentrated between the national and provincial levels. The provision of education will be financed, directed and administered by state bureaucracies. The role of organizations and associations of workers, parents, students, teachers, and other parties will be restricted to influencing state policy. The possibility of power being devolved to district, local and institutional levels is minimal, unless it is contested by the people living on the farms. The possibility of contestation is dependent on organizing, educating and training people to engage

with the state and to win increasing control over their own lives.

6.4 Community schools in the territories

SIMILAR problems face the other kind of rural school, those schools in the territories, where the situation is further complicated by the existence of a different form of state power in the tribal and territorial authorities. By 1994, schooling in the rural areas of the territories was divided between ten different ministries of education with diverse forms of governance, financing, administration, curricula and pedagogy. In order to provide a sharper detailed picture of rural education in the territories this account is focused on KwaZulu and, in the following chapter, on a particular case study of education in a remote rural area. There are two major reasons for focusing on KwaZulu: in 1990, it was the second largest and most underfunded education department; and, in the elections of April 1994, KwaZulu-Natal was the only province in which the previous territorial government won the election and became the dominant partner in the provincial government. In 1991, the KwaZulu Department of Education and Culture (KDEC) had a student enrollment of 1.6 million in 3,000 schools. Ninety-eight percent of the schools were community schools.

MOULDER (1991: 61ff) shows that the funding gap between education in the homelands and education under the DET is far greater than that between the DET and white education. In 1992, the per student expenditure in KwaZulu was 428 Rand compared to 1,248 Rand per student in the DET. The student to teacher ratio in KwaZulu was 53:1 at primary level, and 42:1 at secondary level compared to a national average in African schooling of 29:1 for primary schooling and 27:1 for secondary schooling.

6.5 Schooling in KwaZulu

KWAZULU was characterized by its fragmentation which was the consequence of the state's attempts to create a homeland based on the population distribution that emerged from the clash between the Zulu kingdom of Shaka, and its subsequent remnants, and the forces of colonialism. Even more than most areas of South Africa, KwaZulu resembled an intricate jigsaw puzzle. From the 1960s, the state engaged in large scale removals in an attempt to relocate the majority of African people in Natal into the geographical confines of KwaZulu. These removals, with their attendant increase in population, put increased pressure on severely strained rural areas already made vulnerable by decades of

exploitation by the industrialized metropolitan economy. From 1960 onwards there was a massive increase in the incidence of rural poverty and other "indicators of social collapse" (Hamilton and Mare, 1987: 30).

ONE response to rural poverty was migration to those boundary areas of KwaZulu which bordered on the urban industrial areas of Natal. In 1989, out of the approximately 5 million inhabitants of KwaZulu nearly 50 per cent were living in squatter settlements in these peri-urban areas. The Durban Functional Region alone accounted for 45 per cent of the total population of KwaZulu-Natal (Diakonia, 1989: 14). The jigsaw geography of KwaZulu-Natal means that most of these people, although semi-urbanized, are still subjected to tribal authority or, in more recent times, warlords who assume the position of "informal chiefs".

IN 1990, the general level of education in KwaZulu was low: fifty percent of the population had less than a standard 7 schooling, nine percent had a standard 8 education and only one percent had more than a standard 10. Of the approximately 1.5 million students enrolled only 300,000 were in secondary schools. Eighty percent of the students were in rural and peri-urban community schools. These schools were built by the communities under the

supervision of chiefs and magistrates out of community funds, or in the case of some informal settlements, under the control of a local warlord. The KDEC undertook to reimburse the community on a Rand for Rand basis. These subsidies, however, were only paid post-facto, if at all. By contrast, schools in the urban areas were paid for by the KDEC. The vast majority of students were in academic-oriented schools. Approximately 3,000 students received technical, agricultural or industrial training. There was virtually no provision of adult education, with only 7,500 students in 120 adult education centres.

There were 25,000 teachers of whom twenty-five percent were fully qualified. In addition there were 6,000 teacher trainees. Out of the 40,728 candidates who wrote the Matriculation Examination in 1990, forty-three percent passed, but only ten percent passed with a university exemption. The speed with which the system was growing is reflected in the fact that in 1982, only 15,000 candidates wrote the matriculation examination.

6.6 The economic context of rural schooling

THE original intention of the territories was to subsidize migrant wage employment by food production in the reserves, enabling the mining and agricultural sectors to pay very low wages:

Slowly but surely, the balance has shifted from a case of rural production subsidizing wages to one where wages subsidize rural production: cattle holdings have shrunk for the vast majority in the countryside and plots, located on overgrazed and leached soils, have become increasingly dwarflike (Saul and Gelb, 1986: 148).

The effects of apartheid on those who continue to live in the rural areas have been debilitating. In their detailed studies of rural life on the Pongola floodplain in Maputaland, Derman and Poultney argue that:

It is the nature of socio-economic costs associated with life in rural areas that makes nonsense of any attempt to distinguish a rural-urban dichotomy. Essentially the study of rural populations in South Africa today is the study of survival strategies against poverty and the variety of socio-cultural expressions formulated around different survival strategies (Derman and Poultney, 1985: 2).

A primary reason for this lies in the economics of production in Maputaland. It takes 74 labour days to prepare a hectare for planting, but a team of oxen and a plough will do the same job in 5 to 10 days depending on the type and the condition of the soil, but only 14 per cent of households in the area have oxen and a plough. To survive under these conditions families deploy their labour power across a variety of activities, thereby minimizing the risks. These activities include fishing, handicrafts, brewing, livestock and migrancy. In agriculturally good years, about 54 per cent of households will have at least one migrant member; during bad years this figure will rise to about 80 per cent (Derman and Poultney, 1988: 4). Derman and Poultney argue that, historically, the relations of consumption have been as important as the relations of production:

They provide unskilled labour to the industries and farms located in the developed sector and at the same time act as a large consumer market for goods supplied from the developed sector (Derman and Poultney, 1987: 14).

There is a similarity here with the unequal relations between advanced industrialized countries and the developing countries. Larrain argues that, in the case of Latin America, these relations are an effect of:

Enormous inequalities in income distribution, not just in relative terms which are also typical of central countries, but in the absolute sense of wide sectors having no income at all. This not only produces the widespread problem of destitution, poverty and starvation but in its turn negatively affects the development of an internal market (Larrain, 1989: 209).

FOR Jameson (1990: 250) these unequal economic, political and cultural relations are loosely bound together by the rapid, world-wide expansion of consumerism, as a new and more global capitalism emerges in the wake of the collapse of Eastern European and Soviet-style socialism, spelling the end of autonomous development in the Third World and transforming erstwhile revolutionaries into consumers of foreign goods or labourers for foreign capital.

IN South Africa, the impoverishment of the rural areas is a negation of the enrichment of the urban areas; not a necessary negation, but a contingent historical one that has bound the rural people into unequal power relations with the centres of capital accumulation (Deacon and Parker 1993a; Derman and Poultney, 1985; 1988). Although approximately 50 per cent of South Africa's population live in the rural areas, until the 1970s the literature on this "other half" tended to characterize

these areas as supplementary adjuncts to the urban industrial centres (de Clerq, 1984: 2). According to Beinart and Bundy:

The reserves have been viewed largely in terms of their functionality to the developing capitalist system, as housing a reserve army of labour, or as exhibiting the scars of underdevelopment and impoverishment (1987: 2).

IN KwaZulu the most important factor which structured the total income of households in all groups was access to wage employment. By contrast, agricultural and small-scale production, including the production of commodities, allowed only a minority of households to increase their income (May, 1987: 11).

6.7 Governance in KwaZulu

THE territory of KwaZulu was the result of a process of political, constitutional and administrative development which emerged as a compromise between the traditional authority structures of the Zulu people and western political institutions. This is clear in the The Natal Code of 1891 which stipulated that the Governor of the colony was deemed to be the "Supreme Chief" of the Zulu people with the power to appoint and remove chiefs (McIntosh, 1990: 28).

THE legislative history which emerged from this interplay includes The Black Affairs Act of 1920; The Black Administration Act of 1927; The Representation of Blacks Act of 1936; The Black Trust and Land Act of 1936; The Black Authorities Act of 1951; Promotion of Black Self-Government Act of 1959 and, in KwaZulu, the Zulu Chiefs and Headmen's Act (8 of 1974). The evolving loci of power within the system, at a local level, were the magistrate and the tribal authority. By 1985, a district magistrate was responsible for administration of law, and acted as an agent for all KwaZulu government departments (DBSA, 1988: 24ff).

THE judicial powers of chiefs and tribal authorities extended to the imposition of fines up to 165 Rand and/or corporal punishment, although these were subject to appeal in the magistrates court (McIntosh, 1990: 30/1). By 1994, a uniform system of tribal, district and territorial authorities was in place which gave recognition to the legislative, administrative and judicial powers of chiefs and tribal authorities over their tribes. Each tribe was a political entity with its own population, land and central authority in the form of the chief and tribal authority (DBSA, 1988: 4). In most areas, only men over the age of eighteen were permitted involvement in the tribal authority (DBSA, 1988: 4/9).

THE KwaZulu government was responsible for the provision of police, education, health, social welfare, roads, public buildings, agriculture and forestry (DBSA, 1988: 23ff). KwaZulu was divided into 24 magisterial districts each with a regional authority composed of the chiefs and representatives from the councillors serving on the tribal authorities. Chiefs were responsible for representing the KwaZulu government in the execution of administrative duties; assisting in the maintenance of law and order; furthering the socio-economic development of their people. Chiefs were assisted by a tribal authority consisting of Indunas (a sub-chief for each area) and councillors, usually elderly males. The tribal authority was responsible for the collection and administration of tribal funds from a variety of sources including taxes, fines, and levies; administering salaries for tribal police, chiefs, Indunas and councillors; the building of schools, roads, dams, the provision of water services and agricultural improvement; and for the administration of customary law. Chiefs and tribal authorities worked closely with district magistrates who acted both as a higher judicial authority and as agents for all KwaZulu government departments (DBSA, 1988: 24ff; Lawrence, 1992: 19/20).

ANY community or independent financial donations were paid to the tribal authority subject to controls by the magistrate. In most areas Indunas and councillors were appointed by the chief while in others councillors were elected by all men over the age of 18 (Lawrence, 1992: 19/20). In regard to schooling, the chief and tribal authority were responsible for the allocation of land, the collection and control of funds (under the weak supervision of the magistrate), and the erection and maintenance of school buildings (Harding, 1992: 25/26).

THE powers of the chief and tribal authority extended beyond control over land, customary law, and public infrastructure to include strong influence over the magistrate in the issuing of trading licenses and permits. Mamdani has pointed to that way under tribal authority structures "... in which administration and politics are fused into one" (1987: 90) with the result that all aspects of people's lives fall under the gaze of the chief. Mamdani (1994) argues that this merging of the different forms of political power (legislative, judicial, executive and administrative) into a single locus, the chief, creates a form of non-civil society, where people are no longer citizens with rights, but are subjects of an authoritarian and patriarchal power controlling them through a panoply of coercive measures.

In contrasting the urban citizens of "direct rule" who have access to the economic and political opportunities and risks of a modern nation state with the rural subjects inhabiting a world in which the state is mediated and focused by the tribal authority into a single all-encompassing web of constraints and coercions, Mamdani has provided an illuminating insight into the nature of the "rural" in South Africa (Mamdani, 1994). The power (simultaneously legal, judicial, executive and administrative) of the tribal authority is manifested and maintained through the control over land and, in varying degrees over labour - during times of violence it is not uncommon for this labour to include fighting the "chief's enemies".

THE conditions of poverty, high rates of migrancy and illiteracy, combine to restrict the strength of nascent opposition. Apart from churches, democratic forms of community organization are weak because traditional tribal gatherings and local kinship networks tend towards authoritarian hierarchical structures. This is aggravated by the absence of any equivalent to urban-based trade unions or civic movements (McIntosh, 1990: 43/4). For people whose everyday lives are marked by a struggle to meet basic needs, and who have had little access to or experience of democratic structures, the possibility of democratic local

government and the development of a civil society seems remote. Under these circumstances, it is not surprising that people express solidarity through identification with a collective tribal identity, although for the most part, they survive as individuals and families through the careful management of risk (Derman and Poultney, 1990: 3).

THE KwaZulu Legislative Assembly, from its inception in 1971, was dominated by Inkatha (which became the Inkatha Freedom Party in 1990) lead by Chief Mangosuthu Buthelezi who also acted as the traditional prime minister of King Zwelithini Goodwill KaBhekuzulu. The power of Inkatha lay in its ability to mesh together a coherent discourse combining an ethnic nationalism centred on Buthelezi and King Goodwill Zwelithini with the hybrid political, judicial, executive and administrative structures of KwaZulu. This discourse drew from the traditions and values still respected by many people in KwaZulu-Natal (Mdluli, 1987: 60).

A clear example of this discourse is found in the prescribed syllabus and textbooks for Ubuntu-Botho, a compulsory subject introduced into the schools by the KwaZulu government. The books contain lengthy descriptions of Inkatha which is characterized as the only true liberation movement; a history of the African

people in South Africa; descriptions of traditional African life and culture which is contrasted with life in urban areas (Mdluli, 1987: 62).

CENTRAL to this discourse is the concept of "Ubuntu" which is understood as a form of universal brotherhood for Africans incorporating the values of sharing with others, and treating and respecting them as human beings. Strong emphasis is placed on the importance of respect for one's elders (Mdluli, 1987: 66). Mdluli points to the ambiguity of the word "isizwe" in Ubuntu-Botho where it refers to both the nation and an ethnic group. Inkatha's manipulation of these values and ambiguities produced a discursive mobilization of Zulu nationalism within an authoritarian patriarchy that centred on the sovereign, his prime minister and his local representatives, the chiefs and tribal authorities (Mdluli, 1987: 66/70).

THESE "traditional" power relations were strengthened in April 1994, prior to the elections, by the Ingonyama Trust Act which transferred ownership of the 13 million hectares of land that comprised the territory of KwaZulu from the KwaZulu Legislative Assembly to the trusteeship of the King. Given the nature of existing communal forms of land tenure, the act did not have any

immediate effect on the everyday lives of rural people. In the longer term, the constitutional basis of the kingdom and its legal ownership of the land may impede the pace and quality of change implied by the RDP in the rural areas of KwaZulu-Natal. This will depend on the way in which the King interprets his fiduciary trust. It is not impossible that a king who acted in a benevolent manner, in the special circumstances of KwaZulu, could make a significant contribution to the RDP. The likelihood of this happening, however, is diminished by the existing bureaucracy. By 1994, the KDEC had achieved a deplorable reputation for inefficiency, ineffectiveness, sexism, corruption and a lack of democracy. The effort to construct unity and nation-building was conceived in narrow ethnic terms. Ubuntu-botho, the Inkatha Youth League and the Inkatha Womens League all contributed to the promotion of a specific "Zulu" identity, at the heart of which was respect for one's elders and, particularly, for the tribal authorities and the king.

IN a useful analysis of ethnicity amongst students in KwaZulu-Natal schools, Wedekind et al (1993) bring together a multiplicity of strands in an attempt to understand ethnicity in relation to traditional and modern culture, citizenship and self-identity, modernity and schooling. On the basis of their survey

of student attitudes and beliefs in the urban townships near Pietermaritzburg, they argue that these students use their traditional Zulu heritage to interpret and mediate the modern world and the construction of their self-identity in a way that combines a "persistence of the tradition" and a "dynamic reinterpretation" of the tradition. There is a disjunction between their commitment to the traditional values and their political affiliation to the ANC (with its modern impulses).

THIS distinction, however, is not clear: how do we distinguish between persistent but dysfunctional traces of tradition and functional modern reinterpretations of tradition? How do modern respect, loyalty and industriousness differ from their traditional forms? In order to explain this double ambivalence between persistence and reinterpretation, between modern and traditional, Wedekind at all use the example of young men, comrades, believing in the power of muti (medicine from a traditional healer) to protect themselves from bullets. This example is misleading because it can not count as modern, that is, as rational and useful action. At best, it is an "emotional" attempt to make sense of a violent confusing present which may lead to the death of the believer. By contrast, the increasing appropriation of the Inyanga's (traditional healer) knowledge of

herbal medicine by the allopathic medical fraternity is an example of a modern (rational and useful) reinterpretation of a traditional practice. The significant role of ancestor worship, the payment of lobola (a bride-price) to the parents and initiation rituals in a Christianity that also encompasses belief in the new testament and membership in the communist party is an indicator of how "modern" tradition can be: binding together contradictory beliefs that promote social and self identities that have proved effective in the struggle for survival.

INKATHA'S interpretation of Ubuntu stands in stark contrast to that of the Black Consciousness movement in which the concept of respect is not reserved for elders but is a right of all human beings:

Ubuntu is a thread which runs through people's relationships with family members, neighbors and strangers. The African proverb, *Umntu ungumntu ngabanye abantu* (A person is a person by means of other people), suggests that one's humanness depends upon recognizing the humanity of others and their recognizing yours. It is not enough to have a non-racial, non-sexist, and non-exploitative society if the importance of individual human beings within that society is not fully considered (Wilson and Ramphela, 1989: 267).

FOR Biko, the "oneness of community" was expressed most explicitly by the easiness of communication between people and

was a valuable part of South Africa's indigenous heritage that needed to be rehabilitated. In the past, the lack of individual land ownership, and the sharing of resources that prevented individual poverty, were characteristics of a more humane society and should become a source of strength in the struggle against oppression (Biko, 1978: 57/60). Despite a number of attempts to create an alliance with Black Consciousness oriented movements (AZAPO, PAC), Inkatha's narrow ethnicity and territorial ambitions prevented a broader alliance emerging.

6.8 One education system for KwaZulu-Natal

BY 1994, the KwaZulu education system was characterized by high unification, low systematization, high differentiation and low specialization. These are, except for low systematization, the features of a centralized system and, when combined with the traditional authoritarian forms of governance, they produced a schooling system in which there was little participation by parents or other stakeholders with an interest in education. As a result, there was very little external exchange. A largely passive student population and a corps of demotivated teachers undermined the possibilities for internal initiation. The absence of any opposition to Inkatha's dominance in the KwaZulu

Legislative Assembly ensured that there was no political manipulation and negotiation taking place at the centre. The only opposition to the KDEC came from predominantly urban-based students and teachers. From 1980 to 1990, urban students, particularly in the townships near Durban and Pietermaritzburg, mounted a sustained resistance campaign against the KDEC and the DET. The students were organized as the Congress of South African Students and, after the banning of COSAS in 1985, the Natal Student Congress. Both were ANC aligned and constituent member organizations of the United Democratic Front and the Mass Democratic Movement.

APART from a small number of urban African teachers associated with the National Education Union of South Africa (NEUSA), there was little organized resistance by teachers to the KDEC in the 1980s. After 1990, when NEUSA became part of the South African Democratic Teachers Union (SADTU), there was a rapid increase in the organization of African teachers in the urban areas of KwaZulu-Natal. Although there was a lack of sustained significant resistance, the KwaZulu government was unable to achieve its own objectives or to construct the kind of hegemony over education which it desired. Some of the factors that explain this include:

The inefficiency of the administration.

The underfunding and lack of material resources.

A majority of uneducated and untrained teachers.

Inappropriate and ineffective curricula and pedagogy.

The paucity of the material conditions surrounding schooling.

The poverty of the students and their families.

The absence of public educational services (radio, television, print media, drama, etc.).

These factors combined to undermine the educational project of the schooling system to such an extent that, in the vast majority of schools, very few educational, or even recreational, activities were taking place.

IN 1994, with the election of the provincial government, the KDEC will be incorporated into the KwaZulu-Natal provincial Ministry

of Education together with the white Natal Education Department, the Indian House of Delegates Department of Education and Culture, the coloured House of Representatives Department of Education and Culture, and the African Department of Education and Training. The KwaZulu schools will comprise about 80 per cent of the new provincial education system. The provincial government, dominated by the Inkatha Freedom Party, has a detailed plan for a new provincial education system on which to base its actions (Shah, 1994).

EFFORTS at combining the administrative and governance powers and functions of the Natal Provincial Administration and the KwaZulu Legislative Assembly began in 1980 with the Buthelezi Commission, and were further developed by the KwaZulu-Natal Indaba in 1986. These efforts were consolidated by the negotiations and coordinated actions that took place in the Joint Executive Authority after its establishment in 1988 and in the Natal Education Board, composed of representatives from the five education departments, parent organizations, teacher organizations and authoritative figures. The membership of the board was drawn almost entirely from apartheid constructed institutions. The teacher organizations represented were racially based organizations with a history of involvement in apartheid

structures. The parent organizations represented the white constituencies, excluding predominantly African parent committees that were aligned to the NECC and ANC.

THE report produced in 1994 (Shah, 1994) by the Natal Education Working Committee, composed of NEB participants but dominated by the representatives from the education departments, provides a comprehensive programme of action indicating the steps to be taken to unite the five existing departments into one ministry. The report provides a management structure for the region, and is committed to the implementation of a uniform system with a common personnel policy and role responsibilities, an equal opportunity admission policy, and similar teacher-pupil ratios, curricula, examinations, auxiliary and administrative services (Shah, 1994: ii). It is the responsibility of the provincial government to provide educational services and this is best done through a bureaucracy made efficient through the delegation of powers to the local level (Shah, 1994: 1-5). A detailed description of the organizational structure of the new provincial departments defines the roles of officials at each level, the line-management functions and the scope of decision making (Shah, 1994: 6-18).

THE recommendations of the report are reminiscent of the ERS; they stress continuity and persistence. This is most apparent in

the areas of curricula and pedagogy where the plan recommends that existing curricula and pedagogy, with a few adjustments, are appropriate and should persist into the future. Administrative unity will be achieved by turning existing head offices into regional offices – allowing the geography of apartheid to exert a significant influence on the administration of future provision. Power is concentrated heavily in the centre, at the provincial level, with the head office located in Ulundi, previously the capital of KwaZulu. This will probably lead to high unification with an emphasis on financing powers allocated to the provincial level (for which it will have to contest the national government), a common set of norms, certification, curricula and pedagogy. The continuing geographical distribution of racially categorized bureaucracies will probably produce a low level of systematization – there will be a lack of coherence with different organizational styles and procedures. Existing model C schools will be allowed to continue as semi-private state-aided schools, even though this will undermine attempts at uniformity (Shah, 1994: 37-40).

THE most glaring omissions in the Shah report are the failure to address training, ABET and further education, and the lack of consideration given to rural schools in KwaZulu. The focus of the

report is fixed firmly on the existing schooling system. The only reference to the establishment of community learning centres is linked to the role that CLCs can play in special education.

Special schools should also function as community education centres in keeping with the new thrust of "community and rural development". Parents of children with special education needs should be guided (Shah, 1994: 80).

THERE is no reference to the powers of chiefs and the legal status of rural schools. The provincial government will become the primary site for decision-making and the administrative apparatus of the ministry the agent of implementation and delivery. Given the lack of internal initiation and external exchange, and the low levels of participation in democratic organization by the majority of parents, students and teachers, the only real challenge to the persistence of the status quo will come from political manipulation and negotiation at the provincial centre. In the short term, resistance will have three major sources: from the ANC opposition in the provincial legislature and cabinet (under the interim constitution, the cabinet must include major opposition parties); from SADTU and COSAS in the urban areas; from the business and NGO sectors and the stakeholder forums that are established to influence the formulation of policy.

6.9 Conclusion

THE prominence of Inkatha, the Ingonyama Trust Act and the constitutionally guaranteed rights of chiefs and tribal authorities pose a stark challenge to the democratic and development intentions of the RDP. The embedding of power in a provincially centralized system with policy, planning and delivery all taking place within provincially controlled structures and institutions which are inefficient and ineffective mitigates against efficiency, effectiveness, development, democracy, equity, and redress. The narrow ethnic interpretation used to identify what it means to be Zulu and – given their massive predominance in the province – African, has the strong potential to continue to be divisive. The failure to deliver, to reduce the levels of inequality and to improve the quality of life, promotes divisiveness and disunity undermining nation-building. In KwaZulu-Natal the price of reconciliation may well be the undermining of reconstruction and development which in turn may lead to the weakening of reconciliation.

THE counter thrust to this scenario lies in the establishment of democratic local government structures as necessary prerequisites

confined to a development state schooling system, then the majority of rural people in KwaZulu are likely to remain excluded from education, the economy and the polity.

IF, under the auspices of the RDP, rural people were able to establish CLCs for further, basic and adult education and training as part of a lifelong learning system, under the control of democratic local government structures, they might be able to build and participate in a lifelong learning system. This would contribute to the realization of a democratic society in which people participate directly in their own governance at the local level and through mandated and accountable representatives at district, provincial and national level. One way of exploring these issues in a more detailed and practical manner is to examine an education project in a remote rural area in which a concerted effort was made to establish a community learning centre.

CHAPTER SEVEN

The Mboza Village Education Project.

7.1 Introduction

THIS chapter explores the tension between development and democracy through a case study of an education project in a remote rural area of Maputaland. Once again, the focus is on governance: on questions of ownership and control. In the previous chapters the focus has been systemic, but this chapter is grounded in a particular experience. I describe the economic environment and the existing provision of education in Maputaland and Mboza. I provide a brief history of the Mboza Village Project and of the Mboza Village Education Project. I conclude by analyzing the tensions between democracy and development which confronted the projects.

THE Mboza Village Education Project attempted to develop a community learning centre over a two year period, 1989 and 1990. Mboza is located on the Pongola river flood plain in Maputaland, an area of some 7,000 square kilometres between the sea to the east, Swaziland to the west, with Mozambique to the north and KwaZulu-Natal to the south (CORD, 1990b: 5). The Zululand Land

Commission of 1904 declared Maputaland to be crown land although the local people were informed only in 1939 (VARA, 1985). The area became state land in 1961, following the declaration of a republic.

IN 1904, the people were effectively declared illegal squatters - despite having lived in the area for over 300 years.

Responsibility for Maputaland was divided between ownership of the land by the Crown/State at national level and administrative control which was exercised at a provincial and district level. A consequence of this duality was a system of double taxation whereby people owed both the normal hut tax and an additional crown land rental tax. By 1939, of the developing urban centres, only Durban and Pietermaritzburg contributed more income tax to state coffers than the local people of Maputaland (Derman and Poultney, 1986: 7; VARA, 1985).

IN return, the people received almost no benefits. By 1990, there were approximately 250,000 people in the area with a widely dispersed family-based homestead settlement pattern, apart from two per cent who lived in six villages. There were 8 males to every 10 females. The regional economy was based primarily on migrant remittances and state benefits (primarily pensions), with

some income from agriculture and tourism services. Farming consisted mostly of smallholding subsistence production, and other economic and/or survival activities include fishing, collection of indigenous plants and foods, palm-wine making, and handicrafts. The infrastructure was minimal with 3 hospitals and 9 clinics, 6 post offices, 1 bitumen surfaced road and 7 gravel roads (VARA, 1985).

Ecologically, Maputaland is rich and has a species diversity of over 3,000 plants and animals - which is far greater than that of the Kruger National Park (CORD, 1990b : 9). There are five zones: the Lebombo mountains, the Pongola Floodplain, the sand forest, the mozi/lala palm belt, and the coastal lakes and dunes (VARA, 1985). The economic profile is one of poverty, despite the wealth of the environment:

The estimated geographic income for the region as a whole was 23 million American dollars, an average household income of 654 American dollars per annum... the distribution of income was uneven with the bottom 50 percent of households earning less than 20 percent of total income giving them an average household income of approximately 250 American dollars per annum... 30 percent of the people have been removed at least once, and if proposed plans for development and conservation go ahead, this figure will double to 60 percent (CORD, 1990b: 7).

7.2 Schooling in Maputaland

GIVEN this economic profile it is not surprising that the levels of schooling are abysmal: 66 per cent have had no schooling, 27 per cent have attended four years of primary schooling and only 7 per cent have had some secondary schooling. Less than 30 per cent are literate.

IN 1990, the total student enrollment in Maputaland was about 42,000 in 166 schools with about 1,000 teachers. The distribution of students across the different phases is in the shape of an inverted funnel because of a high drop-out rate (the figures are approximations):

LOWER PRIMARY	27,000
HIGHER PRIMARY	7,000
JUNIOR SECONDARY	4,000
SENIOR SECONDARY	2,000

Throughout the 1980s the Ubombo circuit achieved excellent matriculation results. The number of candidates more than doubled from 1980 to 1990: from less than 150 to approximately 400. The matriculation pass rate was consistently above 70 percent, and in 1987 was 83 percent. This is remarkably high compared with the urban areas which averaged less than 50 percent. It is partly explained by the small number of candidates and the presence in the area of two residential secondary schools, one a state school and the other a state-aided mission school. Shayina High School and the Star of the Sea High School were better equipped and tended to have a high quality student enrollment, with a significant percentage of students from outside Maputaland as well as the best students from the primary schools in the area. Star of the Sea received considerable funding from the American based Genesis Foundation enabling it to improve facilities and resources. These two schools accounted for nearly thirty per cent of the candidates, often achieving more than a 95 percent pass rate.

THE paucity of educational provision exacerbates its exclusionary nature. In the Ubombo circuit of the Maputaland region there are 166 schools serving a potential school-going population of 160,000, of whom only 42,000 (26 per cent) are at school. There

are 64 pupils for every available classroom, and the teacher to pupil ratio is 1:39. Eighty per cent of the teachers are unqualified or underqualified. Each school serves an area with a radius of approximately ten kilometres, containing a total population of ten thousand of whom about six thousand are of school-going age. There are often up to a hundred students in a classroom sitting three or four to a desk or sitting on the floor (the classroom:pupil ratio is misleading because classrooms are often used for storage or as staff rooms). There are few textbooks or other material resources, no electricity, no water taps, and no telephone. The pupils have to walk as far as ten kilometres merely to attend school.

THE costs of education are high relative to family incomes, and few families can afford to invest in the education of all their children. This leads to difficult decisions as to which children should attend. One consequence of this is the discrimination against women, particularly, in post-primary education. Given that a women will go to live in the homestead of her husband and his family, any income that accrues as a result of her education will not benefit her parents' homestead. There are also a variety of hidden costs in education. Rural life is labour intensive and daily tasks include water collecting, cooking, firewood

collecting, cleaning, mending, childcare, laundry, herding cattle, and field cultivation. In addition there may be various forms of coerced labour required by the tribal authority. School attendance deprives the homestead of labour power. Even for children who do attend school, it is often necessary for them to be absent during the peak agricultural periods which often occur around exam time. Of the approximate 1,000 homesteads in the Mboza district, only 50 per cent send some of their children to school. This, together with the high drop out rate, means that less than 30 per cent of the children complete 3 years of schooling. Less than 15 per cent complete primary school and less than one per cent matriculate. Amongst the adult population less than 20 per cent are literate and less than 8 per cent attended school as far as standard two (Derman and Poultney, 1985).

7.3 Schooling at Mboza

IN 1990 Mboza had two schools: a primary school with 700 pupils and 11 teachers and a secondary school with 200 pupils and 5 teachers. This is the result of a rapid expansion in the number and quality of classrooms from 1985 when there were 450 pupils at the primary school in 7 mud classrooms, with 2 classes under trees. The secondary school went only to Standard Eight with 120 pupils in three classrooms.

DESPITE recent improvements at Mboza, the quality of schooling is still poor. Although few pupils suffer from malnutrition, they have to walk long distances and engage in a variety of homestead duties which tend to leave them enervated in the classroom. The teachers, who are mostly underqualified and struggling to come to grips with their educational responsibilities, have only recently been given accommodation. Prior to 1988, the teachers were accommodated four to a room; now they have one room each, which is still unsatisfactory. Being "outsiders" they are responsible for their own housework, as well as having to do their marking and preparation without the benefits of electricity. The curriculum is urban dominated, filled with concepts that lie outside the experience of the pupils and bearing little relevance to their life chances. Pupil to teacher ratios remain high, and there are few textbooks or other material resources. The medium of instruction is predominantly English, which, for most of the students is a foreign language, rather than a second language.

THESE schools are located within a society wracked by the debilitating effects of unequal power relations which have resulted in massive social dislocation and poverty evidenced in:

... a breakdown in familial relationships (child abandonment, destitute elders, high divorce), early removal from school, high dependency ratios, illiteracy, innumeracy, alcoholism as well as a sense of "community" powerlessness to mount constructive forays against the political and economic forces that dominate their lives (Derman & Poultney, 1988: 2).

Despite the prevalence of poverty, there is considerable differentiation between, and even within, homesteads depending on relative wealth, kinship, education and life experience (Derman and Poultney, 1985: 3; CORD, 1990a: 5). The crucial effect of modern economic relations has been the individualization of poverty which has diminished people's capacity to organize collectively:

In a very real sense the ideological base of descent and kinship relationships in community life has been transformed from moral support to economic dependency and unequal interdependency in the struggle for survival and self-advancement (CORD, 1990a: 1).

TO survive under conditions of poverty, rural families deploy their labour power across a variety of activities, thereby minimizing the risks but also reducing the possibilities for accumulation (of economic, human and social capital). Although a community identity may continue to exist in terms of tribal authority boundaries:

It is as families and individuals that people respond to the socio-economic problems... Rational economic decisions are made in terms of past experience (recent and not so recent), the type of information and misinformation available, the severity of crisis on different economic fronts (eg. drought affecting agriculture, recession affecting unemployment), and the types of dependency and interdependency that exist within the family (Derman and Poultney, 1990: 3).

THE opportunities to engage in productive activities, ranging from fishing and brewing to handicrafts and migrant remittances, and to produce sufficient returns to enter into exchanges in the market, to accumulate capital, or to guarantee the survival of the family, are minimal. Poverty is not about not taking advantage of opportunities; it is about the almost complete absence of any opportunities. Many basic necessities, such as building materials and mealie meal, must be imported from urban areas. Hence, the small amounts of money which flow into Maputaland soon return centripetally to the urban areas through consumer expenditure. While very different from the consumerist culture of the city, the relations of exchange underlying consumerism in Maputaland, both commercial and educational, are inextricably interwoven with those of the urban areas (Deacon & Parker, 1993).

FOR the approximately 1,000 homesteads located in the Mboza area, there is a broad community identity based on the geographical boundaries of the tribal authority and the powers of the chief which provide a central point for the social organization of the dispersed homesteads (Derman and Poultney, 1990: 3). The organizing values and practices within and between homesteads are strongly patriarchal with patrilineal descent, patrilocal residence after marriage, and male headship. Other important aspects of social cohesion are provided by churches, Inyangas (traditional healers), and Sangomas (herbalists).

MBOZA has been unaffected by removals and is located in a rich agricultural environment. Despite this, 90 per cent of households farm for subsistence purposes only (Derman and Poultney, 1988; 2). The primary reason for this lies in the economics of production: the number of labour days required, capital resources (plough, oxen), fertility of soil, availability of water, and climate. The range of choice for agricultural production is constrained by the use-tenure relation a homestead will have to the land. This relation depends on the will of the tribal authority; on the activities of the provincial government; on NGO agencies; and on regional and global economic and political relations (Derman and Poultney, 1986: 12; Wulfsohn, 1990: 6).

THE inhabitants of Maputaland both provide labour for South Africa's urban centres and constitute a consumer market for their products. Rural areas do not have the capacity to generate sufficient capital accumulation to enable the creation of the means of producing even the more primitive consumer goods (doors, windows, tables and chairs). The problems are exacerbated by the high costs of rural life. The long distances create high transport costs and the remoteness enables those who do sell goods to have a virtual monopoly by default. For example a postage stamp costs 50 per cent more than its face value (Derman and Poultney, 1985). It is for these reasons that:

Rural populations respond to opportunity defined within a single economy... and manage their labour and capital resources within the constraints and the types of risks they associate with various income generating activities (Derman and Poultney, 1987;14).

It is within this context that the provision and utilization of education needs to be understood. It is seen as providing economic benefits in the future and as a destabilizing factor in the home that creates unequal interdependency between literate and illiterate, educated and uneducated (Derman and Poultney, 1985: 8; CORD, 1990 B: 6). The desire to become literate and to acquire school certificates is rooted in the knowledge that:

Illiterate people... stand very little chance of being employed even as labourers in South Africa's industrial and manufacturing sector (CORD, 1990a: 5).

WOMEN'S access to education is constrained by patrilocality; but for the daughter who believes there is no future outside of marriage, education holds the promise of a good marriage (Derman and Poultney, 1990: 5). Griesel (1986, 1987), in her study of women literacy learners at Mboza, has shown that they value literacy for its practical and social consequences. The learners saw literacy as providing practical skills such as being able to read labels and prices, write letters and as a means to gain access to better employment opportunities (Griesel, 1986: 4). The social consequences included the need for independence, control, status, bargaining power and feelings of self worth. Griesel identified a strong perception of schooling as being divisive. People who had been to school tend to dominate the whole spectrum of social relationships, from better employment opportunities to dominance in church, social and community affairs (Griesel, 1987).

AMONGST the women there was a strong belief in the need for independence and control over their own lives, and anger and

despair at the patriarchal constraints (Greisel, 1986: 2). The women want progress and a better life, but have no desire to migrate to the cities. Their ideal is to have good jobs at Mboza, nice houses, a car, modern furniture, good roads and stores, piped water, and children going to school (Griesel, 1987: 37/45).

IT is extremely difficult for either social groups or individuals living under unequal and oppressive political, economic and cultural conditions to achieve an improvement in the quality of their lives without some form of intervention from outside the area. The political, administrative, and judicial powers, to which people at Mboza were subject under apartheid, promoted different forms of state controlled development: from usurpation of tenure, to malign neglect; from tsetse fly eradication programmes (which denuded the area of wildlife removing a valuable source of food) to the building of the Pongolapoort dam (which drastically affected agriculture). In each case, development was not defined by the people of Mboza in terms of their needs or expectations. Rather, outsiders, usually as agents of the state, determined development, thus making it a process in which development was done to the people of Mboza by others, for others.

7.4 The Mboza Village Project

THE Mboza Village Education Project (MVEP) began formally in 1989, but its roots lay in a process of community development that began in 1979. The process was initiated by Clive Poultney who undertook field research from 1979 to 1983, both as a post-graduate anthropology student and an HSRC researcher. The field research provided a base for a CBO, the Mboza Village Project (MVP), which was initiated in 1983:

In an attempt to overcome community poverty and to organize resistance to state intentions to relocate the population living on the Pongola river floodplain (CORD, 1990a: 2).

THE project was managed by a democratically-structured development committee elected by the community which had the responsibility for raising funds and implementing programmes:

To widen the range and upgrade the quality of local economic opportunities and to counter the drain of capital, skills, labour and resources to urban areas - principally through skills training, education and production (CORD, 1990a: 3).

AS the project grew, programmes were initiated to address wider regional issues, including flood releases from the Pongolapoort dam - the timing of which is crucial to agricultural production; management of the environment and tourism; the provision of clinics, roads, electricity, water, telephones; and the provision of social welfare. The methodology of development employed by the MVP was one in which economic growth as the panacea to poverty was eschewed in favour of "development from below" which has:

The objective of encouraging community development through maximizing local control and knowledge in the transformation of structural relations of power (CORD, 1990b: 4).

From 1985, the MVP was supported by an NGO, the Centre for Community Organization and Research (CORD), based at the University of Natal, Durban.

CORD had to face two key challenges in its support of community development at Mboza: how to shift ownership and control of the MVP from CORD to a local democratic committee or, in other words, from the NGO to the CBO, and how to avoid exacerbating existing inequalities or creating new ones. The old paradox returns in a new form to haunt us. For people's education it was the choice between pursuing

liberation (democratic governance) or education. For the RDP and for CORD it is the choice between pursuing development or democracy. In Wolff's (1970) terms, it is the contradiction between authority and autonomy: how does one exercise authority and promote autonomy or deliver development and transfer responsibility. In Habermas' (1972a: 214ff) terms, the relation between developer and developed would be similar to the therapeutic relation between psychoanalyst and patient. The dilemma is that the authority has to both assume responsibility for the actions of the other and ensure that the other becomes responsible for her own actions.

CORD assumed that the key to effective NGO driven development lies in the use of creative and innovative methods that encourage a broad base of participation (Oxenham, 1982; Wulfsohn, 1990: 11). The emphasis should be on increasing local self-sufficiency and enhancing local capacities:

Change agents should base their work on the "felt needs" of the community, use democratic methods, and insofar as possible, build changes on cultural precedents. Democracy, equality, and respect for cultural integrity are both means and ends of the Community Development movement (Schwartz, 1981: 313).

THE MVEP could be defined broadly as a critical democratic oriented project in which success is only achieved if the end, a democratic education system, is built into its means. The project was built on a central value, democracy. Dewey provides a useful analysis of the problem of valuation with direct relevance to education at Mboza:

The problem of valuation in general as well as in particular cases concerns things that sustain to one another the relation of means - ends... ends are determinable only on the ground of the means that are involved in bringing them about and... desires and interests must themselves be evaluated as means in their interaction with external or environing conditions. Ends-in-view, as distinct from ends as accomplished results, themselves function as directive means; or, in ordinary language, as plans (Dewey, 1939; 53).

In the case of the MVEP, it was understood that the planning process must be democratic as a necessary, although unfortunately not sufficient, condition for a democratic outcome. Being democratic required both participatory and representative modes. Direct participation, by as many members of the community as possible, in the making of crucial decisions (through public meetings) and the setting of the principles and framework for planning, as well as the form of decision-making and

administrative structures. Representation was through an elected committee responsible for the implementation of the project. All procedures and decisions, particularly financial ones, were to be as transparent and accountable as possible.

THE emphasis on democracy was a recognition of the danger of underestimating the inequalities between people. Without significant change to the structured power relations - the judicial, political, economic, and administrative structures embodied in the ensemble of tribal authorities and state agencies that regulate rural life - community development inputs tend to reinforce existing inequalities (Schwartz, 1981: 318). Local level events are shaped by the distribution of power at higher levels (Schwartz, 1981: 318/319). Although operating within a very small space within the gaze of the chief, the MVEP did elicit significant support, largely from its integration with the broader project of the MVP.

THE MVP adopted an approach that emphasized import substitution through the provision of skills training and the establishment of small production enterprises. It attempted to avoid any involvement in the political and judicial activities of the tribal authority (MVEP: 1987; CORD, 1985: 1). The MVP had the

consent of the local chief and tribal authority, the magistrate, the Regional Tribal Authority, and support from members of the KwaZulu Legislative Assembly. The consent and support arose from the politically non-aligned nature of the project and its concerns with economic issues, rather than political or administrative issues. The first community project, the building of a Community Learning Centre, was completed in 1984 and aroused significant local interest because the state's recognition of the right to occupy the building was the first formal state recognition of the community's right to live at Mboza since 1904.

THE objectives of the MVP were similar to the functions of a local government, but without the political, administrative and financial powers of a local government. The focus of the MVP was on the provision of infrastructure and economic opportunities: clean water, health, support for agriculture and small business (carpentry, sewing, welding, brickmaking, fence-making). The goals or "ends-in-view" are summed up by the motto of the project "Sebenza Ukuze Uthuthuke" - Development Through Work. These activities posed, in the initial stages, no threat to the tribal authorities, nor to the hegemony of Inkatha. On the contrary, the provision of clean water, influence on flood releases from Pongolapoort dam (achieved through a network of water committees

contesting the Department of Water Affairs), and an influx of financial resources and expertise supported the tribal authority and chief. The major political constraints on the project came from the security police and the security forces who were active in the area bordering Mozambique. As the project developed an increasing tension emerged over the role of women and out-of-school youth in the education and training programme, and a contestation arose between the MVEP and the school committee dominated by the local sub-Induna.

7.5 The Mboza Village Education Project

CORD was highly successful in raising funds for the MVP and a number of programmes were initiated providing public services, employment opportunities and education. The MVEP originated in the work of Greisel (1986) with women involved in a literacy group begun under the auspices of the KwaZulu Literacy Bureau in the early 1980s. As the MVP grew, particularly after an infusion of foreign funding in 1986, the need for an education programme became apparent. Through a lengthy process of consultation and organization lasting two years, a funding proposal was produced by CORD and the Mboza Education and Training Committee (ETC). It identified three key areas for action: an improvement in the

quantity and quality of schooling; adult basic education (literacy and numeracy); adult education (matriculation, commercial and organizational skills).

THE ETC was a sub-committee of the Mboza Central Development Committee (CDC). The constitution of the CDC divided the Siphondweni district into ten sections with one representative being elected from each section. The tribal authority had observer status but no voting rights; but it was capable of exercising an effective veto through its political and administrative power.

The project is a separate but complimentary structure to the tribal authority system and vice-versa, particularly in matters of mutual community concern. The project must however retain the right to protect its members from the possibility of corrupt officialdom, such as a tribal authority commandeering the resource and facilities the Project has to offer its members (Minutes, 03/12/88: 3).

FORMAL democratic elections were not held before 1990, but the CDC enjoyed considerable legitimacy and support from community meetings (sometimes with more than 1,500 adults present; about 30 per cent of the local adult population). The ETC was intended to represent the community's interest in education and to ensure that public funds (project monies raised in the name of the

community) were used to benefit the largest possible number of people in the most effective and efficient way. The committee was composed of two teachers from the schools, two literacy trainers employed by the MVP, and a preacher, a sangoma and a farmer elected at a community meeting. Although authority over the spending of money invested the ETC with some power, its actions were constrained by the pervasive presence of the tribal authorities, the security police and the multiple webs of apartheid administration:

It is a continuous struggle on the part of the MVP and CORD to develop a democratic community project, alongside, and in cooperation with, the tribal authority, who support and are supported by the state. The tribal authority is informed and consulted on all decisions and encouraged to become involved (Doria, 1989a).

Although the ETC, and ultimately the CDC, had control and ownership of the project they were heavily dependent on the advice, organizational skills and delivery capacity of the staff of CORD.

AFTER receiving a three year funding grant of 283,000 Rand for the period January 1989 to December 1991 from the Chairman's Fund Educational Trust the project employed two education officers, a

literacy coordinator, and a resource officer (MVEP: 1989b; Minutes 03/10/88). The MVEP was supported by the Media Resource Centre and the Centre for Adult Education at the University of Natal, Durban. This enabled it to develop a resource centre with books, videos, magazines and newspapers which could also provide the infrastructure for workshops, adult education and the administration of the education programme. Workshops for teacher training, creative writing, art, badge and poster-making catered to different constituencies. The MVEP also supported various recreational and sporting activities. It subsidized a soccer team, held discos and showed entertainment videos. In 1989, three education programmes were initiated: a correspondence matriculation programme; a literacy, numeracy and English programme; and a school support programme.

THE MVEP attempted to link education to the various programmes within the MVP: agriculture, aquaculture, horticulture, health care, social welfare, the development of a village infrastructure, and skills training and production units (MVEP, 1987). An attempt was also made to network with other education NGOs but this was largely unsuccessful on account of the logistics of delivering services to a remote rural area. The only sustained active cooperation was with the Career Information

Centre and the South African Council for Higher Education (SACHED). The former developed a mobile resource centre providing careers counselling workshops, materials and videos; and the latter provided materials, tutorial support and workshops for the matriculation correspondence programme (MVEP, 1987; minutes: 30/08/89)

THE school support programme was confined to cooperative use of the resource centre. The schools made extensive use of the resource centre, particularly the educational videos, although this was restricted by dependence on unreliable technology (solar power, generators, video and TV machines). Teachers attended a number of workshops and participated in the matriculation programme. The resource centre owned a spirit duplicator which was used on a daily basis by teachers to produce notes, handouts, examinations, circulars, and report cards. The delivery of support to the schools was hampered by a series of obstacles. Any intervention in the school by the MVEP required the approval of the principal, the school committee (dominated by the tribal authority), the circuit inspector, and the KwaZulu Department of Education and Culture. Permission to work in the schools was only achieved late in 1989. In addition, the MVEP did not have the financial resources or the capacity to provide the kind of staff

and curriculum development necessary for improving schooling. The one major contribution to schooling, made by the CDC, was to provide funding for the building of classrooms. It resulted in a rapid increase in the number and quality of classrooms (Doria, 1989b: 3).

THE matriculation correspondence programme was provided in cooperation with Turret Correspondence College, a part of SACHED. The learners were divided into two groups an "interim group" (28 people) and a matriculation group (24 people), making a total of fifty-two people. Tutorials were provided on three afternoons a week for two weeks of the month, most of the teaching being done by the three members of staff working from the CORD offices in Durban who worked on a cycle of two weeks in Durban followed by two weeks at Mboza. This programme did produce some useful materials, but attendance began to decline in 1990 as the learners became disheartened by the extent and duration of the effort required to achieve matriculation. By the end of 1990, the remaining participants were mostly teachers or people employed by, or associated with, the project (Minutes: 29/04/89; Minutes: 17/05/90).

THE Adult Basic Education programme concentrated on literacy. Four local women were appointed as literacy teachers and were

given training and provided with, and taught to produce, materials through workshops provided by CORD. The teachers met with literacy groups in different locations representing different constituencies. By the end of 1989 the following groups were meeting (CORD, 1989):

Learning Centre group:	70
carpentry group	5
Garment manufacture	20
Building and blockmaking	16
communal garden	30
MVP staff	18
Mobile clinic group	40
Total	199

THE broad perspective that loosely defined the research and practice of the literacy programme emphasized the linkage of content to the economic and environmental realities of everyday life as well as a critical approach to the teaching of literacy promoting the right of learners to speak as equals. The objectives, broadly, were to equip people with language skills, develop their capacity to govern their own lives and enhance their economic potential (MVEP: 1989b).

THE effectiveness of the programme was undermined by irregular attendance caused by transport problems or by time problems arising from homestead duties. In addition, the majority of the learners were women who were often subject to resistance from husbands, parents-in-law and the local Induna (Nkosi, D. 1989). The major barrier to effective learning was not in the provision of materials but in the improvement of the pedagogical skills of the literacy teachers who were used to, and comfortable with, traditional approaches to teaching such as rote-learning.

A critical pedagogy requires an (at least partially) enlightened teacher who has sufficient information and reasoning skills to reveal to the learners both their own indigenous knowledge (previously concealed or misunderstood) and the expert knowledge of the educated. The passage to enlightenment lay in a Socratic or "Freirian" exploration of a theme whereby a process of questioning would be used to move from a particular and easily recognizable local phenomenon to more universal reasons and causes. For example, the absence of young migrant men could be linked to explanations of the South African economy (CORD, 1989; Minutes: 05/07/89; Minutes: 14/07/89; Minutes: 01/09/89).

THE MVEP did provide education services to approximately 500 people a year but this was not cost effective, nor did it meet the objectives of the project. In particular the links between the education programme and other CDC projects was not contributing to the development of active participation by local people in the activities of the MVP. At the beginning of 1990, an attempt to achieve greater integration through concentrating on different aspects of the environment, as a unifying theme throughout the MVP, was initiated. This was linked to agriculture, the economic potential of tourism, health and social welfare. The environment was understood as having a commodity value continually threatened by environmental degradation; a phenomenon new to Mboza as, historically, Mboza people had been good resource managers. As part of education and training an attempt was to be made to utilize traditional indigenous knowledge, skills and practices (Minutes: 13/09/89; Minutes: 26/01/90). Unfortunately this programme was aborted by the closure of the MVP under threat of attack from Inkatha and the tribal authority in the middle of 1990 (Minutes: 08/05/90).

7.6 The demise of the Mboza Village Education Project

TENSIONS between the tribal authority and the MVP centred on ownership and control of the project in a climate exacerbated by the civil war in other parts of the province and national political developments. The tribal authority, under the influence of Inkatha, recognized the MVP as an emerging form of local government, as well as a possible basis for ANC activists. From mid 1989, there was increasing conflict between the MVEP and the school committee and tribal authority. The school committee was dominated by the Induna and the secondary school principal who worked closely with security police. In 1990, the resource centre was raided and material confiscated (Kidson, 1990). Another source of conflict was the increasing number of out of school youth who were becoming involved in the CLC, angering the school committee who felt they should have been in school. A compromise was reached whereby students under the age of 16 had to have the Induna's permission to attend CLC courses. The project found itself in a hostile environment in which the security forces of the state and the local tribal authority combined to force a situation in which either the MVP came under the aegis of the tribal authority or closed down. The latter option was taken at a community meeting (Minutes: 08/05/1990).

ALTHOUGH only formally active for eighteen months, the MVEP built on the foundation laid by a well established democratic community development project and a strong relationship to the expertise and resources of university based intellectuals. Although achieving considerable success for a rural education project in a short period of time, the project had only reached the point of a more accurate assessment of the challenges facing it. The major challenges fell into two broad categories: political and pedagogical. The overwhelming presence of the tribal authority, and a lack of participation and consequently of community control of the project, made the democratic practices of the MVEP weak and problematic. The CORD staff attempted unsuccessfully to shift not only ownership but also control to a democratically elected committee. The pedagogical problems arose in the areas of curricula and pedagogy. The curriculum problem was primarily one of finding suitable material, since what was available assumed an unfamiliar urban context. Rather than impose curricular content on the learners, it was decided to involve the learners in an ongoing joint production process. This had been done once before at Mboza by Griesel (1987). The production process is slow and by mid 1990, only five two-week units of English literacy materials had been produced.

THE more serious problem was that of creating appropriate pedagogical methodologies for the learners, the literacy and tutorial teachers, and the CORD education officers (the trainers). The project adopted a broadly critical discourse as its dominant perspective or vantage point from which to (re)view its practices. This approach met with considerable resistance from learners, who found it time consuming with few overt learning outcomes. A preference for a traditional authoritarian approach was voiced frequently: rote learning provides a simple and effective method of achieving specific outcomes (linguistic and behavioural). Attempts to shift power from teacher to learner were mostly unsuccessful. I will analyze these pedagogic relations in more detail in the next chapter.

AT the heart of both the political and pedagogical problems lies the issue of governance. Although the chief initially adopted an attitude of passivity to the MVP (and the MVEP), as the projects grew with money flowing in and infrastructure being built, the chief became an increasingly active opponent, not to the aims of the project, but to the form of power being accumulated through the project by a constituency seen as urban dominated. The CDC, as an embryonic form of democratic local government, was bound

ultimately to come into conflict with the tribal authority insofar as the two forms of power (democratic and tribal) could not agree and cooperate on a common agenda and competed for control of the MVP. The contestation between the MVP and the tribal authorities had an ironic dimension. In one sense the chief was demanding what the MVP wanted: local control and ownership. For the MVP, however, the issue of democratic governance was so crucial that the project was closed rather than responsibility being transferred to the chief.

FROM a pedagogical perspective, the shifting of power from teacher to learner was problematic. The linkage between political and pedagogical power in the context of Mboza is particularly strong given the control over education exercised by the tribal authority, the exclusion of the majority of the population from education and the dominance of traditional and authoritarian educational practices. Given the dominance of a culture of respect for one's elders and for authority, the pervasive patriarchal and patrilocal practices that subjugate women, the poverty and the absence of educated and trained people from within the community, it is not surprising that education raises issues of social and self governance. The strong desires for western oriented schooling (despite its evident failures),

certification and for English literacy are interwoven with their perceived value as the best avenue of escape from subjection to oppressive and exploitative political, economic and cultural power relations. It is ironic that the escape route should be controlled by the very forces rural people are trying to escape.

7.7 Conclusion

THE post 1994 future of education at Mboza is bleak. Given a development state in which education and training are delivered through a system in which power is delegated within a large, expansive and interventionist bureaucracy, the constitutional protection of the powers of tribal authorities, and the political hegemony of Inkatha in KwaZulu-Natal, particularly in Maputaland, it is likely that the majority of the population at Mboza will continue to be excluded and marginalized by the education system.

THE alternative to the dominance of an arrogant development state and the coercive gaze of the chief lies in the fragile possibility of a democratic education under the control of an elected local government with high levels of participation. The initiation of democratic programmes with their promise of local governance, active participation of the community, lifelong open

learning and an infrastructure based on CLCs and extensive use of radio, television and printed media is possible within the parameters of the RDP. This lifelong learning system would be characterized by high specialization, strong articulation, and low differentiation ensuring a close connection between people's everyday life chances, the local environment and the skills and knowledge embedded in education and training.

It is possible for the discourse of the RDP to emphasize democratic values and governance. The dominance of a development discourse may persist, but its very persistence invokes democracy. Furthermore, the RDP could move beyond a coordinating function to directive control over other ministries: from being a form of super-Quango to being a state within a state. Then, as new post-1994 creations, CLCs and lifelong learning could be funded and supported by the RDP outside the control of tribal authorities. In the example of Mboza, if a revived CDC were to become the local organ of the RDP this would establish a powerful counterpoint to the powers of the tribal authority and the KwaZulu-Natal Department of Education. The primary focus of the provincial and national governments will be on schooling and general education. This leaves open the possibility for a democratic discourse and form of governance in the areas of further education and ABET.

THE current dominance of a development discourse within the RDP diminishes the prospects of this scenario emerging, which is unfortunate as it should be possible, at a relatively low cost, to utilize structures like the MVP and programmes like the MVEP to nurture the planting and growth of a democratic alternative – even if only a partial and tenuous one.

JUST as it would be a mistake to limit development to growth and democracy to enfranchisement and equal rights (ANC 1994b: 120; Mamdani 1987: 93), so too it would be a mistake to believe that democracy is secured once local citizens are participating in governance. Democracy is a process of struggle which is never secure, regardless of the number of formally enshrined rights or the degree of substantial involvement in decision-making. Once again the paradox that haunted people's education returns: to achieve the necessary democratic participation requires the emancipating education of a subjected population; but, the emancipating education of a subjected population requires exercising control over the education structures and institutions. Which comes first education or liberation? What this paradox conceals are the modernist assumptions that education can emancipate, and that democracy requires

educated/emancipated people. From the vantage point of rural people, education and democracy are merely different forms of subjection both of which tend to discriminate against rural people. Education is liberation from one subjection and subjection to another liberation (the new libre/book/language of the nation).

THE emergence of a democratic alternative to the dominant development state schooling system would establish new identities, boundaries and exclusions as the alternative became grounded in organizational structures, practices and discourses. Dwelling on the seductive utopianism of the negative, on the possibilities of change inherent in what is not yet, should not obscure an equally necessary pessimism of the positive, a recognition of what exists and is likely to persist. Even if a lifelong learning system does develop in rural areas and does promote economic development and political democratization, rural people will still be subjected to the inequalities and repressions of late capitalism.

THE key issue to emerge from this case study is that of responsibility or governance. Who owns and controls the project? Given a material environment of poverty and the absence of

economic resources, it is likely that intervention from outside will be required, at least to "kickstart" economic development and political democratization. The "outsider" has to exercise authority. Developers and educators have to plan and direct the project, at least in the initial stages. Earlier, I have argued that at the heart of development lies democracy. A development project can not be successful if it creates dependency. The responsibility for development and democracy has to be transferred. Ownership and control of the project has to move from the NGO to the CBO: from the developer to the developed, from the educator to the educated. Rural people have to be, in some sense, empowered, educated and developed.

IN chapters two and three I focused on the governance and values of the education system and highlighted the existence of two opposing conceptions and practices. In chapters four and five I focused on two contradictory interpretations of the dominant policy discourses: the development interpretation and the democracy interpretation. In chapters six and seven, I applied these interpretations to rural education. Throughout a tension has recurred, albeit in different forms.

GROUNDING in the realities of rural education and development, the MVEP demonstrates the difficulty of achieving either democracy or

development. Difficulties arise because, in the education system of South Africa, democracy and development are in contradiction. The contradiction is historical in the sense that it arises from the particular definitions given to the two terms in South African policy discourses and in the existing forms of governance. At the socio-cultural level, in the world of institutions, projects and social groups, democracy and development are opposing tendencies. Development promotes authority and dependency. Democracy promotes autonomy and freedom. Once the two terms have been defined or interpreted in this way, the contradiction between them is a necessary one. Once a system of governance has been constitutionally set in place and developed, over a period of eighty years, into a large modern administrative state it is likely to have a large capacity for persistence. Not surprisingly, the post-apartheid education system will be one of contradiction and persistence.

THE paradox of democracy and development in South African education requires an innovative strategy. So far, I have provided three vantage points from which to view this system. Each vantage point has focused on the relations of governance: in chapters two and three it is the history of political governance; in chapters four and five it is the policy of political

governance; in chapters six and seven it is the governance of rural education. One consequence of this approach has been a predominance of historical description. Another consequence has been the building of an analytic framework and a detailed context within which to theorize the governance relation of most importance to education: pedagogy.

THE tension that undermined the MVEP was over the governance of the project, and specifically over the question of transference of ownership and control from the outside agency to a democratically elected governing body. But democracy was not there to be found. It had to be developed. The local people required education in democracy. They needed to learn to develop and democratize. In the next chapter I analyze pedagogy as a governance relation.

PART FOUR

CHAPTER EIGHT

Development, democracy, power and education.

8.1 Introduction

IN this chapter, I want to adopt an alternative perspective, to shift vantage points from an examination of the institutional structures of education to an analysis of the pedagogic relation between teacher and learner. The connection between the two vantage points is both practical and discursive. The purpose, point or end of an education system lies in particular encounters between teacher and learner. A system of education requires an institutional structure within which power is defined and distributed in particular ways; but, ultimately, it has to end in an interface between the system and a learner. Teachers and texts are the most common forms of interface: the points at which teaching and learning takes place. The concept of governance is central to both vantage points. The distribution and institutional organization of power is one aspect of governance; the pedagogic power relation between teacher and learner is another, equally important aspect of governance.

THE previous chapters have been predominantly descriptive and analytic in an attempt to show what exists and what is likely to persist in the South African education system. They describe how governance has operated within the system and in discourses about the system. This chapter theorizes the governance relation between teacher and student as a power relation. In much the same way as I have used Archer (1979 and 1988) to provide an analytic and illuminating framework, I now want to appropriate diverse ideas from a range of theorists. I utilize the work of Adorno (1973 and 1979), Habermas (1979, 1983, 1987, 1990), Foucault (1979, 1981, 1984a and b, 1986, 1987, 1989), Laclau (1985 and 1990) and Žižek (1989, 1990, 1991) to frame my own theorizing. Once again, my aim is not to critique their work but to borrow some of their insights to ram home the point that education is a necessarily paradoxical project, riven by tension, conflict and contradiction. I argue that, instead of bemoaning our fate, we should exploit the uncertainty and contingency of our situation to construct a democratic educational project.

I begin by analyzing the relation between power and pedagogy showing how the two are mutually implicated. This leads to the identification and analysis of three discourses that dominate

theory about and the practice of education in South Africa. These three discourses share a common set of values, beliefs and practices that have their roots in the Enlightenment and the development of modern western education. Enlightenment tradition has been dominated by particular conceptions of the subject, knowledge, and power which have masked and excluded their opposites, thereby concealing their own contingency and instability. Finally, I argue that modern western education contains contradictory and paradoxical tendencies. These tendencies provide a starting point for a conceptualization of education as subjection and refusal which may be of benefit to rural education.

8.2 Power and Pedagogy

EFFECTIVE governance of the education system requires both the institutional structures by means of which power is distributed through the system and the dominance of a discursive formation which legitimates the distribution of power and underpins the organizational culture of the system. I have argued there is a contradiction that runs through existing policy positions which forces making a choice between a development state orientated and a democratic orientated state education system. In the

development driven system, power is concentrated at a central node (provincial or national). Any power that is dispersed is delegated to administrative agents. The modes of delivery are administratively controlled and the organizational culture is bureaucratic.

IN the democratic driven system, power is devolved, modes of delivery are locally controlled by communities and the organizational culture is participative and democratic. The different organizational cultures are exemplified by MacGregor's distinction between two theories of management, X and Y (MacGregor, 1964). In theory X, management is responsible for organizing the elements of productive enterprise - money, materials, equipment, people - in the interest of economic ends. Peoples' actions are motivated, controlled and directed by management, whose intentions are to fit the actions of their employees to the needs of the organization. Central to this theory is the belief that without this active intervention by management, people would be passive - even resistant - to organizational needs. They must therefore be persuaded, rewarded, and punished. Decision-making is centralized and minimal power is delegated. Theory X is premised on a view of human nature as individualistic, indolent and selfish with little commitment to the "public good" (McGregor, 1964: 422).

MACGREGOR sees theory X as counterproductive; producing, as an unintended consequence, the very culture and practices that it condemns. Using Maslow's hierarchy, he argues for a view of human beings with two powerful ego needs: self-esteem and reputation (McGregor, 1964: 425/6). To achieve a culture which satisfies these needs and thereby promotes efficient and effective practices, he advocates theory Y. People are not by nature passive or resistant to organizational needs. Their motivation, the potential for development, the capacity for assuming responsibility, the readiness to direct behaviour towards organizational goals are all present in people. The essential task of management is to arrange organizational conditions and methods of operation so that people can achieve their goals by directing their own efforts toward organizational objectives. This is best achieved through decentralization, devolution, and enlarged job descriptions that provide space for individual initiative, participation and consultative management (McGregor, 1964: 429).

THEORY X dominates the existing education bureaucracy, and its fit with the form of the development state fosters its continuance as the dominant organizational culture. The

administrative bureaucratic development state is clearly dominant in policy discourses and existing institutions in 1994, but this is less a result of reasoned argument and planning than an example of no choice being made as policy makers and planners succumb to the persistence of what exists. The contradiction over the form of the state is concealed by the prevalent focus on administration and a lack of theoretical interest by policy-makers and planners. This is both strange and explicable: strange because the issue of governance (people's education for people's power) was so dominant in the 1980s; explicable because the policy imperative from 1990 onwards was the imminent need to manage the existing state within global economic and political relations of intense inequality and competitiveness.

SIMULTANEOUSLY, in the policy discourses about education the development or equity dichotomy has displaced the democracy or apartheid (people or state) dichotomy. Reflected as early as 1991 in the NEPI Principles and Framework Committee documents (Gordhan and Parker, 1992; Perry, 1992), the move from democracy or apartheid to development or equity as the privileged icon in education discourse marks the emerging dominance of what, in the 1980s, was characterized as the "liberal" perspective within people's education. A perspective associated with a focus on inequality as the primary problem (Muller, 1987).

FROM inequality to the satisfaction of basic needs, to the priority of development, to the necessity of efficient and effective integration in the world economy, is a rational progression. This is why it has considerable persuasive force within the forums of policy and planning. The force of reason is, in this case, deceptive; it conceals what is happening to power in the con(in)stitutional arrangements of the new state. By focusing on development and equity, or equitable economic growth, and creating a debate about the best balance between the two poles of a (means-end) continuum, problems about the form and distribution of power and governance are occluded. The problems posed by equitable development refer to the why and the what, but avoid the who and the how. In Archer's (1979) language, the conflict of the 1980s combined two oppositions: between the people and the state at the Socio-Cultural level, and between democracy and apartheid at the Cultural System or discursive level. These two oppositions produced a powerful counter-hegemonic social movement. By 1994, the opposition and contradiction have not been sublated or transcended, nor have they disappeared, but rather, they have been displaced and obscured.

AT the moment a number of factors conspire and combine to shape the education system: the dominance of the development state and the equity or development discourse; the absence of an alternative social movement and discourse promoting the democratic ideals of people's education; the existence of a large education bureaucracy; and the "structural history" of South African education. Because of these forces and factors it is likely that the dominant characteristics of the South African education system will persist for at least ten to fifteen years. The major pressure for change will come from those most versed in the development discourse and the intricacies of economic growth: business and labour (Muller, 1993).

THE emphasis within the National Training Board policy proposals, and within COSATU's vision of lifelong learning, is on basic generic education and training followed by flexible but specialized training. Mobility, motivation, efficiency and effectiveness will be secured by a single qualifications authority that assures equivalency between competency and outcome based assessment throughout the system. In Archer's (1979) terminology this vision is committed to a system characterized by low differentiation, high specialization, high unification and high systematization; but it is undermined by the predominance of

the existing schooling systems, with minimal provision of ABET and workplace-based training. The massive expenditure on the schooling system, at least 70 per cent of which is spent on salaries, entrenches the position of the bureaucracy and teachers. The radical changes to the education system presupposed by business and labour are beyond the comprehension and competency of most administrators and teachers (Müller, 1993: 70).

THIS may lead to increasing conflict between "educators" and "trainers", particularly over the allocation of scarce resources. One consequence may well be a growing rift between SADTU and other COSATU unions, as the former seeks to defend its interests by becoming "professionalized". This conflict could lead to an increase in internal initiation and external exchange, as business, unions and education professionals move their attention away from schools towards workplace based training, with ABET and further education being provided through CLCs. If the RDP were to support this movement vigorously it would be possible for a contradiction to emerge between an education system based in the schools and providing 10 years of free and compulsory education to all children, and a training system based in the workplace and CLCs providing training, adult basic education and further

education. These two sub-systems would be bound together within a single lifelong learning system with strong unification at the national centre over finances, norms and standards, qualifications, core curricula, and pedagogy.

WHETHER successful or unsuccessful, the consequences of a development state education system for those living in the rural areas of the territories, particularly in KwaZulu-Natal, under the "indirect rule" of tribal authorities, are grim. Rural people will continue to be excluded from and by the schooling system. The only glimmer of hope for rural people lies in the discourse emerging around the concept of lifelong learning and in the possibility of the RDP emerging as an embryonic democratic-oriented "meta-state" within the development-state rather than being a super-QUANGO parasitic on the development-state. Given the constraints placed on the GNU by the interim constitution, particularly the guarantees given to civil servants, existing governance bodies and traditional tribal authorities, and the immensity and complexity of the organizational structure of the education bureaucracy, the RDP is more likely to become the latter, particularly in KwaZulu-Natal.

THE unity and cohesion of the modernizing South African society and education system would be threatened if a huge and

predominantly rural section of the population was allowed to remain under the coercive power of traditional tribal authorities, and were simultaneously excluded from full participation in modern economic and political relations. The democratic alternative implies that education as lifelong learning delivered through a democratic state can be a means of "liberating" rural people from their political and economic subjection, that it can "empower" and "emancipate" them. It assumes that education is a public good necessary to the progressive development of society.

I have accepted this assumption as a necessary aspect of a perspective that focuses on the governance of education, of the distribution of decision-making power within the organization of education. This perspective of the politics of pedagogy has highlighted a set of useful explanatory dichotomies:

centralized	-	decentralized
delegated	-	devolved
democracy	-	development
citizen	-	subject
urban	-	rural

THESE binary oppositions, however, conceal the interdependence between the two poles and they obscure the process of education as it occurs in the interaction between teacher and learner. This point can be usefully clarified with the help of MacGregor's theory X and theory Y. Given the dominance of development and theory X discourses and practices, the possibility of a more democratic alternative path requires the advocacy of a discourse and organizational practice that are simultaneously dependent on and in contradiction to the dominant formation. Y/democracy is dependent on X/development because the latter is what exists; to deny its presence is to begin with a false assumption and all that entails. Equally, X/development is dependent on Y/democracy insofar as the autonomy associated with successful development requires a democratic environment. In an attempt to grasp the elusive nature of this relation, it is time to turn around and look not at the "governance of education" but, rather, at "education as governance": the political as pedagogy. This alternative perspective is focused on "power" as it occurs in the relation between teacher and learner:

To say that teachers and students are in a structural relationship is only to say that there are people called teachers and students who characteristically do the things that the relationship involves, who characteristically exercise those powers distributed by their roles (Isaac, 1987: 81).

WE can understand the exercise of power within the institution based system of education as being both governance - "to structure the possible field of action of others" (Foucault 1982: 220-221) - and the agency or personal power of the subject who accepts, exercises, resists or refuses power (Morriss, 1987: 35; Lukes, 1974: 54; Giddens, 1982: 35/8; Giddens, 1977: 347; Deacon and Parker, 1994a). Action and structure, governance and agency are mediated by institutions:

Conceived as specific constellations of social relations and material resources. Institutions are characterized by a variety of schemata which define the parameters of permissible action. Such schemata are transmitted through trial and error, initiation and concerted inculcation, enabling the agent to negotiate the routine and novel circumstances of everyday life. Schemata become inscribed in the desires, inclinations, attitudes and beliefs of the subject, constituting that sphere of values... at the roots of voluntary action. Not only is action circumscribed by structure through the medium of social institutions, but structure is reproduced by action through the process of schematic

centralized	-	decentralized
delegated	-	devolved
democracy	-	development
citizen	-	subject
urban	-	rural

THESE binary oppositions, however, conceal the interdependence between the two poles and they obscure the process of education as it occurs in the interaction between teacher and learner. This point can be usefully clarified with the help of MacGregor's theory X and theory Y. Given the dominance of development and theory X discourses and practices, the possibility of a more democratic alternative path requires the advocacy of a discourse and organizational practice that are simultaneously dependent on and in contradiction to the dominant formation. Y/democracy is dependent on X/development because the latter is what exists; to deny its presence is to begin with a false assumption and all that entails. Equally, X/development is dependent on Y/democracy. X

THIS
^

alternative perspective is focused on "power" as it occurs in the relation between teacher and learner:

To say that teachers and students are in a structural relationship is only to say that there are people called teachers and students who characteristically do the things that the relationship involves, who characteristically exercise those powers distributed by their roles (Isaac, 1987: 81).

WE can understand the exercise of power within the institution based system of education as being both governance - "to structure the possible field of action of others" (Foucault 1982: 220-221) - and the agency or personal power of the subject who accepts, exercises, resists or refuses power (Morriss, 1987: 35; Lukes, 1974: 54; Giddens, 1982: 35/8; Giddens, 1977: 347; Deacon and Parker, 1994a). Action and structure, governance and agency are mediated by institutions:

Conceived as specific constellations of social relations and material resources. Institutions are characterized by a variety of schemata which define the parameters of permissible action. Such schemata are transmitted through trial and error, initiation and concerted inculcation, enabling the agent to negotiate the routine and novel circumstances of everyday life. Schemata become inscribed in the desires, inclinations, attitudes and beliefs of the subject, constituting that sphere of values... at the roots of voluntary action. Not only is action circumscribed by structure through the medium of social institutions, but structure is reproduced by action through the process of schematic

generation; and yet action may also replace a particular structure, in which case social structuration of institutions gives way to the active transformation of social structure (Thompson, 1981: 174-175).

WE can approach the concept of power within the institution of schooling through an examination of the discourses within which education is conceptualized and practiced (Jameson, 1991: 326). An educational institution, Foucault suggests, is a discipline (or "a block of capacity-communication-power") in which pre-eminence is given to language:

The activity which ensures apprenticeship and the acquisition of aptitudes or types of behavior is developed there by means of a whole ensemble of regulated communications (lessons, questions and answers, orders, exhortations, coded signs of obedience, differentiation marks of the 'value' of each person and of the levels of knowledge) and by the means of a whole series of power processes (enclosure, surveillance, reward and punishment, the pyramidal hierarchy) (Foucault, 1982: 218-219).

FOUCAULT conceives of communication, particularly communication within institutions, as an objectification of power: to educate requires subjecting teachers and learners to techniques and technologies of surveillance, examination and evaluation (by teachers, administrators, parents and peers), which constitute them as subjects within hierarchies of unequal relations of power

based on class, race, gender, location, and "academic" performance (Foucault, 1981: 120-127, Deacon, 1994).

WITHIN education, power is interlocked with knowledge and truth through:

The production, accumulation, circulation and functioning of a discourse... We are subjected to the production of truth through power and we cannot exercise power except through the production of truth (Foucault, 1986: 229-230).

THE convoluted interweaving of truth and power to which we are subjected is present in those discourses through which we authorize, and are authorized by, a codification of knowledge which simultaneously qualifies one speaker and one knowledge as true and disqualifies other knowledges and other speakers as false (Foucault, 1987, 205; Muller & Cloete, 1986, 19). The exercise of power through the production of truth occurs in the use of codes or rules which allow one to distinguish between true and false statements, accord value to certain techniques, and enhance the status of those who know the codes and say what is true (Foucault, 1989: 58; Ellsworth, 1989, 316; Muller and Taylor, 1993: 5 and 6):

Many (although by no means all) rules which pupils in a modern education system are taught to master are themselves keys to mastery over various facets of the world they inhabit. Often such rules can appropriately be thought of as points of entry into communities of various kinds, so that access to some or other power-begetting technique becomes equivalent to gaining entry into a community (Holiday, 1993: 176).

UNDERSTANDING communication as discourse does not imply "...the creation through discourse of an object that does not exist" (Foucault, 1989: 296). Rather:

The fact that every object is constituted as an object of discourse has nothing to do with whether there is a world external to thought, or with the realism/idealism opposition. An earthquake or the falling of a brick is an event that certainly exists, in the sense that it occurs here and now, independently of my will. But whether their specificity as objects is constructed in terms of 'natural phenomena' or 'expressions of the wrath of God', depends upon the structuring of a discursive field (Laclau and Mouffe, 1985: 108).

A discourse is:

A way of talking about or representing something. It produces knowledge that shapes perceptions and practices (Hall, 1992: 319).

DISCOURSES do have material consequences insofar as they become embedded in practices within an education system. A dominant

discourse becomes a "discursive formation", a blending of governance and values and of institutional structure and organizational culture, which articulates the conceptualization and the provision of education (Laclau and Mouffe, 1985: 109-114). In Archer's terms, a discursive formation "bridges" the Cultural System level and the Socio-Cultural level. To focus on discourse, then, is not to deny the importance of distinguishing between discourse and the reality described by the discourse, but rather to examine the way in which communication, as a necessary feature of education, is interwoven with power (Miller, 1990: 119).

8.3 Three discourses

IT is possible to distinguish between three discourses that dominate both the practice and the theorizing about the practice of education in South Africa (Deacon and Parker, 1991; 1993; 1994a,b,d). The "traditional discourse" is that of the authoritarian pedagogue, instrumentally transmitting knowledge to passive recipients. This discourse, which permeates the South African schooling system and teacher training institutions, constitutes the teacher (or text) as the fount of knowledge and authority, and the role of the learner is to submit to the

prescriptions of the educators. The knowledge imparted by the teacher is certain and true because it is prescribed by higher authority - in the case of Fundamental Pedagogics ultimately by God - hence it requires little reflection and no critique (Parker, 1981: 25). Social inequalities are considered to be natural and desirable, and order and stability are seen as essential for the preservation of cultural traditions and values.

IN the classroom this discourse translates into practices characterized by autocratic and often technical instruction, the uncritical rote-learning of restricted content, the provision of few, if any, alternatives, and corporal punishment. Teachers' language in the classroom takes the form of commands and prescriptions, and the prevalent conception of language itself is of a neutral and effective instrument of communication. Aside from training (with about eighty per cent of teachers being subjected to Fundamental Pedagogics), strong pressures impel teachers toward tradition. In overcrowded classrooms with few resources, where the medium of education is often a foreign language, it offers a coherent survival strategy and a sense of security. By constituting pupils as unquestioning and passive subjects, it prevents the exposure of teachers' inadequacies.

THE "vanguard discourse", like the traditional discourse, also constitutes the teacher (or text) as the legitimate purveyor of knowledge and enforcer of rules, though the learner is allowed greater autonomy. This is partly because this discourse is generally critical of, and favours the leveling of, political and economic hierarchies in society, and partly because knowledge requires scientific validation. The teachers' authority, and the legitimacy of their knowledge, is premised on their access to the techniques of science and to objective truth. The desire for equality which lies at the heart of vanguard discourses is tempered by the necessity of achieving the end by means of the "best scientific method". Having been subjected to the discipline inherent in the rites of education, the vanguard teacher has earned the authority to lead the learner out of the cave of ignorance. The achievement of self-governance by a teacher, marked by public examination, entitles the teacher to govern others.

WITHIN vanguard discourse, traditional classroom practices are not usually problematized. The chief difference between traditional and vanguard discourses lies in the relation of the teacher to knowledge and not in the relation of teacher to learner. The problematization of knowledge and authority, the

undermining of religious traditions by the secular construction of the good, enhances reflection and active discussion, creating a space for the voice of the learner, and reconstituting learners as potential agents. In South Africa, the vanguard discourse is exemplified in the student struggles against apartheid education, in the people's education movement and in the trade unions, but until now it has lacked the institutional base and sufficient resources to pose a serious challenge to the traditional discourse. Within the discourses of NEPI, which uneasily combined liberal and socialist versions of vanguardism, the privileging of equality over democracy reflected a broader amalgamation of socialist and liberal forces within the emerging Government of National Unity.

THE "critical discourse" (Freire, 1972; 1985), confined to a few universities and the projects of various NGOs (where critical and vanguard discourses have tended to cohabit uneasily), has had a negligible impact upon educational practices in South Africa (Walker, 1990). Yet its institutional location coupled with its affinities to the ideals of the vanguard discourse make it extremely influential at the policy-making level. Of the three discourses, critical discourse is most acutely aware of the different identities of and asymmetries of power between teacher (or text) and learner (Carr and Kemmis, 1986; Grundy, 1987):

Critical social scientific research, including emancipatory action research, views education as a historical and ideological process. Its form of reasoning is practical (like that of interpretive research) but also critical: it is shaped by the emancipatory intent to transform educational organizations and practices to achieve rationality and social justice. It is predisposed towards ideology-critique: the recognition and negation of educational ideologies which serve the interests of specific groups at the expense of others and which mark oppression and domination with the appearance of liberation (Kemmis, 1988: 48).

SHYING away from what it perceives as the instrumentalism inherent in the traditional and vanguard approaches, critical discourse seeks to attain its ends by building them into its classroom and teaching practices (Aronowitz and Giroux, 1986; Walkerdine, 1988). Knowledge is no longer conceptualized as guaranteed or scientific but as mutually and democratically constructed; and learner self-understandings are deemed to be as important as teacher knowledge. Critical discourse believes that the expansion in the realm of students' voice, reflection, agency and control over the process of education reduces teacher/learner inequalities and empowers learners to speak and act for themselves.

THE ideal relationship between teacher and learner is reconceptualized as an egalitarian, reflective and empowering

collaboration. The learner's increasing control, or self-governance, is understood as a form of self-discipline which comes from understanding the rules of the educational activity. The implementation of critical discourse, however, has been impeded by the predominance of the traditional approach, peer pressure, inexperience, deprived material conditions and lack of resources, time and syllabus constraints, student expectations, and the lack of recognition or reward for the extra work entailed (Deacon and Parker, 1991).

8.4 Modern Western education

ALL three discourses share common assumptions and origins arising from their location in a broader modern western discourse, a discourse of orthodoxy. This orthodoxy is part of the dynamic cluster of cultural and structural developments, associated with modernity: the Enlightenment tradition of secular, materialist, rationalist and individualist thought; the formal separation of the "private" and the "public"; the emergence of a world system of nation-states; an expansionist capitalist industrialist economic order based on private property and differentiation; urbanization; and the growth of large-scale administrative and bureaucratic systems of social organization and regulation (Hall,

Held & McLennan, 1992: 3). The values of the Enlightenment embodied in the concepts of reason, liberty, equality and justice provided an optimistic utopian foundation for modernity (Hall & Geiben, 1992: 36ff). The optimism of the Enlightenment has been increasingly tarnished, however, during the course of the twentieth century, by world wars, totalitarianism, mass poverty and environmental destruction. The problem is not simply that modernity has a dark side, lamentable but avoidable; rather, the very scientific advances and productive successes of modernity are inextricably entangled with its domination and devastation of natural and social formations (Adorno, 1973: 320).

ADORNO shows how the "total" society of Nazi Germany, far from being exceptional or anomalous, was grounded upon the instrumental reason of modernity. It had a strongly centralized administrative and bureaucratic state, powerful military and surveillance systems, and the technology to manipulate mass culture. National socialism constituted and privileged one subject or nation, the Aryan, through the construction, identification and exclusion, or extermination, of others, the Jew or the communist (Adorno, 1979: 202):

What does Hitler do in *Mein Kampf* to explain to the Germans the misfortunes of the epoch, economic crisis, social disintegration, moral "decadence", and so on? He constructs a new terrifying subject, a unique cause of Evil who "pulls the strings"... the simple evocation of the "Jewish plot" explains everything (Zizek, 1991: 17).

The identity of the Aryan as a superior positive being is premised on its difference from the "other", conceived of as an inferior and negative being, the opposite of the good Aryan.

THE comprehensive and far-reaching social engineering that took place under apartheid is a similar testament to the (ir)rationalizing capacities of modernity. The attempt to construct a pure Afrikaner identity in a context of racial capitalism gave rise to a large, centralized administrative state which excluded and exploited the majority of the population and prohibited or controlled everything from access to jobs through place of residence to social and sexual miscegenation. In the process it crystallized or harnessed forces at work in the global context and applied them on a narrower but no less devastating scale. For Amin: "South Africa is a kind of microcosm of the world capitalist system" (1993: 10). The effects of modernity on South Africa have produced a country with an urban core that is well advanced and a rural periphery that is amongst the worst in

the Third World. An area like Maputaland stands in a similar relation to a metropole like Johannesburg as the Third World stands to the First World, resulting in enormous inequalities, social dislocation, poverty and destitution (Larrain 1989: 209). The impoverishment of the rural areas is a historical negation of urban enrichment, binding rural people into unequal power relations with the centres of capital accumulation and governance. These inequalities are as apparent in education as in most other fields.

THE emergence of a modern administrative development state under the auspices of the GNU is coterminous with the consolidation of a developing market regulated economy and society characterized by high differentiation in the spheres of economy, family, civil and political society, culture and religion (Long, 1977: 10). Both are signs of South Africa's modernization (Moore, 1963; Smelser, 1963; Curle, 1963):

"Modernization" refers to a societal condition where economic growth and an efficient state administration define the path of the society's progress... this means the only future which can be conceived... is a future of (more) economic growth and (more) efficient state administration. Science and technology are to be utilized to ensure the increasing adaptation of both the economy and the state administration to the demands of an efficiently functioning system (Rohm, 1989: 180).

THE progressive teleology that underlies modernization promotes a conception of development as a hierarchical series of steps or stages. Beeby's application of modernization theory to education exemplifies the relation between rationality and progress underlying orthodox discourses (Beeby, 1966; 1981):

There are certain stages of growth through which all school systems must pass: although a system may be helped to speed up its progress, it cannot leapfrog a stage or major portion of a stage because its position on the scale of development is determined by two factors, the level of general education of the teachers, and the amount of training they have received (Beeby, 1966: 69).

BEEBY argues that the key change agent within the education system is the teacher: the interface between the system and the learner (Beeby, 1981: 14). Beeby does not question the role of the speaking teacher as the primary provider, instead arguing that the quality of the teacher is the dominant determinant in the implementation of changes to administration, pedagogy and curricula. The quality of a schooling system and its teachers can be measured by a four stage progression:

Dame school: untrained and uneducated teachers work in a disorganized system within the confines of a curriculum composed of relatively meaningless symbols and narrow subject content. There are very low standards and a strong emphasis on rote-learning.

Formalism: trained and uneducated teachers work within a highly organized system with rigid curricula and pedagogy. There is a strong emphasis on inspection and examination. Tight discipline and rote learning continue to dominate the process and there is little emphasis on the meaning of symbols.

Transition: better educated and trained teachers work with similar goals to formalism, but this stage places a stronger emphasis on efficiency. Pedagogy, curricula and administration are less restrictive, but the intersubjective construction of meaning is still constrained by the dominance of authority.

Meaning: well-educated and well-trained teachers work within a system stressing meaning and understanding in a wider curriculum, with a variety of curricula and pedagogies.

Individual autonomy on the part of teachers and learners is encouraged with an emphasis on activity methods, problem-solving and creativity; internal tests; the emotional and aesthetic dimensions of life, as well as the intellectual; closer relations with the community (Beeby, 1966: 48-68).

OUR three orthodox discourses resonate with Beeby's typology: dame school and formalism are associated with traditional discourse; transition with vanguard discourse; and meaning with critical discourse. The necessity of hierarchical progress through the stages implies that critical discourses are unlikely to be successful in dame schools and that critical discourses are the most sophisticated form of modern western schooling. Although useful as a technique for organizational change, Beeby's theory assumes the validity of orthodox discourse thereby concealing alternative possibilities of change.

FOR Beeby, progressive change lies in improving the quality of education and the quantity of product (educated and trained students) by increasingly efficient means. The responsibility for regulating change is accorded to the state and its administrators. At the heart of Beeby's theory lies a commitment to the universalizing rationality of modernity, a vantage point

which reveals the path to progress and conceals its power infested construction. Beeby accepts the orthodox assumption that schooling is necessary. A general education is a basic human right to which everyone is entitled. And when it is made compulsory, children are forced to exercise their right. Becoming educated is a social duty to increase the exchange value of the collective human resources of the society. Following the leader and keeping your eyes on the path avoids the look of those excluded from the path. For Beeby, development and efficiency precede democracy and equity. So too, in South Africa, under the dominance of a modernization imperative imposed by a globalizing modernity, schooling becomes dominated by a development state, the dominance of orthodox discourses, and a regulated and differentiated market economy and society.

THE relations of power and knowledge that operate through the three orthodox discourses and the institutions of schooling (administrative structures, subjects, texts, pedagogy, and curricula) reflect and reproduce broader patterns of privilege and inequality, inclusion and exclusion (Deacon and Parker, 1993; 1994a). Orthodox discourses subscribe, in a greater or lesser degree, to a rationalist belief in the teacher as the centre or origin of authority on account of her privileged access to reason

and truth. Within the critical discourse this takes the form of an emphasis upon the identification and equal consideration of all viewpoints within a classroom understood as a democratic "public sphere". The mutual construction of truth as governed by the rules of reason becomes a mechanism which regulates conflict and the power to speak. It constitutes participants as equal subjects (thereby concealing the inequalities between them) and simultaneously disciplines them and obliges them to speak under the coercive gaze of reason (Ellsworth 1989: 300-302; Deacon and Parker: 1994a; Deacon, 1994).

ORTHODOX discourses conceive of reality in terms of fixed and essential essences and identities. The traditional discourse goes furthest in treating the relations between identities as natural or ordained and therefore as immutable or worthy of preservation. Their commitment to determinate standards of truth empowers each discourse to distinguish between justifiable and unjustifiable educational goals and methods and to silence or marginalize those practices which fail to conform (Deacon and Parker, 1994a). The persistence of traditional, vanguard and critical discourses of education in South Africa today can be explained in terms of their institutional preponderance (the traditional discourse), their political affiliations (the vanguard discourse) and their

intellectual influence (the critical discourse). The primary reason for their persistence and coexistence, however, is the fact that their real differences can be and are contained by a fundamental similarity: their supremely modernist conceptions of power, knowledge, language and the subject.

ORTHODOX discourses ultimately fail to problematize the identities of and relationships between teachers, learners, knowledge and power. Traditional approaches to education perceive the unequal relationship between teacher and learner to be natural and desirable; the vanguard discourse justifies it scientifically or normatively; and critical discourse conceals it by claiming to have transcended it (Deacon and Parker, 1993). In particular, critical discourse cannot overcome the contradiction inherent in a teacher 'making' learners autonomous without controlling them (Ellsworth 1989: 308). Orthodox discourses efface the supremely modern processes in which subjects are constituted as vehicles for the production of power through knowledge and knowledge through power (Deacon and Parker, 1994).

CENTRAL to orthodox discourses of education, and particularly to critical pedagogy, is belief in the validity and soundness of their basic epistemological and ontological commitments. Whether

knowledge is dictated by authority, discovered by scientific reason, or constructed through rational communication, it is assumed to be universal - showing the traces of a normative transcendentalism that has its roots in those masters of modernity: Kant and Hegel. For Habermas (1990), whose theories provide the most comprehensive account of the philosophical perspective that lies behind critical discourse:

Ultimately, there is only one criterion by which beliefs can be judged valid, and that is that they are based on agreement reached by argumentation. This means that everything whose validity is at all disputable rests on shaky foundations (Habermas, 1990: 14).

WITHIN critical pedagogy, knowledge becomes grounded in the relation between teacher and learner, governed by a normative commitment to understanding and agreement. Knowledge is understood not as the product of a cartesian consciousness, of a pure autonomous cognition that, by following certain methods, produces clear ideas; rather it is a form of intersubjective action oriented towards understanding and agreement based on an assumption of community and communication (Fay, 1987). At the heart of this "discourse ethics" is the belief in the "unforced force" of a reason that is "always already" present as the only alternative to more coercive forms of power:

Rules of discourse are not mere conventions; rather, they are inescapable presuppositions... Every agreement, whether produced for the first time or reaffirmed, is based on (controvertible) grounds or reasons. Grounds have a special property: they force us into yes or no positions. Thus, built into the structure of action oriented towards reaching understanding is an element of unconditionality. And it is this unconditional element that makes the validity that we claim for our views different from the mere de facto acceptance of habitual practices (Habermas, 1990: 71 and 19).

The difficulty for Habermas is that his theory can work only if:

We must assume as already given, what, on his own account does not yet exist but is supposed to come into existence as the result of the theory: namely a world in which power and control are equalized (Lakomski, 1988: 58).

IT is not that Habermas is unaware of this difficulty for his theory but, rather, that he feels it necessary to accept the normative universalizability inherent in rationality as the preferred alternative to committing a "performative contradiction" (McCarthy, 1976: 486ff). Habermas (1987) accuses Foucault of committing a performative contradiction insofar as he both engages in the exercise of rational argument and argues that such an exercise is infused by power in a way that undermines rational argument (Habermas, 1987: 276-282). Contra Habermas, I

want to argue that to insist on a choice between binary opposites, between rationality and relativism, is to succumb to the allure of a logic of identity and difference that provides the conceptual foundation of modernist projects. In an attempt to avoid the choice identified by Habermas, I want to elaborate on the insights of Foucault to illuminate the possibility of an alternative choice. What I shall call the refusal.

THE conceptions of knowledge, language and power, which underpin orthodox discourses, have been critiqued by Foucault, for whom, knowledge is best conceived of as discourses composed of:

Practices that systematically form the objects of which they speak... they do not identify objects, they constitute them and in the practice of doing so conceal their own invention (Foucault, 1972: 49).

A theory of knowledge and communicative action - premised on a concept of truth as a power-undistorted representation of and intervention in reality - is replaced by a conception of truth as power-saturated:

Truth isn't outside power, or lacking in power... truth isn't the reward of free spirits, the child of protracted solitude, nor the privilege of those who have succeeded in liberating themselves. Truth is a thing of this world: it is produced only by virtue of multiple forms of constraint. And it induces regular effects of power (Foucault, 1984b: 72-73).

THE 'multiple forms of constraint', the structural, cultural and personal matrices of risk and opportunity referred to here are similar to the rites of initiation embodied in the confession and the examination (Deacon, 1994; Deacon and Parker, 1994a). The confession, "the formidable injunction to tell what one is" (Foucault, 1981: 60), produces truth by the ordeal of relating it. The confession itself "produces intrinsic modifications in the person who articulates it" (Foucault, 1981: 62). The simultaneous production of truth and disciplining of the subject which emerges from the relation between confessor and penitent petitioner resembles closely the pedagogic power relation between teacher and learner (Foucault, 1981: 67-8).

8.5 Education, identity and governance

AS mass state schooling spread with the growth of urbanization and industrialization over the last one hundred years, the classroom encounter between the teacher and the learner has become increasingly restricted. Many of these restrictions have their origin in the way in which examination has evolved into the central activity of the schooling system, reflecting a shifting of education from the private realm into the public. As the process of secret confession became one of public certification, so too the form of domination became more overt. In the modern classroom – unlike the catholic confessional in which the veiling of faces maintains the privacy of participants – teacher and learner come face to face, each exposed to the look of the other. The increasing openness of examination does not make education more democratic; rather the emphasis is shifted from self-governance (either as the autonomous child of reason or the subject of a god-oriented conscience) to social governance where dominance becomes embedded in the structural and cultural constitution of the classroom, the subjects, pedagogy and curricula. The examination permits particular features of the observed individual to be reported, classified, assessed, evaluated and utilized. The scrutiny of the examiner produces

truth and disciplines subjects by authenticating an acquisition of knowledge and eliciting from the learner an acknowledgement of her own subjection to the desires of the educators (Foucault 1977: 185). All this with a minimum of direct coercion:

He who is subjected to a field of visibility, and who knows it, assumes responsibility for the constraints of power; he makes them play spontaneously upon himself; he inscribes in himself the power relation in which he simultaneously plays both roles; he becomes the principle of his own subjection (Foucault, 1977: 202-3).

NEITHER confession nor examination can function without (re)producing a special category of subject to act as confessor and examiner. In modernity this role is assumed by the educator (Deacon, 1994; Deacon and Parker, 1994a). The development of mass schooling in the wake of the Enlightenment paralleled the consolidation of power by the educators and their establishment as an elite (Deacon, 1994). Their elitism is based on their mastery of the three tools of the intellectual trade, whose origins can be traced back to the appearance of the first shamans and priests in ancient societies: ordeal (asceticism and hard work), taboo and purification (objectivity and institutional isolation), and possession (the dedicated and professional pursuit of the truth) (Deacon, 1994). These three rites

instantiate and explain the separation of the intellectual from the layman, the teacher from the learner, elevating the former while downgrading the latter and presenting "the resultant relationship of domination as one of service and self-sacrifice" (Bauman, 1987: 13).

THE mass schooling of modernity and the enlightenment is not intended to provide "education for liberation" but instead to maintain the perceived imperfection and immaturity of those compelled to learn, primarily in order to reproduce a whole series of unequal subjects. The failure to achieve its own ideal objectives is the necessary impossibility which drives the education enterprise and enables its increasing appropriation of resources and its colonization of the social which is reflected in the high proportion of taxation allocated to education and the increasing emphasis on lifelong learning. The belief that education promotes development, growth, morality, and progress and satisfies needs not only drives the process (is necessary) but conceals the impossibility of achieving the ends-in-view (Dewey, 1939: 52/3). The near-perpetual crises in education the world over are used to justify the need to refine further the technologies of power and knowledge within educational management, pedagogy and curricula - the less education succeeds,

the more it becomes necessary (Smart, 1985: 106; Deacon, 1994; Deacon and Parker, 1994b).

ORTHODOX discourses are committed to a concept of knowledge which has its corollary in the modern conception of the unitary subject: the individual. Education as we know it is an aspect of an eminently western disciplinary practice which took shape with the Kantian definition of human beings as simultaneously knowing subjects and objects of their own knowledge (Dreyfus & Rabinow, 1982: xv). "Aufklärung" for Kant is the point at which human beings attain maturity by shrugging off the authority of others which they imposed upon themselves - the point at which they achieve autonomy, self-governance or self-discipline (Foucault, 1984a: 34-38). It is this attitude of and to modernity that has made both possible and necessary the mass education of beings that are both objectified and subjected, both produced as objects of knowledge to be mastered and as subjects who reify and master.

IN addition, in interpreting beings as objects, the role of the being which interprets, represents, knows and masters - the rational and self-present teaching subject - is so taken for granted as to be rendered invisible and hence unavailable for interpretation (Derrida 1983: 9-14). In these terms, the `power

of modern human reason' which saturates educational discourses can be characterized as a series of interlocking grids of knowledge and power relations, at the interstices of which are constituted beings which are both – and simultaneously – the targets of discourses (their objects and inventions) and the vehicles of discourses (their subjects and agents). Modern subjects, upon whom reason grounds itself, and whose derived status is concealed by the process of objectifying others, are thus exposed as unstable, fragmented and potentially contradictory effects of knowledge and power (Deacon, 1994: 9).

THE human being can be shown to be a paradox: subject and object; creator and effect of relations of power and knowledge; vehicle and target (autonomous agent and determined automaton) of powerful discourses; repressed and produced by power relations; intersubjectively subjected and governed externally by others and internally by conscience. "The entire process of subjectivation, of assuming different subject-positions" (Zizek 1990: 253) always takes place intersubjectively through and in relation to others (including one's self), who may either be objects for oneself or subjects for whom one is an object. As Hegel pointed out in his discussion of the dialectic between Lord and Bondsman, "self-consciousness ... exists only in being acknowledged" (Hegel,

1977: 111). One's 'intuitive' sense of oneself as a self-present, coherent and autonomous agent paradoxically depends upon being recognized as such by another (Mahoney & Yngvesson, 1992: 60; Foucault, 1977: 221-2; Althusser, 1971: 169; Deacon, 1994: 9-10). Subjects thus constitute themselves in relation to others, in the dual sense of being:

Subject to someone else by control and dependence, and tied to his own identity by a conscience or self-knowledge (Foucault 1982: 212).

The paradoxes that permeate my descriptions in earlier chapters emerge here in a new form. Within orthodox discourses it is, in Kant's terms the point of "Aufklärung" where authority is superseded by autonomy and development by democracy. For orthodoxy, the paradox lies in the relation between self-governance and governance by the "other" - the pedagogue, the judge, the state.

THE three orthodox discourses are discrete but overlapping, and their extent, intensity and presence are context-dependent. During the last ten years, for example, schooling in urban Soweto has experienced the impact of all three discourses. The traditional discourse has been dislodged from its dominant

position, but the vanguard and critical discourses have failed to establish themselves. They have been unable to move beyond affirming the negation of apartheid education. By contrast, in the schools of rural Maputaland, educational discourse has been largely restricted to the traditional, with relatively insignificant interventions by critical discourses.

IN the main, attempts to resolve the crisis in South African education, through innovative pedagogies, curricula, and administration, have tended to affirm the opposite: to replace centralization with decentralization, teacher centred with learner centred, rote-learning with discovery learning, academic with vocational. The attempts move from one side of the opposition to the other in the hope that out of this affirmation of a negation - the intensification of a contradiction - will emerge new subjects and disciplines. These approaches, however, remain supremely modernist in that they fail to question the primacy of identity and assume a linear progressive teleology (Adorno, 1973: 7).

THE central concept of modernity which underpins the orthodox discourse is that of identity; as both the logical relation of sameness which is necessary for the practice of reason and

science, and the personal and social construction of self. Adorno provides a useful critique of this concept of identity which, not surprisingly, is integral to the Hegelian and Marxist dialectic. Any attempt to achieve unity and identity for an historical subject (Geist or the communist society) through a synthetic process of affirming the negative as the contradiction of an original thesis is ahistorical, essentialist and teleological:

The fundament and result of Hegel's substantive philosophizing was the primacy of the subject... 'the identity of identity and non-identity' (Adorno, 1973: 7).

THE concept of identity underlying modernity presupposes a discrete, identifiable and conscious subject, an ultimate goal of unity or perfection, and a transcendental scientific or normative method for describing the necessary laws of personal and social development. In so doing, it simultaneously sets up a contradiction against what is different and excluded. The other is not outside of modernity; the contradiction is internal and a necessary part of the whole. It is this contradiction which simultaneously "sutures" the whole (the Aryan nation), and prevents the whole from being completed (the Jew); it is the black hole in the whole (Laclau, 1990: 44; Žižek, 1991: 19ff). The centrality of identity for modernity and the project of the

Enlightenment produces an equal stress on the importance of difference: the one is impossible without the other.

THE primacy of identity and difference under modernity is reflected in the centrality of exchange to economic relations. Jameson demonstrates how the consumerism characteristic of modernity also relies on the concept of identity. "How is it", he asks:

When the consumption of any specific object is unique, and constitutes a unique and incomparable temporal event in our own lives as well, that we are able to think of such things as "the same"? (Jameson, 1990: 23).

He answers that it is:

Exchange value... or the emergence of some third abstract term between two incomparable objects... which constitutes the primordial form by which identity emerges in human history (Jameson, 1990: 23).

IN a similar vein, the penetration of money into a rural economy marks a significant shift in the kinds of power relations that are prevalent. Local structures are displaced by the increasing presence of regional and national structures as power shifts from the local to the provincial and national levels. The necessity of

consumption for survival ensures that rural people are subjected by consumerism and, simultaneously, excluded by the dominant subject-identities and unequal power relations within that consumerism.

EDUCATION involves a similar paradox of identity and difference. To be educated is both to be subjected to/disciplined by the powerful subject-identities of teachers, learners and texts and excluded by those same identities because of one's differences. The more extreme the differences the greater are the inequalities in power. In some sense, education in a rural classroom seduces and repels; the seduction lies in the promise of opportunity to be a full citizen of a modern society, the repulsion lies in the rejection of the rural person as too different, too far from the dominant identities.

8.6 Education, paradox and difference

ADORNO'S response to the dark side of modernity was to develop a dialectic based not on identity but on contradiction, a logic which does not unify but disintegrates, a paradox which is suspicious of all identity:

Under the all-subjugating identity principle, whatever does not enter into identity, whatever eludes rational planning in the realm of means, turns into frightening retribution for the calamity which identity brought on the non-identical (Adorno, 1973: 320).

A negative dialectic implies a continual struggle to disintegrate the world, but in a necessarily self-reflexive manner:

To this end, dialectics is obliged to make a final move... it must now turn even against itself. The critique of every self-absolutizing particular is a critique of the shadow which absoluteness casts upon the critique; it is a critique of the fact that critique itself, contrary to its own tendency, must remain within the medium of the concept (Adorno, 1973: 406).

A logic of disintegration which challenges all subject-identities and the relations of power between them is not outside of the logic of identity which characterizes modernity. Paradoxically, modernity can only be criticized from within: the rationality of

critique assumes the values of modernity. The use of a negative dialectic enables one to identify the logic of integration and disintegration that lies at the heart of modernity, but the price one pays in exchange for this identification is precisely the inability to change what one has just constituted without disintegrating and reconstituting and re-identifying it. It is against the spread of technical reason, total administration and domination in society that Adorno asserts the paradox of trying to conceptualize a subject through a process of disintegrating all subjects and totalities. His dilemma is that to follow dialectical reason into a Zen-like awareness of the tensions within modern societies is to assume a Zen-like detachment that prevents one from planning change and being an effective but subjected actor within the instrumentalist world of technical reason.

AS Jameson has argued:

Identity is not an option but a doom; reason and its categories are at one with the rise of civilization or capitalism, and can scarcely be transformed until the latter is transformed (Jameson, 1990: 24).

The underlying identity logic of modernity, the survival logic of rural life in South Africa, the technical logic of education system change and the discursive logic of orthodoxy are all subject to this aporia.

EDUCATION and development policies in South Africa need to be understood within the wider project of creating a new order and a new nation. Building a nation is a fragile, temporary, contingent and incomplete exercise. For Laclau:

Systems of social organization can be seen as attempts to reduce the margin of undecidability, to make way for actions and decisions that are as coherent as possible... Social coherence will only be achieved at the cost of repressing something which negates it. It is in this sense that any consensus, that any objective and differential system of rules implies, as its most essential possibility, a dimension of coercion. And it is for this reason that there are no systems of social relations which are not, to some extent, relations of power (Laclau, 1990: 172).

APARTHEID was such an attempt to achieve social coherence; so are the efforts to build a new, democratic and developing, South African nation in which education will play a central role. In a sense, the negotiated transition in South Africa was made possible because the negotiating parties already subscribed to an ideal which subsumed the values of development and democracy:

that of a new national order within a global national order premised on identity and difference. Like its predecessor, post-apartheid South Africa is another attempt at closure, at reconciling freedom and necessity, change and stability, difference and identity. The paradox of social action, for Laclau, is that:

Freedom exists because society does not achieve constitution as a structural objective order; but any social action tends towards the constitution of that impossible object, and thus towards the elimination of the conditions of liberty itself. This paradox has no solution.... To understand social reality, then, is not to understand what society is, but what prevents it from being (Laclau, 1990: 44).

THE construction of identities of self, family, community, nation and tribe makes possible the normative project of social order and progress. The path, however, is full of stumbling blocks arising from the oppositions and contradictions created by the excluded surplus or excess (Žižek, 1991: 205). What prevents the new order from being are what it excludes, and chief amongst these in South Africa are the rural poor. This exclusion is internal to the new order, in that each pole of the urban-rural dichotomy is not fixed or essential but interpenetrates and is dependent on the other. The fragmentation of the old subject positions of state and liberation movements and the creation of a

new historical bloc has produced new differences and exacerbated old ones, particularly of a spatial-temporal nature, which both delimit (or reinforce) the boundaries and de-limit (or subvert) them (Deacon and Parker, 1994b).

GIVEN the emergence of a global capitalism (Jameson, 1990: 250) in which everyday life is dominated by the world capitalist economy, the nation state system, the world military order, and the international division of labour (Giddens, 1990: 71), the possibility of generating resistance within education lies in acknowledging both its institutional role within modernity (with its own logic of power accumulation) and the possibility of refusal. Foucault indicates that our task might be:

Not to discover what we are, but to refuse what we are... to imagine and build up what we could be... to promote new forms of subjectivity (Foucault, 1982: 216).

IN order to refuse and criticize what we are, we must at least in a minimal sense have discovered what we are, how we are constituted and what new kinds of subjects we could be. An appropriate strategy for social change under conditions of modernity would involve engaging in what Foucault calls practices of freedom, games of truth or power-plays which are aimed at

discursively reconstituting or re-in-forming subjects in particular historically and culturally proposed or imposed patterns (Foucault, 1987: 122; Deacon and Parker, 1994a).

WITHIN the institutionalized matrices of power relations that constitute modern western education, the greatest potential for resistance and change lies in the constitution of new and different subjects. It is not enough for the new subject to be merely an affirmation of the negation, as this leads directly to Adorno's aporia. Within the framing logic of reason, relations of identity and difference constitute complementary and contradictory subjects. The ruse by which we could both change modernity and remain part of it is to move beyond choosing one side or the other, but choosing to celebrate contradiction as the necessary driving force of change, and to assume contradictory perspectives. A preliminary step is to conceptualize a heterodox discourse that counterpoints the orthodox discourse of modernity and reflects the paradoxical nature of system change: its simultaneous immersion in the present, in the persistence of structural dispositions and orthodoxy, and in its affirmation of the "other" - that which is excluded from view by orthodoxy and promises difference.

A heterodox discourse is no more outside of power than orthodox discourses. The purpose of a heterodox discourse is not to replace an orthodox discourse. Instead of choosing between heterodoxy and orthodoxy, a paradoxical perspective holds the two in an equivalence grounded in their contradiction. From this perspective change is not a unilinear process that can be completely planned and managed. What happens in an education system is a contradictory amalgam of persistence and change.

EDUCATION'S role in the intersubjective constitution of subject identities is explored by Foucault in his critique of a purely juridico-legal conception of power in which power relations are assumed to be harmful, negative, external, centralized, homogeneous, repressive and prohibitive. For Foucault the opposite is equally, albeit paradoxically, true: power relations are also helpful, positive, internal, decentralized, heterogeneous, productive and permissive (Foucault, 1986: 234; Deacon, 1994: 10). Power relations are immanent within and not external to education and its discourses and practices; teachers and learners are subjects of power and knowledge, and their actions are always implicated in the very relations upon and within which they act (Foucault 1981: 95):

Power must be analyzed as something which circulates, or rather as something which only functions in the form of a chain. It is never localized here or there, never in anybody's hands, never appropriated as a commodity or piece of wealth. Power is employed and exercised through a net-like organization. And not only do individuals circulate between its threads; they are always in the position of simultaneously undergoing and exercising this power. They are not only its inert or consenting target; they are always the elements of its articulation (Foucault, 1986: 234).

WHEN power relations are embedded in the institutions, practices and discourses of education, their existence depends on a multiplicity of points of resistance. Power produces resistance against itself; it inadvertently generates opposition:

Where there is power, there is resistance, and yet, or rather consequently, this resistance is never in a position of exteriority in relation to power (Foucault, 1981: 95).

To conceive of power relations as ubiquitous, and as necessarily intersubjective, requires abandoning an ultimate utopia in which power is either absent or has been tamed, and instead to make explicit and engage with the matrix of power relations within which we simultaneously govern ourselves and are subjected to others (Thompson, 1981: 174).

MODERN western education poses as enlightening, empowering and emancipating, but is premised upon the disciplinary constitution of subjects through multiple relations of power. In order to avoid simply reinforcing these disciplinary mechanisms, we must dispense with the illusion of a true education, an education for liberation, a utopia of transparent knowledge and communicative action beyond power relations. This utopianism diverts one from the task of "rethinking subversive possibilities" for teaching and learning "within the terms of power itself":

To operate within the matrix of power is not the same as to replicate uncritically relations of domination (Butler, 1990: 30).

From a paradoxical perspective, society is both an iron cage and a set of relations in which agency is generated, and where power is productive.

JUST as it is impossible to achieve a successful universalizing "suture" of the national identity, so too the constituting and governance of subjects remains a fragile and contingent enterprise (Zizek, 1991: 19). The reciprocal subjection of master and learner in the process of seeking truth and becoming oneself conceals the exercise of power by internalizing it within the

subjects. Whether the learner accepts or resists, her discourses and practices reflect the presence of the other, they are predicated on the existence of an institutionalized enlightened other. The relation between Lord and Bondsman, teacher and learner, conscience and self, is one of coercive or persuasive power (either as the force of reason or violence). The ultimate embodiment of self-discipline is in the ordeal of the ascetic, when the internalization of power in the form of self-governance, expressed as the desire to deny the body, is converted to become the worship of the body as a sacrament:

Since the ascetic is unable to deny the body (this would simply mean death), the only thing that remains to him is to embody denial itself - to organize his bodily life as a standing disavowal and renunciation (Žižek, 1991: 143).

THE exercise of power in education, internal or external, depends not only on resources, institutional and personal, but also on an ideal, a value laden schemata, which provides the legitimacy, the *raison d'etre*, of the exercise. Education as subjection both requires the presence of an institutionalized enlightened other and excludes all different others: those not in conformity with the dominant ideal. The possibility and exercise of power are acts of affirmation or denial of the ideal, whether it be violent

attack on or defense of an irrational system, or peaceful implementation of, or resistance to, a rational alternative.

Wittgenstein reminds us that:

We misunderstand the role of the ideal in our language... we are dazzled by the ideal... the idea now absorbs us, that the ideal 'must' be found in reality. Meanwhile we do not yet see how it occurs there, nor do we understand the nature of this must. We think it must be in reality; for we think we already see it there... the ideal, as we think of it, is unshakeable. You can never get outside it; you must always turn back. There is no outside... Where does this idea come from? It is like a pair of glasses on our nose through which we see whatever we look at. It never occurs to us to take them off (Wittgenstein, 1972: paras. 100-103).

FROM the vantage point of the universalizing normative power of the dominant ideal, the rule governed nature of classroom interaction makes possible the constitution of passive subjects and reinforces existing inequalities in the distribution of power. The reward for subjection is entry into a community, to be a member of a governed society. This one-sided perspective of power, however, is blind to the possibility of the refusal which can either be concealed beneath performance in accord with the rule or revealed in conflict with the rule(r) (Holiday, 1993: 176; Wittgenstein, 1972: para. 201).

THE refusal implies that it is possible to remove our spectacles, that a subject can change position within the ensemble of power-plays. Where are the alternative positions? As Wittgenstein remarks, most poignantly, "If my name is not L.W., how can I rely on what is meant by 'true' and 'false'?" (Wittgenstein, 1969: para. 515). But, these questions are misleading, the subject does not need to know who she is to become:

Contrary to philosophical common sense, "I" does not ensure the subject's identity: "I" is nothing but an empty vanishing point of the "subject of enunciation" which arrives at its identity only by means of its identification with a place in the symbolic network that structures social reality; it is only here that the subject becomes "somebody"; that we can answer the question "Who is in pain?" (Žižek, 1991: 155).

8.7 Subjection and refusal

REFUSAL is a turning away from the coercive gaze of reason, the chief, the teacher, or the self; a shifting to a new and different subject identity. By moving, by acting, the subject changes her own identity and self-consciousness. The act itself is productive. For Butler (1990):

There need not be a 'doer behind the deed', but... the 'doer' is variably constructed in and through the deed (Butler, 1990: 30-31 and 142).

EVEN if a subject were to search for a new identity, a new subject position, this would not assure fulfillment. There would be a lack, something, some excess not included in the new "way of life" (Adorno, 1973: 320). The impossibility of achieving a "total recall", a complete satisfaction of all desires, is the paradox that makes change and movement possible. Desiring, working and educating are persistent human dispositions because their ideals, goals or ends are never achieved or satisfied.

IT is the existence of this lack, of a negative particular that denies the universality of the normative ideal, that makes resistance and refusal possible (Jameson, 1971: 56 & 1990: 32).

In the case of a school, the power of a principal or teacher is the place of "suture": the focal point of persistence and change. From this perspective, Beeby's focus on the teacher as the key agent of change makes good sense: the teacher binds the system together. Equally she is also the point where the system can most effectively be unraveled. In reference to Hegel's account of the monarch, whose irrational (natural, genetic) selection for the position is what enables the monarch to act as the point of suture, as that which provides the foundation on which to build the rationality of the society, Zizek argues:

The monarch is therefore simultaneously the point guaranteeing stability and consistency, and the embodiment of radical negativity - the central element by reference to which the structure obtains stability and meaning; the point of identity in its very heart, coincides with its own opposite (Zizek, 1991: 86).

UNRAVELING the nexus of the subject, the governor cog which controls the speed and direction of change within the system, requires an initiating redescription to transform our perspective on power. To move from a perspective where power is either negative or productive to one where power is both negative and productive. Our ability to redescribe the structure and culture of an education system, to interpret the movements and actions of ourselves and others, is dependent on the emergence of

paradoxical discourses which are located simultaneously within and without orthodox discourses (Jameson, 1991: 394). As Marx demonstrated potently, an effective way to describe and interpret in a productive way is to use the "force of abstraction" (Ollman, 1993: 80) to turn the stable things of this world into fluid relations and processes through spatio-temporal extensions of our perspective (from the here and now, to the there and then); through utilizing different levels of generalization for different purposes (the unique person, modern capitalism, class society, nature); through switching vantage points to view a relation or process from opposing perspectives (Ollman, 1993: 23ff):

CONTRASTING the vantage point of the dominating subject with that of the dominated subject, the system (the universalizing normative) with the classroom (the particular practice), provides the base for a paradoxical discourse in which persistence and change, consistency and contradiction, identity and difference, are simultaneously necessary and contingent. From this paradoxical perspective it is possible to reconceptualize the subject as both a unitary stable, autonomous, rational and free subject and:

As the articulation of an ensemble of subject positions, constructed within specific discourses and always precariously and temporarily sutured at the intersection of those subject positions (Mouffe, 1992b: 236/7).

IT is this space of radical and paradoxical contingency arising from the uncertainty caused by the overdetermination of the subject which creates the possibility for free choice. In other words:

It is the experience of this constitutive contingency itself which leads, paradoxically, to a higher consciousness of freedom and human dignity – that is to say, to the recognition that we ourselves are the exclusive creators of our world, and the ones who have a radical and untransferable responsibility towards it (Laclau, 1990: 173).

THE difference between resistance and refusal lies in the dependence of the former on an affirmation only of the negative (with the positive and dominant being denied and resisted). Refusal holds both sides in contradictory equivalence. Resistance – as a counter-privileging of contingency, particularity and the negative over against necessity, universality and the positive – produces unintended and contradictory results (Mouffe, 1992a: 382; Thompson, 1984: 62). Affirming the negative as discourse or practice, contradiction or opposition (democracy against

apartheid, people against the state), leads either to the vanquishing of the other by the one, or to an impasse. In either case, the affirmation of the negative is an acknowledgement of the primacy of identity and difference.

RESISTANCE is self-defeating insofar as it requires an affirmation of a particular identity over against its universal opposite. The act of affirmation further consolidates the very identities it seeks to deny. Pursuing a paradoxical discourse within modernity is not an attempt to resist modernity, identity and difference, but to refuse their domination by affirming both the difference and the identity. To avoid the refusal becoming a self-defeating resistance, it is necessary to have unifying discourses, which, however precarious they may be, act as alternative hegemonic articulations (Laclau, 1990: 164; Walzer, 1983: 16) capable of capitalizing on the productive and seductive power of education as subjection and refusal (Deacon and Parker, 1994a).

IN the context of constructing a new post-apartheid order, education and development are caught up in the irresolvable paradox of helping people to help themselves: the impoverished rural areas are once again being targeted for social engineering

by a development-state replete with an administrative infrastructure and orthodox discourses. These policies presuppose and reinforce rural lack:

The devaluation of rural societies... is actually the price and pre-condition of their entry onto the path of economic development (Latouche, 1993: 10).

THE paradox of social transformation in South Africa is that it is precisely those values and practices that foster development which also promote elite hegemonies, suppress difference and exclude large numbers of people. The tendency to reduce development to growth is paralleled by the equation of democracy with freedom and equality; democracy must instead be seen as an affective and constitutive matrix of power relations which need to be persistently defended and extended. Similarly, development efforts aimed at meeting people's basic needs cannot be divorced from power relations:

One can perfectly well imagine a world just as inhuman and unequal as the present world even though everyone is fed, clothed, lodged and looked after (Latouche, 1993: 173).

IT is from the standpoint of the rural 'outside' of post-apartheid society that one can question the totalitarian pretensions of the new system by exposing the incompleteness of its foundations, its contradictions, exclusions and temporary nature (Laclau, 1990: 170). This incompleteness is a zone of uncertainty, a counterpoint of difference, where the extent of the lack, of the failure of the existing system and subjects to achieve completeness becomes an opportunity for a radical change within the system. An opportunity for the construction of particular local parts that stand in contradiction to the universalizing normativity of the dominant system and subjects. Such a refusal of existing structures and orthodox discourses is premised on the interaction of structural oppositions and discursive contradictions. The refusal seeks the emergence of different structural configurations of power relations, different organizations, pedagogies and curricula, new discourses and subjects.

FOR the people of Mboza, the establishment of RRCs and CLCs, especially if under the auspices of a democratic oriented RDP, would provide both a discursive and constitutional space within which subjects could be fractured and sutured.

Not having existed before May 1994, as institutional structures they fall outside the constraints of the interim constitution while deriving considerable benefit from the Bill of Rights. Their dispersed planting in rural areas could provide a "locus nexus", a place of connection, in which the seeds of a countervailing tendency to the hegemonic discourses and institutions of modernity may take root. They could provide a space for rural people to engage in lifelong learning and a focus for democratic participation nurturing the potential for new subjects and for new forms of local and district government; subjects born within the gaze of traditional authorities, the embrace of communal land tenure, and the logos of oral traditions interfacing with a paradoxically repressive and productive form of power, structured within both the process of learning and the governance of that process (Long and Villarreal, 1993: 156ff).

DEVOLVING decision-making power to the local government level and promoting and maintaining strong forms of participation and representation throughout a system of lifelong learning, differentiated from the state schooling system through its institutionalization within the RDP but

articulated into a unified Ministry of Education at the national level, may make it possible to set into play a contradiction within the orthodox discourse and an oppositional movement within the system (Turner, 1980: 83). The separation and tension between the schooling system and a lifelong learning system, between the tribal authority and the local government will generate a warp in the power relations of modernity: a place where new subjects can emerge. At its most utopian this vision could include the possibility of these new "rural" subjects being able to enter modernity not in subservience, but as reciprocating invaders bringing new values and forms of governance. The Lord-Bondsman dialectic may then be displaced by an acknowledgement that rests on a refusal, a turning away from the face and the look of the dominating other (Hegel, 1977: 111; Foucault, 1982: 216; Biko, 1978: 65). Biko provides an example of a refusal of the identity of being "non-white":

Being black is not a matter of pigmentation - being black is a reflection of a mental attitude... Merely by describing yourself as black you have started on a road towards emancipation, you have committed yourself to fight against all forces that seek to use your blackness as a stamp that marks you out as a subservient being... any man who calls a white man "Baas"... is ipso facto a non white. Black people - real black people - are those who can manage to hold their heads high in defiance rather than willingly surrender their souls to the white man (Biko, 1978: 62).

THE refusal has to be located in a psychological or discursive space and a structural or institutional space, otherwise it will be individualized and controlled as deviancy, madness, even martyrdom. Instituting CLCs and lifelong learning within a context of growing democratic governance fosters a reconceptualization of education in which it becomes:

Akin on a social level to psychoanalysis of the individual, enabling the critique, and potentially the negation, of organizational forces leading to bureaucratization. Education may thus be a form of permanent revolution, allowing for an ongoing transcendence of the degeneration of democratic relations (Rosen, 1987: 111).

THE roots of discursive refusal for the people of Mboza may lie in being African. As "African", we are the "other" of the West. Hegel's claim that:

Africa proper... has no historical interest of its own, for we find its inhabitants living in barbarism and savagery (Hegel, 1975: 174)

was misleading, in that it concealed how the West, modernity and the Enlightenment were conceptually dependent on their negation, on what they excluded as different and inferior:

In Enlightenment discourse, the West was the model, the prototype and the measure of social progress... And yet, all this depended on the discursive figures of the 'noble vs ignoble savage', and of 'rude vs refined nations' which had been formulated in the discourse of the 'West and the Rest'... The figure of 'the Other', banished to the edge of the conceptual world and constructed as the absolute opposite, the negation, of everything which the West stood for, reappeared at the very centre of the discourse of civilization, refinement, modernity and development in the West. "The Other" was the 'dark' side - forgotten, repressed and denied; the reverse image of enlightenment and modernity (Hall and Gieben, 1992: 313/4).

THE increased globalization of modernity, the ascendancy of a partly regulated marketplace and the penetration of exchange-values, consumerism and electronic simulcra into every facet of life, have combined to make control and resistance, affirmation and negation, equally doomed enterprises. Refusal offers the possibility of moving instead towards:

A paradoxical combination of increased Africanization and increased internationalization... The full maturity of African educational experience will come when Africa develops a capability to innovate and invent independently (Mazrui, 1992: 110).

The social atomization, privatization of interests and subjectivization of the individual intrinsic to western modernity in which being has identity, autonomy and freedom only when privatized can in this way be forced into a confrontational interface with the communal orientation of traditional and local cultures in which people have identity only as part of a community and freedom only as a result of the concrete privileges, responsibilities and immunities which arise from communal life (Ake 1993: 10).

THE contested nature of "being African" can be seen in the contestations over "Ubuntu". The narrow ethnicity, and patriarchal authoritarianism of Inkatha's Ubuntu-Botho can be contrasted with Biko's interpretation. One example is his interpretation of the African proverb, *Umntu ungumntu ngabanye abantu* - "A person is a person by means of other people". Biko shifts the emphasis from a coerced respect for one's elders and traditional authorities to a reciprocal respect for everyone as social beings (Wilson and Ramphela, 1989: 267ff; Biko, 1978: 44

and 65). If democratic forces fail to contest the identity of "African" it could be appropriated by conservative forces asserting only ethnicity, diversity and difference in an attempt to preserve existing privileges and inequalities. The reality, if not the desirability, of ethnicity in South African discourse is undeniable, but the identity of that reality is not yet fixed. Paradoxically, the affirmation that:

Ethnic formations are often the most significant countervailing force to state power as well as the best defence of a separate space against the totalizing tendencies of the post-colonial state (Ake, 1993: 7)

is as much an acknowledgement of the persistence of tradition as it is an affirmation of the contingent form of ethnicity within modernity.

"UBUNTU" could become a useful signifier for articulating the values of communality, intersubjectivity, democracy, equality, economic growth and development that would be required by a project promoting African democracy and development as a paradoxical "way of life". The ruse that would underlie such a discursive refusal requires the ability to continually hold two or more perspectives in view and construct a vantage point from

which to acknowledge the present and refuse its persistence (Saul, 1992: 5; Singh, 1992: 56/7).

WHILE necessary, a paradoxical discourse is not sufficient for education system change. It is also necessary to provide a structural space for the exercise of new forms of power. The CLC, established under the auspices of a participatory democratic local or district government, with institutions and resources allocated with due regard to equity and redress, with sustained organizing and training provided by education and development officers (or cadres), and with local economic development, may be a suitable site.

THE nature and function of each CLC would vary according to the constraints and opportunities of each locale. In the case of Mboza, the CLC would need to provide a variety of courses including ABET, General Education, Further Education (especially agricultural and environmental education and training), with specialized courses offering training in tourist oriented economic activities. General education for the 5 to 15 year old cohort should be provided through existing schools, under the control of chiefs and the provincial ministry of education. The existing facilities for standards 8, 9 and 10 should be

transferred to the CLC. A local radio station, providing 2 or 3 hours of education programming a day and a community communication service, could play a key role in education and organization. To provide high quality and accessible learning environments, most of the learning should take place in small groups meeting at the workplace (homestead, fields) or a local gathering point, using distance education materials, under the direction and supervision of a trained and educated teacher. The emphasis should be on materials and teachers, with a minimal amount being spent on fixed infrastructure. The single greatest uncertainty in planning for the provision of education in a remote rural area is demographic movements. An open lifelong learning system can avoid expensive capital expenditure on facilities that may be abandoned after a few years.

AN open lifelong learning system, based on CLCs as the primary institution, using distance education, electronic media and the local environment would be very different from the existing provision of schooling. Even if CLCs were to be a purely rural phenomenon, different from urban provision, their difference need not be a mark of inferiority – particularly if they use the most advanced modern techniques of delivery to meet local education needs in an economically, politically and environmentally

appropriate way as defined by local people. In the rural areas of KwaZulu-Natal, a network of CLCs established in a relation of dependent contradiction with the schooling system, within a single ministry of education, could create two distinct power formations.

WITHIN the schooling system there is a large expansive administrative development state system where power is concentrated at the provincial levels with minimal power being delegated to administrators and teachers; a theory X organizational culture; a strongly traditional orthodox discourse. System change takes place through political manipulation in a semi-permeable political centre. There are few opportunities for internal initiation or external exchange. The system is characterized by high unification, low systematization, high differentiation, low specialization.

WITHIN the lifelong learning system power is devolved to the local level with minimal coordinating functions allocated to the provincial and national levels (equitable financial allocations, equivalency of norms, standards, and certification). The state consists of a small administrative staff limited to a coordinating function. There is a smaller core of teachers with

higher learner/teacher ratios, a theory Y organizational culture, a vanguard-critical and heterodox discourse. Control and ownership is vested in democratic local government. The system is characterized by high unification, low systematization, low differentiation, high specialization.

BY setting into place parts of a unified system that are in opposition with each other, and complementing these oppositions by discursive contradictions, neither development nor democracy can dominate totally and achieve closure. The nature of this constraining contradiction will promote change, as each side seeks to overcome the tension (Beeby, 1981: 10). This paradoxical combination of development and democracy does not imply the possibility of a utopia, instead it offers only a greater possibility of change, but makes no promises about the consequences of change.

THE implications for pedagogy are equally paradoxical. The particular descriptions offered in this chapter of the traditional, vanguard and critical discourses may well change. However ironic it may seem, the discourse that emerged as Fundamental Pedagogics in the 1930s was an oppositional vanguard discourse. In similar vein, Verwoerd was a committed African who

rejected the dominant European discourses. I have already noted how apartheid laid a foundation for a multilingual society; it may be possible to identify other aspects of apartheid education that could be valuable in the future. It is not inconceivable that the growing dominance of a development-oriented vanguard discourse may solidify into a new hegemonic traditional discourse with a critical ethnic discourse playing the role of a vanguard discourse in support of a democratic oppositional movement.

A second paradox occurs when overlaying the three discourses onto Beeby's taxonomy. If education is subjection, then we need to sever the connections between enlightenment, emancipation (or liberation) and empowerment which lie at the heart of existing critical discourses in South Africa. Critical pedagogy believes the three concepts are consistent and mutually dependent. Education occurs only when all three are present. From this perspective, apartheid education is often condemned for its emphasis on rote learning. Critical pedagogies attempt to replace rote learning with, in Beeby's terms, "meaning": an intensification of the meaningfulness of the symbols and rules of education. If we give up the desire for emancipation and enlightenment, refusing their seduction, then we can re-evaluate the appropriateness of rote learning. In rural contexts, amongst

others, it may be useful and productive to utilize rote learning techniques, at least some of the time. As a form of subjection, of the inculcation of useful habits and routines, rote learning is not necessarily disempowering.

SOUTH Africa's particular trajectory through modernity has exacerbated the contradictions within modernity, exemplifying and refuting the dominant discourses, values and forms of power. South Africa's transition from authoritarianism to democratic development should be interpreted as both conjunction and disjunction. To take one side or the other, to defend or attack persistence, to resist or advocate change, is to remain subjected to the predominantly negative and repressive forms of power. A paradoxical alternative is to hold both perspectives in view simultaneously, to weave a social formation containing a bifurcated state with two distinct forms of power, and to create an interplay between traditional, vanguard and critical discourses. The dominance of western norms, global market relations and traditional/vanguard discourses can be articulated with African norms, the local market and critical discourses. The paradoxes involved in articulating the two "ways of life" will continually generate problems, thus promoting change.

8.8 Conclusion

The approach outlined in this chapter is an attempt to conceptualize an alternative to the dominant policy discourses and existing governance structures that characterize South African education. Guided by an overriding concern to address the problems facing the provision of education in a remote rural area, I have built an edifice based on paradoxes and oppositions. If education is subjection, then the implementation of an homogeneous modern orthodox development state system of education will continue to exclude rural people. However well intended, and even with an optimum of equity and efficiency, rural education provision will not satisfy the needs of rural people. The alternative proposed here does not promise satisfaction; rather, it is an acknowledgement of the impossibility of satisfaction and the contingency and instability of all attempts at governance and nation-building. The constitution of subjects and knowledge that lie at the heart of education should be understood as a contradictory and paradoxical exercise. By refusing the dominant modernist impulses inherent in our collective education project, it may be possible to create a schooling and lifelong learning system that is appropriate to rural circumstances.

My primary concern has been to show the possibility and the necessity of a radical democratic alternative appropriate to rural education. I have, however, provided only a brief indication of what an example of this alternative might look like. It is now time to conclude.

CHAPTER NINE

Conclusion

IN the preceding chapters, I have shown how the development of South Africa's education system for whites and Africans from 1910 to 1990 produced a system with specific structural dispositions of persistence and change, reproduction and resistance; how education policy discourses in the period from 1990 to 1994 became oriented towards a development state system, with a devaluing of democracy; how education in rural areas, and in particular, in a remote rural area of KwaZulu-Natal, has been excluded by the education system in the past and why this exclusion is likely to persist; how democratically governed CLCs may be viable and useful alternatives to the dominant state schooling system; and, finally, how education is a paradoxical project.

THE narrative theme that has dominated the thesis is the history and analysis of governance in the South African education system. In each chapter, I approach governance from a different perspective showing how the dominant conception of education in South Africa makes assumptions common to a modernist western Enlightenment orthodoxy. I do not, however, reject this orthodoxy

or resist its fundamental values because this would be to affirm the negation and remain trapped within orthodoxy. Instead, I argue that we must refuse certain interpretations and practices common to this orthodoxy and accept others. In particular, we must refuse the totalitarian and universalist impulses within modernity and the Enlightenment and recognize the contingent, tentative and uncertain nature of education projects.

AT a practical level, or in Archer's (1979) terms, at the Socio-Cultural level, I have shown that it is possible to institutionalize an alternative form of governance which could promote certain benevolent values of western modernity and the Enlightenment. This is a high risk project as it is inevitable that it will produce unintended and harmful consequences. For the next ten years, at least, South African education is likely to remain trapped within the governance structures and discourses of apartheid education. Development discourses and development states are invariably conservative - they seek to preserve existing forms of governance and distributions of power. The discursive construction of an alternative perspective promotes the possibility of opposition to the dominant orthodoxy in a way that promises substantial change in the forms of governance and the distribution of power. In particular, it may be possible to

design and manage rural education in such a way that it contributes to the development of an improved quality of life for rural people. I have shown, however, that this is no easy task. In order for such a project to succeed, there needs to be a radical reconceptualization of values at the discursive or Cultural System level.

AT a theoretical level, I have shown that education, governance, development and democracy are contingent and paradoxical projects pervaded by persistence and change. The planning and management of education system change must take cognizance of these tensions, contradictions and paradoxes if it is to avoid the totalitarian pitfalls of modernism. In chapter eight, I offer an outline of an analytic framework which illuminates the paradoxical nature of education projects. I argue for a conception of education as subjection and refusal in which orthodox discourses and heterodox discourses are held in an uneasy equivalence. From this perspective education, like democracy, is a never ending project which amalgamates the authority of the past – those forces promoting persistence – and the autonomy of the future – those forces promoting change.

THESE themes are closely interwoven around a key question: How should education at Mboza be changed? This question of change,

and of persistence, leads to two further questions. Who should plan and implement organizational changes of the education system that will effect Mboza? (or, who owns and controls the local provision of education?) And, how do the people of Mboza decide which changes are best? (or, if it is decided by outside experts, how do they decide?).

I do not claim to have reached any final answers to these questions, but I hope I have provided a deeper and richer meaning to the questions themselves. By focusing on the paradoxes that pervade education I show how any planning of change is an uncertain exercise and how it is important to exploit this uncertainty, and to take risks, and to engage in a counter discourse and practice of democracy. The strategy proposed does not advocate resistance, but refusal. It does not deny development discourses or the administrative state, but seeks to provide a counter-point of democracy and the deconcentration of power.

I apply a similar argument to the pedagogic relation and show how education is a dynamic and paradoxical tension between subjection and refusal. If either is missing, it is not education. I argue that one possible productive response to education is to

acknowledge the paradoxes and to utilize their productive capacity. The trick is not to affirm the negation but to deny that it is a necessary negation and to argue that negations, and conflicts, emerge from the clash of particular perspectives grounded in the social. The clash may not be avoidable, but it need not be repressive.

AS is inevitable in a thesis of this nature, there are a number of loose ends that have been left dangling. I believe there are four areas, in particular, which require further research.

FIRSTLY, the tension between democracy and development at the practical and discursive levels should be researched further. I have provided an outline of an analytic framework firmly grounded in the history of South Africa. Exploring this tension would be one useful way of giving substance to the framework. The prime objective of the RDP is to deliver a sustainable and effective programme which meets the basic needs of the poor. The staggering record of development failures, including that of apartheid, emphasizes the importance of caution and critique. Although I have offered some interesting and provocative ideas on this topic, I have not explored their practical and paradoxical consequences. The practical implications of a paradoxical

approach for the strategic action of planning and implementing education system change therefore require further research. One possible direction lies in the work of Kosko and Isaka (1993) on fuzzy logic, and Watzlawick et al (1974) on organizational change.

SECONDLY, the significance of the clash between the West and Africa is implied but never spelt out. One of the peculiarities of academic work under apartheid was the isolation of South Africa from the rest of the continent. Now that interchange is possible, we can explore our African heritage. I believe that I have shown the importance of developing forms of governance, pedagogy and curricula that promote a paradoxical combination of Africanization and globalization. The South African education system propagates western Enlightenment values, but the experience of the majority of students is rooted in a local African reality. I have not explained how this could be done, although I believe that one way of promoting democratic change could be through a strong emphasis on the multilingualism of South Africa.

THE first and most immediate goals of any education system are the achievement of literacy, numeracy and the integration of the

individual into civil society. Language plays a key role in each of these activities. Its potential as a change agent has been examined in considerable detail by linguists and other language specialists. From the perspective developed in this thesis, multilingualism offers an opportunity to combine the modernism of English with the traditionalism of our African languages (including Afrikaans). English could be the language of reason used in commerce and governance as a necessary tool for the reaching of agreement. African languages could be the reservoir of the "other": the medium through which we communicate our joy and despair, our pleasure and our pain. Whether or not such ideas are fanciful, they are certainly worth exploring. In particular, they offer a practical example of a refusal which stands in contrast to the resistance strategy offered by Ngugi Wa Thiong'o (1986). Ngugi argues that the colonizing of the mind implicit in the use of English should be resisted by an affirmation of the negation - an abandonment of English and a privileging of African languages. By contrast, my analytic framework suggests that a multilingualism where English and African languages are given equal value but different roles in our social order may be of more value.

THIRDLY, I have not done justice to the theories from which I have borrowed so liberally. In particular, I have not done

justice to Archer's attempts to explain why and how education systems change. This thesis does provide both positive and negative confirmation of Archer's (1979 and 1988) explanations. The history of governance of the education system for whites positively confirms Archer's explanations. The history of governance of the education system(s) for Africans does not fit Archer's explanations, thereby confirming her warning not to apply her work to colonial and post-colonial education systems. A more detailed and critical application of her work to South Africa would give us a better idea of what is likely to change and what is likely to remain unchanged over the next ten to fifteen years. I have shown, however, that the construction, or deduction, of an analytic framework does provide illumination of the paradoxes of governance. The importance of further research in this area is highlighted by the dangers of an uncontested dominance of a development-oriented orthodoxy. A large administrative state education system, guided by a development discourse, will exclude a large number of people living in poverty in the rural areas. It is important to develop a theoretical perspective which offers a critique of, and an alternative to, the dominant discourses.

FOURTHLY, the implications of a paradoxical perspective for pedagogy remain unexplored. Although I do mention the possible

beneficial consequences of rote-learning, I do not explore how one teaches paradoxically. With its promise of a radically different pedagogy, this idea could have important practical implications. If we accept, even if grudgingly, that a state schooling system is likely to be the dominant form of education for the next fifteen years, then we need to focus strongly on the teacher as the most important change agent within the system. I have indicated that one key to the nature of the relation between master and student lies in the logical contradiction between the concepts of authority and autonomy (Wolff, 1970). At the practical level, the authority of the master and the autonomy of the student must both be present in order for education to take place. Practically they must coexist, theoretically they are logical contradictions: the presence of the one implies the absence of the other.

THE next logical step is to research pedagogic power relations far more extensively. I have suggested that one possible direction for this research may lie in conceptualizing education as subjection and refusal. This perspective exposes the central role played by governance in pedagogy – the exercise of power based on diverse relations of inequality. These relations are understood as having both productive and repressive potential. In

order to maximize the former and minimize the latter, it is necessary to understand pedagogy as a paradoxical project: an exercise of authority that succeeds only when authority fails. Although I have argued against those strands of the Enlightenment that advocate emancipation and liberation, I argue for an education that takes the possibility of empowerment seriously. One paradox of an empowering education is that it requires the simultaneous production and repression of the subject identities and differences that constitute master and student.

THESE four areas are both gaps in the thesis and opportunities for further research. This incompleteness can be a virtue. It leaves the door open for something unpredictable; it prevents the stagnation of closure and makes it possible for others to build on, as well as break down, what I have produced.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

STATISTICAL SOURCES

Ardington, E.M. 1989 Rural Towns and Basic Needs. Centre for Social and Development Studies, University of Natal, Durban.

Behr, A.L. 1984 New Perspectives in South African Education. Durban: Butterworth.

Behr, A.L. 1988 Education in South Africa, Origins, Issues and Trends: 1652-1988. Pretoria: Academica.

Bunting, I.A. 1992 "Post-Secondary Education in South Africa: an overview". NEPI working paper. Braamfontein: NECC/EDT.

Central Statistical Services South African Labour Statistics: 1986 - 1990. Pretoria: CSS.

Christie, P. 1985 The Right to Learn. Johannesburg: SACHED Trust/Ravan Press.

Department of National Education 1988 NATED 02-170 (88/04). Pretoria: DNE.

Department of National Education 1991 NATED 02-300 (91/06). Pretoria: DNE.

Department of Education and Training Annual Reports: 1980-1993. Pretoria: Government Printer.

Development Bank of South Africa (DBSA) 1988 KwaZulu Development Information. Halfway House: DBSA.

Diakonia 1989 Education for Freedom: What is the Churches' role in the 1990's? Durban: Diakonia.

Dostal, E. 1988 Notebook on educational trends and perspectives. Mobil Foundation/Urban Foundation.

Dreijmanis, J. 1988 The role of the South African government in tertiary education. Johannesburg: SAIRR.

Education Projects Unit 1989 Natal/KwaZulu Education Survey. Unpublished fieldwork data. EPU, University of Natal/NECC, Durban.

Education Projects Unit 1989 Education Monitor 1 and 2. EPU, University of Natal/NECC, Durban.

Hartshorne, K. 1992 Crisis and Challenge: Black education 1910-1990. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Horrell, M. 1968 Bantu Education to 1968. Johannesburg: SAIRR.

Human Awareness Programme 1991 INFO: A folder of facts and figures on South Africa, 1985-1990. Johannesburg: Human Awareness Programme.

Indicator Project South Africa Indicator South Africa: 1984 - 1993 Centre for Social and Development Studies, University of Natal, Durban.

Krige, D. 1989 "The basic needs approach to development: The question of education for black people in Natal". In: Development Southern Africa 6, 2.

KwaZulu Department of Education and Culture (KDEC) Annual Reports: 1980-1990 Ulundi: KwaZulu Government Service.

Mathonsi, E.N. 1988 Black Matriculation Results: A Mechanism of Social Control. Johannesburg: Skotaville.

Malherbe, E.G. 1925 Education in South Africa, Vol 1: 1652-1922. Cape Town: Juta.

Malherbe, E.G. 1977 Education in South Africa, Vol. 2: 1923-1975. Cape Town: Juta.

McGregor, R. and A. 1992 McGregor's Education Alternatives. Cape Town: Juta.

Moulder, J. 1991 Facing the Education Crisis: A Practical Approach. Johannesburg: Heinemann.

Nasson, B. and Samuel J. 1990 Education: From poverty to liberty. Cape Town: David Philip.

Nkomo, M. 1990 Pedagogy of Domination. Trenton, Africa World Press.

Parker, B.P. 1989 "In the heart of the country: An exploration of some aspects of education in South Africa". In: Masekela, M.D. (ed) Kenton at Makgobaskloof: The proceedings of the Kenton Conference. Turfloop: University of the North.

Research on Education in South Africa (RESA) 1988 Papers Nos 1, 2, and 3. Department of Sociology, University of Essex.

Rose, B. (ed) 1970 Education in South Africa. London: Collier-Macmillan.

South African Institute of Race Relations (SAIRR) Race Relations Surveys: 1980 - 1993. Johannesburg: SAIRR.

Kallaway, P. 1984 Apartheid and Education. Johannesburg: Ravan.

Taylor, N. 1989 Falling at the First Hurdle. Education Policy Unit, University of the Witwatersrand/NECC, Johannesburg.

UNESCO 1986 Education in Africa in the light of the Harare Conference. Paris: UNESCO.

UNESCO 1977 Education in Africa in the light of the Lagos Conference. Paris: UNESCO.

Vermaak, D. 1981 Educational Wastage in KwaZulu. Research Institute for Education Planning (RIEP), University of the Orange Free State, Bloemfontein.

Verwey C.T. et al. 1983 Forecasts of primary and secondary school enrolment and the outflow of pupils from the education system of KwaZulu. Research Institute for Education Planning (RIEP), University of the Orange Free State, Bloemfontein.

Verwey C.T. et al. 1985 Statistical Review of Education in KwaZulu: 1979-1984. Research Institute for Education Planning (RIEP), University of the Orange Free State, Bloemfontein.

Wilson, F. and Ramphela, M. 1989 Uprooting Poverty: The South African challenge. Cape Town: David Philip.

World Bank 1989 Sub-Saharan Africa: From Crisis to Sustainable Growth. Washington: World Bank.

World Bank 1988 Education in Sub-Saharan Africa. Washington: World Bank.

REFERENCES

Adorno, T. 1973 Negative Dialectics. London: Routledge.

Adorno, T. and Horkheimer, M. 1979 Dialectic of Enlightenment. London: Verso.

African National Congress (ANC) 1994a A Policy Framework for Education and Training: Discussion Document. Braamfontein: SACHED.

African National Congress (ANC) 1994b The Reconstruction and Development Programme: A policy framework. Johannesburg ANC/Umanyano Publications.

Ake, C. 1993 "What is the Problem of Ethnicity in Africa?" In: Transformation 22.

Amin, S. 1987 "The State and the Question of Development" In: Nyong'o, P.A. (ed) Popular Struggles for Democracy in Africa. London: Zed Books.

Amin, S. 1993 "SA in The Global Economic System." In: Work In Progress 87, February 1993. Braamfontein: SARS.

Appiah, K.A. 1992 In My Father's House. London: Methuen.

Archer, M.S. 1979 The Social Origins of Educational Systems. London: Sage.

Archer, M.S. 1984 The Social Origins of Educational Systems. (University Edition) London: Sage.

Archer, M.S. 1988 Culture and Agency: The Place of Culture in Social Theory. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Ardington, E.M. 1989 Rural Towns and Basic Needs. Centre for Social and Development Studies, University of Natal, Durban.

Ardington, L. 1991 "Education for All: Spatial Dimensions". In: Indicator SA 8, 2 Autumn 1991.

Aronowitz, S. and Giroux, H. 1986 Education under Siege: The conservative, Liberal and Radical debate over schooling. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Ashley, M. 1989 Ideologies and Schooling in South Africa. Rondebosch: Pioneer Press.

Bauman, Z. 1987 Legislators and Interpreters: On Modernity, Post-Modernity and Intellectuals. Cambridge: Polity.

Bauman, Z. 1991 Modernity and Ambivalence. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Beeby, C.E. 1966 The Quality of Education in Developing Countries. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Beeby, C.E. 1981 "Reflections on the strategy of changing a schooling system". Presented at the "Seminar on Regional Cooperation in Teacher Education" in Apia, New Zealand.

Behr, A.L. 1984 New Perspectives in South African Education. Durban: Butterworth.

Behr, A.L. 1988 Education in South Africa. Pretoria: Academica.

Bennell, P. and Swainson, N. 1990 Education and the "New Right" in South Africa. Education Policy Unit, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Bennis, W.G. 1964 "A Typology of Change Processes". In: Bennis, W.G., Benne, K.D. and Chin, R. (Eds) The Planning of Change. New York, Holt, Rhinehart and Winston.

Bensusan, D. and Shalem, Y. 1993a Civil Society the Traumatic Patient. In: Pendlebury et al (ed) Kenton at Broederstroom, 1992. Johannesburg: University of the Witwatersrand.

Bensusan, D. and Shalem, Y. 1993b The Crooked Path of Pedagogy. Paper presented at the Kenton Olwandle Conference, October 1993.

- Biko, S. 1978 I Write What I Like. London: Penguin.
- Bird, A. 1984 "The Adult Night School Movement for Blacks on the Witwatersrand 1920-1980". In: Kallaway P. (ed) Apartheid and Education: The Education of Black South Africans. Braamfontein: Ravan Press.
- Bot M. 1991 Social and Economic Update 15: Special Issue on Educational Renewal. Johannesburg: South African Institute of Race Relations.
- Buck-Morss, S. 1977 The Origin of Negative Dialectics. Brighton: Harvester.
- Bundy, C. and Beinart, W. 1987 Hidden struggles in rural South Africa. Johannesburg: Raven Press.
- Bundy, C. 1988 The Rise and Fall of the South African Peasantry (second edition). Cape Town: David Philip.
- Bunting, I.A. 1994 A Policy Framework for Education and Training: Some Critical Comments. Unpublished mimeo. Cape Town: University of Cape Town.
- Butler, J. 1990 Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity. London: Routledge.
- Carr, W. and Kemmis, S. 1986 Becoming Critical: Education, Knowledge and Action Research. London: Falmer Press.
- Centre For Education Policy Development (CEPD) 1993 Policy Proposals Regarding Rural Education: proceedings on Rural/Farm schools Workshop held at Broederstroom, May 1993, CEPD workshop 07/93.
- Chisholm, L. 1984 "Redefining Skills: Black Education in South Africa in the 1980s". In: Kallaway, P. (ed) Apartheid and Education: The Education of Black South Africans. Braamfontein: Ravan Press.
- Christie P. 1985 The Right To Learn. Braamfontein: Ravan Press.
- Christie, P. and Collins, C. 1984 "Apartheid Ideology and Labour Reproduction". In Kallaway, P. (ed) Apartheid and Education: The Education of Black South Africans. Braamfontein: Ravan Press.

Clegg, S. 1975 Power, Rule and Domination. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Cloete, N. 1990 "The Soweto Education Crises of 1985 and 1990". Unpublished mimeo.

Committee of Heads of Education Departments (CHED) 1991a Educational Renewal Strategy: Discussion Document. Pretoria: Department of National Education.

Committee of Heads of Education Departments (CHED) 1991b A Curriculum Model for Education in South Africa: Discussion Document. Pretoria: Department of National Education.

Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU) 1993 Report: Lifelong-learning - Policy Proposals. Braamfontein: Cosatu Education Desk.

CORD 1985 The Mboza Village Project: Funding Motivation. Centre for Community Organisation Research and Development, University of Natal, Durban.

CORD 1989 Mboza Village Education Programme: Annual Report 1989. University of Natal, Durban.

CORD 1990a An integrated approach to aquaculture within the Mboza Village Project. Working Paper 2. Centre for Community Organisation Research and Development, University of Natal, Durban.

CORD 1990b Overcoming Apartheid's land legacy in Maputaland (Northern Natal). Working Paper 3. University of Natal, Durban.

Cronin, C. and Suttner R. 1986 30 Years of the Freedom Charter. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Cross, M. and Chisholm, L. 1990 "The Roots of Segregated Schooling in Twentieth-Century South Africa". In: Nkomo, M. Pedagogy and Domination. Trenton: Africa World Press, Inc.

Dahrendorf, R. 1964 "Toward a Theory of Social Conflict" In: Bennis, W.G., Benne, K.D. and Chin, R. (Eds) The Planning of Change. New York: Holt, Rhinehart and Winston.

- Deacon, R. 1990 "Education for Transformation? Reflections on Critical Theory". In: Media Working Paper #6. Media Resource Centre, University of Natal, Durban.
- Deacon, R. 1991a "Hegemony, Essentialism and Radical History in South Africa". In: South African Historical Journal 24.
- Deacon, R. 1991b "Power, Knowledge and Community Video in South Africa". In: Media Working Papers #8. Media Resource Centre, University of Natal, Durban.
- Deacon, R. 1994 "Discourses of Discipline: Rethinking Critical Pedagogies in South Africa". Forthcoming in: Nain, Z. et al (eds) Communication and Development: The Freirean Connection. London: Sage.
- Deacon, R. and Parker, B. 1991 "Preliminary Reflections on an Education Project". In: Flanagan, W. (ed) Teachers and their Work: Case Studies of In-Service Education in African Primary Schools. Cape Town: Primary Education Project, University of Cape Town.
- Deacon, R. and Parker, B. 1993a "The curriculum and power: a reconceptualisation with a rural dimension". In: N. Taylor (ed) Inventing Knowledge: Contests in Curriculum Construction. Cape Town: Maskew Miller Longman.
- Deacon, R. and Parker, B. 1993b Knowledge, Language and Power in South African Educational Discourse. Unpublished paper.
- Deacon, R. and Parker, B. 1994a "Education as Subjection and Refusal: An Elaboration on Foucault". Forthcoming in da Silva, T. (ed) O Sujeito da Educacao: Interrogacoes Foucaultianas. Rio de Janeiro: Editora Vores.
- Deacon, R. and Parker, B. 1994b "Education, Development and Democracy in South Africa". Forthcoming in Norval, A. and Howarth, D. (eds) Transforming South Africa. London: Sage.
- Deacon, R. and Parker, B. 1994c "Development, Democracy and Rural Education". In: Matlhasedi 13, 2.
- Deacon, R. and Parker, B. 1994d "Modernity and Education in Rural South Africa". In: Matlhasedi 13, 3.

De Clerq, F. 1984 "Education and Training in the homelands: A separate development". Carnegie Conference Paper No. 275. The Second Carnegie Inquiry into Poverty and Development in Southern Africa, University of Cape Town.

Department of National Education (NATED) 1988 The Structure and Operation of the South African Education System. NATED 02-170 (88/04).

Department of National Education (NATED) 1991 Education Realities in South Africa, 1990. NATED 02-300 (91/06).

Derrida, J. 1978 Writing and Difference. London: Routledge.

Derrida, J. 1983 "The Principle of Reason: The University in the Eyes of its Pupils". Diacritics 13.

Derrida, J. 1986 "Racism's Last Word". In: Gates, H.L. (ed), 'Race', Writing and Difference. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Derman, P. and Poultney, C. 1981 Indicators of Household Welfare: The identification of relative poverty and vulnerability in different sectors of the Pongola river Floodplain. Unpublished mimeo. CORD, University of Natal, Durban.

Derman, P. and Poultney, C. 1985 "The politics of production and community development in South Africa". Carnegie Conference Paper no.226. The Second Carnegie Inquiry into Poverty and Development in Southern Africa, Cape Town.

Derman, P. and Poultney, C. 1986 "Agricultural reconstruction in a consumer society: The Mboza Village Project". Paper presented at the conference on land tenure and rural development. Institute for Social and Economic Research, Rhodes University.

Derman, P. and Poultney, C. 1988 Indicators of household welfare: The identification of relative poverty and vulnerability in different sectors of the Pongola river floodplain population. Centre for Community Organisation Research and Development, University of Natal, Durban.

Derman, P. and Poultney, C. 1990 The limits of traditional ethnic paradigms in the explanation of rural social organisation and survival strategies. CORD Working Paper 4, University of Natal, Durban.

Development Bank of South Africa 1989 KwaZulu Development Information: Section 10, Community and Social Services. Halfway House: DBSA.

Dewey, J. 1897 "My Pedagogic Creed". In: The School Journal L1V, 3.

Dewey, J. 1939 Theory of Valuation. Chicago: University Press.

Dews, P. 1984 "Power and Subjectivity in Foucault". In: New Left Review 144.

Diakonia 1989 Education for Freedom: What is the church's role in the 1990s? Durban: Diakonia.

Donaldson, A. 1992 "Reorganising the Education System - Possibilities for the year 2000." NEPI working paper. Braamfontein: NECC/EDT.

Doria, C. 1989a NGOs and Educational Support for Schools: A Case Study of the Mboza Village Education Programme. Report for The MVEP sub-committee, September 1989, CORD, University of Natal, Durban.

Doria, C. 1989b The Urbanization Process: Some effects on access to education in KwaZulu. Paper presented at a seminar of the Centre for Social and Development Studies, October 1989, University of Natal, Durban.

Doria, C. 1990 A report on the Mboza Village Education Project given to the Education Forum of the Centre for Community Organisation Research and Development, University of Natal, Durban.

Dostal, E. 1989 The Long-term future of Education in South Africa. Institute for Futures Research, University of Stellenbosch.

Dreyfus, H.L. and Rabinow, P. 1982 Michel Foucault: Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics. Brighton: Harvester.

Du Toit, D. 1981 Capital and Labour in South Africa. London: Kegan Paul International.

Du Preez, J.M. 1983 Africana Afrikaner. Alberton: Librarius.

- Edgar, R. 1984 "African educational Protest in South Africa: The American School Movement in Transkei in the 1920s". In: Kallaway P. (ed) Apartheid and Education: The Education of Black South Africans. Braamfontein: Ravan Press.
- Eisemon, T.O. 1988 Benefitting from Basic Education: School Quality and Functional Literacy in Kenya. Oxford: Pergamon Press.
- Ellsworth, E. 1989 "Why Doesn't This Feel Empowering? Working Through the Repressive Myths of Critical Pedagogy". In: Harvard Educational Review 59, 3.
- Enslin, P. 1984 "The Role of Fundamental Pedagogics in the Formulation of Educational Policy in South Africa". In: Kallaway, P. (ed) Apartheid and Education: The Education of Black South Africans. Johannesburg: Ravan.
- Esteva, G. 1992 "Development". In Sachs, W. (ed) The Development Dictionary: A guide to Knowledge as Power. London: Zed Books.
- Fay, B. 1987 Critical Social Science. London: Polity.
- Flynn, B. 1981 "Sexuality, Knowledge and Power in the Thought of Michel Foucault". In: Philosophy and Social Criticism 8, 3.
- Foucault, M. 1972 The Archaeology of Knowledge. New York: Harper & Row.
- Foucault, M. 1979 Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison. Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Foucault, M. 1981 The History of Sexuality: An Introduction. Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Foucault, M. 1982 "Is it really important to think? An interview with Michel Foucault". In: Philosophy and Social Criticism 9, 1.
- Foucault, M. 1984a "Truth and Power". In: Rabinow, P. (ed) The Foucault Reader. Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Foucault, M. 1984b "The Order of Discourse". In: Shapiro, M. (ed) Language and Politics. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Foucault, M. 1986 "Disciplinary Power and Subjection". In: Lukes, S. (ed) Power. Oxford: Blackwell.

- Foucault, M. 1987 "The Juridical Apparatus". In: Connolly, W. (ed) Legitimacy and the State. London: Blackwell.
- Foucault, M. 1989 Foucault Live. New York: Columbia University, Semiotext(e).
- Frank, A.G. 1969 Capitalism and Under-development in Latin America. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Fraser, N. 1989 Unruly Practices: Power, Discourse and Gender in Contemporary Social Theory. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Freire P. 1972 Pedagogy of the Oppressed. New York: Seabury.
- Freire P. 1985 The Politics of Education. London: Macmillan.
- Garbers, J.G. 1992 Presentation to the National Education Policy Initiative Workshop. Johannesburg, May 1992.
- Gelb, S. 1990 "Democratising Economic Growth: Alternative growth models for the future". In: Transformation 12.
- Gersony, R. 1988 Summary of Mozambican Refugee Accounts of Principally Conflict-Related Experiences in Mozambique. Washington: Bureau for Refugee Programs.
- Giddens, A. 1979 Central Problems in Social Theory: Action, Structure and contradiction in Social Analysis. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Giddens, A. 1990 The Consequences of Modernity. Cambridge: Polity.
- Giddens, A. 1991 Modernity and Self-Identity. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Gordhan, P. and Parker, B. 1992 "Framework and set of guiding principles: Outline for discussion". NEPI working paper. Johannesburg: NECC/EDT.
- Gordon, A. 1991 "Farm Schools: A Bumper Harvest for the 90s?" In: Matlhasedi 10, 1.
- Gordon, A. 1994 Community Learning Centres: draft document for the Rural Task Team of the Implementation Plan for Education and Training. Department of Education, African National Congress.

Graaf, J.F. 1989 "From dependent under-development to dependent development in Southern Africa: a history of changing ideas in Marxist thought". In: Coetzee, J.K. (ed) Development is for people. Cape Town: Southern Book Publishers.

Graaf, J.F. 1992 "Homeland and Rural Education". NEPI Working Paper. Johannesburg: NECC/EDT.

Graaff, J. and Gordon, A. 1992 "South African Farm Schools: Children in the Shadow". In: McGregor, R. and A. (ed) McGregor's Education Alternatives. Cape Town: Juta.

Gelb, S. 1993 "UDUSA Policy Proposals on Post-Secondary Education: A Macro perspective - comments on the draft document". Paper presented at UDUSA policy Forum, University of Durban-Westville, May 1993.

Griesel, H. 1986 Perceptions of Life Chances in a Rural Community: Women literacy learners at Mboza. Paper presented at the Seventeenth Annual Conference of the Association for Sociology in Southern Africa, University of Natal, Durban.

Griesel, H. 1987 Simbabene. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Grundy, S. 1987 Curriculum: Product or Praxis. London: Falmer Press.

Guthrie, G. 1979 "Stages of Educational Development: Beeby Revisited". Paper presented at Education Research Seminar, University of Papua New Guinea.

Habermas, J. 1972a Knowledge and Human Interests. London: Heinemann.

Habermas, J. 1972b "Towards a theory of communicative competence". In: Dreitzel, H.P. (ed) Recent Sociology, No. 2: Patterns of communicative behaviour. New York: Macmillan.

Habermas, J. 1979 Communication and the Evolution of Society. London: Heinemann.

Habermas, J. 1983 The Theory of Communicative Action, Vol 1. Boston: Beacon Press.

Habermas, J. 1987 The Philosophical Discourse of Modernity. Massachusetts: MIT Press.

Habermas, J. 1990 "What Does Socialism Mean Today? The Rectifying Revolution and the Need for New Thinking on the Left". In: New Left Review 183.

Hall, S. 1992 "The West and the Rest: Discourse and Power". In: Hall, S. and Gieben, B. (eds) Formations of Modernity. Cambridge: Polity/Open University Press.

Hall, S, Held D., McLennan, L. 1992 "Introduction". In: Hall, S, Held, D. and McGrew, T. (eds) Modernity and its Futures. Cambridge: Polity/Open University Press.

Harding, T. 1992 "Community-based Education - Beyond Tribal Controls". In: Matlhasedi 11, 1.

Hart, M. and Gultig, J. 1990 "Schooling and Violence in Natal". In Perspectives in Education 11, 2.

Hartshorne, K. 1989 "Education in the Homelands: In a cul-de-sac or at the crossroads?" The Etheredge Commemoration Lecture, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Hartshorne, K. 1992 Crisis and Challenge: Black education 1910-1990. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Hawes, H. and Coombe, T. et al. 1986 Education Priorities and Aid Responses in Sub-Saharan Africa. London: Overseas Development Administration/University of London, Institute of Education.

Hegel, G.W.F. 1969a "Master and Servant". In: Gardner, P.L. (ed) 19th-Century Philosophy. New York: Free Press.

Hegel, G.W.F. 1969 "The Unhappy consciousness". In: Gardner, P.L. (ed) 19th-Century Philosophy. New York: Free Press.

Hegel, G.W.F. 1975 Lectures on the Philosophy of World History. Translated by Nisbet, H.B. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Heidegger, M. 1969 Kant and the Problem of Metaphysics. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Held, D. 1980 Introduction to Critical Theory: Horkheimer to Habermas. London: Hutchinson.

- Hindson, D. 1987 Pass controls and the Urban African Proletariat. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.
- Holiday, A. 1993 "Teaching to Rule: Wittgenstein and Educational Practice". In: Perspectives in Education 14, 2.
- Horrell, M. 1968 Bantu Education to 1968. Johannesburg: SAIRR.
- Hunt Davis, Jr, R. 1984 "Charles T Loram and the American Model for African Education in South Africa". In Kallaway, P. (ed) Apartheid and Education: The Education of Black South Africans. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.
- Hyslop, J. 1986 "State Education Policy and the Social Reproduction of the Urban African Working Class". Paper presented to the 1986 Conference of the Association of Sociologists of Southern Africa. Durban: University of Natal.
- Hyslop, J. 1987a "The concepts of reproduction and resistance in the sociology of education: The case of the transition from "missionary" to "Bantu" education 1940-1955". In: Perspectives in Education 9, 2.
- Hyslop, J. 1987b "Let us Cry for our Children: Lessons of the 1955-6 school boycotts". In: Transformation 4.
- Illich, I. 1992 "Needs". In Sachs, W. (ed) The Development Dictionary: A guide to Knowledge as Power. London: Zed Books.
- Isaac, J.C. 1987 Power and Marxist Theory: A Realist View. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Jacklin, H. 1994 Interim Report of the Access sub-group of the Rural Education Task Team of the Implementation Plan for Education and Training. Department of Education, African National Congress.
- Jameson, F. 1971 Marxism and Form. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Jameson, F. 1988 The Ideologies of Theory. Volume 2. London: Routledge.
- Jameson, F. 1990 Late Marxism: Adorno, or, The Persistence of the Dialectic. London: Verso.

Jameson, F. 1991 Postmodernism, or, The Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism. London: Verso.

Jay, M. 1973 The Dialectical Imagination. London: Heinemann.

Jones, R.C. 1970 "The Education of the Bantu In South Africa". In: Rose, B. (ed) Education in Southern Africa. London: Collier-Macmillan Publishers.

Kallaway, P. (ed) 1984 Apartheid and Education: The Education of Black South Africans. Braamfontein: Ravan Press.

Kane-Berman, J. 1978 Soweto: Black Revolt White Reaction. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Kelly, G.P. 1979 "The Relation Between Colonial and Metropolitan Schools: a structural analysis". In: Comparative Education Review 15, 2.

Kemmis, S. 1988 "Action Research". In: Keeves, J.P. Educational Research, Methodology and Measurement: An International Handbook. Oxford: Pergamon Press.

Keto, C.T. 1990 "Pre-Industrial Education Policies and Practices in South Africa". In: Nkomo, M. Pedagogy of Domination: Toward a Democratic Education in South Africa. Trenton: Africa World Press, Inc.

Kidson, J. 1990 Distance Education for Adults in Rural Areas. Paper presented to CORD Seminar April 1990. University of Natal, Durban.

Kosko, B. and Isaka, S. 1993 "Fuzzy Logic". In: Scientific American. July.

Kotze, D.A. 1978 "Development and Structural Violence". In: Politikon 5.

Krige, D. 1991 " KwaZulu: Searching for Regional Equality". In: Matlhasedi 10, 1.

Krige, D. et al, 1994 The Education Atlas of South Africa. Durban: Education Foundation.

Krikler, J. 1987 "Reflections on the Transition to Socialism in South African Agriculture". In: Africa Perspective 1, 5/6.

Kruss, G. 1988 People's Education: An Examination of the Concept. People's Education Research Project: No. 1. Centre for Adult and Continuing Education, University of the Western Cape.

Laclau, E. 1971 "Feudalism and Capitalism in Latin America". In: New Left Review 67.

Laclau, E. and Mouffe, C. 1985 Hegemony and Socialist Strategy. London: Verso.

Laclau, E. 1990 New Reflections on the Revolution of Our Time. London: Verso.

Lakowski, K. 1988 "Critical Theory". In: Keeves, J.P. Educational Research, Methodology and Measurement: An International Handbook. Oxford: Pergamon Press.

Land and Agricultural Policy Centre (LAPC) 1994 Research into the decentralization of funding for rural development (Briefing Paper). Johannesburg: LAPC.

Larrain, J. 1989 Theories of Development. Cambridge. Polity Press.

Latouche, S. 1993 In the Wake of the Affluent Society: An exploration of post-development. London: Zed Books.

Lawrence, M. 1992 "Chieftenship, Schooling and Development". In: Matlhasedi 11, 1.

Lawrence, M. 1994 Report on governance structures at the local and institutional level for Community Learning Centres in rural areas. For the Rural Education Task Team of the Implementation Plan for Education and Training. Education Department, African National Congress.

Lee, R. 1990 No Coups D'Etat: Education Policy Change in the 1990s. Centre for Policy Studies: University of the Witwatersrand.

Lerner, M. 1964 "The Discovery of the "Irrational": Personal and Collective". In: Bennis, W.G., Benne, K.D. and Chin, R. (eds) The Planning of Change. New York: Holt, Rhinehart and Winston.

Lerner, M. 1986 Surplus Powerlessness. Oakland: The Institute for Labor and Mental Health.

Lewin, K. 1985 "Quality in Question: a new agenda for curriculum reform in developing countries". In: Comparative Education 21, 2.

Lodge, T. 1983 Black Politics in South Africa since 1945. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Long, N. and Villarreal, L. 1993 "Exploring Development Interfaces: From the Transfer of Knowledge to the Transformation of Meaning". In: Schuurman, F.J. (ed) Beyond the Impasse. London: Zed Books.

Lukes, S. 1974 Power: A Radical View. London: Macmillan.

Lukes, S. 1985 Marxism and Morality. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Magubane, B. M. 1979 The Political Economy of Race and Class in South Africa. New York: Monthly Review Press.

Mahoney, M. and Yngvesson, B. 1992 "The Construction of Subjectivity and the Paradox of Resistance: Reintegrating Feminist Anthropology and Psychology". Signs 18,1.

Malherbe, E.G. 1925 Education in South Africa Vol. 1 (1652 - 1922). Cape Town: Juta & Co.

Malherbe, E.G. 1977 Education in South Africa Vol. 2 (1923 - 1975). Cape Town: Juta & Co.

Mamdani, M. 1987 "Contradictory Class Perspectives on the Question of Democracy: the Case of Uganda". In: Nyong'o, P.A. (ed) Popular Struggles for Democracy in Africa. London: Zed Books.

Mamdani, M. 1993 University Crisis and University reform: A Reflection on the African Experience. Academic Freedom Lecture, University of Natal, Pietermaritzburg.

Mamdani, M. 1994 Work in progress seminar to the Departments of Philosophy and Political Science, University of Durban-Westville, Durban.

Mashamba, G. 1992 A conceptual Critique of the People's Education Discourse. Research Report No. 3. Education Policy Unit, University of the Witwatersrand.

- Marcus, T. 1993 "Absence of Adult Basic Education". In: Matlhasedi 12, 1.
- Marcus, T. 1994 Governance Structures at the Local and Institutional Level for Community Learning Centres - the commercial farming sector. Report for the Rural Education Task Team of the Implementation Plan for Education and Training. Education Department, African National Congress.
- May, J. 1987 "Differentiation and Inequality in the Bantustans: Evidence from KwaZulu". In: Social Dynamics 13, 2.
- Mazrui, A. 1992 "Towards Diagnosing And Treating Cultural Dependency: The Case of the African University". In: International Journal For Educational Development 12, 2.
- Mboza Village Education Project (MVEP) 1987 Project Proposal. CORD, University of Natal, Durban.
- Mboza Village Education Programme 1989A Annual Report. CORD, University of Natal, Durban.
- Mboza Village Education Project 1989B Project Evaluation for the period February to June 1989. CORD, University of Natal, Durban.
- McCarthy, T.A. 1976 "A Theory of communicative competence". In: Connerton, P. (ed) Critical Sociology. Hammondsworth: Penguin.
- McGregor, D.M. 1964 "The Human Side of Enterprise". In: Bennis, W.G., Benne, K.D. and Chin, R. (eds) The Planning of Change. New York: Holt, Rhinehart and Winston.
- McGregor, R. and A. (ed) 1992 McGregor's Education Alternatives. Cape Town: Juta.
- McIntosh, A. 1990 "Rethinking Chieftaincy and the Future of Local Government". In: Transformation 13.
- Mdluli, P. 1987 "Ubuntu-Botho". In: Transformation 5.
- Miller, C. Raynham, S. and Schaffer, A. 1991 Breaking the Formal Frame: Readings in South African Education in the Eighties. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Ministry of Education 1994 Education and Training in a Democratic South Africa. Pretoria and Cape Town.

Minutes of the CORD Education Advisory Committee Meeting held on 30/08/89 at University of Natal, Durban.

Minutes of the CORD Education Advisory Committee Meeting held on 30/10/89 at University of Natal, Durban.

Minutes of the CORD Education Advisory Committee Meeting held on 02/03/89 at University of Natal, Durban.

Minutes of the CORD Education Advisory Committee and the Mboza Education and Training Committee Meeting held on 29/04/89 at Mboza Village, Maputaland.

Minutes of the Mboza Village Education and Training Committee Meeting held on the 17/05/89 at Mboza Village, Maputaland.

Minutes of the Mboza Village Education and Training Committee Meeting held on the 21/10/89 at Mboza Village, Maputaland.

Minutes of the CORD Education Advisory Committee Meeting held on 04/07/89 at University of Natal, Durban.

Minutes of the CORD Education Advisory Committee Meeting held on 05/07/89 at University of Natal, Durban.

Minutes of the CORD Education Advisory Committee Meeting held on 14/07/89 at University of Natal, Durban.

Minutes of the CORD Education Advisory Committee Meeting held on 01/09/89 at University of Natal, Durban.

Minutes of the CORD Education Advisory Committee Meeting held on 07/11/89 at University of Natal, Durban.

Minutes of the CORD Finance Committee Meeting held on 26/01/90 at University of Natal, Durban.

Minutes of the CORD Education Programme Workshop held on 15/01/90 at Mboza village

Minutes of the CORD Education Programme Workshop held on 08/05/90 at Mboza village

- Molteno, F. 1984 "The Historical Foundations of the Schooling of Black South Africans". In: Kallaway, P. (ed) Apartheid and Education: The Education of Black South Africans. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.
- Molteno, F. 1987 1980: Students Struggle For Their Schools. Cape Town: Centre for African Studies.
- Moore, W.E. 1963 Social Change. Englewood Cliffs: Prentice-Hall.
- Morphet, T. 1990 "Brushing History Against the Grain: Oppositional discourse in South Africa". In: Theoria 76.
- Morris, M. 1987 "Social History and the Transition to Capitalism in the South African Countryside". In: Africa Perspective 1, 5/6.
- Morriss, P. 1987 Power: A Philosophical Analysis. New York: St Martin's Press.
- Mouffe, C. 1992 "Democratic Citizenship and the Political Community". In: Mouffe, C. (ed) Dimensions of Radical Democracy: Pluralism, Citizenship, Community. London: Verso.
- Mouffe, C. 1992 "Feminism, Citizenship and Radical Democratic Politics". In: Butler, J. and Scott, J.W. (eds) Feminists Theorize the Political. London: RKP.
- Moulder, J. 1991a Searching for Equality and Affordability: A Commentary on the Schooling Proposals of the ERS for The Department of National Education. Submission to the CHED.
- Moulder, J. 1991b "Unequal Inequalities: Teacher-Pupil Ratios". In: Indicator SA 8, 2.
- Moulder, J. 1991c "Undoing the Past: Index of Educational Need". In: Indicator SA 8, 3.
- Moulder, J. 1991d Facing the education crisis: A practical approach. Johannesburg: Heinemann.
- Moulder, J. 1992 "Another go at Equal Educational Opportunity". In: South African Journal of Philosophy 11, 3.

Muller, J. 1987 "People's Education and the National Education Crisis Committee". In: South African Review 4. Braamfontein: Ravan Press.

Muller, J. 1993a Development, Reconstruction and Education: A Review for the Urban Foundation. Johannesburg: Urban Foundation.

Muller, J. and Cloete, N. 1986 "The White Hands: Academic Social Scientists and Forms of Popular Knowledge Production". In: Critical Arts 4, 2.

Muller, J. and Cloete, N. 1991 "To Outwit Modernity; Intellectuals and Politics in Transition". In: Transformation 14, 37.

Muller, J. and Taylor, N. 1993b "The Gilded Calabash: Curriculum and Every day Life". Paper presented at the Kenton Olwandle Conference, October 1992.

Nasson B. and Samuel J. 1990 Education: From Poverty to Liberty. Cape Town: David Philip.

National Education Conference 1992 Report on and the resolutions of the National Education Conference held at the Alpha Centre, Broederstroom 5 - 7 March 1992.

National Education Policy Investigation 1993A The Framework Report and Final Report Summaries. Cape Town: Oxford University Press/National Education Co-ordinating Committee.

National Education Policy Investigation 1993B Adult Education. Cape Town: Oxford University Press/National Education Co-ordinating Committee.

National Education Policy Investigation 1993C Adult Basic Education. Cape Town: Oxford University Press/National Education Co-ordinating Committee.

National Education Policy Investigation 1993D Human Resources Development. Cape Town: Oxford University Press/National Education Co-ordinating Committee.

National Education Policy Investigation 1993E Education Planning Systems and Structure. Cape Town: Oxford University Press/National Education Co-ordinating Committee.

National Education Policy Investigation 1993F Governance and Administration. Cape Town: Oxford University Press/National Education Co-ordinating Committee.

National Training Board 1994 A Discussion Document on a National Training Strategy Initiative.

Natrass, N. and Ardington, E. 1990 The Political Economy of South Africa. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Ngugi Wa Thiong'o 1986 Decolonising the Mind: The politics of language in African literature. Nairobi: Heinemann.

Nina, D. 1992 "Beyond the Frontier; Civil Society Revisited". In: Transformation 17.

Nkomo, M. 1990 Pedagogy of Domination: Toward a Democratic Education in South Africa. Trenton: Africa World Press, Inc.

Nkosi, D. 1989 From Literacy to Adult Basic Education: A case study. Addendum to Agenda of Mboza Village Education and Training Committee meeting on 07/05/89 held at Mboza Village, Maputaland.

Nozick, R. 1974 Anarchy, State, and Utopia. Oxford: Blackwell.

Nyong'o, P.A. (ed) 1987 Popular Struggles for Democracy in Africa. London: Zed Books.

Nwaila, C. 1993 "Inside a Farm School". In: Matlhasedi 12, 2.

O'Donnell, G. and Schmitter, P.C. 1986 Transitions from Authoritarian Rule: Tentative Conclusions about Uncertain Democracies. Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press.

Ollman, B. 1993 Dialectical Investigations. London: Routledge.

O'Meara, D. 1983 Volkskapitalisme. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Parker, B. 1981 "Freedom and Authority in Fundamental Pedagogics". In: Beard, P and Morrow, W (eds) Problems of Pedagogics. Durban: Butterworths.

Parker, B. 1989 "In the Heart of the Country". In: Masekela, D. (ed) Kenton at Magobaskloof: Proceedings of the Kenton conference. Turfloop: University of the North.

Parker, B. 1993a "Intellectuals and Education System Change". In: Perspectives in Education 14, 2.

Parker, B. 1993b "The Bewitchment of Ethnicity: A Response to Wedekind et al and Steve Segal". In: Pendlebury et al (ed) Kenton at Broederstroom, 1992. Johannesburg: University of the Witwatersrand.

Parker, B. 1994a Report on governance structures at the national and provincial levels for the governance working group of the Rural Education Task Team for the Implementation Plan for Education and Training. Education Department, African National Congress.

Parker, B. 1994b Report of the governance working group on governance structures at the national, provincial, district, local and institutional levels for rural education for the Rural Education Task Team for the Implementation Plan for Education and Training. Education Department, African National Congress.

Perry, H. 1991 Education Demands and the Principles of the Progressive Education Movement. NEPI working paper. Braamfontein: NECC/EDT.

Plant, R. 1987 Managing Change and Making it Stick. London: Fontana/Collins.

Platzky, L. and Walker, C. 1985 The Surplus People: Forced Removals in South Africa. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Rao, S. 1985 Education and Rural Development. New Dehli: Sage Publications.

Rural Education Task Team 1994 Report on Rural Education for the Implementation Plan for Education and Training. Education Department, African National Congress.

Research on Education in South Africa (RESA) 1988a Strategies on Education and Training in South Africa 1960-1987: The Role of Corporate Capital. Paper Number 1. Colchester: University of Essex.

Research on Education in South Africa (RESA) 1988b Bantu Education as a Reformist Strategy of the South African State. Paper Number 2. Colchester: University of Essex.

Research on Education in South Africa (RESA) 1988c The Struggle against Apartheid Education: Towards People's Education in South Africa. Paper Number 3. Colchester: University of Essex.

Rohm, N. 1989 "Critical theory as a way to understand development". In: Coetzee, J.K. (ed) Development is for people. Cape Town: Southern Book Publishers.

Rondinelli, D.A., Nellis, J.R., Cheema, G.S. 1983 Decentralization in Developing Countries: A Review of Recent Experience. World Bank Staff Working Papers Number 581. Washington: World Bank.

Rose, B. 1970 Education in Southern Africa. London: Collier-Macmillan Publishers.

Rosen, M.L. 1987 "Producer Cooperatives, Education and the Dialectical Logic of Organisation". In: Praxis International 7, 1.

South African Institute for Distance Education (SAIDE) 1993 Open Learning and Distance Education. Braamfontein: SAIDE.

Sachs, W. 1992 "Introduction". In: Sachs, W. (ed) The Development Dictionary: A guide to Knowledge as Power. London: Zed Books.

Said, E.W. 1991 Identity, Authority and Freedom: The Potentate and the Traveller. T.B. Davie Academic Freedom Lecture, University of Cape Town.

Saul, J.S. and Gelb, S. 1986 The crisis in South Africa. New York: Zed Books.

Saul, J.S. 1992 "Structural Reform: A Model for the Revolutionary Transformation of South Africa?" In: Transformation 20.

Saul, J.S. 1993 "South Africa between 'Barbarism' and 'Structural Reform'". In: New Left Review 188.

Sayed, Y. and Kulati, T. 1992 An Overall Assessment of the ERS Document. NEPI working paper. Braamfontein: NECC/EDT.

Segal, S. 1993 "The Logic of Fear in Christian Nationalism". In: Pendlebury, S. et al (ed) Kenton at Broederstroom, 1992. Johannesburg: University of the Witwatersrand.

Schwartz, N.B. 1981 "Anthropological Views of Community Development". In: Human Organization 40, 4.

Shah, C.G. 1994 A Unitary Department of Education and Training. Discussion document for KwaZulu/Natal (produced by an education working committee convened by the heads of the five education departments).

Shalem, Y. 1990 Why Professionalism? A study of the relationship between teacher's work, teacher's power and teacher's struggle. Education Policy Unit, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Singh, M. 1992 "Transformation Time!". In: Transformation 17.

Sisulu, Z. 1986 "People's Education for People's Power". In: Transformation 1.

Smart, B. 1985 Michel Foucault. London: Routledge.

Smelser, N. J. 1971 "Mechanism of Change and Adjustment to change". In: Dalton, G. (ed) Economic Development and Social Change. New York: The Natural History Press.

Soobrayan, B. 1991 Student migrancy and marginalisation: A study of the exclusion of African students from schooling in Natal. Education Policy Unit, University of Natal, Durban.

Soweto Parents Crisis Committee (SPCC) 1986 Proceedings of the First National Education Crisis Conference, October 1985. Johannesburg; University of the Witwatersrand.

Stadler, A. 1987 The Political Economy of Modern South Africa. Cape Town: David Philip.

Suttner, R. and Cronin, J. 1986 30 Years of the Freedom Charter. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Sunter, C. 1987 The World and South Africa in the 1990s. Cape Town: Human and Rousseau.

Taylor, N. 1989 Falling at the First Hurdle: Initial encounters with the formal system of African Education in South Africa. Education Policy Unit, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Taylor, N. Muller, J. Cloete, N. and Narsing, Y. 1989 "The First and Last Interpreters". Paper presented at Kenton-at-Magoebaskloof.

Taylor N. (ed) 1993 Inventing Knowledge: Contests in curriculum construction. Cape Town: Maskew Miller Longman.

Thompson, A.R. 1981 Education and Development in Africa. London: Macmillan.

Thompson, J.B. 1981 Critical Hermeneutics: A study in the thought of Paul Ricoeur and Jurgen Habermas. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Thompson, J.B. 1984 Studies in the Theory of Ideology. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Turner, R. 1980 The Eye of the Needle: Towards Participatory Democracy in South Africa. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Union of Democratic University Staff Associations (UDUSA) 1993 Framework Document and Proposals for Post-Secondary Education. Braamfontein: UDUSA.

UNESCO 1977 Education in Africa in the light of the Lagos Conference. Paris: UNESCO

UNESCO 1986 Education In Africa in the light of the Harare Conference. Paris: UNESCO.

United Nations 1986 Declaration on the Right to Development 41/128.

Unterhalter, E. et al 1991 Education in a Future South Africa: Policy Issues for Transformation. Oxford: Heinemann.

Vandeverre, Aspey, Robinson and Associates (VARA) 1985 KwaNgwanase: Development of a Service Centre. Durban: VARA.

Van Heerden, G. 1991 Adult Literacy in South Africa. Centre for Adult Education, University of Natal, Pietermaritzburg.

Van Zyl Slabbert, F. 1990 "South Africa: Beginning at the end of the road". In: Transformation 11.

Wack, P. 1985 "Scenarios: shooting the rapids". In: Harvard Business Review.

Walker, M. 1990 "Action Research in South African Schools: Gilding Gutter Education or Transforming Teaching?". In: Perspectives in Education 11, 2.

Walker, J.C. and Evers, C.W. 1988 "The Epistemological Unity of Educational Research". In: Keeves, J.P. (ed) Educational Research, Methodology and Measurement: An International Handbook. Oxford: Pergamon Press.

Walkerdine, V. 1988 The Mastery of Reason. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Watzlawick, P. Weakland, J. and Fisch, R. 1974 Change: Principles of problem formation and problem resolution. New York: W. W. Norton and Company.

Walzer, M. 1980 Radical Principles. New York: Basic Books.

Walzer, M. 1983 Spheres of Justice. New York: Basic Books.

Walzer, M. 1992 "The Civil Society Argument". In: Mouffe, C. (ed) Dimensions of Radical Democracy: Pluralism, Citizenship, Community. London: Verso.

Webster, E. 1993 "Moral Decay and Social Reconstruction". In: Theoria 81/82.

Wedekind, W. Shange, S. and Piper, L. 1993 "Ethnicity, Culture and Identity". In: Pendlebury, S. et al. (eds) Kenton at Broederstroom - 1992. Education Department, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Wilson, F. and Ramphela, M. 1989 Uprooting Poverty: The South African challenge. Cape Town: David Philip.

Wittgenstein, L. 1969 On Certainty. Oxford: Blackwell.

Wittgenstein, L. 1972 Philosophical Investigations. Oxford: Blackwell.

Wolff, R.P. 1970 In Defense of Anarchism. New York: Harper & Row Publishers.

- Wolpe, H. 1988 Race, Class and the Apartheid State. Paris: UNESCO Press.
- Wolpe, H. 1991a "Education and Social Transformation: problems and dilemmas". In: Unterhalter, E. et al 1991 Education in a Future South Africa: Policy Issues for Transformation. Oxford: Heinemann.
- Wolpe, H. 1991b "Some Theses on People's Education". In: Perspectives in Education 12, 2.
- Wolpe, H. 1992 Towards a short-term negotiating policy on education and training. NEPI Working Papers. Braamfontein: NECC/EDT.
- World Bank 1989 Sub-Saharan Africa: From crisis to sustainable growth. Washington: D.C.
- World Bank 1981 Accelerated Development in Sub-Saharan Africa: An Agenda for Action. Washington: D.C.
- Wulfsohn, T. 1990 Natural Resource Management, Rural Development and Regional Planning in the Natal/KwaZulu Region. CORD: Working Paper No 1, University of Natal, Durban.
- Yudelman, D. 1984 The Emergence of Modern South Africa. Cape Town: David Philip.
- Zizek, S. 1989 The Sublime Object of Ideology. London: Verso.
- Zizek, S. 1990 "Beyond Discourse-Analysis". In: Laclau, E. New Reflections on the Revolution of Our Time. London: Verso.
- Zizek, S. 1991 For they know not what they do. London: Verso.