

# THINKING RACE THINKING TOURISM: A CRITICAL RACE APPROACH TO HERITAGE AND CULTURAL TOURISM IN KWAZULU-NATAL

By

#### THANDANANI GASA

A DISSERTATION SUBMITTED IN FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE
MASTERS OF DEVELOPMENT STUDIES

SCHOOL OF BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND DEVELOPMENT STUDIES FACULTY OF HUMANITIES, UNIVERSITY OF KWAZULU-NATAL HOWARD COLLEGE CAMPUS

**DURBAN, SOUTH AFRICA** 

SUPERVISORS: DOCTOR MVUSELELO NGCOYA and PROFESSOR ROZENA MAART

DATE: 07 July 2019

SUPERVISOR'S SIGNATURE

.....

#### **Abstract**

South Africa's tourism industry continues to grow and has come to be part of the government's developmental strategy which seeks to alleviate poverty and uplift previously disadvantaged groups. In the South African context, where there is a long history of colonization, which unfairly subdivided the country's resources and economy, race is a crucial characteristic in the tourism sector. I use critical race theory to explore the unjust role of race and racism in the tourism sector which has ensured the failure of a post-apartheid transformation agenda by covertly perpetuating White domination. In this study, the focus is particularly on heritage and culture tourism, which encompasses even more elements of racialized exploitation. This way, the study examines the commodification of Black culture in a sector that is still largely owned by White people. The study samples a cultural village in the province of KwaZulu-Natal located in the outskirts of Pietermaritzburg. The study uses a non-probabilistic purposive sampling method where the interviewed participants of the study were direct employees of the cultural village. Ultimately the study finds that there has been minimal to no change in the racial structure of the sector; which is that Whites own a lion's share of the industry while Black people serve as employees, at times for a bare minimum wage. The study finds that the heritage and cultural tourism is racially exploitative and uneven. Worryingly, the White domination of this sector, especially in the case where Black culture is the primary commodity, is characteristic of how most industries can be argued to have functioned during the apartheid era; with Black people at the bottom.

## **Declaration**

The Registrar Academic

University of KwaZulu-Natal

Durban

South Africa

- I, Thandanani Gasa (Student number 214583032), declare that the dissertation titled: THINKING RACE THINKING TOURISM: A CRITICAL RACE APPROACH TO HERITAGE AND CULTURAL TOURISM IN KWAZULU-NATAL is my original research.
  - 1. This dissertation has not been submitted for any degree or examination at any other university.
  - 2. The graphs and other information entailed have all been acknowledged.
  - 3. This dissertation does not contain other persons' writing, unless specifically acknowledged as being sourced from other researchers. Where other written sources have been quoted, then:
    - a. Their words have been re-phrased but the general information attributed to them has been referenced

- b. Where their exact words have been used, their writing has been placed in italics and inside quotation marks, and properly referenced.
- 4. This dissertation does not contain text, graphics or tables copied and pasted from the Internet, unless specifically acknowledged, and the source being detailed in the dissertation and in the References sections.

Sign	Date

# **Dedication**

I would like to hear this and dedicate this to research to my mother, and my two late maternal and paternal grandmothers.

# Acknowledgements

I would like to thank God Almighty, who gave me a compassionate mother that has supported me tirelessly through what has been a very trying process.

A big thank you goes to my friends Ntokozo Zulu, Minenhle Nxumalo, Eliza Solis-Maart, Unathi Mngonyama and Eric Ngcobo. They played a critical role in keeping me focussed and motivated during the most stressful times. I would not have made it this far without them.

I thank the very compassionate and kind-hearted participants of this research who loaded my study with critical content. I am so grateful.

I would like to also thank my amazing supervisors Professor Rozena Maart and Doctor Mvuselelo Ngcoya. They are the best academics and teachers I have ever met and I could not have chosen better supervisors. They pushed me for excellence and kept me motivated throughout the entire process and for that I am grateful.

# **Abbreviations**

SATOUR - South African Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism

GDP - Gross Domestic Product

SAT - South African Tourism

CRT - Critical Race Theory

DAC - Department of Arts and Culture

BBBEE - Broad Based Black Economic Empowerment

EEA - Employment Equity Act

NDT - National Department of Tourism

# **Table of Contents**

AbstractAbstract	2
Declaration	3
Acknowledgements	6
Abbreviations	7
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF STUDY	10
Introduction	10
Background	
Problem statement and rationale	14
Objectives and research questions	15
Research questions: Error! Bookmark	not defined
Organisation of the study	16
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW	17
Heritage and cultural tourism as a method of preserving indigenous knowledge, o	
heritage.	
Heritage and Cultural Tourism as an economic and development strategy	
Theoretical Framework	
CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	28
Research Methodology	29
Study Area	32
Sampling	33
Data Collection Methods	34
Challenges	36
CHAPTER 4: DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS	40
Reasons why employees work in the sector	41
Race and racism	
Ownership	50
Transformation	51
Economic beneficiation and community development	52
Government policy	54
Commodification of the Zulu Culture	56
CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION OF RESEARCH FINDINGS	50

Appendix 2: Consent form for study participants	81
Appendix 1: Semi-structured interview guide for destination employees	77
References	71
Conclusion	69
The nervous conditions of cultural tourism	66
Economic beneficiation and community development	64
Commodification of Zulu Culture	63
Government policy	62
Transformation	60
Employment	59

**CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF** 

**STUDY** 

Introduction

South Africa has numerous prestigious cultural and heritage sites located in different parts of

the country. These include, among others, Mapungubwe Cultural Landscape, Robben Island,

Isandlwana battle site, PheZulu Safari Park, Ncome Battle of Bloodriver and the Voortrekker

Monument. There is rural tourism, which focuses on destinations and touristic interests located

in non-urban areas, such as the study area of this research. There is also township tourism,

which mainly highlights the township culture as well as significant areas of historical

importance within townships, such as the houses and even graves of apartheid struggle icons.

There are a number of stakeholders that are directly and indirectly involved when it comes to

South Africa's domains of culture, heritage and tourism. According to the National Department

of Tourism (NDT), the stakeholders who carry the responsibility of heritage and cultural

tourism products include a national government department which oversees the growth and

development of tourism by formulating good policy and regulations; South African Tourism

(SAT) which is an agency of the NDT that is accountable for the marketing and branding of

South Africa as an ideal tourist destination; the Department of Arts and Culture (DAC), which

10

among other things, informs government policy for creating the best possible funding arrangements to protect and promote South African arts, culture and heritage (Department of Tourism, 2018).

Tourism is seen as a great developmental tool and opportunity by government and an investment opportunity for profits by the private sector. Most interest and approaches by scholars, government and society at large towards tourism have been economic and to some extent preservationist (this is discussed with more detail in chapter two). However, it faces several challenges such as its seasonality, travel marketing and infrastructure. Surprisingly, race, which is a crucial element in this sector especially considering the racial history of South Africa, is often overlooked. This is concerning because the impacts of racism in South Africa are still very evident in the sector. This study therefore seeks to identify and critique the unjust role and implications of race and racism in the heritage and cultural tourism sector. The study is concerned about the impact of racism on the lives of those that are at the receiving end of it. This chapter presents the background of the study and it discusses the research problem as well as the research objectives and questions. This chapter also gives an outline of the dissertation.

#### **Background**

The South African government, like many other governments, has recognised the tourism industry as a great asset for economic development. As a result, the government has made it its mission to realise the economic potential of heritage and cultural resources through sustainable tourism development (Briedenhann and Wickens, 2004). The White paper from the South African Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism, however, acknowledges very briefly that there is a racial dynamic that is a concern to the previously neglected groups which needs to be addressed in order to build a prosperous tourism industry. There is a concern, according to the paper, that tourism is a 'White man's thing' (Department of Environmental

Affairs and Tourism, 1996). This is the perception that tourism caters for White people of middle to upper classes. Though the paper identifies many challenges in the sector, it places much emphasis on the business and developmental aspects. The challenges, for example that seem to take centre stage are economic. For example, the paper identifies the following primary challenges within the sector: failure to get funding in order to exploit opportunities given by the tourism sector; lack of market access and barriers to entry.

The strategy outlined by the White paper mainly focuses on consumption and the economic viability of the industry and says nothing about economic beneficiation in relation to racism. Furthermore, the document has a very positive tone, contrasting South African tourism figures against global averages to show just how successful the industry has been. The document also focuses on several government strategies, plans, policies and ambitions as well as projections which are primarily revenue orientated. Its silence on race, which is a big element in the industry, necessitates the approach of this study.

The government has prioritized the provision of an integrated framework for the development and promotion of heritage and cultural tourism products, for economic development and sustainable livelihoods at community grass-roots level (Briedenhann and Wickens, 2004). There is a strong sentiment that the development of tourism stimulates cooperation and togetherness between local and neighbouring regions and that this ultimately leads to economic growth (Briedenhann and Wickens, 2004).

Alongside many other policies that were enacted as means to redress the detrimental effects of South Africa's racial past was the Employment Equity Act (EEA) of 1998 whose primary aim was to achieve equity in all sectors of the economy (Meyer, 2014: 3). There is also a tourism BEE charter and scorecard which is committed to transforming and empowering the tourism industry while making sure that the opportunities and benefits of the tourism sector are

appropriated to Black South Africans as well. According to the tourism BEE charter scorecard, "Broad-based BEE means the economic empowerment of all Black people including women, workers, youth, people with disabilities and people living in rural areas through diverse but integrated socio-economic strategies that include: increasing the number of Black people that manage, own and control enterprises and productive assets; facilitating ownership and management of enterprises and productive assets by communities, workers, cooperatives and other collective enterprises" (Department of Tourism, 2004;04). The charter, however, has not been successful particularly in the tourism industry at large. For example, Mofokeng et al (2018) investigated if the implementation of BEE has resulted in any form of transformation in the touristic accommodation sector. They discovered that there is lack of transformation within the accommodation sector of the Clarens area.

SA Tourism established a website that encourages local people to travel and enjoy their very own country (Motala & Ngandu, 2018). This, however omits the affordability component of travelling, which in South Africa is particularly racially demarcated. This study thus seeks to address the perpetuation of racism in the sector by looking at how one of the sites is structured, presented, run as well as its attractiveness particularly to the White tourists.

Cultural tourism is characterized by the event of travelling to a destination with a focus on experiencing cultural environments, including landscapes, the visual and performing arts, and special (local) lifestyles, values, traditions, events as well as other ways of creative and intercultural exchange processes (Silberberg, 1995). The South African nation is rich in history, heritage and culture. The country has about 11 official languages and numerous ethnic groups to add to its diversity. The tourism industry has cashed in on this, by commercializing and packaging heritage and culture into touristic products and services that both international and national tourists find attractive. Most Black people in the country are impoverished, even with the tourism sector having commercialized their heritage and culture. The prevalence of this

poverty is despite government having identified the tourism sector as one with the potential to help towards the eradication of poverty.

#### **Problem statement and rationale**

Tourism, particularly in KwaZulu-Natal, is a significant industry for cultural, heritage preservation and economic purposes. The Zulu culture alone has rich traditions, practices, history and heritage which makes for great touristic content within the province. Zulu people have maintained their Zulu culture in spite of apartheid, which in its quest to conquer, sought to destroy the very essence of what made up the Zulu identity. They have continued to speak the Zulu language and wear Zulu garments with pride. Many ancient traditions and practices, such as imbeleko, which is a ceremony that introduces a new-born to the ancestors, are still upheld and practiced to this day. The dancing and singing of tunes which are hundreds of years old are still an integral part of Zulu culture and identity. The continued existence of these characteristics of Zulu culture are what makes tourists intrigued; the resilience and staying power of a culture that has managed to triumph and outlive the highly oppressive apartheid system. Garments, cooking equipment, amour and plants which are used by Zulu people have become highly respected artifacts. There are several battle sites which speak volumes about the resilience, character and strength of the biggest ethnic group in South Africa. The government has marked the industry as a developmental tool, however, one of the main problematic and overlooked characteristics of the industry is that it is racially demarcated. The industry according to the government is supposed to uplift and improve the lives of the previously disadvantaged Black population, who were previously segregated and ultimately cheated out of the economic opportunities within their country.

The main issue is that the industry does not show evidence of having undergone some actual post-1994 transformation. The apartheid structure of the sector seems to have remained intact even though we are now in a democratic era. This is problematic because the apartheid structures and institutions were always in favour of the White minority at the expense of the Black majority. Roles in the industry are racially demarcated even in destinations that sell the culture and heritage of Black people. This study looks at one such case, where race characterizes the ownership, clientele, employment and overall approach of a cultural village whose main touristic product and commodity is Black Zulu culture. There is therefore much concern over how inequitable the industry is.

This concern is necessary because if the industry does not fulfill its non-racial, post-apartheid economic mandate which seeks to redress past racial injustices, then Black people will remain oppressed and impoverished. Black people, who mainly function as workers in the industry do not reap benefits that are equal or even in the range of their White counterparts. The ownership and control of the industry still largely rests in the hands of a White minority. This means that the wealth of the industry, which has the potential to improve the lives of impoverished Black people will not reach them. Race therefore becomes a necessary umbrella under which to examine the sector. This is because race, though ignored, seems to have the biggest influence in determining a person's role in the sector.

#### **Objectives and research questions**

The objectives of this study are:

- a. To investigate the racial composition of the heritage and cultural tourism industry
- b. To examine the role of race in the determination of economic value in the sector
- c. To evaluate the extent and effect of transformation within the tourism sector

#### **Research questions:**

a. What is the self-identified racial composition of the heritage and cultural tourism industry at the establishment?

b. Is economic value racially determined in the heritage and cultural tourism sector, and why?

1. c. Is transformation taking place in the sector and what have been its effects? Organization of the study

This dissertation is made up of five chapters. This first chapter consists of the introduction and background of the study. It also contains research questions and the objectives of the study. The second chapter is a literature review which also includes the theoretical framework that guides the study. The third chapter focuses on methodology, the research design, and the methods used to conduct the research and analyse findings. Chapter four presents the actual research findings which were obtained through semi-structured interviews and observation. The fifth and final chapter then discusses and interprets the findings presented in chapter four.

#### Conclusion

This chapter has given a detailed background of the study, the hypothesised social and socioeconomic injustices that inspired it and ultimately why the topic is necessary. The problematised racial and economic dynamics of the heritage and cultural tourism sector are clearly presented. The order in which the document will be organised is also clearly stipulated in this chapter.

## **CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW**

#### Approaches to heritage and cultural tourism

#### Introduction

Upon reviewing literature for the topic at hand, it became apparent that there are two main approaches towards heritage and cultural tourism, namely the preservationist and developmental approaches. The former sees heritage and cultural tourism as a method of preserving indigenous knowledge, culture and heritage and the latter views heritage and cultural tourism as an economic stimulus and development strategy to uplift the impoverished population. This chapter will also include the theoretical framework through which the study will be interpreted; Critical Race Theory.

The developmental approach towards heritage and cultural tourism is essential as Rogerson (2013) explains how employment intensive the tourism industry is and how that can be an effective economic stimulus particularly for the impoverished and unemployed. On the other hand, the importance of the preservationist approach is also undisputed for various reasons, one of them being that heritage and cultural tourism has arguably been highly effective in reinforcing identity and pride (Estonian, 2001).

There are various definitions of cultural tourism; according to Silberberg (1995), cultural tourism involves the visiting of a person from outside the host community driven partly or totally by an interest in the scientific, historical, and artistic, lifestyle or heritage offerings of a place. To examine this phenomenon in the context of South Africa, this study focuses on two approaches, namely the economic developmental approach and the preservationist approach. Though these two approaches are relevant and important, the theoretical framework of this study argues that the two above-mentioned approaches which have dominated literature on

heritage and cultural tourism, ought to be sub topics under the umbrella of race as the primary approach, especially in the context of South Africa, which has an unpleasant history of racial segregation and discrimination that has shaped industries and society in favour of the White minority. For that reason I adopted critical race theory as a theoretical sense to guide the study.

# Heritage and cultural tourism as a method of preserving indigenous knowledge, culture and heritage.

The term cultural conservation, which came about during the 1980s in the United States of America, was a result of efforts to reshape the national heritage preservation system by rethinking it critically (Kreps, 2013). This somewhat sentimental, aesthetic and preservationist approach towards heritage and cultural tourism has birthed relatively new terms such as 'cultural preservation'. The term presents a different approach towards looking at the safeguarding of heritage. According to Kreps (2013), the term cultural preservation presents a new paradigm since it comprises of an even broader perspective of heritage, such that it includes and places emphasis on the involvement of locals when it comes to the protection of heritage.

There are various types of tourism, which include environmental, ethnic, historical and recreational tourism. This study, however, focuses on heritage and cultural tourism. In the second edition of *The Anthropology of Tourism*, Smith defines various types of tourism; he first begins by stating that defining tourism is difficult because people who travel for conventions and business can combine conferences with tourist-type activities (Smith, 1989. p.1). He goes on to say that generally, a tourist is someone who willingly visits a place that is away from home in order to experience something different (Smith, 1989). He states that a tourist is also a temporarily leisured person. Regarding cultural tourism, he says it involves "picturesque" or "local colour", a display of a gradually dying lifestyle that is now considered old. Furthermore, cultural tourism in its presentation of this 'old style', uses houses, handmade

crafts and homespun fabrics (Smith, 1989). In cultural tourism, upon arrival at the destination, the visitor participates in activities such as folklore performances, wine festivals and meals (Smith, 2018). As is now clear, local people become the 'objects of the study' and the easy access to their habitat in high numbers of tourists can cause tensions to rise.

Heritage and cultural tourism revives a sense of image whilst facilitating understanding, tolerance and harmony among people. It is also believed that heritage and cultural tourism can bring about social cohesion, which Viljoen and Henama (2017) believe is a missed opportunity in South African. Local people produce more as a result of cultural tourism, which can be argued to bring about positive socio-economic changes among people. Heritage and cultural tourism, according to Estonian (2001), can lead to infrastructural development and improved living environments as exemplified by Europe. "As cultural tourism gives the destination an identity, it gets known, this attracts interests and people, which again helps to market local production in general" (Estonian, 2001). Heritage and cultural tourism has been argued to be highly effective in reinforcing identity and pride. It keeps the traditions and beliefs of a society alive (Estonian, 2001). Boswell and O'Kane (2011) also reiterate Estonian's sentiment when they expressed that heritage is significant because it helps construct the identity of the African state.

Chhabra et al (2003) conducted a study to investigate the importance, impact and role of authenticity and staged authenticity in the Flora Macdonald Scottish Highland Games, a cultural festival, which takes place in the United States of America in North Carolina. Visitors and event organizers were asked to assess the level of authenticity of some of the events which take place at the festival (Chhabra et al, 2003). They used a sample survey so as to measure how authentic the festival was perceived to be. According to Zerubavel (1995) in (Chhabra et al, 2003), in cultural tourism, creating authenticity depends on some act of reproducing. Ultimately the study discovered that it is indeed possible to create a high perception of

authenticity and that this is closely attached to the overall satisfaction of a visitor (Chhabra et al, 2003).

#### Heritage and cultural tourism as an economic and development strategy

Cultural tourism has been identified as one of the fastest growing industries in the global tourism economy and such is the case with South Africa as presented in the previous chapter (Novelli, 2015). Nkwanyana et al (2016), Novelli (2015) and Twining-Ward (2013) agree that the sub-Saharan region, which is rich in music, dance and art has untapped potential for inclusive growth and expansion in tourism. The use of heritage and cultural tourism as an economic stimulus is not a local phenomenon; for example, similar approaches can be seen in Australia. A project called The Queensland Heritage Trails Network was tasked to revitalize rural and regional Queensland economies through the creation of jobs and a sustainable tourism infrastructure (Cook, 2001). Silberberg (1995) states that in places like Canada and other parts of the world, developing tourism as an income generator has become a major objective of tourist operators and heritage institutions. This approach by heritage sites and museums, as Silberberg (1995) explains, was compelled by challenging economic times which required means to reduce operational expenses and increase revenue. To achieve this, these institutions have had to thoroughly review their operating policies and practices and place much more emphasis on customer service and packages among other things. According to Silberberg (1995), while remaining open to entrepreneurial approaches, these institutions have had to learn to strike a balance between their important mandates; namely their heritage preservation and their educational mandates.

Silberberg (1995) ultimately emphasizes that there are opportunities for continued cultural development that may be realized if particular focus is placed on heritage sites and museums

in urban settings. In order to achieve the above discussed profitability, Silberberg (1995) goes on to outline eight factors that he says attract tourists. These include customer service attitude, sustainability, perceived quality of the product, awareness, sustainability, convenience, management commitment and capability, community support and involvement (Silberberg, 1995). The practical approach and outlook on heritage and cultural tourism by Silberberg is characteristic of the broader economic beneficiation view of the heritage and cultural tourism industry.

According to Binns and Nel (2002), the increasing significance of tourism especially in the developing world is an important theme in development literature as it has now come to be regarded as the 'passport to development'. The small coastal resort of Still Bay, located in the Western Cape is seen to be a fitting example of local economic development driven by tourism (Binns and Nel, 2002). As a result of tourism promotion initiatives, this small town of about four hundred thousand people has experienced some economic growth and development (Binns and Nel, 2002). Kepe et al (2016) who conducted a study in Bethesda also reiterate similar points, of the capability of tourism to drive economic growth. However, this is not always the outcome of promotion initiatives in an area. Sharpley and Telfer (2002) in (Booysens, 2010), argue that the benefits of tourism usually do not trickle down to poor communities.

Binns and Nel (2002) make reference to Rogerson, who also focuses on tourism as a sector that can drive and foster development. Since the end of apartheid in South Africa, local economic development has become an important part of policy and policy making (Rogerson, 2002). Furthermore, despite the issues around local economic development having attracted the attention of policy making processes, the role of tourism as a leading sector for local economic development, according to Rogerson (2002), still remains a neglected theme. Rogerson studied the case of Highlands Meander in Mpumalanga, which is understood as a fitting example of a tourism-led Local Economic Development initiative in South Africa. This case included the

coming together and collaboration of five towns in their local economic development initiatives so as to promote the tourism products of the region. Rogerson (2002) states that the main discovery from this study was that the initiative was not benefitting local Black communities and thus the recommendation was for the development of a tourism initiative that would be pro-poor. Tourism based development is also said to be a highly important tool in the fight against poverty particularly in third world countries.

The fight against poverty in development regions, however, still remains a challenge, particularly in South Africa where race is a huge factor when it comes to business ownership in sectors like the tourism industry. For example, when Van der Merwe (2016) conducted a survey among cultural tourist guides and the demographics of the respondents were unevenly skewed towards the White population. The survey showed that the majority of the tourist guides that responded in the survey were married White males (63.2%). According to Van der Merwe (2016) the predominance of White male respondents could be a result of South Africa's racially demarcated internet access.

Still, under the economic developmental view of tourism, the 1996 Tourism White Paper emphasizes the importance of community involvement and participation in the process of creating pro-poor and developmental tourism. According to the World Travel & Tourism Travel cited in (Smith, 2019) tourism in South Africa contributed R425.8 billion towards the country's economy as well as 1.5 million jobs in 2018. It contributed 8.6% to the GDP and made South Africa the biggest tourism market on the African continent (Smith, 2019). The figures mentioned above show the economic potential of the tourism industry in South Africa. In the year 2010, there was a dramatic change in the shape of the global economy and the South African political landscape. According to the National Tourism Sector Strategy of 2011/12, this was during this period that the newly established National Department of Tourism saw its

first year of operation (Department of Tourism, 2011). The National Department of Tourism took steps to promote accelerated in the tourism sector one of them being a consultative process to gather data that would inform the focus of the strategy.

In a study of small firms in the tourism sector, Rogerson (2013) shows that the industry has great economic potential as asserted by government and various projections. He speaks of how in the year 2002 South Africa hosted the World Summit on Sustainable Development and how this signified a peaceful transition from apartheid to democracy; it signified potential racial harmony which would be an effective tool for international tourism. South Africa at the time, being the darling of the world, a leading African country in political maturity was expected to attract many international tourists who would come visit a country of profoundly rich history, aesthetic beauty and they would spend lots of money upon doing so.

Rogerson (2013) speaks of the employment intensive nature of the tourism industry and how this would be an effective economic stimulus particularly for the impoverished and unemployed population. Most interestingly, Rogerson (2013) states that the tourism industry is 95% White owned and that government sought to bring about transformation to the industry so that it represents the South African population. Furthermore, the legacy of racial inequality which was institutionalized by the National Party of the apartheid government still prevails 25 years into democracy. This, according Mputa (2016: 1) can be observed in the labour market where there exists racial inequality. This is true of the tourism industry, hence the critical race approach to the study. This inequality is enabled by failed implementation of transformative measures in the industry.

According to Goudie et al (1999) who are very critical of the tourism industry, including the heritage and cultural tourism sub-industry, argue that the industry has not progressed beyond apartheid. They also state that this can be seen through how most of the country's cultural

infrastructure such as museums and monuments, caters for the interests of the White minority. Furthermore, Goudie et al (1999) state that the transformation process in the tourism industry has the state's superficial support in the form of the green and White papers, in terms of tourism being a driver of development for previously disadvantaged groups. Though changes are there, they are minimal and ultimately not enough to make a significant improvement in the lives of the previously disadvantaged. The piece by Goudie et al (1999) is arguably one of very few, where race is a big theme in the analysis of the tourism sector. The racial perspective is the primary lens through which this study examines heritage and cultural tourism in the KZN province.

One of the most evidently common factors between the preservationist and developmental approaches is the psychology of community participation. This is the assertion that it is paramount for the community to support and take part in activities that are brought about by a touristic destination in order for it to succeed (Sdrali and Chazapi, 2007). Within the developmental approach, this means that locals must also form part of the market that buys and consumes the tourist products offered by a destination in their community. In terms of the preservationist approach, this means that the community must be active and willing participants in the protection of artifacts and cultural activities that the local destination may be selling. The lack of educational empowerment and training opportunities for previously neglected groups is, however said to be limiting participation in the sector. However, the participation of the locals and their cooperation with tourism stakeholders remains highly important in order for cultural tourism development to succeed (Sdrali and Chazapi, 2007). Though participation is a common factor between the two approaches discussed above, race, which is one of the most influential characteristics in the tourism sector, is still omitted, hence the critical race theoretical framework.

#### **Theoretical Framework**

Critical Race Theory (or CRT) recognises that several power structures are based on White privilege and White supremacy, which perpetuates the marginalization of people of colour (Modiri, 2012). It draws on the priorities and perspectives of both critical legal studies and conventional civil rights scholarship, while sharply contesting both of these fields. It is however not limited to one field or discipline, rather, as a tool to achieve true liberation from racism legitimately, it touches on any if not all spheres and subjects, including philosophy, law, and science and in this case even heritage and cultural tourism. Critical Race Theory as Modiri (2012) suggests, offers an intellectual and theoretical vocabulary of critique that can expose the role of the law in perpetuating and rationalizing unjust social hierarchies based on class, gender and race to name a few. Critical Race Theory will thus introduce a fresh approach towards looking at heritage and cultural tourism. It will bring out a not so common critique of the sector by focusing on the enduring centrality of race in the tourism sector. In order to achieve this, I begin by locating the relevant conception of race.

To define some conceptions of race, Maart (2015) makes reference to Cashmore et al. (1996) who speak of the conception that race is made up by the similarity of a population's anatomy, physical features, eye shape and colour, the type of hair and skin colour. Maart (2015) goes on to explain how this biological determinism is based on the belief that human beings behave the way they do because of their genes. Sociologists have, however, dismissed this argument, opting rather for the social construction theory. However, for the purposes of this study, the socio-political construction and race as a lived experience are adapted. This conception is best suited for this study and arguably more so in the context of South Africa because it perceives race as something that is experienced and that a person's racial identity is formed by the material conditions of domination and oppression prevalent in their society (Maart, 2015). This

conception is applicable to this study, as the lived experience of race will be displayed by the research participants in the fourth chapter where the research findings will be presented.

According to Modiri (2012), one of the central characteristics of racism is that it is normalized in the social order as an ingrained feature that seems covertly nuanced. Modiri (2012) argues that this notion is one of the foundational principles of Critical Race Theory. Writing from a legal perspective, Modiri goes on to explain that "White supremacy does not refer to rightwing extremist racist hate groups that consciously promote White domination, but rather denotes a system (political, legal, economic and cultural) in which Whites maintain overwhelming control and power" (Modiri, 2012,2). This is true of the tourism industry in South Africa, hence the use of Critical Race Theory in the analysis of findings of this study. Whites still maintain an overwhelming control and power over the tourism sector. What is more puzzling is that this power and control is to the extent that they dominate even the cultural and heritage tourism sector of the tourism industry. This includes destinations that sell, solely, the culture of Black people. This extent of domination suggests that structures that operated during apartheid, when White people were 'legally' favoured in every way possible, are still intact. The legacy of apartheid is at play in the sector, leaving Black people with the empty democratic achievement of political freedom.

According to Dladla (2017), yet another scholar that writes from a critical race perspective, the year of 1994 is falsely believed to have marked the end of White supremacy. Dladla (2017) argues that there is an irony in the nonracialism presented in the liberal constitution of the Republic of South Africa, particularly Act 108 of 1996. Dladla (2017) states that the nonracialism value sought to prevent the unjust use of power, yet the constitution itself still upholds and perpetuates White supremacy (Dladla, 2017). The problematic nature of the

constitution is how for example the preamble begins by saying 'We the people' which includes all South Africans regardless of race, ethnicity, religion or religion (Orgad, 2010). Dladla's point of departure is that on paper, this reads well, especially in the context of trying to create a non-racial and equal society, however the 'we' includes White people, whom in South Africa are the direct beneficiaries of the oppressive apartheid regime that the country is still trying to recover from. The constitution unjustly declares a clean slate for all racial groups, such that those with ill-gotten benefits get to keep them yet supposedly start afresh. This is partly why, there has been no adequate transformation in the tourism sector. The ill-gotten wealth with which several White South Africans were able to start tourism businesses is by constitution, left untouched, which automatically puts Black people at a disadvantaged position both as consumers and entrepreneurs in the tourism industry.

This point is demonstrated in Ngcoya's (2015) introduction of the concept of hyperapartheid, to document his experiences of the White dominated industry in various regions including St. Lucia, KZN. Using this critical race lens, he draws from these experiences, particularly at Oumas B&B in Saint Lucia as a tourist, to take us through the very distinct separation of roles between the Blacks and Whites in tourism business (Ngcoya, 2015). The main discovery was that White people tend to be owners and managers who employ Black workers. This trend can be seen in most parts of the country.

#### Conclusion

Critical race theory as a theoretical framework was useful in this study. Though it originates from legal discipline in the U.S.A, it proved to be relevant and perfectly applicable to this study. Its multi-disciplinary nature as explained earlier equipped my study with an intended racial lens through which I sought to analyse the heritage and cultural tourism industry while

still acknowledging and applying other approaches as well, namely the preservationist and developmental approaches.

# **CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

#### Introduction

This chapter describes the methodology that undergirds this dissertation and the methods used to conduct the research. It also discusses the influences that informed my choice of the study area, the research design, collection of data and its analysis. The study adopted a non-probabilistic purposive sampling method where the participants of the study were direct employees of the cultural village who have first-hand experience in working in the sector. Data was collected through in-depth interviews which focus primarily on the role played by race in

such a setting. Furthermore, data was collected through observation and participation in the cultural tour, which is an integral part of the touristic experience on top of the natural scenery. Using the thematic analysis method, the data is then analyzed, under themes, some of which emerged during the data collection process. The chapter finally addresses ethical issues and states some of the challenges that arose during the fieldwork.

The primary objective of the study was to examine the role of race in a sector deemed highly capable of reducing poverty and bringing about development. The research questions used with the aim of achieving the above-mentioned overall objective are as follows:

- 1. What is the racial composition of the heritage and cultural tourism industry at the establishment?
- a. In what ways does the manner in which the site is presented (language and physical appearance and design) show the influence of White dominance, if at all?
- b. How does race shape the role of different players (tourists, workers) in the heritage and culture tourism sector?
- 2. How is economic value racially determined in the heritage and cultural tourism sector and why?
- a. How does race and racism play a role in the employment and ownership structures of the establishment?
- 3. How do Black and White participants in the industry experience and perceive the sector?
- 4. Why is it important to transform the tourism sector into a more equitable industry?

#### **Research Methodology**

According to Antwi and Hamza (2015), methodology is the way in which a researcher goes about conducting a systematic inquiry into a phenomenon that he or she may be investigating.

The nature of this study is primarily qualitative as it focuses on the experiences of the participants, which in this case was the staff of the cultural village as well my observations upon visiting the site. As Dooley (2002:336) states, "a researcher who embarks on a case study research is usually interested in a specific phenomenon and wishes to understand it completely not by controlling variables, but rather by observing all the variables and their interacting relationship". Furthermore, according to Bunn and Kendall (2011), when doing case study research, the data collection which may involve several sources of rather dense information like unstructured interviews, participant observation and life histories, ought to be in-depth. It is important to note that the methods chosen will vary depending on the research paradigm informing the study.

This qualitative study employed a critical paradigm in order to fulfil its objectives. The purpose of enquiry in the critical paradigm requires the researcher to be the instigator and facilitator that possesses an understanding of the transformation that needs to happen (Guba and Lincoln 1994). In this case, the understanding I possess as a Black South African citizen for needed transformation are the long overdue structural changes that need to happen in the tourism industry to make it more racially equitable. Furthermore, this paradigm was fitting because the study itself critiques the perpetuation of White dominance in a sector where it is often overlooked. The paradigm also involves advocacy and activism.

A critical paradigm was also appropriate because of the theoretical and qualitative nature of this study. The study critiques an intangible phenomenon in the tourism sector which cannot be measured in numerical terms, hence the critical paradigm. Additionally, this approach was fitting because the sought to address issues, as outlined under the objectives, which can broadly be said to be injustices. Similarly, as Modiri (2012) argues for the law to be formulated with

race being its epicenter in the South African context, the theoretical framework of this study advocates for race to be the principal sphere under which the heritage and cultural tourism industry is analyzed. The critical paradigm was thus appropriate since the study sought to argue that the dominant approaches towards heritage and cultural tourism are not nearly sufficient since they tend to overlook race, which is arguably the most crucial factor in the sector. A critical paradigm further advanced the purpose of this study, which was partly to advocate for the urgent need to contribute towards a pool of knowledge in tourism particularly through a racial lens. Lastly, the paradigm gave me the opportunity to highlight and condemn racial injustices which largely characterize the tourism industry yet go by unaddressed, in economic, political and even academic spheres. To critique racism in this case, the collection of data through interviews with people who function in the industry either as employees, managers or owners of cultural or heritage touristic destinations was a necessary and integral part of this study.

In order to capture the narratives of the workers of the cultural village, I used semi-structured interviews to hear about their experience. According to Modiri (2012: 19), "Narrative is useful in opening up discursive spaces for previously silenced voices to participate in public life and also to demonstrate how constructions of social reality can be deconstructed and altered." Hence, semi-structured interviews helped me get more insight into how the staff really felt about the racial factors on their side and surrounding community. The participants expressed contentment with my approach as it gave them the chance to somewhat vent about experiences and issues that they had never gotten to address or address effectively. They even shared with me that the previous researcher, who once came to interview them about cultural tourism, was not so in-depth, that instead he set questions with options and made them tick boxes for answers. Therefore they never got to express themselves since that research was more statistical

and cared very little for their opinion and narratives I was therefore able to find more information from the participants due to the nature of this approach.

Interestingly, an unintended opportunity for the attainment of even more findings arose when the study participants visited the city of Durban where I live and study. Having gotten along so well with them when I initially visited their place of work, we had exchanged contacts when I left the cultural village, so that I could contact them if ever I needed to ask further questions considering how our time together was to an extent limited. One of the participants contacted me with excitement in her tone, to let me know that they were coming to visit Durban for the day and that they would love to see me. Upon meeting up with them along the beachside, where they were leisured for the day, I made some compelling discoveries which I discuss with more detail in the fifth chapter.

#### **Study Area**

My study was focused on one of the Zulu cultural villages, located just outside of Pietermaritzburg. The recreated homestead has five traditional huts that can each accommodate a maximum of four people. On the website through which it is advertised, it is stated that since it is an authentic experience of Zulu culture, there is no electricity (Safarinow, 2018). Cooking is done with firewood, light comes from paraffin lamps and the rooms do not have en-suite bathrooms.

This part of the UMgungundlovu District Municipality which covers Pietermaritzburg and surrounding areas is fairly stable, politically and socially, making it a relatively safe and conducive area within where to conduct research. The area is predominantly Zulu speaking, which was an advantage when it came to conducting interviews and communicating with the employees of the cultural village.

#### **Sampling**

To fulfil the objectives of this study, a purposive sampling approach was adopted. The purposive sampling method, which is also known as judgmental sampling is a non-random technique which involves the researcher choosing a participant because of the qualities that they possess (Tongco, 2007). For the purpose of this study, the informant preferably had to be one that could relate some of their experiences to the subject matter and ultimately bring forth insights that otherwise would not have been found from other people. The manager of the cultural village made it clear that I could only stay one night since I was there for research purposes. He explained that the industry is seasonal and that it was not possible for the establishment to organize a tour for me alone, but rather that I would have to come when there were visitors so as to observe as I intended and see the establishment functioning. He also agreed for me to interview the staff but rendered himself very busy for an interview. He preferred his participation to be the casual conversations around the fire and the tour around the Zulu homestead which also taught a lot about Zulu history, practices and traditions.

On that particular weekend during which I was granted permission to briefly visit, there were only five staff members present and the manager. Though I had initially intended to interview a minimum of eight people, the availability of the sample population in this case was a factor. The five participants, however, proved to be more than enough as there were clear signs of data saturation by the time I interviewed the fourth participant. Data saturation, according to Fusch and Ness (2015), occurs when there is enough information to replicate the study when an opportunity to add more participants has been availed.

Some critics could argue that the number of my study participants was too small to make any meaningful conclusions. However, there are numerous classic studies that convincingly show that a small number of participants in a research project of this nature is not an obstacle. Baker

and Edwards (2012) wrote a review paper upon which qualitative research experts were asked how many qualitative interviews are enough for a study. Some responses from the participants expressed that in some cases even one or two interviews, as seen in several classic studies in sociology, can produce great results. Furthermore, in a study about challenges and successes experienced by women street traders in Cape Town, Sassen et al (2018) state that though their study focused on a small group of women (five), it was able to provide very meaningful insights into the complex relationship between street trading and well-being. Therefore, in the case of this study, though participants are seemingly few, the information they gave would not suddenly vary drastically if more participants were added.

#### **Data Collection Methods**

This study, as mentioned above, used qualitative research methods. Conducting research in this fashion places emphasis on social occurrences and the development of explanations (Hancock, 2007). An ethnographic approach characterised most components of the research process of this study. This approach is suitable because according to Nurani (2008, 1), "Ethnography also relies on observations of interactions and interviews with participants in naturally occurring situation."

In order to answer the main questions of the study, it was of paramount importance to do research at the cultural site through interviews, observation and the use of websites. According to Nurani (2008) the primary objective of observing is to capture the perspective of the observed participants. The consumption of the heritage and cultural products and packages offered by the site (for example presentations and guided tours) was therefore highly instrumental in the observation process of how the site functions. This study undertook what Wiersma and Latham (1986) in Nurani (2008) call structured interviewing which have pre-

determined questions. Among those that were interviewed were primarily the working staff. It was necessary to get different perspectives on the White supremacy issue in the sector from different participants as this will make the findings more dynamic and authentic.

.

Question	Evidence needed	Method of collecting
		evidence
1. Does the manner in	The narratives and personal	Semi-Structured interviews
which the site is presented	perspectives of the	Online website and pamphlet
(language and physical	interviewees.	
appearance and design) show		
any influence of White		
dominance?		
2. Is it a normal	A summary of demographic	Observation of setting and
phenomenon that Whites	records of tourists that visit	participants
tend to be the tourists while	the site and those that work	Documents on the sites
Blacks are the workers in	on the site if available.	visitors, or a summary
tourist attractions?		thereof from the
		management of the heritage
		site.

3. Why is it important	The narratives and personal	Semi-Structured interviews
to transform the heritage and	perspectives of the workers.	
cultural tourism sector into a		
racially just industry?		

Figure 1: Data collection plan

#### **Challenges**

Conducting research in this particular cultural village meant travelling from Durban, where I am based at the UKZN Howard College Campus, to Pietermaritzburg the capital city of KwaZulu-Natal. This is because the cultural village is located twenty seven kilometers outside of the city. One of the main challenges was finding the most cost effective transport to get there. My lack of familiarity with Pietermaritzburg inevitably set me aside as an easy target. Indeed the Taxify driver switched off the GPS without my awareness, and slowly drove into a township and claimed that that was the place I had been looking for. Calmly, I asked him to follow the GPS precisely and not follow his instincts which had taken us to the wrong place. The trip to the incorrect location was to the charge of one hundred and eighty Rands before we started following the GPS which would eventually lead us to the correct place. As we drove to the cultural village, tarred road eventually ran out and the driver was shocked as he had never had a client send him on gravel road before. The charge of the second trip was R 302. Furthermore, I had challenges in explaining some of the concepts in Zulu, for the participants of the study. For example, explaining to the participants what I meant by the term 'transformation' in the socioeconomic and political context of South Africa was not easy as

there is no single term in the Zulu language that is equally pregnant with meaning and can be used as a direct translation.

The most challenging part of this study was finding a cultural village or heritage site. It became apparent, when I approached the relevant places around Durban that the topic with which I was approaching was causing some anxiety and discomfort. The manager of one of the most prominent cultural villages in Durban, a White man, was alarmed from the onset upon reading the topic of this study. Using email to communicate with the manager, I politely explained to him that in order for me to carry out the research, I would kindly need a gatekeeper's letter, which in this case would come from an official authority on the tourist attraction, granting me permission to conduct research on their site. I went on to even draft a template that he could easily follow when he drafts the letter. I made sure to indicate in the email that the letter had to contain the official letterhead and stamp of the business for the Ethical Clearance Committee to approve the research. He then requested that I send him my interview guide which I was going to use when speaking to staff members and reachable management. Upon seeing the interview guide the tone of our conversation began to change to a somewhat more defensive one. He responded by explaining that the business, which sells Zulu culture, is White owned and has been operational for 25 years. He went on to state, in the email, that their business employs up to 70 staff, the majority of whom are African and have little education. Apparently, most of the staff at his cultural village cannot speak English, hence the need to check and approve the questionnaire first. His elaborate response was already suspicious considering that he was suggesting that the questions be modified so that they may be grasped by the staff, who are not educated and cannot speak English. He then went on to express that he wished to speak to my supervisor directly, as I seemingly was not doing a good job in justifying my topic and approach.

My supervisor explained to him that the study was only sampling his destination to speak to the industry at large and that it was not an attempt to expose and bash his business for sport. After not responding for almost three weeks, my supervisor and I probed to find out if he had made his considerations about our study. He then responded and apologized for not being responsive, saying it had altogether slipped his mind. His final verdict was, as he put it:

Unfortunately I will not be taking part in your survey due to the type of questions you will be asking my staff. I am happy that you interview me but not my Zulu village staff. I have explained in previous e-mails my reasoning. I am shocked that you feel is reasonable to ask staff who do not need any education at all and do not speak any English what their opinion is on the finances of the business. During my studies leading questions such as presented would not have been allowed (White manager of a cultural heritage site in Durban, email communication, 11 September 2018).

His ultimate response was that he would be glad to be the one that is interviewed instead of his Zulu village staff. His efforts to keep me away from the staff at the Zulu village left me concerned about the unjustifiable secrecy.

Frankly, the manager of this particular site went out of his way to dodge me because he felt uncomfortable with my approach to the topic, arguably because it may have portrayed him or made him feel that he plays a questionable role in the perpetuation of racial inequality in the tourism industry. His reasoning for refusing me access to the Zulu cultural village staff was very condescending and overbearing. His stance was, that I cannot interview the staff, basically because they do not have the capacity to formulate an opinion on the finances of the business because they were not educated and because they do not speak English. This is despite the fact that I am a fluent Zulu speaker, with an openly Zulu surname. Though his focus was seemingly on the questions about the finances of the business, his charged refusal seemed fueled by a lot

more than what he communicated. In his messages, he left me to connect the dots of his overall fragmented message, which was that, it would not be good for the business, to have it clearly known that staff whose culture is being sold might not be happy about being in the lowest social and economic bracket of the destination under his leadership. It was 'inappropriate' for me to ask a White-owned business which employs Black people, about transformation and racism, because that clearly would have triggered racial issues that are most likely not dealt with. The overly defensive behaviour of this manager suggested that there are several issues that he would rather remain hidden and unknown. Speaking to the Black staff at the Zulu cultural village would have been out of his control and even censorship. As someone that is concerned about the racial inequity characterizing the tourism industry, the reaction of this particular manager left me certain that there is a conscious perpetuation of White domination.

#### **Conclusion**

The fieldwork, as explained above was a challenging task, logistically and financially, however the process was altogether successful. The participants of the study played a critical role in this study, by opening up and speaking freely during the interviews. It was their openness in the interviews that made the next chapter, a very captivating read of lived experiences by workers in an industry which intentionally places them in a disadvantageous position because of their skin colour.

# CHAPTER 4: DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS

#### Introduction

Following research methodology presented in the previous chapter, this chapter presents and analyses the collected data. The study adopted a thematic analysis method to analyze the findings. Fieldwork took place on the 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> of November 2018 at Zulu cultural village. The homestead was established by a White man, who is said to have had a deep love and awe for Zulu culture hence he built a small Zulu hut in which he stayed for a while before turning it into a homestead. He eventually left the homestead and went on to persue his ancestral calling to become a sangoma (healer/diviner). He left the business in the hands of the current manager to look after. The aim of the study was to investigate from a critical perspective, the racial implications of tourism, more specifically heritage and cultural tourism. The main focus was on cultural villages that sell culture of the people of local ethnicity, the Zulus in this case. To recap, the overriding objective of the study is to interrogate the role played by race in a sector deemed highly capable of reducing poverty and bringing about development.

As I indicated in the previous chapter, I initially sought to interview at least eight participants. This however, could not happen as there were only five employees working on the tourist attraction on the weekend that I was allowed to come do my research. Another vital component of the data collection process was observing, which was most suitable during the tour around the homestead that all visitors get. During this tour, the manager shared some extensive knowledge on Zulu culture and what makes it so interesting. During the entire fieldtrip, several themes emerged, some which I had not anticipated. Though the findings are not a representative sample of the broader sector, they reveal common trends and practices in similar establishments.

Themes that emerged during the fieldwork process:

- Reasons why employees work in the sector
- Race and racism
- Business ownership
- Transformation
- Ownership
- Economic beneficiation and community development
- Government policy
- Commodification of Zulu Culture

# Reasons why employees work in the sector

To ease the participants into an open discussion, I started off by asking them to share what has motivated them to work at the cultural village, how long they had worked there and why they continue to work there. This was to give me an idea of their perception of their job and why they go about it in the manner that they do whilst also putting them at ease at the beginning of the interview. The common factor in their responses suggests that unemployment and poverty are the main motivations for them to work in the sector:

I have worked here for about... a year and a half. Hey, the Zulu lifestyle here is great.

Like, even the food we eat here is not Western cuisine, we eat Zulu cuisine and the lifestyle here is less costly. We rarely go to the city, in the city you have to pay rent and

for electricity. But here we do not pay for electricity we collect firewood for warmth and cooking (Participant 1, Male aged 24).

The first participant seemed more positive and established a sense of contentment about working cultural village from the very beginning of the interview. His motivation to work and continue working at this destination was seemingly not driven by the need to have a livelihood like the other participants who responded to the same question as follows:

Well, let me see, let me count... it has been 4 years, what is important is for me to make money of course, and to know about other types of work. Also I need money to support my children and to support my parents. (Participant 2, Female aged 24).

The third participant opened up without any hesitation and told a summary of her heartfelt life story which ties into why she works at cultural village:

Sengisebenze la, iminyaka ewu 20. Ngangidinga umsebenzi, ngingawutholi futhi ke kungekho nokunye. Ngangidinga imali ikhakhulukazi emuva kokuba isoka lami langishiya ngikhulelwe ingane yethu. Kwakungekho muntu engangingalushiya naye usana lwami, kodwa ke hlanhla leyo, bangivumela la ukuthi ngize ngizohlala naye khona ngisebenza. Izinto zazingcono kabi kusasekhona uAJ, isangoma somlungu. Yena wayenomusa bandla, wayethengela ngisho nengane yami ubisi. Emuva kokuhamba kwakhe, ngazama ukuthola elinye itoho ngoba cha kwakungasemnandi kahle hle. Ngiyamuziba

lomphathi osiphethe manje yize enakho ukubamuncu ngoba phela ngidinga ukusebenzela abantwana bami.<sup>1</sup>

The next participant wasted no time before expressing his lack of happiness in the job, when he was also asked about the length of his tenure at cultural village and what had motivated him to continue working there. He was the youngest participant and had worked at the cultural village for the shortest period compared to the other participants:

I started working here in March this year, which is about 9 months now. I continue working here because there are no work opportunities. When I got the call to come work here, it was a good chance for me because there was nothing else I could do, even though I am very unhappy with nature of this work versus its pay, I still do it. (Participant 4, Male aged 21).

The next participant seemed displeased right from the beginning of the interview, but he also briefly expressed that he took this job because he was in need and was ultimately not finding work:

I have been working here since the year 2012 and I have stayed really because I have no better option. (Participant 5, Male in his 30s)

#### Race and racism

The participants were then asked to share their knowledge and experiences if any, of racism and race issues in the industry. Their responses varied, with some showing some reluctance to

43

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> I have been working here for a full twenty years. I needed a job and money especially after my lover left me pregnant to raise our child. I could not leave my new born anywhere and they were kind enough to allow me to bring him to work. Things were the best with CJ, the White sangoma owner. He was very kind, he would even buy my baby formula. After he left, it was only then that I started to look for other jobs because things were not so nice here since he left. I ignore and let go of all the negativity form the current manager because, I know I have to work for my kids. (Participant 3, Female in her 40s).

speak about race and racism whilst others had a lot to say on the topic. The question was phrased as follows: Some people say that there is a race problem in the tourism sector. What is your take on this?

The first participant continued to answer carefully, making sure that he highlights the positive side in every topic I brought up. This was consistent with his contentment as a worker at the cultural village, which he had asserted from the beginning of the interview:

No, I personally would not say that they racially discriminate against us, we as Zulu people also have that thing but ultimately when you treat a White person right, they also treat you right, that is just how it is and how there is no discrimination and here, there is no racial discrimination. (Participant 1, Male aged 24)

### Another participant responded and stated:

Well, from my understanding racism is like when White people dislike Black people. It is when White people take Black people as fools who know nothing and not as people who are just like them. Yeah, it does happen that some have some racial discrimination when some feel superior and all of that, but most visitors that have come here have never been racist towards us. However, when I have visited other places I have felt some racism because I am of this colour. (Participant 2, Female aged 24)

She elaborated and went on to make sense of her experience:

It has not happened here that we experience racism. Perhaps they don't have a problem with us because they come here to learn about our culture anyway. So maybe that has an impact. (Participant 2, Female aged 24).

The next participant expressed somewhat similar sentiments to those of the previous participant when it came to issues of race:

I won't lie, in this place we treat everyone equally as visitors. And we do our best to make sure that every visitor leaves this place happy. However, sometimes the manager does a bit of that thing...you know, our boss, yes but us the workers we treat all the visitors equally with respect. The thing is that, when the White people come visit here, they never discriminate against us. They say they even wish to name their streets in their home countries after us. As for the manager, I guess he must shout at us because he is the boss, I don't know. I guess it is just because we work for him so it is acceptable. (Participant 3, Female in her 40s).

The next participant on the other hand gave an elaborate response to the same question and said:

I think that its wrong, you know, after all, we are all people created to live together peacefully in the world. If anything though, it is now us Black people being racist to other Blacks, the non-South African, African Blacks. With the Boers, the racism has gone down actually. Here, eish ... well ... I would say that there is definitely some racism in the manner which our manager treats us. He really lives in the past that one hey. He sees Black people as animals that he can tell to piss off as he pleases. We hold on and tolerate this because we really need the money. (Participant 4, Male aged 21)

He went on to suggest that in order to end racism, governments need to sit down and talk things through and establish agreements that will ensure that racism is eradicated. He explained that there are different types of racism; African to African, White to African and vice versa. His overall sentiment was that governments must 'put their heads together' to solve this problem.

This topic seemed to have triggered the next participant who went on to give the most elaborate and emotive response to the same question about race and racism in the sector:

Well, I would say that there is no racism from the visitors but from the White manager yes. I mean he has gone as far as to say that Black people don't know anything, they are stupid. Hai, it is a big problem especially from our White manager really. He interferes in everything we do as though we are unable to think for ourselves. Did you know that he makes us work overtime and on weekends but refuses to pay us? However, he does not forget to take his rent from our salaries though. (Participant 4, in his 30s)

I listened very attentively as he spoke and he continued in the same tone, citing his experience and treatment which he regarded as blatant racism from his very own White boss.

Yes, we actually pay rent to stay here on site and guard this place, imagine! And you see this fridge... we had to organize it for ourselves and power it ourselves with some gas. He calls us during our off days to go sort out work related problems like a dead goat somewhere, but he still has the audacity to make us rent to stay here. You see the food that was being eaten last night? Well yes, when the visitors are eating he tells us to dish up and eat along, in true Zulu style, which is communal, but he actually complains afterwards and uses it as ammunition against us. That is why I no longer eat that food. His display of kindness for staff in front of the visitors is all for show.

You eat that food, then he comes and bothers you about if afterwards. When AJ was still here we never had such problems. AJ has no bad vibes, he is a good man that does not discriminate against anyone for anything. The problem is the current manager, and he is too far gone, he will never come right. Ah no, never.

This is someone whom when you get into an argument with, tells you to leave without even paying you what is due to you. I avoid him because I always get into a fight with him. There were times when he allowed us to sell some items to visitors to make some extra cash for ourselves, but when he started to notice that it was now going well, he did not like it and basically put a stop to it. However, when they are buying things from him, the visitors, it is fine. So there is no way for us to try and uplift ourselves. (Participant 5, in his 30s).

Still under the race and racism subtopic, participants were asked to comment on the racial composition of the staff at the cultural village. They responded as follows:

At this cultural village, they only hire Black people and it's because we can handle Blacks. This is effective definitely because a White person will not know anything about Zulu culture. And with regard to the whole racism thing, I think that when you work together, there won't be much racial discrimination. If you spoke badly perhaps to a White person, it is best to sit down and talk about the issue instead of being enraged, especially us Black people. It is best to sit down and talk things through. (Participant 1, Male aged 24).

Another participant gave some insight as to why the cultural village only hires Black people:

The reason why it is only Black people is because we hold the culture. Many people no longer know their culture, they are now living like White people. White people come here to learn about Black culture and heritage. Also, the wealthy Black people that grew up like White people come here to learn about their own culture. So that is why Black people are hired here, they know all about being Zulu and Shaka Zulu as well. (Participant 2, Female aged 24)

The next participant responded expressing a similar sentiment:

All employees are Black Zulu speaking people, not any other kind. Maybe in future there will be others but in my experience it has always been Black people. When it comes to management, all of them are White. (Participant 4, Male aged 21)

The next participant on the other hand was once again triggered by this question as he went to explain how the hiring of Black people to do this kind of work was feeding into the racism he was aggrieved. This a summary of what was a very elaborate and emotive response to the question about the racial composition of staff at the cultural village:

Well, they only hire Black Zulu speaking people, particularly from Msinga. This place is managed and owned by White people alone. No, it is just Black people, Zulu people that work here. Many yes have left, from Msinga. And they clearly state that they leave because they cannot stand the bad treatment from the manager.

Oh yes! With this guy, even if you are a patient person, he will push you to breaking point! Just last month there was drama here. Right at the thick of service with many students visiting us, one of the workers woke up, packed her bags and left. He threatened to call the police on her to stop her from leaving. We said to him he must indeed call the cops so that we can tell them that exactly why she is leaving because he was at fault.

Yes, the poor girl was actually in a lot of pain because her boyfriend had recently died and he was just teasing her about it as though it was nothing while the girl was still in mourning and hurting. "Your boyfriend is gone, he is dead. Your boyfriend left you". Who does that to someone that has just lost a loved one? He is very unpleasant. He shouts all the time in a very degrading manner.

He even starts shouting from the moment he comes out the car when he arrives.

When you don't know him, you would think this White man is good whereas he is not. (Participant 5, Male in his 30s)

To get a sense of who the market of this cultural village is, I asked the participants to comment on the racial composition of their visitors and they briefly responded as follows:

Hai, it is a perfect mix and balance of all races hey, yes. (Participant 3, Female in her 40s)

Another participant made some sense of the racial composition and went on to state that the manager has a preferred racial demographic when it comes to visitors:

Personally I would say our visitors are made up of a balanced mix of races, even though we can tell that this White manager does not like it when too many Zulu people come visit; he ends up not even giving them the Zulu cultural tour properly. He is not a good man at all because he still has the apartheid mentality. He only treats other White people like him with some decency. (Participant 4, aged 21)

The next participant also reiterated that they cater to a racially diverse market:

Well it is very rare that we get Indians, yes, but we get a mix of visitors especially when it is a school visit. However we also get a lot of White visitors and sometimes Black, it varies. (Participant 5, in his 30s)

The race and racism subtopic had varied responses with some in agreement and others in conflict. Besides the one participant who seemed content with the state of affairs at the cultural village and in the sector in general, the other participants who did not have much to say about

race and racism seemed somewhat unbothered by it. Their main focus was on doing the best they can under the circumstances so that they could make their money and hopefully remain in the good books of their boss. They did not want to cause any trouble for others and themselves by being rebellious or expressing a lot of negativity about their work and place of work. In another sense, they expressed that racism was the least of their concerns as they had bigger problems to worry about, such as the state of their children who live far away from them. One of the participants, the oldest employee among them spoke affectionately about her beloved sons whom she was raising alone without the help of their father. She was distraught by how her salary and the nature of her work do not allow her to send her children to private schools so that they could have a brighter future. She was just glad to have a job where she could at least make enough to send a bit of money home. The aggrieved participants, however, got somewhat emotional as they spoke of how their suffering is tied to them being exploited because they are Black and desperate for work. With the one participant, I even abandoned the brief semi-structure under which I had planned to steer the interview as he was expressing himself freely without being probed. Ultimately the overall findings under this subtopic were alarming and clearly showed racially fueled oppression.

#### **Ownership**

I then asked the participants how the racial composition of the management of the cultural village looked and their responses were all in agreement; that the place if fully White owned:

They are all White. Management and ownership. Yes, they are all White. (Participant 1, Male aged 24)

### Another one explained:

Yes they are all White and they are important because they hire uneducated people. So he is there to translate for White tourists as the Black workers share

knowledge in Zulu. Even the Black visitors who do not know Zulu, need the White translator for them because the Black workers are not educated nor are they fluent in English. (Participant 2, Female aged 24)

### **Transformation**

In South Africa, a country with a dark history of apartheid, transformation has formed a considerable part of post-apartheid discourse by government. Ultimately this is to say that the various institutions private and public and different sectors in the economy must change to become more racially equitable and representative. Rakate (2005) states that transformation, according to the White Paper on the Transformation of Public Service (Notice 1227 of 1995), was defined as being a dramatic, focused and relatively short-term process, designated to fundamentally reshape the public service for its appointed role in the new dispensation in South Africa (Winchester & Bach, 1999). It was important to therefore ascertain whether this sentiment was familiar or even applied at this cultural village. Furthermore, as explained in previous chapters, government places much emphasis on the role that tourism ought to play in the lives of the previously disadvantaged groups. The participants were thus asked about changes that they may have observed at the village and the industry at large:

I have not really seen any measures of transformation in this place. I wouldn't say something has been done here to make this place more racially equitable.

(Participant 1, Male aged 24)

### Another participant said:

I would say yes there have been some changes. The main change is that through good experiences and word of mouth form previous visitors, more visitors come through. Therefore, it means this place promotes culture and heritage and that is a good change. This place can be seen as an exemplary pioneer of

transformation in the sector because there can be changes that can help us for moving forward. That's what I would say. (Participant 2, Female aged 24).

Most of the participants reiterated that there have not been any real changes:

There has been no change in that, it is all Black people. Some have left of course when they found better jobs, but it remains Black people working here.

(Participant 3, Female in her 40s)

This village has been a good example in the mixing of different races as different kinds of people come here to visit. It has made strides in mixing people of different races. (Participant 4, Male aged 24).

The participants did not have much to say about transformation. They simply felt that there had not been any significant changes that could be regarded as transformation. Racially, things remain the same with the staff being Black Zulus whilst management is White.

#### Economic beneficiation and community development

Arguably, for tourism to fulfil its developmental mandate, it would have to improve the lives of the people surrounding its base. This is because development, as defined by Boateng et al (2008), can be considered as the objective of moving to a state relatively better than what previously existed: "good change" as defined by Chambers (1997). I therefore asked the participants what the surrounding community benefits from the cultural village as a striving local business:

Eish, well here at this place, yes they do benefit because when we have colleges with over a hundred students then we source the help of community members to

come help us and they do get paid. Anyway most can't really be hired because they are not Zulu and they don't know Zulu culture and they are not from this area. However, I have not seen things such as infrastructure, no, but I think that allowing the local school to come here for free is one way in which we give back to the community. (Participant 1, Male aged 24).

### Another participant explained:

Well our White manager has brought children form the nearby school to feed them, teach them and give them the Zulu culture experience all for free. When French visitors come here, they also go to the impoverished local school and give then children some pens and pencils, etc. Unfortunately though, the local community has not benefitted in terms of work opportunities. (Participant 2, Female aged 24).

She went on to explain why it is that the locals do not get hired at the tourist destination:

We are from the deep rural and the people around here behave a bit ghetto whilst the manager always says that he only wants to hire people from the deep rural areas, who are truly proud of their Zulu culture. After all, there are no places like this. There are perhaps in Durban but they are not like this one. They have many western influences, whilst we are very authentic here. We do not even have electricity here, we show the real life of the ancient Zulus. So it is a good influence because it teaches children about how there wasn't even electricity in the past and the types of dwellings that were used. (Participant 2, Female aged 24).

Another participant briefly responded:

There is hardly any surrounding community actually...yes. Giving back, like letting people come stay free of charge ... it does happen yes. The local school was once welcomed here for free, they got a tour, food and a Zulu experience. (Participant 3, Female in her 40s)

The next participant also cited the same visit with school children as being a community benefit:

Unfortunately, no, I don't think we give back in any way no. Well actually... when it comes to community benefits, this cultural village allows the children of the local to come here for free as a way of rewarding them somewhat. So the children come here and have fun but also they learn more about their culture. We are not White, we are Zulu and so the knowledge that the young ones get is important for their development and identity. (Participant 4, Male aged 21)

Ultimately as it can be seen by the responses above, the existence of the cultural village as a touristic business has not brought tangible benefits or development to the surrounding community. All participants made reference to the free school visit by the local school as the best example of some form of giving back to the community. The locals do not get employment opportunities nor do they share in any of the infrastructure that may have come about as a result of the existence of the cultural village.

## **Government policy**

I then tried to get a sense of the participants' sentiments about their remuneration. I recalled a conversation between myself, the manager and two German tourists that were also guests

where the manager had explained to the Germans that the workers get paid in accordance to the requirements of the government about working conditions and wages. He stressed that they did not have the liberty to exploit employees financially or in any other way. The participants were asked to share their opinions on this. The first participant as always, responded consistently with his contentment as a worker at the cultural village: It is quite clear from the responses above, that the employees have different feelings regarding their remuneration:

Indeed the requirements of government are met here at the cultural village because when the money goes up he tells and then he indeed increases our pay at the end of the month. Here, when the place gets really busy and we have to put in extra work, the manager does have a way of rewarding us for our efforts. (Participant 1, Male aged 24)

The other participants, however, did not quite agree with the above sentiment. One stated:

Not exactly all the time I think. He should abide to the laws of the government though and even if he cheats us, we don't really know. But I don't think he meets government standards when it comes to our wages, however, we really need the money so we stay. (Participant 2, Female aged 24).

Another participant sighed and responded:

Hey my child, we don't know hey. Even when we feel cheated. He is the boss, so we go by what he says. (Participant 3, Female in her 40s).

Another respondent angrily said:

No, I don't think that the government requirements are met at all, no that can't be correct. Can you imagine working so hard, tirelessly till there is no bit of energy left in your body, only for the manager to say at the end of the day that

he is not going to pay you for that day? Like we worked Saturday and Sunday and we are not getting paid for it. We tried to fight this but it was just like we were playing. Also, the owner of the neighbouring farm told our manager that he does not pay his workers sometimes. Our manager was then happy and felt validated in not paying us. Firstly we rent to stay here. Yes, we pay rent to guard their place imagine. When we try fight it, ah it's useless. For us, justice would be a chance to speak to institutions like the department of labour and so on, but we are don't have any knowledge on how to get to such offices. But we really need help in this situation. (Participant 4, Male aged 21).

#### **Commodification of the Zulu Culture**

With the help of some of the staff members, the manager gives a very intriguing tour around the homestead after what can be called a well-structured lesson on the chronology of Zulu royalty. The extensive knowledge and information which the manager displayed during the tour was impressive and this raised the question as to how this is achieved. I then asked the participants if they could locate the source of the extensive knowledge on Zulu culture that is delivered by the White manager during the tour. I also asked if the source of this knowledge was acknowledged or compensated:

I think he gets that information from the elderly women from Msinga and he has sent some money to them to say thank you for teaching him Zulu culture; these women also worked here. (Participant 1, Male aged 24)

### Another respondent said:

Well, the person that he actually learnt from is the Sangoma, AJ who was behind it all. So this manager learnt from him. (Participant 3, in her 40s)

### One participant also added:

He basically gets it from us the Zulu people actually. I don't think the Zulu people get any sort of compensation for their culture being sold though, no. Ah never! Benefits? You would never get them here at this place.

The next participant responded with dissatisfaction:

He learnt most things from AJ the Sangoma, now he is really well informed. Actually the real leader of this place is AJ. He is the one that knows much about Zulu culture, hence he even became a Sangoma. His upbringing was within Black Zulu people and even his Zulu speaking is fluent, very impressive, like I mean real Zulu. When he speaks to other White people he even forgets and actually speaks to them in Zulu. Speaking of those changes you mentioned, perhaps we may have seen positive changes but with this current manager, never! Even the thought of his arrival on the site makes one upset really, because we know he is coming to shout and belittle us. However we need the money, but it's tough and many have quit. (Participant, Male in his 30s)

The Zulu tour given by the manager involves a thorough talk through about the traditional Zulu homestead and why it is built in the manner which it stands. It is during the tour that the visitors learn about AJ, as they all affectionately call him, who is the owner and founder of the cultural village. Two employees also assist during the tour, demonstrating and pronouncing words of certain objects, plants and garments. The manager also gives an intriguing history of the Zulu nation, particularly the Shaka Zulu era. The tour is then concluded with an entertaining Zulu dance, performed by the same workers who work tirelessly on the site.

#### Conclusion

This chapter has presented the findings attained in this study through interviews. The collected data revealed that there is indeed a race problem in the sector and that all the other issues are also influenced by race. Furthermore, the findings also reveal that the sector is still White dominated as things were in the apartheid era and that tourism is failing to bring about meaningful economic development. The workers are also very much aggrieved by their remuneration, their working conditions and their treatment. Ultimately the findings validated the critical framework for this study. The next chapter will be analyzing the findings thoroughly making sense of all the themes identified during the data collection process.

# **CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION OF RESEARCH FINDINGS**

#### Introduction

The main aim of this study was to examine the prevalence and perpetuation of White dominance and to critique the unjust role played by race in the sector. The focus was particularly on finding out what the detriment of the unjustly racialized nature of the industry is. This is of concern because it affects the lives of the impoverished population in South Africa, whom the government believes can be pulled out of the poverty cycle by the ever-growing tourism industry. Another focal point was interrogating the use and consumption of Black a people's culture regardless of the Black person being impoverished. This chapter fulfils the research objectives by discussing the findings of the study under the themes that were identified in the previous chapter.

# **Employment**

Though a quarter century has lapsed since the end of apartheid in South Africa, the labour market still shows racial inequalities in employment (Mputa, 2016: 1). This legacy of unevenness stems from colonial and apartheid policies which established and implemented racially demarcated laws in order to 'officially' overlook Blacks in employment. As a result, Black people could not progress or found it nearly impossible to reach particular highly skilled professions (Mputa, 2016: 3). This study discovers a similar trend functioning within the current democratic context.

According to the findings, it is clear that the people that seek work in cultural villages are driven by poverty and unemployment and less by pride over their culture. The participants of this study overwhelmingly emphasized how living in utter destitution, whilst lacking education and opportunity, has made them desperate for work. The several complaints they had about

how their White manager treats them were very frustrating, however, due to their desperation, they were not at liberty to voice these concerns to him. Though the Black majority is often advised by government leaders and other media personalities and celebrities, to be entrepreneurially minded and start businesses, it is a different view for the people that work at the cultural village. The process of identifying a market, attaining some starting capital and eventually making a profit seems like a farfetched idea for the workers. The manager, according to the findings was stifling the workers' efforts to make some money on the side, even though he had allowed them to venture. The racial demographic order at the cultural village was exactly the same as that of Ouma's BnB which Ngcoya (2015) visited.

The findings of this study seem to be consistent with the piece by Ngcoya, who travelled to St Lucia in the year 1993 and had a rather 'racial' experience of tourism, where the White woman at reception 'malfunctioned' when she learnt that Ngcoya and two other Black colleagues were travelling with the White teachers as well. Much later, in the year 2013, Ngcoya found Oumas BnB, which caters for tourists, to be White owned with Blacks as workers. The young White manager of Oumas BnB according to Ngcoya, had a sense of ownership over the Black staff, referring to female staff as 'my girls' (Ngcoya, 2015). This sentiment is the same at the cultural village. Some have worked for over 20 years at the establishment yet little or no improvement has occurred to their remuneration packages or benefits. Rather, the conditions seem to deteriorate, with the manager insinuating that the workers ought to be grateful and not complain.

#### **Transformation**

According to the findings, transformation is not characteristic of the tourism industry. Conditions and structures in the sector have not changed, at least not enough to significantly change the lives of the poor for the better. This is one of the many disappointments faced by

contemporary democratic South Africa; the harsh realization of how the new regime that took to power upon the advent of liberation has not satisfactorily brought results in terms of the development of the previously oppressed population. In the heritage and cultural tourism sector, the current structure and trends alongside the findings of this study strongly show that there has not been any meaningful transformation in the industry. Whites own and manage a lion's share of the entire industry with Blacks being employees. The structure of the industry can be said to have remained the same as it was during the apartheid era, with Whites dominating and Blacks gratefully serving. Considering the government rhetoric about transformation, the enacted redress-oriented policies have not been successful in the tourism sector. Mofokeng et al (2018) looked at whether the implementation of BEE has yielded any major changes within the accommodation sector in the tourism industry when it comes the participation of Black people. The findings of their research revealed a lack of transformation within the accommodation sector of Clarens. The prevalent lack of transformation within the industry is in spite of the existence of the Tourism BEE Charter that was launched in 2005 and the Tourism BEE Sector Codes of good practice which was launched in 2009 (Mofokeng et al, 2018).

The continuation of White domination in the industry even post-apartheid is in line with what Modiri (2012) highlights as one of the main characteristics of racism. That is, that racism is normalized in the social order as an ingrained feature that seems covertly nuanced (Modiri, 2012). The normalized yet unjust domination by Whites in the tourism industry is not displayed as rightwing extremism or blatant and conscious acts of hatred. Modiri (2012) explains that rather, White supremacy denotes a system within which White people keep a great deal of control and power in an industry. This is true of the tourism industry as shown by the research findings and ongoing trends within the sector. It is a normal phenomenon, as it was during

apartheid, that Black people will be workers at tourist destinations whilst White people manage and own the destinations.

### **Government policy**

Alongside several policies established as means to redress the detrimental effects of decades of racial oppression in the labour market was the Employment Equity Act (EEA) of 1998 which sought to achieve equity in all sectors of the economy (Meyer, 2014: 3). The findings of this study, however, show that the policy has not had the desired effect as the workers on this particular destination are still largely disadvantaged.

In the previous chapter, the manager explained to a German couple who inquired about the wages of the employees. The German couple had asked if the workers were being remunerated for their labour. This was partly informed by the fact that the workers are all Zulu, they reside on the site, and they somewhat live their Zulu lifestyle and tourists consume that as a touristic product too. The manager proudly explained that the government is very strict on labour laws. He went on to emphasize that he cannot exploit them in anyway and that he has to adhere to government standards and regulations when he pays them. During the interviews, this issue was raised with the participants for some insight. Generally, the participants expressed that their wages are in adherence to government's expectations. The topic seemed to cause some level of discomfort among some participants, understandably, as this was their livelihood. Ultimately, the employees did not agree to the sentiment that they were being paid accordingly. They went on to explain that, they do not know or have the means to fight for their rights as workers because they are not educated and are not familiar with the relevant channels. This unevenness and clear White domination was supposedly ended in the year 1994 when the country became a Black ruled democracy with a new constitution, which Dladla is highly critical of.

My findings seem to resonate with Van der Merwe (2016) who conducted a survey among cultural tourist guides and the demographics of the respondents are consistent with the findings of this study. The survey recorded that the majority of the tourist guides that responded in the survey were married White males (63.2%). Van der Merwe (2016) attributes the predominance of White male respondents to internet access which in South Africa remains racially disparate. Furthermore, most of the respondents, who are White, owned the tourist guiding companies (Van der Merwe, 2016).

#### **Commodification of Zulu Culture**

There is a strong need for transformation because economic benefits which are said to be so prevalent in the industry are all racially demarcated. Rent is deducted from what is understood to be an already low salary of the employees at the cultural village, which makes earn even less. The manager lives a completely different lifestyle and his standard of living is clearly not the same as that of workers; he lives in the main city of Pietermaritzburg. The employees on the other hand reside on site, very far from critical services such as health facilities. They also explained that the manager is extremely strict and that they would have to be gravely ill in order for him to allow them to seek healthcare. They expressed that illness presents a clear risk and danger to their jobs, which they so desperately need to keep.

The White dominance in this case is clearly detrimental to Black people. Their working conditions are unpleasant and most of them expressed that the ill-treatment that they receive is motivated by the fact that they are Black and are very desperate for work. Ultimately, out of desperation to keep their jobs they then ignore the mistreatment. One of the workers explained that the manager has got the apartheid mentality in his approach towards them. This is concerning because we are now in a democratic era, guided by one of the best liberal

constitutions in the world, which Dladla (2017) argues, upholds racism, by saying 'we the people' in its preamble, thus including White people who were direct beneficiaries of apartheid. The disturbing manner in which Zulu culture is paraded and displayed stood out. There were two workers, a man and a woman who, during the tour around the homestead, were dressed up in Zulu regalia. During the tour, the manager displayed in-depth knowledge of Zulu culture. What I found disturbing was how the manager used the woman, dressed in Zulu regalia somewhat as a mannequin. He held a stick in his hand and would occasionally tap her dress as he described the clothes that the lady was wearing. I noticed a bit of discomfort in the woman's body language and mannerisms, as the manager kept on pointing, touching and tapping her with the stick. She was placed there like an object to be examined and analyzed, and this was uncomfortable to me as well. This is, however her job, which she so desperately needs to keep.

# Economic beneficiation and community development

Another important aspect of the study sought to find out if the Zulu people, whose culture is being sold get any compensation. Upon asking about the source of knowledge from which the manager had become so well informed. The source of information was said to be AJ, the White Sangoma, who apparently has a love for Zulu culture and grew up among Zulu people. It ultimately became clear that the Zulu people, whose knowledge is being sold, reap no benefits from this. The participants also confirmed that only Black Zulu people are hired at the destination because they hold the knowledge and experience for being Zulu. The manager presented the knowledge very well and would cue the two assisting Black employees to speak occasionally in order to let the tourists hear the best pronunciation of some of the Zulu words. The workers therefore are hired because they are Zulu and are Black; which is perfect for a business that sells Black Zulu culture. The sources of the information are not acknowledged in the tour. The manager presents the knowledge on Zulu culture as though it is authentically his.

We then joked about how I, as a Black Zulu man was being taught my own culture by a White man; civilized only to be uncivilized. He then went to justify that by stating that most people, particularly Black people are now Westernizing and are abandoning their original culture. One of the resourceful White owners of several farms in the area came to pay for the weekend that he and his family had spent at the cultural village, and he left the workers a tip for their good service. When the workers asked the manager how much the tip was, he turned the tables and started joking about how much they loved money. This, especially as a guest was uncomfortable to laugh at, especially for me, as I understood just how desperately they wanted to get every bit of money they could get to add on to their already low wages. The manager, in response to the workers' question joked to me and the German couple, saying that the workers love money too much. He went on to say that the workers ought to be more passionate about their Zulu culture and how they are serving as ambassadors of the Zulu nation which represent the Zulu ethnic group in the face of many visitors, both local and international. He also stated, during his joke, that they were way too obsessed with money and that they were not getting any portion of that tip. He insisted that they ought to be passionate about their job because it is about their very own culture. The workers later expressed that the manager always seeks to cheat them of what is rightfully theirs, in this case their tip.

I experienced quite a bit of discomfort because the manager treated me as a tourist, a learned researcher. This discomfort grew as the hours went by because I was getting to observe the difference between how he was treating me compared to how he was treating the employees. The employees, most of whom were older than me, were fussing around me, being vigilant and making sure I had everything I needed. Sitting on a somewhat higher pedestal than the employees, along the Germans, I felt a strong sense of guilt because throughout my observation and casual conversations, I had started to learn just how difficult their lives were. During meal times, I was naturally making conversation with the Germans and the manager, however, I

started to feel as though I was betraying the workers by dining with their master, against whom there was growing evidence of unbecoming treatment towards them. I struggled for a few hours as I was torn between being the tourist, researcher that spoke polished English with the Germans and the White manager and being the Black Zulu compatriot that identifies with the employees. I wanted to be in solidarity with my fellow Zulu workers on the site, with whom I immediately connected upon arrival, yet the manager made sure to keep me entertained as more of a guest and sophisticated researcher. His efforts to make my stay comfortable and entertaining suggested that he was eager to make a good impression so that I make write well about my experience.

#### The nervous conditions of cultural tourism

As I mentioned in chapter three, after my visit when I had returned to Durban, the study participants who I had interviewed at the cultural village contacted me to let me know that they would love to meet me since they were going to be in Durban for the day. I agreed to meet with them where it was most convenient for them, at the beachfront where they were leisured for the day. I had to get there as soon as possible because they were short of time and would soon have to leave. Nonetheless, on my way, I was glad to realize that they do get some time off from work which from what I observed when I first visited them, was physically strenuous. When I finally reached the beachfront, we struggled to find each other, as the lady with whom I was communicating was not familiar with the place and thus could not clearly describe her whereabouts. She would say "You see the road that turns like this, go straight until you see a tall building". When we eventually found each other we immediately started off by laughing at how she gave directions before making our way to the fast food restaurants. The 24-year-old whom I had been in contact with, led the way and expressed how eager she was to buy something nice for her son. The other lady, an older woman in her 40s was more quiet and

reserved and would make occasional comments on the conversation as we walked to the fast foods restaurants.

When we got to the restaurant, we looked at the colorful displays of the menu on the screens and began to discuss among ourselves what each person was going to buy. As we waited for our food, I then learnt that they were actually brought to Durban by their manager from the cultural village. I found this to be very kind of him compared to the manager I got to know when I did my fieldwork at the cultural village. The 24-year-old participant then explained that they rushed me to the beachside quickly because the manager had already said that they must conclude their activities so they may head back to the cultural village. While we waited, we spoke about several topics such as my research, their stay after my departure and how their children were doing, however, we were interrupted by a phone call. One of the male colleagues with whom they were travelling, who had remained in their vehicle when the two ladies came to meet me, called to say that the manager was ready to leave and would leave them behind if they did not get back to the vehicle immediately. At that very point, the happy reunion turned into a rather sour moment.

The reserved 40-year-old woman went into a panic, worrying about being left behind but more so about being disrespectful to the manager. As detailed in chapter 4, this was the same woman who had worked at the cultural village for about 20 years. During the interview, she did her utmost best to only say positive things about her experience at the cultural village. Her tone was overly grateful and totally submissive to the order of the cultural village as set by the manager. Our food was not ready and we so we had to wait a little longer. She became increasingly nervous and started pacing back and forth near the counter trying to see if they would call her order number next. Meanwhile, the 24-year-old participant was only slightly agitated but was not totally bothered by the situation. I inevitably became concerned and decided to try offer them some comfort by assuring them that I would walk them back to the

vehicle and take responsibility for having stalled them. This did not ease the tension and panic that the 40-year-old participant was in, luckily our food was ready.

We collected the food and proceeded to walk quickly to the vehicle they were travelling with. On our way to the vehicle, the 40-year-old participant, out of fear and panic, began to run uncomfortably, leaving us behind. Having stated during her interview back at the cultural village that she had sons my age, I somewhat saw her as a mother and addressed her as such, as the African culture would have it. Seeing her in that state of utter panic, however, had me very worried about the impact that the manager has been able to have on such a strong-willed individual.

They were travelling in an old Toyota truck, which is ultimately a luggage and goods carrying vehicle. The manager sat comfortably in the driver's seat with his White friend next to him on the passenger seat, while the employees were squashed at the back. I greeted him and his colleague while the 24-year-old employee climbed into the vehicle in the back. He recognized me and smiled eagerly and gestured a handshake. He asked about my research and I explained that I was near completion of transcribing interviews. I went on to thank him for letting me conducting my research at his destination. As we concluded our brief chat, I went on to apologize for having stalled his workers and I explained that it was my fault that they took so long to get back. He assured me that it was alright. I waved goodbye to the employees as they drove away, however, I was left concerned with the fear that they had just displayed towards their manager.

This encounter with the research participants displayed a nervous condition that Fanon (1963) describes as the status of the native. This is a nervous condition created and maintained by the settler colonizer among the colonized people, where the colonized people live in a state of constant nervousness and fear of angering or being in conflict with their master (Fanon,

1963:18). This description of a relationship between a settler and the colonized people is very fitting as a lens through which one can understand the nervousness displayed particularly by the 40-year-old woman. This nervous condition was also evident when I visited the cultural village, where I got to observe the research participants in their place of work. Whenever the manager called one of them, they would somewhat tense up and respond with such a sense of urgency and worry. It was as though the commanding voice of the manager possessed an unchallengeable power of finality. As established in previous chapters, this particular encounter with the research participant from the cultural village, clearly shows the importance of the approach of this study. Race is one of the most influential factors in how the heritage and cultural tourism and broader tourism industries are shaped in South Africa.

### Conclusion

Black Zulu culture is the subject of consumption for tourists, many whom are White yet the rewards are not owned by the Black people. The preservationist approach towards heritage and culture tourism which I discussed in chapter two suggests that establishments in the industry ought to preserve Zulu culture and safeguard its intangible beauty and richness. This approach, however does not address racial inequities which from the study clearly exist. The approach can be critiqued for being linear and not pragmatic when it comes to the need for the industry to be profitable so that the poor may be uplifted. The economic approach on the other hand, which was also discussed in chapter two, says that the sector is an opportunity to bring about economic growth, create jobs and ultimately curb poverty. However, my study findings suggest that this is not going to happen due to the dominant role of White people who own most of the sector. Sharpley and Telfer (2002, cited in Booysens, 2010), argue that the benefits of tourism usually do not trickle down to poor communities. The racial demarcation of the industry suggests that the economic approach is inadequate, hence the Critical Race Theory framework. The perpetuation of White domination in the industry is clearly detrimental to the wellbeing

and living standards of the Black people. Having shown that race plays a critical role in the heritage and cultural tourism industry, the two approaches discussed in chapter two do not do justice when it comes to analyzing the sector or making sense of its strengths and weaknesses. In the industry's current structure, Black people will continue to suffer severely under White supremacy and domination.

# References

Antwi, S.K. and Hamza, K., 2015. Qualitative and quantitative research paradigms in business research: A philosophical reflection. *European Journal of Business and Management*, 7(3), pp.217-225.

Baker, S.E. and Edwards, R., 2012. How many qualitative interviews is enough.

Binns, T. and Nel, E., 2002. Tourism as a local development strategy in South Africa. *Geographical Journal*, 168(3), pp.235-247.

Boateng, R., Heeks, R., Molla, A. and Hinson, R., 2008. E-commerce and socio-economic development: conceptualizing the link. Internet Research.

Boswell, R. and O'Kane, D. (2011). Introduction: heritage management and tourism in Africa. *Journal of Contemporary African Studies*, Vol. 29, No. 4, pp. 361-369.

Briedenhann, J. and Wickens, E., 2004. Tourism routes as a tool for the economic development of rural areas—vibrant hope or impossible dream?. Tourism management, 25(1), pp.71-79.

Bunn, F. and Kendall, S., 2011. Does nursing research impact on policy? A case study of health visiting research and UK health policy. *Journal of Research in Nursing*, 16(2), pp.169-191.

Chhabra, D., Healy, R. and Sills, E., 2003. Staged authenticity and heritage tourism. Annals of tourism research, 30(3), pp.702-719.

Cook, P., 2001, May. Alliances, linkages and challenges: the Queensland heritage trails network. In Australia ICOMOS Making Tracks conference, Alice Springs, May 2001. Cultural Heritage Tourism in South Africa: Perceived a Panacea for Rural Development?

Department of Tourism (2004). TOURISM BEE CHARTER AND SCORECARD. p.4.P.M.

Irvinea, T. Kepea,b, D.T. De Weta and N.P. Hamunime., 2016. Whose Mecca? Divergent experiences of post-productivism and tourism in Nieu Bethesda, South Africa. *South African Geographical Journal*, Vol. 98, No. 2, 386–401.

Department of Tourism (2011). Strategic Documents - Department of Tourism. [online] Available at: https://www.tourism.gov.za/ResourceCentre/Pages/StrategicDocuments.aspx [Accessed 30 December. 2020].

Department of Tourism (2018). Strategic Documents - Department of Tourism. [online] Available at: https://www.tourism.gov.za/ResourceCentre/Pages/StrategicDocuments.aspx [Accessed 19 Apr. 2019].

Dladla, N., 2017. Towards an African critical philosophy of race: ubuntu as a philo-praxis of liberation. Filosofia Theoretica: *Journal of African Philosophy, Culture and Religions*, 6(1), pp.39-68.

Dooley, L.M., 2002. Case study research and theory building. Advances in developing human resources, 4(3), pp.335-354.

Estonian, L., 2001. Lithuanian National Commissions for UNESCO, Baltic cultural Tourism Policy Paper.

Fanon, F., 1963. The wretched of the earth (Vol. 36). New York: Grove Press.

Fusch, P.I. and Ness, L.R., 2015. Are we there yet? Data saturation in qualitative research (1052-0147).

Goudie, S.C., Khan, F. and Kilian, D., 1999. Transforming tourism: Black empowerment, heritage and identity beyond apartheid. *South African Geographical Journal*, 81(1), pp.22-31.

Guba, E.G. and Lincoln, Y.S., 1994. Competing paradigms in qualitative research. *Handbook of qualitative research*, 2(163-194), p.105.

Hancock, A.M., 2007. When multiplication doesn't equal quick addition: Examining intersectionality as a research paradigm. Perspectives on politics, 5(1), pp.63-79.

Irma Booyens (2010) Rethinking township tourism: Towards responsible tourism development in South African townships, Development Southern Africa, 27:2, 273-287,

Kreps, C., 2013. Liberating Culture: Cross-cultural perspectives on museums, curation and heritage preservation. Routledge.

Maart, R., 2015. Decolonizing Gender, Decolonizing Philosophy: An Existential Philosophical Account of Narratives from the Colonized. *Radical Philosophy Review*, 18(1), pp.69-91.

Meyer, M.J., 2014. Challenges facing the implementation of the employment equity act in public FET colleges in the Western Cape (Doctoral dissertation, Cape Peninsula University of Technology).

Modiri, J.M., 2012. The colour of law, power and knowledge: introducing critical race theory in (post-) apartheid South Africa. *South African Journal on Human Rights*, 28(3), pp.405-436.

Mofokeng, M., and Giampiccoli, Andrea and Jugmohan, Sean. (2018). Black Economic Empowerment led transformation within the South African accommodation industry: The case of Clarens. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*. 7. 1-16.

Motala, S. and Ngandu, S., 2018. "Sho't Left": youth going nowhere slowly: enhancing labour-market outcomes for youth in the tourism industry. Mputa, C.K., 2016. Evaluating the implementation of employment equity in a pharmaceutical company: a case study (Doctoral dissertation, Stellenbosch: Stellenbosch University).

Ngcoya, M., 2015. Hyperapartheid. *Journal of Narrative Politics*, 2(1).

Nkwanyana, M.S., Ezeuduji, I.O. and Nzama, A.T., 2016. Cultural Heritage Tourism in South Africa: Perceived a Panacea for Rural Development?. Acta Universitatis Danubius. Œconomica, 12(6).

Novelli, M. (2015). Tourism and Development in Sub-Saharan Africa. Abingdon: Routledge.

Nurani, L.M., 2008. Critical review of ethnographic approach. *Jurnal sosioteknologi*, 7(14), pp.441-447.

Orgad, L., 2010. The preamble in constitutional interpretation. *International Journal of Constitutional Law*, 8(4), pp.714-738.

Rakate, N.F., 2005. Transformation South African Public Service: the case service delivery in the Department of Health (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pretoria).

Rogerson, C.M., 2002. Tourism and local economic development: the case of the Highlands Meander. *Development Southern Africa*, 19(1), pp.143-167.

Rogerson, C.M., 2013. Tourism and local development in South Africa: Challenging local governments. *African Journal for Physical Health Education, Recreation and Dance*, 19(Supplement 3), pp.9-23.

Safarinow.com. (2018). Cramond Accommodation From R1390 - Book Today - SafariNow. [online] Available at: https://www.safarinow.com/destinations/cramond/hub.aspx [Accessed 28 Apr. 2019].

Sassen, S., Galvaan, R. and Duncan, M., 2018. Women's experiences of informal street trading and well-being in Cape Town, South Africa. *South African Journal of Occupational Therapy*, 48(1), pp.28-33.

Schwab, K. ed., 2009. The global competitiveness report 2009-2010. World Economic Forum.

Sdrali, D. and Chazapi, K., 2007. Cultural tourism in a Greek insular community: The residents' perspective. *Tourismos* 2(2)

Sharpley, R and Telfer, DJ (Eds), 2002. Tourism and Development: Concepts and Issues. Channel View, Clevedon.

Silberberg, T., 1995. Cultural tourism and business opportunities for museums and heritage sites. *Tourism management*, 16(5), pp.361-365.

Silberberg, T., 1995. Cultural tourism and business opportunities for museums and heritage sites. *Tourism management*, 16(5), pp.361-365.

Smith, C. (2019). Tourism contributed 1.5 million jobs and R425.8bn in SA - report. [online] Fin24. Available at: https://www.fin24.com/Economy/tourism-contributed-15-million-jobs-and-r4258bn-in-sa-report-20190329 [Accessed 16 Jun. 2019].

South Africa. Dept. of Environmental Affairs and Tourism, 1996. Development and promotion of tourism in South Africa. Commission of Inquiry.

Tongco, M.D.C., 2007. Purposive sampling as a tool for informant selection. *Ethnobotany Research and applications*, 5, pp.147-158.

Twining-Ward, L. 2009. Sub-Saharan Africa Tourism Industry Research. Report prepared for the Africa Region's Finance and Private Sector Development Department, The World Bank, Washington DC.

Van der Merwe, C.D., 2016. Tourist guides' perceptions of cultural heritage tourism in South Africa. Bulletin of Geography. Socio-economic Series, 34(34), pp.117-130.

Viljoen, J. and Henama, U.S., 2017. Growing heritage tourism and social cohesion in South Africa. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*, 6(4), pp.1-15.

Winchester, D. and Bach, S., 1999. The transformation of public service employment relations. Public Service Employment Relations in Europe: Transformation, Modernization or Inertia?,

Wiersma, U. and Latham, G.P., 1986. The practicality of behavioral observation scales, behavioral expectation scales, and trait scales. Personnel Psychology, 39(3), pp.619-628.

Zerubavel, Y., 1995. The multivocality of a national myth: Memory and counter - memories of Masada. Israel Affairs, 1(3), pp.110-128.

Appendix 1: Semi-structured interview guide for destination

employees

Interview guide and questions

Management

Interviews with management of the cultural homestead attraction will help show the primary

aims and functions of the tourist attraction. It will make the research more authentic as well

since the data collected will come from the industry experts themselves. The management of

the homestead will be able to share data that one would not otherwise be able to find in the

public domain, such as the demographics and numbers of visitors.

**Staff** 

The study seeks to interview 5 to 8 staff members that perform different functions at the

homestead, particularly the Zulu cultural village. The staff will give a perspective as the

people that actually render the touristic services and interact with the visitors of the attraction.

They will have perspectives which will speak to the issue of the perpetuation of racial

inequities on the site and the industry at large. Data collected from staff members interviews

will be of paramount importance as it will help answer some of the major questions of the

study.

A: Demographics

Management and staff

77

- 1. How long have you worked at this establishment? (If long, what has made you stay that long and do you see yourself here in the long term?
- 2. Race trouble and equity
  - a. Some people say that the tourism industry has a race problem. Do you agree?Why?
  - b. And this establishment in particular?
  - c. What is your understanding of racism?
  - d. And transformation/equity?
- 3. 3. Did you work at similar establishments before and if so, how does this establishment compare with your previous experience in terms of addressing the question of racial equity in South Africa?
- 4. Where have you made the greatest or least efforts in terms of racial equity?
  - a. For example, what is the racial composition of the staff at this tourist destination? Has it changed much over time?
    - And the demographics of the organization's organogram? (i.e. the racial composition of owners, managers and workers)
  - b. What are the major obstacles to achieving equity?
  - c. What are the demographics of your visitors (in terms of nationality, race, age and gender?)

5.	Do you have any sense of the changes that have taken place (historically and during your tenure) in terms of:					
	a.	the racial demographic of visitors				
	b.	the racial composition of employees				
	c.	community beneficiation				
B. The	economic	beneficiation				
Manag	gement and	staff				
1.	Do the peo	ople whose culture is portrayed at the homestead attraction get any				
	economic	benefits and how?				
	a.	Who are the sources of information about the Zulu culture and how				
		were they selected?				
	a.	Do these sources get any kind of compensation for their knowledge				
		and in what way?				
2.	In what wa	ay does the surrounding community benefit from this tourist attraction in				
	terms of:					
	a.	employment				
	b.	infrastructure				
	c.	access to the site				

	destination.
3.	How are the profits generated shared?
4.	How has government's requirements from the tourism sector affected the profit and revenue sharing of the cultural village destination?
	nsformation gement and staff
	what ways has the cultural village tourist attraction contributed to transformation in the n sector?  a. What indicators are there as clear evidence of transformation at the cultural village tourist attraction?
	w have the transformation measures implemented on this attraction been positive and cial to the surrounding community?
3. Wha	at actions has this tourist destination taken to ensure that it is racially equitable?

corporate social investment and community engagement by the

d.

### **Appendix 2: Consent form for study participants**

# UKZN HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES RESEARCH ETHICS COMMITTEE (HSSREC)

#### APPLICATION FOR ETHICS APPROVAL

#### For research with human participants

#### INFORMED CONSENT RESOURCE TEMPLATE

Note to researchers: Notwithstanding the need for scientific and legal accuracy, every effort should be made to produce a consent document that is as linguistically clear and simple as possible, without omitting important details as outlined below. Certified translated versions will be required once the original version is approved.

There are specific circumstances where witnessed verbal consent might be acceptable, and circumstances where individual informed consent may be waived by HSSREC.

Information Sheet and Consent to Participate in Research

Date: 08 August 2018

Greeting: Dear prospective participant

My name is Thandanani Gasa from the UKZN School of Build Environment and

Development Studies (031 260 2287; JaliL@ukzn.ac.za)

You are being invited to consider participating in a study that involves research on race and

racism in the tourism sector. The aim and purpose of this research is to address the perpetuation

of racism in the tourism sector by looking at how some of the tourist attractions are structured.

The study is expected to enroll (8 to 10 participants in total, from staff and management at the

PheZulu cultural village. It will involve mainly interviews.

The study will provide no direct benefits to participants. The study hopes to highlight, and

contribute to a pool of knowledge that will help address racial inequities characterizing the

tourism sector.

This study has been ethically reviewed and approved by the UKZN Humanities and Social

Sciences Research Ethics Committee (approval number\_\_\_\_\_).

82

In the event of any problems or concerns/questions you may contact the researcher at

(0825490391;214583032@stu.ukzn.ac.za) or the UKZN Humanities and Social Sciences

Research Ethics Committee, contact details as follows:

HUMANITIES and SOCIAL SCIENCES RESEARCH ETHICS ADMINISTRATION

Research Office, Westville Campus

Govan Mbeki Building

Private Bag X 54001 Durban 4000

KwaZulu-Natal, SOUTH AFRICA

Tel: 27 31 2604557- Fax: 27 31 2604609

Email: HSSREC@ukzn.ac.za

Participation in this research is voluntary participants may withdraw participation at any point.

In the event of refusal/withdrawal of participation the participants will not incur penalty or loss

of treatment or other benefit to which they are normally entitled. If a participant withdraws

from the study, data accumulated prior to with withdrawal will be discounted from the study.

The researcher may terminate participant from the study if the interaction poses any kind of

threat to anyone involved or not involved in the study.

In order to protect the confidentiality of personal information of participants, each participant

will be identified by using a unique identifier for each person. The data will be thematically

analyzed and presented as categories of information. Research will be stored on a hard drive

for a period of 5 years and then destroyed.

83

#### **CONSENT**

I (Name) have been informed about the study entitled (provide details) by (provide name of researcher/fieldworker).

I understand the purpose and procedures of the study (add these again if appropriate).

I have been given an opportunity to answer questions about the study and have had answers to my satisfaction.

I declare that my participation in this study is entirely voluntary and that I may withdraw at any time without affecting any of the benefits that I usually am entitled to.

I have been informed about any available compensation or medical treatment if injury occurs to me as a result of study-related procedures.

If I have any further questions/concerns or queries related to the study I understand that I may contact the researcher at (provide details).

If I have any questions or concerns about my rights as a study participant, or if I am concerned
about an aspect of the study or the researchers then I may contact:
HUMANITIES and SOCIAL SCIENCES RESEARCH ETHICS ADMINISTRATION
Research Office, Westville Campus
Govan Mbeki Building
Private Bag X 54001 Durban 4000
KwaZulu-Natal, SOUTH AFRICA
Tel: 27 31 2604557 - Fax: 27 31 2604609
Email: <u>HSSREC@ukzn.ac.za</u>
Additional consent, where applicable
I hereby provide consent to:
Audio-record my interview / focus group discussion YES / NO
Video-record my interview / focus group discussion YES / NO
Use of my photographs for research purposes YES / NO
Signature of Participant Date

Signature of Witness	Date	
(Where applicable)		
Signature of Translator	Date	
(Where applicable)		

# UKZN HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES RESEARCH ETHICS COMMITTEE (HSSREC)

# ISICELO SOKUGUNYAZWA UKWENZA UCWANINGO LOKUSEBENZISANA NABANTU

#### **ULWAZI NGEMVUMO**

#### **OKUZOSEBENZA NGEZIGABA**

Bacwaningi: Kuyisidingo ukuthi konke kwenziwe ngobuchule noma ngokucophelela ngokomthetho, ukuthi konke okwenziwayo kube ulwazi olucacileyo ngokolimu olwaziwayo, futhi kungabi bikho ulwazi olubalulekile oluzokweqiwa kulokhu okungenzanzi. Ulwazi oluhunyushiwe luzodingeka emva kokuthi ulwazi lokuqala selugunyaziwe.

Ngezizathu ezithile ulwazi lungamukelwa ngokukhuluma kudingeke ukuthi kube nobufakazi noma ngezizathu ezithile Ulwazi ngemvumo yomuntu ngayedwa lunqatshwe noma lususwe ikomide(HSSREC).

#### Ulwazi oluqukethwe ngokuzibophezela ukuba yingxenye yocwaningo

Usuku: <u>08 August 2018</u>

Isibingelelo: Ngiyakubingelela lunga lomphakathi

Igama lami ngingu <u>Thandanani Gasa</u>

Uyamenywa ukuba ube ingxenye noma ukusebenzisaname kucwaningo oluhlola ukubhebhethekiswa kokucwasa ngokwebala emkhakheni wezokungcebeleka.

Lesisifundo asinabo ubungozi futhi akukho lapho ozozizwa ungenakho ukukhululeka. Siyethemba lolucwaningo luzosisiza ukwazi kangcono ngabantu baseThekwini ukuthi benza njani uma befuna ukukhombisa amalungelo abo. Okunye okumele ukwazi ngalolucwaningo akukho muhlomulo ngokusebenzisana nathi ngalesisifundo. Lesisifundo sibhekiwe ngokwenkambo yobulungiswa sagunyazwa ikomide lesikhungo sasenyuvesithi UKZN Humanities and Social Sciences Research Ethics (inombolo yokugunyaza\_\_\_\_\_).

Lesisifundo	sibhekiwe	ikomide	elimele	ubulungiswa	sagunyazwa	isikhungo
sesenyuvesithi yakwaZulu Natali( inombolo egunyazayo)						

#### **HUMANITIES & SOCIAL SCIENCES RESEARCH ETHICS ADMINISTRATION**

Research Office, Westville Campus

Govan Mbeki Building Private Bag X 54001 Durban 4000 KwaZulu-Natal, SOUTH AFRICA

Tel: 27 31 2604557- Fax: 27 31 2604609

Email: HSSREC@ukzn.ac.za

Uma kukhona izinkinga obhekana nazo noma kukhona imibuzo ungaxhumana nomcwaningi (kulemininingwane enikezelwe) ningaxhumana futhi nekomide elimele ubulungiswa lase UKZN Humanities & Social Sciences kulemininingwane elandelayo

#### **HUMANITIES & SOCIAL SCIENCES RESEARCH ETHICS ADMINISTRATION**

### Research Office, Westville Campus

Govan Mbeki Building Private Bag X 54001 Durban 4000

KwaZulu-Natal, SOUTH AFRICA

Tel: 27 31 2604557- Fax: 27 31 2604609

Email: HSSREC@ukzn.ac.za

Ukusebenzisana nathi kulesisifundo awuphoqelekile, unalo ilungelo lokushintsha umqondo noma ngasiphi isikhathi uhoxe. Ngasesayidini lethu njengoba senza lolucwaningo asinawo umuhlombulo esizowunikezela kuwe kodwa singakunika uma sesiqedile ukwenza ucwaningo iphepha ukuze ulifunde noma ubeke umbono ngalo.

Umcwaningi akukho lapho ezothatha khona igama lakho futhi konke ozobe usitshela khona akukho lapho oyokubona khona ukuthi uwena. Konke ozokutshela umcwaningi kuzogcinwa kahle kukhiyelwe ekhabetheni. Esizobe sikugcine kwicomputha nakho kuvikelekile ngoba kuba nenombolo yemfihlo uma uyivula. Emuva kweminyaka emihlanu siyokushabalalisa lolulwazi osinike lona.

.....

-----

ISIVUMELWANO (gcwalisa njengoba kudingeka)

Mina ----ngazisiwe ngakho konke

Nginikeziwe ithuba lokuthi ngiphendule imibuzo bayelana nalolucwaningo noma isifundo futhi ngiphendule ngendlela engineliseka ngayo

Mina ngiyamemezela ukuthi ukuba kwami ingxenye yalolucwaningo angiphoqiwe futhi ngingayeka noma nini ngaphandle kokuphazamisa lesisifundo.

Uma ngabe ngiba nemibuzo noma yini ephathelene nalolucwaningo ngingaxhumana nomcwaningi

Uma ngabe ngiba nemibuzo noma ngifuna ukwazi kabanzi ngamalungelo ami ngokusebenzisana nani kulolucwaningo noma okumayelana nalolucwaningo noma ngabacwaningi ngingaxhumana nonobhalo wesikhungo esibhekelene nobulungiswa bokwenza ucwaningo

#### **HUMANITIES & SOCIAL SCIENCES RESEARCH ETHICS ADMINISTRATION**

## Research Office, Westville Campus

Govan Mbeki Building Private Bag X 54001 Durban

4000

KwaZulu-Natal, SOUTH AFRICA

Tel: 27 31 2604557 - Fax: 27 31 2604609

Email: HSSREC@ukzn.ac.za

Okwengeziwe ngemvumo okudingekayo Ngiyanikezela ngmvumo ukuthi

Ukusebenzisa isiqophamazwi / ingxoxo yedlanzana labantu AKUKHO/YEBO/CHA Ukusebenzisa ivido kucwaningo /ingxoxo yedlanzana labantu AKUKHO/YEBO/CHA Ukusebenzisa izithombe zami ngenhloso yocwaningo AKUKHO / YEBO/CHA

Sayina ukuzibophezela	Usuku	<del></del>
Kusayina ufakazi uma ekhona	Usuku	
 Kusayina ochazayo uma ekhona	 Usuku	

Turnitin

https://www.turnitin.com/newreport\_classic.asp?lang=en\_us&oid=1150726329&ft=1&bypass\_cv=1 1/29

Turnitin Originality Report
Processed on: 10-Jul-2019 2:21 PM CAT
ID: 1150726329

ID: 1150726329 Word Count: 21615 Submitted: 1

Thesis By Thandanani Gasa Similarity Index

12%

Internet Sources: 8% Publications: 3% Student Papers: 9% Similarity by Source

```
Document Viewer
exclude quoted include bibliography excluding matches < 3 words download refresh print
mode: quickview (classic) report Change mode
1% match (Internet from 19-Sep-2014)
http://www.tourism.gov.za
<1% match (Internet from 27-Oct-2018)
http://researchspace.ukzn.ac.za
<1% match (Internet from 06-Oct-2015)
http://li.mit.edu
<1% match (Internet from 24-Dec-2014)
http://www.dedea.gov.za
<1% match (Internet from 22-Aug-2018)
https://www.ajhtl.com/uploads/7/1/6/3/7163688/article_33_vol_7__1__2018.pdf
<1% match (student papers from 02-Jul-2013)
Class: Dissertations
Assignment: Final Dissertations
Paper ID: 339121294
<1% match (Internet from 18-Jun-2018)
https://repository.up.ac.za/bitstream/handle/2263/28498/00dissertation.pdf?sequ=
<1% match (student papers from 21-Nov-2018)
Submitted to University of KwaZulu-Natal on 2018-11-21
<1% match (student papers from 26-Oct-2018)
Submitted to University of Stellenbosch, South Africa on 2018-10-26
<1% match (Internet from 03-Mar-2016)
http://apcz.pl
<1% match (student papers from 21-May-2013)
Submitted to University of Surrey on 2013-05-21
<1% match (Internet from 06-Feb-2019)
https://repository.up.ac.za/bitstream/handle/2263/21791/Modiri Colour%282012%29.pdf?
isAllowed=y&sequence=1
<1% match (Internet from 16-Apr-2018)
http://researchspace.ukzn.ac.za
<1% match (Internet from 11-Nov-2014)
http://portal.unesco.org
<1% match (Internet from 21-Apr-2011)
http://www.fsrd.itb.ac.id
<1% match (student papers from 18-Nov-2011)
```



(CK 97/21589/23)

30 September 2018 Mr Thandanani Mthokozisi Gasa (SN 214583032) School of Built Environment and Development Studies College of Humanities Howard College Campus UKZN

Email: 214583032@stu.ukzn.ac.za

Dear Mr Gasa

#### RE: PERMISSION TO CONDUCT RESEARCH

Gatekeeper's permission is hereby granted for you to conduct research at the Ecabazini Cultural Village towards your postgraduate studies, provided ethical clearance has been obtained. We note the title of your research project is:

"Thinking Race, Thinking Tourism: A Critical Race Approach to Heritage and Cultural Tourism in KwaZulu-Natal"

Please note that we grant you permission to speak with the manager and staff of Ecabazini Cultural Village.

Please ensure that the following appears on your interview guide/informed consent form:

- Ethical clearance number;
- Research title and details of the research, the researcher and the supervisor;
- Consent form is attached and to be signed by user before the start of the interview.

Yours sincerely



D. Hazelhurst Manager

> Tel/Fax: +27 (0) 33 3421928 | Mobile: +27 (0) 84 7469741 | e-mail: info@ecabazini.co.za 12 Cordwalles Rd, Wembley, Pietermaritzburg, South Africa, 3201 http://www.ecabazini.co.za



25 October 2018

Mr Thandanani Gasa (214583032) **School of Built Environment & Development Studies Howard College Campus** 

Dear Mr Gasa,

Protocol reference number: HSS/1488/018M

Project title: Thinking race, Thinking tourism: A critical Race approach to Heritage and Cultural Tourism in KwaZulu-Natal

Approval Notification - Expedited / Amendment Application

In response to your application received 30 August 2018 and amendment on 16 October 2018, the Humanities & Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee has considered the abovementioned application and the protocol has been granted FULL APPROVAL

#### AMENDMENT:

Removal of one site

Any alteration/s to the approved research protocol i.e. Questionnaire/Interview Schedule, Informed Consent Form, Title of the Project, Location of the Study, Research Approach and Methods must be reviewed and approved through the amendment /modification prior to its implementation. In case you have further queries, please quote the above reference number.

PLEASE NOTE: Research data should be securely stored in the discipline/department for a period of 5 years.

The ethical clearance certificate is only valid for a period of 3 years from the date of issue. Thereafter Recertification must be applied for on an annual basis.

I take this opportunity of wishing you everything of the best with your study.

Cc Supervisor: Dr Mvuselelo Ngcoya and Professor Rozena Maart

Cc Academic Leader Research: Professor Oliver Mtapuri

Cc School Administrator: Ms Angeline Msomi

**Humanities & Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee** 

Professor Shenuka Singh (Chair) Westville Campus, Govan Mbeki Building

Postal Address: Private Bag X54001, Durban 4000

Telephone: +27 (0) 31 260 3587/8350/4557 Facsimile: +27 (0) 31 260 4609 Email:

Website:



100 YEARS OF ACADEMIC EXCELLENCE