Restructuring inner cities in the post-apartheid era: A case study of Grey Street, Durban

By

Lidiya Mulibana

210531746

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirement for Master of Science in Geography

College of Agriculture, Engineering and Science

School of Agriculture, Earth and Environmental Science

January 2019
ABSTRACT
Apartheid measures shaped, to a large extent, the cities that we live in today. The fall of the apartheid regime allowed city planners to work on plans, strategies and policies for restructuring the city. Post-apartheid urban restructuring has been a challenging process. This dissertation investigates the restructuring of inner cities in the post-apartheid era. A case study of Grey Street, Durban was chosen. The objectives of this study were to: review the historical development of the Grey Street area and its changing fortunes, identify the social, physical and economic changes in Grey Street since 1994, explain the influence of these changes, and assess the influence of government policies on restructuring in Grey Street since 1994. Critical urban theory and regulation theory were used to build the conceptual framework of this study. This study employed a qualitative research approach. Both primary and secondary data were used as part of this study. The purposive sampling was used to select the respondents for this study. In-depth interviews were used to collect primary data.

The Grey Street complex has undergone significant changes since the end of the apartheid era. The area has attracted and continues to attract foreign business people, while less and less of the original Indian traders remain in the area. Changes of the post-apartheid urban restructuring have borne positive and negative influences in the area, which the business owners are widely aware of. The town planning department acknowledges the challenges that the Grey Street complex poses on the greater vision of urban restructuring but they also continuously devise plans to overcome such challenges.

Keywords: Urban, Restructuring, Grey Street Complex, Apartheid, Planning
DECLARATION
I declare that “Restructuring inner cities in the post-apartheid era. A case study of Grey Street, Durban” is a true version of my original work and this study has never been submitted for fulfilment of any degree. All information and ideas taken from other authors have been acknowledged through referencing.

Mulibana Lydia (Author)                                          Professor Brij Maharaj (Supervisor)
Signature: ___________                                           Signature: ______________
Date: _______________                                            Date: ________________
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS
I cannot find the words to express how grateful I am for having finally finished my thesis. This would not have been possible without God’s will. He provided all that I needed in order to reach this final step. Surely his LOVE endures forever. I am grateful for the strength he provided for me to carry on always.

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my Supervisor Professor Maharaj, who through the trials and tribulations, has helped me succeed in this project. His academic support will forever be valued.

I would also like to thank the shop owners in the Grey Street complex for their participation in this study as well as the key informants from the municipality.

Thank you so much to Miss Charity Cele, for agreeing to edit my work. Your kindness is valued.

I would like to thank Louis and Petrea Lodder for being the support structure I needed during difficult times.

I would like to thank Anisa Khotoo, for being such a great friend and mentor; as well as Mogomotsi, for being the great human that he is.
Table of Contents

ABSTRACT ........................................................................................................................................... ii
DECLARATION .................................................................................................................................. iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ......................................................................................................................... iv
LIST OF FIGURES ................................................................................................................................. ix
LIST OF TABLES .................................................................................................................................. x
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS ...................................................................................................................... xi
Chapter One: Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 1
1.1 Preamble ........................................................................................................................................ 1
1.2 Geographical orientation .................................................................................................................. 2
1.3 Rationale for the study .................................................................................................................... 3
1.4 Chapter outline ............................................................................................................................... 4
1.4.1 Chapter One: Introduction ........................................................................................................ 4
1.4.2 Chapter Two: Theoretical framework and literature review ...................................................... 4
1.4.3 Chapter Three: Methodology .................................................................................................... 4
1.4.4 Chapter Four: Data analysis ...................................................................................................... 4
1.4.5 Chapter Five: Evaluation, recommendation and conclusion ..................................................... 4
1.5 Conclusion ...................................................................................................................................... 5
Chapter Two: Theoretical Framework and Literature Review ............................................................... 6
2.2 Theories of urban restructuring ....................................................................................................... 6
2.2.1 Critical urban theory .................................................................................................................. 6
2.2.2 Key elements of critical urban theory ......................................................................................... 7
2.2.3 Critical urban theory in urban studies ....................................................................................... 8
2.2.4 Regulation theory ..................................................................................................................... 9
2.2.5 Key elements of regulation theory ............................................................................................ 10
2.2.6 Regulation theory in urban studies ........................................................................................... 10
2.3 What is urban restructuring? .......................................................................................................... 12
2.3.1 Characteristics of urban restructuring ..................................................................................... 13
2.3.2 The influence of politics in urban restructuring ...................................................................... 14
2.3.3 Globalisation and urban restructuring ..................................................................................... 16
2.3.4 Impacts of urban restructuring ............................................................................................... 17
2.3.5 Uneven social, economic and spatial development ................................................................ 17
2.3.6 Increased immigration .............................................................................................................. 18
2.4 Origins of urban restructuring in South African urban policy ...................................................... 19
2.4.1 Early 1990s .......................................................................................................................... 20
Chapter Five: Evaluation, Recommendation and Conclusion ........................................... 81
  5.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................. 81
  5.2 Evaluation .............................................................................................................. 81
  5.3 Historical Review of the Grey Street Complex and its Changing Fortunes .............. 82
    5.3.1 The Free Indian ................................................................................................. 82
    5.3.2 Impacts of the Group Areas Act ......................................................................... 82
  5.4 Changes in the Grey Street Complex Since 1994 .................................................... 83
    5.4.1 Social Changes ................................................................................................. 83
    5.4.2 Economic Changes ......................................................................................... 85
    5.4.3 Physical Changes ............................................................................................. 86
  5.5 The Impacts of the Changes in the Grey Street Complex ......................................... 87
    5.5.1 Positive Impacts ............................................................................................. 87
    5.5.2 Negative Impacts ............................................................................................ 87
  5.6 Proposed solutions from respondents ...................................................................... 88
  5.7 Government Policy Influence on Restructuring in Grey Street Since 1994 ............ 88
  5.8 Challenges ............................................................................................................ 89
  5.9 Conceptual Reflections ........................................................................................... 90
    5.9.1 Critical Urban Theory ..................................................................................... 90
    5.9.2 Regulation Theory ......................................................................................... 91
  5.10 Recommendations ............................................................................................... 93
    i) Participatory planning ......................................................................................... 93
    ii) Owner/occupant responsibility ......................................................................... 93
    iii) Sanitation ......................................................................................................... 94
    iv) Promote community and unity ........................................................................ 94
    v) Combating Crime ............................................................................................... 94
    vi) Reasonable Rates ............................................................................................ 95
  5.11 Conclusion ........................................................................................................... 95
REFERENCE LIST ........................................................................................................... 97
APPENDICES .................................................................................................................... 110
  Appendix 1: Informed Consent .................................................................................... 110
  Appendix 2: Ethical Clearance ..................................................................................... 112
Appendix 3: Gate Keeper Permission ................................................................. 113
Appendix 4: Interview Guide ............................................................................ 114
LIST OF FIGURES AND PLATES

Figure 3.1: Durban CBD

Figure 3.2: Grey Street (Dr Yusuf Dadoo) Complex

Plate 4.1: Building Previously Used as Cinema

Plate 4.2: Newly Renovated Buildings

Plate 4.3: Cell Phone Repair Corner Shop Inside Another Shop

Plate 4.4: Corner Shop Selling Female Perfumes and Cigarettes

Plate 4.5: Corner Shop Selling Cosmetics

Plate 4.6 Typical Layout in New Shops

Plate 4.7: Blanket Shop Selling Other Products as well

Plate 4.8: Cash and Carry Shops Inside

Plate 4.9: Cash and Carry Shops Inside

Plate 4.10: Cash and Carry Shops Inside

Plate 4.11: Shops Selling Basic Home Supplies

Plate 4.12: Various Products Sold at the Corner of a Clothing Shop

Plate 4.13: Similar Wholesale Shops

Plate 4.14: Some of the Services Provided in the Area

Plate 4.15: Informal Traders’ Products

Plate 4.16: Garbage and poor sanitation in the area
LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1: Sampling format.................................................................39

Table 4.1: Countries of Origin of Respondents...............................51

Table 4.2: Reasons for settling in the Grey Street Complex...............52
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABM</td>
<td>Area Based Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBD</td>
<td>Central Business District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFA</td>
<td>Development Facilitation Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRC</td>
<td>Democratic Republic of Congo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAA</td>
<td>Group Areas Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEAR</td>
<td>Growth, Employment and Redistribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GSC</td>
<td>Grey Street Complex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDP</td>
<td>Integrated Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iTrump</td>
<td>Inner City Thekwini Regeneration and Urban Management Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAP</td>
<td>Local Area Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MNOs</td>
<td>Multi National Operations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOR</td>
<td>Mode of Regulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDP</td>
<td>National Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NIC</td>
<td>Natal Indian Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPC</td>
<td>National Planning Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RDP</td>
<td>Reconstruction and Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADC</td>
<td>Southern African Development Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAHO</td>
<td>South African History Online</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAIC</td>
<td>South African Indian Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter One: Introduction

1.1 Preamble

Urban restructuring is now a common feature in cities in the global North and South (Fainstein and Campbell, 2012). This process usually involves social, physical and economic restructuring. According to Brenner (2009a: 37) “to speak of urban restructuring is to reference a process in which the very nature of cities as sites of production, consumption, settlement, regulation, and contestation, is reorganised and transformed; the city-ness of those spatial units we have come to label cities is thus never pre-given, but is continually remade through the process of restructuring.” This approach explains physical and economic restructuring. In simple terms, economic restructuring refers to the changes in the type of goods and services being produced within an economy in an urban setting (Bradbury, 1989). Many cities have been reconfigured through urban restructuring and this is an important process to study because of the speed at which it takes place and its potential impacts and consequences (Sykora, 1994).

Urban restructuring is an interesting area of research in urban geography and planning. Urban restructuring affects developed and developing cities differently, irrespective of the common causes (Hodos, 2002). This is due to the vast differences that exist between the developing and developed world. Meeting the continuous challenges that come with the processes of urban restructuring requires strong political and economic capacity, which many cities in the developing world seem to lack (Hodos, 2002).

However, even within cities, there are variations in how different urban sectors are affected by the processes of urban restructuring (Hodos, 2002). Socio-economic variation is an obvious example. This is marked by a concentration of an executive, elite-class in one place of the city and the isolated urban under-class in the periphery (Sykora, 1994).

Durban is South Africa’s third largest city and is an interesting research area to study urban restructuring. This is because the inner city of Durban has transformed significantly since the
end of the apartheid era physically, socially and economically (). Using the Grey Street area as a case study, this thesis examines the physical, social and economic restructuring that has occurred in Durban since 1994. During the era of apartheid, Grey Street acquired the name ‘The Indian Central Business District’ (Rajah, 1981). This was because the area was historically designated as an Indian business and residential zone. However, since 1994, there have been major changes in the area, especially in terms of demographic composition as well as business profile. It is now largely occupied by immigrants from Africa and beyond. The factors that have influenced this change are the subject of this study.

1.2 Geographical orientation

Geography is the study of the interaction between all physical and human phenomena and the landscapes created by such interactions (Semple, 2006). This discipline is largely influenced by norms of social science as they offer a variety of perspectives and methods of study. According to Semple (2006), geography not only looks at what is happening but it also looks at where, why and how. Geography is a holistic and interdisciplinary field of study and it seeks to understand the changing spatial structure from the past to the future (Semple, 2006).

Urban geography is a sub-discipline within geography that is concerned with the spatial distribution of towns and cities and the linkages between them (Dili, 2009). It is also concerned with the internal structure of urban places and addresses the development of cities; through the evolution of their infrastructure and planning policies (Dili, 2009).

This study investigates the post-apartheid restructuring of the inner city of Durban, using Grey Street as a case study. Research on post-apartheid urban restructuring in South African cities provides information regarding the developmental progress of cities and also sheds light on the numerous challenges that have risen along the path since 1994.

Urban geography emerged in South African geographical studies in the early 1960s and this was because of apartheid and the significant role it played in urban development (Seekings,
According to Turok (1994), apartheid planning was an instrument of crude social engineering, which caused great hardship in the country and also imposed an unnecessary burden on the economy. As a result, urban scholars focused research on revealing the effects of urban apartheid as well as proposing alternative policies to address this legacy and to restructure the city (Turok, 1994). Such studies continue in the 2010s and there has not been solid success in the urban restructuring of South African cities in the post-apartheid era. Despite all the policies and plans for transformation since 1994, South African cities remain inefficient urban environments (Maritz et al., 2016). According to Oranje (2014), the pure success of urban restructuring requires sufficient funds, hard work, proper planning, and dedication. Pragmatic support is also necessary to analyse and track progress in support of this long term agenda and to fundamentally reconfiguring inequality in society and space (Maritz et al., 2016).

1.3 Rationale for the study

According to Todes (2008) more attention has been paid to the economic part of urban restructuring, which accounts for the neglecting of other variables that should be considered. These variables include spatial restructuring and development. Focusing only on the economic aspect of urban restructuring isolates the chance of observing urban restructuring from a holistic perspective. Geography as a discipline lays a solid ground for a study of this nature. Since geography is an interdisciplinary discipline, this study is able to consider all aspects that are linked to urban restructuring; such as economic development, urban planning, and social development. Studying these components as they are interlinked provides the opportunity to obtain results that are clear and non-biased or not one-sided. According to Fainstein and Campbell (2012, 10), “the changing spatial forms of the era of restructuring have important consequences that can be summed up by analysing the social and economic creation, and meanings of urban space”. Fainstein and Campbell’s argument verifies the need to integrate social, spatial and economic issues when studying urban restructuring. As such, this study has
adopted this approach in studying the restructuring of the Grey Street area. This is a less popular area in urban studies of the city of Durban. Therefore not much has been written about how this area has been affected by urban restructuring in the post-apartheid era.

1.4 Chapter outline
1.4.1 Chapter One: Introduction

Chapter one is an introduction to the study. It provides an overview of the research, geographical orientation and rationale of the study.

1.4.2 Chapter Two: Theoretical framework and literature review

Chapter two entails the theoretical framework and literature review of this study. The first section discusses the theories that were applied in this study. The second section discusses past and present literature on the concept of urban restructuring. This draws attention to the origin of the concept as well as its implementation in South African urban policy while providing information on the shortfalls that have been encountered since 1994.

1.4.3 Chapter Three: Methodology

Chapter three explains the research methods that were used in this study including the sampling technique, data collection and data analysis methods. The limitations and ethical considerations for the study are also presented.

1.4.4 Chapter Four: Data analysis

Chapter four presents the results of this study. The results were analysed using narrative analysis and the results are organised according to themes based on the main objectives of this study.

1.4.5 Chapter Five: Evaluation, recommendation and conclusion

Chapter five presents the evaluation of the results, which includes conceptual reflections. The recommendations and conclusion are also presented.
1.4 Conclusion

Apartheid rule was centred on segregation and the goal in the post-apartheid era has been reintegrating cities and making them compact and inclusive. These are the pillars of urban restructuring. Progress has been evidently slow since 1994. This dissertation aims to investigate the social, physical and economic restructuring that has occurred in the Durban inner city since 1994, with specific reference to Grey Street.
Chapter Two: Theoretical Framework and Literature Review

2.1 Introduction

Urban restructuring is considered a significant part of urban development for several reasons. It is important to continuously transform the social, economic, and physical construct of cities (Soja, 1994). Many cities have been reconfigured through urban restructuring, and this is an important process to study because of the speed at which it takes place and its potential impacts and consequences (Sykora, 1994).

This chapter is divided into two sections. The first section reviews theories of urban restructuring, which influenced this study. The second section discusses the past and present literature on the concept of urban restructuring; it involves providing a historical background for this concept as well as how it obtained focus in South African urban policy.

2.2. Theories of urban restructuring

Research based on the concept of urban restructuring can be informed by two theories from the field of urban studies; namely critical urban theory and regulation theory. These theories have been widely used to understand city processes and changing patterns. Urban theories focus on changing social, cultural, political and economic dynamics of city life (Parker, 2004).

2.2.1 Critical urban theory

The scope of urban studies has expanded over the years as cities experienced accelerated growth globally and cities themselves have become defined more and more by their actions in the global arena (Patt, 2014). Concentrated poverty, ethnic conflict, social isolation and violence, and crime are just some of the challenges associated with rapid urbanisation in the global South (Storper and Scott, 2016). These aforementioned issues have created a need for more challenging and radical theories in urban studies (Patt, 2014). Critical urban theory helps to provide a broader understanding of current problems in urban development (Storper and Scott, 2016)
Critical urban theory was developed in the late 1960s by radical scholars including Henri Lefebvre, David Harvey, Manuel Castells, Neil Brenner, and Peter Marcuse (Brenner et al., 2011). This theory offers opportunities to search for alternative, liberating forms of critique to urban development (Roy, 2016). Many older established theories are blind to certain issues which may be more current and relevant in urban environments (Roy, 2016). Urban environments are constantly changing in form and practice; urban theory has to stay relevant. Under this theory, the city is seen as politically and socially constituted, yet a flexible and dynamic site (Brenner, 2009). Critical urban theory is based on the inquiry of existing urban formations and their continued changing nature as opposed to inherited urban knowledge, which concentrates on studying urban forms from a non-critical perspective (Brenner, 2009a).

The history of a city forms a foundation in which current (21st century) urban development should be based or matched against as it continues to bear impacts on the development of the present (Roy, 2016). However, this should be exercised with critique to allow for alternative methods for development to be developed and implemented. This theory also involves the critique of social-scientific ideology, power, inequality, injustice as well as the exploitation of society and the economy that exists in the construction and reconstruction of cities (Brenner, 2009a). Urban development and restructuring of current cities are often one-sided- meaning that it often focuses on aspects of development in an isolated manner as opposed to holistically (Roy, 2016). This kind of approach is problematic because it causes significant imbalances between social, economic and physical development in cites.

2.2.2 Key elements of critical urban theory

The main focus of critical urban theory is on the analysis of issues that go beyond what already exists or can be seen and creates an environment that allows for a critical enquiry of current practices in urban development. Critical urban theory is reflexive, meaning that “it does not just accept historical knowledge within urban studies, but it focuses on the question of how
oppositional forms of knowledge may emerge from the analysis of urban issues in a historical context” (Brenner, 2009a). This theory functions on revealing the broken parts of systems and institutions within urban development (Brenner, 2009:201a), and provides alternative ways in which such issues can be tackled. Critical urban theory “is not a strategic guide for social change or movement within urban development but it informs the perspective of progressive, radical social and political actors” (Brenner, 2009:201a), which should then feed into urban policy and framework development.

2.2.3 Critical urban theory in urban studies

Critical urban theory states that urban environments can no longer be studied as general and constrained sites (Brenner, 2009a). This is because, in the 21st century, the urban has become a site through which the accumulation of capital, the regulation of political-economic life and the production of everyday social relations are continuously being reorganised, across the world (Brenner, 2009a). Brenner, Madden, and Wachsmuth (2011) raised the question of whether the world today can distinctively define where the urban begins and where it ends or what its most essential features are spatially, economically and socially. Failure to redefine what is urban poses significant challenges to the development and implementation of urban policies, and far-reaching consequences for social, economic and political relations in everyday urban life (Brenner et al., 2011).

It would be highly problematic to assume that there is one universal theory that can be developed and thoroughly addresses all current issues in urban studies (Brenner et al., 2011). Scholars have developed and adopted the Assemblage approach as it is found to be useful to critical urban theory in several ways. The concept of Assemblage indicates the coming together of different elements within an institution or built structure or the combination of different processes for better explanation of one major concept (Brenner et al., 2011).
Assemblage is a concept that is seen as a first-hand tool for “engaging in detailed descriptions of urban inequalities as produced through political, economic and social relations of history” (Brenner et al., 2011:228). Brenner et al. (2011) argued that paying detailed attention to such issues can help urban scholars better understand how current urban situations are or were created. The second use for Assemblage in urban research is its ability to help researchers become familiar with the problem of materiality; focusing on urban materials such as policy, infrastructure, processes and technology (Brenner et al. 2011). Assemblage thinking diversifies the range of causes for urban inequality and urban development features while opening more opportunities for critical intervention (Brenner et al. 2011). This concept raises a variety of new urban questions as well as new sites of analysis, methodological tools, targets of critique and political visions (Brenner et al. 2011).

2.2.4 Regulation theory

Regulation theory is sometimes referred to as the regulation approach which was developed in the mid-1970s, in the fields of urban politics and economics by a group of French economists; Destanne de Bernis and Robert Boyer (Goodwin, 2001). These scholars were concerned about analysing the regulation of the economy (Goodwin, 2001). An underlying premise was that continued economic development is linked to, and often has an influence on, social, cultural and political processes. The analysis is done by looking at the changes that take place within economic institutions as well as the social, cultural and political factors; as one intertwined system (Goodwin, 2001). Boyer (1990, cited in Goodwin, 2001) stated that the variability of economic and social dynamics, in an urban setting, in both time and space, is the central focus of regulation theory. Therefore, economic relations cannot exist outside political and social processes and contexts.
2.2.5 Key elements of regulation theory

There are three main characteristics of the regulation theory that make it interesting for urban research, and relevant for this study of urban restructuring in Durban. First, it presents an account of the changing character of capitalist economies and cities and by so doing it provides a context against which one can discuss urban political change which is linked to economic and social transformation (Painter, 2011). Second, it examines the connections and interrelations between social, economic, political and cultural change (Painter, 2011). Lastly, it avoids the difficulties associated with traditional Marxism by recognising that economic change is dependent upon, and is partly a product of changes in politics, culture and social life (Painter, 2011). Most urban scholars state that urban restructuring is necessary to rebuild economies which is rooted in urban politics and also influences and is influenced by culture and social life (Painter, 1997).

The key elements of regulation theory may differ across space and time; however, they commonly include, economic systems, institutional or political structures, social relations in civil society and cultural norms as well as state activities (Painter, 1997). The effectiveness of regulation theory is often dependent on and enhanced by the dependable interaction of its elements (Painter, 1997). This theory also provides a way of understanding the spatially uneven character of economic and urban restructuring.

2.2.6 Regulation theory in urban studies

Regulation theory is useful in informing urban research, whether from an economic, geographic or political perspective. According to Goodwin (2001), it is better referred to as an approach rather than theory. It is an approach that researchers can adopt to understand economic, political, and social dynamics (which are often interlinked) of cities. Such an approach will help analyse and understand how the process of urban restructuring has affected the Grey Street complex. Hindson and Morris (1995, cited in Danielzyk and Ossenbruegge,
2001) used this theory to study the spatial and economic management of the apartheid government. They argued that the regulatory approach that was applied by the apartheid government supported the economic expansion as well as the political stability which characterised the apartheid era until the late 1960s. This makes this theory especially useful for this study since it is based on examining urban restructuring and its impacts in the post-apartheid era.

There are different concepts that fall under regulation theory, which are used in different studies. One of these is the Mode of Regulation (MOR). “The MOR is a set of rules, norms, conventions, patterns of conduct, social networks, organisational forms and institutions which can help to study and regulate the urban economy and its relative processes and institutions” (Goodwin, 2001, 73). In simple terms, the MOR refers to the multiple social, cultural and political institutions which come together to sustain and promote urban economic growth.

The key concept in regulation theory is its analysis of the connection between the process of accumulation and regulation (Goodwin, 2001); this is what makes it most useful to urban research. It allows one to relate to the general movement of economic and social development to specific processes within urban development as well as politics, and vice versa (Goodwin, 2001).

Numerous authors have used this theory to trace the broad connection between urban and regional development and the processes of capital accumulation and the associated crises. For example, Florida and Jonas (1991, cited in Goodwin, 2001) studied the post-war urban geography of the United States using regulation theory. In their analysis, they explained how economic, social and political factors influenced the broad parameters of post-war urban development. The regulation approach links the concerns of the political economy with analyses of the State and civil society. Regulation theory can be applied at any scale, although
it is mostly used at a national scale. The issue of geographical scale in the application of regulation theory is significant (Goodwin, 2001).

2.3 What is urban restructuring?

A strikingly rapid wave of urban restructuring has been taking place in cities worldwide since the 1980s (Brenner and Schmid, 2015). This has been a result of different crises occurring in cities; urban restructuring is undertaken to repair such damages (Brenner and Schmid, 2015). Urban restructuring refers to major changes in the economy, physical layout and social relations of a city region (Schafran, 2018). These changes are often on a long-term time frame and involve the rebuilding of city architecture, infrastructure, demography and so forth (Schafran, 2018). This is a process that is often goal orientated, with clear intent. Cities across the planet’s landscape have their own unique goals under this concept. This is due to the different situations which lead to the adoption of this concept in urban planning and policy (Schafran, 2018).

Most analysts tend to generalise among the features of all urban spaces and economies, especially those profoundly shaped by capitalism (Brenner, 2009b). However, there are more historically specific understandings of urban spaces and the processes that take place within them. According to Brenner (2009b), the urban is not fixed but instead, it is continuously reconstructed in and through the process of urban restructuring. As a result, there are no fixed features of a city because they are continually remade through urban restructuring (Brenner, 2009b). The character and nature of cities are dynamic and cities have been continuously changing since the earlier times. The most dramatic impact in western cities has been socio-spatial reorganisation in conjunction with post-1970 forms of global capitalist restructuring (Brenner, 2009b).

In recent years, scholars have categorised the process of urban restructuring under the broader concepts of globalisation, capitalism, and neoliberalism (Friedman, 2009). However, this is
more of an economic approach to urban restructuring. According to Friedman (2009), urban restructuring is an on-going process of change that reflects the fluctuating currents of the political economy as it spreads across a highly globalised world.

2.3.1 Characteristics of urban restructuring

There are four main characteristics of urban restructuring; as identified by Soja (1994). These have helped build a conceptual understanding of the process since its emergence in the 1970s. First is the restructuring of the urban form. Cities have transformed since the earliest form of cities, however since the 1970s, the rate at which the transformation occurs has become more and more rapid (Soja, 1994).

Second is the changing geography of production (Soja, 1994). The transformation of the city of Los Angeles since the emergence of urban restructuring has been accompanied by changes in the employment and production industries (Soja, 1994). This illustrates the apparent link between urban restructuring and industrial restructuring. Third and very common, is globalisation and world city formation (Soja, 1994). Globalisation has become a central process in current urban restructuring. This has resulted, among other things, in increased migration flows across countries and continents and the migrants ranging between investors, entrepreneurs, workers, families as well as the unskilled (Soja, 1994). In Los Angeles, immigration has been accompanied by an equally global heterogeneous inflow of capital investment; this inflow is responsible for the continued growth in the region (Soja, 1994). However, this has not been the case in all the cities going through this phase of urban restructuring. Fourth is the repolarisation of the city centres (Soja, 1994). The rapid development of cities under the influence of urban restructuring has resulted in a further division of social and economic groups in cities (Soja, 1994). (Soja, 1994). Most cities are implementing major renovation projects to attract investments and promote development projects.
2.3.2 The influence of politics in urban restructuring

This process is a product of various forces. The politics of a city influences the process of urban restructuring. This refers to the different spheres of government, economic stakeholders from different industries, cultural formations, social movements and much more (Schafran, 2018). Since the fall of socialism in Russia, there have been significant social, physical and economic transformations in the urban landscape of that region (Tosics, 2004). The population of cities appears to be determined by the economic geography of the area; which has also undergone significant restructuring (Tosics, 2004). Political changes are one of the major influences on the process of urban restructuring.

In the 1980s the Chinese government began to revise their plans for the development of their cities (Wei, 2012). Before the revision, the plans focused on controlling the urban population and industrial zones. Since then, urban planning in Chinese cities has become a continuous process of revision, reflecting the impacts of China’s economic reforms (Wei, 2012).

In Prague, the private sector has been very active in the transformation of the city, like in many other cities (Sykora, 1994). Transformations within political systems have created a force for a broader process of urban restructuring, as seen in most cities around the globe (Sykora, 1994). According to Waley (2007), the state plays a role in the process of urban restructuring through the organising of the lower levels of government in terms of function and responsibilities; as well as distributing roles to different sectors - public and private. Urban restructuring is a process implemented by the local government. However, the funds are sourced from the national government, which means that the state still has control over the process to some extent (Waley, 2007). There are numerous ways in which the state influences urban restructuring.

The initial role of the government in urban restructuring is to ensure, or promote, the direction towards the desired change in a city. This is carried out through interventions that are introduced as part of policy and strategies; and these help guide the urban restructuring process.
(Bradbury, 1989). However, changes in economic and social issues are accompanied by numerous trends in political discourse as well as in policy-making (White, 1998). This has been marked by the shift to urban governance, which prioritises entrepreneurialism (White, 1998). In the context of global economic competitiveness, governments increasingly place to enhance national competitiveness instead of undertaking major social and redistributive tasks. This has exacerbated urban inequalities (White, 1998).

Urban redevelopment plans have frequently been handed over to the private sector, which means that the government has reduced control over the whole process of urban restructuring and the urban environment is transformed in the likeness of the private sector (White, 1998). This takes place through the establishment of Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs); the State forms a partnership with the private sector to carry out development projects (Waley, 2007). This is the case in both first and third world countries. The state has now shifted from a managerial position to an entrepreneurial position in most countries. This shift means a significant change in development priorities; more attention is now being attributed to developing cities in a way that allows for capital accumulation rather than developing them as centres for equal wealth distribution (Waley, 2007).

It is not only the built environment that is affected; the standards of living for the urban population are reduced due to the retreat of the welfare state. Moreover, social marginality then becomes spatial marginality in many cities (White, 1998). As argued by Parker (2004), in most cities urban restructuring means a formation of even more partnerships between the private and the public sector. The socio-economic impacts of partnerships of this nature are often severely negative. This is also the reason why many authors question the process of urban restructuring; the consequences are often significant and adverse (Parker, 2004).
2.3.3 Globalisation and urban restructuring

Urban restructuring has become intertwined with global city development as every city transforms its social, physical and technological aspects to be more inclusive and accessible to the world (Brenner and Keil, 2014). At the core of globalisation is freedom of mobility, and this applies to goods, capital, people, information, cultural norms and so forth (White, 1998). However, numerous problems arise in the wake of globalisation from urban restructuring. The social construct of many cities is becoming more and more comprised of often poor low skilled migrants and cities are becoming divided, with mini ghettos in some parts (Brenner and Keil, 2014). While urban restructuring is oriented towards global city development, among other goals, the globalisation has caused some amount of division in cities (Brenner and Keil, 2014). On the positive side, globalisation has improved economic activity and growth in most countries. Its processes have created new employment and income generation opportunities for cities and their citizens (White, 1998). However, such improvements have not benefited all citizens; at least not equally. The job market has also been transformed as a result of globalisation processes, which has also changed the employment basis for different social class structures (White, 1998).

Capital is not the only feature that globalisation has allowed freedom of mobility. The movement of Multi National Operations around the globe has also given way to new patterns of international migration, and this has revealed bias in migration policies in the global north (White, 1998). They gladly welcome the elite who bring skills and investments, but there are increasing restrictions generally on the mobility of the less advantaged. Although migration policies are regularly being changed to reduce the influx of immigrants, the unskilled and work-seeking are becoming more desperate; this is evident in several cases in Latin America and Africa (White, 1998).
2.3.4 Impacts of urban restructuring

Urban restructuring brings about change, and in most cases, it is not always the intended transformation. There are numerous impacts that this process has on cities and their development. Studying urban restructuring is essential in order to understand the different ways in which the modern city and urban life have been reconstructed over time (Soja, 2009). In most cases, urban restructuring results in the intensification of economic inequalities as well as unfavourable social and political conditions in an urban setting (Soja, 2009). Another impact is the influx of transnational immigrants; cities today have become culturally and economically diverse because of urban restructuring (Soja, 2009). Scholars are now shifting from the notion of “crisis generated restructuring to that of restructuring generated crisis”; this is because of the severe impacts that urban restructuring bears on urban spaces and their development, whether it is physical or economic restructuring (Soja, 2009:42).

2.3.5 Uneven social, economic and spatial development

Uneven economic and spatial development is commonly associated with economic and spatial transformations in cities (Pieterse, 2009). Commercial financier driven restructuring has created an uneven spatial order of development in cities around the world and this is a similar case in South African cities in the post-apartheid era (Pieterse, 2009).

Increasing social and economic division is an apparent part of urban restructuring (Sykora, 1994). The emergence of the quartered city has symbolised this. As stated by Marcuse (1991) cited in (White, 1998), cities are now divided between prosperous parts and the marginalised underclass parts. Uneven economic and spatial development is a historical product of political choice and economic conditions (Sykora, 1994). White (1998) stated that uneven development is a historical product because it is inherited with the physical and economic landscape of cities. This explains the case of continued uneven development in most cities, including South African cities, because of certain political and economic regimes that have existed and changed over
time. Research conducted in the late 1990s in Chicago showed that social and economic transformations have adversely affected the distribution of development across the city as well as job access for the urban poor (White, 1998).

Post-world war Netherlands has been characterised by major urban restructuring. The basic idea underlying this process in the Netherlands was to break the physical and social dullness of urban spaces and to have a mixed population, in terms of income (Van Beckhoven and Van Kempen, 2003). The plan was to achieve this by integrating neighbourhoods and improving low-income areas (Van Beckhoven and Van Kempen, 2003). According to planning experts, a concentration of poor people in one area represents a spatial planning problem (Van Beckhoven and Van Kempen, 2003). However, the idea of integration under urban restructuring policy failed in the Netherlands. This is because of the division that continues to exist between individuals of different income groups even when they have put in one place (Van Beckhoven and Van Kempen, 2003).

2.3.6 Increased immigration

Immigration is not a new phenomenon and has been a significant contributor to urban growth since the 1800s (Thorns, 2002). However, current patterns of migration are different from those that existed when this movement first began (Thorns, 2002). There are now numerous and diverse reasons for contemporary migration patterns. According to Thorns (2002), the restructuring of cities around the world since the early 1970s is one of the causes of migration, and it acts both as a push as well as a pull factor.

In the African context, poverty, violent conflict and political oppression in origin countries are key drivers of cross border migration (UN: Economic Commission for Africa, 2017). This is most common with immigrants from central Africa and beyond. In the Southern African Development Community region migration patterns are primarily motivated by economic reasons. Business opportunities in destination countries have also been noted as a key
influencer when it comes to cross border migration in Africa (Crush, Williams and Perbedy, 2005). People migrate to improve their long-term social and economic well-being. Urbanisation is another key driver of different forms of migration within and across borders. It is an intrinsic part of broader processes of economic development, particularly technological (mechanism, infrastructure, and communication) and it is most common in developing countries (UN: Economic Commission for Africa, 2017). Growing rural poverty has pushed people out of their households in search for better livelihoods (UN: Economic Commission for Africa, 2017).

2.4 Origins of urban restructuring in South African urban policy

According to Turok (1994), apartheid planning was an instrument of crude social engineering, which caused great hardship in the country and also imposed an unnecessary burden on the economy. As a result, urban scholars focused research on revealing the effects of urban apartheid as well as proposing alternative policies to address this legacy and to restructure the city (Turok, 1994). The concept of urban restructuring emerged in the 1980s when several planners raised critical concerns about the apartheid planning policies (Todes, 2008). Urban restructuring encouraged more compact, integrated and inclusive urban development plans and policies for urban areas across South Africa (South African Cities Network, 2016). Compaction refers to eradicating low-density urban sprawl as a means to make cities more compact and integration has to do with redressing apartheid-inspired spatial disintegration and or segregation (Todes, 2008).

Since 1994, numerous policy frameworks have seen the light, and they all indicated the need to spatially transform cities and settlements to break the segregatory patterns of the apartheid city (Maritz et al., 2016). Over the decades, these frameworks have been changed, and new ones have been developed, which often stipulate the same objectives (Maritz et al., 2016).
The initial phase of the democratic era after 1994 was dominated by the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) and the Development Facilitation Act (DFA) and this strongly influenced the first post-apartheid municipal plans (du Plessis, 2014). The Growth Employment and Redistribution and Integrated Development Plans followed and focused on the economy and spatial plans. The National Planning Commission, established in 2010, is the most prominent in current plans for urban restructuring and other development plans for the country plans (du Plessis, 2014). The National Development Plan 2030 proposed the reconfiguration of towns and cities into more efficient and equitable spatial forms (du Plessis, 2014).

2.4.1 Early 1990s

In 1994, the new, democratically elected ANC government introduced the RDP as a strategy to address the inequalities of the apartheid era, especially integrating segregated areas and redistributing public resources to promote development in previously disadvantaged communities in South Africa (RDP, 1994). Opening the city to create equal opportunities for every citizen formed a critical part of the RDP as well as the provision of housing and basic services to the historically disadvantaged community (RDP, 1994). In 1996 the government introduced the GEAR (Growth, Employment, and Redistribution) strategy which was a neoliberal, market-led policy (GEAR, 1996). Narsiah (2002) criticized this strategy and argued that it has further instilled economic inequalities in post-apartheid South Africa, instead of eliminating such problems.

The UDF (Urban Development Framework) was then introduced in 1997 to promote GEAR. This strategy was also largely influenced by neoliberalism. However, South Africa’s model of economic growth in the post-apartheid era has proven to be problematic as it did not take on a holistic approach to urban development and this has had negative impacts on urban development and development as a whole. According to Todes (2008), urban development
policies introduced in the early 1990s focused on developing the South African city as a global city; making it safe to attract capital. This is the main reason why there has been a definite need, in policy development, to overcome the separation between spatial, social and economic planning in South African cities as this was one of the main challenges in the development of South African cities (Todes, 2006).

The above strategies failed to address urban social, physical and economic restructuring in an integrated manner (Pillay, 2006). This also weakened local government systems across the country and shifted developmental attention towards making cities attractive for foreign investments, which was basically the GEAR agenda (Harrison, 1995). During this time, there appeared to be a lack of focus on urban spatial policy in these strategies (Harrison, 1995).

2.4.2 2000s

In 1998 the government released the White Paper on Local Government. The White Paper focused attention on the critical role that local government could play in rebuilding local communities and environments, as the basis for a democratic, integrated, prosperous and genuinely non-racial society (White Paper, 1998). The White Paper outlined the systems which were to make developmental local government a reality for South Africa (White Paper, 1998).

In 2012, the National Planning Commission drafted the National Development Plan (NDP) 2030. At national level, the NDP is a strategic plan that encompasses all the long-term development goals of the country, including spatial development (SACN, 2016). Specifically, the NDP motivates for a spatial vision to inform all current and future developmental policies and practices (SACN, 2016). This integration of policies and plans will assist in tackling apartheid legacies of spatial divisions and inequalities; it will inform infrastructural investments (National Planning Commission, 2011). In support of the spatial vision, the NDP has proposed the adoption of five principles to guide the planning of urban future throughout the country; namely spatial justice, spatial sustainability, spatial efficiency, spatial resilience,
and spatial quality (National Planning Commission, 2011). These principles will be the guide for urban planning at a provincial and municipal level. These principles need to be incorporated into operational principles guide for local development while simultaneously responding to the unique local realities and meeting the broader transformation vision defined by the NDP (SACN, 2016).

Current planning, at local municipality level, in South African cities is working on integrating development spatially and sectorally through the mechanisms of IDPs. The plans are vital for constructing an urban vision of the city that clearly shows the development potential of the city as well as how developing the city could benefit the citizens (Visser, 2001). They formulate basic guidelines for broader developmental requirements in order to initiate more inclusive, affordable, appropriate, diverse and effective land use management techniques and regulations for more efficient management of urban growth and urban change (SACN, 2016). These plans are specifically relevant to South Africa when one considers its political history; a successful transition to cities with even social, physical and economic development is long overdue (Visser, 2001). Urban spatial development was included in the IDPs’ formulation, and it was during this period that there appeared to be a renewed interest in city restructuring as part of urban spatial policy. These plans were intended to strengthen local government and to ensure effective social, economic and physical development (Pillay, 2006). Therefore, spatial planning is an important tool under the IDPs, which includes urban restructuring; it plays a strategic role for the economic and social development of the city- which sequentially affects spatial development (Pillay, 2006). Each local municipality has its IDPs, structured to suit its developmental needs.

The eThekwini Municipality has made significant developmental progress through the IDPs. The development of new plans and planning tools has not been an easy task for the
municipality. Planners are faced with the task of addressing historical issues as well as finding solutions for current problems.

The eThekwini municipality has also introduced a strategy called Area Based Management (ABM) which has several focus areas around the municipality. This was developed to address the numerous developmental challenges that were being faced within the municipality (eThekwini Municipality online, 2016). The iTTrump, which stands for Inner City Thekwini Regeneration and Urban Management Programme, was then established under ABM as a means to regenerate the inner city (eThekwini Municipality online, 2016). The programme has six key outcomes which are: increasing economic activity, reducing poverty and social isolation, making the inner city more viable, effective and sustainable urban management, improving safety and security and developing institutional capacity (eThekwini Municipality online, 2016).

Todes (2008) argued that the repositioning of Durban as a world-class city is also likely to limit the achievement of the ideals or urban restructuring, namely compaction and integration. This is because it displaces the importance of spatial planning policy in urban policy. Also, these ideas have limits, and different factors serve to weaken their full potential, such as pragmatisation, electoral politics. Also, the significance of compaction-integration is also being displaced by the shift in government roles, national government broadening emphasis on developmental local government, as well as the shift from spatial restructuring towards economic restructuring, creating competitive cities (Todes, 2008). Discourses of competitive cities are becoming increasingly common because of the economic stagnation, growing unemployment and South Africa’s marginalisation in an era of global economic restructuring. Durban has been identified to have potential for being one of South Africa’s most internationally competitive cities and this has influenced negatively on the ideas of urban restructuring. In addition, economic regeneration and repositioning Durban as a world class
city is slowly displacing the importance of spatial restructuring in urban planning agendas (Todes, 2008). The spatial configuration of the Durban CBD has been changing since the end of the apartheid era.

Urban regeneration emerged in the eThekwini municipality in the late 1990s when combinations of background factors were in favour (Housing Development Agency, 2013). First was the accelerated decay of the inner city around that time, due to the planning policies of apartheid. Second was the entrepreneurial turn of the 1990s, this was when concerns of efficiency, fiscal discipline as well as growth and competitiveness became dominant ideas and impacted on the structure of the city (Housing Development Agency, 2013). Lastly was the decentralisation of urban governance and administration, but more especially the creation of metropolitan municipalities (Housing Development Agency, 2013).

Urban regeneration can be defined as a process used to address urban decay, especially in the inner city areas, in order to revitalise the whole physical, social and economic environment of an area (Housing Development Agency, 2013). The leading and important role in this process is played by the municipality. They facilitate by creating dedicated structures, tools and strategies.

The second process under urban restructuring is urban renewal. This process involves the renewal of areas that are poor and underdeveloped; inner cities that have suffered a significant deal of urban decay are most appropriate for urban renewal (Housing Development Agency, 2013). However, the difference between this process and urban regeneration is that the targets for urban renewal are areas with economic potential.

The process of restructuring is undertaken in different forms by different cities. One common factor among cities in urban restructuring is the identification of restructuring zones. Restructuring zones are geographic areas identified for targeted investment and development based on the need for social, spatial and economic restructuring of areas (Housing
Development Agency, 2013). The eThekwin municipality has 19 restructuring zones (Housing Development Agency, 2013). In recent years, urban grey areas have been increasing. These are areas which are not well located in terms of social, economic and transport opportunities as compared to the inner city suburbs and CBDs (Housing Development Agency, 2013). In light of this reality, some planners have raised concerns that restructuring zones are becoming more concentrated in the cities as opposed to focusing on the marginalised areas as well (Housing Development Agency, 2013). This could eventually lead to questioning of the whole purpose of urban restructuring (Housing Development Agency, 2013).

2.4.3 Challenges since 1994

After 24 years into the democracy; patterns of urban development in South African cities still display high levels of socio-economic inequalities (Bassa, 2015). And the rapid rate of urbanisation exacerbates such issues. Given South Africa’s apartheid past and the impact of planned segregation on its cities, there is a strong need to address socio-economic inequalities, racially divided cities and the transformation of cities in order to provide equal opportunities and sustainable means of living for all citizens (Maritz et al., 2016). However, in spite of all the policies and plans for transformation since 1994, South African cities remain inefficient urban environments. Well balanced development in a city has to improve efficiency, entice growth and investment whilst transforming the city spatially. Furthermore, considering the current rate of urbanisation, cities need to be more liveable, inclusive, sustainable and resilient (Maritz et al., 2016). According to Turok (2013), there is a significant lack of substantial change in the development of South African cities. He continues to state that economic forces and weak spatial management are the main reason behind this. Spatial change is unlikely in the absence of economic and social change (Turok, 2013). Evidence suggests that socio-economic integration has been little due to the resistance from communities and financial institutions involved in the process of urban restructuring.
The segmentation of the city by income is also reflected in the location decisions of many industrial and commercial property developers; the affluent areas are getting better as property developers are choosing to settle there while the poorer areas are getting worse due to lack of investment (Turok, 2013). Spatial governance in places characterised by levels of social inequality and racial polarisation will, therefore, continue to be ineffective (du Plessis, 2014). The post-1994 government’s response still displays segregation as opposed to integration. It is vital to reconcile the urban expansion and compaction approaches in order to avoid duplication and dissipation of already scarce resources (Turok, 2015).

When compared to other major cities in South Africa, the eThekwini municipality shows a significant amount of fragmentation. The city still reflects apartheid's policies of separate development. The NDP mentions that the spatial divide from the apartheid era is still visible in South African cities today (Turok, 2013). This then makes it necessary to look into the challenges in spatial development and generate lessons for the future development of South African cities.

Bassa (2015) argued that the structure of South African cities remains inequitable and inefficient and this is a serious challenge for the long-term goal of urban restructuring. He further reiterated the significance that integrational form of development has in addressing such issues. This integration has to occur in planning policy first, before implication in urban restructuring (Bassa, 2015). Certain institutional practices and market forces reinforce spatial divisions (Bassa, 2015). Over the past two decades, the scale, nature, and appearance of South African cities have visibly changed. Spatial transformations are happening at different rates across South African cities and taking different forms. However, the vision of the Spatial Development Framework, which was drafted in 1997, has not been achieved. South African cities continue to display spatial fragmentation as well as socioeconomic exclusion and inequality. These frameworks are constantly reviewed to track progress. A key question that
remains is whether cities are succeeding in restructuring and transforming the past (Maritz et al., 2016). Investigating the spatial transformation of cities since 1994 is vital for assessing progress that has been made thus far. Pragmatic support is necessary to analyse and track progress in support of this long-term agenda and to fundamentally reconfiguring inequality in society and space (Maritz et al., 2016).

Location disadvantage is another factor causing setbacks in urban restructuring. There are areas within and outside the cities where insufficient investment is being made, and this leaves the development of most South African cities unaligned and uncoordinated (Maritz et al. 2016). This means that there are inconsistency and inequality in the way in which it is carried out. Evidence of this is provided through taking a walk around three of South Africa’s largest cities (Cape Town, Johannesburg and Durban); there is visible division in the cities (Maritz et al. 2016).

Oranje (2014) stated that capital investment is the key to achieving the desired spatial transformation for South African cities. This approach has been welcomed gladly by municipalities everywhere, as more attention is paid to attracting foreign investment. This has resulted in a great imbalance between economic and physical restructuring in South African cities; and this is very problematic (Todes, 2006). Urban areas show a mix of developed and developing world conditions in close proximity (Hannan and Sutherland, 2015). Urban restructuring and making cities more competitive have proven to be divergent forces and more integration is required to ensure more sustainable urban futures for South African cities (Hannan and Sutherland, 2015).

### 2.4.5 Lessons for the future

The future of South Africa lies in the future of its cities; they are inseparably linked (Oranje, 2014). During the apartheid era, the city reflected planning frameworks of the successive white-controlled government. It is these large, historically-constructed uneven forms of development
that are the key subject of transformation in democratic South Africa. Therefore, urban policy in the post-apartheid era focuses on integration and compaction, as opposed to segregation (Todes, 2006).

In urban South Africa, numerous problems come from progressive spatial and non-spatial change, and this has resulted in the new form of a fragmented urban structure in South African cities (Oranje, 2014). Since urban restructuring is aimed at fundamental change in South African cities, it should be obvious that all forms of government and all levels of society should promote similar change in order regeneration and integration (Oranje, 2014).

South African cities, even after two decades of democracy, still show significant traits of the apartheid city and they have called for more attention to be paid to the restructuring of cities (Oranje, 2014). This can be noted through the unequal distribution of economic and welfare resources. To some, these are available in abundance while to others they are scarce. As a result, urban restructuring is still relevant and necessary in South Africa; economically, socially and physically (Oranje, 2014). The concept of integration has remained central to the spatial planning and policy agenda right up to the NDP (SACN, 2016). This largely indicates the significance of the concept but also the poor success it has had in urban restructuring.

There are a couple of features, from other countries, which could improve urban restructuring in South African cities. First, local interests have to matter as much as international interests do; to avoid the neglect of local planning agendas in pursuit of satisfying international interests and competing in the global market (Oranje, 2014). According to du Plessis (2014), it is hardly possible for a city to be simultaneously globally competitive while addressing socio-economic redistribution. In cities with increasing global success this has not been spread equally throughout the city (du Plessis, 2014). There is a poor balance, if not none, between global competitiveness and local urban growth.
Second, urban restructuring must imply significant adjustments in the country’s societal, spatial and economical form; the balance between these three elements is necessary for an effective urban restructuring (Oranje, 2014). Lastly, enabling economic participation for previously disadvantaged individuals is also important, as well as for other citizens (Oranje, 2014). For example, the informal economy sector is an important source of jobs and income for the poor but it is still subject to marginalisation and control at the level of cities (du Plessis, 2014). The analysis of urban spatial plans sought to establish the extent to which the role of the informal economy is recognised in spatial strategies and proposals (du Plessis, 2014). These features are not only necessary for South Africa’s urban restructuring, but they are also long overdue.

Several interventions that need to be carried out to guide the process of urban restructuring (Oranje, 2014). These have been identified using international case studies. However, it does not mean that they cannot be applied in South Africa’s urban restructuring; a few may be relevant and useful. These interventions are meant to guide how the process is carried out as well as its duration. Urban restructuring cannot be a short-term process for it requires careful planning and caution when implementing (Oranje, 2014). However, this does not mean that careful planning and caution is always applied. Partnerships for broader economic and social transformations are worth consideration as various stakeholder involvement in this process can bear positive results (Oranje, 2014). These two interventions are most common among every country that is implementing urban restructuring and should be emphasised in South Africa. Implementation of legislation is another important part of for urban restructuring. It is passed down from the national government to the local government for implementation. This has yielded positive results in most case studies of urban restructuring, and in some cases, it showed a variation in impacts (Oranje, 2014). Municipalities need to find creative ways to deal with the challenges facing cities (SACN, 2016). Informality is a growing, dominant mode of
behaviour and is part of everyday survivalism for many lower-income people across urban centres and it is necessary for this aspect to be included in spatial planning (SACN, 2016). The pure success of urban restructuring requires sufficient funds, hard work, proper planning, and dedication. The main problem for South Africa has always been funds, which has resulted in the slow transformation of cities; and this also makes good planning strategies seem very weak (Oranje, 2014). One source of funds are investments, which most countries rely on for city development. However, in the case of South Africa, it is not easy to attract foreign investment for there are many reasons investors may choose to not invest in South Africa (Oranje, 2014). There are other numerous reports, which have been published, that focus on the issue of urban restructuring in South Africa. The State of Cities Report 2016 includes several ways in which city transformation in South Africa can be turned around for the better. For example, local government is in the best position to achieve spatial transformation; and this can be achieved through facilitation, establishing meaningful partnerships with between private sector agencies, communities and civil society organisations and other urban stakeholders and actors (SoSACR, 2016). This matters because these are all the people affected by the outcomes of the urban restructuring.

The municipality has to recognise the needs of the urban residents and address existing economic, spatial and social imbalances before moving forward (SoSACR, 2016). The financial implementation challenges will persist unless significant strides are made to restructure the current South African city (SoSACR, 2016). The government needs to ensure that development is productive, inclusive, sustainable and well governed (SoSACR, 2016); there is no single image of what a city should look like, and this means that there is no need to copy of each other. Spatial planning is vital for proper spatial transformation. This process has to be monitored in a different way than it has been to date (SoSACR, 2016). An all-inclusive and sustainable urban restructuring will be successful because it will be well integrated. There
also has to be a change in politics and power. Corruption, inefficiency and political power arrangements all cause challenges in the process of urban restructuring, thus slowing down the spatial and social integration of the South African city (SoSACR, 2016). Transformation of the institutions and governmental relations must also occur. This is highly dependent on effective intergovernmental relations that recognise the critical function played by local government. Such relations need to be strengthened in order to drive agreed policy and steer the priorities of the urban agenda (SoSACR, 2016).

2.5 Conclusion

This chapter examined the work of numerous scholars to provide a review of the concept of urban restructuring and its origins in South African urban policy. An in-depth discussion of urban restructuring and its elements was provided. The literature review revealed that urban restructuring originated from the Western world where it was undertaken as a measure to redress problems in urban development caused by the histories of cities. South Africa also adopted this concept for the same reasons.

Urban restructuring has been part of South African urban policy for more than 20 years now. However, apartheid traits can still be identified in the development path this country is taking. Urban development in the light of urban restructuring still requires more integration, compaction, and inclusiveness. There are numerous challenges that South African urban policy has faced over the decades and this explains the slow improvement. Continuous research on the process of urban restructuring in South Africa is necessary in order to uncover the impacts it bears on different places in which it occurs as well as to discover strategies on how the uneven can be evened. This is important because the initial reason behind the development of urban restructuring was to ensure equal development everywhere social, physical and economically.
Chapter Three: Methodology

3.1 Introduction

This chapter explains the methodology adopted in the study. More specifically, it highlights the aims and objectives of the study and the key research questions, describes the history of the Grey Street Complex and explains the specific methods used in the research. A qualitative research approach was adopted, and the main methods were in-depth unstructured and semi-structured interviews. Documentary sources provided important historical background information about the study area.

3.2 Aim

The aim of this study is to investigate the social, physical and economic restructuring that has occurred in the Durban inner city since 1994, with specific reference to Grey Street.

3.2.1 Objectives

The objectives of this study are to:

i. Review the historical development of the Grey Street area and its changing fortunes.

ii. Identify the social, physical and economic changes in Grey Street since 1994.

iii. Explain the influence of these changes.

iv. Assess the influence of government policies on restructuring in Grey Street since 1994.

3.2.2 Research questions

This research will attempt to address the following questions:

1. What is the historical background of the Grey Street area?

2. What changes have taken place in the Grey Street area since 1994 and how are these manifested socially, physically and economically?

3. What are the reasons for these changes?

4. How have government policies influenced urban restructuring in the Grey Street area?

3.3 Geographical location and demographic characteristics
Grey Street is located on the west side of the Durban CBD. The Grey Street business community includes Grey, Victoria, Queen and Prince Edward Streets (Desai and Vahed, 2011). This area comprises of several arcades. At present, the population of the Grey Street complex is very multicultural; it includes the original South African Indians, Asians (mostly Chinese) and Africans from various countries around the continent (Desai and Vahed, 2011). Economic activities in this area are also of a wide variety, from small to medium, which includes the informal traders as well.

**Figure 3.1: Durban CBD**

(Source: Report on Durban CBD, 2010)
3.5 History of Grey Street

Grey Street is originally the home of the first Indians who arrived in South Africa 156 years ago. After being released from their contracts as indentured labourers, many of the Indians chose to stay in South Africa, especially in Durban (Rajah, 1981). They brought their families from India and started their lives as small business owners and artisans (Rajah, 1981).

3.5.1 Grey Street under apartheid

The apartheid era began in 1948, and this era made the Grey Street complex an official trading area for the Indian population. Freedom from indenture allowed some Indian people to start their small-scale businesses which were mostly agricultural. Numerous Indian traders became successful by trading with the local African population in the remote areas while some were able to sell their products in the city. They sold items in small quantities and gave some items on credit, and their goods were often cheaper than their white counterpart (SAHO, 2011). The competition between the Indians and the whites, for trading space and customers, grew very
intense. As a result of white agitation, Indians were confined to specific areas for trading; in the CBD this was the Grey Street complex (Moberly and Ward, 1999). Indian businesses flourished in this area, and approximately 15000 people lived there up to the 1970s. Thereafter, the majority were forcefully displaced because of the Group Areas Act (1950) (Maharaj, 1997). Although Indians were increasingly appreciated as labourers, they were never welcomed as settlers and competitors in the business sector.

The Group Areas Act (GAA) was promulgated in 1950, and it applied essentially to the socio-spatial organisation of towns on a racial basis. The GAA was one of the most contentious legislation to ever be passed by the South African parliament. The injustices, human rights violations, and restrictions embedded in this legislation caused serious concern; so much so that the Indian government and UN tried to intervene but were unsuccessful in stopping the implementation of this act (Bagwandeen, 1989). Regarding this law, the government had the power to restrict where members of different racial groups should live, trade and work. This was one of the key instruments used to reinforce the ideology of apartheid and to separate residential areas, educational services and other amenities for the different race groups (Kuper, et al. (cited in Rajah, 1981), 1958; Maharaj, 1992). Land that was made available to other races would often be small, unproductive, barren wastelands situated outside of the city and without civic amenities (Ariyan, 1999). In theory, anyone could own property, but in practice, whites would not only be allocated the bulk of land but could also lay claim to all the prime sites in and around Durban and the surrounding areas (Ariyan, 1999), and especially the Grey Street complex.

3.5.2 Grey Street after apartheid

In the post-apartheid era, the Grey Street complex has changed demographically, economically and physically. The spatial clustering of businesses in the area has significantly changed, mainly due to the type of commercial activities that are now found and dominant in the area.
At first, these new businesses were concentrated around Queen Street, Victoria Street, Grey Street as well as Prince Edward Street. However, they have now spread through the Grey Street complex (Desai and Vahed, 2011).

The Group Areas Act was repealed in 1991, and this caused several changes in the Grey Street complex. First, there was the relocation of the original Indian owned businesses from the area, most of these businesses moved to shopping malls in the most famous Indian neighbourhoods in Durban; Phoenix and Chatsworth. Other businesses moved further into the suburbs and other shopping malls around Durban as well as to the main CBD; West and Smith Street. The moving out of all these businesses left plenty of trading space open in the Grey Street complex.

By the early 2000s, the Grey Street complex was notably becoming a ghost town (Leader, 2001). This was as a disappointing turn of events as the area was once a thriving business and residential complex. However, foreign migrants began to move into the area and exploit economic opportunities.

The freedom that came with the end of Apartheid’s Group Areas Act also led to the arrival of numerous foreign business people in the area. Presently, Grey Street has become a mixed flavour that is both continental and Asian (Sewchurran, 2003). Around the early 2000s, the area became invaded by Pakistanis, Nigerians, and Somalians. The demographic composition has become even more diverse since then as more and more foreigners move into the area: from Congo, Ethiopia, Ghana, and many other countries (Sewchurran, 2003).

Grey Street complex is one of the areas in the CBD constantly mentioned as having its unique character and tensions. It is one of the parts of the CBD that have not seen large-scale transformation in the post-apartheid era; especially when compared to Albert Park, West and Smith Street (Report on Durban CBD, 2010). Although it is still seen by most as the Indian CBD, immigrants from within and outside of Africa have become regular occupants in the area (Report on Durban CBD, 2010).
The foreign business owners have different business ethics, compared to the original older established businesses in the area (Sewchurran, 2003). Today many imported goods are sold in the area, both genuine and counterfeit. Prices in the foreign owned shops are very affordable, which makes buying their products very hard to resist for the customers (Sewchurran, 2003). The shop setting in these new shops is very different compared to the older established businesses in the area. Mixed-trading is a common feature among the foreign shop owners; they sell different products in one shop; such as curtains, shoes and perfumes.

3.6 Research design

This study adopted a qualitative research approach to investigate urban restructuring in the Grey Street area. Qualitative research is a type of research design common in the social sciences field. It focuses on the way people interpret and understand their daily experiences (Mohajan, 2018). According to Merriam (2002: 5), “Qualitative research does not attempt to predict what may happen in the future but aims to understand the nature of a research setting, what it means for the research participants to be in that setting and what the world looks like for them from within that setting.” This research design seeks to understand the why and how of a situation from the respondents’ perspective (Mohajan, 2018). It does not only investigate cause and effect, but it is also interested in uncovering the meaning of the concepts for those directly involved and affected (Lapan et al., 2012). The sampling and data collection methods were chosen using the direction that the qualitative approach determined. This approach helped to fully understand where the Grey Street complex stands with regards to urban restructuring. It also helped to thoroughly unpack the views of the eThekwini Municipality planning department concerning the study area as well as the views from the business owners in the study area. All this information was crucial in order to fully achieve the objectives of this study. The qualitative approach is widely used in numerous sub disciplines of geography, and given the investigative nature of this study, the approach will ensure the production of definite results.
3.6.1 Sampling method

The sampling method that was used for this research is the non-random judgment sampling, also known as purposeful sampling. Ruane (2016, 248) refers to this as the “researcher knows best” method of sampling. This is because it requires prior knowledge of the study area’s population and this provides insight for sample selection (Ruane, 2016). The researcher was familiar with the Grey Street complex. Using this method ensured that the researcher does not waste time choosing irrelevant respondents and helped to eliminate chances of error and incorrect information. It is easy to conduct research and eliminate chances of error when one knows the study area well as it also means that the researcher has sufficient knowledge of the subjects.

The main streets in the study area were chosen to conduct interviews because that is where a majority of the new businesses can be found. The researcher had a significant amount of prior knowledge of the study area; this assisted in selecting the streets in which to conduct interviews. In order to show the spatial distribution of the new businesses in the Grey Street area, an equal number of respondents were interviewed from each of the main streets. This contributed towards data analysis and helped to bring about the social, economic and physical restructuring that has taken place in the area. Table 3.1 below shows the plan for how many people were interviewed per street.

The street names listed below are all those that fall within the study area

**NB:** Using the new street names
Table 3.1: Sampling format

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Street name</th>
<th>No. of buildings</th>
<th>No. of interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr Yusuf Dadoo St [Grey St]</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bertha Mkhize St [Victoria St]</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ingcuce Rd [Albert St]</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Goonam St [Prince Edward]</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Webster St [Leopold St]</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denis Hurley St [Queen St]</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.1 also shows the number of buildings on each of the main streets in the Grey Street complex. For David Webster St and Ingcuce Rd, the researcher interviewed every third business owner until a total of five was interviewed. For the rest of the streets, with more buildings, the researcher interviewed every sixth business owner until a total of five was interviewed. The reason being that there were more businesses on the streets with more buildings than on the streets with fewer buildings.

3.6.2 Sample population and size

The respondents for this study were chosen from the Grey Street area. However, to be specific, these were not just anyone who happens to be around the area. The relevant subjects were the new business people that moved into the area after 1994. This was the main target population, but there were also respondents from outside of the study area, and those were the key informants. These respondents are government officials from the urban planning department of the eThekwini municipality, specifically the senior professional planner and the person in charge of the iTrump programme under the Area Based Management strategy. These were chosen so that information obtained from key informants can enrich the study. Furthermore,
these key informants had interesting insights regarding the process of urban restructuring and its impacts on the Grey Street area.

The chosen sample size for this study was thirty-two (32). Thirty of the respondents were business owners from the Grey Street area. Since this was a qualitative study, a sample size of thirty was a large enough number to use for getting all the required information, in order to address all the research questions. The last two of the respondents were the key informants for this study; which were government officials from the eThekwini municipality urban planning department. This helped to understand further how urban restructuring has influenced the Grey Street area.

3.6.3 Data collection

In-depth interviews are one of the methods used in qualitative research for primary data collection. Most qualitative studies make use of in-depth interviews to allow the respondent to give deeper insight toward certain aspects of their everyday experiences (Silverman, 2013). This study employed the in-depth interview method for the collection of all primary data. In-depth interviews have open-ended questions; this allows the respondents to give long descriptive answers with regards to the research questions and provides the researcher with an in-depth insight of the issue being researched (Sterber, 2017). This method is useful because it is able to inform a wide range of the research questions. Interviews are among the most familiar methods for collecting data for qualitative studies (Merriam, 2002).

This study employed both semi-structured as well as unstructured interviews. Unstructured interviews are interviews that follow a flexible structure (Edwards and Holland, 2013). This was used to collect primary data from the business people in the Grey Street area. This approach requires a great deal of preparation and the key issues that are to be addressed require careful thought and thorough knowledge of the subject matter; which is established from desktop research (Parfitt, 2005). However, these interviews can elicit long answers and the respondents
can end up drifting away from the focus of the question; therefore, polite interventions are often required in order to make sure that this does not happen (Parfitt, 2005). Unstructured questions allow the respondent to give detailed answers thus giving the researcher a chance to ask follow-up questions (Edwards and Holland, 2013).

Semi-structured questions were used for the interviews with the senior professional planner and the person in charge of the iTrump under Area Based Management. Interviews of this nature often have to be planned far ahead of time to take place outside the respondents’ normal daily routine (Sterber, 2017). The researcher had to use this type of interviews to ensure getting the desired information for the study; because of the availability of time on the key informants’ side.

In addition to the primary data that was collected, secondary data was also used in this study. Secondary data is the information that has already been collected by someone else and published and is available for others to use for reference purposes mostly (Ruane, 2016). There are several sources of secondary data that were used for this study. These included online journal articles, library journal articles, historical records as well as newspapers. Images and maps were also used for illustration purposes.

In research, this form of data is used for writing a literature review. This study used this data for chapters 1, 2, 3 and 4. Secondary data is an important element of all human geography for various reasons. It provides a vital guide to the historical background of the study area as well as its people (Ruane, 2016). Furthermore, secondary data can be analysed and reanalysed to show existing or potential relations in different variables of a study (Ruane, 2016).

### 3.7 Limitations

The researcher was quite aware of the limitations that could arise from the selected method of data collection and there were several limitations that were encountered. First, in a few cases, the 3rd or the 6th business did not fall within the research criteria, meaning that this was an
older business which was established before 1994 in the Grey Street complex. In such cases the researcher interviewed the next person who met the research criteria. Second, the researcher had also considered that some respondents may not be willing or may refuse to participate in the research. However, this did not happen, there were a few respondents who required the researcher to make an appointment for the following day. In such cases the researcher had to make appointments for a time that best suited the respondents. Lastly, many of the respondents’ first language was not English thus making the interview process take longer than intended. The researcher had to carefully explain some of the questions during the interview.

3.8 Conclusion

The methods and data sources that were chosen for this study were to ensure the efficiency of information collection and the validity as well as relevance of the data that was used. The data analysis is presented in the next chapter of this study. This will help draw a sensible conclusion for this study and make relevant recommendations.
Chapter 4: Grey Street – Historical, Social and Economic Changes

4.1 Introduction

This chapter presents the research findings of this study. The language used for the data collection was English. Narrative analysis was used to analyse data collected from the 32 interviews that were conducted with the new business owners in the Grey Street complex, the senior professional planner of the Warwick Junction restructuring zone and the coordinator of the iTrump programme. The analysis has been conducted using themes based on the study’s objectives and has been divided down into four main sections which are history of Indians in, Durban South Africa, post-1994 changes in the Grey Street complex, influence of the post-1994 changes and the influence of governmental programs in the Grey Street complex. This has been done this way for purposes of structural coherency.

4.2 History of Indians in Durban

Indians have been in South Africa for over 150 years. Their history in the country is filled with numerous struggles and victories. Durban is the place where the majority of the South African Indian population is found, since this is where most of them were shipped to during the years of indentured labour.

4.2.1 Arrival of Indians in Durban

Indians first arrived in Durban in 1860 as indentured labourers. Indentured labour was a system of bonded labour that was instituted following the end of slavery in British colonies. Under this system, the labourers signed agreements to work for a certain number of years that were specified by the employer (Desai and Vahed, 2010). The labourers were shipped to different areas of South Africa to work on various sugarcane plantations However, the majority of these labourers mainly worked in the coastal belt of Natal which contained the most sugar plantations in the country (Bagwandeen, 1989).
The contracts specified that the Indians could work for up to ten years (two five-year terms) and thereafter may choose to either continue working in the plantations, return to India or remain in South Africa and pursue other forms of work (Bagwandeen, 1989). After the end of the contracts, many Indians continued working on sugar plantations while others went into commercial farming as market gardeners or cane and fruit farmers (Bagwandeen, 1989; Desai and Vahed, 2010). The passenger Indians then came along to establish businesses to serve the needs of the Indian population already in the country. This group of Indians came into the country at their own expense. Durban received a larger influx of passenger Indians, in comparison to other cities, as they came to provide services for the indentured labourers (Konar, 1989).

4.2.2 Commercial development in Grey Street

Freedom from indenture allowed some Indian people to start their small-scale businesses which were mostly agricultural. Numerous Indian traders became successful by trading with the local African population in the remote areas while some were able to sell their products in the city. They sold items in small quantities and gave some items on credit, and their goods were often cheaper than their white counterpart (SAHO, 2011). The competition between the Indians and the whites, for trading space and customers, intensified. As a result of white agitation, Indians were confined to specific areas for trading; in the CBD this was the Grey Street complex (Moberly and Ward, 1999, p. 7). Indian businesses flourished in this area, and approximately 15000 people lived in this area up to the 1970s. Thereafter, the majority were forcefully displaced because of the Group Areas Act (1950) (Maharaj, 1997). Although Indians were increasingly appreciated as labourers, they were never welcomed as settlers and competitors in the business sector.
4.2.2 Anti-Indian Tirade

In the 19th century, the British colonial authorities developed strategies to attract Indians into indentured labour; however, this changed later on when they were constantly trying to find ways to get rid of them. Whites in Durban became fearful that the number of free and passenger Indians who had become traders and farmers were threatening their monopoly in trade and agriculture (Bagwandeen, 1989). Thus, began an anti-Indian campaign by whites. In 1885, the Wragg Commission was appointed to investigate the various complaints that the whites had against Indians. Commission acknowledged that the competition offered by Indians was legitimate and they contributed to economic development in Durban at multiple levels (Maharaj, 1992).

Failure of the Wragg Commission to indict Indians led to even stronger attempts from the whites. In the early 1890s, taxes were imposed on Indians who did not reindenture or return to India. Furthermore, restrictions on Indian trading licences and ownership and occupation of property were introduced (Maharaj, 1992). The Indians began to oppose and mobilise against these unfair restrictions and established the Natal Indian Congress (NIC) in 1894 for this purpose (Bagwandeen, 1989). The anti-Indian agitation continued, with escalating demands for restrictions on the ownership and occupation of land that the Indian access. The government responded with the Asiatic Enquiry Commission (1920), the Indian Penetration Commission (1940). The Pegging Act of 1943 as well as the Asiatic Land Tenure and Indian Representation Act (1946) were forerunners for the Group Areas Act (1950) and served to further implement restrictions on Indians’ land and property rights (Bagwandeen, 1989).

Apartheid started with the election of the Afrikaner National Government in 1948, which continued to carry out the process of spatial and functional containment of the Indian community (Rajah, 1981). The Population Registration Act of 1950 was responsible for the official classification of every individual into racial groups. The Group Areas Act (1950) had
a devastating impact on the Indian community in South Africa, and especially Durban (Maharaj, 1997).

4.2.3 The Group Areas Act
The Group Areas Act (GAA) was promulgated in 1950, and it applied essentially to the socio-spatial organisation of towns on a racial basis. The GAA was one of the most contentious legislation to ever be passed by the South African parliament. The injustices, human rights violations, and restrictions embedded in this legislation caused serious concern; so much so that the Indian government and UN tried to intervene but did not succeed in stopping the implementation of this act (Bagwandeewen, 1989). In terms of this law, the government had the power to restrict where members of different racial groups should live, trade and work. This was one of the key instruments used to reinforce the ideology of apartheid and to separate residential areas, educational services and other amenities for the different race groups (Kuper, et al. (cited in Rajah, 1981), 1958; Maharaj, 1992). Land that was made available to other races would often be small, unproductive, barren wastelands situated outside of the city and without civic amenities (Ariyan, 1999). In theory, anyone could own property, but in practice, whites would not only be allocated the bulk of land but could also lay claim to all the prime sites in and around Durban and the surrounding areas (Ariyan, 1999), and especially the Grey Street complex.

4.2.4 Impacts of the GAA on the Grey Street Complex
Indian communities across South Africa were harshly affected by the GAA. This was because the segregation and exclusion of the majority African population had long been entrenched by the Urban Areas Act in 1923 (Davenport, 1970). The effects of the GAA were felt significantly in Durban as the majority of the Indian population was located in this region, and there were also restrictions on their movements to other provinces (Horell, 1956). The most significant losses were incurred in terms of property and trading spaces.
Since the 1960s, the Grey Street complex experienced significantly low rates of development because of the uncertainties associated with the GAA (Rajah, 1981). This was because they were not sure of their future in the area. The GAA took away security of tenure, which was a crucial element for development. Furthermore, the Group Areas Act did not offer alternative accommodation or compensation to those who had to uproot their families and businesses.

Property owners, entrepreneurs, and residents lived in a limbo of uncertainty until the area was declared a trading only area in 1973 (Watts et al., 1971). In terms of Proclamation No. 106 of 1973 in the Government Gazette dated 27 April 1973, declared the Grey Street area of Durban to be an area for occupation and ownership by members of the Indian group in terms of Section 23 of the Group Areas Act 1966 (Chetty and Omar, 1983:2). Furthermore, according to Section 19(1) of the Act, all the buildings, land or premises in the Grey Street Area were declared to be used only for business purposes (Chetty and Omar, 1983:2).

The GAA took away security of tenure as well as opportunities for physical and economic growth in the Grey Street complex. Under this act, traders were required to obtain permits for any development and occupation of property. These permits were difficult to obtain because they were granted only on condition that no residential development will take place and that the premises on the ground floor will be rented out to Indian traders who had been displaced by the GAA outside the city centre. This possibly meant that they would not be able to afford to trade in the city and the property owners would lose income due to lack of suitable tenants (Watts et al., 1971).

Moreover, these permits could be withdrawn at any time, if, and, as the apartheid government saw fit. Permit holders had no security of tenure, and for this reason, bonds and loans were difficult to acquire from banks (Watts et al., 1971). This permit stood in the way of many Indian business owners’ development plans.
As stated previously, the main terms of the GAA stated that the Grey Street complex would only be used for trade and light industrial businesses. The Indian business sector reluctantly accepted these limited concessions because they feared that if they persisted in their agitation and opposition, they would lose the area (Natal Mercury, 1982). Their fear was justified because they had already lost residential areas namely; the Cato Manor, Riverside, Malvern, Queensburgh and Umbilo, which were zoned as white areas under the GAA. Therefore, their fear of losing the GSC was a rational one (Natal Mercury, 1982).

After the GSC was declared a trading only area, the majority of the Indians were forced to move to residential townships such as Chatsworth and Phoenix. Furthermore, the act required developers to rent out space to displaced small-time traders who had no central area trading experience; this was viewed as a form of economic discouragement (Watts et al., 1971). Any new high-rise building could not benefit from the high demand for residential space, as this was not allowed in the area as per the permit requirements of the GAA (Watts et al., 1971).

Between 1950 and 1975, an estimated 5058 Indian traders, in Durban, lost their trading licences because of the GAA (Watts et al. 1971). Majority of these traders were in the Grey Street complex. The business elite in the Indian community continued to agitate for the repeal of the residential restrictions in the GSC. Finally, in 1983 the ban on residential development in the Grey Street complex was lifted. (Natal Mercury, 1983). This was partly a strategy by the apartheid government to give credibility to the discredited tricameral parliament (Natal Mercury, 1983).

However, the Grey Street complex never fully recovered from the devastating impacts of the GAA. The Financial Mail on 22 June 1984, noted development taking place in the Grey Street complex after GAA restrictions were lifted. Although major developments were expected in the area, this did not materialise for several reasons. Many businesses that traditionally served the needs of the Indian community had relocated from the GSC to Chatsworth and Phoenix.
In the mid-1980s, wealthy Indians started purchasing property around Durban, including the beachfront as they were finally able to when restrictions of the GAA were gradually getting lifted (Daily News, 1981). Freedom of choice in buying property, which the GAA limited, allowed for the affluent Indian families in invest in property outside traditional Indian group areas, including the GSC. Implementation of the GAA marked the beginning of the slow stagnation and economic decline of the Grey Street complex. By the early 1980s, forced removals and migration had reduced the population of the Grey Street complex from 25,000 to 6,500 (Natal Mercury, 1983). The GAA was responsible for the stagnation and economic decline of the GSC, a trend which continued into the post-apartheid era.

4.2.5 Grey Street Complex Post-1994

By the early 2000s, the Grey Street complex was notably becoming a ghost town (Leader, 2001). This was a disappointing turn of events as the area was once a thriving business and residential complex. However, foreign migrants began to move into the area and exploit economic opportunities.

Grey Street complex is one of the areas in the CBD constantly mentioned as having its unique character and tensions. It is one of the parts of the CBD that have not seen large-scale transformation in the post-apartheid era; especially when compared to Albert Park, West and Smith Street (Report on Durban CBD, 2010). Although it is still seen by most as the Indian CBD, immigrants from within and outside of Africa have become regular occupants in the area (Report on Durban CBD, 2010).

Absentee landlords and slumlords are a prevalent feature in Grey Street in the post-apartheid era. These are landlords that are often never seen even though the tenants continue paying rent. Some of these landlords rent out warehouse buildings for more than one purpose; such as renting out buildings for both residential and commercial use (Report on Durban CBD, 2010).
Such buildings are often characterised by overcrowding, which is evident in the layout of businesses in the Grey Street complex (Report on Durban CBD, 2010).

There have been significant changes in Grey Street in the post-apartheid era, including street name changes, demographic, ethnic composition and nationality of traders and their economic activities. For example, Grey Street is now called Dr. Yusuf Dadoo, a leader in the anti-apartheid struggle. This is in accordance with the street name changes that took place in many South African cities since 1994.

In the democratic era, there has been an influx of foreigners into the country. The Grey Street complex was an easy place for foreigners to settle because most landlords in the area were desperate to lease out their spaces because of the declining interest in the CBD (Sunday Tribune, 2003).

4.3 Post-1994 changes in the Grey Street Complex

Several changes have occurred in the Grey Street complex since the end of the apartheid era. These are changes of a social, physical and economic nature. Analysing these changes was a vital part of this study in order to show the extent to which urban restructuring has taken place in the Durban CBD, with specific reference to the Grey Street complex.

4.3.1 Social Changes

The Grey Street complex was historically known as the Indian CBD. This is because it was the designated area where Indian business owners traded. This is also where the general Indian population went for shopping and other services. The demographic composition of the business owners and the customers in the area has changed. The Grey Street complex is no longer an exclusively Indian trading area. The customers, in the post-apartheid era, include many races and nationalities. However, there are still a few businesses that are owned by Indians and also a few Indian customers.
Thirty business owners were interviewed for this study. These were from the larger sample of business owners that moved into the Grey Street complex after 1994. The new business owners come from various countries within and outside of Africa, specifically Asia. Table 4.1 presents a breakdown of the countries of origin for the 30 business owners (respondents) that were interviewed. As shown in Table 4.1, majority of the new businesses, of the sample of 30, were from Somalia and Nigeria.

**Table 4.1: Countries of Origin of Respondents**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country of origin</th>
<th>Percentage (out of 30 respondents)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Somalia</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistani</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zimbabwe</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eretria</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congo</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Several of the business owners interviewed stated that the transition from apartheid to democracy in South Africa made it possible and easy for them to migrate into South Africa and start businesses. One of the key questions of this study was finding out what has led to the influx of migrant business owners. The reasons for settling in the GSC are summarised in table 4.2.
Table 4.2 Reasons for settling in the Grey Street Complex

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quote</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“I saw an opportunity to start a new life and so I came for it.”</td>
<td>(Nigerian Men’s Clothing Shop, November 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“There is a lot of unrest going on back in my home country. It is</td>
<td>(Pakistani Electronics Shop, November 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>not good for business.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I saw an opportunity in South Africa. Things are very bad</td>
<td>(Zimbabwean Hair Salon, November 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>financially in my home country (Zimbabwe).”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I left my country (Ethiopia) for political reasons not because I</td>
<td>(Afro Wholesalers, November 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>was after economic gain. But now I am self-employed because I cannot</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>find a job in the South African labour force.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Friends and family who came before me told me the place had lots</td>
<td>(Nigerian Hair Salon, November 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of opportunities for business.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“There are fewer opportunities for business back in my country, so</td>
<td>(Nigerian Perfume Shop, November 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I decided to try South Africa.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“The economy in my country crashed that’s why I decided to come</td>
<td>(Zimbabwean Hair Salon, November 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>here for new opportunities to make money so I can take care of my</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>family.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“There are better chances for my clothing business to succeed here</td>
<td>(Fresh Fashion Shop, November 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>because there is high demand.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is evident from Table 4.2 that there were common pull factors that attracted migrants to the GSC. Many migrants were pushed out of their home countries because of economic decline and political instability. They were attracted to South Africa because of the perceived
opportunities, where they were able to make a decent living and provide for their families and did not have to live in fear of their lives because of civil wars.

Before 1994, businesses in the GSC were owned by groups of Indian families. In the post-apartheid era, this has changed in the GSC with the influx of foreign migrants. Family ownership is common among the Chinese, Somalian and Pakistani business owners. However, other new business proprietors in the area were not working with their families and were either sole traders or in partnerships with friends from their home countries, and sometimes friends they have made in South Africa. Their local friends are loyal customers, especially hawkers who buy stock from them and with whom they have established business networks:

“I have built a strong business relationship with some of my customers, the hawkers buy in bulk and that is good for my business. I always encourage them to return by keeping my prices fair” (Afro Wholesalers, November, 2016).

“The ladies who work in hair salons always come and buy hair products from me because I make sure I give them a good deal. Having loyal customers is good for business” (Somalian Hair Product Wholesalers, November, 2016).

4.3.2 Physical Changes

In addition to the social changes, the physical configuration of the Grey Street complex has changed significantly. The end of the apartheid era marked the beginning of significant restructuring in South African urban spatial planning and development. In Durban, the inner city was divided into several restructuring zones (Housing Development Agency, 2013). A senior professional town planner was assigned to each section. The Grey Street complex was grouped with Warwick Junction as one restructuring zone (Masimula, 2017).

The physical makeup of the Grey Street complex has changed significantly. The buildings in the Grey Street complex mostly do not go above five floors; this is because when the area was being built, it was a low-density, and a lower income area (Rajah, 1981). Most buildings in the
area were neglected because of the uncertainty related to the Group Areas zoning, with little signs of renovation. The majority of the buildings that were residential buildings, during the apartheid era, are now used for both residential and commercial purposes. One respondent shared some information about the previous uses of one of the buildings in the area:

“The building across the road used to be a cinema, but now it’s used for all sorts of things ... When I first started renting this shop, there was a flat upstairs but now it’s another shop” (Afro Wholesalers, November 2016).

Plate 4.1 shows the building that the owners of Afro Wholesalers is referring to in the quote above. The building is now used for other commercial purposes. Khayalethu Wholesalers, which is on the ground floor of the building, specialises mainly in women’s clothing and shoes. The upper floors of the building were used for other, unknown, commercial activities.

**Plate 4.1: Building Previously Used as Cinema**

Several buildings in the area have been renovated. The building in Plate 4.2, on the right, was renovated about 3 years ago and is privately owned by a Portuguese family. The buildings in Plate 4.3 are also owned privately by South African Indians.
The ownership and leasing structures have changed in the GSC. In the early 1970s, Indians owned 95% of properties in the Grey Street complex, of which 39% was used for residential purposes. The area served an invaluable function in generating profits for further commercial development of the Indian elite (Watts, et al., 1971). Before the uncertainty relating to group areas zoning, the GSC contained some of the most affluent Indian businesses in South Africa. These included cinemas, leading restaurants, high-ranking hotels, clothing boutiques and a mosque that is regarded as the largest in the Southern hemisphere (Watts, et al., 1971).

However, in the post-apartheid era these ownership and occupation patterns have changed. All the respondents stated that they were renting the properties in which they operate their businesses. The majority of the respondents stated that they were renting their premises from South African private owners who are mostly Indian. A few respondents shared interesting stories about the ownership history of the buildings from which they operate:

“I am renting this small space from an Indian guy, he owns the whole building. I think there are 3 or 4 spaces upstairs that are used for residential purposes” (Eritrean Wholesale shop, July, 2018).
A significant addition to the physical layout of the Grey Street complex has been the regulation of informal trading stalls. The municipality has attempted to regulate small informal businesses in the post-apartheid era and has provided stalls for trading throughout the inner city, including the Grey Street complex. Durban’s informal economy stands out when compared to other big cities in South Africa as they have a separate department that oversees street trader management (Skinner, 2005). On a more important note, the Warwick Junction area, under which Grey Street falls, has been noted as the most successful at integrating informal traders into city plans and providing support for the poor (Skinner, 2005). This was further substantiated by Mr. Masimula’s (February 2017) comment that the stalls are added as a means to support the growth and expansion of the informal economy, an important means of survival for poor families.

Another new development is the rise of ‘corner shops’. These are shops usually found in small spaces between two big shops or at the front corner inside a bigger shop. This phenomenon was not common during the apartheid era. The activities in the corner shops were often unrelated to the main business types operating under the same roof. This was a common trend in the case of Pakistani owned cell phone and other small electronic repair shops. All of the Pakistani respondents interviewed occupied the corner part of the bigger shop. This is illustrated in Plates 4.3, 4.4, and 4.5. The respondents occupying these shops stated numerous reasons for choosing to operate in this manner:

“I find it easier to occupy and rent a small corner at the front of another shop since I am operating a small business. Cell phone repairing does not generate enough income for me to be able to rent a big shop” (Pakistani electronic shop, November 2016).

“Renting a corner space in a bigger shop makes it easy to get customers, most people will buy airtime and phone covers on their way out. I make money easier that way. I
cannot rent a big shop on my own because there is a lot of competition here” (Pakistani cellphone repair and airtime shop, November, 2016).

Plate 4.3: Cell Phone Repair Corner Shop Inside Another Shop

Plate 4.4: Corner Shop Selling Female Perfumes and Cigarettes
4.3.3 Economic Changes

There have also been economic changes in the Grey Street complex. This can be seen through looking at the type of businesses that are now found in the area. During the apartheid, the Grey Street complex comprised of traditional Indian businesses including jewellers, fabric traders, traditional Indian restaurants, tailors, grocery stores, homeware sellers and so forth. The older established businesses specialised in one product in their shops such as traditional Indian outfits for women.

The new businesses in the post-apartheid era show significant differences from the original Indian businesses of the Grey Street complex. Each business resembles the shop owners’ cultural background. There are major differences in the shops based on the place of origin of the owner. The majority of the respondents were from Somalia, Nigeria and Ethiopia, with the others from Pakistan, Eritrea, Zimbabwe, China and the DRC. The Somalian, Eritrean, and Ethiopian shops, for example, showed significant similarities in terms of layout, even if they sell different products.

Plate 4.6 shows the typical shop layout among the new Somalian, Ethiopian and Eritrean businesses. These layouts are chosen to showcase products in each shop for customers:
“I chose this layout to display each design so that customers can browse easily in the shop. I’m sure other people have copied it but it is not a problem” (Eritrean Wholesale shop, July, 2018).

“When I started my business, I saw other people that had set up their shops and just followed that style. The way I pack clothing items makes shopping easy for customers” (Fresh Fashion, July, 2018).

“Most of my customers are hawkers so I stack products in packs of 10 so that I can offer discounts when someone buys the whole pack. The layout makes unpacking stock easy for me” (Afro Wholesaler, July, 2018).

“This layout helps me display all my products easily. I have to make the most out of this small space so customers can see clearly what I am selling” (Four Seasons Wholesalers, July, 2018).

Plate 4.6: Typical Layout in New Shops

4.4 Products and Services Provided by the New Businesses

The new businesses in the Grey Street complex specialise in various products and services; often these would be in one shop. Clothing and shoes (male and female) are among the most
common type of product in which many of the new business specialise. Other types of products include food, male and female cosmetics, cell phones and cell phone accessories as well as homeware. Clothing and shoe trading are more common among the Somalian, Eritrean, and Ethiopian shops.

The services provided by the new businesses in the Grey Street complex include hair salons, cell phone/ electronic repairs, restaurants, and internet cafes. Service-based shops are not as numerous as the product-based businesses among the new businesses. A trend worth noting is how the products and services provided by the new businesses are exceptionally affordable. Plates 4.7 to 4.14 show the various products and services provided by the new businesses in the Grey Street complex.

**Plate 4.7: Blanket Shop Selling Other Products as well**

![Blanket Shop Selling Other Products as well](image)

The cash and carry shops or other food wholesale shops usually provide affordable bulk products, especially for traders in the informal sector. This is also a demonstration of the mixed product culture that exists amongst the new businesses. The Blanket City shop, for example, sells not only blankets but also winter coats, pots, etc.
Plate 4.8: Cash and Carry Shops Inside

Plate 4.9: Cash and Carry Shops Inside

Plate 4.10: Cash and Carry Shops Inside
Plate 4.11: Shops Selling Basic Home Supplies

Plate 4.12: Various Products Sold at the Corner of a Clothing Shop
4.5 Increase of the Informal Economy

The Grey Street complex has seen a significant increase in the number of informal traders. Apart from the municipality installed trading stalls, there are also people who trade on the sidewalks in the area without any formal shelter or permit. This is related to the high level of unemployment, and the informal sector is an important survival strategy. The products sold by the informal traders are also in the same range as those that are sold by the formal businesses. Mr. Masimula (eThekwini senior professional planner) provided the following reason for the addition of the informal trading stalls in the Grey Street complex:
“The addition of informal trade stalls is done when there is a pressing need to provide traders with good trading spaces. We have a challenge in the city in that there are more informal traders than the spaces provided. The eThekwini Municipality has taken a view that on certain roads in the CBD informal trading is not allowed, for example, around the ICC (International Convention Centre), Bram Fischer Street, near the City Hall etc. When traders settle on these precincts metro police gives them notices to vacate the spaces and if this fails then they will confiscate the goods” (Mr. T Masimula, March, 2018).

Plate 4.15: Informal Traders’ Products

4.6 The Impacts of the Changes

The changes that have occurred in the GSC, post 1994, have had positive and negative impacts in the area. The area has become very dynamic in terms of demographic composition. This has attracted more businesses into the area, as well as customers. The Grey Street complex has
been described as an illustration of an aspiring rainbow nation (Report on Durban CBD, 2010), and reflected a ‘mini Africa’:

“This area has become a mini Africa. Shop owners here are from all over Africa. It is wonderful to see. We all get along and look out for each other” (Afro Wholesalers, November, 2016).

“It is difficult being away from home but there are fellow countrymen in this area, and we support each other” (Zimbabwean Hair Salon, November, 2016).

While people of various social classes shop in the GSC, the area caters largely for low-income groups, and this was acknowledged by the formal traders:

“My customers are obviously not upper-class people; there is a difference in customers between here and the main CBD” (Afro Wholesalers, November, 2016).

“My business helps a lot of poor people because they can buy items at very low prices, and sometimes customers can lay buy” (Four Seasons Wholesalers, November, 2016).

“I know that there are people who live in some of the rooms upstairs, many buildings are mixed like that in this area” (Four Seasons Wholesalers, November, 2016).

The changes in the Grey Street complex have also had negative impacts. A major concern was that the rates for utility services in the area were perceived to be unreasonably high. There were complaints that the rates were not commensurate with the municipal services provided in the GSC. Respondents complained that the municipal officials do not attend to the problems in the Grey Street area, especially in terms of infrastructure provision and maintenance:

“We have great plans for how this area can be improved to better suit our needs, but the problem is that the concerns we raised do not seem to be taken into consideration for the development of this area” (Afro Wholesalers, November 2016).
“Every time we raise complaints, we are told it will be dealt with, yet we see no changes taking place. We have asked for an improvement in cleaning services several times, but city officials seem to be ignoring them” (Evermore Cash and Carry, November 2016).

“When we complain about buildings being old and dirty, we are always told it’s up to the building owners to sort that out. But environmental health inspectors come and go every once in a while, and our complaints are not passed on to the owners” (Zimbabwean Hair Salon, November 2016).

Several respondents interviewed complained about the overcrowded buildings in which they have to operate. The landlords were not investing in upgrading or renovating the buildings in the area. It was evident that business owners sub-letting their premises in order to reduce the costs of business overheads, especially rent. Many businessmen complained about the high rentals in the GSC:

“The rent has gone up from R3000 to R10000 ... The rent is too high for such a poorly managed area” (Afro Wholesalers, November 2016).

“We are being charged large amounts of rent, but the buildings we use are not maintained. It is unfair. I am renting a corner of a shop, but I still struggle to make ends meet from time to time” (Pakistani Electronics shop, November 2016).

The increasing crime rate in the Grey Street complex was another problem. This is largely because there are now more businesses (formal and informal) in the area. As a result, the number of customers has increased. This has created more targets for the criminals in the area:

“There is a lot of crime in this area. There are women who come to the shops wearing tights, and they stuff clothes under those garments” (Four Seasons Wholesalers, November 2016).
“I have been a victim of theft more than once in this area. There are people who come into the shops in groups and distract you so they can steal” (Afro Wholesalers, November 2016).

“There is too much crime in this area. The police do not listen to us when we complain about it” (Fresh Fashion, November 2016).

While South Africa is generally known for its high crime rates, an article by IOL (2018) stated that the Durban CBD is the most unsafe of places in Durban (IOL, 2018). Whoonga addicts are listed as one of the biggest causes for the high crime rates in the CBD (IOL, 2018). There is also a significant lack of resources (police officers) and this makes it more difficult to fight crime in the CBD as it is generally a high populated and busy place (IOL, 2018).

Xenophobic incidents increase every year as more foreign nationals from outside South Africa settle in the country. The local business owners have continuously expressed their anger towards the influx of the foreigners, as they call them, in the Grey Street complex (Sewchurran, 2003). The new business owners in the area have also raised concerns about the xenophobic attacks, often live in fear of losing their lives and businesses:

“I am always scared that I will be attacked in my shop by the locals. They hate us” (Afro Wholesalers, November 2016).

“We live in fear in this area. The locals can be very violent” (Fresh Fashion, November 2016).

“Even some of my customers who are locals do not treat me with respect because I am a foreigner. They are always hostile” (Ethiopian Shoes and Curtains Shop, November 2016).

Furthermore, refuse and waste management is lacking in the area. There are numerous complaints from the business owners in the area about poor refuse removal services and waste management. This results in large amounts of refuse and litter in the area:
“This area is always dirty. It is too busy” (Chinese stationary shop, November 2016).

“This place is always dirty. It makes our businesses unattractive. That’s why we can only attract the lower income class” (Nigerian Hair salon, November 2016).

It is evident from Plate 4.16 that there is a lot of garbage that is left lying around in the area. It is also evident that some of the garbage is next to the shops and informal traders’ stalls, which justifies the respondents’ complaints.

**Figure 4.16: Garbage and poor sanitation in the area**

With the increase of new businesses in the Grey Street complex, there has also been an increase in competition. This competition is between the old businesses, the new business, and informal traders in the area:
“We all have similar businesses here, so there is very high competition” (Riceberg Cash and Carry, November 2016).

“Customers go for the cheapest product, so we sell the cheapest to stay above the competition. I have a lot of competition in this area. My business struggles” (Zimbabwean Hair Salon, November 2016).

There is keen competition because the different businesses in the area often sell similar products and customers go for the cheapest product. The new businesses have had to come up with ways to mitigate the impacts of the competition. One strategy was to diversify rather than depend on one product or economic activity:

“I sell a variety of products; hair extension for women, perfume and other hair products. I know women love these things, so it’s easy to make money by selling these products” (Zimbabwean Hair Salon, November 2016).

“I have a hair salon but also sell hair products, and I rent out the front corner of the shop to another business. A gold coin exchange business” (Nigerian Hair Salon (Gold exchange), November 2016).

“It’s not every day that people want to do their hair, so that’s why I sell the hair products coz they are cheaper, and they help me get by” (Zimbabwean Hair Salon, November 2016).

“I sell a variety of goods; men’s jeans and shoes. I am new to this business but it seems to be going well so far. I always have sales to attract more customers and fight competition” (Nigerian Men’s clothing shop, November 2016).

Another strategy was to improve the quality of the service offered:

“There is lots of competition, and all I can do is give customers good customer service to make sure that I have regular customers and that the competition does not affect me that much” (Afro Wholesalers, November 2016).
A common complaint was harassment by the Metro police for no apparent reason or for ‘petty offences’ such as playing the music too loud or having an extra mannequin outside the shop:

“The police often come here to start trouble as much as we try to stay out of trouble. Sometimes they complain that I play music in the shop too loud” (Nigerian Men’s Clothing shop, November 2016).

“Sometimes when you add a mannequin outside your shop the police come and ask you to put it back inside. There are no known regulations for such things, but the police make a noise about it anyway” (Four Seasons Wholesalers, November 2016).

There was a suggestion that such police harassment could be attributed to attempts to solicit bribes: “I have not personally experienced being bullied by the cops, but I have heard numerous complaints from other shop owners. I imagine someone without official papers for being in the country can easily be bullied into paying a bribe …” (Eritrean Hair Wholesalers, July 2018).

4.7 Proposals to respond to Challenges in the Grey Street Complex

At a personal level, some traders have cut down on personal luxuries or unnecessary spending and engaging in mixed trading in response to economic challenges and competition. This explains why you now find shoes and stationery in the same shop in the Grey Street complex; some have mixed food and clothing items as well. Some shop owners have had to cut down on spending money on certain luxuries such as eating out and going to home countries too often:

“With so much competition in this area, profits have changed. We have had to cut down on expenses and certain luxuries to survive” (4 Seasons Wholesalers, November 2016).

“I keep a steady lifestyle always. I cannot overspend simply because I have made more profit than the last month” (Evermore Cash and Carry, November 2016).

There are also suggestions to reduce crime in the GSC. The respondents were committed to presenting a united front amongst the various businesses to fight crime in the area:
“We can come together as businessmen in this area and develop our own crime fighting unit. Unity helps fight crime in this area but no to a large extent; we help each other in catching thieves during the day” (Afro Wholesalers, November 2016).

“When I see someone stealing, I will shout out for others to hear so they can be caught. The local language for this is ‘Vimba’; which means block the person. This alerts everyone in the streets of the thief” (Evermore Cash and Carry, November 2016)

“We do our best to help each other in fighting crime because we are a community here. But we still need some stronger intervention from the police” (Zimbabwean Hair salon, November 2016).

A significant number of the respondents have considered relocating out of the city centre to avoid some of the problems and challenges experienced in the GSC. However, it was impossible for most, as the required finances to facilitate the relocation are not readily available:

“If I could move out of this area it would be to Joburg because I know there will be more customers there. But at the moment I cannot afford to fund the relocation.” (Evermore Cash and Carry, November 2016).

“If my business picks up financially, I would move to another town or maybe even one of the townships in Durban” (Nigerian Men’s clothing shop, November 2016)

Some of the respondents suggested that the municipality should to allow them to trade until after 18h00, beyond their normal business hours. This would be very beneficial for their businesses, especially during the festive season since people spend more. The inability to open until late affects their profits because even some of their loyal customers resort to doing their shopping in other places:

“We have to be provided with facilities to be able to open until late, especially during festive seasons’ the area also needs more parking spaces. Our loyal customers end up
An important objective of this study was to understand the impact central and local government policies in the GSC. The primary data for this aspect of the research was the in-depth interviews conducted with the senior professional planner in charge of the Grey Street complex, Mr. Themba Masimula, and the manager of the iTrump programme, Mr. Hoosain Moolla. These interviews provided a clearer insight on how government policies have influenced the urban restructuring of the Grey Street complex in the post-apartheid era.

As discussed in chapter 2, the eThekwini municipality has devised and implemented numerous strategies to respond to urban restructuring. Some of the plans have been successful while others have required revision to adapt to rapidly changing conditions. Mr. Masimula highlighted the reasoning behind the policies being continually revised:

“The city planning department continues to do its best to develop the city. Unfortunately, there is no one plan that can work for everything, that is why we have to keep changing polices. We also want to see an equally developed city.” (Mr. T Masimula, February 2017).

The eThekwini municipality has also introduced a strategy called Area Based Management (ABM), which has several focus areas around the municipality. This was developed to address the numerous developmental challenges that are being faced within the municipality (eThekwini Municipality online, 2016). The iTrump, which stands for Inner City Thekwini Regeneration and Urban Management Programme, was then established under the ABM in 2006 as a means to regenerate the inner city (eThekwini Municipality online, 2016). The programme has six key outcomes which are: increasing economic activity, reducing poverty and social isolation, making the inner city more viable, effective and sustainable urban
management, improving safety and security and developing institutional capacity (eThekwini Municipality online, 2016).

The Grey Street complex falls under the same restructuring zone as the Warwick Junction. This restructuring zone is currently managed by Mr. Themba Masimula, Mr. Hossain Molla, the manager of the iTrump programme was also interviewed. Both the key informants shared pertinent information about the social, physical and economic state of the Grey Street complex, and were optimistic about the changes introduced:

“Socially, I would give Durban a 7 out of 10. We were the first city to have an informal traders policy, every informal trader in the city has a stake and we have tried to find space for them in the inner city. Around Grey Street there are lots of traders. We try to accommodate everyone as part of our vision as a caring city” (Mr. T Masimula, February, 2017).

“There are a lot of people using the city and we are trying to accommodate everyone, ensuring that we welcome all traders, South Africans, non-South Africans, informal traders. Unemployment is so high, that’s why we have a big informal trading demand. The social space and physical space does not cater for the people very well. There is no balance” (Mr. H Moolla, February 2017).

It is evident that the social problems in the inner city, specifically the GSC, are in fact on the municipalities’ radar and attempts are being made to eliminate the problems. The municipal officials are aware of the the physical development challenges experienced in the GSC:

“I would rate the physical environment as a 5 out of 10; it needs improvement. We would love for it to look the same as other parts of the city. There are differences in maintenance and the physical infrastructure, as you move towards Grey Street it plummets. The physical environment needs to match the number of traders because
there are so many; the area needs more ablution blocks, trading shelters and so forth” (Mr. T Masimula, February 2017).

“Yes, historically the Grey Street complex (now known as the Dr. Yusuf Dadoo complex) has been part of apartheid development. It is a public space that we need to improve, but property owners also need to take responsibility for their property. The buildings are very old in the Grey Street complex. That needs by-laws to make sure that the owners of the buildings comply and upgrade their premises” (Mr. H Moolla, February 2017).

In terms of physical development, the municipal officials acknowledged that the area was in decline. Moreover, they stated that some of these issues, like the poorly maintained buildings, had to be addressed by the property owners. Residential and property investment, especially renovation and repairs were lacking. The municipality would like to see the area live up to its full development potential. In terms of economic viability, the GSC was successful with potential for more growth, especially catering for the poor and working class.

“Economically, I consider the Grey Street complex to be a lower-class area, stretching on to Warwick Junction. Look at the quality of the residential buildings, stores, parks, I would give it a 5 out of 10. It’s not okay, it’s vibrant ... but the environment is not as good as we would want it to be. There is a lot of congestion” (Mr. T Masimula, February 2017).

According to Mr. Moolla, Durban’s location as a port city and its connections with the hinterland, provides better opportunities for economic growth, compared to other cities in South Africa. However, there should be strategies in place to deal with incidents of xenophobia which can discourage economic growth in the area:

“Economically we are growing, there is opportunity, and we have to make sure that the people benefit and that we mitigate the tension that arises between the South Africans
and immigrants. Durban is an entry point to Africa, there will always be people coming into the city” (Mr. H Moolla, February 2017).

Mr. Masimula stated that the Grey Street complex has benefited significantly from urban restructuring policies. The planning department has continuously improved the physical environment of the area. Thus promoting social and economic development. Integration remains a big part of the urban restructuring process plans, and the municipality is gradually linking the Grey Street complex with other parts of the CBD:

“In the CBD urban restructuring plans have always been done but after 1994 greater effort was made to make the city accessible to those that were excluded in participating in the economy. After 1994, the city has been pushing for more integration between communities residing in the different precincts in the CBD. This has been done through pedestrian routes created to link the CBD with Warwick Avenue. The Grey Street Complex has benefited from Municipal interventions new stalls for informal traders, new pavements, cleaning up the area more frequently, beefing up safety and security and installing new street lighting” (Mr. T Masimula, March 2018).

There was also an acknowledgement that some parts of the GSC had been neglected:

The city has been divided into 6 restructuring zones and the Grey Street complex falls within zone 1 and 2 ... restructuring plans are currently focused on Warwick junction and less on Grey Street. These plans include things such as plans to transform the abandoned buildings into decent accommodation for students and other city visitors.” (Mr. T Masimula, February 2017)

4.8.1 Challenges in Inner City Urban Restructuring

The municipality faces several challenges in their aim to restructure the inner-city. The rate of the development was uneven across the city plans for inner city renewal were being continuously revised. These challenges were linked to the legacies of apartheid spatial planning which persist and were still visible:
“Apartheid still has an impact in the development of the city. The level of services has always been higher on West Street (former white zone) than in the Grey Street part. That is why the area will always appear to be behind when it comes to development ...If you compare the Grey Street complex to other parts of the city you must remember that other parts of the city were and still are predominantly white-owned because of the apartheid planning and there are more informal traders on Grey Street” (Mr. H Moolla, February 2017).

An important academic concern was to understand how the eThekwini Municipality develops policies for urban restructuring, and from where they draw their ideas. Senior municipal bureaucrats travelled to several European countries searching for ideas for the development of the inner city (Mr. T Masimula, February 2017). The main reason for visiting European cities is to get a global perspective on urban development, which can then be incorporated into local plans for inner-city development. Locally, they have visited Johannesburg and Cape Town to broaden their knowledge on developing a busy, yet efficient city:

“Locally we have visited both the city of Joburg and Cape Town to draw lessons which were closer to the city of Durban. European cities were used in that they have been able to perfect public transport within their cities and across the territorial boundaries. Most of these cities are highly populated but still function efficiently. Whenever intervening in challenges facing the city one must think globally and act local. Knowledge gain from overseas combined with local knowledge is the best solution to the problems facing our city” (Mr. T Masimula, March 2018).

Currently, the municipality is devising new strategies for restructuring the inner city. This is called the Local Area Plan (LAP) which focuses more on the integrated development of the city. The focus of LAP was on connectivity, walkability, realising potential and integration. The inner-city LAP connects with the National Development Plan (NDP) and the eThekwini
Municipality’s iTrump project. The goal is to enhance the inner-city economy of Durban and to direct and guide development to attract investment (LAP Draft, 2016). In the GSC these plans are intended to tackle several issues such as property development, crime, and poor municipal services in the area. The intention was to transform the inner city so that it benefits all citizens. The GSC is one of the main entrance points to the CBD, and Mr. Masimula has repeatedly stressed the need for this area to be as well developed as other parts of the CBD:

“The condition of the environment and infrastructure needs to change in the Grey Street area. It’s one of the entrance points to the CBD, and it must be of the same quality as the other parts of the city ... The urban poor are mostly found in Grey Street, so we want to increase social facilities in that area” (Mr. T Masimula, February, 2017).

Several challenges have been identified in the implementation of the LAP in Durban. There were difficulties in establishing accurate population and residential demands, partly because the nature of demand in the inner city was very dynamic (LAP Draft, 2016). Also, experience in planning has shown that cost constraints can make financial feasibility, for housing, difficult to achieve (LAP Draft, 2016). The key informants also shared some of the challenges that they encounter in the process of urban restructuring, especially lack of interdepartmental cooperation:

“Very often internal departments do not understand the visions of the planners who are forced to work with limited budgets. There is a failure to understand that investment in infrastructure and technology needs to increase to make a city environment of good quality” (Mr. T Masimula, February, 2017).

There was also some resistance from local inhabitants who believe that rents and property rates will increase as a result of the physical improvements in the GSC:

“The communities can also be a challenge, always worried about the rent and rates increasing, and so they turn out to be against the improvement. They do not share the
long-term vision of the improvements proposed. They worry about not being able to trade through the construction period ... Public participation is difficult” (Mr H Moolla, February, 2017).

The researcher observed that although there are numerous plans for the development of the inner city, the Grey Street complex does not seem to be included specifically in many of the plans. However, Mr. Masimula added information to the study regarding the applicability of the LAP in the Grey Street complex. The outlines goal appears to be in line with the original goal of urban restructuring; which is creating a well-integrated and compact city, with a focus on

“Connectivity, walkability, realising potential and urban integration. More effort will be put into creating walkable streets and improving the pavements in this vicinity. Safety and security are also at the centre of the strategy to improve service levels in this area with more security personnel being deployed and lighting being improved. Informal trading will be re-arranged so that the pavements are not blocked for pedestrian movements.” (Mr. T Masimula, March 2018).

4.9 Conclusion

A historical review of the GSC revealed that it was historically associated with Indian traders and indentured customers in Durban. The colonial and apartheid government authorities enacted several laws and commissions in attempts to stop the expansion of Indian economic activities. The Grey Street area was originally for white traders. However, with the rapid increase of Indian traders in the CBD the GSC was informally designated as an Indian CBD. There were several attempts to contain and restrict the growth and expansion of Indian commercial enterprises which were consolidated in the GAA. As a result of the uncertainty relating to zoning, Indian traders in the GSC operated in limbo until the area was officially declared a trading only area for that group in April 1973. However, the uncertainty over race
zoning over two decades led to urban blight in the GSC as Indian business and property owners were reluctant to invest in the area. The GAA led to many losses of property and business for Indians from the Grey Street area and underdevelopment which is still present in the post-apartheid era. Very few original Indian businesses remain in the area, and many had moved to townships like Chatsworth and Phoenix. The findings of this study revealed that the GSC had experienced significant social, physical and economic transformation in the post-apartheid era. However, overall capital investment in the area still appears to be stagnant, and urban blight is visible across the GSC. With a few exceptions, buildings in the area show severe wear and tear but continue to be occupied for commercial and residential purposes. The informal sector has expanded significantly in the GSC, with municipality approved trading stalls being allocated on pavements. Another new physical feature in the area is the small corner shops found as either stand-alone businesses or inside bigger shops. This is evidence of landlords trying to maximise profits by dividing buildings, as well as tenants sub-letting to subsidise high rents.

The demographic composition of the area has become more diverse in the post-apartheid era. The new shop owners come from various countries in Africa, Asia, and the Middle East, whereas before it primarily limited to Indian origin. A wider range of products and services are now offered in the area, and this can be attributed largely to the new businesses that cater for a more diverse population in terms of race and ethnicity.

Although changes in the GSC have led to both negative and positive impacts, the evidence suggests that the former outweigh the latter. The commercial and demographic diversity has opened economic opportunities for many foreign migrants, who unfortunately continue to face threats of xenophobic violence. A much wider range of customers are attracted to the area as the extended range of services and products for low income groups. There were numerous complaints from shop owners about overcrowding, crime and inadequate maintenance in the area. Senior municipal officials acknowledged that these problems required attention.
The influence of the government’s policies on the urban restructuring of the GSC has been minimal. However, there appears to be some optimism for the future for the area as the municipality is working on new plans to develop the area.
Chapter Five: Evaluation, Recommendation and Conclusion

5.1 Introduction

The history of the Grey Street complex is one of oppression and conflict. It began with the arrival of Indian traders from Gujarat (Bagwandeen, 1989). The local white elite the economic competition from this group demanded that their expansion is restricted, and they were spatially confined to the GSC (Maharaj, 1992). This affected the Indian population in terms of property development and other commercial ventures (Watts et al., 1971). In the post-apartheid era, the GSC shows numerous changes in its social, physical and economic composition.

The aim of this study was to investigate the social, physical and economic restructuring that has occurred in the Durban CBD, with specific reference to the GSC. This study revealed that the Group Areas Act played a major role in the development of the Grey Street complex. Its implementation negatively affected the growth of the area and increased conflict between the Indian and white community. From as early as the 1960s the area showed signs of becoming a ghetto, and this could be attributed to the GAA. Even in the post-apartheid era, the GSC is still far behind in terms of physical and economic development. Although the social composition and economic activities have changed in the area, there is still massive renovation and infrastructure upgrades required for the area to reach its full economic potential.

This chapter presents the overall evaluation, recommendations, and conclusion of this study. It discusses the history of the GSC while shedding light on the influence of apartheid planning on the area. Several changes are identified in the post-apartheid era as well as the associated reasons. Critical urban theory and evolution theory were used to conceptualise this study. This chapter also analyses the role of the government in the post-apartheid development of the GSC and the future plans for the area.

5.2 Evaluation

The objectives of this study were to:
• Review the historical development of the Grey Street area and its changing fortunes.
• Identify the social, physical and economic changes in Grey Street since 1994.
• Explain the influence of these changes.
• Assess the influence of government policies on restructuring in Grey Street since 1994.

5.3 Historical Review of the Grey Street Complex and its Changing Fortunes

5.3.1 The Free Indian

Indentured labourer contracts stated that after working for up to ten years, the labourer would then have the freedom to decide what they would next do with their lives. They could continue working in the plantations, or stay in South Africa and work for themselves or they could go back to India. Many Indian labourers gained their freedom only to realise the options thereafter were not as previously stated. In 1885, a 3-Pound tax was implemented on those who did not return to India or re-indenture after their contracts were finished. This was done as a means to maintain cheap Indian labour since this was the only reason they were brought to Durban (SAHO, 2011). However, most chose to stay, and they are the roots of the South African Indian population. After gaining freedom from indentured labour, many Indians rented land to grow fruits and vegetables for local markets and others became entrepreneurs and opened small stores (SAHO, 2011).

Passenger Indians arrived and also contributed to the growth of the economy in Durban. Whites believed that their commercial interests were threatened as they competed for trading space and customers with the Indians. This study revealed that Indian businesses were allocated to the GSC because the white government wanted to separate Indian and white business interests, and the GAA was used for this purpose.

5.3.2 Impacts of the Group Areas Act

The GAA was implemented in 1950, and this Act posed many restrictions on Indian businesses in the CBD. Compliance with the terms and conditions of the Act crippled the growth of the
Indian enterprises. Under this act, ownership and occupation of property was now to be administered according to race. This allowed whites first choice when it came to ownership and occupation of land. This study revealed that the Indian community lost a significant amount of land and capital due to the implementation of the GAA, which marked the beginning of the slow stagnation and economic decline of the Grey Street complex. Forced removals reduced the population of the area from 25 000 to 6500 (The Natal Mercury, 1983). Restrictions in terms of the GAA were lifted in 1983 in the GSC. However, this legislation had strangled opportunities for massive growth in this area.

In the early 2000s, writers noted that it was becoming more of a ghetto or a slum instead of the predicted well developed trading area. The area may not be referred to as a ghetto formally. However, the observed reality shows an area that is overcrowded and underdeveloped. Although many businesses in the area are still Indian owned, there have been far too many businesses shutting down and relocating, both before and after the apartheid era.

In the post-apartheid era, the Grey Street complex shows many changes socially, physically and economically. An area that was once the pride of the Indian community has now become the ghetto of the inner city of eThekwini. This study revealed that the Grey Street complex is deteriorating.

5.4 Changes in the Grey Street Complex Since 1994
5.4.1 Social Changes

Since the dawn of democracy, the business owner demographic composition in the Grey Street complex has changed, as well as the customers. The peaceful transition from apartheid to democracy in South Africa was identified as the main reason for choosing to relocate to South Africa by many of the respondents that were interviewed. Migration is stated by Thorns (2002) as one of the significant impacts of urban restructuring in cities around the world, and the arrival of people from other countries in South Africa validates this statement. Before 1994, there was a significant number of immigrants in South Africa, but the numbers declined as the
apartheid government implemented laws and policies to restrict free movement around the country as well as into the country (Crush et al., 2005). The end of the apartheid era, a system which was designed to control movement and exclude outsiders, produced new opportunities for internal and cross border migration (Crush et al., 2005). Since 1994, there has been a major influx of immigrants into South African cities, especially in Johannesburg and in Durban. The urban restructuring of South African cities began shortly after the end of the apartheid era. This meant major changes in urban development policy and positive growth; economically, socially and physically. The inflow of immigrants also increased. Durban has received a significant amount of both legal, and illegal immigrants and the numbers continue to increase to date. Durban is South Africa’s third largest city, and this has attracted both skilled and unskilled migrants (Maharaj and Moodley, 2000). Certain trends that can be identified in the migration flow towards the Durban inner city. During the apartheid era, migrants were mainly from the SADC region. However, in the post-apartheid era, people are coming from all over Africa, and even outside of Africa such as Asia (Maharaj and Moodley, 2000).

Poverty, violent conflict and political oppression was repeatedly mentioned by respondents as one of the main reasons for leaving their home countries. Such factors have been noted in research as major contributors to migration in Africa (UN Economic Commission for Africa, 2017). Business opportunities also influenced migrants’ decisions largely when it came to choosing the destination country (UN Economic Commission for Africa, 2017). Information gathered from respondents substantiates this statement as they mentioned that they chose South Africa because they saw there was a lot of potential for business.

Business ownership trends have also changed in the post-apartheid era. Most of the new businesses are owned by individuals and not families as it was with the original Indian enterprises in the Grey Street complex. The majority of the new business owners come from countries such as Nigeria, Somalia, Eretria, Ethiopia and China.
5.4.2 Economic Changes

Urban restructuring encompasses a change in the economic geography of a city. The economic component of the city is often transformed by changes in the product and service sectors (Schafran, 2018). This is true in the case of the GSC. This study revealed that the new businesses in the GSC provide a wider range of products and services and these are often mixed in one shop. Similarities in the new shops were identified, and these are based on the country of origin of the business owner. This has been a largely positive influence in the GSC as there are more and more people who require services and products at the prices that these shops are able to provide.

However, although there has been economic restructuring in the area, there is still a significant lack of development in the area, and it is not well integrated into the city as a whole. The informal economy has increased rapidly in the area. These include people trading on the pavements and those that trade under the municipality provided stalls. The increase of the informal economy in the area has notably created more competition. The formal businesses have to compete for customers with informal traders. Pedestrians in the area also have to compete for space with the informal traders as some of them take up space that is not officially designated for informal trading. Based on the results, it is clear that there is more space required for informal traders. Additionally, the town planner assigned to the area noted that space is one of the main challenges they are facing in city planning, especially regarding space in the inner city.

Although some respondents stated that they make decent profits, the overall economic state of the area is declining. Perhaps what further exacerbates the economic stagnation and decline in the area is the keen competition in the area. The products and services offered in the post-apartheid era are diverse, but too many shops sell similar if not the same things. They also have to compete with informal enterprises as it is a huge part of the area.
Similarly, in India, urban restructuring has been accompanied by significant changes in the economy of its cities. Various businesses have been emerging since the beginning of urban restructuring in the 90s, and this has resulted in a growth of products and services, increased competition between local businesses and rapid economic growth (Gavsker, 2011). However, the rapid economic growth is not necessarily positive as it has also led to a growing disparity of poverty for urban dwellers (Gavsker, 2011).

### 5.4.3 Physical Changes

Physical changes form a significant part of urban restructuring (Bagguley et al., 1990), although these are meant to be positive changes. The buildings have aged significantly in the area. The area has lost its aesthetic appeal. It is safe to say that, based on the state of the roads and buildings in the area, the physical component of urban restructuring has failed the Grey Street complex. Bagguley et al. (1990) stated that physical restructuring can be identified by examining the architecture of the city, such as infrastructural development and transportation. Since the end of the apartheid era, these aspects of the GSC have declined instead of being improved. The rapid development of cities under the influence of urban restructuring has proven to result in further division of social and economic groups in cities (Soja, 1994).

This study revealed that majority of the buildings are used mostly for commercial purposes with a few buildings still used for both commercial and residential purposes. Some buildings are now used for different purposes than they were 20 years ago. Building ownership trends have also changed notably in the post-apartheid era. Most of the new business owners are renting shops from Indian businessmen who had previously traded in the Grey Street complex. A new trend has also risen in the post-apartheid era; there are several corner shops in the area. These exist as a means to survive the ever-increasing rent and utility bills in the GSC.

Overall, the physical state, including infrastructure, of the GSC appeared to be in decline. There has been little to no improvement in the buildings in the area. The roads also need maintenance.
Clean up services are also poor in the area as garbage spends days out on the streets before being collected by the municipality.

5.5 The Impacts of the Changes in the Grey Street Complex

Soja (2009) stated that there are several impacts of urban restructuring in cities. The physical, social and economic changes that have occurred in the GSC have had several negative and positive influences. However, the negative impacts have been far greater compared to the positive effects.

5.5.1 Positive Impacts

This study revealed that the GSC had experienced a few positive impacts due to post-1994 changes. With more and more businesses opening in the area, there is more provision for the urban poor. This also provides continued revenue to the owners of the buildings in the area. Based on the information gathered from the respondents, it is clear, although unfortunate, that urban restructuring has not had significant positive impacts in the GSC. According to Todes (2008), integration and compaction were the two pillars guiding the process of urban restructuring; this has not been achieved in the inner city of Durban since there are areas like the Grey Street complex that are still not integrated into the inner city.

5.5.2 Negative Impacts

Increasing social and economic division is an apparent part of urban restructuring (Sykora, 1994). This study showed that there have also been numerous negative impacts on the area resulting from urban restructuring. The buildings are overcrowded and crime has increased in the area. The customers and shop owners note that they are constantly falling victim to acts of crime. The arrival of new businesses has also strengthened xenophobic behaviour in the area. Soja (2009) stated that in most cases urban restructuring has resulted in the intensification of economic inequalities as well as unfavourable social and political conditions in an urban
setting. This is somewhat true when one looks at the state of development of the GSC as well as the negative impacts the process has had on the area.

In the age of urban restructuring, numerous challenges have arisen along the way. Uneven spatial development has been emerging many cities undergoing urban restructuring (Brenner and Schmid, 2015). This is accompanied by economic stagnation and marginalisation of some parts of cities (Brenner and Schmid, 2015). Patel (2004) also stated that urban planning has a huge role to play in eliminating these inequalities. This can be verified by the results of this study, which show that the GSC is behind when in terms of development.

5.6 Proposed solutions from respondents

The study revealed that many of the respondents are aware of the conditions of the area. They shared solutions that they feel would be suitable for dealing with the area’s problems, especially the state of the buildings in the area and the crime. It is evident, from observing the physical and economic state of the GSC that the concerns and solutions of the business owners have not been taken into consideration by the Municipality. The State of Cities Report (2016) indicated that the municipality has to recognise the needs of the urban residents.

5.7 Government Policy Influence on Restructuring in Grey Street Since 1994

According to Waley (2007), the government plays a role in the process of urban restructuring. This role is played out through the organising of the lower levels of government in terms of function and responsibilities, as well as distributing roles to different sectors; public and private. This study revealed that the eThekwini municipality’s planning department is organised in such a way that each restructuring zone has its senior professional planner assigned to it.

Evidence from this study suggested that the process of post-apartheid urban restructuring appears to still be at its early stages of development. Policies and strategies have changed over time mainly because there are still difficulties in creating a balance between physical, social
and economic development in the inner city of eThekwini. This could perhaps be another reason why policies keep having to change.

Oranje (2014) stated that the scale of the problem in South African cities is large and therefore requires significant intervention for cities to fully transform for the better. This should be used as a guide for any urban restructuring policy that is developed. The eThekwini municipality has developed the LAP, to foster urban restructuring in the city. The goals of this plan are centred on creating more income generation opportunities, more social facilities and creating more employment and making Durban a world city. Nevertheless, its success should be measured by whether or not it has improved all parts of the inner city, including the GSC. The latest versions of spatial plans indicate moderate progress in several aspects of urban restructuring, specifically physical and economic changes for the Grey Street complex. However, focus should be equally distributed to all parts of the city to ensure that the inner city LAP is fully effective. According to Maritz et al. (2016), investigating the spatial transformation of cities since 1994 is vital for assessing progress that has been made thus far. Pragmatic support is necessary to analyse and track progress in support of this long term agenda and to reconfiguring inequality in society and space.

5.8 Challenges

It is unfortunate that after 24 years into the democracy, patterns of urban development in South African cities still display high levels of socio-economic inequalities (Bassa, 2015). The key challenges that have been identified in the LAP need to be addressed. The LAP has to be more inclusive of the city centre in order to ensure that urban restructuring takes place in a manner that ensures balance between social, physical and economic development. It is interesting that the municipality acknowledges this challenge. Objectives of the LAP should be channelled towards the direction of addressing this imbalance. The State of Cities Report (2016) indicated that urban restructuring has to be all-inclusive, sustainable and well integrated in order for it to
work for South African cities. It is difficult to assess what influence the LAP has had on the GSC.

Spatial development has not been well integrated into the various spheres of urban development (Du Plessis, 2014). This has resulted in major setbacks in the spatial transformation of South African cities since 1994. Spatial policy needs to be integrated with plans for tangible public and private investment that are sustained over time, and carefully adapted to the needs and opportunities of specific places (NDP Planning document 2, 2015). Todes (2008) argued that there is a stronger need for integration, not only in the development of cities, but first in the planning sector. Spatial development has to be aligned with infrastructural development and land use management (Todes, 2008). This, evidently, is an important aspect that has been contributing to the challenges experienced in the urban restructuring of South African cities.

5.9 Conceptual Reflections

A critical analysis of urban issues that goes beyond what is already known is necessary to uncover the complexities that are involved in urban planning and development (Brenner, 2009). The scope of urban studies has expanded over the years due to rapid urbanisation and cities have become defined more and more by their actions in the global arena (Patt, 2014). Many cities aspire to become world cities, and this has also shaped post-apartheid development plans in South African cities which compete for international investments and tourists. This section revisits the theoretical framework for this study to contextualise the development of the GSC and its changing fortunes in the post-apartheid era.

5.9.1 Critical Urban Theory

Critical urban theory emphasises the politically and ideologically mediated, socially constituted and therefore flexible character of urban space (Brenner, 2009). Hence, the city is viewed as a site, medium, and outcome of historically specific relations of social and political power. Critical urban theory is based on the inquiry of existing urban formations and their
continued changing nature as opposed to inherited urban knowledge, which concentrates on studying urban forms from a non-critical perspective (Brenner, 2009). This approach assisted in analysing the physical, social and economic changes that have occurred in the Grey Street complex.

It was evident from this study that the historical development of the GSC was influenced by political and social dynamics, especially to confine and stop the expansion of Indian business enterprises.

The GAA was a key legislation in the exercising of apartheid power. In the DST the GAA took away security of tenure, which was a crucial element for development of the area in terms of investments and physical expansion. Property owners, entrepreneurs, and residents lived in a limbo of uncertainty until the area was declared a trading only area. Furthermore, the GAA did not offer alternative accommodation or compensation to those who had to uproot their families and businesses.

Post-apartheid planning has been focused on reconstructing the city to repair the damages that were caused by apartheid urban engineering (Turok, 1994). This study revealed that this process is still at an early stage, notwithstanding more than two decades of democratic governance. It is safe to say that the population of the GSC has been left out when it comes to urban restructuring and addressing the historical legacy of apartheid. The business owners complained that the local authority has done very little when it comes to addressing the problems and challenges in the GSC. Hence, there are remarkable continuities in terms of deliberate neglect in addressing the problems in Grey Street in both the apartheid and post-apartheid eras.

5.9.2 Regulation Theory

Regulation theory is sometimes referred to as the regulation approach was developed in the mid-1970s, in the fields of urban politics and economics by a group of French economists.
These scholars were concerned about analysing the regulation of the economy (Goodwin, 2001). An underlying premise of this theory is that continued economic development is linked to, and often has an influence on, social, cultural and political processes (Goodwin, 2001). This analysis is done by looking at the changes that take place within economic institutions as well as the social, cultural and political factors, which are intertwined as one system (Goodwin, 2001). Boyer (1990, cited in Goodwin, 2001) stated that the variability of economic and social dynamics, in an urban setting, in both time and space, is the central focus of regulation theory. Therefore, economic relations cannot exist outside social processes and contexts. Most urban scholars state that urban restructuring was a strategy to rebuild economies, to addresses economic change and the whole process is rooted in urban politics and therefore has effects on culture and social life of cities (Painter, 1997).

It was evident from this study that economic restructuring occurred in the GSC in the form of product transformation. The new businesses in the GSC show such changes. Within the process of economic restructuring, businesses often change the type of products they sell, or they expand their product base. In other words, businesses start to include more, and often, different products than they usually provide (Bradbury, 1989). Product transformation is more common among smaller, less formal businesses.

Through regulatory analysis, this study also discovered that access to funding is a major challenge in the process of urban restructuring in Grey Street. Municipality officials stated that many projects have been unsuccessful because of a lack of funding.

Regulation theory is best suitable for understanding issues that arise from the process of urban restructuring and for this study it was used to analyse the influence of the changes that have occurred in the GSC since 1994. Post-apartheid development has had several positive and negative influences on the area. On the positive side, the area has become socially and economically diverse, with opportunities for emerging entrepreneurs. On the negative side,
multiple problems appear to indicate a decline in the area. This is particularly a negative aspect since there are people depending on the area, such as shop owners, informal traders and customers.

5.10 Recommendations

There are plans in progress for transforming the physical and economic state of the GSC. The overall aim is to make the area an efficient, well-developed part of the Durban inner-city by tackling the objectives stated under iTrump. This is not the only programme for inner city redevelopment. However, it is the most relevant for the GSC.

The objectives of the iTrump are increasing economic activity; reducing poverty and social isolation; promoting effective and sustainable urban management; improving safety and security; and developing institutional capacity. This study has provided useful insights into the social, economic and physical change and challenges in the GSC, and proposes the following recommendations to address the challenges facing the GSC:

i) Participatory planning

Plans for the GSC must incorporate inputs from the business people in the area. This is necessary because they know what they need and which issues are more urgent. In other words, the municipality has to encourage greater public participation, and there has to be greater transparency in terms of how decisions for the GSC are made. Participation will empower owners, businesspeople and commuters to contribute towards the resolution of the problems in the area.

ii) Owner/occupant responsibility

The municipality officials stated that with some developmental issues in the area, they could not intervene or interfere because many of the buildings were privately owned. The owner has the responsibility of maintaining the building as well as managing the activities of the occupants in those buildings. A report on the Durban CBD stated that some buildings in the
area are owned by absentee landlords and slumlords. There has to be a sense of responsibility instilled in the landlords and their tenants. Property development has a huge role to play in both the physical and economic development of the GSC, and owners have a responsibility to cooperate.

iii) Sanitation

The researcher is aware that this might be a problem that affects not only the Grey Street complex but the whole city of Durban. However, the GSC is overcrowded and poor sanitation poses serious health threats to the people in the area. The municipality has to make plans to improve the sanitation in this area. However, this has to be done through partnership with the residents, business owners and landlords of the area; they also need to take full responsibility when it comes to the sanitation in their shops and surroundings.

iv) Promote community and unity

Some of the locals (business owners and customers) in the GSC display hostile attitudes towards the new business owners because they are not South African and this can lead to xenophobia. Members of the police force also often treat the new business owners with hostility. Promoting social cohesion and a sense of community would go a long way towards reducing tensions in the GSC.

iv) Combating Crime

Crime is a serious concern in the GSC. The introduction of efficient and effective crime fighting strategies is necessary for the safety of the business people and consumers in the area. This would also combat the issue of urban decline since the GSC is slowly losing its value and becoming like a flea market. However, in as much as the city police are responsible for this neglect in terms of safety and security, the Grey Street community also needs to work together in combat fighting crime.
vi) Reasonable Rates

A few of the respondents voiced their concerns about the continuously increasing rent and utility costs in the area. High rates pose a serious threat to business expansion in the GSC, more especially the small, recently established enterprises. The municipality needs to find creative ways to address such issues. Lowering the utility and rates charges to a reasonable level for new businesses that employ more than two persons could be an option.

5.11 Conclusion

The GSC experienced significant stagnation in its growth from the 1950s, and this was mainly caused by the GAA. This act posed severe restrictions in the area, which stifled Indian business enterprises and also crippled the physical and social development of the area. Numerous businesses closed down while others had to relocate to areas outside of the city. Post-1994, the area is still underdeveloped with little to no evidence of urban regeneration. The demographic composition and economic activities since 1994 show significant diversity. Immigrants from within and outside of Africa have filled up the area, and the new businesses offer a wide range of products and services. However, the GSC is yet to reach a state of full social, physical and economic transformation in the post-apartheid era. Poor growth and marginalisation characterises the area in the post-apartheid era, and this appears to get worse with the years. It is rather a let-down as in its early stages, the GSC showed great development potential and was a beaming trading area. There appears to have been minimum efforts from the municipality to upgrade and integrate the GSC and make it a viable part of the inner city.

There are numerous plans and policies, besides iTrump, that have been devised, since 1994, for inner city improvement. However, these have had little or no effect in the GSC. There is a need for a stronger hand when it comes to the implementation of polices and plans for urban restructuring. Scholars in the field have also suggested that there has to be integration in the planning sector. Spatial development cannot occur in isolation from infrastructural planning.
and land use management. Planners in these sectors have to integrate plans in order to allow
for urban restructuring policies to effectively address the divisions and inequalities caused by
the apartheid planning practices. In the post-apartheid era, the divisions caused by the GAA
and similar policies remain visible in the Durban inner city. It is now time to move forward
and create a well-integrated city, where the development is well balanced between social,
physical and economic development. This requires significant transformation within the
governmental institutions which are responsible for rolling out plans and policies under urban
restructuring, channelling investments and funding into the correct projects, and the different
spheres of government (National, Provincial and Local) have to improve communication and
integration in planning and implementation.
REFERENCE LIST


eThekwini Inner City Local Area Plan 2040: Draft Vision and Concept Plan. 2015.

EThekwini Municipality.

eThekwini Municipality


APPENDICES

Appendix 1: Informed Consent
You are kindly invited to participate in the research project conducted by Lydia Mulibana, student number 210531746. I am conducting research for the fulfillment of my Masters research which I am registered for at the University of Kwa-Zulu Natal (UKZN). The aim of this study is to investigate the social, physical and economic restructuring that has occurred in the Durban inner city, with specific reference to the Grey Street area since 1994.

If you agree to take part in this study, you are expected to answer the questions from the interview schedule, which will be given to you. The interview session will be recorded for clarity purposes. However, if you feel uncomfortable with being recorded your answers will be written down on the interview sheet. The interview will take 15-30 minutes. You have the right to withdraw at any time you may want and you also have the right to not answer questions that you feel uncomfortable with.

Your participation in this study will help answer the questions of the research. And it will also help in making suggestions to policies that deal with the development of this area as well as other areas of similarity in the eThekwini municipality. No compensation will be given for participating in this study. Your participation will also be anonymous. The data obtained from you will be kept safely in my locker and it will be held confidentially. In the analysis, you will not be referred to by name but as a respondent. Also, you will not be asked to state your name or the name of your shop during the recording, in order to keep the unanimity.

If you have any questions regarding this study, please do not hesitate to contact my supervisor Prof Brij Maharaj at 031 260 1027 or email Maharajb@ukzn.ac.za

I………………………………………………. (Name and surname) hereby confirm that I have read the information sheet and I am willing to take part in this study. I understand the nature of this study and that I have the right to withdraw at any time. I understand that the research will keep the information confidential.
Do you give permission for the interview to be recorded? Yes/no?

Respondent’s signature…………………… Date …………………..

Witnesses signature…………………… Date …………………..
Appendix 2: Ethical Clearance

UNIVERSITY OF
KWAZULU-NATAL
INYUVESI
YAKWAZULU-NATALI

27 September 2016

Ms Luleya Gugu Mulbana 210531746
School of Agriculture, Earth and Sciences
Westville Campus

Dear Ms Mulbana

Protocol reference number: HS/15/21/018M
Project Title: Restructuring inner cities in the post-apartheid era: A case study of Grey Street, Durban

Full Approval – Expedited Application

In response to your application received 13 September 2016, the Humanities & Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee has considered the aforementioned application and the protocol has been granted FULL APPROVAL.

Any alteration(s) to the approved research protocol (i.e. Questionnaire/interview Schedule, Informed Consent Form, Title of the Project, Location of the Study, Research Approach and Methods) must be reviewed and approved through the amendment/modification prior to its implementation. In case you have further queries, please quote the above reference number.

PLEASE NOTE: Research data should be securely stored in the discipline/department for a period of 5 years.

The ethical clearance certificate is only valid for a period of 3 years from the date of issue. Thereafter Recertification must be applied for on an annual basis.

I take this opportunity of wishing you everything of the best with your study.

Yours faithfully,

Dr Shyamala Singh (Chair)
Humanities & Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee

Coordinator: Professor Brij Malhotra
Co Academic Leader Research: Professor Gisilmo Mutaaga
Col School Administrator: Ms Marsha Manjo

Humanities & Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee
Dr Shyamala Singh (Chair)
Westville Campus, Gordon West Building
Postal Address: Private Bag X0400, Durban 4000
Telephone: +27 (0) 31 260 3687/3683/3687/3688 Fax: +27 (0) 31 260 4082 Email: research@ukzn.ac.za /chsm@ukzn.ac.za /yks@ukzn.ac.za
Website: www.ukzn.ac.za

1910 – 2010
100 YEARS OF ACADEMIC EXCELLENCE

Open University
Nelson Mandela University
Medical School
Pietermaritzburg
Westville

112
Appendix 3: Gate Keeper Permission

For attention:
Chair: Research Ethics Committee
College of Agriculture, Engineering and Science
University of KwaZulu Natal
Durban
4001

25 June 2016

RE: LETTER OF SUPPORT TO Ms LG MULIBANA, REGISTRATION NUMBER 210531746 - GRANTING PERMISSION TO USE ETHEKWINI MUNICIPALITY AS A CASE STUDY

TITLE: “Restructuring inner cities in the post-apartheid era. A case study of Grey Street, Durban”.

Please be informed that eThekwini Municipality’s Head: Development Planning & Management in partnership with the Head: eThekwini Municipal Academy (EMA), have considered the request by Ms LG Mulibana to use eThekwini Municipality as a research study site leading to the awarding of a MSc degree in Geography and Environmental Science.

We wish to inform Ms LG Mulibana of the acceptance of her request and hereby assure her of our utmost cooperation towards achieving her academic goals; the outcome which we believe will help our municipality in the long run.

In return, we stipulate as conditionally, that Ms LG Mulibana presents the results and recommendations of this study to the related unit/s on completion.

Wishing the student all the best in her studies.

[Signature]
Head: Development Planning & Management Unit
eThekwini Municipality

[Signature]
Head: EMA
eThekwini Municipality

Date
Appendix 4: Interview Guide
Restructuring of inner cities in the post-apartheid era. A case study of Grey Street, Durban.

Section A: Interview Guide for New Business Owners in the Grey Street Complex

1. Which country are you from?
2. What form of business are you engaged in and what reasons made you choose this form?
3. Have you always been a business person?
4. Is there a main product that you specialize in or you sell a variety of goods?
5. Yes/No. Why?
6. What encouraged you to come to South Africa, Durban and start a business in this area?
7. How long have you been trading in this area?
8. Who are your main customers?
9. Since arrival, have your profits increased?
10. What do you think are the reasons for the increase or decrease?
11. Do you have competition from the main CBD or in this area?
12. How is your business affected by competition?
13. How do you mitigate the impacts of the competition?
14. Does your business have any link with the main CBD?
15. If yes, elaborate.
16. Given the option, would you have chosen the main CBD to establish your business?
17. Do you get the same group of customers as the businesses in the main CBD?
18. Can you mention a few reasons for this? (the above answer)
19. How has your business and livelihood been affected by the changes that have occurred in the area and the arrival of more new businesses?
20. What problems have you experienced in this area?
21. Can you comment on the economic, social and physical state of this area?
22. How does that affect your business?
23. In your opinion, does the municipality show interest in developing or upgrading this area? Justify your response.
24. Are there any projects that you are aware of that are for upgrading this area?
25. What recommendations would you make for the development of this area?
26. Would you make more investments in this area?
27. Yes/no. Why?
28. Would you consider relocating to a new area?
29. Where and why?

Section B: Interview Guide for iTrump Coordinator

1. Are you familiar with the Grey Street complex?
2. Can you say that it has been fairly included under iTrump?
3. If no, please state your reason(s)
4. How would you justify the major difference that exists between Grey Street and the
   Cleaning services must start from the worst areas then move to the better areas
5. Mention the positive influences, in terms of social, economic and physical
   development, that this programme has on the Grey Street complex.
6. To what extent is the public (business owners in Grey Street) involved in iTrump?
7. If they are not involved, what is the reason(s)?
8. Are there projects that are in the pipeline for the area?
9. Can you please provide the aim of each project?
10. Can you comment on how the iTrump programme has achieved each of its main
    objectives?
11. If they have not been achieved, what is the reason(s)?

Section C: Interview Guide for Senior Professional Planner at eThekwini Municipality.

1. How many restructuring zones are there in Durban (inner city)
2. Is the Grey Street area included in that list?
3. How would you describe the physical, social and economic state of the Grey street area?
4. How has it changed, when compared to how it was during the Apartheid era?
5. Have there been plans put into action before (last 5-10 years) to upgrade the area?
6. Have the plans succeeded or failed?
7. What are the main challenges that the area poses to effective policy implementation?(urban restructuring policy)
8. Have the challenges been addressed?
9. If yes, how?
10. If no, why?
11. Are there current development plans being made for the area?
12. How has the IDP programme helped in developing the Grey street area?
13. Has urban restructuring been of any significance to the businesses in the Grey Street area?
14. Has the IDP programme ensured equal development in all parts of the city centre?
15. Yes/No. Why?
16. Is there an equal balance between physical, economic and social restructuring, with regards to urban restructuring in the city centre?
17. Can you predict a possible (realistic) future for the Grey Street area from an urban planning perspective?

Additional questions: Interview Guide for Senior Professional Planner at eThekwini Municipality.

1. The Grey Street Complex has a significant number of informal trading stalls. Could you shed light on the reason behind adding these stalls in the area?
2. Urban restructuring plans took effect from 1994. How much has the Grey Street complex been included in these plans? Has the area benefited from urban restructuring? If yes, How?
3. In our first interview, you mentioned that you have visited several European cities to draw examples for the development out the Durban CBD. Why have you not looked at African/Asian examples for city development?
4. The LAP promises significant improvement for the city centre. How will this plan help with the development of the Grey Street complex specifically?