AN ANALYSIS OF THE DEPICTION OF "BIG MEN" IN APARTHEID AND POST-APARTHEID SCHOOL HISTORY TEXTBOOKS

BY

ANAND NAIDOO

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Masters in Education (History Education)

at the

University of KwaZulu-Natal

2014

PERSONAL DECLARATION

I Anand Naidoo (8421847) declare that:

(i)   The research reported in this dissertation, except where otherwise indicated, is my original work.

(ii)   This dissertation has not been submitted for any degree or examination at any other university.

(iii)   This dissertation does not contain other person's data, graphs, pictures or other information, unless specifically acknowledged as being sourced from other persons.

(iv)   This dissertation does not contain other persons' writing, unless specifically acknowledged as being sourced from other researchers. Where other written sources have been quoted, then:

    a. Their words have been re-written but the general information attributed to them has been referenced;
    b. Where their exact words have been used, their writing has been placed inside quotation marks, and referenced;
    c. This dissertation does not contain text, graphics or tables copied and pasted from the internet, unless specifically acknowledged, and the source being detailed in the dissertation and in the References sections.

Anand Naidoo

SUPERVISOR'S DECLARATION

As the candidate's supervisor, I agree to the submission of this dissertation.

Professor Johan Wassermann

15.1.2015

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Firstly, I thank God for His grace, mercy and the strength He gave me to complete this dissertation. I also thank Him for taking care of my health and giving me hope despite the challenges I faced whilst completing this dissertation. Thank you Lord for Your wisdom, presence and divine power.

I would also like to sincerely thank my supervisor, Professor Johan Wassermann for his constant support, unfailing commitment, patience and motivation. Prof; I thank you for your words of encouragement and for also instilling confidence in me. I would not have succeeded without your intervention and guidance. I salute you for being such a committed mentor who always encouraged me to persevere and believe in myself.

Thanks and appreciation must also go to the editor, Mrs Angela Bryan for editing this dissertation. Your professional input has been acknowledged.

I am also deeply indebted to my wife Anusha and my children, Caleb and Carmel for their understanding, patience, love and words of encouragement. I am grateful to you for the sacrifices you made and also for allowing me the space that I needed in order to complete this study.

I would also like to thank my family, friends and colleagues at work for their prayers, words of inspiration and support.

DEDICATION

I dedicate this Masters in Education dissertation to my late parents, Mr. Moonsamy (Ganas) Naidoo (1937-1995) and Mrs. Dhanalutchmyammal (Kamala) Naidoo (1939-2013). You will always be remembered for the sacrifices you made towards my education.

ABSTRACT

Male historical figures or "big men" as I refer to them in this study have appeared in South African history textbooks since their inception. I learnt about these "big men" when I studied history at school and thereafter when I began teaching history at school. I taught history in both the apartheid and post-apartheid eras and used the textbooks from both. I was therefore curious to discover whether the new democratic dispensation and the associated curricula had an impact on the depiction of "big men" in contemporary history textbooks in South Africa. Since I am an educator who uses history textbooks in my teaching, I wanted to research this topic and therefore contribute to the discourse on the portrayal of "big men" in history textbooks. Hence I analysed the depiction of "big men" in selected South African history textbooks of the apartheid and post-apartheid eras for this dissertation.
.
This study is informed by the interpretivist paradigm as the aim of the study was to reach some understanding of how "big men" were portrayed in history textbooks of both political eras and why they were portrayed in such a manner. The research approach is qualitative in nature and I employed qualitative textual analysis as the research methodology. Content analysis and open-coding were used as the data analysis methods for the study. The sample constituted eight selected primary and secondary school history textbooks from the apartheid and post-apartheid eras. Connell's theory of masculinity was employed to justify that the "big men" who appear in the textbooks embody the ideals and practices of the hegemonic man.

The study revealed that "big men" and their characteristics have in some ways evolved but in others stayed the same since apartheid to the post-apartheid era history textbooks. Although different narratives have been constructed about "big men" in history textbooks of both political eras in South Africa, the reality is that "big men" are still present in the history textbooks. These "big men" are still attributed with "enduring" characteristics which transcend from the apartheid to post-apartheid history textbooks.

Based on the findings although this cannot be generalised to all school history textbooks, this study has concluded that patriarchy although challenged after 1994, is still entrenched in history textbooks and consequently history teaching and learning in South Africa.

.

LIST OF FIGURES

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER FOUR
DATA ANALYSIS

CHAPTER FIVE
DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW OF THE STUDY

1.1 Introduction

Male iconic figures or "big men"[1] as I refer to them in this study have been part of the history curricula in South African schools since the inception of formal education. These men were considered "big" because of, amongst other reasons, power, status and popularity. Hence, the prescribed school history textbooks ensured that these "big men" appeared in them so as to transmit the ideology of the state. As a result these textbooks contain narratives of "big men" in history. Consequently history textbooks in apartheid and post-apartheid South Africa have constructed "big men" both similarly and differently by attributing various characteristics to them in their depiction. This study is therefore an analysis of the depiction of "big men" in selected history textbooks in apartheid and post-apartheid South Africa. It will therefore engage with two related phenomena: school history textbooks and "big men" in history in this study.

1.2 Background and contextualisation

Recently Joshua Ferris in the *International Herald Tribune Style Magazine* (circa Sept 2013) stated that "the male hero, once in ample supply, has entered a period of steady decline, and today our most iconic men are more likely to inspire cynicism than reverence" (p. 27). He further argued that the impact of post-modernism provided another dimension on how these "big men" were depicted. But nostalgically he recounts that society was told that "the world needed these charismatic men who were seen as transcendent beauties in the past" and these figures had, by and large exemplified the nation's heart as such and "a consensus prevailed that they were great men" (Ferris, 2013, p. 28). I will use this statement as a point of departure for this study to analyse the

---

[1] The term "big men" will be placed in inverted commas throughout the study to indicate a caustic use of the term.

characteristics attributed to "big men" identified in apartheid and post-apartheid era history textbooks.

The statement by Ferris hints that "big men" have, throughout the centuries, featured in history textbooks at national and international levels. Textbook publishers, authors, historians and the state all impacted on the depiction of "big men" in these books. "Big men" were therefore bestowed with iconic status, power and influence in their depiction. This was especially true under the apartheid era when men and "big men'' in particular were foregrounded by a patriarchal male dominated society. History as such has a rather deceptive position in the South African school curriculum in the apartheid era as the subject has been exploited in order to legitimise past and present racially orientated power bases which include gender relations. The South African history curricula before the 1990s were largely designed by white men who sought to highlight the actions and achievements of white men (Dean & Siebörger, 1995). Therefore, the history curricula were inseparable from the power relations of race and gender in apartheid South Africa. The apartheid government thus used school history to justify its policies and history in particular was written from an Afrikaner Nationalist perspective (Dean & Siebörger, 1995). Consequently, during the apartheid era, black and white learners were taught the same school history in a core syllabus which was mainly the history of European/Western civilization and of the white population, especially "big white men" in South Africa. Textbooks were written by white male historians in order to conform to the Christian Nationalist perspective. No history from a revisionist or liberal historiography was allowed (Dean & Sieörger, 1995). There was thus great dissatisfaction in the early 1990s regarding the history curriculum. Pressures for a more comprehensive South African curriculum began building up during this time.

History teachers and historians were expecting a new history curriculum after the release of Nelson Mandela in 1990 and the democratic elections in 1994 (Sieörger, 2000). They anticipated a new history curriculum, shelving the old apartheid one and the implementation of one that would forge a "new national identity" (Sieörger, 2000, p. 1). This new history curriculum was expected to contain three new r's: "reconstruction,

redress and reconciliation" (Siebörger, 2000, p. 1). Furthermore, it was hoped that a new curriculum would be designed to reflect different perspectives including the views of liberal and radical historians (Siebörger, 2000).

After 1994, the then new Minister of Education, Professor Sibusiso Bhengu, began the process of revising the education curriculum and putting in place an interim history syllabus in order to remove archaic, racial and controversial content (Siebörger, 2000). This was referred to as cleansing the curriculum (Chisholm, 2003). It focussed on, amongst other aspects, the rewriting of a formerly gender-biased curriculum. In so doing it was hoped to give just articulation to the stories of previously marginalised groups of people such as women and indigenous peoples and not only the so-called grand narratives of predominantly white middle class men. The result was Curriculum 2005 (C2005) accompanied by a form of outcomes-based education (O.B.E). C2005 intended to plot a route out of the "stultifying" education that had existed prior to 1994 and advocated a new approach to education-away from a "subject –bound, content-laden curriculum" (Chisholm, 2003, p. 3). However, history was at risk of losing its identity. History and geography were lumped together in a learning area known as Human and Social Sciences (HSS). Furthermore this model of O.B.E espoused only one outcome dedicated to history content and the remaining seven were dedicated to skills and values. Therefore according to Siebörger (2000, p. 2) "… it created the sense that some content was privileged." Hence there was much criticism of C2005 and its relationship to history.

The successor as Minister of Education to Bhengu, Professor Kader Asmal, himself a former history teacher, initiated a curriculum revision process in 2000 and gave special attention to history, seeing it as being important for many reasons including that of nation-building. This stance "was oppositional to official histories, histories of victors, of great men and of grand narratives" (Chisholm, 2003, p. 8). Following criticism of this new curriculum a ministerial review committee was appointed and met in February 2000. It suggested that a National Curriculum Statement (N.C.S) be drawn up for history. In the same year the Working Group on Values Education published its report. It

identified six values that it felt should be taught in schools: equity, tolerance, multilingualism, openness, accountability and social honour (Siebörger, 2000). The committee recommended that history in particular should be integral to the teaching of tolerance. The Revised National Curriculum Statement (R.N.C.S.) was created as a result of these processes and became policy in 2002. Distinctive features of this curriculum were that it was rights-oriented and outcomes based (Chisholm, 2003). The R.N.C.S was also designed on the principles of social transformation, human rights, inclusivity, as well as environmental and social justice (Department of Education (DoE), 2003). According to the R.N.C.S the concept of social justice involved empowering those who had previously been denied both skills and knowledge (DoE, 2003).

According to Chisholm (2003) one of the components that shaped the revision of the curriculum and the implementation of the N.C.S-History was the question of voice and the representation of voice. By voice she referred to who speaks and the positioning of this voice. Power is a critical component of voice and Chisholm (2003) argues that it was the voices with social power that led to the revising of the curriculum and the writing of the N.C.S-History.

There were also problems with the implementation of the N.C.S (Bertram, 2012). The problems that were identified were learner underperformance and overworked teachers who felt confused and stressed. The review of the N.C.S process began under the tenure of the successor to Asmal, Naledi Pandor, and was continued under her successor, Angie Motshekga (Motshekga, 2009). The result was Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS) in which the history curriculum was overhauled (Kallaway, 2012). The CAPS documents impacted on the nature of the content in the textbooks including the depiction of "big men" in some of the textbooks selected for this study. Furthermore, the CAPS compliant textbooks, as with all previous textbooks, needed to reflect the aims and objectives of the history curriculum. The CAPS history document, as with previous history curricula, found itself reflecting the political objectives of the country, key of which are nation building and democratisation as envisaged in the Constitution of South Africa. The aim of nation building post-1994 is to

unite South Africans of all ethnicities after being divided by the racist policies of apartheid. The aim is for a new South African identity to be established in order to create a secure nation state. Democracy is the ideology of the post-1994 nation state with particular emphasis on human rights. Education and the curriculum have been identified as being crucial in achieving these political objectives.

But despite these changes in the various curricula as related to history, ten years after the advent of democracy in South Africa, Bekker and others found in their survey of history textbooks at South African state secondary schools that old era texts continue to be used more often in history classes than new era texts (Chisholm, 2003). This speaks to how textbooks play an important role in legitimating and constructing dominant notions of citizenship (Chisholm, 2003). It is therefore prudent to ask if apartheid era textbooks lingered for so long did the characteristics attributed to big men" not also linger?

The context and background to this study forms the backdrop against which the characteristics of "big men" in apartheid and post-apartheid South African history textbooks will be investigated. History textbooks in the apartheid era were largely products of a white male dominated patriarchal society with the end of apartheid being a post-modern moment. The advent of post-modernism challenged the meta/master narratives especially on "big white men" Thus the history textbooks of the post-apartheid era were products of a post-modernist, revisionist society. Hence, the textbooks that have been selected for this study are products of apartheid and post-apartheid South Africa and their content, as legitimate knowledge, were analysed to develop an understanding of the depiction of "big men" in the selected textbooks and the characteristics attributed to them and if these have changed across the two eras, and if so, how did they change?

1.3 Rationale and motivation for the study

I am a middle-aged male educator teaching at a public school. History textbooks are core resources which were used in my teaching of history, both in the apartheid and the post-apartheid era. I became interested in the phenomenon of "big men" and the construction of masculinities in textbooks towards the end of the apartheid era and the beginning of curriculum transformation in South Africa. The history curriculum in both the eras included "big men" amongst other themes. I therefore decided to engage in study on this phenomenon to deepen my understanding of male hegemony and how this manifested itself through the medium of history textbooks.

On a professional level, the objective behind this study was to further my career by obtaining a Masters degree in History Education. Since this is a dissertation by research it would also improve my research skills. Furthermore, I interact with textbooks on a regular basis and the research process also enabled me to gain a better understanding of how history textbooks depict male historical figures over time. Evolving literature on history textbooks in South Africa focussed on race, ideology, representation of historical figures and knowledge presentation. This is supported by Sieborger (1994,p.103) who mentions that "textbook writers should not perpetuate discrimination and prejudice on the basis of gender, race or class and so help to release women and men ,girls and boys from damaging stereotypes". Hence, little has been said about the depiction of "big men" as part of a male hegemony in history textbooks. By engaging in this study, as a researcher and educator, I am hoping to contribute to the discourse on school history textbooks by analysing the depiction of "big men" as historical characters in history textbooks used in South African schools.

1.4 Purpose and focus of the study

My emphasis in this study is on the characteristics of "big men" and how they were portrayed in history textbooks. Thus, by undertaking an analysis of "big men'' in apartheid and post-apartheid history textbooks (two distinctly different political eras) I aim to contribute to the scholarship pertaining to "big men" as historical characters. The aim of this study is, furthermore, to provide a better understanding of the depiction of

"big men" in apartheid and post-apartheid South African history textbooks. Hence the purpose of my study is to analyse the depiction of "big men" in the selected history textbooks and to reach some understanding of how these men are depicted and why they are depicted in such a manner. In so doing "big men" will be tracked in South African history textbooks from the 1970s until 2013. The emphasis is thus on selected apartheid and post-apartheid era history textbooks and the characteristics attributed to "big men" as historical characters, regardless of who they were, in these books.

Historical figures have always appeared in the media, but their depiction especially in history textbooks in South Africa is not clear. Hence, their depiction has not been explored as a research problem before. Whilst this study is concerned with the characteristics of "big men" in history textbooks, the impact of feminism on gender construction and power relations is also paramount. Kaufman (1999, p. 76) points out that while men do reap the benefits of the power that traditionally has characterised a patriarchal society, theirs is also a "strange combination of power and privilege, pain and powerlessness". The way that men have ordered the world and empowered themselves has come at a price: "pain, isolation and alienation not only for women, but also for men". Gender theory has more recently been broadened to look at gender inequality more holistically-to include not only girls and women but also boys and men who "do not conform to, or who threaten or challenge, hegemonic notions of masculinity" (Morrell, 1998, p. 220). Thus, the two phenomena of this study, being "big men" and history textbooks will be researched to understand the notions of male hegemony and patriarchal power in South African history textbooks.

The research questions of this study therefore are:

1. What are the characteristics attributed to "big men" as portrayed in selected apartheid and post-apartheid era history textbooks?

2. Why are these characteristics attributed to "big men" in their depiction in selected apartheid and post-apartheid era history textbooks?

These research questions were designed with the aim of analysing the depiction of "big men" in the selected apartheid and post-apartheid history textbooks. The first research question will analyse how the "big men" are portrayed in the selected history textbooks and what characteristics are attributed to them in this depiction. The second research question deals with why these "big men" are portrayed the way they are in terms of characteristics and what the reasoning behind this is.

The key concepts that I will be working with in this study are "big men", male hegemony and masculinity and history textbooks. "Big men" were conceptualised in the literature review as great men or heroes in the history textbooks. They were considered "big" because of the status that was bestowed upon them by both the populace and the state. These "big men" are perceived as leaders of particular ability who possessed remarkable individual qualities (Clay, 1992). Male hegemony deals with patriarchal power and male domination in the depiction of "big men" in the history textbooks. Masculinity is associated with some qualities that supposedly define men which could include physical strength, intellectual abilities and economic resources (Swain, 2003).

1.5 Research design and methodology

The purpose of this section is to briefly describe the research design, the methodology and the methods employed to address the research questions listed. A more detailed explanation including a link between the methodology and the research findings is provided in chapters three and four respectively. Gray's (2004) template was used to outline the research design of this study. The research approach is qualitative in nature. This approach was used to explore and understand a specific phenomenon in this study that being "big men" in history textbooks. History textbooks from the apartheid and post-apartheid era were selected for analysis. Hence this is a longitudinal study. I employed qualitative textual (documentary) analysis as the research methodology. Content analysis and open coding were used as data analysis methods for the study.

The study is informed by the interpretivist paradigm. It has centred on an in-depth understanding of a phenomenon (Henning, 2004). This paradigm is appropriate for this study because it aims to provide a deeper understanding of the "big men" phenomenon evident in the selected South African history textbooks from two different eras. A qualitative textual analysis by means of open coding was employed to analyse the depiction of selected "big men" in the selected history textbooks. In this study I generated and interpreted data using interpretivism as a guiding paradigm. Qualitative content analysis was used for "subjective interpretation of the content of text data through a systematic classification process of coding and identifying themes and patterns" (Hsieh & Shannon, p.1278, 2005). Qualitative textual analysis examines meanings, themes and patterns that may be present or non-existent in a text (Ifversen, 2003). This method is inductive as inferences were drawn from the depiction of "big men" as they appear in the texts. Qualitative content analysis involves condensing raw data into categories or themes based on valid inferences and interpretation (Zhang & Wildemuth).

The study used open coding as a research tool. This is where coding categories were derived directly and inductively from the textbooks. Purposive sampling of four books each from the apartheid and post-apartheid era was undertaken. The texts were selected purposively to conduct the analysis and the findings were compared with the theoretical notions of "big men" in the literature review of the study. Within the selected texts, the sections in which "big men" appeared were analysed using open coding to identify the characteristics attributed to these men as historical characters. Open coding involves breaking down, comparing; conceptualising and categorising data (Nieuwenhuis, 2007).Data for open coding was selected using "open sampling". This involved identifying sections and portions of the text that led to greater understanding of categories and their properties. Through open coding I was able to locate themes and assign codes or labels to condense data into categories. The key points were marked with codes which were extracted from the text and were grouped into concepts. Categories were formed from these concepts which formed the basis of a theory.

Coding sheets were utilised to record the characteristics of "big men" as they were tracked.

There were no specific set of historical characteristics that I was looking for in the textual analysis but I did employ both inductive and *a priori* coding as the instruments of analysing the depiction of "big men" in the selected textbooks which enhanced the trustworthiness of my study. The open coding process was used to reveal the characteristics of the "big men" in the selected textbooks. Thus, the main objective behind the research methodology is to provide a better understanding of the depiction of "big men" and the characteristics attributed to them in selected apartheid and post-apartheid history textbooks.

1.6 Layout of study

The structure of the thesis comprised five chapters and this is how it will be presented:

Chapter One

This chapter provides an overview of the study. In this chapter I discussed the background and context of my study; the rationale and motivation for doing it as well as the purpose and focus of the study. The research design and methodology employed in the study are also clarified and a summary of the different chapters is also provided.

Chapter Two

This chapter provided an outline of the local and international research conducted in areas that directed the study. The literature pertaining to "big men" in history, history textbooks, textbooks and power and history textbooks in apartheid and post-apartheid South Africa were reviewed thematically in this chapter. The main phenomenon, that is ''big men'' in history textbooks was critiqued in this chapter. It also provided the theoretical framework for understanding ''big men'' in this study based on an analysis of different theories that have been proposed to explain "big men". The chapter also included the implications of the literature review for the purpose of this study. Moreover,

10

it explored the niches that do exist in the literature reviewed as part of the intellectual discourse on "big men" and history textbooks so as to find a place for my study.

Chapter Three

This chapter focussed on the research design and methodology that were employed to interpret the data required to answer the research questions of the study. The theoretical perspective, research approach, research methodology and data collection methods are outlined in this chapter.

Chapter Four

I presented the results of the data analysis in this chapter. The results of the data analysis were used to answer the research question of how "big men" are depicted in the textbook samples. I firstly presented an analysis of the data from the apartheid era history textbooks in order to conclude with a prototype of characteristics attributed to the apartheid era "big man" as a historical character. I then presented, in a similar manner, an analysis of data gathered from the post-apartheid era history textbooks to finalise the conclusion on characteristics attributed to the post-apartheid "big man". Firm findings were then presented.

Chapter Five

In this chapter I engaged with a second level of analysis with my data so as to answer my second research question, namely why were the "big men" portrayed the way they were as historical characters. I compared my findings as found in chapter four with the literature reviewed in chapter two. This second level of analysis enables me to discuss my findings and compare them to known knowledge found in the literature. This allowed me to propose a theoretical answer to the second research question. The study is also concluded in this chapter. Some implications of the findings of the study are discussed with suggestions and recommendations based on the implications. The limitations of the study were explained with the aim of initiating possibilities for further research on the topic.

1.7. Conclusion

In this chapter I introduced and summarised the research that is encapsulated in this dissertation. The main objective was to explain the background and context of study. In this chapter I foregrounded the context under which this study was undertaken. I also outlined the purpose and focus and the rationale and methodology of the study. The chapter concluded with an overview of the research study by providing a preview of the chapters to follow. In the next chapter the detailed literature review on ''big men'' and history textbooks will be presented.

CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1. Introduction

It is essential for this study to review the available literature on history textbooks and "big men" in history. The conceptualising of "big men" in history is the foundation for establishing how they are depicted, and the characteristics attributed to them, in the history textbooks that were analysed. This chapter begins by my examining the nature, purpose, methodology and structure of a literature review. I then relate these integral aspects to the literature reviewed for this study. The following themes are therefore discussed in this chapter:

- The nature, purpose, structure and methodology of the literature review
- The nature of textbooks
- The power of textbooks.
- The importance of history textbooks
- History textbooks in the apartheid and post-apartheid eras
- Conceptualising "big men"
- "Big men" in history textbooks

The aim of the literature review was to demonstrate the type of themes that are relevant to this research as well as the niche that exists for my study. As Kaniki (2006) points

out, thematic reviews are structured around different themes or perspectives in the literature and often focus on debates between different schools of thought. Finally, in my conclusion I synthesise the argument and provide an analysis of the themes that were unpacked to demonstrate the research gap that exists for my study in the literature reviewed.

2.2 The nature, purpose, structure and methodology of the literature review

A literature review frames a study or research and places it in context of previous research. This indicates how a proposed research project fits into a particular field of study. According to Boote and Beile (2005), a literature review transcends the simple search for information; it is an appraisal of literature relating to a specific study and in this case the depiction of "big men" in apartheid and post-apartheid era history textbooks. It is in a literature review that researchers provide a context for their research and illustrate where their research merges with existing knowledge in that particular field.

A literature review identifies the gaps that exist in a body of knowledge and creates a niche for the proposed study. Without a literature review "… you will not acquire an understanding of your topic, of what has already been done on it, how it has been researched, and what the key issues are" (Hart, 1998, p. 1). Therefore it is important that a researcher illustrates that he or she has read widely on the topic and is familiar with the key theories, concepts, thinkers and other studies which have been previously conducted regarding his or her research topic.

The purpose of a literature review is also to establish who has studied the research problem the researcher plans to examine. A research problem does not exist in isolation but must build upon what has been done previously (Kaniki, 2006). According to Neuman (2006), the necessity of a literature review in a research project is equally based on the assumption that knowledge accumulates and that people learn from and build on what others have done. Therefore, any specific research project is but a

fraction of the overall process of creating knowledge. As a result, reviewing the literature becomes an important step in the research process because there is a need for the study to build on existing knowledge and not to merely add to the accumulation of findings on a particular topic (Creswell, 2009).

Kaniki (2006) identifies other more specific purposes of a literature review which are: the identification of gaps in knowledge and the development of a research problem; the identification of a theoretical framework; identification of issues and variables related to the research topic; identifying conceptual and operational definitions; and lastly the possibility of the literature review revealing a number of similar or different methodologies that have been employed by others to study similar problems. In the view of Kaniki, "the more a method has been tested and adjusted for use in studying a specific problem, the more reliable it will be" (2006, p. 22).

The review of related literature also validates the researchability of the topic before the research proper commences (Hart, 1998). By becoming familiar with the history of the subject; the researcher will also become acquainted with the current research and debate on the topic. The literature review therefore distinguishes what has been done from what needs to be done and also discovers important variables relevant to the topic (Hart, 1998).

For the purpose of this study, I needed to create an awareness of developments in the field of textbook research. Furthermore, an understanding of how "big men" are depicted in literature was crucial as it would be valuable to the study to compare the depictions of "big men" in the textbooks to those in other forms of literature. In addition, reviewing the literature pertaining to history textbooks and "big men" was invaluable in understanding why "big men" are represented the way they were in the textbook sample. Thus, the purpose of reviewing the literature for this study is to provide a better understanding of the phenomenon of "big men" and the way they are depicted in history textbooks.

The literature presented in this chapter was reviewed by keeping the focus of the study in mind. The available literature on textbook research and "big men" is vast, and to review most of it would extend beyond the limits of this study. Therefore, I have only included the literature that is relevant to the themes that I have identified for the literature review. Initially, I began researching the study by reading academic literature on "big men". There was an adequate amount of literature on "big men" but very little critical material on how they are portrayed in history textbooks. I then began researching the issues concerning textbooks both globally and locally. The research on issues concerning textbooks was vast. I obtained the literature through various sources. The main source of my literature was via the internet through desktop searches via electronic databases such as Google Scholar. I also sourced literature from the libraries of the University of KwaZulu-Natal (UKZN). Literature was also obtained from my supervisor.

A thematic approach has been used to structure the literature review. The various themes as mentioned in the introduction of this chapter are unpacked by providing a critique of the literature dealing with the topic. Organising the literature review in such a manner is highly flexible as, "… the complex nature of work in an area can be respected while at the same time bringing some degree of order and organisation to the material" (McLeod, 2003, p. 19).

This chapter, therefore, presents the literature review by examining the nature and power of textbooks. I then outline the importance of history textbooks in general. Literature pertaining to history textbooks in the apartheid and post-apartheid eras in South Africa is then reviewed. This is followed by a conceptualisation of the phenomenon of "big men". Finally, in this chapter I examine the way in which "big men" are portrayed in history textbooks. The arguments and contestations are then drawn together to demonstrate where the gap for my study exists in history textbook research.

2.3 The nature of textbooks

Textbooks are a "… representation of political, cultural, economic and political battles and compromises" and they are therefore extremely complex (Crawford, 2004, p. 2). Sleeter and Grant (1991) support this by pointing out that textbooks are symbolic representations of the world as well as the society in which we live. Textbooks are, therefore contentious in nature.

The symbolic representation in textbooks firstly confers authority on the dominant status of certain groups, such as men, in society. This can be illustrated in the way certain social groups are depicted in the textbooks. Secondly, symbolic representations or social constructs are projected as the truth. This in itself is contentious, particularly in texts which deal with history, as history can never be seen in a truthful manner as it is full of ambiguities and thus there can be no truth but merely different interpretations which are generally subjective in nature. Therefore, what is regarded as 'truth' is forever changing and is open to interpretation because what is included in textbooks is set out to fulfil a particular agenda of the state in space and time (Sleeter & Grant). The third and final reason symbolic representation is important in textbooks is the text which "… screens in and screens out certain ideas and realms of knowledge" (Sleeter & Grant, 1991, pp. 79-80). This prompts learners and even teachers to think and act in certain ways and not to consider the alternatives. Textbooks can therefore never be neutral as they cannot disguise their ideological and cultural potency (Foster & Crawford, 2006) and are therefore contentious not only in terms of which content is included but also by design.

Texts according to Apple (2000) also have the dual nature of either regulating or liberating. Although there are several phases in textbook production, many of them are controlled by the state in collaboration with the publishing industry. Therefore, textbooks have the power to regulate or are regulated by what is taught in terms of content and ideology as well as the power to liberate if the content portrays the state in a favourable light. For example in Russia, during Communist rule, history textbooks deliberately portrayed the ideologies of Leninism in a positive manner http://www.saHistory.org.za). Therefore, the powers of those particular textbooks were focussed on regulating as

opposed to liberating. Similarly, under apartheid in South Africa texts were seen to regulate knowledge as opposed to liberating thus illustrating the very contentious core of the nature of textbooks.

The treatment of women and also the approach to non-British states in international affairs are some examples of prejudiced accounts in history textbooks. These interpretations in history textbooks are highlighted in a report by the Schools Council History Project (SCHP) in Britain (1976).Likewise, Lin et al (2009) indicate that a comparative content analysis of history textbooks from Japan, China, South Korea and the United States of America (USA) revealed major discrepancies and differing views dealing with the Korean War of 1950-1953.Hence ,authorities play a critical role in determining not only what content should be included in textbooks, but also how some facets of history must be disseminated.

The curriculum informs the content of the textbook. It is a socially constructed program of what is to be taught and textbooks have to adhere to such a program. Education is therefore not neutral simply because the curriculum that regulates what is taught is not neutral itself (Apple, 1990; 1993). The curriculum enjoys high order prioritisation in education and is often a battleground where interest groups fight to determine whose knowledge is most valuable and thus included as 'official knowledge' (Apple, 1993).

Schools are regarded as agents for social control in that learners are socialised. Knowledge that is disseminated in schools is selected form a larger body of knowledge by the dominant class. Who determines what is taught and what content should be in the textbooks determines how political and cultural domination is achieved in schools and consequently in wider society (Apple, 1993). Thus the first step in achieving domination would be to regulate the school curriculum which determines what content is included in textbooks and what is taught in schools. Therefore, the curriculum (and the textbooks it spawns) cannot be regarded as neutral, but rather the object of debate and scrutiny amongst interest groups who strive to achieve cultural and political hegemony in a society.

As noted previously, the curriculum determines the content and form of the textbook. The curriculum is a product of socio-political battles and it is understood that the textbook is also such a product. Textbooks are "conceived and designed by real people with real interests" (Apple, 1992, p. 4). The decision behind the choice of content in textbooks is therefore based on specific intentions and motives. Thus, any depiction of heroes or "big men" in the case of this study, or representations found in textbooks, has real motives behind it (McKinney, 2005). Textbook authors and producers, who are themselves a product of their own social environment, cannot be disinterested parties. Textbook content is therefore not neutral but contains knowledge that is carefully and purposefully selected by people with their own agendas in mind.

The textbook also carries strong cultural messages (Foster & Crawford, 2006). In the textbook, which is an instrument of socialisation, there exists the fundamental cultural knowledge which learners are likely to embrace (Crawford, 2000). According to Fitzgerald, cited in Foster and Crawford (2006), the function of the textbook is to "tell the children what their elders want them to know" (p. 4). Here the 'elders' refer to those in the dominant cultural group. Textbooks also play an important role in defining whose culture is taught (Apple, 1992). This means that textbooks generally reflect the culture of the dominant group. Textbooks are therefore cultural artefacts that contain the values of dominant cultural and social groups (Foster & Crawford, 2006). Thus the textbook can also be used as a medium for cultural domination.

Textbooks are also key elements in the formation of 'appropriate' ideologies and are a reflection of the values and knowledge which are regarded as important by dominant groups in a society (Dean, Hartmann, & Katzen, 1983). This is relevant for this study, as the depiction of for example Verwoerd in apartheid era history textbooks or Mandela in post-apartheid era history textbooks is likely to support the values of the dominant political groups that they represent. Therefore, textbook content is the result of competition between powerful groups who fully understand its centrality to the

furtherance of their political goals and disseminating their ideology (Crawford, 2003). Therefore, textbooks often carry obvious political messages.

The purpose of a textbook can then be to "… influence the knowledge and understanding that young people [learners] have about their past and environment" (Bourdillon, 1992, p. 6). Selander (1990, p. 140) in turn claims that "… the purpose and function of the textbook is to fit into the institution's 'education' … the idea is not to present new knowledge per se, but to reproduce already known knowledge." Therefore, textbooks in any discipline will influence the way already known knowledge is presented to learners. This knowledge can be presented in any form, maintaining that power exists with teachers to portray events or happenings as social constructs in any way that is in accordance with the state endorsed curriculum.

Textbooks are not only conveyors of knowledge but they are the conveyors of state sanctioned knowledge. This state sanctioned knowledge can be called the official narrative of a country or nation state. Therefore, the state sees it fit to mould the official narrative into a curriculum that agrees with its political ideology and framework (Foster & Crawford, 2006; Sleeter & Grant, 1991). The official narrative is what is intended to be taught in schools by means of textbooks which are official as it is endorsed by the Department of Basic Education and Training (DoBET) and by means of the CAPS in the case of South Africa. It is merely a version of the truth which the state wants learners in schools to learn about and understand. Textbooks are therefore powerful ideological constructs which can be used to promote particular perspectives and negate others. In the case of this study the characteristics of "big men" across two vastly different political eras

The nature of textbook production and the demands of the capitalist driven market also determine the content of textbooks. Finance and costing place pressure on publishers. The textbook industry is profit driven (Crawford & Foster, 2006; Apple, 1991) therefore, content and ideology becomes less significant for publishers. Publishers strive to position their textbooks on an approved textbook list because this makes a textbook

20

more profitable. Thus, publishers avoid the inclusion of controversial content (Apple, 1991). Therefore textbook publishers must ensure that official knowledge as encapsulated in for example curricula is adhered to in pursuit of profits.

The editorial process also impacts on the content of textbooks. Crawford and Foster (2006) mention that textbooks are 'designed' by editors instead of being written by the authors themselves. The original work of authors is edited with authors sometimes rewriting a large part of the textbook. This editing occurs for many reasons; to maintain the form and shape of a series of textbooks, to make it more accessible to the reader or to decrease the content. Thus school textbooks are not only products of authors but also editors. Therefore, the originality of the content of the textbook becomes questionable.

In this theme I have explored the nature of textbooks and it has emerged that textbook content is not neutral but is a reflection of the official knowledge of dominant interest groups within a society. The way in which textbooks are produced also impacts on the representation of official knowledge within the textbooks. Therefore, the nature of textbooks also has implications for the way in which "big men" are portrayed in the selected history textbooks of this study

2.4 The power of textbooks

It is evident from the previous theme that a textbook is a product of social constructivism where various interest groups strive to maintain social and cultural hegemony in society. Thus, its content is perceived to have great power. In this theme I elaborate on the power of the textbook and ask, "What innate power does the textbook possess?" This power of textbooks is reinforced by the fact that textbook are usually the most readily available resource at the teachers' and learners' disposal. Apple (1991, p. 6) states that, "… textbooks, for better or worse, dominate what learners learn. For many learners, textbooks are their first and sometimes only early exposure to books and reading." Therefore, textbooks have immense power. Textbooks are often the only text or

information with which learners are confronted but they can also be viewed as, "… the commercial product it is, operating in a market which is sometimes sensitive to quality, but implacable on price" (Wilkes, n.d., p. 16). Thus, textbooks are also powerful as an economic commodity and function as part of an economic process (Lebrun, 2002). Consequently, textbooks are powerful in many ways and thus, cannot be defined as having a single purpose.

Textbooks convey instruction or information and in each instance, the text is regarded as the 'expert' from where knowledge is gleaned (Crawford, 2004). The impact of such a text is more powerful at school level and textbooks are thus regarded as one of the, "… most important educational inputs: texts reflect basic ideas about a national culture, and are … often a flashpoint of cultural struggle and controversy" (Altbach, 1991, p. 257) and are therefore frequently used world-wide including in South Africa. Foster and Crawford (2006, p. xi) note the importance of textbooks when they argue that, "textbooks and other books of text have been both important and ubiquitous in schools across many hundreds of years [and] they continue to be central to school curricula … in almost all countries." It is therefore evident that textbooks play a powerful role in school education including history.

Textbooks are also used as political tools. Firer (1998, p.196) contends that, "Textbooks, as 'legitimized knowledge,' are reliable mirrors of the political culture of societies", and are therefore powerful political tools. Apple and Christian-Smith (1991, p. 3) agree that textbooks are, "… published within the political and economic constraints of markets, resources, and power" implying that textbooks are not only used to impart knowledge but do so in a politically constructed manner. Textbooks, then, have a major influence on how learners think and understand, how and what they learn, as well as how teachers teach a particular topic or content. This is so because the text is regarded as the official narrative and authorised version of the state. Textbooks are therefore, powerful tools for society as they signify particular constructions of reality and reflect the values and aspirations of society (Apple & Christian-Smith, 1991; Foster & Crawford, 2006; Sleeter & Grant, 1991). Therefore, although textbooks are constructed by various

individuals and influenced by different stakeholders such as ideology; the state; publishers; teachers and textbook authors, they present a broader cultural message which emerges from the state sanctioned curriculum and thus, present what is known as the official narrative. In the case of this study it would be the official narrative on "big men" during two different eras.

Textbooks also play a pivotal role in a student's academic life. The textbook is one of the key elements in the education of learners and they spend many hours learning its content. In practice Apple found that a textbook is used "75% of time in class and 90% of time on homework" (Apple, 1991, p. 24). Moreover, textbooks also determine what learners learn in preparation for texts and exams, and consequently have tremendous power in that "official knowledge" could be stored in the long term memory of future generations (Apple & Christian-Smith, 1991). Some teachers encourage rote learning to enhance retention of information. Textbooks in such cases have greater implications concerning political and social control. Thus, considering the content of the textbook, the amount of time spent by learners with textbooks and the fact that learners have to write examinations based on textbook knowledge gives the textbook considerable power.

The power of the textbooks is reinforced by the fact that textbooks are often the most readily available resource at the teachers' and learners' disposal. According to Husbands (1996, pp. 88-89) "… the principle teaching tools we have to develop our pupils' [learners'] understanding and awareness are words: their words, our words and the words of actors in the past as they are presented to us in documents or as textbooks". Textbooks are also the first body of knowledge that learners are introduced to and thus, as Paxton (1999) notes, the most common text with which learners are familiar. As a result, the textbook has power and control over the learners' consumption of knowledge; the teachers' presentation of content and the way the text is actually presented.

From the arguments presented on the power of the textbook it can be deduced that textbooks are not only conveyors of knowledge but also conveyors of state sanctioned knowledge. This state sanctioned knowledge can also be called, as far as history is concerned, the official narrative of a country. Thus, for the most part, the state shapes the official narrative into a curriculum that is aligned with its political ideology and framework (Foster & Crawford, 2006; Sleeter & Grant, 1991). The official narrative is proposed to be taught in schools through the medium of textbooks which are official as it is endorsed in the South African context at present, by the DoBE by means of the CAPS. During the apartheid era, the Department of National Education (DoNE) (and the myriad of apartheid era departments it controlled) was responsible for sanctioning the official curriculum on which textbooks were based (Dean, Hartmann& Katzen, 1983). The implication of the power that the textbook has for this study is significant as the textbook represents the official narrative. Therefore, this ultimately impacts on how "big men" are depicted in the history textbooks. Textbooks are not only powerful but are also embedded in ideological discourses used by the state to promote a particular ideology. This ideological discourse becomes the official state sanctioned narrative which is evident in learners' textbooks. Thus, if the state and society are dominated by men, then what is presented in textbooks and how it is presented, especially in history textbooks is questionable.

2.5 The importance of history textbooks

The previous theme dealt with the power of textbooks and whilst this applies to textbooks in general, it also applies to history textbooks. It can be argued that history textbooks are even more powerful than textbooks in general as the nature of the subject is politically charged and contentious in nature and filled with ideological discourses. Stojanovic (2001, p. 27) states that "History textbooks are among the most important means for shaping national identity and historical awareness. Owing to them, pupils [learners] are at an early age imbued with images of their own nation, its place in History, its characteristics, as well as with images of other notably neighbouring people."

History textbooks are therefore ideologically contentious as there are no living memories for events, as learners and teachers only have the books as resources.

The history textbook contains the agreed upon collective national memory of a society. Politicians, governments and other stakeholders are therefore interested in its content. Santoli (1999) acknowledges the importance of history textbooks in the classroom as playing a major role in shaping learners' knowledge about their country's and other countries' history. Nicholls (2003, p. 180) also places emphasis on the importance of history textbooks by arguing that "… at the present time textbooks continue to be important resources in History lessons in many countries, their production, distribution and usage tied to major economic, political and ideological interests." Hence, the history textbook is integral to the teaching and learning process and is a powerful medium which is used to promote the state's ideology.

Governments and nation states note the importance of history textbooks as an appropriate vehicle with which to inculcate in learners a shared set of values, a national ethos, and a sense of political correctness. History textbooks therefore, it is argued, contain the 'national historical narrative', an account that defines the conceptions of nationhood (Foster & Crawford, 2006). At this juncture it is important to acknowledge that the textbook is probably the only history book most people will read (Morgan, 2012). Most learners according to Vinterek (2009) state that if they do get to read a text it is more likely to be in a history class. Thus, few students will encounter alternative histories while the majority will remember the official knowledge that they were exposed to at school. For example, Anderson (2007) states that in Moldovan public schools, history classes and textbooks are expected to transmit ideas about the nation and the state, thus creating and maintaining national identity and citizenship. Therefore, history textbooks are official narratives of a country and are powerful in promoting certain perspectives and ideologies in textbooks.

In many history classrooms learners are exposed to narratives that are selected by dominant groups to reinforce a collective memory. Foster (2011) states that many

publications on history textbook knowledge concur that history textbooks are regarded as powerful media through which specific aspects of nationhood are presented. History textbook authors deliberately include some information and exclude others. According to Stojanovic (2001), national heroes of one nation can be regarded in another as the main anti-heroes. Likewise, she further maintains that the same historical personalities may be portrayed as exclusive national heroes in historical awareness of two or three peoples, with their names adjusted to a specific national language. Thus these choices are made for ideological reasons and reflect the values and beliefs of dominant groups in society.

The presentation of knowledge in history textbooks is shaped by ideological and cultural forces within a country. Political and cultural interest groups influence the selection of content which is placed in history textbooks. This is done to achieve power within a society. Governments are fully aware of the importance of history in creating a national narrative, a collective memory, which consolidates their notion of nationhood and national identity (Weldon, 2003; Foster & Crawford, 2006; Torsti, 2007).

The state is dependent on a collective nationhood. Therefore the history textbook is integral in the creation of a national narrative. The nation state may not tell the truth about itself, but strives to shape a single and unifying historical narrative. All other inputs and conflicting views are disregarded in order to create a national narrative. This narrative must be relevant in order to mobilise support of the citizens. Such a narrative can be useful in invoking the memories of past heroes who made sacrifices in service of the nation (Foster & Crawford, 2006). Therefore, the history textbook is important as it contains the national narrative of a state and in the case of this study the narrative on the characteristics attributed to "big men."

There are stereotypes that can be found in the analysis of history textbooks. In most countries, history textbooks provide factual, descriptive accounts of political and military events without any evaluation or value judgements. "Nevertheless, there are underlying ethnocentric stereotypes that cannot be detected at first sight but which can prove to be

more effective and thus dangerous" (Koulouri, 2001, p. 17). These stereotypes are evident in the structure of the historical narrative, in periodization, in historical concepts and vocabulary. For that reason, they are also influential in the way in which "big men" are portrayed in school history textbooks which is the focus of my research. Thus, history textbooks are important because they contain underlying stereotypes which are used to achieve the intended purpose.

History textbooks are also agents of socialization: "For many people it is only during their time in school that they are actively exposed to historical knowledge" (Schissler, n.d, p. 94). In this regard history textbooks contain valuable and authoritative knowledge. Decision makers have a vested interest in the content of teaching resources, because schools are the most important institutions for socialising the future generation into the value system of a given society (Schissler, n.d, p. 94). History textbooks are thus used by the state for conveying social and political values. This then raises significant questions about groups within society: Who do textbooks grant agency? What role do groups of people play? How are men and women portrayed? Do they play a role at all in "history"? What about minorities? These are questions which are directly and indirectly related to the depiction of "big men" in this study.

The history textbook is also an important document for historians. Historians use a wide variety of texts and write about them. There are other forms of historical evidence such as photographs, films, buildings, oral histories and archaeological artefacts etc. but written documents are more valuable for historians (Paxton, 1999). In the light of this Paxton claims that, "Historical texts are in effect artifactual evidence to be used in an interpretative, constructive, analytic and dialogic process" (1999, p. 317). As a result, the history textbooks that have been selected for this study are the most appropriate documents which are used to analyse the depiction of "big men".

In South Africa, history textbooks play an important role because teachers do not have access to other forms or types of media or subject content (Bloch, 2009). This is highlighted by the *Report of History/ Archaeology Panel* to then Minister of Education

who noted that "History textbooks cannot but remain central to the cause of an improved History Education" (*Report of the History/ Archaeology Panel*, 2000). The current Minister of Basic Education and Training, Angelina Motshekga also emphasised the general impact of textbooks in the teaching and learning process by stating that textbooks are the most "effective tool to ensure consistency, coverage, appropriate pacing and better quality in terms of instruction and content" (Motshekga, 2009, p. 1).

Because of their power states are known to have manipulated the history textbook by conveying information that can be regarded as official history or the official narrative. This official history is merely a version of the truth that the state wants its people to appreciate and understand which excludes and includes events as long as they agree with the adopted political ideology and framework (Crawford, 2006; Foster& Crawford, 2006; Sleeter & Grant, 1991). Thus historical exclusions in history textbooks are rife (Kennedy-Manzo, 2004; Nash, 2009). International literature also confirms that states and governments are instrumental in what history content is taught in schools. In Zimbabwe, for example, textbooks are sanctioned by the government to portray their work in a positive light – hence there is no mention of land distributions and international sanctions are blamed for the disasters that have occurred in the country (Jobling, 2006). The Chinese government likewise monitors the writing of history textbooks which are of paramount importance in maintaining the ideological status quo. Content of textbooks is carefully controlled and important events such as the Tiananmen Square uprisings are excluded (Crawford, 2000). The Japanese government similarly monitors and controls textbook content. Textbooks are vetted and approved by a textbook screening committee (Crawford, 2006). Here a textbook, *New Japanese History*, was rejected because it contained too many negative illustrations of Japan's experience of World War II. This illustrates the importance of the history textbook in conveying only state sanctioned knowledge.

2.6 History textbooks in Apartheid and Post-Apartheid South Africa

It is necessary for the purpose of this study to explore the discourse surrounding apartheid and post-apartheid school history textbooks in South Africa. This understanding will shed some light as to how these textbooks were used by the state and other interest groups to portray the ''big men'' selected for the study. I will first examine the issues surrounding apartheid history textbooks and then trace the development of history textbooks post-apartheid.

South African history in the apartheid era was largely based on the legitimacy of white objectives (Dean, Hartmann & Katzen, 1983). The non-whites, especially blacks were presented as obstacles to the achievements of white objectives.

Apartheid era history textbooks conform to a paradigm that has dominated and still largely dominates South African historical writing. This paradigm contains the implicit assumptions that history begins with the arrival of the whites and is primarily concerned with the attempts of different white groups in establishing themselves politically, socially and economically (Dean, Hartmann & Katzen, 1983). The textbooks from the apartheid era were consequently used as tools to legitimise apartheid ideology (Weldon, 2003). Thus, until recently, there has been little effort by historians to write about people that were not white in history. Auerbach (1965) found that much emphasis was placed on the history of Europeans in South Africa, especially Afrikaners. In line with this the education system during the apartheid era used textbooks as a medium through which ideology was disseminated. Unsurprisingly only positive aspects of Afrikaner history were portrayed in South African history textbooks (Engelbrecht, 2006).

The differences between whites and blacks were highlighted to establish a favourable disposition for the white group and to justify the actions of this group (Engelbrecht, 2006). Therefore there was very little done to highlight the positive aspects of the history of black groups until recently. Their history was neglected as reflected in the school textbooks of the era. Thus the apartheid history textbooks contained strong political and ideological content that was aligned to the racist political dispensation of the day.

Furthermore, there was evidence of crude stereotyping of ethnic groups in the textbooks (Dean, Hartmann & Katzen, 1983) which further divided society. Apartheid textbooks had further limitations in that they adhered to a Rankean historiography, with its sexist 'great men' approach (Engelbrecht, 2008). This had powerful implications for this study which analyses the depiction of "big men", especially "big white" men in apartheid era history textbooks. An analysis of the textbooks later on in the study will provide answers as to how these "big men" were portrayed in order to promote the ideology of the dominant group.

Apartheid era history textbooks also contained myths that were used as vehicles to legitimise the apartheid political system (Engelbrecht, 2006). Myths, such as the belief that white settlers settled on unoccupied land, were powerful devices for justifying white minority rule. Carnevon, cited in da Cruz (2005), identified 10 myths present in apartheid era textbooks that promoted the ideology of the apartheid government. The most popular was the myth that the Voortrekkers moved into uninhabited land and thus had the unchallenged right to settle in such areas. The second myth was that traditional African leaders were only warmongering, blood thirsty despots (da Cruz, 2005). The apartheid history textbooks include the arrival of trekkers who eventually brought peace, thus justifying white minority rule (Bam & Visser, 1996).

According to Polakow-Suranski (2002) Afrikaner nationalist history after the Anglo Boer War of 1899-1902 can be regarded as a response to forced Anglicisation policies and the inculcation of British education norms. Hence, pro-British bias in history textbooks was present long before the advent of Afrikaner nationalism. Therefore, the Afrikaner used this to justify the rewriting of Afrikaner history with the Afrikaner being the protagonist after the founding of the apartheid state in 1948.The main objective behind the history textbook narrative in the apartheid era was to establish a national identity and develop the current social order and national orientation. Thus, history textbooks were used by the Afrikaner in a biased manner to promote Afrikaner nationalism.

C.J. Joubert's textbook *History for standard 6 written* in 1975 is a good account of a biased narrative found in apartheid history textbooks. Polakow-Suranski's analysis of this textbook indicates that the text devotes only one-third of its 156 pages to South African history and of this one-third, half is devoted to the Great Trek and white settlement (Polakow-Suranski, 2002). Historian Charles Van Onselen has referred to this as the "Great Trek virus" and laments that this virus has so profoundly stultified the practice and teaching of history in South Africa (Du Bruyn, 1997, p. 137).

Polakow-Suranski (2002) affirms further that the section of Joubert's *History for Standard 6* (1975) that deals with black history focusses on strengthening the white presence in South Africa by promoting the theory that blacks are not actually from South Africa but they have emerged from around the Great Lake regions of Central Africa. These textbooks included master symbols and stereotypes which were used to promote Afrikaner nationalism that had been dominated by the former British and was still considered threatened by the black majority population (Du Preez, 1983).

Apartheid era textbooks presented history that merely justified Afrikaner supremacy and Afrikaner struggle for autonomy and this struggle was a fundamental aspect of the South African curriculum and history textbooks of the time (Engelbrecht, 2008). Du Preez (1983) conducted an analysis of some 53 textbooks in use in apartheid era black and white schools to justify this. Master symbols were identified in this study amongst which was the notion that "whites are superior and blacks are inferior" (Engelbrecht, 2008, p. 1). These master symbols also form part of the discourse on how "big men" are portrayed in the apartheid era history textbooks. The study by Du Preez (1983) implies that the textbooks were responsible for the ideological conflict in pre-1994 South African society as the apartheid regime used history textbooks to endorse apartheid ideology.

Msila (2007, p. 151) noted that the main goals of the new educational system introduced by the new democratic government in 1994 were "to create a new South African identity that encompasses critical consciousness, to transform South African society, to promote democracy and to magnify learner involvement in education".

Current textbooks were expected to conform to these ideals. However, this is not evident as contemporary studies on South African history textbooks reveal a reversal of the racial identities that characterised the apartheid era. These textbooks now focus on silences and omissions regarding the white minority population; their aspirations and their leaders, and new stereotypes are deliberately presented to challenge apartheid stereotypes (Engelbrecht, 2008). This argument implies that current South African history textbooks have the power to portray "big men" of the post-apartheid era in way that the dominant group wishes, thereby legitimating the government's ideology.

The former South African Minister of Education Kader Asmal in 2004, as cited in Engelbrecht (2008) alluded to this when he declared:

> In Africa, in the struggle between the hunter and the lion, the hunter has written the history. The lion, we have always hoped, will one day have its day. The lion will one day have its say. The lion will one day rise up and write the history of Africa. We know, very well, the kinds of histories that have been written by the hunter. Those books only serve the hunter's interests. But those books are so often also boring and stultifying. We now want to hear the lion's story. We now want to hear the lion's roar (p. 523).

The government therefore acknowledges that the history of black South Africans had been marginalized for many years and with political freedom now, it is time for this disadvantaged group to start writing their own version of history (Fru, 2012). This concurs with Steve Biko's position on the need to discredit apartheid myths and to rehabilitate the history of South African blacks as is clearly expressed in his words: "… If we as blacks want to aid each other in our coming into consciousness, we have to rewrite our history …" (da Cruz, 2005, p. 81). Therefore an analysis of South African history textbooks post-1994 is imperative in order to establish how ''big men" are portrayed in these textbooks as a means of promoting political ideology – and also to determine what, if any, change or continuity occurred across the two eras.

Da Cruz (2005) indicates that some post-1994 South African history textbooks can be classified as being impartial. He points out that unlike white supremacist history that had

thrived for centuries with a dominant paradigm and grand old narrative, the remains of black history are significant as they have never been told in South African schools therefore, "… even if the beginnings of a vague black history exist somewhere in the new textbooks, black history as a historical narrative does not" (p. 83). However, he maintains that when these contemporary textbooks are considered in a real world context it becomes clear that they have made little effort to rectify the "lingering injustices committed by its predecessors" (p. 83). This has implications as to whether the "big men" identified in selected textbooks in the study still appear in a hegemonic manner.

The role of master symbols used to proliferate particular ideologies in South African history textbooks during the pre- and post-apartheid eras is a recurrent discourse. Engelbrecht (2008) and Polakow-Suranski (2002) indicate that master symbols in history textbooks become embedded in society's collective consciousness because they determine the socio- cultural generalisations of a society. These symbols could play an important role in creating consciousness of the social order among children as they are similar to mythologies and stereotypes. Therefore, the Nationalist Party regarded these master symbols as ideal weapons to maintain their status quo in the South African social structure and therefore used them widely in history textbooks in the apartheid era. Thus, these master symbols may be influential in the way in which "big men", especially "big" white men were depicted in the apartheid era textbooks.

Morgan and Henning (2011) point out that through a reductionist approach, new stereotypes have emerged in post-apartheid era history textbooks. Stereotypes such as black and white and perpetrator and victim were evident in most of the textbooks that they analysed. History textbooks did very little to highlight complex issues such as racism and imperialism. Although there was a transition from apartheid ideology, contemporary South African history textbooks have their own stereotypes.

2.7 Conceptualising "big men" in history textbooks

Much has thus far been made of "big men" and it is necessary to clarify it as a concept. The "big men" in history theory was popular in the 19th century and was used to explain history by dint of the influence of "great men" or heroes. Thomas Carlyle, the 19th century historian, stated that "the history of the world is but the biography of great men", reflecting his belief that male heroes shape history through both their personal characteristics and divine inspiration (Carneiro, 1981, p. 171). This implies that the personal qualities and character of these men, together with their personal relationship with God, may have an impact on the way they exercised power.

Hutchins (2011, p. 649) alludes to a similar notion by stating that "they are often ascribed (quasi-) divine roles and devotion in the national consciousness." Carlyle asserted that "big men" are "heroic individuals who arrive invariably onto the world scene to guide humanity to higher levels of existence and provide leadership in times of crises" (Shields, 2002, p. 2). He also maintains that the "Great Man" is not a mere product of time and culture but is instead God ordained (Shields, 2002, p. 3). Anthony Smith as cited in Hutchins (2011, p. 649) "has demonstrated how heroes can function as spiritual ancestors of the nation, thus fostering a sense of community grounded in these shared values and meeting the fundamental needs for a sense of meaning, security and belonging." These assertions imply that "big men" serve as role models for their communities and their virtuous conduct and heroic deeds were a source of inspiration to their followers.

Throughout history men have dominated the discourse in the subject and at times one perceived history to be only about men, and not only ordinary men but "big men". These were politicians, philanthropists, military leaders and so forth. The poem by Bertolt Brecht, "Questions of a worker reading History", is significant at this juncture as it attempts to differentiate between ordinary men and "great men" or "big men." Brecht makes mention of people in the poem who would not appear in the majority of history textbooks such as slaves, builders, bricklayers, cooks and citizens. This implies that ordinary people are the most important in history because "they are the people who compose the vast majority of the citizenry in virtually every country in the world"

(Bermeo, 2003, p. 3). According to Bermeo (2003) the actions of "great men" are conditioned by their judgements of how ordinary people will behave. Ordinary people become active participants in determining the future of ''great men'' and their countries when they assume roles as "voters", "demonstrators" and as "members" of public associations. Therefore, ordinary people are the most important in history because they have the power to shape the leadership of "great men" through collective or individual action.

Brecht, who was a Marxist writer, does not make reference to any women in his poem. According to Martens (2001, p. 3), "feminism was considered contrary to socialist ideology and therefore was strictly discouraged." This also demonstrates the hegemonic power of "great men" and how they were depicted. Invariably these men were attributed with certain characteristics, such as wealth, association with royalty, power and influence almost in a hegemonic manner. Wright (1956, p. 1) makes reference to this hegemonic power of "great men" in American society by stating that "the power elite is composed of men whose positions enable them to transcend the ordinary environments of ordinary men and women" and "they run the machinery of the state and claim its prerogatives". Thus Brecht's poem demonstrates male patriarchal power by excluding women.

One of the strongest and most authoritative theoretical voices in pro-feminist scholarship, which is needed to understand "big men" in history, is that of R.W. Connell. Connell's theory of masculinity (1996) describes four categories or groups of men that emerge in the analysis of different forms of masculinity. The first is hegemonic masculinity. This refers to masculinity that is shaped by the legitimacy of patriarchy. Because of the configuration of various masculine practices and values, this is the group that has traditionally been exalted as the dominant form of masculinity and in existing it serves to subordinate the other gender as well as other forms of masculinity. Examples of such forms of masculinity are evident in the celebration of athleticism over the arts; the emphasis of physical activity over academic pursuits; body strength over emotional strength; action over thought, older men over younger men and also men

over women. Thus, the classical "big man." However, as Connell points out, new forms of masculinity are always challenging the hegemonic as "it is a historically mobile relation" (Connell, 1996, p. 207).

The second category according to Connell (1996) is subordinate masculinity. This category is created through various gender relation practices that seek to establish a masculinity hierarchy with hegemonic masculinity at the top and various subordinate masculinities at the bottom. This will consequently also affect those heterosexual men who do not share the same gender values or practices as the hegemonic form of masculinity. Homophobia is played out in order to naturalize dominant gender performances and to eradicate that which is different. According to Connell (1996), it is a form of masculinity policing.

The third category is that of complicit masculinity. This category exists because most men do not in fact attain the normative practices of hegemony. Although most men benefit from the patriarchal dividend that emerges from hegemonic masculinity through such practices as the domination of men over women, not all men embody the ideals or practices of the hegemonic man. Yet in order for the hegemonic form of masculinity to dominate, various complicit intermediaries - lesser masculinities that serve to highlight the subordinates - are required in order to exalt the hegemonic. This group constructs its masculinity by "gaining the patriarchal dividend without the tension or risks of being the frontline troops of patriarchy" (Connell, 1996, p. 21). Hegemonic masculinity dominates because of the complicit masculinity's silence.

The last category according to Connell (1996) is the marginalized form of masculinity. This deals with the interplay between gender and other structures of society such as class and race. Marginalization is always in relation to the dominant form of masculinity. In the context of my study the dominant form of masculinity may or may not be evident depending on how the "big" men are depicted in the history textbooks. There may or may not be a specific race or class of the "big" man that could emerge from the analysis of the history textbooks although the emphasis is on the characteristics of these men.

Swain (2003) agrees with Connell (1996) that masculinities come into existence as people act. They are not predetermined. Masculinities rather are constructed by social and material practices. Schools and academic subjects therefore play an important role in the construction of masculinities. This is imperative in this study as textbook publishers, authors and the state are also responsible for the construction of masculinities in textbooks in order to legitimate the dominant ideology. Therefore, Connell's theory of masculinity is significant in that it clarifies what hegemonic masculinity is. We need this understanding in order to explain why "big men" are exalted in the history textbooks in the way they are depicted.

According to Clay (1992) "big men" are perceived as leaders of particular ability who, through their remarkable individual qualities manage to overcome, though never totally, the limitations of their unstable and underdeveloped political systems. These were the characteristics that set them apart from ordinary men and women. However, ordinary individuals can also make a difference in history. Bermeo (2003, p. 4) states that "as individuals, ordinary people can be democracy's fickle friends. In times of crisis, they will abandon democratic parties and support polarized parties instead". Therefore the ordinary person has the power of voting in the leader of choice in a democracy and also joins the masses in a revolution to overthrow weak dictator.

However, "big men" also have power and agency that can supersede that of ordinary people. With reference to the "great men" in Brecht's poem they did accomplish what they set out to achieve: Frederick the Great won the Seven Years War, Alexander conquered India and Caesar beat the Gauls. However, all these "great men" never accomplished these achievements on their own. They were supported by ordinary people such as builders, cooks and slaves. Therefore it is both the actions and abilities of "big men" and the support of their citizens together with their perceptions of these men that makes them ''big''. Historians and their depiction of "big men" in history textbooks and the media's depiction of "big men" are significant in conceptualising the phenomenon of "big men". Thus the notion of "big men" is conceived by their own

perceptions of "greatness" and how the rest of the world perceives them. Examples of this are to be found in the work of Maylam (2011).

Maylam (2011) offers portraits of a few 'luminous figures' that were heads of state in their countries in the twentieth century. These include Jawaharlal Nehru, the first prime minister of India; Olaf Palme, the prime minister of Sweden and Nelson Mandela, the first democratically elected black president of South Africa. According to Maylam (2011), these presidents and prime ministers are portrayed as "luminous figures", not as heroes or "great leaders". He further argues that "greatness" is much of the time an empty, meaningless concept. If the concept is to be used, then the criteria for 'greatness' have to be clarified. For the most part they are not. For him "greatness is associated with a set of vague, underlying assumptions" (Maylam, 2011, p. 7). However, "luminous" and "great" are mere substitutes for "big". "Big" and "great" can be used in various ways to conceptualise "greatness". They can be used from the sardonic, to the self-bestowed and to the view of all people .This is evident in the way in which society perceives what is "big" and also how "big men" assign status on to themselves. Thus, for Maylam great leadership is too often associated with victory in war, nationalism, decision making, imperialism and power. These are undoubtedly characteristics of "big men" displaying male hegemonic power and are therefore imperative in conceptualising that which is "big" or "great".

On the contrary, Yair et al (n.d.) state that nations often use male heroes and role models for creating collective identities and a sense of continuity. In this regard, scholars from various disciplines have emphasised the role of collective heroes suggesting that they play a role in creating the national myths that people aspire to attain (Yair, et al, n.d., p. 2). They stand out from the ordinary in displaying ideals and values that people find useful and worthy to emulate. Therefore, narratives about "big men" were considered an important educational tool for building morality and for strengthening unity. For example in post-apartheid South Africa we have statues for Mandela, Albert Luthuli, FW de Klerk, Shaka and Dinizulu, amongst others. These were all "big men", none of them were women and ordinary men. According to Tomaselli et al

(1996, p. 50) "historical ideas of nation and nationhood are related to South African national monuments policy debates, with specific reference to the impact of previous policy decisions based on identification of the concepts of 'nation" and culture. This is thus related to the notion of states using male heroes for establishing national identities. There was much controversy regarding the renaming of streets and airports in post – apartheid South Africa. Most of these were named after "big men" in South African history and few had names of women and none of ordinary men. In KwaZulu-Natal, the international airport was named King Shaka, thus reaffirming collective memory, nationhood and heritage.

However, the impact of globalisation and post modernism "increase societal fragmentation and challenge the very basis of agreed-upon collective myths and heroes" (Yair et al, n.d., p. 3). There is a growing perception that male heroes and values are defunct in this era. Schwartz (1998, p. 2) states that "the decline of metanarratives is the single most distinguishing feature of post-modern culture". This alludes to the notion that there are no grand or master narratives on "big men'' and that history should also include stories of ordinary people. The definition of postmodern according to Schwartz (1998, p.2) includes "incredulity toward metanarratives". The narrative function, he says, "is losing its functors, its great heroes, its great dangers, its great voyages, its great goal" (Schwartz, 1998, p .2).Hence, the focus is not on "new or revised metanarratives but an unprecedented sense of the irrelevance of all metanarratives and the repudiation of all heroes" (Schwartz, 1998, p. 4). Therefore, the discourse dealing with the conceptualisation of "big men" has implications on how they are portrayed in the selected history textbooks of this study.

2.8 "Big men" in History textbooks

"Big men" have featured in history textbooks locally and internationally for as long as these books existed. The aim of this theme from the literature reviewed is to provide an understanding of how "big men" are depicted in history textbooks and why they are portrayed in that manner. For: "The choice of heroes and the way in which textbooks

present them offer unique insight into the interplay between scholarly historiography and competing versions of ethno-history" (Hutchins, 2011, p. 650). According to Alridge (2006, p. 662), "U.S. history courses and curricula are dominated by such heroic and celebratory master narratives as those portraying George Washington and Thomas Jefferson as the heroic "Founding Fathers," Abraham Lincoln as the "Great Emancipator," and Martin Luther King Jr. as the messianic saviour of African Americans. Often these figures are portrayed in isolation from other individuals and events in their historical context. Simultaneously, the more controversial aspects of their lives and beliefs are left out of many history textbooks." Learners are thus presented with one-dimensional and condensed portraits which restrict their understanding of the contradictions and complexities in American history (Alridge, 2006). The depiction of "big men" thus forms an important aspect of the discourse on the promotion of master narratives in school history textbooks.

Gilbert (2003), in his article "Emiliano Zapata: Textbook Hero'' traces the resurrection and subsequent career of this Mexican revolutionary as a textbook hero. According to Gilbert (2003, p. 127), "Emiliano Zapata (1879-1919) died defeated and in many quarters, despised." His article examines depictions of Zapata in state sanctioned Mexican primary school textbooks from the early 1920s to 2002. These textbook accounts are considered in a dual context: the external political context in which the books are created and the internal narrative context of Mexican history as presented by official historians" (Gilbert, 2003, p. 127). The article tracks Zapata's transformations from a defeated Attila to a victorious national hero. His prospects were shaped and reshaped by national circumstances thus turning his textbook career into a mirror reflecting Mexico's own transformations. This article therefore demonstrates how ruling elites exercise hegemony in promoting national symbols, heroes and myths.

History textbooks sometimes have a tendency to present what may be described as politically correct history. This is a form of purified history in which selected heroes and heroines are valorised to the extent of almost being viewed as saints. For example, Alridge (2006) analysed the depiction of Martin Luther King Jr. and argued that history

textbooks represent only the politically correct or favourable history of people who are considered to be heroes. Such tendencies, he warned, risk education systems producing school graduates who cannot tell the relationship between history and the present-day world. Furthermore, learners are denied "access to relevant, dynamic, and often controversial history or critical lenses that would provide them insight into the dilemmas, challenges, and realities of living in a democratic society such as the United States" (Alridge, 2006, p. 663).

This also applies to the South African context where critical skills are crucial for survival in a democratic dispensation. Crawford (2004, p. 23) alludes to a similar notion by stating that "history textbooks, intentionally and unintentionally, take up positions in which heroes and villains are clearly identified." This can happen through the presentation of dual oppositions such as the good versus evil tradition and right versus wrong (Crawford, 2004). Contemporary textbooks are filled with such images e.g. Hitler vs Churchill, in British textbooks; the English versus the Germans, French, and Irish and so forth. These narratives also create the distinction between "us" and "them" which have great impact upon children's perceptions of, individuals, events and nations (Crawford, 2004). Crawford (2004, p. 23) sums this up by asking if "… identifying such opposites can reveal much about how it is thought by publisher and author that a nation ought to see itself? Who are the heroes and who are the villains, how are they presented and what does that tell us about national identity?" This also has implications as to how "big men" are identified and depicted in the selected history textbooks of this study.

Manzo (2004) further argues that history textbooks have been used to create a certain collective memory which blocks out past events that might not support current ideology. For example, there is a trend for new Russian history textbooks to provide a glossier presentation of Stalin as a "big man" (Manzo, 2004). This is in direct contradiction to the exposition of the brutality of Stalin that was evident in Russian history textbooks soon after the collapse of the Soviet Union. Manzo (2004) furthermore noted that in India, the new history textbooks underplay the role of Mahatma Gandhi and his assassination by a

41

Hindu extremist while the Hindus are portrayed as the pure Indians. In South Africa, da Cruz (2005) conducted a case study of white supremacy in pre- and post-apartheid history textbooks. The main aspect under scrutiny was the depiction of Shaka, the Zulu King, in pre-1994 history textbooks and the main conclusion is that the textbook had played a part in perpetuating myths which entrenched negative perceptions of black people in South Africa. Hence "big men" are portrayed in a particular manner in textbooks here and abroad and what has emerged from these arguments is how textbooks perpetuate myths about "big men" with the aim of promoting a historical literacy that is sanctioned by the ruling elite.

Loewens (1995) in his book *Lies My Teacher Told Me: Everything your American history textbook got wrong*, explored the process of hero making in the first chapter by examining how American history textbooks depict historical figures. Loewens (1995, p. 2) states that "many American history textbooks are studded with biographical vignettes of the very famous." These vignettes according to Loewens (1995, p. 2), "allow textbooks to give space to characters such as Blackwell and Hansberry, who relieve what would otherwise be a monolithic parade of white male political leaders." Elizabeth Blackwell was the first woman to graduate from medical school in the USA and Lorraine Hansberry was the author of *A Raisin in the Sun*. Furthermore, Loewens (1995) is not concerned with who is selected, but rather what happens to them when they are presented in the history textbook – which is also the case in this study. He provides case studies of Woodrow Wilson and Helen Keller as examples of heroification. Wilson was an important president and he receives much textbook coverage, whilst Keller was a "little person" who did not sanction any legislation or declared war (Loewens, 1995). Teachers however, have considered Helen Keller, the blind and deaf girl who overcame her physical handicaps as an inspiration to generations of schoolchildren. According to Loewens (1995, p. 2), "only one of the twelve history textbooks I surveyed includes her photograph." This analysis of heroification is therefore imperative as it indicates how textbooks elevate "big men" and downplay the contributions of so called "little persons" who are invariably women and ordinary men.

The depiction of "big men" is significant in negotiating meanings of national identity and history. This is demonstrated by Hutchins (2011) who examines the representation of the USA's two most prominent traditional heroes; George Washington (1732-99) and Abraham Lincoln (1809-65), in history textbooks for elementary-school pupils, selected for use in the state of Texas and published in 1982, 1997 and 2003. According to Hutchins (2011, p. 652):

> Washington and Lincoln have long been the most revered heroes in the USA's pantheon, the first offering an archetypical illustration of the sacralised founding father, the military leader who defeated the colonising oppressor and, according to popular myth, the selfless first president whose judicious and disinterested use of power ensured national survival and established the precedent for ideal leadership. Lincoln belongs to the second great age of national definition: he presided over the American Civil War, which established the nation as one and indivisible, and led to the end of slavery in the USA, thereby expanding the polity and the implementation of what most Americans see as their core national values of freedom and equality.

Moreover, different political groups have competing notions of how these men should be portrayed. Washington outnumbers Lincoln by a large margin as he is presented in illustrations in the textbooks (Hutchins, 2011). While Washington's popularity increases over time, Lincoln's decreases. Washington appears 4.8 times on average per book in 1982, 12.8 times in 1997 and 17.7 times in 2003. Among books published in 1982 and 1997, Lincoln ranks second, being featured in 1.6 illustrations on average per book in 1982 and 7.8 times on average per book in 1997. However, this number drops to 5.7 times on average per book in 2003 (Hutchins, 2011, p. 652). Hutchins' analysis of American "big men" demonstrates how textbook publishers are influenced by various political groups and organisations in the depiction of heroes. Therefore, one can apply a similar approach to the South African context in establishing how "big men" are mythified and who mythifies them and for what purpose.

2.9 Conclusion

In this chapter I have demonstrated that textbooks are powerful tools which can be used by various stakeholders to promote dominant ideology and establish political hegemony. Textbooks also contain the official narrative of dominant groups within a society. From the literature reviewed, it is evident that history textbooks have immense power to shape their society by disseminating a national narrative. I have also explored how history textbooks were used in the apartheid and post-apartheid eras in South Africa and what impact this had on the creation of historical consciousness. South Africa as we know is a post-conflict society, and thus history textbooks become integral in establishing a national and collective identity. I have also conceptualised the notion of "big men" by demonstrating how they are made "big" and what makes them "big". Finally I have examined how "big men" are portrayed in history textbooks which is necessary for this study as it provides a background for analysing how they are depicted in the selected South African history textbooks.

The literature review provided depictions of "big men" in academic and general literature texts. This has enabled me to create instruments for analysing data in the textbooks. Although there has been academic research regarding historical figures as part of history textbook research in South Africa; my reflections on the literature dealing with "big men" in South African history textbooks leads me to conclude that this particular theme has not been adequately researched. This is the gap that my research will try to fill. In the following chapter I will explore the research design and methodology used to research the identified gap.

CHAPTER THREE

RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

3.1. Introduction

In this chapter I engage in a discussion of my research design and research methodology. The research design and methodology will be used to demonstrate how the characteristics of "big men" are portrayed in the selected apartheid and post-apartheid school history textbooks. The purpose of the chapter is therefore to explain how the research design and methodology were used to answer the research questions posed. Firstly, I will differentiate between research design and methodology. Thereafter the following aspects of the study will be presented: the research design which deals with interpretivism, qualitative research and the ontological and epistemological assumptions of the study. The second half of the chapter includes the research methodology which focusses on explaining phenomenological research; data analysis methods and techniques and sampling and sampling methods. I will then focus on ethical issues, issues of trustworthiness and methodological limitations.

Researchers often use research design and research methodology interchangeably as concepts. Mouton (2001) defines both concepts quite distinctly. The research design is

described as an action plan and a blueprint with which to conduct the study and answer the research questions. The research design is very important and requires careful thought before conducting a study. It is therefore the overall plan which the researcher will use to embark on a study.

The research methodology on the other hand is recognised as the means with which to achieve the strategy or plan. Mouton (2001) uses the analogy of building a house to clarify the difference between research design and research methodology. Here the research design is the approved plan with which to build a house. The plan is based on an idea that was formed in the mind of the prospective home owner and this idea is transferred onto a blueprint. The research methodology involves the actual construction of the house by using the different tools and methods to conduct the different tasks.

3.2 Research design

The research design in this study had to be structured in a coherent manner beginning with the paradigm that is related to the study and then proceeding to the data analysis methods. Considering the limitations in history textbook analysis (Weinbrenner, 1992; Nicholls, 2003), a functional methodological framework had to be designed. According to Pingel (1999, p. 21) it is important for the history textbook researcher to have well defined stages of research, methods and techniques and clear "categories upon which an analytical instrument may be constructed." Therefore, the research design had to be clearly defined as part of the research process. I used Gray's (2004, p. 30) template as an example of a summary of a research design to summarise my research. This is outlined in the table below.

Figure 3.1: Summary of the research design adapted from Gray (2004, p. 30)

Paradigm	Interpretivism
Theoretical perspective	Social constructionism
Research approach	Qualitative

Research methodology	Qualitative textual / documentary analysis
Time-frame	Longitudinal
Data analysis methods	Content analysis

In the sections that follow I explore the theoretical perspective, the research approach and the epistemological and ontological assumptions which are integral in the research design of this study.

3.2.1 Interpretive paradigm

This study has been informed by the interpretivist paradigm. Interpretivism is basically exploratory and descriptive in nature and is designed to discover what can be learned about the phenomenon which is being studied (Williams, 1998). The central aim of this paradigm is to understand and explore phenomena. The interpretive paradigm has implications for interpretive researchers and qualitative research (Esterberg, n.d.). "This interpretive tradition assumes that researchers need to begin by examining the empirical world" (Esterberg, n.d., p. 17). Instead of using a theory or beginning with a preconceived notion of how the world works, researchers should begin by immersing themselves in the world inhabited by those they wish to study. Gubrium and Holstein as cited in Esterberg (n.d., p. 17) state that "instead of seeking to go 'inside the worlds of their subjects', the researchers' emphasis is on understanding how individuals construct and interpret social reality."

Social reality is based on how individuals construct it and therefore the main research task is to interpret those constructions. Researchers are human and therefore the research process can be seen as a social production. Their writings are interpretations of what they think about their findings. Therefore, interpretive writing is shaped from a researcher's interpretation of reality – in the case of this study the depiction of "big men", and the characteristics attributed to them in two specific contexts. However, the researcher's interpretations of reality are not individual creations because humans are

social beings and therefore creating and interpreting reality are essentially social processes. Hence, this paradigm is flexible and steered by a set of views, beliefs and opinions on the world and how it should be interpreted and studied (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005).

Interpretivism focusses on developing a greater understanding of how people make sense of contexts in which they live and work. Stevens, Schade, Chalk and Slevin (1993) provide three key aspects in explaining the interpretivist paradigm. Firstly, the knowledge that is produced within the paradigm is done inductively and consequently concepts and theories emerge from the interpretation of the phenomena. Secondly, the data collected from within this paradigm is mainly subjective. Cohen, Manion and Morrison (2007) therefore note that the interpretive paradigm is concerned with the individual and its main aim is to understand the subjective world of human experience. Lastly, research within this paradigm is conducted in the contexts in which the phenomena occur and in the case of this study, the research is carried out within the textbooks where the phenomenon is found. Therefore, the interpretivist paradigm was most appropriate for this study as it aims to provide a deeper understanding of the phenomenon that is being researched ("big men") in apartheid and post-apartheid era school history textbooks.

Textbooks are viewed as social constructions of knowledge for this study. The fundamental principle of interpretivism is likewise that reality is socially, culturally and historically constructed (Nieuwenhuis, 2007; Bloomberg & Volpe, 2008). Thus, the depiction of "big men" in the history textbooks would also be socially constructed. Creswell (2002, p. 9) also alludes to this by maintaining that people seek an understanding of the "world in which they live and work" and that they develop subjective meanings of their experiences. These meanings are varied and multiple, leading the researcher to look for the complexity of views rather than narrowing meanings into a few categories or ideas". Therefore, the interpretive paradigm was an ideal choice for researching the textbook samples as it allowed for a detailed description of the different depictions of "big men" within the textbook sample. In addition, I have

made subjective interpretations of the textbook content which is acknowledged by the interpretive paradigm.

The uncertainty of research findings is an important aspect of the interpretivist paradigm (Henning, 2004). What this means is that no single researcher can objectively make sense of the world. The researcher cannot be separated from the research. Thus, for the interpretivist all research is thus subjective.

Researcher subjectivity is aligned to interpretivists maintaining that the social world is a product of human knowledge, and its very existence is reliant on human knowledge. Researchers are influenced by their own knowledge and preconceived ideas of the object under investigation (Nieuwenhuis, 2007). Therefore, researchers adhering to the interpretivist paradigm must acknowledge that they approach research with their own baggage drawn from their life experiences. The researcher considers such baggage carefully so as to be cautious of how their own life experiences will influence the interpretation of data. In the case of this study, it is I the researcher who is able to temper the high degree of subjectivity found in interpretivist research. Researchers thus situate themselves in the research to recognise their own cultural, social and historical backgrounds. Thus, I as the researcher, have to acknowledge that I am a South African born Indian male coming from a middle–class background with my own life experiences who works as a primary school history teacher. For the purpose of this study, I had to take cognisance of my own views on "big men" in history textbooks and how those views developed historically. Considering such "baggage", the researcher instead of starting with a theory, formulates research questions and aims to develop meaning from the data inductively as the research progresses (Creswell, 2002; Bloomberg & Volpe, 2008).

Nieuwenhuis (2007, p. 60) states that "the ultimate aim of interpretivist research is to offer a perspective of a situation under study to provide insight into the way in which a particular group of people make sense of their situation or the phenomena they encounter." Therefore the researcher becomes central in the research process as

he/she is the instrument through which the data is collected and analysed. Thus, this introduces the issue of researcher bias which is addressed in the final chapter of the study.

3.2.2. Qualitative Research

The qualitative approach was used to understand and explore a specific phenomenon in this study and that being "big men" in history textbooks. According to Nieuwenhuis (2007, p. 50), "people often describe qualitative research as research that attempts to collect rich descriptive data in respect of a particular phenomenon or context with the intention of developing an understanding of what is being observed or studied. It therefore focuses on how individuals and groups view and understand the world and construct meaning out of their experiences." It is concerned mostly with exploring the "why" questions of research (Nieuwenhuis, 2007). This type of research is closely related to the interpretivist paradigm which precedes this section. According to Nieuwenhuis (2007, p. 56), "authors often loosely refer to qualitative research as being based on the interpretivist paradigm." This is because of the emerging world view's emphasis on understanding how people make sense of phenomena in their environment. However, this may be misleading as qualitative research includes a wide range of research approaches and research methodologies. Qualitative research is also concerned with understanding the processes and the social and cultural contexts which underlie various behavioural patterns. This thinking is supported by Creswell (2002, p. 18) who states that "a qualitative approach is one in which the inquirer often makes knowledge claims based primarily on constructivist perspectives (i.e., the multiple meanings of individual experiences, meanings socially and historically constructed, with the intent of developing a theory or pattern) or advocacy/participatory perspectives (i.e., political, issue-oriented, collaborative, or change oriented) or both. Nieuwenhuis (2007) has demonstrated that interpretivism is the oldest strand in qualitative research by discussing the emerging world-view's emphasis on the construction of reality. Qualitative research is therefore useful for this study as it provides a better

understanding of why "big men" are depicted in a particular manner in the history textbooks.

It is asserted by Gonzales et al (2008) as cited in Cohen et al (2011) that qualitative research is concerned with an in-depth and detailed understanding of meanings, actions, as well as observable and non-observable phenomena, intentions, behaviours and attitudes. This suggests that a qualitative study should produce findings that are not obtained by means of quantification which is typical of quantitative research. Qualitative research is based on detailed understanding of a specific phenomenon. This approach is the most appropriate for this study as it encapsulates the research questions underpinning this study since it provides an understanding of how "big men" are depicted in the selected history textbooks and why they are portrayed in any specific way. Henning (2004) therefore maintains that these are the types of questions that qualitative researchers seek to examine. Moreover, it is an approach that is aligned with this study as it examines the discourse of the "big men" phenomenon and its depiction in history textbooks. Researchers, therefore tend to use qualitative research in such studies. So, the purpose of qualitative research is to explore a phenomenon, such as the depiction of "big men" in order to obtain a deep understanding. Thus, the focus of such studies is on depth, as well as on quality.

The research approach is qualitative in nature as quality refers to the quintessence, which is the characteristic of a phenomenon under study (Henning, 2004; Picciano, 2004). Qualitative research focusses on concepts, connotations, context and description. Therefore the qualitative approach allows for an in depth exploration of the characteristics of the "big men" in this study and how they are depicted conceptually in the textbooks.

In qualitative research, the researcher seeks believability, insight and trustworthiness through a process of verification. The researcher is the data gathering instrument in qualitative research. Therefore, "when qualitative researchers speak of research "validity and reliability" they are usually referring to research that is credible and

trustworthy" (Nieuwenhuis, 2007, p. 80). The section assigned to limitations in this chapter will deal with the issue of assessing this study.

The qualitative approach also allows the researcher to make knowledge claims based on the interpretive paradigm. The qualitative approach is basically interpretive in that the researcher interprets the data (Creswell, 2002). Merriam (2002, p. 3) maintains that paramount to understanding qualitative research is that "meaning is socially constructed by individuals in interactions with their world" which in essence is an interpretivist world view. This study is located in the interpretivist paradigm and therefore it is reasonable to use the qualitative approach. Apart from interpretation, the qualitative researcher aims to produce a rich description of the phenomenon under study (Hancock, Windridge & Ockleforld, 1998). Thus, the qualitative approach made it possible to produce a rich description of the depiction of "big men" found in the textbook sample.

The qualitative approach is also very flexible. In qualitative research the 'variables'-that is the depiction of "big men" in this study are usually not unassailable. Consequently, the qualitative researcher has the freedom to develop the study in any manner that he/she sees fit. This freedom also allows the researcher to understand, and elucidate an argument, by using evidence derived from the data and from the literature, regarding what the object under study is all about (Henning, 2004).Therefore, in this study I had the freedom to identify various depictions of "big men" without being restricted to a group of specific depictions. The flexibility of the qualitative approach enabled me to provide a richer and broader description of why "big men" are portrayed the way they are in the selected textbooks that were analysed.

The researcher is the primary instrument for data analysis in qualitative research (Merriam, 2002; Henning, 2004). The qualitative researcher must acknowledge that the interpretation of his/her findings is shaped by his/her background. This has been mentioned previously as a feature of the interpretivist paradigm. Thus, it is imperative that the researcher, in conducting qualitative research, must reflect on who he/she is (Creswell, 2002). In this regard, I had to once more take cognisance of the fact that I am

a product of an Indian South African middle class background and had to consider its implications for my research.

The process of analysing data in qualitative research is mainly inductive in that the researcher gathers meaning from data and works towards a theory (Creswell, 2002; Merriam, 2002). This is relevant in my study as I analysed the data in the selected textbooks of the two eras on "big men" in order to establish how they are portrayed in the history textbooks. I did not refer to any existing theory on the depiction of "big men" because this would have placed restrictions on my research resulting in a rigid study. Therefore I adopted the flexible approach of qualitative research which enabled me to develop a theory as the study progressed.

The aim of qualitative research is to gain understanding; therefore the human is an ideal instrument in that he/she is immediately responsive and adaptive. This is supported by Nieuwenhuis (2007, p. 79) who states that "the researcher's involvement and immersion in the changing, real-world situation is essential since the qualitative researcher needs to record those changes in the real life-context (sometimes before, during and after the change occurs)." Furthermore, the end product of qualitative research as mentioned earlier on in this chapter is richly descriptive. Words are used to convey exactly what is learnt (Merriam, 2002). Therefore, words were the most appropriate means of describing the depiction of "big men" in the textbooks that were analysed. Furthermore, in answering why "big men" are depicted in the way they are, a rich descriptive analysis was most suitable in this regard.

3.2.3. Ontological and epistemological assumptions

The ontological and epistemological assumptions which I have made for this study also impact on the choice of approach and paradigm for this research. According to Nieuwenhuis (2007, p. 53), "The study of the nature and form of reality (that which is or can be known) is called ontology." This is defined differently by different philosophers, and in various research methodologies and approaches to research (Nieuwenhuis,

2007). Henning (2004) and Sarantakos (2005) contend that a clear distinction exists between the two concepts. Hence, the critical ontological question here should be: what is the nature of reality? They contend further that a methodology is informed by epistemologies or about what is considered as a fact or about the nature of knowledge and where knowledge is to be found. The crucial questions researchers ask here are: How do we discern what we know? And how do we identify reality? Epistemology deals with the philosophy of knowledge. Everyday research is also guided by paradigms of epistemological and ontological prescriptions (Sarantakos, 2005), and the interpretive paradigm specifically is categorized by a definite ontology and epistemology (Blanche & Kelly, 2002).

This study assumed the social construction of knowledge epistemology. Social constructionism is often combined with interpretivism and is typically viewed as an approach to qualitative research (Creswell, 2009). This implies that the phenomenon of "big men" is understood within social, cultural and economic contexts focussing on hegemony, patriarchies and power. The reviewed literature has demonstrated that the "big men" phenomenon" means different things to different people at different times. Consequently the understandings of "big men" in this study are informed by the various social contexts in which the concept is used. From an ontological perspective, this study assumed that reality or the truth is imposed. Considering the depiction of "big men" in history textbooks, the assumption is that reality is justified and because of the political nature of textbooks, as discussed in the literature review, it is the content of these textbooks that is understood as "big men". Therefore, this research is based on the social construction theory of knowledge and the assumption that reality in history textbooks is imposed. In this regard, our knowledge of "big men" is what is contained in the history textbooks, thus rendering it imperative that these textbooks be critically analysed.

Crotty, as cited in Creswell (2002), maintains that epistemology is the theory of knowledge that informs the research. The theoretical perspective and the methodological approach of the study have to be complemented by the epistemology.

Qualitative researchers maintain that people have individualistic world views which are influenced by their life experiences. Thus, for the qualitative researcher, the method of knowing reality is by probing into the experiences of others concerning the phenomenon under study. Considering that society is made up of complex human beings, each with their own unique life experience, one cannot find set solutions to human problems. Thus, research findings cannot be generalised because of the complex nature of society. The qualitative researcher must acknowledge that situations differ and one must pay careful attention to the context of the phenomenon that is being researched. The researcher is also a product of his /her life experience and thus cannot be detached from the study because his /her life experience will impact on any conclusion made by the researcher. Therefore, knowledge is always subjective as it always involves a human researcher (Nieuwenhuis, 2007).

In summary, having mentioned that this study is located in the interpretivist paradigm and is approached from a qualitative perspective, the ontological and epistemological assumptions of the study are that knowledge and reality are socially constructed. Furthermore, the research design has indicated that this study involves exploring a phenomenon in detail in a world which is socially constructed. The research methodology which follows will explain how this phenomenon will be analysed.

3.3. Research Methodology

I have included phenomenological research as a starting point in the research methodology because the study deals with a phenomenon under investigation which is the depiction of "big men" in history textbooks. It is therefore imperative to explain the significance of such research for the study. The research methodology adopted for this study is content analysis and the method that was followed in conducting the content analysis was textual analysis.

3.3.1 Phenomenological Research

This study is guided by phenomenological research, which aims to enquire about the nature of a phenomenon under study (Hatch, 2002) which, in this case, is the depiction of "big men" in history textbooks. Phenomenology was imperative in this study as the phenomenon of "big men" was conceptualised, analysed and interpreted. It must be noted that interpretation is the core of phenomenological research. This is also related to the interpretivist paradigm which deals with how people make meaning of the phenomena under investigation. Therefore, Welman & Kruger (2001, p. 81) state that: "Phenomenologists question the possibility of studying [a psychology or sociological] reality with so-called objectivity … according to phenomenologists, what researchers observe is not a reality [or truth] as such but an interpreted reality [or truth]." Whilst there are other stakeholders such as the state and the curriculum and the publishers and authors, the main focus of the study was the depiction of "big men" in history textbooks. Moreover, phenomenology has strong links with the interpretivist paradigm because both deal with the interpretation of phenomena. Research within the interpretivist paradigm is carried out in the contexts in which phenomena occur. In this study the research or analysis is conducted within the textbook where the phenomenon in question is found. Phenomenological research and the interpretivist paradigm, therefore, deal with the interpretation of phenomena. The research embraces both the paradigm and phenomenological research as they speak to each other and form integral aspects of the research design and methodology.

Schutz and Luckmann (1973) as cited in Schostak (2002, p. 39) note that phenomenology occupies an attitude where a "… belief either for or against the reality, the truth, the rightness of anything said to constitute the world is suspended … [thus] provide[ing] a way of mapping the subject." Thus, the epistemological assumption that knowledge is subjective and constructive can be applied to the literature reviewed on the depiction of "big men" in history textbooks and therefore what is considered as truth or reality is 'suspended' or disregarded so that the 'subject' or phenomenon can be explored.

3.3.2 Content analysis

Content analysis was used to analyse the textbooks in order to provide a better understanding of the depiction of "big men" in history textbooks. Weber, as cited in Neuendorf (2002, p. 10), states that "content analysis is a research method that uses a set of procedures to make valid inferences from text." Content analysis is a method of analysing documents which in the case of this study are textbooks. I used content analysis to capture the obvious depictions of "big men" and the non-obvious depictions presented in the textbooks (Hofstee, 2006). Content refers to words, pictures, meanings, symbols or any other communicated messages which are found in the textbooks (Mouton, 2001; Kohlbacher, 2006). This type of analysis involves analysing data from different viewpoints with the aim of recognising keys in the text that will help us understand and interpret the data found in the textbooks (Nieuwenhuis, 2007).

Nieuwenhuis (2007, p. 101) clarifies content analysis further by stating that it "is a systematic approach to qualitative data analysis that identifies and summarises message content." Content analysis is an inductive and iterative process where similarities and differences are identified in text that would corroborate or disconfirm theory (Nieuwenhuis, 2007). This is significant for this study which involves an in-depth analysis of school history textbooks and the way in which "big men" are portrayed in them.

The advantage of content analysis is that it aims to preserve the benefits of quantitative content analysis for a more qualitative text interpretation in that step by step rules of analysis are applied and that categories are identified within the process of analysis (Mayring, 2000; Kohlbacher, 2006). There are no systematic procedures available to the researcher with regard to the actual analysis of the content (Elo & Kyngas, 2008). The absence of systematic procedures does not limit the analysis itself but rather affords it flexibility. The value of content analysis is that one is able to detect nuances in the content (Krippendorff cited in Elo & Kyngas, 2008) and is flexible in terms of research design (Harwood and Garry cited in Elo & Kyngas, 2008).

3.3.3 Textual analysis

Textual analysis is the method that was used in conducting the content analysis. It involves an analysis of historical documents (Ifversen, 2003). This study is concerned with the textual analysis of historical material which are school history textbooks: "At a semantic level, a text can be said to constitute a certain unity of meaning, which contains sequences of sentences" (Ifversen, 2003, p. 61). Therefore, it is the meaning of these sentences in the text which is the actual content that will be analysed in the study. I employed qualitative textual analysis and coding as the two research instruments for analysing the data.

3.3.3.1 Qualitative textual analysis

Qualitative textual analysis is also known as qualitative documentary analysis. The texts or documents which are analysed are South African school history textbooks. In this thesis, methodology refers to "the coherent group of methods that complement one another" (Henning, 2004, p. 36). Therefore the sampling, data generation and data analysis methods coherently collaborate in consistency with qualitative documentary analysis as the relevant research instrument. Using the qualitative documentary analysis instrument, I aimed at providing a better understanding of the depiction of "big men" in an inductive way. Thus, whilst I conceptualised the phenomenon of "big men" in the literature review, I did not depend entirely on a preconceived hypothesis. Therefore, the conceptual framework of "big men" was used as a guide to identify categories, patterns and themes in the analysis. Whilst this study is located within the interpretivist paradigm, it must be noted that it is a study of text within this paradigm where a textual analysis was conducted to obtain a better understanding of the main phenomena, that being "big men" in history textbooks. "Therefore, the textual component determines the channels and modes through which a message (or a theme) is transmitted" (Ifversen, 2003, p. 61). Thus, it is the interpretation of text within the selected history textbooks of this study, which provided answers to the critical questions raised in Chapter One.

3.3.3.2 Coding

Coding is the actual manner which I have used in analysing the selected textbooks of the study. In the view of Nieuwenhuis, "Coding is therefore defined as marking the segments of data with symbols, descriptive words or unique identifying names" (2007, p. 105). What this implies is that when a meaningful segment of text is identified, a code or label is assigned to that segment. The coding process enables the researcher to retrieve and collect data they have associated with some theme so that the sorted bits can be examined together and different cases are compared. This process is also known as open coding (Nieuwenhuis, 2007). According to Cohen et al (2011, p. 559) "Coding is the ascription of a category label to a piece of data, that is either decided in advance or in response to the data that have been collected." This instrument of analysis is relevant to this study as it is used to categorise the characteristics of "big men" in the history textbooks.

I have also developed codes as the data was being coded. These are known as "inductive codes" (Nieuwenhuis, 2007, p. 107). These codes emerge from the data as the data was being examined. I have also identified certain codes from the literature review of the study. These are known as *a priori* codes and are developed before examining the current data (Nieuwenhuis, 2007). These codes were used in the data analysis instrument and are found in Figure 3.3 further down. In inductive coding related codes were combined into themes or categories. This was done by assigning a label to each category by using descriptive phrases or words from the text.

In *a priori* coding, I used pre-set codes and pre-set categories into which the data was sorted. I started with a list of categories in advance, and then searched the data for the themes. In this regard important themes from the literature review were identified. These themes proved useful in that they provided direction for what I was looking for in the data. Nieuwenhuis (2007, p. 109) sums this up by stating that "you identify the themes before you categorise the data, and you search the data for text that matches the themes."

Thus I have employed both inductive and *a priori* coding as the instruments of analysing the depiction of "big men" in the selected textbooks which enhanced the trustworthiness of my study. These are integral aspects of qualitative research and also speak to the interpretative paradigm and phenomenological research. The objective was to obtain a rich description of the phenomenon that is being researched.

3.4 Sampling

The research sample in the study was both purposive and convenient. The research sample in qualitative research is generally purposive (Nieuwenhuis, 2007; Merriam, cited in Bloomberg & Volpe, 2008). I have chosen textbooks as units for analysis and Teddlie and Yu (2007) concur stating that purposive sampling is mainly associated with qualitative studies and may be defined as choosing units, with a specific objective in mind. Purposive sampling involves selecting groups or categories based on their relevance to the research questions (Mason, 2002). The main idea of purposive sampling is for the researcher to identify rich cases, that is cases that will satisfy the specific needs of the study (Cohen & Manion, 1994), with the specific aim of obtaining the richest possible sources of data to answer the research question (Nieuwenhuis, 2007), as opposed to random sampling which is more for quantitative studies (Bloomberg & Volpe, 2008). I therefore chose purposive sampling as it as it is aligned with qualitative studies and that it allowed me to engage in an in depth analysis based on the rich data that was found in the selected textbooks on "big men" and their characteristics.

Convenience sampling involves choosing samples that are easily accessible (Teddlie & Yu, 2007). As this is a longitudinal study, I chose textbooks that contained rich data content relating to "big men" in the apartheid and post-apartheid eras. I narrowed the eleven textbooks that I had initially chosen to eight as this study is a Masters Degree dissertation. The sample was limited to a manageable quantity due to time and length

constraints. This is a qualitative study and thus the aim is to describe the phenomenon under study in terms of depth rather than breadth.

I selected textbooks from the apartheid and post- apartheid eras. These are textbooks which are used in both primary and secondary schools and they are approved (the post-apartheid era ones at least) by the DoBET or its predecessor the DoE. The samples that were used included the depiction of "big men" from the early 1970s till present. The sample is a fair representation of the approved history textbooks as it includes an equal number of textbooks from the apartheid and post-apartheid eras. One of the limitations of purposive and convenient sampling is that the results of the findings cannot be generalised. As this is a qualitative study, issues of generalisation do not present a problem as I intended to describe the depiction of "big men" in depth and not in breadth.

Figure 3.1 The research sample of eight selected textbooks used for the study displayed alphabetically by first author

Authors	Date	Title	Publishers
Chengalroyen, Y., & Pillay, L.V.	1983	*History 2000:Standard 4*	Nasou Limited
Chadwick, G.A., Syphus, E., & Van Heerde, L.	1974	*Man Through The Ages: Standard 7*	Shuter and Shooter
Garbharran, H., Machin, I., & Matthews, J.	1982	*History is about Change: Standard 4*	Shuter and Shooter
Lintvelt, H.G.J., Stander F., & Van Niekerk, A.P.	1975	*Our Living Past: History for Standard 7*	Maskew Miller Ltd.

Buthelezi, S., Horn, K., Labuschagne, M., Le Roux, E., Maloka, E., & Zondi, S.	2005	*OBE for FET: History Grade 10 Learner's Book*	Nasou via Afrika (Pty) Ltd.
Bottaro, J., Visser, P., & Worden, N.	2005	*In Search of History: Grade 10 Learner's Book*	Oxford University Press(Pty) Ltd.
Clacherty, G., Delius, P., Dyer, C., Naidoo, L., Nisbet, J., Saunders, C., & Seleti, Y.	1999	*Looking into the Past: Learner's Book Grade 12*	Maskew Miller Longman(Pty) Ltd
Collier, C., Frank, F., Govender, K., Hlongwane, J., Mbansini, T., Sikhakhane, L., Stephenson, C., Subramoney, R., & Virasamy, C.	2011	*New Generation History: Grade 10 Learner's Book*	New Generation Publishers

The data generated for this study originated from eight history textbooks mentioned above and can be viewed as secondary existing data. These textbooks were chosen on the basis of their accessibility and availability. I did not experience any problems in obtaining them from the neighbouring schools and most of them included rich data content relating to "big" men.

Most of the data came from sections in the textbooks which focussed on "big men" and their characteristics. The "big" men who appear in these textbooks are Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi, Jawaharlal Nehru, Louis Botha, Hendrik Frensch Verwoerd and Shaka Zulu. A thumbnail biography of these "big" men is provided in Chapter Four of this study. Only type written text was considered as data. Therefore, images such as photographs and cartoons were excluded because the emphasis was on the meaning of the sentences in the text. Furthermore the written text contained rich data dealing with the characteristics of the "big" men.

3.5 Ethical Issues

This study complies fully with the UKZN's policy on ethical issues. Refer to Appendix A of this study. I have used history textbooks as data for this study and these textbooks have been published and are available for public consumption. The use of textbooks as the source of data precluded any involvement of other people in this study. The data was treated in full compliance with the rules of the University. There were no problems in obtaining ethical clearance for the study as the data involves text which is available in the public domain and has been written for public consumption (Koekemoer, 2012). In addition to employing verification strategies, in order to prevent me, or anyone else, who may read this dissertation from developing bias against a publisher, I referred to the textbooks using various colours as specified in the following table.

Figure 3.2 The sample of textbooks and their specific codes

History 2000:Standard 4	Yellow Book
Man Through The Ages: Standard 7	Green Book
History is about Change: Standard 4	Red Book
Our Living Past: History for Standard 7	Orange Book
OBE for FET: History Grade 10	Blue Book
In Search of History Grade 10-NCS	Grey Book
Looking into the Past Grade 12	Black Book
New Generation History Grade 10-CAPS	Purple Book

With regard to ethical issues I have not plagiarised anyone else's work and the work contained in this dissertation is my own. I have submitted my work to Turnitin, in compliance with UKZN policy which verified the fact that I have not plagiarised. See Appendix B at the end of the thesis.

3.6. Issues of trustworthiness

The issue of trustworthiness needs to be clarified in qualitative research, as the in-depth meaning of something is measured rather than its quantity. According to Winter (2000), the term validity is not applicable to qualitative research and therefore terms such as relevant, trustworthy and plausible have been used. I will refer to trustworthiness (Cohen, Manion & Morrison, 2007) for the purpose of this study. The qualitative study strives for believability, based on lucidity, understanding and instrumental utility (Eisnet cited in Creswell, 2002). Trustworthiness is often preferred instead of validity and is established by verification as opposed to quantitative measures of validity (Lincoln & Guba cited in Creswell, 2002). I have used investigator triangulation to support the trustworthiness of my research. This has been explained previously in this chapter.

Furthermore, I worked inductively and did not start with any previous assumptions. I devised a data analysis instrument (See Fig 3.3. below) which included characteristics of "big" men that were obtained from the literature review of this study. To ensure the trustworthiness of my research, I discussed my research methods with my supervisor and also conducted presentations dealing with research methodology at the M.Ed. History Education cohorts. The fact that I did employ both inductive and *a priori* coding as instruments of analysing the depiction of "big men" in the selected textbooks also enhanced the trustworthiness of my study. In this way I was able to receive suggestions and feedback regarding the strengths and weaknesses of my data analysis.

Figure 3.3 Instrument for textbook analysis

Specific era	Name of "big" man	Title/Colour of Book (Year of publication)
Characteristics of the "big" men	Reference-page numbers	Categories/annotations from text
1.God ordained, personal relationship with God; spiritual ancestors of the nation		
2.Personal qualities and		

character		
3.Providing leadership in times of crises		
4.Role models for communities		
5.Heroic deeds		
6.Shaping the destiny of ordinary people		
7.Hegemonic power, association with royalty, power and influence		
8.Patriarchal power and the exclusion of women		
9.Ability in achieving objectives		
10.Bestowing of status-self /others		
11.Self-perception-how they perceived themselves		
12.The media's portrayal of the "big" man		
13.Patriotism and leadership		
14.Peacemaker		
15.Historians depiction of the "big" man		
16.Creating collective/national identities		
17.Strengthening unity		
18.Myths about the "big" man		
19.Founding father/architect of policies and plans		
20.Nation builder		
21.Reconciler		
22.Messiah /saviour		
23.Popularity		
24.Relationship with other "big" men		
25. Appearance in the public eye.		
26. Other		

3.7. Methodological limitations

The first limitation of this study is the sample size. The sample size may appear small and non-representational. However, all the history textbooks that were selected for analysis were subject to some vetting procedure in order for them to be used in schools. The second limitation is that the findings of this study cannot be generalised. Mouton (2001, p. 168) states that: "Given that most discursive practises are context-dependent or context-bound, such studies are limited in their generalizability." Therefore, because this study is researching a phenomenon in South African history textbooks, it is context based. Thus, the findings of this study will not be transferable to other contexts.

3.8 Conclusion

In this chapter I have explained and outlined the research design and research methodology used in this study. A qualitative research approach was chosen for this study together with phenomenological research as the study of a phenomenon was clearly evident in this study. This was underpinned by an interpretivist paradigm which was best suited to this research. A sample of eight history textbooks from the primary and secondary schools was selected and the data was generated from chapters and specific sections which depicted the "big men" in this study. Criticisms of the research approach and paradigm and the limitations of this study were duly acknowledged. In the next chapter I will deal with the results of my data analysis relating to the depiction of "big men" in the selected textbooks. The results were based on the application of the methodology described in this chapter.

Chapter Four

Data Analysis

4.1. Introduction

In Chapter Three, I expounded the research design and methodology and clarified how it was developed with the intention of answering my research questions. I outlined significant aspects related to the methodology and methods that I have employed in my research. I also provided justification for the methods that I have utilised in order to answer the research questions posed: How are selected "big men" portrayed in apartheid and post-apartheid South African history textbooks? And, why are they depicted in such a manner? The aim of this chapter is to analyse the portrayal of "big men" and specifically the characteristics attributed to them as historical figures. I will do this by presenting the findings based on my analysis of the apartheid and post-apartheid era history textbooks that I have analysed as it relates to the characteristics of "big men". In so doing I followed a thematic approach to present my findings.

I began by examining the characteristics attributed to "big men" in the history textbook sample for the apartheid and then the post-apartheid eras. I subsequently addressed the various representations with regard to "big men" from the content of the textbook sample and linked these to the characteristics attributed to "big men" as gleaned from the literature review and encapsulated in my research instrument (Figure 3.3). In the

process I immersed myself in the data (selected history textbooks) allowing it to speak to the two research questions for this study.

It must also be reiterated that the textbooks that were analysed were selected so that "big men" could be tracked across the apartheid and post-apartheid eras. Although some "big men" appear in the books of both eras others did not. However, it must be pointed out that that the emphasis is not on specific "big men" as such but on the characteristics attributed to them during the two respective eras. Hence the emphasis is not wholly on the individuals but the characteristics that they are portrayed as possessing.

4.2. An analysis of the depiction of "big men" in apartheid era history textbooks

The phenomenon of "big men" has already been theorised in Chapter Two of this study. According to that conceptualisation these were men who were characterised as being heroes, leaders and role models for their communities. Prior to the 1990s history curricula in South Africa were largely designed by white men who sought to highlight the actions and achievements of white men (Dean & Siebörger, 1995). According to Weldon (2003), textbooks from the apartheid era were used as tools to legitimise apartheid ideology. The apartheid education system also used textbooks as a medium to disseminate their ideology and divide South Africa along racial lines. Thus, the apartheid era textbooks analysed in this study portray a particular type of "big man" that may represent the ideals of the apartheid political system.

4.2.1 Green Book (1974)

Four "big" men appear in this textbook. They are Jawaharlal Nehru,[2] Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi,[3] Louis Botha[4] and Hendrik Frensch Verwoerd.[5]

---

[2] Jawaharlal Nehru (1889-1964) first Prime Minister of India and leader of the Indian independence movement. Born in Allahabad, India. He was the son of Motilal Nehru, a prominent lawyer and nationalist statesman. Graduate of Trinity College, Cambridge and the Inner Temple where he trained to be a barrister (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Jawaharlal Nehru,2014).

[3] Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi (1869-1948) preeminent leader of Indian independence movement in India, pioneer of Satyagraha and advocate of Indian rights in South Africa. Born in Porbandar, India. His

Jawaharlal Nehru was Prime Minister and founder of modern India on gaining its independence from Britain in 1947. He was depicted as being associated with royalty in that "his father was a very rich man and a Brahmin, i.e. a very high caste Hindu" (p. 146). According to the Green Book he shaped the destiny of the ordinary Indian people as he had the "major task of educating the [Indian] people as the majority were illiterate" (p. 149). Nehru was also the architect of the "five year plans" (p. 149) in India. His plans included changes in education, agriculture and industry (p. 149). In the process "Coalfields were exploited and many factories were established. Irrigation systems were built while steps were taken to improve communications" (p. 149). Although "he had allowed many groups to develop in their own way; he had retained the unity of India" (p. 151). It is evident in this textbook that Nehru had hoped to create an independent, united India but was not able to obtain the co-operation of the Moslem leaders who wanted a separate state, independent of the Hindus (p. 148). When the British government, the colonial power at the time, granted India independence in1947, it was decided that India would be divided into two states to avoid a civil war (p. 148). Nehru had to thus deal with Hindus fleeing to what became Pakistan which became a Moslem state. It is also pointed out in the Green Book that Nehru was not in agreement with the proposed expulsion of forty million Moslems who lived in India when it became a Hindu state (p. 149). Nehru also had "to negotiate with hundreds of independent princes to persuade them to join the New State" of India (p. 149). Hence, according to the Green Book, although "he had allowed many groups to develop in their own way; he had retained the unity of India" (p. 151).

---

first seven years were spent in the typical patrilineal Hindu kutum or 'joint family with uncles and cousins. In 1876 the nuclear family moved to Rajkot, where the father, Karamchand, had been appointed dewan (prime minister) to the local rana (prince). In 1887 Mohandas sat for his matriculation examination in Ahmedabad. In 1890 he passed his law examinations in London and in July 1891 he returned to Bombay to practice law (du Toit, 1996).

[4] Louis Botha (1862-1919) Boer general and statesman. Born in Greytown, South Africa. He was the son of Voortrekker parents and was brought up on a farm in the Free State. He was educated at the local German mission school (http://www.sahistory.org.za/people/louis-botha,2014).

[5]Hendrik Frensch Verwoerd (1901-1966) academic, South African Prime Minister considered being the prime architect of apartheid. Born in Amsterdam, the Netherlands. He was the second child of Anje Strik and Wilhelmus Johannes Verwoerd. His father was a shopkeeper and a deeply religious man. Attended the Lutheran school in Wynberg and Wynberg High School for Boys. Studied psychology and philosophy at University of Stellenbosch (http://www.sa history.org.za/people/hendrik-frensch-verwoerd, 2014).

According to this textbook Nehru also "visited many foreign countries" (p. 149) with the intention of maintaining India's relationship with them. Amongst others he met with the leaders of China and visited Russia "where he was not impressed with communism" (p. 147). This "big man" as per the textbook was a follower of Gandhi's teachings which related to simplicity and compassion for the poor (p. 147). In this regard he made personal sacrifices for his people as his family "sold many of their possessions, dressed in simple Indian clothes and moved into the villages with the peasants" (p. 147). It is also evident in this textbook that Nehru was also "arrested and jailed many times" (p. 147) because of "non-co-operation with the British" colonial authorities (p. 147). At that time India was ruled by the British and after the Second World War there "was much agitation against the British and Nehru and his family decided to follow Gandhi's teachings" (p. 147). Nehru was therefore seen as a threat to British rule in India as "he was active in demanding independence for India" (p. 147).

Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi, is the next "big man" found in this textbook. He "was one of the great world figures in the first half of the twentieth century" (p. 241). In the view of the apartheid-era Green Book, "He successfully led the Indian people to independence and gained a world–wide reputation" (p. 241). Gandhi was also known as Mahatma which means "the great spirit" (p. 241). In this book he is thus depicted as God ordained. Gandhi is characterised as providing leadership in times of crises in South Africa. He qualified as a lawyer and came to South Africa in 1893 to fight a case for an Indian firm (p. 241). He decided to remain in South Africa and organised a petition "to fight a decision in Natal to take the vote away from Indians" (p. 241). This "big man", as depicted by the Green Book, shaped the destiny of the Indian people in South Africa as he became "the watch-dog of Indian rights in South Africa" (p. 242).

Gandhi, according to this textbook, also used his "weapon of Satyagraha" (p. 242) or passive resistance to obtain some of his objectives in South Africa and in India. He was also, in the view of the Green Book, a patriot because he organised an Indian field–ambulance service during the Anglo-Boer War of 1899-1902 between the Boer

Republics of the Transvaal and the Orange Free State and Britain (p. 242). Gandhi is also portrayed as a peacemaker as he tried "to reconcile differences between the Hindu and Moslem sections" during the time of the partitioning of India (p. 243) as explained under Nehru above. This he did, "By completely peaceful means involving mental and spiritual force, Gandhi was able to obtain many of his goals" (p. 243). The Green Book argues that he was popular as he "gained a world–wide reputation" (p. 241). Gandhi also founded the Natal Indian Congress (1894), a political organisation, in South Africa (p. 242). This "big man", as depicted in the Green Book, made personal sacrifices as he "employed fasts and hunger strikes as part of his method of passive resistance" (p. 243). He also made contact with other "big men" such as Jan Smuts[6] "and a mutual admiration developed between these two great men" (p. 243). Finally the Green Book characterises Gandhi as a man of principle. This is made evident by the incident in the book when he was confronted by a section of the white population in Durban where he was mobbed because of "his work on behalf of the Indians in Natal" (p. 242). He was not deterred "in his efforts to put right wrongs that had been done to his people" (p. 242).

The next "big man" in this textbook is General Louis Botha. He became the Union of South Africa's first Prime Minister in 1910. Botha is portrayed in the textbook as a man "who loved people and had the ability to make people serve him" (p. 248). He is also depicted in the Green Book as a man of power and influence as he was "appointed Commandant-General of the Transvaal" during the Anglo-Boer War of 1899-1902 (p. 248) and later "Prime Minister of the Union of South Africa" after 1910 (p. 248). The Green Book also depicts him as a patriot, politician and leader as he was a "member of the Transvaal Volksraad" (p. 248). Botha also "took the lead in the peace negotiations at Vereeniging" between the Boer Republics and Britain (p. 249) and "led the campaign to conquer South West Africa" from Germany during the First World War (p. 251). At the end of this conflict, Botha also "headed the South African delegation to the Versailles

---

[6] Jan Christiaan Smuts (1870-1950) world-famed statesman, a military man, a botanist, politician and former Prime Minister of South Africa. Born near Riebeeck West in the Western Cape. Graduated from Victoria College in Stellenbosch and studied law at Christ's College in Cambridge. Returned to South Africa in 1895 and practiced as advocate in Cape Town (http://www.sa history.org.za/people/general-jan-christiaan-smuts, 2014).

peace conference" in 1919 which decided the fate of Germany (p. 252). Botha is also portrayed as a peacemaker in the Green Book as he "had striven to achieve conciliation between the English and Afrikaner elements" after the Anglo-Boer War (p. 252). According to the Green Book he was a man who was able to win the respect of all including the "English section of the population" (p. 248). Moreover, he was popular because he "had the backing of the former republics [Transvaal and Orange Free State] and had strong support in the former English colonies [Natal and Cape Colony]" (p. 249).

The final "big man" who appears in the Green Book is Hendrik Frensch Verwoerd. "Dr. H.F. Verwoerd became the first prime minister of South Africa not born in this country" (p. 275). He was born in Holland and came to South Africa with his parents when he was very young (p. 275). Verwoerd is portrayed as an academic as he studied overseas and was "appointed Professor of Applied Psychology at Stellenbosch University" (p. 275). According to the book he is known as the architect of the policy of "separate development" (p. 275). This policy, better known as apartheid, stipulated that the different race groups in South Africa had to live and work separately. The book also points out that he shaped the destiny of the ordinary people because, "During his term of office the first self–governing Bantu[7] homeland was created" (p. 275). Furthermore, as per the Green Book, to curtail "Bantu migration to the cities and employment in White industries, Verwoerd encouraged the development of "border industries". These industries in or near the Bantu homelands [Bantustans] would provide employment for the Bantu" (p. 276). In the view of the Green Book he was strong willed and determined as he "pushed through his policy irrespective of all opposition or arguments against it" (p. 276). Hence, his policy of separate development was what made this "big man" prominent amongst his contemporaries.

Verwoerd is also depicted as a patriot and leader as he became a Senator and served in the National Party cabinet as Minister of Bantu Affairs from 1950 to 1958 (p. 275).

---

[7]"The terms "Bantu" and "Native" while not directly insulting, have a derogatory connotation, and are resented by many Africans. The word "Bantu" is also used by anthropologists to designate a large group of peoples speaking related languages" (van den Berghe, p. 10, 1965).

The Green Book also points out that he "was the man who led South Africa to republican status" (p. 276) on 31 May 1961 (p. 276) which meant full independence from Britain. The textbook states that Verwoerd attended the Commonwealth Prime Ministers Conference in March 1961 and applied for South Africa to become a republic and still be a member of the Commonwealth (p. 276). Furthermore, he was a man in whom the people had faith because they gave him the mandate to declare a republic (p. 276).

As per the book Verwoerd may also appear as a peacemaker because he claimed that by establishing a republic, "the discord between English and Afrikaans-speaking would end" (p. 276). He was, according to the book, brilliant as "his intellectual prowess and clear thinking gave him an unrivalled insight into South African affairs" (p. 276).

In conclusion the prototype of the "big man" in this textbook is that of one who shaped the destiny of his people. The respective "big men" analysed for their characteristics in this book, namely Nehru, Gandhi, Botha and Verwoerd were collectively and individually presented as being popular. It is evident in this book that they made personal sacrifices and were also political patriots. These "big men" were leaders with vision. They are according to this textbook extreme patriarchs, "big men" and "fathers". Thus all these men as they appear in this textbook displayed hegemonic form of masculinity because of their popularity, power and influence. These "big men" as mentioned in the Green Book were also saviours in many ways – mostly on a political level. It is evident in this book that these men used their power, status and intellectual abilities to protect the interests of their people.

The Green Book did not employ the views of historians, history educators and academics to further enhance the depiction of the "big men" but employed apartheid era ideology to portray the characteristics of the "big men" analysed as a mirror image of what the state wanted them to be. Therefore we have a "big man" who is associated with traditional characteristics of masculinity (toughness, strong and aggressive) that emerges from the Green Book to promote apartheid ideology.

4.2.2. Orange Book (1975)

The four "big men" that appeared in the Green Book (1974), Nehru, Gandhi, Botha and Verwoerd, also make their appearance in this textbook. They are analysed in the order that they appeared in the Green Book.

Nehru appears in the Orange Book as outspoken because "he criticised Britain's war [Second World War] effort and at times spoke very provokingly" (p. 91). He also wrote to "President Roosevelt of America that India could not support the British war effort but would organise her own war" (p .91). The Orange Book also characterises Nehru as a patriot and a man who possessed great leadership skills. He was, as per the book, elected Chairman of the Congress, the political party he belonged to, in 1929 (p. 91). According to the book he became Prime Minister, Minister of Foreign Affairs and also President of the Congress (p. 92) in India. His patriotism is evident when it is described in the textbook that he "proposed that the immediate aim of the Congress should be to win total independence for India" (p. 91). This is further supported by the Orange Book which states that, "In 1950 Nehru led the delegation which put to the Commonwealth Prime Minister's Conference India's request to become a republic" (p. 92).

Nehru is also depicted in the Orange Book as a man who was able to achieve some of the things he planned to achieve. Thus he had to pay attention to agriculture and irrigation to increase the production of food (p. 92). According to this specific apartheid era textbook Nehru succeeded in achieving this and after the five year plans he was satisfied with food production and was able to give attention to industrial development (p. 92). Nehru was also responsible for increasing the production of cement and paper (p. 92). The man is also depicted as a peacemaker in the Orange Book "as he strived for peace in his foreign policy" (p. 92). Furthermore, the textbook states that he played "the part of peacemaker in the international arena" (p. 92). Therefore, one of his principles "for the peaceful coexistence of nations" (p. 92) was a "policy of non-aggression" (p. 92). Nehru is also depicted as a man who wanted to develop relations with other countries for "He believed in visiting other countries and receiving statesmen

in India" (p. 92). This man, according to the textbook, also made personal sacrifices for his country. He was sent to jail for four years for criticising Britain's war effort (p. 91). He, to boot, was also a scholar according to the Orange Book as he studied law in Britain.

Mohandas Gandhi is portrayed in the Orange Book as a champion of Indian rights in South Africa (p. 128). According to this textbook he qualified as a lawyer in Britain and used his expertise to fight for the political rights of Indians in South Africa (p. 127). Gandhi, as per this book, is presented as a leader who provided leadership in times of crises as he "drew up a petition in which he protested against the intention of the Natal Legislative Assembly to deprive the Indians of the vote" (p. 128). The Orange Book states that he established the Indian Congress as "he felt that the Indians in Natal urgently needed an organisation to safeguard their interests" (p. 127).

It is also evident from this textbook that Gandhi was "received as a hero" (p. 129) when he returned to India in 1915. The Orange Book also depicts him as a patriot as he supported Britain in World War 1 "in the hope of obtaining self-government for India if Britain won the war" (p. 129). Thus, when he returned to India he "devoted his time and energy to the upliftment of his own people" (p. 129). Gandhi was also depicted as a peacemaker in this book because the "man who had all his life opposed violence died violently" (p. 130). Gandhi as a "big man" also started the passive resistance organisation in South Africa which emphasised the use of non-violence by the Indian people in the fight against unjust laws introduced by the government (p. 128). According to the Orange Book Gandhi also recognised the power of women in the struggle to improve conditions of the Indians in South Africa: "From the Transvaal 11 women also crossed the border into Natal without permits, where at Newcastle, they persuaded the mine workers to strike" (p. 129). This book also indicates that he made personal sacrifices for the Indians in South Africa as he was jailed many times (pp. 128-129).

General Louis Botha is the next "big man" in the Orange Book and is portrayed as a military leader and a politician (p. 133). According to the textbook he provided

leadership in times of crises by interceding for the Transvaal burghers "who had been impoverished" (p. 133) after the Anglo-Boer War. Louis Botha is also depicted as a patriot in this textbook as he "assumed command of the Union's forces himself" (p. 137) in the South West Border Campaign (p. 137) during World War 1. He is also portrayed as a peacemaker in the Orange Book as he "considered it his life's task to remove the bitterness resulting from the two South African wars and he hoped to achieve this by following a policy of conciliation" (p. 134). Hence, his motto was "forgive and forget" (p. 134). Botha is also depicted as a unifier and nation builder. Therefore, he wanted "co-operation between the two White population groups aimed at building a new nation" (p. 134). Moreover, it is evident as per the Orange Book that he tried to "heal the rift among the Afrikaners and to bring the two language groups closer to each other" (p. 138). He was, according to this textbook, also popular amongst the Afrikaners as "he was accepted by the burghers as their political leader" (p. 133).

Verwoerd is the last "big man" who appears in this textbook. He is depicted in the Orange Book as a man who was blessed with a "strong personality, a brilliant mind and fine political intuition" (p. 165). He was also versatile because he was according to the Orange Book appointed as a professor, chief editor of a newspaper and then he became involved in politics (p. 162). In this book Verwoerd is portrayed as one who shaped the destiny of the people of his country when he "announced that the Government would proceed with its plan to create a republic" (p. 163). The Orange Book also depicts him as the architect of the racial policy based on separate development (p. 162) or apartheid. This is however, since it is an apartheid-era textbook not articulated as such by the book. According to this textbook he formulated the Bantu Policy of the National Party Government as the Minister of Bantu Affairs (p. 165). In the view of the book, "This he did with exceptional clarity and imagination and implemented the policy vigorously. Indeed, he may be regarded as the architect and first great builder of this policy" (p. 165).

Verwoerd also appears in the Orange Book as a unifier between the English and Afrikaners because "he appealed to the two population groups to respect each other's

language" (p. 162) as "He also encouraged the two language groups to attend each other's festivals" (p. 163). According to the Orange Book Verwoerd was also popular as his appointment as Prime Minister was decided by the votes of his fellow party members (p. 162). This man, in the context of the time, also embraced nationhood as he believed that "the feast days, as well as the national heroes should be regarded as belonging to the whole nation" (p. 163). Verwoerd is also depicted in this textbook as a man who wanted to maintain ties with all the African states (p. 165). Thus "he offered the hand of friendship to these states and declared that South Africa would be prepared to help and co-operate in matters of mutual interest" (p. 165).

In the final analysis the appearance of the "big men" in this textbook is in many ways similar to the way in which they appeared in the Green Book (1974). They appear in the Orange Book to be patriots, peacemakers, unifiers and nation builders. The "big" men also appear as founding fathers and architects of plans and policies. It is evident in this text that the "big men" displayed great political leadership skills and were able to achieve many of the objectives which they had set out. They generally appear in the text, as being well educated (except for Botha), outspoken, brilliant and versatile. The textbook also depicts them as embracing nationhood and that they also made personal sacrifices for their people. In the final analysis the Orange Book characterises some "big" men such as Verwoerd, Gandhi and Nehru as heroes and saviours. All of these "big" men were also characterised as leaders and patriarchs. However, comments from historians and academics about the depiction of these four "big men" are not evident in this textbook. The "big men's" power, status and brilliance as portrayed in this textbook is the ideal masculine construction associated with apartheid ideology.

4.2.3. Red Book (1982)

In this textbook, only Mohandas Gandhi and King Shaka[8] Zulu make their appearance as "big men". Gandhi has already appeared in the Green and Orange Books.

---

[8] Shaka ka Senzangakhona (circa 1787-1828) King of the Zulus. One of the most influential monarchs of the Zulu kingdom. Born in KwaZulu-Natal, near Melmoth. Shaka was the illegitimate first son of the chieftain Senzangakhona ka Jama, a prince of the Zulu clan, and Nandi, a daughter of Bhebe, the past chief of the Elangeni tribe (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/shaka, 2014).

Gandhi is portrayed in the Red Book as providing leadership in times of crises. According to this textbook he set up two farms to provide refuge for Indians who encountered difficulties because of defying the government (p. 96). The Red Book also points out that Gandhi shaped the behaviour of ordinary people by introducing the "policy of passive resistance" (p. 95). He also, according to the book, organised a march into the Transvaal which resulted in the passing of the Indian Relief Act (1914). This act "abolished the £3 tax and recognised Indian marriages" (p. 97). The textbook also associates him with royalty and wealth as his "family was wealthy and cultured" (p. 94). Gandhi is also depicted as a peacemaker in the Red Book as he "discouraged the use of violence" (p. 95). He also strengthened unity amongst the Indian people by publishing the "weekly newspaper, *Indian Opinion*" (p. 96). According to this textbook he also used women in his fight against injustice. This is evident in the textbook when Gandhi "asked a group of Indian women to cross the border into Natal to defy the immigration law" (p. 96) and in 1913 the women persuaded miners to stop work (p. 97). This is the first time that a "big man" in an apartheid era textbook was associated with women. The textbook also portrays him as a "married man, professionally qualified as a lawyer" (p. 94). Gandhi appears in the textbook as a patriarch, family man and a carer of ordinary people. He is also depicted in this textbook as a man who was bestowed with status. Gandhi is characterised in this textbook as a peacemaker, a man of compassion and a unifier.

Shaka's appearance in the Red Book in 1982 is historical as this is the first time that an African "big" man has become the object of study in the apartheid era history textbook analysed in this study. King Shaka "was greatly feared" by the ordinary people (p. 68). He is characterised in the Red Book as being associated with hegemonic power and royalty. This is supported by text which states that he "became chief of the Zulus and ruled as king" and he "kept all power in his own hands" (p. 68). According to this textbook Shaka exercised patriarchal power as he "included only men and boys in his army" (p. 65). This textbook points out that he was also innovative as he "invented the short stabbing assegai instead of throwing assegais which were lost" (p. 67). His

soldiers moved bare foot to increase speed (p. 66). He also used young boys to carry supplies for the army to lighten the burden of the soldiers. In the Red Book it is evident that Shaka also used "crescent formation when the army attacked" (p. 66). He is also depicted as an "outcast son" in this textbook (p. 65). The Red Book portrays Shaka as powerful, innovative, cruel and creative. According to this textbook Shaka was greatly feared and he was a military man who created "real men". The textbook also associates him with hegemonic power, royalty and patriarchal power.

The two very different "big men" found in this book share common characteristics in their portrayal. Both Gandhi and Shaka are characterised as founding fathers, patriarchs and saviours in this textbook. They were portrayed in the textbook as leaders and men bestowed with status. What is also significant is that there are no "big" White men appearing in this textbook as compared to the previous textbooks which I have analysed. Moreover for the first time an African "big" man makes his appearance in a textbook. Shaka is characterised as a violent and autocratic "big" man in this textbook. Gandhi, in contrast, is portrayed in this textbook as a compassionate, non-violent and caring "big" man. However, both these "big men" display characteristics of hegemonic masculinity in this textbook.

4.2.4. Yellow Book (1983)

Verwoerd and Gandhi are the two "big men" that appear in this apartheid–era textbook. Verwoerd, according to the Yellow Book, shaped the behaviour of ordinary people in a democratic manner by holding a referendum (p. 53). He is also depicted as a patriot in the textbook as "he revived the Republican movement" (p. 53). Most important of all, in the view of this book, was that he introduced the "Bantu Homelands policy" which was one of the key elements of his policy of separate development (p. 53). According to the textbook this "big" man shaped the destiny of ordinary people by introducing the policy of separate development. In conclusion the Yellow Book depicts Verwoerd as a patriot, leader and founding father as he is portrayed as making personal sacrifices for his people. Furthermore, this "big man" is portrayed as being popular as he was revered by other "big men". However, he does not appear in this textbook as a peacemaker.

79

The Yellow Book depicts Gandhi as possessing strong willpower when he continued the struggle against inequality despite being imprisoned (p. 97). It is evident in the view of the textbook that he also provided leadership in times of crises as he assisted in a civil case as a lawyer (p. 94). He also displayed leadership skills by forming the Natal Indian Congress to fight the disfranchise bill aimed at Indians (p. 95). Gandhi as a "big man" in this textbook is also depicted as one who shaped the destiny of ordinary people by forming the "Satyagraha movement" (p. 96) which promoted passive resistance and non-violence in the struggle against injustice. Thus, he was a founder of the passive resistance movement in South Africa (p. 96) and the "settlement at Phoenix" (p. 95). Furthermore, Gandhi is also portrayed in the textbook as making personal sacrifices in his fight against inequality as he was "imprisoned a number of times" (p. 97). Gandhi was also, according to the Yellow Book, revered by other "big men" such as Jan Smuts who "always spoke highly of Gandhi" (p. 97). Ultimately he is portrayed in the Yellow textbook as a saviour, peacemaker, leader and founding father.

Gandhi and Verwoerd are depicted in the textbook as patriarchs, founding fathers and patriots who shaped the destiny of the ordinary people. They were also characterised as popular "big men". However whilst Verwoerd is depicted as a humanist in this textbook, Gandhi's political career and his imprisonment for resisting policies are foregrounded now. Gandhi's depiction in this textbook differs from the way he is portrayed in the previous apartheid era textbooks of this study. He is characterised in the previous textbooks as a campaigner for human rights and a carer of ordinary people. However, in the Yellow Book, he is depicted now as a struggle hero and political activist.

4.2.5. Conclusion

I have analysed the data from four textbooks of the apartheid era. It is imperative at this juncture to mention that these "big men" must be understood in the context of apartheid which was patriarchal and male dominated. Hence the textbooks that were analysed must be seen for what they are, apartheid era mouthpieces which spawned a certain kind of "big man". This is supported by the Yellow Book which states that "In our study

of the prime ministers of South Africa, we will be concerned with them as men" (p. 248). However, these "big men" were not selected because of their positions. They were analysed as they appeared in the selected textbooks. Hence, these textbooks highlighted the actions and achievements of "big men" especially white ones in the apartheid era. Although all the "big men" do not appear in all four of the textbooks, there are certain common characteristics that emerge from the analysis. The apartheid era "big man" generally appears as a patriot, founding father, hero and leader. He is also a patriarch, peacemaker and nation builder. A collective analysis of the "big men" in the apartheid era textbooks reveals that they were, across racial lines, able to achieve many of their objectives that they had set out to achieve. They were also outspoken, brilliant and innovative. These "big men" were exalted with status in their depiction by the textbooks.

Individually the textbooks do not portray them as leaders who are God ordained. Instead they are portrayed as saviours. There also no myths created about these "big men" in the textbooks. Moreover, views from the media, academics and historians were not used as an alternative source in the textbooks in the depiction of the "big man". In other words the textbooks portrayed the "big men" in a single master narrative. These textbooks are apartheid era constructs which used evidence judiciously to create important characteristics in the "big men" portrayed. Whilst all the "big men" were depicted as leaders and founding fathers in all of the textbooks, what is foregrounded is the notion of patriotism and patriarchy. Patriotism and patriarchy are essential elements of apartheid era ideology. Consequently, a dominant hegemonic "big man" does appear in all four of the apartheid era textbooks of this study. Verwoerd is the enduring "big man" appearing in three of the four apartheid era textbooks. He is portrayed as the architect of apartheid in all four textbooks. Verwoerd is the physically, big white Afrikaner politician appearing in the apartheid era textbooks. The changing political scenario during the apartheid era also impacted on the type of "big man" appearing in these textbooks. Hence Shaka appeared in 1982 as the only "big" black man in the apartheid era textbooks analysed. He is, in contrast to the other "big men" analysed portrayed as violent and being a tyrannical autocrat. Although women also appear

alongside the "big men" in the two apartheid era textbooks, their depiction is not highlighted. Hence this depiction of the characteristics of "big men" in the apartheid era textbooks is inextricably linked to the power relations of race and gender in South African society at the time. In the next section of this chapter I provide an analysis of the "big men" in the post-apartheid era history textbooks.

4.3. An analysis of the depiction of 'big men' in post-apartheid era history textbooks

The post-apartheid era is a period of transformation, nation building and reconciliation. A democratically elected government by all the people of South Africa replaced the apartheid government in 1994. The two key political objectives of the democratic government as envisaged in the Constitution of South Africa were nation building and democratisation. The aim of nation building is to unite South Africans of all ethnicities after being divided by the racist policies of apartheid. A new South African identity needs to be forged in order to create a secure nation state. Democracy is the ideology of the new nation state with particular emphasis on human rights. Thus the characteristics of the post-apartheid "big men" in the analysis of the textbooks should in theory now be different. These "big men" should ideally be attributed characteristics such as nation builders, reconcilers and promoters of human rights in the textbooks. I will return to this in the final chapter of the dissertation. Hence, what follows is an analysis of post-apartheid era history textbooks to highlight the characteristics of the post-apartheid "big man".

4.3.1. Black Book (1999)

In this book, I examine the characteristics attributed to Nelson Mandela who[9] was the first president of a democratic South Africa. According to the Black Book, Mandela was a global icon who was revered throughout the world for his fight against the evils of the

---

[9] Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela (1918-2013).Lawyer, anti-apartheid activist and first elected president of a democratic South Africa .Born in Mvezo district of Umtata in Transkei, South Africa. His father was the chief of Mvezo and he was the son of the third wife, Noqaphi Nosekani who was a Methodist. He matriculated from Clarkebury Missionary School. He studied law at the University of South Africa and was awarded his Bachelor's degree in 1941.

apartheid regime in South Africa. Although he did not renounce violence Mandela agreed to work "for a peaceful solution to the conflict between the African National Congress (ANC) and the government" (p. 339). It is evident in this textbook that Mandela also wanted to strengthen unity between the different race groups in South Africa as he "stressed the need for national reconciliation and nation building" (p. 353) when he became president in 1994. The textbook also portrays him as "the most famous apartheid prisoner, known internationally" (p. 339). He was also a very popular "big man" in that he was "welcomed by a crowd of 100 000 ANC supporters at the Soccer City Stadium in Soweto outside of Johannesburg two days after his release from prison in 1990" (p. 340). Mandela, according to this textbook, "defended the continuance of the armed struggle" and stated that it "was purely defensive action against the violence of apartheid" (pp. 347-348).

Hendrik Verwoerd also appears in the Black Book. He is depicted as the architect of apartheid. Verwoerd is characterised as possessing leadership potential as he became "Minister of Native Affairs" (p. 300) very early in his career in 1950. He is also portrayed in the Black Book as a founder of apartheid who introduced the policy of separate development (p. 301). The Black Book depicts him as "often charming in public, but revealed himself to be a fanatic in the application of apartheid" (p. 301). He is also presented in the textbook as a "brilliant scholar" (p. 300) and editor of the newspaper, *Die Transvaler* (p. 300).

In conclusion, the post-apartheid Black Book collectively characterises "big men" as founders and leaders .They were also characterised as patriarchs and saviours in the textbook. However, Verwoerd as per the textbook is depicted as a racial humanist as he wanted the different race groups to develop separately. He is also portrayed as an intellectual in this textbook. Verwoerd's intellectual abilities were equally evident in the apartheid era textbooks. Moreover his appearance in this post-apartheid era textbook confirms the enduring legacy of him as a "big man". However, this textbook is not overly critical in its portrayal of Verwoerd when compared to his characterisation in the apartheid era textbooks analysed earlier. Mandela on the other hand is depicted in the

textbook as a nation builder and reconciler. He is also depicted as a global icon, hero and a popular "big man" in this textbook. Mandela's characterisation shows some resonance with the post-apartheid era ideals and principles as enshrined in the democratic constitution.

4.3.2. Blue Book (2005)

Jawaharlal Nehru who has also appeared in some of the analysed apartheid era textbooks also features in this textbook. He is depicted in the Blue Book as providing leadership in times of crises as he gave "Britain an ultimatum to give India self-government before the end of 1929" (p. 152). Nehru is also portrayed in the Blue Book as shaping the destiny of the Indian people as he "declared India an independent country in 1930" (p. 152). He is also depicted in the textbook as a patriot and a man of status as he became "the new president of the Indian National Congress" (p. 152) and "was the first Prime Minister of India" (p. 154).

The second "big man" found in the Blue Book is Shaka. According to this textbook Shaka Zulu, king of the Zulus, shaped the destiny and behaviour of his subjects by maintaining a tight rein on the Zulu kingdom, "with iron discipline over both his warriors and people" (p. 235). Moreover, it is evident in this textbook that films about Shaka show his "ruthlessness and everyone else gives a child-like loyalty to him and him alone" (p. 242). Shaka is also associated with hegemonic power in this textbook as he is described as a "powerful king" (p. 235). It is evident in the text that, "Images of Shaka Zulu in films show him with a war-like disposition carrying a spear in one hand and a war shield in the other. His face is always full of anger and vengeance. His dark, muscular body was made to shine and his eyes were red to show his ferocity. He is shown as being very tall, as if he towered over all other people" (p. 242).

According to the Blue Book a myth was created of a "ruthless, bloodthirsty Shaka" (p. 242). He "was portrayed as a bloodthirsty despot, bitter towards everyone, including his aides and family members" (p. 242). However, this textbook points out that "the image and power of Shaka were deliberately over-emphasised for example in films to give

credit to attempts by settlers [white people] to justify their demonization of the Zulu kingdom, which they saw as a danger to their expansion into the interior of South Africa from the Cape" (p. 243). According to the textbook certain myths about Shaka were also created by the white settlers and Zulu nationalists. He was depicted in the textbook as a bloodthirsty tyrant by the white settlers and a strong and powerful leader by the Zulu nationalists. This as verified in the textbook was done to justify white settler expansion and to strengthen Zulu nationalism. It is also evident in the textbook that "Zulu political nationalists created a myth of a powerful Shaka to whip up Zulu nationalism from the 1920s under the banner of the Inkatha movement. They exploited the image of Shaka as a strong, fierce founder to project a powerful, unified Zulu nation to serve their political interests in the twentieth century" (p. 243).

Shaka is also portrayed in the Blue Book as being popular. This is so because "more motion films have been made about Shaka than any other African leader" (p. 242). Shaka, as per the book, was also innovative and introduced close combat by inventing short spears instead of long ones which were usually thrown at the enemy (p. 242). He was also depicted in the textbook as cruel and tyrannical in his leadership (p. 235). However, in the view of the Blue book Shaka also allowed women to have power in the military as the textbook refers to MmaNthatisi, who was known as the "Destroyer of Nations" and one of the Zulu commanders named Nyamazana, who was described as a remarkable warrior (p. 236). The participation of women in the military during Shaka's reign as pointed out in the Blue Book challenges hegemonic notions of masculinity. The Blue Book also portrays Shaka as being hungry for land and power (p. 235). Shaka is thus characterised as powerful, strong and ruthless. He is characterised in this textbook as a big, brave man who was feared by his subjects but his construction as a big man is contested and not merely accepted which points to politicization of his depiction.

Mahatma Gandhi is the third "big man" portrayed in this textbook. The Blue Book characterises him as being God ordained as he was referred to as "Mahatma" or "great soul" (p. 48). Gandhi, in the view of the book, also shaped the destiny of the Indian people as he was "largely responsible for India's independence" (p. 147). The Blue

Book also portrays him as a peacemaker as he "did as much as he could to ensure peace between the Muslims and the Hindus" (p. 155). Gandhi, as per the text, also encouraged South Africans to resist apartheid in a peaceful way (p. 148). This statement is made despite him passing away before the implementation of apartheid. It is evident from the text that: "He did not believe in violence, as he was convinced that he could bring independence to India through peaceful mass demonstrations, non-cooperation with the British government, and by boycotting British goods" (p. 148). According to the textbook Gandhi founded the Satyagraha movement which was based on "firmness in truth", non-violence and passive resistance (p. 148).

Mahatma Gandhi was also portrayed in the Blue Book as "the most famous leader of the Indian National Congress" (p. 147) and a popular leader (p. 148). He sympathised with the poor and "gave up his own personal comforts" (p. 148). This textbook also depicts him as a married man who was professionally qualified as a lawyer (p. 148). Gandhi also "worked as a stretcher-bearer for the British Army in South Africa" (p. 148). Hence, Gandhi is characterised in this textbook as being a peacemaker and a founder of the passive resistance movement. The Blue Book also depicts him as being famous and popular. Gandhi is also portrayed in this textbook as a carer of ordinary people, a family man and a peacemaker. He is also according to the textbook described as being God ordained and a spiritual ancestor of the nation.

In conclusion, there are similarities and differences in the characteristics attributed to the "big men" who appear in this textbook. Collectively, these "big men" were according to the textbook patriots, leaders and, men with status. They were also depicted in the textbook as patriarchs and founding fathers. These men were also characterised as popular and powerful "big men" in the textbook. They were also as pointed out in the textbook, portrayed as shapers of the destiny of the nation. Moreover, these "big" men were depicted in this textbook with similar characteristics as in the apartheid era textbooks. They were all portrayed as hegemonic men in both eras. Shaka is the enduring black man transcending textbooks from the apartheid era. He is characterised in greater detail in this textbook when compared to the two "big" Indian men appearing

in this textbook. Myths were used to politicise his depiction. His characterisation as a ruthless tyrant on the one hand and a powerful and strong leader on the other reflects the changes in the political scenario in the post-apartheid era. What is also significant is that no "big" white man is portrayed in this textbook and there is lesser detail regarding the characteristics of Gandhi and Nehru as "big men" in this textbook when compared to Shaka. Furthermore women also make their appearance in this textbook. Thus issues of race, gender and politics are foregrounded in this textbook. This could be related to ideals and principles of the new democratic constitution of the post-apartheid state.

4.3.3. Grey Book (2005)

In this book only Shaka features as a "big man". According to the Grey Book Shaka impacted on the future of his people because, "The rise and expansion of Shaka's Zulu kingdom led to a period of great disruption and population movement in southern Africa" (p. 190). The textbook also provides various representations of Shaka and how his name and image are used by the media, political parties, charitable organisations and the tourism industry to achieve their objectives (pp. 196-197). It is evident in the Grey Book that: "Many companies use Shaka's name to advertise their products on the internet, for example, www.boomshaka.com for reggae music, and www.shakagolf.co.za to promote golfing holidays around South Africa"(p. 196). The television series *Shaka Zulu* was according to this textbook made in the early 1980s. "It was shown on the [apartheid] government controlled SABC TV and then across the world (to 100 million people). The director claimed it was made to change racist interpretations of African history. However, it reinforced them through stereotypes of Zulu life. Shaka is physically brave, but is shown as being incapable of emotions other than revenge and hate" (p. 196).This textbook also indicates how the charity organisation called "The Lions" use Shaka to advertise their convention (p. 196). According to the organisation with reference to the characteristics attributed to him, "The Shaka theme epitomises teamwork, dedication, preparation and leadership-all elements that we, as Lions, also aspire to in our community service activities" (p. 196).

The Grey Book also points out that Shaka's image is being used by the tourism industry in advertisements on the internet (p. 197). The advertisement for 'Shakaland', a tourist resort owned by the Protea Hotel group (p. 197) mentions that 'Shakaland' "was originally designed around some of the sets from *Shaka Zulu,* and all images of Shaka at the resort are in fact of the actor, Henry Cele, who played the part of Shaka" (p. 197). Thus, it is evident in the text that Shaka's image and name is used for commercial purposes (p. 197). Shaka is therefore characterised as a powerful, brave and popular "big man" in this textbook and his name is influential as it is everlasting and can be used for various purposes. Furthermore, much detail is provided in this textbook regarding the depiction of Shaka.

As per the text some historians also thought that the Mfecane was caused by "Shaka's aggressive expansion of the Zulu kingdom" (p. 189). The word "Mfecane" means to be crushed in total war. It was started by Shaka in 1816 (Turton et al, 2007). "This brutal period of history consisted of what is known in contemporary politics as ethnic cleansing, depopulating the hinterland of what we today call South Africa, displacing people as far as Tanzania in a domino effect of refugee migration. This ended with the final military engagement of the Anglo-Zulu War, known as the Battle of Ulundi" (Turton et al, 2007, p. 4). Moreover, this textbook states that, "Some colonialist writers stressed his violence and cruelty in order to contrast all African people as a whole with 'civilised' Europeans" (p. 194). Therefore, Shaka "maintained a fierce discipline and for the slightest fault men were put to death … all were terrified of Shaka and many of his own people hated him because of his cruelty to them" (p. 195). Thus, Shaka is depicted in the Grey Book as a cruel, violent and 'ruthless tyrant' (p. 194) and part of his depiction was an historical construction by the colonialists.

Whilst Shaka was characterised as a "ruthless tyrant" (p. 192), he was according to the text celebrated as a great leader among Zulu people after his death (p. 193). The Grey Book also confirms that Zulu success was due to Shaka's leadership style and ingenuity (p. 189). Hence, Shaka introduced the short stabbing spear and age regiments in the military (p. 189). According to this textbook Shaka also allowed women to play a role in

the creation of the Zulu kingdom as "female amabutho (age regiments) were also organised under the control of the chief. They played a crucial role in maintaining food production in the homesteads" (p. 189).

Shaka as per the Grey Book also "became a symbol of Zulu greatness, used by Zulu political and cultural organisations to stress Zulu initiative and achievement" (p. 194). In his speech at the King Shaka Memorial Day on 24 September 1974, Mangosuthu Buthelezi who was Chief Executive Councillor of KwaZulu stated that "King Shaka is a man who lived in quest of knowledge … There is no limit to what we can learn from him, from his beliefs and his life even now. King Shaka has lessons not just for Zulus but for all humans. The leadership such as we see in him, as far as human relationships are concerned, is sorely needed in Southern Africa" (p. 194). Thus Shaka is depicted as a symbol of Zulu heritage and culture in the Grey Book. His symbol has also been used by others "to celebrate South African, and in some cases African, achievement as a whole" (p. 194).

There is a description in this textbook of how Shaka was presented to learners at school in the 1970s. Therefore it is pointed out in the Grey Book that "The ancestral heroes of our fathers, the great chiefs which our parents told stories about, were in class described as bloodthirsty animal brutes; Shaka, the brilliant general who welded the Mnguni tribulets into a unified and powerful Zulu nation, the greatest war machine in South African history, was described as a psychopath" (p.195). The Grey Book also highlights what the late Chief Albert Luthuli, the one-time leader of the A.N.C wrote about Shaka in his autobiography: "His outlook was that of his day, and when that is taken into account, and when all that can be said to his discredit has been said, this king of legendary physique emerges as a brilliant general, and a ruler of great courage, intelligence, and ability. Nevertheless, Shaka did go against some of the customs of his people, and this was his downfall. In particular, he over-used the army, allowing his soldiers little time for the normal pursuits of peace. As the years passed, his ambitions got the better of him. That he was despotic [acted like a dictator] probably didn't matter, but his people expect their king to balance this with kindness. Shaka's rule grew harsher

… In the end, Shaka went the way of most tyrants … Even the army appears to have helped to plot the assassination by his half-brother, Dingane. Shaka died unmourned by the nation which he had raised up" (p. 195).

Shaka is the only "big" man appearing in this textbook and is covered in immense detail in a deeply nuanced manner. Moreover, he is a "big" African man. What is significant is that he makes his appearance in this textbook which was published in the same year (2005) as the previous one. Whilst Shaka was characterised as being violent and cruel in this textbook, he was also depicted as a symbol representing Zulu history, culture and heritage. He is also portrayed in the Grey Book as a brilliant and intelligent leader. The big man's name and image is according to this textbook used for commercial and political purposes. The Grey book portrays this "big man" as an extreme patriarch who allowed women to help build his kingdom. This is very important as we have a post-apartheid construction of the "big man" in the textbook being challenged by notions of feminism.

This textbook depicts Shaka as a dictator and a hero and also points out how he was presented to learners at school in the apartheid era. According to this textbook, Shaka was presented as a savage, a great military leader and a psychopath to learners at school. The Grey Book provides a detailed account of Shaka's characterisation. His depiction is also nuanced in this textbook and he is portrayed in different ways in the textbook. Shaka is depicted in a positive and negative manner in this textbook. Whilst he appears as per the text as a cruel and ruthless tyrant, Shaka is also portrayed as a role model for all humans. It is also evident in this textbook that Shaka is depicted as symbolising Zulu heritage and culture. According to this textbook he is not only depicted as being used as a propaganda and political tool, but is also characterised as a symbol of African renaissance. Whilst, there are no "big" Indian and White men appearing in this textbook, women do appear playing a sub-ordinate role.

4.3.4. Purple Book (2011).

Once more, Shaka is the only "big" man appearing in this textbook. He is depicted in this textbook as a" blood thirsty dictator" (p. 127) .The Purple Book points out that, "In war he was an insatiable and exterminating savage, and in peace an unrelenting and ferocious despot, who kept his subjects in awe by his monstrous executions, and was unrestrained in his bloody designs" (p. 127). According to this textbook, this influenced the way in which historians reacted to these depictions of Shaka by the English traders in Natal. Furthermore, it is evident in the textbook that, "Early historians accepted these European viewpoints and included them in their books. Modern historians have questioned the truthfulness and reliability of these accounts as the writers might have had ulterior motives such as portraying themselves as a civilising force in Africa. The frequent use of words such as "savage" indicates that the European writers thought that they were superior to the Africans they were describing" (p. 127). Thus, this textbook provides an account of what influenced the way in which Shaka was depicted by historians in their own narratives.

The characteristics attributed to Shaka in the Purple Book are those of a brave military leader and efficient ruler (pp. 128-129). It is highlighted in this textbook that "Shaka was a fearless soldier who had transformed his *amabutho* into a well-disciplined and motivated army" (p. 128). It is also evident in the textbook that, "He had also established military alliances with surrounding chiefdoms" (p. 128). According to the book, "He became a soldier in the Mthethwa army where his bravery and leadership qualities were soon noticed by Dingiswayo" (p. 128) who was chief of the Zulus. Shaka is also associated with royalty in the Purple Book as he was made "chief of the Zulus" (p. 128).

Shaka is also depicted in the Purple Book as one who was able to achieve his objectives as he "gained control of most of the Phongola-Thukela region by conquest and peaceful means" (p. 128). Hence, he also appears in this textbook as a military leader who is not necessarily blood thirsty. He was also "able to win the loyalty of many different groups of people and created a well-organised kingdom'' (p. 128). What was most striking as per the textbook about this "big man" is his ingenuity in preparing for war. Shaka was in command of a large army who used new tactics during war (p. 128).

This is pointed out in the text where Zulu soldiers used a short spear and wore body – length cowhide shields to protect them from spears (p. 129). The soldiers had to also run barefoot to strengthen their feet (p. 129).Shaka is therefore portrayed in this part of the textbook as an innovator and warrior who did not want to spill blood.

According to the Purple Book Shaka is also depicted as one who used peaceful means to control his kingdom (p. 129). This is evident in the text which states that: "He was an effective ruler who used his diplomatic skills to encourage groups to join him voluntarily. This was often done by marriage alliances. Women who had been presented to Shaka as tribute lived in the *izigodla* (king's establishments) and were married to wealthy or powerful men. This enabled the king to forge alliances and to receive lobola (bride wealth)" (p. 129). The Zulu chief also appears in this textbook as one who "introduced national ceremonies" (p. 129) to create a collective identity.

Although Shaka is characterised in the Purple Book as powerful and diplomatic, some of his acts as per this textbook were extremely cruel (p. 130). "When his mother Nandi died, Shaka had some 7000 people killed because they did not display enough grief" (p. 130). The textbook also explains that, "Discontent with Shaka's rule had increased as he became more autocratic" (p. 130). However, despite this discontent, this textbook depicts him as a "dynamic military leader" (p. 130) who imposed tight discipline (p. 130). All in all, he had a "spectacular" (p. 131) reign.

The Purple Book portrays Shaka as a nuanced "big man". On one end of the spectrum Shaka is depicted as a blood thirsty and war mongering savage by writers in this textbook. He was also characterised as being cruel and relentless in the textbook. According to the textbook his people became discontented with his autocratic style towards the latter part of his reign. On the other end of the spectrum, the Purple Book depicts him as being big, brave, powerful and diplomatic. He was innovative in preparing for war and commanded respect from his subjects. It is also evident in the textbook that this man displayed great leadership and also tried to create a sense of unity by using his diplomatic skills. He is depicted in the Purple Book as a Renaissance

man with all his flaws. There is a deeper historiography of the "big" man depicted in this textbook. Whilst he is depicted as a propaganda tool to promote the interests of European writers, Shaka is also characterised as a builder of national identity. He appears in a good and bad way in this textbook. Despite the differing depictions of Shaka in this textbook, there is an attempt by this textbook to provide a genuine description of his reign.

Four textbooks were analysed to establish how "big men" appeared in the post-apartheid era textbooks. The "big" men were portrayed as politicians, peacemakers, founding fathers and diplomats in all of the post-apartheid era textbooks. They were also depicted as courageous, powerful and intelligent "big" men in the textbooks. As pointed out in the textbooks these men also shaped the destiny of their people and had great leadership potential. These "big" men as depicted also appear as a heroes, patriarchs, saviours and nation-builders. These textbooks also characterise them as "real men" who belonged to the top of the masculine hierarchy because they embody the ideals and practices of the hegemonic man. They displayed hegemonic forms of masculinity as they were all men who were characterised in the textbooks as patriarchs and founding fathers who were recognised as leaders who dominated over other men and women

They were as per the textbooks strong and determined men who endured despite the circumstances with which they were faced. Only Verwoerd appears as the "big" white man in the Black Book (1999) which was published four years after South Africa became a democracy. He does not feature in the other textbooks analysed after 1999.Shaka is the enduring "big" black man who appears in the textbooks from 2005 until 2011.

What is significant in the analysis of the post-apartheid era textbooks is the persistence of a certain type of "big" man who appears in the apartheid era textbooks and transcends into the post-apartheid era textbooks. Moreover the number of "big" men appearing in the textbooks also diminishes as the textbooks are analysed. The "big"

white and Indian men do not appear in the last book, the Purple Book (2011). Instead, a "big" African man emerges as the dominant hegemonic male in the post-apartheid era textbook. Women also make their appearance in the textbooks, playing a sub-ordinate role. Thus, the issue of race and gender becomes foregrounded in the post-apartheid era textbooks. This "big" African man is portrayed in various ways as his characterisation is nuanced.

4.4. Conclusion

In this chapter, I analysed the data in the apartheid and post-apartheid South African history textbooks. Some of the textbooks provided adequate and relevant data, whilst others did not. Despite this, I was able to provide answers to the first research question of this study and that is how "big men" are portrayed in apartheid and post-apartheid South African history textbooks. It is evident from this analysis that "big men" were portrayed differently in textbooks of both the apartheid and post-apartheid eras. Whilst the "big men" appear as heroes, saviours and nation-builders in textbooks of both the eras, the issue of race emerges as a backdrop against which the characteristics of these "big men" are constructed. The political climate also impacted on the dissemination of knowledge and this is evident in the way the textbooks constructed the prototype of a "big man" to promote the dominant ideology of the state,

In the next chapter, I discuss the findings from this chapter and align it with the research and theoretical literature. I will also provide an overview of the study and discuss issues emerging from the study of the depiction of "big men" in apartheid and post-apartheid era history textbooks. I will also address the second research question underpinning this study and that is to provide reasons as to why "big men" are portrayed the way they are in the apartheid and post-apartheid era history textbooks.

CHAPTER FIVE

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

5.1 Introduction

In this chapter I will be discussing the findings of the analysis of the depiction of the "big men" in the eight selected South African apartheid and post-apartheid history textbooks. These textbooks were used in primary and secondary schools and covered the apartheid era history curricula from circa 1974, the O.B.E and N.C.S (post-1994) and the recently introduced CAPS curricula (2011). I will also compare and discuss the findings to the literature and theories as covered in Chapter Two of this study.

As mentioned in Chapter One, the focus of this study is on analysing the depiction of "big men" in selected South African history textbooks of the apartheid and post-apartheid eras. In this chapter I will attempt to answer the research questions which form the framework on which this study is based. In the previous chapter, I divided my data into two themes to mirror the two political eras. The first theme focussed on the analysis of "big men" in apartheid era history textbooks and the second theme focussed on the analysis of "big men" in post-apartheid era history textbooks. In both themes I used the data analysis instrument (gleaned from the literature reviewed) as a lens to engage with the written content from the selected textbooks as it related to the

characteristics attributed to the "big men" found in the aforementioned books. This comprised my analysis and formed the basis of my subsequent findings.

I analysed only the written data from the textbooks as an inclusion of visual images as data would have extended this study beyond the scope of a Masters dissertation. In my analysis, I focussed on how the "big men" were depicted in the textbooks with specific emphasis on the characteristics attributed to them. I completed the templates of the data analysis instrument by analysing each textbook and filling in data that matched the characteristics of the "big men". I looked at what knowledge was evident and also that which was omitted. The omissions were significant as these were the silences in the textbooks. These silences may imply how the "big men" do not appear in the textbooks and as such point to what is either deemed as normative or which needed to be avoided in the analysed textbooks.

Considering the above this chapter deals with discussing and concluding the findings for my study. I will discuss the findings based on the analysis conducted in Chapter Four. I begin by first providing an overview of the study thus far by giving a brief summary of each chapter. Thereafter I present the findings on the characteristics of "big men" in the history textbooks of both the apartheid and post-apartheid eras and after making a comparison of how they are depicted in terms of changes and continuities across the two eras I draw some conclusions. In this chapter I will also discuss and compare the literature reviewed in Chapter Two and the differences and the trends and patterns if any which have emerged from the literature. Hence, a second level of analysis will be done. I will also provide reasons as to why "big men" were portrayed in the manner that they were in the selected South African history textbooks. Thus I will be focussing on the most important part of the study by providing answers to the research questions and in so doing consider the implication of the findings of my study. I will also theorise my findings on the depiction of "big men" in history textbooks and consider the consequences thereof.

Thereafter I will highlight the contributions of my study to research and then discuss the implications of this study for future research. I will also point out the limitations of the study focussing specifically on the methodology employed. This will be followed by a personal and professional reflection of the study. In the conclusion I will summarise what has been achieved in this chapter and also what I have accomplished by undertaking this dissertation.

Under the next sub-heading I will conduct an overview of the study and provide a summary of what was discussed in each chapter.

5.2 Overview of the study

Chapter One introduced the study and provided an overview of how the thesis was structured. The background and contextualisation of the study placed the phenomena under study, "big men", in their historical context by focussing on how they impacted on the way in which the "big men" were portrayed in the selected history textbooks. The rationale and motivation for this study were also provided. I also dealt with the purpose and focus of this study. In so doing, I explained the aims of this study and what I hope to achieve by conducting this study. The two research questions were also included to outline the aim of this study. This chapter also included a summary of the research design and methodology of the study. The research approach is qualitative in nature and the research methodology employed is qualitative textual analysis. I also provided a layout of this study by explaining what each chapter will deal with.

In Chapter Two I reviewed the available literature on "big men" and history textbooks. I structured the chapter by including the following themes:
- The nature, purpose, structure and methodology of the literature review
- The nature of textbooks
- The power of textbooks
- The importance of history textbooks
- History textbooks in the apartheid and post-apartheid eras

- Conceptualising "big men"
- "Big men" in history textbooks

The literature was reviewed in order to demonstrate the type of themes that are relevant to this study as well as the niche that exists for the study. The other purpose of this literature review is to identify gaps in knowledge and to also establish a theoretical framework. I also reviewed the literature to familiarise myself with history of the phenomena that are being researched and also current research and discourse on the topic.

In Chapter Three I engaged in a discussion of my research design and research methodology. I explained how the research design and methodology will be used to answer the research questions. The first half of the chapter dealt with the research design. This includes the paradigm, the research approach, theoretical perspective and data collection methods. The second half of the chapter dealt with the research methodology. The research methodology adopted for this study is content analysis and the method that I used in conducting the content analysis was textual analysis. Qualitative textual analysis and open coding were the research tools used to analyse the data. The research sample of the selected history textbooks in the apartheid and post-apartheid eras was also provided and explained in this chapter. The other relevant aspects included in this chapter were ethical issues, issues of trustworthiness and methodological limitations.

In Chapter Four I presented the findings of how "big men" are portrayed in the apartheid and post-apartheid era history textbooks. I first presented the data from the four textbooks of the apartheid era and thereafter the data from the four textbooks of the post-apartheid era. I was then able to draw conclusions as to how these "big men" appeared in the textbooks of the respective eras. There were similarities and differences in the way the "big men" were depicted in the history textbooks of both eras. In this chapter I was also able to answer the first research question dealing with how "big men" were depicted in history textbooks.

Chapter Five is the final chapter and deals with the discussion of the findings. It included an overview of the study by providing a summary of each chapter. The discussion includes findings on the characteristics of "big men" in the apartheid and post-apartheid history textbooks. A comparison of the characteristics of the "big men" in the apartheid and post-apartheid eras was also undertaken. The findings were then compared with the literature review. In this chapter, the second research question is answered by providing reasons as to why the "big men" are portrayed the way they are in the history textbooks. I also proposed a theory on "big men" across the two eras linking this specifically to history textbooks. Thereafter I highlighted the contributions of my study to academic research followed by its implications for future research. I then discussed the limitations of this study making reference to the methodological sample and researcher bias. The personal and professional reflections of this study were also acknowledged. I concluded this chapter by summarising what was achieved in this chapter and also mentioned what I had achieved by conducting this study.

5.3 Findings and discussion on the characteristics of "big men" in the apartheid and post-apartheid era history textbooks analysed

The following two figures are used to illustrate the findings on the characteristics of the "big men" as they were analysed in the textbooks of the two eras under review. Based on this my discussion will firstly deal with findings on the characteristics of "big men" in the apartheid era history textbooks, followed by a discussion of the findings of "big men" in the post-apartheid era history textbooks. I will then draw a comparison of the "big men" in the history textbooks of both the eras based on the discussion of the findings.

Figure 5.1: Findings on the characteristics of "big men" in the apartheid era history textbooks

"Big men"	Title of textbook	Characteristics attributed in depiction
Jawaharlal	**Green**	Founder, associated with royalty, popular, patriot,

Nehru	**Book (1974)**	personal sacrifice, leader, peacemaker, shaper of destiny, patriarch
Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi		Popular, leader, peacemaker, patriot, man of principle, personal sacrifice, founder, advocate of Indian rights, patriarch
Louis Botha		Popular, powerful, patriot, politician, leader, peacemaker, reconciler, patriarch
Hendrik Frensch Verwoerd		Architect of policy, shaper of destiny, patriot, leader, academic, strong willed, trusted, patriarch
	Orange Book (1975)	
Jawaharlal Nehru		Outspoken, leader, politician, patriot, peacemaker, educated, patriarch
Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi		Advocate of Indian rights, educated, political activist, hero, patriot, founder, patriarch
Louis Botha		Military man, politician, peacemaker, unifier, nation builder, patriarch
Hendrik Frensch Verwoerd		Academic, brilliant, intuitive, architect of policy, shaper of destiny, popular, patriarch
	Red Book (1982)	
Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi		Leader, carer of ordinary people, pioneer, founder, peacemaker, political activist, man of compassion, patriarch, unifier
Shaka Zulu		Powerful, tyrant, military man, innovative, hegemonic power, royalty, patriarch, autocrat
	Yellow Book (1983)	
Hendrik Frensch Verwoerd		Patriot, leader, architect of policy, shaper of destiny, founder, personal sacrifices, patriarch
Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi		Founder, carer of ordinary people, leader, political activist, saviour, peacemaker, strong willed, personal sacrifices, patriarch, revered

As illustrated in figure 5.1 above the "big men" studied were all characterised as patriarchs in the apartheid era textbooks. All the historical figures depicted here were not ordinary men but "big men". Almost all of the "big men" were depicted as leaders, patriots and founders. Most of them were characterised as peacemakers except for

Shaka. The characteristic that was least attributed to the "big men" of the apartheid era, except for Louis Botha, is that of being a nation builder. It has been pointed out in the background to this study that these "big men" were depicted as patriarchs because under the apartheid era "big men" were foregrounded by a patriarchal male dominated society. Furthermore, in the apartheid era history had a rather illusive position in the South African school curriculum as the subject has been exploited in order to legitimise past and present power bases which include gender relations. All the "big men" except for Louis Botha did not appear in the textbooks as nation builders because in the apartheid era the National Party government enforced the policy of racial segregation which divided the population according to race hence each "big man" logically had to be a nation builder in their own separate way. Moreover, most of these "big men" were depicted as leaders, founders, patriots and peacemakers as the apartheid government used these "big men" in history textbooks to create stereotypes of "big" white and Indian men who were flawless.

All the apartheid era "big" white men depicted in the textbooks were Afrikaners. They were portrayed as popular and patriotic "big men". According to the literature the South African history curricula during the apartheid era were designed by white men who persevered to highlight the actions and achievements of white men (Dean & Siebörger, 1995). The "big" white men were persistent in the apartheid era history textbooks since the early 1970s until 1983. Verwoerd continued to appear as the "enduring" white man in the apartheid era history textbooks. Dean and Siebörger (1995) justify this depiction by stating that during the apartheid era black and white learners were taught the history of European Western civilisation and of the white population, especially "big" white men in South Africa. Furthermore textbooks were written by white male historians in keeping with the Christian Nationalist standpoint (Dean & Siebörger, 1995). According to Apple (1992, p. 4) textbooks are "are conceived and designed by real people with real interests". Hence the decision behind the choice of specific "big men" and the characteristics attributed to them in textbooks of the era is based on specific intentions and motives. McKinney (2005) correctly points out that any depictions of heroes or "big men" as in the case of this study, or representations found in textbooks, has motives

behind them .Therefore, the depiction of "big" white men in apartheid era history textbooks supported the values of the dominant groups that they represented and who in turn represented them in the textbooks.

"Big" Indian men were also depicted alongside the "big" white men in the apartheid era textbooks. They were depicted, just as the "big" white men, as peacemakers and patriots in the apartheid era history textbooks. The "big" Indian men were also "enduring" "big men" who appeared throughout the apartheid era textbooks. They also appear flawless and in some ways mirrored the characteristics of the apartheid era "big" white men. What is also striking here is that Gandhi is depicted as a political activist in all the apartheid era textbooks that were analysed. However, these "big" Indian men are depicted in such a way to create a national narrative. According to Fitzgerald, cited in Foster and Crawford (2006) the function of the textbook is to "tell the children what their elders want them to know" (p. 4). The 'elders' refer to those in the dominant cultural group. Thus, these "big" Indian men were characterised in such a way to promote the political goals of the apartheid state.

Shaka is the only "big" African man appearing in the apartheid era namely in the Red Book (1982). He is characterised as a hegemonic "big man", a tyrant and an autocrat. His appearance was related to myths that existed in apartheid era history textbooks. Engelbrecht (2006) mentions that apartheid era history textbooks contained myths that were used as vehicles to legitimise the apartheid political system. One of the myths was that traditional African leaders were only warmongering, blood thirsty despots (da Cruz, 2005). Thus, Shaka is the only "big man" who is black and also the only one to be characterised as violent and ruthless in the apartheid era textbooks. In contrast the other "big men" of the era are portrayed as respected and revered.

The "big men" who were depicted in the apartheid era textbooks appear as men who according to Connell (1996) displayed hegemonic forms of masculinity. This type of masculinity as theorised by Connell (1996) is shaped by the legitimacy of patriarchy. Moreover this is the group of men that has traditionally been exalted as being the

dominant form of masculinity and in existing it serves to subordinate the other gender as well as other forms of masculinity. Thus older men have dominated over younger men and also men over women in the apartheid era history textbooks. The depiction of "big men" in the apartheid era textbooks indicates that an underlying stereotype of a "big" white man has been created to establish an Afrikaner nationalist historiography. Therefore the power that these "big men" possessed set them apart from ordinary men and women and this why there are omissions regarding the portrayal of women and men who according to Connell (1996) do not embody the ideals and practices of the hegemonic man.

Figure 5.2: Findings on the characteristics of "big men" in the post-apartheid era history textbooks

"Big men"	Title of textbook	Characteristics attributed in depiction
	Black Book (1999)	
Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela		Peacemaker, global icon, revered, nation builder, reconciler, popular, political activist, patriarch, hero
Hendrik Frensch Verwoerd		Architect of policy, leader, founder, brilliant ,academic, patriarch
	Blue Book (2005)	
Jawaharlal Nehru		Patriot, patriarch, bold, status, shaper of destiny
Shaka Zulu		Ruthless, autocratic, powerful, big in stature, character is nuanced-bloodthirsty tyrant also a strong powerful leader, mythical figure, brave, innovative military man, patriarch
Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi		God ordained, peacemaker, shaper of destiny, founder, family man, carer of ordinary people, political activist, popular, patriarch, patriot
	Grey Book (2005)	
Shaka Zulu		Symbol of heritage and culture, commercial, political, used for propaganda, nuanced, powerful, brave, role model, innovative, ruthless, violent, patriarch, autocrat,

		hero
	Purple Book (2011)	
Shaka Zulu		Nuanced, political, used for propaganda, savage, tyrant, bloodthirsty, dictator, brave, military leader, efficient ruler, diplomat, renaissance man, builder of national identity, patriarch

In figure 5.2 all the "big men" were depicted as patriarchs in the post-apartheid era history textbooks. They appear as hegemonic "big men" and their masculinity as per the theory of Connell (1996) is shaped by the legitimacy of patriarchy. These "big men" are not attributed other characteristics of masculinities as theorised by Connell (1996) in the literature review of this study. Hence, lesser forms of masculinities where less popular men, ordinary men, younger men and also women appear were not depicted in these books neither were characteristics other than those associated with patriarchy seriously entertained.

Verwoerd is the only "big" white man appearing in a post-apartheid era history textbook. He is depicted as a patriarch and an architect of the policy of apartheid in the post-apartheid history textbook thus indicating the power of Afrikaner nationalist historiography to endure even in a new political era. However, "big" white men do not appear again in the history textbooks of the post-apartheid era that were analysed. This is because of new stereotypes which have emerged in South African history in the post-apartheid era which were used as an anti-dote for dealing with the Afrikaner nationalist historiography of the apartheid era.

Mandela is the first "big" African man who makes his appearance in the post-apartheid era history textbooks analysed and he appears in the Black Book in 1999. He is depicted as a reconciler, hero and a political activist. However, Shaka appears as the dominant "big" African man in the post-apartheid era textbooks and he appears in most of the textbooks analysed. His characterisation is nuanced in the post-apartheid era textbooks when compared to the apartheid era. White settlers and Zulu nationalists created certain myths about Shaka in order to achieve their own objectives. The

following speaks to this. He was depicted by white settlers, as explained in the post-apartheid textbooks, as a bloodthirsty tyrant in order to justify white settler expansion. In turn Shaka was portrayed by Zulu nationalists in the post-apartheid- era textbooks as a strong, fierce and powerful leader in order to strengthen Zulu nationalism. Furthermore, as an indication of the kind of masculinity and characteristics attributed to him his name has been used by the media, advertising, political parties and tourism industries for commercial and political reasons. Additionally, he has been characterised as a symbol of Zulu history, heritage and culture in the Grey Book (2005). Shaka has also been portrayed as a role model and a symbol of Zulu success and achievement in the Grey Book (2005). He emerges in this textbook as a brilliant military leader and a courageous, intelligent and powerful king. According to this textbook, Shaka's symbol has been used "to celebrate South African, and in some cases African, achievement as a whole" (p. 194). This depiction is related to the African renaissance theme, an integral element of the post-apartheid and post-modern eras. Thus, Shaka's characterisation in the post-apartheid textbooks has been politicised in numerous ways for various reasons as pointed out above. Hence, he has been characterised as a political and propaganda tool in the post-apartheid era textbooks.

"Big" Indian men, such as Gandhi, initially still appeared in the post–apartheid era history textbooks. They are characterised as patriots and patriarchs. These "big" Indian men also mirror some of the characteristics of the apartheid era "big" white men. For example, Gandhi is depicted as a political activist and a carer of ordinary people.

It is imperative to draw conclusions on how the political eras impacted on the depiction of "big men" in the textbooks. It is assumed that the depiction of "big men" in the apartheid and post-apartheid era textbooks was a deliberate construction reflecting the dominant ideology of the state. This will be expounded upon later when I compare my findings with the literature review of this study. It is evident from the comparison of the analysis of "big men" in textbooks of both the eras that two different types of "big men" emerged. In the apartheid era, a hegemonic Afrikaner "big" white man dominated the portrayal in the textbooks. He was a powerful, strong, founder, leader, patriarch and

patriot who was the architect of policies like those in the apartheid era. The Indian men portrayed were generally attributed the same characteristics. The only African man to appear, Shaka shared some of these characteristics but was otherwise portrayed as a war mongerer and as a blood thirsty tyrant. The apartheid era textbooks depicted a number of different "big men", all politicians, and there was much detail in their characterisation which in turn reflected the ideology of the patriarchal apartheid state.

In the post-apartheid era textbooks a hegemonic "big" African man starts to emerge from the depiction in the textbooks. His characterisation, as in the case of Shaka is nuanced in nature and contains rich detail. This "big" African man is depicted in the post-apartheid era textbooks as a good and bad character by various interest groups and we thus perceive him as a propaganda and political tool amongst other depictions. Moreover, he is characterised as a symbol representing the African renaissance, heritage, culture and history which resonate with the current political dispensation's ideals. What is also clear in this era is not only the decline of the number of "big men" portrayed but also the disappearance of "big" white and Indian men from the text.

What is evident from the analysis of the depiction of the "big men" in the textbooks across the two political eras is how the issue of race is inextricably linked to the textbooks' construction of a specific type of "big man" that appears deliberately and purposefully to reinforce the dominant ideology of the state. However, the analysis of "big men" in the textbooks of both political eras has indicated that the depiction of "big men" has changed substantially from the apartheid to the post-apartheid era history textbooks. It has changed in terms of who they are and the characteristics attributed to them confirming that there is a patriarchal "big" man still present in the contemporary history textbooks. Although the "big" white and Indian men disappeared from the textbooks in the post-apartheid history textbooks, learners are still studying a physical "big man" as depicted in the history textbooks. Hence although changes took place continuity still exists with "big men" and specifically a patriarchal stereotypical one still appearing in the textbooks. Hence, the classical "big man" as theorised by Connell (1996) still exists in the history textbooks of the two eras which were analysed and the

other categories of masculinities as classified by him are omitted. Simply put, no place could be found for men that are not big in the hegemonic and patriarchal sense.

In the next section I will be comparing the findings with the literature reviewed in Chapter Two of this study.

5.3.1 Comparing my findings to the literature – second level of analysis

The main objective of the literature review was to establish what body of knowledge already exists in my field of research thus enabling me to find a niche for my study. The literature review chapter has also enabled me to explore and discover what literature was available with regard to the depiction of "big men" in apartheid and post-apartheid South African history textbooks.

It is evident from the findings that the depiction of "big men" in the apartheid and post-apartheid history textbooks was influenced by the state, the political climate, societal norms and other interest groups such as textbook producers and publishers. Sleeter and Grant (1991) point out that textbook are symbolic representations of the world as well as the society in which we live. This symbolic representation in textbooks confers authority on the dominant status of particular groups in society. This is illustrated in the way that "big men" as a social group are depicted in the textbooks. Hence, the appearance of a patriarchal white man in the apartheid era textbooks and a patriarchal black man in the post-apartheid era history textbooks is a social construction designed to fulfil a particular agenda of the state served by the textbooks produced.

The arguments presented on the power of the textbook in the literature review confirm that textbooks are not only conveyors of knowledge but also state sanctioned knowledge. This state sanctioned knowledge is the official narrative that is shaped into a curriculum by the state and thus aligned with its political ideology and framework (Foster & Crawford, 2006; Sleeter & Grant, 1991). This is why the "big men" analysed

earlier are actually portrayed in a specific way in the history textbooks of both political eras where race and gender are foregrounded in a certain manner to reinforce the dominant ideology of the state.

The literature reviewed revealed that history textbooks are official narratives of a country and are instrumental in promoting certain perspectives and ideologies in textbooks. Anderson (2007) states that in, for example, Moldovan public schools, history classes and textbooks are expected to transmit ideas about the nation and the state, thus creating and maintaining national identity and citizenship. The presentation of knowledge in history textbooks is therefore shaped by ideological and cultural forces within a country. The selection of content which is placed in history textbooks is in turn influenced by political and cultural interest groups to achieve power within a society. The state is dependent on a collective nationhood and therefore the history textbook is integral in the creation of a national narrative. This narrative must be relevant in order to mobilise support of the citizens. Hence, the depiction of "big men" in history textbooks in this study is influenced by the political and ideological interests of the state in a continuous manner.

Literature on history textbook production in pre and post-apartheid South Africa has also shed some light as to why the "big men" were depicted in a particular manner in the textbooks that were analysed in this study. According to Weldon (2003), textbooks from the apartheid era were used as tools to legitimise the apartheid ideology. Engelbrecht (2006) points out those only positive aspects of Afrikaner history were portrayed in South African history textbooks. There was very little done to highlight the positive aspects of black history. Verwoerd was therefore depicted as the enduring "big" white Afrikaner man in the apartheid era history textbooks. Textbooks of the apartheid era also contained myths which were used to legitimise the apartheid political system (Engelbrecht, 2006). One significant myth was that traditional African leaders were only warmongering, bloodthirsty despots (da Cruz, 2005). Hence, white settlers created a myth about Shaka being a ruthless tyrant and this is how he was depicted in the history textbook of the apartheid era in which he appears. History textbooks of the apartheid

era contained master symbols and stereotypes which were used to create a sense of historical consciousness among children and to promote the Afrikaner heritage. Engelbrecht (2008) points out that apartheid era textbooks presented history in a way that merely justified Afrikaner domination and Afrikaner struggles for self-determination. Furthermore, the presentation of knowledge in history textbooks is shaped by ideological and cultural forces within a society. The "big" white man's depiction is thus a product of political and cultural interest groups whose aim is to achieve power within a society. Therefore governments are fully aware of the importance of history in creating a national narrative, a collective memory, which consolidates their notion of nationhood and national identity (Weldon, 2003; Foster & Crawford, 2006; Torsti, 2007). This confirms that the depiction of "big men" in the apartheid era history textbooks was influenced by Afrikaner nationalist ideology and carefully considered "big men" were chosen as objects of study and applicable characteristics were attributed to them.

According to Engelbrecht (2008) post-apartheid history textbooks now highlight silences and omissions regarding the white minority population; their aspirations and their leaders, and new stereotypes are deliberately presented to counter apartheid stereotypes. The democratic government introduced a new curriculum in 1994. Msila (2007, p. 151) states that the main goals of the new educational system were "to create a new South African identity that encompasses critical consciousness, to transform South African society, to promote democracy and to magnify learner involvement in education". Contemporary history textbooks were supposed to be aligned to these patronising ideals. However, the findings of this study also reveal a reversal of the identities that were characteristic of the apartheid era. Da Cruz (2005) also points out that unlike white supremacist history that had flourished for centuries with a hegemonic paradigm and grand old narrative, the fragments of black history are paramount as they have never been told in South African schools therefore,"… even if the beginnings of a vague black history exist somewhere in the history textbooks, black history as a historical narrative does not" (p. 83). However, he submits that when these contemporary textbooks are considered in a real world context it becomes clear that they have made little effort to redress the "lingering injustices committed by its

predecessors" (p. 83). Hence, this confirms that the post-apartheid era "big man" is also a stereotype that was constructed to legitimate the government's ideology and still carries the marks of the "big men" of the previous era.

It is also evident in the findings of this study that a patriarchal "big man" exists in the textbooks of the apartheid and post-apartheid eras. According to Connell's theory of masculinity (1996) this "big man" falls into the category that displays hegemonic masculinity. This refers to masculinity that is shaped by the legitimacy of patriarchy. This is the group that has traditionally been exalted as the dominant form of masculinity and in existing it serves to subordinate the other gender as well as other forms of masculinity. Therefore, the literature is in agreement with the findings that hegemonic masculinity is still the dominant form of masculinity in history textbooks of the apartheid and post-apartheid eras. In the case of the latter this exists in a diminished manner as far as numbers are concerned but little else. Space could not be found for different masculinities or "big men" who were not politicians.

5.3.2 Why are "big men" portrayed the way they are in the history textbooks of the apartheid and post-apartheid eras?

At the outset I would like to point out as mentioned previously in Chapter One of this thesis that this is a longitudinal study which tracks the depiction of "big men" across apartheid and post-apartheid history textbooks. Thus, these were two different political eras with two different political systems. There were acute differences in these political systems with regard to the education system, school history and the way men were treated. The textbooks of both the eras were consequently also different.

The apartheid era history textbooks portrayed a persistent "big" white man as they conform to a paradigm that has dominated South African historical writing. This paradigm, according to Dean, Hartmann and Katzen (1983) contains the implicit assumptions that history begins with the arrival of the whites and is primarily concerned with the attempts of different white groups in establishing themselves politically, socially

and economically. All the "big" white and Indian men in the apartheid era textbooks were characterised positively as there was evidence of crude stereotyping of ethnic groups in the textbooks (Dean, Hartmann & Katzen, 1983). This was because South African history in the apartheid era was largely based on the legitimacy of white objectives (Dean, Hartmann & Katzen, 1983). Africans especially were presented as obstacles to the achievement of white objectives. As pointed out earlier the education system during the apartheid era used textbooks as a medium to disseminate ideology. Hence only positive aspects of Afrikaner history were portrayed via the characteristics of the "big men" in South African history apartheid era history textbooks (Engelbrecht, 2006).

The hegemonic "big" white man appears as a patriot and a founder in the apartheid era textbooks. The "big" Indian men mirror similar characteristics of the "big" white men. In contrast the "big" African man is depicted in the apartheid era textbooks as a tyrant and a violent autocrat. This is because the differences between whites and blacks were purposefully highlighted to establish a favourable disposition for the white group and to justify the actions of this group and the policy of apartheid. The fact that only one "big" African man appears in the apartheid era textbooks which I have analysed indicates that their history was neglected. Furthermore, there was very little done to illuminate the positive aspects of the history of blacks until recently. The apartheid government was under the leadership of "big" Afrikaner men and therefore the history textbooks were a medium through which the state was able to further the ideals of Afrikaner nationalism.

The "big" white men featured in every history textbook in the apartheid era because they contained master symbols and stereotypes which were used to create a sense of historical consciousness among children and also to promote the Afrikaner heritage that had been subdued by the former British and was still deemed threatened by the black majority population (du Preez, 1983).

In the post-apartheid era textbooks a "big" African man appears persistently at the expense of all other "big men". Hence race is still foregrounded here just as it was in the

apartheid era textbooks. The "big" African man's character is more nuanced than before and contains more historical depth as he was depicted as a political tool, as propaganda and as a symbol of African culture heritage and achievement. It is also pointed out that his name and image is also used in the media and tourism industries. However, this "big man" does appear in a hegemonic paradigm in the post-apartheid era textbooks but not in the same absolute manner such as the apartheid era "big man". His appearance has been challenged by post-modernism and political transformation. This is supported by Schwartz (1998, p. 2) who states that "the decline of metanarratives is the single most distinguishing feature of post-modern culture". The occasional appearance of women alongside this "big man" also challenges the notion of masculinity and male hegemony from a post-modern perspective. For example: women were allowed to have power in the military during Shaka's reign as indicated in the Blue Book (2005). They were as pointed out in the Grey Book (2005) also allowed to play a role in the creation of the Zulu kingdom by forming female age regiments. He is portrayed in this way in the post-apartheid era textbooks to establish a new national identity thereby legitimating the government's ideology. This is endorsed in the CAPS history document which reflects the political objectives of the country, key of which are nation building and democratisation as envisaged in the Constitution of South Africa.

However, the post-apartheid era "big man's" depiction has been politicised to create a new national narrative as the "big" African man appears in the textbooks as a symbol of heritage, history, culture and in some cases African achievement. He is depicted as a Renaissance man in the post-apartheid era history textbooks as South Africa became a democracy in 1994 and therefore he mirrors a new nation and national identity. Furthermore, Yair et al (n.d) state that nations often use male heroes and role models for creating collective identities. Hence, we have the depiction of a "new man" in some ways for a "new era" subject to the current political forces.

In the next section, I will highlight the possible impact of my findings on the depiction of "big men" in history textbooks of the apartheid and post-apartheid eras.

5.3.3 Theoretical discussion of "big men" in history textbooks of the apartheid and post-apartheid eras

As pointed out in the findings "big men" were depicted differently in the apartheid and post-apartheid era textbooks. The findings also revealed that the history textbooks constructed a specific "big man" who appears in the history textbooks of both political eras. Whilst, the "big men" appear with different characteristics in the textbooks, only certain aspects of their characterisation have been foregrounded. Hence, the issue of race, class, politics and gender are integral in proposing a theory for this thesis. I will link these to the two main phenomena of this study i.e. "big men" and history textbooks.

The main aim of this study was to analyse and provide a better understanding of the depiction of "big men" in history textbooks of the apartheid and post-apartheid eras. As pointed out earlier race, class, politics and gender are issues which emerge out of this analysis which are related to the two main phenomena of this study. Why is this so? I will speak to these issues by drawing on relevant literature that has been reviewed for this study.

A new political dispensation was introduced by the democratic government in South Africa in 1994. This was also a post-modernist moment because white hegemonic power came to an end. This era also marked the end of the archetypical white man in history in South Africa. Changes in world politics also had an impact on political transformation in South Africa. Ferris (2013) as pointed out in Chapter One of this study argued that the impact of post-modernism provided another dimension as to how "big men" were depicted. He recounts that society was previously told that "the world needed these charismatic men who were seen as transcendent beauties in the past" and these figures had, by and large exemplified the nation's heart as such and "a consensus prevailed that they were great men" (Ferris, 2013, p. 28). However, the tracking of the "big men" in apartheid and post-apartheid South African history textbooks has indicated how male hegemony has been challenged thus hinting at a demise of patriarchy in the post-apartheid era. Political transformation in the post-apartheid era

also brought about changes in the education system. Not only have the "grand scale" politics changed but along with those the depiction of "big men" in history has changed. This has filtered into history textbook production in other parts of the world and also in South Africa. A new narrative representing a "new nation" and a "new era" has emerged in history textbooks of the post-apartheid era.

An African "big man" emerges as a prototype in the post-apartheid era history textbooks. His characterisation is historically nuanced. This is to mirror a new nation and national identity. Furthermore this Africanisation of the "big man" challenges the meta/master narratives on especially "big" white men. However, there is a danger of it mirroring the "big" white Afrikaner men who appear flawless in the apartheid era textbooks.

The analysis of the depiction of "big men" has also revealed how the characteristics attributed to the "big men" have changed from the apartheid to the post-apartheid era. According to Engelbrecht (2008), history textbooks pre-1994 presented history in a manner that merely justified Afrikaner domination and Afrikaner struggle for self-determination and this struggle formed the core of the South African curriculum and history textbooks of the apartheid era. Black history was neglected as reflected in the school textbooks of the apartheid era. Only positive aspects of Afrikaner history were portrayed in South African history textbooks. The difference between blacks and whites were highlighted to establish a favourable disposition for the white group and to justify the actions of this group (Engelbrecht, 2006). Therefore there was not much progress in highlighting the positive aspects of the history of black groups and "big men" until the arrival of the post-apartheid era. Hence, apartheid era history textbooks contained narratives about "big men" which reflected the political and ideological content of the state. However, the findings in this study indicate that there was a move from the big and narrow Afrikaner nationalist historiography in the apartheid history textbooks to a nuanced and more critical narrative in the post-apartheid history textbooks.

Although the "big men" have diminished in quantity in the post-apartheid era history textbooks and the narrative about them changes in the history textbooks, the change is not as complete as it could have been. The "big men" are still here in the history textbooks of the post-apartheid era. There is continuity in masculinity and patriarchy from the apartheid to the post -apartheid era history textbooks despite changes in the characterisation of the "big men". Hegemonic masculinity has been dominant in textbooks of the apartheid and post-apartheid eras. This is the appearance of the physical "big man" in the history textbooks. The "big men" as depicted in these history textbooks fall into the first category of masculinity as theorised by Connell (1996) which is hegemonic masculinity. This refers to masculinity that is shaped by the legitimacy of patriarchy. According to Connell (1996) this is the group that has traditionally been exalted as the dominant form of masculinity and in existing it serves to subordinate the other gender as well as other forms of masculinity. This type of masculinity is continuous as it dominates the history textbooks of both political eras. The "big men" as they appear in the apartheid and post-apartheid history textbooks of this study exercise power over younger men and also over women. However, none of the other masculinities according to Connell's (1996) theory actually appear in the depiction theses "big men" in the history textbooks of both political eras. Hence they can be classified as classical "big men" in history textbooks of both the eras.

This study revealed that "big men" as historical characters and their characteristics have transcended from the apartheid to the post-apartheid era textbooks. This is partly attributed to the role of master symbols used to propagate particular ideologies in South African history textbooks during the pre-and post-apartheid eras. According to Engelbrecht (2008) and Polakow-Suranski (2002), master symbols become part of society's collective consciousness. These symbols, similar to stereotypes and mythologies, could play a significant role in creating consciousness of the social order among children. They were used extensively in history textbooks during the apartheid era because the ruling elite regarded these as ideal weapons to maintain their status quo in the South African social structure. These master symbols are also related to what Connell (1996) refers to as hegemonic masculinity which is shaped by the legitimacy of

patriarchy. Therefore, the historical characters and the characteristics attributed to them in the apartheid and post-apartheid era textbooks cannot be undone twenty years after the demise of apartheid. This is because patriarchy and the dominant forms of masculinity are firmly entrenched in the societies and hence the history textbooks of both eras. However, on a positive note, the "big men" have changed from the apartheid to the post-apartheid era history textbooks in terms of who they are and how they are depicted in the textbooks. There were also changes in terms of race as the "big" white and Indian men diminish in the post-apartheid era history textbooks and a "big" African man dominates the textbooks.

Although different narratives have been created about "big men" in history textbooks of both political eras in South Africa, the reality is that "big men" are still present in the history textbooks. They are "big men" who still dominate and will still be making their appearances in future school history textbooks in South Africa. These "big men" are still attributed with "enduring" characteristics which transcend from the apartheid to post-apartheid era history textbooks. They still appear as strong, powerful, popular "big men" in the history textbooks of both eras. We are yet to encounter "big men" in the history textbooks that display other forms of masculinity as theorised by Connell (1996). All the "big men" in the studied textbooks were leaders who were characterised differently in the history textbooks of the apartheid and post-apartheid eras. However, they still appear as "big men" not ordinary men. Jawaharlal Nehru was the first Prime Minister of India; Hendrik Frensch Verwoerd was a South African Prime Minister and academic and Shaka ka Senzangakhona was king of the Zulus. Thus they were depicted as politicians, academics, military leaders and founders of plans and policies. They were not ordinary men such as builders, bricklayers, and cooks who would not appear in the majority of history textbooks as pointed out in Bertolt Brecht's poem, "Questions of a worker reading History".

The appearance of "big men" in history textbooks in South Africa twenty years after the demise of apartheid indicates that the state is still dependent on a collective nationhood related to patriarchy. It is argued in the literature review of this study that history

textbooks are even more powerful than textbooks in general as the nature of the subject is politically charged and contentious in nature and filled with ideological discourses. It is also imperative to ask whose knowledge is considered to be the legitimate knowledge that is found in the revised history textbooks of the post-apartheid era.

The fact that hegemonic masculinity still dominates in the history textbooks of the post-apartheid era indicates that new stereotypes have not fully emerged. A "big" African man dominates the history textbooks of the post-apartheid era. Hence, this may be a deliberate attempt to counter racial stereotypes of the apartheid era. What this implies is that history textbooks also have a political agenda which is informed by the curriculum. This is because history textbooks contain the 'national historical narrative' that defines the conceptions of nationhood (Foster & Crawford, 2006). It is not in the interest of the nation state to tell the whole truth about itself, but rather to construct a single, simplistic and unifying historical narrative. Hence, the construction of a historical narrative in the textbooks regarding "big men" in this study is integral to nation building and the creation of a national narrative – regardless of the era. History textbooks are official documents of the state and thus all stakeholders involved in their production should exercise impartiality in the inclusion of historical characters. The literature has also revealed how history textbooks have been used to convey propaganda inside history classrooms. History textbooks are indeed used to advocate political ideology. Authors such as Stojanovic (2001) and Nicholls (2003) have indicated in the literature reviewed that textbooks play a powerful and significant role in the teaching of history. They are used to drive a certain agenda and may contain hidden motives. Furthermore, the literature has revealed that textbooks and history textbooks that are used in all spheres of schooling have the power to dominate what learners learn and how they learn in schools. The findings from the analysis of selected history textbooks of this study concur with what other authors have argued about "big men" in history textbooks. According to Hutchins (2011, p. 650) "the choice of heroes and the way in which textbooks present them offer unique insight into the interplay between scholarly historiography and competing versions of ethno-history".

The history textbooks analysed in this study revealed that male hegemony is still entrenched in history textbooks despite many changes to the curriculum and the political system. The state, textbook publishers and authors are therefore responsible for promoting ideology by depicting "big men" in a particular way in the history textbooks. The narratives about the "big men" in the apartheid and post-apartheid history textbooks have also side-lined the contributions of women and ordinary men in South African history. Hegemonic masculinity in the history textbooks also reaffirms the power that patriarchy still has in South Africa despite the provision of gender equality in the democratic constitution. Moreover, learners through the medium of history textbooks will still believe that the history of the world is about "big men", not also about ordinary men and women. Thus, history textbook agencies need to review the way in which "big men" are depicted in South African history textbooks to ensure that there is transparency, impartiality and diversity in the construction of a historiography dealing with historical characters.

5.4 Contributions of my study to research

My study has hopefully made a contribution to textbook research by confirming the view that history textbooks are contentious in nature, and the textbooks under study do conform to the ideology of the ruling elite – regardless of the system. The study has also filled a gap in academic research because until recently, there has not been a study of how "big men" have been portrayed in history textbooks in South Africa.

This study has also shown that stereotypes of "big men" existed continuously in apartheid and post-apartheid history textbooks despite textbook revision and changes in the curriculum and the political system of the country. This continuity is offset by certain changes. It has also indicated that the appearance of "big men" in the history textbooks have changed considerably from the apartheid to the post-apartheid eras. The "big men" have changed in terms of race and the characteristics attributed to them in the history textbooks of the apartheid and post-apartheid eras. Their politicisation has ignored inclusivity, gender equality and multi-culturism in the depiction of historical

118

figures. Hopefully, my study will create awareness with the DoBET and history textbook publishers to become even more sensitive to issues such as race and gender in the production of history textbooks in South Africa. This study will also hopefully raise awareness amongst history teachers as to what to look out for when dealing with topics dealing with historical figures in history textbooks in South Africa.

5.5 Suggestions for further research

I suggest that there is a need for a study on how "big men" have been portrayed in history textbooks that have been prescribed for tertiary institutions such as universities. There could also be a study conducted on the depiction of "big men" in other subjects in the school curriculum. This study can also be used as a basis for further research on teachers and learners' perception of "big men" in history textbooks in South Africa. Further research can also be conducted to determine how the depictions of "big men" in current history textbooks contribute to views in academic history.

5.6 Limitations of the study

The aim of this study was to provide a better understanding of the portrayal of "big men" in apartheid and post-apartheid South African history textbooks. The fact that this is a study on "big men" only in history textbooks may be seen as a limitation. However, this was a not a deliberate attempt to marginalise women in history textbooks. I am aware of gender issues regarding the depiction of women in history textbooks in South Africa especially the recent study by Nene (2014) on the visual depiction of women in history textbooks in South Africa. My study also makes reference to the marginalising of women in history textbooks of the apartheid and post-apartheid eras.

I first began analysing the textbooks with a bigger sample size. However, I decided for pragmatic reasons to reduce the sample size. Thus I analysed eight textbooks for the study which proved manageable. I also used open coding as a research method and

this is greatly dependent on the analysis of the researcher – a characteristic that resonates with qualitative research. In the next paragraph I elaborate further on this. As a foil, I used my supervisor as the 'second eye' to review the categories that I developed during the coding process. Furthermore, to avoid bias against or towards any textbook, I referred to the textbooks using various colours such as the Green Book (1974), Orange Book (1975), the Black Book (1999) and so forth.

My life experience and background are also limiting factors because as a researcher one cannot escape the lens through which one sees the world. Therefore, it is imperative that the researcher, in conducting qualitative research, must reflect on who he/she is (Cresswell, 2002). I am a middle-aged Indian male South African who has taught history in schools during the apartheid and post-apartheid eras. Therefore I have experienced as a man, a human being and a history educator the political and educational changes (including the changes in history curricula and textbooks) of the past 25-years. Hence my experience has influenced my positioning and the analysis I have done on the depiction of "big men" in the history textbooks across two eras. In the process I had to constantly challenge my own bias and prejudice.

5.7 Personal and professional reflections of the study

I undertook this study mainly for professional reasons. I wanted to improve my professional academic qualifications by obtaining my Masters degree in History Education. Personally, I wanted to become involved in research to improve my research skills. This dissertation has actually improved both my writing and critical thinking skills. It has also broadened my knowledge about "big men" in history textbooks. Moreover, I have also learnt that history textbooks are powerful and contentious in nature. This study has also made me aware of how stereotypes become entrenched in history textbooks through the construction of a particular narrative on "big men" in history textbooks in South Africa. I have also come to respect "big men" even more although they had flaws.

Although this study has been a challenge, it has also empowered me to deal with educational issues with confidence. It has also improved my self-confidence because I always thought that I would not finish this study because of the challenges I was faced with. This study has also enlightened me about the nature of academic research as this is the first time I have engaged in a study where I had to interrogate my own thoughts. I also believe that this study has filled a gap in research and could lead to further research regarding "big men" in South African history textbooks.

5.8 Conclusion

In this chapter I provided an overview of the study by reviewing what was dealt with in each chapter. I also presented the findings of this study and then dealt with drawing a comparison on how "big men" were depicted in history textbooks of both political eras. A comparison of the findings with the literature review of this study was then conducted. I then proceeded to state the conclusions that I reached with regard to why "big men" have been characterised the way they have been in the history textbooks under study. This was followed by a theoretical discussion regarding the depiction of "big men" in history textbooks across the two eras and I also discussed the consequences of it. The contributions that this study has made in terms of academic research regarding "big men" in history textbooks were noted. I then outlined the implications of this study for future research. The limitations of this study were then pointed out. Finally I reflected on my personal and professional development in this study.

When I started this study I never knew that I would end up with a depiction of "big men" in history textbooks that I was not hoping to find. I was also hoping to prove my critics wrong who believed that curriculum transformation and the democratic dispensation post-1994 acknowledged diversity and multiculturalism with regard to the depiction of "big men" in South African history textbooks. This study has indicated that we must not take textbooks especially history textbooks for granted because they are powerful tools which are used by various interest groups to achieve specific aims. Based on the eight history textbooks that I have analysed, although this cannot be generalised to all school

history textbooks, patriarchy, although challenged after 1994, is still entrenched in history textbooks and consequently history teaching and learning in South Africa. Finally, male historical characters are depicted with specific characteristics in the analysed history textbooks to reinforce rather than challenge patriarchy in the teaching and learning of history across the apartheid and post-apartheid eras.

REFERENCES

Alridge, D.P. (2006). The limits of master narratives in history textbooks: An analysis of Representations of Martin Luther King, Jr. *The Teachers College Record, 108*, (4) pp. 662-686.

Altbach, P.G. (1991). *Textbooks in American Society.* New York: State University Press.

Anderson, E.A. (2007). 'They are the priests': the role of the Moldovan historian and its implications for civic education. *Journal of comparative education, 37 (*3), pp. 270-290.

Apple, M.W. (1990). *Ideology and the curriculum.* New York: Routledge.

Apple, M.W. (1991). The culture and commerce of the textbook. In M.W. Apple & L.K. Christian-Smith (Eds.), *The politics of the textbook.* pp. 22-36. New York: Routledge.

Apple, M.W. (1992). The text and cultural politics. *Educational Researcher, 21 (*7)*, pp. 4-19.

Apple, M.W. (1993). The politics of official knowledge: Does a national curriculum make sense? *Discourse, 14* (1), pp. 1-16.

Apple, M.W. (2000). *Official Knowledge: Democratic Education in a Conserving Age* (2nd ed.) New York: Routledge.

Apple, M.W. & Christian-Smith, L.K (1991). The politics of the textbook. In M.W. Apple & L.K Christian-Smith (Eds.), *The politics of the textbook.* pp. 1-14. New York: Routledge.

Auerbach, F.E. (1965). *The Power of Prejudice in South African Education.* Cape Town: Gothic.

Bam, J. & Visser, P. (1996). *A new history for a new South Africa.* Cape Town: Kagiso Publishers.

Bermeo, N. (2003). *Ordinary People in Extra Ordinary Times: The Citizenry and the Breakdown of Democracy.* United Kingdom: Princeton University Press.

Bertram, C. (2012). Bernstein's theory of the pedagogic device as a frame to study History curriculum reform in South Africa*. Yesterday & Today,* 7, pp. 1-21.

Blanche, M.T. & Kelly, K. (2002). Interpretive methods. In M.T. Blanche & K. Durrheim (Eds*.), Research methods in practice: Applied methods for the social sciences,* pp. 123-146. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

Bloch, G. (2009). *The Toxic Mix*: *What's wrong with South Africa's schools and how to fix it.* Cape Town: Tafelberg.

Bloomberg, L. & Volpe, M. (2008). *Completing your qualitative dissertation* : A road map from beginning to end. California: SAGE Publications.

Boote, D.N. & Beile, P. (2005). Scholars before researchers: On the centrality of the dissertation literature review in research preparation. *Educational Researcher ,*34(6), pp. 3-15.

Bottaro, J., Visser, P., & Worden, N. (2005). *In Search of History: Grade 10 Learner's Book.* Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Bourdillion, H. (1992). *History and Social Studies – Methodologies of Textbook Analysis – Report of the Educational Research Workshop Held in Braunschweig (Germany*) 11-14 September 1990. Amsterdam: Swets and Zeitlinger.

Buthelezi, S., Horn, K., Labuschagne, M., Le Roux, E.,Maloka, E., & Zondi, S. (2005). *OBE for FET: History Grade 10 Learner's Book .* Hatfield: Nasou via Afrika.

Carneiro, R.L. (1981). Herbert Spencer as an Anthropologist. *Journal of Libertarian Studies,* 5, pp. 171-2.

Chadwick, G.A., Syphus, E., & Van Heerden, L. (1974). *Man Through The Ages: Standard 7.* Pietermaritzburg: Shuter and Shooter.

Chisholm, L. (2003). The Politics of Curriculum Review and Revision in South Africa. Paper presented at the 'Oxford International Conference on Education and Development' held at the session on Culture, Context and the Quality of Education, Oxford, U.K. on 9-11 September, 2003. (Unpublished).

Chengalroyen, Y., & Pillay, L.V. (1983.). *History 2000. Standard 4.* Cape Town: Nasou Limited.

Clacherty, G., Delius, P., Dyer, C., Naidoo, L.,Nisbet, J., Saunders, C., & Seleti, Y. (1999). *Looking into the Past: Learner's Book Grade 12.* Cape Town: Maskew Miller Longman.

Clay, B.J. (1992). Other Times, Other Places: Agency and the Big Man in Central New Ireland. *Man, New Series, 27 (*4) pp. 719-733.

Cohen, L., & Manion, L. (1994). *Research Methods in Education.* London: Routledge.

Cohen, L, Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2007). *Research methods in Education* (Sixth ed.). New York: Routledge.

Cohen, L. *et.al.* (2011). *Research Methods in Education.* New York: Routledge.

Collier, C., *et.al.* (2011). *New Generation History .Grade 10 Learner's Book.* Durban: New Generation Publishers.

Connell, R.W. (1996). Teaching the boys: New Research on Masculinity and Gender Strategies for Schools. *Teacher College Record,* 98, pp. 206-235*.*

Crawford, K. (2000). Researching the ideological and political role of the history textbook-issues and methods. *International Journal of Historical Learning, Teaching and Research, 1(*1), pp. 81-91.

Crawford, K. (2003). The role and purpose of textbooks. *International Journal of Historical Learning, Teaching and Research, 3*(2), pp. 5-11.

Crawford, K (2004). *Researching the Ideological and Political Role of the History Textbook – Issues and Methods.* Edge Hill College of Higher Education, Lancashire.

Crawford, K (2006). Culture wars: Japanese history textbooks and the construction of official memory. In K. Crawford (ed) *What shall we tell the children ? International perspectives on school history textbooks.* pp. 49-68. USA. Information age publishing.

Crawford, K. & Foster, S. (2006). The political economy of history textbook publishing in England. In J. Nicholls (ed), *School history textbooks across cultures*: *international debates and perspectives.* Oxford: Symposium books.

Creswell, J.W. (2002). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches.* Los Angeles: Sage.

Creswell, J. W. (2009*). Research design*: *Qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches* (Third ed.). Los Angeles: Sage.

Da Cruz, P. (2005). *From Narrative to Severed Heads: The Form and Location of White Supremacist History in Textbooks of the Apartheid and Post-Apartheid Eras. A Case Study* (Unpublished Masters Dissertation, University of Cape Town).

Dean, E., Hartman, P. & Katzen, M. (1983). *History in black and white. An analysis of South African school History textbooks.* Paris: UNESCO.

Dean, J. & Siebörger, R. (1995). After Apartheid, the outlook for history*. Teaching History,* 79, pp. 32-37.

Denzin, N.K, & Lincoln, Y.S (2005). The *SAGE PUBLICATIONS PTY* (LTD) handbook of qualitative research. Los Angeles: Sage.

Department of Education (DoE). (2000). *Report of the History/Archaeology panel to the Minister of Education*. Pretoria: Department of Education.

Department of Education (DoE). (2003) *National Curriculum Statements Grades 10-12 (General) History.* Pretoria: Department of Education.

Department of Basic Education (DoBE). (2011). *Curriculum and Policy Statement: Grades 10-12: Histor*y. Pretoria: Department of Basic Education.

du Bruyn, J. (1997). Early Transvaal: A historiographical perspective. *South African Historical Journal, 36(*1), pp. 136-144.

du Preez, J.M. (1983). *Africana Afrikaner: Meestersimbole in Suid-Afrikaans skoolhandboeke*. Alberton: Librarius Felicitas.

Du Toit, B.M. (1996). The Mahatma Gandhi and South Africa*. The Journal of Modern African Studies* , *34* (4), pp. 643 – 660.

Elo, S. & Kyngäs, H. (2008). The qualitative content analysis process. *Journal of Advanced Nursing,* 62(1), pp. 107-115.

Engelbrecht, A. (2006). Textbooks in South Africa from Apartheid to post-Apartheid: Ideological change revealed by racial stereotyping. *Promoting,* 71, pp. 1 -12.

Engelbrecht, A. (2008). The impact of role reversal in representational practices in history textbooks after Apartheid. *South African Journal of Education.* 28, pp. 519-541.

Esterberg, K.G. (n.d.).*Qualitative methods in social research:* New York: McGraw-Hill.

Ferris, J. (2013). *International Herald Tribune Style Magazine*.

Firer, R. (1998). Human Rights in History and Civics Textbooks: The Case of Israel. *Curriculum Inquiry*, *28(*2), pp. 195-208.

Foster, S. (2011). Dominant Traditions in International Textbook Research and Revision. *Education Inquiry, 2* (1), pp. 5-20.

Foster, S. & Crawford, K. (2006). The critical importance of history textbook research. In K Crawford (Eds.). *'What shall we tell the children? International perspectives on school history textbooks'.* USA: Information Age Publishing.

Fru, R.N. (2012). *Heritage in contemporary South African grade 10 history textbooks. A case study* (Unpublished Master's thesis). University of KwaZulu-Natal, Pinetown.

Garbharran, H., Machin, I., & Matthews, J. (1982). *History is about Change. Standard 4.* Pietermaritzburg: Shuter and Shooter.

Gilbert, D. (2003). Emiliano Zapata: Textbook Hero. *Mexican Studies/Estudios Mexicanos, 19* (1), pp. 127-159.

Gray, D.E. (2004). *Doing research in the real world.* London: Sage.

Hancock, B., Windridge, K. & Ockleforld, E. (1998). *An introduction to qualitative research.* The NIHR RDS EM/Y2007. Trent focus group. Retrieved 24 August 2013, from http://www.rds-sc.nihr.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/2011/07/5 Introduction-to-qualitative-research-20091.pdf

Hart, C. (1998). *Doing a literature review*. London: Sage.

Hatch, J. A. (2002). *Doing Qualitative Research in Education Settings*. New York: State University of New York Press.

Henning, E. (2004). *Finding your way in qualitative research.* Pretoria: Van Shaik Publishers.

Hofstee, E. (2006). *Constructing a Good Dissertation: A Practical Guide to Finishing a Masters, MBA or PHD on Shedule.* Sandton: EPE.

Hsieh, H.F. & Shannon, S.E. (2005).Three approaches to qualitative content analysis. *Qualitative Health Research*, *5* (9), pp.1277-1288.

Husbands, C. (1996). *What is History teaching? Language, ideas and meaning in learning about the past.* Berkshire: Open University Press.

Hutchins, R.D. (2011). Heroes and the Renegotiation of National Identity in American History Textbooks: Representations of George Washington and Abraham Lincoln, 1982 -2003. *Journal of the Association for the Study of Ethnicity and Nationalism,* 17 (3), pp. 649-668.

Ifversen, J. (2003).Text, Discourse, Concept: Approaches to Textual Analysis. *Kontur,* 7, pp. 60-69.

Jobling, I. (2006). The Inverted World. White America. Retrieved March, 26 2013 from http://whiteamerica.us/index.php/Articles/teh invented world

Kallaway, P. (2012). History in Senior Secondary School CAPS 2012 and beyond: A comment. *Yesterday & Today*, 7, pp. 23- 62.

Kaniki, A. M. (2006). Doing an information search. In M. T. Blanche, K. Durrheim & D. Painter (Eds.), *Research in practice: Applied methods for the social sciences* (Second ed), pp. 17-28. Cape Town: UCT Press.

Kaufman, M. (1999). Men, feminism and men's contradictory experiences of power in: J. Kuypers (Ed), *Men and Power,* pp. 75-103. New York: Prometheus

Kennedy-Manzo, K. (2004). Countries torn over baring warts in History Texts. *Education Week, 24*(11), p. 8.

Koekemoer, M. (2012). *Analysing the dominant discourses on the holocaust in grade 9 South African history textbooks.* (Unpublished Master's thesis). University of KwaZulu-Natal, Pinetown.

Kohlbacher, F. (2006). The use of qualitative content analysis in case study research. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung / Forum: Qualitative Social Research* [On-line Journal], *7*(1), Art. 21. Retrieved 24 August 2013, from: http://www.qualitative-research.net/fqstexte/1-06/06-121-e.htm

Koulouri, C. (2001). Introduction: The Tyranny of History. In C. Koulouri (Ed.), *Teaching the History of South-eastern Europe.* Thessaloniki: Centre for Democracy and Reconciliation in Southeast Europe.

Lebrun, J, (2002). Past and Current Trends in the Analysis of Textbooks in a Quebec Context. *Curriculum Inquiry, 32*(1), pp. 51-83.

Lin, L., Zhao, Y., Ogawa, M., Hoge, J., & Kim, B.K. (2009). Whose history? An analysis of the Korean War in history textbooks from the United States, South Korea, Japan and China. *Social Studies, 100*(5), pp. 222-232.

Lintvelt, H.G.J., Stander, F., & Van Niekerk, A.P. (1975). *Our Living Past. History for Standard 7.* Cape Town: Maskew Miller.

Loewens, J. W. (1995). *Lies my teacher told me. Everything your American History textbook got wrong.* New York: Simon & Shuster.

Manzo, K. K. (2004). Countries torn over baring warts in history texts. *Education Week, 24*(11), p. 8.

Martens, L. (2001). *The Promised Land? Feminist Writing in the German Democratic Republic.* New York: State University of New York Press.

Mason, J. (2002). *Qualitative researching.* London: Sage.

Maylam, P. (2011). *Enlightened Rule: Portraits of six exceptional twentieth century premiers.* Bern: International Academic Publishers.

Mayring, P. (2000). Qualitative Content Analysis. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung / Forum: Qualitative Social Research, 1*(2), Art. 20, Retrieved 20 December 2013, from http://nbn-resolving.de/urn:nbn:de:0114-fqs0002204

McKinney, C. (2005). *Textbooks for diverse learners: A critical analysis of learning materials used in South African schools.* Cape Town: HSRC Publishers.

McLeod, J. (2003). *Doing counselling research*. London: Sage.

Merriam, S.B. (2002). *Qualitative research in practice: examples for discussion and analysis.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bas.

Morgan, K. (2012). Stereotypes, prejudices, self and 'the other' in history textbooks. *Yesterday and Today, 7,* pp. 85-100.

Morgan, K. & Henning, E. (2011).How school history textbooks position a textual community through the topic of racism. *Historia*, *56 (*2) pp.169-190

Morrell, R. (1998). Gender and education: the case of masculinity in South African schools. *South African Journal of Education*, *18*(4), pp. 218-225.

Motshekga, A. (2009). *We've signed OBE's death certificate*. Statement by Minister of Basic Education, Angie Motshekga, on curriculum review process, National Assembly, November 5, 2009. Retrieved 10 October 2014, from http://www.politicsweb.co.za/politicsweb/view/politicsweb/en/page71656?oid=150055&sn=Detail

Mouton, J. (2001). *How to succeed in your Masters and Doctoral Studies*. Pretoria: Van Shaik.

Msila, V. (2007). From apartheid education to the Revised National Curriculum Statement: Pedagogy for identity formation and nation building in South Africa. *Nordic Journal of African Studies, 16*(2), pp. 146-160.

Nash, M. A. (2009). Contested Identities: Nationalism, Regionalism, and Patriotism in Early American Textbooks. *History of Education Quarterly,* 49, pp. 411-441

Nene, N. (2014). *An analysis of the visual images of women in Grade 12 South African history textbooks.* (Unpublished Master's thesis).University of KwaZulu–Natal, Pinetown.

Neuendorf, K. (2002). *The content analysis guidebook.* California: SAGE Publishers Limited.

Neumann, W.L. (2006). *Basics of social research*: *Qualitative and quantitative approaches* (2nd Ed.). Boston: Allyn & Bacon.

Nicholls, J. (2003). Methods in school textbook Research, *International Journal of Historical Learning. Teaching and Research*, *3*(2). pp. 7-12.

Nieuwenhuis, J. (2007). Qualitative research designs and data gathering techniques. In K. Maree (Ed.), *First steps in research* (First ed. pp 70-79). Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Paxton, R.J. (1999). A Deafening Silence: History Textbooks and the Students Who Read Them. *Review of Educational Research, 69(*3), pp. 315-339.

Picciano, A. G. (2004). *Educational Research Primer.* London: Continuum

Pingel, F. (1999). UNESCO guideline on textbook research and textbook revision. Retrieved 12th July 2013, from http://www.ann.SAGEPublicationsPty(Ltd)oub.com/content/617/181.refs.html

Polakow-Suranski, S. (2002). *Historical amnesia? The Politics of textbooks in post-Apartheid SA*. Paper presented at the American Educational Research Association, Annual meeting, New Orleans.

SA History Online. Retrieved April, 6, 2013, from http://www.sa history.org.za/archive/chaoter8-leading-behind

Santoli, S.P. (1999). The Treatment of World War 2 in the Secondary School National History Textbook of the Six Major Powers Involved in the War*. Journal of Social Studies Research.* Retrieved 12th March 2013, from http://wwwfindarticles.com/p/articles/mi qa3823/is 199901/ai n8837

Sarantakos, S. (2005). *Social Research*. Palgrave Macmillan.

Schissler, H. (n.d.). *Beyond National Narratives. The Role of History Textbooks.* Braunschweig: Georg Eckert Institute.

Schools Council History 13-16 Project. (1976).A new look at history. Edinburgh: Holmes McDougall.

Schostak, J.F. (2002). *Understanding, Designing and Conducting Qualitative Research in Education – framing the project*. New York: Open University Press.

Schwartz, B. (1998). Postmodernity and Historical Reputation: Abraham Lincoln in Late Twentieth Century American Memory. *Social Forces*, 77 (1). pp. 63-103.

Selander, S. (1990). Towards a Theory of Pedagogic Text Analysis. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research, 34(*2), pp. 143-150.

Shields, P. (2002). Sons of Disorder: Thomas Carlyle, Samuel Beckett and the Travesty of Great Men. *Samuel Beckett Today/Aujourd 'hui, Pastiches, Parodies and other Imitations*, 12, pp. 121-130.

Siebörger, R.F. (1994). Reconceptualising South African School History Textbooks. *South African Historical Journal, 30* (1), pp.98-108.

Siebörger, R. (2000). History and the Emerging Nation: The South African Experience.

Sleeter, C, & Grant, C. A. (1991). Race, class, gender and disability in current textbooks. In M. Apple & L. Christian-Smith (Eds.), *The politics of the textbook.* New York: Routledge, Chapman and Hall.

Steven, P., Shade, A., Chalk, B., Slevin, O. (1993). *Understanding Research.* Edinburgh: Champion Press.

Stojanovic, D. (2001). History Textbooks and the Creation of National Identity. In C. Koulouri (Ed.), *Teaching the History of South-eastern Europe.* Thessaloniki: Centre for Democracy and Reconciliation in Southeast Europe.

Swain, J. (2003). How Young Schoolboys Became Somebody: the role of the body in the construction of masculinity. *British Journal of the Sociology of Education, 24* (3), pp. 299-314.

Teddlie, C. & Yu, F. (2007). Mixed methods sampling: A typology with examples. *Journal of Mixed Methods Research, 1*(18), pp. 77-100.

Tomaselli, K.G., Shepperson, A .& Mpofu, A.(1996).National symbols, cultural negotiation and policy beyond apartheid. *South African Journal for Communication, Theory and Research, 22 (*1), pp. 50-54.

Torsti, P. (2007). How to deal with a difficult past? History textbooks supporting enemy images in post-war Bosnia and Herzegovina*. Journal of Curriculum Studies, 39*(1), pp. 77-96.

Turton, A.R., Rascher, J., Maree, G. & Findlater, K. (2007). *Back to the Future: A South African Perspective on Mar de Plata and Beyond. CSIR Report No:CSIR/NRE/WR/EXP/2OO7/0105/A.*

Vinterek, M. (2009). International Society for History Didactics. *Possibilities and Obstacles in the study of Textbook use in the classroom.* Paper presented at the Annual

Conference together with Georg-Eckert-Institut Für Internationale Schulbuchforschung. Braunschweig. Germany. 14-16 September 2009.

Weinbrenner, P. (1992). Methodologies of textbook analysis used to date. In H. Bourdillon (Ed.), *History and Social studies: Methodologies of textbook analysis* (pp. 21-34). Amsterdam: Swets & Zeitlinger.

Weldon, G. (2003). A comparative study of the construction of memory and identity in the curriculum of post-conflict societies: Rwanda and South Africa. *International Journal of Historical Learning,* Teaching and Research, 6, pp .55-71.

Welman, J. C., & Kruger, S.J (2001). *Research Methodology*. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Wilkes, J. (n.d.). *Making the best use of text books*. New University of Ulster.

Williams, E. (1998). Research and Paradigms. Retrieved September 12th 2013, from http://www.umdmj.edu/idsweb/idst600/williams research+paradigms.htm

Winter, G. (2000). A comparative discussion of the notion of validity in qualitative and quantitative research. *The Qualitative Report*, 4, (3&4).

Wright, C. (1956).*The Power Elite.* Oxford Press.

Yair, G. et. al. (n.d.). "We Don't Need Another Hero": Heroes and Role Models in Germany and Israel. *Comparative Education Review*. Retrieved 27 February 2014 from http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.1086/675379

Zhang, Y. & Wildemuth, B.M. (2OO9). "Qualitative analysis of content" in *Applications of social research methods to questions in information and library science*, pp.308-319. Connecticut: Libraries Unlimited.

APPENDIX A – ETHICAL CLEARANCE CERTIFICATE

UNIVERSITY OF
KWAZULU-NATAL

INYUVESI
YAKWAZULU-NATALI

27 June 2013

Mr Anand Naidoo 8421847
School of Education
Edgewood Campus

Dear Mr Naidoo

Protocol reference number: HSS/0424/015M

Project title: The study is an analysis of the portrayal of selected "big men" in apartheid and post-apartheid era history textbooks. The focus of the study is the tracking of "big men" in South Africa school history textbooks from +- 1970 until 2013 (with the end of apartheid being a post-modern moment) which challenged the end of meta/master narratives on especially "big white men" to determine if their depiction has changed and if so how did it change.

NO- RISK APPROVAL

In response to your application dated 22 April 2013, the Humanities & Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee has considered the abovementioned application and the protocol has been granted FULL APPROVAL.

Any alteration/s to the approved research protocol i.e. Questionnaire/Interview Schedule, Informed Consent Form, Title of the Project, Location of the Study, Research Approach and Methods must be reviewed and approved through the amendment /modification prior to its implementation. In case you have further queries, please quote the above reference number. Please note: Research data should be securely stored in the school/department for a period of 5 years.

I take this opportunity of wishing you everything of the best with your study.

Yours faithfully

Dr Shenuka Singh (Deputy Chair)
Humanities & Social Science Research Ethics Committee

/pm

cc Supervisor: Prof JM Wassermann
cc Academic Leader: Dr MN Davids
cc School Admin.: Ms B Bhengu

Humanities & Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee
Professor Urmilla Bob (Chair) and Dr Shenuka Singh (Deputy Chair)
Westville Campus, Govan Mbeki Building
Postal Address: Private Bag X54001, Durban, 4000, South Africa
Telephone: +27 (0)31 260 3587/8350/4557 Facsimile: +27 (0)31 260 4609 Email: ximbap@ukzn.ac.za / mymahn@ukzn.ac.za / mohunp@ukzn.ac.za
Website: www.ukzn.ac.za
Founding Campuses: ▪ Edgewood ▪ Howard College ▪ Medical School ▪ Pietermaritzburg ▪ Westville

INSPIRING GREATNESS

133

APPENDIX B - TURNITITIN CERIFICATE

Turnitin Originality Report
"Big Men" in History Textbooks
☐ Processed on 15-Jan-2015 9:49 AM CAT
☐ ID: 488549952
☐ Word Count: 41391

Similarity Index 9%
Similarity by Source
Internet Sources: 4%
Publications: 2%
Student Papers: 6%