



**A Critical Assessment of the Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace's  
Contribution towards Good Governance in Zimbabwe from 1990-2000**

**Student: Stephen Phiri**

**Student Number: 208524489**

**Submitted in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of  
Master of Social Science [Policy and Development Studies] in the College  
of Humanities, School of Social Sciences at the University of KwaZulu-  
Natal, Pietermaritzburg Campus**

**December 2013**

## DECLARATION

---

I, Stephen Phiri declare that

- i. The research reported in this thesis, except where otherwise indicated, is my original work.
- ii. This thesis has not been submitted for any degree or examination at any other university.
- iii. This thesis does not contain other persons' data, pictures, graphs or other information, unless specifically acknowledged as being sourced from other persons.
- iv. This thesis does not contain other persons' writing, unless specifically acknowledged as being sourced from other researchers. Where other written sources have been quoted, then:
  - a. their words have been re-written but the general information attributed to them has been referenced;
  - b. where their exact words have been used, their writing has been placed inside quotations marks, and referenced.
- v. Where I have reproduced a publication of which I am an author, co-author or editor, I have indicated in detail which part of the publication was actually written by myself alone and have fully referenced such publications.
- vi. This thesis does not contain text, graphics or tables copied and pasted from the Internet, unless specifically acknowledged, and the source being detailed in the thesis and in the References sections.

Signed: ..... Date: .....

## ABSTRACT

---

Zimbabwe and its controversial government, with Mugabe at the helm, has been a source of concern for Southern Africa, global politics and not least Zimbabweans themselves. Though Mugabe has presided over the country for more than three decades, there has been relentless criticisms of, and opposition to, his form of governance. Apart from caustic political opponents of Zimbabwe's government, there has also been advocate groups or the civil society who have been intrepid critics of the government.

One of the most influential civil organizations in Zimbabwe is the Catholic Church. The Catholic Church in Zimbabwe has a college of Bishops which gives the most formal and influential stance of the Church on Zimbabwean politics. One of the most effective advocacy channels used by the Catholic Church has been the Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace in Zimbabwe (CCJPZ). This paper analyzes the role of the CCJPZ in trying to infuse political and moral rectitude in the Zimbabwean governance. Through the use of Antonio Gramsci's theory of civil society, the paper analyses why the calls of the CCJPZ have remained largely unheeded by the Mugabe leadership. By this the paper further analyses whether certain tendencies that have rendered CCJPZ hamstrung or ignored are solely because of its own weakness, or the impervious nature of the Zimbabwe government to those it considers its wanton detractors and hypocrites. Gramsci talks of civil societies which can be pro-hegemony i.e. in tandem with the ruling class and one that is counter-hegemony i.e. at variance with the ruling class. The findings in this paper show that the CCJPZ has not abdicated its moral certitudes in support of the ruling class, hence it is counter-hegemony.

The paper tries to explore how far-reaching the crusade for good governance, as championed by the CCJPZ has been. Despite being a Catholic group, the paper argues, the CCJPZ has to incorporate all Zimbabwean who are restive because of what is largely considered bad and violent governance. Only a wide-reaching crusade that does not include participants based on religious persuasion can give a more forceful voice against the form of governance that rules Zimbabwe.

The key terms that underpin this study are: Civil society, State, Good governance, Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

---

My sincere gratitude and acknowledgement to:

- *Mark Rieker, my supervisor*
- *Dr Roderick Hewitt, my co-supervisor*
- *School of Social Science for financially supporting part of my studies*
- *Dr Annah Theresa Nyadombo- Director of the Catholic Social Communications Commission in Zimbabwe for allowing me to access CCJPZ Newsletters*
- *Mr T Zimbiti- Assistant Director of The Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace in Zimbabwe for giving me some of CCJPZ documents*
- *Chrispin Kampala and Emmanuel Matambo for their insights*
- *Marvel Banda, my brother, for believing in my academic capabilities*

## ACRONYMS

---

<b>CCJP</b>	Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace
<b>CCJPZ</b>	Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace in Zimbabwe
<b>ESAP</b>	Economic Structural Adjustment Programme
<b>IEC</b>	Independent Election Commission
<b>IMF</b>	International Monetary Fund
<b>LHR</b>	Lawyers for Human Rights
<b>MDC</b>	Movement of Democratic Change
<b>NCA</b>	National Constitution Assembly
<b>NGO</b>	Non-Governmental Organisation
<b>STC</b>	Social Teachings of the Catholic Church
<b>YCW</b>	Young Christian Workers
<b>ZANU (PF)</b>	Zimbabwe African National Unity Patriotic Front
<b>ZCBC</b>	Zimbabwe Catholic Bishop Conference
<b>ZCC</b>	Zimbabwe Council of Churches
<b>ZCTU</b>	Zimbabwe Congress of Trade Unions
<b>ZEC</b>	Zimbabwe Electoral Commission
<b>ZHF</b>	Zimbabwean Human Rights Forum

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

<b>DECLARATION .....</b>	<b>I</b>
<b>ABSTRACT.....</b>	<b>II</b>
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....</b>	<b>III</b>
<b>ACRONYMS.....</b>	<b>IV</b>
<b>CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND: A PREVIEW OF THE STUDY .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1.1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1.2 BACKGROUND AND OUTLINE OF RESEARCH PROBLEM .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1.3 PRELIMINARY LITERATURE STUDY, AND REASONS FOR CHOOSING TOPIC .....</b>	<b>4</b>
1.3.1 CIVIL SOCIETY AND THE STATE.....	4
1.3.2 CIVIL SOCIETY AND GOOD GOVERNANCE IN ZIMBABWE .....	6
<b>1.4 KEY RESEARCH QUESTIONS .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>1.5 OBJECTIVES THE STUDY .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>1.6) BROADER ISSUES TO BE INVESTIGATED.....</b>	<b>8</b>
1.6.1 BROADER QUESTIONS .....	9
1.6.2 BROADER OBJECTIVES.....	9
<b>1.7 PRINCIPAL THEORIES UPON WHICH THE RESEARCH PROJECT IS CONSTRUCTED.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>1.8 RESEARCH METHODS .....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>1.9 LIMITATIONS AND SCOPE OF THE STUDY .....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>1.10 DATA ANALYSIS .....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>1.11 DISSERTATION STRUCTURE .....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>1.12 CONCLUSION.....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW AND THE THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK .....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>2.1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>2.2 LITERATURE REVIEW .....</b>	<b>14</b>
2.2.1 CHURCH AND ADVOCACY .....	14

2.2.2 CHURCH’S ADVOCACY IN ZIMBABWE.....	16
2.2.3 THE CATHOLIC CHURCH AND ADVOCACY .....	17
<b>2.3 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK.....</b>	<b>18</b>
2.3.1 A BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF GRAMSCI’S CONTEXT.....	19
2.3.2 GRAMSCI AND THE ZIMBABWEAN CONTEXT .....	19
2.3.3 CLARIFICATION OF GRAMSCI’S PHILOSOPHY OR POLITICAL THOUGHT .....	20
2.3.4 RELATING CIVIL SOCIETY WITH DOMINATION, HEGEMONY AND COUNTER-HEGEMONY .....	21
<b>2.4 CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>CHAPTER THREE: DEVELOPMENT OF THE CATHOLIC SOCIAL TEACHING: THE CCJP.....</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>3.1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>3.2 MARX AND HIS CHALLENGE OF THE CHURCH/RELIGION.....</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>3.3 CHURCH’S SOCIAL ACTIVITIES 1848 .....</b>	<b>27</b>
<b>3.4 RERUM NOVARUM 1891 .....</b>	<b>29</b>
<b>3.5 AFTER 1891- DURING AND BEFORE VATICAN II: METHODOLOGICAL ENQUIRY .....</b>	<b>30</b>
3.5.1 YCW (YOUNG CHRISTIAN WORKERS) METHODOLOGY .....	31
3.5.2 LIBERATION THEOLOGY IN LATIN AMERICA.....	32
<b>3.6 VATICAN COUNCIL II (1962-1965) AND CCJP .....</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>3.7 CATHOLIC COMMISSION OF JUSTICE AND PEACE IN ZIMBABWE.....</b>	<b>37</b>
3.7.1 THE MANDATE OF THE CCJPZ IS TO.....	37
3.7.2 SOME OF CCJPZ PROGRAMMES.....	38
3.7.3 STRATEGY OF THE COMMISSION .....	38
3.7.4 HOW DOES THE CCJPZ WORK? .....	38
<b>3.8 CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>39</b>
<b>CHAPTER FOUR: DATA PRESENTATION.....</b>	<b>40</b>
<b>4.1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>40</b>
<b>4.2 DATA INDICATING THE CCJPZ’S CONTRIBUTION TO GOOD GOVERNANCE.....</b>	<b>41</b>
4.2.1 ESAP .....	41
4.2.2 ELECTIONS.....	43
4.2.3 CORRUPTION .....	45
4.2.4 VIOLENCE .....	46

4.2.5 CONSTITUTION .....	47
4.2.6 'OTHER' CATEGORY.....	48
<b>4.3 CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>48</b>
<b>CHAPTER FIVE: DATA ANALYSIS .....</b>	<b>49</b>
<b>5.1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>49</b>
<b>5.2 DOES THE DATA ANSWER THE RESEARCH QUESTION? .....</b>	<b>49</b>
<b>5.3 THE CHALLENGES AND RESULTS OF CCJPZ ITS ADVOCACY WORK.....</b>	<b>52</b>
5.3.1 CHALLENGES .....	52
5.3.2 DID THE GOVERNMENT RESPONDED TO CCJPZ'S ADVOCACY EFFORTS? .....	54
<b>5.4 CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>55</b>
<b>CHAPTER SIX: AN ANALYSIS OF THE EFFECTIVENESS OF CCJPZ'S CONTRIBUTION .....</b>	<b>56</b>
<b>6.1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>56</b>
<b>6.2 CONTEXTUALIZING GRAMSCI'S THEORY OF CIVIL SOCIETY.....</b>	<b>56</b>
6.2.1 OUTLINING GRAMSCI THEORY OF CIVIL SOCIETY.....	56
6.2.2 THE CONTEXT OF GRAMSCI AND THE ONE FOCUSED BY THIS STUDY .....	58
<b>6.3 FIRST TRAJECTORY: DID CCJPZ EVER PRESENT ITSELF AS PRO-HEGEMONIC? .....</b>	<b>59</b>
6.3.1 THE CATHOLIC CHURCH'S INSTITUTIONAL AND LEADERSHIP HEGEMONY .....	60
6.3.1.1 The Catholic Church's Political Nature.....	60
6.3.1.2 The Church's Leadership Structures .....	61
6.3.2 CATHOLIC CHURCH'S LEADERSHIP AS PRO-HEGEMONIC .....	62
<b>6.4 SECOND TRAJECTORY: EXAMINING THE COUNTER-HEGEMONIC ACTIVITIES OF CCJPZ .....</b>	<b>63</b>
6.4.1 EVIDENCE OF THE 'WAR OF POSITION' IN CCJPZ'S ACTIVITIES.....	63
6.4.2 A CRITICAL LOOK AT CCJPZ'S CONTRIBUTION .....	64
6.4.3 THE NECESSITY OF THE 'WAR OF MANOEUVRE' IN CCJPZ'S CONTRIBUTION.....	65
<b>6.5 CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>67</b>
<b>CHAPTER SEVEN: GENERAL CONCLUSION.....</b>	<b>69</b>
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY .....</b>	<b>72</b>



# CHAPTER ONE

## INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND: A PREVIEW OF THE STUDY

---

### **1.1 Introduction**

This study offers a critical assessment of the Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace (CCJP's)<sup>1</sup> contribution towards good governance in Zimbabwe from 1990-2000. The documentary resources that constitute the CCJPZ's contribution will be interrogated within the academic discourse of civil society and public policy, with the objective of identifying sign posts for good governance. The study identifies the Church as an essential socio-ecclesia institution. This chapter presents an overview of the following seven fundamental elements that constitutes the road map that serves as a signpost of the study: 1) Background and outline of the problem, Motivation 2) Preliminary literature review and reason for choosing the topic, 3) Research problem and objectives, 4) Research problems and objectives of broader issues to be investigated, 5) Principle theory upon which the research is constructed, 6) Research Methodology, 7) Scope and limitations of the study and general outline of the chapters.

### **1.2 Background and Outline of Research Problem**

After the nation of Zimbabwe became independent in 1980, a number of African governments consistently pleaded for the legislation of one party state. Robert Mugabe, who was Prime Minister and Leader of the Zimbabwean African National Unity Patriotic Front (ZANU PF) gave a speech in 1982 in which he stated: 'we (Zimbabwe) are one state with one society and one nation, that is the political concept we cherish' (The Herald 5<sup>th</sup> August 1982). From 1980-1990 ZANU PF under Mugabe's leadership successfully work towards the achievement of a one party state. As a result, 'the space for opposition parties or any form of advocacy had been diminished; making the prospects of civil society in Zimbabwe appears rather gloomy' (Moyo 1993:13). Within such a context of hegemony and 'government by one party' dominance, other alternative organizational structures with different perspectives on how good governance could be achieved within the context were prohibited so as to allow the ruling authorities to parade the declared unity of the state under one party and one leader. Hence,

---

<sup>1</sup> CCJPZ is a Non-governmental organization run by the Catholic Church.

‘the differences among social groups and between them and the state were never tolerated’ (Moyo 1993:2).

The period between 1990 and 2000 marked the emergence of different civil society groups that challenged the nature of governance in Zimbabwe. This emergence was fuelled by the deteriorating economy due to excessive government spending on things that did not grow the economy to provide employment because their actions were inspired by economically defective social development policies popularized during the 1980s and negative effects of ESAP<sup>2</sup> in the early 1990s (Maposa et al 2011:250).

In 1997, Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace in Zimbabwe (CCJPZ) challenged the legitimacy of Mugabe’s method of governance by releasing a report about the atrocities in Matabeleland<sup>3</sup>, which took place early eighties. In the same year the National Constitution Assembly (NCA) was formed. Its objective was to push for a new constitution as against the existing one, which gave the president excessive power towards the state’s affairs (Musekiwa 2013:22). The NCA comprised of the Zimbabwean Council of Churches (ZCC)<sup>4</sup>, Zimbabwean Congress of Trade Union (ZCTU) leaders and Academics that later comprised the leadership of the main opposition (MDC). The Catholic Church participated indirectly through the Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace (Ruzivo 2008:6-7). In 1999, two years after the formation of the NCA, Movement of Democratic Change (MDC) was formed headed by Trade Union boss Morgan Tsvangirai<sup>5</sup> (Maposa et al 2011:250). What made this political party unique and more threatening to Mugabe is that, unlike the previous opposition parties, its support base was beyond the ethnic divisions. The people who spearheaded the formation of this party were from both prominent Zimbabwean tribes namely Shona and Ndebele.

---

<sup>2</sup> Economic Structural Adjustment Program suggested by the IMF and World Bank as a solution to economic recovery in Zimbabwe.

<sup>3</sup> I will give more details about the Matabeleland atrocities during data presentation in chapter four.

<sup>4</sup> A group of Churches in Zimbabwe in which the Catholic Church is not a full member but an observer.

<sup>5</sup> When Tsvangirai was still the Secretary General of the Zimbabwe Congress of Trade Union (ZCTU), the ZCTU was in the forefront of those who asked Mugabe to quit in 1998 for the first time. Later Mugabe faces the same person as a leader of a very powerful opposition party in 1999.

Significant quantity of literature are available which explicitly document how the Roman Catholic Church (hereafter refer to as the Catholic Church) protested against the colonial imposed Rhodesian government during the Liberation struggle of Zimbabwe. Among the literature is a classic book by Linden entitled *The Catholic Church and the Struggle for Zimbabwe* which gives a detailed account of the contribution of the Catholic Church towards the liberation of Zimbabwe. A key literature which highlight the contribution of the Catholic Church to national development during the post-independence era is an article by Gundani (2007) entitled *Prophecy, Politics and Power: Changing Relations between the Catholic Church and the Zimbabwean State*.

However most of the literature identified for this study seems to recognize that the Catholic Church became less pro-active in its critical engagement with the state after the 1980 experience of independence. This could have been predicated on the notion that they expected much from the new government to address issues of injustices that denied the majority from full participation in the development of the nation. Therefore the Church restricted its critique to the point where some critics would argue that the Catholic Church compromised to the extent that it seems to have 'shared the same bed with the government'. The only dissenting voices within the leadership of the Church came from a few outspoken priests or bishops<sup>6</sup>.

This study therefore seeks to assess the contributions of the Catholic Commission of Justice and Peace towards good governance in Zimbabwe from 1990 to 2000. It explores the extent to which the rise of civil society during this time frame served as a catalyst in the development of the Catholic Church's perspectives and praxis of what constitute the best form of governance that can serve the common good of all Zimbabweans. This study falls under the auspices of civil society and good governance as expressed by Gramsci<sup>7</sup>.

---

<sup>6</sup> Former Archbishop of Bulawayo Rt Rev Pius Ncube

<sup>7</sup> Gramsci's understanding of civil society is expressed in the section six

## **1.3 Preliminary Literature Study, and Reasons for Choosing Topic**

### **1.3.1 Civil Society and the State**

Fatton (1995:77) warns that in any attempt to define civil society, one must be aware that this term can only be conceptualized in plurality not singular. In plurality, this concept offers a better explanatory framework of the dynamics of political struggle than a simplistic and undialectical notion of single unified civil society. Hence, the attempt to define this term does not necessarily imply a scientific conception but a framework to guide this study. It is important to note that in order to conceptualize civil society, one is inevitably confronted with the realization that you cannot successfully think of civil society without considering the identity and purpose of the State.

According to Bratton (1989:416), Hegel saw civil society as an intermediate stage of social organisation between family and the State. This understanding is not strictly a definition of civil society but rather the place where civil society is situated. Therefore, civil society is any group beyond the family but not the State. A civil society according to Hann (1996:2), 'exist when individuals and groups are free to form organisations that function independent to the State's political institutions, and that can mediate between citizen and the State'. This definition emphasizes the mediation role of civil society. This definition can also be understood in situations where civil society works in partnership with the government; for instance, in service delivery where the state is overwhelmed by its responsibilities as a service provider. Hence, a book called '*Improving Public Policy*' argues that 'the state does not need to produce all the services itself in order to function, alternative delivery mechanism exist to customize and maximise' the duties of the state (Cloete & Wissink 2000:183).

The third definition depicts civil society as 'the private sphere of material, cultural and political activities resisting the incursion of the State' (Fatton 1995:67). Fatton further explained that civil society represents a counterweight to the State power and therefore serves as a critical agent of democratization for good governance. This understanding of civil society relates it to the State in conflictual terms. In this sense, 'civil society functions as a constant thorn in the monopolizing political claims of the State' (Fatton 1995:67). This study looks at the relationship

of civil society to the state in situations where civil society is unsatisfied with the way the State is being governed, within Zimbabwe. Cox (1999) in his article *Civil Society at the Turn of the Millennium: Prospects for an Alternative World Order* argues that the meaning of civil society has changed considerably. Some critics view it as opposing the State while others view it as strengthening the state's ideologies. As indicated by Cox's article mentioned above, Antonio Gramsci's perspective acknowledges both meanings. For Gramsci, civil society can sustain hegemony and can also be the source upon which an emancipatory counter hegemony could be constructed. This study dwells on the latter because the contemporary Zimbabwean political context needs to be channelled towards an alternative socio-political order.

This study views civil society in relation to good governance. Warren, M E (1999) in his article *Civil Society and Good governance* argues that although "good governance" is always contestable, linking the concept to civil society enables an appeal to the ethical intuitions already embedded in the concept. Good governance, viewed through civil society, already suggests the liberal-democratic good of joint self-governance. Civil society associations provide people with the ability to organize collective actions; they also provide the ability to resist what they do not like—sometimes graciously, through the vote or through gathering and distributing information or civil disobedience.

Even if the Church falls within the definition of civil society as expressed by the above definitions, she has been seen as a separate entity from civil society groups because of its predominantly theological/spiritual character. It is important to note that this study does not identify the Church as a social movement devoid of spirituality, but it highlights that social activities of the Church are actually central to the definition of its spirituality. Therefore, advocacy becomes an essential part of the Church's being. It is in this sense that this study sees the CCJPZ as a civil society group. It is also important to note that the Catholic Commission of Justice and Peace falls under the umbrella of The Zimbabwe Human Rights NGO Forum. CCJPZ is a Catholic branch responsible for teaching and disseminating of the Catholic social teachings or the Church's socio-political engagements. This study looks specifically at the activities of this organisation and not at the Catholic Church in general. However, reference to the general work

of the Catholic Church is necessary only as a way of recognizing that the CCJPZ is answerable to the episcopal conference of governance within the Church (the Catholic Bishops' senate).

### **1.3.2 Civil Society and Good Governance in Zimbabwe**

In response to the crisis of governance in Zimbabwe, a number of books and articles have been written indicating how civil society can advocate for good governance in Zimbabwe; however, only two books and an article were more relevant because they looked specifically on the Church's contribution towards good governance. The first literature resource is a book by Dube entitled *A Socio-political Agenda for the Twenty-first Century Zimbabwean Church* written in 2005. Dube was convinced that the Church has a responsibility to step in, in a bid to alleviate this crisis. According to him, the Church has failed to engage with the state because it 'does not only lack a socio-political theology, but it has yet to find its own effective way of relating to the state'. Dube was referring to the Methodist Church, which by that time did not know how to deal with the State. However, in 2007 an article was written by Gundani about the Catholic Church, which has many years of experience in dealing with the State.

This article is entitled *Prophecy, Politics and Power: Changing Relations between the Catholic Church and the Zimbabwean State* and it investigates the role played by the Catholic Church in Zimbabwe since 1980. The author specifically looks at the way the Catholic Church exercised her prophetic role within the changing social, political and economic environment since independence. The paper interrogates the role of the Catholic Church in Zimbabwe since independence in 1980. Gundani seems to be satisfied with the way the Catholic Church expressed its prophetic/political voice. Four years after this article was written another book was published in 2011 entitled *Zimbabwean Political Crisis: The Catholic Church on the Crossroads* by Phiri. This book takes further the argument of Gundani by not just being satisfied by the way the Catholic Church engaged with the State but by evaluating the effectiveness of its prophetic voice in the post- independence Zimbabwe.

What makes this study unique and different from Phiri and Gundani is that it uses the publications of the Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace in Zimbabwe (CCJPZ) and its annual reports, thus in addition to the pastoral letters; Whereas, Phiri and Gundani only used

the Bishop's pastoral letters as the basis of their analysis of the Catholic Church's contribution towards good governance in Zimbabwe. This study argues that the pastoral letters do not give adequate presentation of the of the Church's contribution since they excludes the work of CCJPZ and its annual reports. Phiri and Gundani's writings cover a period of more than twenty-five years of Zimbabwean post-independence, which this study find to be too wide for a focused analysis. Therefore in order to facilitate in depth study focus is specifically concentrate on a ten year period (1990-2000) instead. Unlike Phiri and Gundani who looked at the Catholic Church in general this study gives focus attention to the work of the Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace Zimbabwe (CCJPZ), which function as a civil society Catholic organisation responsible for the Church's social engagement in collegiality with the Bishops.

Gundani and Phiri's writings seem to view religious organisations such as the Catholic Church as predominately spiritual entity in which engaging in social issue is just part of its ministry. This study shows that social involvement is at the heart of faith communities' spiritual life. Therefore, their quest for justice becomes the basis of the authenticity of their spiritual life not vice versa. In this sense, advocating for justice is not done out of charity but defines the heart and soul of their ministry, mission and the essence of their spirituality. This study recognizes the CCJPZ as having the status of civil society organisation as any other secular group involved in advocacy. It is important for secular organisations that doubt the Church's credibility as Marx<sup>8</sup> did in the nineteenth century, to recognise that the Catholic Church is the first civil society group to push for the need to recognize human rights<sup>9</sup> as an essential international right. This study further tries to show that religious organisations in their capacity as civil society groups can stimulate more favourable conditions which promote good governance. In the light of the above discourse the core research problem of this study seeks to assess the contribution of the CCJPZ towards good governance in Zimbabwe from 1990-2000.

---

<sup>8</sup> Chapter three will provide some more information about Marx's attitude towards religion.

<sup>9</sup> Until this day, the Dominican Catholic Church Order is still closely associated with the department of Human rights of the United Nations. The representative of the Dominicans is a South African- Fr Mike Deeb. He is a former director of the Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace in South Africa.

## 1.4 Key Research Questions

The research question that undergirds this study states: What contribution has the CCJPZ made towards the Promotion of Good governance in Zimbabwe from 1990-2000?

The following are further sub-questions to be asked in order to clarify the above question:

- What is the identity and vocation of the CCJPZ and what is the nature of its relationship and engagement with the Zimbabwean state?
- What were the challenges that the CCJPZ experienced from 1990-2000?
- What were the successes that the CCJPZ experienced from 1990-2000?
- What were the results of the encounter and how did they influence the nature of governance in Zimbabwe?

## 1.5 Objectives the Study

- Identify the identity and vocation of the CCJPZ and assess its contribution made towards good governance in Zimbabwe from 1990-2000.
- Assess the challenges that the CCJPZ experienced from 1990-2000 in its experience with the nature of engagement between the state and CCJPZ
- Assess the challenges and successes of the engagement
- Critically assess the outcome of CCJPZ's engagement

## 1. 6. Broader Issues to be Investigated

Karl Marx took the pleasure to describe religion as the *opium of the people*; this is reflected in his document entitled *Economic and Philosophic Manuscript 1844*<sup>10</sup>. What prompted this statement was the nature of the Church's activities, which ignored the socio-political situation of the people because it was preoccupied with heavenly programmes. Gollwitzer (1970:19) comments that the comparison of religion with opium was a common phenomenon in the

---

<sup>10</sup> Details and references of Marx will be highlighted in Chapter three.



nineteenth century and was associated with romanticism movements of revival with their emotional excitement and individualistic interest in the salvation may have given occasion to such comparison. The following broader questions can be asked about the Church:

### **1.6.1 Broader Questions**

- Has the Church evolved from its nineteenth century perceived religious mentality which has nothing or very little to do with social issues?
- Can the Church function consistently as a civil society group which is pro-social or it prioritises its spiritual character to the detriment of its social involvement?
- How does the Church explain its theological understanding of good governance?
- Does the Church's predominately spiritual identity enhances or undermines its engagement in issues related to advocacy and good governance?

### **1.6.2 Broader objectives**

- Assess whether the Church has evolved from its nineteenth century perceived religious mentality which has nothing to do engagement with social issues.
- Assess whether the Church can be relied on to function consistently as a civil society group which is pro-social or it succumbs to prioritise its spiritual character to the detriment of good governance?
- Assess whether the Church defines its theological identity in relation to issues of good governance?
- To assess whether the Church's predominately spiritual character enhances or undermines its engagement in issues related to advocacy for good governance?

## **1.7 Principal Theories upon which the Research Project is Constructed**

As indicated in the literature review, civil society engages with the State in different ways, the nature of this engagement determines the role of civil society. As spelt out by the literature review, civil society is a partner with the government in the service delivery sector. Within the policy making processes, which include participation, their relationship varies. In this category the State and civil society are not necessarily construed as strategic partners because civil

society plays the role of a watchdog. It is not surprising to realise that many definitions of civil society normally reflects a conflictual rather than a harmonised relation of the State and civil society. Such a conflict is normally determined by the political situation of the State in question. If the State's nature of governance is questionable, like in Zimbabwe, normally civil society groups like, the CCJPZ, are forced to confront the State and challenge it to conform to good governance as stipulated by the constitution. The understanding of Gramsci on civil society as a guiding theory constitutes the reference point of this study.

According to Gramsci, civil society is the arena, apart from the 'State and markets, in which ideological hegemony is contested, implying that civil society contained a wide range of organisations, which both challenge and upheld the existing order' (Lewis 2001:2). Cox (1999:3) argues the 'Gramsci's perspective embraced both meanings: civil society was the ground that sustained the hegemony of the bourgeoisie but also that on which an emancipatory counter hegemony could be constructed'. Civil society, in Gramsci's thinking, is the realm in which the existing social order is grounded; and it can also be the realm in which a new social order can be founded. 'His concern with civil society was, first, to understand the strength of the status quo, and then to devise a strategy for its transformation' (Cox 1999:4). It could be argued that Gramsci's confrontational strategy of civil society against totalitarian states is reflected in the relationship of the CCJPZ and the Zimbabwean government.

### **1.8 Research Method**

This study is a qualitative research that involves an extensive literature review and documentary analysis of the advocacy of CCJPZ<sup>11</sup> from 1990-2000. The focus is directed on relevant library information from published or unpublished material, magazines, newspapers and articles from the internet. My literature search on the subject is done in the libraries of the University of KwaZulu-Natal and the archives of the CCJPZ in Harare and Bulawayo-Zimbabwe.

In an attempt to analyse the contribution of the CCJPZ towards good governance in Zimbabwe this study used three principle sources namely the Annual reports of CCJPZ, CCJPZ's

---

<sup>11</sup> The study will be using the words 'CCJPZ' and 'the Commission' interchangeably.

publications/newsletters and the Zimbabwean Bishops' pastoral letters that focuses on good governance. The Pastoral letters and CCJPZ are official publications not just a product of theological reflection of the bishops but products of wide consultation that take place prior to publication. The Bishops work closely with the CCJPZ, a research institute and a civil society group of the Catholic Church. The CCJPZ seeks legal advice on legislation and advises the Bishops' Conference accordingly. It is also the channel of communication between the Bishops and the faithful, keeping the Bishops informed of the suffering and complaints of the people. Actually, the Commission<sup>12</sup> recommends to the Bishops to 'speak out' through Pastoral letters. 'On many occasions these letters and statements were drafted with the assistance of CCJPZ members' in accordance to the Catholic social teachings (Auret 1992:105). It is in this sense that they represent genuine thinking and position of the Catholic Church. CCJPZ's annual reports and newsletters are easily obtainable as hard copies in any branch of the CCJPZ both in Harare and Bulawayo.

### **1.9 Limitations and Scope of the Study**

This chapter has already specified the scope and limitations of the study especially the last part of the preliminary literature review. The study's focus is on the Catholic Church's socio-political engagement in Zimbabwe from 1990 to 2000. The research gives specific emphasis on the Catholic Church's social activities; hence CCJPZ is the object of analysis. Since CCJPZ cannot be adequately understood apart from the Catholic Church which is predominantly a religious institution, the spiritual perspective of the church will only be used if it is meant to support the social life of the Church. The contribution of the CCJPZ exclusively focuses on good governance. The study uses Gramsci as a critical assessment tool and Marx as a force which contributed towards reminding the Church of its contextual irrelevance to the plight of the workers/poor.

### **1.10 Data Analysis**

The study uses Content Analysis, which is 'any technique for making inferences by objectively and systematically identifying specified characteristics of messages' (quoted by Babbie &

---

<sup>12</sup> The Commission refers to CCJPZ

Mouton 2012:492 in Roller et al 1995:167). Since there are two types of Content Analysis namely Conceptual Analysis and Relational Analysis, this study uses the former. According to Palmguist (1993) as quoted by Babbie & Mouton (2012:192) Conceptual analysis consist of eight processes of which I have used the following six namely

- deciding on the level on analysis
- deciding on how many concepts to code for
- decide on how to distinguish among concepts
- developing rules for the coding of text
- coding text
- analysing results

### **1.11 Dissertation Structure**

**Chapter one:** This chapter introduces the fundamental elements of the thesis. These fundamental elements give the reader a road map, which defines the heart of the study.

**Chapter two:** This chapter concentrates on two essential elements, namely, the theory which guides this research and the literature written around the subject matter of this study, which will ultimately lead -to the questions this thesis is engaging.

**Chapter three:** The main objective of this chapter is to describe the nature of engagement and organisation of Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace in Zimbabwe (CCJPZ) as a civil society group. Such a description can only be possible if we look at the historical development of different councils and documents which culminated into the present social teaching of the Catholic Church

**Chapter four:** Data Presentation: The data on the contribution towards good governance by the CCJPZ from 1990 to 2000 will be presented according to relevant themes.

**Chapter five:** Data analysis: The data in chapter four is analysed using content and interpretative data analysis method in a bid to discover if the collected data is answering the research question. This chapter highlights difficulties the Commission faced and the data on whether the objectives of the Commission's contribution were realized or not?

**Chapter Six:** An Assessment of the Effectiveness of CCJPZ: This chapter evaluate the contribution of CCJPZ using Gramsci's theoretical framework as an assessment standard.

### **1.12 Conclusion**

This chapter has indicated what questions this research seeks to answer. The chapter has also highlighted the objectives which should be reached by the end of this research. The research proceeds from the ideal assumption that governments and civil societies have to be partners in dispensing service delivery to citizens. For this reason, civil society is morally and politically bound to question governments or rulers that turn on their people. As indicated in the chapter, the research is qualitative in its manner and hence the mode of analysis to be used is one that is germane to qualitative inquiries. The ensuing chapter delves into the literature that has preceded this research on the subject of governance in Zimbabwe and how the CCJPZ has tried to influence it. The same chapter also includes the theoretical framework.

## CHAPTER TWO

### LITERATURE REVIEW AND THE THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

---

#### 2.1 Introduction

This chapter concentrates on two essential elements namely, the theory which will guide this research and the literature written around the subject matter of this study, which will ultimately invite questions this thesis is trying to engage. The literature review focuses on three essential areas namely 1) Church and advocacy in general, 2) Church advocacy in Zimbabwe and 3) The advocacy of the Catholic Church in Zimbabwe. The theoretical framework employs Gramsci's perspectives on civil society and the political community<sup>13</sup> as the lens through which we interrogate the contribution of CCJPZ towards good governance in Zimbabwe. An emphasis will be stressed on the relational dynamics of domination, hegemony, counter-hegemony and civil society.

#### 2.2 Literature Review

##### 2.2.1 Church and Advocacy

Whenever the words such as 'church' and 'religion' are mentioned, they seem to link religious organisations within the environmental realm of spiritual or heavenly discourse. Such a response is common because the discourse on religion tend to be associated with either issues surrounding spirituality, heaven and in most cases God. Religious organisations are also involved in social issue but such involvement at times tends to be peripheral because they are construed to be secondary to the spiritual realm. Since the criticism of religion which was popularize by Karl Marx in the nineteenth century through the words *opium of the people*<sup>14</sup>, there has been a shift in the relationship of the church's spiritual emphasis and its social engagement. Quite a number of writers have pointed out that social actions are central to the spiritual character of the church or religious organisation. These writers include Dietrich Bonhoffer, Alistair Kee, Joseph Cardijn and Gustavo Guitierrez.

---

<sup>13</sup> What is normally regarded as the state or the governing body of a government or country- policy making body

<sup>14</sup> The source of this quotation is highlighted in chapter three.

Bonhoeffer (1955) in the third section on 'State and Church' reveals that the Church cannot be understood exclusively in spiritual terms. For Bonhoeffer, a Christian does not live in a vacuum but in a world of government, politics and labour. Therefore, Christian ethics cannot exist in a vacuum. What the Christian ethics needs is a concrete instruction to respond to in a concrete contextual situation. The roots and background of Christian ethics is the reality of God as revealed in Jesus Christ. This reality is not manifest in the Church as distinct from the secular world such a juxtaposition of two separate sphere is a denial of God's having reconciled the whole world to himself in Christ. On the contrary, Gods' commandment is to be found and known in the Church, the family, labour and government.

Reinforcing what Bonhoeffer said above Kee (1974) states that God is not the God of metaphysical or heavenly scheme exclusively but also God of history, of society, of future -all in the concrete sense of the gospel of God's way of humankind in Jesus Christ. The transcendence of God does not necessarily result in the alienation of humanity, nor does God divest humans of their historical and social constitutive identity. It is God's transcendence which sets the agenda and situation of humanity that informs their identity and purpose.

Cardijn (1995) argues that it is inevitable for the Church to be involved in issues of good governance because the earthly life is the foundation upon which eternal life can be built upon. There cannot be heaven without earth because our heavenly destiny is derived from the temporal life. It is in this sense that the eternal destiny can never be separated from our earthly destiny than religion is separated from morality. Therefore, social, political or economic activities are central to the life of the church.

Gutierrez (1979) is convinced that amidst violence the Church should be part of a revolutionary process; this process is what defines its mission. The Church must place itself within the process of revolution. His argument goes further to assert that the Church's mission is defined practically and theoretically, pastorally and theologically in relation to this revolutionary

process. The missional agenda of the Church is therefore defined and set more so by the realities of the socio-political context than the inner challenges of the church.

This thesis does not endeavour to change the Church into a social movement devoid of its spirituality. Rather the object is to highlight that social activities of the Church are actually central to the definition of its spirituality. Therefore, advocacy becomes an essential part of the Church's being.

### **2.2.2 Church's Advocacy in Zimbabwe**

Ruzivo (2008) argues that Christian Churches in their public role in the democratisation process in Zimbabwe continue to exercise their moral influence. The Catholic Church, Evangelical and Pentecostal churches, and Protestant churches participated in the democratisation of the country through their para church agencies such as the Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace, Evangelical Fellowship of Zimbabwe, and the Zimbabwe Council of Churches. These church organisations continue to engage the State on the political processes of the country.

Matikiti (2008) explores the Church's role in promoting multi-party democracy during the colonial era, with particular emphasis on the post-independence era, characterized by the dominance of one political party. As Verstraelen (1998) has illustrated that the Church can exercise its ethical task or prophetic mission vis-à-vis politics on different levels by condemning the tyranny of unjust rulers and demanding democratic political space for all citizens. He further outlines the background of Zimbabwe's struggle for freedom and nationhood, spanning the interactive dynamics between religious and political forces during colonialism, to the birth of a new nation, and later searching for a multi-party democracy. Verstraelen argues that the Church in Zimbabwe exists in a socio-political economic context of struggle and change and must, as a matter of urgency, define its role in the quest for the promotion of democratic values in the country.

Dube (2006) appreciates the contribution of the Church towards good governance but still attests to the fact that the Zimbabwean Church was not effective because it lacked political acts



of theological imagination. For him, the involvement of the Church was sporadic instead of consistent and systematic.

### **2.2.3 The Catholic Church and Advocacy**

Gundani (2008) investigates the role played by the Catholic Church in Zimbabwe since independence in 1980. Of particular interest is the way in which the Catholic Church has exercised her prophetic office within the changing social, political and economic environment since independence. Although there are many ways of approaching the subject, Gundani decided to interrogate the role of the Church in the past 27 years on the basis of bishops' pastoral letters. Firstly, they are ready resources available for any study of the Catholic because they are published for public consumption.

Secondly, they are themselves a product not only of the theological reflections of the Bishops but of wide consultation that takes place prior to their publication. In this sense, they genuinely represent the thinking and position of the Catholic Church on issues discussed in the article. In the article Gundani focuses only on three issues, namely, Church and state relations; reconciliation; and governance. His conclusion is that the prophetic voice of the Catholic Church in Zimbabwe was compromised by its proximity to state power in the first years of independence. However, as the State became more and more distanced from the people and began to politicize every aspect of life, the Bishops finally managed to recover their prophetic voice, and have since 2000 come out openly in defense of the oppressed and marginalized citizens.

Three years after Gundani wrote his article, Phiri (2011) evaluated the effectiveness of the Catholic Church's prophetic voice in the post-independence Zimbabwe. He demonstrated that the Catholic Church has made great strides in its efforts to promote good governance in Zimbabwe. The book further expresses dissatisfaction towards the nature of its advocacy claimed that the prophetic voice of the Catholic Church lacked dialogue. The lack of dialogue is expressed by two trajectories or perspectives, which showed that the Catholic Church's dialogical method is non-empathetic. The first trajectory looked at the Catholic Church's

authoritative voice in dialogue, which is prescriptive and non-consultative mode of governance in respect to the opinion of her worshippers. The other trajectory focused on the failure of the Catholic Church in Zimbabwe to speak with one voice, since one faction of the clergy compromised with the State instead of empathising with it. Both trajectories witness to the failure of the Catholic Church to effectively engage with the State.

Phiri (2011) proposed a dialogical prophetic voice, which is empathetic and engaging. His proposal points to a prophetic voice that understands the context of the State without compromising with it on what are the fundamentals of its faith; but having the capacity to work in partnership with others with the objective to constructively work for the common good. Phiri has therefore suggested an Empathetic Dialogical Method as central and foundational to an effective dialogical process.

Like Gundani, Phiri uses the Bishops' pastoral letter as evidence of the Catholic Church's contribution towards good governance in Zimbabwe. Their survey concentrated more on the relationship of the Catholic Church and the State and generally looked at the post-independent Zimbabwe. However this study examines civil society in Zimbabwe and focus specifically on the period when Zimbabwe faced political instability and economic hardship that stimulated the formation and regrouping of civil society groups which were either thwarted or relaxed in the 1980s. This includes the Catholic Commission of Justice and Peace that constitutes the specific focus of this study as it examines its engagement with the Zimbabwean State for a ten year period from 1990-2000.

### **2.3 Theoretical Framework**

The researcher is convinced that any appropriate framework has to possess a striking similarity with the context upon which it is going to guide. That particular framework also has to be relevant to the objectives the intended study wants to achieve. These two important elements will be used to evaluate the suitability of the framework, which is going to be used in this study. A relevant framework should be based on the definition of civil society since such a definition

can determine the nature of relationship that a particular civil society group has with the State. As once expressed in the preliminary literature review<sup>15</sup>, civil society relates with the government in different ways. This section will endeavour to show that Gramsci's understanding of civil society provides an appropriate framework for this study.

### **2.3.1 A Brief Description of Gramsci's Context**

Antonio Gramsci was born towards the end of the 20<sup>th</sup> Century in Italy, at 20 while at the university he met a future Communist leader Palmiro Togliari who influenced his socialist ideas (Rugger 2010: On line 25 July 2013). After two years he was convinced that all the problems of underdevelopment will be solved in the context of Socialist policies. By 1915, he wrote regularly about the cultural question in which he stressed on the importance of educating the workers for revolution (Rugger 2010: On line 25 July 2013). Gramsci's understanding of the oppressed was not limited to the workers like in Marx's case; he used Lenin's strategy which included the peasants as well.

Gramsci assumed leadership of the Communist party in Italy, the same time Mussolini seized power in 1922 (Rugger 2010: On line 25 July 2013). During his tenure in office he was critical of the lethal character of fascism<sup>16</sup> and was arrested in 1926. Three years later, in prison, Gramsci started to write his famous *Prison Notebooks*, out of which his political thought is well explained. This theoretical framework will use his writings on hegemony, domination and counter-hegemony; out of this one should be able to understand his unique understanding of civil society and the State. Socialist ideology endeavours to exalt civil society, of which in Marx's time it was the workers, in Gramsci time it was the workers and the peasant and in contemporary era it involves numerous non-governmental organisations.

### **2.3.2 Gramsci and the Zimbabwean Context**

A socialist such as Gramsci from a communist background would inevitably use the word like 'revolution' as central to his vocabulary. In contemporary democracies it might seem overrated

---

<sup>15</sup> See Chapter One

<sup>16</sup> An authoritarian nationalist political ideologies or mass movements that are concerned with notions of cultural decline and seek to achieve a national rebirth by exalting the nation or race, and promoting cults of unity, strength and purity (newworldencyclopedia.org/entry/fascism- accessed 15 October 2013)

and radical but in the context of Zimbabwe, the term is appropriate because the nation has been subjected to a political leadership which has held the civil society in bondage since independence in 1980<sup>17</sup>. The liberation politics<sup>18</sup> has been used as a license to control the civil society/masses and hold them ransom for the past thirty-three years. Only radical transformation within the political system can root out this hegemonic and dominant political scourge. There is a need to change the present political system in Zimbabwe and Gramsci's understanding of civil society offers one way in which such a change is possible. Before the researcher go into Gramsci's understanding of civil society and the conditions necessary for it to change an oppressive status quo, it is important to point out the state in which Gramsci's philosophy can be understood.

### **2.3.3 Clarification of Gramsci's Philosophy or Political Thought**

Firstly, Gramsci's understanding of the State is slightly different from what is expressed by most of the literature explored earlier in this in this study. Generally, the State is referred to as individuals and structures, which constitutes those who are part of the policy making body (rulers). The State is normally distinguished from the civil society, which constitutes the ruled masses, who can influence policy but hardly participate in formulating it. For Gramsci, as expressed in his Prison Notes as indicated by Cox (1999:4), what is normally called the State he calls the political society. The State in Gramsci's understanding is the aggregate of both the political society and civil society. It is for this reason that civil society is responsible for both hegemony and counter-hegemony.

Secondly, Gramsci was not concerned with building an abstract theory or a system of political analysis that would stand the test of time. He was concerned with changing his world (Cox 1999:4). Contrary to Karl Marx, who anticipated an inevitable and scientific revolutionary change, Gramsci anticipated voluntary change, which ultimately rests in the hands of the civil society. Therefore any development of his thinking arise from both the reflection on the condition of the world as it is, and serve as a guide to action designed to change the world so as

---

<sup>17</sup> See chapter four: The presentation of data, this chapter shows how the people of Zimbabwe are treated by the ruling party.

<sup>18</sup> This is a politics which gives permission to the war heroes to rule the country as a necessary condition earned during the liberation struggle.

to improve the lot of humanity's social equity. Civil society in Gramsci's thinking, as highlighted by Cox (1999:4), 'is the realm in which the existing social order is grounded; and it can also be the realm in which a new social order can be founded'. His concern with civil society was its capacity to facilitate societal change and then to devise a strategy for its transformation. The emancipatory potential of civil society was the object of his thinking (Cox 1999:4).

### **2.3.4 Relating Civil Society with Domination, Hegemony and Counter-Hegemony**

*Domination and hegemony:* This section highlights the relationship of civil society and the State authorities in cases where the civil society is controlled and subjected to opposition from political authority or dominant groups. Gramsci was convinced that the dominant groups maintain their position through coercion of political society. Even under such conditions, civil society can actively participate but this participation tends to be as a result of consent through hegemony. The active participation of the Zimbabwean civil society in support of the dominant groups/elite is upheld through violence and infliction of fear by the political community<sup>19</sup>. The Zimbabwean populace is afraid of the regime to the extent where they listen to their commands without any resistance.

The use of force in the process of domination is the sphere that Gramsci recognised as the 'political society'. Simon (1990:71) defines the political society as 'the armed forces, police, law courts and prisons, together with all the administrative departments concerning taxation finance, trade, industry, social security, etc...'. The political society according to Gramsci (2003:12) is the 'apparatus of state coercive power' its duty is to discipline those groups who do not consent to the whims of the leading group. The State, or governing group, only turns to coercive strategies if efforts to influence consent fail. Consent to command is developed within civil society. It is an internalized form of authority that differs from the external, 'direct domination' achieved through the coercive force of political society (Gramsci, 2003:12). Civil society can therefore be defined as another branch of the state, apart from the political community, which follows and maintains supremacy. Social order is created by the leading group where 'a common social-moral language is spoken, in which one concept of reality is

---

<sup>19</sup> This rule by fear and violence is mentioned in the Chapter four under political violence as part of collected data.

dominant, informing with its spirit all modes of thought and behaviour' (Femia, 1981:24). In Zimbabwe, during the 1990s when the people were losing faith in the ruling party, the party decided to introduce liberation songs in all television and radio stations. This was accompanied by speeches, which labelled the opposition as conspiring with colonisers. This was meant to convince the civil servants to maintain their support of the ruling class.

Hence, domination is not simply attained through the alignment of the free choices of subordinate groups. Consent is actively created within civil society. Hegemony is pursued through 'extremely complex mediums, diverse institutions, and constantly changing processes' (Buttigieg, 1995:7). 'Through their presence and participation in various institutions, cultural activities, and many other forms of social interaction, the dominant classes 'lead' the society in certain directions' (Buttigieg, 2005:44). Hegemony operates through the social institutions of civil society: the Church, the educational system, the press, all the bodies which help create in people certain modes of behaviour and expectations consistent with the hegemonic social order. Gramsci's civil society is best defined not as the sphere of liberty but of domination as well (Buttigieg, 1995:6).

*Counter-hegemony:* Gramsci presented two methods that can be used to challenge hegemony, namely a *war of manoeuvre* and a *war of position*. The former comprises of physically overwhelming the coercive mechanism of the State. However, the success of this strategy depends on the nature of the state's hegemony, that is, its position within civil society. The strategies in the war of manoeuvre include direct confrontation e.g. armed uprising, general strike, etc. Such strategies will not threaten the dominant groups so long as their credibility and authority is firmly rooted in civil society. Buttigieg notes, 'civil society, in other words, far from being a threat to political society in a liberal democracy, reinforces it—this is the fundamental meaning of hegemony' (Buttigieg, 2005:41).

However, Gramsci does not give up on the idea of radical change in liberal democracies because he was a writer chiefly focused on a radical change of capitalist society. His main concern was 'how might a more equitable and just order be brought about, and what is it about

how people live and imagine their lives in particular times and places that advances or hampers progress to this more equitable and just order' (Crehan, 2002:71). It was Gramsci's view that 'one should refrain from facile rhetoric about direct attacks against the State and concentrate instead on the difficult and immensely complicated tasks that a *war of position* within civil society entails' (Buttigieg, 2005:41). Described by Gramsci as 'the only viable possibility in the West,' a *war of position* is resistance to domination with culture, rather than physical might, as its foundation (Gramsci, 2007:168). Cox understands a *war of position* as process which 'slowly builds up the strength of the social foundations of a new state' by 'creating alternative institutions and alternative intellectual resources within existing society' (Cox, 1983:165). For Gramsci, issues of culture are what lie at the heart of any radical project; culture is 'how class is lived,' it shapes how people see their world and how they manoeuvre within in it and, more importantly, 'it shapes their ability to imagine how it might be changed, and whether they see such changes as possible or desirable' (Crehan, 2002:71).

A preliminary research made by the researcher indicates that CCJPZ's activities were more inclined to the *war of position* than the *war of manoeuvre*. Therefore, this study argues that both the *war of position* and the *war of manoeuvre* are necessary towards achieving good governance in Zimbabwe. The present government has culturally influenced the political will of the people through propaganda and violence<sup>20</sup>; to undo such a systematic intellectual domination will take time. *War of manoeuvre* can help speed up the process by making the political community realize that they are not immune to political winds of change; and reminded of the irreverence of their policies.

## **2.4 Conclusion**

This chapter has shown that though the Church is primarily a religious institution, it has a responsibility to all facets of human life. Karl Marx, who rued religion's inactivity in non-

---

<sup>20</sup> See chapter four and five

religious matters by calling it the opium of the people, was indirectly imploring the Church not to ignore the welfare of people outside the confines of religion. From the time of Marx, theologians like Dietrich Bonhoeffer have written extensively that the Church should not be clinically detached from social responsibility. From this broader perspective, the chapter also looked at the specific case of Zimbabwe and how the Church has been (in)active in trying to entrench good governance.

The second part of the essay explained the theoretical framework which will be applied for this research. Antonio Gramsci, an Italian politician is the inspiration behind the theoretical framework to be used in this research. Gramsci divided society into the political and civil society, arguing that the civil society, which harbours no political ambitions, can either be pro-hegemony or counter-hegemony. Using the theoretical framework, the research will try and determine how the CCJPZ, in its endeavour not to be tethered to the government and its form of rule, has performed in Zimbabwe, a country which has remained largely unchanged despite calls for better governance.



## **CHAPTER THREE**

### **DEVELOPMENT OF THE CATHOLIC SOCIAL TEACHING: THE CCJP**

---

#### **3.1 Introduction**

This chapter will focus on the development of the CCJP of which the CCJPZ is a subsidiary. In order to understand the development of CCJP, it is politic to delve into historic moments that compelled the Church to become more responsive to the social wellbeing of the society.

The chapter will start with Karl Marx and how he played a seminal role in awaking the Church from its confinement to the spiritual matters, and was arguably indifferent to the political, economic and social injustice of people. After Marx vilified religion as the opium of the people, lazy escape from earthly suffering with the promise of heavenly bliss, there was a development of Church literature to challenge this view. The Catholic Church in particular embarked on writings that were partly made to repudiate Marx's hostility to the conduct of the Church. One of the most influential repositories of the Church's intent to care for sundry needs of its adherents was the *Rerum Novarum*, an encyclical letter which proclaimed the sympathy of the Church with the plight of exploited workers.

The development of liberation theology in Latin America was a very instructive way through which Catholic theologians grew more aware of the role that the Church can play in campaigning for political rectitude and economic justice. From the publication of the *Rerum Novarum*, the next momentous event which reiterated the transformation of the Church from an institution which was exclusively theological to one which was moving apace with the world was the Second Vatican Council (1962-1965). It was actually at Vatican Council II that the development of the Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace (CCJP) was mooted. For this reason, the search will talk about liberation theology, Vatican Council II as part of the development of CCJP.

From this background, the chapter will then culminate into the details of the CCJPZ. The researcher will give the background of the CCJPZ, its programmes, its strategy and its aims. The rationale behind the addition of Marx, liberation theology and the Vatican Council, and the

minor details about the Young Christian Workers (YCW) resides in the fact that the advocacy of the CCJPZ in Zimbabwe could not be understood in a vacuum, without reference to matters that played a formative role in the development of the Church's social advocacy.

### **3.2 Marx and his Challenge for the Church/Religion**

Karl Marx is well known for his support of communism. He was a stout opponent of Capitalism as an ideology that was exploitative and valued profit to the detriment of human dignity. Though Marx was a militant atheist, he argued for communism because of his concern with the poor. This concern was akin to the concern that the Church manifests in its social responsibility. Marx took it as his responsibility to stand on behalf of the poor and initiated a philosophy that was intimately connected to the experiences of the poor. This philosophy is informed with the real conditions of the poor in the nineteenth century. Alienation is the key word which Marx uses in describing the state which people were in, when they were stripped of their dignity. This is eloquently expressed by Marx in the *Economic and Philosophic Manuscript 1844*.

Marx is arguably the biggest influence on how the Church has tried to act on its social responsibility from the nineteenth century. He described religion as 'the opium of the people' (Marx 1844: on line) in his *Critique of Hegel's Philosophy of Right*<sup>21</sup> (1844). His antipathy to religion was based largely on how it ignored the poor conditions of workers. The comparison of religion with intoxication was common during Marx's time. For instance, Heinrich Heine in 1840 commented that 'for men whom earth has nothing more to offer, heaven is invented... Hail to the invention. Hail to a religion which poured for a suffering race of men some sweet narcotic in to their bitter cup, spiritual opium, a few drops of love and hope and faith' (Gollwitzer 1970:18). The reason beyond the dictum that religion was opium was that it forestalled the abused believers from changing their circumstances because of the religious promise of an idyllic afterlife. For this reason, believers could just resign themselves to their deplorable but changeable conditions. On these grounds, it is plausible to argue that the development of social concern in the Church after Marx was largely due to the realization that the Church was truly

---

<sup>21</sup> This is a subsection found in Marx's *The Economic and Philosophical Manuscript* (1844)

abstracted from the real life experience of people. Gollwitzer argues, that it should be emphasized that attacking religion was not a central theme in Marx's thought. Religion was just one of the institutions that did not question the unjust nature of the world in which the rich exploit the poor with impunity (Gollwitzer 1970:11).

One of the first known Catholic leaders to write on the Church's social involvement was Bishop Kettler. Some writers like Walsh and Davies (1984) have argued that Bishop Kettler's advocacy of the rights of workers in the nineteenth century was influenced by the structures of medieval German not by the experience of industrial society. They further went on to say Bishop Kettler was sympathetic with ideas of socialism not economic liberalism (Walsh & Davies 1984:xii). Though the researcher cannot dismiss this argument, it can still be argued that Marx had an influence on Kettler. Kettler writes his book nineteen years after the prevailing of Marx's socialist ideology, which by then had spread like veld fire. Will it not be logical to say, since the Church never had any social movement which aimed at improving the condition of the poor, Kettler heed the call of Marx and did something about it? This chapter traces the development of the social teaching of the Catholic starting from the perspective of Marx. My bone of contention is that one perspective cannot be accepted at the expensive of the other; hence our preference does not have to be perceived as exclusive but an opportunity to widen our knowledge base and the horizon of our consciousness.

### **3.3 Church's Social Activities After 1848**

It was only until the end of the nineteenth century that the Catholic Church officially realised for the first time that its doctrines were divorced from the ordinary lives of the people. In the same century prior to this realisation, Karl Marx and his friend Fredrick angels were engaged in issues of social justice, which resulted into a communist blueprint document called the Communist Manifesto in 1948. This document was a sort of a constitution, which laid the rights of the workers against industrial capitalism. Among the individual clergy who heed the importance of Karl Marx's call for social justice was a prominent Catholic Church high ranking Bishop Cardinal Manning. He was concerned with the plight of exploited and alienated workers in Britain (Bokenkotter 1998:172). The Catholic Church officially expressed its willingness to

social justice issues in 1891 when Pope Leo XIII wrote an encyclical letter called *Rerum Novarum*, which laid the ground work for Catholic social teaching.

Some developments in the social involvement of the Church can be traced within Europe especially in German and England. Two prominent individuals were Bishop Manning in England and Kettler in German. To suffice the conditions of this study the researcher will concentrate on the latter (Kettler). In 1848 when the communist manifesto was released, there was a revolution in Europe. The revolution was based on a widespread emergence of situation across much of Europe, where populist human aspiration variously sought constitutional, liberal, national or socialist changes in society ([Age of the Saga: On line 24 August 2013](#)). The Church never participated, according to Schafers (1991:7), because the Church had no basis on which to organise- it lacked the political revolutionary awareness.

Apart from the lack of revolutionary socialist method, some strides towards addressing the social problems were made by Kettler. W E von Kettler was a pastor of a small Westphalia community on Hopsten and a Catholic delegate to the Frankfurt parliament. Kettler, (in Schafer 1991:8), pointed out that, 'if we want to discern the time we must seek to fathom the social question'. The social question according to Kettler was the recognition that 'the social situation of his time was characterised by the way in which there was hostile confrontation between the haves and the have-nots' (Schafer 1991:8). Like many of his contemporaries in Church circles, Kettler saw the solution to the 'social question' as in establishment of charity associations or intensive priestly pastoral care. Even if these ways of responding to the social question were hardly appropriate measures of coping with the on-going struggle for political emancipation among industrial workers, it was at least the beginning of facing the 'social question'.

It is interesting to note that the rise of Catholic or Christian workers' movement was not only because of the rise of the Socialist workers' movement but also due 'to the paternalistic spoon-feeding of industrial workers by large parts of the official church hierarchy, which kept them in subservience' (Schafer 1991:9). Between 1865 and 1870 the first Christian-social associations

emerged. In as much as these associations admired the work of socialist groups, they were against social Democrats' emphasis of the power of the workers without God and the liberals' emphasis on the power of money without religion. According to Schafer (1991:12) Christian-social organisation's involvement in organising strikes and attempts to organise the workers' interest in a way which transcended confessions and was independent of Church supervision. The final downfall of the Christian-social association was brought about by the police-state measure taken in the Kulturkampf and socialist war of 1878; this also affected all Social Workers Movements.

### **3.4 Rerum Novarum 1891**

This section shows the importance of this encyclical letter<sup>22</sup>, with a special indication of its contribution to the Catholic Church's efforts toward advocacy. It is also important to note that, whenever the researcher is talking about the Church's advocacy in the nineteenth century he will be using the word the 'social question' in order to be consistent with the efforts of Kettler and Manning.

This social encyclical was written in 1891 and marked the first official response of the Church to the 'social question'. It is interesting to note that this encyclical was specifically trying to act as a solution to the social question which had taken place in German Catholicism of the nineteenth century. This explains why the researcher intentionally chose to use the German history over the English when he was looking at the development of the social engagement by Catholic and Christian groups. As indicated by Schafer (1991:14) most of the basic contents of this 'Worker'<sup>23</sup> encyclical, like the demand of State intervention and freedom; the resolution of the property question with reference to Thomistic philosophy, natural law and revelation; and the anti-socialist and anti-liberal orientation had already been developed by the Christian social movement before 1891, then what was the purpose of this encyclical.

---

<sup>22</sup> These are letters written by the popes about developments in the church's life. These letters are also regarded as official document of the Catholic Church.

<sup>23</sup> It is called the worker's encyclical because it was written specifically against the way workers were treated in the nineteenth century.

The encyclical served not as the brainchild of the social question but rather as an affirmation of what has been done. It was an official ecclesiastical<sup>24</sup> recognition of the social question. By the time this encyclical was written, other Social Christian movements had come into being as a response to the demands of the nineteenth century's modern world socialist perspective. These organisations took a direct part in the social and political struggle of the time, and in so doing developed an ethic, which was adopted by this papal encyclical. The purpose of this encyclical was to confirm the need of the Church to Christianise the modern life and modernising Christian life. How was this done? According to Schafers (1991: 14) the encyclical's aim 'was to draw the attention of large areas of the public within the Church to the workers' question, which hitherto had been treated only by individual representatives and groups within Catholicism and the Christian movements'. The letter challenged those Church circles which were fixated on authority and hesitation or even hostile about workers organising themselves to be concerned about the 'social question'. It is true that the Church dragged its feet in adopting the social question because it would have done this thirty years ago with Kettler and Manning, but at least something was done.

After 1891, the Church in general has always taken a Christian inspired socialist perspective, which is critical of capitalism due to its emphasis on economic development at the expense of human development. This socialist perspective has also been critical of communism due to its antireligious position, which in history has degenerated into totalitarian rule which ultimately undermines human dignity. The Church's perspective does not disqualify these two ideologies but it seeks to give them a human face through Christian principles.

### **3.5 After 1881 During and Before Vatican II: Methodological Enquiry**

It is interesting to note that the Church in 1881 acknowledged the 'social question' but never suggested any practical solution to this question. If the Church was to be involved in the plight of the workers, it had to have a socio-political theology. The Church generally operates through

---

<sup>24</sup> Ecclesiastical refers to the official recognition of the 'social question' by the Catholic Church.

a deductive method<sup>25</sup>, which is rooted in the divine truth. The use of inductive method<sup>26</sup> was new for the Church but unfortunately this was the only way in which the Church was to effectively deal with the 'social question'. Hence, the Catholic Church was an amateur in this regard. Since inductive method was the domain of socialist groups like those shaped by Marxism, the Church was impelled to learn from these groups. Albert Nolan, a prominent South African liberation theologian implicitly acknowledges the use by the Church of a method with an origin from the Marxist tradition as follows:

...if Aquinas can use a pagan philosophy like Aristotle and some modern theologians can use an atheist like Freud, why can't we use an atheist social scientist like Marx...Making use of tools of analysis that happen to have their historical origin in Marx, does not mean that we now adopt the same conclusion about everything in the society (Nolan & Broderick 1987:66/68).

This section focuses on two groups that adopted the inductive method popularised by the Marxist tradition. This method was later taken by the Catholic Church as its model of evangelisation. The model was further used as an action methodology of the Catholic Commission of Justice and Peace.

### **3.5.1 YCW (Young Christian Workers) Methodology**

YCW was founded in 1925 by a Catholic priest called Joseph Cardijn. This group consisted of unemployed youths, who gathered to reflect on their problems in a bid to find ways of solving them. In explaining the methodology used by YCW to deal with their social realities, Cardijn described three fundamental truths. He was convinced that there is a truth of faith, which is the eternal destiny of each young worker. The second truth is a truth of experience, which is a terrible contradiction existing between the real state of the young worker and this eternal destiny. This is an existential truth, which constitutes our day to day experiences. The third truth is a truth of pastoral practice or method, this truth tries to help us to live our faith through our everyday experiences. Our faith cannot be understood as separated from our experiences.

---

<sup>25</sup> Deductive method starts from ideas, principles or doctrines and then deduces or draws conclusions from these about the world around us (Nolan 1987:21).

<sup>26</sup> Inductive method 'starts from human experience and develops ideas and principles from our experience of life in the world (Nolan 1987:21).

Affirming the three fundamental truths, the founder of the movement, Monsignor Father Joseph Cardijn in 1935 on the 26<sup>th</sup> August gave a speech expressing the centrality of human experience to our eternal destiny as follows

There cannot be an eternal destiny by the side, at a distance from the earthly life, unrelated to it. A destiny cannot be disincarnated, any more than religion cannot be disincarnated. No, eternal destiny is incarnate in time, begun in time, develops, is fulfilled, in the whole earthly life, in all its aspects, all its application, in all its achievements, physical, intellectual, moral, sentimental, professional, social, public life, daily life, concrete and practical. Eternal destiny can no more be separated from temporal destiny than religion is separated from morality (Cardijn 1995:83).

This address' objective served to show that there was a contradiction between the terrible conditions of the young worker and the promises of eternal destiny. Cardijn further said 'we must remain with our eyes fixed to the heaven and our feet on the earth as we are inexorable for the brutality of the conditions of the earthly life as we are inexorable for the demands of eternal destiny (Cardijn 1995:84).

This movement was directly influenced by a social analysis used by secular socialist groups, out of which YCW methodology See-Judge and Act was formed. It is important to note that the present Catholic Church's pastoral method of evangelisation is drawn from the lessons learnt by the Church through secular groups like Marxism. For example, historically we will realise that despite the fact that the Church was concerned with the plight of the workers, it lacked the practical methodology to deal with these issues. What makes this method different from Karl Marx's theory or other social theories is that it is specifically meant for young workers and its chief aim is to try and discern how a young worker within an oppressive milieu can live his or her faith in a way which emancipates him or her from this oppressive ordeal.

### **3.5.2 Liberation Theology in Latin America**

This type of theology rose during the 1960s, when priests who worked among the poor realised that there was a gap between theory and practice, both in their own religion and in the continent's politics. 'A growing number of priests began to question whether social and



economic injustice could be tackled with good will and the word of God' (Gheerbrant 1974:10). According to Nolan and Broderick (1987:18) this theology was stimulated by a context of ever-increasing poverty of millions of people in Latin America and their political struggle for liberation from the social structures that make them poor. This social and political context gave rise to the questions related to the meaning and relevance of their faith in such circumstances. Liberation theology was the answer to these questions. Such a theology was one which was prepared to abandon its intellectual focus on 'Western philosophy to the life and death struggle of the poor and oppressed communities' (deGruchy & Villa-Vicencio 1994:184).

As a guide to the Liberation Theology's advocacy work was a Marxist maxim 'Preferential option of the proletariat'. Baum (1991:58) understands that the preferential option of the poor was inspired by Marxism but he goes further to make a distinctive traits of the one advocated by Liberation theology. According to Baum, Liberation theology's 'preferential option of the poor' goes beyond material gains of the disenfranchised but also for the sake of common good that is for ethical and spiritual well-being of the whole society Baum (1991:59). This 'preferential option of the poor' is derived from the religious experiences of base communities in Latin America, and has been defended and explored by Liberation theology and approved by the Medellin and Puebla conference (Baum 1991:58). This maxim is a motto against the powerful upholders of the oppressive and exploitative structures.

At Medellin in September 1968 the Latin American Bishop expressed salvation in terms of liberation. Pope Paul VI in his opening address urged the delegates to promote social justice and to love the poor (Villa-Vicencio 1994:185). The important question is what type of liberation? The Bishops were unaware that they were implicitly calling for a revolution, and Medellin was nothing but 'a staging- point along the road to frankly political liberation' (Hebblethwaite 1977:43). McLellan using an article from Gutierrez's *Liberation Theology* expressed the prospects of Medellin as follows:

Medellin marks the beginning of a new relationship between theology and pastoral language on the one hand and the social science which seek to interpret this reality on the other hand. The relationships gives rise to statements which are to a large extend contingent and provisional;

this is the price one must pay for being incisive and contemporary and for expressing the Word *today* in our everyday words. But this language is only a reflection of a deeper process, a new awareness (McLellan 1997:114)

Medellin sums up the previous efforts taken by the Latin Americans to identify their faith with their experiences. Liberation requires social analysis, which was to be borrowed from Marxism/social sciences in order to uncover various levels of exploitation. One cannot fight an enemy which one cannot see or understand. There was a need to analyse the situation and this analysis was fundamental to liberation and hence Liberation Theology. The Bible might have good intentions but the actual situation needed a scientific understanding of the situation, which underlined all oppression. It is not surprising that the first Liberation theologians like Leonardo Boff were labelled as Marxists. It is important to note that Liberation theology is not a product of Marxist ideology, but both Marxism and Liberation Theology are inspired by the oppression of the poor and their methodology is derived from the experiences of the oppressed. Since Liberation Theology wanted to deal with a situation similar to Marx's, it has to borrow some useful hints from a method, which once worked. Looking at the historical priority and the prominence of Marx, it is inevitable to see the connection of these two liberation models.

From the reading of the earlier Liberation theologians, it is easy to see that they were influenced whether consciously or unconsciously by Marxism. Hebblethwaite (1977:50) affirms this point by saying Liberation theologians are Marxist because of the lack of any alternative analysis of society and the causes of its oppression. He further quotes Paul Lehmann who said that 'contemporary revolutionary practice has been forged by the Marxist assessment of the concrete mode of injustices and the realities of power' (Hebblethwaite 1977:50). What Hebblethwaite is saying is that Marxism is used as an instrument, in a way that freed it from its rigid ideological comfort. In other words, I am not saying liberation theology is a branch of Marxism as it is a system of practical Christian thought that acknowledges and critiques Marx's contributions at the same time.

### **3.6 Vatican Council II (1962-1965) and CCJP**

This section does not give a detailed account of the Vatican Council II; it briefly highlights how this Council contributed to the Church's advocacy role. This Council is known as the Vatican II Council because it was a second council of this nature to be held in the Vatican City. This Council took place during the same period when the theology of liberation was being spearheaded in Latin America. It was actually after this Council that the efforts advocated by the proponents of liberation theologians were officially acknowledged by the Latin American bishops. What was it about this council that makes it unique?

This Council was called by Pope John XXIII and it took place in Rome, Vatican City from 1962 to 1965. It will be useful to understand this council in comparison with the 1981 *Rerum Novarum*. *Rerum Novarum's* acknowledgment and official declaration of the Catholic Church's concern with the plight of the workers. It expressed the need of the Church to stand for the justice of the workers. If we are to look back especially at the criticism of the Church by Marx we realise that the Church was losing relevance to the modern world. A closer look at the history of the Catholic Church makes us realise that the Church has been fighting against modernity in a bid to re-establish traditional Christianity. One cannot deny that there have been some efforts to try and make the Church relevant, *Rerum Novarum* witnesses such efforts though to a minimum.

The Vatican Council II presented itself as a solution to this problem. Its radical stance called for change both within the Church and how the Church relates with the outside world. Comblin (2005:82) described the Council as preparing the Church to genuinely start to listen to the actual world. Hales (1965:xi) expressed that fact that the few extraordinary years, which this council took place enabled the Church to meet the world, and the world to meet the Church. Pope John XXIII had in effect thrust the problem of change upon the Council, when he asked it to enact amendments to make the Church's message more intelligible and acceptable to the modern persons (O'Malley 2012:47). One of the words commonly used was *aggiornamento* which means 'to bring the Church up to date' (Hales 1965:xi).

For the first time, Catholics were allowed to vote for Communist political parties and the pope was prepared to invite communist leaders to Rome. No pope in the whole of papal history has

ever suggested so many specific and practical suggestions in the realm of social organisation as Pope John (Hales 1965:xii). Pope John wanted to approach the problem of the world more empirically, unlike his predecessor who had less to say about justice, practical suggestions and policy changes. He announced that the Church's laws and institutions must enshrine a wider equality and a fuller social justice (Hales 1965:xv). The Latin American Bishops who officially accepted Liberation theology were inspired by this Council, which made the Church open to dialogue with prevailing philosophies. It is during this Council that religion averted its description as 'opium'. One of the most manifest ways in which the Catholic Church has exuded its intent for social advocacy was forming the model of Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace (CCJP).

The idea of the Catholic Commission of Justice and Peace was proposed during the Second Vatican Council. In the words of a document produced by the second Vatican Council, the purpose of this commission was 'to stimulate the Catholic Community to foster progress in needy regions and social justice on the international scene (*Gaudium et Spes*, No. 90<sup>27</sup>). This proposal was responding to the request that Pope Paul VI<sup>28</sup> established to the Pontifical Commission "Justitia et Pax"<sup>29</sup> on the 6<sup>th</sup> of January 1967. Two months later, in an encyclical written by Pope Paul VI called *Populorum Progressio*, Paul VI officially named this new body Justice and Peace. *Gaudium et Spes*<sup>30</sup> and this Encyclical were the founding texts and points of reference for this new body. On the 30<sup>th</sup> November 1971 during a Synod of Bishops Second General Assembly<sup>31</sup> a declaration of how the Catholic Church through CCJP was going to operate was expressed as follows;

The uncertainty of history and painful convergences in the ascending path of the human community direct us to sacred history; there God has revealed himself to us, and made known to us, as it is brought progressively to realisation, his plan of liberation and salvation which is once and for all fulfilled in the Paschal Mystery of Christ. Action on behalf of justice and

---

<sup>27</sup> Pastoral Constitution on the Church in the modern world, 'Gaudium et Spes', no 10.

<sup>28</sup> Pope Paul VI is a predecessor of Pope John XXIII who died before the end of the Vatican II Council

<sup>29</sup> 'Justitia et Pax' is an equivalent of 'Justice and Peace' in English.

<sup>30</sup> *Gaudium et Spes* is another document produced during the second Vatican Council.

<sup>31</sup> This is a conference where bishops gather to deliberate on a very important decision.

participation in the transformation of the world fully appear to us as a constitutive dimension of the preaching of the Gospel, or, in other words, of the Church's mission for the redemption of the human race and its liberation from every oppressive situation (Gremillion 1976:514).

The work of CCJP is recognised as a very important constitutive part of preaching the gospel. After a ten-year experimental period, Paul VI gave the Commission its definitive status on the 10<sup>th</sup> of December 1976. From its inception the CCJP has been instituted in many different nations where the Catholic has a presence. The next section looks at the CCJP in Zimbabwe (CCJPZ).

### **3.7 Catholic Commission of Justice and Peace in Zimbabwe**

The CCJPZ is a commission of the Zimbabwe Catholic Bishops Conference (ZCBC) established on 2<sup>nd</sup> of March 1972. Its main objective is to promote justice and peace guided by Social Teaching of the Church. Its intentions are to create a God fearing, democratic and prosperous nation where truth, love and freedom exist (Auret 1992:24). The commission changed its name when Rhodesia became Zimbabwe after independence in 1980 and has offices in all seven Zimbabwean Diocesan<sup>32</sup> namely Harare, Bulawayo, Mutare, Chinhoyi, Gokwe, Hwange and Masvingo. The information about the mandate, CCJPZ programmes, CCJPZ's strategy and how it works is taken from the 2011 Annual Report of the CCJPZ.

#### **3.7.1 The Mandate of the CCJPZ is to**

- To monitor and document human rights situation in the country for appropriate action.
- To research, investigate and publish situations of Justice and violence and use the information to promote justice and peace.
- To inform the faithful and the clergy of their responsibilities to work for justice and peace
- To promote informed decisions making among clergy and the faithful to influence public opinions according to the Social Teaching of the Church (STCs).

---

<sup>32</sup> A diocese is like the Catholic Church's provincial Centers in different counties.

- To make constructive suggestions and input for the enactment of just civil laws and their impartial administration and implementation.
- To empower and capacitate the clergy and the faithful to understand, promote and implement STCs in their lives for the fulfilment of human potential and growth (CCJPZ Annual report 2011).

### **3.7.2 Some of CCJPZ Programmes**

Public and Civic Educational programmes provides civic education on STCs<sup>33</sup>, human rights, justice, voting, election observation and monitoring. Action for better Governance programme helps communities to identify pertinent governance issues, carry out research on the identified issues and engage with responsible authorities to demand unavailable services as a way of reducing poverty (CCJPZ Annual report 2011)

### **3.7.3 Strategy of the Commission**

It involves provision of public and civil education on STCs, human rights, good governance, justice, peace and participation of all to create a living environment that suits God's plan for the earth's creation. They provide communities with skills to research and peacefully engage and dialogue with each other and or with relevant stakeholders to build a God fearing, democratic and prosperous nation. At the national level they collaborate with others doing similar work to advocate and lobby for a just peaceful nation (CCJPZ Annual report 2011).

### **3.7.4 How does the CCJPZ Work?**

It works with committed volunteers, or justice and peace players all over the country and fulltime staff and diocesan level that are committed to work for justice and peace. The commission works through an effective representative structure that starts from the National to diocesan level. CCJPZ is one of the few Faith-based organisations in Zimbabwe with effective and functional structures that reach the remotest parts of the country where human rights abuses are usually pertinent.

---

<sup>33</sup> Social Teachings of the Catholic Church

### **3.8 Conclusion**

This chapter has described the nature of Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace in Zimbabwe (CCJPZ) as a civil society organisation. In order to put the development of the CCJPZ in perspective the chapter commenced by alluding to the Church's advocacy responsibility to the challenge that Marx thrust at it. The Church responded favourably to the challenge of getting more involved in other aspects of human life, not only the spiritual. The Church realized that it was less than appealing in the eyes of critical thinkers because of its historical neglect of social responsibility. The chapter mentioned the *Rerum Novarum* a papal missive which talked at length about the welfare of people. The Vatican Council II which came more than fifty years after the *Rerum Novarum*, was another influential episode in reinforcing the social responsibility of the Church. The chapter has also made allusions to liberation theology and the YCW and how these evince the intention of the Church to be more involved in advocacy. From this backdrop, the chapter has shown how Vatican Council II stimulated the beginning of CCJP and from then the development of nation-based branches of CCJP of which the CCJPZ is an example.

The chapter gave a rounded explanation of what the CCJPZ's mandate in Zimbabwe. The following section will be a logical consequence from this one because it will then present data supporting the claim that the CCJPZ has been vocal in Zimbabwe. The Chapter will also show how the CCJPZ engaged with issues like the economic structural adjustment programme (ESAP), and how these foreign imposed programmes did not reap the fruits they intended to generate. The chapter will show the CCJPZ's opinion on political issues like elections, corruption, the constitution, violence and other issues in Zimbabwe.

## **CHAPTER FOUR DATA PRESENTATION**

---

### **4.1 Introduction**

The range of data presented in this chapter is thematised in five categories which are related to governance. The themes are presented through the following concepts: ESAP, Violence, Corruption, Elections and the Constitution. These categories are not exclusive in terms of content but there is an overlapping of themes. Categories are still legitimate because they help make sense of the data, which accommodates a conducive platform for data analysis. There is also a sixth category which is called 'other' because the content is related to governance but cannot readily fall under any given category. It is also important to note that the data presented in this chapter is dated after 1993. According to the 1993 Annual report of the CCJPZ, the human rights situation in the country was generally satisfactory by 1993 (Annual Report 1993:1). The most of the data was collected from the National office of CCJPZ and The social communications office in Harare. Permission was granted from the Deputy Director of CCJPZ Mr T Zimbiti and The National Co-ordinator of Social communications Dr Theresa Nyadombo.

The collected data highlights the contribution of the Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace towards good governance in Zimbabwe. This contribution is based on the publications of the CCJPZ not on press releases as the researcher initially anticipated because the media which publish these releases only focus on what suits their cause. Hence, the essential information will be ignored. Essentially, the majority of the data was drawn from the Newsletters of CCJPZ, which are found in the editions of the Catholic News Magazine, and the minority of the data was collected from the pastoral letters of the Bishops and the CCJPZ Annual Reports. As reflected in the first chapter, the bishop's letters are important because they are the media through which the social teachings of the Catholic Church are expressed. These letters' facts are supported by the research conducted by CCJPZ, and the CCJPZ's main objective is also to express justice in accordance to the social teaching of the Catholic Church.



## 4.2 Data Indicating the CCJPZ's Contribution to Good Governance

### 4.2.1 ESAP

ESAP was the main factor which influenced the commentary and activities of the CCJPZ on the economic situation in the 1990s. After independence the government adopted Socialism as a blueprint for creating development that would enhance the quality of life of the people but the socialist mentality lasted for only a decade. During the first ten years 'the government undertook policies to benefit the Black majority, which included expansion of education facilities in rural areas, free health services, subsidy of basic consumer goods (mealie meal, milk, cooking oil etc.) and a minimum wage system (Verstrealen 1998:58). These incentives, inspired by a socialist spirit, put strain on the economy by 1990, and the government took up a proposal suggested by IMF<sup>34</sup> and the World Bank called ESAP which was to help the country to recover economically. Unfortunately, the programme failed resulting in hardships.

As a result of the hardship which the majority experienced due to the failure of ESAP, from December 1997 to January 1998 'massive demonstration and riots were confirmed against inflation and additional measures taken by governments which increased hardships of people's lives (Verstraelen 1998: 59). It is during the 1990s that the Zimbabwean economic meltdown revealed its symptoms and at the same time the ruling party's popularity with the urban areas was dwindling. The section will concentrate on the response of CCJPZ to this situation. The response will consist of three articles, a section from the Annual Report of 1993 and a research survey.

April/May 1994 an article entitled *What is ESAP Doing to the Poor* was published by the CCJPZ. The CCJPZ was highlighting the efforts made by the Catholic Development Commission of Zimbabwe together with delegates from other African countries and the Vatican representatives on how to deal with ESAP. The objective of the workshop was to understand ways in which ESAP was affecting the poor and put forth measures to mitigate its effects. This workshop/meeting discovered that the expectations of ESAP were not realized. ESAP was expected to make the economy grow, encourage people to start new businesses and create

---

<sup>34</sup> International Monetary Fund

jobs. On the contrary, ESAP is making the lives of the people difficult because prices of goods were no longer under control, labour laws were disregarded, education and health sectors were no longer being subsidized. Such a situation worsened the already miserable state of the poor. Amidst all this madness, some political heavyweights were taking advantage of the economic meltdown to enrich themselves. The workshop concluded by recognizing that ESAP instead of empowering the poor it disenfranchises them. The workshop suggested that the debt owed by development countries should be forgiven. The workshop also pointed out that there should be fairness in trade between the developing countries and the developed countries.

The CCJPZ Annual Report of 1993 pointed out that ESAP was to become the focus of a document which is in preparation and was inspired by the discussion at the annual workshop described above. A further consultation will be done to ensure that there is accurate information about the plight of the poorest.

January/February 1996, an article by Mike Auret, entitled *Budget and Population Control in Zimbabwe* looked at the effects of ESAP. According to the article, due to ESAP most ministerial budgets were cut and the bishops condemned the minister of finance Mr Ariston Chambati for cutting the healthy budget to almost half the budget of defence. The Bishop questioned the wisdom of putting more money on protecting a country without enemies, while cutting down on the essentials. In another article entitled *Bishops Concerned with Budget Cuts* (January/February 1996), the Bishops' president Francis Mugadzi pointed out that budget cuts affected Mission hospital more than government hospitals. Mission hospital needs to be subsidized just as government hospital because they serve the rural areas where the majority of Zimbabwean live. The Bishop called for a meeting with the Minister of health to discuss the detail of the financial crisis.

In order of the CCJPZ to effectively advocate for the wellbeing of the poor, it has to understand the context and nature of the problem at hand. For this understanding to be possible, the commission needs to conduct a research to legitimize their claim. Research has always been central to the activities of the CCJPZ. Due to ESAP the CCJPZ conducted a research which helps

employers to calculate the minimum wage enough to feed an average Zimbabwean family. The study was meant to determine the minimum cost of consumption needs. The study was published in the issue of January/February 1996. The study serves to challenge the government and other private organisation not to take advantage of phenomenon like ESAP by avoiding paying equitable wages to those who work for them. The study is called *The Urban Poverty Datum Line in Zimbabwe*.

#### **4.2.2 Elections**

After 1990, the next election was going to be held in 1995, the CCJPZ took it as its responsibility to prepare Zimbabweans for these elections. In October/November 1994 a pamphlet was published in three main Zimbabwean languages namely Ndebele, Shona and English. These pamphlets were meant to inform the voters about why they are voting? How voting makes the government accountable for its actions? The pamphlets also highlighted the power of elections in removing and appointing leaders. It further shows the contribution of elections towards improving the general political systems. At the end of the pamphlet, the CCJPZ highlighted the meaning of democracy and the duties of a citizen in a democratic environment.

October/November 1994 there was another article published on *Voting Information and Education*. It highlighted the fact that as 1995 election will take place soon, there is a need to deal with voter apathy which characterized the previous elections. The Catholic Church upholds the freedom of choice as a fundamental right every individual must exercise. A voter education workshop was run from August 23-26 at Rockwood spiritual Centre. It was attended by CCJPZ representative of all diocese/province in Zimbabwe and people from different professional background. The topics ranged from political rights to economic progress. Participants agreed that citizens have a right to take part in the decision making of the country. The following resolutions were reached:

- There is a need to improve dialogue between Member of Parliaments (MPs) and their constituencies.
- MPs and voter are supposed to be educated about their roles.

- There is a need to persuade government to help diocesan parishes/individual churches extend their voter-education campaigns.

An article by Edwin Sakala entitled *Civic and Church Bodies Want to Monitor Elections* published in an October/November 1994 issue, pointed that CCJPZ together with Civic and church organisation can apply to the National Electoral Commission (NEC) for an official monitoring status in monitoring the 1995 elections. This was revealed at the voter education workshop held in Harare.

In the January/February 1995 issue an article entitled *The United Party Appeals to CCJPZ* was published. It highlighted how the United Party led by the retired Bishop Abel Muzorewa has appealed to the CCJPZ for help to pressure government to amend the electoral act. It highlighted the Political Party Finance ACT (1992), in which the presidential powers are so exaggerated that they actually mocks the idea of a democratic election. The party was appealing for an impartial and independent Electoral Commission through which such queries are raised.

The issue of January/February 1995 published an article entitled *Commission to Monitor*. The CCJPZ, both on the national and on diocesan level, agreed that they have a duty to monitor in the June 1995 General elections. At a meeting held at the YWCA in Harare on the 7<sup>th</sup> of January 1994. The monitors will be required to assess what is happening in their areas during election campaign period, during elections and after elections. After the election the information will be gathered and collated into a document. If there are any queries the document will be given to the government.

May/June 2000 issue had an article entitled *Election must be Free of Violence* by Edwin Sakala. It expressed how deeply disturbed the CCJPZ was about the developments in Zimbabwe, which indicate how intolerant our society is of their difference in political thoughts. There has been a wave of political violence which shows a high level of political maturity. The CCJPZ received news of countrywide political violence. The commission urged people to desist from allowing

political parties to use them to harass members of other political party. It also discouraged people from being used by other people who create hatred among tribal and racial lines. The commission also discovered that intimidation was used as a tool of campaigning. The CCJPZ appealed to all Zimbabweans of goodwill to denounce all forms of intimidation and violence.

### **4.2.3 Corruption**

According to the 1997 CCJPZ Annual Report, corruption practices came to light through the independent press. It involved tenders in Matabeleland Woodlands, construction of a new airport. It also involved the War Victims Compensation Fund and The housing scandals. In all these cases the ruling party officials were in the forefront.

CCJPZ highlighting electoral corruption: In the issue of March/April 1996, an article entitled *The Force Behind Margaret Dongo* by Petronilla Chikamba was published. It highlighted how Dongo challenged the election results which were rigged by Zanu PF<sup>35</sup>. She courageously challenged the high court of the validity of elections in Harare South. Another incident in which the election results were manipulated by the Ruling party was the Chitungwiza mayoral elections. In an article by Stewart Musiwa entitled *Mhashu in another Legal Battle to Challenge Mayoral Elections*. March//April 1998. Fidelis Mhashu challenged the Chitungwiza mayoral elections accusing the registrar-general of facilitating electoral rigging. He was convinced that the registrar used the old presidential voter's role.

In July/August an article entitled *Know Your Rights* by Edwin Sakala was published. It brings awareness of the evil of corruption. According to Sakala, complaints about the increased incidents of dockets missing from the police are common in Zimbabwe. Well known criminals work with corrupt police officers and court clerks make arrangements to have dockets and court records destroyed. This article encouraged people to open up and tell their stories to the public through CCJPZ's publications.

---

<sup>35</sup> Zanu PF is the ruling party in Zimbabwe since independence in 1980

#### **4.2.4 Violence**

A report by the CCJPZ entitled *Crisis of Governance: A Report on Political Violence in Zimbabwe* was published in the year 2000. Its objectives were to seek to highlight the wicked acts of political violence and its grave dangers to our society. Political violence is an evil that severely threatens peace, security, law, order and harmony in the society. Secondly, we (the Church) strongly believe that the apparatus of justice, law and order existing in our society should perform the roles and function for which they were founded without favour. The report published the names of the perpetrators to deter other perpetrators. It also served to awaken the conscience of the nation to take a firm stand against political violence and promote the spirit of national reconciliation.

CCJPZ together with the Human rights organisation, the Legal Resource Foundation compiled a very thorough and detailed report of 260 pages on the civil war in the province of Matebeleland and in the South-West of Zimbabwe which followed the collapse of the coalition government in 1982. The Bishop decided to present the report first to the president and have dialogue with him about what ought to be done to heal the still open wounds of the cruel civil wars in which thousands die. The most important part of the report is the recommendations where a proposal was made to fund and finance and rehabilitate the affected. The report does not demand criminal prosecution of the people responsible for the massacre; it merely wants them to be removed from the office (July/August 1997, CCJPZ Presents Report on Gukurahundi).

In response to the pre-election violence, the Zimbabwean Catholic Bishops Conference (ZCBC) wrote a pastoral letter on the 7<sup>th</sup> of June 2000. This letter was written just before the 2000 parliamentary elections. It condemned the pre-election violence and killings. It categorically expressed that nobody is supposed to suffer reprisal for honestly expressing and living up to their convictions. ZCBC recognized that some people have already been victimized for belonging to a different political party or for having a different political opinion. ZCBC plead to all political parties and supporters to desist from any form of violence. The Bishops challenged the government to take its rightful role of ensuring that there is peace during elections.

#### **4.2.5 Constitution**

An article was published in July/August 1999 edition by Oskar Wermter. It was meant to inform the people about the essential elements of the constitution and the issues surrounding it. The article was entitled *Constitution: What is at Stake?* This article was written just before the Zimbabwean constitutional referendum of 2000. Firstly, the writer gives an analogy to explain what a constitution is. It compares the constitution to the rules of football. All teams in a field have to obey the rules because they serve both teams even if the teams are opponents. A constitution does the same. It is meant to serve everyone in the country that is why everybody should participate in its formulation or amendment.

Secondly the article explains the complexity of this process. The constitutional process was started by the National Constitution Assembly (NCA), which consisted several Civil society groups. The ruling party was invited but it declined and decided to form another body with the government called a presidential commission of 260 members. The Zimbabwe Council of Churches (ZCC) pulled out and joined the presidential commission but the CCJPZ continued to work with NCA. Prominent Catholic Church members joined the presidential commission. The NCA rejected the presidential commission as an convener of the constitutional change because half of its member were parliamentarian, most of which were from the ruling party. The other reason of the rejection was that the president controlled the commission; NCA members feared that he would not allow the process to take its course since the main purpose of constitutional reforms was to limit his powers.

In January/February, an article was published entitled *Catholic Bishops Speaks on the Constitution*. The ZCBC submitted a six paged document to the constitutional Assembly highlighting 1) Despite a plurality of cultures the Church sees a need for a common moral convictions expressed in the bill of rights, The Individuality of Universal Declaration of Human Rights to be corrected by inserting African Communal Values of the African Charters on Human and People's rights. 2) The Constitution should guarantee freedom to different players in civic society to run its own education as well as healthy institutions. 3) Economic policies should put people before profits in order to bring favourable conditions for employment. 4) Power should

not be concentrated in the hands of a few; it should be balanced to avoid absolute power. 5) Present presidential power needs to be adjusted. 6) For a proper democratic culture to grow and develop in Zimbabwe we need an Independent Electoral Commission (IEC).

#### **4.2.6 'Other' Category**

ZCBC wrote a pastoral letter in May 1998 entitled *Working for the Common Good*. The letter acknowledges that we live in a time of crisis, which include recent food riots and two national stay aways<sup>36</sup> indicate a general deep discontent and resentment, worsened by deteriorating public health and educational services, unemployment growth and corruption. The situation exhibit signs of hopelessness. We believe things can change for the better, but change must be based on the principles of social justice. Economic and political solutions are not enough in the current situation because the root crisis is moral; hope is in our people to develop answers for themselves.

#### **4.3 Conclusion**

This chapter presented collected data which highlighted the contribution of the Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace towards good governance in Zimbabwe. Most of the data was drawn from the Newsletters of CCJPZ, which are found in the editions of the Catholic News Magazine, and some of the data was collected from the pastoral letters of the Bishops and the CCJPZ Annual Reports. The next chapter will further analyse this data and see if the collected data answered the research question.

---

<sup>36</sup> Stay away is a passive way devised by the civil society to convince the government to give in to its demands through encouraging all workers to stay away from work nationwide.



## CHAPTER FIVE DATA ANALYSIS

---

### 5.1 Introduction

The study uses Content Analysis as the basis of analysing data. According to Roller, Mathes & Eckert (1995:167) as quoted by Babbie and Mouton (2012:492) Content Analysis is 'any technique for making inferences by objectively and systematically identifying specified characteristics of messages'. Since there are two types of Content Analysis namely Conceptual Analysis and Relational Analysis, this study uses the former. Chapter four has already used this analysis by identifying concepts which are related to good governance and used these concepts as themes or categories in presenting data. This chapter continues to analyse the contribution of CCJPZ towards good governance in Zimbabwe from 1990 to 2000. The first part of this chapter examines whether the data collected is answering the research question. The second part highlights difficulties which the CCJPZ faced and also presents the data on whether the objectives of the Commission's contribution were met.

### 5.2 Does the Data Answer the Research Question?

We have to identify the central terms in the research question, which the researcher will use as a foundation to determine whether the research question has been adequately answered. The researcher has to pick three main concepts from the research question, the first concept or term is *good governance* the second is *Zimbabwe* and the third presents the period which the study will focus which is *from 1990-2000*. *Good governance* reflects the focus of the study, *Zimbabwe* represents the context and *1990-2000* is the period in which the activities took place. Of the three concepts or terms *good governance* is the central term or concept of the research question.

The *Human Rights Web page* highlight that there is no single and exhaustive definition of good governance but there is however a consensus which relate good governance 'to political and institutional processes and outcomes that are deemed necessary to achieve the goals of development' (United Nations Human rights 2000: on line). Looking at the Zimbabwean context

within the period stated (1990-2000) we recognize five categories of terms which are associated with good governance in both negative and positive ways. These terms have already been identified and categorised during the presentation of data. The first two terms are *the constitution* and *elections*. The former represents a 'system of laws and basic principles that a state, country or organisation is governed' (Wehmeier 2006:312). The latter represents 'the process of choosing a person or a group of people for a position especially political position' (Wehmeier 2006:472). These terms are positive in relation to good governance because as long as good governance refers to a process whose sole purpose is to achieve the goal of development, then we will assume that an electoral process will provide good leaders who will use the constitution toward goals of development. These two terms are necessary because they constituted the context of Zimbabwe from 1990-2000 as already shown during the presentation of data in chapter four. If these concepts were pivotal to good governance then we expect an advocacy group like the CCJPZ to have played a part in promoting these concepts or terms.

The remaining three terms which constituted the Zimbabwean context and had a negative influence on governance were *Violence*, *ESAP* and *Corruption*. Violence was not just mere violence but it was politically motivated, what this means is that it is a 'form of violence that seek to achieve certain desired political objective by either enhancing the political fortunes of the perpetrator or negating those of the opponents' (CCJPZ 2000:15). The time frame under scrutiny in this study witnessed political violence and intimidation before and during election times. If violence was used as a tool that decides that voter's choice, which in turn result in the selection of leaders against the people's choice then it is against good governance. Such a leader will not follow the principles of the constitution but will rule for the sake of power. If the CCJPZ is a Civil Society which advocate for justice, it will not tolerate any form of violence. We will expect CCPZ to say or do something about such a situation.

The other term is ESAP, which was imposed on the people by IMF and World Bank through the consent of the Zimbabwean leaders but it did not deliver on its promises as a result it made the lives of the ordinary Zimbabwean suffer. Since ESAP resulted in budget cuts of necessary benefit like health, it did not to promote development but destroyed it. Hence, such a program

seeks to negate the values of good governance. If CCJPZ keeps quiet, we will have to wonder whether it is still an advocate of good governance. We expect the Commission to say something or do something against such a Programme. The last term or concept is *Corruption*, which is defined 'in legal terms such as bribery... (it is) any use of official position, resource facilities for personal benefit' (Doig 1996:36). Zimbabwe has witnessed corruption in all walks of life including the electoral process. From the definition, we realized that corruption by its nature is detrimental to good governance and if it was witnessed in this period noted by the study we expect the CCJPZ to have done or say something.

The chapter on data presentation presented these five concepts as different categories out of which we can determine whether the CCJPZ contributed towards good governance in Zimbabwe from 1990-2000.

The first Category is represented by the concept *Elections* or the electoral processes. Five published articles revealed that CCJPZ played a part in the electoral process in Zimbabwe. Due to political motivated violence which was experience experienced before the 1995 elections, the Commission circulated pamphlet about voting in all three Zimbabwean main languages. In the same period (October/November 1994) it also held a workshop on voter education and another one on election monitoring. The data also reveal that the Commission decided to monitor elections to ensure that proper procedures were followed. Moreover, the CCJPZ encouraged other civil society groups to go and monitor elections. There was still intimidation in the 1995 election and the CCPJZ wrote an article just before the 2000 June parliamentary election advocating for an elections free of violence.

The second Category is represented by the concept *Constitution*. July/August 1999 edition published an article which explains the controversy and debate around the constitutional reform process. This article was published because there was a lot of confusion and misinformation of the public about issues around the constitution reforms, which ended up into a referendum. January/February 2000 edition published what the Bishops expected from the new constitution, the free electoral process and the mitigation of presidential powers were highlighted coincidentally the latter was central to the objective of the constitutional reform

The third Category is represented by the concept *ESAP*. The data highlighted how the commission was worried about the condition of the poor. It is important to highlight that the commission was worried by the fact that even if ESAP brought hardships, some people especially the elite took an opportunity to get even richer. Another thing which the CCJPZ and the Bishops point out is that the Minister of Finance cut budget of Health to almost half of that of Defence when there was no war. The government seems to be worried about the protection of the country to the detriment of the essential need of the people.

The fourth category is represented by the concept *Violence*. Violence seems to appear in all elections but I chose to highlight it again because it is central to the crisis of leadership in Zimbabwe. In 1997 CCJPZ reported the killings, which were tantamount to genocide in Matabeleland. In 2000, a report was written which reflected the Zimbabwean history of violence entitled 'Crisis of Governance: A Report of Political Violence in Zimbabwe'. In 2000 the Bishops condemned the pre-election violence and killing in a pastoral letter.

The fifth category is represented by the concept *Corruption*. In this section elections will be associated with corruption. Two stories were highlighted by CCJPZ in which the ruling party was challenged for electoral fraud and how corrupt the electoral commission was? Another article entitled *knowing your Rights* highlighted the widespread corruption in Zimbabwe.

From the information provided, we can come to the conclusion that CCJPZ made a contribution towards good governance in Zimbabwe from 1990-2000. Concentrating on the contribution is not enough in itself because in most cases, if not all, a certain result is expected. Out of all these efforts what did the CCJPZ achieve.

## **5.3 The Challenges and Results of CCJPZ Advocacy Work**

### **5.3.1 Challenges**

The CCJPZ has been one of the main civil society voices which advocated for justice during the liberation struggle. After independence the CCJPZ decided to withdraw from political engagement/advocacy and concentrated on helping the government to uplift the lives of

Zimbabwean through service delivery. CCJPZ withdrew its advocacy work because the oppressor<sup>37</sup> was defeated and a new government needed to be help to rebuild the county. The future of Zimbabwe was promising and there was no violence or abuse of human rights. The mistake which the Mugabe regime made was to assume that the place of the Church was behind the holy altar or helping the government to achieve its goal. Politics was to be left to the politicians. One of Mugabe's loyalist Dydimus Mutasa, the administration Secretary of the ruling Zanu (PF), by that time, 'more or less sought to banish pastors to the pulpit suggesting that politicians should be left alone to deal with matters of running state affair without interference from the churches' (Sakala 1999:23).

Despite all these efforts to deter the Church from standing for justice, the CCJPZ continues its work for advocacy. In 1999 the Commission was accused of being partisan. In response the deputy director of the Commission Mr Zimbiti in an article entitled *For Justice and Peace not Partisan* explained that the CCJPZ has never been partisan since it was founded in 1972. Some politicians of the ruling Zanu (PF) party have accused the CCJPZ of aligning itself with the opposition when it criticized the government. According to Mr Zimbiti, CCJPZ have never been partisan and have always historically taken a firm stance on the perpetrator (Musiwa 2000:20).

The CCJPZ has been criticized for nurturing political aspirants, citing an example of the former CCJPZ director Mike Auret, who is currently a member of parliament for the Movement of Democratic Change (MDC). Zimbiti further responded that, the Church does not stop people who have retired or resign to join politics. The CCJPZ has always consistently championed the cause of the oppressed since its inception. If the Commission is taking a side, be assured that it is not ideological or partisan but it is always on the side of justice and truth (Musiwa 2000:20).

The accusation levelled at the CCJPZ as a political party by the government only witnesses to affirm the stance it takes on issue of social justice. The government cannot acknowledge the presence of any group which questions its integrity. The challenges faced by the CCJPZ in its advocacy work only reveal to show that the government feels uncomfortable when it is

---

<sup>37</sup> The Rhodesian government

challenged by a church organisation on public policy grounds. It is not surprising to note that the United Party (in the issue January/February 1995) asked the Commission to help pressure to government to amend the electoral Act because the leader of that party knew that CCJPZ have considerable influence towards governance in Zimbabwe. This can be supported by the fact that, the leader of this party Bishop Abel Muzorewa would have appeal to another Church organisation called Zimbabwe Council of Churches (ZCC), which he was a member, but he preferred the CCJPZ. The result of CCJPZ's contribution are gloomy, this does not mean it has never successfully challenged the government. The CCJPZ had in the past challenged and forced the government to give in into its demands. For instance, CCJPZ supported an application of Churu Farm residents against eviction from the Farm (Annual Report 1993). It is unfortunate that Commission has never really successfully yielded positive results on issue which this study is highlighting.

### **5.3.2 Did the Government Responded to CCJPZ's Advocacy Efforts?**

Despite all these efforts nothing fundamentally changed, actually the situation became worse. CCJPZ annual report of 2000 reported a very gloomy picture of the Zimbabwean situation. An assessment made by the end of the year indicated that properties were destroyed; people were terrorized by the ruling party members. Some war veterans become known for causing chaos in the societies. Even if these incidents were reported the police was indifferent and the perpetrators were rarely arrested. Some policemen/women who dare to pursue these allegations were transfer to other police stations (Annual Report 2000:3). The economy continued to deteriorate as companies started to close down and relocate to other countries. Tourism suffered because Zimbabwe was seen as an unsafe destination due to political instability. Mines continued to close and downsize their staff followed by retrenchments and increased unemployment. The commercial farming was interrupted by invasions, fuel shortages caused more inconveniences.

Acknowledging that the situation was getting worse, the CCJPZ published a detailed report of about 143 pages entitled *Crisis of Governance: A Report on Political Violence in Zimbabwe*. This

report highlighted the wide spread violence and how people were terrorised due to differences of political opinions. This report expressed lack of tolerance and hope in the country.

Eight year later the CCJPZ published another report which indicated that the situation has gone from bad to worse. The report was entitled *Graveyard Government*. It explored political violence in Zimbabwe following March Harmonised 2008 elections and illustrated the horrendous depth which Zimbabwean society has descend into. Events covered by the report demonstrate how political leaders actively used national institutions to undermine the wellbeing of Zimbabwean people. According to the report, human dignity, human rights and life itself has been callously trampled.

Three years later in 2011, a book was published entitled *When a State Turns Against its Citizens* by Llody Sachikonye. The book explores the causes, patterns, dynamics and consequences of political violence during the period of Zimbabwean crisis from 2000-2008. It looks at how violence has affected the country's evolving political culture. The focus of this study is on institutionalized violence. The book declared that, 'the consequences of this state of affair is a society traumatised by fear, withdrawal and collective depression based on past memories of violence, intimidation and harassment' (Sachikonye 2011:xvii).

#### **5.4 Conclusion**

Both chapter four and five gives sufficient evidence that CCJPZ contributed towards good governance in Zimbabwe from 1990-2000. This chapter further pointed out that CCJPZ had its challenges and moreover most of its objectives of advocating for justice never influenced the situation of Zimbabwe for the better. As indicated by Sachikonye, the situation became worse. If the situation of Zimbabweans never changed for the better, this study will attempt to look at the possible causes for the resistance to change. Hence, chapter six will critically assess the effectiveness of the CCJPZ using Gramsci's theory.

## **CHAPTER SIX**

### **AN ANALYSIS OF THE EFFECTIVENESS OF CCJPZ'S CONTRIBUTION**

---

#### **6.1 Introduction**

Despite the efforts invested by CCJPZ toward good governance from 1990 to 2000, the Zimbabwean political crisis remained unabated; it could actually be said to have worsened. When something has been done in order to improve a particular situation and there is no improvement, it is logically common for people to enquire why the intervention did not change the situation. This chapter examines the reasons that could be adduced to explain the continuance of bad governance in Zimbabwe, amid advocacy of the CCJPZ for a more benign brand of leadership. This examination will be done with reference to Gramsci's theory of civil society. The chapter will seek to expose government's intransigence and the other more far-reaching methods of advocacy that the CCJPZ did not explore in its *modus operandi*. The chapter is divided into three main sections. The first section puts Gramsci's theory within the context of the 21<sup>st</sup> century civil society. The second section assesses if CCJPZ exhibit signs of being pro-hegemony, and lastly the third section further assesses the counterhegemonic activities of CCJPZ.

#### **6.2 Contextualizing Gramsci's Theory of Civil Society**

##### **6.2.1 Outlining Gramsci theory of Civil Society**

Gramsci understands civil society as ordinarily under the hegemony of the rulers. According to him, the state of bondage can be characterized by the civil society's state of consciousness or culture which they are schooled in. Since this consciousness is socially constructed, it can be reversed and the reversal will result in counter-hegemony. Counter-hegemony is an effort of the civil society to free themselves from the dictates of rulers. Civil society can support hegemony by following and acknowledging the dictates of the rulers as legitimate or they gradually change the state of their consciousness and reach a stage where they no longer endorse the *status quo*. Once the civil society is self-conscious, it assumes a counter-hegemonic



stance. The main objective of Gramsci's theory is to emancipate civil society from the bondage of hegemony.

According to Gramsci, as highlighted by Cox (1999:15), for a consciousness which seeks to be counter-hegemonic, there is a need for civil society to go through various stages of consciousness. The lowest level of consciousness is called collective or corporative consciousness. This particular group seeks to fulfil its self-interest. This can constitute the loyalists, who support the ruling class because as long as their 'assumed' interests are fulfilled they have nothing to worry about.

The second level of consciousness is called class consciousness. This consciousness unifies various forms of corporative consciousness (Cox 1999:15). This unsettles the comfortable state of corporative consciousness, revealing the possibility of other ways of looking at the prevalent status quo in a different light. There is an exposure of contending consciousness states. The civil society begins to doubt or question their present culture. This stage does not result in counter-hegemony but it prepares the ground upon which the civil society will eventually oppose the existing state of affairs.

The third level of consciousness is called self-consciousness. According to Cox (1999:16), this is the stage where social groups extricate themselves from complying with the status quo. The alliances of different social groups at this stage are stronger than those in the class consciousness. Self-consciousness contributes to organized social forces strong enough to challenge the dominant power in society, and seeks to successfully replace the dominant class (Cox 1999:16). Self-consciousness employs long term strategies to challenge the state of affairs. Gramsci calls this strategy the *war of position*.

The *war of manoeuvre* is another strategy of emancipation by the civil society suggested by Gramsci. This type of war is understood as the seizure of power before the ground work of social organisation mentioned above has been built up. This type of emancipation is not a substantial because it is more likely to succumb because the civil society is not prepared to sustain the new reality.

### **6.2.2 The Context of Gramsci and the one focused by this study**

Gramsci wrote his political thoughts during his imprisonment. Reading the writings of Gramsci and his followers one gets the idea that there was not many organized civil society groups. His reference to civil society refers to the majority of the poor Italian workers and peasants who constituted the majority of the population. He made no reference to strong trade union groups. One cannot deny the existence of civil society group like the Christian socialist movement but most of the organized groups which supported the civil society were politically driven with political power. Almost hundred years later the world is experiencing well-organized civil society groups with no political ambition. These groups are designed to speak on behalf of the general population; they also endeavour to empower the masses against the hegemony of the State.

During the 1990s, Zimbabwe had many civil society groups, which included two main parachurch NGOs namely CCJPZ and ZCC. Two secular NGOs which proved to be more vocal were the Zimbabwe Congress of Trade Union (ZCTU) and NCA that was formed towards the end of the decade under the scope of this study. Our era witnesses civil society groups with no political aspirations but with special interest in good governance. Some of these NGOs specialize in a particular area. NGOs like CCJPZ are multi-tasked even though they also seek advice from the specialized NGOs. Most NGOs tends to work together in clusters. For instance the CCJPZ belongs to the NGO cluster of Zimbabwean Human Rights Forum.

This chapter assesses the contribution of CCJPZ to good governance in Zimbabwe using two trajectories presented by Gramsci which look at the CCJPZ through the pro-hegemonic and counter-hegemonic lens. If the CCJPZ compromised its stance on governance, it could be indicted with either being pro-hegemonic or undermining its own advocacy. If it was pro-hegemonic, then it could also be said to have conspired with the government. On the other hand, we can ask whether the way CCJPZ advocated for good governance was the best possible way or whether or there are other ways which could have enhanced its effectiveness.

### **6.3 First Trajectory: Did CCJPZ ever present itself as Pro-hegemonic?**

Phiri (2010) highlighted that some catholic clergy took the side of the government and chose to ignore the plight of the Zimbabwean people. This might possibly make us assume that the Church was pro-hegemonic but the researcher is still convinced that CCJPZ as an organisation never really took the side of the government. It will be unfair to sacrifice the profound advocacy work done by CCJPZ because of a few misguided priests or a bishop. This study will not take such a route.

Mugabe was confronted by the CCJPZ about his unjust method of ruling; in response he reminded the Catholic Church to examine itself if it is doing any better before it judges him. It is unfortunate that the researcher did not locate a substantial source of what Mugabe said about the Catholic Church but the statement is well known to many Zimbabweans. Even if this statement will seem like 'hearsay' the researcher will use it to begin his argument about a perspective in which the CCJPZ is pro-hegemony. The study will give an indirect evidence to substantiate this statement.

Mugabe is a Catholic and he understands how the Catholic Church works because he was educated by the Catholic Church and still claims to be a devoted Catholic. At first glance we might not take him seriously but as we further explore his statement one will start to see its validity. Many critics have expressed concern about the political/leadership structure of the Catholic Church; it has been depicted as oppressive and prescriptive. Phiri (2010) highlighted this element at length in his thesis when he was analyzing the conceptual lay out of the bishops' pastoral letters. The statement by Mugabe implies that before the Church judges him, it should first put its house in order. If the Church does not present itself as an example in its leadership, we should at least have an idea why the Mugabe's administration might not have taken the CCJPZ's efforts seriously. The pro-hegemonic perspective of this section is not based on the fact that CCJPZ supported the government but because the Church which runs CCJPZ is no better than the government; for it exhibits or manifest characteristics of hegemony. The main objective of this section is to show that.

### **6.3.1 The Catholic Church's Institutional and Leadership Hegemony**

#### **6.3.1.1 The Catholic Church's Political Nature**

The Vatican City is not just the spiritual Headquarters of the Catholic Church, it is also a city-State, a sovereign State and the Pope is its absolute monarch (Manuel, Reardon & Wilcox 2006:34). The Catholic Church is able to internationally interact on both religious and political levels. Foreign diplomats are accredited to the Pope not to the government of the Vatican. The Catholic Church is in formal diplomatic ties with about 175 countries (Manuel, Reardon & Wilcox 2006:40). The Papal Nuncios<sup>38</sup> have the same privileges as secular diplomats. The Church also shares a permanent observer status at the United Nations (Manuel, Reardon & Wilcox 2006:41). The Catholic Church also acts as an International Governmental Organisation as well as an International Non-governmental Organisation. The Bishops and the Pope are chief administrators of both the political and religious life of the Church.

The political structure of the Church is always subordinate to the religious institution because the Pope does not see himself as a political leader but a religious one. The legitimacy of the Pope as a leader with divine powers is claimed to be derived from the apostolic succession founded by Jesus as expressed by Canon 331 under the title *The Roman Pontiff and the College*:

The Bishops of Roman Catholic Church, in whom continues the office given by the Lord uniquely to Peter, the first of the Apostles, and to be transmitted to his successors, is the head of the college of Bishops, the Vicar of Christ, and pastors of the universal Church on earth. By virtue of his office he possesses supreme, full immediate, and universal ordinary power in the Church, which he is always able to exercise freely (Walf 2004:431).

As indicated by the quotation the Holy See<sup>39</sup> is the Leader of the Church, like Apostle Peter. He represents Christ and the Bishops are successors of the apostles. Let us look at the Bishops

---

<sup>38</sup> A permanent diplomatic representative of the Holy See accredited to a civil government and often of ambassadorial status (:969).

<sup>39</sup> The word 'Holy See' is the same as the word 'Pope'

because they are the ones who lead both the political and religious structures of the Church in collegiality with the Pope. Canon 375 under the title *Legates of the Roman Pontiff* says:

Bishops whom by divine institution succeed to the place of the Apostle through the Holy Spirit, who has been given to them, are constituted pastors in the Church, so they are teachers of Doctrine, priests of the sacred worship, and ministers of governance. Through Episcopal consecration itself, receives with the function of sanctifying also the function of teaching and governing; by their nature, however, these can only be exercised in hierarchical communion with the head and members of the college (Balvo 2004: 490).

The authority wielded by the bishop to govern cannot be determined by humanity but God. The whole political structure and property of the Church finds its ultimate meaning in the divine. Leadership in the Church cannot be a subject of debate because it is divinely instituted.

#### **6.2.1.2 The Church's Leadership Structures**

In spite of the fact that the Catholic Church prides itself as a religious institution par excellence, its structure of leadership is questionable. Some historical evidence has revealed that the present institutional 'empire like' structure of the Catholic Church is derived from ancient, secular and oppressive structures and customs as expressed below:

The power structure in the Church today is indebted to centuries-old patterns, and two patterns are worthy noting in particular: the experiences with Roman power and Feudal structure. The Church assumed customs, titles, expressions, and symbols from them. Hierarchy, as a term and as a concept, is a result of this process (Boff 1985:40).

The above explanation does not say the Catholic Church is a reflection of the Zimbabwean State but it reflects all the necessary qualities of a hegemonic institution. According to Kee (1976:79) the values upon which the Church defines itself are no different from those which hegemonic states are defined with.

### **6.2.2 Catholic Church's Leadership as Pro-Hegemonic**

The researcher takes the liberty to use the perspective of Boff - a famous Catholic theologian who expressed his dissatisfaction with the way the Catholic Church was led. Boff 'has been caught in a more acrimonious tension with Rome than any other liberation theologian. He has been outspoken in his critique, and has possibly been scrutinised more oppressively; recently he has had to submit every single thing he writes for censorship' (The Tablet 1992:827). The researcher is choosing Boff because he is one of the few theologians who openly declared his position and experience of the Catholic Church. This account does not give a complete description of the nature of the Catholic Church but it endeavours to show us that the Church cannot be completely excused from being identified as a hegemonic institution. This study does not support Boff's position, as it is partly extreme, but it tries to show us the punitive side of the Church when confronted with opposition.

The focus of Boff's writing was predominately on the question of church order, and has inevitably led to acute tension with Rome. Boff was worried that the Church used theology to justify its hegemony and avoid criticism as following:

The rejection of Protestantism was a historical mistake not only because Luther was excommunicated but because any possibility of true criticism or questioning of the system in the name of the gospel was also expelled. Catholicism became a total, reactionary, violent and repressive ideology. There is nothing further from evangelical spirit than a Catholicistic system's pretension to unlimited infallibility, to questionability, to absolute certainty' (Boff 1985:86).

In another account Boff describes the painful experience he went through before he decided to leave the Church. For him, the Church lacks political means to punish those who oppose its teaching. Thus, instead of inflicting physical torture it resorts to psychological torture. Such torture can be characterised by

The juridical insecurity of the doctrinal processes; the anonymity of the denunciation; lack of knowledge as to the reason behind the charges; no acknowledgement of offered explanations; repeated accusation to known questions; long intervals between correspondence; the insecurity

and uncertainty as to whether the process is being continued or discontinued or whether the procedures have been further refined (The Tablet 1992:828).

All these processes of torture make one suffer marginalisation due to scrutiny of the *Sacred of the Doctrine of the Faith*<sup>40</sup>. Torture inflicted by the Church, according to Boff, 'leads theologians to the dark night of lonely suffering, psychological worry, and even physical death' (The Tablet 1992:828). It is difficult to hold the Church accountable because there is a very thin line between its religious convictions and its political proceedings since the former justifies the latter. The present Pope has also identified some weakness of the Church by speaking about many controversial issues which other Popes dared not to discuss. The nature of the Catholic Church as an empire might possibly have raised questions about its ability to advocate for good governance.

#### **6.4 Second Trajectory: Examining the Counter-hegemonic Activities of CCJPZ**

This section will concentrate on two ways, in which the Civil Society can emancipate itself from the hegemony of rulers through the contribution of the CCJPZ towards good governance in Zimbabwe. The first method of emancipation is called the *war of position*, which seeks to undo the culture of domination into the thirst for liberation from bondage. This process takes a long time; it is like a sort of an enlightenment process. This process serves to make the civil society aware of what is going on around them, and ultimately this awareness will impel them to emancipate themselves from the oppressive force. According to the data that was collected concerning the contribution of CCJPZ, it is evident that the Commission contributed immensely towards making the Zimbabwean people aware of what type of government they were dealing with.

##### **6.4.1 Evidence of the War of Position in CCJPZ's Activities**

The publications of CCJPZ showed that the government did not have the people at heart. On the economic issue the CCJPZ showed that the government cared more about a defence budget to the detriment of essential services like health and education. This is found in the article

---

<sup>40</sup> The Sacred Faith of the Doctrine of the Faith is the judicial arm of the Catholic Church which ensures that the doctrine (which is the constitution of the church) is followed.

entitled *Budget and Population control in Zimbabwe*. Two more articles were written about the economic situation during ESAP. There has been evidence of CCJPZ showing how corrupt the government is; an example is the publication of how elections were stolen through the corrupt Registrar General's office and the government controlled Electoral Commission. Corruption is highlighted in articles about Margaret Dongo and Fidelis Mhashu in March/April 1996 and March/April 1998 respectively.

The Commission has tried to show how the ruling party used violence as a campaigning tool. Violence was used to discourage the opposition from going to vote. The government further took advantage of its position to manipulate the electoral process. The CCJPZ endeavoured to show how the government manipulated the electoral process. It further contributed into voter education and election monitoring. During the process of constitutional reforms the Commission took as its responsibility to highlight the importance of the Constitution to good governance. All these activities can be found in the data presentation under three categories namely the Electoral process, Violence and the Constitution.

#### **6.4.2 A Critical Look at CCJPZ's Contribution**

Before this study began to explore the contribution of CCJPZ, it seems as if the contribution made by the Commission was negligible because there is not much information about the CCJPZ in press conferences or national newspapers. These public media only publish what they find relevant and what serves their objective. During the search, the researcher only realised that most of CCJPZ's activities were published through the Bishop's Pastoral letters, CCJPZ Annual Reports and its Newsletters which are published through the Catholic magazine called *The Catholic News*, which is a fortnight publication. The CCJPZ aims at conscientising the Zimbabwean people about the nature of the government but the scope covered by its publication is limited. The Catholic News magazine is sold to everyone but its target market is Catholics because you can only find it in Catholic bookshops and around Catholic Churches. It is rare to find a Catholic News issue in an ordinary bookshop or sold by a vendor on the street where more people have access to its content.



Pastoral letters are designed for different purposes depending on the situation. Though they embody the Catholic teachings, they are normally directed to either the government or the Catholic faithful. These letters only become public if a journalist happens to have highlighted what the Bishops are saying. The researcher is a Catholic and a former student priest but he only had more knowledge about the activities of the CCJPZ through research. In other words, the research is trying to show that even when it comes to Catholics not all of them know about this contribution if the scope of these publications is not widened. No matter how the Commission tries to make the Zimbabwean public aware of the miscarriage of governance in Zimbabwe, they need to incorporate their publication with widely well-known publications.

One can argue that the CCJPZ has published its concerns through the Zimbabwe Human Rights Forum because in 2000, the Forum together with the CCJPZ compiled a report on the political violence entitled *Organised Violence and Torture in Zimbabwe*. Even though such efforts are made, how will we know the specific position of the Commission? As long as the efforts of CCJPZ are meant to benefit everyone beyond Catholics, the Commission should rethink its publishing methodology. The researcher has highlighted about four detailed reports of more than 150 pages written by the Commission. Unfortunately these reports are normally found in Catholic properties. On one hand, if a piece of information is meant for the catholic community e.g. an issue of doctrinal nature, it should be found in Catholic premises. On the other hand, if the Catholic Church writes information meant for the Zimbabweans beyond denominational limitation, this information is no longer Catholic property; every Zimbabwean is entitled to have it. Any library should have such information. The CCJPZ needs to find effective ways of publishing their contributions.

#### **6.4.3 The Necessity of the War of Manoeuvre in CCJPZ's Contribution**

Gramsci's writings and commentary seem not to support the *war of manoeuvre* because it is unsustainable and lacks a strong foundation of self-consciousness which characterises 'War of Position'. *War of manoeuvre* consists of the uprising of the Masses declaring their dissatisfaction with the present government in a bid to takeover. Other writings which comment on the relationship of *war of position* and *wars of manoeuvre* especially Cox (1999)

say these two 'wars' work together; they cannot be understood separately. This section will want to see these positions as necessarily co-existing elements. It is important to note that the researcher's use of the *war of manoeuvre* is not meant to take over the government but to give people power to demand a better government and leadership of their choice.

The information collected in this research shows that most of the energies invested by CCJPZ were channelled towards the *war of position*. As indicated earlier in this chapter, CCJPZ's contribution was focused on making Zimbabwean people aware that they are being taken for a ride by the government. The researcher has never witnessed a peaceful march of defiance which was organised by the CCJPZ; it is in South Africa where such demonstrations are witnessed. The CCJPZ has in the past expressed support of peaceful protest organised by other bodies but it has never organised such a march before, since none of its writing witnesses to that. The research is convinced that the CCJPZ should do that because it has been trying to challenge the government for too long now. A march of defiance gives the people an ownership of their fight for emancipation. Moreover, people will have hope if they are assured of protection from an internationally recognised body like CCJPZ.

The CCJPZ has branches in every province in the country and such branches can work with all churches/parishes in those provinces. The Catholic Church has a church/parish almost in every part of Zimbabwe, it would be more effective for the Catholic Church if it embarked on a massive peaceful protest against the government of Zimbabwe. The timing of the protest should be so organized that people in different parts of the country would embark on it precisely at the same time. The situation of Zimbabwe is so desperate that an action of that nature is necessary. If CCJPZ wants to help the situation it should move out of its comfort zone defined by conferences, press release and research. The Catholic Church is not a small organisation like National Constitution Assembly. It is universally linked such that it can first mobilise the universal Church's support. Amongst all the despair in Zimbabwe the researcher still believes that CCJPZ can influence change towards good governance in Zimbabwe.

## **6.5 Conclusion**

This chapter sought to understand why the political upheaval, mainly engendered by the government, has continued inexorably in Zimbabwe despite the calls by the CCJPZ for better governance. One of the reasons adduced for this was that Mugabe, who is the state president and a Catholic by religious persuasion, has accused the Church of applying double standards; he has used the fact that Catholics do not democratically vote for their leaders and so for Catholic movements such as CCJPZ to claim to promote democracy reeks of hypocrisy. The lack of democracy in the Church has been a contentious issue. The case of Boff, who tried to challenge age-old hierarchies of the Church and was ostracized for this proves that the Church is also intolerant to challenging views and it is also not willing to move with time.

The concepts of consciousness/culture that Gramsci talks about in his writings have also been used as tools of analysis in this chapter. The first level of a consciousness in a civil society is collective consciousness wherein a civil society is motivated by self-interest in its advocacy. By seeking self-consciousness, advocacy groups would prefer lending their support to a repugnant hegemony provided this secures the interest of the group. The second level is class consciousness. This type of consciousness scouts for alternative way of leadership in a polity. It does not, without questioning, pander to the ideas of the hegemony. Self-interest here is not a blind ambition. Self-consciousness is a level where civil society totally extricates itself from any form of patronage by the political society.

It can safely be said that the CCJPZ, from 1990-2000 exuded certain indications of self-consciousness. It should then be asked as to why Zimbabwe has not changed for the better. Apart from the counter-accusations that the government flings at the Church, another aspect that has made the CCJPZ's approach impotent is the scarcity or the selective accessibility of its crusades. Despite being a Catholic organisation, the CCJPZ aspires to improve the lives of all Zimbabweans irrespective of their creed. For this reason, pastoral letters and every other avenue that the CCJPZ uses should be at the disposal of all Zimbabweans. In addition to this the CCJPZ ought to organize far-reaching protests against bad governance. Again, despite the

Catholic Church being the provenance of such initiatives, those who should galvanised into actions are all Zimbabweans who wish to register their misgiving with the government. Thus, from Gramsci's *war of manoeuvre* and *war of position*, the CCJPZ could use both of these aspects. The *war of position* takes a toned-down approach of criticising the government, much like what the CCJPZ has used mostly in Zimbabwe. The *war of manoeuvre*, in its raw form could be so radical as to call for a wholesale takeover and replacement of the government. This research calls for a *war of manoeuvre* which is morally defensible and does not degenerate into violent chaos. There are more benign ways of carrying out the *war of manoeuvre*. These would include non-violent nationwide protests, championed by the CCJPZ, its fellow civil society groups and all concerned Zimbabweans.

## **CHAPTER SEVEN GENERAL CONCLUSION**

---

In recent decades, Zimbabwe has been in the spotlight because of its political and economic travails. Even from the most casual observer, it is obvious that much of the suffering in Zimbabwe has been caused by the problem of governance. Robert Mugabe and his colleagues have been jeered and vilified by Zimbabweans as well other concerned parties outside Zimbabwe and Africa. In Zimbabwe, there has been consistent opposition to the government by both political and civil society groups.

This research has looked at the role of one of the many civil society groups, the CCJPZ and its advocacy in Zimbabwe. The research has used Gramsci's theory of civil society to analyse the stance of the CCJPZ in Zimbabwe. The research has been a qualitative study and hence has not made any use of quantitative data and its tools of analysis. The research has relied mainly on qualitative literature that has preceded this research.

In order to put the actions the CCJPZ in perspective, the paper has taken a historical and broader framework of looking at how the Church gradually improved its social responsibility. For this reason, the research cited Karl Mark as one of the most important influences behind the Church's turn towards social responsibility. By popularizing the saying that religion was the opium of the people, Marx meant to impress on his readers the fact the religion was inadvertently supporting the injustice of the world by ignoring the plight of the people in so far as it was not directly connected to religious spirituality. Theologians who came after Marx and talked about the role that the Church could play in social, were in some way trying to address the challenge that Marx put to the Church.

The *Rerum Novarum* was a historic missive to emerge from the Vatican in that it was the first time the Church officially talked about the plight of the working class. Its striking resemblance to Marxist sentiment was manifest. After this document came the evolution of tradition

spirituality in Latin America into and advocacy-driven theology known as liberation theology. This form of theology was very applicable in that it advocated for political and economic justice in Latin America. This brand of theology showed a lot of intent on the part of the Church to get involved in all facets of human life.

The Vatican Council II has also been alluded in this research mainly because it was during this Council that the development of the CCJP was agreed. From that time, the CCJP has been very instrumental in advocating for good governance and justice in the world. Since its inception, the CCJP has been formed in different nations and hence in Zimbabwe it is known as the CCJPZ. The contribution of the CCJPZ in Zimbabwe has been analysed from the theoretical framework of Antonio Gramsci.

Gramsci proved apposite because he talks of how the civil society can either be pro-hegemony or counter-hegemony. Those that are pro-hegemony support the status quo whether it is to the detriment of the wider society or not. Those that are counter-hegemony seek to change the political landscape or at least to force it to change certain things about it. One other thing that has been very important from Gramsci is his concept of consciousness. Gramsci talks of three levels of consciousness through which civil society can pass. The first type of consciousness is collective/corporate consciousness in which civil societies engage in advocacy for the self-interest only. This type of consciousness would forestall civil societies from criticising political leaderships that are inimical to the general public as long as it secures the interests of the civil society. The second type of consciousness is class consciousness which is a combination of different corporate consciousness and expresses some misgiving with certain misdeeds of the political society. The highest level of consciousness is self-consciousness where the civil society adheres to the norms of civil society and frees itself utterly from the pressure and influence of the hegemony or political leadership.

The research has shown that the CCJPZ is totally free of political ambitions. However, despite its calls for better conditions, the situation in Zimbabwe has not changed for the better. For this

reason, the research has shown that the CCJPZ could use the two ways of advocating for a better society. Gramsci says the first way of protesting is called the *war of position* and the second is the *war of manoeuvre*. The former is mostly theoretical, but the latter is a radical form of protest. The paper argues that the CCPZ can use both of these forms of protest. The *war of manoeuvre* can be expressed through protests which take on a notional following. For this to happen, the paper has argued that the CCJPZ and its documents have to be accessible to all Zimbabweans, even those that are not Catholic. Through these initiatives, the CCJPZ would get more followers on its stance against corruption, violence and the doctoring of elections in Zimbabwe. The data presented has shown that despite its estimable stance on these vices, the CCJPZ has been relentless in calling for good governance. What has left it hamstrung are issues of the CCJPZ inaccessibility to non-Catholic and the intransigent of the government in Zimbabwe.

## Bibliography

---

A Report on the Disturbances in Matebeleland and the Midlands 1980-88 entitled *Breaking the Silence: Building True Peace* by The Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace in Zimbabwe.

A Report on the Political Violence in Zimbabwe during Parliamentary Elections held in 2000, entitled *The Crisis of Governance* by The Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace in Zimbabwe.

A Report on Political Violence in Zimbabwe from 1998 to 1999 entitled *Violence and Torture in Zimbabwe in 1999* by Human Rights Legal Unit of the Zimbabwean Human Rights Forum.

A Report on the Political Violence in Zimbabwe following the March Harmonised 2008 Election entitled *Graveyard Government* by The Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace

Auret, D. (1992). *Reaching for Justice: The Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace (1972-1992)*. Gweru: Mambo Press.

Auret, M. (1996). 'The Budget and Population Control in Zimbabwe', in *Catholic Church News*. (January/February): p19.

Babbie, E. and Mouton, J. (2012). *The Practice of Social Research*. 14<sup>th</sup> Edition. Cape Town. Oxford University Press Southern Africa (Pvt) Ltd.

Baum, G. (1991). The Originality of Catholic Social Teaching. *Concilium* (5): 55-62.



Boff, L. (1985). *Church, Charism and Power: Liberation Theology and the Institutional Church*. London: SCM.

Bonhoeffer, D. (1955). *Ethics*. London: SCM Press Ltd

Bonino, J M (1983). *Towards a Christian Political Ethics*. Philadelphia: Fortress Press

Bratton, M .(1989). 'Beyond The State: Civil Society and Associational Life in Africa'. *World Politics* 41 (3): 407- 430.

Bratton, M. (1994). Civil Society and Political Transition in Africa. *Institute for Development Research Reports* 11 (6): 1-21.

Buttigieg, J.A. (1995). 'Gramsci on Civil Society' *Boundary* 22(3): 1-32.

\_\_\_\_\_ 2002. "On Gramsci" *Daedalus*, 131(3): 67-70.

\_\_\_\_\_ 2005. 'The Contemporary Discourse on Civil Society: A Gramscian Critique' *Boundary*, 32(1): 33-52

Cardijn, J M. (1955). London: Cooperative Press LTD.

CCJPZ Annual Report of 1993

\_\_\_\_\_1997

\_\_\_\_\_2000

\_\_\_\_\_2011

CCJPZ (2000). 'The State Exists for the People: Catholic Bishops Speaks out on the Constitution'. *Catholic Church News* (January/February): 18.

\_\_\_\_\_(1995). 'Commission to Monitor Elections'. *Catholic Church News* (January/February): 21

\_\_\_\_\_(1995). 'The United Party Appeals to CCJPZ'. *Catholic Church News*. (January/February): 21

\_\_\_\_\_(1994). 'Voting Information and Education'. *Catholic Church News*. (October/November):19.

\_\_\_\_\_(1994). 'The Voter Education Project'. *Catholic Church News*. (October/November):21.

\_\_\_\_\_(1997). 'CCJPZ presents Report on Gukurahundi'. *Catholic Church News*. (July/August):19.

Chikambi, P (1996). The Force behind Margaret Dongo. *Catholic Church News*. (March/April):17.

Comblin, J (2005). 'The Signs of the time'. *Concilium* (4): 72-85.

CNN Reporter (1996). 'Bishop Concerned with Health Budget Cuts'. *Catholic Church News*. (January/February):19

Cox, R. (1983). 'Gramsci, Hegemony and International Relations: An Essay in Method'. *Millennium: Journal of International Studies*. 12(2):162-175.

\_\_\_\_\_ 1999. 'Civil Society at the Turn of the Millenium: Prospects for an Alternative World Order'. *International Studies* 25 (1) (January): 3-28.

Crehan, K. 2002. *Gramsci, Culture and Anthropology*. California: University of California Press.

deGruchy, J & Villa-Vicencio, C (ed). (2005). *Doing Theology in Context: South African Perspective*. Cape Town: David Philip.

Doig, A (1996). 'From Lynskey to Nolan: The Corruption of British Politics and Public Services?' *Journal of Law and Society*. 23 (1): 36-55.

Dube, J G (2006). *A Socio-Political Agenda for the Twenty-First Century Zimbabwean Church*. New York: The Edwin Mellen Press.

European Revolution of 1848. (Age of the Sage.org). Available from <http://www.age-of-the-saga/europeanrevolution/1848>> [Accessed on 25 August 2013].

Fatton, R. (1995). 'Africa in the Age of Democratization: the Civic Limitations of Civil Society'. *The African Studies Association*. 38(2): 67-99.

Fascism (New World Encyclopedia.org). Available from  
<http://newworldencyclopedia.org/entry/fascism> [Accessed 15 October 2013]

Femia, J. V. (1981). *Gramsci's Political Thought: Hegemony, Consciousness, and the Revolutionary Process*. Oxford: Clarendon.

Flannery, A (ed) (1980). *Vatican II Council: The Conciliar and Post Conciliar Document*.  
Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press.

Fr Boff's Resignation: Questions About Freedom in the Church. *Tablet* 4 July 1992, 827-828.

Gheerbrant, A. (1974). *The Rebel Church in Latin America*. Ontario: Penguin Books

Gramsci, A. (2003). *Selections from the Prison Notebooks*. Hoare, Q & Nowell Smith, G., (eds).  
New York: International Publishers.

\_\_\_\_\_ (2007). *Prison Notebooks, Volume 3*. trans. J.A. Buttigieg. Columbia University Press.

Gremillion, J (1976). *The Gospel of Peace and Justice: Catholic Social Teaching since Pope John*. Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books.

Gundani ,P (2007). 'Prophecy, Politics and Power: Changing Relations between the Catholic Church and the Zimbabwean State'. Available from  
<<http://seach.ebschost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=3451408&site=ehost-live>>

[Accessed 28<sup>th</sup> June 2013]

Gutierrez, G (1979). Liberation Praxis and Christian Faith, in Gibellini, R (ed) . *Frontiers of Theology in Latin America*. Mayknoll, New York: Orbis Books.

Good Governance and Human Rights: What is good governance (2010). (Human Right Page)  
Available from

<http://www.ohchr.org/en/Issue/Development/GoodGovernance/pages/GoodGovernanceIndex.aspx> [Accessed 22 August 2013].

Hales, E E Y (1965). *Pope John and his Revolution*. London: Cox & Wyman.

Hann, C (1996). 'Political Society and Civil Society Anthropology, in Hann, C & Dunn, E (ed). *Civil Society: Challenging Western Models*. London & New York: Routledge.

Hebblethwaite, P (1977). *The Christian-Marxist Dialogue: Beginning, Present Status, and Beyond*. New York: Paulist Press.

Kee, A (1974). *Domination of Liberation: The Place of Religion in Social Conflict*. London: SCM Press Ltd.

Linden, I (1980). *The Catholic Church and the struggle for Zimbabwe*. London: Longman

Matikiti, R (2008). 'The Church and the Struggle for multi-party Democracy in Zimbabwe', in: *The Role of the Church in the Struggle for Democratic Change in Zimbabwe*. Harare: Zimbabwe Institute Publications: 25-39.

Makumbe, J (1998). 'Is there a Civil Society in Africa'. *International Affairs* 74 (2): 305-317.

Manly, M (1994). What is ESAP Doing to the Poor. *Catholic Church News*. (April/May), p 14-15.

Manyonganise, M & Chirimuuta, C (2011). Christians' participation in politics in Zimbabwe: A privilege or a right. *Missionalia* 39 (3): 287-305.

Manuel, P C, Reardon, L C, Wilcox (ed) (2006). *The Catholic Church and The Nation-State: Comparable Perspectives*. Washington D C: Georgetown University Press.

Marquardt, M (2000). *John Wesley's Social Ethics: Praxis and Principles*. Eugene: Wipf and Stock Publishers

Marx, K (1844). *Hegel's Critique of his Philosophy of Right*. Marxist Org. Available from <http://marxist.org/archieve/marx/works/critique-hps/intro.htm> [Accessed 11 May 2009]

Marx, K (1844). *Economic and Philosophical Manuscript*. Marxist. Org. Available from <<http://marxist.org/archieve/marx/works/1844/manuscripts/labour.htm>>. [Accessed 31 May 2013]

McLellan, D (ed) (1997). *Political Christianity: A Reader*. London: SPCK

Moyo, J N (1993). 'Civil Society in Zimbabwe'. *Zambezia* 20(1): 1-13.

Musekiwa, P (2013). 'Constitutionalism in Zimbabwe: A History of Progression or regression'. *Mukai* 64 (March): 21-23.

Musiwa, S (2000). 'Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace not Partisan'. *Catholic Church News*. (September/October): 20.

Musiwa, S (1998). 'Mhashu in Another Legal Battle to Challenge Mayoral Election Results'. *Catholic Church News*. (March/April):16-17.

Nolan, A & Broderick, R (1987). *To Nourish Our Faith: Theology of Liberation for Southern Africa*. Hilton: Order of Preacher.

O' Malley (2012). 'Ressourcement and Reform at Vatican II'. *Concilium* (3): 47-55.

Phiri, I (2001). *Proclaiming Political Pluralism: Church and Political Transition in Africa*. London: Praeger Publishers.

Phiri, S (2011). *Zimbabwean Political Crisis: The Catholic Church on the Crossroads*. Saarbrücken: Academic Publishing GmbH&Co. KG.

Phiri, S (2010). *A Critique of the Relationship between the Catholic Church and the State in Zimbabwe: Towards an Empathetic Dialogical Method*. MTH thesis, University of KwaZulu-Natal, Pietermaritzburg.

Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace. (Vatican.va/roman) Available from [http://www.vatican.va/roman\\_curia/pontifical\\_councils/justpeace/documents/rc\\_pc\\_justice\\_pro\\_20011004\\_en.html](http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/pontifical_councils/justpeace/documents/rc_pc_justice_pro_20011004_en.html) [Accessed 24 July 2013].

Rugger, C (2010). 'Antonio Gramsci Facts' in Encyclopedia of Biography. Available from [www.yourdictionary.com/antonio-gramsci](http://www.yourdictionary.com/antonio-gramsci) [Accessed 25 July 2013]

Ruzivo (2008). 'A Mapping of the church groups in Zimbabwe' in *The Role of the Church in the Struggle for Democratic Change in Zimbabwe*. Harare: Zimbabwe Institute Publications, 25-39.

Sachikonye, Lloyd (2011). *When a State Turns on its Citizens*. Harare: Jacana Media.



Sakala, E (2000). 'Elections must be Free of Violence'. *Catholic Church News*. (May/June): 24.

\_\_\_\_\_(1999). 'Church, Politics and State Affairs'. *Catholic Church News*. (January/February ):23.

\_\_\_\_\_(1997). 'Know your Rights'. *Catholic Church News*. (July/August):22.

\_\_\_\_\_(1994). Civic and Church Bodies Want to Monitor 1995 Elections. *Catholic Church News*. (October/November): 20.

Schafers, M (1991). 'Rerum Novarum- The Result of Christian Social Movement from below'. *Concilium* (5): 4-15.

Simon, R. (1990). *Gramsci's Political Thought: An Introduction*. 2nd ed. London: Lawrence & Wishart Ltd.

Verstraelen, F J (1998). *Zimbabwean Realities and Christian Responses*. Gweru: Mambo Press.

Warren, M E (1999). Civil Society and Good governance. (Georgetown.edu). Available in

<<http://www.georgetown.edu/faculty/wilcoxc/civilsociety.pdf>> [Accessed 24 June 2013]

Walsh, M & Davies, B (1984). *Proclaiming Justice and Peace*. London: Collins Liturgical Publication.

Walf, K (2004). The Roman Pontiff and the College, in Beal, J P, Coriden, J A & Green T J (ed). *New Commentary on the Code of Canon Law: Study Edition*. Bangalore: Theological Publication in India.

Wermter, O (1999). Constitution: What is at Stake? *Catholic Church News*. (July/April), p 26-27.

Wehmeier, S (2006). *Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

ZCBC Pastoral Letter, 'Use your Vote, It is your Right'. (7<sup>th</sup> June 2000).

ZCBC Pastoral Letter, 'Working for the Common Good'. (May 1998).