

**AN ASSESSMENT OF PEOPLE'S PERCEPTIONS ON THE
SUSTAINABILITY OF CATO MANOR'S LOCAL ECONOMIC
DEVELOPMENT INITIATIVES IN POST-APARTHEID SOUTH
AFRICA**

BANDILE PRECIOUS CELE

**Dissertation submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the
Degree of Master of Social Science in the Faculty of Humanities,
Development and Social Sciences (in IOLS)**

UNIVERSITY OF KWAZULU-NATAL, DURBAN

SUPERVISOR: MR SITHEMBISO BHENGU

November 2010

DECLARATION

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Social Science, in the Graduate Programme in

**Industrial, Organisational and Labour Studies,
University of KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa.**

I declare that this dissertation is my own unaided work. All citations, references and borrowed ideas have been duly acknowledged. It is being submitted for the degree of Master of Social Science in the Faculty of Humanities, Development and Social Sciences, University of KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa. None of the present work has been submitted previously for any degree or examination in any other University.

Bandile Precious Cele

November 2010

DEDICATION

I dedicate this dissertation to my parents, Nduna and Simangele Cele.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to give thanks to God for his love and guidance at all times.

Thanks to my supervisor, Mr Sithembiso Bhengu, for believing in my abilities at all times.

Thank you to the NRF for securing me with a scholarship for my studies.

To Dr Mpedi Madue and Prof Ari Sitas thank you for your encouragement and much needed assistance.

Finally, I would like to thank my husband Khapane Sebedi, my mom Simangele Cele, family and friends for their love, support and encouragement throughout the year. Thank you!

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION.....	ii
DEDICATION.....	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS	v
CHAPTER ONE: OVERVIEW OF THE RESEARCH.....	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background to the Research Topic.....	1
1.3 Problem Statement and Justification	2
1.3.1 General Research Questions.....	4
1.4 Research Objectives	4
1.4.1 Primary Objective.....	4
1.4.2 Secondary Objectives	4
1.5 Preliminary Literature Review	5
1.6 Research Methodology.....	5
1.7 Significance of the Study.....	5
1.8 Format of the Thesis.....	6
1.9 Conclusion.....	7
CHAPTER TWO: INTRODUCTION TO THE RESEARCH SITE	8
2.1 Introduction	8
2.2 Background of Cato Manor: Case Study Area.....	8
2.2.1 Cato Manor: The Early Years.....	8
2.2.2 Cato Manor: Post-1994.....	10
2.2.3 Cato Manor’s Economic Status.....	13
2.3 Development in Perspective	13
2.4 The Integrated Development Plan	15
2.5 Conclusion.....	16
CHAPTER THREE: LITERATURE REVIEW.....	17
3.1 Introduction	17
3.2 Defining Development	17
3.2.1 Sustainable Development	20
3.3 Sustainable Livelihoods Theory.....	21
3.3.1 Sustainable Livelihoods and its Assumptions	24
3.3.2 Sustainable Livelihoods Frameworks.....	25
3.3.3 SL Approaches used regionally and internationally?	30
3.4 Critique of Sustainable Livelihoods (SL) and the Frameworks	30
3.5 Conclusion.....	32
CHAPTER FOUR: METHODOLOGY	35
4.1 Introduction	35
4.2 Research methods and approach.....	36
4.3 Fieldwork process: collecting primary data.....	37
4.3.1 Archival and Documentary data	37
4.3.2 Interviews	37
4.3.3 Questionnaire survey.....	38
4.4 Limitations.....	39
4.5 Conclusion.....	39

CHAPTER FIVE: RESEARCH FINDINGS	41
5.1 Introduction	41
5.2 Analysis of the data	41
5.2.1 Prior	41
5.2.2 During.....	42
5.2.3 After and/or continuation effects.....	46
5.3 Interpretation	51
5.4 Conclusion.....	54
CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	55
6.1 Introduction	55
6.2 Literature Review	55
6.3 Empirical Findings	55
6.4 Limitations of the research	58
6.5 Recommendations	58
6.5.1 General.....	58
6.5.2 Recommendation for further research.....	59
6.6 Conclusion.....	59

CHAPTER ONE

OVERVIEW OF THE RESEARCH

1.1 INTRODUCTION

The monopolisation of Africa's means of subsistence negatively affected Blacks all over the world ... the emancipation of the Black world and the rest of the oppressed is inconceivable without breaking and melting down the chain of economic bondage and our reified historical consciousness. (Magubane, 2000: 414-6)

In order to free African communities from economic bondage to their erstwhile oppression, the South African State seeks to develop local communities through projects that facilitate local control of the means of subsistence. This research explores one recipient community's perceptions of the sustainability of such interventions. That is done by means of a case study involving the Cato Manor Entrepreneurial Support Centre project and the Industrial and Commercial Land Development premises project. This in-depth study of Cato Manor development projects looks into urban development in post apartheid South Africa. The Cato Manor community's struggles with serious challenges like unemployment and poverty provide a good case for a study such as the present one.

This opening chapter sets out the importance of the study, while also outlining the problem statement along with the research objectives.

1.2 BACKGROUND TO THE RESEARCH TOPIC

Sachs (2005) states that South Africa suffers from a highly dualistic economy, with a world class formal economy that includes an increasing number of multinational companies, alongside a certain population that is unemployed and dependant on both welfare grants and the informal sector for survival (<http://www.khaya-aicdd.org>). A quarterly labour force survey done by Statistics South Africa shows that by June 2008 59.4 % of the SA population fell under the sector of formal employment and 35.8 % under informal employment and the remaining 4.8% fell under the other employment, namely, employers and own account workers who are not in the informal sector (Quarterly Labour Force Surveys Report, 2008:6).

The different employment sectors in SA “are characterised as the formal (first) and informal (second) economy and Government has been given responsibility to promote the second economy namely encouraging pro-poor LED” (<http://www.khaya-aicdd.org>). A feature of economic development in major metropolitan municipalities in South Africa is the building of globally competitive regions which ought to benefit the surrounding communities from the ensuing economic growth and attendant job creation.

In the context of Local Economic Development, Cato Manor has initiated economic development projects as part of a Small, Medium and Micro Enterprise (SMME) Development Programme. The Entrepreneurial Support Centre (ESC; see Appendix E) for small manufacturers and the construction of small-scale industrial workshops serve as an incubation centre. This centre is considered a local economic empowerment structure serving the SMME sector in the areas of knowledge network and business linkage processes. It thus is a delivery vehicle for a range of information dissemination and development initiatives (Cato Manor Social Development Strategy Review, 2005). Linked to the ESC are the Container Park and the Wiggins Economic Hive; both units are strategically placed to provide appropriate, resourced and networked business premises.

Therefore, it is opportune and constructive to evaluate stakeholder perceptions of how the ESC project and the Industrial and Commercial Land Development projects (Container Park and Wiggins Economic Hive) serve their needs relating to sustainable job creation and long-term economic growth. This evaluation is further necessitated by a desire to facilitate critical comparisons across various development scenarios (Capricorn et al, 2000). It is for these reasons that the present research delves into the strengths and weaknesses of the ESC project and its relationship with Container Park and the Wiggins Economic Hive projects.

1.3 PROBLEM STATEMENT AND JUSTIFICATION

Magubane stated:

“I am having seven children and nothing to depend on. I am making bricks and sometimes it rains and then I can’t do it. And I collect food and take it to people. I fetch wood and collect cans of cold drink and sell them. When I am without food then I go next door and if they don’t have, then the children will have empty stomachs and I cry. Yesterday I left with my children fast asleep because they will ask me what we are going to eat. I am very thin, because

when I bought a bucket of mielie meal, I won't eat at all if I am thinking of the children.”

The foregoing interview (taken from Marais, 2001:198-199) echoes quite eloquently the everyday life and experience of the people of Cato Manor as well as many other poor communities in South Africa (Adelzadeh, Alvillar and Mather, 2001; Khosa, 2001; Bond, 2002). Dealing with informal housing, low education levels and economic decline are just some of the severe developmental challenges that South Africa is facing. South Africa's official unemployment rate rose to 23.5% in the first quarter of 2009 from 21.9% in the previous three months, according to Stats SA. A total of 208 000 people living in South Africa lost their jobs between the last quarter of 2008 and the first quarter of 2009, according to the agency's quarterly labour force survey (Stats SA, 2009:1). The survey shows that losses occurred in both formal (88 000) and informal (96 000) sectors. Agriculture and private households accounted for the other losses. The population of the unemployed people seeking employment increased from 3.873 million to 4.184 million in the same period.

In South Africa, being below the poverty line means spending less than R476.30 per month (<http://2www.saep.org>). The prevalence of unemployment in South Africa makes it practically impossible for many people to rise out of poverty. Moreover, the number of new entrants to the job market is outstripping formal sector job creation by an ever wider margin. As noted by Adelzadeh, Alvillar and Mather (2001:23), “Semi-skilled and unskilled workers have been hardest hit by the shrinking of formal sector employment opportunities caused by economic restructuring noticeably in the mining and agricultural sectors.”

According to Desai (2001), unemployment in specific townships and areas that are dominated by the poor can reach the heights of 70%, leaving many families completely reliant on pensions and grants. Given all these pressing concerns, the need has arisen for South Africa to adopt diverse income generating strategies in addition to strategies aimed at ensuring sustainable livelihoods. Consequently, one of the development strategies in KwaZulu-Natal (KZN), the Area Based Management (ABM), serves as a model local development strategy.

The ABM actively involves local citizens and other stakeholders in the management of their own area so as to deal effectively with local economic and social issues. The ABM is an important institutional mechanism through which the delivery of services can be focused on key areas, namely, the Cato Manor Development Association (CMDA) and the Warwick Junction projects.

The eThekweni Municipality together with the European Union (EU) have extended the piloting of area based management to five areas within the metro. “These include the Inner Thekwini Regeneration and Urban Management Plan or iTrump (based in the inner city), the South Durban Basin (the largest manufacturing base in the metro), INK (Inanda, Ntuzuma and Kwamashu) and Cato Manor” (Moodley, 2004:48).

1.3.1 GENERAL RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The research questions that guide this study are:

- What are the participants’ perceptions of the impact of LED projects on their lives in Cato Manor?
- How does the sustainable livelihoods framework facilitate the understanding of LED strategies and projects in post-apartheid SA?

1.4 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

Given the research questions with which this research is concerned, the objectives of the research can be listed as follows.

1.4.1 PRIMARY OBJECTIVE

This research attempts to examine the relationship between sustainable development, sustainable livelihoods and Local Economic Development theory with the practical implementation of development projects in the South African context.

1.4.2 SECONDARY OBJECTIVES

The specific objectives of the study are to:

- Assess whether the development projects in the Cato Manor area are positively or negatively perceived
- Determine whether the skills acquired through the projects are of use outside the Local Economic Development environment (e.g. sustainable job creation and creation of long-term economic growth)
- Examine whether recipients have been able to utilise skills acquired from the training programmes meant to better their businesses

1.5 PRELIMINARY LITERATURE REVIEW

Development literature supplies the theoretical and methodological compass for the execution of this project. Authors such as Adelzadeh, Alvillar and Mather 2001; Bond, 2002; Bloch and Kesper, 2000a; Helmsing, 2003; Louw, 1997; Hirsch and Hanival, 1998; Rogerson, 1998c; and Solebury, 2003 have made pertinent contributions to the body of literature that engages the subject of Local Economic Development (LED). The various perspectives on LED and the sustainability approach were fused with a view to develop a synthetic picture of the development trajectory in the broader South African urban development landscape in the context of the economic problems mentioned above. Numerous articles in international and South African journals and a number of books were used in order to gain a general understanding of the historical processes which inspired the field of LED on the one hand, and, on the other, the different approaches it encompasses. The application of this literature to the South African is not a straightforward affair as will become apparent below that further research is required.

1.6 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

At the level of empirical research this study was conducted through a qualitative research. A semi-structured questionnaire research tool was designed for the study. Information was gathered via the administration of interviews and questionnaires to stakeholders (ABM and ESC), community leaders, NGOs, CMDA key informants (senior managers), as well as individual beneficiaries.

The study involved 20 in-depth interviews with appropriate leaders that were selected using non-probability purposive sampling (Babbie and Mouton, 2001). For project participants approximately 150 questionnaires were distributed amongst the participants via project leaders and 100 questionnaires were completed. The data thus gathered is analysed below using qualitative methods whereby themes were identified and analysed in greater detail.

1.7 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY

South Africa is currently going through a period of political and social change. Associated with the transition are new ways of reconstructing cities in order to increase the quality of life for all South Africans, especially the poor and marginalised whereby the issue of development becomes critical (May, 1998). I chose this research topic because, after 1994, it became the government's prerogative to redress inequality, alleviate poverty and bring about development (May, 1998). I

used sustainable development and the sustainable livelihoods theories because they deal with issues of development, especially development geared towards sustaining community benefits after the implementation of a project. The literature around post-apartheid development discourse, e.g. Bond (2000), Terreblanche (2002) and Padayachee and Freund (2002) provides a critical South African foundation which this research endeavours to engage decisively.

This study also attempts through an evaluation of LED projects, using the Sustainable Livelihoods approach, to further conceptualise and contribute concrete evidence for the sustainability approach to research as argued by De Haan and Zoomers (2005).

Cato Manor can legitimately be viewed as a microcosm of South Africa and its dire need for empowerment and development. Furthermore, Cato Manor was selected for this research because of its status as a Presidential Lead Project (Cato Manor Social Development Strategy Review, 2005). For this reason, its successes can easily become a model for other major inner city development projects in the post apartheid era.

1.8 FORMAT OF THE THESIS

Chapter two introduces the research site and briefly describes the history of Cato Manor (Umkhumbane) as an area that was affected by apartheid legislation. The chapter also gives a broad analysis of LED as a global concept and argues that although it is feasible to duplicate plans and implementation strategies from elsewhere to suit local conditions, caution is always necessary. The concepts of sustainable development and sustainable livelihoods are incorporated with a view to develop a perspective from which LED initiatives can be seen in Cato Manor. Due account is also taken of the contributions of the local government, the Cato Manor Development Agency (CMDA), the eThekweni Municipality, the business sector and the local community, to the enhancement of LED. Special focus is placed on efforts concerned with increasing incomes and alleviating unemployment and poverty. Mention can be made of, for example, attempts at education and training that enable the unemployed individuals within the community to access the skills to afford them employability across a variety of commercial and industrial sectors.

The purpose of chapter three is to review the literature which I was able to access around the subjects of Sustainable Development, Sustainable Livelihoods. A number of pertinent approaches are reviewed in order to generate a theoretical framework through which the Cato

Manor case study can be analysed. An explanation of the sustainable development concept will form the first part of literature review. The second part focuses on the Sustainable Livelihoods approach. Key proponents of these approaches are outlined and some debates and incipient critiques of this development framework are highlighted.

Chapter four discusses the research methodology employed in terms of the advocated conceptual framework alongside the research design. Data collection techniques are described in detail. In addition, details of the formulation of the sample used as the main source of data are also discussed. Qualitative methods of analysis are then employed to analyse the data gathered in this study.

Chapter five provides the findings of the study through a discussion of the themes emerging from the analysis of primary data. This chapter explains the way in which the Entrepreneurial Support Centre (ESC) has been organized and describes activities which are carried out at the Centre. The characteristics of the ESC will be discussed in the light of the theoretical framework developed for the study in an attempt to discover the extent of the contribution of the Centre to LED, sustainable development and sustainable livelihoods.

Chapter six constitutes the conclusion of this study. The chapter summarises the main findings of the research, including some recommendations that crystallised in the course of the research. The recommendations embody areas for future research on development scenarios.

1.9 CONCLUSION

This opening chapter has presented the background of the research topic, the research problem, as well as the aims and objectives of the ensuing study. Then the chapter concluded with an aerial overview of the remaining chapters in order to enable the reader a realistic sense of what to expect in the pages ahead.

CHAPTER TWO

INTRODUCTION TO THE RESEARCH SITE

2.1 INTRODUCTION

Prior to 1994 South Africa was characterised by unequal development, repression, gross illiteracy, and the economic marginalisation of the overwhelming majority of its citizens. Redressing the inequities of the past forces us to rethink existing ones as well as formulate new socio-economic policies if we are truly interested in increasing the quality of life for all South Africans especially the poor and marginalized (Adelzadeh, Alvillar and Mather, 2001; Bond, 2001).

No political democracy can survive and flourish if the majority of its people remain in poverty, without land, without basic needs being met and without tangible prospects for a democratic Government. (Government of National Unity Report, 1994:5).

Therefore in overcoming the problem of poverty, SA will require that the local government adopts and pursues a sustainable programme of poverty relief. (Office of the President Report, 1999:9)

Hence, from the inception of the post-apartheid dispensation in the early 1990s poverty alleviation came to represent an increasingly significant development concern in South Africa (Adelzadeh, Alvillar and Mather, 2001; and Winter, 2004). Thus "...a concomitant response has been a reconfiguration of the contours of poverty research in South Africa" (Winter, 2004:1), one that reflects this commitment to understanding the nature and causes of impoverishment and contributing to the appropriate formulation of sustainable policy interventions. Cato Manor with its unique history serves as an appropriate base for this research for two reasons. First, in order to facilitate an in-depth understanding of past social inequalities, and secondly in serving a special purpose with the integrated development programmes that have been initiated.

2.2 BACKGROUND OF CATO MANOR: CASE STUDY AREA

2.2.1 CATO MANOR: THE EARLY YEARS

Cato Manor Farm is composed of two wards (wards 29 and 30) and it covers a geographical area of 1,800ha. It is situated approximately 10 kilometres north of Durban's city centre (CMDA

Review, 2002). Cato Manor has a complex history of settlements in relation to its class and racial composition, its patterns of legal and illegal ownership, as well as residence and occupation within the city. Evidence shows that Cato Manor was settled by African communities during the pre-colonial era. During the early years of the 19th century white settlers began to occupy the port of Natal concentrating on the harbour and Berea (Maylam, 1983).

In the early 1840s the British annexed Natal. The beachfront was reserved for use by the military. In 1845 Durban's first mayor, George Cato

...was granted land at Cato Manor in compensation for a beachfront property which had been expropriated for military purposes. George Cato and his descendants farmed this land until the turn of the century, after which it was subdivided into a number of smaller farms. (Maylam, 1983:400)

Between 1900 and the 1930s, the landowners tended to hire out or sell plots of land to Indian market gardeners. By this time, isolated clusters of shacks occupied by Africans had begun to appear along the banks of the Umkhumbane River. "Under the then Union's laws, Africans were prohibited from owning land or building homes in an urban area, and were regarded as a renting class" (Popke, 1997:6).

The influx control measures which had previously been relaxed were consequently tightened; the City Council enforced the provision of a Group Areas Proclamation of the 1940s which prohibited the entry of African work-seekers into an urban area where there was already full employment, which Proclamation also required the removal of all unemployed Africans from the same area (Popke, 1997:7). Cato Manor was incorporated into the municipality of Durban in 1932, which meant that the shack settlements became "illegal". However, authorities turned a blind eye, and people continued to pour into the area. Indian landowners found shack-letting to be more profitable than market gardening, and Indian businessmen set up shops and bus services.

The so-called "Durban Riots" broke out during 1949, "following an incident in which a 14-year-old African boy was allegedly assaulted by an Indian man near Durban's Indian market" (Maylam, 1983:423). This sparked off two days of anti-Indian violence which spread across Cato Manor. On the whole, "87 Africans, 50 Indians, and one white were killed; over 100 people were injured; and many buildings were destroyed and damaged" (Maylam, 1983:424). The riot and the mass campaigns during this period were later viewed as part of popular legend and reflection in history (Maylam and Edwards, 1996).

After 1950, following the riots, Indian landlords returned to collect rents, or let entire plots to Africans who then erected more shacks and sub-let them. By 1950 there were 6 000 shacks in the area, housing between 45 000 and 50 000 people (Maylam and Edwards, 1996). In 1957 the government instructed the municipality to begin developing a new housing scheme for Africans at KwaMashu, and to set up a temporary transit camp in Cato Manor (Maylam and Edwards, 1996).

Attempts to begin moving people in 1959 to other areas such as KwaMashu met with stiff resistance and tensions in Cato Manor. Increasing Pass and liquor raids led to the “Beerhall Riots” (Maylam and Edwards, 1996:135). In 1960 nine policemen were killed by a mob in the Emergency Camp. This event tipped the scales against Cato Manor, and the rapid clearance of the entire area began. When the Group Areas Act was eventually passed by the government, forced removals ensued during the period involving Indian residents being moved to Merebank, Chatsworth and Phoenix while African residents were moved to areas such as Kwamashu, Chesterville and Umlazi (Maylam and Edwards, 1996).

By 1968 Cato Manor was left largely vacant/ desolate. A few scattered houses, shops, the beerhall and several Hindu temples remained (Popke, 1997). During 1978 the few remaining residents formed the Cato Manor Residents' Association, to resist further removals and racially-based housing developments. In the mid-1980s major portions of Cato Manor were officially identified for development and some formal houses were built at Wiggins. The more broadly representative Cato Manor Development Forum (CMDF) was established in 1992 after lengthy negotiations. Ultimately, in 1993, the Cato Manor Development Association (CMDA) was created in order to begin implementing the re-development of Cato Manor (CMDA Review, 2002).

2.2.2 CATO MANOR: POST-1994

The re-emergence of Cato Manor once again attracted a number of informal settlements and widespread land invasions. The place began to come to life again in the early 1990s after the CMDA was formed to deliver much needed infrastructure to the area. In recognition of its significance, Cato Manor became one of the largest lead projects in 1995 (Cato Manor Social Development Strategy Review, 2005:1). It was the first area targeted in Durban for integrated housing and community development in a formerly reserved area. Its other accolade relates to

being one of the first large-scale integrated area schemes to test replicable sustainable issues which were raised by the Government's new housing policies. It thus has practical significance in serving as a pilot project having been selected as a Special Presidential Project – SPP (EU Final Report 2003). As a result, Cato Manor is one of the areas that eloquently represents and can be viewed as a microcosm of inner city underdevelopment in South Africa.

Cato Manor can also be considered one of South Africa's academically richest case studies alongside other special presidential projects e.g. Sophiatown and District Six. As already indicated above, development initiatives for these areas can serve as credible models for other major inner city development projects in post apartheid South Africa (EU Final Report, 2003). External funding is a major factor in the viability of these exemplary projects. "Vast amounts of government resources as well as donor funding notably from the European Union were ploughed into the area" (Cato Manor Social Development Strategy Review, 2005:1).

The Cato Manor Development Programme (CMDP) under the CMDA reflected the political change in South Africa which occurred in 1994 when new priorities were set for the national development effort, most important of which is integration of the previously disadvantaged communities into the mainstream of national life. The gaping chasm between the disadvantaged sections of society and their more affluent co-citizens still exists and closing this gap "will take many years if not decades to accomplish" (Cato Manor Social Development Strategy Review, 2005:1).

By the early 1990s the redevelopment of Cato Manor had emerged as a priority on the agendas of various organizations and initiatives in Durban. After intense negotiations in 1991 an agreement was reached to constitute a widely representative body for the holistic development of the greater Cato Manor area (Robinson and Forster, 2004). By January 1992, the greater Cato Manor Development Forum (CMDF) was established and became the focus for further negotiations about land, development rights and planning. The Cato Manor Development Association (CMDA) was established in 1993 as an implementation vehicle (Cato Manor Development Project Review, 2002). The development of Cato Manor was a response by the council to the need to provide an orderly, integrated and compact development in the heart of the Durban Functional Region to meet the demands of post-apartheid urban development.

The policy drawn up by the CMDP in 1992 stated that the primary objectives of the Cato Manor Development Program (CMDP) are the creation of an efficient and productive ‘city-within-a-city’ aimed mainly at the poor and marginalized. This would be achieved through the

...provision of affordable housing and security of tenure; the development of Cato Manor’s infrastructure, including bulk services to reduce disparities created during apartheid; the improvement of access between people’s homes and places of work, social facilities and shopping sites; the establishment of safe and secure living and working environments; the provision of jobs and extensive economic opportunities; and the integration of Cato Manor into the eThekweni Municipality spatially, politically, economically and socially. (Cato Manor Development Project Review, 2002:1)

This integrated development has been implemented through the CMDP with the CMDA, eThekweni Municipal Authority and its various line departments, the European Union, KZN Provincial Government and the S.A. Government as its major stakeholders (EU Final Report, 2003). The EU Final Report reveals that, since that time CMDA has driven the process to a stage where, by 2002, almost all the planning had been completed, and most of the infrastructure was in place; a significant amount of public investment into public buildings, facilities and capacity building, had been instituted (EU Final Report, 2003).

Throughout this process, the CMDA’s role has been one of strategist, planner, facilitator, project initiator and developer. However, the institutional configuration of the project and of the CMDA itself changed in response to the shifting socio-political environment in Durban and changing conditions on the ground within Cato Manor. For instance, since “September 2003, the ongoing development initiatives were and are being managed through the Area Based Management Programme Office of the eThekweni Municipality” (EU Final Report, 2003:1). Through the infrastructural developments which have taken place over the last ten years in Cato Manor, the Area Based Management (ABM) has furthered the initiative towards social and economic development (CMDA Review, 2002:10).

With specific reference to economic development, Cato Manor’s Local Economic Development Programme aims to lift the skills base of the people of Cato Manor and in the process empowering them to access economic opportunities. Secondly, the programme also seeks to trigger investment through ‘ice-breaking’ projects which the private sector can replicate in the future. “All levels of economic activity are supported from survivalist ‘backyard’ operators to

the provision of industrial space to large scale labour-intensive enterprises thereby creating a hierarchy of opportunities” (Cato Manor Development Project Review, 2002:2). In a nutshell, Cato Manor’s LED programme was designed with the intention of addressing poverty and the need to integrate Cato Manor’s economy with that of the broader metropolitan area (Cato Manor Development Project Review, 2002).

2.2.3 CATO MANOR’S ECONOMIC STATUS

Some of the socio-economic factors that contribute to the quality of life in Cato Manor include population group, age and gender profiles, levels of education, employment and levels of income. For example, the 1996 population census showed a high proportion of female-headed households in Cato Manor. The Census showed that 40% of households in Cato Manor were female-headed households (Vermaak et al, 2001). Many of these female-headed households contained a number of dependants creating an even greater economic and social burden on female earners.

Education levels differ between the formal and informal areas of Cato Manor, which highlights the yawning gap between the classes and thus the social upliftment that is urgently required in the area (Vermaak et al., 2001). Economically, almost half of the Cato Manor population lives below the per capita poverty line which is set at R476, 30 per month, making it an economically poor area (Vermaak et al., 2001). Unemployment rates are highly variable for the Cato Manor population as 27% of its citizens are involved in the informal sector with street vending being the common informal activity, 29% are unemployed and only 44% are economic active (van Schalkwyk and Naidoo, 1999 cited in Crooks, 2000). These are some of the critical factors why this study is undertaken to assess the impact of development initiatives, which were introduced in order to alleviate the above problems, and to facilitate sustainable economic development.

2.3 DEVELOPMENT IN PERSPECTIVE

LED can be defined as a process through which local governments or community-based groups manage their existing resources and stimulate economic activity within the local context by creating local wealth through utilising local resources and potential (Nel, 2001:1005). From a policy perspective, Nel and Binns argue that LED represents the post-apartheid government’s pursuit of a neo-liberal economic strategy and a commitment that devolves the powers of government to the local level so as to more efficiently support community based endeavours.

They further explain that this is due to the fact that under apartheid, a racialised form of Keynesian style policies were rigidly applied to ensure that the central state gained control over all aspects of the society, which led to the suppression of local initiative and the erosion of local autonomy. This might explain why in South Africa LED is regarded as a post-1990 phenomenon (Nel and Binns, 2001).

LED strategies universally have some common objectives. These include meeting social, economic and physical development needs of target communities, through local economic development initiatives. Furthermore, there are six strategies to promote LED, namely, industrial recruitment and place-marketing; small medium micro enterprise (SMME) promotion and support; community economic development; export promotion; business retention and expansion; and investment attraction designed to alleviate poverty, support small business and expand business development (Bond, 2001, 2003; Ndimande, 2006, 2007).

However, support for the development of small, medium and micro-enterprises (SMMEs) remains one of the cornerstones of LED programmes that have been introduced across South Africa over the past decade (Nel and Rogerson, 2005:35). Thus, local government support for SMME development has been an essential element of LED programming, particularly in South Africa's major cities (Parahanse and Goldman, 2006; Rogerson, 1999, 2006). Local interventions made to support SMME development have taken a variety of forms, most importantly concerning affirmative public procurement, assistance for promoting local clusters of SMMEs, the establishment of business incubators as an infrastructural support measure, new frameworks for informal economy entrepreneurs, and the innovation of a range of local advice or support centres designed to nurture entrepreneurship in addition to the advancement of existing SMME entrepreneurs (Rogerson, 2006:54).

Preliminary SMME research findings show the political attention given to SMMEs in post-apartheid South Africa to be an important vehicle for addressing the challenges of job creation, economic growth and equity. The persistence of these challenges continues to be a benchmark for examining the situation of small enterprise development particularly of Black (or African) owned enterprises in South Africa (Rogerson, 1997:37). There has been an explosion of literature on micro enterprises which has mainly emanated from cross section surveys with a focus on growth constraints. Examples include Cattell, (1993); Riley, (1993); TaskGro, (1993); Eichler, (1994); Hirschowitz et al., (1994); Manning and Mashigo, (1994); Horn, (1995); Levy,

(1996); Rogerson, (1996; 1997); Reid, (1997). Literature on established successful SMMEs, by contrast, is rather sparse (Levin, 1997; Rogerson, 1998; Kesper, 1999; Manning, 1996; Bloch and Daze, 2000).

Within the context of LED, Cato Manor has initiated a number of economic development projects as part of a (SMME) Development Programme. “Two components of this are the establishment of an Entrepreneurial Support Centre (ESC) for small manufactures and the construction of small-scale industrial workshops” (Capricorn et al., 2000:1). The ESC can thus be defined as a

...locally owned and managed small and medium enterprise service delivery facility, in partnership with local and national SMME initiatives. The activities of the ESC are structured to empower and nurture existing and new manufacturing SMMEs within a dedicated manufacturing environment. (Capricorn et al., 2000:25)

Within the ESC is situated the Entrepreneurial Support Programme (ESP). The “ESP is a suite of support programmes for full spectrum of economic development initiatives ranging from micro-survivalists to formal industrial and commercial operations” (Capricorn et al., 2000:24). Therefore, the focused objective of the ESC and the ESP is to grow potential entrepreneurs into viable enterprises. The Industrial and Commercial Land development and premises serve as units placed on three sites to provide appropriate resources and networked business premises. In this way, a new holistic development management process – Integrated Development Plan (IDP) – was institutionalised. The previously separate processes of planning, budgeting, implementation and monitoring now form part of one single, participatory process.

2.4 THE INTEGRATED DEVELOPMENT PLAN

The Integrated Development Plan (IDP) 2005/6 for the eThekweni Municipality serves as an overarching framework within which the Cato Manor Local Economic Development project initiative belongs. This policy document outlines the City’s goals and strategies for achieving balanced growth, with poverty reduction and employment creation as its cornerstone. The IDP goals entitled *Economic Development and Job Creation* are:

- To support those sectors that are aligned to and supportive of the City’s values, to retain, grow and create jobs
- To develop the informal sector

The desired outcome is strong and sustainable economic growth. Moreover, the goals and desired outcomes of IDP are consistent with the ideals of reducing poverty and the income gap and creating sustainable employment.

The ensuing research assesses how this LED initiative goes about its task of realizing the objectives of sustainable job creation, and long-term economic growth, in a manner that will allow its success to be generalised across other development scenarios in South Africa. The research also looks into whether and how the participants are able to utilize the skills acquired from the project as well as into the challenges that they come across after the duration of the project. Proof of the success of LED will be found in the extent to which the empowerment skills acquired from the project enables the recipients to raise their household income thus moving their households to above the poverty threshold.

2.5 CONCLUSION

The purpose of this chapter was to provide a comprehensive background and rationale for the study. The chapter has shown what the legacy of apartheid has done to South Africa as whole as well as to affected communities like Cato Manor. Local governments clearly have a complex role to play in reorganising and reorienting previously divided and fragmented cities and towns in pursuit of a new social dispensation for all, and especially for the historically excluded and marginalised.

In summary the chapter has presented broader abstract level challenges into a concrete case of Cato Manor. The chapter was then concluded by an overview of development perspectives.

CHAPTER THREE

LITERATURE REVIEW

3.1 INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this chapter is to trace the theoretical debate on sustainable development and how it has developed into a dominant discourse within the development paradigm. A summarized synthesis of sustainable development and sustainable livelihoods is discussed in this study. This research assesses perceptions of sustainability of Cato Manor projects around its contributions towards the community of Cato Manor. But before concentrating on what has been written on development, it is important to define the concept in detail.

3.2 DEFINING DEVELOPMENT

The concept of development has changed along with economic, political, and social trends. It is from this perspective that I recognise the study of development includes various applications of disciplines (Klaren and Bossert, 1986; Martinussen, 1997; Weaver, 1997; Roberts and Hite, 2000; cited in Solesbury, 2003). In that, development is a multi disciplinary and to fully explore the concept one will need to analyse a few definitions offered by internationally acclaimed authors whom will play a dominant role as well as local ones. This will serve the purpose to provide an understanding of the concept as well as show how different disciplines have used this concept.

According to Flammang (1979) development is defined as a qualitative change in what or how goods and services are produced through shifts in resource use, production methods, workforce skills, technology, information, or financial arrangements. A deduction is made that development is about change, where consideration is given to the quality of current as well as future generations. This particular change process seeks to produce sustainable economic growth while ensuring future generations' ability to do the same. It is from this perspective that Shaffer (1989) defines development as a process that involves improvement in change, a direct attempt to improve public participation, equity, the function of institutions and quality of life. Development can thus also be viewed as the creation of wealth, i.e. the things people value not just money, but a process which enables human beings to realize their potential and the building of self confidence.

Sen (2000) is of the same opinion that development is a process that focuses on human freedom. Development being seen as an expansion of capabilities (people's potential functioning) an approach that is not always linear but may be deviations, acceleration stagnation and lapses along the development path (Anand and Sen, 2000). Sen (1995) views capabilities as corresponding to the overall freedom to lead the life that a person has reason to value. Sen emphasizes the importance of "reason to value" because he believes one needs to scrutinize motivations for valuating specific lifestyles and not simply just valuing a certain life without reflecting upon it.

Korten (1990) provides a social background understanding of the concept. Development is defined as a process by which the members of a society increase their personal and institutional capacities to mobilize and manage resources to produce sustainable and justly distributed improvement in their quality of life, consistent with their own aspiration.

According to Martinussen (1996), the development process is presented from an economic perspective, whereby the real per capita income of a country increases over a long period of time while simultaneously poverty is reduced and the inequality in society is generally reduced. Similarly, Morris and Therievel (2001) explain development as a process that is measured in terms of goods that can be purchased or the 'standard of living'. Based on this concept, development is measured according to the accumulation of material assets. Morris and Therievel (2001) continue to state that further to this, development is also seen as a process that measures the quality of life. However, the quality of life is difficult to measure through markets, since natural capital is largely excluded in the measurement of markets as it is difficult to quantify (Morris and Therievel, 2001).

However, Todaro (1994) explains development as a process that is not purely an economic phenomenon but rather a multi dimensional process involving reorganization and reorientation of entire economic and social system. He argues that development is viewed as a process that improves the quality of all human lives with three equally important aspects these are

- Raising people's living levels, for example incomes and consumption, levels of food, education through relevant growth processes
- Creating conditions conducive to the growth of peoples' self esteem through the establishment of social, political and economic systems

- Increase peoples' freedom to choose by enlarging the range of their choice variables, for example varieties of goods and services.

Padayachee (2006:15) is of the opinion that development is an exercise of power in multiple interconnected arenas, inseparably linked with the socially and spatially uneven dynamics of capitalist development. From this perspective also Evans (1995), provides a remarkable analysis of the conditions under which states in newly industrialised countries encourages private enterprises to pursue the dynamic entrepreneurial strategies which serve as the key to successful industrial development. In that the exercise of power between state and society is questionable in achieving economic development. Therefore Evans (1995), critical question is not how much state intervention is necessary for development, but what kind? He argues that because different types of state structures create different capacities for state intervention these structures define a range of roles that states can pursue. Developmental outcomes depend on whether these roles fit the surrounding social context and how well they are executed by political elites.

Ferguson (1990:9) explains that there are two conceptualisations in literature of development as it manifested through the development agencies and development planning or policies. According to this view, development agencies construe the development system as a collective effort to fight poverty, improve livelihoods and other forms of progress. The first view sees development as a measure of the quality of life dealing with issues such as reduction of poverty and improved standard of living. The second view portrays development as a process of transformation towards a capitalist economy and the development of the drivers of production. The aim of development policies will be to ensure that scarce resources are effectively distributed across a wide spectrum of needs. In theory, decisions on the allocation of resources efficiently and economically imply that often, programmes have to be aligned to the needs of the poor.

The above analysis has explored the different definitions of development provided by various authors. The definitions are characterised by a common key element that 'development is about people' and that is a shared phenomenon be at a social, political or economical level. Development is at a central point of any societal change and has a great impact on people as to how they think, react and make decisions. Taken from the definitions discussed above reveal that in order to see and feel change development must be sustainable. Development is rooted in dense networks of social ties that influences political conduct and negotiations carried out on future

goals, policies and implementation strategies of a community. To further outline the development process the notion of sustainability plays a pivotal role in this regard.

3.2.1 SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

The United Nations World Commission on Environment and Development in 1992 presented a sustainable development framework that makes the conquest of poverty reduction the main long term goal (Soubbotina, 2004:9). The framework has principles and key elements including, but not limited to respect and care for the community of life; improvement of the quality of life; conservation of the earth's vitality and diversity; minimisation of the depletion of non-renewable resources; keeping within the earth's carrying capacity; changing of personal attitudes and practices; enabling of communities to care for their own environments; provision of the national framework for integrating development and conservation; and creation of a global alliance (Brandtland Commission in Yeld, 1993:7).

Within the sustainable development approach, six issues have been identified by the Commission as necessary for these principles to be realized. These are: population development, food security, species and ecosystems, energy, industry, and the urban challenge. However, this list does not include issues of poverty, access to resources and basic services, gender and age inequalities. For this, one may argue that sustainable development places environmental issues ahead of human development. Development effectiveness is questioned when applied to countries with developed economies against underdeveloped and developing countries. For example Bond, (2002:6) argues that as a semi industrialised country South Africa suffers extremely high levels of poverty. Inequality is also worsening as the proportion of black Africans under the poverty line rose dramatically during the period 1993-2001, from 50% to 62%. Again the South African Human Development Report of 2003 addresses these concerns by arguing that the sustainable development approach of any country can only be as effective as its people want it to be. Based on the literature on sustainable development and relevant trends in socio-economic development and policy making in South Africa, the report identified the following four central challenges facing sustainable development in SA:

- The eradication of poverty and extreme income and wealth inequalities
- The provision of access to quality and affordable basic services to all South Africans
- The promotion of environmental sustainability
- A sustained reduction in unemployment rate and the attainment of sustainable high growth rates (South African Human Development Report, 2003:27)

The report points out important findings that shifting decision-making closer to communities and their organisations can improve the connection between sustainable development policies and outcomes moreover, sustainable development in South Africa depends on confronting political challenges including strategic political interventions that focus policies and support measures on achieving sustainable development goals (South African Human Development Report, 2003:27). From this review it is also critical that all the key actors develop a better understanding of the need to match institutions and policies to the stages and realities of each nation and that is achieved through local development i.e. being able to address issues at local levels as in South Africa we have diverse communities and community participation is taken as a vital factor.

3.3 SUSTAINABLE LIVELIHOODS THEORY

The Sustainable Livelihoods (SL) theory has been influenced by a number of diverging themes. The concept of a sustainable livelihood was first widely acknowledged when it appeared in the Brundtland Commission Report of 1987. This report put the concept of sustainable development firmly on the global political agenda. It defined sustainable development as:

“...development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs. It contains within it two key concepts: the concept of ‘needs’, in particular the essential needs of the world’s poor, to which overriding priority should be given; and the idea of limitations imposed by the state of technology and social organisation on the environment’s ability to meet present and future needs” (World Commission on Environment and Development, 1987: 43).

The report went on to argue that the pursuit of sustainable development requires:

- a political system that secures for citizens the opportunity to participate effectively in decision making
- an economic system that is able to generate surpluses and technical knowledge on a self-reliant and sustained basis
- a social system that provides for solutions for the tensions arising from disharmonious development
- a production system that respects the obligation to preserve the ecological basis for development
- a technological system that can search continuously for new solutions

- an international system that fosters sustainable patterns of trade and finance
 - a flexible administrative system that has the capacity for self-correction
- (World Commission in Environment and Development, 1987: 65)

The first Human Development Report from the United Nations Development Programme shared much of this analysis (UNDP, 1990). This and subsequent reports addressed development in terms of individual and household health, education and well-being, thus shifting the focus away from the macroeconomic bias of earlier development thinking. Many of the ingredients that subsequently characterised the SL were evident in the Brundtland and the Human Development reports: the focus on poor people and their needs; the importance of citizen participation; the emphasis on self-reliance and sustainability; the ecological constraint. These subsequently became powerful terms in the lexicon of international development policy and politics, particularly in the work of the UN's 1992 Environment Conference in Rio, the 1995 World Summit for Social Development and the 1996 World Food Summit.

In that, SL theory is based on poverty reduction, the way the poor live their lives and the importance of structural and institutional issues. It draws on three decades of changing views on poverty. In particular, participatory approaches to development have highlighted great diversity in the goals to which people aspire, and in the livelihoods strategies they adopt to achieve them. Poverty analysis has highlighted the importance of assets, including social capital, in determining the well being of people (Ashley and Carney, 1999:4). The dimensions of poverty are wide and complex and the realities of poverty vary between regions, countries, communities and individuals. The SL theory has been used as a tool for planning interventions, reviewing and evaluating projects, research, policy analysis and development (Cahn, 2002:1). For example when development projects are sustainable that is, can last across generational lines, and then this criterion can be used to measure their success (Helmore and Singh, 2001).

Therefore, development projects will be sustainable if they meet the following two criteria. Firstly, they must last long enough for opportunities of future generations not to be endangered. Secondly, they must, all along the way, be able to increase the income of many people. That is to say, they must reduce poverty and increase employment. The definitions of SL will for the purpose of this research project, take the form of its components. Sustainability is often used in reference to environmental or cross-generational sustainability. In other words, sustainability may be defined as the management and use of natural resources to ensure that these resources

will remain intact for future generations. Broadly speaking, sustainability is a key indicator of success or failure in development projects (Ashley and Carney, 1999:4).

Sustainability is designed to promote four essential characteristics economic efficiency, social equity, ecological integrity, and resilience.

- Economic efficiency: to be sustainable, a livelihood system must be economically efficient, rather than wasteful, in its use of resources
- Social equity: in order to attain sustainability, livelihoods must adhere to the precepts of social equity. This means that when one household or community makes its livelihood it must not disrupt options for others to make theirs, i.e. one form of a livelihood should enhance other livelihoods, creating a trade, exchange, and service type of a relationship
- Ecological integrity: to be sustainable, livelihood systems must obey the laws of ecological integrity, preserving or restoring resources for use by future generations (Ashley and Carney, 1999:4).

This emphasises how people make their livelihoods should however not destroy the resource base or exhaust the capital. To be sustainable livelihoods system must be resilient, being able to cope with, and recover from, shocks and stresses (Ashley and Carney, 1994:4). This encourages people involved to be resilient and resourceful enough so to employ effective mechanisms to survive during times of crisis. When these coping mechanisms prove effective enough and are employed over an extended period of time, then they will become what the SL paradigm calls adaptive strategies

Chambers and Conway (in Carney et al., 1999:4) developed a definition of livelihoods and the factors that make them sustainable, which underpin all of the livelihoods frameworks currently being used: a livelihood comprises the capabilities, assets (stores, resources, claims and access) and activities required for a means of living: a sustainable livelihood which can cope with and recover from stress and shocks, maintain and enhance its capabilities and assets, and provide sustainable livelihoods opportunities for the next generation; and which contributes net benefits to other livelihoods at the local and global levels in the long and short term. Rakodi and Lloyd-Jones (2002:3) report that the Chambers and Conway definition was modified by the Department for International Development (DFID) in 1999. The DFID defined the livelihood concept as a process that needs to be sustainable, that can cope with and recover from stresses and shocks and maintain and enhance its capabilities and assets both now and in the future, while not

undermining the natural resource base. Other livelihood definitions make people more central and are less concerned with precise terminology for different kinds of assets. One will note that they highlight issues of ownership; access and decision making. For example, Carney et al. (1999:4) state that the people's capacity to generate and maintain their means of living enhances their well-being and that of future generations. These capacities are contingent upon the availability and accessibility of options which are ecological, economic and political and which are predicated on equity, ownership of resources and participatory decision making. Long (1997) also states that the term livelihood best expresses the idea of individuals or groups striving to make a living, attempting to meet their various consumption and economic necessities, coping with uncertainties responding to new opportunities, and choosing between different value positions through conceptualisation, indicating further that to understand livelihoods one has to go beyond the economic or material objectives of life.

Therefore, it is stressed that a livelihood is never just a matter of finding or making shelter, transacting money, getting food to put on the family table or to exchange on the market place. In that, a livelihood can be understood as a dynamic, integrated and holistic concept in that it involves not only economic factors such as shelter and bread, but also educational and cultural factors, including individual and group identity, availability of information and other significances of vulnerable people.

3.3.1 SUSTAINABLE LIVELIHOODS AND ITS ASSUMPTIONS

Various assumptions of Sustainable Livelihoods are made in relation with its effectiveness of development outcomes and can be improved through:

- Systematic but manageable analysis of poverty and its causes
- Taking a wider and better informed view of the opportunities for development activity, their likely impact and fit with livelihood priorities
- Placing people and the priorities they define firmly at the centre of analysis and objective setting (Ashley and Carney, 1999:6)

Helmore and Singh (2001:90) further argue that the simple act of focussing on what people already have, what they already know and do – instead of on what they need – shifts the perception the poor have of themselves from one of helpless victims of circumstance to one of capable actors who can control their own destiny. Thus the SL approaches put less emphasis on needs than it does on the community's assets, strategies and strengths.

Theoretically, the SL approach has been put forward as an approach to understand poverty – an approach that many see as comprehensive, realistic and built on existing lessons. Critically, it has been argued that the approach synthesises many issues into a single framework, but inevitably cannot capture every strand of development thinking for example the issues of power relations (De Haan and Zoomers, 2005:31). Ashley and Carney (1999:7) are of the opinion that this may be cited as a weakness as power relations feature so prominently in causing or addressing poverty and underdevelopment issues. However, more recent studies have attempted to address these shortfalls by bringing into the picture issues relating to power and poverty, arguing that the SL approach could become more forceful analytically if it improved its theoretical depth, especially on power relations. Property relations and configurations of power play a major role in inducing poverty (De Haan and Zoomers, 2005:33). It can thus be concluded that, any development framework, if is to fully appreciate and understand community development dynamics has to include power as a major determinant of scales of economic inequality within a given community.

3.3.2 SUSTAINABLE LIVELIHOODS FRAMEWORKS

The adoption of SL in practice and research can be appreciated by the speed with which this concept has been adopted by non-governmental organisations and leading humanitarian organisations which are fighting poverty and injustice at a global level. Namely, Oxfam, CARE, the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and the Department for International Development (DFID) were attracted by the concept and adopted variations in their work. This happened explicitly from 1993 onwards but seems to have been foreshadowed by earlier internal debates and practices. According to Solesbury (2003:15), in embracing SL, the NGO's were building on their long-standing commitment to participatory approaches to development. The SL concept aligned with their existing values and beliefs but it also gave the NGO's powerful new analyses and arguments with which to promote them

The CARE agency is an international NGO that uses the livelihoods approach as its primary planning framework. In its definition of livelihoods three fundamental attributes of livelihoods are identified namely 'the possession of human capabilities, access to tangible and intangible assets, and the existence of economic activities (Carney et al., 1999:6). This framework distinguishes between assets, capabilities and activities. It places less emphasis on macro-micro links, although these are considered important in many aspects of its work. It uses a light

conceptual framework and tries to include other approaches. At the same time it aims to allow any framework to be adapted as lessons are learnt so that multiple actors contribute to the evolution of the livelihoods framework.

The Oxfam agency uses livelihoods framework 'semi-officially' emphasizing that there are no 'established rules'. Oxfam says existing frameworks are still too abstract for field-level staff to understand, although they are valuable at programming and policy levels (Eade and Williams 1995:11). Oxfam also draws on Chambers and Conway (1992), for its definition of SL and emphasises that sustainability has different dimensions. These are economic (the functioning of markets and credit supply), social (networks of reciprocity, gender equity), institutional (capacity building, access to services and technology), political freedom, and ecological (quality and availability of environment resources).

The UNDP agency understands livelihoods as the means, activities, entitlements and assets by which people make a living. Sustainable livelihoods are defined as those that are able to cope with and recover from shocks and stresses such as drought, civil war and policy failure; economically effective; ecologically sound; socially equitable (Carney et al., 1999: 14).

The value of the DFID agency is that it is one of the most widely used when it comes to studies relating to livelihoods and is the framework engaged with and critically analysed in this research. It sets out to conceptualise certain factors of living and people; that is, how people operate within a 'vulnerability' context that is shaped by different factors. For example, shifting seasonal constraints and opportunities, economic shocks and longer-term trends; how they draw on different types of livelihood assets or capital in different combinations which are influenced by the vulnerability context; a range of institutions and processes; how they use their assets base to develop a range of livelihood strategies to achieve desired livelihood outcomes (Carney et al., 1999:5).

This DFID agency is seen as informed by certain core concepts, some of which include:

- It is *people-centred* in the sense that it advocates that development policy and practice should flow from an understanding of the poor and their livelihoods strategies
- The poor should directly contribute to determining development priorities and be able to influence the institutions and process that impact on their lives

- It is *holistic* in that the framework encourages analysis that cuts across different sectors and recognizes a range of actors and influences as well as multiple livelihood strategies and outcomes
- It is *dynamic* in that it tries to understand change over time and the complex interplay between different factors
- It starts from an analysis of *strengths* rather than needs and problems
- It looks for and makes the linkages between 'micro' and 'macro' levels. It is concerned with sustainability in all its dimensions - social, economic, institutional and ecological (Solesbury (2003:16).

At the centre of this agency is 'Asset' which households or individuals draw upon to build their livelihoods. Access to and use of assets is influenced by policies, organizations and relationships between individuals and organizations. Thinking in terms of assets is seen to be an antidote to the view of people as 'passive' or 'deprived'.

In the words of Bebbington (1999), a person's assets, such as land, are not merely means with which he or she makes a living from but they also give meaning to that person's world (Rakodi and Lloyd-Jones, 2002:09). Assets are not simply resources that people use in building livelihoods they are assets that give them the capability to be and to act. Assets should not be understood only as things that allow survival, adaptation and poverty alleviation: they are also the basis of agents' power to act and to reproduce, challenge or change the rules that govern the control, use and transformation of resources (De Haan and Zoomers, 2005:32).

According to Rakodi and Lloyd-Jones (2002:11), the DFID framework provides five different types of assets namely:

Human capital: The labour resource available to households, which has both quantitative and qualitative dimensions. The former refers to the number of household members and time available to engage in income-earning activities. Qualitative aspects refer to the levels of education and skills and the health status of household members;

Social Capital: The social resources (networks, membership of groups, relationships of trust and reciprocity, access to wider institutions of society on which people draw in pursuit of livelihoods;

Natural Capital: The natural resources stocks from which resources flow useful to livelihoods are derived include land, water and other environmental resources, especially common pool resources;

Physical capital: Physical or produced capital is the basic infrastructure (transport, shelter, water, energy, communications) and the production equipment and means which enable people to pursue their livelihoods;

Financial Capital: The financial resources available to people (including savings, credit, remittances and pensions) which provide them with different livelihood options (Rakodi and Lloyd-Jones, 2002:11).

In support of the types of assets the core principles that underpin the DFID Sustainable Livelihoods approach and can also be applied to any type of poverty focused development activity are:

People-centred:

This principle focuses on putting people at the centre of development. The focus of people is important when one thinks about objectives such as poverty reduction, economic reform or sustainable development as this takes place at a micro or community level. When one views this particular principle at a practical level, the following factors should be highlighted for a better understanding of what people-centeredness is within development:

- The principle needs to start with an analysis of people’s livelihoods and how these have been changing over time
- Fully involve people and respect their views.

It focuses on the impact of different policy and institutional arrangements so they promote the agenda of the:

- Poor (a key step is political participation by poor people themselves)
- Works to support people to achieve their own livelihood goals taking into consideration the sustainability factor (Ashley and Carney, 1999:20).

Responsive and participatory:

The principle applies that the people must be the key actors in identifying and addressing livelihood priorities (Ashley and Carney, 1999:20). It incorporates and builds upon existing participatory objectives namely:

- It promotes people’s achievement of their own livelihoods objectives which is established through participatory activities;

- It builds upon people's strengths. This is only possible if participatory methodologies are used to establish who has access to which types of capital and how this is affected by the institutional, social and organisational environment;
- Indicators of impact are expected to be negotiated with local people. This idea of negotiation goes well beyond minimal ideas of participation as consultation

Helmore and Singh (2001) stress that these principles aim at developing and at the same time enforcing the idea of empowerment as the perception that people really feel more at ease when they are active participants of the system rather than passive recipients within a system.

Multi-level:

In terms of development activities, they focus at either the macro or micro level (Ashley and Carney, 1999:20). In attempting to bridge the gap the livelihood approach therefore emphasises the importance of micro level policy and institutions to the livelihood options of communities and individuals. This principle also stresses the need for higher-level policy development and planning to be informed by lessons learnt and insights gained at the local level. This objective will simultaneously give local people a chance in policy making and the overall effectiveness.

Sustainable:

Sustainability looks at the balance between economic, institutional, social and environmental sustainability (Ashley and Carney, 1999:21). Sustainability can be seen as a key indicator of success in which projects which are based on empowerment and improvement upon the livelihoods of the poor stands a better chance of surviving than projects that fade away with the depletion of initial funding effort.

Dynamic:

This principle looks into the nature of being flexible to adapt to people's situations and being able to develop long-term commitments (Ashley and Carney, 1999:21). The approach also seeks to understand and learn from change so that it can support positive patterns of change and help moderate negative patterns (Helmore and Singh, 2001).

Building on strengths:

This principle implies on the recognition of everyone's inherent potential, whether this derives from their strong social networks, their access to physical resources and infrastructure, their ability to influence core institutions or any other factor that has poverty-reducing potential (Helmore and Singh, 2001). In terms of the development effort of livelihoods the main key objective will be to remove the constraints to the realisation of potential, thus this will assist the people to become more stronger and better in terms of being able to achieve their own objectives.

This framework will assist in analysing the development projects in Cato Manor, whether the above mentioned principles were implemented and what the gaps and challenges were.

3.3.3 SL APPROACHES USED REGIONALLY AND INTERNATIONALLY?

- In Zambia and India, existing infrastructure and watershed project proposals were reassessed and substantially altered when viewed through an SL lens;
- In Kenya and Pakistan, multi-sectoral scoping studies were conducted in order to identify a range of suitable entry points for DFID interventions;
- In Nepal (community forestry) and Indonesia (livestock), long standing sub-sectoral programmes that pre-date SL have used and implemented many key SL principles;
- In South Africa and Zimbabwe, SL approaches have been used to guide research on policies and institutions;
- In several cases (e.g. Latin America, Russia) SL principles have been used explicitly in project design. In Latin America they have been used implicitly in the development of country strategies and programmes and in monitoring on-going livelihoods activities (Ashley and Carney, 1999:8).

3.4 CRITIQUE OF SUSTAINABLE LIVELIHOODS (SL) AND THE FRAMEWORKS

The use of the notion of sustainability within the ‘sustainable livelihoods approach’ has been seen to be marginalised in relation to integrating it with other concerns namely environmental issues. However, this has led to the conclusion that SL may be too broad for improving practitioners in understanding of the links between poverty (creation and alleviation) and environmental change. For example, in Brazil the environment has generally been the entry point for donor intervention, but the SL framework was found to pay inadequate attention to global environmental issues (Ashley and Carney, 1999:34). SL approaches embrace different elements which build up sustainability, namely economic, social, and institutional and environmental. The frameworks suggest that assets and activities which are conducted are never static so to maintain a variety of outcomes, meaning there is no single sustained component. Such a manner is however, difficult to translate in terms of action, definition and in measuring problems has shown to be a greatest challenge (Ellis, 2000). SL puts forward approaches to understand poverty, approaches that many see as comprehensive, realistic the ones that builds on existing lessons. However, it has been argued that the approaches seems to synthesise many issues yet

failing to capture every strand of development thinking namely social formulations/institutions and political processes (Ashley and Carney, 1999:34).

It is known that SL approaches have been adopted for the contribution that they are expected to make to durable poverty elimination and the achievement of the International Development Targets. However, it is argued that there is no explicit mention of poverty in the SL frameworks. In a way people find it problematic to use the SL frameworks under the fear that their work will not be adequately poverty focused (Carney, 1999a, Singh and Gilman, 1999). Further enriching the debate, SL approaches offer an integrated perspective that allows for the philosophy of access to resources to run. Bebbington (1999) in Rakodi and Lloyd-Jones, (2002:72) emphasises the relationship between access and resources especially in order to understand the urban context, for the investigation of urban poverty processes in cities quickly reveals that proximity to resources means very little when access to them is denied.

This looks at the factor of some people being excluded from access to resources with the objectives of maximizing their own returns. This introduces the concept of ‘social exclusion’, which encompasses social and physical characteristics such as race, gender, language, ethnicity, origin or religion to legitimise this fencing-in of opportunities. Most livelihood analysts, including Bebbington (1999), tend to somehow largely ignore the role played by gender and generation in influencing differential access and ability to command resources on the part of individual household members. This stems from the fact that most livelihoods approaches take their cue from the contribution of Chambers and Conway (1992) who do not point up explicitly the gender dimensions of livelihoods where gender and intra-household relations are intrinsic to the analysis. (De Haan and Zoomers, 2005:36).

“Within the tradition of gender studies there is recognition that if power relations are neglected, it would mean a failure to reach any understanding of (or solutions to) the deprivation of women in the development process” (Kabeer, 1994:20). Scott argues that gender relations are the primary way of signifying relationships of power. It is when the importance of analysing power as one of the critical mass upon which livelihoods depended and empowerment as the key factor to development or well being (De Haan and Zoomers, 2005).

The concept of power within gender studies has been demonstrated as the type of power that is somehow normal to people unquestioningly accepted, the type of power that cannot be

possessed, but exists only when exercised. This component follows Giddens' idea of a continued interaction of agency and structures and the possibility that actors by themselves will deviate from discourses which are previously shaped by generations and thus inducing change in structure (De Haan and Zoomers, 2005:36). This recognition Giddens (1986) sees as social power of men over women being a culturally constructed one, insidiously operating as it does through society's structures and further giving rise to critical questions of, how do we create the conditions for gaining equality of access to social resources? What are the social issues around which we should be mobilising for struggle to achieve this goal of empowerment? De Haan and Zoomers (2005) view empowerment as a vital factor as they believe that women have the ability to improve their position within the wielding and yielding process that is the possibility of using their manoeuvre. It is here where Rappaport (1981, 1984), Zimmerman (1995) and Rowlands' (1997) provided a conceptual framework of empowerment which provided an enlightenment in examining this dynamic process.

Empowerment tries to achieve 'power within' whereby individuals build upon their confidence and consciousness to shape their livelihoods. This self-understanding/power-to transform lives in improving capabilities namely, skills, income and market or job access. In improving livelihoods through such power can be encompassed through joint action. Power within' means networking with others for joint action to challenge and change power relations leading to 'power over' which is overcoming subjugation (De Haan and Zoomers, 2005:37). Therefore such an analysis, which focuses on various layers of power wielding, would however complete the conceptualisation of access as the key issue in the livelihoods approach (De Haan and Zoomers, 2005). They continue that like all contemporary social analysis, any development framework has to take seriously the effects of gender-based power relations. Indeed, women empowerment has, rightfully, become central in South African development politics. Because of this gender equity discourse, "access to resources and assets is also changing for the better, though gradually. Therefore, they need to be included in analysing the qualitative aspects of SL in economically vulnerable communities. Not only is the gender dynamic good to incorporate into livelihood analysis, but also to include within the broad development paradigm because of its quantitative significance to the community and thus to the analysis.

3.5 CONCLUSION

This chapter has drawn from the theories of sustainable development (SD) and sustainable livelihoods (SL). Sustainable development is understood as a process that puts emphasis on the

continuation of development over a very long-term period, made possible by organizing the environment and the human uses in order to ensure a long-term development (Harrison, 2000). In attempting to understand sustainability and development, the theory of sustainable livelihoods was incorporated. SL theory looked into management and the use of natural resources and how these resources can remain intact for future generations. Sustainability was viewed as a key indicator of success/ failure in development projects (Helmore and Singh, 2001) and also understood both as a long – term flexibility and as an ecological soundness (Haan and Zoomers 2005). “A livelihood is discussed as a system that is encompasses capabilities, assets (including both material and social resources) and activities required for means of living. In that the livelihood system deemed sustainable when it can cope with and recover from stresses and shocks and maintain or enhance its capabilities both now and in the future, while not undermining the natural resource base” (Haan and Zoomers, 2005:12). Helmore and Singh (2001) argued that the difference between the SL approach is that “the simple act of focussing on what people already have, what they already know and do – instead of on what they need – shifts the perception the poor have of themselves from one of helpless victims of circumstance to one of capable actors who can control their own destiny” (2001:90). The SL theory puts less emphasis on needs than it does on community’s assets, strategies and strengths. This theory also highlighted the role women can play in development initiatives. In this research theoretically the SL has been put forward as a theory that understands poverty –a theory that many see as a comprehensive, realistic and built on existing lessons. The theoretical background of this research will be used to assess perceptions of participants in relation to the impact of the development projects which have been implemented by the Cato Manor LED initiative. In the SL case, the conventional view of research informing policy which frames practice also assist in guiding this research question on how does the SL framework facilitate understanding LED strategies and projects post-apartheid South Africa.

Critically it has been argued that this theory synthesises many issues into a single framework, but inevitably cannot capture every strand of development thinking for example the issues of power issues (Ashley and Carney, 1999). This may be cited as a weakness as power relations feature so prominently in causing or addressing poverty and underdevelopment issues (Ashley and Carney, 1999). However, more recent studies as discussed above– dating from the mid-1990s – have attempted to address these shortfalls by bringing into the picture issues relating to power and empowerment to poverty (De Haan and Zoomers, 2005; Giddens, 1986; Zimmerman, 1995). They argue, for example, that “...the livelihoods approach could become more forceful

analytically if it improved its theoretical depth, especially on power issues... Property relations and configurations of power play a major role in inducing poverty...” De Haan and Zoomers (2005:32-33). In that, this key factor gave way to this research selected methodology by Burawoy (1991) ‘extended case method’ which will be discussed in detail in chapter 4. This selected methodology will assist in guiding whether or not for a development theory if it is to fully appreciate and understand community the development dynamics has to include power as a major determinant of scales of economic inequality within a given community.

CHAPTER FOUR

METHODOLOGY

4.1 INTRODUCTION

This research explores perceptions of the community and recipients regarding sustainability of Cato Manor's LED initiatives. The perceptions are around developmental initiatives which are the day to day livelihood survival strategies of a community affected by unemployment. The research is guided by two questions:

1. What are the perceptions of participants about the impact of LED projects on their lives in Cato Manor?
2. How does the sustainable livelihoods framework facilitate an understanding of LED strategies and projects in post-apartheid SA?

These are a thread that runs throughout the research study. They try to show a clear relationship of the research to the field of study. Blakie (1993) states that research questions are formulated around such concepts:

- Research questions shall be clearly formulated
- They must be intellectually worthwhile and researchable
- The research questions shall provide answers which are related to the study in which they will end up being the formal expression of one's intellectual puzzle (Blakie, 1993:60).

Through these concepts I was able to determine what I am trying to research and how I will be able to conduct this particular research. In exploring peoples' development, perception, feelings and attitude (Babbie and Mouton, 2004; Singleton and Straiti, 1999) specific research methods were used. Research methods are not just about gathering and analysing data but the extent of how a researcher links directly to epistemological foundations of how one theorises the world around us and knowledge we produce in research (Burawoy,1991).Therefore, this chapter will look into the theoretical basis of this research, research methods of gathering evidence and analysis.

4.2 RESEARCH METHODS AND APPROACH

The study explores people perceptions regarding sustainable development. Social science research looks into the dimensions of theory and the data that has been collected. The interest moves beyond learning about a specific social situation but also into learning from the situation which was under study. It is the task of methodology to explicate methods of turning observations into explanations, data into theory. Both grounded theory and ethnomethodology are methods that use participant observation to develop microsociology (Burawoy, 1991). These micro-sociologies examine the institutional context that shapes and distorts what happens in the life-world and the approach of this research will be more concerned with will be to examine the extended case method.

The extended case methods examines how social situations are shaped by external forces or in the terms of C .Wright Mills' sociological imagination, tries to connect the personal troubles of the milieu to the public issues of social structure. This approach allows for participant observation to examine the macro world through the way the latter shapes and in turn is shaped and conditioned by the micro world, the everyday world of face to face interaction. This approach is not about the introduction of new theory from the ground but through the failure and/or gaps and then reconstruction of existing theory.

Therefore, this study aims to use Burawoy's (1991) extended case method in trying to find an understanding between the background of the Cato Manor community and the current public issues of social structures. The specific study of the social situation will enable the reconstruction of the sustainable livelihoods theory. Chapter 3 provided us with an analysis of the existing gaps through the debates of De Haan and Zoomers (2005) and Zimmerman (1995). The investigation will allow for a reconstruction of an already known existing SL theory. In that the extended case method in this research is useful as it serves as an epistemological framework of research because this research does not start from just concrete to abstract, i.e. 'grounded theory', nor 'positivist', just explaining and elaborating existing theory. Rather, this research engages existing theory/knowledge and reconstructs it on the basis of what findings tell us about Cato Manor development and the people's feelings and perceptions about it.

4.3 FIELDWORK PROCESS: COLLECTING PRIMARY DATA

4.3.1 ARCHIVAL AND DOCUMENTARY DATA

Most of data on the history of Cato Manor was sourced from archives at the Kwa-Muhle Museum in central Durban and at Kellie Campbell Africana Library in Morningside, Durban. Other documentary sources were kept at the Intuthuko Junction Library in Cato Manor. Furthermore, the Kwa-Zulu Natal Income Dynamics Survey (KIDS) for analysis on income and households dynamics in Kwa-Zulu Natal was also used.

4.3.2 INTERVIEWS

The interview guide that was used in this study was compiled with the guide of the research problem, analysis of the observations made during the field work and participant observation, and a study of related literature helped to set down the problem and to provide topics and subtopics to be covered in the investigation.

The topics provided the main divisions for the guide and a structure for later analysis and interpretation. The ordering of the topics followed the schema of Stimson and Webb (1975) who divided the process in three phases: beginning of development (the funder, costs of the projects); participants' involvement during development (numbers of participant, community responses); and perceptions of sustainability of the development initiatives (participants viewpoints, life after the projects).

The instrument for the qualitative method was used for direct interviews with 1 Director, 4 Managers, 10 Community Leaders and 5 Coordinators. Qualitatively, these 20 leaders were selected in a non-probability sampling method using a 'purposive' selection basis. Purposive sampling is:

“...a general term for judgmental sampling in which the researcher purposely selects certain groups or individuals for their relevance to the issue being studied.” (Williamson et al., 1982:106).

The major advantage of having used purposive sampling in this research was being able to get information from respondents who are crucial to this study and to the Cato Manor project as a whole. The management representative played a role in providing us with information which covered the development of the project designs, the policies and strategies, the implementation and evaluation of the projects, funding, and challenges faced by the SMME sector in SA.

Community leaders also provided us with information pertaining to the projects but especially their involvement in representing the rest of the community members.

Subjects were interviewed at the Intuthuko Junction Cato Manor Office premises within a space of five months. During the interview as a researcher I assumed a non-argumentative, supportive and sympathetically understanding attitude. In terms of Weber's (1949) formal and empathic understanding processes, I was able to establish a rapport with the subjects. This was with the help of the research and communication manager who assisted with the securing of the interviews, taking into consideration their busy schedules. It was explained to the subjects what the purpose of the interviews was and in what way the data and findings would be used.

Interviews were conducted using unstructured questions to allow respondents freedom to lead the interview process. Only key themes were hinted at during interviews, as well as probing. This allowed for more elaboration on topics which were discussed. This also allowed for probing and clarifying some meanings.

The content of the completed guides and additional notes, concepts and patterns were recorded and a qualitative analysis of the situation was presented.

4.3.3 QUESTIONNAIRE SURVEY

In drawing up the quantitative research instrument I ensured that the needs and challenges of the target group being studied was prioritised. The quantitative method deals with numerical data, which is collected and turned into numbers which tend to:

“...represent values of variables, which measure characteristics of subjects, respondents, or other cases” (Neuman, 1997: 295).

However, this research instrument aimed at the participant also included qualitative questions. By doing so the survey enabled the participants to elaborate on their active representations of how they interpret and understand their own world (Burawoy, 1991).

Cato Manor is situated within the boundaries of the Durban Metropolitan Area, and is home to about 93 000 people (Moodley, 2004:50). The Entrepreneurial Support Centre (ESC) provides workspace and business support for 30 small businesses on site and the Container Park and Wiggins unit workspace accommodates 70 people. Therefore, questionnaires for participants were distributed via the project coordinators.

4.4 LIMITATIONS

Both questionnaires were based on the perceptions of the research topic and therefore increased the chances of subjectivity when people completed the questionnaires. However, spending time at the projects site and informal communication with the respondents assisted in clarifying this concern.

The questionnaires were distributed to all participants at both sites by the project coordinators but after a period of three months only 100 questionnaires came back and of the other 50, 30 were returned not completed and 20 was not returned at all. Some blamed it on being busy as they were forever on the road or just a complete refusal to participate after having to go from container to container. However, this shortfall was redressed by the fact that during my visits to the site as well as observations made through informal conversations, data collected from interviews and questionnaires was verified.

Another potential limitation was change of management in CMDA, but this issue was addressed through the provision of contact details of the previous management team. However, the participant observation played a vital role in encountering the above mentioned limitations as the data from the questionnaire survey, informal interaction with them and the observation sessions during my visits at the sites and workshops assisted in reassuring the data collected from the survey.

4.5 CONCLUSION

The research has been central to all aspects of the research process. In this way, this report represents the investigation considered necessary by those directly affected by the implementation of these projects and seeks more development which is sustainable which will work in their common best interest.

This study examined the opinion of key role players involved with the development projects. These groups identified and provided a great deal of perspective and a range of opinions. In retrospect, the questionnaires for the participants took a great deal of time as I had to conduct follow up informal interviews for those whose initial answers were either unclear or lacked

information. In all, the research instruments used and the interviews conducted provided a great insight into the development process and the people who are at the core of development.

CHAPTER FIVE

RESEARCH FINDINGS

5.1 INTRODUCTION

The purpose of analysing research findings is to organise the description of observation so that it becomes manageable. The description of this research will be balanced by an analysis that will lead into interpretation (Patton, 1980:343).

5.2 ANALYSIS OF THE DATA

Following the schema of Stimson and Webb (1975), the analysis in the research was undertaken in three parts, corresponding to the phases of the encounter process: prior to, during and after (and/or continuation) of participation. To entail a suitable understanding of the participants and their experiences with the LED initiatives the report was analysed against the background of the ESC as an organisational structure.

5.2.1 PRIOR

Employment and Skills Development

According to the 1996 census (augmented by surveys undertaken by the CMDA), the total level of unemployment among the economically active population in Cato Manor was 29%.¹ Among men this rate was slightly lower at 26% and among women slightly higher at 32%. By economic sector, the main source of income was retail (65% of employment) followed by services (18% of employment). The skills profile of the unemployed in Cato Manor revealed the following:

- 35% have received 8 years or less education
- 9% have been exposed to technical training
- 36% have never been employed
- 23% feel not fit for any job
- 10% want to open their own businesses

(CMDA Status Report, 2000).

From these figures participants, local community organisations, political parties and city and provincial authorities joined forces to embrace the numerous re-development challenges

¹ 29% is a restricted unemployment figure

presented by Cato Manor. *“Together, they devised a plan which would correct the wrongs of the past and establish an institutional framework to facilitate the development process”*.² The Entrepreneurial Support Centre (ESC) Container Park and Wiggins provides workspace and business support with the aims of maximising job creation for Cato Manor residents as well as maximising revenues to be reinvested in socio-economic projects in Cato Manor. This development has been targeted for business people living in Cato Manor. The participant felt *“that prior to this initiative operational space was a problem as well as additional business skills were required...in that this form of initiative was mostly required”*.³

5.2.2 DURING

Phindubuye Cooperative

This cooperative was registered in September 2005 it currently has five male members. All members have attended a Business Management Course (3 week duration) at the Swinton College. One respondent said, *“We were able to come up with a business plan with the assistance of facilitators from Swinton College thereafter, we forwarded it to Ithala Bank to secure funding”*.⁴ They are based at the ESC premises, in 2006, an SMME workshop was held and all cooperatives were invited to register in a government database. Another respondent said, *“The database registration assisted us for being updated regarding local employment opportunities”*.⁵ Their business focuses on interior design, painting and metal welding.

Sidlakahle Catering

Sidlakahle operates within the Wiggins Hive since 2004. Sidlakahle continues to have strategic engagements with the ESC office through participation in their ongoing trainings which empowers them with skills and more business knowledge. A group of four women operate this business. They have attended training on productivity and all have graduated at ceremony for Women in Business held at the ICC in July 2007. *“It was a great experience as we are able to adopt the training context and approaches learnt on the programme and apply them effectively”*.⁶

² Pseudo Sakhi Zungu 22 March 2009

³ Pseudo Mandy 31 January 2009

⁴ Pseudo Mbuso Dlamini, 21 January 2009

⁵ Pseudo Siphosiso, 21 January 2009

⁶ Pseudo Nobantu, 20 January 2009

Khulasizwe Organic Farming Cooperative

This cooperative is a group of thirty males and forty (60) female farmers who practice subsistence farming. The ESC office assisted with tools/ equipment and seeds on an individual basis since 2003 which later the farmers were encouraged to form a cooperative in 2006 which is now called the Khulasizwe Organic Farming Cooperative. In November 2007, these members participated in a one month leadership and management training course; Economic life skills and home ownership education programme. One respondent said, *“After these trainings we considered ourselves business competent.....as we were exposed to interpretation of financial statements; business risks; and essential and practical aspects of business strategy, marketing, finance, costing and pricing.....we are quite satisfied afterwards”*.⁷ This cooperative has been funded by the ESC for a hydroponics tunnel for growing mushrooms and also installed chicken runs to support their business.

XCC Construction

This business operates within the Container Park by two women and two males. All members have attended block-making training in 2006 with the Natal Portland Cement (NCP) and another training in 2007 on marketing skills facilitated by Makho Communications all facilitated by the ESC office. Within the context of the training as respondents *“one is able request information from the facilitators regarding ones business”*.⁸ Satisfaction with the training for some depended on the adequate information provided by the facilitator *“she does not rush you but explains things to you”*⁹ and whether one was able to ask questions about their experiences within their business *“yes, and the facilitator will always have a session for questions”*.¹⁰ Participants were asked about their feeling about the trainings their attended. Their perceptions were influenced by the relevance of the training content to their business and had *“confidence in the facilitators as they will train you and a block making machine from (NCP)was made available to us for a short period of time”*.¹¹

Nothos Designers

This business is owned by two women. It operates within the Wiggins Hive premises and has been operational since 2004. They make traditional garments namely Izishweshwe (African print garments); Imbhulaselo (traditional Zulu pants); and also Xhosa and Sesotho (traditional attires).

⁷ Pseudo Mandla and Cebo, 21 January 2009

⁸ Pseudo Thomas, 21 January 2009

⁹ Pseudo Naledi, 21 January 2009

¹⁰ Pseudo Shawn 21 January 2009

¹¹ Pseudo Tania 21 January 2009

Both the members have attended the 2007 marketing skills training which was facilitated by the Makho Communication from the ESC office. Satisfaction and effective outcomes of the training appeared to depend on the nature of the training sessions and the expectations and achievement between participant and facilitators. What they regarded as the basis for their satisfaction with the training they participated in was “...*being able to obtain new ideas on how to sustain our business, being able to implement the lessons learnt from the training and ability to improve and change on previous business mistakes*”.¹²

Impumelelo Designers

This business has been operational since 2004 at the ESC premises. It was formed by three females and one male who originally operated a business from the Container Park since 2002. They make bags, school shoes, sandals and leather jackets. In November 2007, these members also participated in a one month leadership and management training course and also attended the Economic Life Skills training. They feel the training has assisted them to better manage their business and bringing in new ideas within the business “*as things were difficult at the beginning while based at the flea market as we both didn't have any business skills but through attending business management programmes offered by the ESC the business has grown and our finances are more stable*”.¹³

Siyakhula Cooperative

This cooperative became operational in 2005 at the ESC facilities. It was formed by eleven females who have been sewing at the Container Park since 2002 on an individual basis (production ranges from curtains, bedding sets, school, company and church uniforms). They were encouraged by the ESC office to work collectively and establish a cooperative. They have received the necessary training and gained skills and information on business plan writing, business management, and marketing. According to the participants, the quality of training that they have received has equipped them with relevant skills and knowledge to run an effective business...“*the retail programmes that the ESC has provided has assisted us as upcoming entrepreneurs to teach others within the community. As the sharing of skills assist us because when we receive a big order (e.g. +5 000 school uniforms at the beginning of each year) we*

¹² Pseudo Neli, 01 February 2009

¹³ Pseudo Lungi, 08 February 2009

*usually need extra hands to complete the task and we temporary employ the very same people from the team we train...the government has also funded us with 10 small sewing machines... ”.*¹⁴

Natal Portland Cement (NPC)

The NPC was formed by ten men and provides decentralised training for SMMEs in Cato Manor located at the ESC. Training content includes cement uses and applications, block making and advice on purchasing construction material. Such training includes quality control since it is an important aspect of a business. Ensuring quality includes taking their products for quality checks before sales are made. The NPC has been assisting the SMMEs with the equipment for block-making. The block making equipment is hired out to members who have just started their businesses for a short period of time. This is done to assist them until their businesses are financially viable in affording to purchase individual tools.

Mzwakhes Building Innovation

This business was formed by two men and is located at Container Park since 2003. They install electrical systems and aluminium windows. The training has assisted them to better market their business as well as the housing development in the area assisted in terms of getting contracts from the ESC office.

Siyakha Carpentry and Welding Holdings

This business was registered in 2002 and started off at Container Park but is now located at the ESC premises formed by five males. All members have attended a three week Business Management Course at the Swinton College. While I was conducting data this business had a production order of two hundred desks from a local high school *“for us receiving local construct shows that we are working together as a community and the commuters believe in our good quality production... ”.*¹⁵

Siyacathula Day-Care Cooperative

This cooperative was formed by fifteen women and was registered in 2003 with the ESC. All fifteen women attended a three month Day Care Management course. The training involved the following:

¹⁴ Pseudo James,08 February 2009

¹⁵ Pseudo Nick,20 February 2009

- Start and operate your own child care facility (licensing, accreditation and certification)
- Set up and maintain a safe, clean, well-organized child care environment
- Use computers to help children learn and play
- How to work with parents, handle finances and the budget of your child care facility.

Additional training attended by the women was Economic Life Skills and Home ownership education programmes. *“As this is a female driven initiative we wanted something that was going to empower us as females, working together and growing and that has been achieved as in 2010 this cooperative has grown to six Siyathula Day-care facilities in the area”*.¹⁶

Table 1: Summary of the existing Businesses

Organisation/Company	Business Location	Sex	All Attended Training
Phindubuye Cooperative	ESC	5 Males	Yes
Sidlakahle Catering	Wiggins	4 Females	Yes
Khulasizwe Organic Farming Cooperative	ESC-Community Hall	30 Males 60 Females	Yes
XCC Construction	Container Park	2 Female 2 Male	Yes
Nothos Designers	Wiggins	2 Females	Yes
Impumelelo Designers	Container Park	3 Females 1 male	Yes
Siyakhula Cooperative	ESC	11 Females	Yes
Natal Portland Cement (NPC)	ESC	10 Males	Yes
Mzwakhes Building Innovation Company	Container Park	2 Males	Yes
Siyathula Day-care Cooperative	ESC-Home based in six different locations	15 Females	Yes

5.2.3 AFTER AND/OR CONTINUATION EFFECTS

The Cato Manor project was conceptualised as an integrated urban development project. The tables below summarise skills development and employment creation in the projects that have been initiated. The LED %age within the table shows us a greater impact to the community as compared to the other projects.

¹⁶ Pseudo Amanda, 03 March 2009

Table 2: Local Residents trained and jobs yielded

Activity	No. Local residents trained		No. Local residents who were given temporary employment	
	No.	% of resident pop	No.	% of resident pop
LED	2973	3.2%	3644	2.9%
Housing	2610	2.8%	2610	2.8%
Infrastructure	0	0.0%	1136	1.7%
Social Facilities	1369	1.5%	1369	1.5%
Total	6952	7.5%	8759	9.4%

(CMDP Review Report 2006)

Results of employment programmes:

A total of 8,759 temporary jobs were created by the programmes run under the CMDP. 1% of these jobs became permanent, and all of these were created by the LED programme (which also generated the most number of temporary employment opportunities). The housing programme resulted in 2,610 temporary jobs. The skills development component of the Housing and Social Facilities programme was particularly successful with 100% of temporary employees receiving some level of skills transfer.

Table 3: Local residents with skills and jobs

Activity	People with skills*		People with temporary activity employment**	
	No.	% of resident pop	No.	% of resident pop
LED	2973	3.2%	3644	3.9%
Housing	2610	2.8%	2610	2.8%
Infrastructure	0	0.0%	1136	1.2%
Social Facilities	1369	1.5%	1369	1.5%
Total	6952	7.5%	8759	9.4%

*Local residents with skills refers to those trained in the CMDA/P projects

**Local residents with temporary employment refers to the temporary jobs yielded in the CMDA/P project (CMDP Review Report 2006)

Key findings from the survey: Skills transfer assessment:

Firstly, skills transfer assessment from the majority of the respondents from all the business sectors showed that from the programmes provided by the ESC they were able to implement what was learnt and this enhanced their business skills. Table 4 shows the overall %age from the respondents regarding the context of the training programmes, approaches used in the programmes and the implementation of the skills learnt.

Table 4: Skills transfer assessment

Assessment of people's perceptions of the training offered by the ESC	No. of people who said		
	Yes	No	Not Sure
Chances of adopting the training context and approaches learnt on the programmes	77	23	0
From the training, do you consider yourself business competent	90	7	3

Secondly, these are a few responses from all four business sectors of the key results of the skills development programme assessment. The findings showed that a large %age benefited from both the theoretical and practical aspects of training. The training also gave them a sense of ownership and how to better sustain their businesses.

Table 5: Assessment of courses

On completion of the courses, how would you rate improvement of your understanding?	No. of people who said		
	Yes	No	Not Sure
Interpretation of financial statements	89	11	0
Areas of risk requiring special attention in SMME	64	32	4
Essential and practical aspects of business strategy, marketing, finance, costing and pricing	89	6	5

From the assessment (Table 5) the aim was to answer a few research questions on assessing the impact of the training programmes, viewing at the initial design and their alignment with the required business needs of the participant.

Thirdly, the study shows that 60% of the respondents have obtained new business ideas from the programmes provided to them meaning an expansion on the original business whilst 27% already had original business ideas and 13% were reluctant in their responses. The study also shows that the programmes have enhanced the respondents' business approaches as 77% feel they are able to implement concepts into their businesses and this has created a great impact on the business performance.

Table 6: Skills development training programmes

Since undergoing the training programmes	No. of people who said		
	Yes	No	Not Sure
Obtained new ideas to better and sustain your business	60	27	13
Expanded your business, increased your customer base	50	26	24
Been able to understand business better	77	9	14
Been able to implement the lessons learnt from the training programmes	77	9	14
Improved your performance from the concepts learnt	80	3	11

The KwaZulu Natal household income survey is shown in Table 7 with an in-depth analysis from the KIDS report 2006 attached.

Table 7: 1993 to 2004 Transition Matrix

		< 0.5 PL	< 1PL	<1.25 PL	<1.5PL	<2.5PL	>2.5PL
<0.5PL (n=129)	% of Row	38.0	34.1	10.9	3.1	8.5	5.4
	1993 NE *	0.4	0.4	0.4	0.4	0.4	0.4
	2004 NE	0.3	0.7	1.1.	1.4	1.8	3.6
< 1PL (n=218)	% of Row	26.8	31.9	11.4	10.4	11	8.5
	1993 NE	0.7	0.7	0.7	0.7	0.7	0.8
	2004 NE	0.3	0.7	1.1	1.4	1.9	4.2
<1.25 PL (n=111)	% of Row	26.1	27	12.6	1.8	16.2	16.2
	1993 NE	1.1	1.1	1.1	1.1	1.1	1.2
	2004 NE	0.3	0.7	1.1	1.3	2	5.1
< 1.5PL (n=69)	% of Row	11.6	20.3	5.8	7.2	18.8	36.2
	1993 NE	1.4	1.3	1.3	1.3	1.4	1.4
	2004 NE	0.4	0.7	1.1	1.1	1.9	5.3
<2.5PL (n=161)	% of Row	10.6	15.5	8.1	4.3	23.6	37.9
	1993 NE	1.9	1.8	1.8	1.7	1.9	2
	2004 NE	0.4	0.8	1.1	1.4	2	5.2
> 2.5PL (n=79)	% of Row	1.3	10.1	3.8	3.8	7.6	73.4
	1993 NE	4.8	3.5	3	3	3.4	5.2
	2004 NE	0.3	0.7	1.4	1.4	2	8.4

*NE indicates real per-capita expenditures that have been normalized by the Hooegeveen and Özler (2005) poverty line.

Each household in Table 7 is assigned to a row based on its 1993 normalized expenditure measure. Thus, the first row contains the 129 households whose 1993 level of well-being was less than half the poverty line. In the second row are the 218 households whose level of well-

being was greater than half the poverty line but less than poverty line. The other rows are defined similarly using the well-being limits shown in the table. The columns of Table 7 are defined using households' 2004 level of normalized well-being and thus permit us to see the fate of each household over the 1993 to 2004 period. Looking across the first row, 38% of the households whose 1993 standard of living was less than half the poverty are just as poor in 2004. Another 34% of these households have modestly higher standards of living in 2004 (still below the poverty line, but above half of it). The remaining 28% of these households now enjoy standards of living in excess of the poverty line. In addition to the percentages of households in a specific transition category, each cell of the table reports the average 1993 and 2004 standardized expenditures for households in the cell. For example, the households that made the transition from less than half the poverty line to more than 2.5 times the poverty line had average expenditures equal to 40% of the poverty line in 1993, and equal to 3.6 times the poverty line in 2004. Finally, the main diagonal elements of the transition matrix are highlighted in bold and show the fraction of households in each row that have not changed their well-being category (for example, 73.4% of households that had living standards in excess of 2.5 times the poverty line in 1993 were still above that level in 2004).

Table 7 as a whole reveals several distinctive patterns:

Significant Chronic and Transitory Poverty

- More than (60%) of households that were poor in 1993 were also poor in 2004.
- While there is some upward mobility amongst those who were initially poor, there is also substantial downward mobility (53%) amongst those just above the poverty line.
- These figures are consistent with the existence of a core group of persistently poor people, surrounded by a somewhat smaller group of sometimes poor who move in and out of poverty over time, an argument made earlier by Carter and May (2000).

Instability and Bifurcation amongst the Nearly Poor

- The two expenditure groups just above the poverty line appear to be quite unstable.
- Roughly 40 to 45% of households that had expenditures between 1.0 and 1.5 times the poverty line in 1993 enjoyed expenditures more than 1.5 times the poverty line in 2004.
- Another 40 per cent or so of these households had fallen below the poverty line in 2004, with the remaining 10 to 15% holding onto those middle positions.
- This pattern of apparent bifurcation (with some households slipping to a low level equilibrium and others rising toward a high level equilibrium) is consistent with that identified by Adato, Carter and May (2006) based on the 1993 to 1998 KIDS data.

Real Income Growth at the Top of the Income Distribution

- Consistent with studies of the earlier rounds of the KIDS data, those households who were well above the poverty line in 1993 largely maintained their positions or moved ahead over time.
- On average, households that had expenditures more than 2.5 times the poverty line in 1993 had 61% income growth over the 11 years of the study.
- Nearly 40% of the households that had expenditures in 1993 between 1.5 and 2.5 times the poverty line moved ahead substantially over time and mean expenditure of this group grew by a massive 160%.
- Again consistent with the findings by Adato, Carter and May (2006), there is little downward mobility amongst these better-off groups.

Not surprisingly, the combined effect of these mobility patterns is to increase income inequality, a finding consistent with those of Hoogeveen and Özler (2005) and many others analysing South Africa's income distribution since 1995. Among the KIDS households, the Gini coefficient measure of inequality in the distribution of household expenditures has risen steadily from 0.42 in 1993, to 0.50 in 1998 and a remarkably high 0.57 by 2004. As discussed by Carter and May (2001), this increase in income inequality is neither surprising nor an unambiguously bad thing, although May, Carter and Padaychee (2004) caution that at some point high levels of inequality may impact upon economic growth rates and social stability. As analyzed elsewhere (May et al., 2000; Carter and May, 2001), the 1993 to 1998 period saw substantial increases in poverty and slippages at the bottom end of the income distribution, with substantially more improvement at the top end of the income distribution. The 1998 to 2004 period saw some moderation in this trend. (KwaZulu Natal Income Dynamic Study Report, 2006)

The Table 7 analysis presents an overall picture of the evolution of economic well-being for a cohort of KwaZulu-Natal households over the first decade of the post-apartheid economy. The KIDS data permit us a closer look at that history. This data is of importance to this research finding as it provides us with a broader picture of the KZN province of which Cato Manor forms a part.

5.3 INTERPRETATION

Although the focus of the study was on the participants' perceptions of their LED encounters, it remains an important factor for a researcher to stand back from the subjects and data and to

sociologically interpret all the viewpoints. Through the investigation it was possible to develop a holistic picture of how the subjects perceived LED and the meaning it held for them. In that perceptions and meanings built upon the perspective of the subjects' world and its setting.

The analysis of data revealed patterns that emerged. The most prominent factors in the participation and situation of the subjects and their involvement with the ESC appeared important in an evaluation. Critical factors were the following:

- The impact of the LED initiative does hold a potential for local economic growth.
- The issue of power plays a vital role when it comes to development
- Attaining sustainability

Regarding the first critical factor, the LED local initiative has taken a variety of forms, most importantly concerning affirmative public procurement, assistance for promoting local clusters of SMMEs the establishment of business incubators as an infrastructural support measure, new frameworks for informal economy entrepreneurs, and, the innovation of a range of local advice or support centres designed both to nurture entrepreneurship and the advancement of existing SMME entrepreneurs. Participants appeared to be well informed about the new development opportunities being implemented and accepted it as part of a community drive, an initiative for all. As well as the KIDS survey (2006 wave) shows that the pattern of income distribution among the KIDS cohort is one of increasing poverty and inequality since 1993. That said, the partial reversal of these trends in the post-1998 period is somewhat hopeful as there are signs of relative prosperity among those that successfully established independent next-generation households. In addition, access to services has generally improved for households in the KIDS sample. Contributing factors “the expansion or contraction of employment and change in wages for less skilled workers. Mobility and its causes, such as improved education and better functioning of the labour market...” (May et al., 2006:21). Therefore, at a local level the promotion of the SMME economy has been associated with an official assumption that supporting small businesses would boost employment at a local level and thus causing a dent on unemployment and poverty.

In regard to the second factor, this factor completes the theoretical gap of SL when it comes to the gender power issue as debated De Haan and Zoomers (2005) and of empowerment by Zimmerman (1995) and hopefully to reconstruct the theory. Before the forced removals in the early 1960s, the area was home to powerful women's organisations which emerged to challenge

apartheid influx control laws and subsequent relocations (Edwards, 1996). This history was encountered by the CMDP as it was later invoked to organise women towards development in the area.

The investigation showed that women were not passive in the Cato Manor context. As a set of powerful women leaders, linked to political structures are on the board of the CMDA and CMDP and play key roles in the representative community structures that were set up. They had been central to land invasions and some were involved in informal land markets. These women did articulate women's interests, and were not easily intimidated.

Awareness of these power and access dynamics, the CMDP set up broader communication strategies to reach community members directly, including a community newspaper, mass meetings (attended predominantly by women) and localised participation around particular projects and issues. The CMDP also attempted to facilitate women's participation through the meetings were held and by offering transport home to ensure safety. Women played an active role in committees and were sometimes dominant in numbers (an estimated 40% of development committee members comprised women overall). Most importantly the CMDA and CMDP have ensured to implement informal policies to favour women in order to enhance participation. In addition the ESC has made available training programmes to enhance this move: The Economic Life Skills programme, which provides training in basic economic knowledge and the Home Ownership Education programme. Both programmes are run by a gender activist and have important empowerment dimensions, including leadership training and capacity building. Nevertheless, significant benefits to women were delivered, even given the fluid and contested terrain on which the ESC had to operate.

An obvious question though is that of sustainability. In this regard the investigation has shown that the CMDP has achieved worldwide acclaim as a model for integrated development. Within South Africa, it has become a model of post-apartheid sustainable urban development practice. Key funders of the CMDP are the South African Government, the European Union, the Provincial Housing Department and the eThekweni Municipality. The value of this LED project ranges from R12-50 million (due to confidentiality the breakdown was not made available). From 1995, it has also enjoyed the status of being a Special Presidential Lead Project. It provides a base for learning from past development experiences and also serves as a special purpose vehicle for integrated delivery.

Where satisfaction with entire encounters of development was indicated an acceptance from the participants surfaced stemming from the factor that the projects allowed them to view themselves as capable actors who can control their destiny. People centred responsive and participatory development allowed people to develop a sense of ownership in which it does hold the potential of sustainable livelihood. States of excitement and commitment could be indicative from the participants in that many aspects of the development initiatives received at the ESC do hold the potential for positive impact towards inner-city development.

5.4 CONCLUSION

In conclusion, this chapter has looked at the descriptive background of the projects. These included the realisation that poverty and unemployment have taken their toll in Cato Manor and that the need for generating a large and vibrant local economy with high levels of participation by local residents had to be established through sustainable and developing projects. This chapter also assessed the impact of the projects.

CHAPTER SIX

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1 INTRODUCTION

The last chapter of this dissertation is aimed at drawing the conclusions as a means of sealing the empirical evidence and providing scholarly recommendations for practitioners in our discipline. The conclusion and recommendations of this research are formulated on the basis of the literature review and the empirical evidence. This chapter also provides an overview of the challenges and limitations of this study. Therefore the starting point would be on revisiting the aims of this study before presenting the actual recommendations and conclusion.

6.2 LITERATURE REVIEW

The first aim of this research was to conceptualise Sustainable Development and Sustainable Livelihood and to determine key aspects. The theoretical overview is covered in Chapter 2. The conclusion can be drawn that the conceptualisation of these theories is not an easy task due to the fact that there is no single generally accepted definition. However, there are certain key characteristics (development, sustainable, people, poverty, access to resources) within the theories that seemed to be generally accepted.

With regard to the aspects of Sustainable Livelihoods, various types and dimensions of these were explored. The key types of Sustainable Livelihoods were identified and defined (e.g. participation, people centred, sustainability). Furthermore, other frameworks were also explored. The role that Sustainable Development, Sustainable Livelihoods as theories play within development projects was explored and it can be concluded that these theories have a significant influence on the extent of internal integration in the form of people working together in order to achieve sustainable livelihoods and remain competitive.

6.3 EMPIRICAL FINDINGS

The conclusions of the study pertain to both people's perception of the sustainability of the projects and the usefulness of SL framework in researching development. In terms of the appropriateness of the qualitative framework and methodology that was used the findings could be used to substantiate and support and in turn call for further theorising.

Perceptions perceived by the participants towards the local development initiatives were identified. The most important of these were that before projects are conceived, people need to be consulted so that they may own the process and actively participate in it. This bottom-up approach requires that people be fully involved and their views respected. In Cato Manor a study was undertaken that revealed the need for the projects. Furthermore, before the projects started, community meetings were held that served as a platform for the officials and community members to discuss many issues relating to the projects.

People being the key actors in identifying and addressing livelihood priorities, in Cato Manor, the study indicated that the municipality has shown commitment through participation involving a range of activities. These included creating democratic representative structures like ward committees, assisting these structures to plan at a local level through Community Based Planning (CBP), and to implement and monitor their ward-based plans built on community strengths. The research findings indicated that a solid partnership existed between eThekweni Municipality, the European Union (the donor) and community participants.

The study has shown that the European Union has shown a great interest in Cato Manor and its upliftment of the community. The Municipality has also created networks with other local donors such as Standard Bank, ABSA and Ithala in terms of finances. The research findings explained that the majority of the small businesses in Cato Manor are perceived to be sustainable, as businesses have been operational since 2000 and up to 2010 they are still in existence. During this period participants have been involved in skills development training which is provided with the objective of ensuring that the participants' businesses are sustainable and self managed.

The study has shown that the Cato Manor development project has focused on original community initiations with an aim to a better sustainable empowering development. The main argument here is centred within the analysis of the poor community itself. It says that a re-examination of the significant conceptual attempts to capture access has to include, in order to become more forceful analytically, issues of power as adumbrated in development sociology and gender studies.

De Haan and Zoomers (2005) argue that access depends on the performance of social relations and these are sometimes far from harmonious. Ellis (2000) is of the view that social relations comprise gender, caste, class, age, ethnicity and religion and institutions comprise both formal rules and conventions and informal codes of behaviour, so include laws, property rights and markets. To complete the conceptual picture around access, De Haan and Zoomers (2005) argue, the livelihoods approach must incorporate power relations. On this score, the findings could be used to substantiate this factor as Cato Manor's main thrust on development is on the empowerment of access. In that, the conventional view of research informing policy which frames practice could be better represented as a triangle where all components inform each other.

In the case of Cato Manor the study shows that the community is undergoing drastic social change whereby new ways of reconstruction are taking place in order to increase the quality of life for all South Africans, especially the poor and marginalised whereby the issue of development becomes critical. The research findings of this study inform us in order to address past inequalities Cato Manor's LED drive has taken a shift from a political drive to a more economic focus. This is shown by the existing partnership of three bodies - the State, the EU and the community at large - all working collectively to reach the common goals of development. Local development strategies have also initiated the Integrated Development Plan to ensure proper practical implementation. For example the Ingwe Municipality in KZN has prioritised addressing poverty in its IDP and identified an innovative range of mechanism to achieve this. The municipality has been rated as one of the best performing in tourism (Parahanse and Goldman: 2006)

Therefore in this study it is evident that the government is indeed intervening in many instances in trying to promote the interests of society. However, the market in the neo-liberal sense in which it is made to operate today, still defines to a large extent livelihoods of the poor. This is the reason why South Africa needs to review current strategies to enable existing development projects to successfully realise their aims or perhaps focus what Streak (1997) calls a revisionist view of development, with strong emphasis on state intervention in the market to bring about development. This is so, especially in light of the fact that South Africa is grappling with high levels of unemployment and poverty at a wider level of the populace and to use an SMME approach does no more than uplift very few individuals, thus leaving the majority unaffected by the changes. The worst part of it is that the development of and support for the SMME sector require vast amounts of financial capital expenditure.

In assessing whether the LED projects in Cato Manor are being perceived as addressing the issue of poverty, the study shows us that the LED projects do assist the community participants to rise above the poverty line. Although it is a long-term process and a difficult one development is possible.

Parahanse and Goldman (2006) are also of the view that despite the apparently favourable legal and policy context and the significant resources of larger cities and the private sector, the experience of over ten years of applied LED in South Africa indicates that applying the LED is possible, but difficult. For South Africa to obtain greater impacts requires clearer policy direction, a clear articulation of the mechanisms that can be used and greater capacity movements.

6.4 LIMITATIONS OF THE RESEARCH

In summary, with regard to the literature review, the major limitations that were encountered are:

- The absence of a universally accepted definition of the concepts of sustainable development, sustainable livelihoods and poverty and there appears to be little agreement on how it should be observed and measured.
- The projects are on a five year financial renewal support from the funders for fifteen years since 2000 thus one was unable to analyse the consequences of the financial impact towards sustainability.
- Due to my personal safety as a researcher I was unable to access other businesses operating out of the ESC premises beyond the above mentioned.

6.5 RECOMMENDATIONS

6.5.1 GENERAL

Project leaders and stakeholders have an important role to play in assisting participants to understand how practices within sustainable development can have an impact on their livelihoods. In order to be able to achieve this, it will therefore be critical to ensure that these development theories are properly aligned with development policies as well as the Cato Manor ABM policies and strategies. This will be to ensure effective practical work, assessment and interpreting performance.

6.5.2 RECOMMENDATION FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

It is recommended that in order to achieve true value from the research, other presidential lead projects in the LED sector (e.g. Sophiatown, District Six) should also be selected to participate in the research. This will enhance the study even further as these areas have a common background of similar development requirements and viewing in which development practice has worked most effectively for each area.

6.6 CONCLUSION

The vision for Cato Manor encapsulated many of the qualities, the pursuit of which is required by law in all South African towns and cities. It is therefore useful to reflect on the experience and to attempt to extract lessons which may be helpful to other initiatives elsewhere.

The generation of large amounts of external finance is important in achieving co-operation from municipal line function departments. In this regard donor funding in Cato Manor showed it can play a critical role in facilitating both quality and scale. Projects to address some of the challenges should be constantly evaluated and innovative long-term solutions addressed, as the desired outcomes are poverty alleviation, empowerment of productive individuals and the integration of marginalised people into the economy and life of Cato Manor.

Thus, according to the government, the priority areas for intervention are the need for concentration and appropriate skills training where there is a shortage, and reasonable access to funds. Meaningful impact assessment requires good data. Good data refers to both the quality and quantity of the data to ensure appropriate analyses and the impact. It is not enough to simply register clients or businesses. The ESC registration business system allows tracking and monitoring as there is movement from Container Park, Wiggins to the ESC from the ESC to the Community Hall and area based. The study also showed that SL should take a full participatory bottom-up action oriented approach that allows local communities to be active in processes of their own development.

Development programmes and projects should empower and benefit local communities. It is thus imperative that they optimally and efficiently utilise local resources. The perceptions and interpretation showed that development strategies are not a universal remedy but rather a way of thinking that has considerable potential as an analytical guide to researchers and development practitioners in development and poverty reduction. As the development strategies are still

evolving, new approaches emerge and the discussion continues as the strategies are sensitive to context and situations. Therefore, in Cato Manor the SL theory can be viewed either by how well the framework reflects on the ground realities and how efficiently the framework was used practically. To complete the conceptual picture around access and reconstruction for the SL approach to be effective it must incorporate power relations.

Reference List

1. Adelzadeh, A. Alvillar, C. and Mather, C. (2001) "Poverty alleviation, employment creation and Sustainable Livelihoods in South Africa" in Khosa, M. "Empowerment through economic transformation", African Millennium Press, South Africa
2. African National Congress (1994) "The Reconstruction and Development Programme: A policy framework", by Umanyano Publications South Africa
3. Anand, S. & Sen, A. (2000) "Human Development and Economic Sustainability," World Development, Elsevier, Vol. 28, No 12
4. Ashley, C. and Carney, D. (1999) "Sustainable livelihoods: Lessons from early experience", London Department of Economic Development
5. Babbie, E. and Mouton, J. (2004) "The Practice of Social Research", Cape Town: OUP, South Africa
6. Blakie, N. (1993) "Approaches to social enquiry", Cambridge, MA. Polity
7. Bloch, R. and Daze, S. (2000) "A review of the South African Local Business Service Centre programme: Current status and future prospects", Report for the International Development Research Centre (IDRC-Rosa) Johannesburg
8. Bloch, R. and Kesper, A. (2000a) "Supporting the Small and Medium Manufacturing Sector in the Western Cape", Report for the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research, Pretoria, South Africa
9. Bloch, R. and Kesper, A. (2000b) "Supporting the Small and Medium Manufacturing Sector in the Highveld Production Region", Report for the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research, Pretoria, South Africa
10. Bond, P. (2000) "Elite transition: from apartheid to neo-liberalism in South Africa". London: Pluto Press
11. Bond, P. (2001) "Debates in Local Economic Development Policy and Practice, Municipal Services Project, Research series occasional paper, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg
12. Bond, P. (2002) "Local Economic Development Debates in South Africa" Occasional Paper Series No6 <http://www.LED.co.za> Accessed 19 July 2009
13. Bond, P. (2003) "Debates in Local Economic development Policy and Practice" Urban Forum, Vol 14 No 2-3 pp 1003-1024 ISSN
14. Brundtland Commission in Yeld. (1993) <http://sdgateway.net> Accessed 29 January 2009

15. Burawoy, M. (1991) "Ethnography Unbound: Power and Resistance in Modern Metropolis", Berkeley: University of California Press
16. Burawoy, M. (2000) "Global Ethnography: Forces, Connections and Imaginations in a Post-Modern World", Berkeley: University of California Press
17. Cahn, M. (2002) "The business of living: rural micro-enterprise and sustainable livelihoods", University of Palmerston North
18. Capricorn, C. Breetzke, A. Menzies, D. and Tedder, E. (2000) "eThekweni Municipality ESC Project", Report for Cato Manor ABM, South Africa
19. Carney, D. (1998) "Sustainable Rural Livelihoods. What contribution can we make?" Papers presented at the Department for International Development's Natural Resources Advisers' Conference. DFID. July.
20. Carney, D. (1999a) "Approaches to sustainable livelihoods for the rural poor", ODI Poverty Briefing 2
21. Carney, D. (1999b) "Livelihood approaches compared" DFID, London
22. Cato Manor Development Association. (1995) "Annual Report:1994", Durban
23. Cato Manor Development Association. (1997) "Annual Report:1996" Durban
24. Cato Manor Development Association. (1997) "EU Final Report 2003" Durban
25. Cato Manor Development Association. (1999) "Cato Manor Development Project: Progress Report 1997-8", Durban
26. Cato Manor Development Association. (1999) "Greater Cato Manor Structure Plan: Executive Summary", Durban
27. Cato Manor Development Association. (2000) "Status Report", Durban
28. Cato Manor Development Association. (2001) "Intuthuko Junction: Durban's New Development Hub", Durban
29. Cato Manor Development Association. (2001) "Sustainability Report 2002", Durban
30. Cato Manor Area based Management implementation Plan 2004-2005 Final Report by Anne Vaughan and Amanda Williamson, McIntosh Xaba and Associates.
31. Cato Manor Development Association. (2002) "Strategy Review Report", Durban
32. Cato Manor Social Development. (2005) "Strategy Review Report", Durban
33. Cato Manor Development Association. (2006) "Strategy Review Report", Durban
34. Cato Manor Development Project. (2006) "Review Report", Durban
35. Cattell, K. (1993) "Black-owned small scale building enterprises in the South African construction industry: attributes, constraints to growth and factors of success" University of Cape Town, South Africa

36. Chambers, R. and Conway, G. (1992) “ Sustainable Rural Livelihoods: Practical Concepts for the 21st Century”, IDS Discussion Paper 296, Brighton: Institute of Development Studies
37. Clark, D.A. (2002) “ The Capability Approach: Its Development, Critiques and Recent Advances”, research paper for the University of Manchester, UK
38. Connell, R.W. (1987) “Gender and Power” (Polity Press)
39. Crooks, 2000 “Okhahlamba IDP” <http://devplan.kzntl.gov.za/Municipal/IDPs> Accessed in 15 May 2008
40. Davis, L. (1997) “Local Economic Development and Rural Transformations: the case of the Umbumbulu District in KZN” Master’s thesis, University of Natal, South Africa
41. Desia, A. (2001) “We are the poors-community struggle in Post-Apartheid South Africa, Monthly Review Press
42. Desai, A. (2004) “The Post-Apartheid State and Community Movements in Mobilising for Change: the rise of the new social movements in South Africa”, Development Update, Vol 5, No2, Johannesburg: Interfund
43. De Haan, L and Zoomers. (2005) “Exploring the Frontier of Livelihoods Research”, Development and Change, Vol 36, No1.
44. Eade, D. and Williams, S. (eds). (1995) “Oxfam handbook for development and relief” Oxford: Oxfam.
45. Ellis, F. (2000) “Rural livelihoods and diversity in developing countries”, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
46. European Union. (2003) “Cato Manor Development Programme: Mid Term Review Report”, Durban, South Africa
47. Evans, P. (1995) “Embedded Autonomy: States and Industrial Transformation”, Princeton: Princeton University Press
48. Ferguson, J. (1990) “The anti-politics machine: Development, depoliticization and bureaucratic power in Lesotho”, Cambridge University Press
49. Flammang, R. A. (1979). “Economic growth and economic development: Counterparts or competitors?” Economic Development and Cultural Change, 28: 47-62
50. Giddens, A. (1986) “Sociology: a brief but critical introduction” (2nd Edition)
51. Government of National Unity Report, (1994): <http://www.info.gov.za/speeches> Accessed 12 June 2008
52. Harrison, N.E. (2000) “Constructing Sustainable Development”, USA, State University of New York
53. Hebinck, P. (2002) “The Sustainable Livelihoods Framework” Report 2001

54. Helmore, K. & Singh, N. (2001) "Sustainable Livelihoods; Building on the Wealth of the Poor", USA: Kumarian Press, Inc.
55. Heymans, C. (1995) "A lifelong Task: The RDP in perspective, The indicator SA, Vol 13, No1, pp57-64
56. Hirsch, A. and Hanival, S. (1998) "Industrial Restructuring in South Africa: The perspective from Government" Paper presented at the 1998 TIPS Annual Forum Johannesburg, South Africa
57. Hirschowitz, R., Orkin, M., Rogerson, C., and Smith, D. (1994) "Micro-Enterprise Development in South Africa" report prepared for the European Union, Johannesburg, South Africa
58. Horn, P. (1995) "Self-Employed Women's Union: Tackling the class gender intersection" South African Labour Bulletin Vol19 No6 pp34-38
59. Kabeer, N. (1994) "Reversed Realities, Gender Hierarchies in Development Thought" London: Verso
60. Khosa, M. (2001) "Empowerment through economic transformation", African Millennium Press, South Africa
61. Kesper, A. (1999a) "Small and Medium-sized Metalworking Companies in the Witwatersrand: Facing the global challenge" Paper for the TIPS Annual Forum, Johannesburg, South Africa
62. Kesper, A (1999b) "Small clothing manufactures in the Johannesburg inner city: Facing the global challenge" Urban Forum Vol10, No2, pp137-164
63. Korten, D.C. (1990) "Development as Transformation: The Agenda" West Hartford, CT: Kumarian Press
64. Leibbrandt, M and Woolard, I. (1999) "A comparison of poverty in South Africa's nine provinces" Development Southern Africa Vol 16, No 1, pp41-54
65. Levin, S. (1997) "Runners and Laggards: An Analysis of the Factors Promoting and Constraining the Growth of Small Manufacturing Firms in the Plastics and Furniture Industry" Paper presented to the Friedrich Ebert Stiftung Johannesburg, South Africa
66. Levy, B. (1996) "South Africa: The Business Environment for Industrial Small and Medium Enterprises. WB Discussion Paper 11, Washington D.C, The World Bank
67. Long, N. (1997) "Agency and constraint, perceptions and practice. A theoretical position", Images and Realities of Rural Life, Wageningen Perspectives on Rural Transformations. Assen: Van Gorcum. Pp. 1-20.

68. Lootvoet, B. and Freund, B. in Padayachee, V. (2006). Local economic development: utopia and reality-the example of Durban, KwaZulu-Natal “The development decade: Economic and social change in South Africa 1994-2004”, Cape Town: HSRC Press
69. Magubane, B. (2000) in Mthembu, N. (2005) “Survival Strategies of Individuals and Households Affected by Unemployment in the Ethekewini Municipality” RASSP Research Report No1 University of Natal, South Africa
70. Manning, C. (1996) “Manufacturing in South African micro-enterprises. IDS Bulletin 25, Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex, Brighton
71. Marais, H. (2001) “South Africa Limits to change: The political economy of transition”, University of Cape Town Press, Cape Town
72. Martinnussen, J. (1996) “Introduction to the Concept of Human Development”, in Integrated Farming in Human Development- Proceedings of a Workshop, Copenhagen, IDS - Roskolde University.
73. May, J. (1998) “Poverty and Inequality in South Africa”, Report for the Executive Deputy President and the inter-ministerial committee for poverty and inequality, South Africa
74. May, J. and Norton, A.(1997) “ A Difficult life: The perceptions and experience of poverty in South Africa”, Social Indicators Research Volume 41, No4, pp102-120
75. May, J., Agüero, J., Carter, M.R., Timaeus, I.M., (2006) “ The KwaZulu Natal Income Dynamics Study (KIDS) Third Wave, 2004: Methods, first findings and an agenda for future research”, Development Southern Africa
76. Maylam, P. (1983) “The Black belt: African Squatters in Durban1935-50” Canadian Journal of African Studies Vol 17, No 9
77. Maylam, P. & Edwards I. (1996) “The People’s City; African Life in Twentieth-Century Durban”, Pietermaritzburg: UNP Press.
78. Mbeki, T. (2006) “State of the Nation Address” <http://www.info.gov.za/speeches>. Accessed 11 June 2008
79. Mchunu, B. R. (2002) “Assessment of factors which contribute to the success of community development in projects in alleviating poverty”, University of Natal Durban
80. Michelle, L. B. (2003) “The whole is more than the sum of its parts”, Cumulative risk of indoor air pollution and urban vulnerability in Cator Manor, University of Natal Durban
81. Moodley, S. (2004) “Making city strategy come alive: Experiences from eThekwini Municipality”, Durban, South Africa

82. Morris, P. and Therivel, R. (2001) "Methods of Environmental Impact Assessment: Second Edition" Spon Press: London
83. Ndimande, P. (2006) "Challenges facing implementation of Local Economic Development", Report for Cato Manor Area Based Management and Development Programme eThekweni Municipality
84. Ndimande, P. (2007) "Sustainable Development: Towards Achieving MDGs", eThekweni Municipality, 4th Local Economic Development Symposium, SA
85. Nel, E. (2001) "Local economic development: A review and assessment of its current status in South Africa", Urban Studies, Vol38, No7, pp1003-1024
86. Nel, E. and Binns, T. (2001) "Initiating developmental local government in South Africa: Evolving local economic development policy", Regional studies, Vol35 No4, pp355-362
87. Neuman, W, L. (1997) "Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches", Forth edition. Boston: Allyn and Bacon
88. Office of the President Report. (1999) <http://www.info.gov.za/speeches> Accessed 12 June 2008
89. Padayachee, V. and Freund, B (2002). "Durban Vortex: South African city in transition", Pietermaritzburg: UNP Press
90. Padayachee, V. (2006) Development discourses in post-apartheid South Africa. "The Development decade: Economic and social change in South Africa 1994-2004", Cape Town: HSRC Press
91. Parahanse, R. and Goldman, I. (2006) "Investigating pro-poor Local Economic Development in South Africa" <http://khanya-aicdd.org> Accessed 05 March 2009
92. Patton, M. Q. (1980) "Qualitative evaluation methods" Beverly Hills: Sage
93. Perkins, D. And Zimmerman, M. (1995) "Empowerment theory, research and application" : American Journal of Community Psychology; Vol23, No5
94. Popke, J. (1997) "Violence and memory in the Reconstruction of South African's Cato Manor", East Carolina University, Greenville
95. Rakodi, C. and Jones, L.T. (2002) "Urban Livelihoods: A people centred approach to reducing poverty", USA:
96. Rappaport, J. (1981) "In praise of paradox: A Social policy of empowerment over prevention" American journal of community psychology, Vol 9 pg1-25
97. Rapport, J. (1984) "Studies in empowerment: Introduction to the issue" prevention in human services, Vol 3, pg1-7
98. Robinson, Peter. McCarthy, J. and Forster, C. (2002) "Urban reconstruction in the developing world: learning through an International Best Practice", Heinemann: Sandown

99. Rogerson, C. (1996) "Rethinking the informal economy of South Africa". Development Paper 84, Development Bank Southern Africa, Halfway House
100. Rogerson, C. (1997) "SMMEs and Poverty in South Africa" Input Report for the National Project on Poverty and Inequality, Johannesburg, South Africa
101. Rogerson, C. (1998) "Small Enterprise Development in Post Apartheid South Africa: Gearing up for growth and poverty alleviation?" Report for the development studies centre, University of Edinburg, Edinburgh
102. Rogerson, C. (1999) "Successful SMEs in South Africa: The case of clothing producers in the Witwatersrand", Report prepared development studies centre, University of Edinburg, Edinburgh
103. Rogerson, C. (2006) "Local Economic Development in South Africa: A ten year research review", in Padayachee V (ed), *The Development Decade?*, HSRC Press, Cape Town, South Africa
104. Romaya, S. & Rakodi, C. (2002) "Building Sustainable Urban Settlements; Approaches and Case Studies in the Developing World". UK: ITDG Publishing
105. Rowlands, J. (1997) "Questioning Empowerment: Working with women in Honduras" Oxford: Oxfam Publications
106. Rwigema, H. & Karungu, P. (1999) "SMME development in Johannesburg's Southern Metropolitan Local Council: an assessment" *Development Southern Africa* Vol16, No1
107. Sen, A. (1995) "Women, Culture and Development: a study of human capabilities" *Gender inequality and theories of justice*, in Nussbaum and Glover (eds.), Oxford: Clarendon Press
108. Sen, A. (1999) "Development as Freedom" , Anchor Books
109. Shaffer, R. E. (1989) "Community Economics. Economic Structure and Change in Smaller Communities" Iowa State University Press, Ames, Iowa
110. Singh, N. and Gilman, J. (1999) "Making livelihoods more sustainable". *International Social Science Journal* 162:539-545.
111. Singleton, R, A. and Straits, B, C. (1999) "Approaches to Social Research", 3rd edition, Oxford: OUP
112. Solesbury, W. (2003) "Sustainable Livelihoods: A case study of the evolution of DFID Policy" DFID London
113. Soubbotina, P. (2004) "Beyond economic growth. An introduction to sustainable development", The World Bank Washington DC

114. Statistics South Africa. (2009) "Quarterly Labour Force Survey: February 2010",
Statistics release P0211
115. Stimson, G. and Webb, B. (1975) "Going to see the doctor", London: Routledge and
Kegan Paul
116. Streak, J. (1997) "The counter-counterrevolution in development theory on the role of the
state in development: inferences for South Africa" in Development Southern Africa Vol.
14 No. 3
117. Terreblanche, S and Durrheim, K. (1999) "Research in Practice: Applied Methods for
Social Science" Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press
118. Terreblanche, S. (2002). "A history of inequality in South Africa: 1652-2002".
Pietermaritzburg: University of Natal Press.
119. Todaro, P. and Smith, S. (1994) "Economic Development" 5th edition Longman New
York
120. Van Schalkwyk & Naidoo, (1999) cited in Crooks, 2000 "Okhahlamba IDP"
<http://devplan.kzntl.gov.za/Municipal/IDPs/Okhahlamba> Accessed 15 May 2008
121. Vermaak, K. Hlongwa, L. and MacPhall, C and Peckham, S. (2001) "Rural Livelihoods
at Dwesa: Poverty and Development" <http://www.livethefuture.co.za> Accessed 12 June
2008
122. Weber, M. (1994) "The methodology of the social sciences" New York: Free Press
123. Williamson, J. B., Karp, D.A., Dalphin, J.R. & Gray, P.S. (1982) "The Research Craft:
An Introduction to Social Research Methods" 2nd edition, Canada
124. Winter, R. (2004) "Cato Manor Development Association trading as Umkhumbane
Entrepreneurial Support Centre Proposal Report: Business Linkage Centre", Durban,
South Africa
125. Zimmerman, M.A. (1993) "Empowerment theory: Where do we go from here" Paper
presented at the annual meeting of the Midwest Psychology Association, Chicago

Interviews:

126. Amanda, 03 March 2009, Cato Manor, South Africa
127. James, 08 February 2009, Cato Manor, South Africa
128. Lungi, 08 February 2009, Cato Manor, South Africa
129. Mandy, 31 January 2009, Cato Manor, South Africa
130. Mandla and Cebo, 21 January 2009, Cato Manor, South Africa
131. Mbuso Dlamini, 21 January 2009, Cato Manor, South Africa
132. Naledi, 21 January 2009, Cato Manor, South Africa
133. Neli, 01 February 2009, Cato Manor, South Africa
134. Nick, 20 February 2009, Cato Manor, South Africa
135. Nobantu, 20 January 2009, Cato Manor, South Africa
136. Sakhi Zungu, 22 March 2009, Cato Manor, South Africa

137. Shawn 21 January 2009, Cato Manor, South Africa
138. Siphos, 21 January 2009, Cato Manor, South Africa
139. Thomas, 21 January 2009, Cato Manor, South Africa
140. Tania 21 January 2009, Cato Manor, South Africa

Appendix A

Cato Manor Projects’ Sustainability Study: Project Leaders and Stakeholders Questionnaire.

Section A

- 1. Name of the Project
.....
- 2. Your capacity or role on the project
.....
- 3. Dates project began and ended
.....
- 4. Was the project successful in terms of its stipulated aims
[1] Yes [2] No [3] Not Sure
- 5. Who initiated the project
[1] Community structure or member [2] An official from the local governing structure [3] Don’t know
- 6. Who funded the project?
[1] Government Dept. [2] International Donor Agency [3] National Donor Agency [4] Don’t know
- 7. What was the value of the project?
.....
- 8. What was the essence of the project? (in one sentence)
.....
- 9. Is the project complete now?
[1]Yes [2] No
- 10. How did the initiator of the project figure out its necessity?
[1] A study was carried out [2] It was obvious from ordinary observation
[3] Previous studies were consulted [4] Don’t know

Section B

- 11. Who were the targeted beneficiaries of the project?
[1] Women [2] Youth [3] Businesspeople [4] Anyone could participate
- 12. Was there a need for strict adherence to the geographical location of participants?
[1] Yes [2] No [3] Not sure
- 13. Please provide statistics on the demographic detail of participants (if any) in terms of both age and gender? (in 100% form).....
.....
.....
- 14. What were the stipulation requirements for participation in the project?
.....
.....
.....
- 15. Did you explain all the details of the project to the people before they could take part?
[1] Yes [2] No

Section C

- 16. Was there a priority for the sustainability of the project before the project was implemented?
[1] Yes [2] No [3] Not sure
- 17. If yes, why was this priority necessary?.....
.....
.....
- 18. How much successful was the project in terms of this priority?
[1] 100% [2] 50% or above [3] Less than 50%
- 19. If less than 50% in Q18, can you account for the 'failure'?.....
.....

20. What is the situation now as the project is complete or in process?.....

21. Would you say that the project was aimed at improving the economic lives of the people in the area?
 [1] Yes [2] No [3] Not sure
22. If yes, in what way?
 [1] By increasing employability of participants [2] by increasing income-earning capacity [3] By reducing poverty levels in some other way [4] All of the above [5] other(please specify).....
23. Was the project directly related to meeting people's needs?
 [1] Yes [2] No [3] Not sure
24. If yes, how was this need identified?
 [1] A study was carried out [2] Obvious from ordinary observation [3] Previous studies were consulted [4] Don't Know
25. Did the funder spell out that participants in the project would have to be supported after the running of the project?
 [1] Yes [2] No [3] Not sure
26. Were the participants actually supported after the project duration?
 [1] Yes [2] No [3] Not sure
27. If yes, how? If no, why?

28. What would you say is the direct (short-term) benefit of the project to the participants?

29. What would you say is the direct (long-term) benefit of the project to the recipients (both short and long term)?

30. What would you say are the indirect benefits of the project to the recipients (both short and long term)?

31. Would you recommend a similar project for other poor areas and why?
 [1] Yes [2] No [3] Not sure

Appendix B

Questionnaire: Participants'

Section A

1. Name and location respondent?
2. Name of the project?
3. How did you hear about the project? [1] Word of mouth [2] Community meeting [3] Newspaper or radio [4] Other
4. What was specified as the criteria for participation on the project? [1] Age [2] Gender [3] Business inclination [4] Location [5] Other (specify
5. Did you participate? [1] Yes [2] No
6. Do you know who funded the project or how much it was worth? Were all the details of the project explained before you could take part?[1] Yes [2] No[3] Not sure Such as rent/electricity/water
7. Were there any 'strings attached' to participation (such as payments of some money or engagement in some activity after the project? [1] Yes [2] No
8. If yes, mention the condition?
9. Did you feel that the people who facilitated the project were dedicated enough for the job?[1] Yes [2] No [3] Not sure
10. Were the aims explained? [1] Yes [2] No
11. If yes, what were these aims (in one sentence)?

Section B

12. Do you feel that the project is sustainable and it closes an important gap in your economic life?[1] Yes [2] No [3] Not sure
13. If yes, what gap is this (in one sentence)? Was this gap successfully closed?[1] Yes [2]No
14. If yes/no, how (in one sentence)?
15. What benefits did you derive from the project?(name at least 3)

Section B

16. Do you feel that the benefits of the project were relevant after the project had run and ended? [1] Yes [2] No [3] Not sure
17. If yes, why do you say so (explain giving as much details as possible)

18. Of all the participants of the project, how many do you think successfully benefited?(In% form)

19. Do you feel that the project:

- I. Reduced poverty levels? [1] Yes [2] No
- II. Reduced unemployment ?[1] Yes [2] No
- III. Increased income?[1] Yes [2] No
- IV. Increase quality of life for the ordinary people? [1] Yes [2] No

*All names used have been changed for confidentiality purpose