

**MASCULINITIES, THEOLOGIES AND HIV AND AIDS IN THE
CENTRAL REGION OF MALAWI:
A CASE STUDY ON THE CHURCH OF CENTRAL AFRICA
PRESBYTERIAN NKHOMA SYNOD'S
APPROACH TO NEGATIVE MASCULINITIES IN
ITS HIV PROGRAMME**

By

**DUMISA M ATEYO MBANO
S/N: 211528512**

**Submitted in Partial Fulfilment of the
Academic Requirements for the Degree of**

**MASTERS IN THEOLOGY AND
DEVELOPMENT**

**SCHOOL OF RELIGION, PHILOSOPHY
AND CLASSICS
UNIVERSITY OF KWAZULU-NATAL
(Pietermaritzburg Campus)**

SUPERVISOR

DR. FEDERICO G. SETTLER

**PIETERMARITZBURG
September 2014**

DECLARATION

As required by University regulations, I hereby state unambiguously that this work has not been presented at any other University or any other institution of higher learning other than the University of KwaZulu -Natal, (Pietermaritzburg Campus) and that unless specifically indicated to the contrary within the text it is my original work.

DUMISA MATEYO MBANO

01 September 2014

As candidate supervisor I hereby approve this dissertation for submission

DR. FEDERICO G. SETTLER

01 September 2014

CERTIFICATION

We the undersigned declare that we have abided by the College of Humanities, University of KwaZulu-Natal's policy on language editing. We also declare that earlier forms of the dissertation have been retained should they be required.



GARY STUART DAVID LEONARD

01 September 2014

DUMISA MATEYO MBANO

01 September 2014

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This dissertation is a result of personal effort harnessed over the past two years. For this I would like to acknowledge the support of the School of Religion, Philosophy and Classics, in the College of Humanities at the University of KwaZulu -Natal.

I would also like to express absolute gratitude to my supervisor, Dr Federico Settler for going above and beyond his expected role and duty. I owe a lot to him for the development in my academic and personal life. Thank you for not just being a supervisor, but also a mentor and a friend.

A word of gratitude also to the Rev. Gary S. D. Leonard for assistance in language editing this research study, as well as providing the layout and desktop publishing.

I would particularly like to thank my mother, father, sisters and brother for tirelessly supporting me. God bless you all.

Finally, I would like to thank the African Network of Higher Education and Research in Religion, Theology, HIV and AIDS (ANHERTHA) for providing financial assistance for this research project. I should add however, that all opinions and conclusions expressed in this study doesnot necessarily reflect their viewpoint.

ABSTRACT

Drawing from recent research on the critical role that men play in determining the course of the HIV epidemic and the socially constructed notions of masculinities, I am particularly concerned with the relationship between religion, masculinities and HIV and Aids in the central region of Malawi.

In this study, I evaluate the Church of Central Africa Presbyterian Nkhoma Synod's 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' project. I first place Malawian masculinities in their broader context by providing a brief survey of the historical forces that help to shape current masculinities in Malawi, tracing the key developments in men's studies globally and discussing the role of religion in public health. I then place the Nkhoma Synod's 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' project in its historical context, focusing particularly on its 'Man-to Man' Campaign in its broader context by offering a brief history of the Nkhoma Synod and its partnership with Norwegian Church Aid and exploring its capacity for generating social capital.

Using Critical Discourse Analysis, I then analyse the official documents of the project and investigate the ideological bias in their discourse. I go on to evaluate the Nkhoma Synod's HIV competence in its 'Man to Man' Campaign by using Sue Parry's HIV competent church action framework. I show, through a careful analysis of the official documents, that some of the discourses constructed in the official documents of the project display an uncritical approach towards Malawian masculinities and a conservative view of gender relations. With respect to my evaluation of the Nkhoma Synod's HIV competence, I found that the Nkhoma Synod was lacking in a significant number of aspects which Perry's framework considers essential for a church to achieve HIV competency.

I conclude the study by recommending further research in the assets of the indigenous matrilineal system of the Chewa people that can be retrieved and emphasised in the context of the HIV epidemic and gender injustice.

Key Terms: Behavioural Change; Church of Central Africa Presbyterian General Synod; Chewa People; Colonialism; Critical Discourse Analysis; Development; Education; Faith-based Organisations; Gender Justice; Gender Inequality; Globalisation; Hegemonic Masculinities; HIV and AIDS; HIV Competency; HIV Competent Churches Action Framework; HIV Prevalence; Inner Competence; Livingstonia Synod; Malawi; Malawi Masculinities; Man to Man Campaign; Nkhoma Synod; Norwegian Agency for International Development; Norwegian Church Aid; Outer Competence; Religion; Sex-role theory; Sexual Behaviour; Sub-Saharan Africa; Southern Africa; Theology.

GLOSSARY OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AIDS	Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
ARHAP	African Religious Health Assets Programme
CBE	Community Based Education
CBC	Christian Based Communities
CBE	Community Based Education
CCAP	Church of Central Africa Presbyterian
CDA	Critical Discourse Analysis
CSD	Church and Society Department
DA	Discourse Analysis
DCS	Department of Church and Society
DRC	Dutch Reformed Church
FBO	Faith Based Organisations
FBI	Faith Based Initiative
FGM	Female Genital Mutilation
GBV	Gender Based Violence
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
IMF	International Monetary Fund
MCM	Malawi Congress Movement
MCP	Malawi Congress Party
MCRD	Millennium Centre for Research and Development
MTM	Man-to-Man Campaign

NAC	Nyasaland African Congress
NACP	National AIDS Control Programme
NBC	National Baptist Convention
NCA	Norwegian Church Aid
NT	New Testament
OT	Old Testament
PAC	Public Affairs Committee
PIM	Providence Industrial Mission
PLWHA	People living with HIV and AIDS
SAP	Structural Adjustment Programme
TEBA	The Employment Bureau of Africa
UK	United Kingdom
UKZN	University of KwaZulu-Natal
UN	United Nations
UNAIDS	United Nations Programme on HIV and AIDS
USA	United States of America
US	United States (of America)
WARC	World Alliance of Reformed Churches
WB	World Bank
WCC	World Council of Churches
WHO	World Health Organisation

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION	ii
CERTIFICATION	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iv
ABSTRACT	v
GLOSSARY OF ABBREVIATIONS	vii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	ix

CHAPTER ONE: GENERAL INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY

1.1.	Introduction	1
1.2.	Construction of Masculinities in Malawi: Historical Forces	2
1.2.1.	Masculinities under British Colonial Rule	2
1.2.2.	Masculinities and Missionary Influence	4
1.2.3.	Masculinities under Hastings Kamuzu Banda during the Post-Independence Period	5
1.2.3.1.	The Malawian Culture under Banda's Leadership	6

1.2.3.2.	The Malawian Economy under Banda's Leadership	7
1.3.	The Involvement of the Church in Malawian Public Affairs	9
1.3.1.	The Church and Colonialism	9
1.3.2.	The Church and Hastings Kamuzu Banda	10
1.3.3.	The Church and Democracy	12
1.3.4.	The Church and Public Health	13
1.4.	The Focus of the Study	15
1.5.	Chapter Summary	16

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1.	Introduction	17
2.2.	A Brief History of Modern (Western) Masculinities	17
2.2.1.	Reformation and Renaissance	17
2.2.2.	The Military, Nationalism and Masculinities	18
2.2.3.	Colonialism and Masculinity	19
2.2.4.	Globalisation and Masculinities	20
2.3.	A Brief History of Masculinity as a Conceptual Tool	21
2.3.1.	From Sex-role Theory to Masculinities	21

2.3.2.	From Masculinities to Hegemonic Masculinity	22
2.4.	Masculinities in Interdisciplinary Studies	25
2.4.1.	Masculinities in Postcolonial Studies (Africa)	25
2.4.2.	Masculinities in Public Health in sub-Saharan Africa	27
2.4.3.	Masculinities in Theological and Social Studies	28
2.4.4.	Masculinities and Faith Based Organisations	30
2.5.	Chapter Summary	31

CHAPTER THREE: CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORKS AND RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1.	Introduction	32
3.2.	Faith Based Organisations and Faith Based Initiatives	33
3.3.	The HIV Competent Churches Action Framework	34
3.4.	The Concept of Social Capital	36
3.5.	African Religious Health Assets Framework	39
3.6.	Critical Discourse Analysis	41
3.7.	Chapter Summary	44

CHAPTER FOUR: THE NKHOMA SYNOD, NORWEGIAN CHURCH AID AND INTERNATIONAL AID

4.1.	Introduction	45
4.2.	The History of the Nkhoma Synod in Malawian Public Life	45
4.2.1.	The Nkhoma Synod and Education	46
4.2.2.	The Nkhoma Synod and Politics	47
4.2.3.	The Nkhoma Synod and Gender	49
4.3.	Norwegian Faith-based International Aid in Malawi	51
4.3.1.	Norwegian Church Aid's Framework for Partnership	52
4.4.	Chapter Summary	55

CHAPTER FIVE: CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF THE POLICY, PROGRAMME AND CAMPAIGN DOCUMENT OF THE MAN-TO-MAN (MTM) CAMPAIGN

5.1.	Introduction	57
5.2.	The Pre-'Man-to-Man' (MTM) Campaign Study	58
5.2.1.	Androcentric Discourses	59
5.2.2.	Conservative Theological and Linguistic Discourse	64
5.3.	The Nkhoma Synod Church and Society Department's 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' Proposal	67

5.4.	The Nkhoma Synod's Church and Society Progress Report	69
5.5.	Chapter Summary	70

CHAPTER SIX: THE NKHOMA SYNOD'S HIV COMPETENCE IN ITS 'MAN-TO-MAN' CAMPAIGN

6.1.	Introduction	72
6.2.	HIV Competent Churches Action Framework	73
6.2.1.	HIV Competency	73
6.2.2.	Inner Competence	74
6.2.2.1.	Personalising and Internalising the Risk of HIV	75
6.2.2.2.	Recognising the Impact and Long-term Consequences of HIV	76
6.2.2.3.	Assessing the Risk Factors that Increase Vulnerability to HIV	77
6.2.2.3.1.	Structural and Social Risks	77
6.2.2.3.2.	Gender Imbalances and Norms	78
6.2.2.3.3.	Gender Based Violence	78
6.2.2.3.4.	Negative Cultural Practices	78
6.2.2.3.5.	Economic Risks	79
6.2.2.3.6.	Political Challenges	79

6.2.2.4.	Confronting HIV Stigma, Discrimination and Denial	80
6.3.	The Bridge between Inner Competence and Outer Competence	80
6.3.1.	Leadership	81
6.3.2.	Knowledge	81
6.3.3.	Resources	83
6.4.	Outer Competence	84
6.4.1.	Theological Competence	84
6.4.2.	Technical Competency	88
6.4.3.	Social Relevance	89
6.4.4.	Inclusiveness	89
6.4.5.	Networking	90
6.4.6.	Advocacy	90
6.4.7.	Compassion	90
6.5.	Chapter Summary	91

CHAPTER SEVEN: FINDINGS, DISCUSSION, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1.	Introduction	93
7.2.	Findings	93

7.3.	Discussions	100
7.4	Recommendations	102

CHAPTER EIGHT: BIBLIOGRAPHY	104
------------------------------------	-----

8.1.	Published Works	104
------	-----------------	-----

CHAPTER ONE

GENERAL INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY

1.1. Introduction

In 2008, following the findings of a study by the Millennium Centre for Research and Development (MCRD)¹, the Church of Central Africa Presbyterian Nkhoma Synod's Church and Society department (CSD) in cooperation with Norwegian Church Aid (NCA), the 'Man to Man' (MTM) Campaign was inaugurated. This programme was launched in the central region of Malawi, being aimed at engaging local men in a process of discussing those issues pertaining to masculinity, alcohol, and HIV and AIDS.

As presented in the original proposal, the (MTM) Campaign was to "pose heightened challenges to institutional structures such as the church, schools, theological schools, madrassas, and the chieftaincy, institutions at the core of the rites of passage" and thus deepen its impact and the interrogation of masculinities in the light of HIV and AIDS

in the Malawian context. In part, the MTM Campaign reflected recent academic research on the critical role that men played in determining the course of the HIV epidemic. Such research sought to understand the many socially-constructed definitions of masculinities and what it meant to be a man and how to transform men in the context of the HIV epidemic (Van Klinken 2010:5).

Practitioners, activists and organisations involved in HIV and AIDS work have generally acknowledged the need for transforming masculinities in the context of the HIV epidemic in Africa (van Klinken 2010:5) A number of theologians, ranging from Ezra Chitando (Zimbabwe), Mike Anane (Ghana), Anthony Simpson (Zambia), and

Adriaan Van Klinken (Zambia), have conducted studies in what can be identified as

¹ This research uncovered the linkages between masculinities, alcohol abuse and HIV and AIDS.

the intersection between masculinities, HIV and AIDS, and religion and theology. Significant studies in this intersection of masculinities, HIV and AIDS, and religion and theology have been conducted in South Africa (Burchardt 2010), Zimbabwe (Chitando 2008), Tanzania (Kabigiza 2005) and Zambia (Simpson 2007; van Klinken 2010) but none yet in Malawi. Where there has been scholarly reflection on HIV and sexuality in Malawi it has largely focused on the relationship between patriarchy and femininities (Moyo 2004, 2005; Muula 2010; Rankin 2005, 2008). In this dissertation, I propose to investigate the relationship between masculinities and HIV and AIDS in the central region of Malawi. As a case study, I will look at the Church of Central Africa Presbyterian Nkhoma Synod's 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' project, particularly focusing on its "Man to Man (MTM) Campaign."

In this introductory chapter I will first introduce the social and historical forces that helped construct masculinities in Malawi. I will then provide a brief history of the church's involvement in public affairs in Malawi. I will conclude this chapter with a survey of how the Church of Central Africa Presbyterian Nkhoma Synod's 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' project came into existence.

1.2. Construction of Masculinities in Malawi: Historical Forces

1.2.1. Masculinities under British Colonial Rule

Malawi, formally known as Nyasaland, was 'discovered' by the Scottish explorer David Livingston, who was commissioned by then British government to conduct a scientific investigation of the geography and resources of the sub-Saharan region that would aid the British empire in setting up legitimate trade to replace the slave trade (Msangaambe 2011:46).

Upon his return to Britain, Livingstone appealed to the Senate House of Cambridge University on 04 December 1857, hoping to gain the sympathy of its administrators and missionaries by pointing out that the Nyasaland Protectorate held great potential

for Christianity and commerce (2011:46).² It is widely believed that it was through Livingstone that Christian activity and British administration came to Malawi. As a consequence, Malawi is often referred to as “Livingstone Country” (Kalinga 1998:529). However, as Owen Kalinga (1998:529) has argued in his article “The Production of History in Malawi in the 1960s,” Sir Harry Johnston is the key figure in the birth of Malawi and consequently one of the key forces in shaping masculinities in Malawi.

In both his academic and administrative work, Harry Johnston was involved in establishing Malawi’s national boundaries, creating its administrative structure, initiating its revenue collecting system, and contributing to the literature of “the people of the region” (Kalinga 1998:529). As its first colonial Governor, Johnson was to establish stereotypes of the Malawian society and culture which were to remain unchallenged well into the post-colonial period (1998:530). Expressing an interest in what he considered was a legitimate British rule, he portrayed the people of Malawi as “placid noble savages who had to be protected from the Swahili-Arab region and its Islamic influence” (1998:530). Like many other scholars of his time, Johnston was pre-occupied with the ethnic classification and sub-classification of peoples which was in keeping with the physical anthropology of the colonial period. He also displayed a particular fixation with the African as a sexual animal (1998:529) which again was not uncharacteristic among travellers and scholars of the nineteenth century. It was thus due to his influence that the people of Malawi were not only classified, but were also given an identity in the new imperial medical, moral and religious order (1998:529). David Chidester (1996:124 -126) observes a similar effect of European classification of the indigenous Hottentot peoples of South Africa. Chidester (1996:124) thus argues that a generation of scholars influenced by the Linnaean taxonomy³ distinguished the Hottentot from the bushmen; an ethnic distinction that was not there before. He further points out (1996:24) that this classification lies at the root of the subsequent estrangement of the Bushmen people. In a similar way, Malawian masculinities, under the classification and sub -

² Nyasaland became independent from Great Britain on 06 July 1964 and was subsequently renamed Malawi.

³After the Swedish scientist Carl Linnaeus, who developed a classification of Homo sapiens into four basic species: (i) Americanus, who were thought to be reddish, choleric, and erect; (ii) Asiaticus, who were thought to be sallow, melancholy, and stiff; (iii) Afer, who were thought to be black, phlegmatic, and relaxed; and (iv) Europaeus, who were thought to be white, sanguine, and muscular.

classification systems characteristic of the colonial period, were reconstructed with explicit associations and emphases being placed on Malawian men having an animalistic sexuality.

1.2.2. Masculinities and Missionary Influence

Under Johnson's colonial administration and the Pax Britannica, Malawi saw an intensification of Christian activity and the introduction of capitalism in the form of labour migration and farming. Among the Christian missionary interests in evangelising Malawi were missionaries from South Africa's, Dutch Reformed Church (DRC), who opened their first mission station at Nkhoma in 1889 (Phiri 2007:49). At this time, Malawi was viewed as an outpost for cheap labour for the southern African regional economy, mainly supplying European settlers and the mining enterprise (Bryceson 2004:7). The "migrant-and-remittance" economy was formalised in 1903 by the setting up of the Rhodesian Native Labour Bureau (2004:8). In this, the DRC mission at Nkhoma emerged as a significant stakeholder in this economy. This was effected through its educational philosophy and village schools, which aimed to train African labour by focusing on basic literacy and low-skills development and thus supplying the demand for low-skilled casual labour (Lamba 1984:379).

In order to produce "a Bible-loving, industrious and prosperous peasantry," the DRC Mission, which later became the Nkhoma Synod, (Lamba 1984:373), took a conservative stance in most public affair issues. Isaac Lamba (1984:377) thus argues that the DRC missionaries saw Africans as second-class citizens, who were the "wretched of the Earth," with no special social organisation conducive to a civilised mode of life. This view of Africans informed the Cape Dutch conceptualisation and development of its African education policy insofar as it set out to produce a moderately skilled labour force. The DRC Mission in Malawi, which later formally established the Nkhoma Synod in 1968 (Coertzen et al., 2005:361), had an education programme aimed at "the formation of character and a Christian peasantry" (Lamba 1984:377). This policy, spearheaded by the DRC Mission, never conceived of African women's educational needs as extending beyond basic literacy. Neither was there any possibility of academic equality. As a consequence, the privileging of girl children

over boy children had to be avoided for fear of “creating a class of women without the hope of marriage, since men would shun them” (1984:385).

Unlike the other two synods of the Church of Central African Presbyterian (CCAP)⁴, the Livingstonia and Blantyre Synods regarded education as an essential gateway to social and economic success (Ross 1996:16). In contradistinction, the education policy of the Nkhoma Synod between the years 1889-1931 only sought to develop the Malawian rural population to the level of low-skilled labourers (Lamba 1984:387). The impact this policy had on masculinities in Malawi can be seen in two ways. First, it facilitated the exclusion of women from the late colonial economy, thus placing primary responsibility on men to provide for their families. Second, it placed an increased emphasis on the man being the family breadwinner. This shift, as Phiri (2007:47) has noted, was radical for the Chewa people of the central region of Malawi who practiced a matrilineal system; a system that granted women relatively more space and opportunity for leadership than that of other African societies. As a consequence of the policy, men of the central region of Malawi would associate “manliness” with manual migrant labour. This association would define Malawian masculinities well into the postcolonial period.

1.2.3. Masculinities under Hastings Kamuzu Banda during the Post - Independence Period

As has been indicated above, the missionary enterprise had a significant impact on identity politics in Malawi. That said, concerns with nation, self, and manhood were also significantly influenced by the struggle against colonialism. The Native Association, an indigenous resistance movement whose leadership emerged primarily out of the Blantyre and Livingstonia Synods, was central to the formation of the Nyasaland African Congress which ultimately secured Malawian Independence from Great Britain in 1964 (Ross 1996:16). In turn, the Nyasaland African Congress (NAC), which later became the Malawi Congress Party (MCP), sought a leader with

⁴ The Church of Central African Presbyterian (CCAP) is a Presbyterian denomination that came out of an ecumenical effort between the Free Church of Scotland (which had a mission station in the Northern region of Malawi), the Church of Scotland (which had a mission station in southern region of Malawi), and later the Dutch Reformed Church (which had its mission station in the central region of Malawi).

seniority and experience that would command the respect of both the rural and conservative majority. Consequently, they invited Dr Hastings Kamuzu Banda, a Malawian medical doctor practising in Great Britain to lead the Malawi Congress Party (Ross 1996:17).

Prior to his return to former Nyasaland and becoming involved in the latter half of the struggle for political Independence, Banda had maintained an active interest in local affairs. He had sponsored several development projects in his home district (Lamba 1984:378), written and published several articles on the culture of the Chewa people, and networked with other African nationalists (Forster 1994:485). Banda returned to Malawi in 1958 after a delegation sent by the then NAC met and dialogued with him in Liverpool (1994:485). He returned to a nationalist mood set by the then NAC and as part of its propaganda, the sixty-year-old Banda being portrayed in decidedly messianic terms in the hope that he would be a suitable figurehead to lead the newly liberated nation. Nevertheless, some have suggested that this messianic portrayal of Banda undermined the younger leaders who sought to retain the real political power (Ross 1996:17). As the newly inaugurated president, Banda unexpectedly reorganised the Malawi Congress Party (MCP) so that it reinforced his personal authority (1996:17). Within a month, however, the majority of the cabinet broke with Banda over his style of leadership. Banda exiled these rebel ministers and thereby reconfigured the MCP membership to be understood in terms of personal loyalty to him.

1.2.3.1. The Malawian Culture under Banda's Leadership

Between 1966, when he became president, and 1971 when he declared himself life-president, Banda and his new government reconfigured the literal and figurative role of women in the matrilineal culture to suit his own political ends (Semu 2002:81).

Having co-authored several articles on Chewa maternal society with the Scottish missionary, Cullen Young (Forster 1994:487), Banda used his knowledge to create what John Lwanda (1996:203) has called "a Mbumba culture," that placed more

emphasis on women as dependants to a male guardian or Nkhoswe⁵ (Semu 2002:81).

In 1963, Banda formally declared himself 'Nkhoswe No. 1' after which he demanded that women buy and wear political party uniforms depicting his portrait and that they had to sing and dance praise songs to their Nkhoswe at all party political meetings (Semu 2002:82). This formed a massive political base which in turn further entrenched the stereotyped identities of women in Malawian political circles as being meaningful only in their display of support for male politicians (Semu 2002:82).

Malawian women in support of Banda's role as 'Nkhoswe No. 1' thus travelled around the country to participate in political rallies where their ultimate function was to uphold his ideal of masculinity.

In 1977, Banda further formalised his role as 'Nkhoswe No. 1' by nominating women as members of parliament and thus consolidated his leadership role as the national male guardian (2002:83). By so-doing, Banda embodied a hierarchy of masculinities in Malawi, thereby further entrenching a hegemonic understanding of masculinity. Finally, the practice of women from all over Malawi being transported to political rallies to dance for one man became a visible symbol that associated a man commanding the attention of many women.

1.2.3.2. The Malawian Economy under Banda's Leadership

Under his presidency, Banda's economic adjustments emerged as the second most significant force that would shape masculinities in Malawi. Wiseman Chijere Chirwa argues that the Malawian economy following Independence continued to benefit significantly from a labour- and remittance-based economy. Chirwa (1996:626) further notes that from 1964-1974, a high percentage of Malawian men were employed by either the local estates or South African mines. The arrangement between the Malawian government and the South African labour recruiter, the Witwatersrand Native Labour Association, flowed smoothly until 1974 when Banda banned all labour recruiting activities. This was in reaction to the April 1974 aeroplane crash in Francistown where seventy-four Malawian migrant labourers died

⁵ The Nkhoswe in the Chewa matrilineal system was the Male guardian who presided over his sisters and their children and sustained of their social, economic and legal interests (Phiri, 1983: 258).

(1996:623). Four years later, Banda lifted the ban and signed an agreement with The Employment Bureau of Africa (TEBA) that made it the official recruiting agent of the South African Chamber of Mines in Malawi (1996:631). This second period of labour recruitment was less successful and more problematic than the first. During this period, Chirwa (1996:633) notes how South African employers had more bargaining power and thus opted for younger labourers and demanded shorter holidays for them.

As with the education reform of the late colonial period, the post-Independence migrant labour arrangement further eroded the village subsistence economies. This second arrangement came to an end in 1987 when the South African Government demanded HIV pre-testing for recruits from Malawi (1996:639). The Malawian Government refused this demand and subsequently, 13,000 Malawian workers on South African mines were repatriated (1996:639). Deborah Fahy Bryceson (2006:181) notes that this influx of “men with little to no prospects of employment adversely affected gender roles and the village economy.” These affected men tried to cope with their situation by displaying an aggressive masculinity characterised by high levels of alcohol consumption, demand for control over domestic economic decisions, and cultural ascendance (2006:185).

Another significant adjustment was the economic liberalisation during the 1980s and 1990s. In 1981, under the financial and technical support of the World Bank (WB) and International Monetary Fund (IMF), Malawi began to implement a series of reform programmes aimed at changing the structure of the economy from being government-controlled to private-sector led (Kayia 2008:21). Bryceson (1999:173), notes that economic liberalisation policies in Africa resulted in “a plethora of changes in rural productive and marketing infrastructure” that increased economic and political uncertainty. The Malawian government, in keeping with the demands of the Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs), downsized the national crop -buying parastatals and removed the fertilizer subsidy (Bryceson 2006:182). This, coupled with cutbacks in the public funding of hospitals, schools and other social services led to the increased need for cash, which in turn led to the need for remunerative activities outside of subsistence farming (1999:173). Again, this drove men to look for employment outside of their villages and thus reinforced the association between being a man and a migrant labourer.

The various historical forces that informed the construction of masculinities in Malawi, whether cultural, economic, religious, during both the colonial and postcolonial periods, well illustrates the extent to which the making of masculinities in Malawi has always been ambivalent and always under construction.

In recent years, religious and cultural ideas have been invoked in an attempt to understand and stabilise these ambivalent notions of “being a man” (van Klinken, 2010:5). This in turn calls for an interrogation of the religious meaning of masculinities in the context of the HIV epidemic in contemporary Malawi.

1.3. The Involvement of the Church in Malawian Public Affairs

To fully appreciate and articulate the religious and cultural content of the ambivalent notions of what it means to be a Malawian man, a short survey will now be provided of the churches historical involvement in public affairs.

As was suggested above, the Protestant missionary-led church in Malawi in general, and the Nkhoma Synod in particular, has variously been implicated in both political and social processes that had an impact on conceptions of masculinities in Malawi. Nonetheless, the church in Malawi has a history both of complicity and resistance towards oppressive regimes. This ambivalence was present from the very early days of the Protestant church’s presence in Malawi. For example, Reverend John Chilembwe (1871-1915) is recognised and celebrated both at the popular and scholarly level as a central figure in the colonial resistance movement in Malawi.

1.3.1. The Church and Colonialism

As Jack Thompson (2005:577) has noted, Joseph Booth, who became both a mentor and confidante to Chilembwe, was “one of the few genuinely anti-colonial British missionaries” and that the two were instrumental in the establishment of the missionary enterprise in Malawi. Together, they travelled to the US where Chilembwe enrolled at Virginia Theological Seminary, Lynchburg, Virginia, later graduating with a B.A. and B.D., before returning to Malawi and establishing the Providence

Industrial Mission (PIM) as a mission station for the National Baptist Convention (NBC) (Soko 2010:12).

The PIM was situated in the southern part of Malawi and was established as a Christian mission to train indigenous Christian leaders in addressing race-based socio-economic injustices in colonial Malawi (Makondesa 2006:10). It contributed to the training and educating of black Malawians to enter the white-dominated economy of colonial times by advocating for equal rights and opportunities for black Malawians and campaigning against the Federal State arrangement that would see Nyasaland (Malawi), Northern Rhodesia (Zambia), and Southern Rhodesia (Zimbabwe) come under a single white colonial administration (Soko 2010:31). Thandiwe Soko (2010:39) further argues that the most critical social contribution the PIM made was the Chilembwe Uprising of January 23-24, 1915, which left more local Malawians than Europeans dead. The devastating response to the dehumanising landlord and labour practices of one particular white farmer (Soko 2010:39) and the Chilembwe Uprising must be understood within the context of a broader anti-colonial discontent.

1.3.2. The Church and Hastings Kamuzu Banda

Forty-nine years after the Chilembwe Uprising, Malawi gained its Independence from Great Britain (Ross 1996:145). As noted above, the Livingstonia and Blantyre Synod's education policy significantly impacted the development of local leaders. These in turn would play a critical role in Malawi's political independence movement (1996:16). As Ross (1996:10) goes on to note, Orton Chirwa, Henry Chipembere and Kanyama Chiume, as organisers responsible for the Malawi Congress Movement (MCM), were all products of the Livingstonia and Blantyre Synod school system. In particular, the Blantyre Synod is noted for openly supporting the struggle for political independence (1996:16). However, after Banda consolidated his political power base, the role of the church in public affairs became limited to carrying out education and public health policies. This was mainly because of Banda's autocratic leadership style and his use of violence against any dissenting voices. John Chester Katsonga, the founder of the Christian Democratic Party, was one of the many fatalities of Banda's use of violence (1996:20).

This marginalisation of the church can be seen most clearly in how the Malawian Government handled the emergence of HIV and AIDS as a health crisis across the country. Although current research points to an earlier arrival of HIV in Malawi the official discourse maintains that the first AIDS diagnosis in Malawi was made in 1985 at Kamuzu Central Hospital (Muula 2008:854). With President Banda's monopoly on power and information, the response to this emerging public health crisis was significantly hampered. This was evidenced by the fact that the Ministry of Health was the only agency authorised to issue reports about any health -related occurrence in the country, any other commentaries or observations from within or outside of government were looked upon with suspicion (2008:854). Finally, in 1987 a cabinet committee dealing with HIV and AIDS was set up and two years later a National AIDS Control Programme (NACP) was established. Although Banda's institutional response was fairly comprehensive, its cultural response was less decisive in two significant ways. First, the critical civil society stakeholders, the church, as well as other faith communities and cultural authorities were excluded from formal engagement in seeking a response to curb the infection rate (whether through education or treatment). Second, the government awareness campaign misrepresented HIV and AIDS by its emphasis on what John Lwanda (2003:121) distinctively calls the "no HIV cure" campaign.

As a result, HIV and AIDS at a government policy level was never acknowledged as a major health challenge and in its response, the administration downplayed the role of human sexuality (Lwanda 2003:120). At a more popular level, Banda's government promoted the "no HIV cure" campaign which presented HIV as an immediate death sentence (2003:121). This translated into the understanding of HIV and AIDS in retributive terms.

Drawing from this, the church's response to HIV and AIDS was couched in the language of the theology of retribution. The theology of retribution is a loose label that is placed on theologies that emphasise God's control over human affairs and the reward and punishment relationship God has with human beings (West 2010:42). John Lwanda (2003:121) notes how words and phrases such as "immorality" and "God's Wrath" were frequently associated with HIV and AIDS. Lwanda (2003:122) also points out that since 40% of hospitals and about 50% of schools are run by FBOs,

a significant Christian point of view was leveraged on the debate surrounding HIV and AIDS. Thus, the aura of fear and secrecy of the Banda regime coupled with the theology of retribution mainly informed the popular understanding of HIV in Malawi.

1.3.3. The Church and Democracy

Despite the apparent collusion or agreement between church and State around the issue of HIV and AIDS during the late 1980s, Kenneth Ross (1996:22) argues that church-state relations in Malawi took a significant turn following the Pastoral Letter issued by Roman Catholic Bishops in 1992. In drawing particular attention to the “AIDS tragedy,” the Pastoral Letter called for more accountability in Malawian public life, demanded far reaching political and economic reforms (Kaiya 2008:15) and called upon the State to address inequalities in the medical treatment, shortages of health centres and medical personnel. (Ross 1996:24). Despite the efforts of Banda’s Government to alienate the Roman Catholic Bishops, the support for the Pastoral Letter was soon to become apparent.

The Pastoral Letter ignited widespread support from students⁶ and trade unions⁷ alike who wanted a campaign for democratic change in Malawi (Ross 1996:27). Soon the CCAP, encouraged by a delegation sent by World Alliance of Reformed Churches (WARC), presented an open letter to President Banda, insisting that his Government address the issues raised in the Roman Catholic Pastoral letter (1996:29).

Following some international pressure in support of reform, Banda responded to the open letter by inviting church leaders to dialogue with his ministers (Ross 1996:28). The Public Affairs Committee (PAC) was formed in 1992, comprising of FBOs, the Malawi Law Society, the Associated Chambers of Commerce and Industry and other civic groups (Ross 1996:29; Msangaambe 2011:98). In the process, the PAC became

⁶ A week after its release, students of the University of Malawi marched in support of the Roman Catholic Bishops.

⁷ A month later, Chakufwa Chihana, the Malawian Secretary-General of the Southern African Trade Union Coordinating Council, returned to begin a campaign for democratic change in Malawi (Ross 1996:27). In two months, both the public and private sector experienced an unprecedented wave of labour strikes that were sometimes accompanied by riots and the looting of the Malawi Congress Party’s infrastructure (1996:27).

the power broker in the democratisation of Malawi, gaining its support from all the mainline churches with the exception of the Nkhoma Synod (Ross 1996:35). The Nkhoma Synod's historical links with Banda's ruling party's leadership and the Synod's own historical conservatism largely explains this incongruity.

Following Malawi's first multiparty election in 1994, the new president, Bakili Muluzi, immediately invited church leaders to offer counsel to his government "whenever it might stray from the path" (Ross 1996:40). In this regard, Peter VonDoepp (2002:126) notes that two years into the Malawian democratic experiment it was evident that there were significant shortcomings in the extent to which the new administration addressed the needs and aspirations of its local citizenry. Presbyterian and Roman Catholic clergy were viewed as being well-positioned to help overcome these shortcomings in the system, either by helping to stimulate greater participation on the part of citizens or serving as advocates for their needs (2002:126). However, as Englund (2000:585) has argued, the main role of the mainline churches in Malawi was largely seen in terms of civic education. Similarly, VonDoepp (2002:280) notes that after these multiparty elections, the mainline churches continued to contribute to democracy in more subtle ways. The miphakati (midweek Bible study) was a tradition that was practiced widely in Malawian churches during this period. VonDoepp compares this to the Christian Based Communities (CBCs) of the Latin America's liberation theology movement which provided a creative space where congregation members could democratically participate in the organisation of their communities in response to local and national socio-economic and public health challenges (vonDoepp 2002:281).

1.3.4. The Church and Public Health

Augustine Musopole (2006:52) points to February 2001 as the date of a major breakthrough in State and church dialogue on the HIV epidemic. This was when the then vice-president of Malawi, Justin Malewezi, chaired a day-long State-Faith Communities Consultation to strategize on how to curb the spread of HIV in Malawi. Musopole (2006:52) further notes that the Malawi Council of Churches had previously released a policy statement that called for the incorporation of condom use

as a response to the spread of the HI-Virus and thereby subscribed to the fidelity and abstinence approach. This decision, Musopole argues, served as an important precursor to the consultation.

Following this increased engagement between church and the State around the issues of HIV and Aids in Malawi, the Presbyterian Synods incorporated into their organisational structure a Church and Society Department (CSD) that would be responsible for public affairs issues. Despite its social conservatism and historic collusion with the Banda administration, the Nkhoma Synod had by 1994 established its own CSD, which by 2007 had launched a number of projects on human rights awareness, good governance, advocacy, and civic education on democracy. To enhance the impact of these projects, the CSD also worked in cooperation with a number of local and international organisations.

One of the international organisations that had an ongoing relationship with the Nkhoma Synod CSD was that of Norwegian Church Aid (NCA), which alongside other major international foundations and governments formed the main donor support for HIV and AIDS work in Malawi⁸. In the Malawian context, gender mainstreaming and responses towards HIV and AIDS have emerged as two significant areas of engagement for NCA. Its HIV and AIDS programmes are specifically intended to empower women, men, girls and boys in local communities to ultimately reduce the spread of HIV and AIDS and mitigate its impact by supporting the development and capacity of FBOs in Malawi through prevention activities, the provision of care and support for the infected and affected, and by reducing stigma and discrimination (NCA Global Strategy 2011-2015:24). The NCAs gender programmes are primarily oriented towards the elimination of gender based violence (GBV) and the creation of a society where women and men, girls and boys enjoy

⁸ The international organisations and donor agencies included: USAID, the British Council, the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA), the Church World Service (CWS), CIDA, DANIDA, the Department for International Development (DfID), the European Union (EU), Family Health International (FHI), FIDA International, the Global Fund to fight AIDS, TB, and Malaria, the Government of Finland, GTZ, Hope Worldwide, JICA, the Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS), Médecins Sans Frontières (Doctors without Borders), Pathfinder, Population Services International (PSI), the (US) President's Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief (PEPFAR), SIDA, the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID), the UN family (e.g., UNAIDS, UNDP, UNICEF), the (US) Centres for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC), the World Bank (WB), and the World Health Organisation (WHO).

equal rights and are able to participate in national, local and personal development. This was a far cry from the late colonial policies that shaped the theological and ecclesiological character of the Nkhoma Synod.

1.4. The Focus of the Study

The focus of this study will be an examination of masculinities and how they have been shaped and contested by the Church of Central Africa Presbyterian Nkhoma Synod. In particular, I will scrutinise one of the programmes funded by Norwegian Church Aid, namely, the 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' Project with special attention on its 'Man-to-Man' (MTM) Campaign.

The 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' Project was implemented across the main trading centres⁹ of the central region of Malawi, an area over which the Nkhoma Synod has jurisdiction. Trading centres were targeted because they not only register a high level of alcohol consumption but also report a high HIV prevalence (Kirkens Nødhjelp 2011:4). In 2011, there was a deliberate scaling up of the project in both its reach and impact in order to touch more trading centres and thus move the project beyond mere "awareness raising to a concrete involvement of key institutions central to the reconstruction of masculinity" (Mayaya 2012:8). The project also aimed to continue its ongoing challenge "to institutional structures such as the church, schools, theological schools and madrassas, the chieftaincy, institutions responsible for rites of passage" and thus deepen the impact of the project in reconfiguring masculinities in the light of HIV and AIDS (2012:8). This was in recognition of the significant role such institutions play in socialising men. Part of this project was the 'Man to Man' (MTM) Campaign which emerged as a Community Based Education (CBE) project intended to engage men of the central region of Malawi in the reconstruction of masculinity in light of the HIV epidemic. The MTM Campaign as a dedicated programme on masculinities within the Nkhoma Synod is the focus of my study which is concerned with the social and theological contestation, or reconstructions of masculinities in this context.

⁹ Trading centres are semi-urban areas in Malawi that facilitate commercial activities for the surrounding rural areas.

1.5. Chapter Summary

In summary, a programme aiming to engage men in the context of HIV and AIDS in Malawi has to take seriously in account the historical forces and factors that shaped masculinities and the involvement of churches in public life. As illustrated in this chapter, masculinities in Malawi remained highly contested and ambivalent. This has remained so despite Harry Johnston's classification of Malawian men and Hastings Kamuzu Banda's manipulation of Malawian culture.

Also illustrated is the history of church involvement in Malawi public life; from its involvement in the independence movement to its championing the democratic transition of Malawi. In this chapter I traced to the development of church involvement in public health issues in Malawi; particularly focusing on contribution in the Malawian HIV and AIDS response.

In the chapter to follow, by means of a literature review, I will explore theories on constructions of masculinities. And will give particular focus on Sub-Saharan African masculinities before going on to look at the historical and theological factors that have informed the Nkhoma Synod's focus on masculinities

CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1. Introduction

The first scholarly usage of masculinity can be traced back to Jeffrey Weeks in his (1985) book, *Sexuality and Its Discontents*, (Brod 2013:83). Masculinity as a conceptual tool was immediately adopted and employed by leading scholars in gender studies who felt that the sex role theory had fundamental limitations (Brod 2013:84). R. W. Connell, J. Lee and H. Brod were among the first to employ masculinity as a conceptual tool in their research and have thus emerged over the past few decades as the key theorists in the field.

In this chapter I will explore how masculinity as a conceptual tool has evolved over the last two decades and how useful it can be in understanding modern gender relationships, both globally and locally. I will do this by historically tracing the modern constructions of masculinities in its western form. I will then explore how masculinity as a conceptual tool has evolved. Finally, I will examine its recent interdisciplinary usage, concentrating particularly in the area of postcolonial public health and theology.

2.2. A Brief History of Modern (Western) Masculinities

2.2.1. Reformation and Renaissance

In her article “The Big Picture: Masculinities in Recent World History,” R. W. Connell (1993:607) traces the construction of modern masculinities back to the protestant reformation. She argues that the spreading of Renaissance culture by the Protestant Reformation “disrupted ascetic and corporate -religious ideals of men’s

lives, of the kind institutionalised in monasticism” (1993:607). According to Connell (1993:607), the reformation and the renaissance culture contributed in two main ways to constructs of modern masculinities:

- i. The Reformation placed more emphasis “on married heterosexuality as being the hegemonic form of sexuality.”
- ii. The renaissance culture, with its emphasis on individualism, laid the grounds for modern conceptions of male identity.

These constructions of masculinities can be best seen in the military as an institution and nationalism as a movement.

2.2.2. The Military, Nationalism and Masculinities

Joane Nagel (1998:243-244) in her article “Masculinity and Nationalism,” invokes Connell (1995), before she goes on to argue that nationalism can be best understood as “masculinist projects, involving masculine institutions, masculine processes and masculine activities,” and reflecting “masculinised memory, masculinised humiliation and masculinised hope.” The gender biases of nationalism can clearly be seen in the military.

The military is one of the institutions that has been noted for the institutionalisation of gender inequalities and hegemonic masculinities. Britton and William (1995), in their article on “Military Policy and the Construction of Heterosexual Masculinity,” argue that the military as an institution reflects cultural “privileging of a heterosexual masculine ideal.” Britton and William (1995) point out how the “traditional family among officers and career enlisted men” are encouraged and supported in the military.

Citing Adrienne Rich (1980), Britton and William reiterate that masculine identities, as institutionalised in modern military culture, “should be viewed as a political institution, which has a material and an ideological base.” This can also be traced to

British public schools and British imperial armies (Nagel 2012:402). The British imperial project, in turn, exported these ideals to the colonies.

2.2.3. Colonialism and Masculinity

In their chapter¹ on “Postcolonial Perspectives on Masculinity,” Robert Morrell and Sandra Swart (2005:92) define colonialism as the “political ideologies that legitimated the modern occupation and exploitation of already settled lands by external powers.”

For the indigenous population this translated to the “suppression of resistance, the imposition of alien laws, and the parasitic consumption of natural resources, including human labour” (2005:92).

Morrell and Swart (2005:92) argue that colonialism was “a highly gendered process.” In turn, Connell (2005:75) notes that the colonial conquest was mainly carried out by “segregated groups of men—soldiers, sailors, traders, and administrators.” These men exported and embodied European masculinities. This, coupled with capitalism, forced indigenous males into the working class and thereby created “working class masculinities as cultural forms” (Connell 1993:611). Connell (1993:611) cites four conditions for the emergence of these forms of masculinities organisation around wage-earning capacity:

- i. The “separation of the household from the working place.”
- ii. The “dominance of the wage form.”
- iii. The “development of industrial struggle.”
- iv. The “expulsion of women from industries.”

Linda Lindsay (2007), in her chapter entitled, “Working with Gender: The Emergence of the ‘Male Breadwinner’ in Colonial South-western Nigeria.” traces the “male breadwinner” ideal to colonialism. She points out that in nineteenth -century Nigeria, one of the issues of contention between the colonial State and Nigerian workers was that of equal wages to their white counterparts. Nigerian workers argued that they too were breadwinners and thus deserved equal wages. One can thus see how under

¹ In the Handbook of Studies on Men & Masculinities.

colonialism certain notions of being a man, such as individualism and the exclusive access to the formal economy, were exported from the colonisers and added to the masculinities of the colonised.

2.2.4. Globalisation and Masculinities

In relating modern constructs of masculinities to globalisation and what can best be described as “a form of neo-colonialism” (Morrell and Swart 2005:93), Morrell and Swart (2005:93) have argued that globalisation continues the “colonial legacies of inequality and exploitation.” In an age of global markets, multinational corporations, labour migration and transnational media, local communities cannot escape the effects of what Connell (1993:612) calls “globalising masculinities” insofar as globalisation continues to reinforce roles and representations of being a man in terms of wage earnings and aggression. For Connell (1993:612), it is power—in its social, historical, economic and physical sense—that is “the strongest force redefining men’s place in gender relations globally” and it is this which is mainly expressed in economic and cultural imperialism.

Nagel (2005:244) argues that what currently drives global masculinities through cultural imperialism is a “US hegemonic masculinity.” Consequently, Nagel (1998:243) traces the US hegemonic masculinity back to “the scholastic preoccupation with masculine ideals of physique and behaviour” around the late nineteenth- and early twentieth-centuries. These ideas of what it meant to be a man became institutionalised into such organisations and institutions as Theodore Roosevelt’s ‘Rough Riders’ unit and the Boy Scouts of America. These organisations embodied American and European male codes of honour which Nagel (1998:244) captures in three stereotypes:

- i. The “Masculine Achiever” (i.e., competitiveness, independence, persistence).
- ii. The “Christian Gentleman” (i.e., willpower, restraint, discipline).
- iii. The “Masculine Primitive” (i.e., strength, virility, courage).

The “masculine primitive” was the stereotype employed by the Dutch Reformed Church (DRC) missionaries in Malawi to the benefit of the low skilled labour demand in Southern Africa during the colonial period. In more recent years, aided by the transnational media, these values have been exported to the rest of the world.

2.3. A Brief History of Masculinity as a Conceptual Tool

2.3.1. From Sex-role Theory to Masculinities

In his contributing chapter to the Handbook on Studies of Men and Masculinities book, entitled “Some Thoughts on Some Histories of Some Masculinities,” Henry Brod (2005:83) points out how the sex role theory preceded masculinity as a conceptual tool was put under the spotlight of academic reflection in the field of gender studies. Brod (2005:89) suggested that the static, ahistorical overtones of the sex role theory resulted in its falling out of favour with theorists. Connell, in reflecting on sex role theory, notes three main weaknesses present within the sex role theory. These are:

- i. The “blurring of behaviour and norm.”
- ii. The “homogenising effect of the role concept.”
- iii. Its difficulties in “accounting for power.”

As a consequence, masculinity as a conceptual tool emerged as a response to these inadequacies and was formulated “as a more dynamic, history sensitive and constructive conceptual tool to aid gender theorist” (Brod 2005:89). Gender theorists quickly modified the concept masculinity to masculinities, realising “that gender is socially constructed” and that “different social groups construct masculinity in different ways at different times and in different contexts” (O’Brien 2008:513).

2.3.2. From Masculinities to Hegemonic Masculinity

As this field of studies developed, hegemonic masculinity became the term used for socially dominant construction of masculinity in a hierarchical gender order. Connell, being responsible for the conceptualisation of the term 'hegemonic masculinity.' (Lynch 2008:8), in her book *Gender and Power: Society, the Person and Sexual Politics*, draws from Antonio Gramsci's term 'hegemony' (Connell 2005:831).

Gramsci employed this term to problematise the stabilisation of class relations. In turn, Connell transferred the idea in terms of the stabilisation of gender relations (Connell 2005:831). What 'hegemonic masculinity,' as a conceptual tool did for male sex-role theory (a theory that preceded hegemonic masculinity in the men's studies), it failed to do in addressing power (2005:831). While the sex-role theory seems to conceal the power aspect of gender relationships (whether between or within sexes), 'hegemonic masculinity' as a conceptual tool tends to reveal the power aspects within gender.

In rethinking the concept of hegemonic masculinity Connell (2005:829), notes how it has significantly influenced recent thinking about men, gender, and social hierarchy as well as how it has been applied in different fields ranging from education and anti-violence work to health and counselling. Hegemonic masculinity as a conceptual tool was conceived to account for the weakness in the sex-role theory that preceded it (2005:831).

Following a considerable "success in applying hegemonic masculinity to empirical social research in local gender hierarchies and local cultures of masculinity in schools," the concept started to take form (Connell 2005:832). The main formulations of hegemonic masculinity, as noted by Connell (2005:832) are five in number:

- i. "Hegemonic masculinity as the pattern of practice that allowed men's dominance over women to continue."
- ii. "Hegemonic masculinity as distinct from other masculinities."
- iii. "Hegemonic masculinity as not normal in the statistical sense but normative."

- iv. “Hegemonic masculinity as an ideology that legitimates the global subordination of women to men.”
- v. “Hegemonic masculinity as being open to historical change.”

This type of formulation, as Connell (2005:832) has noted, prompted its application from academia to that of activists in a range of fields. She notes that the “late 1980s and early 1990s saw research on men and masculinity consolidating as an academic field and a rapidly expanding research agenda across the social sciences and humanities” (2005:832). Hegemonic masculinity proved to be significant in public health and organisational studies (2005:832) and in public health, where it was applied as a concept to understand men’s health practices. Connell (2005:832) points how the concept helped in research on men’s risk-taking sexual behaviour and men’s difficulties in responding to disability and injury. Reflecting on research in gender transformations in Southern Africa associated with the end of Apartheid, Connell’s (2005:833) argument that masculinities are not simply different but also subject to change, becomes a critical consideration.

Following the conceptualisation, formulation and application of hegemonic masculinity, Connell (2005:833) notes five main criticisms raised against it:

- i. Hegemonic masculinity “essentialises the character of men or imposes a false unity on a fluid and contradictory reality.”
- ii. It has “failed to adequately emphasise the discursive construction of identities.”
- iii. It is “framed within a heteronormative conception of gender that essentialises male-female difference and ignores difference and exclusion within the gender categories.”
- iv. It “logically rests on a dichotomisation of sex (biological) versus gender (cultural).”

- v. It therefore “marginalises or naturalises the body.”

Connell (2005:832) goes on to respond to these criticisms by arguing that “social science and humanities research on masculinities has flourished during the past twenty years mainly because the underlying concept employed is not reified or essentialist.” Connell (2005:832) continues by pointing out that the notion and concept of masculinity essentialises or homogenises and is quite difficult to reconcile with “the tremendous multiplicity of social constructions” which “ethnographers and historians have documented” with the aid of this concept.

Having cited examples of research concerned with the exploration of masculinities enacted by person with female bodies, Connell (2005:832) then turns to the ambiguity of the concept of hegemonic masculinity as a criticism worth addressing. The ambiguity of who actually embodies this hegemonic masculinity has led to inconsistent applications of the concept, sometimes referring to a fixed type of masculinity and on other occasions referring to whatever type is dominant at a particular time and place². In addressing this, Connell (2005:838) argues that “ambiguity in gender processes may be important to recognise as a mechanism of hegemony.” She illustrates this by outlining a social process that can lead to these ambiguities. This position holds that “there is a circulation of models of admired masculine conduct,” which “may be exalted by churches, narrated by mass media, or celebrated by the state” (2005:832). This social process can “construct hegemonic masculinities that do not correspond closely to the lives of any actual men but still expressing widespread ideals, fantasies, and desires” (2005:832). As a consequence, hegemonic masculinity although ambiguous “provides models of relations with women and solutions to problems of gender relations” (2005:838). According to Connell (2005:838), this contributes to “hegemony in the society -wide gender order as a whole.”

That said, Connell (2005:838) also points to “the problem of reification of hegemonic masculinity.” Noting that “to deduce relations among masculinities from the direct exercise of personal power by men over women is a mistake,” and that it leads to “a

² A similar ambiguity will be seen in one of the documents I will analyse in chapter five.

circular argument that sees masculinities as the explanation (and the excuse) for the behaviour.” To address this problem, Connell suggests a more nuanced approach that factors in “the institutionalisation of gender inequalities, the role of cultural constructions, and the interplay of gender dynamics with race, class, and region,” and for our purposes, it would include the church as institution and experiential faith as a cultural construction.

Connell (2005:842) also argues that “hegemonic masculinity is constructed by discourse and used in discourse.” She points to several studies that took a “discursive psychology” approach that illustrate this. However, as Connell (2005:842) also notes, non-discursive practices like “wage labour, violence, sexuality, domestic labour, and child care,” also play a significant role in constructing hegemonic masculinity—as I will attempt to illustrate in my discussion of religion, labour and masculinities in Malawi in this dissertation. Connell (2005:842) thus responded to the criticism by citing Whitehead’s argument that hegemonic masculinity as a concept “can only see structure, making the subject invisible” Connell (2005:842) sees the concept of hegemonic masculinity as embedding “a historically dynamic view of gender in which it is impossible to erase the subject.” The adaptability of masculinities and hegemonic masculinity as conceptual tools in many disciplines illustrates its usefulness in understanding and analysing gender.

2.4. Masculinities in Interdisciplinary Studies

2.4.1. Masculinities in Postcolonial Studies (Africa)

Marc Epprecht, in his article, “’Unsaying of Indigenous Homosexualities in Zimbabwe: Mapping a Blindspot in an African Masculinity,” (1998:63 3) points out how African masculinities were significantly shaped under the oppression of colonialism and racial capitalism. Focusing on Zimbabwean masculinities, Epprecht (1998:637-639) notes the power relations between the colonial administration and the indigenous people, the influence of missionaries and the interaction with Malawian migrant workers and how all of these factored in the reconstruction of masculinity.

Ingrid Lynch (2008:13) citing Epprecht, points out how the African male was partially referred to as 'boy' regardless of Age or/and status. This, Lynch argues (2008:13), made more "aggressive and exaggerated expressions of African masculinities" develop as a response. It is this historical interplay between institutionalised racism and constructions of masculinities that makes the concept of hegemonic masculinity relevant in studies of males in post-colonial Africa.

Kopano Ratele (2008:512), in his analysis of males in Africa, argues that there is much to be gained in employing "an analysis of male practices and experiences grounded in social conditions as well as those things to be found in the psychosocial realities of individual males." Ratele (2008:521) points out that there are historical and cultural forces between African males and masculinities that need observing when analysing male lives. Ratele (2008:513) suggests that this view of masculinity helps researchers in analysing males "who are powerless in relation to other males but at the same time members of a powerful gender group in relation to females"; an analysis that was hard to do using the narrow application of the concept of hegemonic masculinity. Other significant "social-psychological categorisations" "such as being without gainful employment," have to be factored in if "the intricacies that riddle the lives of African males" are to be fully understood (2008:514). Drawing upon the relationship and interplay between psychology and politics, Ratele suggests two categories that can help in analysing masculinities in Africa. The first category is "Age and African manhood"³ (Ratele 2008:523). The rites of passage⁴ by certain cultural groups are a good illustration of how age is an element in constructing masculinities. This category can also be used to understand the construction of masculinities in a gerontocracy (Ratele 2008: 526); a situation that Malawi was in under Kamuzu Banda and of which a significant number of African states are still under. What the category of age brings into the understanding of masculinities in

³ Among the interesting implications about age and seniority in relation to manliness is that in the pre-colonial period or outside of colonial reach, post-menopausal females and females who occupied male stools or chiefly offices could become "ritual men," embodying a form of female masculinity and attaining social positions reserved for men (Ratele 2008:524).

⁴The amaXosa, Basotho and the Yao's (to mention a few) falls under what Ratele calls a bio-psychocultural (Ratele 2008:524). The boy's coming of age (an biological factor) changes how he looks at himself (psychological factor) and how the society looks at him (cultural factor) and the rite of passage vehicles this transition (Ratele 2008:524).

Africa is the limitations and opportunities that different age brackets bring in different contexts.

The second category is “Burdens of masculinity and occupation and income attainment” (Ratele 2008:529). This category works on two assumptions: that most constructions of masculinities in Southern Africa see work and the production of income as key to being a man and that “gainful employment” does not only satisfy material needs but also “ego needs” (2008:529). This category opens up analysis of masculinities in relation to unemployment, minimum wage, violence and sexual risky behaviour (2008:529-533). While Ratele is looking at masculinities in Africa mainly in relation to the context of gender wars in word and in deed, his analysis offers critical insight into a discussion of public health in this context.

2.4.2. Masculinities in Public Health in sub-Saharan Africa

In more recent years, in the context of the HIV epidemic, the hegemonic position of heterosexual masculinities has been probed repeatedly and the prevalence of HIV has led many to question the naturalness and universality of heterosexuality (Redman 1996:169). Critically, such probing and questioning exposed the fatal consequences (to both women and men) of hegemonic heterosexual masculinities (1996:170). This is not least true in Sub-Saharan Africa, where heterosexuality is the predominant expression of masculinity (Moyo 2009; Van Klinken 2011).

Ingrid Lynch (2008) in her study, *Constructions of Masculinity among Black South African Men Living with HIV*, identified six discourses that construct their understanding and expedience of masculinity. Here, I will list only three discourses that are relevant to this study:

- i. Lynch (2008:37) identifies “My son, he’s a man, a real man” as the first discourse and relates it to the academic discourse of hegemonic masculinity. This traditional hegemonic masculinity, Lynch (2008:37) notes, is attained by certain cultural practices. Lynch’s study found that “being a financial provider”, “being in a heterosexual relationship”; “getting married and having

children”; and “being in a position of authority in the home” were central in the construction of a traditional hegemonic masculinity. Lynch (2008:37) also notes that alongside the discourses of being in a position of authority in the home was the notion that men are entitled to have multiple sexual partners.

- ii. Lynch (2008:74) identifies the second discourse as that of invulnerability. In this discourse, men are constructed as being self-reliant, independent and tough. Lynch (2008:50) argues that within this discourse men are unable to disclose anything that might be perceived as weakness. She shows the negative effect this has in public health issues, not least in the HIV epidemic, illustrating how this construction of masculinity forces men to be silent about being HIV-positive and to have poor health-seeking behaviour.
- iii. Lynch (2008:75) identifies “Men die like sheep” as the third discourse . The metaphor employed to explain how men resist their emotional expression. Lynch argues that within this discourse, men are constructed to express emotions associated with a normative masculinity, such as that of aggression.

2.4.3. Masculinities in Theological and Social Studies

As with other disciplines in the humanities and social sciences, religion and theology has been recognised as having an enduring impact on shaping, maintaining and transforming masculinities (van Klinken 2011:7). This has led to a number of scholars in the disciplines of theology and religion to conduct studies in what can be called “an intersection of masculinities, HIV and AIDS and theology and religion” (2011:7). Anthony Simpson in his article, “Sons and Fathers/Boys to Men in the Time of AIDS: Learning Masculinity in Zambia,” reflected on a cohort of Roman Catholic mission - educated Zambian men’s understandings of masculinities. Through the use of life stories Simpson investigated how their concept of masculinity was constructed and found that “the roots of many understandings of masculinity are to be found in domestic and extra-domestic worlds where boys observed the ways in which men took precedence and exercised power over women and children” (Simpson 2005:569).

Also focusing on Zambia, Adriaan van Klinken in his PhD dissertation, “The Need for Circumcised Men: The Quest for Transformed Masculinities in African Christianity in the Context of the HIV epidemic,” investigated the (re)construction of masculinities in the context of African Christianity. He studied the strategies employed in Christian faith communities in Zambia to realise behavioural change among men and to transform masculinities. One of his findings was that although these strategies of faith-based organisations tackled behaviour issues among men, they failed to address the aspect of male headship.

Morten Skovdal et al., in their study conducted in Zimbabwe, entitled: “Masculinity as a barrier to men’s use of HIV services in Zimbabwe,” investigated how local constructions of masculinity in rural Zimbabwe impacted on men’s health seeking behaviour and their use of HIV services. This study drew on the perspectives of fifty - three antiretroviral drug users and twenty-five healthcare providers and found a “clear hegemonic notion of masculinity that required men to be and act in control, to have know-how, be strong, resilient, disease free, highly sexual and economically productive” (Skovdal et al., 2011:1). They argued that this was in direct conflict with “the ‘good patient’ persona who is expected to accept being HIV positive, take instructions from nurses and engage in health-enabling behaviours such as attending regular hospital visits and refraining from alcohol and unprotected extra -marital sex” (2011:1).

Elsewhere, Louise Vincent, in his article “Boys will be Boys’: Traditional Xhosa Male Circumcision, HIV and Sexual Socialisation in Contemporary South Africa,” investigated how the cultural and social meaning of ritual male circumcision has changed among the Xhosa peoples of South Africa in the context of HIV and AIDS. Vincent (2008:431) pointed out two key ways in which traditional Xhosa circumcision has changed, namely, “the role which circumcision schools once played in the sexual socialisation of young men” and the emergence of “the idea that initiation gives men the unlimited and unquestionable right to access to sex rather than marking the point at which sexual responsibility and restraint is introduced into the lifestyle of young men.”

These studies all point to the increasing interest in understanding and reconfiguring masculinities in sub-Saharan Africa, and it is within this context that I want to situate my own reflection on constructions of Malawian masculinities as constructed and ambivalent.

2.4.4. Masculinities and Faith Based Organisations

Practitioners, activist and organisations that are involved in HIV and AIDS work have also recognised the critical role that men play in determining the course of the epidemic. It has raised an academic quest to understand the many socially constructed definitions for being a man, masculinity, and how to engage them in the context of HIV and AIDS (van Klinken, 2010:5). Faith-based organisations are slowly incorporating programmes that deal with the gendered aspect of the epidemic. The Roman Catholic Relief Services is one of the faith-based organisations that have attempted to address the gender aspect of the epidemic in sub-Saharan Africa (Clark 2012:1), it having initiated collaborated and participated in several HIV programmes that aimed to stimulate men's involvement in the HIV response (2012: 6).

In its (2012) *Getting to Zero: Diverse Methods for Male Involvement in HIV Care and Treatment Report*, the Roman Catholic Relief Services catalogued a range of programmes in different parts of Africa (Nigeria, Uganda, Zambia and Kenya) designed to employ a gendered lens and male involvement in the HIV epidemic (Clark, 2012:4). Motivated by the Roman Catholic social teaching in general and the UNAIDS goal of "getting to zero" in particular, the Roman Catholic Relief Services programmes that deal with male involvement, ranges from creating support groups for infected men, strengthening couple relationship and encouraging couple testing, to campaigns to increase men's involvement in antenatal care (2012:5 -12). At the same time, there has been scholarly pursuits to understand the role of religion, in general and Christian theology in particular, in the formation of negative masculinities and attempts to retrieve those resources that could transform the currently negative expressions of masculinities in the context of the HIV epidemic in sub-Saharan Africa. This study places itself within this quest.

2.5. Chapter Summary

In this chapter I have provided an introduction and background to the literature concerning the constructions of modern masculinities. I have done this by tracing the historical roots of modern constructs of masculinities and noting their exportation to the rest of the world through colonisation and globalisation. Using some selected texts and scholars, I then explored how masculinity as a conceptual tool has evolved over the last two decades by tracing its development from its older monolithic formulation (masculinity) to its diversified formulation (masculinities) and finally to its more critical formulation (hegemonic masculinity). At the end of this literature review, I listed the multidisciplinary applications and engagements with masculinities, focusing particularly on its usage in Postcolonial studies, theological studies and faith-based developmental practices, to illustrate its centrality in any critical scholarly engagement with faith, gender relations and development in the context of HIV in Malawi. In the next chapter I will introduce the conceptual frameworks and methodological tool that I will seek to employ in the study.

CHAPTER THREE

CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORKS AND RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1. Introduction

Motivated by a desire to interrogate the central Malawian Presbyterian Synod's conception and engagement with masculinities in the context of HIV, this chapter will explore the social science concept of social capital, the redemptive concept of religious health assets and the action framework of an HIV competent church. These theoretical tools will be later employed in the study to evaluate the theological and practical effectiveness of the Nkhoma Synod's 'Man-to-Man' Campaign in addressing negative masculinities in the context of the HIV epidemic. I will also utilise the concept of social capital to analyse and understand how social resources are produced and maintained within local faith communities in central Malawi. The concept of religious health assets which emerged out of the theoretical framework of the African Religious Health Assets Programme (ARHAP) will be used along with the HIV competent churches action framework designed by Sue Parry¹ to ascertain the Nkhoma Synod's engagement with the HIV pandemic.

In this chapter, I will first elaborate on the term 'Faith Based Organisations.' I will then move on to discuss the conceptual tools that will be used in this study. Finally, I will introduce the critical discourse analysis (CDA) as a methodological tool that I intend to employ in examining and interrogating the official and unofficial documents of the Nkhoma Synod's MTM Campaign.

¹ Sue Perry is presently the regional coordinator for Southern Africa's Ecumenical HIV and AIDS Initiative in Africa and has done substantial research involving the mapping of church activities regarding HIV and AIDS in Southern Africa.

3.2. Faith Based Organisations and Faith Based Initiatives

The terms 'Faith Based Organisation' (FBO) and its variant 'Faith Based Initiative' (FBI) have been used to understand the partnership between secular institutions (in the forms of international foundations and governments) and religious organisations to deliver social services (Beckford and Demerath 2007:345). According to Beckford and Demerath (2007:345), these terms can be traced to their origins in the United States of America and are best understood in that context. The US. is widely noted as being one of the most religious of Western democracies and its constitution as being the most explicit in its supposed separation of religion and the State (2007:345). Unlike in other societies where the State assumes a significant share of responsibility for social well-being, "in the USA there has been a steady move to limit the states direct involvement in projects of social well-being" (2007:345). This, Beckford and Demerath have argued, has led to the US Federal Government to become indirectly involved with private agencies and organisations that have social-civil interests. This it does by funding these private agencies and organisations including those motivated by religion. In responding to this development, the North American courts have repeatedly emphasised that, "governmental activities must have a secular purpose, must not advance any particular religious interest, and must not exclude or marginalise citizens who claim other, or no, religious affiliation" (2007:346). It is from this context that the terms 'Faith Based Organisation' (FBO) and 'Faith Based Initiatives' emerged and found their application. These terms are useful for both parties and civic organisations and religious bodies.

For many secular institutions this made possible the opportunity to engage and evaluate religious non-profit service agencies without having to compromise their non-sectarian stance. Similarly, religious non-profit service agencies can receive aid from secular institutions without having to compromise their theological motivations. In the context of HIV and AIDS and the significant involvement of religious non-profit service agencies in sub-Saharan Africa, these terms have proven particularly useful and relevant.

In 2004, the World Health Organisation (WHO) estimated that 20% of organisations engaged in HIV programming globally were Faith Based (Parry 2008:16). The WHO

also estimated that FBOs provided between 32% and 70% of all healthcare in Africa (Schmidt et al., 2008:5). It also noted that this involvement in health and HIV by FBOs was increasing (de Gruchy et al., 2007:7). It was in view of the significant contribution that faith-initiated programmes bring to public health in general and to the response to the HIV challenge in particular, that initiatives such as the African Religious Health Assets Programme (ARHAP) and the UNAIDS Partnership with Faith Based Organisations were set up. This has not only provided churches with a renewed social relevance but it has also challenged churches to meaningfully assess their competence to serve as agents of development in the context of HIV in the sub-Saharan region.

3.3. The HIV Competent Churches Action Framework

The idea of an HIV competent church action framework was developed by Sue Parry in her book, *Beacons of Hope*. With its slogan, “the body of Christ has AIDS.” Parry provides a framework deeply rooted in New Testament Pauline ecclesiology. She thus employs the metaphor ‘the Body of Christ’ to invoke ecclesial unity. Similarly, Hadede (2006:98) has pointed out that while the Apostle Paul uses several metaphors to describe the church, such as, the household of God and the habitation of God (Ephesians 2:19-22), a community of equals (Galatians 3:24), and the bride of Christ (Ephesians 5:25-33), it is the metaphor, ‘Body of Christ’ that African scholars frequently use in theologising HIV and AIDS that is found to be most relevant.

Haug (2009:214) has argued that the metaphor ‘the body of Christ has AIDS’ has been employed by African scholars to challenge the notion that HIV and AIDS is something that happens out there in the world. It therefore promotes the idea that the church’s mission is that of reaching out—an attitude that characterised the first phase of churches response to the HIV epidemic.²

² The church’s dominating high moralistic view of HIV and AIDS had left its efforts in prevention, at best irrelevant and at worst counterproductive (Doupe and Kurian 2006:437). In comparison with other stakeholders, the church has trailed behind in HIV prevention by continuing to insist on outdated methods and ignoring new strategies and methods.

In total, the metaphor, “the body of Christ” makes it possible to address stigma, to express agency, and calls for solidarity with those African local churches that are directly infected and affected by the epidemic, as well as the institutional Church, including those that are not directly infected or affected by the epidemic (Haug 2009:214).

In his (2008) article, “When the Body of Christ has AIDS: A Theological Metaphor for Global Solidarity in Light of HIV and AIDS,” Adriaan van Klinken traces the metaphor’s first usage to that of Ron Russell-Coon’s (1990) book, “The Church with AIDS: Renewal in the Midst of a Crisis. Van Klinken documents how the metaphor has been used and explores its implication for the church.

Parry, in her book “Beacon of Hope: HIV Competent Churches a Framework for Action,” extends the metaphor by employing a medical term, ‘HIV and AIDS competence.’ For Parry (2005:19), the full term, ‘HIV and AIDS immuno-competence,’ refers to “a functional and effective immune system in a patient with HIV/AIDS.” For her, the churches have to strive to develop an effective and functional immune system towards HIV competence and thus she envisions an “HIV Competent Churches Framework for Action” as a means for the churches to attain this (2005:20). This framework for action was designed for those who hold leadership roles in churches, as well as those who are already involved in responding to HIV (2005:8). Parry (2005:8) explains what HIV competence is, why the need for competence is critical, and why it seeks to identify that which is often missing in churches HIV response. In summary, Parry lists three markers to help understand the process toward HIV competence:

- i. Inner competence.
- ii. The bridge between inner and outer competence.
- iii. Outer competence.

For Parry (2005:20), the “inner competence of a church involves the acknowledging and internalising of the scope and risk of HIV on the local community and church

members,” while the bridge between inner and outer competence is identified as leadership, knowledge and resources. Finally, for Parry (2005:79), outer competence involves developing theological and technical competence (in the context of the HIV epidemic) to bring about social cohesion³ through social relevance and “forming networks that increase the scale and sustainability of the HIV responses and participation in advocacy.” This framework is based on the premise that churches generate social capital and that such social capital can be used to harness and build resources or assets to be utilised in the curbing of the HIV epidemic.

3.4. The Concept of Social Capital

Two important questions arise: What is social capital? And what does it bring to a discussion of church competence in the context of HIV in Southern Africa? The term ‘social capital’ can be traced back to Jane Jacobs in her classic work, *The Death and Life of Great American Cities*, (Fukuyama 1997:377). Social capital, as James Coleman conceptualised it, “exists within a social structure of relationships and is available to actors with the intention of achieving specific aims” (cited in Provenzo and Provenzo 2009:2). This is why social capital as a conceptual tool is fitting for the study of Faith Based communities in general and for understanding the formation of masculinities in particular.

In particular, the concept draws on the notion of capital. Lin Nan, in her article, “Building a Network Theory of Social Capital,” recalls that Karl Marx defines capital as part of the surplus value captured by capitalists or the bourgeoisie who control production means as well as the circulation of commodities and monies between the production and consumption processes and it is thereby based on the exploitative social relations between two classes (Lin 1999:29). The neo-capital theories (about human capital, cultural capital and social capital) as Lin (1999:29) argues, have through practices of refinement and modification still managed to “retain the basic

³ According to a recent South African government report on Social Cohesion and Social Justice in South Africa, Social Cohesion refers to “the extent to which a society is coherent, united and functional, providing an environment within which its citizens can flourish” and is a measure to social capital See: <<http://www.thepresidency.gov.za/docs/pcsa/social/social/part1.pdf>> [Accessed 31 May 2014].

elements of capital in its classical Marxian definition” and thus for her, fundamentally capital, in all its neo-capital theories, remains “a surplus value and represents an investment with expected returns.” However, social capital differs from human capital. While human capital (education and skills) can be achieved in isolation, social capital has “to be shared by more than one individual to have meaning” (Fukuyama 1999:378).

Francis Fukuyama (1999:377) in his book, *The Great Disruption*, defines social capital as the existence of a certain set of informal values or norms shared among members of a particular group that permits cooperation among them. However, he points out that the sharing of values and norms does not in itself produce social capital. Instead, they must be the right values (1999:378). According to Fukuyama (1999:378), the values key to the production of social capital are truth -telling, the meeting of obligations, and reciprocity. Here, it is worth noting that not all forms of social capital are necessarily positive (1999:380). For example, Steven Robins (2003), in his chapter, “Grounding ‘Globalisation from Below’: ‘Global Citizens’ in Local Spaces,”⁴ points out how certain gangs in the Cape Flats of Cape Town are an example of negative social capital.

Social capital, according to Lin (1999:31), works on a simple and straightforward premise whereby investment is understood in terms of its social relations and expected returns. Lin (1999:31) suggests that there are three explanations for why embedded resources in social networks will enhance the outcomes of actions:

- i. Social networks facilitates the flow of information.
- ii. The social ties social networks often exert influence on the agents.
- iii. Social networks certify an individual’s social credentials and hence provide them more access to resources.

⁴ In the book, *What Holds Us Together: Social Cohesion in South Africa*.

Social capital should thus be understood as “investment in social relations by individuals through which they gain access to embedded resources to enhance expected returns of instrumental or expressive actions” (1999:40). From this definition three processes can be clearly identified:

- i. Investment in social capital.
- ii. Access to and mobilisation of social capital.
- iii. Returns of social capital.

In the context of Faith Based interventions in reconfiguring masculinity in the light of the HIV epidemic, the first process can be investing in spaces where men form and reform notions and norms of masculinities. The second process can be accessing these spaces and mobilising them towards a transformed masculinity. Finally, the third process can be the expectance of returns in the form of transformed masculinities after establishing trust and social cohesion⁵.

Janine Nahapiet and Sumantra Ghoshal (1998), in their article, “Social Capital, Intellectual Capital, and the Organisational Advantage,” define social capital as “the sum of the actual and potential resources embedded within, available through, and derived from the network of relationships possessed by an individual or social unit.” Unlike Lin’s focus on investment-for-returns, Nahapiet and Ghoshal privileges the idea of social capital as produced from a network of social relationships, and as such identifies three dimensions that inform the production of social capital. These are:

- i. The structural dimension.
- ii. The cognitive dimension.
- iii. The relationship dimension (Nahapiet and Ghoshal, 1998:243).

⁵ Adriaan van Klinkin (2011:118), in noting the low attendance of men at traditional church spaces, recalls a suggestion by a church minister, who was part of his study, to “minister to them [men] in the pubs or wherever they are.”

Relating these dimensions to faith communities and gender, the structural dimension is the 'pattern of linkages' as manifested in hierarchy. The cognitive dimension is the shared 'systems of meaning,' manifested in shared narratives. Particularly relevant to the present study is the idea of shared language and code. The relationship dimension accounts for the personal relationships people develop with each other (Nahapiet and Ghoshal, 1998:243).

According to Koseoglu (2007:10), the structural dimension represents the network structure, network configuration, and pattern of linkages, whereas the cognitive dimension is related to the shared goals and shared culture in a group and the relationship dimension relates to trust within that group. In terms of the relationship dimension, these groups includes "all social associations, libraries, clubs, workers unions, and significantly, faith communities and Faith Based organisations. This leads some scholars to conclude that, "the human resources of language, culture and religion, the human relations of family, neighbourhood, voluntary associations and civil society, have all been rendered as forms of social capital" (Chidester et al., 2003:18). The concept of social capital is therefore not only useful in understanding the role of religion in public health, but also in analysing and interpreting the various ways in which religious and cultural constructions of masculinities can be problematised and/reformed as a social development asset or capital.

3.5. African Religious Health Assets Framework

Jill Oliver, James Cochrane and Barbara Schimdt in their article, "ARHAP Literature Review: Working in a Bounded Field of Unknowing," point out that religion builds and harnesses social capital, whether through seemingly mundane experiences such as singing in a choir regularly, or more institutionally recognised initiation rituals, or through more overt ways in which religious involvement engenders hope or resilience through volunteerism and education to produce behaviour change. However, in the context of public health religion in general and theology in particular —because of its condemnation and stigmatisation rhetoric—it has been looked at with suspicion at best and hostility at worst. This has been partly because of the secularisation theory and partly because of the negative contribution of religion in the public arena, not

least in public health in general and in the context of the HIV epidemic in particular. However, in recent years there has been a change in attitude, resulting in the significant role that Faith Based organisations play in public health being recognised (Parry 2008:14). In particular, it was in recognising the significant role faith plays in informing health practices in Africa and the contribution that faith -initiated programmes bring to public health in general and in the response to HIV challenges in particular that the African Religious Health Assets Programme (ARHAP) was initiated. It is in this regard that the ARHAP initiative provides an excellent theoretical framework for interdisciplinary research dealing with religion and public health in sub-Saharan Africa.

The ARHAP theoretical framework rests on three principles:

- i. That the secularisation thesis is in crucial aspects invalid in the African context.
- ii. That human beings have the capacity to exercise their own agency in dealing with their own health.
- iii. That an assets-based approach is most appropriate for research in this field (Olivier et al., 2006:9).

Based on these ideals, the ARHAP theoretical framework is well-suited for researching and understanding FBOs, probing how religious health assets “can be drawn into the public health systems” and developing appropriate language for this intersection of concerns (Cochrane 2006:59). Again, this theoretical framework in particular and the ARHAPs practical approach to public health in Southern Africa in general, creates a space for trust between faith institutions and secular institutions and thereby generates capacity within FBOs. This is done by the focusing on assets rather than deficits and the developing of appropriate language. ⁶ All of this can be seen through the lens of social capital, more especially its cognitive dimension. The shift from a deficits based narrative to an asset based narrative and the development of

⁶ As already stated above, language shapes beliefs and beliefs translate into action and hence key to any transformative endeavor is language (this will be elaborated on later in the dissertation)

context appropriate language as transformative tools is relevant not only for dealing with public health issues, but in dealing with social relations determined by particular constructions of masculinities. Hence, faith communities and FBOs, as sites that produce social capital, are in an ideal position to identify and develop assets for health management in the context of the negative masculinities and HIV.

The concept of social capital and the ARHAP theoretical framework will be employed to understand the Nkhoma Synod and its MTM Campaign. This study does not take for granted that the Church of Central Africa Presbyterian Nkhoma Synod generates a positive social capital in the context of HIV and AIDS and hence employs a framework to investigate this. The HIV competent churches framework will be used to interrogate the Church of Central Africa Presbyterian Nkhoma Synod's HIV programmatic approach in addressing negative masculinities as seen in the MTM Campaign.'

3.6. Critical Discourse Analysis

Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) is a theoretical and methodological tool that allows one to "examine the constitutive role that discourses play in contemporary society" (Mills, Durepos and Wiebe 2010:244). Although it shares a lot in common with the broader field of Discourse Analysis (DA), it nevertheless differs in its particular history and ideological leanings.

CDA methodological history can be traced back to the British and Australian critical linguistics in the 1970s that researched on the intersection of discourse, ideology, and power (Given 2008:145). As for its ideological history, this can be traced back to Michel Foucault, Jürgen Habermas, Antonio Gramsci and the Frankfurt School (Littlejohn and Foss 2009:221). In recent years, Norman Fairclough, Teun van Dijk, Theo van Leeuwen, and Ruth Wodak are recognised as the leading scholars in this field (Mills et al., 2010:244).

CDA defines theory as “a coherent series of individual and universal statements, going beyond a mere description and making it possible to substantiate, explain or understand, or even (re-)construct the object of theory as well as to establish causal relations between specific phenomena”(Gilbert Weiss and Ruth Wodak 2007: 1-2) . The coordinating conjunction, ‘or’, in the definition identifies a particular difference in approach to the constitution of theory: a hermeneutic-reconstructive one (understanding) and a nomothetic-deductive one (explaining) (Gilbert Weiss and Ruth Wodak 2007: 2). These differences can be understood in the broader social science debate of objectivism versus subjectivism or in an older philosophical distinction between theory (as contemplative attitude) and practice (as action-oriented position). CDA, drawing from Marx, Nietzsche, Heidegger, Horkheimer, Adorno, Foucault, and Habermas, claims that “every theory is determined by practical research goals” (Gilbert Weiss and Ruth Wodak 2007: 2).

Michel Foucault’s tools, in CDA, are used on both the epistemological level and the level of discourse theory and, particularly relevant to this study, his view on the role of religion in society. To understand Foucault’s view on the role of religion in society, it is essential to know three of his terms; Technologies of self, pastoral power and Governmentality. What Foucault means by “technologies of the self” “is techniques which permit individuals to perform, by their own means, a certain number of operations on their own bodies, on their own souls, on their own thoughts, on their own conduct, and this in such a way that they transform themselves, modify themselves, and reach a certain state of perfection, of happiness, of purity, of supernatural power, and so on’ (Foucault cited by Holland 2002: 81)

“Pastoral power” is a strand of power that the modern state employs. This strand of power is legitimated by the Christian metaphor of pastor. Foucault shows how the modern state employs it as means and justification for its involvement in the individual (Holland 2002; 88). Foucault sees the modern state fully functioning when the external power (pastoral power) is met by an internalizing of power by the subject (through the Christian version of technologies of self) in a state he calls “governmentality”(Golder 2009; 161). Foucault sees religion playing a crucial role in setting up foundations for technologies of domination (Golder 2009; 174). The practices of confession as inherited from Christianity tend to lead to self-destruction as opposed to self-autonomy (Holland, 2002; 82). They also lead to the binding of the self to the other in a permanent relationship; so in other words the technologies of the self, with the aid of religion, are turned into technologies of domination of the self(Golder 2009; 161). And the limitations of the state in its citizen and state relationships are overcome, with the aid of religion in its concept of pastoral relationship between the state and the subject (Golder 2009; 173).

However Foucault also sees in religion elements that can be used for resisting domination (Golder 2009;174). He points out that the practice of asceticism, the formation of communities, the cultivation of mysticism, a return to scripture, and an embrace of eschatology can be used as forms of resistance against governmentality (Golder 2009;174). In all the forms of resistance, Foucault sees it necessary to address the relationship of self to self. Foucault's insights will be employed in this study particularly in approaching Malawian masculinities as presented in the Nkhoma Synod and Norwegian Church Aid's documents regarding the MTM Campaign.

CDA ideological commitment is to transformation (Lewis-Beck et al., 2004:215). CDA assumes that discourse structures constitute social inequality and injustice and seeks to expose those "structures in both the production and reception of written, spoken, and/or visual text" (Littlejohn and Foss 2008:221). Rooted in its commitment is CDA's emphasis on the notions of ideology, power, hierarchy, gender and sociological variables in interpretation or explanation of text. Ideology is an important concept in CDA because it is through ideology that power and inequalities are maintained (2009:221). Ideology, as defined by J.B Thompson (1990), is social forms and processes within which, and by means of which, symbolic forms circulate in the social world (Gilbert Weiss and Ruth Wodak 2007: 14). For CDA, ideology is seen as an important means of establishing and maintaining unequal power relations (Gilbert Weiss and Ruth Wodak 2007: 14) and the meaning of texts are seen as being encoded by those in power. CDA aims at making the encoding process visible by asking whether texts serve powerful interests or structures of domination, by evaluating whether one representation or identity is selected or constructed in particular ways, and by asking who produces the representations and what their motivations might be (2009:221).

The collaborative project of Paul Baker, Costas Gabrielatos, Majid KhosraviNik, Michal Krzyzanowski, Tony McEnery and Ruth Wodak that examined discourses of refugees and asylum seekers in the UK press illustrates this principle well. The project aimed to examine the discursive presentation of refugees and asylum seekers, as well as immigrants and migrants in the British press over a ten-year period (1996-2005) (Baker et al., 2008:278). To achieve this aim, the team set up the following main research questions:

In what ways are Refugees and Asylum Seekers linguistically defined and constructed?

What are the frequent topics or issues discussed in articles relating to Refugees and Asylum Seekers?

What attitudes towards Refugees and Asylum Seekers emerge from the body of UK-based newspapers seen as a whole?

Are conventional distinctions between broadsheets and tabloids reflected in their stance towards (issues relating to) Refugees and Asylum Seekers? (Baker et al., 2008:278).

The project employed two analytical tools:

- i. Corpus linguistics.
- ii. Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA).

A corpus linguistics analysis was done on all 140 million words collected in the data. However, “the texts to be analysed by CDA techniques were selected from a pool of articles published in periods of increased references to Refugees and Asylum Seekers”

(Baker et al., 2008:285). Despite the magnitude of the media outlets and diversity in point of views represented in the data, a critical discourse analysis exposed three ideological biases that characterised the discourse. First, there was a portrayal of refugees and asylum seekers not as a heterogeneous set of people, but rather as an issue which was being debated between two political parties (2008:295).

Second, there was the de-emphasis on the ethicality of what was being debated and an emphasis placed on how the debate between the two main UK-based political parties could be won (2008:96). Third, there was a biased representation of what the researcher called “in-group members” 7 over the “out-group members” (2008:296).

The project employed two analytical tools:

- ii. Corpus linguistics.
- iii. Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA).

A corpus linguistics analysis was done on all 140 million words collected in the data. However, “the texts to be analysed by CDA techniques were selected from a pool of articles published in periods of increased references to Refugees and Asylum Seekers” (Baker et al., 2008:285). Despite the magnitude of the media outlets and diversity in point of views represented in the data, a critical discourse analysis exposed three ideological biases that characterised the discourse. First, there was a portrayal of refugees and asylum seekers not as a heterogeneous set of people, but rather as an issue which was being debated between two political parties (2008:295). Second, there was the de-emphasis on the ethicality of what was being debated and an emphasis placed on how the debate between the two main UK-based political parties could be won (2008:96). Third, there was a biased representation of what the researcher called “in-group members”⁷ over the “out-group members”⁸ (2008:296). The in-group members were prioritised in the representation, whether by being given more space or provided with direct quotations and hence portrayed as composed. The out-group members⁸ were given limited space and no direct quotations and hence portrayed as being inarticulate (2008:296). This research represents a critical discourse analysis (CDA) approach that emphasised on a broader social -political context.

One of the approaches that emphasises on a more specific social-political context is the Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis. Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis, as the name suggests, aims to bring a critical perspective on unequal gender relationships that are sustained through language usage (Lazar 2007:1). Michelle Lazar (2007:3-4), in the seminal book, *Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis: Gender, Power and Ideology in Discourse*, notes that there were two main reasons for the development of this focused research perspective. First, it was aimed at providing a critical feminist

⁷ People that held the same views as the media.

⁸ That is, people that held different views to the media.

view that was motivated by the need to change the existing conditions of gender relations. Second, it was aimed at researchers who shared a common feminist concern to come together in a shared forum. I will use Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) in general, but particularly employ Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis, to approach the Nkhoma Synod and Norwegian Church Aid's documents regarding the MTM Campaign so as to unmask the ideological discourse as relating to Malawian masculinities.

3.7. Chapter Summary

In summary the social concept of social capital, the redemptive concept of religious health assets and the action framework HIV competence church are relevant and useful in analysing faith based initiatives involved in HIV response. The concept of social capital provides a lens to view the resources that faith communities have in generating social change, the concept of religious health assets helps in identifying assets that faith communities have and the HIV competence church action framework provides a way of evaluating churches' response to the HIV epidemic. And the methodological tool of CDA, with its emphasis of how language and power, provides a critical and practical method of analysing documents. In the next chapter I will provide a history of the Nkhoma Synod in preparation for my critical discourse analysis of the documents related to the 'Man -to-Man' Campaign.

CHAPTER FOUR

THE NKHOMA SYNOD, NORWEGIAN CHURCH AID AND INTERNATIONAL AID

4.1. Introduction

The 'Man-to-Man' (MTM) campaign, which is part of the larger masculinity, alcohol, and HIV and AIDS project, is a result of the partnership between the Nkhoma Synod's Church and Society Programme and Norwegian Church Aid. In this chapter I will give the context of this partnership. I will do this by firstly providing a brief history of the Nkhoma Synod's engagement in the Malawian public life in general, and then focusing on its engagement with gender issues. I will then trace Norway's history of international aid to Africa; particularly focusing on the faith-based aspect of such interventions. Finally, I will outline the framework which Norwegian Church Aid used from 2011-onwards in determining which institutions it should partner with in its development work.

4.2. The History of the Nkhoma Synod in Malawian Public Life

The founding of the Nkhoma Synod can be traced back to Rev. Andrew Murray, a missionary commissioned by the Dutch Reformed Church (DRC) of South Africa (Phiri 2007:49). Murray established the first mission station in the central region of Malawi and named it Mvera station; this was later to become the headquarters of the Nkhoma Synod. The Nkhoma Synod existed in a relationship with the Livingstonia Synod (in the north) and Blantyre Synods (in the south). These three Presbyterian missions were established in Malawi (then Nyasaland) as a direct result of David Livingstone's appeal to the Senate House of Cambridge University, outlining Malawi's (then Nyasaland) potential for Christianity and commerce (Msangaambe 2011:46). In 1924, after a long period of discussion and organising, the Livingstonia and Blantyre Synod came together to formally constitute the Church of Central Africa

Presbyterian (CCAP) General Synod. Initially the Nkhoma Synod was reluctant to join this unification of churches and instead participated as a passive observer in its formation. Two years later however, the Nkhoma Synod joined the CCAP and cooperated with it in two main areas, namely, education and Bible translation (Zgamo 2011:37).

4.2.1. The Nkhoma Synod and Education

The voice of the Nkhoma Synod in shaping education policy in Malawi differed from the other CCAP Synods in three main ways. The first point of difference was the basic educational philosophy that motivated their education project. Lamba (1984:377) noted how the Livingstonia Synod's "liberal, social and political" view of education was significantly different from the Nkhoma Synod. The Nkhoma Synod "strongly believed and echoed" apartheid South Africa's education policy and translated it into their administration of village schools (Lamba 1984:378). Village schools under the Nkhoma Synod administration excluded the teaching of the English language which was resented by many Malawians, who viewed the English language as the gateway to social and economic success (1984:378). The Nkhoma Synod's aim was that of the low-level mass education of Malawians who in turn would supply the growing demand for cheap labour (1984:379). Apart from pointing out the inherent racism in the Nkhoma Synod's education policy, Lamba also notes its failure at a practical level. He pointed out that the new class of semi-skilled Africans in a rural environment with no capital failed to establish themselves or gain any meaningful influence among the villagers (1984:379). On the other hand, the Livingstonia Synod's approach to education, which was characterised by teachers' councils which participated in policy decisions was successful in nurturing African leaders.

The second point of difference, with other CCAP Synods and the Livingstonia Synod, was the educating of girl children. The Nkhoma Synod considered girls' education of secondary importance and only aimed to "meet a demand for Christian wives for church leaders and teachers" (Lamba 1984:384). This view led inevitably to the prioritising of boys' education and its outright refusal of a co-educational approach (1984:385).

The third point of difference was the envisioned goal of education. Mhango (2004:49) notes how the Nkhoma Synod primarily set out to “train natives for life in their own villages” and thus emphasised agriculture and village industries. The Livingstonia Synod, together with the other CCAP Synods aimed instead to educate “the child in such a way as to finally reach the whole nation” (1984:378) and hence placed an emphasis on teaching the English language which, according to Lamba (1984:378), many Africans saw as the gateway to social and economic success.

4.2.2. The Nkhoma Synod and Politics

The Nkhoma Synod under the Banda regime was noted for its “apolitical stance” and its close relationship with Kamuzu Banda (Brown 2005:226). In surveying the Nkhoma Synod’s church and State relations, Brown (2005:220 -240) identifies three main instances which illustrate the church and State interaction through the political collusion that characterised the Nkhoma Synod in this period.

The first instance concerns a memorandum drafted to address the transition from the administration of Dutch Reformed Church Mission to that of the Nkhoma Synod. The memorandum opened by addressing Kamuzu Banda in the following way: “The right honourable, the first prime minister of Malawi, the life president of the Malawi Congress Party and the founder of Malawi nation.” Despite the wide criticism of Banda’s despotic administration, the church memorandum went on to point out that, “the Nkhoma Synod fully accepts...[Kamuzu Banda’s]...genuine leadership and remembers with gratitude the peaceful way in which [Kamuzu banda] brought the Malawian people from colonial rule to a state of self-government and independence” (Brown 2005:222). In this memorandum, the Nkhoma Synod, apart from its enthusiasm to legitimate Banda’s hold on power, insinuates a position of unquestioning loyalty to the Banda regime that was to be expected from all its ministers.

The second instance that illustrates the Nkhoma Synod’s church and state interaction was the 1981 General Secretary’s report. This report described the relationship between the Nkhoma Synod and Banda’s regime as one of “good co-operation” and

reported “receiving advice and instructions” from government officials as proof that Banda’s regime was “a democratic government indeed” (Brown 2005:226). The rhetoric in these two documents illustrate how the Nkhoma Synod colluded with the Banda regime in presenting to the public a state of affairs that had little to do with the realities on the ground. In my view, Malawi was far from democratic under the Banda regime. The exiling of dissenting ministers in 1964 illustrates this point well.

Democratic transformation in the form of Malawian multiparty politics was only to take place much later following the 1992 referendum.

The 1992 Referendum was sparked by the Pastoral Letter entitled “Living Our Faith” and was issued by the Roman Catholic Bishops of Malawi in 1992 (Ross 1996:22). It has been argued that this document was central in bringing a sense of accountability into Malawian public life (1996:22). In this letter, the Roman Catholic Bishops addressed the structural flaws of the public administration under Banda’s regime (1996:25).

The Synods of the Church of Central Africa Presbyterian (excluding the Nkhoma Synod) also presented an open letter to President Banda which insisted that the Government address the issues raised in the Roman Catholic Bishops’ Pastoral Letter (Ross 1996:29). By doing so, the Nkhoma Synod distanced itself from the Pastoral Letter. Brown (2005:234) notes how the Nkhoma Synod’s response to the Pastoral Letter was out of sync with most ecumenical organisations in Malawi of the day. When the faculty of Zomba Theological College informed and advised the Nkhoma Synod to support the 1992 Pastoral Letter, the Nkhoma Synod went against this advice (Brown 2005:234). Later that same year, the Christian Council of Malawi (currently, the Malawi Council of Churches) suspended the membership of the Nkhoma Synod on the grounds of the Synod’s reluctance to take a multi-party democratic stance (2005:234). The Nkhoma Synod’s resistance to the wave of change softened after President Banda’s regime had agreed to a referendum (2005:234). The Synod, in a press release responded to the announcement of the date for the referendum by declaring that although “other Churches and Church representatives” had chosen to speak, the Nkhoma Synod “will remain silent on the issue” (2005:236).

Under the subsequent democratic dispensation, the Nkhoma Synod developed a more critical stance concerning public matters. In 1998, it issued its first Pastoral Letter, citing corruption, tribalism and poverty as issues to be addressed by the new government (Brown 2005:237). In 2003, it was part of a movement to stop the late President Bakili Muluzi from amending the Malawian constitution in a way that would allow him to stand for more than two terms.

While one can see in the Nkhoma Synod a significant change in attitude in issues of politics, they have maintained a generally conservative position. This too has been the case around issues of gender.

4.2.3. The Nkhoma Synod and Gender

The Nkhoma Synod, like its mother church, the Dutch Reformed Church, has embodied and maintained a patriarchal leadership system. Jurgens H. Hendriks (2012), in his article, "Networking theological education in Africa," has pointed out that the Nkhoma Synod was the last among the Protestant/Reformed churches in sub-Saharan Africa to admit women as deacons. He also noted that the Nkhoma Synod did not allow the ordination of women (Hendriks 2012:126). This gender bias can be traced back to the establishment of the Nkhoma Synod in the central region of Malawi among the Chewa people.

In her book, *Women, Presbyterianism and Patriarchy: Religious experience of Chewa women in Central Malawi*, Isabel Apawo Phiri (2007:44) has argued that the Nkhoma Synod's strong patriarchal leadership system overlooked the indigenous matrilineal system that the people of the central region mainly practiced. This was a system that grants women more space and opportunity for leadership.

The Chewa people, being the largest ethnic group in Malawi, follow a matrilineal culture (Phiri 1983:257). Kings Phiri (1983:257) has further argued that although it had been affected by the slave trade, interaction with patrilineal groups, together with the coming of Christianity and adaptation towards a capitalistic economy, caused the Chewa people to give considerable consideration to the rights of the

women(1983:257)¹. According to Kings Phiri (1983:258), this was achieved by uxori-locality (i.e., the husband living with his wife's relations) and the avunculate practice (i.e., the exercise of domestic authority by the wife's brother). While the Chewa matrilineal practices had interacted with other patrilineal systems before, and had to readjust their system in the light of invasions, the slave trade, and colonialism, their interactions with the Nkhoma Synod posed a more serious threat to their traditions and practices (1983:267).

Hawkins Gondwe, in his MA dissertation entitled, "The Possible Influence of Crucial Pauline Texts on the Role of Women in the Nkhoma Synod of The Central African Presbyterian Church" points out that the Dutch Reformed missionaries regarded the Chewa culture as, "fully erroneous and barbaric and they were determined to replace it with the Christian culture" (Gondwe 2009:56). They did this through education, socialisation and the discontinuation of the Chewa cultus. The Chewa cultus provided women with privileged positions in their religious hierarchy, whereas the discontinuation of the cultus affected women leadership greatly (2009:57). Isabel Phiri (2007:44) has argued that the Nkhoma Synod emphasised a patriarchal theology that privileged the headship of men over women and consequently reduced women's influence among the Chewa people.

Given that the Nkhoma Synod's continuing reluctance to implement fundamental gender reforms, it must be noted that the Synod's attitude towards women has not significantly changed over the years. This is in spite of its interaction with local and international organisations that emphasise gender justice. Specific to this study is the Nkhoma Synod's interaction with organisations under the Norwegian Agency for International Development (NORAD), and particularly that of the Norwegian Church Aid, with which the Nkhoma Synod partners in the 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV & AIDS in Malawi' project. Norwegian Church Aid's focus on gender justice in its partnership framework and the history of Norwegian faith-based international aid in Africa is a subject worth exploring.

¹ The right of the woman even in marriage to remain united with her own kinspeople and to control, with their help, the offspring of her marriage. The woman is supposed to remain united with her brothers and sisters, and together they retain right of possession over their children.

4.3. Norwegian Faith-based International Aid in Malawi

Jarle Simensen, in his article "Religious NGOs and the Politics of International Aid," notes how Norway provides a unique history in international relations. Because it was not directly involved in the colonial project, Norway's first contact with other continents of the world only came about in the nineteenth -century in the form of missionary activities (Simensen 2006:85). Simensen (2006:85) considers Norway's missionary activities successful on two main grounds: By the 1950s, the local churches that had been founded by the Norwegian missionaries had transformed into self-governing bodies. Secondly, they represented the largest and most developed organisation in the host country (2006:85).

In 1962, during the period of decolonisation, the Norwegian Agency for International Development was founded (NORAD) (Simensen 2006:86). Decolonisation translated into the missionary context came with a general resentment against the "old -style missionary set-up" (2006:87). The financial aid from NORAD gave an enthusiasm and motivation for new possibilities of supporting and collaborating with the then independent African churches (2006:87).

In 1973, after long disagreements on practicalities between missionaries and NORAD, an agreement was reached at the Consultation on Mission and Development Aid (Simensen 2006:88). What came out of this consultation was an emphasis on neutrality and social development. The Consultation's declaration stated that, "there must be no discrimination on ideological grounds among recipients of aid coming from NORAD" and that priority had to be given to churches that aimed for "social development and the improvement of living conditions" (2006:88). The debate at the Consultation and its subsequent resolution reflects the prominence of missionary societies in the early period of NORAD. By 1985, this prominence had ended and five organisations, namely, Norwegian Red Cross, Norwegian Church Aid, Norwegian People's Aid, Norwegian Save the Children and Norwegian Refugee Council, came to replace mission societies (2006:89). Among these five organisations, Norwegian Church Aid is the sole faith-based organisation.

Norwegian church Aid defines itself as an ecumenical and humanitarian organisation mandated by its member churches and Christian organisations in Norway to work for a just world by both empowering the poor and challenging the wealthy and powerful (NCA Global Strategy 2011-2015:12). Its belief that all humankind is created by God with the same inalienable dignity and with fundamental rights and duties has informed its approach to development (2011-2015:12). Norwegian Church Aid uses a right-based approach² in long term development, advocacy and emergency preparedness and response (2011-2015:12). Malawi has benefitted greatly from Norwegian international aid, both in its work and partnership with Norwegian Church Aid.

4.3.1. Norwegian Church Aid's Framework for Partnership

Norwegian Church Aid, in its international activities, prefers to work with local and national partners (NCA Global Strategy 2011-2015:24). There are two rationales for this approach:

- i. Norwegian Church Aid ensures the local ownership of the administered project.
- ii. Norwegian Church Aid helps in the strengthening of national civil society .

Norwegian Church Aid places its partners in four categories:

- i. Core partners;
- ii. Programme support;
- iii. Resource organisations;
- iv. Strategic alliances (NCA Global Strategy 2011-2015:24).

² A right-based approach can be noted by its emphasis on treating human rights as a normative framework for development (Cornwall and Musembi 2004:1416). I will reflect more on this approach in the concluding chapter

The core partners are Norwegian Church Aid's main link to local communities and national authorities. These relationships are in principle holistic and comprehensive where "any issue can be discussed" (NCA Global Strategy 2011 -2015:25). To ensure this, Norwegian Church Aid has set up five important criteria for choosing core partners:

- i. Legitimacy in local and national contexts;
- ii. Rootedness;
- iii. Ability to organise development work in close dialogue with local communities;
- iv. Be part of national or regional networks and alliances;
- v. An ability to work with an integrated approach (2011 -2015: 25).

Because of its relationships, Norwegian Church Aid has access to global, regional and local networks of faith-based actors³ (NCA Global Strategy 2011-2015:25). These faith-based actors become Norwegian Church Aid's natural core partners in the local contexts (2011-2015:25). Some core partners are identified as lacking the capacity to undertake advocacy work and a rights-based approach to development. Norwegian Church Aid therefore enumerates three core areas where capacity can be built:

- i. Human capacity;
- ii. Relationship capacity;
- iii. Resource capacity (NCA Global Strategy 2011-2015:25).

³ Norwegian Church Aid understands faith-based actors as groups, institutions and organisations that draw inspiration and guidance from a given religious tradition, such as Christianity, Hinduism, Judaism, Buddhism or Islam. These may be congregations, religious leaders, faith-based humanitarian agencies or faith-based development organisations or organisations involved in social service delivery and advocacy (NCA Global Strategy 2011-2015:25).

First, human capacity entails the building of skills in carrying out local context analysis, local negotiations and local mobilisation (2015:25). Second, relationship capacity means the capitalising on the shared belief systems, developing networks and finding means of sharing information (2011-2015:25). Third, resource capacity refers to both tangible ⁴ and intangible ⁵ dimensions of resources (2011-2015:25).

The programme support partnership involves Norwegian Church Aid offering support in the form of funding, technical expertise or professional exchanges. This support is meant to address particular areas of development work under a given theme ⁶ (NCA Global Strategy 2011-2015:25). The resource organisation partnership involves Norwegian Church Aid using its relationships with specialised professional organisations and institutions in relevant fields to strengthen the impact on prioritised programmes (2011-2015:5). This type of relationship is narrow and focused and “often revolves around negotiation on discrete projects” ⁷ (2011-2015:25).

The fourth type of partnership is the strategic alliance partnership. In this partnership, Norwegian church Aid forms strategic alliances with organisations that are able to work for a just world beyond the national level. A good example of this is Norwegian Church aid’s partnership with ACT Alliance. ⁸ In all of these forms of partnership, Norwegian Church Aid takes on five distinctive roles:

- i. Facilitator;
- ii. Accompanier;
- iii. Funder;
- iv. Broker;

⁴ E.g., in money and buildings.

⁵ E.g., time

⁶The cited example is the support given to a women’s organisation in a project to enhance the participation of women in local elections (NCA Global Strategy 2011 -2015:25).

⁷The ‘discrete projects’ may include fine detail of design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation (NCA Global Strategy 2011-2015:25).

⁸The ACT Development Alliance (Action by Churches Together for Development) is a global alliance of churches and related organisations, including the World Council of Churches, the Lutheran World Federation and the like, focusing on long-term development and humanitarian assistance.

v. Challenger (2011-2015:26).

Because of its faith-based nature and its recognition of the social and moral capital that religion holds, Norwegian Church Aid prioritises faith-based actors in partnerships (NCA Global Strategy 2011-2015:26). Faith-based actors in many regions of the world are a source of power and life in achieving positive change and it is for this reason that Norwegian Church Aid views partnership with them as an important comparative advantage in furthering development (2011-2015:27). That said, Norwegian church Aid, within its partnership framework, is aware of the patriarchal and hierarchical structuring of many faith-based institutions and hence expresses an intention to challenge such institutions (2011-2015:27). Norwegian Church Aid (NCA), in its general programmes, partners with a number of faith-based institutions in over fifty different countries. In its HIV and AIDS programmes its primary focus is on eight particular countries. Malawi is one of the eight countries targeted in Norwegian Church Aid's HIV and AIDS programmes and the Nkhoma Synod is one of its local partners.

4.4. Chapter Summary

In summary, the history of Nkhoma Synod's engagement in the public life in Malawi and its stance towards gender issues, which I have outlined in this chapter, significantly differs from Norwegian Church Aid's history and stance on gender issues. Norwegian Church Aid's framework that it uses to determine which institutions it should partnership has a progressive stance in gender issues while the Nkhoma Synod's history and practice shows a conservative stance in gender issues.

In the next Chapter I will observe how the Norwegian Church Aid and the Nkhoma Synod partnership plays out through a close reading of the founding documents and the subsequent correspondence documents and critically analyse these documents to understand the theological and development discourses about masculinity and HIV in the central Malawian region.

CHAPTER FIVE

CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF THE POLICY, PROGRAMME AND CAMPAIGN DOCUMENT OF THE MAN-TO-MAN (MTM) CAMPAIGN

5.1. Introduction

The 'Man-to-Man' (MTM) Campaign is a collaborative initiative that mainly involves three organisations, namely, the Nkhoma Synod, Church and Society Department, Norwegian Church Aid (NCA) and Norwegian Campaign for Development and Solidarity (FORUT).

In this chapter, I will analyse three official documents relating to the MTM Campaign:

- i. The published study that was conducted in preparation for the MTM Campaign.
- ii. The Nkhoma Synod's Church and Society Project Proposal to Norwegian Church Aid.
- iii. The Nkhoma Synod Church and Society Progress Report to Norwegian Church Aid.

These three documents have been selected because they represent three significant points in the development of the MTM Campaign and are representative of the progress of the official rhetoric surrounding campaign. These documents will be critically read to ascertain the particular theological and development concerns that informed the establishment of this campaign. The proposed reading of these documents and record is based on the conviction that all texts have hidden within them the ideological and philosophical assumptions of its authors. As Jacques Derrida

(1998:15), has argued, all texts contain logic that is determined and not fundamental and that this determined logic when deconstructed reveals the author's ideological biases. I will employ the tools of CDA in my analysis in order to explore the power relations and ideological biases that construct the discourse found in them. I will do this by identifying and analysing the discourse found in these documents.

5.2. The Pre-'Man-to-Man' (MTM) Campaign Study

Realising that there is a knowledge gap in the link between masculinity, alcohol and HIV and AIDS in Malawi, the Norwegian Church Aid (NCA) in collaboration with the Norwegian Campaign for Development and Solidarity (FORUT) funded a study that would investigate this linkage (Kirkens Nødhjelp 2011:3). The study was carried out between August and September 2008 by the Millennium Centre for Research and Development across nine districts in Malawi (two of these districts being in the central region of Malawi). The purpose of the study was to collect data and critically analyse it so that it would serve as a planning tool for guiding Norwegian Church Aid (NCA) and its local partners in designing and implementing effective programmes in the area of men's behaviour change. This was in light of the consensus between scholars and practitioners on the critical role men play in determining the course of the HIV epidemic in Sub Saharan Africa (2011:3). This study was later published under the Kachere Series in 2011 in Zomba, Malawi.

In the publication that followed the study, "The Link between Masculinity, Alcohol, and HIV/AIDS in Malawi", I note two categories of discourse relating to masculinities and HIV in Malawi:

- i. An androcentric discourse¹
- ii. A conservative discourse²

¹ I have categorised any discourse that places male human beings at the centre of presenting and interpreting the findings of the Pre-'Man-to-Man' Campaign study

² I have categorised any discourse that displays, in the presenting and interpreting the findings of the pre-'Man-to-Man' Campaign study, an understanding of gender roles in a traditional way

In the androcentric discourses category there are two main approaches (whether wittingly or unwittingly) that display a sexist bias, and in the conservative discourse there are also two approaches to gender that display a view that legitimates the status quo regarding gender relations in Malawi.

5.2.1. Androcentric Discourses

The pre-Man-to-Man campaign³ study collected data that would aid the design of programmes that would challenge negative masculinities and construct positive masculinities in the context of HIV and AIDS and which appear to display a static view of masculinities. This can be seen from the two competing perspectives to masculinity attended to within the text:

- i. An essentialist perspective.
- ii. A seduction perspective.

In the essentialist perspective, the author of the study appears sympathetic to an understanding of masculinity in essentialist terms. It must be noted that while the initiator/facilitator⁴ of the study, the team leader⁵ of the study and the editor⁶ of the publication are named in the publication of the study, the author is not identified.

Excerpt #1

Masculinity has its roots seemingly in genetics, but is in reality a social construct. Perceptions of masculinity differ from culture to culture, but there are common aspects to its definitions across cultures. Janet Saltzman Chafetz points out seven fundamental characteristics. (1) A “real man” must be physically strong, athletic and brave. (2) Functionally he is the breadwinner and the provider for the family. (3) Sexually, masculinity defined by aggressiveness and much experience. (4) Emotionally, he does not show feelings, “real men don’t cry.” (5) In intellectual terms, a masculine man is rational, logical and objective. (6) In interpersonal relationships he is a demanding leader dominant

³ “The Link between Masculinity, Alcohol, and HIV/AIDS in Malawi.”

⁴ Gerard Chigona

⁵David Mkwambisi

⁶Klaus Fiedler

and independent. (7) Finally, he is ambitious, success oriented, proud, egotistical, reliable and adventurous (Kirkens Nødhjelp 2011:10).

In this first excerpt, the author appears to be sympathetic to essentialist conceptions of masculinity. Although the author introduces masculinity as being a social construct, the poor use of Janet Saltzman Chafetz, a sociologist and gender theorist who is widely recognised for her scientific explanation of gender stratification, displays sympathy to essentialist conceptions of masculinity. This can also be seen in the next excerpt.

Excerpt #2

It is generally accepted that since masculinity is a social construct with different societal perceptions, most men feel pressured to act masculine. Therefore men who want to be “masculine” feel that they have to prevail in situations that require physical strength and fitness. To appear weak, emotional, or sexually inefficient is a major threat to their self-esteem. To be content, these men must feel that they are decisive and self-assured, and rational. Masculine gender roles stress may develop if a man feels that he has acted “unmanly.” Conversely, acting ‘manly’ among peers will often result in increased social validation or general competitive advantage (Kirkens Nødhjelp 2011:11).

In this second excerpt, the author of the text continues to display a sympathy to an essentialist understanding of the concept of masculinity. The author begins by acknowledging the scholarly consensus on the socially constructed nature of masculinity, but then proceeds to exhibit an essentialist understanding. The usage of the term ‘masculine’ in the text is never qualified with an allocation of its particular social context and thus leaves an understanding of the term as though it is universally applicable. This displays a sympathy to an essentialist understanding of the concept of masculinity that views characteristics attributed to masculinity as being natural and universal as opposed to being constructed and particular. This conception of masculinities can also be clearly seen in the next excerpt:

Excerpt #3

The Wikipedia defines Masculinity as “manly character.” Masculinity specifically describes men; that is, it is personal and human, unlike male which can also be used to describe animals, or masculine which can even be used to describe noun classes. Masculinity brings social

status, just like wealth, race and social class. In western culture, for example, greater masculinity usually brings greater social status. An association with physical and/or moral strength is implied. Masculinity is a characteristic of gender, not sex. Masculinity is complex owing to its multidimensional nature; personality traits, physical appearance, role behaviours, and how these relate to each other—all these make up masculinity. The understanding of masculinity may differ between groups of people and within one group, and is transmitted through the process of cultural socialisation.

Men are by instinct aware of masculinity and therefore would like to fit into the picture, using the “coping with peer pressure strategy.” It is socially desirable for men to believe they are masculine, regardless of whether it is true by some objective standard or not. Otherwise, men fear damaging their self-esteem should they feel a lack of masculinity (Kirkens Nødhjelp 2011:38).

Apart from displaying an uncritical approach to scholarship exhibited by the reference to a dubious on-line source such as Wikipedia, the author continues to display an essentialist understanding of the concept of masculinity. This can be seen in the author’s particular usage of a comparative adjective to qualify masculinity. Here I am referring to the author’s use of the adjective ‘greater’ to qualify masculinity. The author’s essentialist understanding of the concept of masculinity can also be seen in the reference of men (and how they relate to masculinity) without situating it in any particular context. This omission in detail betrays an assumption that all men (despite their historical, social, political and geographical context) act in the same way. This view is in keeping with an essentialist understanding of the concept of masculinity.

The study’s essentialist orientation can further be seen in the next excerpt with its implication that there are culturally fixed ways in which Malawian men understand and express their masculinity:

Excerpt #4

Masculinity and HIV and AIDS are closely linked through men’s superiority in decision power even over sex and the male cultural freedom to have several partners. Some harmful practices also perpetrate irresponsible masculinity that promotes the spread of HIV and AIDS. Beer drinking associated with masculinity brings men and commercial sex workers together resulting in irresponsible and unprotected sex, a swift vehicle for the spread of HIV and AIDS (Kirkens Nødhjelp 2011:62).

In trying to establish the reason for the linkage between masculinity and HIV and AIDS, the author identifies “men’s superiority in decision power” and further essentialises cultural practices, such as polygamy and beer drinking, as necessarily negative and fixed. The correlations between the local expressions of masculinity and HIV and AIDS are not adequately problematised, thus fixing all Malawian masculinities as a threat to healthy social relations. The author does not qualify whether this “superiority in decision power” of men is perceived or socially constructed and thus places it in an essentialist interpretation.

The second perspective that is evident from within the androcentric discourse is the focus on the idea of seduction. In this perspective, men are seen as being the unwitting victims of women’s seductive practices especially in the context of sexual transactions. The author of “The Link between Masculinity, Alcohol, and HIV/AIDS in Malawi” constructs this discourse in several places:

Excerpt #5

Commercial sex workers are aware of the fact that men naturally display masculinity attributes, which sex workers take advantage of in order to earn money from the men. For example, men may want to enhance their masculinity by making women submissive to them during sex. Sex workers appear to respond deliberately to men’s gestures of masculinity. In fact, to be an effective commercial sex worker one needs to be sensitive to masculine attributes of men for proper response to or manipulation of the man. This study suggests that “masculinity” is often linked to the ability of having multiple partners, imbibe alcohol and engage in promiscuous behaviour. Men, therefore, become ‘the catch’ for the commercial sex workers (Kirkens Nødhjelp 2011:39).

In this fifth excerpt, the author, by the usage of phrases and words such as, ‘take advantage of,’ ‘deliberately,’ ‘manipulates’ and ‘catch’ absolves men of their agency and conscious participation in the transaction. Additionally, female sex-workers are presented as being the pro-active agents of the transaction and hence bear the responsibility of the result of it. Women are thus presented as acting either in silence or as source of social denigration and the corrupters of men’s masculinity. A similar construction can be seen in the next excerpt about sex-workers:

Excerpt #6

They also strongly felt that men who earn more money are tempted to spend it with sexual partners (20%). Men are even willing to pay for unprotected sex (10.3%). All because they do not feel satisfied when, for example, they use condoms. In fact, from their experience, it is not strange for men to insist on unsafe sex (6.9%). Female commercial sex workers are attracted by handsome men; therefore they entice them to have sex (10.3%) (Kirkens Nødhjelp 2011:57).

In this excerpt, the author notes the purchasing power and demand of particular Services⁷ that men hold in the transaction of sex. However, in the last sentence there is again the suggestion that women's practices of seduction is widely prevalent. This can be seen in two ways:

- i. By constructing men as objects of desire.
- ii. The usage of the word 'entice' as related to the deliberate action of a sex-worker⁸.

Excerpt #7

Another linkage is rather indirect; whereby men are expected to drink beer and when drunk they lose their sense of judgment which exposes them to other women and unprotected sex. Female commercial sex workers who are infected can even abuse them. Alcohol increases vulnerability in men (Kirkens Nødhjelp 2011:60).

In the above excerpt, the author's usage of words, 'exposes,' 'abuse,' and 'vulnerability,' are used in connection to the position of men in the transaction and portrays them as victims who are likely to be 'infected' villainous by sex-workers. A critical reading of the author's seduction thesis presents men as innocent victims whose masculinity is doubly corrupted by mind-numbing alcohol and sexually-seductive women. This idea is more evident in the next excerpt:

Excerpt #8

Indeed, women can go a long way to "catch their prey." A careful analysis of the observations made during interviews with female

⁷ Unprotected sex in particular

⁸ The seduction perspective can also be seen in the next excerpt.

commercial sex workers reveals something cunning about “symbols of innocence” used to beguile and subdue the prey (Kirkens Nødhjelp 2011:78).

In this excerpt, the author uses words such as, ‘cunning,’ ‘beguile’ and ‘subdues’ in reference to the action of sex-workers and uses the word ‘prey’ in reference to men involved in the transaction of sex. These words present a seduction perspective that absolves men of agency and thus renders them as innocent. The study not only reflects an understanding of men in mostly essential terms, but also represents a contradiction to the initial essentialism, which depicts men as the seduced victims of manipulative women—a predicament, supposedly, made all the more likely by the consumption of alcohol! This study did not present Malawian men’s masculinities simply as ambivalent, constructed, fluid and at times problematic. Instead, the author frames local men’s masculinities as being fixed in particular local forms and in need of reform.

5.2.2. Conservative Theological and Linguistic Discourse

The study, although intended to collect data that would aid FBO to design and implement transformative programmes in the context of HIV in Malawi, instead reveals a non-transformative view. This view can be seen in its use of two conservative approaches:

- i. It limits the role of the churches.
- ii. It uses inappropriate language for HIV and AIDS.

These two approaches are conservative in how:

- i. They desire to conserve a traditional understanding of the role of churches in the public sphere.
- ii. They display a usage of HIV and AIDS language that is not in keeping with the current re-evaluation of HIV and AIDS terminology.

The limiting of the churches role in the public sphere can be seen in how the author of the “The Links between Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV/AIDS in Malawi” prescribes particular roles for churches, FBOs, and other religious institutions. In the author’s reflections and recommendations, one can see a limiting of religious institutions to not only the preaching of abstinence but also prohibiting the promotion of safe sex through condom use. Significantly, this attitude seems to dismiss local knowledge and it fails to take seriously the development of local theological responses to local public health conditions. This can be seen in the following excerpt where the author is making a direct recommendation to religious institutions:

Excerpt #9

Preach more on abstinence and faithfulness than on condom use. It seems condoms are encouraging sex among both the youth and the old (Kirkens Nødhjelp 2011:64).

In this above excerpt one can see how the author is presenting a perspective that limits religious institutions in action and content. The actions of the religious institutions are not only limited to preaching, but also the content of their homilies is limited to abstinence and faithfulness. This conservative view of the role of religion in public health can also be seen in the next excerpt:

Excerpt #10

The Church should take a leading role in spreading HIV messages by among other things integrating HIV messages in their sermons and homilies (Kirkens Nødhjelp 2011:100).

Again in the above excerpt, the author recommends limited action to religious institutions. This is consistent with the view held of religious institutions that their role in public health is limited and conservative as opposed to being holistic and progressive.

The second approach is what I refer to as conservative linguistics, and concerns the situating of HIV and AIDS within an inappropriate language discourse. Despite the fact that UNAIDS has freely made available guidelines for terminologies for researchers and organisations working in the global response to HIV, the author uses terms which are patently inappropriate. The UNAIDS guidelines were drafted as a

result of the belief that language shapes beliefs and influences behaviour, and for our purpose, the language of the author can expose her/his biases. The UNAIDS guidelines lists terms to be avoided in formal documents on the basis of their redundancy or more seriously on their stigmatising effect. Despite this widespread practice, the author of “The Links between Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV/AIDS in Malawi” constantly uses those terms that are listed as to be avoided.

Significantly, in the title, “The Links between Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV/AIDS in Malawi,” the author uses the term HIV/AIDS as opposed to HIV and AIDS.

According to the UNAIDS guideline, this combination of terms is at best confusing and at worse stigmatising. This is because HIV is a virus and AIDS is a clinical syndrome, but even more significantly, most people with HIV do not have AIDS and the author fails to appreciate or clarify this distinction. Although the two terms relate, the combining of the terms with a forward slash constructs a discourse that might stigmatise those who have HIV.

The other term which the author uses throughout the study is ‘fighting.’ This is used in relation to HIV (i.e., ‘fighting against HIV’). The UNAIDS guidelines cautions writers and researchers against the usage of combat language in relation to HIV and AIDS on the basis that the fight against HIV might transfer to the fight against people living with HIV. This I believe reveals a conservative fault-line in the authors thinking.

Lastly, the author constantly uses the term ‘commercial sex-worker’—this term is at best a tautology and at worst is stigmatising. Similar to the other terms cited above, the UNAIDS guidelines suggests dropping the ‘commercial’ and just using ‘sex-worker’ so as to limit the stigmatising association. By saying of the same thing twice, whether wittingly or unwittingly, has an emphasising effect—in this case, the transacting of sex for money. Tautologies are devices of rhetoric that provoke a response and in this case it might be one of stigma. In the context of HIV and AIDS, such inappropriate language is problematic and is likely to lead to stigmatisation of particular groups of people.

The study was firstly submitted to Kari Øyen, the Country Representative of Norwegian Church Aid Malawi programme, and Dag Endal, Project Coordinator at the Norwegian Campaign for Development and Solidarity (FORUT) and later published (2011) in the Kachere Series in Zomba, Malawi. It was intended to provide information, give insight and inspire future projects concerned with transforming Malawian masculinities in the context of the HIV epidemic. In spite of its uncritical approach to Malawian masculinities and its limited view of the role of FBOs in public health, the study emerged as decisive in shaping the direction and character of the Norwegian church Aid (NCA) and its partnership with the Nkhoma Synod's Department of Church and Society in response to negative masculinities in the context of the HIV epidemic.

5.3. The Nkhoma Synod Church and Society Department's 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS Proposal'

On the 15 December 2011, following the findings of "The Links between Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV/AIDS in Malawi," the Nkhoma Synod's Department of Church and Society submitted its "Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS" proposal to Norwegian Church Aid. The Nkhoma Synod's Department of Church and Society proposed the scaling up of its 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' project⁹ from its initial awareness-raising focus to a more concrete involvement of key institutions that they regarded as central to the reconstruction of Masculinity. In the proposal, the Nkhoma Synod's Department of Church and Society expressed its intention to pose a heightened challenge to institutional structures such as the church, schools, theological schools and madrassahs, the chieftaincy and institutions at the core of the rites of passage that shape masculinities in central Malawi. This was based on the assumption that these institutions were central to the socialisation of boys and men in the region. To achieve this the Nkhoma Synod's Department of Church and Society isolated four particular strategies for the next phase in its intervention:

⁹ The 'Man-to-Man' campaign is under this project

- i. Developing explicit forums that promote the discussion of manhood/masculinities;
- ii. Mobilising communities around the vulnerabilities of males;
- iii. Building broader alliances amongst the custodians of culture;
- iv. Documenting positive elements of masculinities that already exist in the culture.

Unlike the published study, “The Links between Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV/AIDS in Malawi”, this document displayed a more nuanced understanding of the concept of masculinity and, on a whole, presents a critical and progressive discourse. However, the Nkhoma Synod’s Department of Church and Society proposal revealed a less progressive attitude towards the indigenous culture. This can be seen in the excerpt below where the drafter of the report referred to traditional rites of passages performed by different indigenous groups in Malawi in essentially negative terms:

Excerpt #1

These rites are particularly important in creating male identities of which the school, the church and other institutions are sometimes unable to erase, since these rites serve as a locus of social control to guide the young male from the transition from childhood to manhood, including reinforcing one’s tribal identity as a Chewa, Tumbuka, Yao, and Ngoni etc. (p. 8).

The above excerpt constructed a discourse similar to that of the Dutch Reformed missionaries, whereby the indigenous practices of the Chewa people were viewed as being at odds with Christian faith and practice (Gondwe 2009:56). The idea of ‘erasure’ in reference to the knowledge acquired by boys and men through the indigenous rites of passage reveals two presuppositions:

- i. That schools, churches and other institutions not only have the ability to ‘erase’ forms of knowledge but that they are custodial institutions of civility.

- ii. That indigenous knowledge gained through these rites should be wholly done away with because it upholds a form of masculinity that leads to social degeneracy.

These presuppositions are consistent with the education policy of the Nkhoma Synod inaugurated during the colonial period (Gondwe 2009:56)¹⁰.

The Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV and AIDS Proposal was accepted and funded by the Norwegian Church Aid (NCA). It commenced in the 2012 and by the September a progress report was issued.

5.4. The Nkhoma Synod's Church and Society Progress Report

In September 2012 (i.e., one year later), the Nkhoma Synod's Department of Church and Society published a report to Norwegian Church Aid (NCA). This report covered all activities of the 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' project in the preceding twelve months. I am particularly concerned with the assessment and reflection the report offers on its engagement with church leadership and will reflect on it below.

The progressive attitude of "heighted challenge to institutional structures of the Church" that was found in the proposal¹¹ is replaced within a cautious attitude of reinforcement of the clergy's role in gender issues. This can be seen in the objectives of a clergy conference on reconstructing masculinity:

Excerpt #1

- To reinforce the clergy role in reconstructing Masculinity and Femininity.
- To identify opportunities for discussing gaps in catechisms and doctrines in order to improve processes leading to the reconstruction of masculinity and femininity.
- To accentuate the clergy role in mitigation of the socio-cultural impact of HIV/AIDS.

¹⁰The education policy of the Nkhoma Synod was discussed in chapter one.

¹¹See above section.

- To highlight the benefits of networking among religious leaders (Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS Project Progress Report, September 2012:4).

In the excerpt above, the use of words such as, 'reinforce,' 'accentuate,' and 'highlight,' display a pursuit that is not seeking radical change but rather one of moderation. This pursuit of the moderate change can be seen in the report's list of constraints and challenges:

Excerpt #2

- While the church in essence has accepted the dynamics of the project, it is as an institution going through a sharp learning curve in terms of organisational development and change.
- Masculinity and femininity are new concepts that require time to internalise particularly when internalising them in local challenges as usually the intent is lost in translation (Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV and AIDS Project Progress Report, September 2012:13).

In the above excerpt, one can see an acknowledgement of the note of resistance from the church (the Nkhoma Synod in particular) to radical change.

5.5. Chapter Summary

In this chapter, having used critical discourse analysis, I have analysed the official documents relating to the 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' project to isolate and expose the socio-political and theological orientation that underlie the programme. In my analysis, I have noted two main discourses in the officially published document that preceded the project:

- i. An androcentric discourse.
- ii. An essentialist discourse.

In the proposal of the project which was drafted by the Nkhoma Synod's Church and Society department, I have highlighted one particular discourse that echoes the

colonial missionary attitudes on indigenous Chewa cultural practice. Similarly, in its first progress report on the 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV/AIDS' project I have noted a discourse that shows a resistance to radical change in the Nkhoma Synod.

In the next chapter, using Sue Perry's HIV Competent Churches Action Framework, I will evaluate the Nkhoma Synod's implementation of the 'Man -to-Man' Campaign.

CHAPTER SIX

THE NKHOMA SYNOD'S HIV COMPETENCE IN ITS 'MAN-TO-MAN' CAMPAIGN

6.1. Introduction

Part of the 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' project, as outlined by the Nkhoma Synod's Church and Society Department (CSD), was the MTM Campaign. The MTM Campaign was intended to engage men and challenge negative notions of masculinity in the context of the HIV epidemic.

In this chapter I will primarily use Sue Parry's HIV competent churches action framework to evaluate the Nkhoma Synod's response to HIV as seen in the MTM Campaign. Parry's HIV Competent Churches Action Framework was designed to help churches which are involved in the response to HIV to evaluate and improve their HIV competence (Parry 2005:9). This makes it significantly helpful in evaluating the Nkhoma Synod's response to HIV and AIDS, particularly in its campaign to transform negative masculinities.

Parry's HIV Competent Churches Action Framework first defines what HIV competence is and argues why it is needed by the churches in their response to HIV.

She then proceeds to outline the framework's three key points:

- i. Inner competence.
- ii. The bridge between inner and outer competence.
- iii. Outer competence

To help understand the process toward HIV competence and to place it in its broader public health context, I will also draw from the ARHAP Framework as well as the

social science concept of social capital. I will do this by particularly focusing on the use of language and how it contributes to a competent response to the HI-Virus.

6.2. HIV Competent Churches Action Framework

6.2.1. HIV Competency

To use the HIV Competent Churches Action Framework it is essential to understand what is meant by HIV competency and what constitutes an HIV competent church. In this respect, Parry (2005:17-18) lists ten core components needed to achieve HIV competency. These are as follows:

- i. Attitude changes—this relates to views and actions that lead to stigma and discrimination.
- ii. Courageous leadership—this relates to individuals who acknowledge difficult and unpopular topics.
- iii. Theological reflection—this relates to the pastoral and spiritual demands of HIV and AIDS.
- iv. Strategic planning—this relates to the ability to make relevant long-term commitments.
- v. Open dialogue—this relates to human sexuality.
- vi. Gender issues—this relates to addressing the traditions and practices that make women more vulnerable to HIV infection.
- vii. Advocacy—this relates to challenging injustice and inequalities.

- viii. Relevancy—this relates to recognising the evolving nature of the epidemic and responding appropriately.
- ix. Efficiency—this relates to responding in time and appropriately.
- x. Compassion—this relates to being in solidarity with those in need.

Parry (2005:20) goes on to define an HIV competent church as being:

A church that has first developed an inner competence through internalisation of the risks, impacts and consequences and has accepted the responsibility and imperative to respond appropriately and compassionately. In order to progress to outer competence, there is need for leadership, knowledge and resources. Outer competence involves building theological and institutional capacity in a socially relevant, inclusive, sustainable and collaborative way that reduces the spread of HIV, improves the lives of the infected and affected, mitigates the impact of HIV and ultimately restores hope and dignity.

6.2.2. Inner Competence

The HIV Competent Churches Action Framework begins by evaluating inner competence. According to Parry (2005:24-27), for a church to consider itself as having an inner competence, it has to fulfil four fundamental aspects:

- i. Personalising/internalising the risk in an open and honest way.
- ii. Recognising the impact and considering long-term consequences.
- iii. Assessing the risk factors that increase vulnerability.
- iv. Confronting stigma, discrimination and denial associated with HIV.

To evaluate the inner competence of the Nkhoma Synod I will use “The Nkhoma Synod Declaration on HIV/AIDS,” signed on 11 May 2000, by sixty-five church leaders from the Nkhoma Synod. This document records their concerns and

commitment following a two-day gathering where they reflected on the HIV and the Nkhoma Synod's role in responding to the epidemic. The declaration reads as follows:

We Ministers of Nkhoma Synod CCAP, gathered here at Namonikatengeza Church Lay Training Center Chongoni from 10th to 11th of May 2000, noting with great concern the Devastating effect of HIV infection and AIDS in Malawi, do hereby DECLARE that we, as a Church, confess and repent before the Almighty God that we have not obeyed His word, and that we have not been fully involved in addressing the HIV/AIDS crisis, and that we ask for God's forgiveness, and from now onwards, we will take a preventive, care and support stand. SO HELP US GOD!! (The Nkhoma Synod's Declaration on HIV/AIDS 2000) (Emphasis original).

The declaration went on to list three resolutions. First, that "pastors should start sensitising Christians in the church on the dangers of HIV/AIDS." Second, that "pastors should preach messages of hope to both the infected and affected in the church and at funeral ceremonies." The third and final resolution stated that "Christians in the church should start projects" on "home -based care for the infected," "Prevention activities amongst the youth, men and women," and "Orphan care programmes in homes" (The Nkhoma Synod's Declaration on HIV/AIDS 2000).

6.2.2.1. Personalising and Internalising the Risk of HIV

As stated above, the first aspect of inner competence in Parry's HIV Competent Churches Action Framework has to do with personalising and "internalising the risk in an open and honest way" (Parry 2005:24). This involves considering personal risk factors for the church, whereby "consideration of sexual behaviours, mind -sets, attitudes and values," is given and "the acceptance that anyone can contract HIV" (i.e., church members and church leaders alike) made (2005:24). To emphasise this process of personalising/internalising, Parry (2005:24) draws on the biblical metaphor "the body of Christ has AIDS" and points out that the same Bible text upon which the metaphor is based, declares: "If one part of the body of Christ suffers, we all suffer" (1 Corinthians 12:26).

While the Nkhoma Synod's Declaration was a decisive step towards positive engagement with the social realities of the epidemic, its drafters still did not overtly recognise HIV and AIDS as an affliction experienced by the church itself. The declaration is thus largely pastoral in tone where the church offers care and counsel to those outside the church who are infected and affected by the HI-Virus.

While there are allusions to a consideration of sexual behaviours, mind -sets and values in the three resolutions, there is no allusion to this level of internalisation in the Nkhoma Synod's declaration. The approach towards HIV, as presented in the declaration, displays an attitude that sees HIV, not an internal problem that needs their attention, but rather a problem 'out there' that requires their concern. This can be seen in the statement "noting with great concerns the devastating effect of HIV infection and AIDS in Malawi." Likewise, the "devastating effect of the HIV infection and

AIDS" is only seen in the general context of Malawi and not as a social or public health challenge in the particular context of the central region (i.e., the Nkhoma Synod's pastoral domain) or more specifically in the context of the church itself. The acceptance that anyone can contract HIV is also missing. In the first and second resolutions, pastors are represented as primarily ministering to a congregation that have, or might have been infected and affected by HIV and in so doing it ignored the possibility that pastors are not exempted from contracting HIV.

6.2.2.2. Recognising the Impact and Long-term Consequences of HIV

The second aspect of inner competence is the ability to recognise the impact of HIV and AIDS and to consider its long-term consequences. This involves the impact that HIV, "has had, is having and will have on individuals, families, communities, churches and on society as a whole" (Parry 2005:24). In focusing on the impact and long-term consequences on churches, Parry (2005:25) notes three particular consequences:

- i. The loss of members to AIDS-related deaths.

- ii. The loss of members from mainline churches to more charismatic churches that “offer anonymous ‘healing services’ as part of their regular service.”
- iii. Increasing numbers of orphans needing help.

While the third long-term consequence on the churches is acknowledged in the Nkhoma Synod’s Declaration, the first and second of Parry’s consequences are not mentioned or alluded to at all.

6.2.2.3. Assessing the Risk Factors that Increase Vulnerability to HIV

The third aspect to inner competence is to assess the risk factors that increase vulnerability. Parry (2005:25-27) lists six risk factors that require consideration:

- i. Structural and social risks.
- ii. Gender imbalances and norms.
- iii. Gender-based violence.
- iv. Negative cultural practices.
- v. Economic risks.
- vi. Political challenges.

Structural and Social Risks

Reflecting on the first factor, Parry (2005:25) argues that individual behaviour is profoundly influenced by “financial stability, social control, order and social cohesion, social norms, service accessibility and public policy.” In Deborah Bryceson’s 2006 study, conducted in the central region of Malawi among casual

labourers and smallholder farmers during a time of famine, this factor is well - illustrated. Bryceson (2006:173) thus argues that Malawian public policy in the form of the discontinuation of subsidised fertilizer loans to smallholder farmers contributed to “the intensified incidence of HIV infection.” This, coupled with poor rains contributed to the famine which in turn led to the practice of trading sex for food (2006:173).

Gender Imbalances and Norms

Reflecting on the second factor, Parry (2005:26) notes that the images and practices of masculinity and femininity with which people have been raised may render them more or less vulnerable to HIV infection. Parry (2005:26) argues that because of the “biological, behavioural and social factors that contribute to the increased vulnerability of women to HIV infection” gender imbalance must be understood and acknowledged.

Gender Based Violence

Related to gender imbalances and norms is that of gender -based violence. Reflecting on the significance of gender relations advocated by the church, Parry (2005:26) shows that gender based Violence (GBV) includes physical, sexual and psychological abuse, which “must be acknowledged and addressed if prevention strategies are to have any meaningful effect.”

Negative Cultural Practices

Parry (2005:26) places negative cultural practices as the fourth risk factor and notes that underage marriage, female genital mutilation (FGM), unhygienic male circumcision, wife inheritance and widow cleansing practices, and polygamy constitute some of the negative cultural practices. For Parry, churches must have a clear understanding of them if inner competence is to be achieved. It should be noted

that these practices are culturally constructed realities and thus the churches' response depends on what cultural context the church works within. Here, Parry's framework displays a contextual flaw.

Economic Risks

Reflecting on economic factors, Parry (2005:27) argues that "poverty challenges and insecurity in food, health access and services, housing and vital transport access" each contribute to rendering people more vulnerable to HIV infection. In reflecting on unemployment and famine during the period 2001 to 2003 in the central region of Malawi, Bryceson (2006:173) notes how this made Malawian smallholder farmers more vulnerable to HIV infection. Bryceson (2006:195) goes on to estimate that during the 2002 famine, 75% of the rural households in the central region of Malawi were involved in some sort of casual labour to make up for the low yields. For women, such casual labour often translated into transactional sex.

Political Challenges

Reflecting on the sixth risk factor, Parry (2005:27) argues that violence, restricted access to services, and a lack of an enabling environment in which to provide services caused by an unstable political climate, lead to an increase in vulnerability to HIV infection. Despite the fact that all these risk factors relate directly to the Nkhoma Synod and its impact on congregants and clergypersons alike, there is no mention or allusion to any of these factors in the Synod's 'Declaration on HIV/AIDS' or any of its resolutions, thus exposing a theological and pastoral response to the HIV and AIDS epidemic that can be described as moderate at best, and conservative denialism at worst.

6.2.2.4. Confronting HIV Stigma, Discrimination and Denial

The fourth aspect of inner competence is that of confronting stigma, discrimination and denial associated with HIV. Parry (2005:27) argues that this must not only be at the level of church organisation and practice, but “at the level of what is taught in theological institutions, what the faithful believe and do, and what values inform the pastoral formation of pastors and lay people.” Language, as Parry (2005:27) notes, “can be a potent tool for stigmatising and excluding” and hence should be transformed to be more inclusive. The Nkhoma Synod ‘Declaration on HIV/AIDS’ confronts stigma at the level of church organisation and practice, as seen in the second and third resolutions. However, its lack of internalising HIV (as discussed above) and its use of inappropriate terminology (particularly the combining of the terms HIV and AIDS with a forward slash = HIV/AIDS) and its employing hyperbolic language (as “devastating” and ‘danger’) constructs a discourse that might stigmatise those people who have HIV.

Taking into consideration the critique of the Nkhoma Synod ‘Declaration on HIV/AIDS’ using Parry’s six risk factors, it becomes patently clear that Nkhoma Synod has failed to achieve inner competence as a church.

6.3. The Bridge between Inner Competence and Outer Competence

According to Parry (2005:32), to move from inner competence to outer competence “three key cornerstones” are essential:

- i. Leadership.
- ii. Knowledge.
- iii. Resources.

6.3.1. Leadership

Reflecting on leadership, Parry (2005:33) argues that “leadership from above needs to meet the creativity, energy and leadership from below” if there is to be a bridge between inner competence and outer competence. However, in the ‘Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS’ project this seems to be lacking in the collaboration between the leaders of the Nkhoma and the Nkhoma Synod’s CSD. This can readily be seen in the section on church leadership in the project progress report submitted by the Nkhoma Synod’s CSD to Norwegian Church Aid in September 2012. The section reads as follows:

While the church in essence has accepted the dynamics of the project, it is as an institution going through a sharp learning curve in terms of organisational development and change...Masculinity and femininity are new concepts that require time to internalise particularly when internalising them in local challenges as usually the intent is lost in translation. (The Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS Project Progress Report:13)

In this excerpt, two drawbacks in bridging inner competence to outer competence can be readily seen. First, the church leaders display a lack of full knowledge and commitment to the necessity of transforming masculinities in the context of the HIV epidemic. Second, there appears a distinct discrepancy between the Nkhoma Synod church leaders making the decisions and the Nkhoma Synod’s CSD implementing the programme on the ground. For the project to be effective, the lack of knowledge and commitment on the part of the church leaders and the discrepancy between church leaders and those involved in its implementation has to be addressed. As Parry (2005:35) has noted, it is “extremely empowering” for people involved in implementing HIV projects “to know that the leadership of the church solidly backs their activities.”

6.3.2. Knowledge

Reflecting on the second cornerstone of knowledge, Parry (2005:35) notes that it is not enough just “to have a working knowledge of the HI-Virus, its modes of

transmission and what facilitates its spread; its physical effects; management and treatment issues.” Parry (2005:35) goes on to argue that this knowledge should extend to understanding HIV and AIDS’ “impact on the individual, on the family and on society.” This involves “acquiring appropriate knowledge of the people concerned, their circumstances, and the context in which they live and what contributes to their vulnerability to HIV infection” (2005:35). In turn, this “requires consideration of cultural heritage”, together with those negative and positive aspects in the context of HIV, and “of gender scripting which renders both sexes vulnerable” (2005:35). The Nkhoma Synod’s consideration of cultural heritage and gender scripting is uncritical at best and problematic at worst. This can be generally seen in the androcentric discourses in their documents, but particularly in how they construct discourses around culture. The comment on traditional rites of passages, masculinity and gender imbalance, which is found in the ‘Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS’ project proposal, well-illustrates this point. The comment reads as follows:

These rites are particularly important in creating male identities of which the school, the church and other institutions are sometimes unable to erase, since these rites serve as a locus of social control to guide the young male from the transition from childhood to manhood, including reinforcing one’s tribal identity as a Chewa (page 8).

I have already argued in chapter five above that the use of the word “erase” in reference to the knowledge acquired by boys and men through the indigenous rites reveals a view of indigenous knowledge as being wholly negative and thus to be done away with. With the research and work of ARHAP, this view has been generally challenged, but also particularly in the context of the Chewa people and their indigenous matrilineal system this view becomes problematic. As I have already pointed out in chapter four above, the Chewa matrilineal system granted greater gender balance. For the bridging of inner competence to outer competence in the ‘Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS’ project in general and the MTM Campaign in particular; the Nkhoma Synod needs to acquire a critical knowledge of cultural heritage and gender scripting. There are a number of indigenous assets in the Chewa matrilineal system that can be drawn from for the transformation of negative masculinities in the context of the HIV epidemic.

6.3.3. Resources

Turning to the third cornerstone of resources, Parry (2005: 37 -41) lists what for her are its five components:

- i. Financial resources.
- ii. Structural resources.
- iii. Human resources.
- iv. Spiritual resources.
- v. Resource material.

The financial resources, of the 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' project in general and the MTM Campaign in particular, are covered by Norwegian Church Aid.

According to the project's reports to Norwegian Church Aid, funding was received timeously, the document citing only one delay in the disbursement of funding in January 2012 (September 2012 report:13).

As regarding structural resources, The Nkhoma Synod seems fairly equipped. The Nkhoma synod has 126 church buildings, a hospital, 10 health centres, a nursing school, a university and a radio station. Its human resource is equally as vast with 119 clergypersons and 1,317,000 church members.

While its spiritual resource cannot be quantified, it can be imagined in tangible terms and its access to resource material seen in its partnership with other aid agencies (the NCA being one of them), together with its network of theological institutions both locally and internationally. At its cornerstone, the Nkhoma Synod is adequately competent.

So in conclusion, one can see that Nkhoma Synod, in regards to the cornerstones of leadership and knowledge, has displayed inadequacy, despite the fact that the Synod is well resourced.

6.4. Outer Competence

Sue Parry (2005:44) argues that even with acquired leadership skills, appropriate knowledge and adequate resources, the translation into effective and competent action is not automatic. Parry (2005:44) lists seven aspects that relate directly to the outer competence of a church:

- i. Theological competence.
- ii. Technical competence.
- iii. Inclusiveness.
- iv. Social relevance.
- v. Networking.
- vi. Advocacy.
- vii. Compassion.

6.4.1. Theological Competence

Reflecting on the first component of theological competence, Parry (2005:45 - 49) divides it into two stages:

- i. Working out a theology of HIV.

- ii. Engendering such a theology.

Key to the Nkhoma Synod working out a theology of HIV is its need to address the theology of retribution in the Malawian context and to formulate a transformative theology that addresses the negative constructions of masculinity which renders both men and women vulnerable to HIV infection.

While the theology of retribution marks one of the earliest Christian theological interactions with HIV worldwide (Wyngaard 2009:69), in the Malawian context it was reinforced by Kamuzu Banda's monopoly over public health information and his "no HIV cure" Campaign. A theology of retribution is a loose label that is placed on theologies that place emphasis on God's control over human affairs and the reward and punishment relationship that God has with human beings (West 2010:42). Gerald West (2010:42) points out that such a theology is derived mainly from the Old Testament saying that states, 'what one sows, one will reap.' West (2010:42) traces the actual saying "what one sows he will reap" to more agrarian societies where peasant families lived on tribal lands and its yield was in direct proportion to the amount of work they put into the land. After Israel moved from an agrarian economy to a city state economy, this principle no longer functioned (2010:42). This was because the farmer was taxed in order to support the king, his court and the standing army (2010:43). The peasant farmer ended up not 'reaping' what h/she had 'sowed' (2010:43). Unfortunately, this change in experience did not immediately translate into a change in theology (2010:43). As a result, such a theology of retribution is found later in the Old Testament Book of Job, voiced by Job's friends.

It is this theology of retribution that has been used by many in the church to make sense of HIV and AIDS (West 2010:44). The fact that HIV is mainly transmitted through sexual intercourse seems to validate this stance (2010:44). When HIV cases first appeared in the 1980s, the dominate view among Christians was that it was a punishment from God for the sin of homosexuality and illegal drug abuse (Wyngaard 2009:269). This view, although challenged, has persisted in many faith communities and has slowed down the struggle against HIV and AIDS, not least in sub-Saharan Africa.

The theology of retribution applied to HIV and AIDS has a devastating effect. First, it does not confront the social and structural injustices that are at the root of HIV and AIDS (Hadebe 2007:19). Instead, it focuses on linking the victim of these social and structural injustices to sin (2007:19). By so doing, it perpetuates the stigma and exclusion of individuals living with HIV and those with AIDS (2007:19). Such a theology “does not bring healing to any area of one’s life; whether spiritual, psychological, mental or physical” (2007:19). Instead, it addresses human sexuality in a very limited, rigid and traditional way and which inevitably results in being a health liability (Joshua 2010:437).

The theology of retribution’s view on HIV and AIDS, human sexuality, sin and judgment does not create sufficient theological space for it to be useful in efforts of HIV prevention. This is because it views HIV and AIDS as a divinely ordained punishment for sin. By preventing its natural course would be like going against God’s will. This theology therefore needs to be critiqued and a relevant and transformative theology formulated in its place that addresses the negative constructions of masculinities in the context of public health in Malawi. This is crucial if the MTM Campaign is to have any significant impact.

In developing a new theology of HIV and AIDS, the work of Graham Ward may help in such a reformulation. In his book, *Cultural Transformation and Religious Practice*, Ward (2008:5) attempts to answer the question of the relationship between Christian discursive practices and the production and transformation of public truth. He notes how a concept of public truth is problematic in a radically plural context and hence opts to build on the social science concept of social imaginary (2008:126 -127). The concept of social imaginary works from “the understanding that ‘the public’ is a construct and not a given” (2008:120). While the “relationships which are involved in high degrees of physical contact, of co-presence like a lover, friend, sibling or child” can be categorised as familial, the relationships between two members of the public are imaginary (2008:121). The “public is an imaginary community which is sustained by a belief in a relationship between member that might not meet or even know each other by name” (2008:121). This belief is maintained by rhetoric and authority (Ward 2008:123).

Ward moves on to trace the development of the public sphere in modern times, noting that the citizen has move from “a rational and critical debater to a narcissistic consumer” (Ward 2008:125). He attributes this development to techn ologies, media and economies. Ward, in citing Charles Taylor, reiterates that “social imaginaries have no ontological foundation but rather are ways of making sense” (2008:129). Drawing from the work of Ricoeur, Ward suggests that the language (and metapho r in particular) “is crucial in producing and reproducing of social imaginary” (2008:130 - 131).

Relating this to Christianity, Ward (2008: 134) notes that the:

Christian’s social imaginary is eschatologically coloured by language of the Kingdom, by liturgical practices such as the Eucharist within ecclesial bodies, by teachings with respect to discipleship, the treatment and identification of one’s neighbour and the relation of this world to the heavenly one, and by relations between Church and State.

Drawing from psychoanalytical theory, Ward (2008:149) notes that:

Production of new imaginaries is not in the coining of new words or new vocabularies, but rather by drawing from what is already available new sentences can be generated, new moods defined, new aesthetic experiences composed.

Ward (2008:150) relates this to the New Testament Gospel accounts, pointing out that they draw for genres already available to them to make a new genre.

Finally, Ward comes back to the question of the relationship between Christian discursive practices and the production and transformation of public truth. For Ward (2008:168), Christianity approaches the world critically, its critique coming from both its ethical and its eschatological vision (2008:168). However, the Christian critique is not simply a negative analysis, but rather it participates on the critical issues in an attempt to establish hope (2008:168).

Using Ward’s analysis in the context of masculinities and HIV and AIDS in contemporary Malawi is helpful in developing a transformative theology. The negative masculinities that encourage and emphasise violence and sexual risky

behaviour make men and women more vulnerable to contracting HIV and the notion of masculinity that requires men to be and act in control and not admit weakness plays badly when men contract HIV and have to live with AIDS. In short, negative masculinities in the context of HIV leads to death for both women and men and hence can be captured poetically in the metaphor “in Adam all die.”

Drawing from the Greek philosopher Aristotle’s work, *Poetics*, Ward (2008:6) relates poetry to praxis. According to Ward (2008:7) poetics can be best understood as the “organisation of the fashioning of the text that inspire creative action and practices of production.” In Nicholas (Tom) Wright’s (1998:6) reflection on in 1 Corinthians 15, he notes how Paul is rethinking his Jewish tradition in the light of the crucifixion, death and resurrection of Jesus and how he uses the metaphor of planting a seed to illustrate the idea of the continuity and discontinuity of transformation. This could be useful in ways of rethinking current masculinities and formulating transformative theologies. By persisting in the negative masculinities, “all die,” but through the sacrificing of the perceived privileges of the current masculinities men can come out of the process transformed. This transformation would bring life affirming hope in the broader context of the HIV epidemic. Once such a theology is formulated, it has to be adopted by the Nkhoma Synod.

As I have already pointed out in chapter four above, the Nkhoma Synod embodies a patriarchal system which privileges men over women in leadership positions. The Nkhoma Synod should lead by example by transforming its patriarchal attitudes and practices and implementing a gender reform across its leadership. This would serve as an example to men in their congregations to rethink their perceived privilege of masculinity and thus transform them in light of the HIV epidemic. By so doing, the Nkhoma Synod would become theologically competent.

6.4.2. Technical Competency

Reflecting on the second component of technical competency, Parry (2005:50) notes that this involves “building institutional capacity to plan, implement, coordinate, and monitor and evaluate HIV programmes effectively.” The Nkhoma Synod is well

developed in this area through the setting up of the Department of Church and Society (DCS) and its interaction with international partners.

6.4.3. Social Relevance

In her reflection on social relevance as the third component to outer competence, Parry (2005:70) points out that this involves “exposing and challenging the structural sins of society.” Parry (2005:70) further notes that “too often the debate concerning HIV transmission has stalemated on issues of morality” with greater emphasis being placed on individual sin. Parry (2005:70) defines structural sin as being “social evils which constrain the choices that individuals are able to make.” Putting this in the context of the HIV epidemic, Parry (2005:70) goes on to note that “there is much attention and blame for HIV transmission apportioned to the woman prostitute” with less attention given to the structural sins of society which have leaves “this woman poorly educated, discriminated against, stripped of assets and left with little else beyond her body” and the men who solicited her services. This bias can be seen in the “seduction perspective” in ‘The Link between Masculinity, Alcohol, and HIV/AIDS in Malawi’ study; which I analysed in chapter five above. If it is to be socially relevant, the Nkhoma Synod needs to factor in the extent of structural sin in the context of the HIV epidemic.

6.4.4. Inclusiveness

In her reflection on the component of inclusiveness, Parry (2005:76) points out that a greater involvement of people living with HIV and AIDS (PLWHA) in programme design and implementation has been beneficial in local, national and international HIV efforts. PLWHAs involvement “has been instrumental in reorienting priorities, ensuring relevance and effectiveness, and increasing accountability” (Parry 2005:76). However, the Nkhoma Synod, according to the documents from the ‘Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS’ project in general and the MTM Campaign in particular, have not shown the involvement of PLWHAs in either project design or implementation. As Skovdal et al., have noted, notions of masculinity also influence

and affect the lives of PLWHAs. This was particularly evident in the areas of health seeking behaviour and following instructions from female medical attendants (Skovdal et al., 2011:1). The Nkhoma Synod in its 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' project in general and the MTM Campaign in particular, needs to include PLWHAs in its upcoming phases if it is to have an outer competence.

6.4.5. Networking

In her discussion about the importance of networking to outer competence, Parry (2005:76) argues that currently there is a greater need for coordination and collaboration in HIV work. In this area, the Nkhoma Synod is well develop with adequate partnerships locally and internationally; as shown by collaboration with Norwegian Church Aid (NCA) and the FORUT Campaign for Development and Solidarity in the 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' project.

6.4.6. Advocacy

On advocacy, the sixth component of outer competence, Parry (2005:77) notes that churches need to reclaim their prophetic voice particularly, 'against those determinants that are driving the epidemic.' Gender injustice is one of these determinants. However, the Nkhoma Synod's history, (as outlined in chapter four above), and its general attitude towards gender issues proves to be a problem. The Nkhoma Synod needs radical discontinuity with its history in advocacy and in its attitudes towards gender issues if it is to obtain outer competence.

6.4.7. Compassion

Finally, on reflecting on the seventh component of compassion, Parry admonishes those churches involved in HIV work in that what really seals all the other components of outer competency is compassion. This is shown by solidarity with

people living or affected by HIV. While such a trait as human compassion is obviously very important, it is hard to evaluate from coldly analysing documents.

The Nkhoma Synod in its response to HIV, in general and in the MTM Campaign in particular, displays a lack of internalising the HIV risk in an open and honest way. This is seen in how the Nkhoma Synod 'Declaration on HIV/AIDS' displays an attitude that sees HIV as not an internal problem of the church corporate that needs their attention but rather a problem 'out there' that requires their concern. According to Sue Parry's HIV Competent Churches Action Framework, internalising the HIV risk is crucial if a church is to be HIV competent. Also important for HIV competency is recognising the long-term impact of the HIV epidemic and assessing the risk factors that increase the church membership's vulnerability to the HI-Virus. Both of these factors are not critically addressed in the Nkhoma Synod's declaration. Apart from that, the Nkhoma Synod declarations employ language and terminologies that might stigmatise people living with HIV.

The Nkhoma Synod's leadership displays a lack of full knowledge and commitment to the necessity of transforming masculinities in the context of the HIV epidemic in Malawi. The Nkhoma Synod generally, but more particularly in its attitude toward boy's rites of passage, displays a view of indigenous knowledge as being wholly negative and thus to be done away with. This is problematic particularly in the context of the Chewa people who practice an indigenous matrilineal system that in its ideal expression, grants more gender balance. All of these inadequacies in leadership and knowledge are part of the MTM Campaign despite the Nkhoma Synod's adequate financial, structural, material and spiritual resources. All of this negatively affects the Nkhoma Synod's outer competence in its MTM Campaign.

6.5. Chapter Summary

In this chapter, by using Sue Parry's HIV Competent Churches Action Framework, I have evaluated the Nkhoma Synod's response to HIV and AIDS as seen in the MTM Campaign. I have done this by interrogating the Nkhoma Synod's documents and have found that the Nkhoma Synod in its MTM Campaign lacks inner competence.

The Nkhoma Synod also lacks adequate leadership and knowledge, yet has adequacy in the area of resources. In regard to outer competence, the Nkhoma Synod needs to address and challenge the theology of retribution. Instead, it needs to formulate a theology of hope in the context of a prevalent negative masculinity as well as stigma towards those living with HIV and AIDS. While the Nkhoma Synod is well-established in the aspects of technical competence and networking, it still needs improvement in the aspects of social relevance, inclusiveness, and advocacy.

Having evaluated the MTM Campaign, in the next chapter I will draw my final conclusions and recommendations.

CHAPTER SEVEN

FINDINGS, DISCUSSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1. Introduction

In the first chapter, I introduced the context of this study by outlining some key historical forces that shaped masculinities in Malawi from the period of British colonial rule through to Hastings Kamuzu Banda's one party rule. I then gave an account of the church's involvement in Malawian public life. I concluded this chapter with a survey of how the MTM Campaign came into existence. In the second chapter, I provided a literature review of the concept of masculinity, tracing its history and exploring its evolution in application. In the third chapter, I introduced the theoretical tools that I have employed in this study. In the fourth chapter, I presented the context of the Nkhoma Synod and Norwegian Church Aid partnership. In the fifth chapter, using Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA), I analysed the official documents related to the MTM Campaign. In the sixth chapter, using Sue Parry's HIV competent churches action framework, I evaluated the Nkhoma Synod's response to negative masculinities in the context of the HIV epidemic in Malawi. In this final chapter, I will conclude the study by summarising my findings and proposing some recommendations.

7.2. Findings

Using CDA I found two main categories of discourses in the published study that preceded the 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' project:

- i. An androcentric discourse.
- ii. A conservative discourse.

Under the androcentric discourse category were two particular perspectives that guided the study:

- i. An essentialist perspective.
- ii. A seduction perspective.

Guided by an essentialist perspective, Malawian masculinity was discussed without any specification of its historical, social, political and geographical context. Accordingly, its understanding and portrayal was in essentialist terms. This is in conflict with current thought and research on masculinities and particularly contrary to the findings of this study concerning the historical survey on the construction of masculinities in Malawi. In chapter one, I illustrated how there are different historical forces that helped shape Malawian masculinities.

In the study, guided by the seduction perspective, Malawian men were presented as being victims of women's devices especially in the context of sexual transactions. Men's agency and conscious participation in the transaction was absolved and thus reinforced those stereotypes that inform men to be devoid of responsibility when it comes to issues of gender and human sexuality. This perspective is problematic in that it does not challenge the gender status quo or inspire transformation, but instead continues to echo past-prejudices that often lead to irresponsibility and gender-based violence.

Under the conservative discourse category, there were two particular approaches:

- i. A limiting approach to the role of FBOs in public health.
- ii. An inappropriate language approach towards HIV and AIDS.

In the limiting approach to FBOs role in public health, Malawian churches were limited both in action and content. Their actions were limited to preaching and the content of their homilies was limited to abstinence and faithfulness. This discourse is

problematic in that it limits the role of the church in public health and prescribes ineffective approaches and strategies to HIV intervention.

With regard to an inappropriate language approach towards HIV and AIDS, the study found that incongruous language was used by the church concerning HIV and AIDS. This language, whether used wittingly or unwittingly, can have a stigmatising effect on people living with HIV.

In the Nkhoma Synod's CSDs proposal submitted on the 15 December 2011 to Norwegian Church Aid, I found a particular perspective that betrays an uncritical approach to indigenous culture. The presupposition behind this perspective is that indigenous culture is wholly negative and must be done away with. This view is problematic in that it is not only against current thinking and research as seen in the ARHAP programme, but that it purposefully ignores the important contribution that indigenous resources can make to issues of public health such as HIV and AIDS. This view is particularly problematic in the context of the Chewa people who practice a matrilineal system that grants women relatively more space and opportunity for leadership. It is thus of great importance that the resources of this Malawian indigenous system be retrieved and used in the context of gender imbalance and the HIV epidemic.

In the Nkhoma Synod's CSDs progress report submitted in September 2012 to Norwegian Church Aid (NCA), I found that a radical discourse challenging the institutional structures of the church was replaced with a far more moderate approach. Hence, while the discourse acknowledged a resistance from church leaders to radical change as regarding masculinity and HIV and AIDS, the NCA toned down its critique of the institutional structures of the Nkhoma Synod. This is problematic in that if men are expected to radically change their notions of masculinity in light of the HIV epidemic, their church leaders must also display a change in approach to HIV issues.

In chapter six, using the HIV competent churches action framework, I evaluated the Nkhoma Synod's approach to negative masculinities in the context of HIV. In my evaluation I found that the Nkhoma Synod lacked inner competence because it had failed to internalise the risk of HIV in an honest and open way and thereby undercut

the risk factors that increase vulnerability. Furthermore, the Nkhoma Synod's 'Declaration on HIV/AIDS,' displayed an attitude that viewed HIV, not as an internal problem that needs the church's attention, but rather a problem 'out there' that requires the church's concern. This attitude is problematic in that it fails to acknowledge the real extent of the HIV epidemic. As other research has shown, churches are equally affected by the epidemic as any other sector of society. It is also stigmatising to church members and leaders who are living with HIV.

The Nkhoma Synod CSD also failed to assess the risk factors that increase vulnerability. As Parry (2005:25-27) has noted, there are six risk factors that require consideration:

- i. Structural and social risks.
- ii. Gender imbalances and norms.
- iii. Gender based violence (GBV).
- iv. Negative cultural practices.
- v. Economic risks.
- vi. Political challenges.

All six risk factors must be acknowledged if an institution is to increase its HIV awareness. Yet, within the Nkhoma Synod's 'Declaration on HIV/AIDS, there is no mention or allusion to any of these risk factors either in its declaration or resolutions. This is problematic in that it displays an uncritical approach on the part of the church to the HIV epidemic.

Parry (2005:32) argues that for an institution to move from inner competence to outer competence three key cornerstones are essential:

- i. Leadership.

ii. Knowledge.

iii. Resources.

While the Nkhoma Synod exhibits adequacy in its resources, it displays a patent inadequacy both in leadership and knowledge. This is problematic in that leadership and knowledge are essential for a church or institution to make the important link between inner competence to outer competence and thereby become HIV competent.

Finally, in evaluating the Nkhoma Synod's outer competence, I assessed the seven aspects that relate directly to outer competence:

i. Theological competence.

ii. Technical competence.

iii. Inclusiveness.

iv. Social relevance.

v. Networking.

vi. Advocacy.

vii. Compassion.

With regard to theological competence, I found that the Nkhoma Synod needs to address the theology of retribution in the Malawian context and to formulate a transformative theology that addresses the negative constructions of masculinity that renders both men and women vulnerable to HIV infection.

For the Nkhoma Synod to be competent. I suggested the work of the contextual theologian Graham Ward and the biblical text in 1 Corinthians 15 to assist in the formulation of such a transformative theology. Ward's insights on cultural

transformation could be employed as social analysis. Likewise, 1 Corinthians 15, where the Apostle Paul compares Adam to Jesus and evokes Jesus' death and resurrection to inspire transformation in the lives of the Corinthian church members could be used for theological reflection and thus lead to a praxis that transforms Malawian masculinities in the context of the HIV epidemic.

On technical competence, I found that the Nkhoma Synod was well developed in this area through the setting up of the CSD and its interaction with international partners.

On inclusiveness, I found that the Nkhoma Synod in the documents relating to the 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' project in general and the MTM Campaign in particular, had not shown involvement with PLWHAs either in project design or implementation. This again is problematic. As Parry (2005:76) has pointed out, the increased involvement of PLWHAs is "instrumental in reorienting priorities, ensuring relevance and effectiveness, and increasing accountability." The Nkhoma Synod's omission of PLWHAs involvement has to be reconsidered if the 'Masculinity, Alcohol, and HIV&AIDS' project in general, and the MTM Campaign in particular, can be effective.

On social relevance, I found that the Nkhoma Synod needs to factor in the extent of structural sin in the context of the HIV epidemic. Parry (2005:70) notes that there is much to be gained when structural sin is considered in HIV analysis. As I have already illustrated, particularly in chapters one, four and six, there are numerous studies that reveal the structural forces behind the HIV epidemic in the Malawian context.

On networking, I found that the Nkhoma Synod is well-developed with adequate partnerships locally and internationally, the NCA being one such partnership.

Concerning advocacy, I found the Nkhoma Synod needs radical discontinuity with its history in advocacy as well as its attitude towards gender issues if it is to display an outer competence. Because of its intangible nature, I could not evaluate compassion by analysing the documents alone.

In conclusion, I found that interaction with Sue Parry's HIV competent churches action framework is essential if the Nkhoma Synod is to achieve HIV competency. That said, it is not out of character for the Nkhoma Synod to take this particular theological and pastoral stance in relation to the HIV epidemic in the central region of Malawi. As I have illustrated, particularly in chapters one and four, the Nkhoma Synod has had a long history of orienting itself towards a more conservative stance regardless of a felt and expressed need for reform by the Malawian population in general. In light of the extent of the HIV epidemic in Malawi, I therefore feel it is time for the Nkhoma Synod to not only reconsider its acquiescence to power and patriarchy, but to reform its theology and practice in relation to those affected and effected by HIV and AIDS within its congregation and in the larger community. This leads me to make some important recommendations.

7.3. Discussion

The essentialist perspective, as displayed in in the published study that preceded the 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' project, fails to take in account the discursive and non-discursive forces that have shaped masculinities in Malawi and consequently provides a faulty analysis. Such an analysis sets a bad tone for a project that aims to understand and engage local Malawian men in the context of the HIV epidemic and displays an uncritical engagement with current research in gender studies.

The seductive perspective (also displayed in the above mentioned study) absolves men of urgency by portraying them as victims of seductive female sex workers. This perspective is problematic, especially document that is preceding a project that is aimed to engage and transform men in the context of the HIV epidemic and displays an institutional bias in issues of gender relations as it related to the HIV epidemic. Gender inequalities and the victimization of women have been noted to be the main contributors to the HIV epidemic in Sub Saharan Africa. An attentive survey on published studies on HIV and gender relationship would have better informed the Man to Man Campaign.

All of these perspectives fit in with an androcentric discourse which echoes the Nkhoma Synod's practice in gender issues. This is problematic, more especially for a study that aimed to address the negative effects gender inequality has on the HIV epidemic in Sub Saharan Africa.

The limiting of FBO's role in public health is also problematic and displays a limited understanding of churches mission to the world. Many theologians, particularly those in the liberation theology tradition, have called for churches to be more proactive and engaged in public health issues. The limiting of churches' involvement in public health issues to homilies and abstinence campaigns displays a conservative stance which too often has proved problematic in the context of the HIV epidemic.

As I have already stated above, the published study that preceded the 'Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS' project set a bad tone for project. This, in my view, stems from its lack of engagement with current research in HIV, theology and gender.

The Nkhoma Synod's CSDs proposal displays an engagement with current research in HIV and gender and introduces a radical discourse challenging the institutional structures of the church. However it echoes the DRC's attitude toward indigenous culture during colonialism. The proposed wholly doing away with indigenous culture is counterproductive, especially in the context of the Chewa people whose matrilineal system can provide assets to be used in response to a feminized epidemic.

The Nkhoma Synod's CSDs progress report the radical discourse challenging the institutional structures of the church is replaced with a moderate one. This, as acknowledged in the document, is a result of a resistance from church leaders to radical change as regarding masculinity and HIV and AIDS.

In the progression of the Masculinity, Alcohol and HIV&AIDS Project, as displayed in the analysis documents, two particular issues can be observed: the toned down challenge to the Nkhoma Synod's patriarchal stance and the differences in commitment to challenging patriarchal structures between Nkhoma Synod and Norwegian Church Aid. While Norwegian Church Aid has an expressed intention to challenge patriarchal structures Nkhoma Synod has a history of complacency in challenging patriarchal structures.

As I will recommend in the following section a study employing the tools of organisational discourse analysis would be useful in understanding this difference.

7.4 Recommendations

Because of the limits of my study, I acknowledge that there were some aspects of the relationship of the Nkhoma Synod towards masculinities and the HIV epidemic in the central region of Malawi that I did not fully explore in this dissertation. I therefore propose further research in the following areas:

- i. The assets in the indigenous matrilineal system of the Chewa people that can be retrieved and mobilised in the context of the HIV epidemic and gender injustice.
- ii. The relationship dynamics of the Nkhoma Synod and the NCA, both in administration and theological outlook.

As I have already argued in chapter four, the Chewa matrilineal system granted women relatively more space and opportunity for leadership than that of other African societies. With the coming of the Dutch Reformed Church missionaries, capitalism (in the form of wage labour) and the introduction of a remittance -based economy system, this arrangement was radically changed. A study employing the conceptual tools of the African Religious Health Assets Programme (ARHAP) could investigate which

assets can be retrieved and emphasised in the context of the HIV epidemic and that of gender injustice.

Also in Chapter four, I showed how the Nkhoma Synod has had a very conservative view as regarding the issue of gender and how the NCA in its partnership framework states that it is "aware of the patriarchal and hierarchical structuring of many faith based institutions and hence expresses an intention to challenge such institutions" (NCA Global Strategy 2011-2015:27). A study employing the tools of organisational discourse analysis could investigate the relationship dynamics between these two organisations regarding their differences both in outlook and values in respect to gender equality.

The body shuts down when it has too much to bear; goes its own way
quietly inside, waiting for a better time, leaving you numb and half
alive.

(Jeanette Winterson, *The Passion*)

If one member suffers, all suffer together with it; if one member is
honoured, all rejoice together with it. Now you are the body of Christ
and individually members of it.

(1 Corinthians 12:26-27)

CHAPTER EIGHT

BIBLIOGRAPHY

8.1. Published Works

- Anane, M. 1999. "The Soul is Willing, Religion, Men and HIV/AIDS in Ghana," in *AIDS and Men, Taking Risks or Taking Responsibility*, edited by Foreman, M. London, Zed Books
- Baker, P., Gabrielatos, C., Khosravini, M., Krzyżanowski, M., McEnery, T., and Wodak, R. 2008. "A Useful Methodological Synergy? Combining Critical Discourse Analysis and Corpus Linguistics to Examine Discourses of Refugees and Asylum Seekers in the UK Press." *Discourse and Society*, 19(3), 273-306.
- Beckford, J. A., and Demerath, J. 2007. *The SAGE Handbook of the Sociology of Religion*. London, Sage.
- Britton, D. M., and Williams, C. L. 1995. "'Don't Ask, Don't Tell, Don't Pursue', Military Policy and the Construction of Heterosexual Masculinity." *Journal of Homosexuality* 30(1), 1-21.
- Brown, W. L. 2005. *The Development in Self-understanding of the CCAP Nkhoma Synod as Church during the First Forty Years of Autonomy: An Ecclesiological Study*. Stellenbosch: University of Stellenbosch.
- Bryceson, D. F. 1999. "African Rural Labour, Income Diversification and Livelihood Approaches: A Long-term Development Perspective." *Review of African Political Economy* 26(80), 171-189.
- Bryceson, D. F. 2006. "Ganyu Casual Labour, Famine and HIV/AIDS in Rural Malawi, Causality and Casualty." *Journal of Modern African Studies* 44(2), 173.
- Burchardt, M. 2010. "Ironies of Subordination, Ambivalences of Gender in Religious AIDS Interventions in South Africa." *Oxford Development Studies* 38(1), 63-82.

- Carpenter, S., et al. 2012. *Social Protection and Basic Services in Fragile and Conflict-Affected Situations. Secure Livelihoods Research Programme (SLRC)*. London: Overseas Development Institute.
- Chidester, D. 1996. *Savage Systems, Colonialism and Comparative Religion in Southern Africa*, University of Virginia Press.
- ., et al. 2003. *What Holds Us Together? Social Cohesion in South Africa*. HSRC Press.
- Chirwa, W. C. 1996. "The Malawi Government and South African Labour Recruiters, 1974-92." *Journal of Modern African Studies* 34(4), 623-642.
- Chitando, E. 2008. "Religious Ethics, HIV and AIDS and Masculinities in Southern Africa," in *Persons in Community: African Ethics in a Global Culture*, edited by Nicolson, R. Pietermaritzburg, University of KwaZulu-Natal Press.
- Clark, A. 2012. *Getting to Zero, Diverse Methods for Male Involvement in HIV Care and Treatment Report*. Catholic Relief Services.
- Coertzen, P., et al. 2005. "How Nkhoma Synod Church of Central Africa Presbyterian found its Prophetic Voice."
- Connell, R. W. 1987. *Gender and Power, Society, the Person and Sexual Politics*. Stanford University Press.
- . 1993. "The Big Picture: Masculinities in Recent World History." *Theory and Society* 22(5), 597-623.
- ., and Messerschmidt, J. W. 2005. "Hegemonic Masculinity: Rethinking the Concept." *Gender and society* 19(6), 829-859.
- Cornwall, A., and Nyamu-Musembi, C. 2004. "Putting the 'Rights-based Approach' to Development into Perspective." *Third World Quarterly* 25(8), 1415-1437.
- Derrida, J. 1998. *Of Grammatology*. JHU Press.
- de Gruchy, S., Jones, D., Cochrane, J. R., Germond, P., Gunderson, G., Matimelo, S., Molapo, S., McFarland, D., Olivier, J., Reilly, T., and Mwiche, M. 2006. *Appreciating Assets: The Contribution of Religion to Universal Access in Africa*. Cape Town: African Religious Health Assets Programme (ARHAP) Report for the World Health Organisation.

- . 2007. "Taking Religion Seriously, Some Thoughts on 'Respectful Dialogue' Between Religion and Public Health in Africa." *Collection of Concept Papers*, 7.
- Dube, M. W. 2012. "Mainstreaming HIV-AIDS in African Religious and Theological Studies." *African Traditions in the Study of Religion in Africa, Emerging Trends, Indigenous Spirituality and the Interface with Other World Religions. Essays in Honour of Jacob Kehinde Olupona*, 77.
- Englund, H. 2002. *A Democracy of Chameleons: Politics and Culture in the New Malawi*. Nordic Africa Institute.
- Epprecht, M. 1998. "The 'Unsayings' of Indigenous Homosexualities in Zimbabwe: Mapping a Blindspot in an African Masculinity." *Journal of Southern African Studies* 24(4), 631-651.
- Forster, P. G. 1994. "Culture, Nationalism, and the Invention of Tradition in Malawi." *Journal of Modern African Studies* 32, 477-477.
- Fukuyama, F. 1999. *The Great Disruption*. London: Profile Books.
- Given, L. M., ed. 2008. *Qualitative Research Methods*. Vol. 2. Sage.
- Gondwe, H. C. T. 2009. "The Possible Influence of Crucial Pauline Texts on the Role of Women in the Nkhoma Synod of the Central African Presbyterian Church."
- Hadebe, N. M. 2007. "A Theology of Healing in the HIV & AIDS Era," in *The HIV and AIDS Curriculum for TEE Programmes and Institutions in Africa*, edited by Dube, M. W. Geneva: WCC Publications.
- Haug, K. S. "Overcoming HIV/AIDS-related Stigma-tisation and Affirming Life in the African Context, The Role of Theology."
- Hendriks, H. 2012. "Networking Theological Education in Africa: The NetACT Story 2." *Christelike Lekturfonds*, 120.
- Johnston, H. H. 1897. *British Central Africa*. Methuen and Company.
- . 1910. *The Negro in the New World*. Macmillan.
- . 1912/1922. *A Comparative Study of the Bantu and Semi-Bantu Languages*. AMS Press. Available On-line at: <https://archive.org/details/cu31924026932875/>. [Accessed 31 July 2014].

- Kabigiza, C. 2005. HIV & AIDS and its Consequences: The Situation in the Kagera Region, Tanzania," in *God Breaks the Silence: Preaching in Times of AIDS*, edited by Hedrich, U., Toya, J. and Isaak, P. Wuppertal, Mission 21/Protestant Mission/Basel United Evangelical Mission.
- Kaiya, M. 2008. "Being a Church in a Globalised World, Reflection on the Need for Theological Transformation for the Church's Advocacy Work in Malawi."
- Kalinga, O. J. 1998. "The Production of History in Malawi in the 1960s: The Legacy of Sir Harry Johnston, the Influence of the Society of Malawi and the Role of Dr Kamuzu Banda and his Malawi Congress Party." *African Affairs* 97(389), 523-549.
- Kimmel, M. S., et al. 2005. *Handbook of Studies on Men and Masculinities*. Sage.
- Kurian, M., et al. 2006. "HIV Prevention."
- Köseoğlu, G. 2007. *Social Capital Development among Tenant Firms and between Tenant Firms and the Host University in Business Incubators: A Case of a Turkish Business Incubator*. Middle East Technical University.
- Lamba, I. C. 1984. "The Cape Dutch Reformed Church Mission in Malawi: A Preliminary Historical Examination of its Educational Philosophy and Application, 1889-1931." *History of Education Quarterly* 24(3), 373-392.
- Lewis-Beck, M., et al. 2004. *The Sage Encyclopedia of Social Science Research Methods*. Sage.
- Lin, N. 1999. "Building a Network Theory of Social Capital." *Connections* 22(1), 28-51.
- . (2002). *Social Capital: A Theory of Social Structure and Action*. Cambridge University Press.
- Lindsay, L. A. 2007. "Working with Gender: The Emergence of the 'Male Breadwinner' in Colonial South-western Nigeria." *Africa after Gender*, 241.
- Littlejohn, S. W., and Foss, K. A. 2008. *Theories of Human Communication*. Cengage Learning.
- Lwanda, J. 2003. "The [in] Visibility of HIV/AIDS in the Malawi Public Sphere." *African Journal of AIDS Research* 2(2), 113-126.
- Lynch, I. 2008. *Constructions of Masculinity among Black South African Men Living with HIV: A Discourse Analysis*. University of Pretoria.

- ., et al. 2010. "Constructions of Masculinity among a Group of South African Men Living with HIV/AIDS: Reflections on Resistance and Change." *Culture, Health and Sexuality* 12(1), 15-27.
- Macan Ghail, M. 1996. *Understanding Masculinities, Social Relations and Cultural Arenas*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Makondesa, P. 2006. *The Church History of Providence Industrial Mission, 1900 - 1940*. Kachere Series.
- Mhango, H. C. 2004. *Reading the Bible through the Eyes of Women and the Oppressed: In Search for Justice and Liberation in Malawi*. University of Glasgow.
- Mills, A. J., ed. 2010. *Encyclopedia of Case Study Research*. Vol. 1. Sage.
- Morrell, R., and Swart S. 2005. "Men in the Third World: Postcolonial Perspectives on Masculinity." *Handbook of Studies on Men and Masculinities*.
- Moyo, F. L. 2004. "Religion, Spirituality and Being a Woman in Africa: Gender Construction within the African Religio-cultural Experiences." *Agenda* 18(61), 72-78.
- . 2005. "Sex, Gender, Power and HIV/AIDS in Malawi: Threats and Challenges to Women Being Church," in *On Being Church: African Women's Voices and Visions*, edited by Phiri, I. A., and Nadar, S. Geneva, WCC Publications 133, 554-555.
- . 2009. *A Quest for Women's Sexual Empowerment through Education in an HIV and AIDS Context, The Case of Kukonzekera Chinkhoswe Chachikhristu (KCC) among aMang'anja and aYao Christians of T/A Mwambo in Rural Zomba, Malawi*. Unpublished PhD Thesis. Pietermaritzburg, University of KwaZulu-Natal.
- Msangaambe, C. 2011. *Laity Empowerment with Regard to the Missional Task of the CCAP in Malawi*. Stellenbosch: University of Stellenbosch.
- Musopole, A. C. 2006. *Spirituality, Sexuality, and HIV/AIDS in Malawi, Theological Strategies for Behaviour Change*. African Books Collective.
- Muula, A. S. 2008. "Language as Vehicle for the Spread and Prevention of HIV in Malawi." *Croatian Medical Journal* 49(6), 853.

- . 2010. "Marriage, not Religion, is Associated with HIV Infection among Women in rural Malawi." *AIDS and Behaviour* 14(1), 125-131.
- Nagel, J. 1998. "Masculinity and Nationalism: Gender and Sexuality in the Making of Nations." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 21(2), 242-269.
- Nahapiet, J., and Ghoshal S. (1998). "Social Capital, Intellectual Capital, and the Organisational Advantage." *Academy of Management Review* 23(2), 242-266.
- Nødhjelp, K., et al. 2011. *The Link between Masculinity, Alcohol, and HIV/AIDS in Malawi*. Kachere Series.
- Olivier, J., et al. 2006. *ARHAP Literature Review, Working in a Bounded Field of Unknowing*. University of Cape Town. Department of Religious Studies. African Religious Health Assets Programme (ARHAP).
- Parry, S. and C. oecuménique des Eglises. 2008. *Beacons of Hope, HIV Competent Churches, A Framework for Action*. WCC Publications.
- Phiri, I. A. 2007. *Women, Presbyterianism and Patriarchy, Religious Experience of Chewa Women in Central Malawi*. African Books Collective.
- Phiri, K. M. 1983. "Some Changes in the Matrilineal Family System among the Chewa of Malawi since the Nineteenth Century." *Journal of African History* 24(2), 257-274.
- Provenzo, A. B., et al. 2009. *Encyclopedia of the Social and Cultural Foundations of Education*. Sage.
- Rankin, S. H., et al. 2008. "The Condom Divide, Disenfranchisement of Malawi Women by Church and State." *Journal of Obstetric, Gynecologic, and Neonatal Nursing* 37(5), 596-606.
- ., et al. 2005. "Donkey Work, Women, Religion, and HIV/AIDS in Malawi." *Health Care for Women International* 26(1), 4-16.
- Ratele, K. 2008. "Analysing Males in Africa, Certain Useful Elements in Considering Ruling Masculinities." *African and Asian Studies* 7(4), 515-536.
- Robins, S. 2003. "Grounding 'Globalization from Below,' 'Global Citizens' in Local Spaces." *What Holds Us Together, Social Cohesion in South Africa* 242-274.
- Ross, K. R. 1996. *God, People, and Power in Malawi, Democratization in Theological Perspective*. Christian Literature Association in Malawi.

- Russell, L. M. 1990. *The Church with AIDS, Renewal in the Midst of Crisis*. Westminster John Knox Press.
- Schmid, B., et al. 2008. *The Contribution of Religious Entities to Health in Sub-Saharan Africa*. Cape Town, African Religious Health Assets Programme.
- Semu, L. 2002. "Kamuzu's Mbumba, Malawi Women's Embeddedness to Culture in the Face of International Political Pressure and Internal Legal Change." *Africa Today* 49(2), 77-99.
- Simensen, J. 2006. "Religious NGOs and the Politics of International Aid: The Norwegian Experience." *Forum for Development Studies*. Taylor and Francis.
- Simpson, A. 2005. "Sons and Fathers/Boys to Men in the Time of AIDS, Learning Masculinity in Zambia." *Journal of Southern African Studies* 31(3), 569-586.
- Skovdal, M., et al. 2011. "Masculinity as a Barrier to Men's Use of HIV Services in Zimbabwe." *Globalisation and Health* 7(13), 1-14.
- Thompson, T. J. 2005. "Presbyterians and Politics in Malawi: A Century of Interaction." *The Round Table* 94(382), 575-587.
- van Klinken, A. S. 2010. "Theology, Gender Ideology and Masculinity Politics: A Discussion on the Transformation of Masculinities as Envisioned by African Theologians and a Local Pentecostal Church." *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa* 138, 2-18.
- . 2010. "'When the Body of Christ has AIDS', A Theological Metaphor for Global Solidarity in Light of HIV and AIDS." *International Journal of Public Theology* 4(4), 446-465.
- . 2011. "Male Headship as Male Agency: An Alternative Understanding of a 'Patriarchal' African Pentecostal Discourse on Masculinity." *Religion and Gender* 1(1), 104-124.
- . 2011. "The Need for Circumcised Men: The Quest for Transformed Masculinities in African Christianity in the Context of the HIV Epidemic."
- . 2011. "The Ongoing Challenge of HIV and AIDS to African Theology: A Review Article." *Exchange* 40(1), 89-107.
- . 2012. "Men in the Remaking, Conversion Narratives and Born-again Masculinity in Zambia." *Journal of Religion in Africa* 42(3), 215-239.

- . 2012. “The Politics of ‘Biblical Manhood’: A Critical Study of Masculinity Politics and Biblical Hermeneutics in a Zambian Pentecostal Church.” *The Bible and Politics in Africa*, 341.
- van Wyngaard, A. 2013. “Addressing the Spiritual Needs of People Infected With and Affected by HIV and AIDS in Swaziland.” *Journal of Social Work in End-of-Life and Palliative Care* 9(2-3), 226-240.
- VonDoepp, P. 2002. “Malawi's Local Clergy as Civil Society Activists? The Limiting Impact of Creed, Context and Class.” *Commonwealth and Comparative Politics* 40(2), 21-46.
- Ward, G. 2004. *Cultural Transformation and Religious Practice*.
- West, G. 2010. “‘God Wants His People’: Between Retribution and Redemption in Trevor Makgoba’s Engagement with HIV and AIDS.” *De Arte* 81, 42-52.