

***An Investigation into Learner Disposition and Learner Demonstrations of  
Bernstein's Recognition and Realisation Rules***

***A Case Study of Grade 10 English Home Language Learners in the micro-context of  
the Learning of Poetry***

**By**

**Antoinette Harding**

**Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Masters in  
Education in the School of Education, University of KwaZulu-Natal, Pietermaritzburg**

DECLARATION

Unless otherwise indicated in the text, this dissertation represents my own work.  
Opinions expressed and conclusions arrived at, are those of the author.

*A. Harding*  
-----  
Antoinette Harding

## ABSTRACT

The National Research Foundation has directed research to obtain information about learners who are entering the FET phase of education and have completed nine years of Outcomes Based Education. This study aims to ascertain whether learners (in the micro-context of English Home Language – Grade 10) are performing according to the Assessment Standards stipulated in the NCS 2003 and whether they are demonstrating control of the recognition and realisation rules as discussed by Bernstein that apply to poetic analysis. The learners' personal dispositions toward teaching and learning at a city school in Pietermaritzburg have been analysed to find out if there is any correlation between their personal dispositions and their control of the recognition and realisation rules.

The project is a case study and the approach is interpretive. Bernstein's theory forms the framework from which the model was structured and analysed. Instruments were developed to measure the degree of control of recognition and realisation demonstrated by ten, Grade 10 English Home Language learners. These learners also completed questionnaires and in-depth interviews were conducted to explore the dispositions of the learners. Results from the recognition and realisation tasks (mainly qualitative with some quantitative support) were analysed and correlated with the interpretation of the findings from the interviews and questionnaires.

It is hoped that the conclusions from this research will provide insight into how these specific learners, who have only experienced Outcomes Based Education, will perform in the FET phase of education. It is further hoped that the findings may shed some light into the process of social transformation in South Africa and how, if given the opportunity to do so, learners develop mastery of the elaborated code that enables them to function successfully in society. In the words of Zonke (a learner in the study), how a learner must 'get that light that shows them the way'.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am grateful to the following people/institutions for their support and contributions to this study:

The management and learners of Ace High School, who enabled this case study to be undertaken.

My Supervisor, Dr Wayne Hugo, for his incisive direction.

The National Research Foundation for their financial contribution to the project.

My family, for enduring my neglect.

Darling 'Tilly', my octogenarian mother who financially supported me for a term to complete the data capture and analysis.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.1	Introductory comments	1
1.2	Motivation for the study	3
1.3	Rationale directing the study	4
1.4	Key research questions	8
1.5	Overview	8

### CHAPTER TWO: CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK AND ANALYTICAL MODEL

2.1	Introductory comments	9
2.2	Democracy, transformation and pedagogy	10
2.3	The pedagogic device and the possibility of transformation	11
2.4	Morais, Fontinhas & Neves analytical model 1991/92	19

### CHAPTER THREE: CRITICAL REVIEW OF LITERATURE

3.1	Introduction	23
3.2	Examples of empirical investigations to apply Bernstein's theory	24
3.3	South African antecedent to the study	27
3.4	Reproduction theories that influenced the study	30
3.5	Culture and values	37
3.6	Discourse analysis	38
3.7	Conclusion	38

### CHAPTER FOUR: METHODOLOGY

4.1	Introduction	39
4.2	The model of the study	39
4.3	The approach to the study	46
4.4	Validity and reliability	51
4.5	Conclusion	53

## **CHAPTER FIVE: EXAMPLES OF SOURCES OF DATA AND METHOD OF ANALYSIS**

<b>5.1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>54</b>
<b>5.2</b>	<b>Examples of poems</b>	<b>55</b>
<b>5.3</b>	<b>Questions, relative Learning Outcome Performance Standards, coding for recognition and realisation plus model answers</b>	<b>59</b>
<b>5.4</b>	<b>Examples of learners' answers and analysis thereof</b>	<b>61</b>
<b>5.5</b>	<b>Task one</b>	<b>65</b>
<b>5.6</b>	<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>66</b>

## **CHAPTER SIX: IN-DEPTH DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF LEARNER DISPOSITION AND THEIR DEMONSTRATIONS OF THE RECOGNITION AND REALISATION RULES**

<b>6.1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>67</b>
<b>6.2</b>	<b>Subjective mini-profile of learners</b>	<b>67</b>
<b>6.3</b>	<b>Learners' social class background</b>	<b>69</b>
<b>6.4</b>	<b>Leisure activities and family background</b>	<b>70</b>
<b>6.5</b>	<b>Learner dispositions and their demonstrations of the recognition and realisation rules</b>	<b>72</b>
<b>6.6</b>	<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>129</b>

## **CHAPTER SEVEN: CONCLUSIONS**

<b>7.1</b>	<b>Overview of the study</b>	<b>130</b>
<b>7.2</b>	<b>Summary of the study</b>	<b>131</b>
<b>7.3</b>	<b>Interpretation of findings</b>	<b>131</b>
<b>7.4</b>	<b>Limitations of the study</b>	<b>137</b>
<b>7.5</b>	<b>Implications for education in South Africa</b>	<b>139</b>
<b>7.6</b>	<b>Conclusions</b>	<b>140</b>

<b>REFERENCE LIST</b>	<b>142</b>
-----------------------	------------

<b>ETHICAL CLEARANCE FORM</b>	<b>143</b>
-------------------------------	------------

## **CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION**

### **1.1 INTRODUCTORY COMMENTS**

Curriculum 2005 (1997) was formulated to reflect the values and principles of the new South African democracy. The central, underlying principle of the document was to promote equity. It aimed to provide a blueprint for education that would ensure “the same quality of learning opportunities for all citizens” (C2005, 1997:1). The vision behind the curriculum is of a “prosperous, truly united, democratic and internationally competitive country with literate, creative and critical citizens leading productive, self-fulfilled lives in a country free of violence, discrimination and prejudice.” (C2005, 1997:1) The subsequent National Curriculum Statement for Grades 10 – 12 (2003), extends this idea and states that “social transformation in education is aimed at ensuring that the educational imbalances of the past are redressed” (NCS, 2003:2) and that in order for social justice to be achieved, those that had been previously disempowered by their lack of knowledge and skills must be empowered by the acquisition of this knowledge and skills. (NCS,2003)

In accord with the principles of Outcomes Based Education, there are seven Critical Outcomes that are the focus of learning and teaching and that signify a learner has acquired the desired knowledge and skills. The Critical Outcomes require learners to be able to:

- identify and solve problems and make decisions using critical and creative thinking;
- work effectively with others as members of a team, group, organisation and community;
- organise and manage themselves and their activities responsibly and effectively;
- collect, analyse, organise and critically evaluate information;
- communicate effectively using visual, symbolic and/or language skills in various modes;
- use science and technology effectively and critically showing responsibility towards the environment and the health of others; and

- demonstrate an understanding of the world as a set of related systems by recognising that problem solving contexts do not exist in isolation. (NCS, 2003:2)

The learner that is envisaged in the curriculum is not only proficient in knowledge and skills but also embodies the values that dominate our society as described above. The primary purpose of education must be “to enrich the individual and by extension, the broader society.” (NCS, 2003:5) The learner in the FET phase of education must demonstrate advanced thinking and application skills and must “be imbued with the values and act in the interests of a society based on respect for democracy, equality, human dignity and social justice as promoted in the constitution.” (NCS, 2003:5)

What underpins and directs this case study, is the question: are Grade 10 learners, who have completed the GET Phase of their education, in an educational and social position to progress with the FET Phase of their education? Previous research (Hoadley, 2005, Morais et al., 1992) has focussed on the performance of learners in relation to the pedagogic methods employed in the classroom. This case study focuses on the performance of learners in relation to the Performance Standards specified for Grade 10 English learners and their demonstrations of Bernstein’s recognition and realisation rules in their class work and their examinations. Furthermore, it aims to find out if there is a relationship between these demonstrations and the learners own dispositions to school and learning. If it is insufficient for learners to perform academically, in isolation of the society in which they function, then it is crucial to also understand that learner agency impacts on the process of social transformation. Bernstein suggests that if change is taking place, one must question “which group is responsible for initiating the change? Is the change initiated by a dominant group or a dominated group?” (Bernstein, 1996:30) This research differs from previous research (Hoadley 2005, Morais et al. 1992) as it investigates if learner agency is a factor in the social transformation of South Africa. Hoadley (2005) questioned whether school acts as an interrupter of social class. This case study questions whether school acts as an interrupter of social class and if so, to what extent learner disposition impacts on the process. The variable that is under examination, is not the pedagogic practice employed in the classroom, but the

learner's individual disposition. It attempts to explore whether change, if it occurs, is learner initiated.

## 1.2 MOTIVATION FOR THIS STUDY

Ten years after the birth of our democracy, there is a strong sense of concern among critics (parents, learners, educators, researchers, the media) of education that the laudable vision of C2005 and its revisions, has not been achieved. According to Nick Taylor and Penny Vinjevold's book, *Getting Schools Working* (2003), little learning of substance is happening in the classrooms of South Africa and teacher take-up of OBE has exacerbated matters. This is depressing reading and suggests that teaching practice is deficient and unlikely to achieve the aims of the curriculum. In certain instances, a curriculum that was intended to liberate, is achieving the opposite. However, Taylor, Muller and Vinjevold conclude that some "schools ..... can and do have a major impact on the performance of their learners, what it is that they are doing right has got to be systematically investigated and established" (2003:47). Similarly, Pam Christie, in her study of resilient schools (2001), identified factors in schools that succeed despite the odds and recommended that policy makers should focus attention on these schools to enhance the quality of teaching and learning in South Africa. With this in mind, the National Research Foundation has undertaken a project to describe and analyse the implementation of the FET curriculum in the Pietermaritzburg area.

Ace High School is generally accepted as a successful or "resilient" (Christie, 2001) school due to its socially transformed nature and its high matric pass rate (explained in detail in chapter 4) and it may be helpful to investigate if learners in Grade 10 are performing to the requirements of the Performance Standards specified in the NCS (2003) and if they are demonstrating the ability to apply Bernstein's recognition and realisation rules to their learning. Morais, Neves, Davies and Daniels (2001:195) suggest that "realisation rules concern both the selection and production of meanings". If learners at Ace High School, who are mostly from a working class background, are successfully selecting and producing meaning out of the learning that is occurring in the classroom, then we may conclude that this school is acting as an amplifier of social transformation. Ace High School has a record of success in

matriculation examination results (details provided in Chapter Four) which suggests that to a greater or lesser extent, effective pedagogic practice is a given. In *Education Cannot Compensate for Society* (Bernstein, 1971a:65), Bernstein states that the “social experience the child possesses is valid and significant and must be reflected back to him as valid and significant” if education is going to be meaningful. In this case study of ten learners studying English Home Language in Grade 10, I have investigated if learners demonstrate control of the recognition and realisation rules as they apply to the micro-context of poetry and if the individual disposition (that takes into account his/her personal social experience of school) of each learner impacts or influences these demonstrations. The individual disposition of the learner motivates the investigation as it is upon this premise, according to Bernstein (1971a), that meaningful education takes place.

Christie, F. and Macken-Horarik, M. in *Building Verticality in Subject English* (2006) claim that the subject English is vitally important to accessing a life of privilege and is therefore significant. This study is concerned with social transformation and subject English was selected as it provides an avenue toward that transformation. Poetry was selected as a micro-context within subject English as the Performance Standards pertaining to this micro-context are clearly defined and the poems are manageable units to provide data for investigation. The micro-context motivates discussion of not only the knowledge, concepts and skills of poetic analysis but the values expressed in the poems. This opens doors to discussion around each learner’s individual values and provides input into their dispositions toward school. Personally, I am an English teacher and I hope that the process of research will enhance the quality of my own teaching practice as it promotes continuous reflection on how best to achieve the vision of the curriculum as stated above.

### **1.3 RATIONALE DIRECTING THE STUDY**

Dewey stresses two main factors that impact on education: The influence of society on the learner; and the psychological make-up of the individual. He states that “all education proceeds by the participation of the individual in the social consciousness of the race” in such a way that the individual becomes “the inheritor of funded capital of civilisation” (Dewey, 1929:17). I understand “funded capital” to represent

intellectual and moral resources. Dewey sees school as a form of community life that should grow from the home life of the learner. The significance of the learners' home life is also stressed by Bernstein (1996) and is discussed further later in this chapter. Dewey believes that preparation for the future involves living in the present. Education that does not take the child into consideration, is pressure from without and will have external results only which means that the benefits of education will not be internalised by the learner. Ultimately, the child will not inherit the "funded capital". However, this is a complex issue in South Africa at present because our learners lack a homogeneous home background. The home-background of learners differs greatly and we cannot make assumptions that fit groups – individual learners come from differing language, cultural, economic and social backgrounds. As a researcher, I am mindful of this diversity and hope to make sense of it in my investigation.

Freire was concerned about the liberation of the oppressed and he expressed that if learners perceive reality as "dense, impenetrable and enveloping" (Freire, 1970:155), it is the job of education to free them. This is relevant in South Africa and provides worthy research opportunity – has the experience of nine years at school (the GET phase) released learners from their dense, impenetrable, concrete society? A key concept of Paulo Freire's writing is "dialogue" which he defines as "an encounter between man, mediated by the world, in order to name the world" (Freire, 1970:150). He believes that through dialogue, man achieves significance. The two essential factors to ensure significance are "reflection" and "action" which result in "praxis" – the right of every man to transform the world. Without "reflection", "action" is meaningless and "praxis" or transformation cannot occur. In my opinion, this view re-iterates the position of Dewey regarding the imposition of education without taking the child into consideration resulting in external pressure only, not transformation.

Much research has involved "assessing the criteria of attainment that schools hold, and then measuring the competence of the different social groups in reaching this criteria" (Bernstein 1971a:63). Bernstein is critical of this process as it highlights the deficit of certain classes and instead of 'liberating' (as Freire would have) these classes, the research serves to entrench the status quo by confirming pre-conceived notions. Ideally, the role of research is to challenge and expose social assumptions

and rather than focussing on deficit, researchers should concentrate on exposing the potential for change within educational institutions as they are presently constituted.

Bernstein identifies the use of language by the learner as a crucial factor in determining the learner's ability to cope at school. "Code is a regulative principle, tacitly acquired, which selects and integrates relevant meanings, the form of their realisation and evoking contexts" (Bernstein, 1996:111). Bernstein terms language that is context-specific and context-bound as a restricted code. It is often evidenced in working class learners. This does not mean that working class learners are linguistically-deficient but that their expressions of language have particular meanings and the principles and operations which govern those expressions are implicit. This can be problematic for learners at school as "the school is concerned with making explicit – and elaborating through language – principles and operations as these apply to objects and persons" (Bernstein 1971a:64). If expressions of language are context-independent with universalistic meanings, then communication is controlled by the elaborated code. If working class learners do not have access to this 'elaborated code, their opportunities at school must be limited. Through the use of either the elaborated or the restricted code, the learner's culture or sub-culture (class) becomes real and impacts on social relations within the school especially if we accept that the dominant class is in possession of the elaborated code and imposes middle class values on the social relations within a school. The values and morals of this dominant class must influence the content and context of education and this factor could possibly generate conflict within the social relationships in the school. If learners perceive themselves to be marginalized and excluded from the dominant social order, the possibilities for transformation are limited.

"The purpose of schooling is to induct *all* learners into the school code – to specialise their voice with respect to the particular way of organising experience and making meaning in relation to school knowledge" (Hoadley, 2005:13/14). The crucial question emanating from this observation is, how does the language of learners move from the restricted code to the elaborated code? How do learners who have understood the world in context-specific terms move to an understanding of the world that is underpinned by universalistic meaning? Like Dewey, Bernstein claims that the contexts for learning must trigger the imagination of the learner, must trigger his/her

curiosity. In order for the child to be at home in the educational environment, the “culture of the child must first be in the consciousness of the teacher” (Bernstein 1971a:65) and in this way it becomes possible for the culture of the teacher to become part of the consciousness of the child thus enabling the learner to access the elaborated code that is representative of a culture other than his/her own. Bernstein is insistent that this change cannot be forced upon the learner but an introduction to universalistic meaning that triggers the imagination of the learner will hopefully educate (not compensate) the learner. Implicit in the elaborated code are the middle class values that underpin the code and by accessing this code, learners might be transformed. Dewey and Freire stress the importance of the child’s own home background and society and Bernstein agrees that it is important to remember that the social experience of the child is valid and significant and must be reflected back as such. School and society are inextricably linked and in order to understand the child, we need to understand the background from which he/she comes and give it due respect.

There is some correlation between Freire and Bernstein’s concern to access an elaborated code for learners that releases them from their restricted code. Freire advocates a “decoding” movement from abstract to concrete and from part to whole and back again – a movement of flux and reflux. Like Bernstein, he believes that to merely reduce the concrete to the abstract is to negate the dialectical nature of the two. The “decoding” movement, must be preserved if the learner is to be able to critically perceive the concrete and if the abstract is to supersede the concrete. Stakeholders of education in South Africa are concerned that some practitioners of OBE have focussed on the active and dismissed the conceptual, cognitive development of the learner. They are anxious that the concrete has superseded the abstract. In an effort to start at the learner’s home life, they have not moved from the concrete to the abstract and back again but have remained in the concrete. In this study, efforts have been made to establish a link between the learners’ home life and their cognitive development at school.

#### **1.4 KEY RESEARCH QUESTIONS**

- To what extent do Grade 10 English Home Language learners at Ace High School demonstrate control of Bernstein's recognition and realisation rules as they apply to the micro-context of poetry?
- Is there a relationship between the learners' disposition to school and their demonstrations of control of Bernstein's recognition and realisation rules as they apply to the micro-context of poetry?

There are two sub-questions that pre-empt the two Key Questions. These questions form the first step in the research process and are vital to the interpretation of the information gained from the Key Questions but are not 'key' to the central aims of the research. The sub-questions are:

- What are the Performance Standards pertaining to the micro-context of poetry as stipulated in the NCS (2003) for Grade 10 English Home Language?
- Do these Performance Standards require control of the recognition rule or the Realisation Rule or both Rules by the learner?

#### **1.5 OVERVIEW**

Chapter Two presents the theoretical framework and analytical model on which the study was based. It refers, in depth, to Bernstein's recognition and realisation rules and to the studies of Morais and Neves in which they tested for mastery of these rules in subject Science. Chapter Three is a Literature Review that provides more general insight into the readings that impacted on the research. Chapter Four explicates the methodology employed to carry out the research and Chapter Five provides specific examples of the analytical tools and how they were employed to analyse the data. Chapter Six is an in depth Bernsteinian analysis of the demonstrations of recognition and realisation of poetry concepts, knowledge and skills as performed by ten Grade 10 English Home Language learners and a discourse analysis of their personal dispositions. Chapter Seven concludes the findings and draws attention to how these findings apply more generally to South African education.

## **CHAPTER TWO: CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK AND ANALYTICAL MODEL**

### **2.1 INTRODUCTORY COMMENTS**

Bernstein has developed a complex theory to represent the integration of personal interactions with institutional activities and dynamics and, the impact and influences of macro-institutions on the former two. His theory is directed and supported by the belief that education is central to the knowledge base of society and that education is a public institution that can, and must, impact on social justice within that society. Bias is inherent in education in terms of the content, access and opportunities afforded by education. This bias has consequences, “not only for the economy, these biases can reach down to drain the very springs of affirmation, motivation and imagination” (Bernstein 1996:5). Thus, the bias of education can be both an economic and cultural threat to the economy. It is located deep within the structure of education and is evidenced in the system’s processes of transmission and acquisition and in the arrangements of the social relations. In order to unearth this bias, Bernstein has developed a language of description that enables the analysis of the arrangements of social relations and the processes of transmission and acquisition.

This study investigates, using a Bernsteinian language of description, demonstrations of mastery of the Recognition and Realisation Rules in Grade 10 English Main Language learners and enquires about the disposition of the learners in relation to the institution of their school. It aims to investigate whether learners are able to produce meaningful text in the micro-context of poetry analysis and throw light on the learners’ perceptions of the social relations of the school. It attempts to unearth the deeply located bias that, according to Bernstein, is inherent in the social relations of the institution. In the words of Atticus, one of my favourite literary characters, “You never really understand a person until you consider things from his point of view – until you climb into his skin and walk around in it.” (Lee, 1973:35)

## **2.2 DEMOCRACY, TRANSFORMATION AND PEDAGOGY**

Bernstein is deeply concerned about the relationship between democracy and education. Bernstein identifies two major conditions for democracy: people must have a stake in society in that they must be concerned to give and to receive from society and, people must also have confidence in the political arrangements of the democracy to realise that stake. Similarly, at schools, stakeholders (parents, learners, educators) must have confidence that the arrangements of the school will enhance the realisation of their stake in the school. He describes certain rights in schools that are conditions to ensure the realisation of their stake. These include: enhancement, inclusion and participation. Enhancement is “the right to the means of critical understanding and to new possibilities” (Bernstein, 1996:6); at the social level, stakeholders must not be absorbed, but must be included and retain the right to autonomy and; if stakeholders are participants in the school, there must be outcomes to their participation. In investigating the dispositions of the learners, the study aims to enquire if the learners at Ace High school have realised their stake in the school by finding out if they perceive that these conditions (enhancement, inclusion and participation) are being met.

In this study, the concepts of the Recognition Rule and the Realisation Rule are made use of to throw light on educational practice that benefits the development of democracy. If learners demonstrate control of the Realisation Rule and are able to produce meaningful text, then there is evidence that they have accessed the Elaborated Code. If learners have internalised this code, it enables them to function effectively in society and the social transformation that is desired by the NCS (2003) as described in Chapter One, will take place. However, if learners remain bounded in the community code, and do not undergo transformation, then educational practice has failed to achieve its aims.

## **2.3 THE PEDAGOGIC DEVICE AND THE POSSIBILITY OF TRANSFORMATION**

### **2.3.1 POWER AND CONTROL**

For Bernstein (1996), education is the site of struggle for the control of consciousness. He defines pedagogic practice as the “fundamental social context through which cultural reproduction and production takes place” (Bernstein 1996:17). He aims to focus on the underlying rules which shape social construction of pedagogic discourse and its various practices and to provide specific principles of description which will result in an understanding of which knowledge systems become part of consciousness. He provides a means to expose the power relations carried by the discourse by analysing forms of communication that bring about differentiated consciousness. Essentially, he describes how power and control are translated into principles of communication. ‘Power’ and ‘control’ are analytically distinguished from each other as classification and framing respectively. “The classification and framing analysis enabled the integration of the apparently disparate parts of the thesis, the sociolinguistic family-centred, and the transmission-centred study of the school.” (Bernstein, 1996:101) It is for this reason that I include an explanation of these two concepts. The concepts themselves are not under the spotlight in this study, but they inform on the analysis of the dominant codes of the learners, their demonstrations of mastery of the recognition and realisation rules and their personal dispositions. Classification enables the governance of the recognition rule as framing enables the governance of the realisation rule.

### **2.3.2 CLASSIFICATION**

‘Power’ refers to the boundaries that signify the legitimate relations between categories, it suggests a specific order and is conceived as the principle of classification. Bernstein defines classification as “the defining attributes of relations between categories” (Bernstein 1996:19). It is the space between categories that creates the specialisation of that category. It determines what maintains the strength of insulation between categories and allows for a distinct voice for each category to emerge that is the measure of its recognition. It sets the limits of a particular

discourse, thereby defining what the discourse is. Classification functions both externally and internally. Internally, classification refers to relations internal to the individual, maintaining the integrity of categories within the individual. Bernstein refers to psychic defences that individuals set in place to defend their intra-personal categories but he notes that these defences are never wholly effective. Internal classification could also refer to the definition of categories internal to a classroom or a school. External classification regulates relations between individuals (inter-personal) and sets up a social order. It could also refer to classification that defines categories external to the classroom or school – on the macro-level of society. If categories are strongly classified then the categories will be clearly defined and the voice of that category strongly announced. However, if classification is weak, categories will be weakly defined and it will be difficult to discern the voice of the category. Those schools that adhere to the principle of strong classification, are more likely to conform to a collection code type curriculum. In terms of this curriculum, it is likely that progression and evaluation will be according to the performance model and that structures and social orders within the school will be stratified. However, those schools that adhere to the principle of weak classification, are more likely to conform to an integrated code type curriculum. In terms of this curriculum, it is likely that progression and evaluation will be according to the competence model and that structures and social orders within the school will be differentiated.

It is possible that integrated code type schools are more vulnerable to change due to increased communication internally and externally. Bernstein suggests that the integrated code is more suited to the organic type society of the twenty first century but he observes that classification is not necessarily applied uniformly within and without the school and variations of these modes do occur. This observation has been validated by Naidoo (2006), who researched a South African school in which the collection and integrated codes operate concurrently, and progression and evaluation is achieved via the performance and competence models. Initial research in one classroom at Ace High School revealed that classification of subject English is very strong but that classification of social order within the same English classroom, is significantly weaker, bearing out Bernstein's point that dual modalities can operate efficiently, concurrently.

Classification is the “means by which individuals are able to recognise the speciality of the context that they are in” (Bernstein 1996:31). An example of this would be that if the classification of the social order inside a classroom is strong, then learners will defer to the authority of the teacher. On the other hand, weak classification can create ambiguity and the possibility of change or transformation of the social order emerges if learners do not recognise their positions within society as strongly classified. In another school where Naidoo (2006) conducted research, she describes learners as “street-wise, intelligent, outspoken, politically aware, empowered by the human rights discourse, ..... they had no qualms about challenging their teachers and asserting their collective power to control teachers” (Naidoo, 2006:182). This factor has been explored in chapter six by analysing the disposition of the learners to school and analysing how learners classify themselves in relation to school. Because the principle of classification regulates the distribution of power, it enables the operation of the recognition rule. According to Bernstein, if the recognition rule is not evidenced, it is impossible for the realisation rule to govern the pedagogic process as recognition is a pre-requisite to realisation. Interestingly, in this research, there were examples analysed of learners who did not demonstrate mastery of the recognition rule in a specific context but still made efforts to demonstrate mastery of the realisation rule in the same context. This will be discussed further in Chapter six. The operation of the recognition and realisation rules will be discussed in greater detail later in this chapter.

### 2.3.3 FRAMING:

Framing has to do with how time and pace are controlled. It establishes legitimate forms of communication and socialises individuals into established relations of power. Framing has the power to reproduce social relations and change them. By defining the nature of talk within a context and the how the kinds of spaces constructed by classification are affected, it establishes a means of acquiring the legitimate message within that context – framing relays the voice that emerged from classification. Like classification, framing operates internally and externally. Internally, it controls the selection of communication, sequencing, pacing, criteria for evaluation and impacts on the nature of social relationships between transmitters and acquirers within the pedagogic context. However, control over communication

outside the classroom or school impacts on the pedagogic practice internal to the classroom or school and is therefore, relevant to the pedagogic context. If framing is strong, stakeholders will know precisely how the pedagogic discourse (communication) arising out of the pedagogic context will be transmitted. But if framing is weak, the pedagogic practice will be less visible and the discourse arising out of the context will be implicit. Framing, therefore, regulates the realisation rules for the production of discourse. Framing establishes what Bernstein terms as the discursive order in which the regulative discourse and the instructional discourse operate. As the name suggests, the regulative discourse communicates the regulations (the how that things are done and who controls what) within a context. The instructional discourse specifically communicates the instructions relating to the discipline within that context.

An example arose out of the research previously mentioned at Ace High School. In terms of the Instructional discourse, framing was very strong and learners were given very specific instructions on how to carry out their task and what they were supposed to do. However, the framing of the regulative discourse was relatively weaker. Interactions between members of groups as they carried out their tasks were very open and depended to a large extent on the characters and strengths of the participants within the group. It may be concluded that the external framing of the regulative discourse was weak and relied upon strong internal framing from each of the participants. This weaker framing of the regulative discourse allowed for the disposition of the learners to emerge more strongly.

In this case study, the classification and framing relations of the pedagogic device have not been analysed but these concepts are relevant to this study as the learners' dispositions have been analysed, as have their demonstrations of mastery of the recognition and realisation rules. It has been shown above that classification and framing impacts upon the learners' dispositions and their demonstrations of mastery of the recognition and realisation rules.

Bernstein's concepts of the restricted code and the elaborated code were mentioned in Chapter One and I will try to demonstrate the relationship between the pedagogic device, the realisation rule and the possibility of access to an elaborated code for all

learners irrespective of their backgrounds. It is this relationship that, I believe, is significant in the development of equity in South Africa. Because framing relays the voice established by classification, it has the power to either strip the identity of the acquirer (learner) or include it in the process. It was established earlier that Bernstein believes that one of the rights that is a condition to ensure the realisation of democracy, is the right to inclusion. From this we may conclude that if framing serves to include the acquirer in the process, it also serves to enhance democracy and develop equity among learners. Furthermore, if framing enables the governance of the realisation rule within a context, then learners will be in possession of their right to participation, a further condition to ensure the realisation of democracy. In this way, the acquirer gains the ability to 'speak the text' or to 'have acquired the legitimate pedagogic code', it allows the acquirer to construct meaning and make that meaning public. This process inevitably communicates itself to the transmitter allowing for change in the established social order and the emergence of greater social justice.

This is my optimistic analysis of the possibilities if the realisation rule governs within a particular pedagogic context. What I hope to reveal in this research is, if in fact, the realisation rule does govern the texts of ten, Grade 10 English learners, in the micro-context of poetry analysis, and if it does, does it enhance democracy and develop equity among learners? Do the learners themselves recognise their positions within the society of the school or does the possibility of transformation exist from their perspective?

#### 2.3.4 PEDAGOGIC DEVICE

Bernstein is more explicit about the education of our learners in his model on the pedagogic device. In my understanding, central to this model is the discursive gap and the recontextualising rule that operates as a principle within this gap. It is this area that allows for the transformation from a 'restricted' code to an 'elaborated' code, for the transformation from mundane knowledge to esoteric knowledge. It is within this area that classification and framing are applied to produce varying power relations.

The pedagogic device is a means that “continuously regulates the ideal universe of potential pedagogic meanings in such a way as to restrict or enhance their realisations”. (Bernstein 1996:42) Bernstein explains that the pedagogic device has the potential to enhance meaning for the learner. Within the device, there are three major interrelated rules that regulate pedagogic communication: the distributive; the recontextualising and the evaluative rules. These rules are hierarchically related to each other with the distributive rule dominating. The distributive rule marks and distributes who may transmit what, to whom and under what conditions – it sets the outer limits of legitimate discourse. The distributive rule establishes the relationship between power, social groups, consciousness and practice. It is through this rule that different forms of consciousness and knowledge are distributed. It has the potential to alter consciousness from the thinkable to the unthinkable, from the mundane to the esoteric and from the knowledge of others to the otherness of knowledge. It is the space between the thinkable and the unthinkable that is the discursive gap and it is this gap that is the site of alternative possibilities or alternate realisation of the relationship between the material world and the immaterial world. Through the application of classification and framing, the rule distributes power to regulate the realisation of potential meaning. Within the classroom, the rule is constantly in play but the modes of regulation differ depending on the context and it is these differences that are of interest to the researcher. The agents who control the access to the site of the discursive gap are those who have been legitimately pedagogised – the teachers. A paradox exists as the distributive rule attempts to regulate those who have access to this site and control alternative possibilities “but the gap itself has the possibility of creating an alternative order, an alternative society and an alternative power relation” (Bernstein 1996:45). This is an exciting prospect if we consider then that the learners themselves, via the discursive gap, become agents for change.

The recontextualising rule “constitutes specific pedagogic discourses” (Bernstein 1996:46) – the instructional discourse and the regulative discourse, with the regulative discourse dominating. The relationship between the two discourses reflects the relationship between the rules with the instructional discourse embedded in the regulative discourse as the recontextualising rule is embedded in the distributive rule. Arising out of these discourses, two oppositional forms of discourse are identified: vertical and horizontal. Very broadly speaking, these discourses can be aligned with

the elaborated and restricted codes. Vertical discourse is characterised by its coherence, its systematic, hierarchical organisation and the dominance of explicit principles. It is disembodied from local experience whereas horizontal discourse is context dependent, segmentally organised and dominated by the influence of the concrete. These discourses are the forms of communication through which pedagogic subjects are related, selected and created through contexts and contents. They serve as the principle on which recontextualisation exists. Together, these discourses constitute one pedagogic discourse that combines both the values and competences of education, ensuring that skills and values are not disparate factors of education, as some would have it. Bernstein talks of the motivation, aspirations and values of the learner that enhance the likelihood of realisation taking place and despite noting the distinction between the instrumental and expressive orders, in his later work, Bernstein integrated the instrumental order (the transmission of skills) with the expressive order (the transmission of conduct, character and manner).

It is on this premise that I explore the inter-relationship between the learners' demonstrations of the recognition and realisation rules and their personal dispositions. The educator employs the discourses at his/her disposal to recontextualise for the learner and in this way enables the learner to move within the discursive gap from the concrete to the abstract. If this process is successful, the learner will gain access to the 'elaborated code' and will embark on the journey from the known to the unknown, the mundane to the esoteric. If learners are freed from their reality as "dense, impenetrable and enveloping" (Freire, 1970:155), then they will be socially transformed as envisaged by the NCS (2003). The key to this transformation is the learners' mastery of the realisation rule as this will enable them to produce independent, meaningful text. The focus of this research, is not on the pedagogic device that enables the production of this text, but the text itself. The research questions if there is evidence of mastery of the realisation rule in the text of the ten, Grade 10 English learners and if so, what is the relationship between this text and the disposition (conduct, character and manner) of the learner.

### 2.3.5 THE RECOGNITION AND REALISATION RULES

In Chapter One, I discussed Bernstein's concept of code: elaborated and restricted. In the previous sections, I have elaborated on Bernstein's concepts of classification and framing and in both, I made mention of the recognition and realisation rules. In this section, I will make explicit the links between these key concepts and provide greater clarity on the recognition and realisation rules and how they operate.

In summation of the previous discussion, Bernstein employs a socio-linguistic device, to describe the dominant modes of communication used by learners, that he refers to as code: the restricted and elaborated codes. The restricted code dominates the reasoning and communications of working class learners who mostly express themselves in context-dependent and context-specific communications that are horizontally organised and whose meanings are implicit. The elaborated code is evidenced in mostly middle class learners who have the ability to express themselves in context-independent and generalist communications that are vertically organised and whose meanings are explicit. Education at school, is dominated by the elaborated code and learners are required to access this code if they are to achieve success. Classification is the principle that determines the boundaries and specialisation of categories. If the knowledge, skills and concepts of school are strongly classified, then they are insulated from the knowledge, skills and concepts of the community and the voice of school is differentiated from the voice of the community. If learners enter school with the community code dominating their reasoning, they may not be in a position to recognise the elaborated requirements of the school context or hear the voice of education. Conversely, if learners enter school with the elaborated code dominating their reasoning, they are more likely to be able to distinguish between the contexts of the community and school and employ the generalist, specific principles required by school. Framing is the principle that controls the timing and pacing of the transmission of the knowledge, skills and concepts of education, it relays the message of the voice of school. The pedagogic device enables the recontextualisation of knowledge, skills and concepts to take place. Through the pedagogic device, the teacher makes use of the principles of classification and framing to recontextualise the requirements of school. Via the process, a discursive gap emerges and it is within this space that the possibility for transformation exists.

A relationship exists between the principle of classification and the recognition rule. The recognition rule enables the learner to identify the specificity or similarity of contexts (Bernstein, 1996). In the example given above, the middle class learner, because he is more likely to come to school in possession of the elaborated code, he is more likely to recognise the specific requirements of the context of school. "As the classification principle is established by power relations and relays power relations, then recognition rules confer power relative to those who lack them" (Bernstein, 1996:107). This statement suggests that learners in possession of the elaborated code are not only advantaged in cognitive terms but are also advantaged in social terms. In this study, I question whether the learners have mastered the recognition rules as they pertain to poetry analysis and whether they recognise their positions within the social order of school and society.

It is insufficient to master the recognition rule of what has been learned. Learners are also required to construct meaning, in the form of text, from what they have learned. If they are able to produce legitimate, meaningful text specific to that context of learning, then they have mastered the realisation rule. The principle of framing regulates the appropriate pedagogic practice within a context that enables the development of mastery of the realisation rule or the ability of the learner to realise the meaning of what he has recognised by producing text that is meaningful to that learning context. Thus the recognition rule operates between contexts and the realisation rule operates within a context. In this case study, a variety of examples of texts produced by the learners were analysed to evaluate whether learners had mastered the realisation rule specific to the context of poetry analysis.

## **2.4 MORAIS, FONTINHAS & NEVES ANALYTICAL MODEL 1991/1992**

### **2.4.1 OVERVIEW OF THE MODEL**

Researchers in Lisbon, Portugal, employed Bernstein's theory to analyse learners' demonstrations of the recognition and realisation rules in the micro-context of problem-solving in subject science at a primary school. They focussed on the processes and transmission of learning, the learners' mastery of the recognition and realisation rules and correlated these to the learners social class and coding

orientations. They attempted to unearth the reasons why learners experienced difficulties in this micro-context and their principal instrument of analysis was Bernstein's concept of code: "code is a regulator of the relation between contexts and as such it should general principles which permit distinction between contexts and principles which lead to the production of texts adequate to each context" (Bernstein, 1977 cited in Morais et al, 1992:248).

#### 2.4.2 DETAILS OF THE MODEL

A sample of 80 learners (half female and half male) in Grades 5 and 6, aged between 10 and 12 years of age were selected from a school of predominantly working class, black and white learners. Their sample was deliberately heterogeneous. One educator who was well versed in Bernstein's theory was selected to employ three differing pedagogic practices, with correlating differing values of classification and framing to regulate the pedagogy of three different groups within the original sample of 80. The learners' achievements were assessed for different competences. The first assessment focussed on the learners' ability to distinguish between two different contexts ie. a context that required the acquisition of knowledge and a context that required the application of knowledge. The researchers were testing for the learners' control of the recognition rule. The second assessment focussed on the learners' ability to use or apply knowledge in a new situation ie. the level of abstraction was extended. The researchers were testing for the learners' control of the realisation rule. These assessments were conducted via questionnaires and structured interviews and the findings were analysed according to scales. The design of the research was essentially qualitative but co-relational statistical analyses were also completed. The results of the investigation were discussed in relation to the recognition and realisation rules, in relation to the learners social identities and in relation to the three differing pedagogic practices employed. The results of the study did not influence my selection of this study as a model, it was the design of the study that served as an analytical model.

### 2.4.3 RESULTS OF THE STUDY

Very broadly speaking, the results of the study by Morais, Fontinhas and Neves (1992) were that in response to the selection question learners experienced less difficulty than in response to the problem-solving question on a specific scientific concept, where, in 60% of the cases analysed, common-sense knowledge (the restricted code) dominated their answers. The minority of cases evidenced mastery of the Realisation Rule – “this shows a certain stability to the explanations at the level of common sense, which acts like a barrier to prevent explanation on the basis of the concept involved. On one hand, the students explained the concept in their own words but on the other they solved the problem on the basis of common-sense knowledge” (Morais et al, 1992:258). This suggests that the learners had developed greater control of the recognition rule and that the possibility of the mastery of the realisation rule existed but that “it is possible that the school does not develop efficient strategies that lead the children to encode the correct text” (Morais et al, 1992:259). They also discovered that social class is highly correlated with recognition and there was a strong relation between specific coding orientation and social class – one of the basic reasons for failure of learners from the lower social class is that they failed to correctly apply the recognition rule. They also discovered a correlation between race and recognition and realisation in that the black children experienced difficulties in both recognition and realisation and there was also a trend that there was a stronger correlation between boys and recognition and realisation. They also found that “the relations between pedagogic practice and specific coding orientation holds only for the simpler tasks of recognition and realisation: in the most complex tasks, the pedagogic practice did not have any influence” (Morais et al., 1992:265).

### 2.4.4 RELEVANCE OF THE PORTUGUESE STUDY TO THIS CASE STUDY

Details of the method employed in this case study are provided in Chapter Four but I will describe in what ways the Morais, Fontinhas and Neves (1992) study influenced the design and analytical focus of my investigation.

Firstly, my study also aimed to investigate whether learners had gained control of the recognition and realisation rules but the micro-context differed. In this study, the micro-context was poetry analysis, not problem-solving in science. The Portuguese researchers investigated the relationships between recognition, realisation, social class, race, gender and pedagogic practice. My study investigates the relationship between recognition, realisation and the disposition of the learner. Their dispositions are impacted upon by the learners' social class and the pedagogic practice of the school but social class and pedagogic practice were not specific factors under investigation. The concept of code was the principal instrument of analysis and it was pivotal to my analysis. The Portuguese researchers designed specific tests to test for recognition and realisation but in this study, the learners' original texts in class and in examinations were analysed. The sample used by the Portuguese researchers was much bigger and there is a difference in the ages of the sample. In this study, the learners were in Grade 10, and were age appropriate to their year of study. This is a significant factor as this study is particularly interested to find out if learners entering the FET phase of their education are able to cope with the requirements of the curriculum. In their sample, there were boys and girls of different races, in this sample, there were boys and girls but they are all zulu children. And although social class was not a factor in their selection as a sample, 9 out of the ten children in this sample came from a working class background. This is not surprising as the learners at the school are predominantly zulu speaking from a working class background. In the Portuguese study, the pedagogic practice employed to teach the learners was correlated to their demonstrations of recognition and realisation and this was not a factor under investigation in this study. This has been discussed further in Chapter 7 as a limitation of this study. The design of their analysis was essentially qualitative as was this study.

The Morais, Fontinhas and Neves study has been a most useful analytical model for this study and although it has been modified quite extensively, as shown above, the orientating concepts of Bernstein's codes and their relationship to recognition and realisation have been central to this study. In the following chapter, a more general, critical review is undertaken and there is further discussion on the research of Bernstein and others who have enquired into related concepts and issues.

## CHAPTER THREE: CRITICAL REVIEW OF LITERATURE

### 3.1 INTRODUCTION

The central area of concern in this study is social transformation. As stated in Chapter One, Curriculum 2005 envisages a learner whose academic skills and performances will allow him/her to effectively take his/her place in South Africa today or stated alternately, the aim of curriculum 2005 is to produce learners who have been socially transformed and are in a position, as a result of their education, to be meaningful citizens of South Africa.

Harley and Wedekind (2004) note the close alignment between curriculum policy and political vision and highlight three design features that characterise the policy. These include that it is outcomes-based, an integrated knowledge system and that it promotes a learner-centred pedagogy. It is this last design feature of the curriculum that has motivated this investigation because “Learner-centredness quickly became one of the teachers’ defining features of the new curriculum” (Harley et al., 2004:200) and yet Harley et al. (2004) describe that teachers’ understanding of the implementation of the new curriculum is shallow and only reflects the trademarks of the curriculum and not its principles. They conclude that ironically, C2005 which was primarily a political policy aimed at social transformation, has served to reproduce class inequalities. “Commitment to a vision of *what should be* clouds the ability to seriously consider *what is*, so that the good intentions of social reconstructionism have more influence on the policy agenda than social and school realities.” (2004:212) In their ‘Notes’, they state, “An extensive bibliography contained not a single study dealing with the student perspective”. (2004:216)

From the above, three important factors were taken into account: the learner-centredness of the curriculum; that we should seriously consider *what is*; and that there is a dearth of investigations to represent the learners’ perspective. This investigation aims to focus on what learners have, in reality, learned at school. It questions, not only whether learners demonstrate control of the recognition and realisation rules in the micro-context of poetry analysis, but also looks at their own perspective about what learning is and how it occurs at school. This enquires if the

political vision of social transformation is perceived by the learners and evidenced in their dispositions toward school.

### **3.2 EXAMPLES OF EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATIONS TO APPLY BERNSTEIN'S THEORY**

3.2.1 In 1981, Holland conducted the original tests to illustrate the use of recognition and realisation rules as functions of classification and framing. Children from different social backgrounds were shown a series of pictures of food that was offered to the learners for lunch at their school. The children were asked to group the foods in any way that they thought would be appropriate and after this task had been completed, the children were questioned about why they had grouped the foods. From these tests, (Holland, 1981) the concept of code was demonstrated. One set of learners grouped the foods according to their own experience of life and their personal choices while the other set of children grouped the foods according to some common feature that the foods shared or, a more general principle that applied to the foods. When the children were asked to group the foods again, some of the learners from the group that had previously applied generalised principles, used more context-specific and personalised choices to group the foods while the other group, used the same method to group the foods as they had in the first test. This demonstrated that those students who originally recognised the context as specialised and used context-independent principles to group the foods (applied the elaborated code), were able to move from the elaborated code to the community code (application of context-dependent, personalised groupings) and back again. These learners were mainly from a middle class background and it was concluded that middle class learners were more likely to be in a position to access the elaborated code in a school setting than the working class learners who were disadvantaged in a school setting as they did not have the capacity to move from the community code to the elaborated code and back again. In my investigation, nine out of the ten learners were from a working class background and in analysing their class work, examination answers, and their personal dispositions, I questioned to what extent learners applied the elaborated or community code to their reasoning.

3.2.2 It was mentioned in Chapter Two that an investigation by Morais, Fontinhas

and Neves (1992) posed as the analytical model for my investigation but other research carried out by Morais et al. (2001) also made use of Bernstein's theory and there were aspects of this more recent research that were very informative.

When studying the pedagogic social contexts, Morais et al. (2001) identified internal and external relations that impacted on the pedagogic process and agents within that process were teachers, parents and family, and the students. Internal to the pedagogic process is the agency the school, and within that environment, two main discourses prevail. The instructional discourse which has to do with communications about concepts, problems, experiments, assessment etc. and the regulative discourse that has to do with communications about distinctions in power relations and the development of socio-affective competences that are the appropriate aspirations, motivations and values to enable realisation to take place. The instructional discourse is embedded in the regulative discourse and the regulative discourse dominates. The instructional discourse communicates the instrumental order and the development of skills and knowledge whereas the regulative discourse communicates the expressive order that is concerned with the transmission of conduct, character and manner, the development of social competences that are a prerequisite to effective development of recognition and realisation by the learner. King (1974) conducted an empirical study into the instrumental and expressive orders but Morais et al. (2001) distinguished socio-affective competences from recognition and realisation of science knowledge and concepts and this interested me. In the earlier research (1992), the focus of the testing was for recognition and realisation of science concepts and knowledge whereas in the later investigations in 1998 and 2000 more complex testing took place that made the distinction between scientific knowledge and concepts and the socio-affective competences required in the problematic situation. "correct textual production requires not only the possession of recognition and realisation rules but also positive socio-affective dispositions, motivations and values towards the text to be produced." (Morais et al, 2001:214) Because my investigation focussed on the disposition of the learners, this more complex distinction was most relevant.

3.2.3 Rose (2004) described how Indigenous children in Australia have been disadvantaged by the education system due the sequencing and pacing of the curricula that does not take into account the orientations to meanings acquired in the previous

stages to learning. Rose (2004) advised that specific changes must be made to the sequencing and pacing of pedagogic practice to provide the appropriate scaffolding for learners to learn how to read. Although this is of great value to me as an English teacher, it was not significant to my investigation. However, the background to his study was relevant to my study because he explained, using Bernsteinian terms, how some learners lack the appropriate orientations to meanings to enable them to read, how they lacked the elaborated code due to their home backgrounds. Rose (2004) described in detail the drop out rate of indigenous children from school, the unemployment levels in their regions and other social ills of their communities. He drew a very clear picture about the relationship between poor educational achievement, limited economic opportunity and lack of social transformation. He referred to the link between the macro socio-economic perspective and the micro functions of the pedagogic device and concluded that the existing sequencing and pacing in schools ensured the maintenance of social inequality.

In chapter two, I explained how classification and framing in the pedagogic device impact on the learners' access to the recognition and realisation rule. This explanation concurs with Rose, if social transformation is to take place, learners must have accessed the elaborated code that enables them to produce meaningful text at school. Rose explains how when reading, the role of the other speaker in an exchange is replaced by the book and this interaction differs greatly from an oral interaction. It requires a different orientation to meaning than one has when orally conversing. Learners who have been orientated to the social processes of reading from an early age will be more likely to access the elaborated code. Bernstein describes the elaborated code as "the media for thinking the 'unthinkable', the 'impossible', because the meanings they give rise to go beyond local space, time, context and embed and relate the latter to a transcendental space, time context". (Bernstein 1990:182) Rose emphasises the link between reading ability and the learners' access to the elaborated code that determines the organisation of knowledge and meaning at school. He explains how the scaffolding interaction of mother-child reading activities in early childhood endorses the likelihood of learners accessing the elaborated code in school-going children and shapes the learners' identity at school. As I am interested in the learners' identity and their disposition toward school, this background is significant.

### **3.3 SOUTH AFRICAN ANTECEDENTS TO THE STUDY**

3.3.1 An investigation by Hoadley (2005), which took place in South Africa, inspired, directed and informed my study. Hoadley (2005) is also concerned with social transformation and she discusses various reproduction theories and how, instead of schools enabling the transformation of poor learners, it actually “sets them up for dominated positions in society” (2005:16). She makes use of Bernstein’s code theory in her language of description and she suggests that greater focus must be placed on the educator or the teacher as an agent for either transformation of social class or reproduction of social class as through the teacher’s pedagogy, his/her own social class impacts on the process.

Essentially, Hoadley investigates how social class differences are reproduced through pedagogy. She notes that in the South African schooling system there are bands of disadvantage and privilege and she investigates what is different about the pedagogy in different social class schooling contexts. Then she enquires why these differences exist and in an attempt to explore this enquiry further she focuses on the role of the teacher in the process of reproduction of social class. She explores the orientation of the teacher – his/her social class and concordant code orientation and his/her professional disposition.

Hoadley understands that the implementation of pedagogy acts as either an interrupter or an amplifier of the community code for the learner. In order to find out how pedagogy impacts on the reproduction of social class, she analyses student voice – their articulation of either the community or the elaborated code. To do so, she designed arithmetic tasks for Grade 3 learners that tested for recognition and realisation of the required skills and knowledge. If the voice of the learner is weakly specialised and the community code dominated the organisation of the learner’s thoughts, he/she would be unable to apply the recognition and realisation rules to that micro-context. Hoadley explains that the framing of pedagogy regulates the acquisition of voice by the learner and creates the message that is transmitted. The message is what is realised by the acquirer. However, there is a dialectical relation between voice and message and the outcome of the ‘voice-message’ relationship is

educational identity – if educational skills are clearly marked and bounded, the voice is 'specialised'. Therefore, the role of the teacher is central to what message is transmitted and what voice is acquired by the learner. Thus Hoadley explores the social class and the professional disposition of the teacher and its impact on his/her implementation of pedagogy.

Hoadley focussed on the teacher as a potential agent of transformation. Despite accepting that code orientates the learner's ability to apply the recognition and realisation rules to a specific context and that pedagogy impacts on the specialisation of the learner's voice, I took the position that learners, like teachers, are also agents in the process of their own transformation. Learners, like teachers, develop a disposition to school and this disposition may enhance the possibility of school acting as an interrupter of the community code or it may inhibit the possibility of the school interrupting the community code. If the community code is amplified by schooling, it is not only as a result of the pedagogy implemented but also as a result of the learner's own disposition toward schooling. In order to unearth greater insight into the disposition of the learners, I aimed to investigate, once pedagogy had been classified and framed, what 'message' had learners received and had this 'message' impacted on the specialisation of their voice. From this perspective, pedagogy does not only include academic teaching and learning, but encompasses the entire experience of school.

3.3.2 Breier (2004) analysed the verbal transmissions of transmitters (lecturers) and acquirers (students) in order to deconstruct the 'voice' of participants in two university courses in Labour Law. Her project interested me because the underlying motivation of the analysis was that "the experience of the adult student should be valued, taken account of and built up in curriculum and pedagogy" (Breier 2004:1). In my study, I take a similar position with regards the learners whose dispositions are being analysed. Following on a long tradition of oppositions between abstract and concrete forms of thought, Breier noted that acquirers adopted "various strategies (conscious and unconscious, verbal and non-verbal) to achieve the successful acquisition of content and gain access to the recognition and realisation rules" (Breier 2004:6). She identified two broad strategies that acquirers adopt in the verbal transmissions, 'the generalising strategy' and the 'localising strategy'. She broke

these two categories down further but what interested me was the parallel that can be drawn between these two broad categories and Bernstein's elaborated and community codes. Breier explains that generalising strategies are employed in statements that include the abstract and the general and are not dependent on personal context. They allow the acquirer to apply rules and concepts to specific examples. Whereas localising strategies are employed in statements that focus more on the concrete and what is particular to the acquirer's context. These two strategies are closely aligned to Bernstein's elaborated and community codes respectively. The results of Breier's study showed that despite the value of personal experience to the course, those students who adopted generalising strategies were more successful than those who relied exclusively on localising strategies. Like the children in Holland's (1981) test, the students who made use of generalising strategies also made use of localising strategies but they were able to make the transitions between the two strategies and this enabled them to apply the recognition and realisation rules required by the course whereas the students who were only able to make use of localising strategies were not able to apply the recognition and realisation rules. Furthermore, the four learners that only used localising strategies, were all from working class backgrounds and that they were unable to adopt generalising strategies, prevented them from successfully applying the rules and concepts required in the labour law course that was being studied. This project particularly interested me because the transmissions of the acquirers that were studied, were the actual transmissions of the students in their lectures and on their examination scripts. In my study, the texts of the learners that were analysed, were also their actual texts from class and examinations.

3.3.3 Flanagan (1997) reported on an investigation carried out on teachers who were studying a distance Language and Learning Course to find out if teachers had acquired the recognition and realisation rules required to implement the pedagogic changes in the classroom. Two researchers, Evans and Reeves, designed instruments to measure teachers' application of the recognition and realisation rules. What they discovered was that the course assumed that teachers would critically reflect on what they had learned on the course but the mode that governed the teacher's thinking was rote-learning and therefore, teachers were not always able to recognise the requirements of the course and more often, were unable to produce the legitimate text that evidenced that they had accessed the realisation rule. In certain instances, as was

revealed on the teachers' examination scripts, the teachers were able to distinguish between contexts but in the classroom they were unable to realise what they had recognised. For example, teachers recognised that when reading in class, learners should actively respond to texts but they were unable to realise that the appropriate pedagogic practice of correcting the learners' errors when learners responded incorrectly. This study was not directly relevant to my investigation but similar results were noticed in some of the learners in the project.

### **3.4 REPRODUCTION THEORIES THAT INFLUENCED THE STUDY:**

Reproduction theorists are concerned with how power is distributed in society to ensure the dominance of a particular group or class. They focus on how schools are complicit in this process by making use of their material and ideological resources to reinforce the social relations of a dominant group. "School sites have integrated the traditionally separate tasks of reproducing work skills and producing attitudes that legitimise the social relations in which these skills are related." (Giroux, 2001:72)

3.4.1 Althusser (1971) noted that the above held true – it was insufficient that schools taught skills that equipped learners for jobs in the work force but schools also taught attitudes and behaviours commensurate with their social positions. Althusser suggested that dominant ideology is represented at school in the material demonstrations of rituals and practices at a school but also in the unconscious images that subjects hold of themselves within society. Althusser claims that there is a relationship between the deeply seated psychological make up of subjects and their positions within society. This is relevant to my analysis as I make efforts to uncover the dispositions of the learners.

3.4.2 Bowles and Gintis (1976) are less concerned with dominant ideology and more concerned with the 'correspondence principle'. According to this principle, the social dynamics of the classroom correspond to the values, norms and skills of capitalist society. As a result, learners are inculcated with the necessary attitudes and dispositions to carry out what they have learned at school, in society. In this way, social relations in school determine the social position of learners in society. This theory does not allow for the possibility of human agency that resists the deterministic

nature of the correspondence principle. In my investigation, I am interested to find out if the learners at Ace High School, are agents who determine their own positions in society.

3.4.3 As explained in Chapter One, in terms of Bernstein's Code Theory, learners come to school with a particular orientation toward organising their thoughts and making meaning of what they encounter. Those from a working class background are more likely to demonstrate the community code in their responses to school but those from a middle class background are more likely to demonstrate the elaborated code in their responses to school. However, this is not entirely deterministic as Bernstein points out, and as is explained further in Chapter Two, that the application of differing strengths of classification and framing to pedagogy enables the creation of the discursive gap which in turn creates the possibility of the development of greater mastery of the realisation rule and enhances the dominance of the elaborated code within the learner. In accord with Bernstein's recommendations, in Hoadley's study, she is more concerned with how pedagogy is applied, the process or 'relay' that exists in the class, than the content or what is taught and learnt in the classroom. She focuses on how teachers classify and frame pedagogy in order that learners may learn because she believes that through differing strengths of classification and framing, the position of learners will either be reproduced or they will be enabled to move into alternate positions in society.

I accept this position but because my study is located in a school that is generally accepted as successful due to its high matric pass rate, I am not so interested in the 'relay' in the classroom but more in the response of the learner to that 'relay'. Classification and framing are relevant in that classification "defines attributes of relations between categories" (Bernstein 1996:19) and enables the successful application of the recognition rule by learners as framing regulates the realisation rule and enables the learner to produce meaningful text. I am interested in the learners' control of the recognition and realisation rules and am also interested in their disposition to school. Bernstein mentions socio-affective competences that are evident in a disposition that is favourable to realisation. Morais, Fontinhas and Neves, in their study, "aim at improving children's achievement in science education in both cognitive competencies and socio-affective dispositions" (Morais et al.,

1992:247) which suggests that they too were concerned with the disposition of the learner as well as his/her ability to apply the recognition and realisation rules. In that report however, no further mention is made of the socio-affective competencies. In a discussion on the differences between mechanic solidarity and organic solidarity Bernstein explains that an indicator of a society that is governed by mechanic solidarity is that members of that society share a common belief and value system and this leads to social integration. However, in a more current, organic society, individuals hold private beliefs and their social roles are achieved through personal endeavour. Social integration occurs as a result of inter-dependence of specialist, differing roles in society and tension may exist between the personal values of an individual and his/her role in society as the value systems of the society are more ambiguous. In this investigation, attention is given to the individual learner and how that learner understands his/her role in society. Bernstein states "the pupil's role is less clearly defined. Of equal significance, his role conception evolves out of a series of diverse contexts and relationships." (Bernstein, 1971b:168) With this in mind, efforts were made to explore the learners' diverse contexts and their relationships in order to ascertain whether their positions in society would be reproduced.

3.4.4 Bourdieu and Passeron's views on social reproduction made sense in terms of this study for two reasons. Firstly, from a methodological perspective, they believed that theory must be connected to empirical research that is grounded in everyday life. The goal of research is to lay bare for scrutiny ordinary events. What distinguishes this research from other studies within the Bernstein orbit (Hoadley 2005, Morais & Neves 1992) is that the tests were not specifically designed to test for recognition and realisation but arose out of the everyday school life of the learners. From a theoretical perspective, Bourdieu and Passeron aim to reconcile the subject (in this case, the learner) within the objective structures (in this case, the school). I will discuss two central concepts that were useful to my analysis.

The concept of 'symbolic violence' is that the holders of symbolic power use that power against the subjects within society and alter the actions of subjects through coercive means but they are understood as legitimate. Or as Bourdieu and Passeron state "every power which manages to impose meanings and to impose them as legitimate by concealing the power relations which are the basis of its force, adds its

own specifically symbolic force to those power relations” (Bourdieu et al., 1977:vi). This is explained further, “What makes the power of words to command and to order the world is the belief in the legitimacy of the words and him who utters them, a belief which words themselves cannot produce”. (Bourdieu, 1977:177 in Bernstein, 1996:170) Linked to the concept of symbolic violence is the concept cultural arbitrariness. Bourdieu refers to culture as arbitrary as it is not valid in its own right but due to its origin in the ruling class and it is imposed upon society. According to Bourdieu, culture is reproduced through pedagogic action that in turn ensures reproduction of the whole social system because success is achieved through cultural behaviours that are not necessarily academic. An example of culture at many South African schools that is imposed on the learners is the culture of participation in sporting activities. Bourdieu identifies sporting activities as an indicator of middle class culture. Via sporting activities, subjects are inculcated into the culture of the institution (the school) and accept the ‘symbolic violence’ of the school as legitimate. Willis (1977), who was critical of Bourdieu, analysed working class learners who resisted by not performing academically. In the case study of this thesis, Nhlaka who earlier in his career at Ace High School demonstrated some form of ‘resistance’ to the institution through non-compliance to the rules of the school and academic failure, became more involved in sporting activities and began to feel personally endorsed by those activities. His ‘resistance’ to the institution decreased as he accepted its culture as legitimate. From the example of Nhlaka the complexity of the concept of symbolic violence is evidenced. Bourdieu views the sporting activities as symbolic violence, Willis suggests that learners’ lack of participation in this form of ‘oppression’ represents some form of ‘resistance’. However, lack of participation is a form of ‘non-resistance’ because it does not result in any change. The so-called symbolic violence is still being imposed and the learners are not socially transformed as a result of their ‘resistance’. In the previous sentence, I refer to ‘so-called’ symbolic violence as one may also question what is in reality, the legitimate power of the school. Bernstein avoids value laden terms like symbolic violence and suggests that it is accepted that an institution does demonstrate a dominant culture and that the role of the researcher is to observe the relay of how, through the regulative rule, that culture is imposed on the members of the institution and what the results of the relay are. More details are provided in Chapters 6 and 7 when discussing Nhlaka and this issue.

From Bourdieu's perspective, if learners (the subjects) recognise the legitimacy of the power of the school, via 'symbolic violence', their positions in society will be reproduced. Bourdieu refers to this as 'misrecognition' and Tom Bottomore recommends that it is "doubtless the most favourable moment for bringing to light the objective truth" of the imposition of 'symbolic violence' (Bourdieu et al., 1977:xii) Savage, (2003) tends to support this viewpoint and he suggests that in this century, there is a new inter-relationship between class, identities and inequalities. In the past in Britain, despite that the working class was subordinate in power relations, it was the powerful working class that defined social relations and the middle class defined itself in terms of a series of oppositions to that working class. In this century, the middle class has become the "particular-universal class" (Savage, 2003:536). By this he means that generally middle class values and norms are perceived as 'good' and 'appropriate' and the "practices of the middle class have increasingly come to define itself." (Savage, 2003:536). Oppositions between classes are less evident but individuals who fail to demonstrate the 'good' and 'appropriate' practices of the middle class are perceived as failures. Because overt class oppositions are no longer clearly visible, Savage, like Bottomore, suggests that researchers expose the "unacknowledged normalcy of the middle class." (Savage 2003:537) In this investigation, I question whether learners do recognise the legitimacy of the power relations, the dominance of the middle class, or not, and how this impacts on their personal dispositions.

The concept of 'habitus' informed my understanding of learner disposition. 'Habitus' are systems of dispositions or schemes of thought that are lasting and lead to actions that reproduce structures. 'Habitus is the unifying principle of both thought and action or behaviour and opinion. It is this concept that enables the reconciliation between subjects and objective conditions discussed in the first paragraph. Bourdieu explains the process of the reproduction of social class as a circular motion that unites structures and practices through the mediation of 'habitus'. Via the educational system, structural and operating properties of society are reproduced through agents whose dispositions are socially conditioned by those properties ie. the agents are both the products of and the producers of the structural and operating properties of society. The school confirms and strengthens class 'habitus' and this ensures the perpetuation of the objective conditions of society and prevents the transformation of social class.

On an individual basis, the objective regularities of the school are internalised by the subject that leads the subject to have expectations that are relative to what has been internalised. This results in objective behaviours by that subject that are likely to contribute toward the realisation of the objective probability of social class being reproduced. An example in this study is of Nonhle who is self-deprecating, she has resigned her expectations to academic failure and she unconsciously anticipates being a member of the dominated class. She is a victim of 'symbolic violence' and she has not broken away from her 'habitus'. Details to substantiate are provided in Chapters 6 and 7.

Rist's classic study (1970) of Student Social Class and Teacher Expectations, observed behaviours in the natural settings of the school but focussed on the social organisation of the class as imposed by the teacher and the emergence of "patterns of behaviour, expectations of performance, and a mutually accepted stratification system delineating those doing well from those doing poorly." (Rist, 1970:267) Teachers in this study organised their classrooms according to their 'ideal type' that corresponded strongly to the middle class 'type'. They classified these learners, in their own words, as "fast learners" and those learners that did not conform to the 'ideal type' were classified as "slow learners" who were expected to fail. This organisation of learners into 'ideal types' and those that were not, resulted in differing teaching practice, differing interactional patterns and a social gap between the two different types of learners. What interested me particularly was the response of the students. Student behaviours shifted as a result the social gap. The 'slow learners' did actually learn despite their disadvantageous positions but they were ridiculed by the other learners, they seldom verbalised what they had learned, they engaged in disruptive behaviours and ultimately withdrew from classroom participation. Although Rist's study took place nearly 40 years ago, the results foreran what Savage has to say about middle class dominance and its consequence for learners at school. The behaviours of the learners resulted from the disposition of the learners to their experience of being socially stratified and appears to endorse Bourdieu's concept of 'habitus'.

In discussing Nonhle and Nhlaka, Bourdieu's theory is upheld but it can also be criticised as it presupposes that 'bourgeois' culture dominates society. In South Africa, due to the momentous changes that have taken place, and despite our

predominantly capitalist economy, the culture of our society is not clearly defined and is in a potential state of flux. This aspect is dealt with further in attempting to explore the disposition of learners at Ace High School and will be discussed in greater detail later in this chapter. Thus, Bourdieu's theory of cultural reproduction is helpful but as will be seen when the detailed analysis is discussed in Chapters 6 and 7, it does not hold true in all instances.

3.4.5 Giroux believes in the "primacy of student experience as a central terrain for understanding how identity, politics and meaning actively construct different interventions and mediations within the sphere of schooling" (Giroux, 1988:xv) and it was this aspect of his theory that particularly applied to my investigation. Giroux does not accept the more deterministic theories of reproduction but believes that reproduction occurs as "culture, power, and ideology work as mutually informing apparatus of domination to shape student subjectivities and maintain the hierarchical separation between dominant and subordinate groups" (Giroux, 1988:xiv). However, he holds the optimistic viewpoint that human agents do possess the power to overcome their histories and inherited cultures. If learners at schools make use of the spaces and tensions within school sites to apply critical knowledge as resistance, they can alter the course of history – "Individuals, for Giroux, are both producers and products of history" (Giroux, 1988:xv). Giroux challenges and questions generally accepted assumptions about social reproduction. He is concerned that educators recognise how dominant school culture can lead to the disempowerment of subordinate groups. He agrees with Bourdieu that dominant culture at school does enforce compliance and powerlessness on subordinate groups but encourages educators to question how and why this occurs in order to develop human agency that has the capacity to resist this dominance. His focus is on teachers repositioning pedagogy in order to empower learners and it is the real, concrete problems facing the learners that must direct this repositioning. In exploring the disposition of learners in this study, I hope to expose the real, concrete problems facing the learners at Ace High School.

### 3.5 CULTURE AND VALUES

In his book, *Creating People-Centred Schools*, Ndhlovu (1988:38 in Harley et al, 1999:111) defines culture as “the way of life of the people within a particular school. It refers to the underlying beliefs and assumptions, norms and values, relationships and interactions, shared by people in a school”. Woods (1983:8) stresses that “[t]hese will not be formally regulated, but heavily implicit. One’s part in them may not be consciously recognised. Rather one grows into them, and may recognise them as a natural way of life.” Values arise out of culture as our shared beliefs and assumptions will give rise to what we regard as good, right and moral or the opposite thereof. Behaviours and actions that are deemed good, right and moral within a school sphere arise out of the dominant culture of that school.

A discussion on culture and values is relevant to my research because as discussed above, theories on cultural reproduction have influenced my analysis. In my efforts to explore the dispositions of the learners, and in accord with the advice of Giroux, the culture of the school and the values arising out of that culture must be laid bare. The culture of a school provides guideline for generally accepted ways of thinking and behaving and leads to everyday patterns of living within that context. However, it is our tendency to accept these patterns without questioning and challenging them. We take these cultural understanding for granted and do not consciously perceive that tensions may exist between the dominant culture of the school and the learners within that school. The culture of a school impacts on the role of the learner and how he/she perceives himself/herself. Hargreaves (1967) developed a theory about the subcultures that form within a school. He argued that the structural organisation of the school creates divisions within the learners and that the school treats groups of learners in different ways. This in turn, leads to a separate identity for each group with their own subculture. In my interviewing of learners, I was mindful of these dynamics. Furthermore, in my interviewing, as a background to the discussions and directing the process, was the Dumont and Wax study (1976 in Harley et al, 1999:113) in which teachers had completely misinterpreted the behaviour of the Cherokees in their classrooms. What the teachers perceived as compliant docile behaviour was in fact, total resistance to the learning (or lack thereof) being imposed on them. The teachers interpreted the conduct of the Cherokees from within their

own culture. They were too firmly set within in their own traditions to understand the complex reality of the Cherokees. As a researcher and a teacher at Ace High School, it is essential that I do not allow my own cultural beliefs to colour my analysis to the extent that it obscures the complex realities of the learners in the case study.

### **3.6 DISCOURSE ANALYSIS**

The second Key Question underpinning this case study relates to the disposition of the learner and how this disposition impacts on the learner's control of the recognition and realisation rules. Learners completed questionnaires and participated in in-depth group interviews to reveal their dispositions. The task of the researcher, is to meaningfully interpret and analyse what the learners have revealed. In this chapter, I have not focussed on discourse analysis as the method employed is described in detail in Chapter Four and the theory supporting that method is also described in Chapter Four but essentially, I borrowed from Parker's (1992) 'Criteria for distinguishing discourses' and applied the criteria to analyse the questionnaires and the interviews. It is advantageous to employ discourse analysis because it allows for a critical distance from the discourse and enables the analyst to reframe the object so that the content of what is analysed is not seen as 'truth' but as 'reality' expressed in language. It is a holistic approach that explores the complexities of that 'reality'.

### **3.7 CONCLUSION**

A more general critical review of the literature that informed and directed the case study has been presented in this chapter. Those readings that impacted more directly on the project have been discussed and the reasons for their significance have been stated. In the following chapter, further discussion does take place on literature that relates to the methodology employed.

## **CHAPTER FOUR: METHODOLOGY**

### **4.1 INTRODUCTION**

Layder (1998 in Hoadley, 2005) refers to 'Orientating Concepts'. The researcher identifies specific concepts from a general theory and these concepts inform and direct the process of data collection and analysis. "Theory inevitably shapes the collection of continuous data, guiding what the researcher foregrounds and backgrounds" (Ensor & Hoadley, 2000:2). In this study, the concept of recognition and realisation, as discussed by Bernstein (1996) has orientated the collection and analysis of data. The initial focus of the study was to establish the extent to which learners in Grade 10 English Main Language at Ace High School demonstrated mastery of the recognition and realisation Rules. The secondary focus of the study was an attempt to explore the relationship between the learner's demonstrations of recognition and realisation and their socio-affective dispositions. That learners were able, or not able to demonstrate mastery of the recognition and realisation rules is relevant in relation to the learners' perspectives or the framework through which learners make sense of their experiences at school (Woods, 1983). Bernstein (1996) notes that that learners who cope in the school context, are in possession of the elaborated code that academic performance in school demands. He explains that learners who come from a working class background, often remain bounded in the community code despite the endeavours of school to 'interrupt' this code and 'amplify' the elaborated code (Hoadley, 2005). Previous investigations have explored the relationship between learners, pedagogy and their social backgrounds (Morais, Fontinhas & Neves, 1992) and between learners, pedagogy and teacher dispositions (Hoadley, 2005) but this study focuses on the relationship between learners and their own dispositions. It focuses on how learner disposition impacts on their demonstrations of the recognition and realisation rules.

### **4.2 THE MODEL OF THE STUDY**

The orientating concepts as explained above informed and directed the model of the inquiry. The approach to the study is interpretive. Weber and Dilthey (in Neuman

2000:70) explained that the root of the study is “an empathetic understanding of the everyday lived experience of people in specific historical settings”. The study is characterised by an empathetic identification by the researcher of the learner, by phenomenological inquiry into the lived experience of the learner at school and in relation to school and, meanings are derived from the analysis of a variety of texts produced by the learners. The last characteristic is related to Hermeneutics that “emphasises a detailed reading or examination of text, which could refer to a conversation, written words, or pictures” (Neuman, 2000:70). In this study, the texts that were studied to reveal meaning included the learners’ classwork, examination scripts, a questionnaire, the transcript of group discussions and a re-test of work studied in the previous year.

The design is Qualitative. Neuman (2000:16) lists the principles of qualitative research as:

“Construct social reality, cultural meaning; Focus on interactive process, events; Authenticity is key; Values are present and explicit; Situationally constrained; Few cases, subjects; Thematic analysis; Researcher is involved.”

In this study, I have aimed to ascertain to what extent learners have mastered the Recognition and Realisation Rules as demonstrated in their work through the year and the answers to their exams ie. in their authentic day to day work at school. And, I have aimed to make sense of the cultural meanings of a selected sample of learners in the context of Ace High School and to draw conclusions from these findings from a thematic viewpoint. My involvement in the study has not only been as a researcher, but also as the learners’ teacher and this factor must have impacted on the collection and analysis of the data. I have made explicit my interest in the study to all role players and stakeholders and later, when dealing with the validity and reliability of the study, it is shown that efforts have been made to avoid compromising the integrity of the study.

The study was essentially modelled on two other studies and drew insight from their methodologies, which were replicated in certain instances, and adapted in others.

In order to ascertain the extent to which learners demonstrated mastery of the Recognition and Realisation Rules, aspects of a study by Morais, Fontinhas and

Neves in 1992 and *Towards a Sociology of Pedagogy* by Morais, Neves, Davies and Daniels (2001) were modelled. (Details of 1992 study are discussed in Chapter 2: Analytical Model) In 2001, they investigated the difficulties students encountered in problem solving in the area of sciences. They developed a process whereby they identified if learners' demonstrated mastery of the Recognition and Realisation Rules in solving science problems. They were concerned with "both cognitive competences and socio-affective dispositions" (Morais et al., 1992:248). This was adapted to the micro-context of the Grade 10 Poetry curriculum as stipulated in the NCS 2003 and as practised in Grade 10 English Home Language at Ace High School. A range of classwork exercises and examination answers supplied the data for analysis. All exercises and answers analysed were initially correlated to Specific Outcomes in the NCS 2003 in order to establish a direct relationship between the Official Discourse and the Pedagogic Discourse. An instrument was developed, based on the instrument used by Morais and Neves (2001), to measure the demonstrations of Recognition and Realisation of Poetry Concepts and Knowledge and demonstrations of the appropriate Socio-Affective Competences.

The following abbreviations have been used throughout the study:

**Recognition of Knowledge and Concepts – Rck**

**Recognition of Socio-Affective Competence – Rcc**

**Passive Realisation of Knowledge and Concepts – Rlp**

**Active Realisation of Knowledge and Concepts - Rla**

**Failure to achieve required recognition or realisation – F**

**Recognition or Realisation partially achieved – Rck-;Rcc-;Rla-**

	<b>MORAIS &amp; NEVES (2001: 198)</b>	<b>HARDING (2006)</b>
Rck:	Recognising the specificity of the micro-context of problem solving within their practice	Recognising the specificity of the micro-context of poetry concepts and knowledge previously acquired
Rcc:	Possessing socio-affective dispositions favourable to that realisation (motivations, aspirations, values)	Possessing socio-affective dispositions favourable to that realisation (motivations, aspirations, values either as required by the specific question or by the task)
Rlp:	Selecting meanings adequate to that micro-context, that is, knowing how to proceed to solve problems correctly	Selecting meanings adequate to the poetry micro-context, that is, knowing how to recognise knowledge and concepts that will enable production of appropriate text
Rla::	Producing the text, that is, presenting a correct solution to the problem	Producing the text, that is, presenting a text that makes explicit the correct knowledge and concepts as applied in the poetry micro-context

Neves re-tested work previously analysed to identify changes in recognition and realisation from participants and I did the same. Details of the re-test follow.

All learners in the class completed a questionnaire in the third term and the entire process was completed with the re-tests. In the Morais and Neves study, an instrument was constructed to “analyse recognition and realisation in the assessing context” (2001:202). This involved a two-stage ‘test’ to ascertain whether the students demonstrated recognition, passive and/or active realisation. It took the form of a semi-structured interview. I developed a similar ‘test’ administered six months after the completion of the year’s learning and based entirely on the November/December exam of the previous year and the learners’ own answers to that examination. It was two-stage, in that the form of the test started as a structured group discussion that was strongly classified and framed with explicit explanation to the groups of learners of the process involved. In the second stage of the test, individual learners wrote, in silence, the answers to the questions. The classification remained positive but the framing was more loosely articulated to allow for expression of the learner’s voice. Learners were required to initially identify the best answer to a question, then identify the worst answer and produce a text in which they had to explain why, or give reasons why, it was the worst answer. The identification

of the best answer demonstrates that the learner has recognised the specific poetry knowledge and concepts. The operation that the learners is required to perform is recall of previously learned knowledge or concept. Correct identification of the worst answer suggests that the learner is able to discern between two answers that are in some way flawed and thus the learner demonstrates passive realisation with the possibility of demonstrating active realisation. The operation that the learner is required to perform is somewhat more complex than recall as if the learner is able to make the distinction, he/she is demonstrating that the potential for producing text that realises knowledge or concepts exists. Expressed alternately, the learner demonstrates that he/she not only recalls the specific knowledge or concept, but has taken the first step in demonstrating a more complex understanding of the general principles that underpin that knowledge or concept. If the learner is able to produce a text that adequately explains why he has selected the worst answer, then the learner demonstrates mastery of active realisation in this micro-context or, expressed alternately, he/she can produce a text that demonstrates a more complex understanding of the general principles that underpin the required knowledge or concept.

The test took place over two one hour sessions, with two groups of five learners, one week apart. I refer to this in the following chapters as the 're-test'. That the re-test took place over two weeks, was a disadvantage as the time lapse may have impacted on the results of the written part of the test. However, all learners (with the exception of two who were absent for the introductory session and are accounted for in the analysis) experienced the same lapse of time.

In the secondary focus of the study, the exploration of Learner Disposition, I made use of Hoadley's Phd Thesis, *Social Class, Pedagogy and the Specialisation of Voice in Four South African Primary Schools* (2005). In this thesis, she explores the dispositions of the teachers studied. I adapted her method of exploration to the dispositions of the learners studied at Ace High School. This aspect of the study is exploratory in nature and researches the qualitative disposition of the learner to school. It does not intend to establish a direct causal relationship between the disposition of the learner and his/her demonstrations of recognition and realisation. Details of her thesis have been referred to in Chapter 3.

In order to make sense of the information gleaned from learners, I referred to Ian Parker (1992) and his 10 Criteria for distinguishing discourses and their applications in *Culture Power & Difference* (1997) by the same author that provides a number of examples.

The criteria are described below:

- A discourse is realised in text: The objects of study (in this case, the learners) must be treated as texts made up of words. In this instance, the text was the discussions and the questionnaires and Parker advises that “a process of exploring the connotations, allusions and implications which the texts evoke” (Parker, 1992:7) must be employed. Throughout my analysis, efforts were made to ‘unpack’ the connotations, allusions and implications of the discourse.
- Discourse is about objects: According to Foucault, (1972:49 in Parker, 1992:8) discourses are “practices that systematically form the objects of which they speak”. This means that discourses speak of a ‘reality’ and it is the job of the researcher to find out about the objects of reality to which the discourses refer. It is this complex reality that the teachers failed to understand of the Cherokees.
- A discourse contains subjects: Different types of persons are talked about in the discourses and “we cannot avoid the perceptions of ourselves and others that discourse invite” (Parker, 1992:9). In order to ‘hear’ the discourse, we need to understand in what way the discourse is talking to us – what role do we hold as subjects of the discourse. This is a significant factor considering my role as both researcher and teacher.
- A discourse is a coherent system of meanings: Within a discourse, statements can be grouped to lend coherence to a subject. In order to successfully analyse discourse, culturally available understanding of what constitutes a topic must be employed and questions must be asked about whom the discourse benefits and whom it oppresses. This criteria relates to what Giroux advises above and allows the creation of a map of the world that this particular discourse presents.
- A discourse refers to other discourses: This criteria is concerned about the relationship between thought and language – “the articulation of our reflections on discourse must require the use of discourses. A critical reflection on a discourse will often involve the use of other discourses.” (Parker, 1992:13). There is an interrelationship between different discourses in an analysis and discourses draw

support from each other. The distinction between the discourses is conceptual. For example, Bernstein's way of looking at objects differs from Bourdieu and Giroux strongly asserts that "language is not merely an instrument that reflects social reality 'out there' but also is partly constitutive of what in our society is considered 'real'. (Giroux 1988:xvii)

- A discourse reflects on its own way of speaking: The terms that are used within a discourse are commented on and reflected upon. An analysis of discourse "should bring in other readers and listeners and use their understanding of a discourse to bring out the implicit meanings." (Parker, 1992:15) Thus, the analyst must refer to other texts to elaborate on the discourse being analysed and reflect on the terms used to describe the discourse. Throughout my analysis, I have referred to the theorists discussed above and in Chapter 2.
- A discourse is historically related: It is pertinent that a discourse is not static, it is located in time and when analysing the discourse, the time and place at which it emerged must be taken into account.

Parker adds three further criteria to his initial seven that are also relevant. They are:

- Discourses support institutions: Parker supports what Bourdieu has to say – "a discourse is also a practice which reproduces the material basis of the institution". (Parker, 1992:17) This is particularly relevant as in my analysis I must identify institutions (the school) which are reinforced or subverted by the discourse.
- Discourses reproduce power relations: Parker uses an analogy to demonstrate how patients are disempowered by medical discourse and this surely can apply to learners who are disempowered by school discourse. Bernstein contends that the elaborated code of school may pose as an obstacle to social transformation and the critical pedagogy of Giroux advocates teachers who actively empower learners through their discourse. This is central to my investigation that aims to explore the possibility of social transformation of working class learners.
- Discourses have ideological effects: If discourses reproduce power relations, a political position lies behind the discourse. The analyst must reveal that position and show how discourse sanctions the oppressed and allows dominant groups to legitimise their positions.

Throughout the analysis in Chapter Six, I am mindful of the power of the institution as the learners reveal their dispositions “within the gaze of the institution” (Levett et al., 1997:45) This notion is vitally important in making sense of the “types of self” (Parker, I. 1992:8) especially as I, as the researcher, also represent the institution as the teacher of the learners. My position in relation to the learners is explored further in the discussion on validity and reliability as is my inexperience as an interviewer. Henning (2004) suggests that in order to make sense of the multiple meanings of the participants’ reality, the researcher should question the origin of the discourse, the framework in which it exists and how it is strengthened in the specific social context. Kvale (in Henning 2004:165) explains about a spiral toward deepened understanding of meaning:

“...it is common to read an interview through first to get at the more or less general meaning. One then goes back to certain themes and special expression, tries to develop their meaning, then again return to the more global meaning of the interview in the light of the deepened meaning of the parts, and so on.”

Rigorous efforts have been made to adhere to this process. In the initial focus on Recognition and Realisation Rules, the analysis could be accused of being atomistic because, as mentioned earlier, it is orientated toward a specific concept and thus it foregrounds one aspect of the learner and the theory is made use of to materialise this, specific aspect. However, in the secondary focus, the analysis is more holistic, addressing a more complex, interwoven system of networks that make up the patterns of human behaviour that reveal the participants’ reality and which are resistant to “reductionist account” (Parker 1992:26).

#### **4.3 THE APPROACH TO THE STUDY**

A Case Study design was employed “to gain an in-depth understanding of the situation and meaning for those involved”. (Merriam 1999 in Henning, 2004:41)

Essentially the aim of the study was to provide an in-depth discussion, rich in meaning that resulted from an interaction between the participants in the sample (the learners), the context (the school) and their actions (texts for analysis). The process of the interaction was the focal point of the study and this represented the unit of analysis. The case study design is justified in this instance because it is well suited to a small-scale study that is limited in breadth but displays depth in meaning. “Cresswell (1998:61 in Hoadley 2005:47) defines a case study as an exploration of a ‘bounded system’ of a case over time, through detailed, in-depth data collection”.

4.3.1 The Context: The study was located at Ace High School. This is a well-resourced, former Model C school that presently has 1083 male and female learners enrolled. It is situated in the suburbs of Pietermaritzburg, a short walking-distance from the centre of the city. It is considered to be a transformed school as the racial breakdown of the learners is representative of the racial breakdown of the province of KwaZulu-Natal. The learners are drawn from diverse social backgrounds but the bulk of them (approximately 80%) come from working class to lower-middle class communities. There are boarders at the school but the study focussed on day learners who pay R6 600,00 per annum school fees. There are 50 members of staff, 11 of whom are paid by the governing body. Members of staff are well qualified.

The school boasts a proud record of achievement in matric results:

2002	100% NSC	44% Exemption
2003	98,3% NSC	50,3% Exemption
2004	96,17% NSC	50,82% Exemption
2005	99,5% NSC	62% Exemption (17,20% Conditional)

(Results obtained from National Senior Certificate NCS Results Sheets)

This school was selected because the majority of the learners come from either a working class or a lower-middle class background and because of its academic record in matric. As discussed in Chapter 3, Bernstein’s theory focuses on learners’ particular orientation to meaning due to the dominance of either the community code or their access to the elaborated code. Learners at Ace High School fit the profile of those learners who would have difficulty in accessing the elaborated code demanded

in school performance due to their working class background and yet, matric results suggest that despite their background, nearly 100% of learners at this school are performing sufficiently well to pass the National Senior Certificate and more than half of them are gaining Exemption which enables them to study further.

#### 4.3.2 The Key Questions

In terms of Bernstein's theory, control of the recognition and realisation rules is a pre-requisite to gain access to the elaborated code. The key research question is:

To what extent do learners in Grade 10 English Main Language at Ace High School demonstrate mastery of the recognition and realisation rules?

A sub question relating to the requirements of the FET National Curriculum Statement (2003) dealing with the poetry concepts, knowledge and skills necessary to Grade 10 English Main Language Learners needs to be answered first. This is the first step in the research process and aligns the requirements of the Official Discourse with the requirements of the Pedagogic Discourse. All tasks, activities, exercises and questions were initially analysed to correlate with the Specific Outcomes of the NCS.

Coding was used to denote the correlation between the questions analysed and the specific outcomes in the NCS (2003). For example the code LO2.3.1 refers to the following Learning Outcome and Assessment Standard:

**Learning Outcome 2: Reading and Viewing** – The learner is able to read and view for understanding and to evaluate critically and respond to a wide range of texts.

**Assessment Standard 2.3:** We know this when the learner is able to explain how language and images may reflect and shape attitudes:

**2.3.1:** Identify and explain the socio-cultural and political values, attitudes and beliefs such as attitudes towards gender, class, age, power relations, human rights, inclusivity and environmental issues.

Thereafter a further key question arises:

Is there a relationship between learner disposition and their demonstrations of mastery of the recognition and realisation rules?

4.3.3 The Sample: The class for observation was purposefully selected. In 1967, Hargreaves observed the development of subcultures at a school in England that he suggested correlated with the organisational division of classes in a grade (Hargreaves, 1967). He identified certain indicators that characterised a member of a specific class that was streamed according to academic performance. At Ace High School, there are six classes per grade. The A Class is streamed according to the highest scores of the previous year and is expected to perform to an academically high standard but in other classes, other criteria come into play and expectations vary. For example, all learners who take Afrikaans 2<sup>nd</sup> Language or Zulu Home Language must be in the A B or C class. The result is that the other five classes are mixed ability classes to a greater or lesser extent. The class selected for observation was a J class. This is a mixed ability class and the basis for learner inclusion in this class has to do with the learner's choice of subjects for matric and time-tabling requirements. These learners are representative of the 'average'. They are not the 'high-achievers' or the 'problem-children'. There were 39 learners in the class, which is an average size for an English class at Ace High School, five of whom had repeated a year at school. All learners in the class were Zulu speaking although 23 learners stated that their home language was both English and Zulu. There were 19 females and 20 males in this class, almost a 50% gender split. The homogeneous racial composition of the class and the gender split is somewhat unusual at Ace High School because in most classes there are representatives of other races as the school's learner population closely represents the province's racial composition and in most classes there are more males than females as the school was traditionally for boys and it is still favoured by boys. However, this composition of learners was an important factor in the selection of this class as other issues (eg. racial/gender) that may have impacted on learner performance were avoided. The registrar of this class is an experienced and well-respected educator who ensured that disciplinary measures imposed on learners in all subjects were carried out. She enjoyed harmonious relations with the learners and in my opinion, had a positive impact on the general well-being of the class. However, this factor has not been explored as an indicator impacting on the learners' dispositions. All learners were informed at the beginning of the year that that class

had been selected for research purposes and that their English lessons and tasks were being observed and monitored. There is a possibility that this may have also positively impacted on the performance of the class but it is unlikely that they would have been able to sustain their efforts for an entire year and this factor has not been explored as an indicator impacting on the learners' dispositions. They were not informed before the end of the year, who the members of the sample group would be, or even if there was a sample group, so this did not impact on the data.

According to methods of purposeful sample selection as described by Struwig and Stead (2001), a critical case sample was selected because it was hoped that this sample would provide the most meaningful information. The relevance of the information is inherent in its logic, not in its generalisations. Primarily, the basis for selection of the sample group was the learners' mid-year results. A range of learners from the top mark in the class to one of the bottom marks. A total of five females and five males were selected. Learners who demonstrated confidence in class and who I believed would be comfortable and willing to participate were selected. In my opinion, all learners selected can adequately understand and express themselves in English although this is not their mother tongue. All learners study English Home Language at school and passed the requirements for Grade 9 so despite the fact that their mother tongue is not English, linguistic ability should not be a factor that prevents them from recognising and realising knowledge and concepts. In their answers, language, spelling and grammar errors were not taken into account in the analysis of the data. There were a number of repeats in this class, two of whom are among the sample. The sample group was observed throughout the year but specific poetry tasks were selected for detailed analysis using tools created to observe mastery of Bernstein's recognition and realisation rules.

**PROFILE OF SAMPLE:**

	<u>GENDER</u>	<u>AGE</u>	<u>REPEAT</u>	<u>PARENT</u>	<u>OCCUPATION</u>
Nh)	Female	16	Yes Gr 1	Single	Police Woman
Nn)	Male	17	Yes Gr 10	Two	Contractor to Government Services (Retired)
Kh)	Male	16	No	Two	Correctional Services

Pm)	Female	15	No	Two	Teachers
Zm)	Female	15	No	Single	Nurse
Nw)	Female	15	No	Nil	Nil
Sd)	Male	16	No	Two	Businessman (Owner)
Bm)	Male	15	No	Single	Teacher
Nr)	Male	16	No	Single	Government (not Specified)
Fn)	Female	15	No	Single	Teacher

4.3.4 Data Collection Strategies: Tasks through the year yielded the data for analysis. They included: An oral task (with a written presentation) at the beginning of the year, mid-year exams, one written class worksheet in Term Three and final exams. The tasks have been selected as they took place at various times throughout the year and because they reflect a variety of learning/teaching/assessment strategies. In total, 267 discrete texts were correlated with Specific Outcomes and Assessment Standards in NCS (2003) and analysed for demonstrations of mastery of the Recognition and Realisation Rules. Examples of texts and analysis are included in Chapter Five. In-depth group interviews (with five learners in each group) were conducted to explore their learner dispositions. Examples of the transcript of the interviews and analysis thereof are provided in Chapter Six.

#### 4.4 VALIDITY AND RELIABILITY

Mouton (1996) debates the elusive ideal of truth. The aim of this study is not to present 'truth' but to present findings that are sound and can be defended by adherence to an external language of description and by a detailed, explicit revelation of all data capturing and analytical procedures. The internal language of description is Bernstein's Theory and the concepts and constructs therein enable the researcher to develop an external language of description that is a 'data-near device' that allows the researcher to 'read' the data that yields valid findings (Moore & Muller 2002:634).

In this case study, efforts were made to ensure the validity of the findings: the data that was analysed for demonstrations of recognition and realisation was produced

from the learners' actual work and their questionnaires that were meticulously transcribed and filed; The interviews were recorded and transcribed as was the first session of the re-test; Copies of the transcriptions were given to the learners to read and check for accuracy and any changes were implemented. The findings emanated from a variety of data sources and a multiplicity of texts.

There were threats to the validity of the findings, especially in the interview. It was mentioned earlier that my relationship to the learners is that of teacher to learner that inevitably is underpinned by a relationship of authority. In selecting the sample, this factor was taken into account and in order to minimise its effect, and after observing the class throughout the year, learners were selected who displayed an ease to express themselves to me and an enthusiasm to talk. As Nn said in the interview, "All I know is I like to talk".

Henning (2004) refers to the participants of the interview as co-constructors of the meaning. Whether the interviewer intends it or not, there is a two-way communicative action and the actions of the interviewer impact on the actions of the interviewee. I was aware of my inexperience as an interviewer and noted limitations to the study that resulted from this factor. Specifically, the issue of substance abuse by parents arose and initially my response to the learner (a mild, light response) unintentionally, but effectively quelled on-going discussion. I mis-read the depth and seriousness of her comment and I didn't have the experience or skill as an interviewer to unobtrusively re-direct the discussion back to the issue. This is discussed further in Chapters Five and Six. I was also aware that my analysis is from an educator's point of view as opposed to from a psychological point of view and I lack the skills to analyse from a psychological perspective. Had the interview been conducted by a psychologist, results may have differed.

The issue of researcher bias, considering my intimate relationship with both the school and the learners was taken into account. It was for this reason that a Hermeneutic approach was adopted in the analysis. From this perspective, the interpreter engages with his/her own bias and risks testing his/her preconceptions and prejudices. "Meaning is negotiated in the act of dialogue and not discovered" (Naidoo, 2006:69). Transparency in methods of interpretation has been aimed for

throughout the study to ensure that the Hermeneutic approach has indeed been adopted.

It is generally understood that data is reliable if different researchers in the same context produce the same results. When discussing the model of the study, the timing of the re-test was raised as a possible threat to the validity of the results. I am not convinced that had the written part of the test been conducted on the same day as the discussion part, the results would have been the same. Nevertheless, I am convinced that the existing results are reliable as if a different researcher had conducted the same test in the same time frame, the results would have been the same.

The case study approach can only be generalised to the theory and not to society. It is noted that the ten learners who participated in the study represent approximately 4.6% of all Grade 10 learners in 2005 in one school. However, the power of this study is not in its broad generalisations but in its depth of illuminating specific interactions (Henning, 2004).

#### **4.5 CONCLUSION**

Ensor & Hoadley (2000) warn about the tendency toward the anecdotal and snippets of information in a case study approach. In this study, the wealth of the findings produced from a set of data has been positioned against the orientating concepts referred to above in an attempt to produce valid and reliable results and avoid anecdotal snippets of information. The logic of the methodology employed is both inductive and deductive. The discourse analysis inductively inferred generalisations from specific, particular texts of the learners whereas the analysis of the learners' mastery of recognition and realisation rule worked deductively from the general theory of Bernstein to apply to the specific texts of the learners. These results are explored in-depth in Chapter 6.

## **CHAPTER FIVE: EXAMPLES OF SOURCES OF DATA AND METHOD OF ANALYSIS**

### **5.1 INTRODUCTION:**

The aim of this chapter is not to analyse the data but to make the process of analysis transparent. In this chapter I provide examples of the poems that learners studied, examples of the questions that learners responded to, the correlated Learning Outcome Performance Standard and how the questions were coded for recognition and realisation. Although necessarily, analysis is undertaken, the focus of this chapter is the method of analysis. This chapter is structured to make clear this method and it is not intended to make the analysis meaningful. The aim of Chapter Six is to present a meaningful analysis and this chapter precedes it to facilitate the interpretation of Chapter Six.

As mentioned in Chapter One, two sub-questions had to be answered before the key research questions could be approached. The two sub-questions are:

- What are the Performance Standards pertaining to the micro-context of poetry as stipulated in the NCS (2003) for Grade 10 English Home Language?
- Do these Performance Standards require control of the recognition rule or the realisation rule or both rules by the learner?

These preliminary studies had to be undertaken in order to ensure that the tasks undertaken by the learners in their classwork and their examinations, were aligned with the existing curriculum. If the Grade 10 learners demonstrate control of the recognition and realisation rules, but the micro-context to which they apply is not relevant to the curriculum, then their demonstrations are not of worth in the context of schooling and education in South Africa. In this chapter, the Learning Outcome Performance Standards are correlated to the questions in the tasks. In Chapter Six, the Learning Outcome Performance Standards are not indicated as the focus of Chapter Six is on the learners' control of recognition and realisation and their dispositions.

## 5.2 EXAMPLES OF POEMS

In the rest of this chapter, single spacing has been used as the format of the chapter is not in paragraphs.

### 5.2.1

(Extracts from)

**FIRST BLOOD** by Jon Stallworthy

It was. The breech smelling of oil, 1  
The Stock of resin – buried snug  
In the shoulder. Not too much recoil  
At the firing of the first slug.

(Jubilantly into the air) 5  
Nor yet too little. Targets pinned  
Against a tree shot down: and there  
Abandoned to the sniping wind.

The larches closed their ranks. And when 10  
Earth would not muffle the drumming blood  
We, like dishonoured soldiers, ran  
The gauntlet of a darkening wood.

### 5.2.2

(An extract from)

**TELEPHONE CONVERSATION** by W. Soyinka

The price seemed reasonable, location  
Indifferent. The landlady swore she lived  
Off premises. Nothing remained  
But self-confession. 'Madam', I warned,  
'I hate a wasted journey – I am African.' 5  
Silence. Silenced transmission of  
Pressurised good-breeding. Voice, when it came,  
Lipstick-coated, long gold-rolled  
Cigarette-holder pipped. Caught I was, foully.  
'HOW DARK?' ..... I had not misheard ..... 'ARE YOU LIGHT 10  
OR VERY DARK?' ButtonB. Button A. Stench  
Of rancid breath of public hide-and-speak.  
Red booth, Red pillar-box. Red double-tiered  
Omnibus squelching tar. It was real! Shamed  
By ill-mannered silence, surrender 15  
Pushed dumbfoundment to beg simplification.  
Considerate she was, varying the emphasis –  
'ARE YOU DARK? OR VERY LIGHT?' Revelation came.

### 5.2.3

(An extract from)

SONATINA OF PETER GOVENDER, BEACHED by Douglas Livingstone

My last was *Dieselene Conqueror*  
- night-muggings, cops,  
knives, that coked and jammed injector  
- right hand nursing in me a reel, 5  
the cane cracking at the start of the day,  
things of the land becoming remote.  
My prime as oarsman:  
heroics of the offshore boat,  
catching all that steel slabs of sea could express.  
My porpoise-wife is gone, seeded 10  
spent, queen among curry-makers.  
I'm old now, curt.

### 5.2.4

(An extract from)

ONE SMALL BOY LONGS FOR SUMMER by Mafika Gwala

The kettle hisses  
Mother moves about the kitchen  
Sliding from corner to corner.  
The fire from the stove  
Pierces into the marrow. 5  
And mother pushing towards the stove  
Warns of the steam.  
My young brother, Thamu, jerks my arm  
Violently: Stop leaning on me, your elbow  
Has sunk into my thigh. 10  
Apology  
I wasn't aware.

The kettle sings  
Some distant far-away song?  
Mother picks it up 15  
With an almost tender care.  
Sets me thinking of a war-picture  
The actor carefully setting the charge  
And smiling all the time  
I'll also be a soldier 20  
When I'm old – why, Uncle Shoba was one  
Father drops the paper on the table  
He comes to join us  
- staring coldly round.  
It's no frown really, 25  
But he's grinding his jaws.  
Maybe it's the July Handicap.

### 5.2.5

(An extract from)  
WOMAN OF THE FUTURE by Cathy Warry

I am a child. 1  
I am all the things of my past.  
I am the freckles from my mother's nose.  
I am the laziness of my dad  
Resting his eyes in front of the television. 5  
I am all I see.  
Boys doing Karate chops.  
Rubens' lovely ladies,  
Fat and bulging.  
Tv ads of ladies who wear lipstick in the laundry. 10  
And worry about their hands  
And their breath.  
Madonnas with delicate faces holding little bundles of Jesus.

### 5.2.6

MY NAME by Magoleng wa Selepe

Look what they have done to my name ..... 1  
The wonderful name of my great-great-grandmothers  
*Nomgqibelo Ncamisile Mnqhibisa*

The burly bureaucrat was surprised  
What he heard was music to his ears 5  
'Wat is daai, se nou weer?'  
'I am from Chief Daluxolo Velayigodle of emaMpodweni  
and my name is *Nomgqibelo Ncamisile Mnqhibisa*'

Messia, help me!  
My name is so simple 10  
And yet so meaningful,  
But to this man it is trash .....

He gives me a name  
Convenient enough to answer his whim:  
I end up being, 15  
Maria .....  
I .....  
*Nomgqibelo Ncamisile Mnqhibisa*



## 5.2.8

### WARNING by Jenny Joseph

When I am an old woman I shall wear purple            1  
With a red had which doesn't go, and doesn't suit me,  
And I shall spend my pension on brandy and summer gloves  
And satin sandals, and say we've no money for butter.  
And I shall sit down on the pavement when I am tired  
And gobble up samples in shops and press alarm bells  
And run my stick along the public railings  
And make up for the sobriety of my youth,  
I shall go out in my slippers in the rain            10  
And pick the flowers in other people's gardens  
And learn to spit.

You can wear terrible shirts and grow more fat  
And eat three pounds of sausages at a go  
Or only bread and pickle for a week            15  
And hoard pens and pencils and beer mats and things in boxes.

But now we must have clothes that keep us dry  
And pay our rent and not swear in the street  
And set a good example for the children.  
We will have friends to dinner and read the papers. 20

But maybe I ought to practise a little now?  
So people who know me are not too shocked and surprised  
When suddenly I am old and start to wear purple.

## **5.3    EXAMPLES OF QUESTIONS SET ON POEMS, PERFORMANCE STANDARDS AND CODING FOR RECOGNITION AND REALISATION**

### **5.3.1    QUESTIONS ON HIPPOPOTAMUSMAN, RELATIVE LEARNING OUTCOME PERFORMANCE STANDARDS, CODING FOR RECOGNITION AND REALISATION PLUS MODEL ANSWERS**

5.3.1.1 In the title to this poem (Hippopotamusman), the poet has chosen to combine two words and create one. In your opinion, why does he do this?            (2)

Learning Outcome 2.4.1: Explore key features of texts and explain how they contribute to meaning (these features should never be dealt with in isolation):  
\*transactional and creative texts (eg.poetry) – identify and explain the purpose, structure and language used in texts across the curriculum (In this case, poetry).

**Rla:** The learner is required to produce a text that demonstrates that he/she correctly understands why the poet has chosen to create this new word.

**Model Answer:** The image is not of a man or of a hippo but of a new creature with characteristics of both man and hippo;

**OR,** The new word attracts attention and emphasises the ugliness of the Hippopotomusman;

**OR,** It gives the image more 'umph' – not just any ordinarily ugly man.

**5.3.1.2** Quote from the poem to identify two more examples of the above technique that the poet has used. (1)

**Learning Outcome 2.2.1:** explain the meaning of a wide range of written, visual, audio and audio-visual text: Find (in this case identify) some relevant information and detail in the text.

**Rck:** The learner is required to recognise knowledge that has been previously acquired.

**Model Answer:** "grotesqueeruptions"; "wartsscrambled"; "limpinggropingly"; "mudstudded";

**5.3.1.3** Explain why these newly created words are so effective. (3)

**Learning Outcome 2.1.6:** Demonstrate various reading and viewing strategies for comprehension and application – infer the meaning of unfamiliar words or images in selected contexts by using knowledge of grammar, word-attack skills, contextual clues, sound, colour, design, placement and by using the senses;

**AND**

**Learning Outcome 2.3.1:** Explain how language and images may reflect and shape values and attitudes – identify and explain the socio-cultural and political values, attitudes and beliefs such as attitudes towards gender, class, age, power relations, human rights, inclusivity and environmental issues.

**Rla:** The learner is required to produce text that demonstrates that he/she is able to explain the efficacy of the images in relation to our attitudes and values.

**Model Answer:** The combined words have a cumulative effect eg. Grotesqueeruptions are not just grotesque, or just queer or just eruptions but all three, one on top of the other to emphasise the horror of the man.

**OR,** the combined words create a clearer picture with greater emphasis on the ugliness of the man, sparking the imagination;

OR, because the words are new and different, they attract our attention, cause the reader to pause and more deeply consider the meaning and impact of the word and image.

5.3.1.4 Consider Lines 15 – 21. In your own words, describe the response of the passengers. Is their response true to real life according to your experience? Provide an example from your own experience to support your answer. (4)

Learning Outcome 2.5.1: Poetry: explain how word choices, imagery and sound devices affect mood, meaning and theme;

AND

Learning Outcome 2.3.1 and Learning Outcome 2.3.2: explain how language and images may reflect and shape values and attitudes – identify and explain the socio-cultural and political values, attitudes and beliefs such as attitudes towards gender, class, age, power relations, human rights, inclusivity and environmental issues and explain the nature of bias, prejudice and discrimination in texts.

Rck and Rcc and Rlp and Rla: The learner is required to recognise knowledge previously acquired and demonstrate this knowledge by describing the scene in the poem. He/she is required to demonstrate passive realisation by stating whether this is true to real life experience and then demonstrate active realisation by providing an example to support the previous answer. Furthermore, the learner is required to demonstrate socio-affective competences by recognising the attitude of the passenger and comparing their attitude to his/her own.

Model Answer: The passengers privately spew (spit) at the man revealing their disdain for him but had they been in groups, and not individuals, they would have openly laughed at him, publicly displaying their scorn. Learners must recognise that it is common practice for an individual to conceal her views, feelings and opinions, but in a group, she would be more inclined to express herself. Learners must choose any appropriate example from their own experience. Individual learners may be critical of the passengers' response and may choose an example that negates the norm but they must make clear how and why their response differs from the one in the poem.

#### **5.4 EXAMPLES OF LEARNERS' ANSWERS AND ANALYSIS THEREOF**

In this section, I provide all answers analysed for the above questions. In Chapter 6, only selected answers are provided. The same method of analysis was applied to all tasks throughout the year as described in Chapter Four but here I only provide detailed answers to the questions above. I refer to the LO numbers. The full Learning Outcome Performance Standard is stipulated above. The mark allocation that the learner received is also provided but is not relevant to this study as the marks were awarded in response to the criteria for assessment and did not necessarily relate to the recognition and/or realisation requirements. "F" suggests that the learner has failed to apply the recognition or realisation rule to answer the question.

5.4.1 In the title to this poem, the poet has chosen to combine two words and create one. In your opinion, why does he do this? LO 2.4.1 Rla (2)

- nh) To make us see that the man looked like a hippopotamus to give the idea of what to expect in the poem. R1a- (1)
- nn) To make us get the picture of that the poet is saying. R1a- (1)
- kh) To combine these two words in order to make a picture in our minds of these two objects combined or mixed. R1a (2)
- pm) He is describing this man with a hippopotamus his giving him a name that describes him best. R1a- (1)
- zm) I think it is to make the title more effective. Rc (this learner recognises that by combining the words, the title becomes more effective but she is unable to explain why.) (0)
- nw) It is because when you say the words, they sound as one word. F (0)
- sd) He does this to make the word sound worse than it normally is and to show how ugly the person really is. R1a- (1)
- bm) The poet wants to give us a sense of ambiguity that what he is talking about is a hippo that is a man. R1a--(This learner incorrectly identifies this technique as ambiguity thus suggesting that there is no active realisation of the language technique used. However, there is minimal understanding of the combination of characteristics of man and hippo.) (1)
- nr) He emphasises the significance of putting the two words to create a much stronger and more effective feeling on to what he looked like. R1a- (1)
- fn) I think he does this to create a whole new image of a man who is huge, grumpy and ugly and looks like a hippo. R1a (2)

5.4.2 Quote from the poem to identify two more examples of the above technique that the poet has used. LO2.2.1 Rck (1)

- nh) "A face like a hippopotamus" F (0)
- nn) Grotesqueeruptions; Wartsscrambled Rck (1)
- kh) (line 2) a man with a face like a hippopotamus (Line 27/28) the hippopotamusman wondered whether it was Wednesday. F (0)
- pm) Grotesqueeruptions and wartsscrambled Rck (1)
- zm) Grotesqueeruptions and Wartsscrambled Rck (1)
- nw) Wartsscrambled and Grotesqueeruptions Rck (1)
- sd) Wartsscrambled and Limpinggropingly Rck (1)

- bm) Wartsscrambled mudstunned limpinggropingly making two words to be one.  
Rck (1)
- nr) “groesqueereruptions” and “wartsscrambled” Rck (1)
- fn) “grotesqueereruptions” and “wartsscrambled” Rck (1)

5.4.3 Explain why these newly created words are so effective. LO 2.1.6 & 2.3.1 R1a (3)

nh) They show us exactly what the poet is trying to tell us what he/she means by writing this poem for us to read it. To show the use of language he combines words. F(0)

nn) Because it describes the structure of the person the poet is talking about. F(0)

kh) I think they are effective because you first do not get their mean but the sound horrible and when you do find there meaning you get a really gross picture in your head. R1a- (2)

pm) They are used together to describe this one man because he is undescriblebal. R1a-- (1)

zm) It's because they make it more hoffific and hideous. It also makes more disgusting than ever. R1a- (1)

nw) They are so effective because you don't usually get them from any poem or in any book, they are words made up by the poet. R1a- (1)

sd) They give a completely new meaning to the original word because when a person reads this he will see hippopotamus and man put them together it sound very nasty. R1a (1)

bm) They are so effective because of their ambiguity it gives us more understanding of the hippopotamusman looks like. (Repeated incorrect use of ambiguity concept) F (1/2)

nr) They are very effective because the thought of this think like, warts scrambled shows that it like thick warts filled with puss scrambled all over his face. R1a- (1)

fn) They are effective because they make literally imagine exactly what this man looks like, because of the warts that are scrambled in his face and is just ugly, strange and explosive – disgusting image. R1a- (2)

5.4.4 Consider lines 15 – 21. In your own words, describe the response of the passengers. Is their response true to real life according to your own experience? Provide an example from your experience to support your answer. LO 2.5.1 & 2.3.1. & 2.3.2 Rck Rcc Rlp R1a (4)

nh) . No. In life people either laugh or talk about you while you are passing. Even though they are not in groups but some of them might just look at each other. Some might vomit and open their windows wide open for fresh air. Some might move away from their places and rather sit with their worst enemies. Rcc- (1)

nn) It true that some people drink so much that they don't remember the days of the week. The passengers would turn their face because you can see the person is so ugly by look at him feel like vomiting so it better to like throughout the window. Rck (1)

kh) The passengers felt like get of(f) the bus and not see something so ugly that might had made them get running stomach or made them want to vomit. Yes, it is true that in real like that if they were in groups they would have laughed because it happen all the time among black communities. Rcc Rck- Rlp (2)

pm) They are disgusted by the look this man they don't even want to look at him they turn around and face the window. Yes, it is true. When I had my leg burnt everyone used to turn and stare at my leg. It was quite emberresing. Rck Rlp Rcc-(1)

zm) The passengers pretended as if they didn't see anything but really they did and they felt like throwing up. The response is true to real life eg. If a person (girl) has a black eye and she gets in a taxi, everyone will be quiet or just talk about something else. But when she gets off the taxi, the people will start talking. Maybe saying she has an abusive boyfriend or father and they assume she needs help. It's more like gossiping. Rck Rcc- Rlp Rla- (2)

nw) They had been in groups, laughing but when the hippopotamusman entered they were all singles, turned their faces to the window, yes it is true in real life. One of the friends, her mouth stinks and when she talks, we block out noses. Rck- Rcc- Rlp (2)

sd) If they had been when they friends they would have laughed at him but they were alone they turned their faces out the window they didn't who it but inside they were disgusted. Rck Rcc Rla- (2)

bm) Their response is true to real life because people think that they are superior and look down on others they laugh and gossip. Some were vomit just because of your appearance prejudice. Rck- Rcc Rlp (2)

nr) Yes their reactions are true indeed, because if you'll are in groups and see something odd your'll tend to laugh but if you are alone your turn a blind eye and walk past. For me it was when there was a fight at the market square and I walked straight past when I was walk alone but if we were a group I promise you we would have stopped and started cheering and making noise. Rck Rcc Rlp Rla (4)

fn) The response from the passengers was that they were feeling disgusted and couldn't even bare to look at the man so they turned away, since they were in singles. Their response is true to real life. Eg. At a grocery store, a seriously physically challenged woman was shopping for groceries and some other kids were laughing at

her and some staring at her, and she was carrying on with her shopping like any other day, just like you would shop everyday for your groceries. Rck Rcc- Rlp Rla- (3)

**STATISTICAL SUMMATIVE ANALYSIS OF LEARNERS RESPONSES:**

LEARNERS	5.4.1 Rla	5.4.2 Rck	5.4.3 Rla	5.4.4 Rck/Rcc/Rlp/Rla	TOTAL
Nh	,5	0	0	,5	1
Nn	,5	1	0	1	2,5
Pm	,5	1	,5	2,5	4,5
Kh	1	0	,5	2,5	4
Zm	0	1	,5	3	4,5
Nw	0	1	,5	2	3,5
Sd	,5	1	1	2,5	5
Bm	,5	1	0	2,5	4
Nr	,5	1	,5	4	6
Fn	1	1	,5	2	4,5

The above table shows whether learners were required to ReCognise Knowledge (Rck), ReCognise Socio-Affective Competences (Rcc), Passively ReaLise Knowledge and Concepts (Rlp) or Actively ReaLise Knowledge and Concepts (Rla) in questions 5.4.1, 5.4.2, 5.4.3 and 5.4.4. It shows that 7 opportunities in total occurred for learners to demonstrate either recognition or realisation and also shows the total number of demonstrations from each learner. Nh only managed to demonstrate recognition and/or realisation in 1 instance out of 7 whereas Nr demonstrated recognition and/or realisation in 6 out of 7 opportunities. This case study was approached from a qualitative perspective but some quantitative statistics have been provided to support and enhance the qualitative analysis undertaken in Chapter 6.

**5.5 TASK ONE**

In Task One, learners were required to choose their own poem for analysis. Extracts from the poems are provided in Chapter Six but I have not included all of the poems as learners each analysed different poems

## **5.6 CONCLUSION**

Chapter Four provided details of the methodology employed in this case study, Chapter Six presents an in-depth meaningful analysis of the results of the case study but this chapter provides a bridge between the method and the results, it makes transparent the process employed to obtain the results and ensures strict adherence to the methods described in Chapter Four.

**CHAPTER SIX: IN-DEPTH DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF LEARNER DISPOSITION AND THEIR DEMONSTRATIONS OF THE RECOGNITION AND REALISATION RULES:**

**6.1 Introduction:**

As mentioned in Chapter Four, ten learners were selected essentially on the basis of their results in the mid-year exams. In this Chapter, I provide a brief profile of each learner, conduct a Discourse Analysis to reveal the Learners' Dispositions and analyse a variety of examples of their work to find out to what extent each learner has mastered the Recognition and Realisation Rules as they apply to the micro-context of poetry knowledge, concepts and skills.

**6.2 Subjective Mini-Profile of Learners:**

The following subjective mini-profiles are provided to familiarise the reader with the learners who made up the sample of the case study in order to facilitate a meaningful reading of the analysis of the findings. The information provided stems from my personal knowledge of the learners and experience of teaching the learners. It is presented to provide a first impression of the learners.

- 6.2.1 Nh is referred to as Nonhle. She is a reserved 16 year-old girl who failed a year in primary school and she lives with her mother, a police-woman, in Howick. In class, she does not offer contributions to discussion unless prompted to do so and her work does not always reflect her best efforts.
- 6.2.2 Nn is referred to as Nhlaka. He is a 17-year old young man who lives with both of his elderly parents. He failed grade 10 in 2004 and encountered a number of disciplinary problems during that year. He expresses himself confidently and humorously in speech although his expressions often contain language errors. In writing, his work is hampered by language, spelling and punctuation errors. In 2005, he has largely conformed to the rules of the school and in class he is eager to participate although he is clearly challenged by academics.
- 6.2.3 Pm is referred to as Patience. She is a 15 year-old girl who lives with both of her parents who are both educators. She is very quiet in class and can easily

be overlooked because although she conforms to all the requirements, her introverted nature prevents her from expressing herself openly.

- 6.2.4 Kh is referred to as Nkosi. He is a 16 year-old male who lives with both of his parents. His father works for the Correctional Services Department. Although he does not lack confidence, he is reserved. He is more of a loner and holds to his individual point of view. He makes every effort in class and is proud that he has never been to detention.
- 6.2.5 Zm is a 15 year-old female who is referred to as Zonke. She lives with her aunt, a nurse, because her mother has passed away and her father has remarried. She has a confident, outgoing nature and authority does not daunt her. She has a positive attitude to life, is a diligent worker and demands recognition for her efforts.
- 6.2.6 Nw is referred to as Nomsa. Despite her slight figure, she displays a boyish energy. She is a well-liked, bubbly 15 year-old who is orphaned and lives in a children's home near the school. She responds positively to challenge and establishes meaningful relations with those around her. Her enthusiasm is infectious and other learners enjoy working with her.
- 6.2.7 Sd, referred to as Siphso, has a strong personality and others defer to his quiet, authoritative manner. He is small in stature, 16 years old and lives with both of his parents. His father is a businessman and the other learners respect him for his wealth and status. He is active in and out of the classroom. His contributions in class reflect insight and intelligence that is not always evident in his written work. He gives the impression that it is more important for him to be 'cool' than it is for him to perform academically well.
- 6.2.8 Bm is a 15 year-old young man who lives with his mother, a teacher. He is referred to as Brian. He is very neatly groomed and this attention to detail is evident in the quality of his work and his efforts. He aims to please both his peers and his educators. He has made very good progress academically and in sport. He is hoping to participate in National trials for Soccer. He is consistently courteous and attentive in class and willingly shares his strengths and knowledge with others without dominating.
- 6.2.9 Nr is a 16 year-old male who is referred to as Nkululeko. He lives with his mother who works in a government department. Nkululeko is politically aware and has a strong sense of the inter-relationship between the individual,

school and society. He enjoys debate, has a lively sense of humour and is particularly successful at co-operative work – he is a team player.

6.2.10 Fn, referred to as Fekile, is a demure 15 year-old who lives with her mother, a teacher. She is extremely well organised and disciplined and the quality of her work reflects much effort. She has strong opinions and expresses herself with confidence but she is not forceful in her manner. She tends to have a few, close friends and she may be accused of being aloof.

### **6.3 Learners' Social Class Background:**

Of the 10 learners selected for the sample, the eldest was 17 and the youngest 15 so all learners were age appropriate for Grade 10. Two of the learners had repeated a year at school, Nhlaka in Grade 10 and Nonhle in Grade 1. Of the 10 learners, Nomsa has no parents and lives in a children's home, five learners are from single parent families, four of whom live with their mothers and one of whom lives with her aunt.

All parents of the learners selected for the sample earned some form of income although Nhlaka's father is currently retired. Nhlaka described his father as "having a tender" when he was working and in his interview he explained that he did tender work for the municipality and supplied some form of transport. So although he was self-employed, he derived his income from the government. Only one parent does not derive his/her income from some form of government service.

Hoadley (2005) makes use of Seeking's (2003) Scale to measure the occupational level of participants in her study. In terms of this scale, 80% of the parents of the sample fit into the class he describes as semi-professional. I equate these parents as in the same class as the teachers in Hoadley's study who she claims "are representative of a form of class mobility that is very common in South Africa" (Hoadley, 2005:223). Hoadley goes on to explore the material condition of these teachers as she suggests that their "particular lived experience" (2005:223) may not be what one might traditionally expect from this class. Hoadley suggests that despite the teachers fitting into a semi-professional category on a professional level, their living conditions are not consistent with what one might expect from this class. Their living conditions more consistently reflect the working class. Below the living conditions of the

learners in this study are described and in nine instances, their “particular lived experience” is consistent with the working class.

Nomsa who lives in a children’s home, lives close to the school in a “village” that aims to emulate a family, middle class home. Nhlaka, Nkululeko and Nonhle live in formerly coloured, indian and black working-class areas. Siphho and Patience both live in middle class areas a little removed from the centre of the city. Nkosi, Zonke , Fekile and Brian all live in close proximity to the school in lower-middle class suburbs. Learners all relied on public transport to school but those who lived in walking distance of the school, sometimes walked home in the afternoon. All learners enjoy a stable home environment that, although not privileged, suffices their needs.

The social class of the learner was not a factor in selecting the sample but it is interesting to note the similarities in their backgrounds.

#### **6.4 Leisure Activities and Family Relationships:**

Learners discussed their leisure activities and their relationships with their families.

At Ace, extra-mural activities play a major role in the life of the school. Siphho plays basketball, rugby and soccer. Nkululeko and Nhlaka both play rugby in the first team. Nkosi reported that a negative experience he had at Ace “discouraged” him. He explained that the response of certain teachers to his efforts has caused him to give up sport at school. He prefers to play soccer on the streets at home and Nonhle goes home after school to watch TV but she gives the sport at Ace as a reason for coming to the school. Siphho commented that playing sport after school releases tension as it is fun. Nkululeko added that even if you don’t get good marks at school, you can do better on the sportsfield. Nhlaka and Nkululeko reported how they had experienced a severe loss on Saturday in rugby and how hard the game was but Nhlaka was proud of how he had played his best even if the team had lost. Parker (1992) suggests that analysts should identify institutions that are reinforced by the discourse being used. The institution of Ace High ‘sells the extra-mural’ pitch as a strength of the school and from the learners’ comments, they have ‘bought into’ this. Brian plays soccer and cricket at school and sees it as something positive, he claims that it is helpful after

concentrating hard at school and as a stress-reliever, it gets your mind off the stresses of home. He informed the group that his mother believes that if you don't play sport you get exposed to many things like smoking and drinking but Fekile disagreed strongly saying that anyone can do bad things – it didn't make any difference if you played sport or not and Zonke added that sometimes people who are involved in sport are trying to avoid going home. Patience plays hockey at school and she feels this helps her with life but she says it can be a distraction from school work and she is not convinced that extra-murals have any influence on her school life. Nomsa plays netball and basketball and does so because she loves sports. She mentioned the importance of the coach or how the teacher treats you, she said that if you wanted to please them, you would go to sport everyday. With the exception of Zonke and Patience who questioned the worth of sport, learners all supported the institution's position. It is possible to interpret the learners' comments as connecting with the discourse of the institution (Parker, 1992), thereby reinforcing the discourse of the institution. However, discourses are, according to Foucault (1972:49 in Parker 1992:8) 'practices that systematically form the objects of which they speak'. Parker (1992) goes on to explain that via the discourse, a 'reality' is created and the 'reality' of this discourse is that the learners comment positively on the role of sport as a leisure activity and this correlates positively to their dispositions as learners.

Sipho lives with both of his parents but he was reticent in describing his relations with the rest of his family and although they do eat meals together, he says that they don't really spend time together. However, he feels closer to his father because sometimes his father takes him to work and shows him what he does. Sipho's father is a businessman and he is the only parent who does not derive his income from some form of government service. Brian commented that when he got home, he watched some television but mostly listened to the radio and had supper with his mother. Patience spoke about her close relationship with her sisters, especially her elder sister. She also explained how both of her parents assist her with her homework. They set aside an hour after school for her to study and revise what she has done at school and then they test her on the work covered. Nomsa explained how her friend comes home from work and they chat but they don't share meals as Nomsa only eats junk food. Fekile and Patience both spoke about spending time with family during the holidays. Sometimes Patience visits her cousins in Durban and sometimes she accompanies her

parents to visit her gran in Colenso. She doesn't really enjoy going to her gran's home but from her comments about her family, she appears to enjoy a close and supportive relationship with them. Brian said that he is often involved in sporting events in the holidays so sport is very big in his life. His mother does take an interest in his participation and supports him by buying him the equipment he needs and helping him make arrangements eg. Getting a passport in case he gets selected.

Analysis of the above suggests that the learners' sporting interests are indicators of middle class (Bourdieu) but, with the exception of Brian, all these activities are school related and the question arises whether the culture of the school is being imposed on the learners without them internalising the correlating elaborated code values. Indicators relating to family and home activities suggest a working class background and it is possible that some tension exists between the learners' school persona and their home persona. If this is the case, it would shed light on their erratic demonstrations of recognition and realisation of cognitive concepts as learners are vacillating between the restricted, context dependent code of their working class background and the demands of the elaborated, generalist code of their middle class school.

#### **6.5 LEARNER DISPOSITIONS AND THEIR DEMONSTRATIONS OF THE RECOGNITION AND REALISTIONS RULES:**

In discussion, it became clear that learners' dispositions toward teaching and learning at Ace High School are quite closely linked to their aspirations. Many of them mentioned their perception of the relationship between achievement after school and achievement at school. 80% of the learners stated that they wanted to study further after school.

Below is an in-depth analysis of each of the learner's individual responses in the interview and their demonstrations of recognition and realisation in response to the tasks described in Chapters 4 and 5. For ease of reference, the list of the abbreviations used is repeated.

**Recognition of Knowledge and Concepts – Rck**

**Recognition of Socio-Affective Competence – Rcc**

Passive Realisation of Knowledge and Concepts – Rlp

Active Realisation of Knowledge and Concepts - Rla

Failure to achieve required recognition or realisation – F

Recognition or Realisation partially achieved – Rck-;Rcc-;Rla-

6.5.1 Nonhle wants to study in the arts and she would like to be a Graphic Designer. She says you have to go to school and pass if you want to be a businesswoman. When she states this, it echoes the myth that ‘education is the key to success’, it is as though she is repeating what she has heard over and over again, as though an alternate discourse is imposing itself upon her own. When questioned about what a Graphic Designer does, she is at a loss until prompted and then she repeats the researcher’s key word, “ads”.

Nonhle travels from Howick to school in Pietermaritzburg each day even though there are more than adequate schools closer to her home. When questioned about her choice of school her answers reflected the community code: “I just like it” and “I don’t like it” and “Ace has got lots of sport and it’s nice”. She seemed incapable of formulating a reason beyond her personalised choice and is bounded in the community code.

Nonhle commented that she learns best with a strict teacher, her motivation for learning is external and she will only be compliant with the rules of the school if the teacher imposes those rules. Thus, if a teacher is less authoritarian and is unable to successfully implement the regulative rule, she will not comply. This has ramifications for the school as it is impossible that all the teachers at the school are successful in implementing the regulative rule. If Nonhle is representative of a number of learners at the school, the problem is exacerbated. The following extract from Nonhle’s discussion was one of her most in-depth contributions to the discussion and it suggests that she feels strongly about this factor contributing to her learning experience at school.

“You start bending the rules if teachers are going to be lenient and then you don’t learn stuff and you are not going to do your homework if you don’t feel like it but if you have a strict teacher, then if you bend the rules, you get punished.”

Nonhle was unable to comment on the value of a personal relationship with educators but did comment that if you do badly at school, you know you are stupid but then when you do good, you know you can do better. She repeats a similar idea – “you do your best when you like it and you do well”. The first criteria that Parker (1992) stipulates is, in the analysis of discourse, explore connotations. From the above expression, I assumed that if a teacher positively re-enforces her academic performance, she is motivated to improve. Once again, if this learner’s position is representative of the general, this could point toward a problematic classroom practice in the school. There is an implicit connotation that Nonhle has been made to feel stupid on occasion and this has negatively impacted on her performance. If educators are employing this strategy generally, the results in terms of learner disposition would be negative. “Positive feedback is as important as, and in the earlier grades possibly more important than, negative feedback.” (Hart & Risley, 1995 in Taylor et al., 2003:134)

Nonhle’s favourite learning activity is group work but she did not substantiate her opinion. I assumed that she is more comfortable performing in a group than independently because earlier she said that she doesn’t like to be identified as stupid and she gets support from others when working in a group. However, she commented that she likes writing poetry because “you get to write things that have been so long hurting in your heart and you have a chance to tell them to some one”. In writing poetry, Nonhle experiences the safety to express her inner feelings without the fear of being condemned as stupid.

Nonhle chose a very simple poem for analysis in Task One, *Best Things* and her analysis thereof exclusively reflected the community code. All judgements were context-dependent and she gave her reason for choosing this poem as “Because I like food”. She chose *Woman of the Future* as her favourite poem studied through the year as “it talks about things that happen in reality and it talks more about ourselves.

we as young youth". In response to the question: What have you learned from the poems we have studied this year? Nonhle spoke only in intra-personal terms, that were totally context-dependent – she has learnt to be honest, caring, trustworthy and loyal to other people and not to lie. Hoadley (2005:235) describes working class teachers responses to classroom activity as, "the outer, non-cognitive aspects of classroom activity, such as enjoyment and the behaviour of learners" and Nonhle's response is similar. The study of poetry, as an analytical process, has been very weakly classified by Nonhle and has not been bounded from her community experience of life. Thus, at a most basic level, she is not demonstrating the recognition rule as she is unable to recognise the specificity of the micro-context of the study of poetry as a classroom activity.

In the second question of Task One learners were required to carry out a line-by-line analysis of the poem they had chosen and explain the imagery and figures of speech used in the poem. Nonhle's explanation of the poem focussed on the general sense of the poem. There was a good vocabulary list with adequate explanations but no attempt was made to explore the purpose or essence of the poem and the imagery was dealt with from a literal, context-dependent perspective. There was strong evidence of the restricted code as explanations only included relevance to learner's personal context eg. "the poem talks about the things I love best and it explains how I feel about things. The learner fails to demonstrate recognition of previously learned poetry concepts and knowledge as she doesn't refer to any figures of speech or literary devices used by the poet. She does produce a text to explain the poem but all reasons given are based on her personal response to the poem with no reference to principles of analysis so she is not able to demonstrate mastery of the realisation rule. **FF**

In the first question of Task Two in which the learner has to explain why the poet has chosen to combine two words into the title, *Hippopotamusman*, Nonhle's answer partially explains why the poet has combined two words to create one. She produces a text that partially realises the appropriate knowledge and concepts eg. "To make us see that the man looked like a hippopotamus to give the idea of what to expect." **Rla-**

However, the second question of the same task is closely related to the first question and required the learner to recognise the poet's use of the same technique later in the poem. In the second question of the same task:

2.1.2 Quote from the poem to identify two more examples of the above technique that the poet has used. **Rck**

The question requires the learner to recognise a previously learned concept i.e. that the poet combines two words to create one new one. This learner provides an incorrect answer to this question as she cannot identify the relevant information eg. "A face like a hippopotamus" F, therefore, she does not demonstrate the required recognition skills.

Nonhle did not complete Task Three that was a class worksheet. Of all the tasks analysed, this was the only task set that was not for marks. This suggests that Nonhle lacks the socio-affective competences or motivation required to fulfil the outcomes for poetry in Grade 10 English Home Language. She selects to complete tasks that are utilised for summative assessment. If the task is a formative task, she does not value its worth and chooses not to comply.

In Task Four, the final exam of the year, Nonhle had moved from Higher Grade to Standard Grade. This move was motivated by her poor results through the year and is aimed toward making the questions more accessible to the learners. The material for study does not change but questions are more community orientated as revealed in the example given below. This is an interesting factor because those learners who will enter the FET phase from this year, will not be given the option of Standard Grade.

In Question 4.5.3, the learner is required to describe relations between members of the family as revealed in the given extract and use examples from the poem to support the description. In Nonhle's answer she does recognise skills required of her because she does describe one incident that reveals relations between the family but her answer is restricted to a specific incident and therefore only partially realises the knowledge and concepts required eg. "They respect each other. They are African. In the poem it

says: ‘your elbow has sunk into my thigh. Apology. I wasn’t aware.’ He apologises for what he has done. **Rck Rla-**

In Task Five, the re-test of the final exam that was conducted six months after the final exam, Nonhle managed to identify the most correct answer to five out of eight questions answered and demonstrated passive realisation in three out of five questions answered but in only one question was she able to only partially demonstrate active realisation. For this task she failed to produce evidence that school has been an interrupter of the community code and she fails to utilise context-independent principles to explain why an answer is least correct eg. “They are explaining simple things that we can see, we can read.” **F**

TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ANALYSED:	22
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASK ACHIEVED:	9
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	2
PERCENTAGE OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	50%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ANALYSED:	6
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED:	4
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	2
PERCENTAGE OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	100%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ANALYSED:	9
TOTAL NUMBER OR RLP TASKS ACHIEVED:	3
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	1
PERCENTAGE OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	44%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ANALYSED:	19
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED:	2
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	4
PERCENTAGE OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	32%

From the above table, it is evident that Nonhle does not demonstrate mastery of the realisation rule but that she manages to cope at school as she has some control over the recognition rule and her socio-affective competences are highly developed. With the emphasis on skills, knowledge and values in NCS, and continuous assessment throughout the year of all three of these factors, she manages to comply with the

requirements for promotion. However, she is firmly bounded in the community code and school has not acted as an interrupter of this code. After 11 years of schooling, she very rarely is able to demonstrate that she has the skills to employ context-independent reasoning and move from the restricted code of her community into the elaborated code of school.

6.5.2 Nhlaka hopes to do agriculture or farming after school and he expressed some doubt over the worth of school if you wish to be a farmer. Although he wouldn't choose to study at a school that focuses on farming, he would like to study in a related field after school. His interest in farming is derived from his father and due to his association with a family friend, he believes he can make a lot of money out of farming. He would like to be a cattle farmer because he says that he knows a lot about animals and that he loves animals, especially dogs. He judges it as a nice job because you come into contact with animals. When another learner suggested that he become a vet because there is a big difference between dogs and cows, he didn't respond. This leads me to believe that, as in the case of the learners in Hoadley's (2005) study who grouped the foods together, Nhlaka has grouped farming, dogs and cows together in a context-dependent category that relates to his personalised experience and his perceptual response to animals. He extends his reasoning by stating that his father used to farm and he misses it.

Nhlaka prefers teachers who make jokes when teaching and who make it more exciting in the classroom. He gave the example of the History teacher who tells a lot of good stories and this is why History is his best subject. His assessment of his best learning experience is context-dependent and his judgement relies upon his personal likes and dislikes. In response to questioning about his behaviour at school Nhlaka commented that the punishment at school motivated him to behave well. He specified that the HOD who is in charge of discipline imposed a system that made him scared that he would have to leave the school and go to another school in Imbali where he would be bullied. He repeated that the discipline at the school has reformed his behaviour and had made him do better at school. He had failed grade 10 the previous year but said that in 2005, "I felt like I'm alive". This passionate statement suggests

that Nhlaka is positively disposed toward school life despite his failure the previous year.

Nhlaka differentiated between subjects by the results you get in those subjects and how positive results make you feel good:

“Sometimes it makes you want to give up if you feel stupid but if you go to History and you know you are getting 80%, you go with happy smiles because you know, “I’m alright”. But if your go to Maths and we all know Maths is hard, then .....

The unfinished sentence suggests that for this learner, in Maths, he, personally, is not ‘alright’. Academic performance is very closely related to this learner’s positive self-concept and he believes that there is a strong correlation between improved academic performance and improved discipline.

Nhlaka sited his older brothers and sisters as the strongest motivating factor for him to achieve well at school. He described in detail their qualifications after school and their achievements. He expressed that he didn’t want to be the only one who doesn’t achieve. Nhlaka was one of the learner’s who spoke animatedly about his sporting commitments at school and interestingly, the HOD who is in charge of Discipline is also in charge of rugby. It appears that this learner’s working class background is being interrupted by a combination of factors. His family is mobile and appears to be moving away from their working class roots and he has ‘bought into’ the institutions dominant discourse. His expressions still appear to be essentially community orientated but at times he does demonstrate mastery over the recognition rule and occasionally over the realisation rule.

In response to questions on classroom activities and the most effective way of learning, Nhlaka says that he prefers to work in a group when you brain storm an idea because four brains are better than one and when he learns for exams, he likes a friend to work with him and ask him questions and test him. But, he perceives the value of the teacher because he says that sometimes you think that your friend is right but she is wrong and when it comes to education, he believes the teacher is always right

because she has a degree or some sort of qualification. Although Nhlaka has moved away from his working class roots to some extent, this opinion reveals that he still accepts the “symbolic violence” (Bourdieu, 1977) of the dominant class and the authoritarian, hierarchical structure of the working class family (Bernstein, 1996) and despite the social mobility of his family as evidenced in his brothers and sisters qualifications and jobs, he has not accessed the elaborated code sufficiently to question the authority of the teacher or the source of his/her knowledge.

*Still I Rise* was Nhlaka’s personal choice of poem for analysis in Task One. This correlates strongly with his aspirations and he writes:

“this poem inspired me so much that maybe one day I want to make something of myself. Even though people think the worst of you, they talk bad about you but you try to ignore them and you RISE against them. (capital letters used in the original) Rise symbolises a strong positive feeling, be sure of what you are doing.”

Nhlaka continued to explain his understanding of the concept of rising and he mentioned that if you have died but you leave a good name behind for yourself you are still rising and you can rise by the recommendation of the good things that you have done even if people try to bring you down. He clearly recognised the central theme to the poem and his identification of the complex figures of speech featured in the poem suggested passive realisation of the poetry concepts demanded in Grade 10. However, although this was an individual task, his analysis could well have been a collaborative effort as he has mentioned that he prefers to work with a friend and interpretation of complex terms not readily in use in South Africa (eg. Sassiness) was accurate and was possibly as a result of consultation with someone else. This method does not negate his positive learner disposition and reflects that this learner’s socio-affective competences are well developed, suggesting that he recognises the value of co-operative effort and in this way he is fulfilling one of the critical outcomes of C2005.

Nhlaka’s choice of favourite poems studied through the year, explicitly reflects the community code and is context-dependent. He explains that *Hippopotamusman* is his

favourite poem because “it shows how people smile but you never know about what they are really thinking behind the smile, you ask yourself if they are pretending or not.” His reason for rejecting *My Name* is that “when someone can’t pronounce your name and gives you another name, it is annoying and it shows that some people don’t care or bother to learn a name that your parents gave you because they thought it is the right name for you.” These statements reflect Nhlaka’s personalised responses and the community code but do not necessarily preclude Nhlaka from context-independent reasoning and accessing the elaborated code in other conditions.

From the analysis of findings on Nhlaka’s performance through the year, his demonstrations of the recognition and realisation rules were erratic. This was especially evident in the final exam. A factor that has not been explored in this study is the effect of substance abuse on the learner. An answer that had no relevance to the question and Nhlaka’s unusual behaviour in his final exam alerted me to the possibility of substance abuse by this learner. In the mid-year exam, learners were asked to comment on the behaviour of passengers in the bus in the poem *Hippopotamusman* and relate this behaviour to their everyday experience. Nhlaka wrote:

“It is true that some people drink so much that they don’t remember the days of the week. The passengers would turn their face because you can see the person is so ugly by looking at him you feel like vomiting so it is better to look through the window.”

The first sentence to the answer has no relevance to the content of the poem. It is possible that this is how Nhlaka relates the behaviour of the passengers in the poem to his own lived experience. The in-depth interview and the questionnaire focussed on learner disposition at school and in relation to school, they did not explore more intimate, personal factors and this is a distinct limitation of the study that should be addressed to reveal a more complete representation of learner disposition.

In Task One in which Nhlaka was required to select a poem of his own choice for analysis, he demonstrated a high degree of mastery of the recognition and realisation rules. Only in one question, where he was required to prepare a work sheet on the

poem, was he totally unsuccessful and this was because he did not carry out this aspect of the task. In the second question to the task in which he was required to provide a line-by-line analysis of the poem and explain the imagery and figures of speech in the poem, his explanation was most convincing. There was excellent recognition of the literary devices used and adequate explanation of how they worked revealing partial active realisation **Rck Rla-**. His reason for choosing the poem is that “it inspired me so much that one day I want to make something of myself. Even though people think the worst of you and they talk bad about you, but you try to ignore them and by that you RISE against them.” (Capitals used in the original) In the first part of the answer, he gives his personal reason for choosing the poem, “I want to make something of myself”. In the second part he refers to aspects of the poem (they talk bad about you) that he relates to and can apply in his own life. This has been analysed as moving from his personalised, context-dependent viewpoint, to a more generalised, independent position and back to his own viewpoint and reveals mastery of the realisation rule in this micro-context. **Rck Rla Rcc**

This particular task is of interest in the analysis because, as mentioned earlier, Nhlaka achieved a high degree of mastery over both the recognition and realisation rules. As this was the first task of the year, you may expect that learners’ responses vary according to their prior learning experiences in poetry. Nhlaka failed Grade 10 the previous year and for this reason, one could assume that his performance in this task would be lacking. Bernstein and the NCS make mention of socio-affective competences that impact on the motivation of the learner and this learner’s performance in this task seems to have been positively impacted upon by these competences that are more difficult to pin down. Firstly, although learners did hand in a write-up of their oral presentation, the task was essentially an oral task. This learner has difficulties expressing himself in writing and makes regular spelling and language errors in his written work but expresses himself clearly and confidently in oral presentations. Secondly, this poem (*Still I Rise* by Maya Angelou), is a poem of his own choice, selected by him to analyse. His comments on the poem and his explanation of the tone and theme of the poem suggest that he responded passionately to the poem, possibly because of his previous year’s experience of failure. Thirdly, because this task was an individual task but was prepared at home and in class, it is

likely that he took advantage of this opportunity to work co-operatively in order to perform individually at his peak.

In Task Two in the mid-year exams, Nhlaka did reveal a certain amount of control over the recognition and realisation rules, especially in the first poem he selected to answer. In the second poem, two questions were designed to test recognition of previously acquired knowledge and concepts. In question 2.3.2, the learner was required to identify 'Burly Bureaucrat' as alliteration. Nhlaka identified the example as personification F. In 2.3.3, the learner was required to identify one word from the last verse that had a similar meaning to the explanation given ie. the learner had to recognise one word that was a synonym of the explanation given. Nhlaka's answer was, "he was an Afrikaner" F. This reveals that Nhlaka neither recognised the operation that was required of him ie. to identify a synonym, nor was he able to carry out that operation so he did not demonstrate recognition of previously acquired concepts and knowledge. This is surprising if you take into account Nhlaka's accurate recognition of figures of speech in Task One. It is possible to conclude that, without realisation occurring, recognition is erratic and is only triggered in a specific micro-context. In this instance, the learner remains functioning within the restricted code and does not generally reason in the elaborated code but only adjusts his reasoning when specifically stimulated to do so.

Nhlaka failed to complete Task Three, the class worksheet. As mentioned earlier, this task was a formative task and Nhlaka chose not to comply.

Like Nonhle, Nhlaka also moved to Standard Grade for the final, end of the year exam. In this exam, Nhlaka's performance did not reflect the level of mastery he had achieved through the year. He arrived to write the exam nearly an hour late and did not follow instructions written on the exam. He was required to select two poems and answer the question set on those two poems. Nhlaka attempted to answer questions on all three poems and his jumbled answers and scrawly script suggest that he was in a panic and not reasoning clearly. Of all the questions he answered, he only achieved full recognition in one answer and partial recognition in another. He achieved partial realisation in two answers. If you were to take only this examination into account, you would conclude that this learner has achieved almost no control over the

recognition and realisation rules as they apply in this micro-context. This conclusion is not borne out if you analyse his performance over the year and points towards the dangers of placing too much emphasis on the end of the year exam results. This incident prompted me to believe that Nhlaka may have a problem with substance abuse as suggested earlier.

In discussion, before the written aspect of Task Five, the re-test administered six months after the final exam began, Nhlaka made several contributions and it was obvious that he was grappling with the concepts. Some of these contributions reveal recognition of previously acquired knowledge and concepts and others revealed a very real attempt to achieve active realisation. In engaging with the imagery of the poem, he asked the question: “is the smell real or imaginary?”. This question suggested that he was actively realising the difference between the image, and its representation. However, when it came to writing down the answers, he did not demonstrate active realisation though at times, there was evidence of recognition of previously learned concepts and knowledge.

TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ANALYSED:	24
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED:	8
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	2
PERCENTAGE OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	42%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ANALYSED:	6
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED:	4
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	1
PERCENTAGE OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	83%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ANALYSED:	9
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED:	4
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	1
PERCENTAGE OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	56%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ANALYSED:	19
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED:	2
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	8
PERCENTAGE OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	53%

This learner's demonstrations of the recognition and realisation rules are erratic. There are instances when he uses context-independent reasoning and appears to be grappling with the elaborated code but for the most part, he relies on the community code to inform his responses.

6.5.3 Patience explains that she loves her school work, if she understands the work, then she loves it. She finds it helpful to concentrate in class as this develops her understanding of the work. The achievement of good marks motivates her, an extrinsic motivator. She spoke about problems she experiences in communicating with teachers who sometimes do not understand what she is asking and then give her the wrong answer. But she didn't expand further on this problem she had experienced. Generally, she was reticent in discussion and only responded when specifically prompted. She does want to study after school and hopes to follow a career in Business Management but she did not offer any further information about how this relates to her performance at school or her disposition toward school. She finds it unsatisfactory to present individual orals because often she doesn't understand what she is talking about and she feels uncomfortable because she is shy. When asked if she was scared if people would laugh at her, she replied "sometimes".

Patience finds the most satisfying learning experience when the teacher goes over the poems in class because a learner can ask the teacher if he/she doesn't understand. She explained that Business Economics used to be her favourite subject but now it is not because she doesn't understand the new teacher. For this learner, the source of knowledge is the teacher. Her learning is dependent upon the teacher and her response to work is dependent upon how well she relates to the teacher's pedagogy. The implicit connotation of the word 'understand' is, if the content of what she is studying is made clear by the teacher, then Patience 'understands'. In my opinion, she does not use the word 'understand' to mean the deep, in-bedded principles of a subject that would enable her to work independently. If Patience represents a more generalist position in relation to the educators, then it is possible that learners at Ace High only learn in a situation where they 'understand' the teacher. In a study conducted by Jones in 1988, findings revealed that for working class girls in a middle-to-low stream

class in New Zealand, getting the teachers knowledge was their central focus. They believed that the source of knowledge is the teacher and that if they got notes from the teacher, they would 'know' the work. (in Harley et al., 1999:118)

*Hippopotamusman* was Patience's favourite poem studied through the year. She chose this poem because she understood it and it was quite fun and she liked the way words were used in the poem. Her reasons for choosing this poem were all context-dependent and relied upon her personalised response to the poem. She begins to reocognise why she likes the poem when she refers to the words in the poem but she doesn't employ a more general, context-independent method to describe what it is about the words that appeals to her. Thus, her comments reflect the restricted code and her experience of school has not moved her reasoning to reflect the elaborated code. In Hoadley's research she refers to the working class teachers who may fit into Seekings semi-professional class due to their qualifications and occupations but other indicators suggest that their life experience is still working class (Hoadley, 2005). Both Patience's parents are educators and from her descriptions of her home life, she fits into the same mobile group as Hoadley's working class teachers. School has not interrupted the community code.

Although Patience claimed that she did not enjoy presenting individual orals, she made a good effort to present a difficult Thomas Hardy poem that was her personal choice. Although, there were aspects of the poem that she did not fully come to grips with, she extended herself and empathised well with the tone of the poem and the feelings expressed. She attempted to explore the literary devices used in the poem and her explanation of a metaphor did reveal some movement toward the elaborated code, "My heart has shrunk as thin is a metaphor because the poet is referring to his heart as being confused, it doesn't have order, it is all crumbled up as thin, as small as it could be" Rck R1a-. It is interesting that Patience's efforts on this task reveal a positive disposition toward learning despite the fact that she is battling to express herself in the elaborated code demanded of the task and feels uncomfortable presenting orals.

As mentioned in the paragraph above, the poem, *I Look into My Glass* by Thomas Hardy, that Patience selected for analysis in Task One, where she was required to

select a poem of her own choice, analyse the poem and present the analysis in an oral to the class, was an interesting choice as it extended the learner beyond her comfort zone and she engaged with the content of the poem despite some difficulties she encountered. In her discussion on the poem, she sometimes demonstrated lack of recognition eg. “by hearts grown cold to me” she describes as personification which is an incorrect recognition of the figure of speech in this example **F**. She is able to accurately identify the feelings expressed in the poem although she has difficulty in translating this into the tone of the poem eg. “the feeling of this poem is loneliness and the tone is sympathy **Rck- Rla-**. In her assessment of the poem, she was less successful and demonstrated that she was not able to make use of the elaborated code and her answer is totally personal and context dependent eg. “I like this poem because I mostly feel lonely.” **Rcc- F**

In Task Two which was the mid-year exam, Patience demonstrated that she recognised the concepts and knowledge previously acquired in the first poem selected, *Hippopotamusman* but she had difficulty in expressing realisations of this knowledge and relied on her community code to reason. In the following example, Patience was required to give an example from her own life that relates to the example in the poem. By doing this, she was required to move from her own community context, to the general by relating the example back to the text. She accurately describes the reaction of the passengers on the bus, demonstrating recognition **Rck** but the example that she gives from her own experience actually contradicts, not supports, the situation in the bus eg. “They are disgusted by the look of this man and they don’t even want to look at him, they turn around and face the window. Yes, it is true. When I had my leg burnt, everyone used to turn and stare at my leg. It was quite embarrassing.” **Rck Rlp Rcc- F**

In Task Three, The worksheet done in class on *Warning* by Helen Joseph, Patience demonstrated that she struggles to move out of her community code but nevertheless, she grapples with the elaborated code in an attempt to demonstrate realisations of knowledge and concepts. She is successful at describing the tone and gives appropriate examples eg. “The tone is humorous and funny – ‘sits on pavement when she is tired’” **Rck Rla**. She is able to explain her personal response to the woman’s rebellion that suggests that she is able to recognise her own community code as such

but she is not really able to move beyond this code. eg. “I don’t like the way they behave because they should be respectable. It does not suit an old woman when she does incorrect things.” **Rck Rcc**

In the final exam, Patience was successful in recognising previously learnt knowledge and concepts and was partially successful in realisations. In only one question was she unable to demonstrate any recognition or realisation. In most questions, her answers are analysed as **Rck Rla-**.

In response to the following question,

Through the descriptions of the young brother (line 8) and the father (line 26), the poem manages to convey the irritation and frustration of these people in the small house. Discuss.

Patience answered:

“His young brother Thamu, jerks his arm violently and says: stop leaning on me, your elbow has sunk into my thigh. His father is grinding his jaws, because maybe it’s the July Handicap.” **Rck Rla-**

She clearly recognises the appropriate knowledge and demonstrates this by an accurate description but she is not able to use context-independent principles to discuss how this is achieved.

In the re-test of the same work covered in the final exam, Patience’s answers to the first three questions correlated with the analysis of her prior work. She demonstrated recognition in all three and grappled with realisations, only partially achieving realisation. However, for the next six questions, she was almost entirely unsuccessful. In only one answer did she demonstrate recognition and one partial realisation.

TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ANALYSED:	26
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED:	15
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	5
PERCENTAGE OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY	77%

ACHIEVED:	
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ANALYSED:	8
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED:	2
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	5
PERCENTAGE OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	88%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ANALYSED:	9
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED:	3
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	0
PERCENTAGE OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	33%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ANALYSED:	24
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED:	1
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	13
PERCENTAGE OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	58%

In analysing all the tasks Patience completed, she only demonstrated full realisation in one task. This suggests that although Patience engages with the material at school and makes every effort to realise the knowledge and concepts taught at school, she remains bounded by the community code and school has not interrupted this restriction.

6.5.4 Nkosi was the only learner who does not intend to study after school and he spoke about his ambition to be “Sipho’s dad”. As a group, they demonstrated their approval of this idea by laughter and agreeing with the ambition to “earn a lot of money”. Nkosi explained:

“No it’s not about school. It’s all about money. You need to know how to manage money. I don’t think it matters what you learn at school.”

Later on, he made clear how money is a motivating factor in his frame of reference. He explained that at home if you get promised a reward (eg. If you pass matric then I will buy you a car) but if you don’t do well at school, then you don’t get reward and “your marks will drop down, down, down.”

From these remarks, it is evident that for Nkosi, there is no intrinsic motivation at school and yet he is a “model” student. His behaviour in class is exemplary and he achieves adequate results in his subjects. He has never been to detention which shows that he is compliant with the rules of the school. He was also most forthcoming in the discussion, often offering his point of view without being prompted and his explanations were more in-depth and complex than some of the other more repetitive and mono-syllabic comments from other learners.

Nkosi mentioned earlier that he had been “discouraged” from participating in sport at school and later he elaborated on his ideas of the purpose of schooling.

“I don’t think people should go to school because at school, people are pushed into doing something they don’t like. Just because they saw it at school, it’s not something they wanted to do but school suggested so. Like some people want to be scientists but at school, because of their marks, they have to be a businessman but their real ambition is to be a scientist. You do something that was not actually meant to be your career.”

From the above extract and Nkosi’s earlier comment, one may conclude that he does not support the discourse of the institution. However, this does not necessarily mean that he has a negative disposition toward teaching and learning at Ace High as evidenced below. He speaks about his personal experience of the teachers.

“When I first came here, I thought that the rules were going to be strict but they weren’t going to affect the teachers, that the teachers were just going to live on the other side but I find that teachers do live by the rules and they are quite strict.”

Parker (1992) suggests that “discourse analysis cannot take place without locating its object in time” (Parker, 1992:16). From the above comment, Nkosi implies that his previous experience (“when I first came here”) had led him to believe that teachers act in a manner that is beyond the “rules” but that his more recent experience of teachers had changed his opinion.

He expanded his ideas on the teachers in response to a question about what makes Ace High a better school than others:

“The pass rate and the teachers. There are teachers who support you even if you are not doing great. I had a really bad experience last year and my marks weren’t that great but there were teachers that helped me. They helped me to improve. If you are having problems, they actually work with you and guide you through the work.”

However, he was also critical of teacher’s handling of disciplinary problems in class. He stated that teachers waste the learners’ time with detentions. If someone makes a joke, the teacher responds by writing down detention slips that is wasting time that should be used to learn.

The above comments reveal a questioning and critical stance that does not negate the learners’ positive disposition to the school. He conveys the sense that he does not concur with the opinion of the group and has the confidence to express his individual position, he is insightful and sensitive to issues around him and this is further endorsed by his personal choice of poem for analysis – *The Mother’s Ballad*. Parker (1992) advises the analyst to refer to other texts that may reveal the implicit meaning of the discourse being analysed. In this case, *The Mother’s Ballad* is the other text that is critical of war and the Catholic Church and it was a courageous and unusual choice, an implicit reflection of his self-confidence and his independent spirit. He commented that teachers know what is going on but he preferred self activities like orals in which he gets up there and expresses his feelings and stuff. He says this gives the learner the opportunity to listen to more than one poem and get different points of view. He believes that “we actually learn more from each other” but he also felt it was helpful going over a poem in class with a teacher and taking notes which correspond with the poem. Nkosi appears to support the social constructivist view of knowledge and his original thoughts closely reflect the principles underlying the present curriculum. We can assume that he has positively responded to his first nine years of schooling under C2005.

He chose *My Name* as his favourite poem because,

“us, as black people can relate to it and because it’s something that might have occurred to our parents. One of the points that the poem was giving across was to be proud, and stand up for yourself and whom you are and what you are.”

Clearly, Nkosi has a developed sense of self worth and what it entails. He is highly motivated by material wealth but doesn’t seem to crave it for the status symbols that other teenagers value so greatly but because it will provide him with the freedom to achieve his desires.

In Task One in which the learner was required to select a poem of his own choice for analysis and presentation to the class, Nkosi demonstrated the appropriate recognition and realisation for almost all aspects of the task suggesting that he has control of the elaborated code. Even in the learner’s reading of the poem, his pace suited the content of the poem and he used strong expression to reveal in-depth understanding of the content and theme of *The Mother’s Ballad* by Rosalind Gould. This aspect was stressed further in his explanation on rhythm and how this impacted on the effect of the poem. His questions and answers on the worksheet he designed reveal that for this poem, this learner has mastered both the recognition and realisation rules eg. “Why do you think the poem is titled *The Mother’s Ballad*? Because the poem is sort of like a worn out song from a parent who is crying her sorrows out.” This answer reveals recognition of the term ‘ballad’ plus realisation of the central theme of the poem. The choice of poem reveals his highly developed socio-affective disposition and this aspect is explored further in Chapter Six. **Rck Rla Rcc**

In Task Two, the mid-year exam, Nkosi selected *Fist Blood* as the second poem to answer. He was one of only three learners to do so and he only completed the first question set on the poem because he did not effectively plan his time. In answers to the first poem, *Hippopotamusman*, there was again evidence to suggest that Nkosi was reasoning in the elaborated code as although he made some recognition errors, the answers that required production of a text to demonstrate realisation of concepts and knowledge revealed use of context-independent principles. In the following question:

2.1.3 Consider lines 15 – 21. In your own words, describe the response of the passengers. Is their response true to real life according to your experience? Provide an example from your own experience to support your answer.

Learners were required to recognise knowledge previously acquired and demonstrate this knowledge by describing the scene in the poem using their own words. He was required to demonstrate passive realisation by stating whether this is true to real life experience and then demonstrate active realisation by providing an example from their own experience, but one that supports the previous answer – thus demonstrating the ability to move from a personalised context into a more generalised context. Furthermore, the learner is required to demonstrate socio-affective competences by recognising the attitude of the passengers and comparing this attitude to his own context. Nkosi's answer demonstrated **Rck**, **Rcc** and **Rlp** but only partially demonstrated **Rla**- because he was unable to move back into the more generalised context:

“The passengers felt like getting off the bus and not seeing something so ugly that might make them get running stomach or want to vomit. Yes, it is true that in life, if the passengers had been in groups, they would have laughed because it happens all the time among black communities.”

In terms of assessment, Nkosi did not do very well in this section of the exam, as although his answers reveal that he has some ease functioning in the elaborated code, he is unable to complete the required questions in the allocated time and this negatively impact on his scores.

In Task Three, the worksheet completed in class, Nkosi revealed very little mastery of the recognition and realisation rules as they applied to this micro-context. In the first question on the poem *Warning* by Jenny Joseph, learners were required to describe the tone of the poem and quote from the poem to prove their opinion. Nkosi chose the word “shall” to best describe the tone. This word suggests that this learner does not recognise the term ‘tone’ and is therefore unable to carry out the operation. F The second question was a more general question requiring recognition of the concept

'stereotype' and realisation of that concept by producing a text that explains how conventional expectations limit and inhibit people. Nkosi demonstrated that he recognised the concept 'stereotype' and demonstrated partial realisation in the text he produced. **Rck Rla-** However, in the two questions that followed, which related more directly to the poem, Nkosi failed to demonstrate any recognition or realisation. **FF**

In the questionnaires that all learners in the class completed, a majority of learners mentioned that *Warning* was the worst poem that they had studied through the year. Learners were deeply offended by the idea that the elderly should become:

“And I shall spend my pension on brandy and summer gloves  
And satin sandals, and say we've no money for butter.  
I shall sit down on the pavement when I'm tired  
And gobble up samples in shops and press alarm bells.....”

In their opinion, the idea that the elderly should be 'drunk and disorderly', was absurd. It is embedded in the zulu culture to respect the elderly and conceive them as dignified and wise. Many learners rely on their grandparents as guardians. In this instance, learners were unable to move out of their community code and analyse the poem from a context independent position as subconsciously, they believed this to be a criticism of old people that went against everything that they had been brought up to believe. The poem *Warning*, acted as a barrier to the elaborated code for Nkosi. In the case of *Still I Rise*, the poem acted as a trigger for Nhlaka to move out of the community code and reason in the elaborated code. Much debate has arisen over the euro-centric bias of our curriculum and authorities have endeavoured to, where possible, balance this with a more afro-centric orientation. Those that are critical of this shift have warned that 'knowledge' may be lost in the process. The above example suggests that, not only is this shift desirable in terms of the development of a sense of pride in our culture, but is also desirable as it possibly increases the learner's access to knowledge and allows the learner the opportunity to function in an elaborated code which otherwise may be denied to him.

In Task Four, the final exam, Nkosi once again demonstrated substantial control of both recognition and realisation rules. He selected a difficult poem *Sonatina by Peter*

*Govender, Beached* by Douglas Livingstone and he was only one of two learners to do so. In the last question, Nkosi demonstrates that although to a large extent he is able to express himself in the elaborated code, the community code still impacts on his reasoning greatly and sometimes impairs his realisations:

4.2.3 What impression do we gain of his wife in lines 10/11 (“My porpoise-wife ....Queen among curry-makers)? Refer to words and images.

The learner is required to demonstrate recognition of the implications of the terms “porpoise-wife” and “queen among curry-makers”. He is required to produce a text that demonstrates realisation of the connotations of these images.

Nkosi answered:

“The impression of porpoise-wife is a fun, kind, playful, loving person. Queen among curry-makers shows that she is a good cook as Indians love cooking curry and Govender loves it.”

From this answer, Nkosi clearly understands the image of the porpoise wife but is limited to a context-dependent text when explaining the image of queen among curry-makers. **Rck Rla-**

In the final task, the re-test completed six months after the final exam, Nkosi’s contribution to the discussion before the writing section again revealed strong demonstrations of the realisation rule. However, this was not as strongly evident in the written section. In question 5.2.2, the learner is required to explore the image of “prime as oarsman” by referring to the lines: “heroics of the offshore boat, catching all that steel slabs of sea could express.” Nkosi did not recognise the correct worst answer but was able to explain, using general principles, why he chose the following answer as the worst:

“They convey it in a way that he was good at fishing even in his ‘prime’ times but here were those who were with him, heroes who caught really big, stubborn fish, people who loved and had a passion for sea.”

Nkosi explained that the above answer was the worst because the answer focuses on the fishing whereas the question asks about his 'prime as oarsman', therefore the focus of the question is inappropriate. This elaborated reasoning is sound and suggests that in certain instances, learners may not be able to recognise knowledge and concepts but are able to produce context-independent texts to support their conclusions. Nkosi does not recognise the correct worst answer but the text that he produces demonstrates realisation of the concepts involved. This implies that recognition is not always a pre-requisite for realisation.

**F Rla F**

TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ANALYSED:	23
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED:	14
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	1
PERCENTAGE OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	65%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ANALYSED:	7
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED:	4
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	1
PERCENTAGE OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	71%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ANALYSED:	8
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED:	4
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	1
PERCENTAGE OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	63%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ANALYSED:	23
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED:	7
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	9
PERCENTAGE OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	70%

Although Nkosi is sometimes impaired by the community code, to a large extent (approximately 70%), school has been an interrupter of this code and he is able to make use of context-independent principles to reason and achieve realisation of concepts and knowledge in this micro-context. It is interesting to note that statistically, Nkosi scored lower in passive realisation than in active realisation. This

may be as a result of recognition errors and yet he constantly strives at realisation as evidenced in the 9 instances in which he achieves partial realisation.

6.5.5 Zonke believes very strongly in the influence of your home life on what choices you make in both your personal life and your performance at school. She revealed a fascinating, mature attitude toward decision-making and an elaborated, well-structured, deductive argument. She starts with a general principle, introduces a specific example to prove her principle and then draws a conclusion.

“It doesn’t mean that if you are a clever person, you are not going to do something wrong. But if you are wiser, then you won’t do something wrong. It’s like if I go to university and in my third year I get pregnant. It’s not that I wasn’t clever enough, it’s that I wasn’t wise enough. I didn’t appreciate my opportunities and I messed up because I didn’t have that ‘light’ which shows me the way. It starts at home. You always think about those things that happened at home.”

Parker advises that we explore the metaphors that are employed in a text. He gives an example (1997) of someone who is struggling to emerge from a militaristic, apartheid background, who grapples with the emerging democracy as making use of battle metaphors like ‘under seige’ or ‘embattled’. In the above metaphor, I get the sense that Zonke is not referring to the traditional Christian ‘light’, but a more symbolic representation of wisdom or enlightenment which empowers her to control her own life. One may infer from the above comment that Zonke is influenced by the middle class values that she experiences at home but her life experience does not seem to correlate with this interpretation and appears to conflict with what she says. She gave a complex explanation about what motivates her to do better at school:

“For me it’s my enemies that motivate me to do better. Everytime I do something, they want me to do something wrong but I do the opposite and I am always right so it’s like I have to prove them wrong. It’s actually my step-mother who says that she wishes that I get pregnant before I finish school or do something like leave school or run away just so that she can hurt my father

and my aunt (with whom she lives) and tell them because I don't have a mum."

This explanation reveals the tensions in Zonke's life. She lives with her aunt who is a nurse and she seems to have a negative relationship with her step-mother who she describes as her "enemies". She gives an example of falling pregnant twice as something that would not be wise possibly because this common practice in her working class environment is a real threat to her aspirations. She would like to study after school and she chooses two very diverse careers as options for study, journalism or engineering. This suggests that she doesn't really have a clear plan for her future yet. She explains that her aunt maintains quite strict control over her personal life but doesn't get involved in her school work.

At school, Zonke prefers to work in a group where other people support you, however she is resentful if she doesn't get full credit for her input. She explained how in her experience, she has not found teachers approachable as, "sometimes you try to do something on your own and then you ask the teacher and she says why aren't you listening in class? You have been playing and stuff." She is also critical of teachers who just give you the answer from the book and do not explain what something means. However, she conceded that some teachers, if they have experience, are able to give you examples and when you write tests, you will remember that example. In order for Zonke to prepare for tests and exams, she writes summaries of what she has learned and then "puts it in a way that I can understand". This learner has demonstrated many of the critical outcomes stipulated in C2005. She is critical of the teachers at school and doesn't accept their answers just because the answers come from the book. She makes use of active learning methodology and she is comfortable working in a co-operative environment. There are indicators to suggest that Zonke's middle class schooling has acted as an interrupter of her working class home background and she makes use of an elaborated code to make sense of her own community.

*My Name* is the poem that Zonke chose as her favourite poem studied this year. She enjoyed it because it showed how parents give names because they have expectations of their children. Children should be proud of their names because they have a deeper

meaning. The poem she least enjoyed is *Warning*. She didn't like the poem because she interpreted it to be critical of old people. Parker's (1992) 4<sup>th</sup> criteria for discourse analysis is that a discourse is a coherent system of meanings. He claims, "statements in a discourse can be grouped, and given a certain coherence, insofar as they refer to the same topic" (Parker, 1992: 11). The above statement reveals that Zonke is a product of her culture that strongly rejects any perceived insolence toward the elderly. Thus her response to *Warning* represents her community code. She is unable to move beyond the restricted code and employ context-independent analytical techniques to judge the poem. Her choice of *My Name* also relied on her personalised interpretation of the poem. Similarly, when analysing *Bloody Men*, the humour of the poem escaped Zonke's attention and although she was able to identify the central simile, she was not able to expand on the extended image which leads me to conclude that she has, to a certain extent, mastered the recognition rule as it pertains to poetry and is, on occasion, able to passively realise the knowledge and concepts required in analysis but overall, she is unable to demonstrate active realisation. Rck F

Generally, Zonke's presentation and written assignment in Task One demonstrated that she recognises previously learnt poetry concepts and knowledge as she provided an adequate explanation of the content of the poem *Bloody Men*, but in this particular assignment, there was little evidence to suggest that her socio-affective disposition had positively impacted on her mastery of the recognition and realisation rules. Her ability to produce a text that made use of context-independent principles to realise the concepts and knowledge was limited although when probed on imagery, her answers did reveal some insight. In the explanation below, she interprets the following image:

"Bloody men are like bloody buses  
You wait for about a year  
And as soon as one approaches your stop  
Two or three others appear."

"In this poem, the poet is irritated by men because when she needs one, he's not there and when she's found one, many other men appear. She feels irritated but not angry." Rck Rla-

Zonke is able to recognise the concept 'imagery' and partially realises this concept by describing what the image represents but she does not establish the relationship between the image and its representation.

In answering the questions to *Hippopotamusman*, Zonke continues to recognise previously learnt concepts and knowledge and some effort was made to produce texts that realised these concepts and knowledge. Her answer to question 2.1.4 about the passengers' response reveals this effort:

"The passengers pretended as if they didn't see anything but really they did and felt like throwing up. The response is true to real life eg. If a person has a black eye and she get in a taxi, everyone will be quiet or just talk about something else. But when she gets off the taxi, the people will start talking. Maybe saying she has an abusive boyfriend or father and they assume she needs help. It's more like gossiping." **Rck Rcc Rlp Rla-**

She clearly recognises the passenger's response as she is able to describe it in her own words, she passively realises the knowledge as she claims this response is true to life and her example is appropriate. However, she does not make explicit the relationship between her example and the response of the passengers in order to fully actively realise the concept.

In the second poem of the same task, *My Name*, Zonke's answers extended the trend of demonstrating recognition and partial realisation. In response to question 2.3.4 on tone Zonke writes:

"Nomgqibelo Ncamisile Nmqhibisa uses a sad tone. She feels sad because other people don't know the importance and significance of her name. While to her it's history, future and maybe her life." **Rck- Rcc Rla-**

Zonke recognises and appropriately identifies the tone and provides a succinct reason for this tone. However, she does not provide examples from the poem to support her position, demonstrating thereby active realisation and her position is somewhat

limited as the tone varies through the poem and is at times, desperate – “Messia, help me!”

Although Zonke provided lengthy answers to the questions in Task Three on the poem *Warning*, she did not demonstrate any mastery of recognition or realisation. The community code dominated her answers and she was unable to make use of the elaborated code. In response to the question on the concept ‘stereotype’

“We stereotype aged people because they complain everytime. They also say they don’t need our help, they can perform or do everything by themselves. The one thing that I’ve noticed is that once they get their pension money, they have the, I don’t care attitude. If you try to hep them, they say that you’re after their money.”

The above answer does not demonstrate recognition of the concept ‘stereotype’ and is not relevant to the poem. She reveals a personalised position that is totally context-dependent. **FF**

In Task Four, the final exam of the year, Zonke’s answers do demonstrate recognition to a large extent and she attempts to produce texts that realise the poetry knowledge and concepts. More often than not, she achieves partial realisation and her answers waver between the community and the elaborated code. She has accessed the elaborated code to a certain degree but the community code is still evident in her answers. In response to a question on the literary devices used in the poem *One Small Boy Longs For Summer*, she writes:

“The poet uses personification when he or she says ‘the kettle sings’. Usually music brings happiness and personally, if I have problems, I listen to music and it drives them all away. So even though Thamu jerked his brother’s arm violently, here we get, or feel the atmosphere of love and care. **Rck Ria**

Zonke recognises the concept ‘personification’ and she adequately explains its representation in this example but it is as though, she cannot help but refer to her personalised response, which is not called for in this particular question.

In the re-test of the work covered in Task Four, most of Zonke's answers demonstrate recognition and passive realisation. In three answers she fully realises the required poetry knowledge and concepts and in two partially. She claims "he has conquered and he has won" is the worst answer because "I can still remember what the poem was about and it had nothing to do with conquering. It talked about a man's career, not a war." In this answer she not only recognises the required knowledge but provides an appropriate reason to realise why this answer is incorrect. **Rck Rla Rlp**

TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ANALYSED:	27
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED:	17
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	3
PERCENTAGE OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	74%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ANALYSED:	8
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED:	4
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	2
PERCENTAGE OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	75%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ANALYSED:	9
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED:	7
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	0
PERCENTAGE OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	78%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ANALYSED:	24
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED:	3
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	11
PERCENTAGE OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	58%

Zonke is only able to produce a text that demonstrates realisation of knowledge and concepts in just over half the tasks analysed, but in nearly 80% of the tasks analysed, she demonstrates passive realisation which suggests that although she has some control in the elaborated code, she struggles to express herself. Her answers suggest that she has not yet internalised the elaborated code and for her, it is more natural to respond in her context-dependent community code. There are elements of context-independent reasoning but her personalised response still dominates.

6.5.6 For Nomsa, her performance at school is almost entirely dependent upon her personal relationship with her teachers. She explains that if you want to please your teachers, you will strive to improve. However, from the following statement, Nomsa believes that certain learners are blessed with innate abilities and their lack of effort in class doesn't necessarily negatively impact on their performance.

“Some people can't concentrate in class. They try to but they are thinking about something else and they get frustrated. Maybe their parents are fighting or just something distracts them and they lose concentration but when it comes to exams, they just get the work right. They manage by perhaps asking their parents to help them or they are just good at working on their own.”

Nomsa, does not believe that she is one of the learners who has this innate ability. She says that she has tried to work on her own but she can't manage it. She likes to be able to study in silence and ask the teachers when she has a problem. There is a tone of irritation in her voice when she explains that there are some clowns in the class who are seeking attention. It is easiest for her to understand a subject when a teacher explains it well and if she still can't understand, then she will ask the teacher to explain further. She takes notes when teachers are explaining and then she learns these notes in preparation for exams and tests. Sometimes her housemother tests her on the work she has learned. She relies on rote learning and then she says she can forget what she has learnt as she has never had to remember something afterwards. This implies, that in Nomsa's learning experience, subjects have not been vertically structured but have been horizontally layered. She is not interested in the deeply in-bedded principles of a subject but merely needs to regurgitate the information provided to her by the authority – the teacher. This claim suggests that in Nomsa's experience of education, the curriculum retains its emphasis on content and rote learning and is not in reality, in accord with the requirements of the NCS. Nomsa does not express any of the frustration that other learners have expressed in not being able to successfully communicate with teachers, she doesn't hesitate to ask if she requires clarification.

Nomsa was not successful in completing the task in which she was required to analyse a poem of her own choice at the beginning of the year. If one takes into account her views as expressed above, one can understand that an independent task, with little teacher input, would present considerable challenge to Nomsa. As a result of her response to this task, an initial assessment of this learner might have suggested that she lacked a positive learner disposition but this assessment would be flawed as it fails to take into account the personal relationships that Nomsa establishes with her teachers that enable her to adequately perform academically. *Woman of the Future* is the poem that Nomsa chooses as her favourite poem studied this year and she expresses a sense of pride in her identity as a woman. Her criterion for choosing this poem is context-dependent and she relates to the poem from a personalised viewpoint. She re-iterates this viewpoint when discussing poetry in general:

“Poetry expresses people’s feelings and I have learned from poetry to be myself, how other people live, feel and how to express this and accept what I am”.

Although Nomsa does not use any elaborated reasoning, she does demonstrate that she has recognised the specificity of this micro-context, the study of poetry and although she has not actively realised this concept to date, she states that she has learnt “how to express this” and thus the possibility of active realisation remains.

In Task One, the selection and analysis of a poem of her own choice, Nomsa demonstrated almost no recognition or realisation of poetry knowledge or concepts. Her analysis was shallow and her conclusions incorrect at times. Even her personalised responses were contradictory eg. “I think the poem is nice but I don’t really like it cause it does not even say one good thing about days and life.” FFF

In Task Two, the mid-year exam, answers to questions revealed that Nomsa was grappling with the concepts of analysis and attempts were being made to realise concepts and in certain instances, she was able to recognise previously learned concepts and knowledge. In the poem *Hippopotamusman*, she was able to recognise and identify when the poet utilised the same technique of combining two word to create one and she attempted to explain why these words are effective: “You don’t

usually get these words from any poem or in any book, they are words made up by the poet.” Rck Rla-. In the text that she has produced, she does not make explicit why the words are effective but she recognises that because they are unique, they are effective and she partially realises the concept. However, in the second poem selected *First Blood*, Nomsa is largely unsuccessful at demonstrating recognition or realisation. In response to a question about the poet’s intention in writing the poem, she writes:

“the poet’s intention is to show us that there is a first time for everything, hunting is like when you go to war, your main target in the war is your enemy, but hunting it’s the same. It is an animal, ‘at the firing of the first slug’”.

Her conclusion about the intention of the poet is incorrect so she has failed to recognise the concept and she is unable to produce a text that realises this concept. **FF**

Nomsa failed to complete Task Three that was the formative assessment task. This reflects negatively on her socio-affective disposition – she is not motivated to complete the task if it is not for summative purposes. Continuous Assessment assumes that learners are willing and motivated to participate in the process but it doesn’t take into account that often, the very learner who would benefit from the formative process of the exercise, is unwilling to participate in the process.

In the final exam, the answers to questions revealed that Nomsa had made considerable progress as in all questions she was either fully or partially able to recognise the previously acquired knowledge or concept and in 50% of the questions, she was able to produce a text which fully realised that knowledge or concept and in the other 50%, her answers partially did so. Examples of analysis are provided below:

How do lines 8/9 “lipstick coated ....pipped.” work to effectively help convey the landlady to the readers?

“It shows us that the lady was rich and how she showed off during the conversation – what kind of lady she is. Rck- Rla-

The question requires that the image is ‘unpacked’ to reveal its representation. The answer suggests that the lipstick represents “showing off” and the gold-rolled cigarette-holder represents wealth. The learner demonstrates recognition of this image’s representation but she does not realise the concept by making explicit the relationship between the image and its representation. **Rck- R1a-**

Discuss how the poet uses poetic devices to enhance the reader’s appreciation of the kettle in this scene.

“Metaphor, the kettle sings in order to show that the water is boiling. This tries to tell us that the family loves one another and takes care of each other, so the poet uses the kettle to indicate and describe the family to us. **Rck- R1a-**

In this question the learner is required to recognise the previously acquired figure of speech that is personification. The learner is then required to demonstrate realisation of that concept by explaining the relationship between the personification and the reader’s appreciation of the poem. Nomsa incorrectly identifies the figure of speech but she is able to explain its function and show how our appreciation is developed through the use of this figure of speech. She demonstrates partial recognition and partial realisation. Her explanation is context-independent and she attempts to explain by using the principles of analysing an image and its representation in this micro-context.

Nomsa was not present for the first session of the re-test and did not answer the first six questions but results of the last three questions demonstrated substantial recognition and some realisation despite having missed the in depth explanation into how the process functions.

TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ANALYSED:	16
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED:	7
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	6
PERCENTAGE OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	81%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ANALYSED:	4
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED:	0

TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	2
PERCENTAGE OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	50%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ANALYSED:	5
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED:	3
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	1
PERCENTAGE OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	80%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ANALYSED:	18
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED:	5
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	5
PERCENTAGE OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	56%

The number of tasks analysed for this learner is quite substantially less than the other learners because she did not complete Task Three and the first six questions of Task Five. Had these questions been added to the statistics, her percentage of achievement might have been negatively affected because there would have been many more opportunities for her to have not achieved recognition and/or realisation. This is conjecture and points toward a weakness in statistical analysis. From a subjective point of view, the quality of her answers did not reflect more than 50% realisation but she does prepare thoroughly and this enables her to recognise knowledge and concepts. There is evidence to suggest that there has been considerable development in this learner's mastery of the recognition rule and to a certain extent of the realisation rule.

6.5.7 As mentioned earlier in relation to family matters, Siphon was reticent in discussion. He does wish to study further and follow a career in advertising but really only commented on other member's career choice as opposed to his own. His few comments did, however, reveal a positive disposition toward school. He disagreed with Nkosi that school restricts a learner because "you start to enjoy what you do, getting into it." He claims that although Business Economics is his best subject, he loves History because it is interesting. Siphon concurs with Nhlaka's comments about good teachers. Siphon believes that the key to a good pass rate is "if the teachers don't talk all the time. When the teachers kept on talking, it gets boring but if they crack a joke, then that interrupts your thoughts." When Siphon explained further about the teacher's ability to at least once a lesson crack a joke to make the lesson interesting,

he became animated which revealed that this was a very important factor for him in the learning process. Like Nkosi, Siphso was extrinsically motivated by rewards from his parents if his marks improve but this did not appear to greatly influence his school life.

As a learning activity, Siphso prefers group work because it provides you with the opportunity to get to know the other learners and to see what they can come up with. In class discussion, you get to understand the work better and it helps the teacher find out exactly who doesn't understand, who is lurking at the back and not understanding. He also believes it is easier to express yourself orally than in writing. He enjoys finding out more about his classmates when they express what they like, dislike and what they feel inside.

He responded positively to the analysis task of choosing your own poem and was effective in analysing the tone of the poem that was vital to an in-depth understanding of this poem. He demonstrates a context-independent stance when describing the accessibility of the vocabulary of the poem as it was written by an 11 year old. He correctly identifies figures of speech, thereby demonstrating recognition of the concepts and knowledge required in the analysis of poetry and although he doesn't fully explain the specific application of the figures of speech in this poem he is able to comment on them that reveals passive realisation and the possibility of active realisation.

In choosing his favourite poem studied this year, Siphso adopted a context-independent position and focussed on the general principle of the poem as opposed to the context-specific stance of many of the girls. *Woman of the Future* is his favourite poem because "it showed the steps a child has to take until they become a good and wise adult". Siphso was able to divorce himself from the title "woman" and unpack the principles governing the theme. He also stated that *Warning* was his least favourite poem, not because of its perceived insulting content, but because he thought he had understood it, only to discover that he had not. The implication is that Siphso experienced frustration in the learning process and this negatively influenced his view of the poem. Although this is a personalised response, he is able to recognise the specific reason why he responded negatively to the poem.

Sipho's home background and family relationship differs somewhat from the other learners in that his father is self-employed and is a successful businessman. His disposition toward school is positive and he was expansive about the role of sport in his school life but his reticence in discussion suggests that possibly he is not as comfortable to express himself within the group. Possibly, there is some tension between this learner's perception of his own identity and those of the other learners.

In Task One, Sipho demonstrated that he entered Grade 10 having mastered the required Recognition and Realisation Rules appropriate to the first year of the FET phase. He selected *My Sister* by James Tochey (aged 11), a very moving, emotional poem that he read beautifully. The learner states in his written presentation:

“This poem is an eye-opener for adults because they think that the bad things that happen, it also takes its toll on the child.”

This statement suggests that Sipho responded appropriately to the content of the poem and is in possession of the socio-affective competences required to select a poem that is stimulating and thought-provoking to a Grade 10 English learner. Sipho provided a full and accurate analysis of the poem. The language is simple and accessible (as pointed out in his analysis), all figures of speech were correctly identified and explained and the use of repetition and its effect was discussed. The learner's methodology of analysis revealed recognition of previously acquired concepts and skills of analysis and the content of his analysis demonstrated that he is able to produce a text that realises the required concepts and skills of analysis. In his assessment of the poem, he demonstrated his ability to move from a personalised response, to a more general position: “It is touching and realistic – it will make adults think.” **Rck Rcc Rla**

Sipho selected *Hippopotamusman* as his first poem in Task Two. Again he demonstrated a high degree of mastery of both the recognition and realisation rules as suggested in the example below.

Explain why these newly created words are so effective.

“They give a completely new meaning to the original word because when a person reads this he will see hippopotamus and man, put them together and it sounds very nasty.” **R1a**

The above text reveals that Siphso is able to produce a text that realises the required skills.

Surprisingly, Siphso did not demonstrate the same degree of mastery in the second poem he selected, *My Name*. Other learners found this poem more accessible than the first but Siphso made basic recognition errors, for example, he identified “burly bureaucrat” as a metaphor **F**. It is possible that he did not plan his time effectively and spent too much time on the first poem and didn’t leave himself enough time to think clearly in the second poem. This is a factor that Nkosi also had problems with and is obviously a skill that needs to be developed by educators.

Unlike other learners, in Task Three, the worksheet on the poem *Warning*, Siphso’s answers demonstrated a high degree of recognition and some realisation. In the first question on tone, he recognised the concept tone but incorrectly identified it and consequently the example did not effectively correlate to the tone:

“The tone is depressed, unhappy, tired – ‘When I am old, I shall wear purple with a red hat which doesn’t go.’” **Rck F**

This example suggests Siphso is projecting his own, personalised, context-dependent response – he clearly would be depressed to wear purple and red that doesn’t go!

However, in the more general question on stereotype, he ably demonstrated recognition of the concept and he produced a text that realised this concept and the content of that text suggested that he is in possession of the appropriate socio-affective disposition. He utilises delightful examples from his own experience to demonstrate the general concept of stereotype:

“The stereotypic notions about aged people is that ..... they lose their funky side, they sit on the rocking chairs and watch old soapies and listen to their

Elvis Presley songs and wear raggy and worn out clothes .... That is the stereotype we young people think happens when you get old. **Rck Rcc Rla**  
 In Task Four, Siphso was less consistent in demonstrating mastery of the recognition and realisation rules. Answers suggested that partial recognition and realisation was taking place but not full recognition and realisation.

4.3.1 What does the verb “pierces” (Line 5) tell us about the heat from the fire?

“It tells us that it is very, very hot inside the small kitchen” **Rck Rla-**

The above answer suggests that he recognises that the effect of the word “pierces” is extreme heat but he does not make explicit the image and its representation to fully realise the concept.

In the re-test, this inconsistency was evident again and none of the written answers demonstrated full mastery of the realisation rule. However, in discussion before the written part of the test, Siphso did demonstrate both recognition and realisation.

TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ANALYSED:	25
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED:	13
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	3
PERCENTAGE OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	64%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ANALYSED:	8
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED:	6
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	1
PERCENTAGE OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	88%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ANALYSED:	7
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED:	3
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	0
PERCENTAGE OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	40%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ANALYSED:	22
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED:	8
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	8
PERCENTAGE OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	73%

Sipho has achieved above 70% realisation in all the tasks undertaken and there are an equal number of tasks fully achieved and partially achieved. Analysis reveals that in exam conditions, Sipho mostly partially achieved realisation whereas during classwork exercises, he consistently achieved full realisation. The quality of answers that were analysed suggest that Sipho is able to adequately express himself in the elaborated code and he moves with ease from the community code, to the elaborated code and back again. Sipho's home background differs to a certain extent from the other learners and this is a possible factor in producing the ease with which he makes this transition. It is interesting to note that Sipho only achieves 64% mastery of the recognition rule. This may result from Sipho's lack of preparation for content-based questions. When a question requires the learner to realise knowledge by producing an independent text, he is able to do so because he can access the elaborated code but when a question simply requires a learner to recognise previously acquired knowledge, he is not always able to do so because his memory fails him. Analysis of Sipho's work suggests that recognition is not always a pre-requisite for realisation of knowledge.

6.5.8 The majority of Brian's contribution to the discussion focussed on his participation in sport which clearly is very important to him and goes beyond his commitments at a school level. In talking about his preferred study method, he prefers to study in silence. Mostly he summarises the work done in class and checks that he understands what he has written and he finds the teachers who are most helpful are the ones who are easy to approach and who are willing to help you after school. Bruce mentioned that in his experience, there is almost no overlap between common sense knowledge and school knowledge, however, he believes Geography is the exception as you can actually go to the Duzi and see the flow. His favourite subject is Art because there is a practical component to it but he was very specific that he would like to pursue a career in science. He did not give any reason for this choice.

Brian chose *My Name* as the best poem he had studied that year. This is particularly interesting as this learner chooses to be called by his English name and not his Zulu

name and yet the poem impacted on him. He has researched the meanings of all his own names and values their symbolic representation. He was moved by the sense of identity that the speaker in the poem expresses and the pride with which she announces what she stands for.

“If you don’t have identity, then you don’t know where you are from and you don’t know where you are going.”

Brian has a strong sense of self worth and although he is a generally reserved young man, he is confident to express his individual views. He has highly developed socio-affective competences and is not concerned with outdated racist notions as evidenced by his attitude towards his names. He chose to analyse *Neutral Tones* by Thomas Hardy, a challenging poem that requires a mature response, once again reflecting his self-confidence. His analysis of the poem revealed his control of the elaborated code as he made use of general principles and he utilises this reasoning to substantiate his choice. He also conducted research into the poem that suggests that he made an additional effort that was not stipulated as part of the task.

“There is a feeling of deadness to nature. As the title describes, the tone of the poem is neutral. It is not happy nor sad but neutral. The poet uses nature to describe his feelings and this gives us more feeling and understanding. I chose this poem because I like the way the poet gives us a feeling of deadness to nature. It connects to me.”

For Brian, school has acted as an interrupter to his working class background. His positive learner disposition suggests that the middle class values of the school have been internalised as through a variety of texts, there is no evidence of any tension within this learner.

As mentioned above, Brian personal selection of a poem in Task One was *Neutral Tones* by Thomas Hardy, which presented challenges to a Grade 10 learner. In the main, he responded positively to these challenges and both his oral and written presentation demonstrated a high degree of mastery over the recognition and realisation skills. In reading the poem, despite being blessed with a deep, resonant

voice, Brian did not always articulate the words clearly which led me to believe that he was not familiar with the vocabulary. His in-depth explanation and excellent vocabulary list revealed much effort, especially if you take into account that he experienced some difficulty with the vocabulary. His sense of tone and his response to the subtle nuances of the poem revealed insight and mastery over both the recognition and realisation rules. **Rck Rla Rcc**

In Task Two, the first poem Brian selected was *Hippopotamusman*. In this poem, he incorrectly recognised a technique of combining two words into one as ambiguity. This error of recognition negatively impacted on his answer. He was unable to realise the required knowledge and concepts because the premise from which he started was erroneous. **F F**

In the second poem he selected, *First Blood*, he makes a similar mistake:

2.2.1 The first sentence of the poem is, “It was.” What is the subject of this sentence? Why is this an effective introduction? **Rck Rla**

The learner is required to recognise the subject of the sentence (It) and produce a text that correctly explains why the introduction is effective.

Brian incorrectly recognises “was”, the verb, as the subject of the sentence. He recognises that he must identify a part of speech but he identifies it incorrectly. Thus he fails to master the recognition rule in this context. However, his explanation of the effect of the verb is valid and relevant and demonstrates realisation of the concept of the verb. This suggests that had his recognition been accurate, he has the ability to realise knowledge and concepts. This is another example of the interesting relationship between the recognition rule and the realisation rule and that mastery of the former, is not necessarily a pre-requisite of mastery of the latter.

“It is about something that came and went in the past. It is effective because it gives us an idea that something “was”, now it’s no more. Maybe death has occurred.” **F Rla**

His ability to realise knowledge and concepts is revealed in his last answer in response to what the poet's intention is:

"In my opinion, the poet doesn't like hurting animals that are innocent and defenceless. Hunting is not good. 'We were like dishonoured soldiers.' What is the point of doing something you are not proud of?" **Rck Rla**

The answers in Task Three suggest that although Brian does not always recognise and realise the poetry concepts and knowledge, he is able to move beyond his community code and adopt a more generalist stance. This is revealed in his answer to his personal response to the speaker's rebellion in *Warning*:

"I feel that her rebellion against the rules of society is a good thing though I'm clueless of the outcome because what she is attempting to do, is something that hasn't been done before." **Rck Rla**

He attempts to analyse her rebellion in terms of the consequences to that rebellion and he realises that there is no general precedent from which to draw a conclusion. This is an example of context-independent reasoning in which the learner is searching for a general principle to endorse his own viewpoint.

In Task Four, the final examination for the year, Brian achieves full recognition in four of the six answers and partial recognition in the other two. He achieves full realisation in 50% of the answers and partial realisation in the others. In no question does he fail to achieve any recognition or realisation. Brian's performance through the year demonstrated consistent development of mastery of both the recognition and realisation rules and these findings did not vary dramatically in exam conditions.

In the re-test, Brian's performance remains consistent for the recognition rule and there is some evidence of realisation. In six of the eight questions, he recognises the best answer. In four out of five answers he achieves passive realisation and three out of five answers, partial realisation. His contributions in discussion before the written tests also demonstrated realisation of the required concepts and knowledge:

“I think it’s B. It’s because of that word ‘respectful’. It’s like you said. It’s sort of ironic and when she speaks it sounds like she is a lady but then deep down inside she is not, she is racist when the guy tells her she is black.” **Rck**

**Rlp Rla**

This answer suggests that he correctly recognises the concept ‘irony’ and uses an example from the poem that the woman cannot be racist and respectful to demonstrate irony thus making use of a specific example to demonstrate a general principle and producing a text that realises this concept.

TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ANALYSED:	25
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED:	16
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	5
PERCENTAGE OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	84%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ANALYSED:	8
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED:	6
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	1
PERCENTAGE OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	88%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ANALYSED:	7
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED:	5
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	1
PERCENTAGE OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	86%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ANALYSED:	24
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED:	8
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	9
PERCENTAGE OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	71%

Despite making some recognition errors, Brian demonstrated considerable mastery of the realisation rule. His answers reflect an ease with the elaborated code that suggests he has internalised this code and that he moves from the community code to the elaborated code in the appropriate micro-contexts.

6.5.9 From the outset of the group discussion, Nkululeko was willing to volunteer information, even if the information he was offering was not correct. When he discovered his mistake, it did not alter his approach that was forthright and direct.

“My father died in 2003, so my mother is the breadwinner.”

Nkululeko intends to study after school but his aspirations lack clarity at this stage. In discussion he hopes to be a computer specialist but on his questionnaire he said he would like to study law and in conversation, he jokingly mentioned that he would be the next president of the country. He has demonstrated an interest in politics and chose to speak on democracy for his oral. This broad spectrum of interests suggests that Nkululeko is not daunted by the diversity of opportunities available to him but his choice has not been finalised. Contrary to the opinion of some of the other learners who failed to make any connection between school knowledge and everyday knowledge Nkululeko believes that the work done at school is useful:

“At school we get the feeling of how the real world is. You get to meet different people and you learn to act amongst others.”

Nkululeko explained that he chose to come to Ace High School instead of a local school in Eastwood because he thinks that the learners are more determined at Ace High. He admires the teachers who encourage learners to work harder and then they pass. He says the teachers really make a difference to the school and he refers to a teacher that has left the school as an example of a teacher who made a difference. Interestingly, this teacher had never taught Nkululeko but he recognises his worth. Successful academic performance positively impacts on Nkululeko personally. Other people, friends and family, motivate him to learn and he sites Steve Biko as someone who has had a particular influence on this life. Nkululeko has accepted the dominant discourse of the institution as his own as evidenced in his repetition of an often quoted axiom from a past head boy:

“The words of VB (previous Head boy) come to mind. ‘You can either maintain, or improve.’ And you think, let me go for it. Let me maintain or let me improve. And then you kind of like feel, wow!”

Nkululeko prefers class discussion as a method of learning because you take down the correct notes and you get to find out what other people know. Unlike other learners, Nkululeko prefers to express himself in writing rather than in orals and he believes that poetry is worthy of inclusion in the curriculum as it enables the learners to explore their feelings. He has the confidence to question teachers when he is not sure about something and Nkululeko was the only learner who mentioned that although his family doesn’t help him with work, they end up debating about something. He expressed typical teenager frustration at the direction of discussion within the family:

“I have got my point of view, I have got a foundation and all I am asking is that they build on my foundation but they disagree, I can say something about Biology and then they will disagree.”

This comment suggests that Nkululeko takes for granted that his family has input into his academic development and he doesn’t feel privileged, but a little resentful, of this ‘interference’. This is an indicator of a middle class environment where, according to Bernstein, the family introduces children to the elaborated code. Because it all sounds so natural to Nkululeko, we can assume that he has experienced this for some years and although he comes from a single parent, working class background, his extended family has had a vibrant influence on his life. His ease in expressing himself in the elaborated code is evidenced when he explains why *Hippopotamusman* is his favourite poem studied this year. He combines a personalised response with general principles to support his response:

“I really liked this poem because it is easy and fun. It explored different ideas with combinations of words.” **Rck Rla**

His least favourite poem was *Whiffs of my Oddity* which he described as:

“the information was not straight out, you had to focus and read into it to find the answers.” **Rck Rla-**

Other learners have expressed their dislike for a poem because it is difficult but Nkululeko is able to not only recognise its difficulty, but what causes it to be difficult. Thus, he demonstrates control of the recognition rule as it applies in this micro-context and goes some way toward producing a text that reveals active realisation.

In his individual choice of poem, *I have not seen God*, Nkululeko came to an incorrect conclusion about the poet’s position regarding God:

“The poet proclaims that he has not seen God because a part of him doesn’t believe that God is alive.” **FF**

However, this did not discourage him from exploring other, equally complex imagery within the poem:

“In the last line the poet says, ‘ find the unknown through the known’ and this means that in the hidden detail, try to use the information that you know, to find what you don’t know.” **Rck Rla**

This process suggests that Nkululeko has the confidence to explore knowledge and concepts individually and that he is not reliant on the teacher to produce knowledge for him. He has the courage to accept that his conclusions may not always be correct, as evidenced at the beginning of the discussion, but this does not dissuade him from further effort. Nkululeko is empowered by the acquisition of knowledge and his motivation for learning is intrinsic. He demonstrates highly developed socio-affective competences and these remain in tact despite not always being able to actively realise the appropriate knowledge and concepts. He has internalised the dominant discourse of the institution and has made it his own.

Nkululeko selected the poem *I have not seen God* by Phoebe Hesketh as his poem for analysis in Task One. This poem makes use of symbolism to represent a complex message and as the example above demonstrates, Nkululeko made every effort to

engage with this symbolism but his oral and written presentation suggested that although he had acquired some mastery over the recognition rule, he was not able to fully realise the required knowledge and concepts for this poem. He accepts the literal meaning of the title and although he understands the last image in the poem (extract given below), he understands it in isolation, and doesn't relate it to the title:

“But I love the light that quickens wood and stone,  
The sudden grace  
Lifting a dull pedestrian out of time  
And Place, to find the unknown through the known.”

In this micro-context, Nkululeko can, at best, only partially realise the knowledge and concepts required. **Rck Rla-**

In Task Two, the mid-year exam, Nkululeko once again demonstrates mastery of the recognition rule but battles to adequately express realisation of the concepts and knowledge required. In response to a question on tone in *My Name*, he writes:

“She has strong feelings toward the discrimination of her name. She feels as if they are taking advantage of her name, not noticing its importance and this makes her feel sad. **Rck Rcc Rla-**

Nkululeko recognises that he must explore the speaker's feelings in order to reveal her tone and he does provide a relevant reason for her feelings but he doesn't give examples from the poem to support this reason and the term used, “sad”, is somewhat limiting and not entirely appropriate.

Only in the answer to the question on the reactions of the passengers in *Hippopotamusman* does he demonstrate both recognition and realisation of the concepts and skills required:

“Yes, their reactions are true indeed, because if you'll are in groups and see something odd you'll tend to laugh but if you are alone, your turn a blind eye and walk past. For me it was when there was a fight at the Market Square and I walked

straight past when I was alone but if we were a group, I promise you we would have stopped and started cheering and making noise.” **Rck Rcc Rlp Rla**

In this answer, he recognises the reaction of the passengers and accurately describes it. He demonstrates passive realisation by stating that their reaction is true to life and he produces an example from his own experience that demonstrates active realisation as he is able to establish the appropriate connection between his example and the one in the poem. However, his conversational style of expression in the written form (I promise you), suggests that he is not at ease in the elaborated code and that for this question, he was able to extend himself beyond the community code but this may be specific to this question.

In Task Three, the class worksheet on the poem *Warning*, his answers demonstrate some recognition but only partial realisation in one question. In question three, which asks about the reader’s personal response to the speaker’s planned rebellion, Nkululeko does recognise what her rebellion entails and he provides a strictly personalised response. He employs no general principles to justify this response and it is totally dependent on his personal context:

“She was very rebellious towards old age. She makes fun of old people which is wrong.” **Rck F**

Although Nkululeko recognises that the speaker is in some way making fun of old people, he does not relate this to the tone of the poem:

“Taught, we are taught not to swear on the streets and we are encouraged to set an example for children.” **FF**

The above answer suggests that he does not recognise the required concept of tone.

The answers in his final examination, Task Four, are similarly limited and mostly demonstrate partial recognition and partial realisation.

4.1.1 Why does the poet offer a self-confession?

“He offers a self-confession by explaining his outer appearance. By explaining his complexion.” **Rck Rla-**

Or

4.1.2 How do lines 8/9 “lipstick coated .... Pipped” work to effectively help convey the landlady to the reader?

“This helps to show that the landlady is a fake. She is not what she makes out to be. She is trying to be what she is not.” **Rck- Rla-**

In the above examples, he demonstrates recognition by describing in his own words aspects of the poem but he does not fully realise why or how this is achieved. He does not make use of the general tools of analysis to produce a text that demonstrates realisation of the required concepts and knowledge.

In the re-test, Nkululeko was not present in the first, discussion phase and only completed part of the written test. In this section answers were consistent with previous findings. Three out of five answers demonstrated mastery of the recognition rule but only one out five demonstrated partial realisation.

TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ANALYSED:	23
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED:	17
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	1
PERCENTAGE OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	78%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ANALYSED:	9
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED:	6
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	1
PERCENTAGE OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	78%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ANALYSED:	7
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED:	2
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	1

PERCENTAGE OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED	43%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ANALYSED	22
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED	2
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED	13
PERCENTAGE OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED	68%

In terms of his reasoning, Nkululeko is bounded by the community code but this is somewhat at odds with his disposition as revealed in the in-depth discussion. Of the 22 realisation tasks analysed, he only produces a text that demonstrates mastery of the realisation rule in two instances. However, if you take into account partial realisations, he achieves close on 70%. He is making an effort to engage with the elaborated code but at this point, is only partially successful.

6.5.10 Fekile expanded on the idea of 'light' as introduced by Zonke. She believes that the 'light' starts at home where she strongly expresses that parents should be an example. They should not drink and smoke and she insisted that they should not get drunk. The connotation of this emphasis is that for Fekile, the sober habits of parents have some importance. Unfortunately, the issue of substance abuse was not explored further and as mentioned in discussion on Nhlaka, this is a limitation of the study.

Fekile explained about the importance of school in the development of learning. She believes it is important to concentrate in class as when you are reading afterwards, you remember what you were listening to in class. She likes the teacher to go over work in class and then she takes down the notes. She gets irritated when people distract her from her work when she is concentrating in class and advises teachers to chase those learners who don't want to work out of the class and let the ones who really want to learn, stay. She says that she is not scared that people will laugh at her but she does not enjoy oral work because she is quite shy. For this reason, she prefers working in groups for orals but likes to do written work individually. She has

grappled with some self-study exercises in Biology and although she does not find it easy, she is able to finally 'get it' and it felt good when she got it right in a test. Fekile is concerned that some teachers are difficult to approach so although she is able to ask questions, there are times when she doesn't. In preparation for tests and exams, Fekile summarises her work and memorises what she has summarised.

Fekile is dependent upon teacher input for a positive learning experience. For the majority of her school work, she does not reason independently but regurgitates the information provided to her from the teacher. Teacher control of discipline within the class is an important factor for Fekile and her preference is to work independently and not in a group. Fekile does not conform to many of the critical outcomes of C2005 as for her, knowledge is essentially content-based, derived from the teacher and she chooses not to work co-operatively. She is critical of teachers but lacks the confidence to question them. However, all evidence of Fekile's behaviour and performance at school suggests that she is a 'model' learner and yet her disposition toward learning is not as the Official Curriculum envisages. It is possible that although this school's curriculum claims to represent the national curriculum, there are some differentials and due to this shift in focus, Fekile displays a positive learner disposition within the school.

In response to poetry, Fekile writes that poetry has given her a whole new perspective or view on life of how other people look at the different things of life:

"I've learnt that people have different views about women and how they look, that you must be proud of your heritage and to appreciate the simplest things in life."

She responds to poetry from a personalised perspective and she has not adopted any context-independent principles to influence her opinion. This is borne out by her choice of favourite and least favourite poems studied through the year:

"I liked *My Name* best because that person was proud of her name, herself and where she comes from which is not always the case with young people."

And

*“Last lesson of the Afternoon has to be my least favourite poem because it has no relevance and it was dull and boring.”*

Ironically, the above poem was specifically selected for its relevance to learners but clearly the teacher’s perspective on what is relevant to learners differs from the learner’s perspective. The above two statements show that Fekile does not avail herself of the elaborated code to express her opinion in text but in many instances through the tasks, she does demonstrate mastery of the recognition rule and to some extent the realisation rule. It is possible that due to Fekile’s positive learner disposition and her diligent memorisation of information, she is able to demonstrate mastery of recognition and realisation for that specific micro-context but that she does not express herself easily within the elaborated code and it is unlikely that school has been an amplifier of this code but that she has learnt the ‘tricks’ of recognition required. This conclusion is evidenced in the re-test administered six months after the final examination. At the beginning of the test, I carefully explicated the requirements of the test and structured examples to illustrate these requirements, providing model answers. Fekile was very quick to ‘pick up’ on the method or process being undertaken and she enthusiastically volunteered worthy input. She recognises the use of key words as indicators of correctness eg. Detail, evidence and example.

*“I think C is the best answer because the first two do not give much explanation and they don’t go into detail. I think that is why he is confessing.”*

**Rck Rlp Rla-**

And

*“In this extract, there is no evidence to show us that she is kind”* **Rck Rla-**

And

*“I think it is B because it takes an example from the actual poem and shows us here how the poet conveys his reactions.”* **Rck Rlp Rla-**

In the case of Fekile, she is able to demonstrate mastery of the recognition rule and to some extent actively realises poetry knowledge and concepts but many of her statements are still organised in a context-dependent, community orientated code.

I have generally accepted that if learners have mastered the recognition and realisation rules for the micro-context of poetry in Grade 10, then for these learners, the classroom has been an amplifier of the elaborated code and learners have developed an ease to express themselves within this code, thus enabling them to move from their working class background and a restricted code to an elaborated code in which middle class values dominate. However, in analysing Fekile's discourse, there appears to be a flaw in the logic of this argument. Analysis of this learner's texts through the year, using the instruments developed to measure recognition and realisation, reveals substantial mastery of both recognition and realisation but in-depth discourse analysis suggests that she does not express herself in the elaborated code but still organises her statements in a context-dependent, community orientated code.

Results of analysis of coding in Task One suggest that Fekile demonstrates mastery of the Realisation Rule and is making attempts to achieve Realisation. In those questions that require her to produce a text that demonstrates realisation of poetry knowledge and concepts, she is able to achieve partial realisation in 100% of the cases. However, in the instances where she is only required to recognise the previously acquired knowledge and concepts, she is 100% successful. Her analysis revealed a more personalised stance and although she recognised the skills of analysis required she was unable to realise these in text. **Rck Rla-**

However, in Task Two more of Fekile's answers suggest that she is able to make use of general principles in order to answer questions:

2.1.1 In the title to this poem, the poet has chosen to combine two words and create one. In your opinion, why does he do this?

"I think he does this to create a whole new image of a man who is huge, grumpy and ugly and looks like a hippo." **Rla**

or

4.3.1 Using evidence from the poem to support your discussion, describe the importance of a name.

“A name is very important and it represents you, where you come from eg. ‘from Chief Daluzolo’ and what you and your family are all about eg. ‘Wonderful name of my great-great-grandmothers.’” **Rck Rla**

In these answers, Fekile does present her personalised opinion but she substantiates it with evidence from the poem that represents a general principle to which she has referred.

In Task Three, the answer to the question on tone reveals how, although she recognises the concept tone, she is not able to realise that concept because the community code dominates her reasoning. Her answer reflects her own, context-dependent position, not that of the speaker in the poem:

Words best to describe her are depressed because she says ‘And I shall spend my pension on brandy’. Brandy is usually linked with drowning your sorrows with strong alcohol. The second word would be irritated, that they have to wear clothes to keep them dry.” **Rck F**

In the answers to Task Four, Fekile again demonstrates mastery of the recognition rule and in 50% of the questions answered, she demonstrates mastery of the realisation rule. It is interesting to note that Fekile was one of two candidates to select *Dieselene Conqueror* for answering. This poem was the most challenging poem studied through the year and it demonstrates her self-confidence that she tackled it. In response to this micro-context, two out of three of her answers demonstrated mastery of the realisation rule which suggests that this learner’s competence has developed through the year.

4.2.3 What impression do we gain of his wife in lines 10/11 (My porpoise-wife ....Curry-makers)? Refer to words and images.

“We get the impression that his wife was once beautiful and young, but was not more like that but was getting old. We also get the impression that she was a wonderful cook, he used to love when she cooked delicious meals for him and we get this because he says ‘queen among curry-makers’, not just curry, but any meals.” **Rck Rla**

From this answer, Fekile recognises the impression of his wife and is able to refer to specific imagery from the poem to substantiate this impression. She produces a text that realises the image by making use of the general principle as represented in the poem, to support her statement.

In discussion before the written section of Task Five, Fekile demonstrated control of the realisation rule. In response to a question on why ‘respectful’ is in inverted commas she explained:

“They are being sarcastic in a way. This lady looks a certain way but she isn’t really like that. She looks good and she has got nice lipstick but deep down, she is not really like that.” **Rck Rla**

She recognises the appropriate use of the inverted commas and she gives a reason why they are used by referring to the specific example from the poem that substantiates her recognition, thereby realising the required concept.

In the written test, she is less successful and mostly achieves partial realisation.

TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ANALYSED:	26
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED:	20
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCK TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	2
PERCENTAGE OF RCK TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	85%
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ANALYSED:	9
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED:	5
TOTAL NUMBER OF RCC TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	2
PERCENTAGE OF RCC TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	78%

TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ANALYSED:	8
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED:	5
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLP TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	0
PERCENTAGE OF RLP TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	63
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ANALYSED:	23
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED:	6
TOTAL NUMBER OF RLA TASKS PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	12
PERCENTAGE OF RLA TASKS ACHIEVED OR PARTIALLY ACHIEVED:	78%

At the beginning of the year, Fekile did not demonstrate mastery of the realisation rule and over the year, less than a quarter of the tasks analysed demonstrated this mastery. However, there was evidence to suggest that she became more in control of the elaborated code and utilised more context-independent reasoning as the year passed. That she has demonstrated mastery of the recognition rule appears to have facilitated this progress as she developed the skills to realise the required poetry concepts and knowledge. However, it is suggested above that this progress results more from Fekile's diligence and memorisation of content than from greater control in organising her thoughts in the elaborated code.

## 6.6 CONCLUSION

This is a very long, weighty chapter of necessity. As mentioned earlier, Bernstein integrates the instrumental order with the expressive order and advises an holistic approach. In accord with Bernstein's advice, I analysed the learners' dispositions (the expressive order) and their demonstrations of recognition and realisation (the instrumental order) holistically but retained the two dimensions. This enabled a full, deep presentation of the findings on each of the learners without too many artificial divides. In the final chapter, an interpretation, in which the essence of these findings is presented, is undertaken.

## CHAPTER SEVEN: CONCLUSIONS

### 7.1 OVERVIEW OF STUDY

Bernstein (1971), in *Education Cannot Compensate for Society*, discusses that learners whose understandings of life are mostly context bound or restricted will 'not feel at home' in the elaborated code of the school environment. Although these learners' mode of communication is mostly governed by the community code in which they grew up, this does not preclude them from accessing the universalistic meanings that dominate school learning if, education examines and acknowledges the social assumptions that underpin the learner and recognises these as valid and significant. In *Pedagogy, Symbolic Control and Identity* (1996) Bernstein explains how the classification of the transmission of knowledge impacts on the governance of the recognition rule and how the framing of the transmission of knowledge impacts on the governance of the realisation rule in an educational environment. Given the optimum conditions for the transmission of knowledge in which knowledge is classified and framed in such a way as to enhance the governance of the recognition and realisation rules, the learner has the ability to demonstrate mastery of these rules.

The initial focus of this study is to ascertain to what extent Grade 10 English learners demonstrate mastery of the recognition and realisation rules as they apply to the micro-context of poetry knowledge, concepts and skills. The secondary focus of the study relates to the examination of the social assumptions that underpin the learners' disposition toward school and investigating any correlation between these two factors.

*Many children of the marginal classes may indeed have a recognition rule, that is, they can recognise the power relations in which they are involved, and their positioning in them, but they may not possess the realisation rule. If they do not possess the realisation rule, they cannot speak the expected legitimate text. These children in school, then, will not have acquired the legitimate pedagogic code, but they will have acquired their place in the classificatory system. For these children, the experience of school is essentially an experience of the classificatory system and the place in it. (Bernstein, 2000:17)*

Bernstein suggests that learners may recognise their position within the social relations of the school and society but have no access to the realisation rule. This study has investigated how learners at Ace High School have recognised their positions in relation to their school and if there is any correlation between this recognition and their demonstrations of mastery of Recognition and Realisation Rules in the micro-context of English poetry in Grade 10.

## 7.2 SUMMARY OF THE STUDY

Chapter One introduced the study and located it within the broader framework of research within South Africa. Chapter Two focussed on the theoretical framework and analytical model for the study. Chapter Three presented a more general critical review of the literature that impacted on the study. Chapter Four related the orientating concepts of the study to the method employed and made clear the language of description to be employed. Chapter Five provided details and examples of the learners work that yielded the findings relating to the demonstrations of recognition and realisation by the learners and made explicit the process of analysis undertaken to secure these findings. Chapter Six analysed the findings relating to the learners' disposition toward school and their demonstrations of recognition and realisation. In this chapter, the interpretation of findings is undertaken, focussing on the implications for South African education and society.

## 7.3 INTERPRETATION OF FINDINGS

### Summary of R & R Findings: Chapter Six

	Nh	Nn	Pm	Kh	Zm	Nw	Sd	Bm	Nr	Fu
<b>Rck:</b>	50%	42%	77%	65%	74%	81%	64%	84%	73%	85%
<b>Rcc:</b>	100%	83%	88%	71%	75%	50%	88%	88%	78%	78%
<b>Rla:</b>	32%	53%	58%	70%	58%	56%	73%	71%	68%	78%
<b>Full Rla:</b>	11%	11%	4%	30%	13%	28%	36%	33%	9%	26%
<b>Rlp:</b>	44%	56%	33%	63%	78%	80%	40%	86%	43%	78%

### Correlation Between Personal Dispositions and R & R Findings:

7.3.1 Nonhle lives in a working class environment and she does not participate in sport at school. Her choices are determined by the community code and her personalised responses. She perceives the teacher as authority due to the teacher's position, not her profession and this corresponds to the working class hierarchical family structure. She complies with school rules because she is forced to do so. Her understanding of poetry as an academic pursuit is weakly classified.

Unexpectedly, Nonhle demonstrated 100% mastery of Socio-affective competences which is at odds with her personal disposition toward school. It is possible that what has been analysed as positive motivation from the learner is, in fact, compliance with the 'symbolic violence' of the authority of the school. If indeed, Nonhle's socio-affective competences were so highly developed, it is likely that there would have been greater evidence of development of mastery of the Recognition and Realisation rules. However, Nonhle has recognised her place in society and as such complies with the expectations of her. The case study of Nonhle serves to confirm how complex the relationship between disposition and mastery of recognition and realisation is. The disposition of the learner cannot be analysed according to a neat, quantitative framework but qualitative statements are suggested to provide individual insight into disposition of the learner toward school and learning.

In half the examples analysed, Nonhle demonstrated control of the Recognition Rule but in less than a third of the examples analysed, she demonstrated only partial control of the Realisation Rule. School has not amplified the elaborated code to a significant extent and it is likely that her reasoning will remain bounded in the community code.

7.3.2 Nhlaka lives in a working class area but his brothers and sisters are all qualified and appear to be socially mobile. He plays for the first team rugby at school and has been personally positively reinforced at school. He questions the worth of school but his choices are determined by the community code. His relationship with teachers is personal, not positional or professional and it is due to this relationship that his disposition toward school has been altered. His perception of a positive learning

experience is determined by his personalised response. At present, Nhlaka's reasoning is predominantly context dependent but some of his values are indicators of the middle class and it is clear that he aspires to this class.

Interestingly, in 53% of the examples analysed, Nhlaka demonstrated partial control of the Realisation Rule despite only demonstrating control of the Recognition Rule in 42% of the examples analysed. It is possible that due to Nhlaka's positive disposition toward school, school has the potential to interrupt the community code and enable him to access the elaborated code on a more regular basis. Despite minimum mastery of the Realisation Rule, Nhlaka has not classified his social positioning within the school and the possibility of the social transformation of this learner exists.

7.3.3 Patience lives in a working class area and her parents are both members of the mobile class that Hoadley (2005) describes. She plays hockey at school but perceives it as a distraction. She is dependent upon the teacher as a source of knowledge and she views the teacher as both a professional and in a position of authority. She is compliant with the rules of the school and efforts are made to master the required knowledge and skills.

Her choices are context dependent and dictated by her likes and dislikes. The learner envisaged by the NCS (2003) is able to transfer skills from the familiar to the unfamiliar and Patience experienced difficulty in carrying out this function in the micro-context analysed. At this point of her education, she is able to appropriately apply the recognition rule in 77% of the cases analysed but there is little evidence to suggest that she is able to apply, principled, context-independent reasoning (In only 4% of the examples analysed did she demonstrate full control of the Realisation Rule). Despite a positive disposition toward school, in this micro-context, school has not amplified the elaborated code and for Patience, her experience of school has enabled her to recognise her position in society and she is unlikely to internalise the elaborated code.

7.3.4 Nkosi lives in a lower-middle class area and there are indicators to reflect his working class background. However, he is independent thinking and critical of school and school ethos. One of the Critical Outcomes for learners stipulated in the

NCS ((2003) is the ability to make decisions using critical and creative thinking. Nkosi has achieved this outcome and this is evident in his disposition toward school and his application of academic skills and knowledge.

Despite Nkosi's working class background, school has amplified the elaborated code and results of findings suggest that he has much potential for context-independent reasoning (He demonstrated partial control of the Realisation Rule in 70% of the examples analysed). It appears that Nkosi is in the process of the social transformation that is envisaged by the curriculum.

7.3.5 Zonke lives in a lower-middle class residential area and her home background is working class. She recognises participation in sport at school as avoidance of home issues which suggests that she adopts an independent, rational position when considering her life experience and this is borne out by her explanation of the 'light'. Her disposition to learning is characterised by enjoyment of group work and a co-operative learning style but she values independent initiative. These characteristics would lead me to believe that she has the potential to demonstrate control of the Realisation Rule.

At the beginning of the year, Zonke seldom demonstrated control of the Realisation Rule but toward the end of the year, she developed greater control. Zonke's comments in the interview suggest that she has a positive disposition toward school and that she will make every effort to access the elaborated code. In my opinion, for Zonke, school will act as an interrupter to the restricted code if she continues to develop as she is at present.

7.3.6 Nomsa does not have a family background as she is orphaned and has been brought up in a home. Her experience of school is coloured by the close interpersonal relations she develops with learners and educators. She does not perceive teachers as authoritarian and content-based, rote learning is her academic focus. In those instances where she has developed control of the realisation rule, it results from a positive relationship with the teacher and her aim to please the teacher, thus demonstrations are erratic and dependent on a specific context.

Nomsa prepares thoroughly for exams and in 81% of the examples analysed, she demonstrated control of the Recognition Rule. This enables her to pass which suggests that despite efforts to re-orientate the focus of education in South Africa, the bulk of assessment still tests for recognition of knowledge as opposed to realisation of knowledge. Nomsa is likely to continue to meet with moderate success at school due to the positive relationships she has developed but there is little evidence to suggest that the elaborated code has been amplified by her experience of school. In her interview, she admitted that she learns what she needs to and forgets it directly thereafter. Her positive experience of school enables her to successfully negotiate the requirements of school and she has sufficient control of the Recognition Rule to master the content of learning but she has not accessed the elaborated code.

7.3.7 Siphon comes from a middle class family background, he plays a variety of sports at school and he has strong support from his parents, especially his father who is in private enterprise. He was reticent in the interview but other learners deferred to his opinion when he did express himself. He is motivated by reward, enjoys co-operative learning but performs well on individual tasks.

From the beginning of the year, he demonstrated context-independent thinking. Analysis reveals that in more than 70% of the examples, he was able to demonstrate partial control of the Realisation Rule and in 36% of the examples analysed, he demonstrated full control of the Realisation Rule. This was the highest incidence of full control of the Realisation Rule and verifies Bernstein's proposition that middle class learners who are exposed to the elaborated code are more likely to be at ease *functioning in the elaborated code of school*. Interestingly, Siphon did not demonstrate a high degree of control of the Recognition Rule (64%) and his exam results are not the highest of the group. This suggests that Siphon may not prepare as thoroughly as the other learners and in areas that are testing for recognition, he does not fare as well. Siphon recognises his middle class positioning within the society of the school and his academic and social performances reflect this positioning.

7.3.8 Brian lives in a lower middle class residential area with his mother who is very supportive. Some of his leisure pursuits are indicators of a working class background but he is deeply involved in sporting activities (a middle class indicator). Thus he

seems to fit into the mobile class that Hoadley (2005) describes. He is a diligent learner and he provided much detail about learning and teaching in the interviews. He prefers independent activities and is not dependent on the teacher as the source of knowledge. He has a strong sense of self-worth. In a few of the examples analysed, he made recognition errors but this did not negate his efforts at realisation of knowledge. In more than 70% of the examples analysed he demonstrated partial control of the Realisation Rule and in 33% of the examples analysed, full control.

In my opinion, Brian's positive disposition has enabled him to internalise the elaborated code and his thinking is dominated by this code. Thus, for Brian, school has interrupted the community code.

7.3.9 Nkululeko lives in a working class area but he has immersed himself in school life and has a positive disposition toward learning and teaching. He expressed strong views of the role of school and the possibility that school has the potential to emancipate. He is politically and socially aware, a trait that was not identified in any of the other learners analysed. He prefers co-operative learning experiences, is not daunted by failure and described family discussions that indicated a middle class environment despite their working class economic situation.

In the examples analysed, Nkululeko demonstrated 68% partial control of the Realisation Rule. However, in only 9% of the examples analysed did he demonstrate full control of the Realisation Rule. Nkululeko has a positive disposition toward school and is making efforts to access the elaborated code but at this point, the community code still dominates his thinking.

I conclude that school has the potential to interrupt the community code for Nkululeko but at present, only specific contexts motivate realisation of knowledge.

7.3.10 Fekile, who lives in a lower middle class residential area, is the only learner who rejected sport which reveals that she is able to maintain an independent stance from the dominant ethos of the school. For her, successful learning is dependent on the teacher and rote learning. There seems to be some incongruence in her disposition

toward school – she is obedient and compliant but comments in her interview suggest that she harbours some resentment.

Due to her diligence, she demonstrated control of the recognition rule in 85% of the examples analysed and partial realisation in 78% of the examples analysed. Her personal work ethic has enabled her to access the elaborated code more than any of the other learners in the study however, it is my opinion that she is still not at ease in the elaborated code and this is evidenced by her achieving full realisation in 26% of the examples analysed. School has acted as an interrupter of the community code and has enabled Fekile to access the elaborated code - she is able to demonstrate substantial control of the Realisation Rule in the micro-context of poetry but at present, she does not perceive the world from a middle class perspective. There appears to be some tension between her personal disposition and her demonstrations of recognition and realisation. On the one hand, she appears to fit into the category that is described by Bernstein at the beginning of this chapter in that she has recognised her positioning in the power relations and the classificatory system of the school but on the other hand, she has also acquired the legitimate pedagogic code. If she continues to develop in the last two years of the FET phase, it is likely that demonstrations of the elaborated code in her thinking will be less context specific and will dominate her thinking more and possibly, her disposition will adjust accordingly.

#### **7.4 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY**

Two major limitations to the study have been identified:

**7.4.1 Link to Pedagogic Practice –** The study revealed that learners demonstrated substantial mastery of the Recognition Rule for this micro-context and there was some development toward mastery of the Realisation Rule in 9 out of the ten learners. However, these demonstrations have only been linked to their own dispositions and not to the specific pedagogic practices that trigger these demonstrations. It has been mentioned that the two other studies on which this study is based, as advised by Bernstein, have focussed on the link between learners' demonstrations of the Recognition and Realisation Rule and the pedagogic practices that trigger these demonstrations. In my opinion, it is also necessary to take into

account the socio-affective competences that learners bring into the classroom that promote the development of mastery of the rules. A projected study that focuses on all three aspects, (the learners' dispositions, their demonstrations of control of the Recognition and Realisation Rules and the pedagogic practices that give rise to these demonstrations) would provide greater insight and could possibly serve as a model for future educators. It would be necessary to conduct classroom observations of a specific micro-context for analysis in order to ascertain what specific classification and framing practices provide the optimum conditions for the transmission of knowledge, what specific pedagogic practice provokes sound recontextualisation of this knowledge by the learners. These learners could then be studied from a more intra-personal perspective to reveal what dispositions, or socio-affective competences, best enhance this successful recontextualisation, thereby enabling them to gain mastery of the Recognition and Realisation Rules.

7.4.2 A Variety of Classroom Observations of Learners Dispositions – Some teachers in the staff room comment on the importance of control in teaching as learners lack discipline, are often distracted from the process of teaching and learning and some learners are disruptive and offensive in their behaviour. However, this is not the experience of all teachers and it appears that learners select in which classes they choose to 'behave' and which classes they choose not to 'behave'. In personally teaching these learners, control issues have not been a factor and their comments in their interviews have been borne out by their behaviour in my class. Notwithstanding that each learner does bring into each class his/her own personal disposition, the individual's behaviour differs from class to class. It would further validate the findings on learners' disposition if their behaviour in a variety of classes had been observed. This could also link up to the above point as specific pedagogic practices may not only impact on the development of mastery of the Recognition and Realisation Rules by the learner, but also on their expressions of their own dispositions.

## 7.5 IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA

7.5.1 Summary of Correlation between Personal Dispositions and R & R Findings: Of the ten learners analysed, Nonhle's personal disposition toward school negated progress toward greater control of the Realisation Rule. Evidence from examples of work analysed revealed that the organisation of her thinking is dominated by the community code. Despite a positive disposition toward school, the assumptions that underpin learning and teaching for Patience and Nomsa tend to imprison the organisation of their thinking in the community code. Siphso is the only learner that comes from a middle class background and analysis of his work reveals that he is at ease in the elaborated code. However, due to his personal disposition toward learning and teaching, his results at school are not as high as one might anticipate. The other six learners (Nhlaka, Nkosi, Zonke, Brian, Nkululeko and Fekile) all demonstrated partial control of the Realisation Rule to a greater or lesser extent and the dispositions of all six directed the organisation of their thinking into the elaborated code in specific contexts. Their personal dispositions enhance access to the elaborated code despite their working class backgrounds and to some extent, school has acted as an interrupter of the community code.

7.5.2 Qualities and Characteristics that Impact Positively on the Development of Control of the Realisation Rule: The six learners (Nhlaka, Nkosi, Zonke, Brian, Nkululeko and Fekile) who are developing greater control of the Realisation Rule all aspire to the middle class and there are certain indicators to suggest middle class values, they do not recognise their positions within society and school as marginalised and they do not classify themselves as such. These learners are in the process of achieving the seven critical outcomes stipulated in the NCS (2003), thereby attaining the social transformation that is aimed for by the present Education Department. "The kind of learner that is envisaged is one who will be imbued with the values and act in the interests of society based on respect for democracy, equality, human dignity and social justice as promoted in the constitution." (NCS 2003:5) The texts of these learners' work and their dispositions as revealed in their interviews and questionnaires, suggest that the learners studied are developing toward the kind of learner envisaged by the NCS (2003). In certain instances, they "demonstrate an ability to think logically and analytically, as well as holistically and laterally" and

they are at times able to “transfer skills from familiar to unfamiliar situations” (NCS 2003:5). Thus their personal dispositions are enabling them to achieve more of the Assessment Standards required of them, thereby demonstrating greater control of the Realisation Rule. However, it was noted that despite the re-orientation of the curriculum toward greater application of skills and knowledge, there were instances where learners focussed their learning on recognition of knowledge, as opposed to realisation of knowledge. In terms of existing assessment standards, their performance is adequate.

## 7.6 CONCLUSIONS

This study reveals that in certain conditions, learners do possess the potential to access the elaborated code and develop control of the realisation rule. In South Africa, learners can be emancipated from the confines of the community code to access the elaborated code, thereby enabling them to master Bernstein’s realisation rule if their dispositions motivate them to do so and if educators recognise and acknowledge their worth. Learners are able to “walk in that light” that Zonke described, and achieve the cognitive empowerment required by the NCS and South African society.

However, two very important factors have impacted on the dispositions of the learners in this study and these factors may well be missing in other schools in South Africa. The first is that 9 out of the ten learners studied come from households where the breadwinner/winners are employed. Their life experience is of the working class. Their home backgrounds may be modest but their basic needs are being met. The work of Bernstein informed and directed the model of this study and his theory was developed in a first world economic environment in which the majority of the population is employed. Here in South Africa, close to the majority of our population is unemployed. Thus, the transformation that the NCS is aiming toward is the transformation of the unemployed class. Our working class is somehow elevated by the very fact that they are employed. It is as though the class structure that applies in a first world society is not really applicable in this country. The ‘workers’ of South Africa are elevated in society due to their employed status. The learners studied come from family backgrounds that fit into this ‘elevated’ South African class. The

question arises whether learners from the unemployed class in South Africa will possess similar dispositions that will enable them to transform their positions in society.

Bernstein recommends that in order for learners to access the elaborated code, their home backgrounds and personal situations must be acknowledged and deemed worthy. Bernstein does not advocate the replacement of community-based knowledge with universalistic knowledge but stresses the importance of learners' ability to move at ease from one knowledge base to the other. As in the initial studies carried out by Holland (1981), described in Chapter 3, learners who are able to access the elaborated code, make use of cognitive operations that draw from both the community code and the elaborated code. The process of the study, in effect, acknowledged the life experience of the learner and reinforced its worth. The very act of examination, establishes the learners' dispositions as significant, thereby promoting learning and the acquisition of the realisation rule. Learners sub-consciously employed principled, context-independent organisation of their thoughts to express themselves in the interviews and on the questionnaires because their views were being examined. In my opinion, this does not invalidate the findings but supports the premise on which the study is based. That is, if learners' mode of communication is mostly governed by the community code in which they grew up, this does not preclude them from accessing the universalistic meanings that dominate school learning if, education examines and acknowledges the social assumptions that underpin the learner and recognises these as valid and significant. The relationship between the disposition of the learner and his/her ability to master the realisation rule is a complex one that defies direct causal correlation. However, in this study efforts have been made to demonstrate qualitatively that learners must be recognised as agents in the cognitive process of the development of mastery of the realisation rule.

The winner of the Nobel Peace Prize this year, M. Yunus claims that economic independence ensures world peace. In South Africa, economic independence, no matter how meagre, will enable the possibility of learners accessing the elaborated code that dominates school learning if educators acknowledge that the personal life experience of the learner is significant.

## REFERENCE LIST:

- Althusser, L. (1971). Ideology and ideological state apparatuses: Notes towards an investigation. In Althusser, L. *Lenin and Philosophy*. London: New Left Books
- Bernstein, B. (1996). *Pedagogy, symbolic control and identity: theory, research, critique*. London: Taylor and Francis
- Bernstein, B. (1971a). Education cannot compensate for society. In B.R. Cosin *et al* (Eds) *School and society: a sociological reader*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Mit Press, pp. 61 – 66
- Bernstein, B. (1971b). Open school, open society? In B.R. Cosin *et al* (Eds) *School and society: a sociological reader* Cambridge, Massachusetts: Mit Press, pp. 166 - 169
- Bernstein, B. (1990). The structuring of pedagogic discourse: Volume IV in *Class, codes & control*. London: Routledge
- Bourdieu, P. Passeron, J-C. & de Saint Martin, M. (1994). *Academic discourse* Cambridge: Polity Press
- Bourdieu, P. & Passeron, J-C. (1977). *Reproduction in education, society and culture*. London: Sage Publications Limited
- Bowles, S. & Gintis, H. (1976). *Schooling in capitalist America*. New York: Basic Books
- Breier, M. (2004). *A Language for the description of formal and informal knowledge in pedagogy*. Paper presented at the Third International Basil Bernstein Symposium. Cambridge
- Christie, F. and Macken-Horarick, M. Building verticality in subject English. in Christie, F. and Martin, J.R. (eds.) (2006). *Language, knowledge and pedagogy: Functional linguistic and sociological perspectives*. London and New York: Continuum
- Christie, P. (2001). Improving school quality in South Africa: a study of schools that have succeeded against the odds. *Journal of Education*, 26, pp. 40-65
- Department of Education. (2003). *National Curriculum Statement Grades 10 – 12 Languages*. Pretoria: Shumani Printers
- Department of Education. (1997). *Senior Phase (Grades 7 to 9) Policy Document*. Cape Town: Government Printers
- Dewey, J. (1929). My pedagogic creed. *Journal of the National Education Association*, 18, (9) pp. 17 – 23
- Ensor, P., & Hoadley, U. (2000). *Developing language of description to research*

*pedagogy*. Paper presented at the International Conference: Designing education for the learning society.

Flanagan, W. (1997). *Recognition and realisation rules in a pedagogy for quality distance learning*. 11<sup>th</sup> Annual Conference of Asian Association of Open Universities, Kuala Lumpur, 2 pp. 94 -119

Freire, P. (1970). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York: Continuum

Giroux, H.A. (1988). *Teachers as intellectuals: Toward a critical pedagogy of learning*. USA: Bergin & Garvey

Giroux, H.A. (2001). *Theory and resistance in education: towards a pedagogy for the opposition*. Connecticut: Bergin & Garvey

Hargreaves, D.H. (1967). *Social relations in a secondary school*. London: Routledge & Kegan

Harley, K. Bertram, C. & Mattson, E. (1999). *Classroom Studies: Researching teacher roles in policy and practice*. Pietermaritzburg: University of Natal Press

Harley, K. Wedekind, V. (2004) Political change, curriculum change and social formation, 1990 to 2002, in Chisholm, L. (Ed) *Changing class education and social change in post-apartheid South Africa*. pp. 195 – 220 Cape Town: HSRC Press

Henning, E. van Rensburg, W. & Smit, B. (2004). *Finding your way in qualitative research*. Pretoria: van Schaik Publishers

Hoadley, U.K. (2005). *Social class, pedagogy and the specialisation of voice in 4 South African primary schools*. PHD Thesis, Cape Town: UCT

Holland, J. (1981). Social class and changes in the orientations to meanings, *Sociology*, 15, (1), pp. 1 – 18

King, R. (1976). *Values and involvements in a grammar school*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul

Lee, H. (1960). *To kill a mockingbird*. Middlesex: Penquin Books Limited

Levett, A. Kottler, A. Burman, E. & Parker, I. (1997). *Culture, power and difference: Discourse analysis in South Africa*. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press

Moore, R. & Muller, J. (2002). The growth of knowledge and the discursive gap. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 20, 2, pp. 189 – 206

Morais, A. Fontinhas, F. & Neves, I. (1992). Recognition and realisation rules in acquiring school science – the contribution of pedagogy and social background of students. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 13, 2, pp. 247 – 270

Morais, A. Neves, I. Davies, B. and Daniels, H. (2001). *Towards a sociology of pedagogy: The contribution of Basil Bernstein to research*. New York: Peter Lang

Mouton, J. (1996). *Understanding social research*. Pretoria: van Schaik

Naidoo, D. (2006). *Curriculum, context and identity – an investigation of the curriculum practices of Grade 9 teachers in three contrasting socio-economic school contexts*. PHD Thesis, Pietermaritzburg: University of Kwazulu-Natal

Neuman, W.L. (2000). *Social research methods: Qualitative and quantitative approaches*. Needham Heights, MA: Allyn & Bacon

Parker, I. (1992). *Discourse dynamics critical analysis for social and individual psychology*. London: Routledge

Rist, R.C. (1970). Student social class and teacher expectations: The self-fulfilling prophecy in ghetto education. *Harvard Educational Review* (2000), 70, 3 pp. 257 – 301

Rose, D. (2004). Sequencing and pacing of the hidden curriculum: How indigenous children are left out of the chain. In Muller, J. Davies, B. and Morais, A. (eds), *Reading Bernstein, researching Bernstein*. London: Routledge Falmer

Savage, M. (2003). A new class paradigm? *British Journal of Education*, 24, 4, pp. 535 – 541

Struwig, F.W. & Stead, G.B. (2001). *Planning, designing and reporting research*. Cape Town: Maskew Miller Longman

Taylor, N. Muller, J. Vinjevold, P. (2003). *Getting schools working*. CapeTown: Maskew Miller Longman (Pty) Ltd

Willis, P.E. (1977). *Learning to labour*. Farnborough, Hants: Saxon House

Woods, P. (1983). *Sociology and the school: an interactionist viewpoint*. London: Routledge & Kegan

**Ethical Clearance got Antoinette Harding (10<sup>th</sup> April 2007)**

**This is to certify that Antoinette Harding has both applied for Ethical Clearance and the Certificate has been approved. The certificate is lodged at the Research Office. She began her research the year before Ethical Clearance procedures were implemented and thus received retrospective clearance.**

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'WH', written in a cursive style.

**Wayne Hugo  
Academic Supervisor**