Trials, Tribulations and Triumphs of Transnational Teachers:
Teacher Migration Between South Africa and the United Kingdom

By

SADHANA MANIK

Dissertation Submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree Doctor of Education In the School of Educational Studies Faculty of Humanities University of KwaZulu-Natal (Westville Campus)

Joint Promoters: Prof. Brij Maharaj Prof. Reshma Sookrajh

January 2005
DECLARATION

I, Sadhana Manik, declare that this thesis is my own. It is being submitted for the degree of Doctor of Education at the University of KwaZulu-Natal, Westville Campus. It has not been submitted before for examination in any other university.

Sadhana Manik

Date: 06/04/05

Brij Maharaj

Reshma Sookrajh
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

From inception to completion, this thesis is the product of time and effort by many people loyal to me and the desire to assist in addressing issues of concern at an academic level. My deepest gratitude goes to them.

➢ GOD - for giving me the courage, strength and perseverance throughout the course of my study.

➢ My sensei - Nikki Pillay for imparting his philosophies of life and discipline. For teaching me that you can only give off a 100% when you’ve decided on your priorities.

➢ My supervisors - Professors Brij Maharaj and Reshma Sookrajh for precious times spent dialoging and engaging with concepts and theories.

➢ Professors Michael Samuel and Renuka Vithal for probing and pushing thoughts and ideas beyond intellectual boundaries.

➢ Doctor Betty Govinden and Doctor Busi Alant for words of wisdom and interesting angles of pursuing research.

➢ Doctor Labby Ramrathan for his advice and earthly grounding, and for being available to test ideas.

➢ Les Naidoo, a dear friend and colleague for his assistance in the distribution and collection of numerous questionnaires.

➢ The many teachers who allowed me access to their feelings, decisions and homes in SA and the UK.

➢ Michelle Stears and Murthi Maistry for research with novice teachers at Edgewood College.

➢ Robin for tapping visiting friends to participate in the research.
➢ The D. Ed 3 class for moments of laughter, joy, frustration and meaningful intellectual stimulation. Especially to Rita Bansilall for an abundance of all things enjoyable.

➢ Rishi Hansraj, Dr. Nirmala Gopal, Juliet Perumal, Tracy, Tammy, Anisha Angath and Busi Goba for your infectious warmth and personality.

➢ The Spencer Foundation and The University of KwaZulu-Natal, Westville Campus for supporting this study.

➢ Rookesh, Kapil and Wazir - for tolerating and accommodating my every whim and fancy.

➢ My family and friends - how do I thank thee, let me count ...
ABSTRACT

The aim of this study was to analyse teacher migration between South Africa (SA) and the United Kingdom (UK). An understanding of teacher migration and migration patterns is of vital importance especially to SA. As a developing country, SA is losing valuable assets, namely professionals (teachers, doctors, nurses) to developed countries. There is a return stream as evident in a cohort of teacher migrants returning to SA. However, increased mobility is a direct occurrence of the forces of globalisation, and neither the loss of professionals (brain drain) nor the brain gain is unique to SA. Nevertheless, the need to understand migrant teachers’ decision-making is salient: firstly, as a step in creating avenues for discourse on addressing the flight of ‘home-grown’ professionals and attracting ex-patriots back to their home country. Secondly, in furthering an understanding of global labour migration, and finally in developing and expanding on existing migration theories in a globalised world.

This study was multi-layered. It investigated two distinct cohorts of teachers: ninety experienced teachers (part of the teaching fraternity) and thirty novice teachers (student teachers in their final year of study at Edgewood College of Education in SA). Within the category of experienced teachers, three separate divisions of teachers were identified for examination, namely pre-migrants (teachers about to embark on their first migration), post-migrants (SA teachers already teaching in the UK) and return-migrants (teachers who had returned to SA after a period of teaching in the UK).

Various theories influenced the study: economic theories of migration, identity theories in education and Marxist labour theory. Within this theoretical framing the influence of globalisation as a process in facilitating cross border mobility was emphasized. Quantitative and qualitative methods were used in the study. Teachers’ voices were favoured in the study as an expression of the complexity of their thinking, attitudes, behaviour and hence, identities.
The study commenced by examining the reasons for novice and experienced teachers exiting the SA teaching fraternity, to work in schools in London in the UK. Then it explored the latter teachers' experiences in those schools and society with a view to revealing their integration into new socio-cultural and political milieus, and highlighting their transnational identities. Finally, experienced teachers' reasons for returning to SA were probed. In tracing teachers' trajectory from pre-migration (before migration) to post-migration (in the host country) to return migration (back to the home country), the study attempted to analyse patterns of transnational migration in a globalised context. The study identified the emergence of a new breed of teachers: transnational teacher-travellers. These are teachers who traverse a country's national boundaries at will. They are at ease trading their services in a global market, all in the pursuit of attaining a kaleidoscope of goals simultaneously. SA teachers were generally leaving their home country for multiple reasons of finance, travel opportunities and career progression. None of these reasons were mutually exclusive of each other. Migrant teachers' experiences in the UK were extensive, from professional growth to salary satisfaction and travel. However, teacher stress from incidents of reduced classroom discipline and loneliness stemming from family separation impacted on migrant teachers abroad, and contributed to return migration.

An evaluation of the data on migrant teachers' motivations, experiences and goals led to the development of a model to understand the transnational migration patterns of teachers traversing from developing to developed countries. The model is sculptured from Demuth's (2000) three phases of migration: pre-migration, post-migration and return-migration. A basic tenet of the suggested model is that teacher migration is a non-linear process. It is initiated and sustained by complex, concurrent push or pull factors in the home country and pull or push factors in the host country. Further, teacher migration is propelled and perpetuated by the influences of globalisation and socio-cultural networks between countries.
## LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Percentage of teachers resigning in one year</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Research Imperatives and Strategies used in the Study</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Biographical Details of Experienced Migrant Teachers</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Biographical Details of Novice Teachers</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Pre-migrants Career Reasons for Exiting South Africa</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Biographical Details and Reasons for Exit of Pre-migrants</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Biographical Details and Reasons for Exit of Post-migrants</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6 Post-migrant Views of UK School Management</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7 Views of Finance as a Reason for Exiting (Novice Teachers)</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8 Pre-migrants Responses to Financial Expectations in the UK</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9 Novice Teachers’ Desire for Global Work Experience</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Post-migrant Views of Pupil Discipline in the UK</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Rest and Relaxation for Post-migrants in the UK</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Reasons for returning to South Africa (Return-migrants)</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Biographical Data, Migratory Trends and Reasons for Return to SA</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FIGURES</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Quantitative and Qualitative Methods and Techniques</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Demuth's Four Phase Model of Migration</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Three Phase Model of Transnational Teacher Migration</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER ONE: On the Migration of Professionals</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Understanding Teacher Migration in Context</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Rationale and Significance of Study</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Why the UK?</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Theoretical Framing</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 Outline of Chapters</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER TWO: Mapping the Theoretical Terrain</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Introduction</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Globalisation</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Migration</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1 An Inter-disciplinary Approach</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2 Genres of International Migration</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.3 Approaches to Social Change and Development</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.4 Theories of Migration</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.5 Return Migration</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.6 Brain Drain</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Teacher Attrition, Global Trends and Corresponding Responses</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Teaching in South Africa: Professional and Policy Dynamics</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1 Policy Shifts in SA Education</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2 Teachers’ Identities</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER THREE: Methodology - Charting a Way Forward

3.1 Introduction 52
3.2 A Multi-method Approach 52
3.3 Aims and Objectives 53
3.4 Attempts at a Baseline Study 54
3.4.1 Attrition Statistics 55
3.4.2 Recruitment Agency Data 56
3.5 Research Design 57
3.5.1 Ethnography 59
3.6 Research Tools and Data Collection 62
3.6.1 Survey Questionnaire 62
3.6.2 Interviews 67
3.6.3 Focus Group Discussion 68
3.6.4 Qualitative Diaries and E-mail 69
3.6.5 Classroom Observation 70
3.7 Sampling 72
3.8 Methods of Data Analysis 74
3.8.1 Data Analysis 75
3.8.2 Presentation of Results 76
3.9 Limitations to the Study 77
3.10 Conclusion 78
### CHAPTER SIX: Homing In

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Migrant Teachers’ Complexities</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2.1</td>
<td>Motivations for Leaving SA</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Globalisation, Goals and Migration Strategies</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Transnational Teachers’ Identities</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Coerced, Gendered Migration</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>Family Obligations and Tentative Trajectories</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>Social Networks</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>Race, Place and Expectation</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>The Emergence of a Global Teacherhood</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.10</td>
<td>Brain Drain, Gain or Circulation</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.11</td>
<td>Three Phase Model of Transnational Teacher Migration</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.12</td>
<td>Avenues for Research</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.13</td>
<td>Conclusion: Journey’s End</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### REFERENCES

**REFERENCES**

**APPENDICES**

203

230
LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix One : Student Teacher Pilot Questionnaire
Appendix Two : Student Teacher Questionnaire
Appendix Three : Pre-migration Questionnaire
Appendix Four : Post and Return-migration Questionnaire
Appendix Five : Classroom Observation Schedule
Appendix Six : Extract from the Transcript of an Interview with a Post-migrant
Appendix Seven : Newspaper Advertisement Recruiting SA Teachers to the UK
Appendix Eight : Map of Kwa-Zulu Natal
Appendix Nine : HRM Circular 20 of 2003
Appendix Ten : HRM Circular 22 of 2003
Appendix Eleven : Media Release
Appendix Twelve : HRM Circular 54B of 2003
Appendix Thirteen : Migrant Teacher’s Resignation Letter
Appendix Fourteen : Sample of an E-mail
Appendix Fifteen : Extract from the Transcript of an Interview with Return-migrant
# LIST OF ACRONYMS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EI</td>
<td>Education International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OBE</td>
<td>Outcomes-Based Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OFSTED</td>
<td>Office for the Standards in Education (UK)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INSET</td>
<td>Inservice Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>International Organisation for Migration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KZN</td>
<td>KwaZulu-Natal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDC</td>
<td>Less Developed Country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NASUWT</td>
<td>National Association of School Masters and Women Teachers (UK)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCS</td>
<td>National Curriculum Statement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPN</td>
<td>Post Provisioning Norm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRESET</td>
<td>Preservice training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QTS</td>
<td>Qualified Teacher Status (UK)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RA</td>
<td>Recruitment Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RNCS</td>
<td>Revised National Curriculum Statement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R&amp;R</td>
<td>Rationalisation and Redeployment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACE</td>
<td>South African Council of Educators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TTA</td>
<td>Teacher Training Agency (UK)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER ONE: ON THE MIGRATION OF PROFESSIONALS

1.1 Introduction

According to the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD, 2004), the nineties saw an increase in the international impetus of highly skilled workers in three sectors: health, education and new technologies. They suggest three reasons for international migration. These are economic magnetism of the destination, an existing social network (family or ethnicity) in the destination country and a closeness (distance) between the country of origin and destination. South Africa (SA) shares the same fate with other developing countries in Africa, specifically in terms of the loss of skilled professionals to developed countries. Vincent Williams, South African Migration Project (SAMP) Manager states that the ‘Big Five’ destination countries are United States (US), United Kingdom (UK), Australia, New Zealand and Canada (Sunday Times, 08-12-2002). Emigration figures of Statistics South Africa estimate that an average of 1000 skilled people are leaving SA every month (Harichunder, 2001). A study of emigration to the UK, US, New Zealand, Canada and Australia by the University of Cape Town suggested that close to a quarter of a million South Africans have settled in these countries between 1989 and 1997 (Louw, 2001).

SA is presently losing workers in the following fields: health (nurses, doctors etc.), teaching, engineering, accounting and information technology (Sunday Times, 08-12-2002). Media and political hype has surrounded doctors and teachers leaving SA. The Minister of Health Tshabalala-Msimang has engaged in talks with the treasury on incentives to retain health professionals whilst Minister Asmal has publicly criticized British teacher recruiters (Sunday Times, 08-12-2002). According to Crush (2004) there are three reasons for health professionals leaving SA: crime, personal safety and poor working conditions. Developed countries have acknowledged the increase in skilled migrants to fulfill their labour demands. For example, The Australian Institute of Health Workers (2003) has declared that the number of doctors permanently migrating from SA has increased from 2,5% of the total medical migrants in 1992-
1993 to 6% in 1999-2000. In the same vein, a report titled the Flight of the Flamingoes\textsuperscript{1} (Kahn et al., 2004) focusing on the brain drain of scientists in SA has found that government underestimated the exit of migrants by four fold. This eclipse in the statistics would have logically impacted on government's misunderstanding of the extent of the brain drain. Nevertheless, the same report has alluded to migrants' intentions to return to SA, which would be a brain gain. A similar finding emerged from interviews conducted by SAMP, where migrants declared that they would be returning to SA in 3-5 years (Moodie, 2002). Whether indeed they will be following through with their intentions has not been studied.

1.2 Understanding Teacher Migration in Context

In many developed countries the teaching profession is ageing due to an inability to attract young people into the fraternity. Teacher shortages are evident in the UK, US, Canada, Australia and Netherlands (van Leeuwan, 2001). The dire need to replenish the profession results in many governments resorting to unconventional measures to overcome these shortages, including paying fees to private agencies for recruiting teachers (Naidu, 2001). The aggressive recruitment drives undertaken by teacher agencies, especially those acting on behalf of UK schools offer lucrative packages for teachers, specifically those from developing countries where English is an official language. According to statistics 10 000 people emigrated from South Africa in 2000 (World Market Research Centre, 2002). The number of teachers was not declared. However, many people do leave the country without making an official declaration. Unofficial estimates put the number of emigrants at three times more than that stated by the SA Government (News24.com, 15-07-2003). Teacher statistics were once again not revealed.

Teacher recruitment is taking place on a significant scale from developing countries such as South Africa. South Africans are in the majority when compared to all foreign teachers in British classrooms (Special Assignment, SABC 3, 23-04-04, 21h30). Consequently, there is much

\textsuperscript{1} This study did not focus on other sectors of employment apart from research and development workers. Kahn et al (2004) contend that the brain drain may be severe in other professions.
concern about the impact of the migration of teachers on the future of education in South Africa. Each year about 17 500 teachers are lost through natural attrition and only 2 500 people are being trained as teachers (Asmal, 2001a). Presently, there are no statistics available regarding the specific number of teachers migrating to the UK. However, the repercussions of a reduction in the number of teachers are serious for South Africa especially in terms of the development of the economy. The teacher shortage in South Africa was highlighted at a World Conference organized by Educational International in July 2001. One of the most significant findings from the conference was that the recruitment of teachers from low-income countries exceeded the increasing school enrolment. This position is contrary to the stance by Department of Education in the province of KwaZulu-Natal (KZN) in SA that there are teacher excesses in KZN. If indeed there is presently a surplus of teachers locally an acceptance of posts abroad would partially alleviate unemployment.

The government’s response to the exit of teachers was to call for the regulation of teacher recruitment to the UK (Asmal, 2000b). However, as to a plan of action to curtail teacher losses from SA, nothing has been unveiled by the national government in the four years that have lapsed. Nevertheless, concerns about teacher recruitment from developing countries within the commonwealth did result in the Minister of Education and 22 commonwealth states signing a protocol on teacher recruitment on the 01-09-2004. The aim is to protect the rights of all stakeholders in the teacher recruitment process, especially that of source countries and recruited teachers. The protocol also serves as an ethical guideline for the recruitment of teachers at an international level. More importantly, it provides a framework for countries such as SA to now develop appropriate legislation on teacher recruitment.

It must be stressed that South Africa is part of an international labour market and teachers are responding to a global demand and supply. Economically, the pound is the strongest currency in the world and it is performing well against the South African rand at the time of writing this.

---


3 A teacher audit has been conducted in KZN in 2004. However, the results have as yet to be disclosed.
In addition, teachers leaving South Africa are promised 2-3 year contracts with options to renew for another two years. Further, changes to the UK immigration policy now imply that migrant teachers can apply for permanent residency (Ryan, 2001). A UK school can motivate for the retention of a South African teacher and provide a permanent post for him or her.

1.3 Rationale and Significance of the Study

The globalisation of the world markets has paved the way for the movement of people with scarce skills across national boundaries with relative ease. Professionals have been extremely susceptible, given their particular knowledge and skills base. The trend is for such professionals from developing countries to fill the gaps in the labour market in developed countries. The mobility of professionals, especially those exiting the home country, has been perceived by politicians and academics, to be especially damaging to the growth of developing countries (Abedian, 2001; Asmal, 2001b; Louw, 2001a).

In respect of SA, if the net migration of teachers is negative, then a brain drain could result in the education sector. Given the fact that teachers are the building blocks of a country, the development trajectory of SA could be affected. Thus the repercussions of neglecting to address the exit of teachers could be detrimental in the long term. An understanding of teachers' decisions prior to departure from SA, migrant teachers' subsequent experiences in the UK and the reasons for their return is crucial to demystifying the context within which migrant teachers are framing their decisions.

The purpose of the study was to investigate the nature of teacher migration between SA and the UK. As Eklund (1999) has posited, defining the term migration is problematic as there is no limit to when a movement may be considered to be a migration. Thus in the present study, migrants are defined as people who are moving from one country to another regardless of the duration of their stay in the host country. The research investigated teachers' motives, decisions and actions,
hence an hermeneutic focus was vital in fulfilling the aim of the study. This was accomplished by examining data prior to teachers' migration, upon their migration to the UK and after their return to SA.

This study thus focused attention on three separate strata (pre, post and return) of teacher migration (experienced and novice teachers) by highlighting teacher thinking and decisions prior to their exiting SA, whilst teaching abroad in the UK and upon return to SA. In analysing migrant teachers experiences in the UK and a cohort of teachers who have elected to return to SA, the study provides a platform for stakeholders in education, for example the DoE in SA, to acknowledge the potential of harnessing the invaluable expertise of returnees and potential returnees (a brain gain). The study also enabled developing a pattern of the movements of transnational teachers between SA and the UK, which is imperative to informing future human resource planning in SA education. Collectively, the study calls for dialogue among all concerned in the education process so that teaching can be made an attractive profession in SA without compromising the freedom of teachers to be part of an international teacherhood in an increasingly globalised profession.

1.4 Why the UK?

The SA-UK flyaway\(^4\) was appropriate for many reasons. More than two thirds of the world's teachers are in developing countries, while conservative estimates reveal that there is a national shortage of forty thousand teachers in the UK (Ochs, 2003). The majority of the advertisements in SA newspapers focus on the recruitment of SA teachers to the UK (Sunday Times, 08-09-02; 01-09-02), as opposed to other flyaways. The UK media has disclosed that shortages in England have led to an increase in the migration of SA teachers. Furthermore, British education authorities have acknowledged that they are aggressively recruiting teachers from SA (Special Assignment, SABC3, 23-04-04, 21h30). A UK principal elaborated that if it were not for South African, Australian, New Zealand or Canadian teachers, London schools would be forced to

\(^4\) route
close (BBC News, 02-02-01). There also exists the need for the UK to retain teachers. Sixty percent of the teachers currently in the UK are over the age of forty (Ochs, 2003). Hutchins et al (2002) posit that the rate of retirement and pre-mature retirement for teachers in the UK is expected to double by 2007.

In SA there has been much print media hype concerning SA teachers’ experiences in London schools (Sunday Tribune, 27-07-03:06; 14-09-03:06). However, there has been no rigorous study focusing on SA-UK teacher migration. Hence, it is imperative to research teacher migration in the SA-UK flyaway.

1.5 Theoretical Framing

Globalisation was used as the overarching theoretical lens for the study. The migration of teachers between SA and the UK reflects global labour trends. Thus the globalisation thesis and migration theories were necessary facets of the theoretical framing in this study. The movement of teachers across national boundaries called for the inclusion of transnationalism as a construct, which is explored for its relevance to teacher migration. Finally, teacher identities were examined as a means to understand the contexts of SA teachers’ experiences and behaviour before their migration (to the UK), after their migration (whilst in the UK) and in their decision to return to SA. Within this ambit it was thus possible to understand migrant teachers’ decision-making and their movements (teaching trajectories).

1.6 Outline of Chapters

The thesis is divided into six chapters.

CHAPTER ONE: commenced with the rationale, which qualified the need to undertake the study. Specific reference is made to the SA-UK flyaway and motivations were provided for the exploration of teacher migration along this route. The theoretical underpinnings were briefly explained for its relevance to the aim of the study.
CHAPTER TWO: provides the theoretical and conceptual framework of the study. Globalisation as a process was advanced as the conduit to facilitate international labour migration. The discussion on migration theories, teacher identities and the scenario in SA provide a platform for understanding the transnational movements of teachers.

CHAPTER THREE: focuses on the methodological approach used in the study. The tools and methods applied to the study were influenced largely, though not solely, by studies in the disciplines of education and migration. The discussion in this chapter details an attempt at a baseline study, the instruments used, the types of data generated and the subsequent methods of analysis.

CHAPTER FOUR: focuses on the motivations for teachers leaving SA and their experiences. This chapter sketches a portrait of teacher discontentment in respect of socio-economic and career dissatisfaction in SA as opposed to contentment in the UK.

CHAPTER FIVE: extends the discussion on teachers' experiences in the UK, and explores their motivations for returning to SA. This chapter develops the characteristics of a Teflon Teacher: a teacher who runs the gauntlet of difficult, stressful classroom experiences and emerges victorious in the UK.

CHAPTER SIX: discusses the key insights emerging from the study. These were theoretical, conceptual and methodological. Collectively, the insights feed into the development of a model to explain teacher migration from developing to developed countries.

The next chapter explores theories and concepts across disciplines that were necessary in providing a framework for the study.
CHAPTER 2: MAPPING THE THEORETICAL TERRAIN

2.1 Introduction

This chapter presents a conceptual understanding of the transnational movement of South African teachers. It is divided into three sections. The first section constitutes a discussion of the impact of globalisation as a process in facilitating migration. As the unit of analysis is the migrant teacher, labour migration literature is the specific focus. Herein, particular attention is given to approaches that generated theories on the conception and perpetuation of labour migration. It is argued that the continued departure of labour is detrimental to the development of a sending country. Hence this section culminates with the examination of a possible brain drain.

However, neither the mobility of professionals nor the possibilities of a brain drain are unique phenomena to SA. The position adopted in this research is based on the premise that there is a correlation between education and migration. This view resonates with Gould’s (1993) contention that the educated in any population are mobile. This relationship is clarified in the second section of this chapter, which emphasises global trends in education. A tenet of globalisation theory is that international shifts will impact on the local environment. This link between global trends and the local scenario is explored in the third section of this chapter. It encompasses an examination of the context of the teaching profession in SA post-1998. Issues affecting teachers’ identities and influencing their decision to migrate are discussed. This chapter culminates with research in the field of teacher attrition in SA followed by a discussion of the media coverage (electronic and print) of SA teachers’ migration to the UK and government’s responses.

---

5 Post-apartheid South Africa heralded many changes in the field of Education at the level of the school. Most pronounced were organisational and policy changes implemented since 1998.
2.2 Globalisation

In order to understand the relevance of globalisation to the migration of teachers it is necessary to trace its beginnings and deconstruct it as a subject. Globalisation emerged as a concept in development circles in the 1990’s. Numerous scholars (Held et al., 1999; Urry, 1998) have debated the phenomenon of globalisation. The conclusion reached is that like all popular concepts it has different meanings (Keohane and Nye, 2000). For de Wet (2002:1). Globalisation has a host of denotations:

i) as a set of economic processes - production, marketing and investment that are integrated across borders and between firms. Globalisation has heralded the emergence of a single market for goods, capital, technology, services, information and to a limited extent for labour.

ii) as a socio-political process, through its impact on culture, people’s perceptions are affected, thus reducing cultural diversity, especially through television and the use of various products, e.g. Coca-Cola and McDonalds.

iii) as a development strategy - ideologically globalisation is underpinned by neoliberalism. The assumption is that the market is an efficient allocator of resources and enhances productivity. It is further assumed that via a trickle down effect increased productivity leads to prosperity and an improved standard of living for everyone.

iv) as a force for domestic reform - governments at local and national level are affected by a deregulation of the labour market, a disbanding of protectionist measures and a reduction in social spending. Much emphasis is placed on the export of products.

Suter (2001:1) hints at globalisation being the dawn of a new era when he states “the world is being ordered. An era is passing away”. However, he fails to explore this idea further. By contrast, Burbach (2001:21) acknowledges globalisation as the “advent of a new epoch”. He
argues that following a continuum, which evolved from the age of discovery and conquest to
industrial and corporate capitalism, globalisation is viewed as the fourth shift. Technological
developments (micro chip and computer) and globalisation are envisaged as “symbiotically
feeding off each other” due to the “information age providing an infrastructure for globalisation”
(Burbach, 2001:21). Consequently, no country is untouched by the forces of globalisation
(Fancourt Commonwealth Declaration, 2000), which has a political impact in terms of the
sovereignty of a nation state. Furthermore, due to globalisation having a strong foundation in
neoliberalism, neither equity nor homogenization is ensured within a country (Keohane and Nye,
2000). This poses a threat in terms of economic growth and the loss of human capital.

According to Castles (1999) the most complete definition of globalisation has been provided by
Held et al (1999). Globalisation is explained as “a process (or set of processes) that embodies a
transformation in the spatial organization of social relations and transactions generating
transcontinental or interregional flows and networks of activity, interaction and the exercise of
power” (Held et al, 1999:16). Castles (1999) maintains that the strength of this definition lies in
the possibility for research, especially along quantitative lines by measuring the intensity and
impact of such flows. This definition also collectively incorporates the various meanings
suggested by the above mentioned globalisation scholars. Held (1999) proceeds to further
suggest that scholars of globalisation can be divided into three categories: hyperglobalisers,
transformationalists and sceptics. Castles (1999:8) explored the differences between each of
these categories. The distinguishing characteristics of each are as follows:

i) hyperglobalisers - believe that globalisation represents a new era in history. “Positive
hyperglobalists advocate neoliberalism with open markets. Negative hyperglobalists
believe that globalisation leads to social fragmentation and cultural uncertainty by
virtue of collapsing trade unions and welfare systems, coupled with a lack of control
by weaker nations over Trans National Corporations” (Castles, 1999:8).

ii) transformationalists - argue that “globalisation is the central driving force behind the
major economic, cultural, social and political changes affecting virtually all the
world's people today. They regard patterns of cross border flows as integrating all countries into a global system bringing about social transformation at all levels” (Castles, 1999:8-9).

iii) sceptics - focus mainly on the economic aspects of globalisation. They “prefer the term internationalization to globalisation and are disbelieving of a global culture or civilization” (Castles, 1999:9). However, Tipoteh (2000) notes that there is little difference between internationalization as being a separate concept from globalisation. He argues that globalisation is not a new phenomenon and flows of capital across borders are referred to as the internationalization of capital.

Giddens (1999) had previously argued that the current wave of globalisation experienced by the world originated in the latter decades of the twentieth century. He attributed it to rapid developments in communication especially the satellite network, internet and television. The impact of such changes meant that time and space was compressed (Urry, 1998) reducing the world to a global village. Thus, world trade at present is far greater than it was previously in respect of commodities and services. Hence, the volume of monetary flows has increased dramatically. Giddens (1999) enunciates this point by using the exemplar of electronic money, which can be transferred by the simple click of a mouse. Repercussions of vast sums of money transferred electronically include the fluctuation of currencies and the destabilising of nations. Therefore, globalisation has facets of politics, technology and culture in addition to economic change. Giddens (07- 04-1999) at the Reith Lecture in London stated “we live in a world of transformations, affecting almost every aspect of what we do. For better or worse, we are being propelled into a global order that no one fully understands, but which is making its effects felt upon us all”. Therefore, in respect of the present research South African teachers cannot be seen as being immune to global transformations and the possibilities it holds for them.

From the discussion above it is clear that globalisation involves an interconnectedness between countries. The term globalisation, for the purpose of this study suggests that socio-economic
linkages between places around the world are now more numerous and intense. People for the most part migrate in search of economic opportunities (e.g. work) and as the economy has globalised, people from around the world find attractive opportunities that might influence them to cross international boundaries (Laws, 1997). Thus, in the present global economy, some countries will function as labour exporting nodes for long or short term migrants and others will act as labour importing countries.

Thus with globalisation facilitating the movement of professionals from developing to developed countries, critical issues emerge such as the loss of revenue and training a replacement workforce in the labour exporting node (home country). A deeper insight into the phenomenon of a brain drain in countries that experience human capital flight will follow later. It is also evident that globalisation is a multi-faceted term. From the above literature it appears to be a gender-neutral term as the effects of globalisation on either males or females specifically, has not been at the core of globalisation research.

For the purposes of this research the transformationalist view, that globalisation is a complex process with unpredictable outcomes, was used. One such outcome could be the inclusion of South African teachers into the global teaching fraternity. Stalker (2000) concluded in his report for the International Labour Office (ILO) that globalisation of the world economy will intensify migration in the twenty first century. His study reveals that economic restructuring in countries will lead to changes in society. The consequence of this will be more people leaving their communities to seek work abroad. Stalker’s (2000) findings are affirmed by Tacoli and Okali (2001) who suggest that migration is one of the most important and tangible aspects of globalisation.
2.3 Migration

Globalisation, defined as an interconnectedness between countries, has intensified migration. But, there exists contestation in defining the term migration (Eklund, 1999). It is problematic as there is no limit to when a movement may be considered to be a migration. Thus, in the present study, migrants are defined as people who are moving from one country to another regardless of the duration of their stay in the host country. The trend of increased mobility has led to migration research in an attempt to understand various aspects of the migration process.

2.3.1 An Inter-disciplinary Approach

The academic response has been the inclusion of migration in many social sciences: anthropology, demography, economics and geography. However, each discipline has approached the study of migration in isolation of research in other disciplines. Brettell and Hollifield (2000) and Maharaj (2004) have contended that the study of migration is extensive and cannot be understood from a singular perspective. Hammar and Tammas (1997:13) have similarly suggested that research (in migration) is "undertaken without consideration or consultation of related work in other disciplines". The present study responds to this call by adopting a multi-disciplinary approach to the international migration of SA teachers.

There are numerous forms of international migration and two (skilled transients and immigration shopping), in particular, can be applied to teachers exiting South Africa en route to the United Kingdom. In order to deconstruct the reasons for departure and understand the fabric of migrating teachers' rationales, the vignettes of international migration are discussed.

The migration of teachers begs the question: What form/s of international migration encompasses the movement of teachers?
2.3.2 Genres of International Migration

Since 1970 migration has taken new forms and Cohen (1997:1-4) draws attention to six forms of international migration that have come to the fore:

i) Refugee Migration

This refers to people who were forced to flee. They are driven by threat of persecution or political opinion. Cohen (1997) further distinguishes between an asylum-seeker and a displaced person. The former requests to be seen as a refugee but has not been confirmed, while the latter has had to flee as a result of any of the following: war (including civil) or natural disaster.

ii) Immigration Shopping

Many western countries have linked their economic development, manpower and immigration departments so that selected migrants fill slots in the labour market. This occurs when countries vie for particular migrants. Depending on the needs of the country, immigration vacancies are created. Suitable migrants in this category have the following attributes: skills, youth, good health, education and a lack of dependants.

iii) Undocumented Workers

This refers to migrants who are regarded as illegals. It takes two forms, either overstaying or purposeful illegal entry into a country. The former occurs when visitors (family, tourist or student) violate the terms stipulated in their passports. The latter occurs through corruption for example forged documentation or corrupt officials.

iv) Independent Female Migration

This is characterized by demands for women in the global service economy such as stewardesses, sex workers and domestic workers. Cohen (1997) does not consider that this form
of migration could also pertain to professions that are an extension of the gendered division of women's roles as caregivers such as nursing and teaching. This category of migrants deals with women as independent actors. It has been noted by Jolly et al (2003) that an increasing number of Asian women are migrating and they are not dependents of male migrants. It is contrary to previous perception in early migrant studies of women as dependants of male migrants. Raharto (2002) in her study of Indonesian female labour migrants, found that migration is closely linked to the decision-making power of women in the household. Migration can thus be viewed as a form of female emancipation. Davis and Winters (2000) contend that the patriarchal family system hinders female migration. Thus the migration of females leads to greater status for themselves by virtue of their economic contribution to the family (Raharto, 2002). Furthermore, it has been noted by the International Organisation for Migration (IOM, 2000:07) that “women account for forty six percent of migration from developing countries”. So female migration has been increasing over the years.

v) **Skilled Transients**

This refers to highly skilled professionals who work for either international companies on contract or are freelancing. The employer affords them privileges in terms of insurance, education for dependants and subsidized family visits. What is relevant to this category is that these migrants are not leaving their home country forever. This form of migration has strong links to what Glick-Schiller et al (1994, 1995) have termed transnationalism.

vi) **Unskilled Contract Workers**

This refers to the development of forms of unskilled contractual labour for specific requirements within a country. This form of migration can be paralleled to that of skilled transients. The South African mine workers are a typical example of this category.

The first category, refugee migration, falls within the scope of involuntary or forced migration. The others can be viewed as voluntary migration. However, Eklund (1999:07) maintains the
view that "it is not easy to distinguish between voluntary and involuntary migration". The migration of educators to the UK will fall into the intersection between immigration shopping and the skilled transient category. The UK has a shortage of teachers and are attempting to bridge the gap by recruiting SA teachers who are professionals. How teachers express their reasons for leaving SA sheds light on whether their migration is voluntary or otherwise.

The following section reviews the theoretical approaches that have been developed in an attempt to explain the process of migration. This will provide a platform for understanding the migration of SA teachers.

2.3.3 Approaches to Social Change and Development

There exists in present migration literature two approaches to viewing the process of social change and development: modernization theory and historical structuralism (Brettell, 2000; Kearney, 1995). Dissatisfaction with these approaches led to the development of new theories such as transnationalism. The approach that resonates with this study is that of transnationalism as it is closely linked with globalisation thesis of migrants moving freely across national borders and between socio-cultural milieus.

i) Modernisation Theory

Modernisation theory purports that all countries have similar starting points in their development and will follow a similar trajectory comparable to the experience of first world countries. One of the basic assumptions of modernization theory was encompassed in the equilibrium model of development as proposed by Rostow in five stages of growth (Baeck, 1993). Modernisation as a development theory failed when the gap between rich and poor countries grew and economic growth was viewed as being slow in Africa, Asia and Latin America (Castles, 1999). It alludes to the movement of people from areas of abundant labour and scarce capital to areas rich in capital.
but short of labour (Brettell, 2000:102-103). This framework is based on push factors of out-migration and pull factors of in-migration. The unit of analysis was individual migrants, which was limiting in that it ignored the household. It was envisaged that migrants would save money and through their savings become the agents of change in their home countries. However, studies on return migration have discredited this claim.

**ii) Historical structuralism**

The flaws in the equilibrium model served as a catalyst for the advancement of the historical-structuralist approach. This approach pays attention to macro-level processes as opposed to the individual migrant. It draws on the work undertaken by dependency theorists such as Frank (1967) and Wallerstein (1974). In this approach migration is grounded in the context of a global economy with core-periphery states. Migration is encouraged in the context of a global economy as a result of inequities between countries. Explanations are forwarded by reference to concepts such as low and high wage countries and labour importing and exporting nodes. Mounting dissatisfaction with a macro approach, which saw migrants as passive, and party to manipulation by a world capitalist system led to the emergence of transnationalism (Brettell, 2000). Hollifield (2000) alluded to transnationalism as a subset of the globalisation thesis.

**iii) Transnationalism**

Transnationalism continues the critique of bi-polar models of migration (Rouse, 1992). It is an idea that emanated in American discourse on cross border population movement (Conway and Cohen, 1998; Glick-Schiller et al, 1992; Massey et al, 1998). Transnational communities exist where the people involved in such movement straddle two worlds. In the past numerous researchers from the US (e.g. Handlin, 1973; Takaki, 1993) have perceived immigrants as people who are uprooted from both home and country and have to endure a process of incorporation into a new socio-cultural scenario. Transnationalism departs from this perception in that migrants forge and sustain multiple connections across national borders at their free will. Glick-Schiller et al (1992:9) define transnationalism “as a social process whereby migrants operate in social fields that transgress geographic, political and cultural boundaries”. Migrants thus move freely across
international borders, between different cultures and social systems (Glick-Shiller et al., 1992; Kearney, 1991). Migrants are involved in nation-building in many countries, which thus has implications for national identity. Scholars have also emphasized multiple destinations in stark contrast to the bi-polar model (Du Toit, 1990; Wilson, 1994).

Also emphasized in transnationalism literature, is the view that there are multiple schools of transnationalism. Crush and Mc. Donald (2000:8) who subscribe to this belief, purport that regardless of there being various schools of transnationalism, none in particular can be selected as being solely representative of transnationalism. They utilize five propositions of Portes et al. (1999) to identify the key features of transnationalism:

i) Transnationalism involves multiple movements of migrants between home and host country.

ii) Transnational activities are related to the internationalization of capital. There is a demand for labour in the Northern hemisphere and as a result of technological advancements in communication and transport, labour from the South can fulfill the demand in the North.

iii) Transnationalism is a unique way of understanding and explaining migrant identities.

iv) Transnationalism by virtue of its linkage (e.g. social) perpetuates migration.

v) Transnationalism is closely followed by new ways of resisting exploitation of migrants based on growing diaspora (offering a framework for support) and advancement in technology.

In an attempt to explain transnationalism, Glick-Schiller et al. (1995:50) have focused on three aspects of transnational migration:

i) A global restructuring of capital based on changing forms of capital accumulation has led to deteriorating social and economic conditions in both labour sending and labour receiving countries.

ii) Racism in both the US and Europe contributes to the economic and political insecurity of the new comers and their descendants.
iii) The nation building projects of both home and host society builds political loyalties among immigrants to each nation state in which they maintain social ties.

The above broad framework was useful in revealing the intricacies of transmigrants’ lives. Margolis (1998:30) in her study of Brazilian immigrants in New York explored how transmigrants can ignore distances and international borders, and concurrently live in two distinct cultures. She maintained that Brazilians saw themselves as ‘economic immigrants’ and this rubric seems appropriate as they were fleeing from conditions of high inflation, underemployment, low wages, a high cost of living and economic uncertainty in Brazil. The Brazilians in New York were not minimum wage earners and they held either semi-professional or professional positions, which paid good salaries by Brazilian standards. The income generated in the US was greater than their earnings in Brazil by as much as one is to four. Margolis (1998:32) recognised the economic impact of the dollar with regard to its exchange rate for Brazilians. Consequently she concludes that the Brazilians in New York are “there in body but not in spirit”. This notion was supported by Gmelch (1992:140) who alluded to immigrants clinging to “an ideology of return” to their home country regardless of the length of their stay in the host country.

Various scholars have delineated transnational migrants into categories, depending on the intentions and paths traversed by them. Grant (1981) utilizes the terms ‘shuttle migrants’ or ‘cultural commuters’ to refer to migrants that travel to and fro with no intention of staying anywhere permanently. Margolis’ (1998) concept of yo-yo migration refers to migrants who return home with the intention of a permanent stay. However, they later return to the host country. Factors prompting this type of migration are deemed to be the harsh reality that the money saved in the US may not last long, given increased inflation or the lack of appropriate jobs with a satisfying wage. Returnees are likely to face the same barriers that led them to remigrate initially (Margolis, 1998).

Transnationalism is not a concept without flaws and Conway (2000:212) offers an intense critique. He applauds Glick-Schiller et al (1992, 1994, 1995) for recognizing “the formation and
consolidation of transnational business connections across national borders". Nevertheless, he argues that as a construct transnationalism is flawed because "it is of little use when it comes to understanding the daily realities of transmigrant life". Conway (2000:213-214) argues that transnationalism is deficient because it:

i) Overlooks the mobility strategies of individuals and households, which can vary for example, impromptu and planned return and postponed return.

ii) Does not consider differences in migrants such as personal attributes, motives and contexts (gendered, racialised etc.) in which decisions are made. Distinctions (e.g. Class, gender, race) in metropolitan areas are not considered and life-space is depicted as homogenous and generalisable.

iii) Fails to examine admission processes (at labour importing nodes) such as various laws or procedures, which may have the effect of restricting legal entry into a country, and inadvertently lead to illegal entry. Illegal sojourning does not feature in transnationalism.

iv) Pays little attention to the actual movement process and its relationship to the lives and aims of the migrants and the maintenance of social networks.

In addition, Conway (2000) states that there is presently a lack of depth concerning the differences among transnational communities. Conway (2000) feels that the concept of transnationalism is problematic when it comes to understanding the lives of migrants, the circumstances within which they choose mobility and the consequences of their movement and behaviour in the sending and receiving areas.

Given the debates about transnationalism, Miles (1993) succinctly states that in a globalised economy, issues related to transnational migration plays a complex role. The implication here is that not many studies have been successful in attempting to unearth the intricate socio-cultural and political dimensions of transnational migrants and this study hopes to achieve some degree of success in this area.
In an attempt to understand migrant teachers' reasons for exiting and re-entering SA, it is imperative to embark on a discussion of the existing theories of migration. Massey et al (1998) distinguish between theories that explain the initiation of migration as opposed to theories that focus on a continued migration. Their differentiation between each of these theories is discussed below.

### 2.3.4 Theories of Migration

Halfacree (2004:239) has called for "a greater appreciation of non-economic issues" that impact on migrant behaviour. He is of the opinion that the complexities of migration should be under scrutiny in research. Lawson (1999) similarly argues that migration literature focuses on economics and thus has a tendency to eclipse other factors of influence in the decision-making process. The present study responds to this call for an inclusion of all reasons relevant to migrant teachers' decisions. Despite this, the importance of economics in the decision of teachers to migrate should not be underestimated. There is panoply of economic theories about migration, but only those that can be adapted to international migration are discussed in this section. Theories will be differentiated along lines of whether they are based on the initiation of migration or the perpetuation of it.

#### i) Initiation of Migration

This section explores the tenets of five theories that generate migration processes.

#### a) Neoclassical macro economic theory

This theory was initially developed to explain internal labour migration (Todaro, 1976). It purports that international migration is caused by geographic differences in the demand for, and supply of, labour. The propositions implicit in this theory are as follows (Massey et al, 1998:18):

- International labour migration is caused by a difference in wages between countries.
The elimination of such differentials will end labour movement.

International flows of human capital (skilled labour) yields a distinctly different pattern to that of unskilled workers.

Labour market mechanisms influence the international flow of workers.

Thus the only way for governments to control migration flows is to influence labour markets in sending or receiving countries.

The weakness of this theory lies in the premise of migrants being individual, rational people. Its strength lies in the consideration of the differences in the demand for, and supply of, labour in countries.

b) Neoclassical micro economic Theory

Here individual rational people migrate after a cost-benefit calculation where the said individuals expect to receive a positive monetary gain (Borjas, 1990). According to neoclassical economic theory:

- International movement stems not only from earnings but from employment rates in the place of destination.
- Individual human capital characteristics (education, experience, language skills etc.) increase the rate of remuneration and the probability of employment in the destination.
- The probability for international movement is increased by individual characteristics, social conditions and technologies that lower migration costs.
- Migration will not stop until earnings and employment rates are equalized internationally.
- Migration decisions are specifically related to the labour market.
- Governments can control immigration through policies that affect expected earnings in sending and or receiving countries (Massey et al, 1998:21).

This theory omits the importance of the household in migration. Much emphasis is placed on sending countries, and receiving countries are neglected. In attempting to forge a case for financial gain this theory ignores the relevance of additional reasons for migration other than economic benefit. As suggested by Lundholm et al (2004) economic reasons alone are insufficient in explaining why people move.
c) *New Economics of Labour Migration*

This theory is associated with Stark (1991) and it refines and enriches the neo-classical approach. Common to both theories is the issue of rational choice. It differs from neo-classical theory in that the role of the family or household is stressed in the decision-making process. That is, members of the household will decide that an individual has to migrate as opposed to the individual migrant making a decision. It alludes to the premise that migration is a family strategy undertaken to minimise risks such as unemployment or loss of income. The new economics theory is of relevance as it highlights the role of families or households and it also pays attention to vital information such as the interdependence between migrants and the context in which they operate. The hypotheses for this theory are as follows:

- Households are appropriate units of analysis for migration research.
- A wage differential is not necessary for migration but households may need to diversify risk or accumulate capital.
- Households may thus engage in local activities as well as migration.
- Governments can influence migration rates through policies that affect labour markets and other programmes, for example unemployment and retirement (Massey *et al*, 1998:22).

A criticism is that this theory is not applicable to the movement of entire households and it is solely concerned with the causes of migration leading to exit. Further, much "emphasis is placed on agrarian households and their circumstances such as capital and credit markets" (Massey *et al*, 1998:21).

d) *Dual Labour/Segmented Market Theory*

In contrast to the New Economics Theory, dual labour focuses only on the receiving end of migration. According to this theory international migration is fueled by a permanent demand for foreign labour as a result of certain characteristics of advanced industrial societies (Piore, 1979), as is the case of teacher shortages in the UK. Therefore, migration is not a result of push factors in sending countries but pull factors in receiving countries, namely, a chronic need for foreign
workers. The demand for immigrant labour is due to four characteristics of advanced industrial economies:

- **Structural inflation** - where attracting locals by raising wages in times of labour scarcity is expensive and disruptive, hence employers seek cheaper and easier solutions such as the importation of migrant labour.

- **Hierarchical constraints on motivation** - people work not only for income but also for the accumulation and maintenance of social status. Motivational problems arise at the bottom of the hierarchy because there is no status to be maintained and there are no avenues for upward mobility. Immigrants satisfy this need for at least at the beginning of their careers as target earners seeking money for a specific goal.

- **Economic dualism** - workers in the capital-intensive primary sector get stable skilled jobs working with the best equipment and tools. In the labour-intensive sector workers hold unstable, unskilled jobs. The dualism between labour and capital leads to native workers being drawn into the primary capital-intensive sector where wages are higher and jobs are secure. Immigrants will thus fill the shortfall of workers in the labour-intensive sector.

- **Ethnic enclaves** - an enclave economy emerges when an initial wave of elite emigrants possessing large amounts of financial, social, human or cultural capital concentrate in one urban area. After becoming established there and founding new businesses, they employ successive waves of lower status immigrants from the same country. The concentrated population of ethnics create a demand for specialized cultural products that immigrants are uniquely qualified to fill (Massey et al, 1998:28).

This theory explains the following (Massey et al, 1998:29-34):

- There are unstable and low productivity jobs in advanced economies;
- Local workers shunning such jobs;
- Local workers' reluctance to occupy unattractive jobs which cannot be solved by raising the wages attached to such jobs;
- Foreign workers from low-income countries willingness to accept such jobs; and
- Structural labour demands being no longer able to be filled as before by women and teenagers.
It is valuable for highlighting the structural demand for foreign labour that is inherent in advanced societies, as well as providing explanations for such a demand. It also dispels the idea that immigrant workers compete with local workers, affecting the latter’s level of wages and employment prospects (Arango, 2001).

Arango (2001) details the numerous flaws of this theory. Firstly, it excludes push factors in the sending countries and therefore explains only a portion of reality. It is taken for granted that most migrants end up finding employment. Also, major emphasis is placed on recruitment, yet in many advanced industrial economies migrants are not coerced into moving. Moreover, this theory fails to explain why different advanced industrial economies with similar economic structures exhibit different immigration rates (Arango, 2001).

e) World Systems Theory

This theory suggests that highly developed economies need foreign labour to work for low wages. Wallerstein (1974) conceptualized the notion that a world system of European hegemony took place since the sixteen century consisting of three concentric spheres: core states, semi-periphery and peripheral areas (Wallerstein, 1974). Migration is thus a product of domination exerted by core countries over peripheral areas in the context of international relationships. Therefore migration stems from inequality, that is, an unbalanced international order. In order to counteract a declining rate of profit as domestic wages rise, core countries intervene in peripheral areas in search of raw materials and profit from cheap labour (Massey et al, 1998). Migration thus operates as a global labour supply system. A major criticism is that world systems theory appears as an interpretation of history accounting for relationships or links between countries connected by past colonial bonds rather than a theory of migration. It omits explanations regarding migration flows between unconnected or weakly connected countries (Arango, 2001).

Despite the numerous theories on the initiation of migration, Lundholm et al (2004:60) concedes that the research design in migration studies is flawed in that “people are rarely consulted on how
they arrived at their decision to migrate”. Where studies have involved pre-migration decisions, Eklund (1999) contends that they have been conducted after migration has occurred. She advances the view that respondents in such studies have a tendency to infuse logic into their motivations for exiting as the passing of time will change attitudes about events.

ii) Perpetuation of Migration

The theories expanded upon in this section, social capital and cumulative causation, sustain the process of migration. This study will advance that the following two theories should not be viewed in isolation but rather as complementary to each other (Massey et al, 1998).

a) Social Capital Theory

Bourdieu and Wacquant (1992:119) make reference to social capital (actual or virtual resources) that accrue to an individual or group as a result of a strong network of relationships. A particular trait of social capital is its convertibility most often to money: either foreign wages or remittances. Access to social capital is gained through network or social institution membership and converted to other forms of capital to improve or maintain a position in society (Bourdieu, 1986). Migrant networks are cited as examples of social capital theory (Massey et al, 1998).

Migration networks can be defined as sets of interpersonal relations that link migrants or returned migrants with relatives, friends or fellow countrymen at home (Massey et al, 1998). They convey information, provide financial assistance, facilitate employment and accommodation and give support in various forms. In doing so they reduce the costs and uncertainty of migration, and therefore facilitate it (Massey et al, 1998). Social networks provide one of the most important explanations of migration. Many migrants move because others with whom they are connected migrated before, which Massey et al (1998) constitute as social capital. Such social capital will be utilized to gain access to financial capital. The initial migrants departing for a new destination are without social relations thus making migration costly. However, the costs of migration for friends and relatives left behind is reduced by virtue of the assistance that they will receive at the destination by the initial migrants. Social networks may
therefore lead to migration having a multiplier effect. An analysis of this trend was previously referred to as chain migration. In time institutions known to individuals can constitute a type of social capital, which migrants can later use to enter foreign labour markets. Of particular interest to education are recruitment agents who can actively create flows of migration to specific destinations, depending on demands in destination countries (Massey et al, 1998).

b) Cumulative Causation

This theory purports that over time international migration is self-sustaining. A key premise is that every act of migration alters the social context for subsequent migration decisions. Social scientists delineate 3 ways in which migration is affected cumulatively:

- expansion of networks - each new migrant reduces the costs and risks for future friends and relatives that will migrate.
- distribution of income - with some families improving their income through migration, families earning a lower income may feel relatively deprived, inducing them to migrate and thus exacerbating income inequality.
- distribution of land - land is often purchased by migrants abroad (Massey et al, 1998).

The above theories have aimed at explaining why people move - the causes of migration. Lundholm et al (2004) has suggested that social networks (e.g. families with children) in the home country are responsible for reducing migration for people over the age of 30. They further contend that in Nordic countries households with two incomes also displayed a low propensity to migrate. In general, the above migration theories are based on the primary movement from the sending country to the destination country. The following section encompasses a discussion on a cyclic pattern, where migrants choose to return to the sending country after a period of absence.

2.3.5 Return Migration

Margolis (1998:31) introduced the concept of a sojourner in her study of Brazilians in the United States. She noted that migration was a temporary strategy to achieve a specific economic
outcome. Brazilians envisaged themselves as target earners intent on accomplishing an objective "back home - buy a house/ apartment, car, start a business ...". A successful migration is thus judged in terms of material benefits that accumulate to the migrant. Halfacree (2004) noted in his study on internal migration in developed countries that reasons expressed for migration other than finance, were travel and the opportunity to interact with people from different social milieus.

Return migration came under the spotlight during the late 1970's by migration scholars across the world (Gmelch, 1980; Stack, 1996). Gmelch (1980) demarcated typologies of return migration by drawing a distinction between emigrants whose departure was temporary and those who were leaving permanently. Dustman (1999) drew attention to return migration being a result of the termination of a contract in addition to individual choice. Gmelch (1980) alluded to the latter reason in his study. He proposed the idea that migrants are more likely to return because of close family bonds than monetary reasons. Stack (1996) revealed similar findings in a study of African Americans returning from northern cities to the rural south. Margolis (1998:31) identified a pattern among migrants that had returned, they had a propensity to re-migrate leading to what she termed ‘yo-yo migration’. Re-migration is in effect a brain drain as migrants are once again leaving their home country. Research conducted on return migration in sending and receiving societies have explored the impact of out-migration on family in the home country and the reintegration of migrants after many years abroad (Brettell, 2000). In addition to the socio-economic and cultural impacts of migration at the micro level of the family, there exists an economic effect at the macro level of the country, in the event of emigration.

2.3.6 Brain Drain

In South Africa, as in the rest of sub-Saharan Africa, there has been much investment in human capital for decades (Campbell et al, 1995). Human capital consists of income producing skills, knowledge and experience embodied in individuals. This stock in capital can be increased by specific actions, e.g. migration to a higher paying job overseas, which leads to human capital
flight, alternatively called brain drain. It involves highly skilled professionals leaving developing countries for opportunities in developed countries (World Markets Research, 2002). Abedian (2001:2) notes that successful countries such as the UK, Canada, USA and Australia vie with each other to attract skilled labour because when a “skilled immigrant enters a country, with him or her comes a sum of ‘past investments’ as well as a stream of ‘future revenues’ based on the embedded competencies of that individual”. The repercussions of the loss of such individuals from developing countries are enormous. The twin effects it has for African economies are losing the best human capital and spending money on educating and training replacements.

The first attempt to provide a comprehensive quantitative assessment of the brain drain was completed by Carrington and Detragiache (1998) who set out to ask the question: Do highly skilled professionals from Less Developed Countries (LDC’s) living abroad represent a sizable fraction of the pool of skilled workers in their countries of origin or are their numbers too small to worry about? A concern of Carrington and Detragiache’s (1998) research is the reductionist approach that they adopted in the International Monetary Fund (IMF) working paper. Targeting numeracy should be secondary to an expression of the loss of the best human resources of a country. Nevertheless, they have stated categorically that their estimates were rough. Methodological shortcomings in their study accounted for their lack of precise quantification.

The extensive use of OECD data and US census data was flawed in that only the top 5 out of 10 immigrant sending countries to each OECD country was recorded, and in small countries estimates of immigration to OECD countries other than the US was understated. Furthermore, the definition of migrants was stated as foreign-born residents over 25 years of age, excluding graduate students. Not withstanding the shortcomings, what could be gleaned from this study with regard to Africa, is that the biggest migratory flows to the US are from Egypt, Ghana and South Africa. It is of importance that in all three countries, sixty percent of the migrants have a tertiary education. Carrington and Detragiache (1998) acknowledge that future research is necessary to obtain the occupational categories of the highly skilled migrants in order to assess the brain drain in specific professional groups.
With regard to the movement of SA teachers, it is important to ascertain whether teachers (as professionals) in other countries across the globe are becoming mobile. The answer to this lies in the following section, which focuses on teacher attrition and global teacher trends. Prior to commencement of this discussion, it was imperative to begin with a differentiation between the terms teacher and educator as it had direct bearing on the title of this thesis. The South African Council of Educators (SACE) defines an educator as “any person who teaches, educates/trains other persons or professional therapy at any school, technical college or college of education or assists in rendering professional services or educational auxiliary services provided by or in a department of education (and whose employment is regulated by the SA Employment of Educator’s Act (1998) and any other person registered with the council” (SACE code of conduct, 2000). An educator is a separate entity from a teacher by virtue of employment regulations decided upon by the Educator’s Employment Act, which implies a link to formal policy. A teacher is linked to everyday experience and understanding in a classroom (Harley, Bertram and Mattson, 1999). For the purposes of this study, the term teacher will be utilized as the study is based on professionals seeking a change in classroom understanding and experience. Given the above clarity, the following section embarks on a discussion of the demand for teachers in first world countries and solutions that have been adopted to address the problem.

2.4 Teacher Attrition: Global Trends and Corresponding Responses

The most significant contemporary educational trend appears to be a shortage of teachers. It is a global problem that came under the spotlight at a world conference by Educational International (EI) in July 2001 (Naidu, 2001). Fred van Leeuwan, general secretary of EI maintained that teacher shortages emanated in both developing and developed countries. He stated, “in many industrialized nations the profession is ageing due to an insufficient flow of young people while in low income countries the recruitment of teachers does not keep pace with the school enrolment” (cited in Naidoo, 2001:8). Teacher shortages were reported in the United States, United Kingdom, Canada, Australia and Netherlands. It is interesting to note that these are all developed countries. Low-income countries take a peripheral position on the subject regardless of them sharing the same problem. This is evident in the dearth of literature on international teacher shortages in developing countries.
The USA highlighted its predicament as far back as 1995 when the Department of Education stated its concern regarding teacher shortage to government. The issue of the attrition of public school teachers in the USA thus became an area of great concern to policymakers and the US administration. A portion of teacher shortage resulted from fewer college students entering the profession but the greatest factor was teacher attrition (Boe et al, 1995). In 1997 President Bill Clinton in his state of the Union address tackled this issue by challenging all Americans to make sure that there was a talented, dedicated and well prepared teacher in every classroom across the country. He stated “we must be able to recruit and hire qualified teachers and keep them in the profession” (State of the Union Address, 1997 quoted in MSA Educational Leadership Program, 1999). The reason for teacher attrition appeared to be multifold. The MSA Educational Leadership Program stated that US schools were failing to deliver a high quality of education. This view led to a labelling of teachers as incompetent. Coupled with needs critical to job satisfaction (such as salary) disenchanted teachers were dropping out of urban public schools leading to a reduced workforce (MSA Educational Leadership, 1999).

The reforms instituted to address the problem by the US government focused on supporting and developing teachers. For example, the introduction of a mentor program where beginner teachers are provided with an experienced mentor to assist and support them. Financial support was given to three cities (New York, San Francisco and Jacksonville) to develop new beginner teacher programs. In North Colombia teachers’ pay was raised to the national average in 2000. Increased pay was also offered to teachers attaining further educational qualifications. Recruitment of overseas teachers is another alternative, which has gathered impetus. Numerous Jamaican teachers were offered jobs in New York. The Centre for Recruitment and Professional Development of New York City schools selected 600 Jamaican teachers in just one recruitment drive. Education Minister Senator Whiteman of Jamaica responded to the recruitment drive by stating that as the exact figures had not been forwarded to the ministry, the effect on the education system could not be gauged. He added that Jamaican teachers were being trained for the world economy and that it should be seen “as a credit to the quality of local teachers that they were being sought by international recruiters”. On the flipside he acknowledged the dangers of
some of the best teachers leaving but he added that many teachers would remain because they were "committed to their families and their country" (The Gleaner, 04-06-2001).

In the United Kingdom there has been a steady decline since 1996 in the number of entrants to initial teacher training courses and those entering the teaching profession (Whitehead, Preece and Maughan, 1999; Whitehead and Postlethwaite, 2000). The demand for teachers became an issue of national concern and led to a government enquiry (House of Commons, 1997). As a result the Teacher Training Agency (TTA) has opened up new training routes as a means of attracting recruits. The most emphasized option was that of recruiting mature students from other occupations such as industry, commerce or research (Whitehead, Preece and Maughan, 1999). Individual schools have also acquired the services of recruitment agencies to recruit qualified teachers from abroad, for example, from South Africa. Much negative media coverage of the UK has accompanied recruitment drives in South Africa (BBC News, 2001; Goldring, 2001; Ryan, 2001). This will be discussed in depth in the following section.

2.5 Teaching in South Africa: Professional and Policy Dynamics

It is imperative to contextualise the study by scrutinizing the recent policy shifts in education in SA. This will be followed by concerns voiced by sectors of society about teacher migration to the UK.

2.5.1 Policy Shifts in South Africa

In a micro-cosm, changes in SA education needs to be understood in context. Education policy changes in post-1998 is explored for its effect or possible links to the propensity of South African teachers to migrate. 1998 was a year, which heralded many changes in the education

---

6 SA had declared that it had a surplus of teachers based on the Hofmeyer and Hall audit (1995).
7 The first democratic election in SA was held in 1994. The Constitution of SA (Act 108 of 1996) provided the foundation for curriculum transformation and development. That is, the incoming government sought to introduce policy changes in education to address the inequities of the past and address future challenges (Chisholm, 2000).
scenario, especially changes in curriculum policy (OBE) and teacher organization (rationalization and redeployment of surplus teachers). An examination of recent South African education policy changes (in the last 5 years since 1998) and teachers' reactions to these policies is imperative in setting the scene for teacher migration. Decisions that created the greatest impacts for level-one teachers were in the introduction curriculum policy and teacher organization.

i) **Curriculum Policy:**

This section explores the implementation of Outcomes-Based Education (OBE) and the National Curriculum Statement (NCS) at schools. Research into teachers' reactions and understanding of the new changes are also examined.

a) **Outcomes Based Education (OBE)**

A change in the curriculum to outcomes-based education was initiated in January 1998 in grade 8. The Department of Education (DoE) stipulated that the OBE curriculum will be introduced to each grade on an annual basis so that by 2005 all grades in South African state schools will be implementing the OBE system. Malcolm (2001:220) has argued that the curriculum "shift to OBE in SA has been dramatic". He alludes to Jansen's (1998) observation that prior to the 1995 White Paper, not only was there little referral in planning documents to OBE but also a lack of dialogue at grassroots school level. Jansen (1998) outlines numerous reasons why OBE will fail in SA. He contends that consultation only took place at national level. At local level this has had negative repercussions for teachers who felt alienated from the process and therefore unprepared for the new curriculum (Carrim, 2001).

What are the major tenets of the new curriculum that makes ownership by teachers so necessary? The Government (Gazette 19640, 23-12-1998:10) argued "OBE is a learner-centred, result-oriented approach to education and training that builds on the notion that all learners need to, and can, achieve their full potential but that this may not happen in the same way or within the same
period. Furthermore, OBE “introduces a shift from a system that was dominated by public examinations and whose main function has always been to rank, grade, select and certificate learners to a new system that informs and improves the curriculum and assessment practices of educators and the leadership, governance and organization of learning sites. For that reason diversification of modes of assessment and improved expertise among educators in designing, developing and using appropriate assessment instruments must be given priority” (Government Gazette19640, 23-12-1998:10). But this did not materialise.

The idea of OBE was thus in keeping with issues of redress and participation but according to researchers this was not achieved. Grange and Reddy (2000) revealed that the five-day workshops conducted by the department officials fell short in preparing teachers for policy shifts and transformation in a classroom. Furthermore, workshops were lacking in that they favoured new terminology over explanations of novel concepts and methods (Malcolm, 2001). The retraining of teachers is not the only facet that was severely overlooked by the Department of Education. There was also a failure to implement a management strategy inclusive of teachers so that there could be a positive shared vision of education (Singh and Manser, 2000). At the coalface historically disadvantaged black schools remained under-resourced and lacked the capacity to successfully implement OBE, hence negating the intentions of policy makers. Jansen (1999) articulated another problem that he foresaw, namely, OBE ‘de-skilling’ teachers. This is achieved by what Young (2001:35) calls ‘box-ticking’. In essence it is a technical assessment procedure that is adopted by teachers of OBE to ascertain the developmental level of pupils.

In May 2000, The Chisholm Review of C2005 was presented to the Minister of Education (Asmal) in Pretoria, providing recommendations on four key features of the new curriculum: staggered implementation of the curriculum in grades 4-8 in 2000, factors for success and strategies for strengthening the curriculum, a structure for the new curriculum and understanding of OBE. It outlined the shortcomings as being numerous: schools and teachers felt that the process was too hasty, coupled with an absence of resources. Chisholm (2000) stated in Chapter Nine of the Review “Although C2005 inaugurated a new dispensation in education in SA, its
implementation occurred in conditions that did not enable it to meet social or personal goals. C2005 was too complex and insufficiently balanced. In its movement from policy to practice, C2005 was stymied by lack of resources and capacity to implement”.

The report did indicate that while there was support for OBE, its implementation was thwarted by the following: “curriculum structure and design, inadequate orientation, training and development of teachers, a lack of alignment between curriculum and assessment policy, learning support materials, policy overload and shortages of personnel to implement and support the curriculum”.

b) National Curriculum Statement (NCS)

The draft national curriculum statement opened for public scrutiny in January 2001. Since then provincial and district staff have agreed that it was inappropriate for teachers to be exposed to draft policy before bureaucrats (Potenza, 2002). As Potenza (2002:28) explained “teachers are the key stakeholders in the curriculum policy and the greater their ownership of the curriculum the more effectively it will be implemented”. This is important as it is easy to embrace a change if you have been party to its development. The curriculum statement is equivalent to a year plan for each learning area\(^8\) in each grade. At present teachers face a dilemma in managing two varying curricula: Curriculum 2005 for grade 1-9 (C2005 uses OBE as a tool for implementation) and the interim syllabus (grades 10-12), and the national curriculum statement (grades R-9). This created tension regarding which should take priority in a classroom setting.

The National Curriculum Statement (NCS) contains learning outcomes and assessment standards and it is therefore an important tool to strengthen OBE. Implementation of the NCS has been staggered since 2003 (grades 1-3). In each successive year, it will be implemented to three

\(^8\) There are 8 learning areas: Languages, Mathematics, Natural Sciences, Social Sciences, Arts and Culture, Life Sciences and Technology.
consecutive grades. A problem is envisaged when NCS is fully implemented, namely C2005 textbooks will not be applicable with the new strategy. This will possibly lead to an outcry as was the case when OBE was introduced where teachers felt that they were under-resourced in terms of physical resource (e.g. textbooks).

The impact of the above policy shifts affects teachers' professional development as they need not only keep abreast of changes but to also embrace the transformation so that implementation filters to the classroom environment. Harley and Mattson (2003) have revealed in their study in KZN that teachers are ‘strategically mimicking’ changes expected of them in classroom practice. However, they are insecure in respect of the new policy demands because of their limited understanding. If teachers do not feel sufficiently confident about their abilities to implement change it will negatively impact on their efficacy. Further to rapid curriculum changes, there was a need to redress the apartheid imbalances in the distribution of teachers in public schools. This was attempted through the introduction of the teacher organization policies in schools on an annual basis.

ii) **Teacher Organisation:**

The following section discusses the impacts the rationalization and redeployment process (R&R). It constitutes applying the post-provisioning norm (PPN) for a school, which then determines the teachers who will be deemed as additional (to the staff) and then redeployed to another school.

a) **Rationalisation and Redeployment (R&R)**

Consultation between the DoE and Teacher Unions at national level led to Resolution 6 of 1998 dealing with the rationalization and redeployment (R&R) of teacher personnel. The goal of R&R was to address the imbalances of the past by redistributing excess teacher personnel, yet it came short of doing so (Govender, 2001; Neerchand, 2000). The persons responsible for managing the process of rationalization & redeployment at provincial level were not empowered to do so,
resulting in the withdrawal of department circulars and the release of new circulars and amendments. The DoE was forced to concede in January 2000 via circular 2 of 2000 that the process of R&R during the period 1998/99 "was not proceeding satisfactorily nor according to plan".

Tensions between school management and teachers were exacerbated by the manipulation of the post-provisioning norm (determines the number of teachers required in a school), resulting in more teachers being declared in excess (Govender, 2001). For teachers declared in excess there was much confusion and anxiety. Many of the vacant posts to which they were assigned were in inaccessible areas, compounding their problems of safety and security. This led to low teacher morale and an increase in leave taking and absenteeism (Neerchand, 2000). Hence schools were left without teachers at crucial times in the year and this resulted in overcrowding in classrooms.

Presently (2004), there still appears to be problems in the implementation of R&R. For example HRM circular 20 of 2003 was a clarification of circulars 8 and 10 of 2003 and HRM circular 22 of 2003 contained amendments to circulars 9 and 18 of 2003. Also, HRM circular 54B of 2004 was a withdrawal of the post-provisioning norm for 2004. Teachers who had thus been redeployed to schools had to return to their former schools after a term of teaching.

The question that needs to be answered at this point is how has the above changes impacted on teachers? In order to achieve a holistic view of teacher thinking, it is imperative to understand how teachers construct their identity within a context of transforming policy.

---

* See appendix 9 & 10 for details of HRM circular 20 and 22 of 2003.
2.5.2 Teachers' Identities

This section is devoted to three factors that have the potential to influence teachers' identities hence their decision to migrate: Education Policy, Teachers' Work and Teachers' Efficacy.

i) Education Policy

There has been a plethora of research each with varied approaches to teacher identity (Carrim, 2003; Mattson and Harley, 2003; Soudien, 2003; Samuels, 2003; Jansen, 2003). Despite the differences, their studies have suggested that teachers' identities are complex, teachers are constantly changing sometimes experiencing discord and this can lead to negative repercussions. Another dimension of teacher identity that emerges in early studies by Carrim (2001), have concluded that teachers differ and should not be viewed as a homogenous group. Later in his research Carrim (2003) examines contextual conceptions of being a teacher, namely, as an intellectual, as a professional, as a gendered and racial subject, and as a facilitator. He has suggested that the differing roles of teachers sometimes lead to conflict. The intent of post-apartheid 1994 education policy was to reprofessionalise teachers, but he purports that this has been thwarted by a lack of recognition of the multiplicity of teachers' identities and the increasing bureaucratic control of teachers. Basic human rights such as freedom to choose the school in which you wish to teach is overlooked, leading to a disillusioned and demoralized teacher corps.

Jansen (2003) approaches teacher identities by clarifying the relationship between policy image (as understood by policy makers) and teachers' identities. He is opposed to the singular form of teacher identity. This valuable insight recognizes the plurality of how teachers perceive themselves. Jansen (2003:32-33) espouses three facets of teachers' identities (political, professional and emotional) that can be used as a framework to understand how teachers view themselves given changes in policy:

- Professional - how a teacher understands his/her capacity to implement proposed policy.
Emotional - the ways in which a teacher understands his/her capability to handle emotional demands of new policy, given present demands (e.g. larger learner numbers in class).

Political - the ways in which teachers understand and act, given their personal backgrounds and professional interests.

It is important to note that teachers are not merely instruments of policy change. Various aspects of their identities are brought to bear in delivering the said policy changes.

Soudien (2003) has also explored and documented teachers’ experiences of their own identities and roles. He concludes that the process of identity formation is complex and that teachers are constantly ‘in movement’. This makes it difficult for researchers to fully know teachers. In order to know oneself as a teacher, the parameters of a teacher’s work needs to be defined.

ii) Teachers’ Work

Very few would disagree that the nature and demands of teaching has changed over the past years. Teaching is not what it used to be - to borrow a phrase from Hargreaves (1994). The responsibilities of teachers have become more extensive with changes in curriculum, pressure for reform, varying assessment strategies - to name just a few. Explanations for changes in teacher’s work have focused on ‘professionalisation’ and ‘intensification’ (Hargreaves, 1994). Debate on issues of professionalisation has centered on extensions of the teacher’s role through mutual support, professional growth, experience of leadership and a commitment to continuous improvement. Intensification centers on a continuous extension of tasks assigned to teachers, coupled with constant change. It is therefore evident that teaching has become more complex in recent years with repercussions for teachers’ political, emotional and professional well-being. The next section provides a discussion of the major tenets of theory of intensification with specific reference to teachers.
a) Theory of Intensification

Intensification is derived from the theory of labour. Underpinning this view is the nuance of a hidden agenda where teachers willingly collaborate in their own exploitation under a guise of professionalism. Within this ambit, teachers' work has become increasingly dense. Teachers are expected to react to greater pressure and adapt to numerous innovations. Larson (1980: 165) and more recently Apples and Jungck (1992) have outlined the tangible results of intensification, which negatively impacts on teachers:

- Reduced time for relaxation during the work day, including eroded lunch breaks;
- Less time to retool one's skills and keep abreast of one's field;
- A persistent overload, which inhibits involvement in, and control over, long term planning. It also fosters dependency on externally produced materials and expertise;
- A reduced quality of service; and
- Enforced diversification by acceptance to cover personnel shortages, which can lead to a reduction in the quality of service.

In Apples and Jungck's (1992) work intensification is viewed as externally produced and imposed objectives. Additional administrative and assessment tasks coupled with less opportunity for creative work has led to teacher complaints. Consequently, the time for teachers to meet, plan, share, help and discuss in the regular school day is increasingly eroded. Broadfoot and Osborn (1988) engaged in comparative studies of what they define as the teacher's role which Apples and Jungck (1992) have termed teachers' work. The former have indicated that the role of the teacher varies. In France, for example, the teacher's role is clarified; it is specified in accordance with academic learning and performance. In Britain and North America the role of teachers is being redefined more widely, encompassing social, emotional, academic and child-welfare goals. Teachers thus allude to what Broadfoot and Osborn (1988) term 'compressed time,' that is, in essence, a feeling that time is rapidly passing and work does not seem to draw to a close. The emotional and professional dilemma facing teachers could thus be extrapolated to include whether teachers feel increasingly pressurized by their role functions, leading to dissatisfaction, low morale and eventual exit from SA. This also has bearing on reasons for return-migration.
Samuel (2003) in his research advances a force-field model of teacher development. He (Samuel, 2003) posits that teacher identity is being pushed and pulled by a host of forces: biographical experiences (personal experiences of e.g race, sex, language) programmatic training (student teacher preparation programs at teacher training institutions) and school contexts (management, pupils, peers). Personal choice accounted for the extent to which student teachers allowed the above-mentioned factors to influence them. He purports that teacher identity is constructed in terms of the forces that influence a teacher. His theoretical model of teacher development, is of particular relevance to this study. A valid dimension that has been omitted in this model is the outcomes of the push and pull forces. Samuel (2003) has suggested that teachers are by no means static. However, if the end product of binary forces is extreme dissatisfaction, this will lead to teachers exiting South Africa, either temporarily or permanently.

Research on teacher identity have thus analysed various dimensions including professional, social, gender and race dynamics. However, of all the aspects, ‘race’ has been predominant (Carrim, 2003). Post-apartheid South Africa heralded the removal of an official differentiation of schools on the basis of race, ethnicity and language but Jacklin (2001) maintains that these differences have not disappeared. Her reasoning stems from the idea that schools develop unique cultures through many factors such as rules regarding language, religion, and staff selection and through their management policies. She omits to add that schools, through their teachers are also responsible for perpetuating the culture they develop. Hence, teachers newly appointed to schools may be faced with rejection if they do not subscribe to the existing ethos at such institutions. Such discontentment will impact on their professional identity and classroom efficacy.

ii) Teacher Efficacy and Stage Development

As recently as the beginning of the last decade Hargreaves (1994:5) argued that the teacher is the “ultimate key to educational change and school improvement.” He elaborated on this by stating that the restructuring of schools and the composition of provincial and national curricula is of
little value if teachers are not taken into consideration. The premise that underpins his thinking is that teachers don’t simply deliver the curriculum. They are responsible for developing, defining and reinterpreting it. Their methods of teaching are grounded in their backgrounds, biographies and capacities. Hargreaves (1994:06) notes that of particular importance to “teachers’ careers are their hopes, dreams, opportunities, aspirations and frustrations” as it has a direct correlation to their commitment, enthusiasm and morale. Also related are their relationships with their colleagues and whether they work in isolation or in teams.

Teacher efficacy is also an area of concern where research data is much needed. Teacher efficacy according to Bandura’s (1977) definition is a type of self-efficacy: a kind of cognitive process in which people construct beliefs about their performance capacities at certain levels of achievement. These beliefs influence a person’s resilience in the face of obstacles and how much effort a person uses when dealing with difficult situations (Moran & Hoy, 1998). Closely related to a teacher’s efficacy is stage development theory, which has been adapted for use in other field disciplines for example, Maslow’s hierarchy of needs in psychology. It has also been applied to studies in education, for example (Huberman, 1993) used stage development theory to understand teachers’ thinking patterns. Huberman (1993) subscribes to the belief that a teacher’s life is sequential and cyclic. However, he explains that not all teachers will experience these sequences and cycles in the same order, age or time. The first phase, which is called ‘exploration’, encapsulates the initial years of the teaching profession. This is followed by the ‘stabilizing phase’ defined by the commitment of a teacher to his job description. The phase is generally when a teacher is between 4-6 years in the profession. The following phase, diversification, is characterized by a teacher’s experimentation with other opportunities. Such may include a critique of the profession or an increase in the teacher’s ambition. A teacher’s efficacy can be negatively affected in this phase. Failure to achieve gratification via experimentation, will lead to the next phase called ‘reassessment’. Reassessment is a period of self-doubt where the teacher considers many factors including characteristics of the educational institution, family, political and economic issues. The result of such an assessment is either to continue teaching (same career) or to follow a new path. The final phase termed ‘disengagement’ is a result of both these paths. The teacher accepts the negative aspects of the profession and then
disengages or disengages resentfully from the profession. The above theory served as a useful tool in understanding the migration of teachers to the UK. SA teachers were disengaging but only from the SA teaching profession.

The above discussion served to highlight the organizational and policy changes that influence teacher identity since 1998 in South Africa. It attempted to explain a context where some disenchanted SA teachers, in the disengagement phase of their career, were concurrently reacting to a shortage of teachers in industrialized nations by migrating internationally. The complexities of migrant teachers' decisions to leave SA were revealed through theorizing on teachers' identities. However, their exit has received a miscellany of comments from sectors in society.

2.5.3 Local Hype on Migration

The transnational movement of SA teachers has led to a hype centering on the issue of teacher migration to the UK. It appears to come from four major quarters of society: research, the media, politicians and migration specialists. A probing of their concerns is vital in ascertaining the extent to which their anxiety is justified. In order to critically address the concerns raised it is necessary to determine the present scenario in schools, bearing in mind that teachers form the building blocks of education and society.

At present there is a significant void in research regarding the demand and supply of teacher skills in a global market. However, according to Hofmeyr (2002) SA is facing a severe teacher shortage. Goldring (2001) shares this view, stating that teacher shortages are in some of the neediest areas such as rural schools, which are overcrowded and under-resourced. Similarly, years before, the 1995 Education Teacher Audit indicated that there would be a shortfall of secondary school teachers after 2000. These projections were based on an annual output of 26 000 teachers graduating from higher education institutions. The number of teachers has shrunk to below 6000 (Hofmeyer, 2002). Research completed for the Department of Education by Crouch (2001) predicted that more than 50 000 teachers will be required by 2010.
The latest statistics on a micro-level informing the demand and supply of KwaZulu-Natal teachers has been interrogated by Ramrathan (2002). He also provides a concise impact analysis on the education system by utilizing data obtained from multiple sources. Ramrathan’s (2002) study on teacher attrition in the context of HIV/AIDS pandemic revealed a new insight into Coombe’s (2000) study, which had received much publicity. His critique highlighted Coombe’s excessive use of secondary sources that represented the picture of AIDS in the education sector of SA. Nevertheless, Ramrathan (2002:135) does allude to the impact on teacher’s roles in schools given the HIV/AIDS pandemic:

- Reduced support to schools due to illness
- Reduced support to teaching and learning because of concerns for their own health
- Reduced care for the learners because society is unaccepting of people with HIV/AIDS

In a later article Ramrathan (2003) examined death rates among male and female teachers in KZN. He reveals that teachers are a low risk group. The only cause for possible concern is the death rate among male teachers in the age groups 31-35 and 46-50. However, here he suggests that life styles preferences and diseases such as heart condition could be responsible for the data in this cohort.

Ramrathan (2002) reveals three determinants that affect the calculation of the future teacher needs in KZN (pupil enrolment, teacher attrition and the supply of teachers from teacher education institutions). He concludes that planning in the following factors will impact the supply of teachers:

- a reduced teacher recruitment into PRESET (preservice training) teacher education programmes;
- a drop in the status of teaching;
- a change in pupil enrolment at schools and
- the impact of the HIV/AIDS pandemic,

---

10 The school Register of Needs in 1999, The Department of Education (KZN) survey of Schooling, staff and students (SNAP survey on the 10th schooling day in 2000), the KZN personnel database: persal 2000 and the KZN Department of Health’s Demographic and Health Survey in 1998.
He calculates that a mere 694 teachers will qualify in 2001. Based on attrition rates at an average of 4% he deduces that approximately 3000 teachers are required annually (Ramrathan, 2002) to prevent a teacher shortage in KZN. He fails to consider that upon graduation there is no guarantee that such individuals will enter the SA teacher corps. They may opt for teaching prospects abroad.

Teacher attrition through resignation in the age group 31-35 was constant for the years 1997-1999. Table 2.1 reflects the statistics of teacher resignation based on data collected by Ramrathan’s (2003).

Table 2.1: Percentages of the Number of Teachers Resigning in One Year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age group</th>
<th>1997</th>
<th>1998</th>
<th>1999</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MALE</td>
<td>FEMALE</td>
<td>MALE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21-25</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>3.1%</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26-30</td>
<td>10.3%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>8.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-35</td>
<td>9.5%</td>
<td>15.3%</td>
<td>9.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-40</td>
<td>7.6%</td>
<td>11.4%</td>
<td>8.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: adapted from Ramrathan (2003:64)

In table 2.1 Ramrathan (2003) alludes to a constant flow of resignations (31-35 years), which represents approximately 25% of annual resignations in KZN. It is salient that this trend differs from the study undertaken by Crouch (2001), which suggested a stabilizing of the teacher corps at national level. There appears to be a mismatch between the national trend as espoused by Crouch (2001) and the provincial resignation trend as presented by Ramrathan (2003). There was discontentment concerning issues of policy change and poor remuneration, which led to psychological stress.

The role functions of teachers in South Africa are numerous. In addition, they have been constantly reconfigured since 1998. The possibilities thus exist for dissatisfaction among South African teachers, as the perimeters of their responsibilities have continuously extended. Again this is an indictment on the DoE that has failed in the provision of adequate inservice training.
There also appears to have been inadequate dialogue between teachers and the DoE subsequent to the implementation of educational reforms (for e.g. OBE).

In addition to local statistics and concerns by researchers, the SA government has also responded. There has been much criticism levelled at the receiving country (UK) and the teachers who are migrating. Western Cape Premier Gerald Morkel addressed parliament on the brain drain from South Africa and the resultant lack of professional skills, which he saw as “sabotaging South Africa’s economic upturn”. Morkel also harshly criticized professionals who had emigrated saying that they were ‘faint hearted’ and ‘lacking in national pride’ (cited in Linscott, 1998:01). He suggested that South Africa should be taking a greater interest in the loss of skilled professionals from the country (cited in Linscott, 1998:01). The South African government severely criticized the UK for “poaching the country’s resources at a crucial time in the nation’s development” (BBC News; 16-02-2001). Goldring (2001) also alludes to the power of the pound taking the cream of the local profession. Education minister Kader Asmal (2001b:2) stated that he had no problem with individual teachers working abroad but argued that “consultation between the two governments would ensure that the interests of both countries could be taken into account”. Hughill (2002:30) also makes reference to criticisms levelled at South African teachers abroad that they were ‘abandoning their country’ which he deems unfair. Such comments from Hughill (2002) are predictable as he is currently in the employ of Timeplan (a UK based recruitment agency presently recruiting in SA).

What politicians and others are failing to answer or address is the question of why skilled people are leaving, particularly in the post-apartheid era (Louw, 2001). It appears that the decision to emigrate is generally based on a combination of factors. Chennault (1998:5) revealed social reasons of emigrants “wanting to escape South Africa’s crime scourge and exposure to technology available in richer countries”. With regard to crime The National Crime Prevention Strategy was introduced in 1996 to strengthen public and international confidence in the government’s capacity to deal with the levels of crime. Little has been achieved according to Cheru (2001) as SA continues to have a high incidence of all forms of violent crime. Cheru
(2001) adds that this is testing the government’s capacity to provide its citizens with a sufficiently secure environment. Louw (2001) suggests other reasons for leaving which include worries over the cost and quality of health and schooling.

Yet another reason for the migration of teachers could be the lack of suitable employment locally. Johannesburg College of Education Rector Graham Hall, commented that youngsters or newly qualified teachers were going abroad, indicating a lack of posts locally (Naidu, 2001). Chennault (1998) made the same deduction years earlier when she quoted unemployment rates in South Africa being an estimated 33%. This provides a potent incentive for work abroad. The importance of economic variables such as a higher pay also appears to be a distinct factor. Hughill (2002) also notes a decline in the status of teaching in South Africa as having been a contributing factor in teachers exiting the country.

Other reasons provided by Chennault (1998) lie in SA politics. It is suggested that Whites are unable to see themselves under a Black leadership (Chennault, 1998). It needs to be chronicled, albeit briefly, that South Africa underwent a complete transformation in the 1990’s from “White supremacist oligarchy to multi-racial democracy” (Bundy, 2002:26). The ruling party is majority Black with a strong affirmative action policy in place to address the imbalances of the past. The politics of neighbouring countries could also be affecting SA. Migration consultant Dirk Oberholzer quoted in Southern Africa Report (Louw, 2001b) links farm invasions and violence in Zimbabwe to the fluctuating value of the Rand as having prompted emigration. An estimation of emigration figures could illuminate the extent to which emigration is taking place. Recently Statistics South Africa estimated that an average of 1000 skilled people were leaving South Africa every month (Harichunder, 2001). Emigration experts estimated that the actual number could be three times more as there are more people who do not notify the authorities of their intention to emigrate. What was needed in these statistics is the net flows into the country which have as yet not been determined. There are no statistics on the number of teachers exiting or re-entering the country or the reasons for teachers choosing to migrate. Consequently, there is no policy in place to address teacher migration or investigate a resultant teacher shortage in the
event of a reduced teacher workforce in South Africa. There also exists the possibility that there could be teachers from neighbouring African countries migrating to SA. Samuel (2004) from the Ministerial Committee on Teacher Education revealed that there has been an increasing number of applications for the recognition of teacher qualifications from other African countries. It must be assumed that these individuals have intentions of entering the South African teaching fraternity. However, the duration of their career as teachers in SA also requires investigation. Could SA be a springboard to overseas countries for these teachers?

If not, bearing in mind Ramrathan’s study (2002), what is the health status of these teachers? de Rebello (2002) has reported on the HIV/AIDS status of four of SA’s neighbours: Botswana, Lesotho, Swaziland and Zimbabwe. Approximately, 36% of Botswana’s 15-49 year olds live with HIV/AIDS. In Lesotho, Swaziland and Zimbabwe, 25% percent in the same age group (15-49 years). Her data are mere estimates as there is a shroud of silence surrounding HIV/AIDS as a disease. Ochs (2003) has revealed in a Commonwealth study on teacher mobility and loss that in Swaziland teacher loss due to death or retirement quadrupled in two years (2000-2002). The highest cause of teacher loss in Zambia’s is death and Ochs (2003) suggests the likelihood of HIV/AIDS.

Notwithstanding the above, the South African government has attempted to partly address the skills deficit by embarking on a skills recruitment and development drive. However, Louw (2001a:12) is of the view that not much has been done with regard to curtailing the departure of locals. He cites the Director of the Department of Labour saying that South Africa intended to use diplomatic missions overseas to recruit foreign skills aggressively for at least the next 20 years. This strategy launched by the Education and Labour Departments followed a call by President Thabo Mbeki for the skills shortage to be addressed. The intention was to focus on general education with the emphasis on the foundation phase in Mathematics and Science (Louw, 2001a). This would help to alleviate shortages in the future. The program would be backed by new legislation. He added that the government would recruit from wherever skills were available.
Schiff (1996) appropriately notes the importance of collaboration by destination countries in the event of implementation of migrant taxation. The collaboration of migrants is essential between all sending and receiving countries not purely for political imperatives, but to achieve developmental goals. Again, this is no easy feat as it is well documented that immigration control adopted by countries is generally applied to unskilled labour as opposed to skilled labour.

Abedian (2001) in his address to parliament’s finance committee stated that South Africa has suffered a continuous brain drain over the past decade. He referred to rapid globalisation, which has created pull factors, such as high remuneration, the promise of less uncertainty, a more peaceful environment and a better lifestyle prospect. He was highly critical of South Africa’s immigration policy, which he fears was not in line with global society. He made reference to a backlog of skills and the Aliens Control Act of 1991 hindering the rate of economic growth and development in South Africa. The extensive bureaucracy in the act negatively influences the entry of professionals from abroad. It was described by the Human Rights Watch (1998:4) organisation as an obsolete relic of the apartheid era, which conflicted with “internationally accepted human rights norms and the South African constitution”. The Immigration Bill has since superseded the Alien’s Control Act in May 2002. However, the new immigration legislation has been criticized for its failure to engage in migration debates and for its inability to position migration within a transforming SA (Business Report, 28-05-2002). A key feature of the bill is the permits and quotas for foreign workers. After the general elections in April 2004, the new Minister of Home Affairs (N. M. Nqakula) amended the Act in an attempt to attract people with skills. She has stated that her goal is to rewrite SA’s immigration legislation (Quintal, 2004; cited in Maharaj, 2004).

2.6 Conclusion

The present study locates itself within the context of globalisation. The study draws on the definition of globalisation as an increase in socio-economic linkages between countries, which is tantamount to the world being perceived as a global village. This interconnectedness between
countries facilitates migration across national borders. Hence, the study utilizes the concept of transnationalism. Firstly, transnationalism is relevant in understanding the ease with which teachers freely cross national boundaries. Secondly, it is useful in revealing the complexities in migrants’ lives as they straddle more than one society and country. Both globalisation and transnationalism were relevant in generating an understanding of teacher migration at a macro-level.

In order to comprehend teacher thinking at a micro-level, various theories and concepts were brought into dialogue with each other. Economic theories coupled with social capital theory provided insight into push and pull factors affecting teacher migrants. As a conduit, the theory of intensification and the professional and personal identities of teachers collectively provided a basis to analyse South African teachers’ vulnerability to migrate and their desire to return to SA.

It is necessary to conclude this chapter by reasserting the position that the research is adopting. At a global level there is a shortage of teachers in industrialized nations while locally South African education has been fraught with turbulence with the advent of a new political dispensation since the early 1990’s. Teachers’ responses to the constant changes in policy coupled with organizational glitches have negatively impacted on teachers’ identities. In a highly globalised world with advanced technology their response has been to become transnational migrants, applying their skills across national borders where economic and travel incentives serve as magnets to attract local teachers. The following chapter will focus on the methodological approach that was utilized in the study.
CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY - CHARTING A WAY FORWARD

3.1 Introduction

The previous chapter explored salient concepts and theories to establish a framework to understand the migration of teachers between SA and the UK. Embedded in the transnational migration of teachers is the process of globalisation, which facilitates the rapid movement of professionals. This chapter discusses the methodological approach used in the study. It explains the use of specific research instruments in teasing out the objectives.

The chapter commences with a discussion of the methodological approach used in the study. The research design is discussed with emphasis given to quantitative and qualitative methods and the research tools used. Complementary methodological tools are discussed for their relevance in achieving the objectives of the study. The choice of the strategy favoured giving voice to teachers, who were exiting (pre-migrants), had exited (post-migrants) or had returned (return-migrants). The chapter concludes with an examination of the limitations to the study.

3.2 A Multi-method Approach

As the study seeks to access teacher thinking prior to, during and after migration to the UK, a multi-modal approach was adopted. The critical questions of the study dictated that multiple methodologies be used. The choice in the design also depended on previous studies undertaken in the field of transnational migration. Such studies have been across a spectrum of disciplines including geography (Fielding, 1992), demography (McHugh, 2000), anthropology (Wilson, 1994; Margolis, 1998), sociology (Glick-Shiller et al, 1995) and politics (Hollifield, 2000). Each discipline has favoured a specific method/s depending on the focus of the study. Hence, although methods derived from other research projects were useful, it was necessary to chart a methodology that was unique to the aim of this study.
3.3 **Aim and Objectives**

The purpose of the study was to explain teacher migration between South Africa in the post-apartheid era and the United Kingdom. In order to fulfil the aim of the study six objectives were identified which illustrate the key focus areas of the study. More specifically, the objectives were to:

3.3.1 **Examine the demographic profile of migrant teachers.**
A profile of migrant teachers characteristics would reveal which teachers are prone to migration and thus assist in human resource planning for the DoE. The novice, pre, post and return migration questionnaire schedules informed this objective.

3.3.2 **Identify the reasons prompting teacher migration to the UK.**
A greater understanding of the rationale influencing teachers to migrate was necessary to ensure that effective measures are adopted by the national department of education for return migration.

3.3.3 **Explain the impact of globalisation on South African teachers.**
Three strategies were adopted: firstly, through an analysis of relevant literature on globalisation and international labour movement. Secondly, interviews with recruitment managers added meaning to the idea of being a global teacher. Thirdly, fieldwork on South African teachers’ experiences in the UK and their future plans informed this aspect.

3.3.4 **To access SA teachers’ experiences in UK classrooms and society.**
Insight into teachers’ professional and socio-cultural identities was important as it provided a basis for their adaptation and future plans. This objective was accomplished by questionnaire schedules, classroom observations, semi structured interviews, e-mail/diary entries and a focus group discussion.

3.3.5 **To understand why SA teachers are returning from the UK.**
A reflection on return migrant teachers revealed information related to the brain drain phenomenon. Instruments that were utilized to achieve this objective included questionnaire schedules and semi structured interviews.

The critical questions that informed the objectives above were as follows:

i) Which teachers are leaving SA?

ii) What are their reasons for leaving SA?
   For the above two questions data was collected from four cohorts of teachers: student teachers (novice), pre-migrants, post-migrants and return-migrants.

iii) What are teachers’ experiences in the UK?
   Data was collected for this question from post-migrant and return-migrant teachers

iv) Why are teachers returning to SA?
   Return-migrants were the data source in this question.

Questions ii, iii and iv have a hermeneutic focus in that the research pursues an understanding of teachers’ thoughts, decisions and actions. These were accomplished by examining data prior to teachers’ migration, upon their migration to the UK and after their return to SA.

Before commencing fieldwork, it was necessary to ascertain whether teachers who were exiting the profession contributed a sizeable fraction of the teachers’ workforce as there was an absence of statistics on teacher migration. The following section outlines the rationale for a baseline study. It also justifies the incorporation of a research method (covert research) that was not initially decided upon at the onset of the study.

3.4 Attempts at a Baseline Study

Prior to conducting fieldwork, an attempt was undertaken to review the existing data and policy on the subject of teacher attrition. This happened in two ways: firstly, in trying to obtain data to ascertain how many teachers had left KZN in the last 3 years (January 1999-January 2001).
Secondly, to elicit data from recruitment agencies regarding the teachers recruited. Such teachers' professional details were necessary as it would reveal the subjects in which teachers are in demand in the UK. The findings in each segment of the baseline study is presented below:

3.4.1 Attrition Statistics

It was envisaged that attrition statistics would be examined with the assistance of the Department of Education. It was necessary to ascertain what percentage of the teacher workforce had exited and whether it was significant by itself or when added to SA attrition statistics.\(^{11}\) This would inform issues of teacher shortage and a potential brain drain. According to Boe, Bobbit and Cook (1995) teacher attrition is a component of teacher turnover (changes in teacher status from year to year). Teacher turnover may include teachers exiting the profession but may also include those who change fields or schools.

In this study teachers exiting the teaching profession through either boarding or retirement was not considered. The DoE in Pretoria willingly submitted their provincial resignation statistics for 1999 to 2001. However, as teachers were under no obligation to stipulate their reason/s for resignation it was impossible to calculate the number of teachers who had resigned to teach abroad. Two clerks interviewed (covert research, 29/04/03) from KZN DoE Leave Section did, however, state that some teachers were under investigation for having exited the country to teach in the UK. The clerks further stated that such teachers were generally from ex-HOD schools and had applied for unpaid or sick leave. They added that it is normally the school principals that inform the DoE of these teachers. Such teachers are given a fourteen-day deadline to return to SA. If they fail to comply, they are dismissed from work. The responses from the majority of these teachers have been to tender their resignation as benefits are greater as opposed to when a teacher is dismissed.

\(^{11}\) Attrition is the termination of teachers' services through any of the following: expiry of contract, death, resignation, retirement, medical boarding, suspension or discharge.
3.4.2 Recruitment Agency Data

It was hoped that the attrition data could be triangulated with information received from the four recruitment agencies. However, recruitment agencies at the local level were unwilling to divulge statistics about the number of teachers in the different learning areas they had recruited in the said period (1999-2001). They feared that it would have repercussions for their companies and provide information for their competitors. Smith (2001:221) alluded to gate keeping when she stated “gate keepers tend to deny and delay researchers because they are concerned, not unreasonably from their point of view, about the uses to which the research data will be put. They cite the need for confidentiality for firms”. Recruitment managers also stated that all documentation was forwarded to the UK and that there was an absence of any kind of statistics at agencies in SA. All queries for the study were directed to the HR departments in the UK. However, no responses were forthcoming in spite of numerous attempts by the researcher via email.

It is obvious that recruitment agencies hold many answers to understanding the migration of South African teachers, but they were reluctant to reveal such information, as it will be quoted for the purposes of research. The decision was then made to embark on covert research to extricate the necessary data (Smith, 2001). Covert research is not a method generally used in research due to ethical considerations. In this study covert research was only utilized for two facets, namely the gleaning of recruitment data from agencies and migrant teacher data from DoE clerks. However, the characteristics of teachers that were being sought became apparent during interviews through probes by the researcher. Furthermore, the necessity to understand the route traversed by migrants in recruitment, as well as the role of agencies and their strategies in facilitating the migration of SA teachers, demanded that the researcher go ‘under cover’.

The researcher assumed the status of a prospective migrant teacher and attended recruitment seminars and mingled with prospective migrant teachers. Discussion centered on their reasons for migration and their emotions prior to departure. The researcher was thus privy to pre-
migrants’ concerns voiced at seminars and the marketing strategies used by agencies to attract SA teachers. After attending seminars, the researcher filled in the necessary documentation that was mailed and awaited a response for an interview. When granted an interview, questions as queries were diplomatically interwoven to gather insight into the type of teachers that agencies were specifically attempting to recruit, and the way London schools were presented to prospective migrants. In this manner, the researcher (as pre-migrant) gleaned information from three agencies via covert research. However, as Smith (2001:222) succinctly warned “as an ethnographer you can’t help but worry that you may be getting only a partial view and so strive to supplement or cross check data with other types of data”. Thus data from seminars was enriched and triangulated with data derived from other sources namely pre-migration questionnaires, interviews and a focus group discussion. In part the baseline study provided a foundation for contextualising the study. The framework for the research design was a blend of quantitative and qualitative methodologies.

3.5 Research Design

Both quantitative and qualitative methods were utilized in the study. Allan and Skinner (1991) posit that of all methodological distinctions, it is the quantitative/qualitative one which has proved most durable. The option whether to select one in preference of the other or to use a complementary approach was deliberated in depth. In the final decision the sentiments of Jackson (1995), Burgess (1984) and Ghauri and Gronhaug (2002) had the greatest influence. Jackson (1995:13) was considered for the distinction between qualitative and quantitative techniques that could be applied in data analysis. Burgess (1984) argued that the qualitative approach required deep understanding of the participants. He noted that it was imperative to understand “the actions of participants on the basis of their active experience of the world and ways in which their actions arise from and reflect back on experience” (Burgess, 1984:3). The premise of this view is that the researched are not objects with given properties such as attitudes and behavioural characteristics that can be readily measured. As the study necessitated an understanding of teacher thinking and subsequent decision-making, qualitative research was the route to accessing participants’ experiences.
The two main criticisms of qualitative research are that they are impressionistic and non-verifiable (Allan and Skinner, 1991). With reference to the idea that it is impressionistic, Allan and Skinner (1991) argue that this will possibly only occur in the early phases of the research when the researcher is open and sensitive to new ideas, suggestions and relationships. With regard to verification, methods of triangulation were employed as will be discussed later in section 3.9.

The aim of the study resonated with the perception that no research method is entirely quantitative or qualitatively. This research is aligned to the belief that neither method takes precedence over the other. In addition, it firmly shares the views of Jankowicz (1991), Waghid (2000), and Jayarathe and Stewart (1995), that quantitative and qualitative research approaches should be seen as complementary to each other and the broader social discourse of research. In this manner the research conducted was an attempt at reaching complementarity for both the quantitative and qualitative methods by virtue of the research design that was utilized. Jankowicz (1991) stated that the research problem and its purpose determine which methods and techniques are most suitable.

Techniques:
Conversation,
Unstructured interviews
Etc.

METHODS
Figure 3.1: Quantitative and Qualitative Methods and Techniques
Source: adapted from Jankowicz (1991:159)
He graphically outlines the differences between methods and techniques in figure 3.1. The techniques from the left to the right become more quantitative. It has been adapted to illustrate the position of the present study. The star represents the study and the arrows the tools utilized.

In the study a strong ethnographic approach has been utilized given the intricacies of teacher migration and it was the overarching approach favouring an articulation of teachers’ thoughts and decisions about migration. Thus the study leans towards a qualitative approach and ethnography was selected to be an integral part of the research.

3.5.1 Ethnography

According to Crowl (1996) ethnography is described as a way of life of some identifiable group of people and that is exactly what this research aims to achieve - a picture of South African teachers who are migrating to the UK and their resulting experiences. Daymon and Holloway (2002) have pointed out that this method has inappropriately been used to describe all forms of qualitative research. Ethnographic research, according to their definition, entails extended periods of fieldwork in a group or community with the researcher observing and asking questions about the manner in which people interact, collaborate and communicate. But it is not only fieldwork, ethnography is also a description (a written story or report) about a particular group of people and in this study this group has been identified as teacher migrants. One of the main characteristics of ethnography is the researcher striving to achieve ‘thick’ (Geertz, 1973) description. Thick description in the present study was achieved through a detailed account of experiences and connections between relationships that join people, for example, social networks of family or other teachers in the UK and recruitment agency support, which facilitated the migration and supported the movement of many participants.

Across disciplines, ethnographic interviewing (Spradley, 1979; Heyl, 2001) and participant observation have been favoured approaches (Spindler and Spindler, 1982; Stack, 1996). Margolis
(1998) has also favoured an ethnographic approach with the use of questionnaires in her study on Brazilian transnationals in New York. Her objective was to understand the link between social, cultural and economic variables in understanding the migration of Brazilians to New York. Sociologists such as Portes (1999) and Glick-Shiller et al (1995) have favoured qualitative studies in attempting to understand the rationale behind individuals migrating. Mc Hugh (2000) quotes Stack's (1996) ethnographic study of African American migrants as a good example of an ethnographic approach to the study of migration. Stack's (1996) use of observation and conversation highlight migration as a socio-cultural experience. Glick-Shiller et al (1995) used comparative ethnographies between the Caribbean and Filipino transmigrants to understand the transmigrant experience. In anthropological studies the unit of analysis has been the household and migrants are viewed as decision-makers within that context. Previous ethnographic studies in various disciplines have used an array of methodological tools.

Babbie and Wagenaar (1998) have asserted that ethnography has traditionally emphasized description rather than explanation. In clarifying the tenets of ethnography, Sarantakos (1998) and Thomas (1993) suggest that there are two types of ethnography:

i) descriptive or conventional ethnography - a focus on description where patterns and categories are uncovered.

ii) critical ethnography - involves a political focus where hidden agendas or assumptions are examined. The idea is to generate change.

Lofland (1995) outlined the use of analytic ethnography which appears to be an assimilation of the above two categories. Here researchers establish patterns of human social life and although some may be descriptive, others are explanatory and this is the approach that was adopted in this research. This study was therefore at the nexus between description and explanation in that the voices of teachers were highlighted accounting for their behaviour, attitudes and the choices that they make.
Such ethnographic studies as described above have the potential to further the understanding of teacher migration. McHugh (2000:72) advocates three reasons for the use of ethnographic studies in migration research:

i) Many individuals forge relations across expanses of space and time which is now receiving attention (Basch et al., 1994).

ii) In studying migration scientifically, the human in human migration is ignored. Ethnography reveals lived experiences embedded within socio-cultural contexts.

iii) Population geography with its emphasis on spatial demography and positivism has become distanced from major philosophical and methodological debates in geography.

In the present study, two primary means of collecting ethnographic data (interviewing and participant observation) was used to reveal the reasons teachers proffer for migrating, and their subsequent classroom and socio-political experiences in the UK, respectively. McHugh (2000:74) contended that migration researchers have favoured demographic approaches to migration thereby “shying away from alternate forms of meaning and understanding”. The present research reacted to this criticism by utilizing various research instruments in an attempt to move beyond statistical trends. In addition, teachers’ experiences that inform their choices and visions for their future were explored. Both Fielding (1992:205) and McHugh (2000:73) agree “only ethnographic research can reveal the subtle details of the experience of migration”. McHugh draws on ethnographic studies by Stack (1996), Mountz and Wright (1996) and McHugh (1996) that provide insight into North American migration systems by revealing the interplay between migration and socio-cultural change. In these studies, migration is revealed as being a personal experience, a family initiative and resulting in community change. Methodologically, this is supported by Portes et al (1999: 220) who advocated “the individual and his/her networks” as the correct unit of analysis for the study of transnationalism. The specific research tools that were used in the study are discussed in the next section.
3.6 Research Tools and Data Collection

Research tools utilized in this study included survey questionnaires (with few open-ended questions), semi-structured interviews, focus group discussions, diary/e-mail entries, and classroom observations. The researcher shares the view of Bloor et al (2001) that multi-method approaches shows a commitment to methodological rigour, hence the use of complementary research tools. The researcher also attended recruitment seminars (two at Proteachers). In addition, recruitment agency interviews were attended (four conducted telephonically at: OptimTeach, Valued Teachers, Quest and Proteachers, and two face-to-face at OptimTeach and Valued Teachers). The seminars and interviews were to gauge the information offered to local teachers and the incentives to travel abroad.

Table 3.1 outlines the research design of the study. The different instruments used and justification for the use of each tool is discussed in the next section.

3.6.1 Survey Questionnaire

The survey questionnaire, which is the best known method of social research (Nichols, 1998) was the first research tool used. In total there were five questionnaires: two for student teachers (novice teachers), one for pre-migrants, one for post-migrants and one for return-migrants. There was a student teacher questionnaire for a collaborated pilot study on reasons student teachers at Edgewood College gave for planning to leave SA to teach in the UK. All questions in the pilot study were close-ended. The details of the pilot study are discussed later in this section.

In addition, there were four separate questionnaire schedules: one for student (novice) teachers; a pre-migration questionnaire for migrants intending leaving for the UK; a post-migration questionnaire for teachers who have exited SA and are presently teaching in the UK; and a return migration questionnaire for teachers who returned after teaching in the UK. All questionnaires
contained close-ended questions for biographical data that could be plotted statistically. The pre-migration questionnaire contained evaluative rating scales for questions on the teaching environment and reasons promoting migration. It was a technique that allowed the researcher to measure teachers’ opinions and views. The pre-migration questionnaire was an integral part of the study as many migration studies are conducted after migration has take place (Eklund, 1999). Hence, there is a logic that participants may add when recalling events and feelings that prompted the decisions they made. The pre-migration questionnaire was a means of capturing emotions and attitudes coupled with decisions whilst they were ‘fresh’ in the minds of pre-migrants.

All questionnaires also contained open-ended questions. As Cohen, Manion and Morrison (2000) have suggested, this is applicable in studies were the size of the sample is not large. In addition, these questions heralded significant and honest information that was probed later in interviews. Student teacher, pre-migration and return-migration schedules were completed in SA. Ten respondents in the UK and twenty respondents who were holidaying with their families located in SA (at the end of the UK school year in July 2003) completed the post-migration questionnaire.

Prior to embarking on the implementation of student migration questionnaires, iterative dialogue (conversations) with Edgewood lecturers led to a joint pilot study on reasons for student teachers exiting SA upon graduation. The results of this study foregrounded the student teacher migration questionnaire, which prioritised the possible reasons for the exit of teachers. It further captured the short and long-term goals of student teachers, which was necessary for its influence on teacher attrition in SA.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CRITICAL QUESTIONS</th>
<th>REASON FOR DATA BEING COLLECTED</th>
<th>RESEARCH STRATEGY</th>
<th>DATA SOURCE</th>
<th>NO. OF SOURCES</th>
<th>SITE OF DATA SOURCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WHICH TEACHERS ARE LEAVING</td>
<td>To gauge how many teachers have exited SA in a set period and to determine the demographic profile of teacher migrants</td>
<td>baseline study</td>
<td>DoE persal</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Pretoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>student-teacher questionnaire</td>
<td>Student teachers Pre-, post- and return-migrants</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>Edgewood College</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>pre-, post- and return-migration questionnaire covert research researcher</td>
<td></td>
<td>90</td>
<td>SA, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHAT ARE THEIR REASONS FOR LEAVING</td>
<td>To understand why teachers are exiting SA</td>
<td>Pilot study</td>
<td>Student teachers Pre-migrants</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>Edgewood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pre-migration questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
<td>30</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Semi-structured interviews/dialogue</td>
<td>pre- &amp; post-migrants</td>
<td>7 &amp; 15</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHAT ARE TEACHERS EXPERIENCES IN THE UK</td>
<td>To access teachers’ experiences in the UK</td>
<td>Post-migration questionnaires Focus-group discussion Interviews/dialogue Classroom Observation</td>
<td>Post-migrants</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>SA, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Post-migrants</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHY ARE SA TEACHERS RETURNING</td>
<td>To understand why teachers are returning to SA</td>
<td>Return-migration questionnaires Interviews/iterative dialogue</td>
<td>Return-migrants</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Return-migrants</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The pre-migration, post-migration and return-migration questionnaire schedules were based on an adaptation of Demuth’s (2000) four-phase model of migration. It served as an analytical tool to understand the complexities of migration.

Figure 3.2: Four-Phase Model of Migration
Source: adapted from Demuth’s model (2000:33)

According to Demuth (2000) the first phase is the decision-making stage. The second is the actual journey and how it is determined by factors such as transport and communication infrastructure. The third phase encompasses the migrant arriving at the destination and either finding a safe haven or being rejected. The final phase involves reflecting on the status of the
migrant in terms of factors such as social and economic integration. It deals with whether the migrant will have a chance to integrate into the new society or face exclusion. The first phase is encapsulated in the pre-migration questionnaire schedule and focuses on the decision to migrate. The researcher has omitted the second phase due to advancement in travel; more specifically migrants exiting will board an aeroplane from Durban and reach London in under 12 hours. The post-migration questionnaire schedule contains aspects of the third and fourth phases. Demuth (2000:45) perceives the fourth phase of staying abroad as ‘migration comes to a halt’. Although his model graphically makes allowance for a return migration, Demuth fails to explore the concept of social exclusion in the fourth phase. Neither, is the nature of the return process discussed. In this study Margolis’ (1998) concept of shuttle migration (refer to theoretical framework chapter) was adapted to extend Demuth’s (2000) model. Hence migration will be viewed as having the potential for a cyclic movement. This idea was explored in interviews and questionnaire schedules which asked respondents to reflect on their expectations and goals.

The questionnaires identified trends and issues for further consideration in interviews for both pre-migrants and return-migrants. The data extracted from the pre-migration and post-migration questionnaire assisted in elaborating teachers’ concerns regarding (refer to table 3.2):

i) their reasons for exiting the SA teacher corps.
   One such reason expressed was dissatisfaction at KZN schools and the impact on teachers’ personal well-being.

ii) their reasons for returning to SA.
   An example of this was teachers’ feelings of loneliness in the UK as many explained that they had migrated without immediate family

The data extracted from the pre-migration questionnaire foregrounded teachers’ perceptions and experiences alluded to later in the post-migration schedules. This approach concurs with the view of Nichols (1998) that the survey is a useful tool and is utilized to its maximum if used in conjunction with other complementary research tools. Teachers do not exit South Africa as empty vessels. They take their perspectives, practices and experiences, whether positive or negative along to the UK. Respondents’ expectations in the UK and long and short-term goals
were probed via iterative dialogue or interviews. The intention was to understand the context within which teachers were making decisions. Questions posed in the post-migration questionnaire schedule with specific regard to teachers’ experiences in UK schools provided themes for discussion in the focus group discussion.

3.6.2 Interviews

Semi-structured interviews were held with select teachers in the SA (pre-migrants and post-migrants) and in the UK (post-migrants) to flesh out written responses from questionnaire schedules. The present research was informed by Hargreaves (1994) use of semi-structured interviews. His aim was to scrutinize teachers’ experiences in their management of school time. He found that teachers were becoming stressed due to an intensification of their duties at school (see Chapter Two, section 2.6.2) The researcher used this idea to probe post-migrants attitudes to extended teaching hours and lesson preparation (in comparison to SA) and to guage teachers professional and socio-cultural identities in the UK.

The semi-structured interview demands great skill from the interviewer. The incorporation of two detailed studies through iterative dialoging allowed for comparative analysis along lines of classroom experiences and socio-cultural and political integration. Seven interviews were held with pre-migrants, fifteen with post-migrants and twelve with return-migrants. Interviews were taped with the respondents’ approval, when there was hesitation the researcher elected to take notes rather than audio-record. Many of the interviews were telephonic due to travel costs and teachers’ time constraints. All interviews were transcribed and analysed thematically.

Semi-structured interviews were also conducted with key stakeholders such as management of two recruitment services. Discussion during the interviews was based on a priori themes such as biographical information of migrants and whether teachers were returning to SA in general. The intention was to solicit information with regard to teacher vacancies in UK schools and plot
migration patterns. The motive for choosing this method is that the interviewer was dealing with people who are accustomed to efficient use of their time. It was also likely that information obtained will be value-laden and therefore require sensitivity on the part of the interviewer (Jankowicz, 1991). The interviewer was in control of the requirements of the interview and had “the freedom to pursue hunches and improvise questions depending on the participants’ responses” (Marlow, 2001: 158). Nevertheless, it should be noted that failure to glean sufficient data via this method led to covert research, which was discussed earlier in section 3.4.2.

3.6.3 Focus Group Discussion

The focus group method was used as it was considered to be a cheap and convenient way of gathering information from several participants in a short time (Ghauri and Gronhaug, 2002). Two focus group discussions were held in the UK at Alambra High School over a period of two days (two hours). Initially it comprised of five ex-SA teachers: three who were permanently employed at the school and two who were occupying supply (temporary) positions. One permanent teacher excused himself as he was part of a team moderating Mathematics and they were meeting concurrently with the focus group. The biographical composition along lines of race and gender for the focus group was as follows: one Coloured male, one Indian female, one Indian male and one white female (refer to table 3.2).

The focus group was used as an ancillary method. The use of a focus group can be consciously built into a multi-method study design (Bloor et al, 2001). As Bloor et al (2001) suggested, the intention is for triangulation, which is the comparison of focus group data with data obtained by other methods. It was believed that an analysis of different kinds of information on the same topic will strengthen and enhance understanding of teacher migration. The focus group discussion commenced firstly with a brief conversation about reasons for the exit of teachers from the South Africa. Thus opening questions were tailored to verify data alluded to in the pre-migration questionnaire schedules on teachers’ reasons for exiting SA. Casual conversation amongst teachers focused on recruitment by agencies and a significant amount of time was used
with teachers expressing their anger and annoyance at the workings of recruitment agencies. The second objective of the focus group was to understand SA teachers' experiences at UK schools. These experiences were alluded to by respondents in the post-migration questionnaire schedule as well as interviews completed in the UK. The discussion also focused on migrant teachers' integration into UK schools and society and their experiences. Data gleaned from the focus group centered on issues of teacher-pupil interactions and UK policies that affected SA teachers. The objective asserted here was not specifically for triangulation but to provide a degree of depth and enrichment to the researcher's understanding of teachers' professional attitudes and beliefs. Two participants were selected to keep qualitative diaries.

3.6.4 Qualitative Diaries and E-Mail

The use of the qualitative diary was specifically for two participants: one who intended on emigrating and one who was shuttling between SA and the UK. Stone et al (1991) suggested that diary keeping is susceptible to attrition and it is for this reason that the researcher chose only two participants who displayed enthusiasm to participate in the study. Their characteristics were as follows (for reasons of diversity along race, gender and marital status): one married male of Indian descent and one single European female. There was difficulty in making contact with white male migrant teachers, as there appeared to be few in the snowball sample. Although two participants agreed to keep a diary, only one followed through (the female). The other participant did e-mail the researcher on three occasions with his experiences in the UK although he had failed to keep a diary. In addition he dialogued with the researcher telephonically and granted interviews when he was visiting family in SA.

Close contact had to be maintained with the participants while they were in the UK. International phone calls by the researcher were kept to a minimum of one per six months whilst phone calls to the migrants' immediate family were made in the event of communication glitches. E-mailing was on a monthly basis to maintain contact with participants as a way of securing data when the diary was not being completed.
The diary was an important part of the study as it chronicled "the flow of public and private events that are significant to the diarist" (Plummer, 1983:17). It allowed the researcher access to the teachers' experiences and thinking in the UK in a relatively unobtrusive manner. As Leadbetter (1993) pointed out, it would also reveal accounts of phenomena over time and hidden behaviour, which should be useful in fleshing out socio-cultural and professional integration, in addition to classroom experiences. The research diary was different from the personal diary in that those activities, events and feelings relevant to the study in a period of eight months were recorded. The diary was unstructured as the researcher was keen to understand the description of the event recorded as well as the participant's reaction. Respondents were asked to detail events or experiences at school that impacted on them.

Electronic mail is a product of the advancement in communication. Correspondence is immediate regardless of distance and UK schools are equipped with computers and internet access. The two participants thus had easy and immediate access to communicate their personal and social experiences when necessary. The researcher engaged in classroom observation in the UK to verify aspects of teacher-pupil interaction to which post-migrants and return-migrants had referred.

3.6.5 Classroom Observation

After UK schools had granted permission (via the research participants), two days of observation were embarked upon for each ethnographic participant. Classroom observations were made in the following categories:

i) teacher-pupil interaction (attitude of teachers and pupils, discipline and deportment)

ii) teachers' pedagogic style

iii) resources (physical and human)
Observations were conducted in three schools in England during April 2003. Pseudonyms are provided for schools given the sensitive nature of the study. The school situated in the east of London is referred to as Jackson Comprehensive School (‘Rena’s school’). The school situated in the north of London is called Alambra High (‘Ben’s school’) and the school in the south, St. Anthony’s Catholic School (‘Lyn’s school’). Jackson Comprehensive and Alambra High can be described as the ordinary British co-ed public schools whilst St.Anthony’s is a single-sex religious school.

All observations at Jackson Comprehensive are omitted from the study due to a tragic event (suicide of a pupil) that unfolded during the week of the researcher’s visit. Observations would therefore not be a reflection of the status quo at the school and are thus excluded. A total of seven lessons were observed at Alambra and St.Anthonys. Five were with post-migrant teachers (one with Lyn, two with Ben and two with Mersan. Mersan was appointed at Alambra and he had been iteratively dialoging with the researcher for a year). Two lessons were observed with British teachers. They were covert observations as British teachers were unaware that their lessons were being observed. These lessons were incidental providing anecdotal information and were not originally intended to be part of the original methodology. Nevertheless, they were relevant for the researcher to deduce whether SA teachers’ experiences in British classrooms were unique to them as foreigners or whether locals shared similar teacher-pupil experiences.

Various types of data were extracted during classroom observations:

i) Completion of a classroom observation schedule for each of the mentioned categories.
ii) Photographs of classrooms to detail physical and human resources
iii) Audio recording of classroom activities to detail teacher-pupil interaction and discipline

At Alambra High audio recording ceased within ten minutes of commencement of each lesson as there was excessive communication between pupils and transcription would have been difficult. In addition, the researcher was unsure whether the appearance of a dictaphone altered the general classroom activity. The researcher resorted to taking notes as classroom events proceeded.
The above data collection strategies were used in order to generate different types of information. Three modes of data that were applied to the study are as follows:

i) written (recruitment documents, questionnaires, diary, e-mail)

ii) Spoken (recruitment seminars, telephonic communication, interviews, focus group discussions)

iii) Visual (classroom observations, photographs)

Freeman (1996:370) has alluded to two types of data with particular reference to classroom observation namely ‘real time data’ and ‘ex post facto data’. The former refers to observing teaching as it is executed and the latter to the data subsequent to teaching. The study at hand introduced data prior to teachers migrating and teaching in the UK. This data in the study will be referred to as ‘pre facto data’. Pre facto data will take three forms: student migration questionnaires for final year student teachers, pre-migration questionnaires and semi-structured interviews for teachers prior to their departure. The construction of the data analysis was an attempt at following a linear pattern from the pre-migration through to post-migration and finally return-migration. This is by no means an endeavour to simplify the complexities of teacher thinking and movement. It is an attempt to understand and portray an existing phenomenon in its various inter-connecting layers.

3.7 Sampling

A major issue with regard to sampling is to determine a selection that best represents a population, thus allowing for accurate presentation of results (Bless and Higson-Smith, 1999). This is termed a representative sample. To ensure a representative sample the use of a correct sampling frame is vital. There is no reliable data available regarding teachers who are migrating from or returning to KZN or South Africa. Teachers are not declaring their intentions to migrate to the UK in advance due to departmental investigations. Teachers who resigned were not under obligation to specify their reasons. Due to the absence of a sampling frame from which to select individuals, the application of a random method of selection was impossible. For the purposes of this study a non-probability sampling technique was applied as the SA migrant population was
difficult to trace. The technique of selection utilized was snowball sampling. It is commonly used in qualitative research (Babbie and Wagenaar, 1998). Margolis (1998) used snowball sampling in her qualitative study to locate Brazilian migrants in New York as she encountered the same problem in her transnational study.

Snowball sampling was selected for its appropriateness in locating members of the teaching population. As the researcher is a teacher, she had some colleagues and acquaintances that had migrated. These teachers also assisted in the location of the sample. The procedure consisted of collecting data on a few members of the population that could be located and then asking those individuals to provide information to locate other members of the population within KZN. As stated previously in section 3.6 the researcher also attended recruitment seminars where she interacted with prospective migrant teachers and selected participants for the study based on teachers’ willingness to be a part of the study.

The sample size (120) for the questionnaire was large enough to be statistically significant. The study distinguishes between four cohorts of teachers. The first group was final year student teachers (novice), the second group was teachers who will soon depart for the UK and are termed pre-migrants. The third group was ex-SA teachers presently teaching in the UK and was referred to as post-migrants. The final group of teachers had returned after teaching in the UK and was called return-migrants. There were 30 respondents from each of the four categories.

Urban public schools in KZN from which teachers have exited as well as UK schools to which they have been recruited, were the sites of the study. In SA the spatial extent was from Tongaat, (on the north coast of KZN) to the city of Durban (third largest city in SA). The areas chosen reflected a cross section of educators’ experiences in contrasting racial and socio-cultural contexts. Educators’ trek from SA schools to those in the UK was documented and parallels and differences with regard to the above-mentioned aspects were recorded. Edgewood College\textsuperscript{12} in

\textsuperscript{12} In 2004 Edgewood College of Education became part of The University of KwaZulu-Natal.
KZN, a pre-service institution was the site for locating student teachers. The College offers four-year primary and secondary teaching degrees and three-year junior primary and secondary diplomas. During apartheid SA it was a ‘white’ college but recent statistics indicate that in 2000 the population was fifty percent white (Reddy, 2003). A stratification along gender lines indicated that from 1994 to 2000 there were three times as many females as males. Reddy (2003) stated that this was in keeping with the gender profile of SA teachers. In 2000 the College had eighty percent of females.

A ‘hidden’ population of student teachers with intentions of migrating thus emerged and they were included in the data design. These teachers were at the time of data collection engaged in completing a teaching degree with the intention of exiting SA upon completion at the end of that year (2003).

3.8 Methods of Data Analysis

The study itself is not positioned within any one specific tradition. The data was examined through the lens of different theories and concepts (for example labour theory and transnationalism). Unexpected data led to certain concepts being included that were not initially thought of (for example mental health and psychological stress). New concepts were born when none could be found in the literature (for example phantom parents/partners and corrosive cultures).

The critical questions raised called for an identification of trends and relationships between variables. The first critical question (Which teachers are exiting SA?) was answered by analyzing data from the student teacher cohort, pre-migrant cohort and the post-migrant cohort and covert research. The second critical question (What are the reasons for departure?) was answered by analyzing information from the following cohorts: student teachers, pre-migrants and post-migrants. The post-migrant and return migrant cohorts informed the question on teachers’
experiences in the UK. The reasons teachers forwarded for returning to SA were answered by examining the return migrant teacher cohort. Responses from students, pre-, post- and return-migrants elucidated the impact of globalisation on the teaching profession.

The methods used to interrogate and interpret data were according to Freeman’s (1986:372) analysis of data. *A priori* categories of analysis were decided upon through iterative dialogue with prospective participants from the pre- and post-migration phases. These categories of analysis were used strictly for the analysis of questionnaires. The broad categories in the reasons for the exit of teachers were: career, finance, social and political. The questionnaire did allow for other reasons to be expressed by the participants and paved the way for a guided analysis in the event of emerging categories.

Quantitative data was analysed by using tables and graphs to indicate relationships, for example, the socio-economic profiles of pre-migrants, post-migrants and return-migrants are reflected along statistical lines. Qualitative techniques were used to flesh out responses and emergent themes such as aspects of job dissatisfaction amongst pre-migrants and poor classroom discipline that post-migrants experienced in the UK.

Struwig and Stead (2001) posit that the question of validity in research (more especially qualitative research) is considered by some researchers to be unnecessary whilst others believe that it is essential. The present study advances the view that validity is relevant and methods of triangulation were used. More specifically the triangulation of measures and method were utilized for the study Neuman (2000). Cognisance was taken of multiple sources (pre-migration questionnaires and post-migrant interviews) to discern which teachers are prone to migrate and the reasons for their decisions. The triangulation of method involved using both quantitative and qualitative techniques and data to produce a comprehensive study. Responses from post-migrant questionnaires regarding teachers’ experiences in the UK were triangulated with interviews. The
methods were used simultaneously to produce enhanced data particularly with reference to teachers’ experiences in British classrooms and society.

3.8.1 Data Analysis

Two forms of analysis for the data was applied:

i) The first was a statistical analysis using SPSS software for all questionnaires (pilot study: 50, main study: 120). A demographic profile of prospective teacher migrants was elicited from the data using the pre-, post- and return-migrant schedules. Descriptive statistics were used to plot the results thereof. The purpose was to summarise the data so that an overall impression of the data could be established. Descriptive statistics used included frequencies and measures of central tendency (mean).

ii) The second was a qualitative analysis in a narrative format for interviews, covert research, focus group discussion and classroom observations. Subsequent to repetitive readings of transcripts, themes were decided upon. Within the confines of these themes, selected studies of particular teachers were included to understand thinking prior to migration, experiences in the UK and to add depth to teachers’ reasons for returning. Thus issues around teacher migration patterns were informed.

3.8.2 Presentation of Results

The data is presented as a response to each of the critical questions following a pattern from pre-migration to return-migration bearing in mind the potential for a cyclic movement. The outline in table 3.3 depicts the format for the presentation of results. The source of data is demarcated within brackets (refer to table 3.2 for detailed research design). Themes relevant to each critical question are captured in textboxes.
i) Which teachers are leaving SA?
   a. Student Teachers (questionnaires)
   b. Pre-migrants, Post-migrants and Return-migrants (questionnaires)
   c. Covert research (seminars, recruitment interviews)

ii) Why are teachers leaving South Africa?
   a. Student Teachers (questionnaires)
   b. Pre-migrants (questionnaires, interviews and iterative dialogue)
   c. Post-migrants (Interviews and iterative dialogue)
   d. Covert Research (researcher as migrant teacher)

iii) What are South African Teachers’ Experiences in UK Classrooms and Society?
   a. Post-migrants (questionnaires, interviews, classroom observations, focus group discussion and email/diary)

iv) Why are South African teachers returning?
   a. Return-migrants (questionnaires)
   b. Return-migrants (interviews and iterative dialoging)

3.9 Limitations of the Study

The researcher is unsure whether to view this as a limitation or not, but recognition must be accorded to the multiple roles of the researcher, teacher, prospective migrant teacher, colleague and sometimes therapist. It is an impossible task to separate these identities. The researcher is a
teacher for the DoE and some of her colleagues were migrant teachers. During covert research, the researcher adopted the role of a prospective migrant teacher and was not immune to the attractive offers used as a sales pitch by recruitment agents. The researcher was therapist on numerous occasions especially when teachers shared their emotions of being ‘forced’ to leave SA without their families to seek a more fulfilling future in the UK. The researcher was also therapist to post-migrant teachers who were reduced to tears when revealing incidents of abuse by pupils and the loneliness of being away from immediate family.

Another facet is that the researcher is of Indian descent and her social and professional circle is majority Therefore there was more interaction in terms of the purposeful sampling with Indian teachers than White as public schools in SA are still racially stratified despite SA being a democracy for 10 years. An attempt to overcome a stratified sample was achieved by attending recruitment seminars and contacting school principals (in the greater Durban area) to liaise with staff on the researcher’s behalf to locate teachers for the study. In addition, student teachers (novice) from Edgewood College were selected to be part of the sample and the biographical profile of the students was overwhelmingly White which is not unusual given its history.

The initial plan was to video record all lessons. However, filming of lessons was only possible in the Catholic school and not the ordinary public school as classroom behaviour was immediately altered when photographs were taken.

3.10 Conclusion

This chapter began with a discussion of the need for a multi-modal approach given the nature of the critical questions asked in the study. In light of the present study being interdisciplinary, a way forward had to be forged beginning with a baseline study. This was undertaken by gleaning exit data of migrant teachers from recruitment agencies. A discussion of the complementary methodologies (blend of quantitative and qualitative methods) followed. The emphasis was on an
ethnographic approach to create a multi-dimensional understanding of transnational migration patterns of SA teachers. The use of each research instrument in the data collection was discussed for its relevance to the study. The snowball sampling procedure was best suited to the study. Its suitability lay in locating the ‘hidden’ population of teacher migrants. The following chapter embarks on a presentation of the findings according to the format alluded to in Chapter three.
4.1 Introduction

This chapter presents an analysis of results obtained in the study. The aim is two-fold. Firstly, it begins with a discussion of the motivations for teachers leaving SA. Secondly, it explores teachers’ experiences abroad in respect of teaching and social integration. The chapter thus responds to three questions: Which teachers are leaving SA? What are the reasons for teachers leaving SA? What are their experiences abroad? The data derived for the first question is captured as a biographical profile of migrant teachers. The data for the second and third questions are presented thematically. Career, finance and travel were common reasons for teachers seeking opportunities abroad. Migrant teachers provided multiple reasons for leaving SA and these were not mutually exclusive of each other. For example, where teachers indicated career as a reason for leaving, they did emphasize that a facet of their dissatisfaction lay in receiving a poor salary. They were also unable to travel due to limited finances. Thus, the themes of travel, finance and career dissatisfaction were intertwined with each other.

The chapter commences with a biographical profile of all teacher migrants (novice, pre-, post- and return-migrants) who participated in the study. It is followed in the second section by a discussion of the motivations for teachers leaving SA and their experiences in the UK. Career dissatisfaction was a major reason for experienced teachers leaving SA. Various strands of their discontentment lay in education policy decisions. These included the reduction of teachers’ leave, the implementation of outcomes-based education (OBE), the application of the post-provisioning norm (PPN) in schools to determine additional teachers, and the instability faced by unprotected temporary teachers (UTE’s). Teachers also expressed their concern about the nature of the school environment: the impact of limited career mobility, poor management and increased workloads. A distinction is drawn between greater workloads with corrosive cultures in public schools in SA as opposed to collaborative cultures offering support to teachers in UK schools.
The third section explores the strategies used by recruitment agencies (RA’s) to attract dissatisfied teachers. Advertisements and seminars emphasized financial gain, opportunities for travel and gaining global teaching experience. Being a ‘global teacher’ was part of the marketing strategy used by RA’s. Hence, the fourth section examines how globalisation facilitates movement across national borders. A natural consequence of globalisation has been the growth in diasporic communities. Hence, this chapter culminates with a discussion of the role of established social networks of ex-patriots (mainly teachers in the UK) who support and encourage transnational migration.

4.2 Biographical Profile of Migrants

This section presents a profile of the migrant teachers (novice, pre-, post- and return-migrants) who participated in the study. It begins by outlining the two distinct categories of teachers exiting SA, namely, experienced and novice teachers. This is followed by a discussion of the general characteristics of each cohort. This is salient in determining which teachers have the propensity to migrate.

There were two categories of teachers who were exiting SA:

i) Experienced Teachers - from public schools that were part of the SA teaching fraternity.

ii) Novice Teachers - Students who were in their final year at Edgewood College of Education, and who on completion of their degree would exit SA. This cohort thus consisted of teachers who were “new” to the teaching fraternity.

The biographical information of migrants is presented in table 4.1. The following biographical information is reflected: migrant’s relationship to the head of the household, age, sex, race and
marital status. Table 4.1 outlines the characteristics of ninety experienced teachers (thirty from each cohort: pre-, post- and return-migrants). \(^{13}\)

Table 4.1 Biographical Details of Experienced Migrant Teachers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Biographical variables</th>
<th>Divisions</th>
<th>Pre %</th>
<th>Post %</th>
<th>Return %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Relation to head</td>
<td>Head of Household</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>46.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spouse of head</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td>26.7</td>
<td>26.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unmarried Child</td>
<td>26.7</td>
<td>23.3</td>
<td>26.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age Group</td>
<td>0-28 years</td>
<td>26.7</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>20.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>29-35</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>33.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>36-42</td>
<td>30.0</td>
<td>30.0</td>
<td>33.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>43-49</td>
<td>23.3</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50-56</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>36.7</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td>50.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>63.3</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>50.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race</td>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>93.3</td>
<td>70.0</td>
<td>80.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>White</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>23.3</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Colored</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital Status</td>
<td>Currently Married</td>
<td>63.3</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>70.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>30.0</td>
<td>43.3</td>
<td>23.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Single Parent</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A majority of the respondents in the experienced cohort were in the age group 29-42 years and occupying the position of head of the household. As head of the household, the migrant was responsible for providing for the needs of the family. The migrant’s position in the household is

\(^{13}\) Pre-migrants: experienced teachers who are in the process of leaving SA to teach in the UK. Post-migrants: ex-SA teachers currently teaching in the UK. Return-migrants: teachers who have returned to SA after teaching in the UK.
consistent with the financial imperative, which was provided as a motivation for teachers exiting (refer to section 4.3.3 on the Financial Justification).

In the cohort of experienced teachers (pre-, post- and return-migrants) an overwhelming majority of migrants who were exiting were married women. This finding is in keeping with the gender profile of a female dominated teaching profession in SA (Reddy, 2003). Further to this, the finding that a majority of migrants were female and married (pre-migrants) has implications of increased power for the status of women in households.

The majority of experienced migrant teachers were of Indian descent from ex-HOD schools. This is not an anomaly as Durban has a large concentration of Indians (africatravelguide.com, 23-09-2003). The racial composition of the city of Durban is 57% Black, 27% Indian, 13% White and 3% Coloured (Urban Bulletin, September 2000). In addition, KZN has a majority of Black teachers (48222), 7215 Indian teachers and 3649 White teachers. Furthermore, English is the first language of Indian teachers in Durban. But there is the possibility that recruitment agencies working on behalf of UK schools are undertaking what Cohen (1997) calls 'immigration shopping' where migrants with specific attributes are chosen to fill gaps in the labour market. Qualifying this position is the stance by the Teacher Training Authority (TTA) in the UK, which is making an attempt to recruit more teachers from minority communities. In 2000 the TTA advanced the position that only 6% of primary school student teachers and 7.5% of secondary school student teachers in British schools were from ethnic minority groups. The TTA’s target is to have 9% of recruits from the said backgrounds by 2005-2006 (Ross, 2002).

The general characteristics of migrant teachers were that they were teachers from public schools, Indian, female, currently married and between the ages of 29-42 years. It can be concluded that

---

14 HOD - House of Delegates. Schools were segregated along racial lines during apartheid. HOD schools were schools for pupils who were of Indian descent. By contrast House of Assembly (HOA) schools were for Whites, House of Representatives (HOR) schools were for Coloureds and Department of Education and Training (DET) schools for Africans/Blacks.

15 Tentative statistics by Balkaran (2004) in ongoing study at University of KZN. English is not a first language for majority of Blacks in KZN (Proteachers interview).
the status of women within the household has grown. This is evident by women increasing their decision-making capabilities in deciding migrate as opposed to that of their husbands.

Table 4.2 Biographical Details of Novice Teachers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Biographical variables</th>
<th>Divisions</th>
<th>No. of Novice Teachers</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Relation to Head</td>
<td>Head of household</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spouse of head</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unmarried child</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>86.7 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other relative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age Group</td>
<td>Younger &amp; Equal to 28</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>96.7 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>years</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>29-35 years</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>86.7 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>90.0 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10.0 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital Status</td>
<td>Currently Married</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Single (Never Married)</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>93.3 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A composite biographical profile of novice teachers is presented table 4.2. The majority of novice teachers occupied the position of unmarried children in the household. They had no marital encumbrances and were therefore geographically more mobile. An overwhelming majority of novice teachers were 28 years of age or younger, which automatically qualified them for a working holiday visa. This implies a quick exit from SA as they can work for a period of two years abroad. In the event of securing a permanent position at a UK school such teachers may extend their stay via a work permit.

The finding that ninety six percent of novice teachers were female comes as no surprise as teaching is a profession largely dominated by women (Reddy, 2003). Also, as Reddy (2003) had contended, from the period 1994 to 2000 there have been three times as many female students as males registered at Edgewood. However, the increase in female migration does reveal greater female power as socially the patriarchal system has hindered the mobility of women (Davis & Winters, 2000). Ninety percent of the novice teachers were racially classified as White. This is also in keeping with the racial profile of the students at the Edgewood College of Education, which was historically a White teacher training institution. To summarise, the general characteristics of novice teachers were white, female, unmarried, equal to or younger than twenty-eight years of age.

It is interesting to note that the Deputy Vice Chancellor of Natal University applauded a hundred graduates from Edgewood College in 2001 for their decision to enter the teaching profession. He stated that something serious needed to be done to attract teachers to the profession, as there was a shortfall (The Daily News, 20-03-2001). He praised the graduates but he was oblivious to the fact that these teachers had no intention of entering the SA teaching fraternity. Many of them were recruited in their final year as student teachers. They would leave to the UK upon completion of their teaching qualification.
4.3 Reasons for Teachers Leaving SA

Since 1999 there has been a larger volume of professionals leaving the country to go to industrialised nations (Cape Times, 06-06-2001). Education is one of the occupations that is worst affected. The number of skilled foreign workers in SA has also declined (Cape Times, 06-06-2001). The result is that SA is a net emigration country according to official statistics. The findings in the present study indicate that there is a combined effect of multiple push factors from South Africa and pull factors from the UK, which influence the migration of local teachers. These factors are thematically discussed below and include career, finance and travel as primary motivations.

4.3.1 Career: Episodes of Dissatisfaction and Delight

This section begins with a discussion of the data gathered from pre-migrant questionnaires. Thereafter, the biographical data from interviews (pre- and post-migrants) are presented in tables. An analysis of these interviews follows highlighting experiences of discontentment in SA and delight in the UK.

Table 4.3 Pre-migrants Career Reasons for Exiting SA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Job Dissatisfaction</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>46.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Experience</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>26.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Forty six percent of pre-migrants indicated that they were exiting due to a dissatisfaction with their jobs. This is in keeping with the findings of previous studies (Markham and Pleck, 1986; Mulder, 1993) where people with a higher level of education are known to have migrated to improve their careers. The majority of pre-migrants interviewed also articulated a dissatisfaction with their careers (table 4.4). The majority of the pre-migrants interviewed (86%) voiced multiple reasons for dissatisfaction with their careers. Seventy one percent of the pre-migrants
interviewed can be termed as ‘seasoned teachers,’ having more than ten years of teaching experience. Yet all were occupying level one teaching posts. This suggests limited upward mobility, which contributed to career dissatisfaction.

Table 4.4 Biographical Details and Reasons for Exit of Pre-migrants (Interviews)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Teaching Experience (years)</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Marital status</th>
<th>Primary reason</th>
<th>Secondary reason</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Les</td>
<td>&gt;10</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>career dissatisfaction - no upward career mobility, increased workload, policy decisions: PPN, workload, poor management</td>
<td>Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Ravin</td>
<td>&gt;10</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>career dissatisfaction - OBE, no upward career mobility, poor management</td>
<td>Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Reshmi</td>
<td>&lt;5</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>career dissatisfaction - instability of UTE</td>
<td>Travel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Farida</td>
<td>5-10</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>career dissatisfaction - policy decisions: OBE, PPN, poor management</td>
<td>Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Meena</td>
<td>&gt;10</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>career dissatisfaction - no upward career mobility, poor management</td>
<td>Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Abdul</td>
<td>&gt;10</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Travel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Rena</td>
<td>&gt;10</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>career dissatisfaction: poor management</td>
<td>Finance, Travel</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thus stage development theory is significant as a probable reason in understanding the exit of experienced teachers. Stage development theory alludes to teachers exploring other avenues (in the diversification phase of the theory) when there is career discontentment, generally after five years of teaching (Ramrathan, 2002). Ramrathan (2002) does not, however, elaborate on the 'avenues' for discontented teachers as it was not within the scope of his study. Post-migrants were also interviewed and the majority alluded to career dissatisfaction as a reason for their exit from SA. Table 4.5 reflects the biographical details of the post-migrants interviewed coupled with their reasons for exit.

Table 4.5 Biographical Details and Reasons for Exiting SA of Post-migrants (Interviews)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Yrs.</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Reason for departure</th>
<th>Marital status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shree</td>
<td>&gt;5</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Career dissatisfaction-poor management</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vern</td>
<td>&gt;5</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Career dissatisfaction- poor management</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asha</td>
<td>&lt;5</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Career dissatisfaction- provincial norms</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sera</td>
<td>&gt;5</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Career dissatisfaction- low morale</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immy</td>
<td>&gt;5</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Foreign work experience</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Des</td>
<td>&gt;5</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ria</td>
<td>&gt;5</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Career dissatisfaction- no upward mobility</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lean</td>
<td>&gt;5</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mersan</td>
<td>&gt;5</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Career dissatisfaction- poor management</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sonny</td>
<td>&gt;5</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ben</td>
<td>&gt;5</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Career dissatisfaction- poor management</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lyn</td>
<td>&lt;5</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>W</td>
<td>Fashion trend</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rena</td>
<td>&gt;5</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Career dissatisfaction- poor management</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jude</td>
<td>&gt;5</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>W</td>
<td>Career dissatisfaction-no upward career mobility</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neven</td>
<td>&gt;5</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Crime</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
All post-migrants had a primary reason for leaving but it was not independent of their secondary reason. The majority of the teachers interviewed had been teaching in SA in excess of five years, and had occupied level one teaching positions (lowest rung in the hierarchy of qualified teachers). None had been promoted. Seventy three percent were married and teaching in SA for more than five years prior to their exit. Forty percent of teachers were married females (Asha, Sera, Ria, Lean, Rena, Jude) and thirty three percent were married males (Des, Mersan, Sonny, Ben, Neven) who had elected to exit SA alone (without family). This is, as stated earlier, an indication that women in the household played a pivotal role in the migration decision.

Migrant teachers were exiting to provide financial security for themselves and their families. The majority of post-migrants interviewed were married and teaching in SA for more than five years before leaving. The dissatisfaction with teaching in SA was due to various reasons ranging from educational policy decisions at national/provincial level by the DoE, to issues of the school environment at grassroot level. Migrant teachers interviewed (Pre- and post-) referred to a multitude of reasons within the parameters of career dissatisfaction. This led to a fracturing of their professional identities, hence their decision to exit the SA teaching fraternity. These reasons are discussed in the next section.

i) Education Policy Decisions in SA

Education policy decisions in SA that disenchanted teachers are discussed in this section. These included a reduction of their leave credits, the manner in which outcomes-based education (OBE) was introduced and managed at school, a dynamic post provisioning norm (PPN) and the plight of being unprotected temporary teachers (UTE).

a) The reduction of leave credits

Teachers complained of various forms of leave privileges that had been either reduced or withdrawn in recent years. Les, a teacher with 20 years experience stated that there was several push factors (pre-migrant interview, 07-08-03):
Firstly, sick leave has been reduced from 120 days in a three-year cycle to 36 days. They have the worst exam leave benefit in the entire civil service: you are entitled to the day you write and the day before. You are only credited if the courses are recognized e.g. I have 10 law courses towards an LLB degree as law is my playground, but I have 20 days deducted from my long leave, which was already reduced by 5/7.

You are entitled to 12 days per year times 20 years = 240. However, legally you are entitled to ’the lesser of 120 or 5/7(multiplied by 5 and divided by 7) of 240 = 180 days or the lesser of 5/7’.16

Also, you cannot access your long leave if you are personally well. It’s only granted if you are medically boarded... or if you resign you lose out on your vacation leave.

Les saw his teaching career on a route of regression as he quoted the alarming drop in the sick leave benefit for teachers. However, Les does not have reason to object to his loss of twenty days. As he has rightly pointed out the DoE does not view the LLB as contributing to the professional development of a teacher. The Employment of Educators Act 76 of 1998 states that special leave may be granted to teachers aimed at personal development “where such personal development is also in the interest of the employer” (Policy Handbook for Educators, 2003, 16 b, section C-128). Les was studying for a law degree and upon completion he could change career, which would equate to the DoE financing his eventual exit from the teaching fraternity. Clearly, Les has been planning to leave the teaching profession.

Further, the abuse of leave by teachers has had an impact on the DoE’s finances. The Minister of Education in KZN, Naren Singh commented that “some doctors in the province were working in tandem with teachers and were giving them fraudulent medical certificates” (The North Coast Chronicle, February 2004: 01-02). The DoE divulged to the press that they were investigating the abuse of sick leave by teachers who run their own business or were travelling overseas to work (The Mercury, 26-03-04). This culminated in HRM circular 97 of 2003 being sent to schools. It stated that the misuse of leave by educators had caused additional strain on the budget.

16 DoE Circular HRM 7 of 2004 stipulates the calculation of accrued leave prior to 01/07/2000.
Les' comparison of teaching to other levels of the civil service highlighted the drop in status of teaching as a profession. He believed that teachers were being penalized with regard to their development and achieving their personal ambitions. As Carrim (2003) has suggested, there are various conceptions of being a teacher, and for Les his role as an academic was being 'snubbed' by the DoE's leave regulations.

b) Outcomes-Based Education

Migrant teachers felt that they were ill equipped to teach within the new education paradigm, OBE. This stemmed from three reasons: firstly, the change from teaching a subject (such as Geography) to a learning area (Human and Social Sciences which is History and Geography). Secondly, the need for retraining which they felt had not been fulfilled by the department; and thirdly, the lack of resources.

Ravin, with 19 years of experience in teaching technical subjects, articulated his frustration and feelings of professional incompetence with regard to OBE (pre-migrant interview, 26-07-03):

With the change in the system I'm no longer teaching technical subjects, which is practical in that you work on a project and produce an article but Technology, which is science-oriented. That is very different because it's about design, discovery, computers, catering, cooking, hydraulics etc. which we normally don't do. We need to go for training but the department (DoE) has assumed that we must take over (teach a learning area instead of a particular subject). Day by day it is very frustrating to be in the education field because even the higher authority that you consult, says that he's in the dark. Also, the facilities are being reduced each year. For example the materials in the workshop: the department (DoE) used to provide... last year the school bought the materials, this year the school asked the boys to buy their own materials.

The exception to this rule is from grades 10 to 12. The New Revised National Curriculum Statement (2002) is being implanted in stages. Teacher training commenced in 2003 for grades 1,2,3 and in 2004 for grades 4,5,6. For each consecutive year, it will be implemented in three successive grades. In 2004 it was implemented in the foundation phase.
Ravin was upset that the designing of the new curriculum did not lead to compulsory retraining. Further to this, there was a lack of management assistance and a reduction in the provision of resources.

Farida expressed a similar view with regard to the implementation OBE and its influence in her decision to exit (pre-migrant interview, 18-07-03). She was unhappy about the impact of OBE experimentation on teachers and pupils:

*It is a nightmare, how it is being dealt with at school. This morning I had an altercation with the deputy principal and I phoned the recruitment agency and asked them how soon can I leave. We are just guinea pigs for OBE. Being in education and seeing children destroyed in schools - I'm not prepared for my children to be damaged.*

Malcolm (2001) has alluded to the curriculum shift to OBE as being sudden. The negative terms used by pre-migrants in interviews to describe OBE (*frustration, nightmare, damage, destroy, guinea pigs*) suggest teachers' frustration and professional inadequacy at the implementation of OBE without adequate training being given. The sense of exasperation felt by Farida and Ravin has been commented on by research academics. Carrim (2001) stated that teachers felt divorced from the process of curriculum change and were not prepared for the new system. Both teachers (Farida and Ravin) felt professionally inadequate to function as "deliverers/facilitators" of a new curriculum. Indeed teachers' dissatisfaction with OBE comes as no surprise as the Chisholm Review of C2005 (2000) outlined numerous shortcomings, which have not been addressed at grassroots level by thorough training of teachers. The Revised National curriculum has attempted to address some of the concerns raised.

c) **Post Provisioning Norm (PPN)**

Teachers were concerned that the constant change in the post provisioning norm (teacher-pupil ratio) had created an untenable climate for teaching and learning. Farida vented her feelings
about the manipulation of the PPN and its disastrous effects for teachers (pre-migrant interview, 18/07/03):

The politicians are changing the norms to suit their agendas while teachers lose their jobs, how contradictory. The corruption that takes place with the PPN constantly changing ... I'm a SADTU (South African Democratic Teachers Union-largest union in the public service) chairperson and while other provinces are moving forward KZN is moving backward. Pupils will be sitting up to the board if the PPN drops next year. There will be in excess of 50 pupils per class. How uncomfortable is that? You can barely walk, there's no motivation to control let alone teach.

The calculation of the number of teachers required by a school using the DoE formulae (weightings have changed yearly) had negatively impacted on the organization of schools. Farida saw the increase in pupils per class as having serious repercussions for classroom management, thus inhibiting the lesson time. She felt that she had an 'insider's' perspective on education and could therefore assert that the scenario in KZN was responsible for the stagnation of the province. Her use of the phrase 'next year (2004)' intimated that she did not envisage an improvement in the near future. She believed that the PPN\(^{18}\) calculation was an extension of the DoE's control over teachers who felt disempowered and were unable to contribute to positive change.

Her concerns materialized in the following year. Maharaj (Post, 21-01-04:01) reporting on school conditions in the new year (2004) remarked "several principals expressed concern that in some cases there would be between forty and fifty pupils per classroom, the reality of the new PPN of 1:35.4 which the DoE introduced last year (2003). Principals said that while on paper the ratio of 1:35.4 could indicate a teacher had an average of thirty five pupils, the reality was most

\(^{18}\) The DoE and teacher unions deadlocked in respect of negotiating the PPN for 2004 on 28:11:2003. Nevertheless the DoE instructed principals to proceed in declaring excess teachers. Later, the Minister of Education (N. Singh) in KZN stated that the DoE will 'not bow to the pressure of SADTU regarding PPN' by supplying schools with additional teachers (North Coast Chronicle, Feb.2004:02) and 'additional' teachers had to report to new schools. Upon investigation, the new Minister of Education, Ina Cronje, reversed the implementation of PPN 2004 and teachers returned after a term to their former schools. The latest PPN for application in January 2005 was released in November 2004-see appendix 11 and 12.
classrooms had a minimum of forty pupils and in some cases fifty”. The DoE has maintained that it has budgetary constraints and is therefore unable to reduce the PPN.

d) Unprotected temporary educators (UTE)\textsuperscript{19}

Reshmi is a UTE and has less than five years of teaching experience. She felt that all UTE’s were at a disadvantage when applying for teaching positions and could therefore never occupy a stable teaching post (pre-migrant interview, 14-07-03):

> When they advertise a post we’ll always be at a disadvantage. A teacher with 17 years of experience will apply for the post and we won’t get it. When are they (DoE) going to worry about our plight? We’re always UTE’s. I don’t want to stay in SA. I don’t like the attitude of the DoE because temporary teachers don’t have much of a say. They employ you when they want then they terminate you.

Reshmi’s use of ‘we’ when referring to her professional status as a UTE highlighted her view that there were many other teachers like herself who suffer as disempowered educators by virtue of being temporary. However, she felt that she could escape this stranglehold that the DoE had over UTE’s by leaving the country. Her use of the word ‘terminate’ and ‘they’ point to the cold attitude and lack of caring by representatives of the DoE.

\textit{ii) School Environment}

The nature of the school environment cannot be overlooked for its importance in ensuring the well-being of the teacher by providing support and encouragement, in addition to creating opportunities for professional growth and development. This section begins by examining the reasons for limited career mobility and poor management. Experiences of increased workloads for teachers and the existence of subcultures at school are assessed. In UK schools migrant

\textsuperscript{19} Unprotected Temporary Educators occupy the lowest rung in the education hierarchy.
teachers spoke of collaborative cultures, which aid professional growth whilst in SA schools
migrant teachers (pre- and post-) alluded to corrosive cultures that hindered their growth.

a) Limited Career Mobility and Poor Management

Ravin (pre-migrant interview, 26-07-03) stated that he was frustrated at the lack of progress he
had made in 19 years as a teacher. He felt trapped by the limited opportunities in the technical
field to advance to the position of Head of Department. Meena (pre-migrant interview, 12-05-03)
shared his sentiments although she was a teacher in the Languages and Literacy Department. She
had been teaching for 14 years and qualified for promotion. However, she was not successful
mainly due to the influence of the school governing body. It was thus evident that there was a
lack of professional development and opportunities for career growth.

Les was bitter about the lack of career opportunities for teachers in comparison to other state
departments and the consequences of having the School Governing Body (SGB)20 play a
determining role in appointments (pre-migrant interview, 07-08-03). He commented on the
absence of incentives and the influence of nepotism in promotion appointments:

Every other state department has a merit pay system. Our department for the last 12
years has no such incentive. In particular ex Hod schools – the government penalized us,
our own people penalized us—that’s been the status quo. In White schools all teachers got
their 3 merit notches (which translated into an increase in pay), not in Indian schools.
There is no upward mobility now with the governing body. Now there’s nepotism, I can
say goodbye to a promotion- in my own school I applied for the HOD post and I didn’t
even get shortlisted (yet he occupied the acting HOD post).

Jacklin (2001) has noted that the demise of apartheid was followed by the removal of a
differentiation of schools based on race, ethnicity or language. However, she maintained that

---

20 The South African schools Act 84 of 1996 heralded the emergence school governing bodies. A large component
of the SGB is the inclusion of parents who now have a significant role in the management of the school.
schools develop their own culture. Les felt that there exists a destructive culture at ex-HOD schools, which is responsible for the erosion of teachers' identities.

At the time of this interview Les was unaware that negotiations at ELRC (Education Labour Relations Council) had led to discussions on pay progression, which was to be introduced by the DoE. SADTU indicated to its members that July 2004 was supposed to be the tentative date for the first pay progression. At present teachers are being assessed for their efficiency in the classroom (by management) and this will impact on the implementation of additional pay.²¹

Post-migrants (interviews, Ria 18-08-03, Sera 14-08-03, Des 05-08-03, SA) who professed that they had no chance of being promoted declared that they had dedicated time and effort to enhancing the performance of pupils in certain activities but were not rewarded for their efforts. They felt hurt and unappreciated for their input. Notwithstanding their enthusiasm and capacity for positive change, they were reminded by members of senior management that, they would not be eligible for promotion. These teachers were bitter because regardless of their contribution to improving school, they would be overlooked in times of promotion as they were young. This was the turning point for such teachers and it prompted them to exit SA.

Ria (pre-migrant interview, 18-08-03) said:

*I've been a teacher for 7 years and I've been told that I'm too young to be promoted. Here in SA it's who you know, who can help you get to the top. I've worked hard but those with a shorter skirt have gone ahead, it's morally wrong and I won't do it. The only chance I have of being promoted here is if I'm between 50-60 years of age.*

Prior to 1996 the DoE was responsible for undertaking promotions. With the advent of the South African Schools Act (SASA, 1996) the onus rests on the SGB to effect promotions. This method was in conflict with those teachers who were of the opinion that members of management at schools were colluding with the SGB and influencing promotions. Migrants thus believed that the process of promotions was being unfairly managed. The Employment of Educators Act of

²¹ Failure in negotiations on salaries including pay progression led to strike action by teacher unions on the 2 and 16 of September 2004. Government re-negotiated with unions and the result was a 6.2% increase plus 1% for pay progression, to be implemented in October 2004. This has not as yet (December 2004) materialised.
1994, and amendments in 1998 did not include age as a criterion for appointments. Des (post-migrant interview, 05-08-03) stated that he had been a teacher for nine years and he felt stuck in the same place with no promise of any change. Sera (post-migrant interview, 14-08-03) recalled how she annually fought a battle at staff level to have a prom ball at the school. The lack of extra-curricular activities dampened her zeal: Morale at the school is so low that nobody is enthusiastic about participation... I’m the only one who wants to do things. I got fed up of having to convince people of the advantages of such an event.

Teachers were articulating their lack of professional growth. Hargreaves (1994) has noted that teachers’ expectations and frustrations in their career affect their morale. Thus, if it were possible to analyse emotions as Zembylas (2002:188) has suggested, then ‘teacher burn-out is a reality when teachers’ professional work is either inadequately supported or undermined by the school administration, colleagues or parents”. According to Zembylas (2002) there are three dimensions to burnout, one of which is applicable to the above-mentioned teachers, namely emotional exhaustion. Thus the articulations of Des, Sera and Ria are suggestive of emotional burn-out given the difficult environment at schools.

b) Increased Workloads with Corrosive and Collaborative Cultures

This section explores the impact of increased workloads on migrant teachers in SA and the UK. The effects of an increased workload linked to a lack of appreciation of teachers’ inputs at SA schools paved the way for teachers’ decisions to migrate.

Les stated that teachers are overworked and underpaid. He said (pre-migrant interview, 07-08-03): Our class size has increased from 25/30 to 50. Our workload has increased from 80 to 100%, our stress levels have increased proportionately but our salary hasn’t.

Les (pre-migrant interview, 07-08-03) added that there is an absence of gratitude. This view has been advanced in previous studies on school environments (Darling-Hammond, 1989). Les emphasized:
the importance of appreciation and thank you: This school has a record of 8 teachers that have died since 1977 when it opened. You are just a number (patal), we are dispensable objects. On the day you die you are spoken about at the funeral, then you're history.

It is evident from the above that Les felt despondent. He stated that management (ex-HOD school) had a tendency to want to perpetuate ignorance amongst level-one teachers as a means of controlling them. It was this control that teachers resented. As teachers are professionals, their independence should be ensured yet they were subject to control in various ways. Les added (pre-migrant interview, 07-08-03):

*We're not empowered, 95% of the teachers don't know their rights. The handbook is in the principal's office. Pre-1994 everything was hidden e.g. labour rights, now it's still hidden. They don't want people to be empowered. In lay man's terms 'they want to treat us like lighties.' It's all about oppression and suppression. And it's unique to ex HOD schools: they want to prove a point to their superiors.*

Farida (pre-migrant interview, 18-07-03) shared his sentiments. To her school life was stressful and there was no positive atmosphere within which she could achieve:

*Here it is claustrophobic to work - everyone at school has their own personal agenda. If they are not going for a promotion then they won't do anything for example fundraising. It's frustrating to be in such a school environment where there's so much red tape, the governing body and the political environment. There are too many chiefs and not enough Indians. Managers are so superior. They have between 2/3 free periods per day for administrative work-which is ridiculous. We teach 5 periods out of 5 on most days. The days where we have one free period it is taken away for relief. As workers we are pressurized. We are like worker bees all the time and they want to be the queen.*

22 A colloquial term for children
Other teachers were also concerned about the excessive workload. Ravin (pre-migrant interview, 26-07-03) felt that there was no consultation when teachers were given duties to perform. He underwent a knee operation and although he was on sick leave, he was asked to assist the substitute teacher. When he returned on a full time basis the principal did not enquire about his health nor was he welcomed back to school. Ravin stated that his principal expressed joy that he and a colleague were leaving. He was of the opinion that his principal always looked at them as troublemakers for questioning certain contentious decisions made at school. It was good riddance that they were leaving. He recalled being informed of the school’s decision to embark on a project: *I was asked to view how the system operates at another school, as it is technical. Then automatically the decision was taken without my involvement that I must be in charge - nobody asked me!* The same applied to the sound system at the school. *Because I know how to connect it, I must be the first one at any school function and the last to leave. In the UK you get paid for any extra duty that you do.*

Post-migrants were concerned about the school management’s lack of professionalism. Teachers who attested to poor management expressed their inability to continue working in an environment where the principal continually treated them unprofessionally. The principal generally adopted a superior attitude based on his/her senior status. They (Ben, Shree, Vern, Mersan) were subject to being belittled in private, chastised openly in the presence of other members of staff or simply ignored as if they did not exist as teachers within the school. Various reasons were provided for the principal’s management style and lack of pastoral care. Migrant teachers were adamant that the principal’s inability to communicate with staff using a developmental approach undermined their professional competence and eroded emotional confidence to the extent that exiting the teaching fraternity in SA was the only option. The articulations of these teachers, highlighting their forced migration, are shared below.

Ben had been a teacher for 13 years at Tregenner High (ex-HOD school). He felt frustrated with the principal’s attitude to the general running of the school (post-migrant interview, 06-06-02). Discipline had deteriorated, there were hardly any sporting activities for pupils and the principal
hardly spent a complete day at school. The principal was not interested in addressing any major issue and had a closed-door policy when he was present at school. Ben stated that if there was a problem you could not approach him. Ben took unpaid leave from school to travel to the UK to scout for a teaching job. He was offered a job but was dissatisfied with conditions at the school and decided to return to Tregonner High. Upon his return, the principal informed him that he was under investigation by the DoE who were querying his 10 days leave of absence: *Somebody brunted*[^23] *me and I know it's him. I could not go on in an environment of distrust, so I resigned.* Ben saw himself as being victimized yet ethically he had erred. He was searching for a trial period in a new teaching environment whilst still in the employ of the DoE. The Employment of Educator’s Act 76 of 1998 (section C-17) states “no educator shall perform or undertake to perform remunerative work outside the educator's official duty/ work”. Due to the DoE investigation into his absence, Ben felt coerced into exiting the SA teaching fraternity permanently. When questioned about his goals, Ben stated that from the UK he would like to migrate to Canada and thereafter (in 10-12 years) return to SA.

Shree (post-migrant interview, 20-08-03) was also compelled into resigning. She said that the principal (ex-HOD school) was wonderful prior to him being promoted. Thereafter it became a *nightmare to be at school*. Shree suffers from a rare blood disorder and is constantly on medication. However, as her medication affects her driving, she waits until she arrives at school before taking any medication. Her school principal threatened to fire the maid at school if she continued to make a cup of tea for Shree upon taking her pills. Shree recalled another incident when she was ill and came to school late. Her principal picked up the telephone to call the district manager[^24] to complain that she was late. She felt that at no point was there any pastoral care and concern shown as the principal failed to enquire about her health but rather reprimanded her.

---

[^23]: colloquial term for passing information
[^24]: Senior authority in charge of schools within a region in SA
Vem\textsuperscript{25} (post-migrant interview, 23-08-03) and Mersan (post-migrant interview, 06-12-02) were teachers at the same ex-HOD school and both left because of the principal’s attitude to the staff. Mersan was part of a crisis committee set up by the staff in an attempt to get the DoE to intervene and address the principal’s managerial style. Mersan stated that the DoE representative failed to investigate the complaints of the staff after promising to do so. He added that life became so unbearable at school that he became suicidal. It was at this juncture that he decided to quit the profession in SA. Vern followed soon after as he realized that there was no progress at the school since his friend’s exit. Vern and Mersan’s experiences in SA point to teachers’ sense of powerlessness without any recourse for change, regardless of their attempts, thus compelling them to leave SA.

Mersan (e-mail, 08-12-2001) sent the following spoof e-mail to his friends and colleagues in KZN subsequent to his departure reminiscing and recalling poignant times spent together. The stress on fun and sun capture the enjoyment of the SA Indian lifestyle and the favoured hobby of fishing in Durban (a coastal town) with friends. The inclusion of the word ‘sun’ highlights the climate in Durban and the general lack of sunlight in the UK. ‘It’s hard to waai (colloquial term for leave)’ indicates that the decision to leave SA was not easy. There exists the suggestion of a residual feeling of ‘good times having passed on after migrating’ to the UK:

\textit{Curry in the Sun}  
\textit{(Sung to the tune of: Seasons in the Sun).}

\textit{Goodbye to you my Indian friend}  
\textit{We jigged (caught) Mullet since we were 9 or 10}  
\textit{Together we climbed Mango trees}  
\textit{Ate samoosas and chillies (Indian cuisine).}

\textit{Chorus.}

\textsuperscript{25}See appendix thirteen for teacher’s termination of service letter and his concerns.
We caught Shad we had fun
We had curry in the sun, and the veggies that we sold
Were only just two seasons old.

Goodbye Govender it's hard to die
With all the Mynahs flying in the sky
All the incense in the air, little lighties (children) everywhere
When I see them I despair.

Goodbye Moodley, please pray for me
I was the albino of the family
You tried to teach me to eat rice, but too much curry paste and spice (typical Indian food), really didn't taste so nice.

Chorus.
We caught Shad (fish) we had fun
We had curry in the sun
Please check out my cab (car) for rust, before I turn to dust.

Goodbye Naidoo it's hard to waai (leave)
Please don't fret or moan and cry, when there's sardine on the run (coastal beaching of fish along KZN in Winter)
Catching Garrick just for fun
Spotting spirits (drinking alcoholic beverages) in the sun

We sold apples we sold plums,
We got hiding on our bums
Then Bobby he got drunk and the fishing boat got sunk.

Chorus.
We caught Shad we had fun
We had curry in the sun
Have you told the Larnie (rich man) yet?
Don't forget my jackpot bet (gambling on horses).
Moodley please will you sell my cart
I can't trust Bobby cause he's not so smart
And my mother is too old, if it's left it won't get sold
And she really needs the gold.

Rena was also an ex-HOD teacher. She had taught for ten years prior to migration and had a masters degree in Education. She was adamant that management at her SA school did not have the interests of their teachers at heart (pre-migrant interview, 06-08-02). As she did not have any children of her own she threw herself into providing the best co-curricular trips for pupils. Sadly, she felt disappointed by her principal's behaviour when the SGB took her and a few colleagues to task over an excursion that was marred by a group of students who had gained access to alcohol. Rena was sad that attempts to reprimand the said pupils was absent, yet the principal and SGB were intent on pursuing and punishing the teachers whom students had accused of verbal abuse. To Rena this was the last straw in a series of events wherein she felt that no value was being placed on her professional abilities. Rena felt that she and the principal were professionals yet he failed to pledge his allegiance to his staff.

Rena (pre-migrant interview, 06-08-02) was of the opinion that a vital role function of the principal, which is pastoral care, was lacking. She failed to understand that a principal could request a motivation letter on why she required a door to her classroom. She stressed that the importance of a good working relationship with colleagues and administration is essential for one's peace of mind. She added that professional output was being compromised in her SA school. She was looking for a positive change in her working environment. Rena's professional
and emotional identities were of paramount importance to her and by exiting SA she was escaping the winter of her discontent.

By contrast and much to their relief and delight migrant teachers experienced supportive management coupled with pastoral care once they commenced teaching in UK schools. An examination of their experiences in the UK, which led to positive professional and emotional identities follows below. The definitions of professional and emotional identities are adapted from Jansen (2003). Teachers’ professional identities entail an understanding of their ability to implement policies and classroom practices. Teachers’ emotional identity encapsulates an understanding of their abilities with regard to emotional demands such as stress.

Once in the UK post-migrants vouched for a positive change that was evident in the management of their schools. The post-migrant questionnaire asked teachers to rate the management of the UK school as either poor, average, good or excellent (table 4.6).

Table 4.6 Post-migrant Views of UK School Management

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>33.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excellent</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The majority of post-migrants viewed school management in the UK positively. A mere ten percent of respondents saw their school management as poor. Post-migrant Ben explained during his interview (06-06-02, UK) the extent of management support in UK schools. He stated that the norm is for the Head of Department to prepare all worksheets and tests and schemes of work. Ben’s responsibility as teacher was to simply ‘administer’ them. Vern (post-migrant interview,
23-08-03) said that the appreciation that management demonstrated to teachers was profound. He recalled that his principal acknowledged every effort put in by individual teachers by either praising them, sending a thank you card and sometimes even a box of chocolates.

A post-migrant (questionnaire) stated that her principal was so overcome by the standard of her work and her commitment that she was asked to return to SA on an all-expenses-paid-trip to recruit SA teachers of her calibre. She revealed that her intention on her trip to SA was to recruit teachers for the following term in her school (September 2003). This is not an unusual occurrence as Mersan revealed that he had recruited Ben to teach at his school after being approached by his principal. For teachers such behaviour had a positive effect on their self-efficacy in the UK. As Bandura (1997) has asserted, a teachers' efficacy is cognitive. Thus a sense of appreciation for teachers' efforts has the potential to affect beliefs about their abilities to perform as professionals in addition to strengthening their personal identities.

It is assumed that for recruitment agencies and schools the impact of such an undertaking of staff recruitment is enormous. The services of recruitment agencies will not be required to procure teachers in the future. Schools will gain financially as they will be directly responsible for the teachers' salaries. They will be neither paying procurement fees nor daily rates to the recruitment agencies for the teachers that have been recruited.

Return-migrants also attested to a supportive management at schools in the UK (interviews, Rennie 20-08-03, Suraida 19-08-03, SA). The management at school was seen as extremely accommodating. Rennie (return-migrant interview, 20-08-03) revealed that if you were going to be absent, the procedure is to inform management so that a supply teacher can be arranged for the day. He added that there is no prying into reasons as *all you do is fill out a form and state that you have a personal reason for not attending school then you can go to Paris for the day*. He highlights the level of professionalism at UK schools but he fails to behave honestly. He also indirectly reveals that the norm in many DoE schools (in SA) is to interrogate teachers who
request for leave. This suspicious attitude of senior management is understandable if teachers are behaving without integrity as alluded to earlier in the section on leave regulations (4.3.1 i a.)

Rennie also conceded that although there is a lot of paperwork, as a teacher you are not pressurized to perform. This is in contrast to other migrant teachers who commented that teachers' work is constantly monitored for efficiency. The difference in attitude is possible given that Rennie had not yet achieved Qualified Teacher Status (QTS) as he was in the UK for less than six months. By contrast, Ash was a qualified teacher (in accordance with UK education policy) and therefore was expected to meet particular standards of efficiency.

Suraida (return-migrant interview, 19-08-03) was overwhelmed by the warmth of management at both the schools (in the UK) where she had taught. She was treated as an equal and not made to feel inferior in her position as a level one teacher. The following excerpt illustrates this point: the head teacher is a human being - no Mr. Ms or Mrs. It's on a first name basis (in the UK) as status is not important - a teacher's commitment is. Rennie (return-migrant interview 20-08-03) concurred in comparing management styles in SA to that of the UK: Principals, especially Indian principals (in SA) want to be in charge of everything. In the UK there is no fear of the Head of Department or principal and nobody takes advantage. Everyone is straight forward, even the subject advisor. Everything is relaxed - there's no pressure. Deva (return-migrant interview 28-08-03) succinctly summed it up as: The support in schools is unparalleled, be it with your HOD or other members of staff - you can't even begin to compare it with SA. Deva's final phrase (you can't even begin to compare it with SA) is a severe indictment by migrant teachers on ex-HOD schools in SA that reduce teachers' professionalism and add to their stress.

All post-migrants interviewed revealed that their experiences of teaching in the UK contributed positively to their professional growth and development. Professional growth began from the day of their arrival at school with induction courses to orientate teachers to a new curriculum. There was ongoing development in the form of inservice training (INSET) days and workshops/courses at regular intervals. Ash (post-migrant interview, 12-04-02, UK) drew a comparison between her
growth in the UK and the absence of professional growth in SA: I've learnt. I've really grown. The bonus is that the DoE in SA would not have made you grow. Here its courses upon courses. I've done 30 courses in one year. I've really networked. She had thus far assisted to structure the RE (Religious Education) syllabus. She said that this took place over a weekend and she was accommodated at a hotel. Ash commented: Back home you're just a persal number. The comments of migrant teachers who had been employed at ex-HOD schools revealed the impact of their interactions with DoE representatives’ (senior management e.g. principal) in such schools. This was in contrast to the collaborative cultures of many UK schools, where management affirmed and enhanced migrant teachers’ professional and personal identities.

All migrants interviewed (post- and return-migrants) endorsed the view that teaching in the UK led to their professional growth. Rennie (return-migrant, 20-08-03) related that he was offered and accepted the post of acting Head of Department. It was a position that he was paid for inspite of being in the school for only four months. Every teacher felt that financially they had also gained. Benjamin (return-migrant, 07-08-03) was paid twenty pounds per hour for Biology tuition given after school. Teachers alluded to a correlation between their professional growth and salary in the UK. If a teacher accepted duties in addition to the normal classroom teaching, then he or she was compensated financially. For Benjamin (return-migrant) twenty pounds was worthwhile as it equated to approximately R200 when converted to SA currency.

All return-migrants interviewed were in awe at the multitude of resources at a teacher’s disposal. They asserted that they had grown especially with regard to information technology. None of the teachers had prior knowledge of using an interactive board or of being able to use appropriate software programmes for either lessons or administrative tasks such as report cards. Charlie (return-migrant interview, 22-08-03) explained: Our resources were good: there are laptops to do your reports on. I used to get shocked how they used the rhizograph like a photocopier. For just one copy, you waste one stencil. What a wastage of money. A rhizograph requires a stencil to be cut in order to make copies and it is therefore more costly than using a photocopier. Many

26 a unique identification number issued to each teacher
SA schools (due to budgetary constraints) insist that when a teacher requires less than thirty copies of a worksheet, the photocopier should be used and not the rhizograph. Charlie added that he was presently using the knowledge gained to initiate the opening of a computer room at the SA school where he teaches.

Teacher assistants\(^{27}\) were also easily available. Recruitment seminars (Proteach 24-05-02, 12-11-02) informed teachers that each class had teacher assistants (TA) to aid in lessons. However, Ash (post-migrant interview, 12-04-03) pointed out that there were many lessons where you are teaching not only the class but also the TA. *All she is, is a glorified secretary*, remarked Ash. Nonetheless, she does provide a service to the teacher by assisting or undertaking administrative duties.

Post- and return-migrants' remarks concerning professional growth due to physical and human resources in the UK were a result of the UK being a developed country. SA is a developing country with a relatively new democracy. In the sphere of education there have been many changes (curriculum and policy). Thus, education is still in the transformation phase. However, at present the DoE in KZN is faced with budgetary constraints (*Sunday Tribune*, 11-04-04:01). Thus many of the perks alluded to by migrant teachers were not affordable.

In addition to career dissatisfaction, migrant teachers were leaving SA for other reasons as well. The next three themes discussed have links to recruitment agencies attract teachers with benefits of a higher salary and opportunities for travel. Thus the influence of recruitment agencies, finance and travel are explored in succession.

4.3.2 Recruitment Agency Persuasion

This section examines the critical role of recruitment agencies (RA's) in the migration of SA teachers. RA's entice local teachers to go abroad in the pursuit of multiple goals. These are

---

\(^{27}\) Generally an unqualified teacher who aids the teacher in a lesson. Within UK classroom pupils have varying abilities and the TA is generally used to assist weaker pupils
earning in pounds, which is the strongest currency at present (an exchange rate of approximately
twelve rands for a pound),\textsuperscript{28} travelling to Europe and opportunities for career advancement by
gaining global teaching experience. Each of these issues are independently probed in depth in the
following sections.

Recruitment agencies were responsible for the hype created about the benefits of teaching in the
UK (covert research, 24-05-02; 12-11-02; 25-03-03). The earning potential, in addition to other
perks such as free flights, accommodation and an opportunity to travel as a migrant teacher in the
UK, is the trump card that is dealt out by recruitment agencies in their weekly advertisements in
newspapers. With the increasing momentum of human capital flight, a quick perusal through the
national newspaper (Sunday Times, 08-09-02; 01-09-02) revealed attractive advertisements\textsuperscript{29} by
recruitment agencies aimed at local teachers offering them lucrative packages to teach in the UK:
"Taking your career on holiday, ... extend your teaching skills, ...join countless other teachers,
...comprehensive support programme, ... the best package you'll find...free" and promises of a
daily rate of one hundred pounds were flaunted in such advertisements.

The above perks were distinctive pull factors: a simple conversion of 100 pounds to rands is an
attractive proposition for a SA teacher. Although agency adverts promised a minimum of 100
pounds a day, whether this was before or after deductions was not disclosed, creating a
misleading picture of migrant’s earnings. Thus, the disposable income of a teacher was rarely
presented during seminars. However, an agency information package for migrant teachers did
state that rent was exorbitant. The estimate given was between 80 to 120 pounds for a double
room in a house, which is shared. If the intention was to rent a flat or house then the cost was
more. Migrants were informed in agency interviews that they could occupy agency
accommodation upon arrival in the UK. Thereafter, they generally shared accommodation to
save costs. Also, about 30% of the migrant’s earnings will be paid towards tax and compulsory
national insurance. An agency contract stated categorically that "any information given is only

\textsuperscript{28} September 2003 exchange rate
\textsuperscript{29} see appendix seven for sample advertisements
intended as a guide and as such the accuracy of this information cannot be guaranteed and should not be relied upon”.

Interestingly, post-migrants Ben and Mersan (focus group, 7,10-04-03, UK) verified that the set salary rate per day is 180 pounds. However, when the ‘researcher as migrant’ queried the salary during an interview with an agency representative (covert research, 29/05/03, SA), the reply was: *Where did you hear that? Perhaps you misunderstood the amount, you might have been told 118 pounds. We could never pay that figure.* It thus became apparent that recruitment agencies were making a profit of sixty-two pounds per day per teacher.

Recruitment was not a free service even when it was presented as such during introductory seminars (covert research, 24-05-02; 11-12-02; 06-06-02). A recruitment agency (RA) is a company whose aim is to make a profit, and it is far from the image of a good samaritan indulging in a charitable cause. Indeed, there were agencies that pretended not to profit by recruiting teachers. The agencies claimed to offer a free service but upon procurement of a job, the agency was liable to pay the teacher’s salary and not the school. An agency newsletter explains “at the end of each week you will need to fill in a timesheet indicating the number of days you have worked. You will need to post them every Friday ... we process the timesheets every second Monday with the money being deposited in your account the next Friday”. The school was thus paying the agency for procurement of the teacher in addition to a daily rate for each day that the teacher reports to school. All agencies did not divulge that once a teacher is placed in a school, for every day that the teacher is present at the school, the agency receives an additional fee of approximately 50 pounds per day (focus group discussion, 07-04-03). Return-migrant Colet (interview, 24-08-03) vehemently stated: *agencies are a rip-off! The school paid 175 pounds per teacher per day, however, the agency only paid the teachers 90 pounds.*

In addition, some of the terms of the contract binding the migrant teacher to agency rules were far from favourable, such as the regulation dealing with absence from school. If the teacher is ill
and does not report to school, he/she will not be paid for the period of absence. A teacher is paid according to the number of hours he/she has worked, which is indicated on the time sheet. Also, migrant supply teachers are not permanent members of staff and therefore do not receive a holiday pay, which translates into a reduced salary (focus group discussion, 07-04-03; post-migrant interview with Ben 06-06-02).

To summarise, a false picture of economic gain was furthered by recruitment agencies in their drive to entice local teachers. This is in keeping with the views of Gould (2002:03) who warns SA teachers to be “aware of slick sales representatives.” This view was also shared by a migrant teacher from SA who posted an article on the internet (SunTimes, 14-02-2002). The article warns migrant teachers “agencies get up to 180 pounds per teacher per day...ensure that your agency provides you with support when you need it”. Further to this, a group of migrant teachers from Africa were recently in the limelight when Garner (2003) highlighted their exploitation by a recruitment agency. The agency had recruited teachers from African countries (including SA) with the promise of regular work. Upon migration, the teachers were informed that work would be intermittent. In addition, after a period of time the visas expired and were not renewed. Teachers were then requested to leave the UK. The article claimed “the treatment of the teachers has been disgraceful and many were living in poverty because they could not find work”. The Deputy General secretary of NASUWT (teacher union in the UK) described their plight as “the worst exploitation of a group of teachers that I have ever come across”. One agency contract did indicate in their numerous terms and conditions of employment (five pages in total) that there could be periods when work will not be available.

Many recruitment agents were quick to highlight all the perks that their company had to offer (covert research, 24-05-02; 11-12-02; 06-06-02) such as structures in place to assist in obtaining accommodation, opening a bank account and the provision of holiday jobs. An agency also offered ‘a less 14% tax concession’ to teachers and airline arrangements in the form of reduced rates to fly to the UK. Recruitment agency promises sometimes did not materialize as confirmed by Colet (return-migrant interview, 24-08-03). She stated that they (a group of migrant teachers recruited by the agency) were not transported upon arrival from the airport as promised by the
agency and this cost her 70 pounds in taxi fare. She added that migrant teachers were also promised free cell phones, bank accounts and free accommodation for two weeks when they were recruited in SA. However, this was not provided upon arrival in the UK and migrant teachers had to cope without agency support.

The above strategies used by recruitment agencies to offer assistance to teachers were to reduce the costs of migration. RA’s were thus attempting to reduce the costs of migration by offering accommodation, cheaper flying rates and tax concessions. However, what some recruitment agencies did not tell migrant teachers, was that their assistance in accommodation was the boarding arrangement that they had made on migrants’ behalf at an astronomical amount. Rental averaged 400 pounds per month according to research participants Hanah and Charlie (interviewed on 17-08-03 and 22-08-03, respectively). The cost of the airline ticket that migrant teachers were charged was also above the general price quoted by travel agents, which migrants only realised later. Hence, the services that were offered as supposedly free by the agency were built into the costs of migration.

It must be stressed that there were a few good agencies that did provide some free services. Upon migration some participants (post-migrants interviews, Lyn 03-04-03; Rena 08-04-03) expressed appreciation for their agencies’ assistance in terms of good support in fetching migrants from the airport, acquiring holiday visas and organizing socials for foreign teachers to assist in their integration into schools. It is clear that the recruitment of teachers was undoubtedly a lucrative industry and extended to numerous additional services offered to teachers at a cost.

Notwithstanding supplementary services, the teacher was a commodity for the recruitment agency to sell to UK schools. Rene, a post-migrant in the UK, stated during a focus group discussion (07-04-03, UK): *They (RA) charge a fee to the school and you feel so cheap, it’s so terrible*. In this instance the migrant teacher conceptualized herself as a commodity but it had implications for her values as she felt that this diminished her professional status. In SA Rene
was a grade 12 teacher and she perceived herself to be professionally on a higher ranking than other level-one teachers. It should also be noted that she willingly left SA and migrated to the UK. However, she was either unaware of the commodification of teachers in the UK or simply ill informed.

Covert research (as a prospective migrant 12-11-02; 25-03-03; 28-03-03) revealed that in order for the teacher to be viewed as a valuable commodity, there was a host of documents that was required with as much detail as possible. The introductory package mailed to the prospective migrant teacher was quite substantial. Some documents were common to all agencies such as the CV, police clearance, certified copies of qualifications and letters of recommendation. However, the distinguishing features of each agency were the lengthy profiles in which SA teachers were expected to outline their teaching methods, educational philosophy and disciplinary measures. There is little doubt that the aim was to explore the teacher’s personality in an attempt to gauge suitability as a candidate for UK schools. It could also be used to establish whether the migrant will adjust and not take the first available flight back to SA. Indeed, this could have been a sincere attempt to place SA teachers in UK schools or for RA’s to decide whether the migrant teacher was a worthwhile investment.

Interviews (post-migrants Rene 07-04-03 and Sera 14-08-03, SA and return-migrant Mala 21-08-03, SA) and covert research (04-04-03, UK) revealed that recruitment agencies were guilty of leaving out vital information from their seminars and interviews prior to departure. Travel costs to and from schools in the UK differed if a teacher intended using public transport to reach the school. Depending on the area that you teach in, it may be necessary to travel by train and bus across zones, which will impact on the costs of a travel card. As post-migrant Sera (interview, 14-08-03, SA) stated that she lived three hours away from school and had to take a train, two buses and a walk to get to school.

RA’s were practicing a degree of gate keeping with reference to the recruitment of teachers to specific learning areas. Four years ago (2000) in order to attract Maths teachers to UK schools,
teachers were offered 4000 pounds an incentive to teach the subject. However, the need for Maths teachers in secondary schools is still great at present (Eteach.com, 06-08-03). Teachers in the Maths and Science fields were declared to be in demand as recruitment seminars in SA highlighted jobs for teachers in specific fields.

Gate keeping was also evident at another level, namely, race. A manager (interview ProTeachers, 11-07-02) referred to having 10% of their enquiries from Black teachers yet failed to recruit any due to English being a second language for SA Blacks. In respect of Indian teachers, English is their first language. It was unlikely that Black teachers were aware of this type of discrimination and it warrants further investigation. Furthermore, the National Director of Teacher Development of the DoE (S. Nxesi) stated that most of the 58 000 underqualified teachers come from formerly Black colleges (Sunday Times, 08-02-04: 01). The implication is that most unqualified teachers are Black. Hence, due to their lack of a recognized teaching qualification they will not be eligible for recruitment as advertisements mention the need for specific qualifications. Strangely though, the UK does not recognize SA teachers’ qualifications. Upon migration, SA teachers were informed that they needed to undertake the QTS exam for recognition as teachers.

However, there were some recruitment managers who were sincere in assisting potential migrant teachers. It extended from personal telephone calls to prospective migrants (covert research, 06-06-02, 29-05-03) to concern over the brain drain with the DoE forcing teachers to resign before they exit SA (interview with ProTeachers, 11-07-02). Pro Teacher’s manager was disappointed in the DoE’s attitude to SA teachers. She felt that the same liberty accorded to teachers from New Zealand and Australia should be applied in SA whereby teachers are encouraged to migrate on account of professional development for a maximum period of a year. The post at the school is temporarily filled by a substitute during the period of absence. The manager of ProTeachers was of the opinion that the DoE was forcing teachers to exit permanently via resignation from the profession.
4.3.3 The Financial Justification

This section examines the financial imperative as a reason for migration. Financial gain was the reason that newly qualified (novice) and some experienced teachers were exiting. Novice teachers were given a range of alternatives from which to select the most appropriate reason for their departure. The responses to finance (likert scale) as a reason for novice teachers exiting SA is depicted in table 4.7.

Table 4.7 Views of Finance as a Reason for Exiting SA (Novice Teacher Pilot Study)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unsure</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fifty six percent of the novice teachers (pilot questionnaire) alluded to financial reasons for exiting SA (Table 4.7). Novice teachers were asked to comment on their perception of teaching in SA. The reason was to understand why they were exiting without gaining any local teaching experience. A vast majority of novice teachers (66.7%) had a negative perception of teaching in South Africa, especially the financial aspect. Responses from the novice questionnaire included:

*I don’t feel that the teaching profession gets the recognition or pay it deserves, big mess at the moment. Salaries are shocking. Class sizes too big, there is not much incentive to stay regarding finance and job security. Jobs are difficult to obtain in private schools or other nice schools, I think there are several flaws in the profession, and that is why we are going to suffer a severe shortage of teachers in the country. Unless government can understand the needs of teachers and accommodate these needs the teacher situation will*
not improve. The salary teachers earn is crazy. Older teachers get frustrated because their salary hardly increases as they stay in the profession for longer.

Novice teachers’ concerns were related to economics, job security and conditions of employment. Collectively these issues contributed to devaluing the status of teaching in SA. Bonorchis (2004:03) commented “teaching is no longer a noble profession if you look at the way our government (SA) pays teachers”. She argued that teachers were being unfairly treated in SA as their pay levels did little to suggest that they were professionals. She compared professions stating that the worst chief executive earns for times more than the best teacher. She added that even journalists earn more than teachers. Recruitment agencies were apparently aware of the degenerating status of teaching in SA. The impression created during one of the RA interviews (covert research, 12-11-02) was that prospective migrant teachers should be grateful for being offered the opportunity to be part of a global teaching profession. The implication was that the RA was offering an escapist route to the land of opportunity for dissatisfied SA teachers.

The pre-migration questionnaire asked participants to outline their expectations for the UK. The following categories were given: career, finance, social, political and other. Responses to the category on finance are captured in table 4.8. The majority of pre-migrants were looking forward to a higher salary. Twenty six percent of the respondents were intending to work in the UK in order to send money to their families in SA.

Table 4.8 Pre-migrants responses to Financial Expectations in the UK

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial Expectations</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Higher salary</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>46.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Remittances</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>26.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The minority of pre-migrants interviewed quoted finance as the main reason, whilst the majority stated that finance was indeed one of the reasons for their decision. Interviews (Les 07-08-03; Ravin 26-07-03; Reshmi 14-07-03; Farida 18-07-03; Meena 12-05-03 and Rena 06-08-02) with these teachers did reveal that an element of their dissatisfaction was closely related to finance. They articulated the concern that the salary of a teacher was inadequate to provide for their needs.

Abdul’s (pre-migrant interview, 12-05-03, SA) main reason for leaving was finance as he had a bond on his house and a car to pay. Rena’s (pre-migrant interview, 06-08-02, SA) idea was to save sufficient money within a year and pay debts that she and her husband had accumulated. She stated that she was looking forward to earning in pounds, suggesting that a SA teacher’s salary was insufficient to live adequately. There was a bond on her apartment that she had to pay and with daily living expenses, she could not afford international travel. Both Abdul and Rena identified themselves in terms of their debts in SA and the unreliability of prospering on a teacher’s salary. Farida (pre-migrant interview, 18-07-03) was vociferous about a teacher’s poor salary. She is a mother and wanted to provide for her children. She said: *My salary doesn’t even pay half my bills. My son’s school fees are R600. When my daughter enters school next year, it will be R1200 excluding their uniforms.*

Although the majority of post-migrants interviewed did not quote money as a primary prerogative, they indicated that the benefits of a higher salary allowed them to either pay off debts in SA or travel extensively. A minority of post-migrants interviewed (telephonic interviews, Sonny 07-08-03; Lean 13-08-03 and Des 05-08-03, SA) alluded to issues of finance as a primary motivation for exiting SA. These teachers were married with children and embraced opportunities in UK schools to secure their families’ future (Ryan, 2003). She quotes a teacher who stated that his reason for leaving was financial. He explained that it was his desire to increase his pension (“I am going to build up my pension”) in addition to paying for his children’s university fees (“.... Having children at private schools and university is hugely

117
expensive"). Further to this, he commented that he was aware of several older teachers having moved to the UK.

Similarly, participants in the present study who were parents were of the opinion that on a teachers' salary they had been unable to save to pay for their children's university fees. Their children were in high school and would be entering tertiary institutions within 5 years. These teachers declared that had they not taken advantage of offers in the UK, they would have been unable to provide for their families' future needs. Sonny and Lean are parents and both wanted to provide economic security for their children. Sonny (post-migrant interview, 07-08-03) said: My son is completing matric this year, I want him to go to university without having to worry about how much it costs. Lean (post-migrant interview, 13-08-03) has two daughters, one in grade 11 and the other in grade 12. She said that her primary intention was to secure my childrens' future financially. When my daughters finish school they will want to attend university, which is costly. Improving livelihoods for children has been suggested as a motivation for migration (Morokvasic et al, 2003).

The lack of financial satisfaction is a cause for concern among experienced teachers as pre-migrant Les, a life style emigrant, explained in his interview (07-08-03). He was adamant that there was no correlation between a teachers qualification, years of experience and salary. He used himself as an example:

Every educator has a diploma and degree. Many have more. Qualification plus experience doesn't equal remuneration e.g. In the Justice System: a worker with matric + 20 years and his earning is R140 000. I have REQV\textsuperscript{30} (salary status) 16, two degrees, 3 diplomas plus a host of other courses and my salary is R92 000 after 21 years of experience. There's an imbalance there.

\textsuperscript{30} Relative Education Qualification Value - The assigning REQV's is to qualifications that are recognized in education. The minimum requirement to be registered as a professionally recognized educator is REQV 13 (Policy Handbook for Educators, 2003).
Les aligned himself to his professional status and drew on the mismatch between his qualification, his years of experience and his earning. A segment of this view has been explored in Carrim's (2003) article on teacher identity. He confirms that although teachers are professionals, they do not share the remuneration of other professionals.

Ravin, (pre-migrant interview, 26-07-03) attempted to work out a retirement package for himself and was shocked at the figure: R150 000 to R200 000 with 19 years of teaching to his credit. He said that if he taught in SA for another ten years I'd be lucky if I see R300 000. All these little things add up. Ravin's intention was to resign from teaching and emigrate with his family to the UK where he has an established social network.

Return-migrant Benjamin, revealed during an interview (07-08-03) that a calculation for a teacher with 10 years of experience in the UK equates to a salary of three times more per month than what he earned in South Africa. This amount excludes any additional responsibilities that the teacher may have accepted. Therefore a teacher's salary could be incremental depending on the teacher’s accumulated responsibility points. Benjamin does not comment on the cost of living in the UK as he shared accommodation and living expenses with a group of teachers. He was thus able to maximize his savings.

Post-migrant teachers interviewed were more than content financially with the salaries and perks for teachers in the UK. They alluded to the benefits of a higher salary facilitating a better quality of life in terms of accessibility to travelling abroad and increasing their purchasing power. Thus teachers were also defining their decision to migrate in terms of their financial position.

Lyn's decision to go to the UK was to save pounds. She was able to save a portion of her earnings every month and was of the opinion that it would be adequate for her return to SA in a few years to buy a house and car (interview, 19-07-02). Nevertheless she did have her engagement in Italy. However, her wedding was held in SA. Vis (return-migrant interview, 23-
08-03) and Rennie (return-migrant interview, 20-08-03) also wanted to save the maximum amount of pounds. They stated that they managed to meet that requirement, although Vis did admit that he purposefully lived under the scantiest of conditions. He alluded to accepting a drop in his standard of living so that he could return to SA with more pounds. Rajen (return-migrant interview 16-01-03) worked in a supermarket on a part time basis to supplemented his earnings by 450 pounds per month. It is apparent that Rajen used every opportunity to accumulate money while abroad.

SA teachers were not simply saving pounds. They were using their salaries to acquire assets in the UK and in SA. Post-migrants Ben and Mersan took advantage of the low interest rates in the UK. Ben (interview, 07-04-03) took a loan in the UK to buy prime property in KZN while Mersan (interview, 06-12-02) paid off an existing bond on a house in SA. Both Ben and Mersan have retained or invested in assets in SA, regardless of them becoming lifestyle emigrants. It can thus be inferred that both have intentions of returning to SA. Ben had alluded to this intention. Rajen (return-migrant interview, 16-01-03) was house hunting in an elite area of KZN for the home of his dreams. Thus prior to exit teachers viewed themselves as economically marginalized and subsequent to their transnational migration they were identifying themselves as financial achievers.

Migrants were of the opinion that on a UK teachers’ basic salary there was more that one could accomplish. A post-migrant elucidated this point by explaining in his questionnaire that you could furnish an entire home on one-and-a-half months salary, pay the instalment on your new car with two days salary and still afford to travel through Europe. Sera (post-migrant interview, 14-08-03) shared this opinion explaining that in SA she could only afford to buy a Toyota Tazz. She presently had three cars: an A class Mercedes benz, a Polo and a Renault. It has been noted that vehicles in SA are over priced, regardless of whether they are imported or produced locally (Post, 19-05-04). Moreover, she stated that she was able to afford going on holidays with her entire family even though her husband is unemployed.
Rena drew a comparison between her standard of living in SA and the UK upon her move (post-migrant interview, 08-04-03):

*Food is so reasonable, things are really cheap. On a teacher's salary here you can survive. I send money home plus I save plus I travel plus I eat well plus I shop and I still have money at the end of the month. You're not scrounging and begging, thinking at the end of the month 'how am I gonna make ends meat?' Okay I don't have a car but you can survive on a teacher's salary - back home you're waiting for pay day.*

Rena highlighted the relationship between inflation and a teachers' salary. The repetition of 'plus' emphasized the variety of options she had in the UK on a teachers' disposable income, which was non-existent in SA on a local teacher's salary. Rena perceived herself in SA as occupying the lowest rung in the social ladder. However, once in the UK her mind was at ease as she could accomplish numerous goals on a teacher's salary. As a married female she had taken the onus to empower herself to be economically secure via remittances to her husband in SA. She was also extending her personal growth and that of her husband by travelling to Europe (telephonic interview, 10-04-2003). He joined her for a Christmas tour to Scotland and Europe in December 2002 (telephonic interview, 27 Jan, 16 Feb 2003).

Many teachers related having been given the option to approach the management of the school if they required financial assistance. There were teachers who had been given an advance in their salary to pay for accommodation and other necessities upon their arrival at a British school. Return and post-migrants interviewed alluded to having additional professional duties offered to them by management. Many of the teachers interviewed had no pre-migration expectations of additional management responsibilities; their sole intention career wise was to simply teach. Nevertheless, responsibilities in UK schools equal an increase in salary and teachers welcomed the opportunity. Ash (post-migrant interview, 12,13-04-03) was in her third year of teaching in the UK and she had reached her maximum salary. However, she maintained that regardless of that achievement, she could apply to cross salary threshold (increase her earnings) by collecting evidence for at least a year in support of her need for an increased salary. Migrant teachers in the UK were emphasizing that the sky was the limit with regard to earning potential. This was vastly different from the salary structure of teachers in public schools in SA.
Economic gain extended beyond the completion of one’s contract in the UK, which was also of advantage to migrant teachers. Return-migrant Charlie (interview, 22-08-03, SA) stated that a migrant teacher was at liberty to reclaim a portion of his/her contribution of government tax, about which the RA had informed him. Charlie’s tax contribution for four months of work was 110 pounds and his refund was 86 pounds. Mala (return-migrant, 21-08-03) saved a total of R27 000 (2 250 pounds) in four months and Charlie R40 000 (3 333 pounds) due to additional duties. These teachers were capitalizing on the average currency exchange rate of R12 to a pound.

Teachers were thus departing for multiple reasons. All post-migrants and return-migrants interviewed added that supplementary to economic gain was the bonus of travelling, either within the UK or to Europe.

4.3.4 The Travel Incentive

This section discusses the travel opportunities for migrant teachers in the UK. It begins with migrant teachers alluding to the UK being their first overseas travel experience. Thereafter, the impact of travelling on migrants’ personal growth is explored.

More than fifty percent of the novice teachers (pilot study) indicated that they had not been overseas and travelling to the UK would be their first trip abroad. A large majority of pre-migrants (73.3%) were exiting SA with the intention of travelling. The desire to travel was mentioned as a secondary reason by 43% of pre-migrants during interviews. A majority (71%) of the pre-migrants interviewed (Les, Reshmi, Farida, Abdul, Rena) alluded to having never travelled abroad, and indicated that they would be taking advantage of that opportunity once they were in the UK. For pre-migrants one of the downfalls of having a low salary was never having the opportunity to travel. Ravin (interview, 16-08-03, SA) said that on a teacher’s salary in SA travelling comes last as you cannot afford it. But as a teacher in the UK you can afford to travel often. He conceded that it’s about a different quality of life. He was looking forward to having the type of lifestyle that his brother and sister-in-law enjoyed. He drew on their experiences as teachers in the UK. They came on holiday to SA twice during the course of a year and whilst in
SA they paid for their entire family to spend a week at an exclusive holiday resort. Ravin added that they also sponsored a trip to the UK for his family to scout for opportunities to emigrate. All pre-migrants were looking forward to touring whilst in the UK. They viewed travel as extending their personal growth and self-development. Abdul (interview, 12-05-03, SA) was confident that teaching in the UK would open up avenues for him to live his dreams of travelling extensively and meeting many people. Reshmi (interview, 14-07-03, SA) stated that she had not been away from home previously. She has a sibling who works in Jordan and travels often via the UK. She intended completing her degree whilst in the UK, then she and her brother would be migrating to Canada. Post-migrants and return-migrants interviewed alluded to the travel advantage of teaching in the UK. Some migrants used travel as a stress reliever if they were teaching pupils that displayed discipline problems. For example Lyn recorded the effect of travel in her diary.

*The induction sessions held on Wednesdays are good for all the new staff but nothing has been able to prepare us for this amount of stress. Thank goodness it is half term. We are off to Newquay with a group of teachers. The support amongst the staff is fantastic! Only thing that keeps me going. (09-02-03)*

*Back from half term, feeling refreshed - having a week is good for my travelling (24-02-03)*

All teachers interviewed (post and return-migrant) also affirmed the safety factor in the UK as facilitating their travels. Post-migrants (Vern 23-08-03, Mersan 06-12-02 and Ben 06-06-02) proclaimed that it was safe. Ben added that it was possible to walk during any part of the night without having to look over your shoulder. The absence of extreme incidents of crime was most comforting to SA teachers who used the safety of the UK and the efficient transport system to travel widely without fear. They also alluded to meeting many different people whilst travelling during school holidays and on weekends. Even those teachers who wanted to maximize their savings by being in the UK had travelled citing the reasonable and efficient transport network.
Rennie (return-migrant interview, 20-08-03, SA) revealed that when he decided that he was not going to ask his family to join him in the UK, he began travelling to numerous destinations in Europe before returning to SA.

4.3.5 Gaining Global Grandeur

The pursuit of global work experience as a reason for novice teachers leaving SA, is discussed in this section. The long-term goals of novice and post-migrant teachers are included in the discussion. The intention was to plot the pattern of movement and the duration of stay of migrant teachers abroad.

The majority of novice teachers (64% in the pilot study) were exiting SA to enjoy the benefits of working in the global market (see table 4.9 below).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unsure</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Global teaching experience coincides with Reddy’s (2003) findings in her study at Edgewood that final year student teachers would be seeking overseas employment as their qualification was seen as a passport to a global teaching market. Twenty percent of the pre-migrants (questionnaire) were also exiting to obtain global work experience. However, once in the UK the SA teaching qualification is not recognized. All migrant teachers were urged to study for the QTS (qualified teacher status) if they intended remaining as teachers in the UK. This can be a
source of annoyance for teachers who have studied hard hoping to be embraced for their academic qualifications. A post-migrant’s response (questionnaire) to what was considered as the least favourable aspect of the UK was as follows: the fact that you’ve got a teaching degree and you’re still seen as an unqualified teacher - absolute bollocks. This attitude was also expressed in a newspaper article on return-migrant Tracy Henderson’s experiences in the UK. The article states “she was taken aback when the British education authorities refused to recognize her teaching qualification and told her to find work in another profession” (Sunday Times-Business, 24-09-03:01).

The novice teacher questionnaire asked prospective teachers to state their long-term goals (6-10 years). The motivation was to plot their migration trends. Thirty percent of the student-migrants stated that they would not be returning to SA. Interestingly, seventy percent of the respondents claimed that they would return to teach in SA. However, they could be merely harbouring this thought as a possibility. Gmelch (1980) noted that migrants think of returning to the home country regardless of the length of their stay in the host country.

Post-migrants were also asked in the questionnaire to state their goals. The importance was to aid in developing global migration patterns for teachers. It was necessary to ascertain whether teachers had intentions of remaining in the UK or returning to SA as this would impact on the brain drain phenomenon. The majority of post-migrants (questionnaire) indicated their desire to remain in the UK for a period of five years in order to qualify for a British passport. Some teachers from this cohort further indicated their desire to move flexibly between SA and the UK. That is shuttling, a concept developed by Margolis (1998) to explain transnational movement. A minority of post-migrants indicated that they would return to SA. The majority of post-migrants declared their intentions to be ‘transients,’ to acquire a British passport, which will enable them to traverse borders with ease at their leisure.
4.3.6 Ease of Crossing National Borders

This section examines the ease of crossing national boundaries in a global labour market. It also emphasizes the illegal practices by some SA teachers to enter the UK. Such behaviour is supported by unethical recruitment agencies in providing teaching jobs to SA teachers who pretend to exit SA on the pretext of a holiday in the UK.

It was relatively simple to exit SA if you were a qualified teacher as recruitment agencies explained that if you are under the age of 30 you automatically qualify for a working holiday visa. In addition, if you are over 30 years then a UK school can sponsor your work permit. Premigrants (pre-migration questionnaire) stated that there were three procedures that they needed to accomplish prior to exit: obtaining a police clearance and a visa and opening a British bank account. Premigrants stated that all three were accomplished within a reasonable period of time. The only procedure that teachers expressed as being lengthy was resignation from the DoE in SA. In addition, pre-migrants stated that RA’s provided a checklist that they were required to follow to expedite their departure. Thus regardless of age, legal departure from SA could be accomplished with relative ease.

Illegal entry into a host country can also be converted into legal entry, as a post-migrant explained. During an interview Neven (16-08-03, SA) stated that he went on holiday to the UK and approaching an agency for a teaching post. He was not turned away but was asked to go on holiday to a Scandinavian country and return after two weeks during which time a valid work permit would be obtained so that he could be legally employed in the UK. Within six months, his wife who is a teacher was also granted a spousal visa and she joined him. She is also presently teaching in the UK. Thus there were teachers, who had used illegal methods and were supported by some recruitment agencies. Neven also shared his intention to recruit his brother-in-law.
4.3.7 Social Networks

This section encapsulates a discussion of teachers’ social networks, which served to support and encourage migration. Where social linkages were absent, recruitment agencies provided shared accommodation facilities for migrants to build relationships.

The majority of the pre and post-migrant teachers interviewed had an existing social network in the UK, either friends or family. Les (07-08-03), Meena (12-05-03) and Resmi (14-07-03) were single and had family/friends in the UK with whom they will be living upon migration. Bourdieu and Wacquant (1992) have explored the importance of a social network. They maintain that such networks facilitate migration by reducing the costs and helping migrants in the process of adjustment in a new environment.

Rena, Abdul, Farida and Ravin (pre-migrants interviews: 06-08-02, 12-05-03, 18-07-03, 27-07-03 respectively, SA) were married. Although Abdul and Ravin had chosen to migrate alone, they had a social network in the UK. Ravin had a brother and sister-in-law teaching and they would assist him to find a job. Abdul has three friends in the UK who will assist him upon arrival in the UK. Once Ravin and Abdul had settled, they would request for their families to join them. Farida had decided to migrate with her entire family as she has a brother in the UK. He was finalizing arrangements to secure a job for her husband. Farida was using her social network to assist her husband who was unemployed. Her decision to migrate accompanied by her husband who was unemployed, indicates the status that she as a female occupies within the household as a decision maker.

Rena decided to leave for a year and her husband remained in SA. She had neither family nor friends in the UK, but the recruitment agency provided accommodation for her at a teachers’ hostel. When post-migrants were asked about their social life during their interviews all SA teachers spoke of mingling with ex-patriots, many of whom were also teachers. Sera (14-08-03)
stated that she *expected to be lonely* but was pleasantly surprised as she met many SA teachers and friends in the UK.

### 4.4 Conclusion

The aim of this chapter was two-fold. Firstly, it commenced with a biographical profile of the migrants who participated in the study with a view to ascertaining which teachers were susceptible to migrate. Experienced teachers were generally Indian, female, married and between the ages of 29-42 years. Novice teachers were White, female, unmarried, 28 years of age or younger.

Secondly, teachers' motivations for leaving and their associated experiences were discussed. Given the variation in biographical data, experienced and novice teachers differed in their reasons for exiting SA. Although both cohorts alluded to multiple reasons for their departure, the reasons were not independent of each other. Novice teachers highlighted global teaching experience, finance and travel as priorities. By contrast, experienced teachers cited career, finance and travel as the principal reasons for departure. Recruitment agencies were identified as playing a crucial role in enticing teachers to the UK. Local teachers were manipulated by bad recruitment agencies that preyed on their discontentment with the DoE in SA. By contrast, there were good recruitment agencies that provide support and encouragement to migrant teachers in the UK. Collectively RA’s emphasized the benefits of finance, travel and gaining global teaching experience upon migration. Prospective migrants were also informed of an established network of ex-patriots in the UK. Migrant teachers were identifying themselves economically as underachievers in SA yet upon migration as achievers. Their articulations revealed their desire for financial gain, which fueled the commodification of teachers. This construct highlighted teachers trading their services on a global market in exchange for material gain. Teachers who were exiting SA due to career dissatisfaction disclosed that an array of opportunities was available to them for career progression in the UK.
The next chapter focuses on a discussion of migrants’ experiences (post- and return-) in UK schools and society. The experiences of migrant teachers were relevant in understanding their thinking, attitudes and how they constructed their decisions. Thus the chapter also highlights the reasons for migrant teachers returning to SA.
CHAPTER FIVE: FLIGHT, FRIGHT AND FORTITUDE

5.1 Introduction

The aim of this chapter is two-fold. Firstly, it extends on the discussion of the previous chapter on migrant teachers' experiences in the UK. It chronicles and discusses teachers' experiences in UK schools and society. Secondly, it explores the reasons for return-migration. Teachers' experiences have extended across the spectrum from teaching in a host of British schools to involvement in social, economic and political debates. Their articulation of such experiences assisted in revealing their dominant identities. Hence, their thinking and perspectives of particular events shed light on their actions and plans for the future. From the previous chapter, it was possible to continue to plot the geographical path of movement that migrant teachers intended traversing from the UK.

As stated in the previous chapter, the findings of the study and discussion thereof are presented thematically. Where themes were common to teachers' experiences and their reasons for return, such themes were not repeated. Thus teacher stress from incidents of reduced discipline and loneliness appear within the ambit of teachers' experiences. However, they were also reasons for return migration to SA.

This chapter begins with a discussion of the culture shock that migrant teachers experienced on entering UK classrooms. An exploration of disciplinary issues encountered by migrant teachers is presented. It commences with a discussion of the emotional and physical abuse of teachers. This is followed by incidents of promiscuous behaviour by pupils during lesson time and episodes of racism and discrimination by pupils. Migrant teachers attributed their experiences to two factors, which perpetuated problems of discipline: structural constraints (UK policies) that protect children excessively, and migrant teachers being sent to undesirable schools in the UK. The consequence of such experiences for migrant teachers contributed to the formation of their dynamic professional identities.
The second section on globalisation and pedagogy discusses the professional growth of migrant teachers. This was primarily by technological advancements in lesson preparation. Despite this there was evidence of discontentment in UK classrooms due to stringent working conditions. Further unhappiness, discussed in the third section, is evident due to various factors: physical climate and the absence of family in the UK. Teachers’ perceptions of British society, discussed in the fourth section, also contributed to feelings of isolation in a foreign environment. The chapter concludes with two other reasons for return-migration: the position of the migrant as the head of the household and migrants’ forced return to SA due to expired leave.

5.2 Teachers’ Experiences in the UK and Reasons for Return

Teachers’ experiences, which had the greatest impact on them, are discussed in this section. Migrants highlighted poor discipline in the questionnaires (post- and return-), focus group discussion and in interviews (post- and return- migrant). They suffered psychological stress in UK classrooms. Each of the aspects of poor discipline are explored: emotional and physical abuse, promiscuous behaviour and racism and discrimination. Thereafter, school policies and undesirable schools in the UK are examined for their influence on discipline.

The next experience alluded to by migrant teachers, was that of professional growth. In this section teachers share their experiences of advanced technology in UK classrooms. However, they advance that excessive paperwork and the lack of a work ethic by pupils leads to teacher stress. The health status of migrant teachers is further affected by the UK climate and the absence of the migrants’ families. Migrants’ isolation is also exacerbated by their views of British society. Each of these aspects are discussed for their influence on migrants’ decisions. Finally, the migrants’ position in the household and forced return are examined as other reasons for return to SA.
5.2.1 Discipline

In the post-migration questionnaire teachers were asked to rate various aspects of the school environment in the UK in an attempt to explore aspects of their professional and personal identities and thus ascertain their level of integration into the UK school system.

Table 5.1 Post-migrant Views of Pupil Discipline in the UK

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>53.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excellent</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Eighty three percent of the respondents rated pupil discipline to be between poor to average. A mere sixteen percent perceived the discipline in school to be between good to excellent (table 5.1).

There were various morphologies of poor discipline in classrooms alluded to by migrants in the post and return-migrant questionnaires, post- and return-migrant interviews and the focus group discussion: emotional and physical abuse of teachers, promiscuity and discrimination by pupils. Migrant teachers in the focus group (7-04-03) suggested that such behaviour has been supported by legislation in Britain. These migrants expressed the view that the supremacy of the student (children’s rights in the UK are of paramount importance) coupled with an easy British curriculum (similar to OBE in SA which migrant teachers were averse to) had impacted negatively on pupils (focus group 7,10-04-03). This had led to the lack of a work ethic in those schools where foreign teachers were welcomed.

An attempt was made to understand the multiplicity of migrant teachers’ (professional and psychological) identities and the complex reality of their experiences. This was accomplished by examining migrants’ interpersonal relations within the classroom/school and society at large.
The post-migrant questionnaire schedule asked migrant teachers to comment on their first month of teaching in the UK, and then to reflect upon their present challenges. The intention in posing both questions was to understand migrant teachers’ conceptions of themselves in the first month of teaching, and then to trace whether these conceptions remained static or were dynamic. An overwhelming majority of migrant teachers experienced a culture shock in UK classrooms. Post-migrants (questionnaire and interviews) described their first month in negative terms ranging from shocking and appalling to nightmarish. They expressed horror at what they called shockingly low levels of discipline amongst pupils. Post- and return-migrants articulated the following features of poor discipline: use of vulgar language (Lyn e-mail, 25-10-02) and physical abuse of teachers (interview Jude, 08-04-03; Benjamin interview, 07-08-03), overt sexual behaviour (Immy interview, 25-07-03; Ash interview, 12-04-03), racism and discrimination (Gene focus group discussion, 7-04-03; Ash interview, 12-04-03). Such behaviour led to a reduction of teachers’ confidence in their professional abilities. Migrant teachers reacted in various ways depending on their past experiences as discussed below.

i) Emotional and Physical Abuse of Teachers

Teachers stated in their questionnaires (post- and return-migration), the outrageous use of profanities by pupils, which they found disturbing. Migrant teachers (post- and return-migrants) interviewed reacted with shock at being addressed by pupils disrespectfully. They felt that it impeded their ability to do constructive teaching. Rennie (return-migrant, interview 20-08-03) stated that pupils are not easy to handle if you don’t have the experience. They sit on the table. they don’t want to do your work and constantly talk Colet (return-migrant, interview 24-08-03) was of the opinion that the pupils are rotten. Mala (return-migrant, interview 21-08-03) shared this view and tried to explain the extent of the poor behaviour. She said think of the worst discipline problem then multiply it by 70. Swearing at you and disregarding you is the norm. Rajen (return-migrant interview, 16-01-03) who also alluded to poor discipline attempted to explain why this occurred. He declared that pupils are not allowed to go ‘skyving’ which is bunking a lesson as their parents can be jailed. Pupils therefore remain in class yet fail to give you their attention. They indulge in
childish behaviour like making and throwing paper rockets at the teacher or retorting: I can't be bothered.

Hanah (return-migrant interview, 17-08-03) felt that as a teacher you become exasperated with non-participation in the lessons. She stated that the kids don't want to learn and you can't touch them or anything. Hanah's remark is significant because migrant teachers exit SA with their baggage of past experiences and perceptions. Corporal punishment was a reality in SA although it was abolished in terms of the South African Schools Act of 1996. There are still isolated incidents of corporal punishment being practiced in SA at present (Sunday Tribune, 16-05-04:01).

Lyn recalled her experiences (diary and e-mail, 25-10-03; interview 03-04-03) at Worthington (school she taught at from September to December 2002) as psychologically destructive to her. Her diary entry stated:

\[
\text{The year nines are shockingly behaved and many teachers are complaining. But in general pupils swear openly, disrespect the teachers and other pupils and are not aware of how to behave appropriately.}
\]

She later alludes in her diary to a traumatic incident in her class (09-02):

\[
\text{Major incident! girl (awful past experiences and sad background; from Africa) went ballistic in my classroom. She held a boy up by his throat and also picked a desk up and slammed it down. She slammed the door so hard that I couldn't open it. Dan was trying to help me, which made things worse (she is afraid and gets upset by males). I spent the next period being consoled, I was so shaken up and then was sent home after writing a detailed report. Awful experience}
\]

In her interview she explained the difficulty of teaching in the UK:
There is graffiti on the tables, on their books, they will be jumping on the desks, sometimes throwing things out of the window, truanting lessons and standing in the corridors. They will leave lessons without permission and run to the bathroom or wherever they want to without asking. It’s unbelievable. If you grow up in SA where you do not swear or say no indignantly, especially to the teacher, you don’t slam a door in someone’s face, you don’t touch the teacher, you just don’t use her things, the behaviour that we foreigners were experiencing is totally unacceptable in our countries. That is why it is so difficult to deal with - it was shocking.

Lyn identified her role as a teacher in SA as being in control and therefore having power over the pupils. The extension of this power translated physically into respect by the pupils for the teacher by not touching her or her things. It is evident that she is comparing pupils in the UK to SA. This is an unfair comparison as cultural norms in these societies differ. Nevertheless, it is understandable that she reacts in this manner as teachers draw on their past experiences in their interactions.

Lynn (interview, 03-04-03) explained a snapshot of a lesson at her school in the UK. It included going into the classroom and writing the topic on the chalkboard directly from the textbook. Pupils then read by themselves and answered the questions from the text: I have resorted to writing instructions on the board for the lesson so that those pupils who want to work can get on with it. Alternately she drew a diagram on the board and in a class of 30 only 5 would copy it down. Lyn’s strategy for coping with her disempowerment as a teacher was minimising her labour in class. In an hour’s period she felt that nothing was accomplished. Lyn said that her challenge was discipline and trying to overcome the frustration of not being able to teach. Her feeling of a lack of accomplishment as a teacher led her and other migrant teachers who spoke of poor discipline (Gene, Rene and Kay, focus group, 07-04-03) to comment about the absence of a work ethic in UK classrooms.
The absence of a work ethic was also encouraged by pupils who ignored the authority of the teacher as a professional. Lyn's diary entry at Worthington is insightful (04-09-2002):

I had to administer a formal test today - what a joke! They all took it so lightly - talking, looking at their friends work. One girl even handed a blank sheet in - these kids have no direction - when asked what they are going to do after school, we get responses like 'become a taxi driver' or 'go on the dole'. Shocking. All this free education being wasted.

Classroom observations (7, 10-04-03) confirmed that when the teacher entered the class, pupils continued with their conversations, apparently oblivious of the teacher's presence. There were the odd few pupils who would be listening to the teacher but this was not the norm. Once lessons had begun they were continuously punctuated by bursts of disciplining to quell the noise until the lesson was over. Examples from utterances during lessons (10-04-03) at Alambra High were:

Sit down properly, turn around and get started.
What's going on?
Behave or do you want detention?
Stop it, hey relax, Jason put that away!
Right, forget that story now... get on with the work.

The extent to which lesson time was eroded by constant disciplining was only understood when a teacher remarked to the teacher assistant and the researcher at the end of a lesson: *We at least got in half an hour's work today* (the duration of each lesson is an hour). There were occurrences where pupils showed very little respect for the authority of the teacher. This was evident in various utterances and actions of pupils during lessons (classroom observations, 10-04-03 and covert observations, 07-04-03) as extracts below indicate: *Whilst a teacher is engaged in a Math exemplar on the board, a pupil calls out 'Boring' at the top of his voice.*
There appeared to be a general lack of control over disruptive pupils. This occurred during the lesson and was exacerbated by pupils entering or exiting a room without the teacher’s permission (classroom observations, 10-04-03):

During the course of a lesson on computers, a pupil ran into the room and began prodding the teacher’s interactive board with a piece of wood. The teacher summoned him and he turned heel and ran out of the room.

Pupils were handed a workbook and asked to complete an exercise in preparation for an exam. As the teacher started to facilitate at one end of the class, pupils at the opposite end were requesting for answers from their neighbours and friends.

A pupil stood up and walked out of the class without seeking permission from the teacher who promptly ceased teaching and ran behind the boy into the corridor. They returned a minute or two later and the boy returned to his seat but failed to do any written work the entire lesson.

In the above extract the teacher appears to be more of a child minder than a professional.

During covert lesson observation (of a British teacher 07-04-03) this also appeared to be the norm: In the British teachers’ classrooms the pupils were equally lacking in respect for the teacher’s authority or presence. This becomes evident when they were supposed to be completing a project for Leisure and Tourism yet were in groups chatting vulgarly and styling their hair. The absence of a work ethic was evident:

Teacher: Would you watch your language please!’ (after a pupil swears, inaudible to researcher what the exact words are although the teacher sounds quite annoyed.)

Computers were still on although some pupils were not working.

A female pupil requested for permission to go to the toilet.

Teacher: No

Pupil: Why Not?

Teacher: Your jacket and earrings and you’ve been doing everyone’s hair. (The researcher noticed that she had make-up on but the teacher did not comment about this.)

The girl divested herself of the earrings and jacket and walked out.
There was not much difference in the behaviour of pupils in the other covert lesson observation of another British teacher (07-04-03) that was undertaken:

Pupils had to plan an essay on their holiday after watching a video clip. From this point onwards there was no period of silence. There was constant talking of pupils to each other, standing up and walking around. Some girls took out a mirror from their handbags and began preening themselves. The teacher called out: “Would you all shut up!”

This did not have much of an impact on the pupils. One or two began to walk around, some were laughing with their neighbours. One pupil pinched her neighbour and he cried out ‘ouch’.

Once again, there was an absence of a work ethic amongst pupils. There s also a total disregard of the teacher’ presence and her attempt to discipline the pupils. The need to instill a work ethic has prompted the London Borough of Islington to institute an ‘acceptable behaviour contract’ at local schools to deal with poor discipline amongst the youth (Eteach.com, 05-08-04).

Many SA teachers have transformed their pedagogic style given the circumstances and the environment in the UK. Regardless of the constant stream of disruptions to the lessons, the commitment of the teacher to educating and empowering his/her class did not waiver. The teachers took the disruptions in their stride and sometimes utilized creative strategies such as humour or wit to engage with the pupils. The extract below is an example:

Someone called out: ‘BORING’ whilst teacher was doing a Mathematics example on the board. Teacher: You didn’t expect it to be interesting, did you? The teacher did not get angry at the comment or the disruption.

In a separate incident a female pupil (Sally) was playing with a toy whilst at the computer. The teacher complimented her work and told her that she would be presenting her slides.

Sally: Do I have to?

Teacher: yes.

Teacher asked her to get on with the next task on the Iraq War and put the ball away. She complied.
During a Mathematics lesson a pupil got up and walked towards the door and left. The teacher followed and had a chat with the pupil. The pupil re-entered the class. The teacher then joked to him about the importance of Mathematics if he wanted a Mercedes. He told another pupil: ‘This is not a hippopotamus, it’s a hypotenuse.’ (when assisting with a Math example).

In the above case the teachers had built a rapport with pupils using devices such as humour and wit to engage with pupils. Pithers and Soden (1998), noted humour to be an effective stress reduction strategy. Some mechanisms were utilized so subtly that it was not easily noticeable, for example in the Mathematics lesson as preparation for the examination. The teacher spent the remaining ten minutes of the period giving the class a pep talk about the importance of the examination. The researcher realized that the teacher had noticed the pupils copying from each other during the lesson and was addressing the issue in an indirect manner.

Rena (post-migrant interview, 08-04-03) was a teacher who had changed her thinking and attitude in order to compensate for the disciplinary problems in school. She revealed that in SA her behaviour was similar to other teachers: the teacher’s role is traditional with the teacher as authority and allowing oneself to become emotionally involved with the students (building close relationships). In the UK she had purposefully chosen to be detached to prevent herself from becoming frustrated and stressed. The transcript below bears testimony to her strategy for coping with disciplinary problems:

I think there are a lot of social problems in this area and that’s how they come to school. I don’t think there is an outlet for those problems: divorces, single parents, low income, people living with their grandparents. When I came here I decided that I was going to choose my battles. I’m not going to get into a fight. I might as well ask them to leave the room. In this school you have a special room called the PRU (pupil referral unit) and if a student is rude, you just send them to the PRU.
Bruce Verity (Special Assignment, SABC 3, 23-04-04, 21h30) has commented that “In all government schools the discipline is poor...the discipline in Britain needs a lot of work”. There exists a view that “London schools reflect divisions of wealth and social status” (independent.co.uk, 08-01-04). Middle class families are said to prefer private education or popular state schools, for example, religious Catholic schools. It was evident that Rena was teaching in a school where pupils came from a low socio-economic background. There were thus many social problems impacting on pupils. Rena was not the only migrant teacher in a school situated in a low socio-economic area. In general migrant teachers commented on the contexts of the schools in which they taught (interviews, Ash 13-04-03; Lyn 03-04-03; Colet 24-08-03; Mala 21-08-03). Migrant teachers spoke of being recruited to teach in low socio-economic neighbourhoods. This is understandable as Lupton (2004:12) has contended that “the reputation of inner London schools affect their staff recruitment”. This is a view that resonates with the general perception of London state schools (BBC News, 12-05-03). Coughlan (BBC News, 12-05-03) reporting on the state of education revealed “Inner London schools face a particular problem with temporary and overseas staff. The poorest London boroughs also have social problems connected with deprivation and dysfunctional families”. There appears to be a link between poverty and low achievement levels. The consequences for schools in such areas are that exam results are lower and truancy higher than the national average in the country (BBC News, 12-05-03).

Rena (post-migrant interview, 08-04-03) explained the challenges that she faced daily:

There is also a special person employed and you can send him to take away students who are behaving badly. I've never had any nasty experiences. I've had basic attitude or arrogance but no one has threatened me or said fuck off? I think also you as a teacher you can't put SA practices into work here, because it's a totally different context. In SA we're still very traditional - where the teacher is the authority and children don't have as much rights as they do here. Here legally or whatever, the child comes first. It has more advantages than disadvantages. You can't come here as if you're the bearer of all knowledge and there's no going against the grain (room for transformation/change).
Rena is aware of the different social contexts when comparing SA to the UK. She realized the 'supremacy' of children in the UK due to British legislation. Pupils have more power than the teachers in UK classrooms and Rena was willing to compromise, unlike other SA teachers she knew, who chose to become return-migrants. She thus saw the need to change her professional identity in order to maintain her emotional strength:

_If you are a person who is always a traditional teacher, you’re the power in the classroom and you find a student saying I’m not doing it, what are you going to do? You can’t beat them up, here there’s no corporal punishment, and you’ll lose your job. Yeh, I’ve had a pupil tell me that, I’ve just let them, its their choice at the end of the day. That’s why I say I’m gonna choose my battles. If I get into a one to one I’m going to get frustrated and stressed out, so it’s basically their choice. I’m not going to be the way I was in SA - gets so emotionally involved into the student that you can’t see reality at the end of the day. You know I hold back a lot, here SA experience has made me wiser - emotionally... definitely-to choose your battles and some battles are just not worth it. I’ve known principals who have packed their bags and left - they are so used to being the authority figure and here you have to find level ground, a meeting point with these students and they can’t do it. It’s either their authority or no authority and I think then you get into trouble._

Her comment _I hold back a lot_ reveals that that she is suppressing her core professional self. In addition, the experiences of other teachers impacted on her, prompting her to develop 'survival strategies' for herself in the classroom. As a teacher in a foreign environment, she transformed her style of teaching and her attitude. Rena used a strategy to develop respect at school. She walked past a particularly bad group of students and would salute them and cry out RESPECT! whenever she saw them. As a drama teacher she adopted the role of an actor. Eventually, the pupils and her reversed roles - every time they saw her they would cry out RESPECT! She revealed to the researcher _You’ve got to be a bit crazy to teach in the UK._ Her articulation of this statement suggested that she was not at ease with this new identity as it did not conform to her understanding of a teacher. However, she succumbed to this role to prevent her classroom
turning into a battlefield. The identity Rena assumed is a dislocated professional identity: it was unnatural for her core self but given her circumstances, she embraced it.

Ash (post-migrant interview, 12-04-03, UK) tried to explain the influence of parents in perpetuating the absence of a work ethic: they (children) are too spoilt. Their parents don’t push (motivate) them. In her class a pupil’s mother said: I don’t see why he should be learning? When I was at school I never liked it. At home (SA) pupils say I’d like to be a doctor, here (UK) they say, I want to be a pop idol. Interestingly, home for Ash is SA although she had been away for three years. She felt that the lack of a work ethic was largely due to the absence of parental motivation. Thus progress was acquiring a tertiary education according to Ash’s personal value system and not the pursuit of fame. Ash’s comparison emphasized the difference in values of people in developed and developing nations. She highlighted the desire for fame that existed among the youth (for an elaboration of this refer to section on Perceptions of British Society). Fernandez (2003) alluded to this phenomenon in the UK, which he called the cult of the child. He stated: “...the problems I experienced were symptomatic of certain deep-rooted problems in British society at large. One of them I would call the cult of the child, the idea that the interests of the child are always paramount. Wherever I went children conducted themselves as if the world belonged to them alone. At the heart of the British malaise is a deep seated materialism and consumerism ...There is the cult of the celebrity (David Beckham being the ultimate example) and with Pop Idols and Pop Stars phenomena, the attraction of instant celebrity”.

Jude (interview, 08-04-03, UK) had also been unfortunate since her arrival in British classrooms and she had to cope with repeated incidents of bad behaviour and vulgar language to which she was unaccustomed. When she arrived, she was very enthusiastic and excited. But that was short lived as at one of her first lessons during the course of that day, she was on the receiving end of a tirade of verbal abuse, which included being sworn at. She later found out from other members of staff that this was a common occurrence. The class was testing her to see who has the guts to stay or leave. What was prevalent in Jude’s phrase was the power dynamics in classrooms where
it appeared that the sanctity of the teacher was superceded by the supremacy of the child. The identity that pupils were searching for in the teacher is resilience.

Similar treatment was meted out to supply teachers (substitute for a permanent teacher on either a daily or term basis) by pupils. Both Gene and Rene (focus group, 7,10-04-03) are supply teachers and they were of the opinion that as a result of this pupils had a tendency to treat you shabbily because they were aware that they will probably not see you again. Rajen (return-migrant, interview, 16-01-03) stated that there was a reason for the behaviour of pupils. Upon a new teacher’s arrival the first question asked is: Are you supply? The reason for this is that their education is not continuous due to a shortage of teachers. They won’t give you their attention if you are a supply teacher.

This view was confirmed by Gene and Mersan (post-migrant focus group, 7,10-04-03) who acknowledged the behavioural problems in schools. They also suggested a reason for such attitudes. Gene said: These kids know what a supply teacher is, they treat you like dirt. There is such a huge turnover of staff that pupils are insecure. Mersan agreed explaining that You have to understand the pupils - there are constant supply teachers, that’s why they have a don’t care attitude. Both Gene and Rajen (interview 16-01-03) had a sympathetic attitude to pupils based on the realities of a severe teacher shortage in the UK. This shortage had been alluded to by the TTA (Teacher Training Agency) in the UK (Eteach.com, 02-09-2003) at the launch of their campaign to attract graduates. The TTA declared that teacher retention was still an issue of concern as teachers did not view teaching as a lifelong occupation.

Supply teachers were treated differently by staff in comparison to permanent teachers. Teachers who had elected to undertake supply work had the same concern regarding staff; they were generally overlooked due to their transient stay at schools. The result of this rejection by colleagues had impacted on teachers. They felt that because they occupied the lowest position in the education hierarchy, their presence at schools went unacknowledged.
After her initiation, Jude (interview, 08-04-03) stated that she decided to use the system to establish discipline. This was her attempt to regain some of the power and position she had lost in the first week at school. In order to mete out discipline, one had to be acquainted with the procedures. The first step was detention when there was an infringement. If it was repeated then the matter was referred to the Head of Department for further detention. Upon the third offence, the child was excluded from the classroom. Pupils could be excluded from class for up to 45 minutes. A list of pupils with behavioural problems was sent to mentors who supervised their work. Jude stated that she had to still supply work for these pupils. Jude disclosed that she was averse to supplying work for pupils who were disruptive in class. The view that she expressed is consistent with Harley and Mattson's (2003) contention that teacher's personal opinions may contradict existing policy.

Nevertheless, Jude (interview, 08/04/03, UK) said that she had developed better discipline and was able to establish boundaries. She (interview, 08-04-03) admitted that it took a while because you need to hear what is acceptable or not and then establish boundaries. Although she was enunciating a negotiated identity for herself, Jude had subsequently experienced various episodes of abuse. She recalled an incident where a child attacked her in the class while he was on drugs. He was excluded from her class and was later found dangling a younger child three floors up. When questioned the boy said that it was a joke but Jude disagreed. The boy was let back into her class and he was in for ten minutes and when the abuse commenced. He said: Suck my balls! followed by Fuck yourself! He continued for 15 minutes in this manner. When she asked him to leave the room he replied: I'm waiting for you to suck my balls, I'm waiting for you to fuck yourself. When she refused to retaliate to his statements, he eventually left. Jude said that this episode left her speechless: I have never, never ever experienced such abuse before. Jude said that in SA she did not experience behavioural problems that were even remotely similar. The pupil's perception of Jude as a perverted sexual being, was a role that she had not previously experienced as a teacher in SA. Pupils' use of such graphic language was demeaning to her professional status of a teacher.
This was not the sole incident of abuse experienced by Jude and she had to deal with further episodes of emotional abuse. A month later (March 2003, UK) a girl refused to do her work in class and when Jude questioned her, it was the beginning of 50 minutes of verbal abuse and being called a *fucking cow*. Jude said that she willfully started a problem and was asked to leave the class. She was later caught vandalizing a teacher’s car and the police were called in to remove her and deal with it as a criminal matter. Jude tried to make jest of the incidents by saying that *my vocabulary has definitely been extended*. What was apparent in Jude’s sarcasm is her bitterness. Van Maanen (1995:175) maintains that “sarcasm announces a position - the attitude of the rhetor towards the target” and in her description Jude’s contempt for pupils who behave so abominably was emphasized.

In recalling another incident (interview, 08-04-03), it became evident that Jude identified herself as a punching bag for pupils. She was attacked in class. A pupil pulled out a tart from the oven at 200 degrees and tried to throw it at her. Jude explained that when she grabbed the pupil’s hand, she dropped the tart and tried to reach for some utensils. Jude attempted to restrain her but was later asked by the principal to apologize to the pupil. The apology was requested because she had failed to restrain the girl from the back and had restrained her by facing her, which is perceived as confrontational. This was contrary to the policy on restraint of pupils.

Gender did not dictate the treatment migrant teachers experienced in the classroom. Benjamin (return-migrant interview; 07-08-03) stated that the most negative experiences that he had in the UK stemmed from poor discipline:

*When you turn to write on the chalkboard, they throw paper balls at you. If you turn around and identify the culprit, he will arrogantly say: Did you see me doing it? If you mistakenly bump into a pupil, he’ll say: I’ll sue you, sir - sometimes jokingly other times seriously.*

In recalling this incident, Benjamin was alerting the researcher to the dissolution of the authority of the teacher. The respect that Benjamin expected to be accorded, based on his SA experiences,
had dissipated in UK classrooms with pupils resorting to physical and emotional abuse of the teacher.

Pupils were not only abusive to teachers. There also appeared to be a lack of respect among pupils when they were communicating with each other in the presence of the teacher. Classroom observations at Alambra High (07,10-04-03) testified to inter-pupil disrespect:

*Pupils had been asked to complete a task on the computer and a pupil was presenting his work when the girl he was standing next to called out: 'Josh, You're smelling.'*

*During a Mathematics lesson, two pupils commenced bickering loudly and the vulgarity was shocking.*

*Pupil 1: you penishead*

*Pupil 2: you dickhead*

*The obscene language continued until the teacher intervened by asking them to continue with the exercise; and they noticed the researcher's obvious shocked expression.*

Return-migrants interviewed acknowledged that the stress of teaching in the UK was part of their motivation for returning to SA. Benjamin (interview, 07-08-03, SA) shared his reason for opting to return to SA:

*The stress level is too high. At my age I want to be around pupils that respect you as a teacher. Here (SA) if you catch a pupil misbehaving, he will apologise, he'll say 'I'm sorry sir, I won't do it again. Not there.*

It was apparent that Benjamin's was identifying himself according to his age (42 years). He felt that age should command respect. This view took precedence in his decision to return.

Deva (return-migrant, 28-08-03, SA) initially stated that he had returned due to an expired work permit. As the interview progressed he alluded to being glad that his work permit had expired as he stated that teaching in the UK was blood money. He had conceded that he traded himself for economic gain. However, upon return to SA he was unhappy with the environment at school.
Regardless of his qualifications and his ambition, he could not see himself progressing. At the
time of the interview, he had reapplied to teach in the UK. This is a phenomenon that Margolis
(1998) referred to as yo-yo migrancy. It is a condition where due to unfavourable working
conditions in the home country, migrants feel the need to exit and migrate once again.

Ash (post-migrant interview, 12-04-03, UK) a junior primary teacher revealed that initially she
wanted to quit teaching because she couldn't handle the rudeness of the children. She said that
generally respect was non-existent with pupils calling teachers and each other fucking nag, slag
(slut). Once a pupil bit her and she walked out of school in exasperation because the child is
never reprimanded. She felt that management always believes what the child is saying. The
supremacy of the student reigned once more for migrant teachers who were at odds with the
degree to which schools supported pupils, especially when they had erred. The lack of respect by
pupils, in addition to the lack of support by management, had the effect of eroding teachers’
confidence in their professional capabilities.

This occurrence of abuse did not appear to be unique to migrant teachers in the UK. In a survey
undertaken by the National Association of School Masters and Women Teachers (NASUWT)
violence, both physical and psychological, was identified as becoming the norm in UK schools
(Eteach.com, 26-03-03). During a period of three weeks teachers in four local authorities
reported almost a thousand incidents of abuse from pupils. Included in this figure were 126 cases
of physical assault. OFSTED (Office for the Standards in Education) also published a report:
‘Bullying - Effective action in Secondary Schools’ (Eteach.com, 26-03-03). Also, the Thomas
Coram Research Unit at the Institute of Education (in an attempt to address this issue), published
Tackling Bullying - Listening to the Views of Children. Holmes (Eteach.com editor, 26-03-03)
stated that these reports indicated “life in school is a disregard for the sanctity of teachers’
necessary seniority over pupils”. This was the experience that migrant teachers were alluding to:
the supremacy of the student (where teachers are at the mercy of pupils who subject them to
episodes of psychological and physical abuse), which was evident in the British schools in which
they had taught.
The effect of agency, of individual teachers’ resilience indicated that migrants were not an homogenous group. Ash changed her mind about quitting when she had class inspections by OFSTED with what she termed a rotten class and she did well. She added that the head teacher came over and gave her a hug. This was the beginning of Ash’s professional growth and her pursuit of a negotiated identity: a professional identity that she needed to become a confident and efficient teacher in the UK. She commenced by acquiring skills to integrate into the UK classroom. She attended a course on tackling discipline (called the Bill Rogers Course) to aid her in classroom management. This assisted her enormously in tackling discipline problems. She learnt don’t be confrontational, change the tone of your voice - whisper in the child’s ear. She said that her strategies had led her now to command a great deal of respect from other teachers. She admitted that there’s no use being pals with them (pupils), you’ve had to be strict and stern. She commonly used silent treatment of pupils and playing kids up against each other. She stated quite categorically that there’s mayhem in British classrooms. Ash’s confidence in her professional abilities had been boosted by her negotiated identity as an authoritarian figure.

Return-migrant Charlie (interview, 22-08-03) also adopted the approach of an authoritarian upon arrival. However, this was his identity in transition, which he had to soon re-negotiate. Charlie said that he attempted to set the tone in his classes by telling his pupils: I’m from SA and I’ll slap you and all that will happen is that I’ll be sent back. He added that later there were pupils that swore at him but his reaction was as follows: You turn, put your hands in your pocket and think pounds. Charlie admitted that his intention was to make money in a short space of time. Competing identity claims (professional versus personal) saw Charlie’s need for financial gain taking precedence over his previous demand for respect from pupils.

Thus responses to incidents of poor conduct resulted in migrant teachers responding differently depending on their personalities. Migrant Colet (return-migrant interview, 24-04-03) changed her perception of what was her purpose in the classroom. Colet said: I was biding time. The resources are good ... but you can’t deliver the lesson because of the students. I was like a class monitor because of the behaviour. Post-migrant teachers referred to themselves as crowd
controllers in their questionnaires and not teachers. Rajen (interview, 16-01-03) vividly captured this point when he recalled that in a sixty-minute period there would be on average forty minutes of disciplining and ten minutes of teaching. Mala (return-migrant interview, 21-08-03) agreed with this comment and stated that she became more of a disciplinarian than a teacher. It was apparent that Colet, Rajen and Mala had the belief that their professional competencies were not required given the adverse climate in their classrooms. It resulted in a reduction of their input during lesson time.

ii) Promiscuity

Migrant teachers were appalled by the behaviour of pupils in respect of their sexual conduct. Ash (post-migrant interview, 12-04-03, UK) related that pupils engaged in overt sexual activity at high school. She stated: *I have a friend who teaches in a high school and there was a 15 yr old kid in his class masturbating being assisted by the girl next to him. He got suspicious when he started hearing strange sounds.* Immy (post-migrant interview, 25-07-03, SA) recalled that he also experienced an incident that made him feel very uncomfortable as a teacher. He explained that there was a girl in his class who was caressing the boy next to her: *She had her hand inside his shirt. I said Stop that! And she replied, What? I said stop that! Her response was Stop what?* Immy said that he thought that perhaps there was something going on that he didn't quite understand. Later when he shared the incident with a colleague, her reply was *it could be that the pupil did not know that what she was doing was wrong.* The above incident pointed to cultural norms in the UK, which SA teachers viewed as unacceptable and therefore experienced discomfort and difficulty in addressing. Bhengu (2003) alluded to a similar view in his interview with a professional (accountant) who had returned to SA. He quoted the professional stating: “*I had a good upbringing here (SA) and I believe there is no better place to raise your family with good values and morals*.”
Racism and discrimination

A few teachers interviewed quoted examples of discrimination by pupils. Jude spoke about complaints by British pupils that they could not understand her accent. She added that for her the truth is that British people don’t like foreigners. Jude was alluding to the xenophobic attitudes that had been voiced. Barker (2000:194) commented on ‘a new racism’ in Britain. He stated “the relatively homogenous white character of the in situ population was disturbed in the 1950’s by the arrival of migrants from the Carribean and Indian subcontinent”. He concluded that national identity was becoming a focus through which racialisation was effected.

Racist expletives were also hurled against white teachers. For example, Ash (post-migrant interview, 12-04-03) recalled a pupil calling the head teacher: Cunt, you’re acting like a black bitch, and the head teacher was White. Ash teaches in a primary school and the use of profanity coupled with racist undertones by a seven year old was difficult for her to comprehend.

Gene (focus group, 07-04-03, UK) was saddened by the racist attitudes of pupils in British schools because of his own history. He recalled teaching in SA during the transition period as his most memorable experience. He stated: I told the White kids (SA) that I never thought I would stand in front of a class of White pupils. It felt good because it was an affirmation that I am a human being.

Gene is a teacher of Coloured origin and as Soudien (2003:335) has remarked about teachers in the pre-1994,31 “black teachers were politically engaged professionals. Given the nature of apartheid there was racist segregation among teachers”. Therefore, Gene’s need for acceptance on the basis of his identity as a professional was of paramount importance. He was averse to being judged by virtue of his racial identity. Gene and other SA teachers will be able to identify

episodes of racist behaviour given South Africa's history of apartheid and racist legislation. As Ross (2002:02) contends "racist practice and behaviour will be more obvious and capable of recognition by teachers who have some direct experience of having suffered from racist behaviour".

In leaving SA, Gene did not anticipate a recurrence of being labeled with a racial identity. He added that *racism is alive and well here (UK)*. At the school to which he was first appointed pupils assumed that he was Jamaican and would make funny noises and mimic a Jamaican accent. He said that his wife experienced the same prejudice at school: *She looks Asian and wears a nose ring so pupils used to mock her by calling her Paki*. The name-calling and noises position Gene and his wife as the objects of racial slandering. Gene accounted for such attitudes by stating that there exists an extreme right wing group in British politics. He added that there was a hatred for foreigners and an attitude that *if you're different, we don't like it*. He was reiterating the xenophobic tendencies that exist which Jude also recognized. Gene vehemently augmented his point by stating *I abhor racism and when they stereotype you. When they hear that I'm neither Jamaican nor Indian but South African, they back-off slightly*. None of the other SA teachers wanted to share their experiences of racist behaviour but as Gene recounted his experiences there were nods of approval and affirmative mutterings from the group (focus group, 07,10-04-03).

Return-migrants alluded to incidents of racism by colleagues. Rajen (return-migrant interview, 16-01-03) did remark that *every staff has 1 or 2 racists but they are in the minority so as a teacher you ignore it*. He agreed with other teachers interviewed that generally the staff component was extremely supportive. He added that as a teacher you were considered a professional and there was no intervention unless you requested for assistance. Colet (return migrant interview, 24-08-03) and Vis (return migrant, interview, 23-08-03) commented about being viewed as racial subjects at school in particular. Colet felt that apartheid was very alive in the UK with pupils disrespecting teachers as a result of their colour. Vis felt that the Whites (teachers) in the school he was at carried themselves with an air of arrogance. But he did add that
it could have been as a result of his attitude given SA's history of apartheid and the psychological burdens that South African people of colour still carried with them. He said: *I was one dark skinned person sitting in the staffroom ... maybe they accepted me but I didn't accept them!*

It was necessary to understand how migrant teachers were rationalizing their experiences. Migrant teachers (focus group, 07,10-04-03 and interviews, Jude, Ash) alluded to constraints in their professional work, which shed light on the nature of their negotiated identities and these factors are explored below.

a) Constraints in Teachers' Work

Post- and return-migrants’ experiences of poor discipline were destructive leading to psychological stress. Migrant teachers accounted for their experiences by stating that firstly there are laws to protect the child in school and society (as determined by politicians) that protect and embellish the supremacy of the student. Secondly, foreign teachers are sent to undesirable schools. The attitudes that migrants expressed gave rise to discussion (interviews - Jude, Ash and focus group), which illuminated teacher thinking and attitudes on school policies in the UK and the bad school syndrome.

➢ School Policies

Kay and Gene agreed that pupils do not value being educated. Gene said that his most memorable experience in the UK was what he was faced with on a daily basis that *kids don't value education*. He was of the opinion that because the law states that children must be educated, they are forced to attend school. Kay agreed adding that *kids don't value education because the social system will help them through*. Both were opposed to the way in which the school system is operationalised and its effect on pupils (focus group, 7,10-04-03):
Gene: Yes. That kids can come through on the other side completely illiterate. There are no consequences even if they are kicked out because again the law says that they must be in a classroom. You’ll find the misfits at school having one to one special treatment (in institutions for pupils with severe discipline problems).

Kay: That is so true.

Gene: And that is the sickest part.

The above is indicative of Gene’s resentment of existing policies at UK schools, which seem to protect delinquent students. Post-migrants interviewed blamed poor discipline in schools on UK politics. Migrants (Gene, Kay, Jude, Ash) were disheartened with the laws that affected their interaction with pupils. They were averse to the extent of children’s rights, which protected the child at the expense of respect for elders. Rajen’s (return-migrant interview, 16-04-03) view that the politicians pander to the needs of children because they will soon be voters revealed the extent to which teachers were aware of their disempowerment. Jude (interview, 08-04-03) declared that the laws governing the protection of children had ignored the distinction between discipline and child abuse. Her assessment was that the child can do no wrong in the government’s eyes and all laws punish the adult for the child’s behaviour. The kids have too much of a free reign. Jude said that the result of this was a total lack of pupil discipline in the classroom because parental control is absent or minimal. Lerew (2004), President of NASUWT, had scathing remarks about British society. She declared that twenty years after Thatcher denied the concept of society, parents who grew up then, have produced materialistic youngsters. She stated that the prevalence of materialistic families led to little respect for teachers. She added that schools were still trying to adjust to the impact of Thatcherite attitudes.

Gene (focus group, 07-04-03) felt that the present laws governing children did not contribute to developing the pupil at school. He stated:

*Even if he (the child) does something wrong and should be shown the front gate, the school pleads “don’t let him go”. It’s almost a good idea to be a horrible child at school. If you are put in a special institution attached to a school you will get absolute first class*
treatment because you get one to one education. It doesn’t matter what you have done - physical assault, damaged property what-ever, you’ll still get your education. Even if you are miles away from that school, they’ll send a taxi to get you - I know of kids who travel 2 hours one way and two hours return ... that’s how good the social system is here (sarcastic).

Migrants (Gene, Ben, Rajen, Hanah, Mala) were of the opinion that the UK school curriculum was designed to protect students by allowing them to pass through various stages at school although they may not be academically ready to do so. Gene (post-migrant focus group, 07-04-03, UK) said that the UK education system was far from difficult. Using the SA curriculum as a benchmark, he believed that the South African education standards provided a higher level of education for pupils. Ben (post-migrant focus group, 7-04-03, UK) agreed with this view but he did maintain that there are some intelligent pupils in the UK. Gene qualified his view by stating:

*I teach all subjects and I can say that the UK system is easy, in fact it is a lot lower than the SA system. Many SA pupils (emigrants) who were average in SA are doing well here. With the UK system you can come out illiterate. There are no consequences for the children because there is no such concept as failure.*

Each child has individual targets to achieve depending on his abilities. Sonny (post-migrant interview) had initially exited SA alone but he was later joined by his teenage son. His wife and daughter remained in SA. His return to SA was due to his desire to have his son complete matric (grade 12) in SA. He was of the opinion that British public schools did not contribute to his son’s educational development. His concern was based on poor education standards at public schools in London. This view resonates with Vaida’s (2003) findings that recruitment companies have noted that there are social and economic reasons for South Africans returning. She refers to two interviews undertaken: Chaskelson, the managing director of Personnel Concept, revealed that one of the social reasons is the “lower standards of education in some countries”. This opinion is shared by Chambers of Deloitte and Touche Human Capital. He says “South African education and qualifications in many cases are world class” (Vaida, 2003).
Return-migrants Rajen, Hanah and Mala also alluded to similar perspectives during their interviews (16-01-03, 17-08-03, 21-08-03, respectively). Rajen ventured that the OBE system in SA had many similarities to the British education system. His familiarity with both systems allowed him to deduce that given the implementation of OBE, the quality of SA students was in jeopardy of becoming poor as

they will be pushed through the system as are British kids with only exit exams at certain points. The British people are of the opinion that their education is superior but they are wrong, SA pupils are smarter and more motivated. He quotes the Mathematics syllabus as being watered down in comparison to SA math syllabus for the same grades.

Mala (interview, 21-08-03) agreed with this contention, stating that her experience had allowed her to change her perception that education in a first world country is superior. She said: What we’re doing here (SA school) is better than the English yet England is a first world country.

Hanah (interview, 17-08-03) also states that she was surprised as she expected a higher level of literacy in the UK schools. It was apparent that there existed a false belief by migrant teachers prior to their exit that the standard of education in developed countries was better than developing countries. Rajen, Mala and Hanah have had their confidence in the local (SA) curriculum renewed by virtue of their experiences in the UK. However, return-migrants were wary that education standards in SA will soon slip, thus lowering their confidence in the future of education for SA.32

Bad School Syndrome

Migrants (Rene, Ben focus group, 07,10-04-03) were in agreement that foreign teachers were recruited to fill positions in undesirable schools (in the UK): bad behaviour and poor academic performance. As alluded to earlier, Lupton (2004) has commented on inner city schools and the problem of staff recruitment. Rene and Ben developed this perception (focus group, 07,10-04-03, UK) and catalogued its effects on the migrant teacher:

32 Interestingly, the issue of the quality of matric passes for 2003 was debated on SA television (Interface: SABC 3, 15-01-2004, 21h30) with the then Minister of Education (Professor K.Asmal) after a leading academic (Professor Jonathan Jansen) criticized the discrepancy between the matric pass rate and performance of first year students at universities.
Rene: It is tiring being in a class here - foreign teachers don't get good schools.

Ben: But don't get the wrong impression - there are some schools where there are some brilliant pupils.

Rene: You see it is very, very hard to get into a good school here because teachers, who are in good schools, just don't leave their schools. So you're going to go into a school where the pass rate is not too good and .... (shakes her head).

Rajen (interview, 16-04-03) had the experience of doing supply teaching in many schools and he conceded that foreigners do not get to teach in schools where there is good discipline. He was certain that they get posted to schools in which British teachers have refused to teach. Rennie (interview, 20-08-03) who had only taught in one school said that migrant teachers were swayed by superficial characteristics of a school: You will see what you think is a top school in brochures but it's different when you get there. SA teachers are getting the worst schools. He used a local example of teachers applying for posts in SA to explain this phenomenon, Everybody wants to teach in Westville Boys High and not Kwa Mashu. The former school is an elite White school (during apartheid) whilst the latter is a black school in a disadvantaged area.

It was apparent that foreign teachers were recruited to schools that were situated in poor socio-economic neighbourhoods. As a result teachers had to contend with a host of behavioural problems in addition to learning difficulties that manifested themselves in the classroom. Lyn’s e-mail (25-10-02) explains:

\[
\text{The area I am teaching in is rather low class and the children come from difficult backgrounds, broken families, exposed to drugs and gangs, unsupportive parents, statemented pupils (pupils with learning or behavioural difficulties). They swear at each other all the time, use foul language in the classroom, are not respectful of discipline or afraid of authority.}
\]
Thus as a result of teachers' experiences in UK schools, their identity formations varied depending on the migrant teachers' personalities such as their emotional threshold and adaptability. Some teachers changed their pedagogic style in UK classrooms, whilst few were unwilling to adjust. There were tales told by post-migrant teachers (Rena, post-migrant interview, 08-04-03 and Lyn, diary, 05-09-2002) of teachers who returned to SA after having a series of nasty experiences. Lyn's diary (05-09-2002) entry read:

> Two of the older, well-experienced SA teachers gave a few days notice and went back to SA. I wish they would stay and try another school...

Ash (12, 13-04-03) had a positive experience and chose to remain teaching in the UK. Neven (16-08-03) confided that he informed the school that he did not wish to remain in the UK and teach in a school where behaviour was of such a low standard. Neven took the next available flight to SA. However, upon arrival in SA he realized that he could not secure a job. His sister was teaching in a UK school where the behaviour was comparatively better and when a position was advertised a month later, he flew up for the interview. He was successful in obtaining the post and he was satisfied with the present school environment. Neven could travel at will between the UK and SA as he had a work permit for the UK.

Post-migrants reactions (questionnaires) to the poor behaviour of pupils ranged from some teachers discussing their feelings with staff to others who stated that they were ready to return home. Those that held the latter view remembered that they had resigned from their positions and had to therefore cope to the best of their abilities in a foreign work environment. This attitude alluded to by teachers indicates their unwillingness to forge ahead with tenacity in spite of their experiences.
5.2.2 Globalisation and Pedagogy

This section begins by examining migrants (post- and return-) expressions of professional growth whilst in the UK. Teachers' work in the UK was extensive. There were long hours, too many education policies and excessive marking and assessments of pupils' exercises. There were suggestions that intense stress at school was affecting the health status of migrant teachers.

Post- and return-migrants interviewed expressed their professional growth in technology. This included having to prepare their lessons on computer and the use of an interactive board. Teachers alluded to having readily available resources provided by the local education authority. These were to assist teachers in daily lesson planning and to provide resource material a year in advance to prepare for standardized testing. Lyn explained the extent of her professional growth at St. Anthony's school (interview, 03-04-03, UK).

She attended a seminar in March 2003 for the Year 10 exit exam for 2004. This implied advance planning and preparation of pupils and teachers to meet requirements of the future. The school generally had a meeting for Key Stage 3 (equivalent to grades 6 and 7 in SA) English teachers every Thursday and it was reflected on the timetable so there was no need for cover (relief). This suggested that the school was sincere about developing their teachers professionally. She explained (interview, 03-04-03):

*The examining board regularly sends folders with worksheets and lesson plans that a teacher can photocopy and utilize. The biggest job is to read through all and decide what will apply to your class. In addition, you can access other teachers’ lessons on the internet, which is free. Also, there is a good relationship between teachers in the English department and there is a sharing of resources. In fact I’m building files of resources to take with me to the next school.*

Lyn’s professional confidence had been strengthened by a culture of teamwork that existed at two levels. Firstly, between the local education authority and schools, and secondly, between colleagues at St. Anthony's school. This collaborative culture was sustaining Lyn's eagerness
and high morale at St. Anthony’s school. Generally all migrant teachers have alluded to teamwork and support in UK schools (refer to Chapter Four on Collaborative Cultures).

Classroom observations in three schools (St. Anthony’s, Alambra High and Jackson Comprehensive 3, 7, 8, 10, 11-04-03, UK) attested to the abundance of resources that could be used to enhance teaching and learning. Every classroom was equipped with an interactive board and computer for the teacher. There were textbooks, stationery (exercise books, pens, pencils, erasers, rulers, files, interleaves) and specialist individual equipment for pupils, for example, calculators. Specialist rooms contained an array of resources for both pupils and teachers from televisions and video recorders to slide projectors, computers and library books. Each classroom was a treasure chest of resources for the migrant teacher. The vast expanse of resources accounted for the captivating visual displays in each class. At St. Anthony’s 03-04-03) pupils’ efforts also adorned the walls, which was absent at Alambra High (classroom observation, 10-04-03).

Human resources were also in abundance as every class under observation at Alambra High had teacher assistants to aid weaker pupils. The class sizes were small: Mathematics had 15-20 pupils and Computers 20-25 pupils. Other classes observed did not exceed 25 pupils. However, inspite of the resources being provided, pupils failed to fully participate in lessons at Alambra High. They rarely gave much attention to the teachers’ efforts to deliver lessons. For example (10-04-03): During the Math lesson for examination preparation, workbooks and calculators were distributed yet pupils were engaged through out the lesson in unrelated private conversations.

In the course of a computer lesson (classroom observation, 07-04-03), pupils were preoccupied with other activities rather than preparing for their presentations. For example:

Sally was tossing a rubber bouncy ball distracting her neighbours and chatting to them. Directly across from her, a group of boys were fighting for possession of the mouse. The teacher intervened before there was any damage to the equipment. Five pupils were milling together having a chat. The teacher walked to them and addressed one of the
boys: "What's going on? Whom are you working with? You're lying that's the problem..."

Thus, although migrant teachers welcomed the array of resources at their disposal, they experienced continuous resistance by pupils in their attempts at delivering lessons. There appeared to be a fundamental tension in competing identities of the teacher as a disciplinarian and as a deliverer of the curriculum.

It is interesting that the availability of resources and workshops did not equate to less work for teachers. Teachers (in the post-migration questionnaire and interviews) were asked to comment on the least favourable aspects of the UK. Responses indicated that the conditions of their employment added additional stress in a day. Complaints of long working hours, acquainting oneself with far too many policies within which to act and an excessive amount of marking was stressful for migrant teachers.

Ash (post-migrant interview, 12-04-03, UK) explained that in the UK teachers are monitored for their efficiency. Classroom visits by DoE officials were put on hold in SA in the early 1990's, pending discussion between the DoE and teacher unions. Classroom visits commenced only in 2001 by management members at schools following the introduction of Development Appraisal of teachers. Ash highlighted the monitoring of teachers by adding there's planning like you've never known. The implication is that as a teacher in SA planning took place to a lesser degree than in the UK. The reason for intense planning in the UK is that pupils are graded according to their individual abilities. Therefore, different tasks have to be planned for different groups of pupils. A teacher in the UK may also have a class, which is vertically graded. Thus, he or she may need to set tasks for what is equivalent in SA to grade one, two and perhaps also grade three. In addition, within each grade there will be pupils with differing abilities. As a teacher in the UK tasks have to be designed for each cohort of pupils. By contrast, at present in SA (2004) all

---

pupils in grades 7-12 are expected to meet the minimum requirements for that grade in order to pass. This will change with the introduction of the revised national curriculum across all grades by 2006.

Marking has to be completed on a daily basis as there are co-ordinators in each subject to monitor books in accordance to a School Action Plan (SAP). Ash copes with her marking by utilizing half an hour daily from her lunch break. She stated that failure to do so would result in her becoming backlogged. A post-migrant admitted in his questionnaire when asked to comment about the most unfavourable aspect of the UK: *I didn’t expect teaching to be so demanding - especially what is required of a teacher. One of the worst things is marking ... you have to mark books in detail everyday (emphasis on everyday).*

Furthermore, teachers were expected to acquaint themselves with a host of policies. The policies demarcate the parameters within which a teacher operates on a daily basis and is a pre-requisite for teaching in UK schools. Ash stated (13-04-03) that *in total there are over 50 policies from marking to assessment to behaviour to ethics.* All teachers were expected to adhere to policy guidelines or else it could open the school for litigation.34

There exists the possibility that intense stress at school could be impacting on the health status of migrant teachers. The challenges that post-migrants faced on a daily basis were no different to that which they faced in the first month at school: coping with pupils' ill discipline and acquainting themselves with curriculum requirements such as lesson planning and policy documents. Ash (post-migration interview, 12-04-03) complained of an average of two hours of paperwork per subject per week and the need to plan for eleven subjects in primary school, which amounts to twenty-two hours of preparation per week.

34 See section 5.1 on Jude's apology to pupil for incorrect restraint procedure.
Post-migrants (questionnaire) were asked to rate rest and relaxation for themselves in the UK. The results are depicted in table 5.2

Table 5.2 Rest and Relaxation for Post-migrants in the UK

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>33.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>36.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excellent</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Forty six percent of the respondents viewed rest and relaxation to be between good and excellent. A majority of teachers (53%) saw rest and relaxation for themselves to be between poor to average, accounting for their feelings of stress as alluded to earlier. When the above table is examined in conjunction with the experiences of post-migrant teachers interviewed, then it appears that regardless of teachers’ professional qualifications, they were subject to controls at various structural levels (schools, recruitment agencies, national laws), which negated their autonomy. Public school teachers in SA do not have a choice in deciding where they can teach (Carrim, 2003). Similarly, migrant teachers who are contracted to recruitment agencies in the UK cannot decide which school/s they prefer to report to, thus leading to increased stress levels.

Note the difference in Lyn’s diary entry whilst she was at Worthington (public school) as opposed to when she was at St. Anthony’s (private religious school). Stress was impacting on the health status of this migrant teacher:
I went to Jane today to tell her I'm leaving! I got all emotional and told her how I wasn't coping. I've been to the doctor several times because of having panic attacks (caused by stress). She understood.

I had such a wonderful day. I actually taught today.

I feel so much happier and am so much more keen to plan creative lessons because the girls are keen.

The teacher support line in England revealed that stress accounted for the highest number of calls in 2003 (Education Review, 26-03-04). The network that reaches one in fifteen teachers in England declared that the behaviour of pupils, teacher harassment and workload were major concerns. This relationship between stress and teacher health was affirmed by the findings of a survey conducted in north Wales (Eteach.com, 03-09-2003). The Wrexham Council's findings from questionnaires distributed to all teachers (local and foreign) in the area indicated that 10% of teachers were on anti-depressants, 30% were indulging in more alcohol than they used to, and 77% complained of fatigue. The multiplicity of teachers' experiences in UK society added to the intricacies of their identities.

5.2.3 Climate and Loneliness

This section commences with an exploration of the impact of climatic changes on migrant teachers. It is followed by a discussion of homesickness due to loneliness. Collectively, climate and loneliness impacted on teacher welfare. The result for some was return-migration.

The climate appeared to be one of the least favourable aspects for many migrants (post-migration and return-migration questionnaires and interviews). Post- and return-migrants (questionnaires) stated that in particular the winters were wet and extremely cold. The most common problem with adaptation for return-migrants interviewed was the physiological adaptation to the climate. Teachers bemoaned the dreadful weather in the UK commenting that
the weather is like the people, cold. All return-migrants interviewed were in agreement that the climate was the most unfavourable aspect of being in the UK.

Three teachers (post-migrants, Ben, 27-03-03; Immy, 25-07-03 and Ash, 12,13-04-03) interviewed had cause for concern about the national health care system in England after their experiences in hospitals and with doctors. Ben and his family were regularly plagued by influenza after their migration. However, he noted that the doctor only prescribed painkillers and never an antibiotic. When he was informed of the researcher’s visit to the UK, he requested for a course of antibiotics, which he professed is like gold in England. Immy was appalled that if injured you could spend up to four hours in the Trauma Unit waiting for a doctor.

Ash had a harrowing encounter with the health authorities. When interviewed in England, she was housebound as she was on sick leave for a term. She had contracted a rare form of pneumonia which she believed came via a pupil in her class who was ill. She shuddered when she recalled the inefficiency of the medical system in England. The procedure to be followed when you move into a residential area was that you had to register with the local doctor. He is the only medical authority allowed to assist you. Initially, she was incorrectly diagnosed and given paracetamol. When her condition worsened, she failed to receive a home visit by the doctor despite being informed that she was ill. Her husband rushed her to the trauma unit of the nearest hospital. The queue was long and more than an hour passed and she was still unattended. She asked her husband to take her back to their flat, as she could not tolerate being in the hospital any longer. On their return, her husband contacted his doctor as the company he works for is contracted to a private medical aid. Unfortunately, this doctor was not authorized to treat her and he had to follow the tedious procedure of requesting permission in writing from the area physician before attempting to hospitalize Ash. She recalled that by this stage she felt that she was going to die and was longing for home. More than 3 weeks passed before she was admitted to hospital and correctly diagnosed. She had been away from school for an entire term recuperating, as her recovery was slow. Presently, this episode had taken a toll on her as she was afraid to venture outside of her apartment lest she might contract some other virus. She shook her
head as she recalled that *Immigration asked for TB X rays because SA is a high risk area but you can contract more diseases in this area.*

The above migrants saw themselves as unable to access appropriate medical assistance in a foreign country when in need, reinforcing the declining status that they occupied as teachers in the UK. By contrast Mersan (post-migrant interview, 06-12-02) was in awe of the excellent welfare system in England. He quoted an incident when his wife developed a boil in her gum and was hospitalized free of charge. He elaborated his viewpoint by a further substantiation of his aunt’s experience. She travelled from SA to the UK on holiday and fell ill. On hospitalization she was offered free cancer treatment as part of the UK national health system. Mersan’s delight was based on access to free treatment for terminal conditions.

One of the impacts of teaching in a foreign country, especially for married migrant teachers who left their families in SA, was the feeling of loneliness. The absence of spouse and children coupled with adaptation to a new career and social environment impacted on migrant teachers. Identities of being phantom fathers, mothers, husbands or wives affected the emotional resilience of teachers.

The majority of the post-migrants (80%) who were interviewed were married with only twenty percent being single. Only a quarter of the respondents who were married migrated as a family unit. The remaining three quarters had opted to teach in the UK without being accompanied by their families. They were thus ‘phantom parents and partners’ as they had to attempt to fulfill relationship obligations regardless of the geographical distance separating themselves and their families. As with the post-migrants, the most colossal challenge for return-migrants whilst abroad, especially those married or in committed relationships, was coping with the absence of family. These migrants were ‘phantom parents or partners’ by virtue of having long distance relationships with their families. Although they were wives/husbands and parents, immense physical distances separated them from their loved ones. Relationships had to therefore be
maintained from afar, with emotional repercussions and new role functions in the household for migrant teachers and their families. The loneliness coupled with additional household functions for male migrants had a tremendous impact on their emotional well-being. Charlie (interview, 22-08-03, SA) said: *I missed my wife's cooking. I had carried chilli powder and I tried to cook but I wasn't successful. But there were curries in England - The meat was lousy (awful) but I ate.* Charlie lamented the change in cultural norms, which affected his migration. His lack of contentment at the absence of his wife's cooking depressed him as he experienced failure in his new domestic role.

The gravity of teaching in a foreign country without next of kin took its toll and teachers spoke at length of the loneliness of being apart from family. Female migrants in particular commented on the emotional trauma of being apart from their families. Mala (interview, 21-08-03, SA) explained that she had a small close-knit family and that her *husband and son pined* for her. Suraida (interview, 19-08-03, SA) commented that she had returned twice from the UK because she missed her children. Her role as primary care-giver took precedence over her role as 'producer' (as a wage earner). The emotional impact of being phantom partner or parent was evident in migrants' articulations. Some male migrants professed the extent of their loneliness. Benjamin (interview, 07-08-03, SA) who had never been apart from his family before stated:

*I'm sorry, sir, I won't do it again - not there ... you know at night you want your family - people that care about you. There were so many of us without our families and I was away from my family for the first time in my life ... it was hard. When you go shopping everyone is with their family and you are alone.*

Deva (interview, 28-08-03, SA) who is single stressed that *it was terrible not having a social circle.* Hanah (interview, 17-08-03, SA) who had originally exited with three friends for company still yearned for her son whom she asked to join her after three months of being in the UK. Hanah's role as a mother constrained her psychologically while she was in the UK. All migrants conceded to telephoning family in SA on a daily basis, thus accounting for international
phone calls taking a fair slice of their budget. Thus it was evident that return-migrants experienced feelings of trauma and depression whilst in the UK.

The strain of such relationships resulted in many married teachers (44%) being joined at a later stage by their families or partners. The time period within which this occurred varied from three months for Asha (interview, 12-04-03) who left SA soon after her marriage, to Mersan (interview, 06-12-02) whose family joined him a year later. Mersan (post-migrant) did not intend visiting SA in 2003 but made an impromptu trip to spend time with his parents and parents-in-law. The extent of his social linkages, to family and friends and his perception of South Africa being his home was depicted in the e-mail he forwarded to family and friends titled ‘Homing In.’ His trip was facilitated by the exchange rate of the pound to the rand which made it affordable even though he had a family of four.

The remaining cohort of married teachers had been scouting for suitable accommodation and prospects for their families, as well as awaiting the sale of their assets in SA with a view to having their families join them. A quarter of respondents from the married cohort of teachers that had exited sans their families declared that family members had visited over holidays solely on a temporary basis. These teachers had made a decision to return to SA within a period of 1-2 years.

Half of the post-migrants interviewed had initially migrated to the UK as sojourners, but had since changed their mind and intended becoming settlers. Sonny (post-migrant) was hoping to acquire a local teaching position (in SA) after being away from home for a year He was unsuccessful in his attempts and the principal of the school that he taught in England promised him a position to teach his passion, English. It was his specialist subject but he was never given the opportunity to teach in SA. Thus the demand for labour in the UK was a tangible reason for many teachers like Sonnie being enticed back to the UK (second migration) with further career promises.
Although the minority of post-migrants were single (Vern, Lyn, Shree) they alluded to returning regularly during UK school vacation times to SA to spend time with family and friends. In essence, a recharging of their ties with family and friends. Furthermore, important events in migrant teachers lives were grounded in SA. Lyn was a typical example: she got engaged on a romantic trip to Italy yet planned for her wedding to be held in SA. She specifically made a trip to Durban four months prior to her wedding to expedite arrangements.

The general characteristics of the majority of the return-migrant teachers who completed the questionnaire were that they occupied the position of head of a household (46.7%), were Indian (80%), married (70%) and within the age group of 29-42 (63%). The majority of the respondents (63%) who completed the return-migration questionnaire indicated that family obligations were the reason for their return (Table 5.3). As the head of a household and married it was evident that return-migrants had family responsibilities and this was relevant in their decision to return. Of the thirty return-migrant teachers who completed questionnaires, 66.6% had returned within one year of their migration. The migrants’ experiences as ‘phantom spouse’ or ‘phantom parent’ in the household, was a determining factor. A mere one third had elected to remain in the UK for a period of one to two years prior to returning.

Thirteen percent of return-migrants went on leave and had not resigned from their SA schools. They had to thus return to SA upon exhaustion of their leave. They disclosed that they were in the employ of the DoE and had applied for unpaid leave, which they had utilized to teach in the UK. This indicated that their migration to the UK was a temporary strategy for financial gain. These teachers had not informed their schools in SA that they will be teaching in the UK during the period of their leave. Their behaviour was unethical and in contravention of SACE code of conduct for educators. Although Rajen indicated in an interview that he returned due to stress, he did divulge that he was on a year’s unpaid leave and due to return to school in SA as he had taken the maximum leave permissable. Ben had elected to resign after his return to school due to a DoE investigation into his leave of absence. He chose to return to the UK, only this time it
would be a family migration as he was soon to be dismissed from work. He had changed from a goal achiever to a lifestyle emigrant due to circumstances.

The above teachers breached the code of conduct. The Code of Professional Ethics for Educators (SACE Act 31 of 2000) clearly defines the type of behaviour teachers must subscribe to:

"educators must act in a proper and becoming way such that their behaviour does not bring the teaching profession into disrepute". These teachers clearly breached the rules for personal capital gain.

Table 5.3 Reasons for Returning to SA (Questionnaires)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family Obligations</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>63.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Goals Achieved</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Return to School in SA</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contract Expired</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative Experiences in UK</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A total of 12 interviews were completed with return-migrants in SA. Table 5.4 reveals their biographical details linked to the reason forwarded for their return. The migrant teacher’s exit pattern (alone or with his/her family) from SA is also captured. The relationship between the exit pattern of married migrants and the reason for their return is evident in table 5.4.

A majority of the interviewees were Indian. Sixty seven percent of the teachers were married yet all had elected to teach in the UK, without their families thus contributing to their feelings of loneliness. The majority (married cohort) indicated that they returned to SA due to family obligations. A categorisation according to gender reveals that they were an equal percentage of males and females (50%). Further, an equal percentage of male and female married teachers returned to SA.

169
Half of the return-migrants interviewed were in the process of finalizing arrangements for a second migration (Charlie, Deva, Suraida, Lyn, Ben, Colet) to the UK. Suraida conceded in her interview that all she had been able to acquire since her return was a part time job at a university for one semester. She felt that she had no option if she wished to be employed but to return to the UK regardless of the fact that this was not her initial intention (forced migration). She had relatives in the UK and could therefore return. Deva could not foresee professional growth for himself in SA. From this cohort preparing for a second migration, the majority (67%) were married and intimated that they will be looking for suitable accommodation for their families upon their return to the UK. No doubt, they were attempting to prevent a recurrence of their loneliness. The remaining 33% were single. Once again on the second migration, there was a cohort of teachers who had intentions of becoming settlers in countries abroad.

Table 5.4 Biographical data, Migratory Trends and Reason for Return to SA (Interviews with Return-migrants)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Marital Status</th>
<th>Migration Pattern on Exit</th>
<th>Reason for Return</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Benjamin</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Alone</td>
<td>Stress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Charlie</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Alone</td>
<td>Unpaid leave</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Deva</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>Permut expired</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Suraida</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Alone</td>
<td>Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Rajen</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td>Stress+ unpaid leave</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Lyn</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>W</td>
<td>S</td>
<td></td>
<td>Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Ben</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Alone</td>
<td>Unpaid leave</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Mala</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Alone</td>
<td>Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Hanah</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Sp</td>
<td></td>
<td>Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Rennie</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Alone</td>
<td>Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Colet</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Alone</td>
<td>Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Vis</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Alone</td>
<td>Family</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.2.4 Perceptions of British Society

This section explores migrant teachers' attitudes and beliefs about UK citizens and society. These are relevant in highlighting migrant teachers' identity formations in a foreign socio-political milieu. Migrant teachers were not simply professionals or workers (Carrim, 2003). Their perceptions of British society emphasized aspects of race, religion and cultural traditions embedded in their identities.

In the absence of their own families, many migrant teachers were drawn to judging family relationships amongst the English, using their own families as benchmarks. Colet (interview 24-08-03) drew a distinction between herself as having close family ties as opposed to UK families that she knew where children were left to their own devices. She stated that there appeared to be no close bonds between family members. She added that children went home to pre-packed meals and were unsupervised. She was also alarmed at children's knowledge of drugs and pornography, citing easy access to the internet as assisting in this regard. Lyn (interview, 19-07-02) also commented on children at Worthington being unsupervised after school. She declared that teachers at school called such children *latch-key kids*, as they would carry their house keys to school.

Post- and return-migrants interviewed stated that they were surprised that as a result of their interactions with English people at school and in society, they could firmly state that they considered the native English people to be dirty (Rajen 16-01-03, Vern 23-08-03, Mersan 06-12-02). Rajen commented that pupils did not bath often. Vern alluded to a teacher at his school who used the same red dress for the entire week. Mersan recalled that whilst he was boarding, he was the only person who bathed on a daily basis. Everyone else bathed on a Thursday. The above-mentioned teachers were of Indian descent and their observations clearly signify differences between and a separation from the native English. This finding was echoed by Ballard (1994) in researching migrants from South Asia who settled in Britain. He maintained that “clear boundaries were drawn between the Asian settlers and their White neighbours” (Ballard, 1994: 204).
Many post-migrants perceptions of British society were mixed (questionnaires). Comments ranged from unfriendly, culture-less, moral-less to open minded and respectful of individual privacy. Mala, Colet and Vis who are return-migrants (interviews, 21-08-03, 24-08-03, 23-08-03, respectively, SA) were perturbed by minor role religion played in British society. Vis had difficulty locating a temple for his prayer during an auspicious occasion. Both Mala and Colet alluded to attending church only to find that attendance was poor. Mala was saddened that the church had lost its place in society. Colet felt that strong family values were not prevalent as was visible in the empty church that she attended. She recalled that the church was massive and beautiful but there was no one present between the ages of 12 and 20 of the people present. Only the very old attended church. The articulations of both teachers point to cultural differences between South Africans and the British as perceived by return-migrants.

Rena (post-migrant interview, 08-04-03, UK) respected the differences between SA people and UK people. She said:

*People told me that they would be rude. I respect the fact that some people don’t want to talk to me. We think this person is being rude or racist but it’s all in your mind. What I really like about here is that nobody minds your business, no ones in your face, no one ... You go to the staffroom and you don’t find people clicking together and talking about you.*

Post- and return-migrants were thus constituting themselves to varying degrees as South African or British. Under some circumstances they identified with the British and at other times with aspects of South African values and culture. However, in none of these categories were migrant teachers an homogenous grouping. Identities were dynamic and determined at the nexus of race, family structure, personal experiences or norms and traditions in South Africa.

The degree to which the English prefer a solitary lifestyle had an impact on migrant teachers perceptions. Ash (interview, 12,13-04-03) stated that she would not consider giving first aid in England even if it was a life or death situation. Her attitude stemmed from the view that if
anything went amiss you will be sued regardless of the fact that you tried to assist. Rajen (16-04-03) echoed the very same sentiments when he stated that people have a tendency to sue for petty reasons. He stated that the politicians were pandering to the needs of the children because they will soon be voters and particular political parties will be kept in power. He quoted the extremity of laws, which were advantaging children unnecessarily by recalling a case where a pupil was suing a teacher for sending her to detention. This view is echoed by NASUWT executive member Weightman (Evening Standard, 24-04-03:24) who commented about UK society: “this is getting to be an increasingly litigious society”.

Lyn rationalized that the differences that exist were based along cultural lines. She demonstrated this by referring to activities that foreigners from tropical climates engaged in:

*The English have an indoors culture and now that the sun is coming out the South Africans, Ozzies and Kiwis want to have braais, go to the beach at Brighton and play tennis. We have similar weather and culture so we get along.*

5.4 Conclusion

This chapter detailed migrant teachers’ experiences in the UK and their reasons for returning to SA. Discussion commenced with experiences of classroom discipline that impacted negatively on teachers’ personal and professional identities. These encounters of poor discipline had the greatest influence on migrant teachers. They felt powerless due to UK policies that protect children regardless of pupils’ poor behaviour. Migrant teachers also held the belief that they were sent to undesirable schools in the UK. Poor discipline in schools was responsible for transforming teachers’ identities once they entered UK classrooms. It was also a reason for migrant teachers’ returning to SA. The UK climate, loneliness in a foreign environment and the migrants’ position in the household as the head were other voluntary reasons for return-migration. Expired leave from the DoE was an involuntary reason for return as some migrant teachers took leave illegally. Such teachers had not declared to the DoE that they were teaching in the UK.
Other experiences that impacted on migrant teachers affecting their professional and self-identities included technological advancements and resources in lesson preparation and the migrants’ interactions with British society. Regardless of the technology, migrant teachers felt stressed and depressed by pupils’ general resistance to lessons and their lack of a work ethic in classroom. To summarise, their experiences led to complex, dynamic personal and professional identity formations. This impacted on their decisions and hence their goals. The final chapter of this thesis provides some critical reflections on the key insights derived from the study.
CHAPTER SIX: HOMING IN

6.1 Introduction

The aim of this chapter is to evaluate the salient insights of the study emerging from the data in order to understand transnational teacher migration. The chapter firstly begins by commenting on the interdisciplinary approach that was used to tease out migrant teachers' complexities and heterogeneity. This approach facilitated the use of theoretical and methodological knowledge across disciplines. It yielded avenues for the examination of data such as teachers' reasons for leaving SA, their attitudes and their motivations for return. As teachers' intentions were imperative in their decision to migrate, the second section assesses their goals and migration strategies in a global context.

It became apparent that migrant teachers' identities (personal and professional) had bearing on their behaviour. This link is examined in the third section on transnational teacher identities. In this regard, three forms of identities were established that teachers coveted and they were relevant in understanding teacher migration. One facet of teacher identity is gender, and the finding that majority of experienced migrant teachers were female and married had latent implications for household power. The motif on gender and coerced migration is thus discussed in the fourth section. It seeks to explore decision-making and empowerment of female migrant teachers by virtue of their migration.

Once in the UK the duration of migrant teachers' stay varied in accordance with their goals and circumstances. These issues are examined in the fifth section on tentative trajectories. Special reference is made to married migrant teachers who were wary of uprooting their families. Thus social linkages played an important role in migration and the discussion on social networks is expanded upon in the sixth section.
The seventh section in this chapter explores the loss of professional power teachers experienced upon migration to the UK. Issues of race and expectations in a foreign environment are assessed. Cumulatively, the above-mentioned issues fed into the belief that a global teacherhood has been created. The emergence of this phenomenon is explored in the eighth section and is based primarily on the concept of the commodification of teachers.

The penultimate section in this chapter considers whether teacher migration in the SA context should be viewed as a brain drain, a brain gain or brain circulation. Collectively, insights from the study led to the development of a three-phase model for understanding transnational teacher migration in a globalised context and this is presented in the final section.

6.2 Migrant Teachers' Complexities

In adopting an interdisciplinary approach to the understanding of teacher migration, the study avoided labelling from the vantage point of methodological preferences within a discipline. In this respect, although the study utilized quantitative empirical data, the primary approach was qualitative. Apap (2000) criticized quantitative migration studies as adopting a dehumanized approach. In the present study an attempt was made to firstly, examine the quantitative empirical data and secondly, to elicit the migration patterns of teachers through a qualitative approach. Thus multi-modal approaches and methods were utilized in the collection and analysis of the data. This yielded motifs that were of relevance to understanding migrant teachers as human beings with similarities and differences. The insights illuminate the complexities of their decision-making and the domains within which they operated in a global context. The present study reveals that migrant teachers were not an homogenous category. They were similar in that they had chosen to migrate to the UK for socio-economic and career reasons. However, they differed in their migration strategies, dynamic identities (personal and professional) and interpretation of their experiences.
6.2.1 Motivations for Leaving SA

Teachers leaving SA had multiple reasons for going abroad. As with the Brazilians in Margolis (1998) study, SA teachers are not minimum wage earners. However, the present study revealed that they were leaving SA for economic, social and career reasons. Crouch (2001) asserts that almost 80% of SA teachers earn more than 50% of the national workforce of the country. He adds that the younger and less educated teachers have a greater pay advantage due to the broad banding of salary scales. This would then explain why the older more educated teachers were leaving SA. As Maketla (2004:08) noted, 67% of the public school teachers in SA did not receive “real increases in the form of pay progression”. In this regard the exchange rate of the pound to the rand is a powerful incentive to migrate. One pound is equivalent to approximately R12-00. For most teachers from 1996 to 2003 salary increases did not accompany any type of pay progression (annual notch increase or promotion). This “caused frustration as teachers could not see progression in their careers” (Maketla, 2004:8).

South African teachers perceived themselves as economically marginalized professionals. Experienced teachers were defining themselves in terms of their position in the family as either head of the household or spouse of the head of the household, hence the need to provide for the family. Experienced teachers were migrating on the basis of this dominant identity as spouse or head of the household. Coupled with this lies the possibility of stage development as stated earlier. Seventy one percent of pre-migrants, sixty seven percent of post-migrants and eighty three percent of return-migrants interviewed were teaching in excess of five years in SA. Ramrathan’s (2002) study on teacher attrition alluded to stage development theory where teachers (on average) after six years of teaching would enter a diversification phase. Here they will experiment with varied opportunities, and this would lead to a reassessment phase where they would consider their options. It could lead to the disengagement phase where teachers will exit the profession. This was consistent with the finding in the present study where the majority of teachers interviewed were migrating after teaching in SA in excess of five years.

35 This was the average exchange rate in 2003. At present, (December 2004) it is approximately R11, 50.
Also, the negative perceptions of student teachers imply that the status of teaching is on the decline. This corroborates Hughill’s (2002) contention that the status of teaching in SA has fallen. Although Hughill (2002) did not elaborate on his view, there is a suggestion that finance has a major role to play in devaluing teaching. This is also a view strongly held in the UK. Ross (2002) has stated “teaching is not seen as a prestigious profession judging by the teaching profession in England at present”. Ross’ (2002) view is supported by media reports of continuing salary disputes, which are raging on in the UK (Special Assignment, SABC3, 23-03-04, 21h30). Thus it would appear that thus teachers were moving from one de-professionalised context to another.

Teachers left SA expecting an appreciation and validation economically and professionally. Once in the UK all teachers were content with achievements in respect of finance and travel. With regard to being viewed as professionals, experiences differed among teachers. In general, poor pupil discipline coupled with school policies thwarted SA teachers’ hopes of being treated as professionals in UK classrooms. However, collaborative cultures at staff level such as teacher support and encouragement to study and obtain QTS and develop by accepting greater responsibilities (e.g. acting head teacher) did lead to some professional growth. Clearly, there were multiple reasons for teachers leaving SA and the following section distinguishes between the various types of transnational teachers.

6.3 Globalisation, Goals and Migration Strategies

This section examines the heterogeneity of migrant teachers’ thinking, their decisions and hence their goals and strategies. Migrants’ goals differed depending on their socio-economic and career intentions when leaving SA. Three types of transnational teachers were identified.

Held’s (1999) definition of globalisation as an interconnectedness between countries is valid in terms of the present study. Globalisation provided the context to facilitate teacher movement

36 A similar view of teachers’ salaries is held by SA teachers. It culminated in a one day strike action on 16-09-2004.
between SA and the UK. This is in keeping with Stalker’s (2000) contention that globalisation of the world’s economy will intensify migration in the twenty first century. Research into the motivations for migration led to theorizing, which focused primarily on economics. Movement was explained in terms of labour supply and demand, and wage differentials between countries. There were subtle differences between the theories that initiate migration. For example, in neoclassical macro-economic theory (Todaro, 1976) the emphasis was on decision-making by the individual. By contrast, the new economics of labour theory (Stark, 1991) suggested that migration was a family or household strategy. Similarly, neoclassical micro-economic theory (Borjas, 1990) stressed the role of sending (source) countries, while dual labour theory (Piore, 1979) prioritised the role of destination countries in fueling migration. Each theory is valuable as collectively they present a collage of influence on the decision-making process of migrant teachers.

Margolis (1998), in her study of Brazilians in New York, found that the respondents were target earners. The Brazilians were in the US to save enough money and return to Brazil to fulfill a dream of perhaps buying a house. Thus the impact of globalisation with its linkages (e.g. transport) and the ease of crossing national borders had facilitated migration, although this was not been considered by Margolis (1998). Globalisation also paved the way for the generation of various modes of migration for transnational teachers. Some South African teachers were exiting to achieve their goal of financial security for their families. The term goal achievers refers to teachers who exited SA on a temporary basis to achieve a particular financial goal. These SA teachers felt burdened by their existing accounts (e.g. a house bond) or inescapable debts in the near future (e.g. children’s university fees). However, whilst in the UK their salary in pounds allowed them to capitalize on travel prospects available.

By contrast there was a cohort of teachers who were exiting SA permanently. Johansson and Persson (2000, cited in Lundholm et al. 2004:04) have contended that migration is dependent on “long term human capital investment rather than short term employment”. This perception is valid in respect of some SA migrant teachers who will be referred to as lifestyle emigrants. They
were teachers who were exiting SA permanently for a better quality of life in a foreign country. Many of the lifestyle emigrants spent a trial period in the UK before embarking on a family emigration. Their migration was motivated by future gains rather than immediate returns.

A third category of migrant teachers was identified in terms of migration strategy. The concept of transnationalism, with migrants straddling two separate social milieus, has bearing in a highly globalised world. Glick-Schiller et al (1995) have maintained that given the intensity of interconnectedness between countries, people are able to move across national borders at will. Migrants are thus able to adjust to different social milieus. Grant (1981) identified shuttle migrants to be those who had no intentions of permanently settling down in any country. Similarly, in the present study transients were specifically teachers who had no intention of permanently settling in either the UK or SA and were at ease crossing international boundaries. Such teachers indicated a willingness to migrate to other countries (e.g. Canada, Australia) in the future. They revealed that travel and teaching experiences in different contexts was the appeal.

To summarise, the study examined three cohorts of experienced teachers: pre-migrants, post-migrants and return-migrants and one cohort of novice teachers. The findings advance the existence of three distinct divisions of transnational teachers based on their goals and migration strategies: goal achievers, lifestyle emigrants and transients. Migrant teachers exiting SA fell into one of three groups:

i) ‘goal achievers’ - who exited SA on a temporary basis to achieve particular socio-economic goals

ii) ‘lifestyle emigrants’ - who were exiting permanently for a better quality of life with a view to starting life afresh in a new country; or

iii) ‘transients’ - who had no intention of permanently settling in either UK or SA and were at ease crossing national boundaries. Such teachers indicated a
willingness to migrate to other countries in the future.

Each of the above categories were not discrete entities and teachers who may initially have exited as goal achievers could become lifestyle emigrants or transients, depending on their circumstances and particular experiences.

Depending on whether the various intentions and expectations were realised, the geographical path/direction of teachers’ movement differed according to their goals. Later in the chapter this movement between countries is captured graphically as a model for transnational teacher migration from developing to developed countries. Upon embarking to the UK to achieve their goals, teachers’ professional and personal identities came to the fore.

6.4 Transnational Teacher Identities

The imposition of educational reforms in SA (e.g. OBE) impacted on teachers’ thinking that the expert was external and not within. This was augmented by the need for teachers to have their work validated. This need to feel appreciated and rewarded manifested itself in migrants seeking gratification: financial or otherwise. The drive for a positive professional identity was more pronounced amongst experienced teachers from ex-HOD schools in their decision to leave SA. Teachers’ dissatisfaction with their careers in SA, especially the nature of the school environment, impacted on their personal and professional identities. Earlier work by Hargreaves (1994) supported the view that teachers’ relationships with their colleagues (and whether they work in teams) had a direct correlation to their level of commitment, enthusiasm and morale. It was apparent that pre-migrants in SA lacked the zeal to teach and displayed poor morale due to specific cultures at school. Stifling interpersonal relations between level one teachers and management was the norm at many ex-HOD schools in SA.

It was apparent that there was a need for workshops/seminars for teachers in acting or management positions (especially in pastoral care) to create an harmonious school atmosphere and an appreciation of the input of all staff. In Britain, James and Vince (2001:307) contend that
“when schools were given greater autonomy and exposed to market pressure, leadership and its development became a priority in national education policy ... induction programmes for newly appointed heads of Department were instituted to provide a framework for their competencies”. Integral to this was managers’ leadership capabilities in fostering a positive school ethos. Evans (2001:302) states that the “ability of managers to buffer their staff against potentially demoralizing, demotivating externally imposed changes” was targeted. Mercer and Evans (1991) have suggested that educational leadership does have the capacity to develop and maintain contentment in professional environments. They reveal that managers’ failure to address issues of morale, satisfaction and motivation represents a form of ‘professional myopia’ (Mercer and Evans, 1991:297). Thus leaders in SA schools need to be taught skills and attitudes to nurture healthy working environments at the level of the educational institution.

In their first month abroad it was apparent that migrant teachers experienced a culture shock in a new social environment. Foucault’s (1981) seminal work on the conception of identity has bearing in this context. He suggested that identity should be seen as a process that is not static but rather constantly changing given various contexts. In the present study the use of e-mail and iterative dialogue with respondents were adopted as methodological tools to tease out the construct of identity as dynamic. The purpose was to understand and trace the transformative aspect of identity formation and portrayal in a new environment. This was salient as the biographical data in questionnaires did not cater for the personal character traits of migrants, for example, if they were ambitious, entrepreneurial or family-oriented by nature. Once in the UK, teachers had to integrate into new social spaces, which were foreign to them given their frame of reference, the SA education scenario.

The socio-economic and cultural contexts were imperative as they provided the basis in which migrant teachers negotiated their identities and developed new ones. Also, circumstances and personal character traits dictated the identities migrant teachers coveted and those they
abandoned. This led to the development of the concept of the teflon teacher, where migrant teachers demonstrated resilience in a foreign environment and adaptability to new social spaces. For example, in issues of poor discipline in the classroom such a teacher will seek out creative methods of coping. Personally, this type of teacher was strong-willed and able to persevere and understand the need to integrate into new socio-cultural and political milieus. Professionally, such a migrant teacher would be able to adapt to a foreign teaching environment without giving up and returning to the home country at the first sign of a difficult classroom situation.

The emergence of three forms of dynamic transnational identities testifies to identity vacillation and the heterogeneity of migrant identities. The three identity modes distinguished within the ambit of what constituted the teflon teacher in the UK are negotiated, privileged and dislocated identities. Burke and Franzoi (1988) have suggested that the self (human being) consists of multiple identities, and depending on specific contexts, a particular identity will come forth. Gergen (1991) shares this view and asserts that the self is saturated with numerous identities (spouse, parent, teacher, wage earner, male/female etc.) and is often confronted by confusion and contradiction. Thus in respect of migrant teachers privileged identities were those (professional and personal) which they willingly coveted in the pursuit of their specific objectives when either leaving SA, whilst in the UK, or upon returning to SA. If migrant teachers had made a decision to teach in the UK as a means of attaining financial security as the head of a household/spouse, then this personal identity of the self was prioritized for the duration of the stay abroad. In such a scenario the disproportionate incomes between SA and the UK was the clarion call. Migrant teachers alluded to overlooking problems of discipline in the UK, which threatened the vestiges of their professional confidence and denigrated them as people. There were instances when teachers had made the decision to exit SA based on a privileged identity, e.g. as the head of the household and needing to provide better financial rewards. Yet upon migration, and due to subsequent experiences in the UK (loneliness or a lack of respect by pupils), the migrant teacher could not keep the façade of such an identity. This led to psychological stress for the migrant teacher.

37 Teflon is the common term for polytetrafluoroethylene, made famous as a durable, non-stick coating used in pots and frying pans. It was developed by DuPont (US firm) in 1938. It is noted for its ability to withstand extremely high temperatures.
Dislocated identities were the result of contestations that migrant teachers experienced upon their entry into UK classrooms. The inner tension culminated in the professional identity portrayed in classrooms in opposition to the core personal identity, creating ambivalent feelings within the migrant teacher (self). This contributed to a lack of inner contentment/happiness. The stress from privileged and dislocated identities led to a cohort of migrant teachers deciding to return to the ‘comfort’ of SA school environments or their families. Indeed, with some migrant teachers there were certain facets of their cultural identities, which they refused to compromise, such as family values, religion and cultural norms. SA is a developing country with a blend of western and traditional influences whilst the UK is viewed as the pinnacle of first world advancement. Teachers’ cultural experiences in SA prior to migration led them to embrace certain aspects of UK society and reject others. Therefore, in general migrant teachers welcomed the monetary benefit of earning in pounds but, ironically, they complained of the British being obsessed with consumerism which contributed to a breakdown in family values. Such social dynamics led many migrant teachers to retreating and insulating themselves from British society. After work, they mingled with South Africans rather than adapting to the ‘pubbing and clubbing culture,’ which is characteristic of the British lifestyle. Although migrant teachers were structurally occupying a rung in the global consumerist market in their commodification as teachers (see section on global teacherhood), they were averse to the British being preoccupied with consumerist tendencies.

By contrast, negotiated identities (professional and personal) evolved for migrant teachers upon an understanding of their need to adapt to a different social context. Personally, such migrant teachers did not insulate themselves from the local community but interacted and participated in activities. Professionally, they used creative strategies and pedagogic styles in UK classrooms. This culminated in migrant teachers’ integration with the socio-cultural norms of the school and host country.
Migrant teachers were thus not an homogenous group. There were few similarities in their experiences, but ultimately the identities that they assumed were complex and sometimes contradictory. In general, teachers experienced a culture shock when teaching in British classrooms as they felt that the behaviour of pupils were unacceptable. Nevertheless, the support from staff, opportunities for travels within the UK and to Europe, as well as the money earned, were pull factors. There were also cases of involuntary, largely female migration to the UK.

6.5 Coerced, Gendered Migration

Eklund (1999) states that it is not easy to make a distinction between voluntary and involuntary migration. Although migrant teachers were not directly asked if they viewed their migration as voluntary or involuntary, interviews revealed that leaving SA was a coerced migration. This was brought about by the socio-economic conditions in SA, the declining status of teaching as a profession in SA and global labour market conditions. In particular, the finding that a majority of migrants were female and married is contrary to the findings of previous migration studies by Mulder (1993) and Smits (2001), which suggested that married people migrate less often across long distances than single people. However, the findings in the present study suggest that in respect of experienced migrant teachers, their privileged identity as wage earners took precedence over their role as husband or wife. Thus being female was not an independent variable, it was couched in marital status and household alliances. Smits (2001) had contended that married women had seldom moved for their own careers. However, the present study indicated that the appeal of increased remuneration coupled with travel benefits and professional growth, may be responsible for offsetting this trend. SA’s emergence from a period of isolation (1960-1994) cannot be ignored for its impact in facilitating new economic opportunities abroad, which were unavailable to teachers previously. Migration is a natural consequence of SA’s inclusion into the global labour market.

Migration theories, according to Eklund (1999) have been gender neutral and have thus masked the migration of females. This criticism extends from theories on the initiation of migration
through to those that sustain migration such as causation. Although the study was dependent to a large extent on data (KZN in SA), several conclusions ascribed to gender can be reached. The fact that teaching is a predominantly female occupation (63% female in relation of unmarried white females and married Indian females to the UK has symbolises an improvement in the status that women occupy within the fold. The importance of patriarchy in the subordination of women has been noted in spat and Patel, 1993). The impetus for the migration of married females in the present study evolves from the economic contribution that women wanted to make towards the improvement in the quality of lives of their families.

Moser (1989) had realised the triple role that women play in third world countries: producer (primary and secondary income), reproducer (biological and social) and community manager. As suggested by Moser (1989), women have the burden of balancing numerous roles simultaneously. Thus the migration of married females is indicative of an amalgamation of the roles of producer and reproducer. This is highlighted in the motivations of women teachers exiting SA that their salaries were to be used for the enhancement of their households’ economic position.

If the process of migration is linked to the decision-making power of women, the trek of females could indicate an increase in women’s power. This perception is derived from them being the catalysts for socio-economic change of their households as well as in their decision (as women) to migrate. Hence, female migration is a means of empowerment for married Indian women. White female teachers were generally single and in the novice teacher category. They were intent on pursuing travel and career opportunities in the UK. As they harboured a negative perception of the SA teaching fraternity, they were thus unwilling to enter the public school arena.

38 Tentative statistics provided by teacher union SADTU for 2004. The DoE (Minister’s office) attests to having 350 000 teachers, yet SADTU has accounted for 259 647 teachers in the country.
Globalisation has provided opportunities for both cohorts of women to migrate transnationally in the pursuit of socio-economic improvement and self-development.

6.6 Family Obligations and Tentative Trajectories

The study revealed that married or attached migrant teachers were initially departing from the home country (SA) as individuals but were making frequent visits home (for example, the majority of post-migrant interviews were conducted in SA). There were numerous movements between the home and host country. The trips to SA coincided with British school holidays. These were frequently at the end of a term or school year. The overarching reason was family ties in SA and a tacit belief held by teachers that their ‘roots’ were in SA. This was apparent in teachers’ reference to SA as home. The family bonds were so strong for some teachers that major decisions were still grounded in SA (e.g. purchasing property in SA) even though the migrant teachers had become lifestyle emigrants. The study also found that a major reason for return-migration was family obligations: a desire to be with family members and also to assist in spousal duties. Gmelch (1980) and Stack (1996) noted a similar pattern where migrants returned due to family ties.

However, upon return to SA, the professional expectations of some return-migrants were not met. These teachers were considering embarking on either a second migration to the UK or planning a migration to another flyaway from SA. Countries viewed as favoured destinations were Canada, Australia and New Zealand where English is a first language and which also have a large proportion of South African expatriots.

Interestingly, none of the married teachers (post- and return-migrants) had left SA accompanied by their families on their first migration abroad. Later there was a staggered family or partner migration on either the primary migration (first contract abroad), or the subsequent migration.
(second contract abroad). Sometimes this was based on migrants’ decision to change from being goal achievers to becoming either lifestyle emigrants or transients. Thus teachers were initially “feeling out” a new environment and had not taken the plunge to migrate as a family unit. Various circumstances served as catalysts in facilitating the migration of teachers’ families. For example, upon the migrants’ entry into the UK, they experienced a deep longing for their families/partners (loneliness), and some made the necessary arrangements for their families to join them. It was apparent that married migrant teachers who remained in the UK in the pursuit of financial gain without immediate family were there physically, but their thoughts were with their loved ones in SA. Teachers revealed that they yearned for their families and regularly telephoned SA to keep in contact.

Theoretically, the exit of married teachers and their families at a later stage is important for two reasons. Firstly, the general trend in migration research rarely included participant’s thinking, which influenced them in the decision to migrate (Lundholm et al., 2003). This study included ‘pre-facto’ (prior to the event) data as a category for analysis. It allowed for access to teachers’ thoughts before exiting (pre-migration) from the home country (SA) and pre-migrants’ expectations of a foreign environment. Freeman (1996) alludes to the categories of data for analysis in teacher education and he draws on the use of ‘real time’ (as events occur) and ‘ex-post facto’ (after the event/s occur) data. The introduction of pre-facto data in the present study allowed for insight into teachers’ initial, contingency and transformative (changed) plans. It thus emphasized the tentative plans and trajectories of migrants.

Secondly, the individual as an extension of his/her family was revealed as the appropriate unit of analysis in studying married/attached migrant teachers and single teachers. Theories on migration have generally focused on either the individual (neoclassical macro- and micro-economic theory) or the family (new economics of labour theory) as the unit of analysis. The link between the individual as a significant member of the family (head of household) has been glossed over although Portes (1990) did acknowledge this relationship. The importance of family bonds as the primary reason for return migration accounted for the validity of the influence of
this factor in teacher thinking and decision-making. The role of the migrant teacher as a vital member of the household dictated the dominant/privileged identity (e.g., as wage earner) in the decision of married teachers to exit SA and teach abroad.

When migrant teachers chose to become lifestyle emigrants, they were emigrating which changed their migration status from “sojourners (visitors) to settlers” in the host country. This change in migrant status from a temporary stay to a permanent stay in the UK is not considered unusual. Ballard (1994: 204) referred to migrants from South Asia who initially migrated to the UK during the 1950’s “as a temporary strategy”. They, however, later changed their disposition from “temporary entrepreneurs to permanent settlers” (Ballard, 1994: 204). Some migrants did indicate a desire to return to SA after five years of teaching in the UK. Their decision is subject to them receiving a British passport, which will, according to migrants, allow them access to the UK at will.

A few return migrants also alluded to clinging to an expectation whilst they were in the UK that the teaching scenario in SA had positively changed. However, they were met with the same frustrations in SA that they had experienced prior to their initial exit. These migrants were in the process of planning a second migration from SA. The specific education scenario in KZN was the reason why single teachers felt that they had no other choice but to return to London. Many had been unable to find permanent jobs suited to their improved qualifications and global work experience. Social networks played an important role in helping them adjust in the UK.

6.7 Social Networks

In the present study, the networks that migrants had in the host country (friends, family or other South Africans) facilitated their employment and also assisted in reducing the costs of migration by providing accommodation. Thus migrants’ ‘social capital’ assisted them to adjust to the environment in the UK. Where such networks were absent, recruitment agencies provided a
support structure for migrant teachers to assist in their integration. In the UK, migrant teachers were housed together for the first two weeks until they were either accommodated in a teachers’ hostel or found their own accommodation. Bourdieu and Wacquant (1992) did not consider the emotional and cultural support offered by migrants’ networks. Teachers shared their thoughts and feelings regarding their experiences with each other. Migrant teachers mingled mostly with the SA diaspora in the UK due to a sharing of socio-cultural norms such as barbeques and a preference for outdoor activities.

Migrants also maintained links with teachers in SA whilst they were teaching in the UK. This transnational social bond led to migrants recruiting their colleagues to UK schools. Such migrants did indicate that they had assisted their colleagues by sharing accommodation and transport. This is in keeping with the theory of cumulative causation where migrants reduce the costs of migration for future migrants. Thus greater volumes of migrants will follow the initial migrant. In essence, social enclave communities were developing. Recruitment agencies also played a role in highlighting such communities as a strategy to attract migrants. They suggested suitable residential areas to pre-migrants along racial and cultural lines, for example, accessibility to a mosque or temple. Despite the support offered by social networks migrant teachers were affected by racist attitudes in the UK.

6.8 Race, Place and Expectation

This section examines migrant teachers’ expectations of the UK and the harsh realities that exist in respect of racial prejudices. SA was 10 years into a democracy yet schools in the country were still largely racially stratified along staff lines. The rationalization and redistribution of teachers since 1998 had done little to alter the racial character of many schools. Balkaran’s (2004) baseline study on desegregation in KZN schools depicts a distinctive racial stratification of schools. Eighty seven percent of Indian teachers were still teaching in ex-HOD schools while 69% of White teachers were in ex-HOA schools. Jacklin (2001) has asserted that schools develop an ethos of their own and it was apparent that ex-HoD schools maintained a racial identity of being Indian. Migrant teachers that exited from such schools considered them having corrosive cultures such as excessive influence by SGB’s, a lack of pastoral care, and little
consultation between management and staff. These attributes hindered professional growth and caused low morale and psychological stress for teachers.

Hence, SA teachers had not taught in fully multi-racial schools prior to leaving SA. By contrast, UK schools were multi-racial and migrant teachers were teaching pupils from various ethnic backgrounds for the first time in their careers. In the present study, there was a tacit belief amongst teachers prior to their first migration that in developed countries of long standing democracies, there was an acceptance of all races. However white and non-white teachers (Indian and Coloured) commented that they were appalled at being referred to in racist terms. Race is a form of cultural identity. When teachers alluded to racism being alive in the UK, they were indicating sensitivity to being labelled in racist terms. In addition, as Ross (2002:02) contends “racist practice and behaviour will be more capable of recognition by teachers who have experience of having suffered from racist behaviour” and some SA teachers had played an important role in anti-racism protests during apartheid in SA.

Surveys of racist attitudes and behaviour in British schools suggest that the problem is serious and widespread (Eslea and Muktar, 2000:207). They (Eslea and Muktar, 2000:216) state that "racism is extremely sensitive and few schools like to risk upsetting pupils, parents or the wider community by raising difficult questions about interracial violence. It is thus an issue, which is generally avoided". Kelly and Cohen (1988) and Mc Donald et al (1989) had also raised the issue of racism being common in British schools in the late eighties. However, in their studies racist attitudes between pupils were interrogated and teachers prejudices were not included. It has been noted that teachers who are teaching in SA are treated with respect (BBC News, 02-02-2001) and this was taken for granted by migrants when they entered UK classrooms for the first time. None of the pre-migrants interviewed alluded to disrespect and racism as salient issues prior to their exit from SA.
Barker (1982) has coined the phrase “a new racism” to refer to the context of racism in Britain. He explained that racism in Britain is different to the discrimination that South Africans experienced during apartheid. In Britain racism deals with issues of national identity and not superiority as in SA. This perception of xenophobia has been reinforced in the present study where even White migrant teachers alluded to cultural exclusion in the UK due to their accent. There appeared to be a distinctly separate South African Indian diaspora and a South African white diaspora in the UK. SA white migrant teachers interacted with each other on weekends and holidays as did SA Indian migrant teachers, but in distinctly separate groups. This became apparent when the researcher was utilizing snowball sampling in the UK. SA Indian teachers only provided the details of other SA Indian migrants with whom they mingled. SA White teachers also referred to other white teachers from their home country. The only instances where this differed were when there were SA teachers of different races at the same school. Barker (2000) states that British Asians are second-class citizens. The ramifications for South African Indian teachers was that they found themselves being stereotyped because of their physical similarities to British Asians. Glick-Schiller et al (1995) have argued that racism in Europe and the US is negatively impacting on migrants’ feelings of security in host countries. This destabilization could lead to teachers re-migrating to other countries.

6.9 The Emergence of a Global Teacherhood

A global teacherhood occurs in the tangible traversing of teachers across borders and continents to fulfill the demand for teachers abroad. Hughill (2002) recognised this possibility when he mentioned the advent of the global teacher, which the present study refers to as the transnational teacher. However, what Hughill (2002) did not allude to is the commodification of teachers that has prompted this phenomenon: teachers being able to trade their skills in a global market in return for socio-economic and career gains. Recruitment agencies were acutely aware of the position of teachers as commodities and maximized their profit in facilitating their movement across countries. The arrival this breed of teacher was also facilitated by what Harvey (1989) terms the time-space compression of a global society. There was an easy and quick flow of services from one place to another.
Johnston (1991) in his study of global work patterns identified attributes of a diverse workforce, one of which was the standardisation of labour practices occurring around the world. He argued that while the world's skilled human resources are being produced in the developing world, most of the well-paid jobs are in developed countries. This offers a possible explanation for the mobility of teachers, especially between developing and developed countries. Marquardt (1999) has identified a number of competencies for global staff. Recruitment agencies have been screening possible migrants for particular characteristics before seeking overseas employment on their behalf. These are also the attributes that SA teachers have alluded to in their experiences abroad: language proficiency and communication skills in the class; self-management and professional learning; a sense of humour and respect for the values of others; emotional resilience and adjustment skills and a cultural awareness of knowing oneself. The above contribute to a specific global mindset, a teacher willing to be part of the exchange of ideas and concepts between countries.

Structurally, it can be argued that the migrant teachers from SA in the UK are pawns, subject to global labour-market conditions during recruitment drives. However, migrants should not be viewed as being constantly controlled by structural conditions, although its impact cannot be ignored. The present study has illustrated migrant teachers' ability to be independent actors in the pursuit of attaining their personal goals and priorities. Return migrant teachers also explained that they had not signed contracts to commit themselves to teaching in particular schools in the UK when approached by school management to do so. Similarly, post-migrants revealed that they 'shopped' through OFSTED league tables to find schools, which were highly rated in terms of academic excellence.

The teaching profession is faced with the same encumbrances, regardless of whether one is a teacher in SA or the UK. Internationally teaching has been faced with a depleted social status. Whether you are teaching in a developed or developing country, teachers' work is generally frowned upon by citizens of the same country. A deputy principal of a school in Manchester revealed that he was short of eleven teachers. Despite advertisements in the UK, he was unable
to find local staff (Eteach.com, 18-06-04). He has resorted to overseas recruitment drive to meet his shortfall. Although teachers are regarded as professionals, the hours are long, the pay is poor and there is a lack of autonomy at all levels. They two teacher unions in the UK testified at a schoolteachers’ review body “teachers had to feel that the work they did everyday was justly rewarded” (Eteach.com, 10-09-03). Furthermore, as a teacher, one is still bureaucratically controlled and answerable to an array of stakeholders including management, school governing bodies, parents and politicians. As Apples and Jungck (1992), and Hargreaves (1994) have contended, teachers’ work has become difficult to perform. Teachers are pressurized by many diverse duties and feel burdened. Broadfoot and Osborne (1988:21) have coined a phrase to describe teachers’ work as never ending ‘compressed time’. Thus teachers globally were perceived as mere workers, what Carrim (2003:333) notes as “executioners of tasks”. What was apparent from migrant teachers’ views was that their duties would not be viewed in negative light if there was financial gain for the acceptance of additional tasks.

Nevertheless, the above attributes of the transnational teacher-traveller are responsible for contributing to the creation and emergence of a global teacherhood. Migration can lead to a brain drain or gain for sending and receiving countries respectively.

6.10 Brain Drain/Gain/ Circulation

A significant question arises from the study: Can the exit of teachers from SA be viewed as a brain drain? The answer is complex. There are no quick fix solutions to the out-migration of teachers from SA. In addition, the right and freedom of individuals to migrate to a location that appears to be desirable and beneficial cannot be denied. Attempts by developing countries of the Commonwealth (including SA) to monitor and stem the flow of teachers in strategic subjects was initiated in the signing of the protocol on international teacher recruitment in September 2004 in Lincolnshire, UK.
The protocol is not a legal document and member countries were requested to use it as a framework to structure relevant legislation to protect national education systems and recruited teachers. Section 5.2 of the protocol calls for teachers to be transparent in their liaisons with current and prospective employers. This is a valid concern that was raised as the present study revealed that some teachers were using unconventional or illegal methods to exit SA and teach in the UK, thus eluding the general methods of disclosure. Such methods employed included ‘pretense holidays’ (travelling to the UK pretending to be on vacation but approaching recruitment agencies for teaching positions) and ‘unpaid leave’ while teachers were still permanently employed in SA.

Also, the recruitment of teachers via the internet was overlooked in this study. Habib (2003:6) maintains that a “SA search engine found 20 000 hits on a check for recruitment agencies abroad. A global search engine found more than a million hits targeting African professionals’ to work overseas”. In respect of the UK, more than half of British trained teachers leave the system within five years of starting (Special Assignment, SABC 3, 23-03-04). If this trend persists, there will be a continuous flow of teacher migrants between SA and the UK. In this respect, section 4.1 of the protocol has relevance. It states “source countries must have effective strategies to improve the attractiveness of teaching as a profession” (www.commonwealth.org).

Politics can also influence migration flows. It must be noted that in respect of Britain, on the 20 June 2003 the government confirmed changes for the working holiday visa, which was effected in August 2003. In this way UK employment restrictions were reduced as working-travellers up to the age of 30 can now apply for a visa and not under 28 years as was the case previously. Further, although the visa duration remains the same, after a year the working traveller may apply for a full work permit. In addition, the UK has also created a new website to help foreign nationals gain employment in the UK (Eteach.com, 03-12-03). It thus becomes imperative for the global code of conduct for teacher recruitment to be monitored for all stakeholders’ needs to be met.
It must be stated that an attempt to link the departure of only one category of professionals, namely teachers, in isolation, could result in a parochial understanding of a brain drain. The lack of tangible data on professional migrants and teachers in particular in SA has led to an absence of evidence to support any theory of a brain drain, gain or circulation with certainty. It must be assumed that SA does not have any research data on migrant teachers as it did not respond to the request to provide data for a Commonwealth study. This was in the Commonwealth countries’ pursuit of a protocol for teacher recruitment (Ochs, 2003). On the 30 September 2002, 54 ministers of education within the Commonwealth were asked to provide the following data (Ochs, 2003):

i) Total numbers in the teaching force (2001-2002) males, females and total;
ii) Percentage turnover of teachers in years 2000, 2001, 2002; and
iii) Teacher turnover due to overseas recruitment, career change, death and retirement in 2000, 2001, 2002

SA’s lack of a response could suggest the absence of tangible data on the migration (in, out and net migration) of teachers. Therefore migration needs to be studied as a vector: that is the quantity (number of migrants) and direction of flow needs to be researched. Much attention has focused on the politics of entering rather than exiting a country. All professionals, including teachers, exiting SA should have their details logged on a separate migration database to create a directory of professionals exiting and re-entering to plot the trajectory of professionals. A calculation of the net migration (emigration versus immigration) is relevant, as it needs to be determined nationally whether teacher migration is a monolithic one-way flow from south to north. The volumes of emigration and immigration will depict trends. Further, it would necessitate enquiries into the socio-economic and cultural characteristics of emigrants and immigrants. This would assist in planning and policy making in sending and receiving countries.

In respect of SA, teacher attrition data recorded by the DoE does not have a category that caters for the exit of teachers due to recruitment abroad. The DoE personnel section needs to include migration as a category for attrition. It is not incumbent upon teachers that resign to provide a
reason/s for their decision. Thus migrant teacher statistics will not be reflective of true trends until amendments to teacher resignation procedures are instituted by the DoE. Furthermore, teachers are exiting the SA teaching fraternity permanently as the conditions of service does not make any provision for temporary leave due to international migration.

What about brain circulation and gain? Indeed, some migrant teachers who had returned from a period abroad, did comment about using their knowledge to develop their SA schools. Thus return-migrants remain an untapped resource in SA education. The initiation of teacher exchange programs not only to the UK but also to other flyways such as Australia, Taiwan and New Zealand and Middle East will lead to teachers’ professional development, especially in terms of a cross-pollination of ideas and experience. This would assist in alleviating the need for teachers’ resigning and exiting South African public schools permanently. A maximum period for exchange can be negotiated. There is also the need to encourage the return of teachers to SA to share the knowledge gained in host schools. SA teachers suggested that the advanced OBE syllabus and the provision of resource packages in the UK can be adapted for application in SA. Their knowledge, skills and expertise gained from their experiences abroad could be harnessed in fine-tuning the OBE curriculum for use in SA.

Some return-migrants have indicated a desire to leave SA on a further migration in the future. This could be a return to the UK or to another developed country. Thus there is evidence pointing to a re-migration although the magnitude, once again, is unknown. Nevertheless, it cannot be overlooked that the brain drain has serious economic repercussions for the development of SA. Van Rooyen (2003) has commented that the brain drain costs SA R2, 5 billion a year and the departure of each skilled emigrant translates into the loss of ten unskilled jobs in SA. Section 4.1 of the protocol on teacher recruitment does suggest that source countries implement measures to retain qualified teachers. Therefore, with regard to newly qualified teachers there is a need for the re-introduction of a compulsory tenureship period upon completion of their teaching degree. This was a system previously used by the DoE when it sponsored study towards a teaching degree by allocating bursaries to students in specific fields. The student teacher component at Teacher Education Departments should be consulted to make
representation on the duration of the tenureship. If implemented such teachers will still be eligible, given their age to exit via a working holiday visa upon completion of their tenureship.

At a macro-level government appears to be making some strides towards addressing the skills deficit. Director General of the Department of Home Affairs, Barry Gilder, stated in a television interview that from an economic perspective SA needed to attract labour. Hence, there was a policy review, which would eventually culminate in a new Immigration Act. As a temporary measure, an amendment to the Immigration Bill was passed by Parliament in July 2004 to manage immigration. However, he conceded that the change only establishes a framework for which type of skills will enter the country. He added that specific short-term issues such as teacher shortages remain a challenge (Interface, SABC 3, 15-07-04, 21h30). An evaluation of the migration streams of teachers between SA and the UK has led to the development of a model based on the transnational movement of teachers.

6.11 Three Phase Model of Transnational Teacher Migration

The present study was limited in that migration between two countries (SA-UK flyaway) was examined. However, from the data available it is possible to extrapolate substantive directional trajectories of transnational teachers from developing to developed countries. The model developed is informed in part by Demuth’s (2000) four-phase model of migration (see Chapter Three). A notable absence in the suggested model is the journey in the second phase of the model. The model in this study deviates from Demuth’s in that it makes allowance for a broadened view of migration alternatives and various cyclic patterns. The heterogeneity of migrant teachers (experienced and novice), their identities and their various goals has led to different forms of migrant teacher movement. Depending on whether the migrant teacher’s decision is to be a goal achiever (temporary migration), lifestyle emigrant (emigration) or transient (shuttling from one country to the next), the movement in respect of destination and direction can be extrapolated. The model also includes possibilities for changes in decisions that may not have been premeditated by migrants.
Figure 6.1 Three-Phase Model of Transnational Teacher Migration

Imperatives: Social, Economic, Career

DECISION-MAKING

PHASE ONE

EXIT: HOME COUNTRY

ARRIVAL: HOST COUNTRY ONE

INCLUSION/EXCLUSION

PHASE TWO

REMAIN: HOST COUNTRY ONE

PHASE THREE

RE-MIGRATE: HOST COUNTRY TWO

Forces of globalisation
**Phase One:** The teacher (novice & experienced) contemplates the decision to migrate based on socio-economic and professional gain. He or she decides in favour of exiting the home country. The teacher follows through with his or her decision in a transnational context. He or she is assisted by a social network of family, friends or a recruitment agency.

**Phase Two:** The teacher arrives in host country one and is faced with inclusion or exclusion. Inclusion and exclusion is influenced by socio-cultural or political factors. In the event of exclusion the teacher will return to the home country (cycle 1). The teacher could also be accepted in the host country one, yet elect to return to the home country, for example, due to homesickness.

**Phase Three:** After remaining in the host country and achieving set goals, the migrant may desire to return to the home country. This could occur, for example, if the migrant is married and exited the home country alone, without his/her family. Again there exists the possibility for a return to the host country one after a period of stay in the home country (cycle 2). Alternately, if the migrant’s family has joined him/her in host country one (via perhaps a staggered migration), the migrant may decide to move (re-migrate) to host country two. This could be for professional experience or travelling opportunities, or a better socio-cultural/ economic milieu: generally, a belief that the grass is greener on the other side. The migrant teacher can remain in host country two or he/she may seek a further migration or return to the home country (cycle 3). Facilitating mobility in all phases by allowing for the rapid traversing across national boundaries, is the influence of the forces of globalisation.

### 6.12 Avenues for Future Research

The present study concentrated on only one flyaway namely SA-UK. There is a need to study three other teacher migration flyaways namely SA-Taiwan and SA-Australia/New Zealand and the SA-Middle East (UAE) in order to enhance an understanding of teacher migration in the
context of SA. Also, it will be useful to assess the extent to which teachers from other parts of Africa are being attracted to SA.

In addition to the above, is the necessity for a macro quantitative study focusing on teacher migration flows into and out of SA. The net migration will reveal whether SA is experiencing a brain drain/gain. A database to capture disaggregated data on gender, age, sex, years of experience and specialist subjects is crucial to ensure the success of this endeavour. It will also be interesting to investigate the mobility of black teachers and explore whether they have intentions of migrating internationally. Thus the racial dimension to migration needs to be explored.

An indepth study on the health status of migrant teachers in foreign countries will shed light on teachers’ integration into new socio-cultural and political milieus. A disaggregation of data along gender lines would be useful in illuminating the similarities and differences between male and female experiences of migrant teacher stress.

It is necessary for SA to develop with destination countries, recruitment agencies and stakeholders a quota system for the recruitment of new and experienced teachers. In respect of newly qualified teachers a nationwide study is important to deduce the number of teachers that intend leaving SA upon graduation. Newly appointed Education Minister Naledi Pandor stated during her budget speech that the national DoE intends spending R60 million on teacher training to alleviate a shortage in English, Mathematics and Science (Sunday Times, 20-06-04:04). Thus the loss of teachers to SA upon completion of their degrees has repercussions for government spending.

It will be interesting to explore the global teacherhood from a political perspective, examining it is an exemplification of western capitalist hegemony. Exploring whether particular countries
were attempting to exploit the global labour market for their benefit will explain the nature of relationships between labour exporting and importing countries.

6.13 Conclusion: Journey’s End?

The process of globalisation has created enormous opportunities for the rapid and dynamic movement of professionals across national borders. This study suggests that the emergence of transnational teachers has led to a global teacherhood and associated transnational teacher identities. Such identities were specific to teachers in transit (teachers who were traversing national borders). What is apparent from the tangible movement of teachers between SA and the UK is the fluid nature of their identities as identities were context specific.

Globalisation as an event/era has elements of contradiction - for SA as a country and its citizens. Teachers’ opportunities for self-fulfillment and personal gain (by migrating to developed countries) should not be spurned. Rather, stakeholders in SA education (e.g. the DoE) need to concentrate on two aspects related to teacher migration: firstly, ways of making the teaching profession attractive and nurturing our human resources. In this manner ‘homebred’ teachers can be retained and it will also pave the way for attracting foreign skills. Secondly, there is a need to understand and appreciate the value of local teachers gaining global experience, and thus encourage their return.

SA has just emerged from a period of isolation (1948-1994) where it was, through sanctions and boycotts, excluded from participating in the global terrain. It now needs to secure a niche in the global market. Therefore, SA cannot afford to be protectionist by disallowing the emigration of professionals. Thus the global teacher recruitment protocol forged on the anvil of the needs of developed and developing countries should be translated post haste into feasible legislation.
REFERENCES


BBC News. 2001. African Teachers Rescue London Schools. 02 February. 5.35 GMT.

Bennell, P., Hyde, K and Swanson, N. 2002. The Impact of HIV/AIDS epidemic on the
education sector in sub-Saharan Africa. Centre for International Education. University of Sussex, UK.

supporting Educational Change: Santa Monica, CA. Vol vii.

London.


Perspective. Juta: Cape Town.

Sage: London.

General Education Teachers in National Perspective. Paper presented at the national
dissemination forum on issues relating to special education teacher satisfaction, retention and
attrition. Washington DC.

Borg, M.G. and Riding, R.J. 1991. Towards a Model for the Determinants of Occupational Stress


Crush, J. 2004. Migration Resources: Brain Drain Resources. SAMP.


Maketla, N. 2004. Teachers have Gained on Wages, Lost on Benefits. The Educator’s Voice, March. 08 (02): 08.


MSA Educational Leadership Programme. 1999. www.unc.edu/-wdevane/paper.html


SABC 3. 2004. Special Assignment. Lessons Abroad. 23 March. 21h30


World Markets Research Centre. 2002. World Markets in Focus. world.markets@wmrc.com


Dear Student

Thank you for participating in this research study. (+/- 10 minutes)

Research Topic: Why are so many teachers leaving South Africa?

Please circle the answer you choose

1. Your gender is
   a) male
   b) female

2. How old are you?
   a) 18-21
   b) 22-25
   c) 26-30
   d) 31-35

3. Your ethnic background is
   a) African
   b) Coloured
   c) Asian
   d) White

4. Have you been overseas before?
   a) yes
   b) no

5. You applied to teach abroad
   a) privately
   b) through an agency
   c) other

6. Do you have citizenship of the country that you plan to work in?
   a) yes
   b) no

7. I am leaving South Africa because of financial reasons.
   a) strongly agree
   b) agree
   c) unsure
   d) disagree
   e) strongly disagree
8. I am leaving South Africa because of the high crime levels.
   a) strongly agree
   b) agree
   c) unsure
   d) disagree
   e) strongly disagree

9. I am leaving South Africa because of personal reasons
   a) strongly agree
   b) agree
   c) unsure
   d) disagree
   e) strongly disagree

10. I am leaving South Africa mainly to enjoy a global work experience.
    a) strongly agree
    b) agree
    c) unsure
    d) disagree
    e) strongly disagree

11. I will return to teach in South Africa.
    a) strongly agree
    b) agree
    c) unsure
    d) disagree
    e) strongly disagree

12. I am satisfied with the current state of South African education.
    a) strongly agree
    b) agree
    c) unsure
    d) disagree
    e) strongly disagree

13. I am satisfied with the way the current South African government has been running the country.
    a) strongly agree
    b) agree
    c) unsure
    d) disagree
    e) strongly disagree

14. I am satisfied with the academic quality of my degree.
    a) strongly agree
    b) agree
    c) unsure
    d) disagree
    e) strongly disagree
CONFIDENTIAL

1. Please do not supply your name.
2. Answer all questions.
3. Return questionnaire to researcher upon completion.
4. Contact researcher if you have any queries.

Sadhana Manik
Cell 0837878998

Proposed date of Departure from S.A. __________________________
Proposed duration of stay __________________________
Date of return / proposed return______________________________
PART A: SOCIO-ECONOMIC PROFILE

Mark with a ✓

1. Relation to Head

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Head of household</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spouse of head</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spouse of married child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unmarried child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grandchild</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Father</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Father-in-law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother-in-law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sister-in-law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brother-in-law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other relatives</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Age

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Range</th>
<th>29-35 yrs</th>
<th>36-41 yrs</th>
<th>42-48 yrs</th>
<th>49-55 yrs</th>
<th>56 yrs &amp; older</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Younger &amp; equal to 28 yrs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. Sex

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sex</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Race

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. Marital status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marital Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Currently married</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single (never married)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widowed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Separated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single parent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6. Do you earn a salary/wage? If yes, specify.

7. Housing and Community

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Dwelling</th>
<th>Flat</th>
<th>Semi-detached</th>
<th>House</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of bedrooms</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ownership</td>
<td>Freehold/own</td>
<td>Rental</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8. Social network

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family/friends within 10km</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family/friends greater than 10km</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PART B: CAREER PROFILE

9. Degree/diploma to be obtained with

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bank loan</th>
<th>Bursary</th>
<th>Own funds</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

10. What is your motivation for obtaining a teaching diploma/degree?
11. Complete the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GOALS</th>
<th>REASONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Short-term</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-term</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12. Indicate the following in order of preference with 1 being most important and 5 least important (Rate each item only once)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ORDER OF PRIORITY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(1/ 2/ 3/ 4/ 5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global travel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career satisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career advancement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (specify)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
13. Describe your perception of the teaching profession in South Africa. Further indicate if you intend returning to teach in South Africa and under what circumstances/factors.


Future Trends

14. Which recruitment agency/ies will you be using?


15. State the subjects you will be teaching?


16. State the age group of the pupils?


Please provide the names, telephone/e-mail addresses of other prospective migrant teachers.


Thank you for your participation
PART A: SOCIO-ECONOMIC PROFILE

Mark with a ✓

1. Relation to Head

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relation</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Head of household</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spouse of head</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married child</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spouse of married child</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unmarried child</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grandchild</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Father</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Father-in-law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother-in-law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sister-in-law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brother-in-law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other relatives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Age

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Younger &amp; equal to 28 yrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29-35 yrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-41 yrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42-48 yrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49-55 yrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56 yrs &amp; older</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. Sex

- Male
- Female

4. Race

- White
- Indian

5. Marital status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marital status</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Currently married</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single (never married)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widowed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Separated</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single parent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6. **Total Income (gross salary/wage) per month**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Range</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>R1 000 - R2 599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R2 600 - R3 599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R3 600 - R4 599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R4 600 - R5 599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R5 600 - R6 599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R6 600 - R7 599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R7 600 - R8 599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R8 600 - R10 000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt; R10 000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. **Net income after compulsory deductions—available for household expenses per month**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Range</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>R1 000 - R2 599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R2 600 - R3 599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R3 600 - R4 599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R4 600 - R5 599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R5 600 - R6 599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R6 600 - R7 599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R7 600 - R8 599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R8 600 - R10 000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt; R10 000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8. **Housing and Community**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Dwelling</th>
<th>Flat</th>
<th>Semi-detached</th>
<th>House</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of bedrooms</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ownership</td>
<td>Freehold/ own</td>
<td>Rental</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9. **Social network**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family/ friends within 10km</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family/ friends greater than 10km</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PART B: CAREER PROFILE

10. Degree/ diploma obtained with

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bank loan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bursary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Own funds</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

11. Years experience in teaching

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt; 5yrs</td>
<td>5-10 yrs</td>
<td>&gt;10 yrs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12. Describe your teaching environment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Poor</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Excellent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pupil discipline</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rest and relaxation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum 2005</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

13. Professionals eg. teachers are leaving South Africa to work abroad. Do you think that this has an impact on the development of South Africa. Explain

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

14. What are your expectations with regards to the UK in the following categories:

14.1 Career

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
14.2 Finance


14.3 Social


14.4 Political


14.5 Other expectations


15. Reasons for migrating. Explain


16. Why did you specifically choose the UK?


17. Was it your decision entirely or a family decision to migrate?
18. Did you discuss your intentions with either relatives/friends? If yes, indicate their responses and state how it influenced you.

__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________

19. List the specific activities you had to undertake to give effect to your decision to move. For each indicate your perception of the time taken.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Quick</th>
<th>Reasonable</th>
<th>Lengthy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eg. Selling assets/ acquiring visas etc</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Additional comments:

__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________

20. Tick in the appropriate block regarding your recruitment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aspect</th>
<th>Favourable</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>Unfavourable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attitude of Agent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistance with queries</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

21. State any reservations that you may have had regarding migrating to the UK.

__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
22. Rate the reasons promoting migration according to your priorities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic</th>
<th>Very Important</th>
<th>Important</th>
<th>Not Important</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Career advancement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social eg. Family attachment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (specify)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

__________________________ Thank you for your participation __________________________
PART A: SOCIO-ECONOMIC PROFILE

Mark with a ✓

1. Relation to Head

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relation to Head</th>
<th>✓</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Head of household</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spouse of head</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married child</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spouse of married child</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unmarried child</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grandchild</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Father</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Father-in-law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother-in-law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sister-in-law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brother-in-law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other relatives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Age

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>✓</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Younger &amp; equal to 28 yrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29-35 yrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-41 yrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42-48 yrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49-55 yrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56 yrs &amp; older</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. Sex

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>✓</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Race

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>✓</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. Marital status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marital Status</th>
<th>✓</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Currently married</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single (never married)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widowed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Separated</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single parent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6. Total Income (gross salary/wage) per month

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Income Range</th>
<th>Box</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt;1000 pounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1001 – 2000 pounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001 – 3000 pounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3001 – 4000 pounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4001 – 5000 pounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5001 – 6000 pounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;6001 pounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. Net income after compulsory deductions—available for household expenses per month

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Income Range</th>
<th>Box</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt;1000 pounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1001 – 2000 pounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001 – 3000 pounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3001 – 4000 pounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4001 – 5000 pounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5001 – 6000 pounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;6001 pounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8. Housing and Community

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Dwelling</th>
<th>Flat</th>
<th>Semi-detached</th>
<th>House</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of bedrooms</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ownership</td>
<td>Freehold/ own</td>
<td>Rental</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9. Social network

| Family/ friends within 10km |       |
| Family/ friends greater than 10km |     |
PART B: CAREER PROFILE

10. Describe your teaching environment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Poor</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Excellent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pupil discipline</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rest and relaxation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

11. Regarding your pre-migration expectations, have these been fulfilled. Explain.

11.1 Career

__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________

11.2 Finance

__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________

11.3 Social

__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________

11.4 Political

__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________
11.5 Other expectations

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

12. Briefly describe your first month of employment in the UK. Explain (also include emotions)

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

13. What do you consider to be:

12.1 The most favourable aspect of the UK

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

12.2 The least favourable aspect of the UK

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
14. What are your

14.1 Short-term goals

14.2 Long-term goals

15. Upon migration, did the recruitment agency offer you a support network for adaptation to the following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Socio-cultural environment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School environment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Where you have answered "yes", indicate which option you have utilized

16. Detail the most important challenges of your new work environment

_________________________________________________________________________

_________________________________________________________________________

_________________________________________________________________________
17. Tabulate the differences (based on your experience) between South African schools and UK schools:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SA SCHOOLS</th>
<th>UK SCHOOLS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

18. Tabulate the differences between SA society and UK society (refer to people and their attributes that you have encountered)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SA SOCIETY</th>
<th>UK SOCIETY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

19. Would you encourage other teachers to migrate? Explain


20. What changes would you implement in SA education if you were offered the opportunity to return to SA to teach?


PART C: RETURN MIGRANTS

(If you have returned to SA, answer questions 20-22)

21. State the reasons for your return

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

22. State your career intentions

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

23. If you have sought a job on returning to SA, describe the ease of integration back into the South African teaching environment.

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
24. Do you intend remaining in SA or returning to the UK. Explain.

Thank you for your participation
APPENDIX FIVE

CLASSROOM OBSERVATION SCHEDULE

Purpose: Pending permission from UK school authorities, classroom observation will be utilized with respect to four ethnographic participants. The data which emanates will be used to triangulate teachers' experiences in UK schools which has been alluded to in the post migration questionnaire schedules and teacher diaries.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>No. Of Pupils</th>
<th>Observation Starting Time</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Teacher</th>
<th>Lesson</th>
<th>End Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

1. Comment on the physical environment of the classroom (care, neglect etc...)

2. Classroom organization (pupils face each other, pupils face teacher etc...)

3. TEACHER'S ARRIVAL

   3.1. Does the teacher greet all learners Most learners Few learners None
   
   3.2. Does the teacher settle pupils

4.1. Where does the teacher stand in relation to the class?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lesson Topic</th>
<th>introductory</th>
<th>continuation of topic</th>
<th>end of series</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

6. Does the teacher explain the objectives of the lesson? Yes No Objectives given but not explained
### 7. TEACHING STYLE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Do pupils appear to understand the lesson</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Are questions asked by pupils</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Are clarities given by teacher</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 8. LEARNER PARTICIPATION AND INVOLVEMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.1 Do the pupils freely interact with each other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2 Do pupils freely interact with teacher</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 9. Lesson Structure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group Activities</th>
<th>Discussion</th>
<th>Entire Classroom Teaching</th>
<th>Other (Specify)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>group work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>discussion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 10. Use of Resources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resources</th>
<th>Textbooks</th>
<th>Worksheets</th>
<th>Computers</th>
<th>OHP</th>
<th>Chalkboard</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### 11. Total school environment: teacher-teacher interaction etc...

### 12. Open Ended Notes: events, non-events. relevant pieces of dialogue

---

---
## TRANSCRIPTS:

**YR:** 10  
**No. of Pupils:** 17  
**Date:** 10/4  
**Time:** 12.25  
**Tchr:** KN

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Observation</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Physical Environ:  
Graffiti on tables and chairs,  
End of a series of lessons. | Well resourced class |
| Transcript:  
Tchr: Sit down properly, turn around, get started.  
Someone calls out: ‘BORING’  
Whilst KN is doing an example on the board.  
Tchr: “You didn’t expect it to be interesting, did you?”  
Instruction given to pupils to complete ex. From textbk. Using calculators which he provides.  
Lots of talking among pupils not related to the lesson.  
Tchr: I’ll speak to you for about 5 mins. – just a quick chat during lunch about how your attitude has changed in the last month.  
A male pupil is busy doing graffiti on the desk– chose not to do the ex.  
Pupils stand up, walk around and chat to others whilst tchr. Is assisting a pupil.Tchr. says: ‘This is not a hippotamus, it’s a hypotenuse.’  
Pupil: Sir, I’m not going to see you over the hols.’  
Tchr: I’ll keep a picture of you on my ceiling so when I awake I’ll see you–okay. A boy and a girl start shoving each other. Tchr: That’s what’s stupid, when I give you a break, you start something...  
Tchr to TA: Today they at least got in half an hour’s work done. | Lengthy periods spent settling pupils.  
Although 2 teacher assistants in class, 15 pupils still present problems-disruptions.  
Resources provided yet many pupils not interested in completing the set task.  
Pastoral care offered by teacher  
Researcher overhears girls making plans to meet after school and spend time with boyfriends.  
Teacher has a good rapport with pupils, doesn’t show that he’s angry, just peeved at times.  
Stated as if to say that this was quite an accomplishment. |
APPENDIX SIX

Extract From Interview With Post-Migrant

MOST MEMORABLE EXPERIENCES IN UK
The travelling. You have not lived if you have not seen things that you have only read in a book. I can’t tell you how awe struck I was to stand in front of the painting of The Last Supper - all you have seen was in a book, photo or magazine. To stand in front of this painting or to be in Scotland in the Highlands or in the hub-bub of Dublin/to see the Swiss Alps - I mean you haven’t lived if you haven’t experienced that. I’m so glad that I experienced this if for nothing else that has kept me going - to see new sights.
Life in Durban - it is so small, some people live there all their lives. But when you travel to Europe, it changes your perspective - what you want in life. In SA especially in Durban, it’s a very materialistic society. You’re constantly judged by what car you drive and how much you have. Teachers work so hard there to acquire those things, some take 2/3 jobs. But when I go back... my outlook on life has changed. I might as well have this experience and take no money home... no body can buy this experience from me for no amount of money. When I came here I had a materialistic view - to save so many pounds and take it back and live cheaply. But when I go back home I just want to live simply. I don’t want a big house or big car. You know many people think you worked in the UK, you’re going to buy a big house or car and have this and that bank account. But being here, it’s changed me. There’s more to life than that. Many people are going back at the end of this year with about R 100 000 - I’m not. But if I compare the money to the experience, I will never trade it really!

(She thinks in pounds) Food is so reasonable, things are really cheap. On a teacher’s salary here you can survive. I send money home plus I save plus I travel plus I eat well plus I shop and I still have money at the end of the month. You’re not scrounging and begging. thinking at the end of the month ‘how am I gonna make end’s meat?’ Okay I don’t have a car but you can survive on a teacher’s salary - back home you’re waiting for pay day.

MEMORABLE EXPERIENCES IN SA
In SA the students - the relationship with the pupils were the most memorable. That I can’t have here because I wouldn’t allow myself to go so far. The kinds of relationships. I think if you have to do it here, the students will take advantage and abuse your kindness because everything here is so strict, structured and rigid. You don’y have teachers having a friendly rapport. You have to be very guarded. Firstly I’m new here I don’t know how far you can push boundaries. Secondly, students will take advantage because they’re not used to that kind of rapport with teachers. There are lots of boundaries you don’t cross. I’ve tried to bring some of the Sa side out but I find students abusing it. They want to eat in class because you’re talking nicely to them or swear in your presence because ‘miss is cool.

10
VIEWS OF ENGLISH
People told me that they would be rude. I respect the fact that some people don't want to talk to me. We think this person is being rude or racist but it's all in your mind. What I really like about here is that nobody minds your business, no one in your face, no one... You go to the staffroom and you don't find people clicking together and talking about you. There's such a big staff here. My English dept. is good. The HOD has total faith in me. Not once has he asked to see my books or second-guessed me in any way. I have tried to talk to as many people as possible. When I arrived I tried to get directions. People have been kind and I think they are a polite society, not friendly but polite. I don't have much contact with the community because my students stay here but I've mingled at the hostel.

TEACHER CHALLENGES IN THE UK
To be a teacher in this country, you have to have QTS. There are three subjects you have to have: Maths, Science and English. Currently there are teachers doing this course and they have had to rewrite Maths, Science and ICT. I've looked through those papers and I can't do it especially Maths, let alone Physical Science. I haven't done Physics in school. Secondly, I think I've studied hard and as a supply teacher there's only so far that you can go because you're not going to be recognized as a qualified teacher. My principal has asked me to stay on but I know the next step is QTS. Personally, I don't think it's fair. We're qualified and I think our degree is of a substantial standard. And why do I need Maths and Science to teach Drama?

WILL YOU RETURN TO TEACH IN THE UK?
I don't think so. If I was single, maybe but I would teach in a primary school, not because I want it easier but because there's a lot of paperwork. I didn't come here just for a holiday. I'm not cheating these students, I'm giving them the best that I can see but I wanted to travel. I'm not going to give my everything here. In SA I will stay 3/4/5 hours after school was finished- I'm not going to here on a regular basis. Some days I stay till late but not all the time, 1/2 hours because there's only so much I'm willing to give.

CAREER INTENTIONS
I'm not ever going to teach in SA. I want something simple for a while. I want a flexible job, to start something on my own, maybe with Drama. When I get back home I'll decide, for now I don't want to think that far ahead, I don't want that pressure.

Things are not perfect here (UK). There are a lot of faults and that's another reason why I won't work here...forget about the QTS! That's the main reason, because there's a lot of problems with the syllabus. It's too structured and rigid, there's not much room for a teacher to create your own...There's a lot of flaws here. Severe discipline problem... Also what they do e.g. yr. 7 does Chaucer. I'm unhappy with the content. I believe in what Jonathan Jansen said that “We should close schools in SA for a year and sort ourselves out. I would really like to know 'Are students learning and what are they learning?"
Teach with in the UK

Extend your teaching skills whilst seeing the UK and the rest of Europe, and you will be joining countless other teachers currently gaining an experience they won't easily forget!

TimePlan, the UK's teacher recruitment specialist, offers a variety of teaching posts in England and Scotland with a comprehensive support programme.

- Schools in cities, suburbs and country towns
- Top rates of pay.

If you have a 4 year teaching qualification (minimum) and excellent spoken English, take the next step and contact:

Teach in London

Qualified Primary, Secondary & Special Needs Teachers
- Make us your 1st Contact!

- The best package you'll find - FREE!
  > Earn up to £335 per day
  > UK bank account assistance
  > Free training courses
  > Access to teacher resource centre
  > Free email and internet access
  > A job to suit your needs - daily or long term

- Call us today and register before you leave home

Visas essential: Are you under 30 or eligible for an Ancestral visa or UK/EU passport?
HRM Circular No. 20 of 2003

CLARIFICATION OF HRM CIRCULARS NUMBER 8 AND 10 OF 2003

1. It has been noted with concern that some employees are using the restructuring process as a transfer measure whereby they elect to be placed in other Regions while they could be successfully accommodated in their new Regions.

2. In order to circumvent this problem, employees will first be considered for placement in their current posts. If they cannot be accommodated, then alternative placement options outside their current regions will be explored.

3. Employees who were attached to the collapsed regions will first be considered for placement in their new Regions, for example, employees who were attached to the ex-Port Shepstone Region will be considered for placement in the Pietermaritzburg Region, before other placement options could be explored.

4. It should be emphasised that employees are not currently redundant and as such will be considered for redeployment from their current posts. Needless to say, paragraph 2 of HRM Circulars number 8 and 10 is hereby withdrawn in keeping with the PSCBC Resolution 7 of 2002.

5. The contents of this circular should be brought to the attention of all employees.

Chief Executive Officer
HRM CIRCULAR NO. 22 OF 2003

To: Principals of all Schools
       Principals of Technical Colleges and Teachers’ Centres
       Heads of Regional and District Offices
       Chairpersons of Governing Bodies and Management

AMENDMENT TO HRM CIRCULAR NO’S 9 AND 18 OF 2003

1. HRM Circular Nos 9 and 18 of 2003 (Advertisement of Level One Educator Posts and Advertisement of Level 1 and 2 ELSEN Educator Posts respectively) has reference.

2. It has come to the attention of the Department that HRM Circular Nos 9 and 18 of 2003 did not reach some schools timeously and therefore the Department has decided to amend the management plan.

3. In addition, the following amendments are brought to your attention in:

3.1 Paragraph 4.2 (HRM Circular No. 9) and paragraph 5.2 (HRM Circular No. 18) should read: "The interview committee will be responsible for shortlisting of applicants to obtain a manageable number and thereafter interviewing and assessing them for the purpose of making recommendations."

3.2 Paragraph 9.2 (HRM Circular No. 9 and paragraph 10.2 (HRM Circular No. 18) should read: "Serving surplus/displaced educators must be included in the shortlist [lists of surplus/displaced educators without School Governing Body recommendations should be compiled and supplied to schools with posts advertised in this bulletin]."

3.3 Paragraph 2.4.1.3 (HRM Circular No. 9) bullet 3 and paragraph 2.3.2 (HRM Circular No. 18) bullet 3 should read: "A self-addressed envelope with sufficient postage to enable the District Office to return the acknowledgement slip to the Applicant."
Summary of agreement reached regarding the advertisement and filling of Posts in the KZN Department of Education.

Following numerous meetings with the Unions the issue regarding the proposed implementation of the 2004 PPN has been resolved as follows:

1. The 2004 Post Provisioning Norm (PPN)
   The 2004 PPN has been nullified because it was the product of a process that did not comply with the provisions of the Employment of Educators Act and related regulations. There are therefore no surplus Educators.

2. Circulars
   All circulars relating to the 2004 PPN have been withdrawn except circular 54A. The provisions contained in circular 54A relating to the staying of the movement of educators are to remain in force until the 30th of June 2004. The reason for this is to ensure that education delivery at the level of the learner is not disrupted. This means that there will be no further movement of educators until 30 June 2004.

3. Advertising of Posts
   The following bulletins concerning fully funded posts will now be released and circulated as open bulletins.
   3.1 On 15/06/2004 a bulletin containing 3409 fully funded post level 1 educators had been released.
   3.2 On 15/06/2004 a bulletin containing 1466 fully funded promotion posts had been released.
   3.3 Reference to these bulletins and where they might be obtained will be advertised in the press on 18 June 2004.
   3.4 Educators who are interested in applying for such posts contained in the bulletins shall have until 8 July 2004 (when applications will be closed) to do so.
   3.5 In addition a further 764 vacant posts not previously advertised will now be advertised.
3.6. After the process involving the receipt of applications has been completed it is expected that the interviews concerning applicants who have been short listed will be completed on or about the 20th of August 2004.

3.7. After the submission of recommendations made by various school governing bodies have been submitted to the Chief Executive officer for approval, it is expected that applicants who are appointed will be able to take up their posts with effect from 4 October 2004, ie at the beginning of the 4th term.

4. Insofar as 2070 posts which, had previously been described, as surplus posts are concerned it has been agreed between the Unions and the MEC that the costing of such will have to be completed and that mechanisms to obtain funding for these posts will have to be explored. These posts will be dealt with separately from the aforementioned posts that will be advertised.

From the desk of the MEC for Education
APPENDIX TWELVE

Arising from an Agreement reached with the Unions on 14 June 2004, the following directive is given relating to the movement of Educators and the Post Provisioning Norm;

This circular supersedes Circular 54A.

1. Since the Post Provisioning Norm of 2004 is no longer valid, Educators who have been transferred (Compulsory Temporary Transfers) to schools in terms of that Post Provisioning Norm should return to the schools from which they have been transferred, and report for duty on 21 July 2004.

2. Schools that are affected through the withdrawal of Educators in terms of Compulsory Temporary Transfers will be permitted to fill the vacancies concerned by means of an Unprotected Temporary Educator to ensure that no class is without an Educator. All such appointments of Unprotected Educators (UTE's) will only apply for the period 21 July 2004 to 09 December 2004.

3. Where schools have experienced an increase in enrolment during the course of 2004, they will be permitted to employ Unprotected Temporary Educators, provided that in so employing the Unprotected Temporary Educators, schools will use 2004 audited statistics.

4. The present situation does not change the basis upon which Substitute Educators may be employed; rules and circumstances under which Substitute Educators were employed in the past are to be applied to the situation at present.

Chief Executive Officer
Department of Education
APPENDIX THIRTEEN

The Regional Chief Director
Attention: Staffing
KZN Department of Education and Culture
Private Bag X54323
Durban
4000

Sir

Termination of Service: 7 September 2001

Notice is hereby given, that I, (Persal No. ), am terminating my service with the KZN Department of Education and Culture on 7 September 2001.

The reason for termination is my Principal's (I Secondary) failure to recommend my application for Leave Without Pay. Upon receiving notification from the Department, I am left with no alternative, but to terminate my service.

I must stress that Mr lack of transparency has forced me to give the Department only 2 weeks notice. I had met with Mr on 3 occasions during the period 31 July 2001 and 14 August 2001. At no point during our discussions did he give me any indication that he was not going to recommend my vacation pay without leave, in spite of the fact that he was informed of my intention to return to England in September 2001.

I am still experiencing difficulty reconciling the past events:
- Mr and the Department recommended/granted me vacation leave without pay for period 1 May 2001 and 31 July 2001 to develop professionally in England.
- The Department sent a replacement, Mr , to Secondary and he is currently employed there. (Note, Mr has now taught at the school for over a term)
- Despite the fact that Mr , is currently employed at Secondary, Mr and the Department have failed to recommend/grant me vacation leave without pay, having previously done so.

As a result of the above occurrences, I have been left with no alternative, but terminate my service and give the Department only 2 weeks notice. I must stress that I had no intention to terminate my service and had planned to return on 1 December 2001. I find it difficult to understand how the professional development of a teacher abroad can be hindered by Mr and the Department, especially when I sought vacation leave without pay.

In an age, when the government is complaining of a braindrain from South Africa, it is Mr and the Department, who are contributing further to this.
I must however, thank the Department for affording me the opportunity to teach and develop as a teacher for the past 13 years. It has been 13 wonderful years, although challenging and trying at times. For this, I am sincerely grateful and will always be indebted to the Department. I trust that you will now accept the termination of my service.

Yours faithfully

_________________________________________

Date: 27 August 2001
Hi Sandy,

The area I am teaching in is rather low class and the children come from difficult backgrounds - broken families, exposed to drugs and gangs, unsupportive parents, statemented pupils - learning or behavioural difficulties.

The swear at each other all the time, use foul language in the classroom, are not respectful of discipline or afraid of authority. They say horrible things to each other all the time and often end up arguing and a few cases of physical violence have resulted in the classroom. There are often fights in the playground or canteen.

The only reason I'm still at this particular school is because of how supportive the staff have been - they will readily assist in the classroom or offer advice etc. But, like you say, discipline strategies would actually be in vain at this stage - the children do not have discipline at home and this is where it needs to start. The school has various strategies we can use but like I said, some of the pupils are not at all afraid of authority. Strategies include, at Book of Calm - to write down offenders during the day and so remember to deal with them - either to chat to them after school, or phone their parents or send a letter home. For physical violence and other similar offences, the children can be internally excluded - they sit in the seminar room for the whole day and work supervised by members of staff.

Hope the above will be helpful - you actually need to be here to experience it though!!

Sean and I actually got engaged last weekend in Venice - very romantic. We plan to get married in SA in August! Next year April/June sounds great - hopefully I will be at a different school by then. Will try to find out the holiday dates for you.

Keep well,

\shaona07@hotmail.com>
02 +0200

Thanks for replying. Enjoy your short break. Are you going on holiday to any place in particular during Christmas? If you can tell me a little more about the pupils eg. what do they say/do that is difficult to tolerate. How
APPENDIX FIFTEEN

Extract for Interview with Return-Migrant

A Mathematics and Science specialist but in the UK he had to teach everything. He would not recommend anyone going via a small agency as he and other teachers could not get a bank account opened. He lived in an agency’s house-boarding @ 75 pounds a week. Initially he was promised 90 pounds a day but he re-negotiated his salary after he was offered a job with another agency. Agency agreed to 110 pounds - 20 pounds a day increase.

Kay pushed me. I had a telephonic interview. It is a lovely school- a refugee school and I fitted in nicely. There was no problem with my English accent as many of the pupils couldn’t even speak English. We had a mixed batch on the staff with lots of foreigners. Initially there were 3 SA teachers then on one drive 8 more were recruited. I am due to return in August but I won’t be going back to the UK. The DoE is getting fussy there’s no chance of me extending my leave although I went on unpaid leave. I have decided to migrate to teach in New Zealand (NZ). When Nel returns next week from his stint in the UK then we will discuss it. But my wife and children coped well, in fact she wants me to return to the UK. She is also a teacher. We are actually a group of four friends that finished College together and NZ is our destination- at least the weather is good there.

It was hard to cope without the family. The most costly thing was to phone SA - a 5 pound global card lasts two days. My wife and children coped well, in fact she told me to go back because she managed so well. My wife wants to leave but I have no drive. My wife didn’t believe that I’d go but everything clicked- police clearance, work permit etc. so I moved. A lot of it was due to Kay’s support. Nel is in Kent then he’ll be going back to New Zealand. I’ll follow in a year or two but this time with my family, not singly again.

WHAT WAS YOUR REASON/S FOR MIGRATING?
The intention was to make money in a short space of time...and I did. I did supply work and the daily rates are better than if you are a permanent employee but you can’t get absent. If you do you are not paid for that day. I saved 425 pounds per week after deductions. Also, I didn’t pay pension, only UIF and Tax. The tax I paid, majority of it was refunded when I returned to SA. For 4 months I paid in total 1100 pounds and 860 pounds was returned. Our rand is picking up nicely now. The conversion was good.

WHAT WERE SOME OF YOUR GREATEST CHALLENGES AND HOW DID YOU RESPOND?
I missed my wife’s cooking. I had carried chilli powder and I tried to cook but I wasn’t successful. But there’s curries in England. The meat was lousy but I ate. Cigarettes are my only vice but I got those posted from SA.
The weather, I went in Summer, but everyday I returned home with my shirt wet.
Every time a kid swears you, you turn put your hands in your pocket and think pounds. After all I didn’t go there to make changes.