AN INVESTIGATION INTO FACTORS INFLUENCING ENGLISH SECOND LANGUAGE, BLACK MATRICULANTS' ATTITUDES TO POETRY, WITH SPECIFIC REFERENCE TO KWAZULU-NATAL

R.N. LATTOR

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Education in the Department of Education, University of Natal, Pietermaritzburg 1998
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</th>
<th>(i)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>(ii)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION A - JUSTIFICATION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION B - METHOD OF RESEARCH</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION C - SUMMARY OF CHAPTERS 1-4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AND CONCLUSION OF DISSERTATION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 4</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS OF DISSERTATION</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION D - DATA COLLECTION</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION E - IMPLICATIONS</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 1 - INTRODUCTION</th>
<th>25</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SECTION A - PRE-COLONIAL LITERATURE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE PERIOD OF ORAL LITERACY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Pre-Colonial Literature and subsequent periods</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Zulu Oral Literature - the paradigm</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Zulu Oral Literature - Main Categories</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Poetry and the Oral Tradition</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Izibongo - Praise poems</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Isithakazelo - Clan praises</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Izaga - Proverbs</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Amaculo - Songs</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Imilolozelo - Children’s songs</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Common characteristics of black ethnic oral literatures</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION B - THE TRANSITION PERIOD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Historical Background</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Language</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. World view</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Characteristics</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION C - LITERATURE OF THE STRUGGLE (1948 - 1994)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Historical Background and Characteristics</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION D - FUTURE LITERATURE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Background Perspective</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION E - CONCLUSION OF CHAPTER 1</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 2 - INTRODUCTION</th>
<th>64</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SECTION A - POETRY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEARNING/ TEACHING IN GENERAL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Why teach poetry?</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Why poetry in English</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The educative value of poetry</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The L2 classroom</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION B - THE SYLLABUS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Syllabus and curriculum as generally understood</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The difference between syllabus and curriculum</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Second language syllabi</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION C - POETRY TEACHING IN KWAZULU/NATAL SCHOOLS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The D.E.T. syllabus</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Prescribed poems</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Classroom methodology</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Examinations (Assessment)</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Speculations on questioning patterns</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION D - CONCLUSION OF CHAPTER 2</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 3 - INTRODUCTION</th>
<th>104</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SECTION A - METHOD OF RESEARCH</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Aims of research</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Justification of research methods</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Rationale and method of selection of poems</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. Locality of research .................................................. 115

SECTION B - INTERPRETATION OF PILOT RESEARCH - SCHOOL A
1. Introduction ......................................................... 117
2. Strategy ............................................................ 117
3. Justification for Pilot ............................................. 117
4. Interpretation of pilot research ................................. 118
5. Conclusion of the Pilot Research .............................. 148

SECTION C - INTERPRETATION OF THE MAIN RESEARCH
1. Modifications resulting from the Pilot Research ............. 149
2. Interpretation of Main Research ................................ 150

SECTION D - CONCLUSION OF CHAPTER 3 (MAIN RESEARCH) ......................................................... 184

CHAPTER 4 - INTRODUCTION ............................................ 185

SECTION A - LANGUAGE POLICY
1. Ideological Standpoints ......................................... 185
2. Pupils Research Sample ......................................... 186
3. Research Findings and the New Language Policy .......... 189

SECTION B - THE MULTILINGUAL/MULTICULTURAL CLASSROOM
1. The multilingual classroom ..................................... 191
2. The multicultural classroom .................................. 198

SECTION C - SYLLABUS DESIGN
1. Research findings and the syllabus ........................... 203
2. The D.E.T. Syllabus .............................................. 204
3. The Interim Core Syllabus ..................................... 205
4. The Interim Core Syllabus in relation to research findings 205

SECTION D - PRESCRIBED POEMS
1. Syllabus design .................................................... 209
2. Balanced selection .............................................. 209
3. Relevance and interest ......................................... 210
4. Accessible language ............................................ 211
5. Poetry in the “multi-classroom” ................................ 211

SECTION E - METHODOLOGY
1. The questionnaire and classroom methodology ............ 213
2. Research findings ............................................... 215
3. The future scenario ............................................. 217

SECTION F - ASSESSMENT
1. The research questionnaire and assessment ................. 225
2. Outcomes-Based assessment and research findings ........ 225
3. Research findings ............................................... 226

SECTION G - CONCLUSION OF CHAPTER 4 ........................ 231

CONCLUSION OF DISSERTATION ................................. 232

SECTION A - NEGATIVE INFLUENCES
1. The language policy of subtractive bilingualism .......... 232
2. Prescribed poems ............................................... 233
3. The learning environment .................................... 234

SECTION B - POSITIVE INFLUENCES
1. The oral tradition ................................................. 235
2. Contemporary Black Poetry ................................... 237

SECTION C - SUMMARY OF CONCLUSION

RECOMMENDATIONS - INTRODUCTION .......................... 241

1. SECTION A - LANGUAGE POLICY .......................... 241
2. SECTION B - POETRY CURRICULUM/SYLLABUS ......... 242
3. SECTION C - PRESCRIBED POEMS .......................... 244
4. SECTION D - METHODOLOGY ............................... 246
5. SECTION E - ASSESSMENT ..................................... 249
6. SECTION F - GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS ............. 249

BIBLIOGRAPHY ............................................................. 251

APPENDICES .................................................................. 259
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to thank Prof. Ken Harley, Head of Education, University of Natal Pietermaritzburg, for his concern and help. To Mrs Belle Wallace Adams, my supervisor. I wish to express my gratitude for the support over the years.

However, I owe a very special debt of gratitude to Ari Blacquiere, former Head of English Second Language Studies at University of Natal Pietermaritzburg and his wife Pat Blacquiere. Apart from lecturing to me during the course work leading up to the dissertation Ari Blacquiere also acted as my supervisor for a short period while Mrs. Belle Wallace Adams was overseas. His assistance with the questionnaire and graphs is highly appreciated. Ari maintained and interest in my work until the end, assisting with the final editing of the manuscript. His wife Pat Blacquiere typed the final manuscript often under great pressure to meet the deadline. It would not be an exaggeration to say that without the assistance of Ari and Pat Blacquiere it is unlikely this dissertation would have been completed on time.

I would also like to thank Mr. Joe Ndlovu of the Geography Dept. and Mr. Sibi Ndlovu of the Commerce Dept. of Umlazi College For Further Education in assisting with the administering of the questionnaire at the schools. As the research was conducted during the period of unrest in South Africa their assistance was in fact a great sacrifice. A special thanks is also due to members of the Zulu Dept. of Umlazi College For Further Education. At that time the members were Mrs. N.R. Nkosi, Mrs. Z. Msomi, Mrs. N. Mfusi, Mrs. P. Khumalo, and Mrs. B. Mtshali, their assistance in correcting any misconceptions and explaining unfamiliar cultural practices to me is highly appreciated.

Thanks is also due to Prof. Mazizi Kunene of the Zulu Dept. of the University of Natal for his valuable insight into the role of the imbongi in traditional Nguni Society.

I would also like to express my gratitude to Mr. Peter Southy of the former Dept. of Education and Training for making available the examiner’s reports on literature for the matriculation exams. Of particular value was the examiner’s reports on poetry.

I also owe a deep debt of gratitude to Gillian Botha and Bruce Issacs for typing the first draft of the manuscript. Mrs. Pat Blacquiere typed the final version of the dissertation.

Thanks is also due to Mr. C.S. Sowki - Head of Languages at Effingham Senior Secondary School for assisting with the proof-reading and editing of the final manuscript.

(i)
ABSTRACT

There is a strong perception among teachers, academics and researchers that English Second Language (L2) black matriculants and black pupils generally do not possess an aptitude for poetry appreciation in English; and therefore have a negative attitude to English poetry.

Another perception is that the apparent lack of aptitude by L2 black matriculants / learners for English poetry arises from the wilful neglect by the previous education system to offer an appropriate poetry curriculum for L2 black matriculants and L2 black learners generally. This perception contends that the poetry curriculum of the previous education system ignored the basic principles of TESOL (Teaching English to Speakers of other Languages) in formulating the English poetry curriculum.

This dissertation tests these perceptions through a pupil questionnaire and teacher interviews. The L2 black pupils' responses are assessed against their literary background viz. the oral tradition and contemporary black writing, as well as the historical, socio-political and economic factors affecting their lives. The dissertation critiques the syllabus used by the Department of Education and Training (D.E.T.);¹ the prescribed poems, and classroom methodology to see whether it reflects an awareness of the L2 black learners' background, guided by the basic principles of TESOL.

The contents of chapters 1-4 are arranged in a sequence that is aimed at testing the validity of the general perceptions of L2 black matriculants' attitudes to poetry mentioned earlier. The research revealed that the attitudes of L2 black matriculants to unjust education system and an inappropriate English poetry curriculum should not be confused with their attitudes to English poetry in general. The dissertation concludes that L2 black matriculants / learners appreciate appropriate English poetry and respond positively to English as a subject.

¹. The Dept. of Education and Training used the syllabus drawn up by the Administration: House of Assembly - Dept. of Education and Culture; for English Second Language Higher Grade, Std. 9 and 10. However in this dissertation the syllabus is referred to as the D.E.T. syllabus as it was popularly known then [See Appendix 11A]
INTRODUCTION

This dissertation investigates English Second Language (E.S.L.) black matriculants' attitudes to poetry. It examines the educational context within which the L2 black matriculant functioned viz. their literary, political, social and economic background in KwaZulu-Natal. Against this backdrop an assessment is made of the positive and negative influences acting upon L2 black matriculants and their attitudes to poetry specifically and English in general. Finally the implications of the findings are discussed in the light of the latest developments in education. The introduction is therefore divided into five sections:

SECTION A - Justification
SECTION B - Method of Research
SECTION C - Summary of Chapters and Conclusion of Dissertation
SECTION D - Data Collection
SECTION E - Implications.

SECTION A

JUSTIFICATION

The dissertation traces and investigates influences that shaped L2 black matriculants' attitudes to poetry and consequently their performance in the genre. The research was entered into without any preconceptions except one viz. that attitude rather than aptitude held the key to L2 black pupils' performance. Hence the choice of the topic, which was chosen for the following reasons:

1. A general perception existed and still exists that L2 black learners do not possess an aptitude for poetry. The dissertation tests this perception through the use of the questionnaire.

2. Matriculants were chosen as the pupil sample because they represented the culmination of the educational process at school for black pupils at that time. Therefore the matriculants represent the L2 black learner generally as they encapsulated the experience of the schooling system then available. Also matriculants, it was presumed, would be more

1. Hereafter referred to as L2 black matriculants. (L2 is used in preference to E.S.L. as it is the most abbreviated form.) N.B. Black, White and other racial categories are only used in an effort to place the research in context and not to help perpetuate its continued use. However, to ignore its existence would be to deny one of the most powerful influences shaping the destiny of South Africans under apartheid, viz. Racial categorisation.
articulate than pupils in the lower grades because they would have had longer exposure to English.

3. Attitudes were chosen firstly because it was considered to be the key factor determining performance in poetry. Secondly attitudes do not change as rapidly as political systems and educational theories, and hence the influence of attitudes may linger long after the political or educational system that engendered it. The perception that L2 black learners generally do not possess an aptitude for poetry is an example of such an attitude. It would be a pity if such attitudes are not corrected in accordance with the changed and changing conditions in South Africa. Mawasha (1990:37) sounded a note of warning:

... such misconceptions, if unchecked, may go on and on until by sheer entrenchment and institutionalisation, they assume the status of fact. A case in point is that in many black schools L2 teachers have, over the years, come dangerously close if not quite to believing that black L2 learners are not capable of coping with English poetry and drama. These are said to be too difficult for them.

Professor Mawasha’s concerns are given substance in an analysis of the examiner’s reports on poetry for the Department of Education and Training examinations 1992/3/4. [For a detailed analysis see Chapter 2, pp.96-101]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of questions</th>
<th>Nov 92</th>
<th>Nov 93</th>
<th>Nov 94</th>
<th>Ave. %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lexical questions</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figures of speech</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content questions</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal response</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3a

All questions are of a lexical or contextual nature, no questions on personal response appear for three consecutive years. The obvious conclusion is that examiners consider poetry in the words of Prof. Mawasha, to be too difficult for them.

1. Hereafter referred to as the D.E.T.
Lastly urban pupils were chosen because of accessibility to the researcher as well as the fact that schools offering poetry at matriculation level were few and the accessible few happened to be in the peri-urban area of Durban in KwaZulu-Natal. For the reasons indicated above the research was considered a necessary and worthwhile undertaking. The period over which the research was conducted covers the final years of control by the Department of Education and Training, through its replacement by the KwaZulu-Natal Education Department, and the use of the Core Interim Syllabus for Matriculation to the imminent introduction of Outcomes Based Education. Therefore the dissertation covers a period of rapid transition, the final chapter of the dissertation, Chapter 4, attempts to reflect salient features of the transition. However, the abiding concern of the dissertation is the influences shaping the attitudes of L2 black matriculants to poetry. The dissertation takes into account influences that could have emanated from the educational, the indigenous literary tradition viz. the oral tradition, as well as the historical, socio-political and economic background. The influences were measured through an analysis of the research questionnaire, teacher interviews, prescribed poems, examiner’s reports, examination question papers and research relevant to the topic. Against this backdrop an assessment is made of the role of both positive and negative influences shaping L2 black matriculants’ attitudes to poetry specifically and English in general.

In conclusion some recommendations are made in the hope that they would prove useful to poetry learning/teaching in future.

SECTION B

METHOD OF RESEARCH

The qualitative research method was used. Bryman (1988:46) defines it as:

An approach to the study of the social world which seeks to describe and analyse culture and behaviour of humans and their groups from the point of view of those being studied.

Besides offering a perspective from the point of view of those being studied, in this instance L2 black matriculants, qualitative research methodology also offered the following advantages:

1. Qualitative research is considered a process and the process itself is regarded as worthwhile. This process method allowed one to explore L2 black matriculants’ attitudes without any preconceptions or fixed expectations. It allowed for the study of a broadly defined topic as opposed to a closely defined one. Often extremely focused or closely defined topics contain within them the conclusions that the subsequent research is tailored
and doctored to prove. The result is vital information that could have been uncovered is lost.

2. The open research strategy or tabula rasa approach of qualitative research enhanced the chances of uncovering hidden or half truths and of debunking or confirming stereotypical ideas and general perceptions. The result was that the research yielded findings contrary to the general perception that L2 black matriculants lacked an aptitude for poetry or had a negative attitude to the subject.

3. The qualitative approach is flexible and allows for the perspective of both sides or all sides to be taken into account before conclusions are arrived at. This approach is of particular significance to a study in South Africa which is a multicultural and multilingual society whose diversity was not fully acknowledged during the apartheid years. Most studies and education itself were looked at from a predominantly Eurocentric perspective. In this investigation of L2 black matriculants' attitudes to poetry the black perspective of poetry is taken into account, a factor previously ignored, the analysis of the prescribed poems in Chapter 2 indicates this. However, the educative value of poetry per se is not ignored in favour of any particular perspective of poetry whether Afrocentric or Eurocentric and a balanced perspective is sought and encouraged rather than a one-sided view.

4. It is an holistic approach and looks at the totality of the human being rather than a fragmentary perspective. Schutz (1962:31) encapsulates this:

   The world of nature as explored by the natural scientist does not mean anything to molecules, atoms and electrons - but the observational field of the social scientist - social reality - has a specific meaning and relevance structure for the beings living, acting and thinking within it.

Therefore, for the purposes of this study the pupil questionnaire did not ignore the home background in determining pupils' attitudes to poetry, language study and education in general. The questionnaire attempted to establish both the social and educational milieux in which the L2 black matriculant had to function.

5. Qualitative research does not fragment reality in terms of past, present and future. The interrelatedness of the time continuum is acknowledged. Therefore in this dissertation the impact of the historical, political, social and economic factors that helped determine L2 black matriculants' attitudes to poetry and English in general are considered.

6. Understanding reality from the point of view of the L2 black matriculant meant using their view of poetry as the starting point. Therefore in this dissertation the chapters and even the content of the chapters were arranged in the sequence that indicated that view. This is further corroborated in the next section viz. the Summary of the Chapters.
SECTION C

SUMMARY OF THE CHAPTERS 1-4 AND CONCLUSION OF DISSERTATION

Chapter 1

This chapter is divided into the following sections:
SECTION A - Pre-colonial literature i.e. before 1652.
SECTION B - Literature of Transition 1652-1948.
SECTION D - Future literature 1994-
SECTION E - Conclusion of Chapter 1

SECTION A

Pre-colonial literature: Before 1652.

This is the period of oral literacy in South Africa. It is dealt with in greater detail than other periods because it was never seriously taken into consideration in assessing the appropriateness of the prescribed poems or classroom methodology. Perhaps because historically, the oral accomplishments of black people were consistently ignored by colonial governments as well as most missionaries.

This section shows how the oral poetic tradition covered every facet of life from the *imilolozelo* or the lullaby in the cradle, to the *izihayo* or chants to the ancestors (*amadlozi*) beyond the grave. The oral tradition also embodied the world-view of the people, prescribed social behaviour, and represented the collective wisdom of the people, as the oral tradition was regarded as a cumulative and collective achievement of the people.

SECTION B

Literature of transition: 1652-1948

This period deals with the impact of black and white culture on one another. Attention is given to the following: Language, Writing and World-view.

Language

The Dutch and English settlers imposed their languages on the indigenous people. With the exception of the missionaries few of the colonists made any serious attempts to learn the indigenous languages. The indigenous languages and the oral tradition were wilfully neglected by the colonial authorities.
Writing
Writing symbolised the most profound change wrought by European culture. It changed the nature of the oral tradition forever. The status of the *imbongi* declined as the written word replaced the *imbongi* as the repository of knowledge.

World-view
The advent of Christianity altered the African world-view. The impact of Christianity on the life of the African is reflected in Ntsikana (1780-1820) among the Xhosa and Shembe (1875-1935) among the Zulus. The two early Christian converts used the African poetic tradition to compose praises to Christ. Later writers used the oral tradition to create a sense of black pride and nationhood as well as use it in the fight for freedom, justice and equality. The transition period was the period of gestation that led to the freedom struggle in South Africa.

SECTION C

Literature of the struggle: 1948-1994
This is a short but prolific period in the literary history of South Africa. Writing was used as a weapon in the freedom struggle. The different approaches to writing indicate the different strategies employed in the struggle ranging from protest, black pride and consciousness, to revolution and the seizure of power. Poetry became the favoured genre of this period because:

1. The multiplicity of meaning and the necessity for interpretation made poetry most suited to evading strict government censorship.

2. Poetry was accessible to the masses through the oral tradition and the use of simple People’s English.

3. Poetry could be easily memorised and shared by all as a form of song and dance accompaniment. This suited the revolutionary purpose as poems could be transformed into revolutionary songs and anthems.

4. Poets of this period considered it their responsibility to change society rather than be changed by it. Hence their concentration on the following themes to the exclusion of more personal ones:

   4.1 Police brutality and harassment.
   4.2 Forced removals.
   4.3 Pain and cruelty.
   4.4 Snobbery and betrayal.
   4.5 Frustration and revenge.
   4.6 Exhortation and encouragement.
4.7 Prayer and hope.
4.8 Forgiveness

SECTION D

Future Literature 1994-

This section deals with speculations on future trends in South African literature. The ideas of two major literary personalities are discussed viz. Nadine Gordimer and Njabulo Ndebele.

Nadine Gordimer sees the role of the writer as one who is free to express the truth. It is the revolutionary duty of the writer to do so.

Njabulo Ndebele (1991:58-65) sees the task of the writer as one who frees the “social imagination” from the “them and us” which is the black and white dichotomy of the past. Ndebele feels that the creative energy of future poets and writers should be directed into areas other than politics, especially facets of life that were neglected during the apartheid era.

SECTION E

Conclusion of Chapter 1

The oral tradition is still alive and has also been largely transposed into writing. Future poetry anthologies should include traditional as well as modern poems by reputable black poets.

Chapter 2

This chapter investigates whether the D.E.T. English Second Language Syllabus, with specific reference to poetry, reflected a sufficient awareness of black pupils’ literary, cultural and historical background; in respect of prescribed poems, classroom methodology, teacher competencies and other related factors. Attention is given to:

SECTION A. - Poetry learning/teaching
SECTION B. - The syllabus.
SECTION C. - Poetry learning/teaching in KwaZulu-Natal schools.
SECTION D. - Conclusion of Chapter 2

SECTION A.

Poetry learning/teaching

1. Why teach poetry
1.1 It is the oldest literary genre among the black people of South Africa and the most popular genre among blacks in recent times.  
1.2 Poetic language is striking and condensed, its universality arising from its varied, versatile and multiple meanings which help pupils exercise their cognitive skills.
2. *Why English poetry*

2.1 It is an international language as well as a language of daily communication in South Africa.

2.2 English has a rich poetical heritage and most modern black South African poets wrote in English.

2.3 It is considered a language of empowerment and liberation by the masses.

3. *The Educative Value of Poetry*

3.1 Poetry gives exposure to the universality of the human experience and critical insight into human nature.

3.2 It provides vicarious experiences of the other cultures, philosophies and world views.

3.3 Poetry stimulates thought, imagination and cognitive development, as well as improves the passive vocabulary.

3.4 Poetry reveals the possibilities of language usage through the use of literary devices like metaphors, similes, alliteration and other figures of speech.

3.5 It stimulates pupils to write their own poems.

4. *The L2 Classroom*

The communicative method is discussed as a highly favoured approach to the teaching of English as a second language. Communicative Language Teaching in L2 is viewed with favour because:

4.1 Poems are seen as real communication, including prescribed poems.

4.2 Contemporary poetry is favoured as it is communication pupils understand.

4.3 Prescribed poems should take into account the pupils' background.

4.4 Pupil enjoyment is seen as the primary purpose of poetry mediation.

4.5 Appropriate poetry and teacher intervention should lead to the holistic development of the pupil.

**SECTION B.**

**The Syllabus**

The D.E.T. syllabus is discussed in relation to the following:

1. Syllabus and curriculum

2. Second language syllabi

   [See Appendix II for the D.E.T. Syllabus ]

1. *Syllabus and curriculum*

The syllabus is seen as a public, legal, political and social document which is authoritative and is used as a guideline by teacher and pupil.

The curriculum is perceived as the planning, organisation, management, implementation and
evaluation of an educational programme.

These definitions are adhered to in the dissertation when referring to the syllabus and curriculum.

2. English second language syllabi

The different schools of thought concerning second language syllabi are discussed, viz:

2.1 Lancaster school
2.2 London school
2.3 Toronto school.

This is followed by a discussion of two types of Second Language Syllabi viz:

2.4 Broad and narrow syllabi

Broad and narrow syllabi are discussed in relation to the schools mentioned above. According to Nunan (1988:5) a narrow syllabus draws a distinction between syllabus design and methodology while the broader view does not separate it, maintaining that the distinction between content and tasks is difficult to sustain.

2.5 Process and product

The difference between a Process Syllabus and Product Syllabus is discussed in detail with specific reference to content and method. The fundamental difference between process and product can be summed up as, a process syllabus gives emphasis to the process by which language is acquired, a product syllabus emphasizes the final product or examination that measures the extent to which proficiency in the language has been acquired.

SECTION C

Poetry Learning / Teaching in Kwa-Zulu Natal Schools

The teaching practices in KwaZulu-Natal schools are assessed against the background of English Second Language syllabi as outlined above. The following aspects affecting poetry mediation are considered:

1. The D.E.T. syllabus
2. Prescribed poems
3. Methodology
4. Examination (assessment)

1. The D.E.T. syllabus

The D.E.T. syllabus was a product type syllabus that militated in favour of a transmission mode of teaching as the examination or product was given more emphasis than the process whereby the language was acquired. However, teaching was hampered because of the lack of...
qualified teachers:
• Qualified 6.5%
• Unqualified 19.2%
• Underqualified 74.3%.  

[See Krige & Scott (1994:98)]

The lack of qualified teachers was aggravated by a high teacher-pupil ratio:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pupils</th>
<th>Teacher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>34-37</td>
<td>per 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38-49</td>
<td>per 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-59</td>
<td>per 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

over the different areas of KwaZulu-Natal.  

[See Krige & Scott (1994:30)]

These facts together with poor facilities and infrastructure gave rise to a negative attitude towards the D.E.T. in general as it was perceived to represent Apartheid Education. These constraints made it difficult for the D.E.T. syllabus to realise its aims. The prescribed poems added to these constraints.

2. The prescribed poems

The D.E.T. prescribed poems did not meet the requirements of TESOL (Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages)\(^1\) theory. Many suggestions were made by leading educationists to improve the selection of poems, few if any, suggestions were implemented. The poems were predominantly Eurocentric, archaic in language and generally belonging in chronology to the sixteenth, seventeenth, eighteenth and nineteenth centuries with a few poems from the twentieth century. Even the few twentieth century poems were foreign rather than South African. This anthology did not excite pupil or teacher enthusiasm and made teaching a difficult task.

3. Classroom methodology

Methodology in poetry learning/teaching has been influenced by a combination of factors viz. the syllabus, prescribed poems, teacher competencies, pupil-teacher ratio and relationships, as well as pupil response.

Because the D.E.T. syllabus was a product type syllabus the examination became the primary aim of both teacher and pupil as well as the community in general. The teacher taught for the examination and the pupil studied poetry with the examination in mind. This entrenched the

---

\(^1\) Hereafter referred to as TESOL
transmission mode of teaching and rote learning.

4. Examination

The analysis of the 1992, 1993 and 1994 poetry examination questions revealed that content and lexical questions predominate while there are no questions on personal response. Hence pupil reaction to poems was ignored. [See analysis, Chapter 2 p. 96-101]

SECTION D

Conclusion of Chapter 2

A conflict of purposes existed between the D.E.T. syllabus, the prescribed poems, methodology, and assessment, because the basic principles of TESOL were not used in the selection of prescribed poems.

Chapter 3

This chapter deals with the research conducted to ascertain what influences shaped and perhaps still shape L2 black matriculants' attitudes to poetry. Therefore it is divided into the following sections:

SECTION A - Method of research.
SECTION B - Interpretation of Pilot Research.
SECTION C - Interpretation of the Main Research.
SECTION D - Conclusion of Chapter 3 (Main Research).

SECTION A

Method of research

The research procedure was as follows:

1. Aims, strategy and research method.
2. Selection of questionnaire poems.

1.1 Aims

The two most important aims are:

1.1.1 To gather information about what influences determine L2 black matriculants' attitudes to poetry.

1.1.2 To arrive at conclusions that may prove useful to future L2 learners/teachers in South Africa, especially in regard to prescribed poems and classroom methodology.

1.2 Strategy

The strategy employed is to interpret the research findings of this chapter in terms of the pupils' background at home and in school as outlined in chapters 1 and 2, and to see how this impacts on pupils' attitudes to poetry, which constitutes the content of chapter 4 and the conclusion of the dissertation.
1.3 Research method

The structured interviews was used to collect data from teachers and the questionnaires was used for pupils. This aspect is dealt with in more detail under data collection and also in the introduction to chapter three.

2. Selection of questionnaire poems

Four poems were chosen for inclusion in the questionnaire, two of the simplest poems from the list of the prescribed anthology called *The Wind at Dawn* and two of the simplest from *Poetry of the People* an anthology of poems compiled by Sached. The simplest poems were chosen so that no prior knowledge or tuition would be required to access them. However, pupils would have had prior knowledge of the poems taken from the prescribed list of poems. The simplest poems were chosen using professional intuition and Brumfit’s (1987:180-183) criteria for the selection of literary texts for L2 pupils. During the teacher interview, this selection was once again confirmed by the professional intuition of the teachers. This method of selection was used in preference to readability tests because of the difficulty of applying readability tests to poetic language. The following poems were chosen:

- *The Wind at Dawn*
- *The Hermit* by Alan Paton
- *The Gamblers* by Anthony Delius
- *Poetry of the People*
- *Faraway City* by Jeremy Cronin
- *Sea and Sand* by Don Mattera

SECTION B

Interpretation of Pilot Research

1. Aim of the Pilot Research

The aim of the pilot research was to test the questionnaire in the field so that flaws and omissions could be corrected before the main research. It also allowed the researcher to ascertain the following:

1.1 Whether the language was accessible and the print and layout clear.
1.2 To observe whether an hour was adequate for pupils to answer the questionnaire.
1.3 To surmise whether 21 pupils, making up the sample, was a suitable number.

2. Results of the Pilot

2.1 The language was found accessible.
2.2 An hour proved enough to answer the questionnaire.
2.3 The following omissions were noted in the choice of subjects and included in the final
3. Conclusion of Pilot

From the responses received it was evident that pupils were appreciative and sensitive to poetry. There was no evidence that poetry was inaccessible.

SECTION C

Interpretation of the Main Research

1. Modifications from the pilot study

1.1 The composition sample was fixed at ±20 pupils.

1.2 The following subjects were included:

- Zulu
- Biblical Studies
- Typing
- Home Economics.

2. Locality of research

The pilot was conducted at one school. The main research was conducted at two schools. The pupils making up the sample of the main research came from a lower socio-economic strata than that of the pilot school. However, this phenomenon did not affect the research process.

3. Research findings

Poetry proved to be a surprisingly popular genre with a popularity rating of ±50%. Research also indicated that more pupils found the poems easy to understand rather than difficult. Pupils indicated a preference for contemporary poetry with simple style and diction and simple English that could be easily accessed. Pupils did not indicate any racial preferences in the choice of Best Liked and Least Liked poems.

SECTION D

Conclusion of Chapter 3 (Main Research).

Pupils displayed a positive attitude to poetry in relation to other genres as well as a positive attitude to English.

Chapter 4

This chapter interprets the research findings in chapter 3 in the light of the L2 black matriculants' background as outlined in chapters 1 and 2. It gives attention to the following:

SECTION A - Language Policy

SECTION B - The multilingual and multicultural classroom
SECTION A

Language Policy

The old policy of subtractive bilingualism in which Zulu was a vernacular rather than a language severely handicapped L2 black matriculants because 86% of the pupil sample indicated that Zulu was the main home language.

However, in spite of the policy of subtractive bilingualism in which English was given a dominant place, pupils' attitude to English was positive as the percentages below indicate:

- 65% used English as Other Home Language
- 63% used English as Other Language Used
- 75% chose English as Best Liked Subject.

The new Language policy has accorded Zulu the status of a language and has given recognition to the linguistic diversity in South Africa with the eleven official languages. The linguistic versatility of L2 black matriculants is now recognised.

SECTION B

The multilingual and multicultural classroom

1. The multilingual classroom

South Africa is a multilingual country. The policy of subtractive bilingualism was apartheid's answer to linguistic diversity. This was disadvantageous to black pupils. The new government has implemented a policy of Additive Bilingualism in which previously neglected languages are now given the chance to develop fully. However, the success of Additive Bilingualism will depend on:

1.1 Pace of implementation, which will vary from province to province, community to community and school to school.

1.2 Teacher competencies and resources, special pre-service, and in-service training should be given to teachers to cope with multilingual classes. Teachers should also be encouraged to learn from multilingual countries abroad without slavish imitation. Teachers should be encouraged to be researchers and to be brave and innovative as
the concept of multilingualism is still in its infancy and their contributions will be valued.

1.3 Textbooks and cost. Books are not available in all eleven official languages and therefore in the short-term English will retain its importance as a medium of learning. To translate all available textbooks in the short term is not possible in terms of cost and resources.

Multilingual models of schools and schooling systems have emerged viz:
(a) The Multi medium School.
(b) L1 as a medium of learning.
(c) The Immersion Model.
The choice of the multilingual model is as yet not finalised. New models may still emerge with time and experience.

2. The multicultural classroom

South Africa is multicultural. The National Party government of South Africa adopted the apartheid policy as an answer to cultural diversity. Apartheid advocated the development of cultures with emphasis on difference and separation in order to preserve cultural identity and racial purity. The A.N.C. government has adopted the policy of multiculturalism. The cultural admixture varies from region to region. In KwaZulu-Natal the admixture is as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Culture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Blacks</td>
<td>Zulu culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whites</td>
<td>Anglo-Saxon culture predominantly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indians</td>
<td>Indian culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coloureds</td>
<td>Christian plus features of other cultures</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As multicultural education is new in South Africa, resources are scant. Also the cultural scenario in South Africa is unique because culture was closely identified with race and ethnicity. These differences were emphasised and entrenched by apartheid and teachers were trained for service within their own racial and cultural groups, which meant training for a monocultural society within a society of diverse cultures.

2.1 Resources for multicultural education

Teachers are the main resource but they lack the necessary training. Intensive in-service training for teachers in service should be made available. And comprehensive pre-service training for those training to become teachers.

Resource material for the multi-classroom in terms of textbooks and other necessary material is scanty. Efforts should be made to build a local resource of relevant textbooks, magazines
etc. that reflect our cultural diversity in an equitable and sensitive manner. Poetry could be a powerful tool in making the multi-classroom a success because it could help to achieve the following:

2.1.1 Poetry in translation could offer exposure to a plurality of cultures;
2.1.2 Re-appraisal of one's own culture in terms of other cultures;
2.1.3 Exposure to other cultures has a de-conditioning effect from bias and prejudice;
2.1.4 Enrich the pupil through intelligent and creative use of other cultural standpoints.

SECTION C

Syllabus design

The D.E.T. syllabus was replaced by the Interim Core Syllabus as the A.N.C. government took power. The Interim Core Syllabus, as the name suggests is an interim syllabus which will soon be replaced by Outcomes Based Education. As far as poetry is concerned the syllabus could be supportive in the following manner:
1. Poetry should not be an avoidable option.
2. Orality should be included as part of the poetry curriculum.
3. Orality in poetry will enrich and be enriched by the multi-classroom.
4. Poetry should be seen to co-exist in both oral and written forms and pupils should be shown how the oral and written forms complement and support each other.
5. Poetry should be emphasised as an eloquent and potent form of communication.

SECTION D

Prescribed poems

The following factors determine the nature and success of prescribed poems:
1. Syllabus design
2. Balanced selection
3. Relevance and interest
4. Accessible language
5. The composition of the multi-classroom.

1. Syllabus design

The syllabus should accord poetry a place of importance. Its position as an avoidable option in the D.E.T. syllabus did great harm to poetry learning/teaching among L2 black matriculants and L2 black pupils in general.
2. **Balanced selection**

The old language policy of Subtractive Bilingualism militated in favour of a predominantly Eurocentric selection of poems.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nov 1990 - June 1993</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>Eurocentric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov. 1993 - June 1996</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td>Eurocentric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov. 1996 - June 1999</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>Eurocentric</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(See Chapter 2 p. 83-86 for a detailed analysis.)

3. **Relevance and interest**

The research findings indicated that pupils found local, contemporary South African poems to be most relevant and interesting.

4. **Accessible language**

Once again the research findings indicated that pupils preferred poems written in simple, accessible English. Poems with simple diction and familiar, uncomplicated stanza patterns appealed to them as indicated in their choice of Best Liked Poem, Easiest Poem and Best Print and Layout.

5. **Poetry in the multi-classroom**

Future poetry selections should bear in mind the racial and cultural diversity of the region for which it is intended, together with the outcomes envisaged for the poetry curriculum. In KwaZulu-Natal for instance, the poetry selection should have an appeal and an enrichment value for all pupils making up the multi-classroom especially with a view to broadening their horizons without ignoring the local contributions and culture viz. that of Zulus, Indians and Europeans.

**SECTION E**

**Methodology**

This Section deals with three aspects

1. The Questionnaire and Methodology
2. The Research findings on Methodology
3. The Future Scenario

1. **The questionnaire and methodology**

A direct question on methodology was avoided in the pupil questionnaire because:

1.1 Teacher sensitivity to scrutiny was respected.
1.2 To avoid unfair comparisons that may arise from ignorance or malice.
1.3 To avoid disturbing the delicate pupil-teacher relationships at that time.

2. **Research findings on methodology**

The responses to questions 8C - 11.8 of the questionnaire provided insight into methodological practices. Pupil’s responses to the questions mentioned above were mature and critical and were completed within the limited time of one hour. As pupils were chosen at random and not for any specific ability, the uniformity with which they so admirably acquitted themselves can be largely attributed to the teaching methodology they experienced. A discerning and mature mentality was found in the pupil sample as a whole.

3. **The future scenario**

Outcomes Based Education is expected to strongly influence teaching methods in future. Poetry learning/teaching could help realise some of the following outcomes:

3.1 **Problem solving** as in riddles, limericks, haikus and the general interpretation of poetry.

3.2 **To interact effectively and acknowledge diversity.** Universality is a hallmark of highly rated poetry.

3.3 **To make choices for healthy and responsible living.** This has been a perennial theme of most poets.

3.4 **The ability to collect, organise and critically evaluate information.** A poem is an example of information collected, organised and critically evaluated in extremely condensed language.

3.5 **The ability to learn ways of more meaningful and effective communication.** Poets communicate through a diversity of styles, language usage and stanza patterns. The purpose of poetry is communication.

3.6 **The ability to use science and technology critically.** Poets have often made this outcome their theme. In fact, it is the forte of poets.

3.7 **The ability to understand the world and function as a global citizen.** Most poets regard themselves as global citizens. To talk of the universality of poets is almost a truism.

3.8 **The ability to act in a manner which reflects human dignity, justice and democratic values.** This outcome could be related to our own concept of *Ubuntu* and similar concepts found in other cultures.

**SECTION F**

**Assessment**

The examination is the best known and most entrenched form of assessment in South Africa. The introduction of Outcomes Based Education promises to change this and replace it with individual and continuous assessment.
1. The Research Questionnaire and Assessment

A direct question on assessment was avoided for the following reasons:

1.1 A question on assessment will have to be related to examinations as it is the best known form of assessment in South Africa.

1.2 Mention of the examination may influence pupil response to the questionnaire, treating it as a form of examination rather than an information gathering process.

1.3 Also pupils' attitudes to the examination could easily have been confused with their attitudes to poetry.

For these reasons a direct question on assessment was avoided.

2. Assessment in Outcomes Based Education and the Research Findings.

The research findings will be discussed in the following order in relation to assessment in Outcomes Based Education.

2.1 Language policy and multilingualism.
2.2 Multiculturalism.
2.3 Prescribed poems.
2.4 Methodology and syllabus design.

2.1 Language policy and multilingualism.

During the apartheid years the language versatility of L2 black matriculants and L2 black pupils in general was ignored. The language ability of pupils is one of the most important facets of prior knowledge that needs to be considered in individual and equitable assessment. That assessment prior to April 1994 was unfair is indicated in the percentages below:

- 86% of pupil sample - Zulu Main Home Language
- 65% of pupil sample - English Other Home Language
- 73% of pupil sample - English Other Language Used.

English was also chosen as Best Liked Subject. This should facilitate the teaching of English and English Poetry. It should also make it easier to include English translations of poems from other languages in the prescribed anthologies.

2.2 Multiculturalism

KwaZulu-Natal is culturally diverse, having an admixture of Indian, Zulu and European culture. This cultural diversity offers a great opportunity for poetry learning/teaching and poetry in turn offers a great opportunity for a real and rich cultural exchange. An equitable formula could be sought to represent the different cultures in prescribed anthologies if it is considered necessary by the communities involved.
2.3 Prescribed Poems

Fair assessment would mean that the prescribed poems should give pupils the highest chance of success, as well as provide the greatest enjoyment and incentive to learn poetry. The prescribed poems of the past did not take into account the L2 black matriculant’s background. The percentages below indicate one aspect of that neglect, in terms of the racial and cultural composition of the prescribed poems.

- Nov. 1990 - June 1993 - 85% Eurocentric
- Nov. 1993 - June 1996 - 95% Eurocentric

Linked to cultural alienation is the aspect of linguistic difficulty as most poems were selected from the sixteenth to the nineteenth century with a few twentieth century poems usually by famous English poets. These poems used archaic English and obscure references rather than simple style and diction, and accessible language which pupils indicated they preferred. Fair assessment would mean that the prescribed poems should reflect greater sensitivity to the needs of L2 black matriculants and L2 black pupils in general.

2.4 Syllabus design and methodology

Syllabus design strongly influences methodology. The D.E.T. syllabus is an example, being a product type syllabus, with the final examination as the final product. All effort was directed to the examination. Teachers taught for performance in the examination which led to the entrenchment of the transmission mode of teaching. All poetry reading was for examination purposes. The examination tested the pupils’ contextual and lexical knowledge of the poems, ignoring their personal response. However, Outcomes Based Education promises to change this scenario by offering teachers and pupils the following:

- 2.4.1 Freedom to adopt a poetry curriculum to suit local conditions.
- 2.4.2 Give the process of poetry engagement more importance.
- 2.4.3 Make assessment individual and continuous taking into account personal response and different learning rates.
- 2.4.4 Teachers would have the freedom to employ a number of different methods and assessment procedures to achieve the desired outcomes. This freedom and trust should give teachers greater confidence in themselves and facilitate their teaching.

SECTION G

Conclusion of Chapter 4

Although L2 black matriculants appeared to be handicapped by the past policy of subtractive
bilingualism, they displayed a positive attitude to English and English poetry. It was also evident that the past policies forced L2 black pupils generally to acquire a higher level of bilingualism in Zulu and English than is found in any other racial group in the province. This is a great advantage to L2 black pupils in general as Zulu and English are the major languages of KwaZulu-Natal.

Conclusion of dissertation

The L2 black matriculants' engagement with poetry during the apartheid era was subjected to the pull of both negative and positive influences.

1. The negative influences were:
   1.1 Subtractive bilingualism
   1.2 Inappropriate prescribed poems
   1.3 Lack of facilities and resources.

2. The positive influences were:
   2.1 The oral tradition
   2.2 Contemporary black poetry and literature concerned with the emancipation and empowerment of black people.

In the battle between the two forces for control of the L2 black matriculant's mind, the positive forces prevailed as the research findings in Chapter 3 indicate.

3. Therefore, the dissertation concludes that L2 black matriculants have:
   3.1 A positive attitude and discerning mentality to poetry.
   3.2 A penchant for local, contemporary poetry written in simple, accessible English.
   3.3 Creative energy and talent as is evident in the proliferation of black poets during the freedom struggle in South Africa. Many, if not all, of these poets were once L2 black pupils if not L2 black matriculants.
   3.4 A positive attitude to the future and to reconciliation.
SECTION D

DATA COLLECTION

Data for the dissertation was collected from three secondary schools in the peri-urban area of Durban in KwaZulu-Natal. At the time of the research, all three schools were exclusively black. The schools were chosen because they offered the poetry option and because of accessibility. Data was collected using the following procedures:

1. Structured interview for teachers.
2. Questionnaire for pupils. [See Appendix I for Pupil Questionnaire.]

1. Structured interview for teachers.

1.1 The structured interviews were used for collecting data from teachers in all three schools. The following questions constituted the core of the interview:

1.1.1 Is English compulsory?
1.1.2 Is English encouraged?
1.1.3 Is English the medium of learning?
1.1.4 Do you confirm the selection of poems in the questionnaire?

1.2 The structured interview was chosen because:

1.2.1 It ensured access to information required while the nature of the questions was such that teachers did not get the impression that they were being interrogated.
1.2.2 The general nature of the questions allowed the teachers sufficient room to ramble if so desired while ensuring that the researcher collected the data needed.
1.2.3 A completely unstructured interview may have necessitated a second visit to acquire information that could not have been obtained in the first because of the rambling and the time factor. Permission for a first visit from the principal during school hours proved difficult enough. In all probability a second visit would have proved even more difficult during 1993/4 because of the violence and unrest in the black townships at that time.

For these reasons the structured interviews albeit a loosely structured one, was chosen as the most appropriate means of collecting data from teachers.

2. Questionnaire for pupils

The pupil questionnaire as well as all the details surrounding the data collection and processing are discussed in detail in Chapter 3 p. 105-107 and 115-116.
SECTION E

IMPLICATIONS

The research findings and conclusions of the dissertation could have the following implications on poetry and literature learning/teaching and on education in general:

1. Research into any one genre, in this instance poetry, can be of use to literature learning/teaching in general. Research into the different genres in the changed and changing South Africa can be collated and common principles sought with a view to providing direction to the new venture in Outcomes Based Education.

2. Research into poetry learning/teaching among L2 black pupils should contribute to the general body of research and to knowledge about literature learning/teaching among L2 pupils in the multi-classroom in which L2 black pupils are the majority.

3. Although the research was not conducted in classrooms that were officially designated multilingual, the research findings revealed a high level of multilingualism among the pupil sample. This finding gives further empirical support to the Language in Education Policy as well as the multi-classroom, even though this was not the intention of the dissertation.

4. Any contribution to literature learning/teaching that could assist in making the multi-classroom a success in South Africa should be welcomed as it is a new venture in education, which requires the building of a resource pool for future use. The establishment of such a pool of research and knowledge may necessitate intensive and extensive research within what remains of racially and culturally exclusive communities in South Africa. This research attempts to provide insight into L2 black matriculants' attitudes to poetry. An understanding of L2 black pupils' attitudes to poetry should also prove useful material in multicultural milieux as pupils and teachers from other cultures may benefit and vice versa. The need for cultural interchange and understanding has particular significance in South Africa as schooling was determined by one's racial, ethnic and even linguistic classification. These barriers are still somewhat intact and their removal should provide understanding of other people's cultures rather than leave a vacuum of ignorance that could be easily filled with new prejudices. Research into attitudes of pupils from different racial, ethnic, cultural and linguistic backgrounds can provide knowledge and understanding that will fill the void created by the removal of the old racially oriented system of education.

5. Even though it was not the aim of this dissertation, it inadvertently provides an historical record of educational practices during an important period in South African history and also in the evolution of L2 methodology in poetry and literature generally.

6. The Truth and Reconciliation Commission claim that to know what happened in the past
helps to create an atmosphere conducive to a better future. This also holds good in education, albeit in a less spectacular and sensational manner. The educational practices of the recent past, particularly of poetry teaching to L2 black matriculants and their reactions could well be forgotten in the euphoria of change. The result may be the loss of the valuable lesson of experience which is necessary to usher in more enlightened educational and classroom practices.
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1. LITERARY BACKGROUND

This chapter briefly traces the literary background of black South Africans, particularly poetry, from pre-colonial times to the present. This selective survey endeavours to provide the backdrop necessary to appreciate the subsequent critique of the syllabi, classroom methodology and prescribed poems in chapter 2; and an understanding of the research findings and conclusions in chapters 3 and 4. To this end the survey uses the commonly accepted divisions of literary history as a basis for discussion viz.:

SECTION A
Pre-Colonial Literature - The Period of Oral Literacy

SECTION B
Literature of Transition - Influence of Oral and Written Literature on one another

SECTION C
Literature of the Struggle - The Appropriation of Writing and Techniques of Oral Poetry in the Cause of Political emancipation

SECTION D
Future Literature - Speculations on new trends in Literature

SECTION E
- Conclusion of Chapter 1

1.1 The discussions in this chapter are guided by:

1.1.1 Important literary developments not just historical chronology in all the periods mentioned.

1.1.2 Similarities and differences between European and African culture with regard to the pre-colonial period and subsequent changes brought about by mutual influence.

1.1.3 The influence of missionaries, especially in respect of Christianity and literacy during transition.

1.1.4 Political, social and economic oppression of Apartheid as reflected in poetry during the struggle.

1.1.5 Alienation suffered by blacks, a rural people, through urbanization and industrialization is also dealt with in the Period of Struggle.

1.1.6 The role of literature in the future as a force for freedom and a voice of all the different racial and linguistic groups in South Africa.
SECTION A
PRE-COLONIAL LITERATURE - THE PERIOD OF ORAL LITERACY

1. Pre-colonial literature is dealt with in greater detail than the literature of subsequent periods:

1.1 Firstly because oral literature of the pre-colonial period and its relation to the literary development of black people is less understood than the other periods. The main reason being that White colonial rule in South Africa from 1652 until the collapse of Apartheid in 1994 did not accord oral literature the status it deserved. Oral literature was not recognized as a valid literary expression that was still alive and deserving of serious attention.

1.2 Oral literature has survived from pre-colonial times until today. The traditional poetic forms such as *izibongo* (praise poetry) *izithakazelo* (clan praises), *izaga* (proverbs), *imitolozelo* (lullabies) and *amaculo* (generic term for songs) have survived from ancient times into the present. The poetic forms have displayed versatility and resilience, adapting to European influence and an urban industrial society.

1.3 It is the most abiding influence in the literary repertoire of black people in South Africa.

1.4 The oral tradition, of which oral literature is a part, embodies the collective wisdom of the indigenous black people in matters such as law, medicine, philosophy and astrology.

1.5 To show that a complex form of literature, predominantly poetry, existed. Comparisons with English poetry will be made to show that even by Eurocentric standards, traditional African poetry was acknowledged as poetry worthy of either emulation, imitation or adaptation. Many white South African poets, for example, Pringle, Carey Slater, Guy Butler and Jeff Opland, perceived the indigenous poetic modes as the most authentic form of expressing the African ethos.

1.6 Lastly to emphasize the importance of poetry in traditional society by showing how poetry permeated every facet of life in traditional society. That blacks in traditional society encountered poetry from the cradle (*imitolozelo*), to the resurrection (*izihayo*), poetry formed part of social interaction as a polite form of address (*izithakazelo*) as well as a yardstick of wisdom (*izaga*). These are mentioned and discussed so as to emphasize the point that in pre-colonial times poetry formed part of the daily communication channels. Though some of these poetic forms may not have been transposed into English they have nevertheless influenced the tone and idiom of black poets/writers.

In order to consolidate this argument a discussion of oral literature is necessary with particular
focus on poetry. However oral literature in South Africa includes a number of black language literatures viz. Zulu, Xhosa, Sotho and Swati being the major ones.

The scope of this dissertation does not allow itself a detailed discussion of the oral literature of each of South Africa's main black languages. However, a brief discussion of one major oral literature is necessary to understand African poetic terminology that will occur in the ensuing discussion and subsequent chapters.

2. Zulu oral literature was chosen to serve as the paradigm of black literature in South Africa for the following reasons:

2.1 The research was conducted in KwaZulu-Natal which is predominantly Zulu speaking.

2.2 Zulus are the largest black ethnic group in South Africa. Classified as Nguni people (with the Xhosa and the Swazis within South Africa) they outnumber all other ethnic and racial groups.

2.3 The Zulus were the last of the black people to accept the use of English as a necessary language; therefore Zulu oral literature should be least affected - in terms of linguistic and cultural interference from a foreign language and culture.

2.4 Also the Zulus were the last to succumb to Christian missionary influence which means that many of the religious beliefs and other customs embodied in the oral tradition would be closest to the pristine practices of the Nguni.

2.5 The Zulu poetic tradition has been preserved and fostered by the intellectual elite of the Zulu people.

2.6 The Zulu oral tradition is still alive, practised by the educated and uneducated alike. Praise poems to honour the king and chiefs, wedding songs, war and work chants, lullabies and dance songs, as well as Christian hymns adapted to oral traditional chants still form part of the Zulu repertoire of communication. This phenomenon is, however, not unique to Zulus but is also found in other ethnic groups.

3. Canonici (1993:1) divides Zulu oral literature into the following main categories:

**POETRY:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Code</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Praise Poetry</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clan praises</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proverbs</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lullabies</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Songs</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Izibongo
- Izithakazelo
- Izaga
- Imilolozelo
- Amaculo

27
4. Poetry and the Oral Tradition

Only poetry will be elaborated upon as it is the subject of concern. Firstly the function of poetry will be discussed. Poetry was a very important means of communication in traditional Zulu society. It still is even today, albeit to a lesser degree. The traditional Zulu did not have to search for the relevance of poetry, it formed part of the routine of daily life. Unlike written poetry it was not restricted to the literate and intellectual elite, those privileged enough to unravel the subtleties of the written word. Everybody was a poet in traditional African society. However, there were professional poets called the *imbongi* among the Zulus, and Xhosa (or the Nguni people).

The *imbongi* rendered poetic narrations at the courts of Nguni kings. However, the *imbongi* was independent of the court and was free to comment critically on social events and current affairs. The *imbongi* used poetic techniques like simile, metaphor, parallelism, repetition and striking imagery to construct praises of the king (*izibongo* zamakhosi). On close scrutiny the praises reveal that the *imbongis* were shrewd judges of character and the praises often contained both virtues and vices. The vices, however, were perceived only by the more discerning listeners, as today they can be found only by reading 'between the lines'. To achieve this the *imbongi* used elevated language to infuse certain chosen events with power. To ensure everyone understood, references were made to actual places and events so that the *imbongi* could achieve his ultimate purpose, viz. social upliftment.

Ordinary people also composed poetry, mothers composed lullabies, fathers, work chants. Children composed dance songs, and the youth verses for a loved one. A closer look at the different types of poetry should place them more securely within the social contexts in which they functioned.

5. Izibongo - Praise Poems

*Izibongo* are praise poems. They could be composed by individuals in praise of themselves or others. The oddness of self-praising is resolved when one examines the content of 'self-praise'. It is not an attempt to elevate oneself but rather to make a declaration to society that society's expectations of one have been endorsed by that particular individual and his descendants for generations to come. The "I" is really the royal 'we'. It is used to make a more forceful
presentation to society of one's accomplishments or of society's expectations of one. The poem usually has its beginning in just one praise name which may be expanded into a few lines of poetry. This praise name or poem becomes permanently associated with a person and it becomes a means of contacting the person after death, when the person has joined the ancestors or amadlozi.

Praise poems about important persons, however, are usually composed by a professional poet, or the imboni or seroki (in Sotho). The praises in honour of important persons like kings and chiefs are called izibongo zamakhosi. These praises constitute the major portion of Zulu oral literature as they are longer and more intricate than the praises of ordinary people. As the praises deal with important people the verses contain references to important historical events with which the person may have been involved. Much has been learnt of the characters of Shaka, Dingane, and other Zulu kings from their praises. The praise-poem or panegyric is the most highly developed genre of Zulu oral literature. Izibongo are still being composed today in Zulu, Xhosa, Sotho and English. The following stanzas of a praise poem in English by Bogani Sithole in honour of Nelson Mandela are taken from Opland (1992:305):

Alas, Dalibunga, you're a chief to be nurtured,
Alas, Dalibunga, you're a chief to be guarded,
You surprised me, tall son of Mandela,
You surprised me, lash that whipped certain nations:
In consultations with whites overseas
You terrified whites who never talk to blacks.
I say to you, old man,
I say to you, Madiba of Zondwa,
I've spoken, I'll not speak again,
I say to you be strong, Dalibunga,
Be strong, Madiba, our ancestors watch you.

6. Izithakazelo - Clan Praises

Clan praises are either just one praise name or a number of praises or praise names belonging to the lineage or ancestors from which the person descends. Mzolo (1988:133-137) lists five important functions of clan praises:

6.1 As a polite form of address which is the most common function. The clan name is used when greeting or acknowledging a greeting.

6.2 As an expression of appreciation or congratulation.
6.3 As a cohesive force for the clan.
6.4 For consoling, comforting or coaxing a child or baby.
6.5 In marriage negotiations.

6.5.1 **Some examples of Izithakazelo:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Izibongo</th>
<th>Izithakazelo</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zulu</td>
<td>Ndabezitha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hadebe</td>
<td>Mthimkhulu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zondi</td>
<td>Nondaba</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khumalo</td>
<td>Mnguni</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7 **Izaga - Proverbs**

The meaning of the word proverb is the same in English as in Zulu. Finnegan (1970:393):

>A proverb is a saying in more or less fixed form, marked by shortness, sense and salt and distinguished by the popular acceptance of the truth tersely expressed in it.

The wisdom expressed in proverbs is based on observation and experience and constitute the collective wisdom of the people. In traditional Zulu society the number of proverbs a person could appropriately use was an indication of how knowledgeable and cultured the person was.

In Zulu proverbs are expressed using a poetic form while idioms use prose, whereas in English both proverbs and idioms usually employ prose. The poetic form used in Zulu to express proverbs employs a number of literary devices used in traditional Zulu poetry. The literary devices are employed with a specific purpose as the examples from Nyembezi (1990:19-199) illustrate:

7.1 **ELISION** - achieve terseness. This is done by elision of the initial or final vowel.

**7.1.1 Initial Elision**

\[ Akulahlwa mbeleko ngakufelwa \]

\[(Akulahlwa imbeleko ngakufelwa) - without elision.\]

**English translation:** One should not be put off by failure.

**Equivalent proverb:** Perseverance is the mother of success.

7.1.2 **Final Elision**

\[ Umthent' uhlab' usamila. \]

Without elision the above proverb would read:

\[ UMthente uhlabe usamila. \]
English translation: The umthente grass pricks even while still young, meaning that things troublesome give early signs which should be acted upon.

Equivalent English proverb: A stitch in time saves nine.

NB: Only the Zulu proverb and not the English translation and equivalent proverb is taken from Nyembezi

7.2 PARALLELISM: This device brings into juxtaposition events which create a mutual contrast that illustrates a point in a vivid or memorable way.

Uchakide uhlolile
imamba yalukile

English translation: The weasel is relaxing, the mamba is moving about.

English equivalent: When the cat is away the mice will play.

7.3 COMPARISON (SIMILE & METAPHOR): To facilitate understanding by relating existing knowledge in an illustrative way.

Simile: Udl' usulelaphansi njengenkukhu

English translation: You eat wiping your mouth on the floor like a fowl.

Metaphor: Akukho nkwal' ephandel' enye.

English translation: No partridge scratches for another.

English equivalent: Each man for himself and God for all.

7.4 ALLITERATION: to assist memorization by creating rhythm through the repetition of a particular sound/s.

Umlungis' uzithel' isisila.

English translation: The one who puts things right brings ill-luck upon himself.

English equivalent: It is best to mind one's own business.

8 Amaculo - Songs

Amaculo broadly refers to songs. However, it is songs that Western Europeans would regard as conforming to their standards of musical notation. Izihlabelelo, which also refers to songs generally, refers to the less restrained forms of singing usually associated with children. Therefore the song of a bird, which is regarded as an accomplished singer, is called amaculo, while that of a child is hlabelelo. However, both words are used as commonly interchangeable synonyms when no fine distinctions are intended. In the Nguni languages poetry and song are inseparable, and manner of rendition determined what was poetry and what was song. This tradition of poet/singer has persisted into modern times. A famous contemporary singer/poet is
Mzwakhe Mbili.

In order to understand the complexity of the Nguni system of song and poetry and its place and function in society, songs will be divided into four major groups, viz:

8.1 **Inkondlo** - poetry generally
8.2 **Amahubo** - hymns/anthems
8.3 **Ingoma** - rhythmic chants with a more secular pace and tone than amahubo
8.4 **Izihayo** - chants to ancestral spirits

**8.1 INKONDLO**

_Inkondlo_ broadly refers to poetry, which, as stated earlier, is also song. There are many different types of _inkondlo_ for appropriate occasions. Below are two of the more popularly known types:

8.1.1 **Inkondlo zothando** - love poetry
8.1.2 **Inkondlo yesililo** - a lamentation

**8.1.1 Inkondlo zothando - Love songs**

These love songs are composed and sung by teenagers either male or female. It would not be considered fitting for married or older people to compose and sing such songs. Below is a love song usually sung by young girls when fetching water:

_Kwakukhona Insizwa_

_Kwakukhon’Insizwa_  
eayinge she la mina!  
Kwenzenjani? We madoda!

_Mina ngiyasaba_  
_Ukukhuluma nalenziwa!_  

There was a young man who wanted to fall in love with me!  
What has happened? (Why am I so frightened that he might talk to me?)  
As for me, I am frightened to talk to the young man!  
Weinberg (1984:124)

It was considered desirable in traditional Zulu society that a girl should be coy rather than forthright in matters amorous. This attitude has changed with the influence of European culture, urbanization and the emancipation of woman. A poem by Mandela Z. (1989:57)

_I waited for you last night_ exemplifies this liberation:

I waited for you last night  
I lay there in my bed  
like a plucked rose
its falling petals my tears.

8.1.2 Izinkondlo zesililo - Elegiac songs

These are sad songs (poems) with a mournful tone expressing sorrow or loss, especially loss through death.

Zulu and English have influenced each other noticeably in this sub-genre. Ntuli (1984:45) mentions the influence of Gray's *Elegy Written in a Country Churchyard* in Vilakazi's *Unokufa* (Death):

NawoGray abake bakubona
Behleli ngasemathempeleni ...

Eng. Tr.: Even Gray who saw you
When he was sitting near the temple

And Slater (1910:73) tried to capture some of the doleful sounds of izinkondlo zesililo (common to both Zulu and Xhosa) in his poem *A Xhosa Lament for Wetu their Cow.*

The mournful refrain in Xhosa:
"Siyalila, siyalila, inkomo yetu ifile",
gives this English poem an authentic African ring.

A more contemporary elegy is that of Mattera (1970:501) appropriately entitled *Lament.* In this poem Mattera uses repetition of "I weep" in a number of opening lines to create a mood of sadness and to establish a rhythmic pattern associated with traditional lamentations. Chapman and Dangor (1982:12) trace Oswald Mtshali's *Weep Not for a Warrior* to the traditional Sotho *Lament for a Warrior*.

8.2 AMAHUBO - HYMNS/ ANTHEMS

Amahubo and ingoma both refer to songs. The amahubo are songs (poems) of a more solemn, ceremonious, religious or spiritual nature. It is this solemnity of the traditional amahubo that provided the Christian missionaries with the ideal verse form for Zulu/Xhosa hymns; and ihubo (sing. form of amahubo) is now used as a synonym for a hymn or psalm. However, the difference between amahubo and ingoma is a subtle difference determined by the pace and tone of the reciter/singer and the social context and occasion of the recital. An ingoma could easily become amahubo and vice versa if the pace, tone, context and occasion changed from a secular context and lively rhythm, pace and tone to that of a more solemn and exalted one.

There are many different types of amahubo besides hymns and psalms. There are also war songs and national anthems. Below is perhaps the most famous ihubo lesizwe (national anthem)
in Africa, Sontonga and Mqhayi's *Nkosi sikelel' iAfrika*:

**GOD BLESS AFRICA**

Lord, Bless Africa
Let its name be praised
(May her horn rise high up)
Listen also to our pleas.
Lord Bless
Us thy children
Come spirit
(Come spirit and bless us)
Come spirit
Come spirit, holy spirit
And bless us, us thy children.

**NKOSI SIK~LEL'I AFRIKA**

_Nkosi sikelel' iAfrika_
_Maluphakamis' uphondo Lwayo_
_Yizwa imithandazo yethu,_
_Usisikelele usisikelele._
**Nkosi sikelel' iAfrika**
**Maluphakamis' uphondo Lwayo**

_Yizwa imithandazo yethu,_
_Nkosi sikelela, thina husapho Lwayo._

**Chorus:**  
Woza Moya (woza, woza)
Woza Moya oyingcwele
_Nkosi sikelela,_
_Thina husapho Lwayo._

**8.3 INGOMA - CHANTS**

*Ingoma* broadly translated refers to songs, however, it is a specific type of song with a chanting rhythm that is purposeful in nature. The purpose of the *ingoma* is to provide inspiration, camaraderie or assurance, either to the singers or the listeners. It is usually sung at the inauguration of a King or Chief, or as inspiration to workers or warriors to finish the task. The most common form of the *ingoma* encountered today is called *izingoma zomsebenzi* or rhythmic work chants that accompany the lifting of heavy objects, or in stick fighting practice, or gum-boot dancing. The *iziqubulo*, a popular synonym for *izingoma zomsebenzi*, is usually made up of a few lines, the effectiveness of which is felt in rhythmic repetition. Below is an example of a popular work chant.

*We Try to Lift it* (translated from Zulu by Vilakazi B.W. in Opland (1992:89), a popular gang-song in South Africa sung strophically, goes:

A  We try to lift it
B  In vain
C  Then pour water
They sing in this way when the load is heavy and will not shake from the ground. But when the gang has the load on their shoulders and are walking away with it, there is a significant change in the strophe:

A Europeans?
B They're swines!

And away they go.

8.4 ISIHAYO - CHANTS TO ANCESTRAL SPIRITS

These chants invoke the spirits of the ancestors and were known to both young and old alike as the Lord's Prayer would be in a predominantly Christian community. As it is so deep-rooted in the African psyche it has still been retained in the ceremony of unveiling of the tombstone. Below is a famous isihayo:

Khuphuka 'dhloz'!
Khuphuka 'dhloz' ehlile emadhloz'
(imi)!
Khuphuka 'dhloz' elingu Baba,
Khuphuka 'dhloz' elang'zakayo.

Rise up spirit!
Rise up good spirit from the other spirits!
Rise up spirit which is of my father,
Rise up spirit that brought me into this world.

(Weinberg 1984:136)

A modern adaptation of isihayo is found in Ngema et al. (1990:79) Woza Albert. The introduction of Christ as Morena is an adaptation that serves the purpose, among other purposes, of making the message accessible and acceptable to an audience that is now predominantly Christian:

MBONGENI (spins with joy): Woza Lilian! - hey Lilian, uya mbona uMorena? Uvuswe uMorena. (Come Lilian - hey Lilian, do you see Morena? It's Morena who raises you.)

They dance on.

BOTH (singing): Yamemeza inkosi yethu
Hathi ma thambo hlanganani
Oyawa vusa umagwane umnyama
Wathi kawo
(Our Lord is calling.
He's calling for the bones of the dead to join together.
He's raising up the black heroes.
He calls to them.

MBONGENI: Steve Biko! The hero of our children! Please Morena - Please raise him!
9 Imiloloze - Children's Songs Or Songs Of Comfort

The *imiloloze* are songs sung by mothers, grandmothers and other adult members of the family to comfort the very young. It is not uncommon for a girl of nine years to sing an *imiloloze* to her baby sister or two year old brother. This genre employs a number of poetic devices like repetition, rhythm, alliteration and onomatopoeia. All these lullabies and songs of comfort are informative or instructive and are not just sound effects common to the English limerick. Sepamla (1982:126) uses the *imiloloze* technique in a *Song of Mother and Child*, placing the African mother in a modern, urban setting. Below is a traditional *imiloloze*:

**Umntwana**

*Infant child, mother went to buy.*

**Umntwana, uMamuyothenga,**

*She went to buy corn for a shilling.*

**Uyotheng'umabele kashelen'**

*Corn for grinding.*

**Amabel' okugaya,**

*Ground corn for you!*

**Umcaba (na) wakho!**

*Too - oo - oo - oo oo!*

(Weinberg 1984:4)

10 Common Characteristics Of Black Ethnic Oral Literatures

The discussion of one major black language literature is regarded as being generally representative of the general characteristics of most of the different black ethnic oral literatures. Therefore the most important common characteristics of the Zulu, Xhosa, Sotho and Khoisan oral literatures will be briefly discussed and reinforced with appropriate examples from the four oral literatures mentioned. The choice of the example is determined by which oral ethnic literature best exemplifies that characteristic. This approach is based on the rationale that the different oral literatures have common features that have developed from an interchange of ideas. Dating to pre-colonial times. Kunene (1976:25-26) corroborates this:

Having pointed out the existence of literary types according to various nation-groups it must be pointed out that fundamentally, the South African oral literatures bear some significant common characteristics. Sometimes literary works are merely translated from one language group to another. This is particularly true of nursery rhymes, stories and story-poems, satires, and occasionally the literary structure of a particular heroic or epic poem, for example, the echoes from the poem on Emperor Shaka of the Zulus in the epic poem on King Sobhuza I of the Swazis.
Nyembezi (1990:1) writes:

Some of the proverbs found in Zulu are found common to many Bantu languages, such as the proverbs about baboons and their foreheads. Such proverbs seem to suggest that they were in existence before the Bantu people divided into groups, and followed various ways.

The uncommon features of the different ethnic literatures must also be further blurred, in modern times, by close interaction in South Africa's cities and towns, in townships and hostels, the workplace and educational institutions. This relatively recent emergence and adaptation of different local and foreign traditions shaped by the urgency of political necessity, led to the emergence of what has been variously called 'township literature, protest literature or Soweto literature'. This phenomenon will, however, be discussed later in more detail. Its mention at this stage is merely to reinforce the point that the interchange of ideas and mutual influence of one people by another, is an inevitable consequence of human interaction.

However, the emergence of new literary paradigms in South Africa as a result of a coalescing of influences, both European and African, does not cancel the effect and influence of the indigenous oral literatures. The oral literatures unconsciously or consciously have exercised a stronger influence on modern black poets and writers than literary critics have acknowledged. Even though the black poets have chosen English as the language in which to articulate their sentiments, their inspiration is largely derived from the oral tradition of South Africa. Mbuli, famous for his 'call to action' poetry, is such a poet, who writes in English but derives inspiration from the oral tradition. He expressed the following sentiments to Khumalo (1994:18-19) of Pace magazine:

As a boy I used to accompany my father to the hostels to settle disputes among the faction fighters from Msinga, Kwa-Zulu. These occasions would be graced by the imbongis (praise-singers). I suppose all the praise-singing stuck in the back of my mind and now it's surfacing to shape up my poetry.

Mbuli is the prototype of the modern black poet in South Africa, poets whose roots are African but who have chosen English as the medium of articulation. The English language, inherited from the colonial past, has been the unifying catalyst in the turbulence of an emerging new national literature in South Africa. Though written in English, black poetry often reflects the ethnic origin of the poet in its content, style and ethos. Oswald Mtshali's poetry is built on Zulu imagery. Mongane Serote reflects African images, not specifically Sotho, while Mazizi Kunene again is unmistakably Zulu in his poetry. Don Mattera, on the other hand, traces his inspiration to Khoisan influence. Nevertheless, even though these poets reflect their ethnic...
origins in their poetry, they are not perceived as promoting ethnicity or divisiveness by black people. This statement is made on the strength of the popularity of modern black poets among students and workers, especially at political rallies and other gatherings at which these modern poets perform before live audiences in the true imbongi tradition.

The acceptance of the influence and inspiration provided by oral literature runs deeper than just the 'freedom struggle'. It lives in the black languages which are still predominantly the L1 of most black people. (Peirce 1990:7):

In a population of 30 million only 5 million people speak one of the two official languages of English and Afrikaans. The majority of the people, black South Africans, speak one, and frequently more than one, of a number of languages such as Sotho, Zulu and Xhosa.

Embedded in the black languages, in the idiom and subtle figurative expressions are the myths, poems and folktales which is the essence of African oral literature. The oral literature comes alive in the black communities weddings, prayer meetings, funeral services and the praises of traditional leaders. Even the solemnity of graduation ceremonies at South Africa's educational institutions are often punctuated by spontaneous outbursts of izithakazelo, and ululations when a close relative or member of the same clan graduates. Even the important members of educational institutions have praises composed in their honour. One such occasion is described by Cope (1986:158).

Finally I would like to present a praise poem papyrally prepared for oral delivery at a later date. To be explicit, it was composed by Mr E.S. Mathabela when he was headmaster at Menzi High School at Ntokozweni, Umlazi, to be delivered on the occasion of the visit to the school by the KwaZulu Minister of Education and Culture, Mr J.A.W. Nxumalo.

Cope (1986:158) goes on to add:

However, the composition represents a high degree of elaboration of the traditional formulas: because of the benefit of literacy, the composer was able to develop, perfect and polish his product before delivery.

These remarks by Cope corroborate that oral literature is alive and its continued existence is assured by its partial adaptation to and benefit from the advent of literacy. But more important it points to the continuance and place of oral literature in the African community. And the position it must occupy in the minds of impressionable pupils at school, especially if the oral composition is delivered by the school principal, on the occasion of a visit by the Minister of Education. It would be worthwhile exploring what gives oral literature its appeal and vitality to black South Africans, apart from cultural continuity; and to isolate general characteristics of
oral literature that could be used to facilitate poetry teaching generally; and to provide some basis for a more relevant selection of literary works.

**SOME OF THE MORE IMPORTANT GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF ORAL LITERATURE ARE:**

10.1 Oral literature embodies the philosophy or world-view.
10.2 It is community based and supportive of authority structures.
10.3 Oral literature is designed for the orally-literate.
10.4 It is contemporary by nature and purpose.
10.5 It is adaptable and flexible.

Each of these will be discussed in detail.

**10.1 EMBODIES THE PHILOSOPHY OR WORLD-VIEW**

The oral literature of a nation embodies its philosophy of life. The world-view of the Nguni, Sotho and Khoisan, and of the people of Africa generally, is based on the belief that the Supreme Being is all pervasive in creation. The earth, water, the heavenly bodies, plants, animals and human beings form an organic whole or unity that is regulated and enlivened by God. Traditional oral literature tended to avoid speculation on the nature of God by placing God and creation in an inaccessible antiquity. The only fact within memory is the divine origin of man. The following Zulu folktale translated by Canonici (1993:1) illustrates this cosmology using the analogy of the divine reed:

1. **THE CREATOR**

   The ancients say that Nkulunkulu is God (the One Who Came First) because they say he appeared first; they say he is the people's Reed from which the people broke off. The ancients say that God exists: he made the first people, the ancients of olden times. Those ancients died and there remained other people generated by them, their children, from whom we heard that there were ancient people of olden times who knew about the breaking off of the world (from the Reed). However, even they did not know God; they had not seen him with their own eyes; they had heard that God existed and had appeared when people broke off from the reed bed. He generated the people of old, and they generated others. It is our ancestors who have told us the stories about God and about the old days. Today's people pray to the ancestral spirits; they praise them that they may come and save them.
Man's divine origin places a special obligation on him. Possessed of free will man is capable, unlike the rest of creation, of causing disharmony. Animals are bound by instinct and plants and minerals by their organic nature, but man has no such limitations. Disharmony is brought about by wanton killing and destruction. Particularly precious is human life. Man's relationship to man is emphasized, especially recognition of the right of another to life, property and freedom. The taking of human life affects the family, the clan, tribe and the nation, all of which are extremely dear to the traditional African. The whole is greater than its parts, the individual subsumes himself to the family, clan, tribe and nation. The family, not the individual is regarded as the smallest unit of society. Hence the killing of a person is in effect an assault on society and the consciousness of the collective good, of mutual support and interdependence. The traditional African did not question this world-view but accepted it as a way of life. This way of life called ubuntu in Nguni and botho in Sotho is rendered as African humanism by Mphahlele (1984:10):

African humanism is not a philosophical contention that has been argued. It has never been a subject of analysis, but we have ample evidence of it as a way of life. The African lives it and does not stand outside it to contemplate the process. It is deeply embedded in our proverbs and aphorisms and oral poetry, and in the way our elders spoke to us, and their children passed on the wisdom.

10.2 COMMUNITY BASED - SUPPORTIVE OF SOCIAL HIERARCHY AND AUTHORITY

The philosophical basis of African oral literature is obviously biased in favour of society's hierarchical and authority structures. The very tradition of oral literature itself is based on authority viz. that of God, the ancestors, the elders of the clan and family. However, the tone of oral literature is not overtly didactic. It is made to appear as if it were a natural device to actively promote the growth, health and continuance of the family, clan, tribe and nation. It teaches without being coldly authoritarian what is acceptable in traditional society. The individual is expected to conform. The praise or condemnation of an individual is praise or condemnation of the family, as the individual is not as significant as the family. The following extract from a San poem shows how the individual is always made to feel part of a family, and how the continuity from son, father, and grandfather to ancestor is emphasized. The ability of the ancestor to determine one's physical and material survival is also obvious in this rain-making ritual.
My great grandfather's name was 'lbuiy-|kütən; father called on him, when he wanted rain to fall; although he was no longer with us, yet father used to beg him for rain. For father believed that, being a rain medicine man; he would hear father when he called.

Bleek & Lloyd (1933:382)

The importance of rain to survival need not be stressed. The power wielded by one who could be on such intimate terms with the unseen powers as to make it rain can only be imagined in a society at the mercy of the elements.

10.3 DESIGNED FOR THE ORALLY LITERATE

Designed for an orally literate population, oral literature by definition is rooted in and intended for a society that appreciates and values oral literacy. However, today the clear divisions of oral and written are becoming blurred. With the advent of colonization those parts of the world in which oral literature flourished without interference from the written have vanished. Notable examples being parts of Africa, India, the Arctic regions (Eskimos) and the Polynesian Islands. Finnegan (1978:2) writes:

But nowadays of course the 'pure' and 'primitive' model of non-literate peoples so beloved of the romantics is becoming less and less in accord with the reality. Most oral poetry this century (and in some places earlier too) is likely to be produced by people who have at least some contact, however indirect, with the wider world in general - and with writing and its products in particular.

In South Africa literature is a means of cultural continuity, a mirror into the pre-colonial past. To the orally literate it represents among other things a form of literary expression with which they can identify and participate. This unbroken tradition provides the researcher with a view to the nature and purpose of oral literature. Fundamentally it was a device of preserving knowledge of whatever kind, apart from serving such purposes as entertainment and inspiration. It has to be borne in mind that memory was the repository of oral literature,
therefore orally literate societies developed dramatic and diverse ways of remembering. Among them being repetition, rhythm, variations of pitch and tone (members of literate societies are often shocked at the forcefulness and loudness of oral renditions), and appropriate gesticulations, which once again appear to be unnecessarily forceful to members from a literate society. However, the combination of voice and action provides for the orally literate what the imagination provides for a person only familiar with the silence of the written word. Orally literate societies realized, perhaps of necessity, that the human voice is nature's most perfect instrument of sound and used it to the fullest together with gesticulation. Therefore oral literature depends on live performance for its life and beauty; when rendered in writing it is often disfigured and appears childish, simplistic, overly brief and even insipid and monotonous. It is not uncommon for a poem or a chant to be made up of just one or two words. The following two line poem is a Pedi lullaby which achieves its soporific effect by repetition and rhythmic movements of the mother or grandmother who has the child strapped to her back.

The song and movements are repeated to the clapping of hands:

Child, be still, your mother's coming
Be still, Child of my child.

Opland (1992:39)

The poem is obviously meant to be appreciated in action. Oral literature does not conform to the aesthetic and intellectual expectations of written poetry; which is elitist when compared to the popular nature of oral literature. Most people in orally literate societies would be acquainted with the songs, poems and folktales, albeit a slightly different version from place to place.

10.4 CONTEMPORARY BY NATURE AND PURPOSE

Oral literature is by definition and practice always contemporary. The poet updates and improvises on the past, but the performance points to the present. To achieve its location in the present, the poet uses commonly known concrete images, refers to actual current events and uses simple, understandable idiom. The oral poet aims to be understood by all, the wise and the foolish, young and old, male and female. An example of the spontaneous and immediate nature of oral poetry is demonstrated by a little poem composed by the imbongi of King Zwelithini who accompanied him on his flight to Cape Town to meet the then President P.W. Botha. The poem and translation is taken from Canonici (1993:11):

(River of Ndaba* flowing on the head
of Matanzima, in the Cape Colony.
All the Xhosas scratch their bald heads,
Saying, "What is it that is raining, brother?"
But it is Mageba flowing on them.)

[River of Ndaba is the urine of the king, Ndaba and Mageba are the izithakazelo or clan name of the Zulu royal family.]

10.5 ADAPTABLE AND FLEXIBLE

Oral poetry is flexible and can be adapted to almost any time or occasion. One of the great strengths of oral poetry is the resilience with which it has emerged in the modern world. Contrary to popular beliefs oral poetry is not a phenomenon of the past; it is alive and vibrant even today. Praise-poets or imbongis are still composing poems about contemporary leaders like Nelson Mandela and King Zwelithini. However, oral poetry of a more prosaic nature is also found as this Tswana poem about a bicycle from Opland (1992:177):

My frail little bicycle,
The one with the scar,* my sister Seabelo,
Horse of the Europeans, feet of tyre,
Iron horse, swayer from side to side.

*tool bag = scar

The bicycle has become one of the commonest means of transport among rural Africans. Here the poet adapts pastoral imagery to what is a relatively modern invention. The power and rhythm of the poem is better appreciated in the original, however, the translation serves to illustrate the point that oral poetry is extremely flexible and adaptable.

6.6 COMMUNAL AND CUMULATIVE ACHIEVEMENT

Oral poetry is not an individualistic achievement but a communal achievement. Being the cumulative effort of successive generations that have added to and modified the original poem or folktale. Every generation adapts the poems to its needs by adding, removing and embellishing as the occasion demands. In traditional African societies language and poetry is regarded as the common property of the people. Ngcongwane (1975:1) comments on this phenomenon:

in the absence of written language, everybody becomes a bit of a poet himself.
Nothing is absolutely fixed, and everybody is free to add new lines to known songs and poems to suit his own circumstances.
 SECTION B

THE TRANSITION PERIOD

1. Historical Background

The transition period began with the meeting between black and white. When the first meeting took place will always be a matter of conjecture. Shipwrecks are however thought to have been responsible for those first meetings; and the fear, excitement and trauma of those imagined first meetings led to the development of a new literary archetype - the European (white) bearer of culture and civilization and the people of colour who received that culture and civilization. This consciously or unconsciously defined the white and black relationship as that of master and slave during the colonial era.

In South Africa the first permanent contact between the whites and the blacks took place in stages. As different white settlements were established they came into contact with different black ethnic groups. The scenario of expansion in terms of first permanent white settlements followed this pattern:

1.1 Khoisan - 1652 Jan Van Riebeeck's settlement at Cape.
1.2 Xhosa - 1815 First British occupation of Cape.
1.3 Zulu - 1824 F. Farewell and F. Fynn settled at Port Natal.
1.4 Sotho - 1833 Paris Evangelical Missionary Society settled in Lesotho.

1.1 The Khoisan did not pose a major threat to white settlement.

1.2 The first substantial resistance came from the Xhosa. Many Frontier Wars were fought by the Xhosas and white settlers over land and cattle. The Xhosas were orally literate and little of their versions of the wars have survived. However, liberal white journalists like Pringle questioned the portrayal of black people as thieves and murderers. A poem of Pringle (1970:96) called *The Caffer* (the word was not regarded as derogatory at that time) questions the accuracy of judgements made about black people:

> He is a robber? - True; it is a strife
> Between the black-skinned bandit and the white,
> (A Savage? - Yes, though loath to aim at life,
> Evil for evil fierce he doth requite.
> A heathen? - Teach him, then, thy better creed,
> Christian! If thou deserve'st that name indeed.)

After the Xhosa were defeated militarily, the missionaries followed. They introduced to the Xhosa the teachings of the Bible and literacy.

1.3 The Zulus were the next major group to come under colonial rule. Themselves a newly
unified and conquering people, with Shaka's exploits still fresh in the memory of some, they fiercely resisted any attempt by Boer or Briton to deprive them of their independence. The result was that ultimately, under the British, they enjoyed a semi-autonomous status in the area across the Tugela called Zululand. This continued into present times under the apartheid regime as KwaZulu. The Zulu people, being extremely proud of their own culture, showed little enthusiasm for European culture or Christianity. Their integration into South Africa has always required more political engineering than that of other ethnic groups.

1.4 The Sotho people were exposed to European culture in a way different from that of the Khoisan, the Xhosa and the Zulu. They were not subjected to military conquest and colonial rule of a conquered people. Their first contact with European culture was confined to the more peaceful activity of the Paris Evangelical Society in 1836. Basutoland, later Lesotho, became a British protectorate on 12 March 1868 at the request of the King of the Sotho people.

This very briefly is the manner in which the four major black ethnic groups came under white colonial rule. White rule impacted on every aspect of black life, of especial interest to this study is the impact white rule had on black culture in respect of:

- **Language** - especially writing
- **World view** - Christian outlook

These two aspects of white culture shaped the literature of the transition period.

2. Language

The conquest of the black people by the whites, first the Dutch and then the British, led to the blacks being overtly and covertly forced to accept the use of the ruler's language. The ruler's language defined the roles of the ruler and the ruled. Ngugi (1993:16) expatiating on the same subject quotes Defoe's *Robinson Crusoe* in which Friday's acquisition of Crusoe's language also confirmed his position and status:

> In a little time I began to speak to him and teach him to speak to me; and first I made him know that his name was Friday which was the day I saved his life ... I likewise taught him to say Master, and then let him know that was to be my name.

In South Africa the language took hold at two levels

- **2.1 Verbal**
- **2.2 Written**
2.1 VERBAL

Verbal communication or talking was understood by both colonizer and the colonized as a means of communication. Even though Friday and Crusoe did not understand each other's language at the beginning, they recognized sound as a means of communication. Thus Friday was able through imitation to learn Crusoe's language.

2.2 WRITTEN

Writing was unknown to black people of Southern Africa and the introduction of this phenomenon into the cultural life of the African is perhaps one of the most deeply felt foreign interferences in African culture. Whether or not this has been a beneficial interference is the subject of a lengthy debate. However, writing changed the traditional way of life which depended on memory as the repository of knowledge. Gordimer (1976:99):

When the first tribal praise-poem was put down on paper, what a political act that was! What could be communicated only by the mouth of the praise-singer to the ears of those present, was transmogrified into a series of squiggles on paper that could reach far beyond his living presence, beyond even the chain of memory of those who came after him. With that act a culture took hold upon and was taken hold upon by another.

Gordimer has, in those few lines, captured the momentous nature of the introduction of writing to the black people of South Africa. The introduction of writing also brought a new culture, the culture of the European/white colonists who subsequently became known as the oppressor. Although the view of Freire (1971:122) that the imposition of the culture of the oppressor on the oppressed results in the oppressed accepting the poor self-image of themselves that the oppressors hold of them, could be generally applied, it is not true for the African intelligensia. The importance of writing in relation to culture was immediately recognized by the African intelligensia as a means of preserving the literary heritage of the past. Gérard (1971:383):

It is significant that the earliest writers of Ethiopia and of South Africa devoted a considerable part of their activity to recording oral lore: praise poetry, folktales and proverbs.

This intuitive sense on the part of the African poets/writers of the worth of their own culture perhaps explains why African poets/writers largely draw their inspiration from their oral literature.

3. World-View

The African way of life is better described as a world-view rather than a philosophy; because
the word philosophy in the European sense implies thinking of a speculative nature that provokes further speculation; it lacks the finality which is the necessary first step to action. Mphahlele (1984:10) has stated that the African does not stand outside the reality to contemplate it. The acceptance stems from a deep innate faith that God is an all encompassing reality and that the universe is metaphorically the body of God. In terms of African poetic imagery God is the original reed and a human being is a branch of that original reed or God. Human beings are therefore microcosmic representations of the macrocosmic God, being made in Christian parlance, in the image of God. It is therefore expected that human beings would respect the divinity in others. Their tasks and obligations therefore firstly lie with their fellow beings, to perfect human relationships and accept the interdependence of life. This leads to a recognition of the importance of the family, clan, tribe, tribal chiefs and elders, the community and finally the nation and people in general. This view of life is summed up in the Nguni word, ubuntu (Botho in Sotho), which compressed into one sentence resembles a Confucian saying, viz.:

Do unto others as you would others do unto you.

The moral implications of such an ontology are fairly obvious for an action directed at another is in effect directed at oneself. Therefore ubuntu encourages people to be kind, truthful, loyal, brave and caring to those less fortunate.

This recognition of oneself in others extends to the transcendental. God's help is invoked through the intercession of the family ancestors (amadlosi). The umadlosi are conceived of as angelic beings who have greater access to spiritual knowledge and easier access to God than human beings. To the traditional African, however, the family ancestors also represent one's higher or spiritual self, for one's ancestors are part of oneself because one's family is an extension of oneself. The traditional African does not subscribe to the Western practice that death ends a family relationship. The traditional African belief is that the relationship continues as death is only of the physical body but the spirit lives eternally. This belief was held almost uniformly over most of Africa. These simple lines from a Khoi-Khoi poem, How Death Came, illustrates this belief:

The Moon, they say, called Mantis
sent him with life to people saying:
Go to men and tell them this -
As I die and dying live
You too shall die and dying live.

Chapman and Dangor (1986:20)

Thus continuity of the family relationship after death means that the ancestors still have a physical life in the family they have left behind on earth and the family on earth have a spiritual
life in the ancestors who have gone beyond. Therefore those on earth call on their ancestors as their ancestors have greater access to spiritual realities and can intercede on their behalf. The family cohesion includes both the physical and spiritual reality. Hence the importance of ancestor worship and remembrance rituals in traditional African society even to this day.

Thus secure in his belief that he would one day join his ancestors the pre-colonial African lived a happy life, not bothered by ontological and eschatological matters of the here and hereafter. The life of the pre-colonial African in Southern Africa was a relatively peaceful rural life of work, song and dance interspersed with occasional warfare. Dhlomo (1962) in his long poem *Valley of a Thousand Hills* tries to reconstruct that life of bucolic bliss before the rise of Shaka and the coming of white settlers.

This peaceful life was partly altered by the Shakan war of unification; and irrevocably changed by white colonial rule and Christian missionary activity. Under Shaka the conquered tribes were absorbed but the traditional African customs were respected; this did not obtain under white rule. However, under Shaka most of the able-bodied youth spent their life in the army and the song and revelry mentioned by Dhlomo disappeared forever.

The missionaries added an even more austere dimension to the South African way of life with their puritanical brand of Christianity. The songs, dance and customs of the blacks were regarded as barbaric and heathen. The traditional garb so suited to South Africa's climate was regarded as indecently scanty, traditional medicine was dubbed witchcraft, in fact every facet of life was altered to coincide with European Christian practices. The missionaries filled this enormous cultural hiatus with a foreign language and religion. Few blacks acquired proficiency in the language offered; most acquired a rudimentary knowledge of speaking and reading, very few could write in the early days of colonialism. The few blacks who were encouraged to become fully literate were ones chosen to become ministers of the church; or because they were chiefs; or favourably disposed to the colonial authorities. No serious attempt was made to bring literacy to the general populace. Therefore the enormous gap created in the cultural life of the African in the early days of colonialism was filled by low grade aspects of European culture associated with urbanization, like alcohol, tobacco, money madness and prostitution. These cultural adoptions to fill the place of traditional African pastimes of song, dance, hunting and courting drew serious criticism even from the earliest black Christian converts and writers of the transition period. Ntsikana (1780 - 1820) among the Xhosa, and a century later Shembe (1875 - 1935) among the Zulus, illustrated in their teachings the danger of confusing Christianity with European culture.
4. Characteristics of the writing of transition:

4.1 Role of the imbongi
4.2 Change of subject and language
4.3 The rise of nationalism
4.4 The emergence of the individual
4.5 Gender emancipation
4.6 The transition to protest

4.1 THE ROLE OF THE IMBONGI

In traditional African society (pre-colonial) the imbongi played the part of:

4.1.1 reporter
4.1.2 entertainer
4.1.3 poet/soothsayer
4.1.4 adviser and critic to the King and Chiefs.

The imbongi also introduced the King to tribal and other dignitaries on formal occasions by singing the King's praises. The position of imbongi in pre-colonial times was the exclusive domain of males.

Within society the imbongi was honoured and respected. He did not have to struggle for fame or immortality, as he was already highly esteemed in his community, and as for immortality he felt assured of a place among his ancestors/amadlozi. Unlike the modern poet of the written tradition no personality cult developed around the imbongi. When the imbongi died his compositions became the common inheritance of the people; in fact even while living anyone could recite his compositions and improvise on them. No copyrights existed governing oral literature in pre-colonial African society. This meant that when a particular imbongi died his compositions lived on in the memory of the people and other imbongi who continued to improvise and improve it.

This scenario changed with the coming of white settlers, the advent of writing and the general spread of literacy. The decline in the status of the imbongi began. Writing meant that the imbongi could be dispensed with as his compositions could be written and read aloud by someone else. However, as literacy was not widespread among the African people the oral tradition persisted side by side with the written and the imbongi have survived until today. The ceremonial function of the imbongi re-emerged strongly during the inauguration of President Mandela and could herald the re-institution of the position of the imbongi as an important part of South Africa's cultural heritage.
4.2 CHANGE OF SUBJECT AND LANGUAGE

White settlement thrust upon the *imbongi* the burden of choice. For the first time he was forced to choose between his own culture and that of another. Firstly in relation to his source of inspiration, style of composition and form of presentation and secondly in terms of language. This, however, was not critical during the early years of transition as few *imbongi* could either read, speak or write in any European language. But inspiration, composition and form were immediately affected. Ntsikana and later Shembe found inspiration in Christ and used the traditional *izibongo* or praise poem to praise God and Christ rather than kings and chiefs.

4.3 RISE OF NATIONALISM

During the transitional period there also arose the idea of black nationhood and a South African nationalism. In pre-colonial times there existed clan and tribal loyalties and the concept of nationhood was limited to ethnicity rather than geographical space.

In the literature of transition we find the beginning of an awareness of blacks being dispossessed. Rubasana (1911) in *Zemk’ Inkomo Magwalandini - Away go the cattle, you cowards!* first articulated the concerns of blacks at the loss of their literary and cultural heritage. The cattle are symbolic of the black people's most precious possession, and one can sense a political motive in the anthology. This is amply supported by Rubasana's political involvement.

For the first time blacks had to resort to writing. Periodicals and newspapers such as *Indaba* (published in 1862), *The Kaffir Express* (in 1870), *isigidi, Invo - Zabantsundu* and *Izwi Labantu* took up the cause of black people and expressed their opinions. In the pre-colonial period participation in nation-building was part of the exigencies of daily life while the coming of white settlers introduced the intellectual necessity of the concept of nationhood and nationalism. What had always obtained in practice in their daily lives had to be now formulated and articulated conceptually through the medium of writing introduced by European civilization.

4.4 THE EMERGENCE OF THE INDIVIDUAL

The meeting with western European culture made necessary a rethinking of the self in terms of God, salvation, the cosmos, and society. Christian monotheism opposed the implicit pantheism of African humanism. [See Mphahlele (1984:9)]. Christian eschatology promoted the salvation of the individual, rather than the favour of the ancestors. Fundamentally the western European world-view militated in favour of individual consciousness or awareness of the self or individual as the most important single entity in society as opposed to the African view of
collective consciousness, viz. that of the family, clan and tribe. The liberation of the individual may be considered one of the most devastating blows dealt by European civilization to the fabric of traditional African society and the values it stood for.

4.5 GENDER EMANCIPATION

White settlement led to the emancipation of the individual. In pre-colonial times, the family not the individual, was regarded as the smallest unit of society. The emancipation of the individual meant that women as individuals could now claim the same rights as men. This, however, does not imply that women did not have rights in pre-colonial society, they were treated with dignity and even after marriage retained and continued to use their own surnames, not that of their husbands.

However, there always existed exclusive male and female domains. For example, important decision making and leadership was almost entirely male. In this sense pre-colonial African society was patriarchal.

White settlement, urbanization, Christianity, and the rise of black nationalism changed the role of women. The transition period produced the first black woman writer, L. Kakaza who in 1913 wrote *Intyatyambo yomzi* or *The Flower in the Home*, a 31 page novella in Xhosa. In 1914 she wrote another novel *Tandiwe, a Girl of the Gcaleka* the Xhosa title being *U-Tandiwe umakwa Gcaleka*. Her early death cut short a promising career.

4.6 TRANSITION TO STRUGGLE

Some important characteristics of transition literature are:

4.6.1 Christian in outlook
4.6.2 Conform to a western literary mode rather than a pre-colonial African literary mode
4.6.3 Avoid controversial issues
4.6.4 Have entertainment value
4.6.5 Do not reflect adult tastes and interests.

[See Opland (1986:136).]

However, in spite of its emasculated and insipid appearance transition literature latently contained the germ of what became literature of the struggle. Perceptible trends are traceable such as:

(a) Appropriation of oral techniques into the written mode, for example Ntsikana's *Great Hymn*.

(b) Passion to be understood by all in the true *imbongi* tradition emerged in the literature of the struggle as People's Poetry, using People's English.

(c) Upholding traditional culture as espoused by Rubasana and later Shembe in his
approach to Christianity - this found an echo in Black Consciousness as appreciation of what is African.

(d) The consciousness of Black Nationhood found in the many periodicals and newspapers of the transition period, some of which were overtly political like *Imvo Zabantsundu*, of which Tengo Jabavu was editor in 1884, heralded the flood of pamphlets, newspaper and magazine articles that were to characterize protest literature.

SECTION C

LITERATURE OF THE STRUGGLE (1948 - 1994)

1. Historical Background and Characteristics

This period is familiar to most academics, educators and creative artists as well as to most sensitive South Africans. For this reason one is tempted to call this period the contemporary period, however, there has already emerged a "New Writing" and such a name could be misleading. This period in the development of South African literature is called for various but valid reasons by many different names. It has been referred to as Protest Poetry, Soweto, People's Resistance, Revolutionary and Liberation Poetry as well as Poetry for Change. [See Chapman (1984:21-32) for a detailed discussion of this period.] For purposes of this dissertation the period will be simply referred to as the Period of Struggle, encompassing all subtle and academic divisions. The reason for this is that the impact of this period in the teaching of poetry is the over-riding concern, above all others.

During the transition period blacks discovered what European/white culture had to offer and responded to it in varied ways, ranging from slavish imitation to an instinctive reaction of protecting and preserving one's own culture. In the period of struggle, blacks discovered themselves in terms of their relationships with other people, not only in South Africa, but the world at large. The gist of that discovery can be summed up as Biko (1978:114) says, in the SASO message: "Black man, you are on your own." This discovery was in a sense anticipated by Peter Abrahams and H.I.E. Dhlomo who, in chronology belong to the transition period. Peter Abrahams became disillusioned with Christianity and the inadequacy of the traditional English idiom to express black sentiments, and turned to African Americans like Langston Hughes for guidance and inspiration. His poem *Old and New: A New Year's Poem* illustrates his disillusionment with Christianity and his opting for the African American idiom:

Take up your Bible and die
The world shall know us;
We're proud

Take up your Bible and die
The world shall know us;
We're proud
H.I.E. Dhlomo, on the other hand, became disillusioned with the hypocrisy of white liberals and the Eurocentric philosophy of individualism which he felt undermined the basic fabric of traditional African society - viz. *ubuntu* or African humanism, which is community based rather than individually based. Mphahlele (1984:8-10) expatiated on this concept of *ubuntu* relating it to other world philosophies.

This move away from Western European tutelage and patronage became obvious after the declaration of South Africa as a republic in 1960. The National Party Government followed a policy of complete separation of the different races, within which policy the white race was given a superior status and preferential treatment. The government was rigid and ruthless in the implementation of its policy.

Each racial group was to have its own Education Department that would educate that racial group to perform the role the National Party had determined for it. Whites were educated for positions of leadership; Coloureds and Indians as artisans, clerks, waiters and for white collar jobs with a limited number of professionals to cater for the needs of the community. For the Africans a system called Bantu Education was introduced. This system stipulated that Africans receive their primary school education in the African languages (Zulu, Sotho, Xhosa, Venda and so on). English was to be introduced in Standard 6 as a second language. This seriously disadvantaged the black student at university. The motive was obviously to reduce the number of African intellectuals, as National Party policy had a different role for Africans in their arrangement of South African society. This was made explicit by Dr H.F. Verwoerd as Minister of Native Affairs and later as Prime Minister, that the African should not aspire to any higher position than that of a labourer within white society, which effectively meant South African society.

From its education policies it was obvious that the National Party realized that the greatest threat to white political and cultural hegemony would come from literacy and literature. The government therefore made every effort to control the reading material available by strict censorship laws and any writing that was considered subversive was banned immediately. Many poets and writers were silenced or driven into exile, like Peter Abrahams, Mazizi Kunene and Eskia Mphahlele to mention a few. The majority of those who remained opted to write poetry as it became the safest form of expression and an easier escape route from draconian censorship. Poetry had the following advantages:

1.1 It was subject to interpretation, more so than any other form of writing.
1.2 Poetry can encapsulate a potent message in a few words.
1.3 It can be committed to memory, with greater ease.
1.4 Poetry was familiar to the South African masses (blacks) because of the *imbongi* tradition.
1.5 It could be turned into political songs, rallying calls and national anthems.
1.6 Poetry could be shared by all people more so than a novel, play, etc.

This, perhaps, explains the proliferation of poets during this period.

As apartheid entrenched itself and white attitudes to blacks hardened as evinced in the support that the National Party received at the polls in each successive white general election, blacks realized that their battle for freedom was their own. It became increasingly apparent that black alienation from the Anglo-Boer culture at home, and Western European culture abroad was permanent. Black intellectuals, poets and writers, as well as politicians turned to the Marxist Eastern bloc and to pre-colonial African roots to formulate a strategy of emancipation. During the transition period efforts were made to assimilate Christianity within African culture as exemplified in Ntsikana and Shembe. With the poets of the period of struggle communal concerns of pre-colonial African culture and the people based society of Marxism found a common ground and purpose. Shifting the centre of gravity from a Eurocentric to an Afrocentric one meant a re-definition of the role of literature, which re-definition for the writer of the struggle meant that literature should lose its elitist nature in order to embrace its all-inclusive nature. Ngugi (1993:XVII) further elucidates:

Hence we need to move the centre from all minority class establishments within nations to the real creative centres among the working people in conditions of gender, racial and religious equality.

Literature was perceived by this new crop of poets as having what Chapman (1990:39-45) calls a "diachronic responsibility", which meant that poets/writers had the onus to change the course of events and not be changed by them. This responsibility meant that in SASO's term, the New Blackman had to act in his own best interest rather than react as the white oppressor's would want him to; only then would literature and poetry have any justification and relevance in the lives of downtrodden people. To achieve this literature had to become accessible to the people, which meant that it had to be written in a language understood by all. The imperialism of language is a phenomenon that is well understood in South Africa, the 1976 Soweto Uprising, a watershed in our history, was the reply given by the black people to the imposition of Afrikaans against their wishes. [See Ngugi (1993:XVII).] So the imperialism of language is not just an academic concept. This problem of finding a suitable idiom for the common people and the de-mystification of poetry was wrestled with by Berthold Brecht in Germany and Pablo Neruda in Chile. Neruda (1935:246) felt that poets should make a
conscious effort to simplify their poems because, as he expressed it, poetry should be "a bread than can be shared by all learned men and peasants alike." Pablo Neruda's obsession for simplicity was quite naturally realized by the black poets, who, because of Bantu education, were spared the taste of the more exalted idiom of the English literary tradition. They wrote spontaneously in colloquial South African English, sometimes called People's English, with a natural and fresh simplicity that was easily understood by all. Bantu Education spared these poets the pain of a studied simplicity.

Simplicity was not an end in itself, but served the purpose of conscientising the people. Poetry was seen as a means to create an awareness among the oppressed people. It was to hold out the ideal of freedom before the people by a graphic exposure of their suffering. This exposure was necessary to prevent the oppressed from becoming so jaded by suffering that they accepted it with a complacency that almost legitimised the status quo. For this reason perhaps, most contemporary South African verse reveals poems that nearly always deal with the following themes:

(a) **POLICE BRUTALITY AND HARASSMENT:**

*Possibilities for a Man Hunted by SBs*

If they suspend your sentence it's ok
But if they jail you
There's one of two possibilities
Either they release you
Or you fall from the tenth floor

Asvat (1980:240)

(b) **FORCED REMOVALS:**

*Shantytown Removal*

I shall never forget that winter morning.
A rainy November morning.
They dismantled our shantytown.
Mindless of sleeping souls.
Fast asleep as of anaesthesia.

Dikobe (1983:765)

(c) **PAIN AND CRUELTY**

*I saw your mother*

Fifteen minutes up
I was led
back to the workshop.
Your death, my wife,
one crime they managed
not to perpetrate
on the day that you died.                  Cronin. (1987:33)

(d) SNOBBERY AND BETRAYAL AMONG THE OPPRESSED:

He wears
the latest Levison's suits
'Made in America';
from Cuthbert's
a pair of Florsheim shoes
'America's finest shoes',
He pays cash
that's why
he's called Mister.

He knows
he must carry a pass
He don't care for politics
He don't go to church
He knows Sobukwe
He knows Mandela
They're in Robben Island.
'So what? that's not my business!'      Mtshali (1971:47)

(e) FRUSTRATION AND REVENGE:

A poem on black and white

if i pour petrol on a white child's face
and give flames the taste of his flesh
it won't be a new thing
i wonder how i will feel when his eyes pop
and when my nostrils sip the smell of his flesh
and his scream touches my heart
i wonder if i will be able to sleep;

Serote (1982:55)
(f) EXHORTATION AND ENCOURAGEMENT:

Now is the time

Now is the time
to violate the eleventh commandment
for today's pain is tomorrow's
imminent comfort
Now is the time

Mbuli. (1987:21)

(g) PRAYER AND HOPE:

Lord

If all our leaders have gone
then you have to lead us
and show us the way
a tunnel to freedom
is our prayer

Mandela Z. (1989:19)

(h) FORGIVENESS:

Sea and Sand

Bless the children of South Africa
The white children and the black children
But more, the black children
They lost the sea. They lost the sand
That they may not lose love for the white child
Whose father raped the land

Mattera (1987:36)

The repetition of these themes is in keeping with the "diachronic responsibility" felt by protest poets. Poetry was to act as the catalyst of change. To do this poetry had to fulfil the following:

(i) It had to be written in simple, People's English, so as to be understood by all.

(ii) Imagery used had to be concrete and drawn from the immediate environment.

(iii) Poetry had to voice popular rather than personal feelings.

(iv) It had to inspire action and change; Mzwakhe Mbuli called his poetry "A Call to Action". Therefore poetry had to give the most authentic and graphic picture of oppression suffered by blacks.

(v) The message of the poem had to take precedence over its artistry.

(vi) If the use of a myth or legend was inevitable it has to be taken from Africa so as to
instil black pride. Hence the re-casting of heroes like Shaka and Makanna in different roles than was accorded to them by colonial rulers and Christian missionaries.

(vii) Lastly the philosophical basis of poetry had to be sought in ubuntu (African humanism), black theology and Marxism rather than in Christianity and the liberal humanist tradition.

SECTION D

FUTURE LITERATURE

1. Background Perspective
Apartheid came to an end after the April 1994 general election. Literature demanding its abolition thus became redundant. However, amidst the clamour of the literature of the struggle some poets/writers were already predicting the course of future writing and offering suggestions, two of the most notable being Njabulo Ndebele and Nadine Gordimer. Gray (1992:23-31) in his article *An Author’s Agenda: Re-visioning Past and Present For a Future South Africa*, assesses their contributions to this future vision. In his assessment of their contributions he sees them as complementary to each other. The papers in which ideas seminal to this future vision appear are:

1.1 Gordimer Nadine(1982) - *Living in the Interregnum*
1.2 Ndebele Njabulo(1991) - *Redefining Relevance*  

Much of those papers deals with the period 1980 - 1994. Many of the hopes, fears and predictions have either been dashed, dissipated, realized or falsified. In short, the bulk of the papers is largely dated as they deal with a South Africa and a literature that has changed radically, perhaps in an unexpected way. However, aspects of their papers comment on future literary trends and possibilities in a new democratic South Africa; this will be concentrated upon.

1.1 NADINE GORDIMER

Gordimer’s paper was presented to a foreign audience at the New York Institute of Humanities. As such, her paper provides historical and political information that is necessary to a foreign audience but would, as Gray (1992:23) points out, appear to be self-evident to a person living in South Africa. Gordimer’s perspective is, as she acknowledges, informed by the following:

1.1.1 She is white, female and from the privileged minority.

1. “Redefining Relevance” was first delivered as a paper in 1986 at Stockholm. [See bibliography Ndebele, N. (1991)]
1.1.2 Her status as a white citizen makes her an outsider looking into the world of black people.

1.1.3 She is a writer, a self-employed private person, who acts according to the dictates of her conscience.

1.1.4 Her conscience dictates that she use her chosen vocation to fight apartheid. Gordimer (1982:276) quotes Gabriel Garcia Marquez: "The writer's duty - his revolutionary duty, if you like - is to write well."

It is from this standpoint that Gordimer's paper is presented. Gordimer tries to give an element of reality to her discourse by periodically introducing real-life vignettes of apartheid by way of illustration. Against the backdrop of apartheid she sees the writer of the future as:

(a) An important early warning voice of the people. Writers feel, like the deep sea fish analogy she uses, the unfelt undercurrents. This allows them access to the collective pulse of the people and they should articulate it. This is a writer's duty, Gordimer (1982:232) quotes Joseph Brodsky: "The people know what to do, before the leaders."

(b) That black writers will find it more difficult to take a dispassionate view of the South African political scenario as black writers were more deeply involved in the struggle for freedom. White writers may have found transcendence of the situation easier.

(c) The writing of the future would obviously demonstrate greater freedom of expression; and also be free from the morbid preoccupations of the interregnum. In the old South Africa a writer was either for or against the system. Impartiality was interpreted as acquiescence to the status quo. With the death of the old order would go the old identifications; the new is unknown and undetermined. New identities will have to be forged. It is on this last point that Ndebele expatiates in greater detail.

2.1 NJABULO NDEBELE

Ndebele's paper was first delivered in 1986 at the Second Stockholm Conference for African writers. His paper is described by Gray (1992:24) as dealing with the not so self-evident truths of the South African literary scenario. Ndebele could deal with the more subtle aspects of writing because his audience, being writers, possessed the expertise necessary to appreciate it. Besides, Ndebele's life in many ways can be seen as antithetical to that of Gordimer, equipping him for the task of a deeper psychological analysis of the black writer and writing:

2.1.1 Ndebele was an underprivileged black male.

2.1.2 He rose to become a figure of importance in the black community, viz. a professor, later Rector of the University of the North.

2.1.3 Unlike Gordimer he is a public servant of great importance, not just a private writer.

2.1.4 His life and achievements as a black gave him firsthand and inside understanding of oppression in South Africa.
To Ndebele (1991:65) the challenge of the future writer is to free the "social imagination" of the oppressed from the shadow of the oppressor. This means freeing the creative process of writing and art in general from the necessity of "the other" (or oppressor) as a form of inspiration or instigation to create. The necessity of the "other" or "oppressor" has a limiting effect on the creative vision. This Ndebele says is evident in the polarization of all art forms between 1948 and 1994. The literature of freedom will have to extend the writer's perception of what can be written about and the means and methods of writing. Before April 1994 the subject, the means (or resources), methods or styles and talent of the writer were harnessed to the freedom struggle and the seizure of power. Now Ndebele feels that the creative artist, especially the writer, has the duty to liberate the minds of the oppressed. Ndebele contends that it is only when people are liberated in mind that true freedom becomes possible and the danger of replacing one tyranny with another is minimized.

In order to ensure that "the social imagination" is emancipated the writer should acknowledge that the literature of the struggle has now served its purpose, viz. the seizure of power. What Ndebele (1991:69) said of protest literature... "that it (protest literature) has run its course", is now true of all literature dealing with the political emancipation of the oppressed in South Africa. Failure to acknowledge that literature has now politically emancipated the masses would mean that the power of literature would be wasted on a battle already won when it could be used to uplift and free the previously oppressed people in other facets of life that Ndebele enumerates, viz.:

a. sport, past, present and future
b. fashion and consumerism
c. the generation gap
d. human relationships in the industrial and commercial world
e. science, scientific advancement as the average man's ideas and response
f. the psychology of the co-opted as used during the apartheid years in government and industry and its future implications
g. rural life and land dispossession - a topic ignored during the struggle
h. inter-racial, inter-ethnic and multi-cultural activity in what (President) Mandela N.R. (1994:44) called "a rainbow nation".

Indeed Ndebele points out that the list is endless. These topics should be tackled with a consciousness, that is cleansed of the past. It should be within a paradigm free from the ghost of the apartheid oppressor. The aim of this new literary paradigm should be to free "the social imagination". How sensitive and how conscious of their new found freedom and power the people will be will depend on the quality of the new writer. Even though political freedom is won, the writer is constantly involved in revolution. The writer's revolution for Ndebele is not
political action; that task he assigns to the political propagandist. The writer's revolution, he contends, is the revolution in the consciousness of man, which is a slow, ongoing, evolutionary process. However, a revolution in consciousness or an inner revolution, is necessary in the reconstruction and development of a shattered land. In order to bring about this change in the psyche of man, Ndebele suggests that future writers seek inspiration at the deepest level, in man it will be the soul or psyche and at the social level the collective social imagination as manifested at the deepest levels of the people's ethos. This perennial source would be ever new and relevant as opposed to a writing that is purely a response to an external stimulus like oppression or an oppressor, or what Ndebele calls "the other". For Ndebele correctly contends that a literature born of a Pavlovian stimulus-response, an almost mechanistic inspiration, can only limit creativity and damage the "social imagination" or collective consciousness of people resulting in morbid symptoms like racism and violence for instance.

Much of what Gordimer and Ndebele have expressed as hopes for the future of creative artists, particularly writers, appear in general broad outlines in the A.N.C.'s - (R.D.P.) Reconstruction and Development Programme - A Policy Framework (1994). Below is a short paraphrase of points relevant to the issues thus far discussed. The RDP arts and culture policies aim:

(i) To promote the rich cultural, religious and linguistic diversity of S.A.
(ii) Develop a unifying national culture without making it an imposition. And to promote non-racialism, non-sexism, human rights and democracy.
(iii) To make resources and facilities available for the production and appreciation of the arts, especially to those communities previously denied these resources.
(iv) Place arts firmly within the national educational curricula.
(v) Link culture to all aspects of human life, e.g. health, housing, tourism, etc.
(vi) Establish and implement a language policy that encourages and supports, financially and otherwise, the utilization of all the languages of South Africa.
(vii) Cooperate with educational bodies and the media in eradicating illiteracy, and in promoting a reading and learning culture.

The A.N.C. policy on Arts and Culture as well as the ideas of Gordimer and Ndebele provide a basis for further speculation on the nature and character of future writing in South Africa. The future literary scenario could and should, among other characteristics, manifest some of the following:

- A writing that expresses greater freedom, creativity and diversity.
- A greater balance between the artistry of form and the message it encapsulates. During the period 1948 - 1994 the message took precedence over all else.
- It should be more self-reflective and cover a greater complexity of themes than the literature of the struggle, which was one-dimensional, aimed at political emancipation.
For that period the one-dimensional nature was appropriate and even commendable in its purposefulness.

- A rise in literature written in black South African languages, especially as nine of the eleven official languages are black languages.

- Also an increase in literature using People's English rather than Standard English can be expected, especially taking into account the use People's English played as a medium of communication in the literature of the struggle.

- Lastly, the polarity that characterized South African writing, viz. Black and White, what Ndebele (1991:65) called "us and them", should dissipate in future writing, to be replaced by a more unified vision of South Africa.

SECTION E

CONCLUSION OF CHAPTER 1

The obvious, and sometimes not so obvious, trend that is observable throughout the writings of black South Africans and later even white South African poets/writers, is the presence and persistence of the influence of the oral tradition. This means that the indigenous culture is still alive and valued in spite of efforts by missionaries and colonial powers to discredit it and the rise of an unsympathetic, urban industrial society to which indigenous African culture (a rural phenomenon) was alien. The change of government in South Africa and the consequent change in the status of indigenous languages and culture, as well as an education policy sensitive to cultural and linguistic diversity and the equal treatment they deserve, should make possible drastic changes in the selection of literary works. With specific reference to poetry the following would be desirable:

1. Future anthologies of South African verse should reflect a greater balance in respect of the cultural and linguistic diversity of South Africa.

2. Curriculum planners and selection panels should be sensitive to the cultural and psychological background particularly of black pupils as they constitute the majority and often come from underprivileged homes.

3. Previously anthologies for schools were compiled with only the white L1 pupil in mind. This was obvious from the poems selected. However, this will be discussed in greater detail in Chapter 2.

4. Future anthologies of South African verse should in their introduction explain in reasonable detail and within the range of pupils for which the anthology is intended, the African poetic tradition and terminology. Sources of more detailed information can be suggested for the use of teachers. If, for instance, an anthology contains Butler's
be suggested for the use of teachers. If, for instance, an anthology contains Butler's (1989:58) *Izibongo of Matiwane*, a short footnote saying that *izibongo* is a praise poem is not enough. The explanation, whether in the footnotes, glossary or introduction, should enable the reader to contextualize the place of the *izibongo* within traditional and modern African society. This is necessary for the future classroom.

5. Also African poetic modes like *izibongo*, *izithakazelo*, *izaga*, *amaculo*, *inkondlo*, *amahubo* and *ingoma* for instance, need to be further validated by actual examples in one or other African language together with a generally accepted English translation; this understanding of the African poetic tradition and its function in the daily life of African people from ancient to modern times would enable African pupils to respond to poetry as an indigenous and not a foreign means of communication. Such explanations would also enable teachers and pupils of other races and cultures to appreciate more fully the African poetic tradition. Previously poetry was taught ignoring the poetic tradition of Africa. This will be discussed in greater detail in Chapter 2.

6. Finally, a knowledge of the African poetic tradition should enable teachers to make meaningful selections when choosing poems as well as to develop methodologies appropriate to the handling of a poetry selection that is more representative of South Africa's population.
CHAPTER 2

INTRODUCTION
This chapter investigates the extent to which the D.E.T. English Second Language Syllabus, with specific reference to poetry, reflects a sufficient awareness of Black pupils' literary, cultural and historical background as outlined in Chapter 1. Teacher competence and classroom methodology will then be considered in relation to the syllabus and its expectations. Therefore this chapter will focus on the following:

SECTION A - POETRY LEARNING/TEACHING IN GENERAL
1. Why teach poetry?
2. Why poetry in English?
3. Educative value of poetry.
4. The L2 Classroom.

SECTION B - THE SYLLABUS
1. Syllabus and curriculum
2. Difference between syllabus and curriculum.
   3.1 Different approaches to syllabus design.
   3.2 Broad and narrow syllabi.
   3.3 Process and product syllabi.

SECTION C - POETRY TEACHING IN KWA-ZULU NATAL SCHOOLS
1. The D.E.T. syllabus.
2. The prescribed poems.
3. Classroom methodology.
4. Examinations. (Assessment)
5. Questioning patterns in Poetry Examinations.

SECTION D - CONCLUSION OF CHAPTER 2
SECTION A

POETRY LEARNING/TEACHING IN GENERAL

1 Why teach poetry?

The teaching of poetry in South African schools is considered necessary because:

1.1 Poetry, like the folktale, is a literary genre that is common to all peoples. South Africa is a microcosm of the world and poetry can act as a unifying force amidst disparate and divisive influences. It achieved much success as the most popular literary genre during the Period of Struggle in South Africa.

1.2 It represents the oldest literary genre in South Africa and contains the history, philosophy, literature and the collective wisdom generally of the Nguni, Sotho and Khoisan peoples of South Africa.

1.3 Poetry contains the most concentrated form of language and generally offers the most creative and picturesque use of words, in any language. This effect is achieved through the use of imagery and symbolism which gives poetry more than just literal or surface meaning. It has a multiplicity of meaning and timelessness seldom equalled in any other genre of literature.

1.4 The multiplicity of meaning usually associated with ‘good poetry’ makes interpretation necessary in order to extract meaning. However, interpretation also ensures the transcendence of poetry through space and time, above and beyond barriers of race, colour, sex and creed and this quality is a hallmark of its universality and value. Interpretation also exercises and develops pupils cognitive skills.

1.5 Poetry was developed in ancient times, in Africa and elsewhere, as an easy, dramatic and enjoyable way of remembering what was worthwhile in the historical and cultural heritage of a people. This was achieved through various literary devices like rhythm, alliteration, symbolism and striking imagery; as well as the ability to encapsulate a message in a few appropriate words. This made poetry easy to commit to memory and also provided a form of entertainment in primitive societies.

2 Why poetry in English

2.1 South Africa is a multilingual country like many African and Asian countries and English serves as a neutral and unifying language as well as providing a link with the world community, English being the first international language.

2.2 The Afro-Asian colonies of Britain developed a literature and poetry in English that is
inextricably bound with their struggle for political freedom. This poetry, in English, in turn becomes important historically and culturally for the identity of these nations, and for the generations to come. It is unlikely that the Poetry of the Struggle in South Africa would cease to be relevant to future generations simply because it was written, for the most part, in English, rather than in indigenous languages.

2.3 English has the widest international readership. Unique forms of English have developed in different parts of the world; Singapore English, Nigerian English, Indian English, Australian English, and so on, covering most of the former colonies of England. All these different types of English have developed a poetry of their own. To study these poems is to be enriched by the widest possible range of thought and culture available in any single language.

2.4 English as the language of the colonizer was given a power and mystique by the colonial rulers. Language was used as a means of control and suppression; and upward mobility depended on the use of the colonizer’s language. In the case of England, it was English. [See Freire (1971:122) and Labov (1969:1-31) and Ndebele (1987:1-16) for a detailed discussion of language and power].

2.5 Writing in English by Afro-Asians from former colonies of England was perhaps a necessary process in the de-colonization of the language by proving that its creative use was open to both colonizer and colonized. This creative exercise effectively destroys the myth of superiority and the aura of mystique surrounding it. African writers of repute like Sonyika and Ngugi have now reverted to writing in indigenous languages. The change in status of Black Languages in South Africa from neglected ‘vernaculars’ to that of official languages could also herald a new era of creativity in writing in indigenous South African languages.

2.6 English has a long history of written literature which was largely supportive of individual rights, human rights, socio-economic and political reform, and support for a more egalitarian society generally. Even though most of what was written was inevitably Eurocentric, as the context was European; writers and poets could identify with the basic principles which remain constant in any context.

3 The educative value of poetry

3.1 Poetry enables pupils to realize the universality of human experience by comparing their own experience with that of other people. Pupils become aware of the virtues and limitations of their own inherited attitudes and values.

3.2 Exposure to poetry of other cultures provides vicarious experience of other cultures, philosophies and world-views and this cultivates tolerance and respect for people of different cultures, in addition to knowledge and general enrichment.
3.3 It provides critical insight into human nature as poetry is a human response to reality; this insight pupils obtain by comparing their experience with that of the poet as well as by an analysis of their response to the poets' experience. This critical response could be developed as a basis for the pupils' own creative writing.

3.4 Poetry stimulates thought and imagination, thus helping cognitive development generally, as well as creating an awareness about the importance of current events. The Poetry of the Struggle in South Africa, is an example of poetry functioning in such a role.

3.5 It improves pupils' vocabulary, especially the passive vocabulary, as poets have a penchant for the use of words in unique and unusual ways.

3.6 Exposure to the unique and unusual use of poetic language makes pupils aware of the possibilities of language and how appropriate word order determines tone, meaning and style.

3.7 Lastly, continuous exposure to poetry of quality like exposure to literature generally, sharpens the critical faculty of pupils and helps them to become more discerning in their reading and assessment of the written medium as well as of life. It also acts as a stimulus to write.

4 The L2 classroom

The popular approach to language teaching today is Communicative Language Teaching, frequently referred to in its abbreviated form as C.L.T. Although the current debate on L2 teaching has many unsolved areas, there is consensus, judging from its widespread use and success attributed to it, that C.L.T. is the most appropriate form of mediation in the present learning/teaching situation in South Africa. No fixed paradigm has emerged from C.L.T. as divergent methods are allowed within an approach which could be broadly classified eclectic, as flexibility and modification is what gives C.L.T. its greatest strength and present appeal. However, the divergent methods are informed by a core of common principles. Raimes (1983:535-552) formulated these common principles into what she calls the 'emerging paradigm' viz. that C.L.T.

4.1 Sees language as communication.
4.2 Uses real language, as opposed to usage.
4.3 Recommends a student-centred classroom.
4.4 Encourages language acquisition.
4.5 Develops humanistic interpersonal approaches.
4.6 Considers the nature of the learner, the learning process, and the learning environment.

1. Hereafter referred to as C.L.T.
Raimes' common principles need amplification within the context of the Department of Education and Training (D.E.T.) schools in KwaZulu/Natal. Applied to the teaching of poetry, Raimes' principles would require that:

4.7 The language of poems prescribed should be seen as communication by pupils and not only as an academic exercise.

4.8 Also the possibility of using poems to communicate should be encouraged. Pupils should be exposed to how language could be used to create poems rather than concentrating only on an analysis of language usage in poems that have become classics or represent the acme of use and usage in the language in which they are written. This could make pupils feel inadequate and could have a counter productive effect in terms of their creative attempts at poetry.

4.9 Prescribed poems should help pupils in language acquisition at the level of use, vocabulary and usage. Therefore contemporary poems should take precedence over poems that use archaic or abstruse language. This should be done on the understanding that contemporary poems would employ an idiom easily identified and understood by pupils.

4.10 The cultural, historical, economic and socio-political background of the learner should be taken into account when poems are prescribed. This should not exclude poems outside the pupils' range of experience but act as a balancing factor. A formula as to proportion may still have to be agreed upon. Rive (1980:5-8) has suggested the three concentric circles formula. [Rive's formula is dealt with in greater detail in the section on methodology.]

4.11 Mediation should enable pupils to interact, and enjoy poetry. Poetry, perhaps more than other genres of literature, requires a thorough engagement with the text at the cognitive, personal and spiritual level before meaning is derived.

4.12 Lastly, pupils should feel tangible benefits from poetry in their language acquisition, cognitive development and personal and spiritual growth.

Subjecting the poetry learning/teaching scenario in D.E.T./KwaZulu-Natal schools to Raimes' 'emerging paradigm' yields the message that pupils must perceive poems to be real, meaningful and purposeful communication before true classroom interaction becomes possible. Carter and Long (1992:1-8) found that the various reasons for the teaching of literature could be collapsed into three broad reasons:

- To enrich and broaden the personal, cultural and historical outlook of pupils through vicarious experience.
- To improve the linguistic ability by exposure to new and novel forms of language usage.
- To encourage pupils to use literature as a resource for personal growth and enjoyment.
These three reasons in turn form the core of three models (or methods) of teaching literature, and are used mostly in combination with one another. The models are:

- The Cultural Model
- Language Model
- Personal Growth Model.

[For a detailed discussion see Carter and Long (1992: 2-11).] The above models will briefly be discussed in relation to poetry teaching.

**THE CULTURAL MODEL:**

This model is usually associated with teacher-centred mediation. The literary text is seen as a source of information, of which the teacher is an authority and is in an ideal position to transmit to pupils. Christian National Education favoured this approach in South Africa, until recently. However, the influence of this approach can still be felt very strongly. Therefore poems that required the teacher’s intervention in order to have their meaning unpacked were considered to be of great educative value. Hence the preponderance of classical poems in the prescribed list. [See section on prescribed poems for range and type.]

**LANGUAGE MODEL:**

This model tends to be more learner-centred and activity based. The pupils are taught to critically evaluate the text. The text is not looked upon as a source of knowledge but rather as opinion and idea expressed in language that the reader has to interpret and critically evaluate. A surface acceptance is not encouraged.

**PERSONAL GROWTH MODEL:**

This model encourages pupils to read by prescribing literature that is:

- suited to the pupil’s age group;
- relevant to the pupil’s experience, e.g. cultural, historical, political, socio-economic, etc.;
- perceived as useful and interesting.

This model has, as its primary aim, to cultivate the reading habit in pupils and get them to perceive it as an important process in their personal growth. It is a pupil-centred approach in which the pupil’s needs are catered for and the pupil’s evaluation is of greater importance than the information dispensed by the teacher.

These three models posited by Carter and Long (1992:2-11) should not be seen as functioning in a mutually exclusive way. They should be seen as working together, with a greater emphasis being given to the approach that is most appropriate in the circumstances. Most teachers use a combination of all three in one lesson, the proportion varying according to the need, pupil
response, and the teacher’s training, inclination and preparation.

Of importance to this dissertation, however, are the basic principles that inform these approaches to literature teaching and the teaching of poetry specifically, to pupils who use English as a second or foreign language. The following principles can be derived from the foregoing discussion:

• The literary and cultural background of the pupil should form the basis for the design and development of the curriculum.
• Relevant contemporary poems should be selected, suited to the pupil’s age group.
• Poems should be studied critically.
• Poetry study should lead to language development, increased knowledge, personal growth and enjoyment.
• Teachers should facilitate bridging the gap between the study of poetry and poetry for pleasure, as a resource and for personal development.
• The teacher could be perceived by pupils in the poetry lesson as a resource to be tapped rather than as a transmitter.

SECTION B.

THE SYLLABUS

The critique of the D.E.T. poetry syllabus will be preceded by a general discussion on the nature and structure of syllabi because:

• The D.E.T. syllabus can then be seen against the backdrop of syllabi generally and placed in perspective in relation to the structure, nature and purpose of syllabi.
• The constraints induced by circumstances that affect the realization of the aims and content of the D.E.T. syllabus can be appreciated within the general context of syllabi.
• Lastly, it can be determined whether the syllabus and its influence on the prescribed poems and classroom methodology was responsible for L2 pupils’ attitudes to poetry.

In order to realize the above, the discussion will focus on:

1 Syllabus and curriculum as generally understood.
2 The difference between syllabus and curriculum
3 Second language syllabi.
   3.1 Different schools of syllabus design.
   3.2 Broad and narrow syllabi.
   3.3 Process and product syllabi.
1 Syllabus and curriculum as generally understood

Below are three common perceptions of a syllabus.

1.1 A public, legal, political and social document.
1.2 Educational, traditional, authoritative, prescriptive, and final specification and requirement document.
1.3 A flexible framework, map, model, guideline for both teacher and pupil to work with and from.


A curriculum is commonly perceived to be:
1.4 The organization, planning, implementation, management and evaluation of an education programme.


2 The difference between syllabus and curriculum

Allen (1984: 61) articulates the difference between the syllabus and curriculum as follows:

I think it is time to establish a clear distinction, and I would like to propose one as follows: curriculum is a very general concept which involves consideration of the whole complex of philosophical, social and administrative factors which contribute to the planning of an educational programme. Syllabus, on the other hand, refers to that subpart of the curriculum which is concerned with a specification of what units will be taught (as distinct from how they will be taught, which is a matter for methodology).

The distinction drawn by Allen (1984: 61) will be adhered to in this dissertation as per syllabus and curriculum. Even though it may be difficult to separate the syllabus and curriculum from one another in practice, as they are so interwoven, especially in Communicative Language Teaching,¹ however, in this dissertation they are treated as two mutually exclusive and separate entities because:

2.1 Firstly, syllabus and curriculum are perhaps the two most used words in educational discourse. Sometimes they are used as synonyms and at other times have a different frame of reference. In order to avoid confusion arising from this ambivalence, specific designations are allotted to the syllabus and curriculum so that their exact frame of

¹ See Nunan (1989:5).
reference within this dissertation is understood.

2.2 Secondly, the areas of the educational process referred to by the syllabus and curriculum even though they overlap and are often confused, must be clearly defined, as they represent two different phases in the mediation process. To isolate these phases as if they were watertight is important in a diagnostic analysis of this nature, because it enables the researcher to distinguish the plan from the action and theory from practice, so that appropriate intervention may be suggested if the diagnostic analysis reveals such a need. Therefore syllabus and curriculum are considered to be separate.

2.3 Finally, separation and isolation ensures a clearer and more intense focus on the subject and area being investigated. Separation also facilitates understanding of the argument as syllabus and curriculum are different entities, allowing for pinpointing problems, and speculation on the origin and cause of the problem.

3 Second language syllabi

3.1 THE DIFFERENT SCHOOLS OF SYLLABUS DESIGN.

Stern (1984:10-11) identifies three schools:

3.1.1 The Lancaster School represented by Candlin and Breen. They regard the syllabus as open and negotiable between teacher and learner.

3.1.2 The London School — Widdowson and Brumfit represent this school. They regard the syllabus as necessary, however they hasten to add that latitude should be given to the teacher to innovate.

3.1.3 The Toronto School — Yalden and Allen are its most famous representatives. This school adds the social dimension to a syllabus, in addition to the teacher and pupil.

3.2 BROAD AND NARROW SYLLABI

Nunan (1989:5) defines broad and narrow syllabi as follows:

The narrow view draws a clear distinction between syllabus design and methodology. Syllabus design is seen as being concerned essentially with the selection and grading of content, while methodology is concerned with the selection of learning tasks and activities. Those who adopt a broader view question this strict separation, arguing that with the advent of communicative language teaching the distinction between content and tasks is difficult to sustain.

Using the above definitions as a means of classification, one would classify the three schools as follows:
3.2.1 *The Lancaster School* is broad. Candlin's definition typifies the attitude:

We might ask whether it is possible to separate so easily what we have been calling content from what we have been calling method and procedure, or indeed whether we can avoid bringing evaluation into the debate?

Candlin (1984:32)

3.2.2 *The London School* will be classified narrow. The following would be a typical definition:

... the syllabus is simply a framework within which activities can be carried out: (a teaching device to facilitate learning). It only becomes a threat to pedagogy when it is regarded as absolute rules for determining what is to be learned rather than points of reference from which bearings can be taken.

Widdowson (1984:26)

3.2.3 *The Toronto School*: It can be considered a synthesis or compromise between the Lancaster and London Schools:

... curriculum is a very general concept which involves consideration of the whole complex of philosophical, social and administrative factors which contribute to the planning of an educational programme. Syllabus, on the other hand, refers to that sub-part of the curriculum which is concerned with a specification of what units will be taught (as distinct from how they will be taught, which is a matter of methodology). Allen (1984:61)

Broad and narrow syllabi in themselves have no intrinsic value. The value of a syllabus is determined by its appropriateness within a context.

3.3 PROCESS AND PRODUCT SYLLABI

A process syllabus gives emphasis to the process or means by which language is acquired, viz: mastery of communication skills.

A product syllabus focuses on the end or final product of a language learning/teaching situation. [See Nunan (1989:27-60) for a detailed discussion.]

Process and product can be seen as the means and end respectively on the road to language competency. Every process must end in a product, if the process is to be of any value, and no product is possible without a process. The difference is one of emphasis. Language syllabi, especially poetry in this instance, should tackle the acquisition of two competencies:

3.3.1 A linguistic competence to interpret;
3.3.2 A communicative competence to articulate the interpretation.

However, process and product derive their value from what they offer within a particular
language context. The table provided tabulates the most significant characteristics so that an appropriate choice of a syllabus can be made within a given circumstance.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Process</th>
<th>Product</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge and skills are gained through the learning process.</td>
<td>Knowledge and skills are a product of instruction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real chunks of language are used to illustrate grammatical usage, in order to contextualize it. For example: “What did you do last night?” Response would imply use of the past tense.</td>
<td>Emphasis is given to theoretical and synthetic items of content, e.g. grammar. The past tense as a separate discreet item may form the content of a lesson, rather than its use in a real context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theoretical knowledge is second order, real language usage is first order. Grammatical items are taught incidentally.</td>
<td>Theoretical knowledge, e.g. grammar figures of speech etc. are usually first order activities, i.e. taught first.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The distinction between content and method is often blurred by emphasis on the actual learning process.</td>
<td>A clear distinction is drawn between content and methodology. Method ensures the means of acquiring the product, i.e. mastery of content.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives describe activities designed to develop skills needed to carry out product objectives.</td>
<td>Objectives describe what learners will be able to do as a result of instruction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment is an ongoing process. Examination could be part of the process but not the entire process.</td>
<td>Assessment depends on one final product, viz: the examination.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.3(a)

The specification of process and product aims and objectives are not mutually exclusive. Process specifies the means and product the end. It could be argued that any comprehensive and relevant syllabus needs to take what is appropriate for the context in which it will operate from both process and product. In the final analysis it is the ingenuity and competency of the teacher who actualizes methodology, rather than just the syllabus, that determines whether or not that syllabus will develop the capacity for communication, growth, and enrichment. In other words the success of a syllabus depends largely on the curriculum in which it functions.
1 The D.E.T. Syllabus

The D.E.T. syllabus will now be discussed in the light of the preceding discussion on second language syllabi. This will enable one to:

1.1 Assess the appropriateness of the D.E.T. syllabus within KwaZulu/Natal;
1.2 Categorize the D.E.T. syllabus in terms of second language syllabi;
1.3 Give attention to the poetry section of the D.E.T. syllabus taking into account the above.

[See Appendix II for D.E.T. Syllabus]

1.1 The D.E.T. syllabus functioned under constraints which did not allow for optimum implementation and realization of its aims and content. The most significant constraints affecting implementation in KwaZulu/Natal were:

1.1.1 A generally negative attitude towards the D.E.T. as an oppressive, beaurocratic mechanism of the apartheid regime evidenced in the repeated and prolonged school boycotts before April 1994.

1.1.2 Poor facilities in Black Schools especially lack of books, classrooms, and in some instances electricity and running water, in rural areas.

1.1.3 Inadequately trained teachers, especially in rural areas. The scenario of African teacher qualifications in KwaZulu/Natal is as follows:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Qualified</td>
<td>6.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unqualified</td>
<td>19.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Underqualified</td>
<td>74.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Krig & Scott (1994:98)

1.1.4 High pupil teacher ratio ranging from 34 to 37:1; 38 to 49:1 and 50 to 59:1 over the different areas of KwaZulu/Natal.

Krig & Scott (1994:30)

1.2 Against the background of second language syllabi the D.E.T. syllabus can be classified a narrow, product syllabus. It is narrow in the sense that it separates content and methodology, the syllabus outlines the parameters within and with which the teacher should work, guided by the primary aim of the syllabus, viz:

As the over-riding concern of this syllabus is communicative competence for personal, social, educational and occupational purposes, it aims: . . .

D.E.T. Syllabus (1985:2)

The syllabus takes for granted that the teacher is already acquainted with communicative
language teaching, even down to the details of marking procedure:

The communicative aims of the syllabus imply positive marking and a concern with what is successfully communicated. D.E.T. Syllabus (1985:7)

This assumption of teacher competency may not be frequently realized in practice. [See Walters and England (1988:226-235) for teacher training in TESOL.]

However, if curriculum designers were sensitive to the constraints mentioned they would have opted for a more process oriented syllabus which would offer more direction without being prescriptive. There could, however, have been constraints that forced education planners to opt for a product syllabus. Some of the better known constraints are:

1.2.1 Inadequate facilities;
1.2.2 Inadequately trained teachers;
1.2.3 High pupil teacher ratio;
1.2.4 Lack of funds from the central government, before 1994, to address these shortcomings.

Perhaps for these reasons a product syllabus that is examination oriented was opted for:

The requirements for the Std 9 and 10 examination are specified below. All tests and examinations must be designed to assess how far the stated objectives of the course have been attained. D.E.T. Syllabus (1985:7)

The continuous assessment recommended by most process syllabi would not have been easy to implement, given the constraints mentioned above.

In the final analysis no syllabus would have been adequate as the social and political inequalities created abnormally difficult problems. Fundamentally, therefore, the D.E.T. syllabus was a syllabus functioning in an abnormal society and learning/teaching situation, which the syllabus itself was powerless to change.

Poetry does not appear as a separate area of study in the syllabus, and perhaps consequently, does not have a separate or explicit set of aims. The teacher is expected to decide which of the general aims is applicable to poetry. As poetry is classified as a sub-section of reading in the syllabus, it is likely that the teacher will be guided by the following general aims:

... to guide pupils towards reading with increasing comprehension, enjoyment and discrimination. D.E.T. Syllabus (1985:2)

This aim has to be guided by the primary aim, viz:

... communicative competence for personal, social, educational and occupational purposes. D.E.T. Syllabus (1985:2)

The syllabus does not explicate on what is meant by communicative competence.
The NEPI Report on Language (1992:PX) defines communicative competence as follows:

Language competence which includes the alternatives and rules for appropriate choice between the many codes, registers and styles of a language.

All the aims of the syllabus should work towards the fulfilment of the primary aim of communicative competence. Therefore poetry is also guided by this concern. In order to achieve this, the D.E.T. syllabus, being a narrow syllabus, specifies WHAT is to be taught, assuming the teacher knows HOW to teach it. The syllabus specifies the number of poems/lines of poetry to be studied and the options opened in relation to other genres, viz: the novel, play and short story:

At least one work will be set in each of the following sections. Pupils are required to study ONE work from each of any two sections, i.e. TWO works in all.

Section 1: Drama
Section 2: Poetry (approximately 20 poems or 400 lines)
Section 3: Novel
Section 4: Open (This could include short stories, relevant prose).

D.E.T. Syllabus (1985:5)

The choice between the different genres, viz: drama, poetry, novel and short story is once again based on the assumption that it would be appropriately interpreted and effectively implemented. This assumption would not be reasonable within the context of most schools in KwaZulu/Natal. Most schools lack highly qualified and competent teaching staff. Usually highly trained teachers are concentrated in the urban and peri-urban areas in contrast to their lack in rural areas. The whole of KwaZulu/Natal has been captioned by the Education Atlas of South Africa as "Areas requiring urgent education intervention". [See Edusource Data News (1995:15)]

Most of the urban areas are regarded as "high need" while the rural areas are regarded as "very high need". When coupled with teacher training and familiarity with L2 methodology it can be appreciated why, according to Reid (1982:336), so few teachers in Black Schools choose the poetry option:

Less than half the questionnaire teachers had chosen the poetry option in the last three years and looking at it, I am surprised that any did.

The reason is perhaps to be sought in the confidence that a teacher requires in order to handle

---

1 National Education Policy Investigation, hereafter referred to as NEPI
subject matter, especially at matriculation level. Adequate qualification would militate in favour of teachers being confident, though this is not always a guarantee. According to Walters and England (1988:226) the qualification scenario in Black Schools appeared as follows:

... 45% of D.E.T. teachers had English III, 27% English I and 20% a third year college qualification.

Of the 45% mentioned as having English as a major subject it is not certain whether or not all of them are involved in actual teaching practice.

Acquaintance with L2 methods gives a brighter picture in terms of statistics:

When one turns to teacher training, a slightly more favourable D.E.T. picture emerges: although 48% C.E.D. teachers were currently working on L2 methodology alone, 23% reported a combination of L1 and "E.S.L." training. In contrast, 60% D.E.T. teachers reported specialist L2 training. Walters & England (1988:226)

Most of the training is received through in-service programmes or correspondence courses offered by both provincial colleges of education or non-government organizations, such as READ, SACHED, TUPS, ELTIC, ELET etc. The question arises as to why do these in-service courses not result in a spectacular change in pedagogical practices. The answer possibly lies in the attitude changes that are needed to implement new methodology. Teachers with innovative methods may find resistance to their ingenuity by principals and inspectors. And innovative principals and inspectors could be viewed by teachers as too demanding when they ask for changes in teaching methods. The resistance to change is still extremely strong and only persistence and time will gradually erode the dominance of outdated methods. So, in spite of a basic knowledge of L2 methods, old methods persist, as Lemmer (1987/88:232) reports:

'Reading-round-the-table' is still favoured by 67% of his D.E.T. sample, and 61% of C.E.D. teachers.

Also, what Mahood (1985:232) describes as the "equally arid method of line-by-line, teacher explication is still favoured by 90% of both groups".

Another reason that could be posited as to why such methods are used despite 60% of

---

1. As a major subject

2. As a first year university subject
teachers in the D.E.T. being acquainted with L2 methods and why none of it seems to spill over in practice can be found in the subject matter that is handled in L2 courses. More often than not L2 experts choose literature of a more contemporary nature in order to emphasize the value of their approach. However, the literature prescribed in D.E.T. schools does not succumb to such treatment. Poetry can be used as a specific example. The poems prescribed by the D.E.T. and the Sached anthology *Poetry of the People* vary greatly. [See Chapter 3 for detailed discussion.] It would take more than just acquaintance with the new methodology suggested by the Sached teacher guidelines for most teachers to be able to transfer expertise. Therefore even though government and non-government bodies have made strenuous efforts to change perceptions and pedagogy, no drastic changes have as yet emerged. To expect such changes would be improper given the time frame in which Black Education generally has come under the spotlight, as a matter of high priority, viz: ± 10 years.

It is therefore not surprising, to find that despite all the changes, many teachers in Black Schools still find the poetry option a daunting one. This, in the opinion of the researcher, lies not with the syllabus, but rather with the prescribed poems, classroom methodology and the manner of assessment.

2 Prescribed poems
An interesting feature of the D.E.T. prescribed literature, including poetry, is that it has provoked much thought, debate and controversy. This has generated literature on the prescribed works most of which is highly critical. However, this literature could serve as a resource for future education planners. The D.E.T. seldom ever implemented the suggestions made by those critics. Some of the leading critics of the D.E.T. were:

2.1 Hartshorne (1970:67-79) argued for the use of abridged texts and reading only for enjoyment. He suggested the omission of literature exams and their deferment until university. He felt that L2 Black pupils were ill-equipped and the exams would be an unfair test.

2.2 Rive (1980:5-8) posited the three concentric circles theory to accommodate indigenous literature, and literature from abroad.

2.3 Reid (1982:266-268) a more flexible approach to prescription, viz: allowing a wide range of setbooks from which teachers could choose, as well as a more liberal approach to exams.

2.4 Mawasha (1982:17) emphasized sensitivity to Black pupils' feelings, awareness of literary merit as well as relevance to the socio-political situation in South Africa.

2.5 Gilfillan (1984:268-270) highlighted significance and relevance; which meant indigenous
writing should be prescribed in early secondary school as relevant; and works of literary significance or merit in later secondary school.

2.6 Walters and England (1988:273-275) suggest participation of all interested parties in the selection of prescribed works, ranging from pupils, teachers, parents and the community. To achieve this they suggest a series of informal committees nation-wide in a tier system until what reaches the top by this process is in fact a selection that originated from the pupil, teacher and parent. This selection by consensus poses logistical problems, but has promise as a starting point for a democratic process of selection. Perhaps implementation of this process may lead to further refinement and the emergence of a satisfactory process of selection in the future.

However, thus far, no finality has as yet been arrived at as to a pedagogically sound, just and interesting manner of prescribing books for L2 pupils in South Africa. Researchers and education planners could benefit from an awareness of the shortcomings of the D.E.T. prescribed works and poems in particular. One could begin by seeing whether or not the D.E.T. poetry selection is guided by the generally proven and accepted principles of TESOL theory. The following would be the most relevant for our purposes:

a. Poems should be interesting, pleasurable and useful to the age group for which they are intended, to encourage further reading and the development of a reading culture. Mawasha (1982:17) comments:

   When Blacks dropped the oral tradition they did not pick up the reading tradition to an equal degree.

b. The selection should be guided by the reading age and intellectual development of the pupils.

c. Poems with a universal appeal, depth of meaning, understandable language and idiom should be prescribed to excite response and interaction.

d. However, literary discourse uses language differently from ordinary discourse. This is perhaps more applicable to poetry than to any other genre of literature. [See Widdowson (1985:185-187).] Therefore one should guard against prescribing poems that do not truly reflect the nature of the genre, viz: poetry. Poems should reveal the communicative potential of a language, how common words can be used in creative ways to say uncommon and unusual things; or give a new dimension to the mundane. Poems that require no perception or skill to access are an insult to the average L2 pupil.

e. It should provide information, guidance and knowledge that dovetails with the schemata (background knowledge) of the pupil. Therefore a theme or some
discernible pattern of selection that would link with themes of other genres or even subjects would be desirable.

f. Care should be taken that the knowledge and information in poems provide opportunity for cognitive development and intellectual stimulation. The dovetailing of knowledge should not be construed as providing exposure to the familiar only; no increase in knowledge is then possible.

g. Poems should be seen to have personal as well as socio-cultural relevance. An overemphasis on the socio-cultural aspect during the Period of Struggle in South Africa should be seen as poetry harnessed for a special purpose, viz: the liberation struggle. In normal circumstances an overemphasis on socio-cultural aspects is counter productive to the cause of popularizing poetry. Poetry belongs to both inner and outer states of mind, it is the inner states that are common to all people and it is in the inner states, viz: feelings, emotions, joys and sorrows that the universality of poetry is found. Therefore only outer states, i.e. poems of socio-cultural relevance, should not be over emphasized. A balance should be sought between poems of social relevance and individual responses to feelings and emotions.

h. Poems should provide scope for critical and creative response, helping cognitive development and stimulating the intellect.

i. Poems should be of a reasonable length. The D.E.T. syllabus (1985:5) stipulates:

   Section 2: poetry (approximately 20 poems or 400 lines).

Lengthy poems are often not suitable for classroom interaction because they cannot be completed within an average period of ± 45 minutes.

j. Poems should represent the cultural diversity of the community from which the pupils are drawn. However, poems from cultures beyond the confines of community and nation should also be included. [See Rive (1980:5-8).]

The implementation of the above criteria in the selection of poems does not guarantee the success of the poetry curriculum because:

(i) Pupil response is subjective, unique and diverse.

(ii) There is no perfect formula by which success or failure can be quantified after poems have been prescribed.

(iii) Peer preferences and pressure, current literary and political trends, social and cultural identities, as well as pop culture also determine the success or popularity of a poem. If Coleridge's *Kubla Khan* became a favourite 'pop song' it is likely that the original poem would excite interest.
(iv) Lastly, no static, inflexible criteria can be applied which would automatically determine the suitability of a poem.

Below is the D.E.T. list of prescribed poems for November 1993 to June 1996 re-arranged to highlight the following:

- **Poet:** The name of the poet generally helps in determining what racial, national, cultural and gender assumptions one could expect in the poem.

- **Chronology:** This establishes the period to which the poet and poem belong. The period determines to a great extent the language use, especially vocabulary and idiom, as well as historical and cultural references.

- **Nationality (country):** Determines, among other aspects of a poem, relevance and cultural identification, and a sense of national pride and self-esteem.

- **Gender:** Measures the balance between male and female poets in the anthology.

- **Race:** Establishes whether or not there is equitable representation of the different racial (and cultural) groups in the anthology.

- **Length:** The length of the poem is important from the pedagogical viewpoint as classroom interaction is largely determined by the length of a poem.

- **Title:** The title of the poem is usually associated with the theme and is an indicator of the interest it may excite in the readers.
## D.E.T. Prescribed poems for Nov. 1993 to June 1996

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poet</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Nationality</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Length</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>W. Shakespeare</td>
<td>1504-1616</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Sonnet 116</td>
<td>14 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J Donne</td>
<td>1573-1631</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Death be Not Proud</td>
<td>14 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Byron</td>
<td>1788-1824</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>There is a Pleasure</td>
<td>18 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R Browning</td>
<td>1812-1889</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Meeting at night</td>
<td>12 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E Dickinson</td>
<td>1830-1886</td>
<td>American</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>The Train</td>
<td>16 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R Frost</td>
<td>1815-1963</td>
<td>American</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Mending Wall</td>
<td>45 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R Frost</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Road Not Taken</td>
<td>20 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L Untermeyer</td>
<td>1885-1977</td>
<td>American</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Portrait of a Machine</td>
<td>14 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W Owen</td>
<td>1893-1918</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>The Send-Off</td>
<td>20 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W Owen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Anthem for Youth</td>
<td>14 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W Owen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Futility</td>
<td>14 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alan Paton</td>
<td>1903-1988</td>
<td>S.African</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>The Hermit</td>
<td>32 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S Smaith</td>
<td>1903-</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Pylons</td>
<td>17 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L Macneice</td>
<td>1907-1963</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Jigsaw 111</td>
<td>18 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Delius</td>
<td>1916-</td>
<td>S.African</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>The Gamblers</td>
<td>12 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G Okaro</td>
<td>1921-</td>
<td>Nigerian</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Piano and Drums</td>
<td>29 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J Kirkup</td>
<td>1923-</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Thunder and Lightening</td>
<td>8 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ted Hughes</td>
<td>1930-</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Thought Fox</td>
<td>24 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ted Hughes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Hawk in the Rain</td>
<td>20 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D Livingstone</td>
<td>1932-</td>
<td>S.African</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Lake Morning in Autumn</td>
<td>21 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D Livingstone</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sunstrike</td>
<td>16 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D Livingstone</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>To a Dead Elephant</td>
<td>16 lines</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2(a)

Poets and Poems:  
No of Poets : 16  
No of Poems : 22
The table below indicates the distribution for the (November 1993 - June 1996) prescribed works.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nationality</th>
<th>No of Poets</th>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>No of Poems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Black</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African (not S. African)</td>
<td>1 = 6%</td>
<td>1 = 6%</td>
<td>1 = 6%</td>
<td>1 = 5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South African</td>
<td>3 = 19%</td>
<td>3 = 19%</td>
<td>3 = 19%</td>
<td>5 = 23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English (British)</td>
<td>9 = 56%</td>
<td>9 = 56%</td>
<td>9 = 56%</td>
<td>12 = 54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.S.A. (American)</td>
<td>3 = 19%</td>
<td>3 = 19%</td>
<td>1 = 6%</td>
<td>2 = 13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>16 = 100%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2(b)

Of the twenty two poems prescribed, one is African (Nigerian), five South African, twelve English, and four American. Representation is then as follows:

African + South African = 28%

English + American = 72%

However the South African poems are written by White South Africans:

The Hermit — Alan Paton
The Gamblers — Anthony Delius
Lake Morning in Autumn — Douglas Livingstone
Sunstrike — Douglas Livingstone
To a Dead Elephant — Douglas Livingstone

Black South African poetry does not feature in the selection. An accurate percentage of poems with a Eurocentric perspective would be:

English and American and South African = 54% + 18% + 23% = 95% of poems.

Per se, poems with a Eurocentric perspective and even bias are not to be excluded. However, a great preponderance of such poems in the socio-political situation in South Africa (between November 1993 and June 1996) shows a lack of sensitivity about the racial polarisation. Further, basic TESOL principles would militate against such an unfair weighting especially in regard to the socio-historical and cultural milieu. Assessed against one of the basic criteria of TESOL, viz: relevance to the target group, in this instance L2 Black matriculants, the
selection appears extremely unsuitable. This is further aggravated by the fact that the prescribed anthology *The Wind at Dawn* contains poems by reputable Black South African poets, viz: Mafika Gwala, Oswald Mtshali, Mongane Serote and Chris van Wyk. Pupils and teachers would interpret their exclusion as a deliberate attempt to deny them exposure to those poets. Such a selection can at best only elicit an indifferent or apathetic response, if the teacher decides to take the poetry option.

The November 1993 to June 1996 selection and percentage distribution cannot be interpreted as a one-off occurrence. The percentage distribution of the November 1990 to June 1993 selection indicates a similar pattern.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nationality</th>
<th>No of Poets</th>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>No of Poems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African (not S.African)</td>
<td>3  = 15%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>3 = 15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South African</td>
<td>4  = 20%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>4 = 20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English (British)</td>
<td>11 = 55%</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>11 = 55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.S.A. (American)</td>
<td>2 = 10%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>2 = 10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>20 = 100%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>20 = 100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2(c)

No of poets = 20
No of poems = 20

[See Appendix 3A for the list of prescribed poems for November 1990 to June 1993.]

Of the twenty poems prescribed, three are African, four South African, eleven English and two American.

Representation is as follows:

- African and South African = 15 + 20 = 35%
- English and American = 55 + 10 = 65%
- Total = 100%

Once again all the South African poems are written by White South Africans:

*Seed* — Herman Charles Bosman
*The Hermit* — Alan Paton
*Sunstrike* — Douglas Livingstone
*Pieta* — Guy Butler

Black South African poets were excluded.
Therefore, poems from a Eurocentric view would be English + American + South African

Eurocentric poems = 11 + 2 + 4 = 17

% = 55% + 10% + 20% = 85%

Total = 85% of poems

**Chronology (Date):** The first ten poems (1 - 11) of the November 1993 to June 1996 selection belong to the sixteenth, seventeenth, eighteenth, nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Most of the poems are written in an English now considered archaic or use highly poetic and idiomatic language that would present difficulty even to an L1 student. Mkhize (1991:26) corroborates:

Many prescribed poems are simply too difficult, too long and too remote for the majority of pupils to be able to enjoy and appreciate. Even teachers find them difficult.

Even the last eleven poems (11 - 22), though twentieth century, are not devoid of similar lexical complexities. The following poems are unlikely to be understood or appreciated by L2 pupils without extensive and intensive teacher intervention, especially as transmitter, because of the language usage:

- Sonnet 116 — W Shakespeare
- Death be not Proud — J Donne
- Pylons — Stanley Snaith
- Jigsaw 111 — L Macneice
- Lake Morning in Autumn — Douglas Livingstone
- Sunstrike — Douglas Livingstone

**Nationality (country of origin):** The selection is unlikely to appeal to L2 Black matriculants because of a strong Eurocentric bias. Not only are Black South African poets excluded, but the bias is exercised at the expense of a more balanced representation of poems representing local cultural and racial diversity as well as other cultures from abroad. Selections that do not contain local Black South African poetry have implicit in them a value judgement about the worth of such poetry. This is considered to be an affront to the national pride of Black South Africans and the Black child’s self-esteem, especially because there are so many reputable, contemporary Black poets.

**Gender:** The gender balance in a poetry selection may not be always possible to achieve. However, an imbalance of 7% female to 93% male (November 1990 - June 1993) can in some way be narrowed. Historically, poetry and writing has been an exclusively male domain. Lockett (1988:44-51) called it “The Men’s Club”. However, the situation is now changed and
changing, poetry selections should reflect such a shift from exclusive male dominance.

**Race:** Although South African poets appear in the selection, they are White South Africans. To Black South African pupils this becomes an issue and a contention, especially as no Black poets are featured in the selection. The issue should not be Black and White but a matter of principle; a basic TESOL principle that ensures an equitable selection of poetry, both indigenous as well as foreign, for relevance to L2 pupils, literary merit and other educative values. This principle should be agreed upon by consensus and understood by all concerned parties.

**Length:** All poems in the selection are of an acceptable length. This is a strong point of the selection.

**Themes:** (as indicated by title in Table 2a): Most of the poems would not appeal to L2 Black matriculants for the following reasons:

- Remote in time and place as indicated by the chronology of the poems and nationality of the poets.
- Lack of cultural continuity and identification as indicated by the themes as well as cultural and historical references.
- Not relevant to Black pupils as they are removed from their experience and understanding of life.
- As to providing vicarious experience, the selection may not always be welcomed or appreciated: because it could be viewed by L2 Black matriculants as a selection that is top-down, unfair and perhaps with a hidden agenda.

The poems are discussed in greater detail in Chapter 3, in the section on the choosing of poems according to readability, especially the section entitled *The Method of Selection*. The characteristics of the D.E.T. prescribed poems mentioned above would make them part of what Protherough (1983: 5-16) calls “a broken-back curriculum”. Among other characteristics the following would be prominent features of such a curriculum:

- Failure to recognize different modes of response according to age and maturity.
- A product syllabus and an examination oriented curriculum which allows no scope for personal response, defeating one of the stated and accepted aims of literature study, viz: enjoyment and personal growth and development. According to a survey quoted by Protherough (1983: 5-16) teachers consider personal or affective functions to be most important, curricular functions such as language to be second and the critical functions to be of least importance.
- The reading of poems just for exams without personal involvement or enrichment
Protherough (1983: 5-16) calls “impoverished reading”. This constitutes the greatest single problem in the teaching of literature in KwaZulu Natal Schools, the gulf between the response the teachers say they value viz: pleasure, enjoyment, enrichment and that which their pupils give in the examination, which is usually stereotyped responses or reproduction of study-aids, making it a wasted effort.

However, the success or failure of a curriculum depends largely on teacher enthusiasm and classroom methodology. Methodology will now be discussed as another important factor in the poetry curriculum.

3 Classroom methodology

Methodology used in poetry teaching is determined by the following:

3.1 Syllabus

3.2 Teacher training, and methodology (i.e. ideological stance, socio-cultural background, motivation etc.)

3.3 Pupil teacher ratio and relationships.

3.4 Pupil response.

3.1 SYLLABUS

The D.E.T. Syllabus (1985:2) is explicit in its aim, viz: “communicative competence”. However, the choice of the prescribed poems seems to have been made without the aim of the syllabus in mind. No reasons for the choice are given in the syllabus. There are no pedagogical justifications nor methodological underpinnings. This leaves the teacher free to choose a methodology that would realize the aim, viz: communicative competence. However teachers almost always are under pressure to pay more attention to the examination than the aim of the syllabi. Long exposure, by teacher, pupil and society in general to product type, examination oriented syllabi have conditioned them to accept the examination results as the acid test of the success or failure of pedagogical practice and classroom methodology. This has resulted in the examination becoming the primary aim of the syllabus in the mind of both teacher and pupil.

The question now arises, whether or not teachers are capable of fulfilling the aim of enabling pupils to pass the examination. Many other factors combine to determine this and poetry alone is not responsible for results. However, the use of the examination as a criterion is an easy enough option for most critics, but at the same time it is an option that has deeper implications than one would immediately suspect. It calls in question the nature of knowledge, the purpose of the methodology and its effectiveness. For examinations, being the final portion of a 'product syllabus', seldom examines and evaluates the affective, personal and emotional dimension of pupils. The affective dimension, according to most teachers, is the most important aspect as it endures long after pupils have left the classroom and it is the dimension
which should make poetry an ongoing quest. The present system of examination does not
cater for this type of assessment so it would be safe to assume that the aim of the syllabus and
the examination is to ensure that the pupil will pass.

This in itself is not a negative aim, but the manner in which it is accomplished does not always
conform to the best pedagogic practices. Teachers, according to research in D.E.T. schools by
Walters and England (1988:226), resort to the following:

3.1.1 line by line explication
3.1.2 round the table/class reading
3.1.3 rote learning
3.1.4 dependence on study-aids.

These strategies are employed by teachers to ensure that pupils pass. The use of interactive
strategies or strategies that are not examination oriented may perhaps cause pupils and parents
anxiety, especially as the examination is not designed to meet the requirements of a more
interactive and communicative methodology.

3.2 TEACHER TRAINING AND METHODOLOGY

The teacher qualification scenario in KwaZulu/Natal is as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualification</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Qualified</td>
<td>6.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unqualified</td>
<td>19.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Underqualified</td>
<td>74.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Krige & Scott (1994:98)

The figures indicate that in all probability most pupils would be exposed to unqualified or
underqualified teachers. The unqualified and underqualified teachers may not necessarily be
poor practitioners, and may even be more conscientious and amenable to change and
suggestions than their qualified counterparts. On the other hand no matter how good the
intentions of such teachers, their lack of exposure to teacher training denies them the
confidence that an effective teacher requires. Since these teachers do not have a teacher
training background, what surfaces is the socio-cultural background. This has many facets, the
position of the teacher in KwaZulu/Natal is closely interrelated to that of the cultural life of the
Zulu people. Traditional Zulu society is a predominantly patriarchal society in which the
following norms obtain:

3.2.1 Obedience to parents, elders, chiefs and persons in authority is obligatory for the child.

Teachers qualify as elders and persons in authority. Until unrest became endemic in
Black schools, most teachers expected unquestioning obedience from their pupils and
inflicted corporal punishment if obedience was lacking. However, the position of
authority occupied by the teacher has been seriously eroded during the unrest of the
apartheid era.

3.2.2 A sense of belonging to a family, clan, tribe and community. The whole was more important than the part. The individual was expected to surrender his rights, if by so doing the community at large would benefit.

Therefore the most visible influences shaping teacher profiles in general, in KwaZulu/Natal would be:

(a) Norms of Zulu society
(b) Teacher training
(c) Lack of facilities or poor facilities
(d) General decline in discipline that used to obtain before school unrest began.

This brief description of the D.E.T./KwaZulu-Natal teachers at the macro level would help place in perspective why a certain pedagogy is implemented and why and how pupils react to it. Very little research has been done on teachers in Black education from the perspective of teaching TESOL in South Africa. Walters and England (1988:205) quote Macdonald (1987) as among the first actual researchers in the field, therefore the earliest relevant research is about ± 10 years old. This is important as it highlights the fact that only very recently has cognisance been taken of of the problems of inadequately trained L2 teachers and the serious implications it has, that far exceed the bounds of the classroom. We have the classroom practice and teacher training interacting to recreate similar teachers, as teachers tend to teach pupils in the same way they were taught. Thus a vicious cycle is set in motion, perpetuating poor pedagogic practices.

Thus an inadequately trained teacher with a narrow, product syllabus viz: D.E.T. syllabus, lacking other forms of guidance uses past examination papers and study-aids to help cope with the task. Walters and England (1988:208) using Barnes and Shemilt's (1974:213-228) classification of teachers, divides them into two broad groups, Transmission teachers and Interpretation teachers. Briefly, the two types could be characterised as follows:

i) The Transmission teacher feels she/he has a monopoly of knowledge and the right to dispense it, his/her authority to do so should be respected and not challenged, and that the examination results are an indication of his/her teaching ability. This mode of teaching is essentially coercive in the sense that the teacher transmits a body of received work and opinions.

ii) The Interpretation teacher is a partner in the search for knowledge, the classroom atmosphere is characterised by freedom rather than authority, and the holistic development of the pupil rather than the examination results is used as the yardstick of achievement. It is considered fundamentally subversive in the sense that pupils are empowered to critique.
Macdonald (1988:208) observed that the two teacher profiles are very sharply drawn and a radical shift to an interpretation model of teaching could create problems inside and outside the classroom. Macdonald (1988:213) observed that pupils preferred the Transmission teachers as they felt that the Interpretation teachers were not doing their work, which ostensibly was to dispense knowledge. Pupils felt that they should be told what to learn by the teacher who has knowledge:

Teachers, according to this view, should be like a strong electric light, shedding radiance on all around them: teachers who seek to implement more active, pupil-centred methods are dubbed "paraffin teachers" on account of the feeble light they shed for their pupils. [Macdonald (1988:213).]

She therefore recommends that a change in pedagogical practices should be effected by a gradual blurring of the sharp dividing lines, and posits a transitional model to bring this about.

Macdonald's observation indicates that a radical change in pedagogical practices means a radical change in society and consciousness, this is especially so when resistance to change comes from children, who become echoes for their parents' and society's values. This would call for a more integrated view of knowledge, a change in the relationship between society and educational institutions and the avoidance of a system of pedagogy which is calculated to become a self-fulfilling prophecy. As Freire (1971:122) says:

... the imposition on oppressed masses of the culture of a ruling class invalidates their own culture and leads to self-depreciation on the part of the oppressed, resulting from their adopting about themselves the opinion the oppressors hold of them.

Other extraneous, socio-political factors determining classroom interaction in Black schools is the language medium. It is not uncommon in many Black schools to have part, if not the entire English lesson conducted in Zulu. Although this may seem strange and pedagogically unsound as the target language is not used, this practice could be considered an expediency measure that often prevents a total breakdown in communication which could so easily occur considering the poor command of English that sometimes both teacher and pupil possess. Kauchali (1988:9):

Secondly, we must keep in mind that the poem we are going to teach is an English piece and the medium of instruction at our schools is also English. Therefore, we must not start our lesson in vernacular or switch over to vernacular during our English lesson.

Other factors that contribute to bad pedagogical practices, poor classroom interaction and poor performance in the examination are, according to Walters and England (1988:224):

- classroom overcrowding
• lack of prescribed books
• poorly equipped libraries
• lack of audio-visual material.

It is against this backdrop that one should consider teacher methodologies and classroom pedagogy in a typical D.E.T./KwaZulu-Natal school. The teacher that will be constantly referred to in the discussion, is a prototype of the Transmission model. This generalisation is necessary for purposes of discourse, but it should be borne in mind that in practice teachers often exhibit both Transmission and Interpretation modes.

It is in this pedagogical ambience that poetry, if not literature itself, has to fight for its survival. The aims of the D.E.T. Syllabus would suggest a more pupil-centred pedagogical practice:

Teachers must create a climate within which pupils can use English with interest, purpose and enjoyment. D.E.T. Syllabus (1985:2)

This does not imply that teachers should abdicate facilitating a literary awareness among their pupils. This awareness is even more important in poetry, because poetry is the most condensed of the literary genres. Brumfit (1987:186) corroborates the teacher’s role:

None the less, language use requires recognition of the density of allusion that humanity is capable of and that any language exploits. All users of language share this common basis and it is from this that a specifically literary education must develop.

Brumfit (1987:188-190) posits a simple pedagogical model for literature teaching, his model will form the basis for assessment of the classroom practice in D.E.T./KwaZulu-Natal schools. The salient points of Brumfit’s model modified to facilitate poetry learning (rather than literature) is listed below:

- An holistic approach to the teaching of poetry rather than a linear approach.
- The pupil should be able to relate the literary text to other schemata and make inferences from the text.
- The techniques in poetry teaching should assist in developing an holistic, mature reading process and the development of inferential skills.
- That poetry is studied, not to provide knowledge but to sharpen perception and facilitate understanding — simply it should aid the cognitive development of the pupil.
- Poetry should be made enjoyable as it is also read for pleasure.
- Poetry should be related to life and the teacher should facilitate the pupil’s awareness that poetry reflects general themes that have a universal appeal and applicability.

The acquisition of the above skills requires exposure to TESOL literature and adequate
training both of which is lacking in a large measure in D.E.T./KwaZulu-Natal schools and perhaps generally as TESOL teaching is a relatively new discipline, approximately 25 years old. The dichotomy between the prescribed poems and the aims of the syllabus serve to accentuate the dilemma of the inadequately trained L2 teacher. As the teacher finds little specific guidance from the syllabus, teachers and pupils alike resort to past examination question papers and study-aids to fill the hiatus created by a narrow product syllabus.

The Department could supplement the syllabus with specific and relevant guidelines. This would obviate the necessity for pupil/teacher dependence on study-aids which have become a thriving industry. Poems become more important than poetry, the vision becomes linear rather than holistic: the study-aid is not a poem, in as much as a handful of petals is not a flower, the vision of poetry is destroyed. This destruction is caused by an overemphasis on examination and standards which is basically the casting of all minds in a uniform mould. Pupils feel there is a fixed way to respond to poetry, the uniform responses given in classroom interaction, assignments and examinations is proof of that claim. Often pupils pass an examination without having engaged themselves with the actual poem but through memorisation of the study-aid.

This practice narrows the creative vision of the pupil, the multi-dimensional nature of poetry, its capacity for even new interpretation, and its ability to enliven the senses and stimulate communication is completely lost. The examination, the teacher's connivance at the use of study-aids and the lack of sufficient stimulus create an ambience which is stifling to the pupil's creative impulses. [See Smith, M. Van Wyk (1990:7) in Wright, L (ed) *Teaching English Literature in South Africa*]

Pupils should be exposed to poetry so that they may have space to develop poems of their own, not memorise study-aids or paraphrase the teacher or passively listen. This diatribe against study-aids is aimed at the commercially based ones. Study-aids with a pedagogical base can do much to help the quality of learning/teaching. The INSET 1820 FOUNDATION PUBLICATIONS based in Grahamstown is a good example of an institution that produces guides with a pedagogical base. Their recent release of "Teaching 40 poems from *The Wind at Dawn*" is a helpful guide to inadequately trained teachers and a good resource for adequately trained teachers.

Providing guidance to teachers, from pre-reading activities to post reading activities, in using the communicative approach in teaching the prescribed poems for D.E.T. schools required considerable thought and insight on the part of the authors, as many of the poems did not have contemporary appeal that would easily lend itself to communication. This has provided much needed assistance even for examinations.
4 Examinations (Assessment)

Seemingly one of the most important aims of the syllabus is the examination because the final section of the syllabus is specifically aimed at the examination:

The requirements for the Std. 9 and 10 examination are specified below. All tests and examinations must be designed to assess how far the stated objectives of the course have been attained. D.E.T. Syllabus (1985:7)

The persistence of the examination system in South Africa, and particularly in KwaZulu/Natal schools in the face of more recent methods of continuous assessment based on process syllabi is usually justified by reference to the following:

4.1 High pupil teacher ratios in KwaZulu/Natal. [See Krige & Scott (1994:30.)]

4.2 Lack of highly trained teacher core to implement process type syllabi [See Krige & Scott (1994:98) for figures].

4.3 Examinations are said to provide objective assessment as against continuous assessment which could be subject to abuse, dishonesty, partiality, favouritism and arbitrary assessment passed off as continuous assessment.

4.4 Lack of staff to monitor and guard against the above abuses that continuous assessment could be subject to.

4.5 General lack of infrastructure to cope with any alternative form of assessment to examinations that could ensure that the alternative procedure is viable, fair and dependable in its outcome.

4.6 Would universities, technikons, training colleges and industrial colleges as well as the private and public sectors accept and absorb matriculants who do not have a certificate that has the general uniformity of the matriculation examination as we know it?

4.7 Lastly, the question that is always asked by those in favour of the examination. What form of assessment would the examination, as we know it, be replaced by, that would be acceptable to all?

The economic power of the matriculation certificate and its necessity for upward mobility in an increasingly aggressive economic society has invested the matriculation examination and certificate with great power and in the case of the examination, great fear and anxiety also. This perception of society and its expectations has also imposed on the teacher and pupil the necessity to value the examination and the results above all other considerations. As Macdonald (1988:213) pointed out, the consciousness of society has to change before a
change in methodology is possible. Walters and England (1988:245) report the following concerns by Black Std. 9 and 10 teachers at in-service courses over a period of seven years:

The over-riding concern expressed orally throughout such courses (in question time or group work sessions) and in evaluation forms at the end, was the extent to which what was being offered on the course was either "likely to be asked in the exams" or more generally — "would help my pupils in the exams".

This obsession with the examination is carried into every facet of life in the classroom including the teaching of literature and in particular, in this instance, poetry. The examination is given priority at the outset. The teacher is expected by society and the pupil to teach for the purposes of the examination. In other words the teacher is expected to function in the transmission mode. The syllabus states explicitly the number of poems or lines of poetry that the pupil will be examined on. The lasting impression is that what is required in the examination is the content of specific poems, a prose rendition of poetry. Pupils are therefore taught poems rather than poetry. This is corroborated by the syllabus, methodology and the examination. The syllabus makes no mention of the techniques poets use to write poetry, the necessity of inspiration, the place of poets in society and the possibility of every person being a poet though not necessarily a famous poet. This ambience is necessary for teaching poetry (not poems).

As Widdowson (1983:103) points out, the study of poetry presupposes that people are already skilled in reading poetry. The syllabus offers no guidance on how poetry is to be taught apart from the long-term aims: the syllabus merely states the number of poems or lines to be studied and the marks allocated for the poetry section. Teachers then resort to study-aids and particularly past examination question papers to prepare their pupils for the examination.

Usually the examination requires nothing more than a lexical analysis of the poems. Pupils are not allowed to display how they can manipulate their understanding of the poem to communicate for a particular purpose or merely enhance the quality of communication. The 'over-riding concern' of communicative competence is overlooked. An analysis of the November 1992/1993/1994 examination questions on poetry reveals a bias for questions of a lexical and content nature rather than questions that would allow pupils to display their communicative competence, or personal appreciation as response to the poems.

The analysis will be carried out using the question paper analysis of the D.E.T. examiners.

The analysis that follows is based on the examiner's reports as received from the D.E.T. for Nov. 1992/1993/1994.
November 1992 English 2nd Language Higher Grade, Paper III (Literature)

The analysis below is based on Section B: THE WIND AT DAWN.

Questions 1-14 are based on *Death be not proud* by John Donne

Questions 15-20 on *Throwing a tree* by Thomas Hardy.

[See Appendix 4A for poems and questions.]
The analysis below is based on Section B: THE WIND AT DAWN.
Questions 1-10 are based on Anthem for doomed youth by Wilfred Owen.
Questions 11-21 on The thought fox by Ted Hughes.
[See Appendix 4B for poems and questions.]
November 1994 2nd Language Higher Grade, Paper III (Literature)

The analysis below is based on Section B: THE WIND AT DAWN.

Questions 1-14 are based on Futility by Wilfred Owen.

Questions 15-21 are based on Meeting a night by Robert Browning.

[See Appendix 4C for poems and questions]
The table below combines the items listed in the November 1992/3/4 examination in an attempt to determine to what extent the pupils' response to poetry is really tested. This is done by how many questions deal with structural items and how many with student response.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ITEMS TESTED IN DET POETRY EXAMS</th>
<th>NO. OF QUESTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nov. 92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alliteration</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cohesion (Voc. inference to)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comprehension</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content (Sense)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deduction (from content)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discourse</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implication</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metaphor (analogy)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personification</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tone</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sense (main idea, meaning, logic)</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Synonyms (variation of vocabulary)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocabulary</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL NO. OF QUESTIONS</strong></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4(a)

*N.B. Question 11 in the Nov. 94 examination was deleted. See item analysis bar graph.

The weighting of questions in terms of percentages appears as follows:

**November. 1992 — Percentage distribution of questions**

Lexical questions  =  Cohesion + Synonyms + Voc.
                   =  1 + 2 + 7
                   = 10
%  =  10/20
    = 50%

Figures of Speech  =  0

Understanding of Content (Sense)  =  Comprehension and Implications and Sense
                                  =  1 + 3 + 6
                                  = 10
                                  = 10/20
                                  = 50%

Personal Response  =  0

The total percentage of questions on poetry for Nov. 1992 was therefore made up of

50%  questions of a lexical nature
50%  based on content
100%
### November 1993 — Percentage distribution of questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Questions Representation</th>
<th>Total Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lexical questions</td>
<td>3 + 1 + 1</td>
<td>= 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figures of speech</td>
<td>Alliteration + Personification + Metaphor + Tone</td>
<td>= 5/21 = 24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content questions</td>
<td>Background + Comprehension + Implication + Sense</td>
<td>= 2 + 1 + 2 + 6 = 11/21 = 52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal response</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total percentage of questions</strong></td>
<td>Lexical + Figures of speech + content + Personal Response</td>
<td>= 24 + 24 + 52 + 0 = 100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### November 1994 — Percentage distribution of questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Questions Representation</th>
<th>Total Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lexical questions</td>
<td>Vocabulary</td>
<td>= 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figures of Speech</td>
<td>Metaphor</td>
<td>= 5/20 = 30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content</td>
<td>Background + Deduction + Discourse + Sense</td>
<td>= 4 + 1 + 1 + 3 = 9/20 = 45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal response</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>Lexical + Figures of Speech + Content + Personal Response</td>
<td>= 30 + 25 + 45 + 0 = 100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Average percentage distribution of questions for Nov. 92/93/94**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of questions</th>
<th>Nov. 92</th>
<th>Nov. 93</th>
<th>Nov. 94</th>
<th>Ave. % (± 3)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lexical questions</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>= 35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figures of speech</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>= 16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content questions</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>= 49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal response questions</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>35 + 16 + 49 = 100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4(b)

Personal response questions — Nil

The implications of the above analysis are:

a. Content and lexical questions dominate the question paper. (35% + 49% = 84%)

b. Factual information is sought viz: content questions based on the poem, lexical questions testing vocabulary and figures of speech. No critical insight or fine appreciation is required. The absence of personal response questions is proof of this.

c. The extent to which the examination requires factual information is the extent to which that information will be taught or drilled in class in preparation for the examination. The practice of teaching poetry or rather poems as bits of information deviates from the definition of poetry and the aims and objectives of poetry teaching as stated in the 1985 D.E.T. syllabus viz: personal enjoyment and pleasure.
5. Speculations on questioning patterns in the November 92/93/94 poetry examination

5.1 Pupils do not possess the necessary linguistic ability to express their deeper appreciation. Hence the opting for contextual questions.

5.2 Pupils are better able to express their understanding by giving a one word answer or choosing the correct answer from a multiple choice. If, however, the pupils were expected to express their deeper appreciation given the general limitations of most L2 pupils, a totally misleading impression may be created of the pupils as incapable of understanding poetry in any form.

5.3 Pupils with serious language problems can articulate their understanding by the choice of the correct word or just through a one word answer. This obviates the necessity to penalize the pupil for grammatical and syntactical errors that may inevitably occur in more lengthy answers.

5.4 Contextual questions may have provided a better option to essay type questions that had fallen into one of the following stereotypes:

"Describe in detail why the poet ................................................”

or

"Give a clear and detailed account of the poem”

or

“Show how in your own words ................................................”

These essay questions more often than not require nothing more than a prose rendition of the poem.

5.5 Essay type questions in poetry, that usually required the poem be retold in prose led to dependence on Study-Aids that provided summaries of poems. The consequence of this practice was, and still is to a large extent, rote learning of the study aid’s summary and stereotyped answers in the examination. Contextual questions must therefore be assumed to be an attempt to avoid stereotypical answers that arise from a dependence on and regurgitation of study-aid notes.

5.6 Another reason for the choice of contextual type questions could be the objectivity they provide in relation to essay type answers. Examiners may have found that assessment varied greatly in essay type questions — considering the extremely subjective nature of the discourse. However, this did not obtain with contextual questions which made marking more objective, faster and easier for examiners.

5.7 Lastly, the opting for contextual type questions could be viewed as reluctance on the part
of examiners to accept essays in less formal types of English, e.g. People's English. This, however, is the subject of a lengthy debate that cannot be given sufficient attention here, but will be explored as a possibility in Chapter 4.

SECTION D

CONCLUSION OF CHAPTER 2

In conclusion it can be said that:

1. Firstly, the syllabus has as its aim communicative competence but the poems prescribed do not easily lend themselves to communication. Teachers still employ transmission style methodology and the examination ignores the affective dimension of pupils. Therefore it can be concluded that there exists a conflict of purposes between the syllabus, prescribed poems, methodology used and assessment in the form of the examination.

2. Secondly, change in prescribed poems should be immediate to cater for the now multicultural classroom. However, one should not expect immediate or drastic changes in methodology. A change in the consciousness and attitude of people generally will have to first take place in accepting a free society before a more open and interactive methodology becomes the norm.

3. Lastly, new methods of assessment will have to be found if poetry teaching is to become meaningful and pupils encouraged to continue reading and enjoying poetry.
CHAPTER 3

INTRODUCTION

The chapter will be divided as follows:

SECTION A. - METHOD OF RESEARCH

1 Aims of research
   1.1 Strategy of research
2 Justification of research methods.
   2.1 Why the structured interview for teachers
   2.2 Why the questionnaire for pupils
3 Rationale and method for the selection of poems in the questionnaire.
4 Reasons for the choice of locality in which the research was conducted.

SECTION B. - INTERPRETATION OF PILOT RESEARCH — SCHOOL A

SECTION C. - INTERPRETATION OF MAIN RESEARCH — SCHOOL B AND C

SECTION D. - CONCLUSION OF CHAPTER 3 (MAIN RESEARCH)

SECTION A.

METHOD OF RESEARCH

1 Aims of research

To explore the attitudes of L2 black matriculants to the poems prescribed by the D.E.T. for the period November 1993 to June 1996.

To arrive at some conclusions based on research that would perhaps offer guidance in the field of poetry teaching in the future, particularly as poetry appears problematic and unpopular.

To use the findings as a basis on which speculations about poetry programmes in the future classroom are made. Speculations that are guided by and are sensitive to the needs of the majority of the pupils, viz. L2 black pupils, with a background of an impoverished system of education.

To explore the possibilities that the research findings reveal as to the inclusion of indigenous, poetic genres (in translation) into the prescribed poems in schools and its likely impact on pupil attitudes and performance.

1.1 STRATEGY

The following strategy will be employed:

1.1.1 To interpret the research in the light of the literary, historical, political, social, cultural, economic and educational life of the L2 black pupil.

1.1.2 To reconcile the pupils' responses in the questionnaire to the teaching methodologies
prevalent in black schools in the teaching of poetry specifically and literature in general with the basic principles of TESOL.

1.1.3 To arrive as outlined in Chapter 2 at an acceptable explanation for pupils’ attitudes to poetry.

1.1.4 To explore the implications of the pupils’ attitudes and other research findings in Chapter 4.

2 Justification of research methods

2.1 WHY THE STRUCTURED INTERVIEW FOR TEACHERS?
The interview was selected as the best means of data collection for teachers as there were only three. The structured interview was most appropriate as only very specific information needed to be gathered, viz. the status of English as a subject at school. The purpose of the interview was not an in-depth study of any teacher’s perspective.

Also the information required from teachers of all three schools was the same, and a structured interview would ensure uniformity and save time. Uniformity of questioning would enable the researcher to make meaningful comparisons. The structured interview also helped to maintain some degree of objectivity. The following questions were asked at the interview:

Is English compulsory?

Is English encouraged?

Is English the medium of instruction?

Do you confirm the selection of poems in the questionnaire?

The teachers were given copies of the poems two weeks in advance. All questions asked were factual and the subjective element was reduced to a minimum. The teachers in all three schools responded positively to all questions and confirmed the selection of poems in the questionnaire. [See Hoinville and Jowell. (1989:90-104.)]

2.2 WHY THE QUESTIONNAIRE FOR PUPILS?
[See Appendix 1 for the pupil questionnaire.]

General reasons:

2.2.1 Written responses were required and for this the questionnaire was most suitable.

2.2.2 As schools were a convenient distance from the researcher and of easy access, the administration of the questionnaire was convenient.

2.2.3 In a questionnaire the mode and tempo of questioning is uniform for all respondents.

2.2.4 The time allocated is the same.

2.2.5 The administering of the questionnaire can be carefully monitored.
2.2.6 It can be administered to many pupils at once.

2.2.7 Pupils were told at the outset that they did not have to append their names to the questionnaire. This anonymity ensured a greater freedom and honesty in the answering of questions than would be expected in a face to face interview.

2.2.8 In an interview, the interviewer is seen as a stranger and an authority figure. This is aggravated if the interviewer is of another race, regardless of political changes, friendliness and social skills. A totally natural and honest response is seldom elicited. Pupils tend to give answers they feel the interviewer would like to hear.

2.2.9 Also, pupils at high school are almost always teenagers and they tend to be self-conscious, shy and sometimes reticent. Such mental and emotional states are hardly conducive to a successful interview which can easily degenerate into an interrogation.

2.3 SPECIFIC REASONS FOR CHOICE OF QUESTIONNAIRE

2.3.1 Some questions (Nos 1-6) required personal and private details which could be embarrassing in a face to face interview. The anonymity of the questionnaire allowed pupils to respond freely.

2.3.2 The quantity of information required by the questionnaire (Nos 7-10) viz. subjects taken, languages spoken, could be most easily accessed by the use of the questionnaire.

2.3.3 Many questions could be answered by just a tick or a cross in the appropriate place. For this the questionnaire is ideally suited.

2.3.4 Pupils needed to read four poems and to respond to these poems, the questionnaire was best suited for this purpose.

2.3.5 The questions on the poems required consideration which meant time, also written answers were expected. The questionnaire provides time for reflection without stress as well as room for written responses.

2.3.6 Questions 11.1-11.4 required pupils to decide for themselves by making definite choices concerning the poems, e.g. 11.3 and 11.4 the best and least liked poems. The questionnaire allows pupils to choose without extraneous influences. In an interview for instance, with the latitude it allows for interpretation, indecision and hesitation may prevail. Time is limited and a definite response is seldom obtained. Attempts to elicit a quick and definite response could appear coercive.

2.3.7 Lastly, pupils were expected to comment on the print and layout of the poems (No 11.8). This meant that they had to see the poems in print which made the questionnaire an obvious choice.
2.4 REASONS FOR THE DESIGN AND STRUCTURE

2.4.1 For all the above reasons, the questionnaire was opted for as the best means of gathering information in the given circumstances. The questionnaire was structured to facilitate the following:

a. Avoid long written answers which might inhibit or stifle a response because a pupil felt inadequate to respond in writing.

b. Also simple language and a response in the form of a tick in the appropriate place or just a word, was intended to place the pupil at ease.

c. Pupil response that required the minimum of literacy skills was deliberate, in order to eliminate the problem of accessing and interpretation of unclear language in answering the questionnaire. This was done, bearing in mind the problems pupils experience in the use of English as an L2.

d. It spared the researcher the burden of deciphering the language of respondents not proficient enough in the L2 (English).

e. Lastly, the simple design and structure of the questionnaire expedited the processing of the data.

3 Rationale and method of selection of poems

3.1 SOURCE

The poems were taken from the following sources:

3.1.1 The D.E.T. prescribed list of poems for the period November 1993 to June 1996. (See Chapter 2, page 83.) The poems are contained in the anthology called *The Wind at Dawn*.

3.1.2 The Sached 'poetry package' called *Poetry of the People*. The anthology includes teacher/pupil guidelines. For the purposes of this research *The Poetry of the People* will be referred to as the Sached anthology. [See Appendix 3C for the list of poems.] The Sached anthology contains contemporary local poetry (not only by black poets) and contemporary poetry from abroad. Teachers in informal discussions have attested to the success of this anthology in achieving interaction between pupil and poem and teacher and pupil. The aims of this anthology, as laid out in the guidelines, indicated that the Sached anthology attempts to fill what is considered to be a gap in poetry teaching, particularly in black schools.
3.1.3 Aims of the Sached selection.

*Poetry of the People* aims to:

a. Make poetry and other literature (e.g. novels, short stories, drama) enjoyable and interesting to pupils.
b. Help pupils to find a way of understanding poetry.
c. Reveal to pupils that poetry and literature are relevant to life, and particularly to their own lives in South Africa.
d. Show that poetry and literature need to be understood as coming out of the society in which they are written. They also play a role in the society.
e. Help pupils to better understand their prescribed poems.

Because the Sached anthology was compiled with an awareness of the state of poetry teaching at present, it was chosen to verify whether the often heard criticism that the D.E.T. prescribed poems are not relevant or contemporary enough is a valid criticism by comparison.

3.2 METHOD OF SELECTION

The researcher decided that two of the simplest poems from each list would be chosen for the questionnaire. It would not have been possible within the time limit of one hour to include more than four poems in total. Two of the simplest poems were opted for rather than any other combination because the researcher's 'professional intuition' indicated that two of the simplest would elicit the best response from pupils. In defining what is meant by 'simple' the researcher considered applying readability tests. However, there are problems in using readability tests in connection with poetry.

3.3 CHOOSING THE POEMS ACCORDING TO READABILITY

Readability can be defined in a number of ways, the various definitions, however, are always appropriate to a context. Below are two definitions of readability that are appropriate to the context in which the researcher views the phenomenon. The definitions cover the area and explain the term readability as used in this context.

(i) Readability is a term used to refer to the measurement of the approximate level of difficulty of written material. Edwards (1975:1)

(ii) ... an objective method of measuring several components of writing which, when considered in relation to each other, result in a quantitative estimate of the reading difficulty of the sample. Aukerman (1972:20)

The general definitions of readability become useful and important when contextualised within our current notions of the reading process. Two important current notions being the 'Bottom-Up' and the 'Top-Down' approaches, simply the 'Bottom-Up' process deals with the incoming message, and meaning is derived from a decoding of sounds, words, clauses and sentences.
The 'Top-Down' process uses what is already in the schemata during the reading process to derive meaning. So at a fairly surface level the two approaches to the reading process appear antithetical to each other. Both approaches have been criticised. Nunan (1989:22-45) sees both approaches as useful in the reading process. Smith (1978:101-146) rejects the 'Bottom-Up' in favour of the 'Top-Down'. Stanovich (1980:32-71) recommends an integration of both approaches. The criticism does not detract from the value of readability within certain contexts. However, the limitations of readability become obvious in areas of complex writing. Literature generally, with its highly figurative use of language, may be classified as a complex form of writing, and poetry even more so. The limitations of readability could, for the purposes of this research, be conveniently divided into two broad categories:

3.3.1 General limitations
3.3.2 Limitations specific to poetry.

3.3.1 General limitations

Klare (1975:62-102) says that there are more than fifty readability formulas in existence. The diversity of formulas is problematic in that scores from the different tests sometimes vary considerably. Researchers have often questioned why the scores vary so much, but it should be borne in mind that the scores are approximations, and complete accuracy is not possible. There exists an element of subjectivity that still eludes measurement. It is therefore advisable to use more than one formula although this is not always possible because of time constraints. Therefore researchers usually opt to use just one formula. Schuyler (1982:560-591) gave the following reply to this vexing question:

The answer is complicated, but one part of it is that most people who have used formulas in the past have used only one. It is simply too time consuming to compute more than one. Because of this, the wide variation in scores often was undetected. Formulas tend to give a false sense of accuracy. By computing more than one formula a valuable element of comparison is added. They do disagree, and some have better reputations than others.

Another basic criticism of 'readability formulas' would be the underpinning assumption (of the simpler formulas) that the level of difficulty can be measured in terms of length of words and/or sentences. Some of the more popular formulas are the Fry Graph and the Fog Index.

Fry (1968:513-516) popularized the Fry Graph as a time saving measure; and it is still very popular for assessing readability because it is highly rated and no formula is needed to apply it manually. The number of words and sentences per 100 words is plotted on graph lines which indicate grade levels. The Fog Index developed by Gunning (1968) is another popular readability formula because it can be applied manually. It has a reputation
for giving higher scores than other formulas. A probable explanation is that the Fog formula was designed to measure the level of comprehension as opposed to the level of speaking. The more complex measures/formulas also match the vocabulary used in the text against a checklist of 'easy words', e.g. the Dale-Chall (1948:11-20) list of 3000 words. This list is used together with a measure of the sentence length and other factors in an equation which results in broad grade ranges. Even though it was developed in the 1940s and is considered outdated, the Dale-Chall formula is still one of the most highly regarded formulas in use.

Crystal's (1987:255) comments on the readability formulas corroborate what has been observed of their general limitations:

Several such formulae have been proposed, of varying levels of complexity. Most assume that difficulty can be measured simply in terms of the length of words and/or sentences. However, there is no neat correlation between sentence length and difficulty ... and not all long words are difficult to read. Factors such as the complexity of sentence construction and the nature of word meaning are far more important, but these procedures usually ignore. Readability formulae have thus attracted a great deal of criticism, but in the absence of more sophisticated measures, they continue to attract widespread use, as a reasonably convenient way of predicting (though not explaining) reading difficulty.

Added to Crystal's criticism a variety of other variables come into play ranging from features such as the complexity of sentence structure and the intended meanings of words, to the familiarity or novelty of the topic to a particular reader. The writer's style also influences how accessible a particular piece of writing is. Nonetheless, it remains remarkable how well some of the ratings that result from their application correlate with the 'professional intuition' of experienced teachers. They therefore remain a convenient way of predicting reading difficulty as a first measure, although they do not go very far in explaining the reasons why one text should be more difficult than another. A more precise analysis of the nature of the lexical, syntactic and semantic components is needed to achieve that.

3.3.2 Limitations specific to poetry

However, in the application of readability to poems further problems exist. In poetry the density of allusion and semantic complexity that is allowed through 'poetic licence' is often considered a 'grammatical deviance' in other genres.
Culler (1975:114) writes:

... anyone wholly unacquainted with literature and unfamiliar with the conventions by which fictions are read, would ... be quite baffled if presented with a poem. His knowledge of the language would enable him to understand phrases and sentences, but he would not know, quite literally, what to make of this strange concatenation of phrases. He would be unable to read it as literature ... because he lacks the complete 'literary competence' which enables others to proceed.

Therefore a process of simply doing word counts and matching against a frequency list would not produce a reliable indicator, even as a first measure. Current notions of readability recognize different processes that present difficulty, viz. vocabulary and structure. Poetry is problematic at both the level of vocabulary and structure. To the uninitiated it could be more difficult at the levels of structure and form, and even to those familiar with the form, the vocabulary could present difficulty, because of the connotative meaning of words and the concentration of meaning generally. The concentration of meaning becomes a necessary art to the poet, as poets use fewer words to push their meaning than do prose writers. Also a lot of latitude is allowed the reader to foist his own meaning, hence the kaleidoscopic and perennial nature of poetry interpretation.

3.4 THE METHOD OF SELECTION

Because of the limitations of the readability formulas the researcher felt that it would be safer to rely on 'professional intuition' rather than the readability scores for the selection of the poems that would appear in the questionnaire. Although apparently nebulous and arbitrary, 'professional intuition' is usually based on a hidden/subjective rationale developed through a deep understanding, over a long period, with pupil and tutorial matter. In relation to this research Brumfit's (1987: 180-183) criteria for the selection of literary texts somewhat encompasses what would be the major considerations of a poetry selection based on 'professional intuition'. However, 'professional intuition' will always contain a subjective element that cannot be included, quantified or articulated in any rationale. Therefore the researcher decided to use Brumfit's criteria in corroboration of the researcher's intuitive selection. The selection was also independently confirmed by a second language expert. The aspects of Brumfit's criteria that were considered relevant in relation to this research are:

3.4.1 Linguistic level
3.4.2 Cultural level
3.4.3 Length
3.4.4 Pedagogical role.
3.4.1 Linguistic level: D.E.T. selection

Of the 22 D.E.T. poems (see Chapter 2, page 86) 13 were written before the 20th century and of the remaining 9 poems only 5 poems were written by South Africans. The 13 poems written before the 20th century present obvious lexical and syntactical difficulties to L2 pupils because of distance in time and place. However, even some poems written during the 20th century with L1 readers in mind, can be extremely difficult for L2 pupils to access. An example of such a poem is *The Hawk in the Rain* by Ted Hughes. The poem uses an unusual lexis, though at the conceptual level it should be within range of an average L2 pupil. Simple lexis, however, in itself is no guarantee that a poem will be easily accessible. *Thunder and Lightning* by James Kirkup is such a poem. The simple lexis is used in highly figurative L1 idiom that is beyond the range of average L2 usage. Also all 3 poems by South African poet Douglas Livingstone, *To a Dead Elephant*, *Lake Morning in Autumn* and *Sunstrike* obviously have L1 readers in mind.

3.4.2 Linguistic Level: Sached Selection

The Sached anthology seems to have taken into account the linguistic range of the pupils. As most of the poems in *Poetry of the People* are contemporary (10 out of 13) and the poems generally have a simple lexical and syntactic structure, with the exception of Poem 8 by e.e. cummings [See Appendix 3C]. Poem 8, entitled *i thank YOU GOD for this most amazing* is a difficult poem both at the linguistic as well as at the conceptual level. The Sached anthology served the purpose of the black political struggle and uses it to validate and nurture the pupil’s interest in poetry, which is a redeeming factor in what might otherwise be dubbed blatant political propaganda. However, it is an interesting form of poetry tuition that uses contemporary poetry, with commonly understood idiom that makes accessing easier. This form of poetry tuition has possibilities for further development and use in the future.

3.4.3 Cultural level

Poetry and literature generally, should be an experience of cultural sharing and enrichment, rather than one of cultural hegemony. Though not subject to cultural shocks that cannot be understood and appreciated, the pupils on the other hand should not be confined to a narrow cultural prison of their own. Rive (1980:5-8) advocated the three concentric circles concept which he developed as a guide to selection of literature for South African pupils. The first circle is South African, the second African and the third cosmopolitan literature. This could with profit be applied to the selection of poems. The D.E.T. selection is largely confined to poetry before 1900 or ‘classics’ usually prescribed for L1 Higher Grade pupils. Significantly absent from the D.E.T. selection are contemporary black poets. Most of the D.E.T. selection is not contemporary at
all. The Sached anthology includes elements of the three circle concept. In this respect the Sached anthology exploits contemporary poetry to its fullest extent. The value of contemporary poetry lies in its potential to awaken pupil interest through the use of understandable idiom and focus on important current issues.

3.4.4 Length

According to Brumfit (1987:189) length is 'a crucial pedagogical factor' about which no finality has been reached. The 'length' of the poem should also incorporate elements such as the lexis, depth of meaning and the complexity of imagery and symbolism. The shortest is not necessarily the easiest nor is the longest poem the most difficult.

The longest poem in the D.E.T. selection is Mending Wall by Robert Frost (45 lines). This is followed by Piano and Drums by Gabriel Okara, a poem of 29 lines. But Piano and Drums is long more for reasons of complex lexis and imagery rather than the number of lines. Mending Wall by comparison uses a simpler lexis and a narrative style and tone that should make it relatively simpler to access. The shortest poem in the selection is Thunder and Lightning (8 lines) by James Kirkup. The poem uses deceptively simple lexis in an idiom seldom employed by L2 users of English. Therefore it was not considered as one among the simplest poems as L2 pupils may find it difficult to access.

In the Sached anthology Poem 1 And in the Darkness by Berthold Brecht is a poem of 3 lines (taken from Poems from the Darkest Years). Poem 2, To be Sure also by Brecht is a poem of 8 lines. These 2 poems are the shortest in terms of length but did not qualify as the simplest because of the complexity of language, symbolism and depth of meaning. Poem 9, There is by Mafika Pascal Gwala, is a poem of 34 lines and yet it may not be as difficult to access as some of the shorter poems. However, There is, is nevertheless, by average L2 standards, a relatively complex poem.

3.4.5 Pedagogical role

Both anthologies may have been compiled with the same aim, viz. to add to the pupil's knowledge or existing schemata. However, the methodologies employed to realize the aim vary considerably.

The D.E.T. selection of poems is without detailed guidelines. The syllabus provides broad and general guidelines so as not to be too prescriptive and allows for individual input. However, taking cognisance of teacher competence, intervention should be made perhaps through a guideline such as the Sached one, or through a short and intensive in-service course to prepare teachers for the prescribed poems. What criterion or criteria are used for the selection of the prescribed poems is not clearly discernable from the poems as in the case of Poetry of the People; the Sached criteria being implicit in what they consider to be the role of poetry. In order to ascertain what could have motivated the D.E.T.
selectors in their choice of poems one has to turn to the list of prescribed poems and seek
discernible patterns or themes. Of the 22 poems prescribed for L2 Higher Grade:

13 poems were written before the twentieth century;
9 poems were written after the twentieth century;
5 poems (only) of the 9 twentieth century poems were South African.

This means that most of the poems are not contemporary, or close enough in time and
place and experience to awaken interest in pupils who are reputed to have a negative
attitude to poetry. The pupils would not have a vantage point (that contemporary/relevant poems offer) that they could use to understand the foreign past and distant
unknown. The selection does not seem to be sensitive to what black pupils consider
relevant. Further evidence is shown by the lack of discernible patterns of thought, theme,
language and conceptual development in the prescribed poems. This perception is further
strengthened when the L1 Higher Grade prescribed poems are compared to the L2
Higher Grade poems: L1 Higher Grade 29 poems; L2 Higher Grade 22 poems; of which
20 poems are common to both L1 and L2. This means that the difference between L1 and
L2 is ostensibly a difference of quantity rather than quality. Does the difference lie in the
intensity and depth with which the poems are treated? Sufficient clarity on this matter
would help teachers visualize the pedagogical role of poetry more clearly. The Sached
anthology makes use of the pupil's political and social awareness and validates it by
prescribing poems which are relevant to the pupil's experience. Excerpts of poems from
abroad are read on the accompanying video and contextualized within South Africa. This,
in a way, obviates the necessity of labouring the point of the universality of poetry. This
was done, perhaps, to entice pupils to read poetry in a way they would not have
otherwise done. Also the aims of the Sached anthology start with the immediate
experience of the child (the known) and proceed to vicarious experience (the
unknown/abstract). The Guidelines describe the role of poetry in the following sequence:

a. Poetry is about suffering (common to people of colour in South Africa);

b. Poetry can uplift one from suffering;
   (i) Poetry can bring optimism (*Singing in the Dark*);
   (ii) Poetry has a universal applicability;
   (iii) Poetry also has a personal dimension;
   (iv) Poetry empowers.

This backdrop to the pedagogical role of poetry in both the anthologies should make one
aware that to choose the simplest poem in terms of its pedagogical role or value is a
difficult if not impossible task as sufficient clarity and finality on this matter is lacking.
The choice of the simplest poem is inextricably bound up with so many subjective elements that only 'professional intuition' could enable one to make a definite choice. The choice is also likely to provoke discussion if not controversy, lacking as it does a generally acceptable objective rationale.

3.5 CHOICE OF THE SIMPLEST POEMS

As readability tests were found unsuitable as a means to isolate the simplest poems, 'professional intuition' was opted for as a viable alternative. The discussion using Brumfit's criteria endeavoured to show that 'professional intuition' as a means of choice need not be arbitrary, but that it could be in a given circumstance the most considered and informed choice, even though it may seemingly lack what is considered to be an objective rationale. The following poems were chosen as the simplest from their respective anthologies through such an 'intuition'.

3.5.1 From *The Wind at Dawn* - D.E.T.
(a) *The Hermit* - Alan Paton
(b) *The Gamblers* - Anthony Delius

3.5.2 From *Poetry of the People* - Sached
(a) *Faraway City* - Jeremy Cronin
(b) *Sea and Sand* - Don Mattera.

The sequence in which the poems appear here and in the questionnaire is in no way indicative of their level of simplicity or complexity. No distinction was made from among the 4 poems as to which was more simple or more difficult. All 4 poems were assumed to be equally accessible for the purposes of the questionnaire.

4 Locality of research

4.1 REASONS FOR CHOICE OF LOCALITY

The peri-urban area of Durban was chosen as the locality in which the sample would be taken. It was decided upon for the following reasons:

4.1.1 Urban schools for blacks at the time of this research were all found in the peri-urban areas, and not central urban areas. Therefore the research was confined to the peri-urban area.

4.1.2 Pupils in urban areas have greater exposure to English, thus ensuring a more meaningful response.

4.1.3 Very few schools choose the poetry option, and these few happen to be located in the peri-urban areas.

4.1.4 Only three schools were located that chose the poetry option. Two of the three are co-educational day schools, and the third is an all girls' boarding school.
factor also further confirmed the locality.

4.1.5 The girls' boarding school was chosen for the pilot research, this left the co-educational schools for the main research.

4.1.6 The reasons for choosing the girls' boarding school for the pilot were determined by the following:

a. Firstly, most pupils, except those in receipt of bursaries, were more affluent than pupils found in state schools. The fee structure initially led to this conclusion. Subsequent research as shown by parents' employment confirmed this.

b. Secondly, the main research would be more meaningful if conducted in co-educational schools as it would give the necessary gender balance.

4.1.7 Lastly, the peri-urban area of Durban is most easily accessible to the researcher as compared to other peri-urban areas in Kwa Zulu Natal. Its accessibility also makes it more cost effective to conduct the research.

4.2 THE MODUS OPERANDI AT ALL 3 SCHOOLS

The research was conducted following the procedure outlined below:

4.2.1 The principal was contacted telephonically and his permission to administer the questionnaire to Std 10 pupils was requested. The principal was also informed that 8 of the pupils from each division should participate. It was assumed that most schools have three divisions. A mutually acceptable date in consultation with the class and subject teachers and the principal was then negotiated.

4.2.2 The principal was also requested to allow the researcher to visit the school and consult with the Std 10 teachers, particularly the English teacher/s. In all cases permission was granted. The visit to the school usually took place ± 2 weeks before the questionnaire was administered. It was during these visits that the English teacher at each of the three schools was given a copy of the Sached Anthology and was asked to choose three of the simplest poems. The teacher was also asked to choose three of the simplest from the D.E.T. prescribed list of poems. Their choice of poems confirmed the researcher's selection. The teacher was informed that the research exercise would take approximately one hour so as to allow the teacher to readjust his/her schedule. The teacher was also informed that pupils would be told that they could have as much time as they needed, though it was unlikely that any pupil would require more than an hour. Nearly all pupils finished within the allocated time.
SECTION B

INTERPRETATION OF PILOT RESEARCH — SCHOOL A

1 Introduction

1.1 AIM OF PILOT RESEARCH

1.1.1 To test the questionnaire in the field.

2 Strategy

The strategy was to test the questionnaire in School A (an all girls' school) so that the remaining two schools, viz. school B and C could be used for the main research. School B and C are co-educational schools and should therefore more accurately reflect pupils' attitudes in general, and poetry in particular.

3 Justification for pilot

3.1 To test whether or not the language used in the pilot questionnaire was accessible and the print and layout clear enough. The language, if difficult, would be refined where necessary and the print and layout, if unclear, would be adjusted.

3.2 To observe whether an hour, i.e. the time allocated for the completion of the questionnaire was adequate.

3.3 To detect and rectify omissions, redundancies and ambiguities.

3.4 To surmise whether the number used to make up the sample composition is too large or too small.

[See the following for questionnaire designs:


(iii) Verma and Beard (1981:6-27, 28-31).]

4 Interpretation of research findings

5 Conclusion of Pilot Study
4. INTERPRETATION OF PILOT RESEARCH

Question 1*

Standard and Division : (e.g. 10A) ..................

*The numbering of the interpretation findings follows exactly the numbering in the questionnaire. [See Appendix 1 for questionnaire.]

Composition of sample

[Comment]

Figure 1 shows the composition of the sample, i.e. three divisions of matric pupils. The intended sample composition was 24, i.e. 8 pupils from each class. Attempts were made to secure the target number but this was not possible at the time when the questionnaire was administered. The teacher-in-charge indicated that the pupils were involved in certain school duties which could not be abandoned but which had not been foreseen when the date for administering the questionnaire had been decided upon. Hence the slightly uneven distribution of numbers as indicated in Figure 1.

This led the researcher to surmise that 24 was perhaps too large a number and in the subsequent main research, the target number for the composition sample from each school was set at 21, viz. 7 from each division, if there were three divisions at the school. However, not all schools visited had three divisions and further modification was necessary in the main research.
As shown in Figure 2 the ages ranged from 16-19 years; which was not a wide distribution. The majority of pupils were 17 years, as the graphs indicate. It is a generally accepted pedagogical principle that age influences and determines interest in a subject and in the case of English the choice of genre also. Age is also of particular importance in any research into poetry study among black pupils as most black youths in South Africa are highly politicised; this factor would inevitably influence response and explain choices made.

*Ceteris paribus*, age also determines response to themes, pupil's attention and motivation, as well as reaction and performance, in almost the entire educative process.
Question 3
Female
Sex: (Please tick)

Male

Comment
This question was included bearing in mind that most schools are co-educational. One of the reasons why this school was chosen for conducting the pilot was the fact that it was an all girls’ school. It was felt that pupils, particularly girls, may have comments to make on the obvious gender imbalances in the prescribed works as discussed in Chapter 2. Also that gender may determine attitude to English, literature, choice or preference of genre, and attitudes to poetry.

Figure 3:
School A is an all girls’ school hence figure not necessary.
Question 4(a)

Is your father/guardian employed?

Father/Guardian employed

[Pilot Study]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Died</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Responses

Figure 4a

Comment

Whether the father or guardian is employed is a significant factor in determining the socio-economic status of the pupil. Besides the monetary implications of employment or unemployment there is also the psychological dimension of anxiety, insecurity and inferiority which might influence the pupils' responses, reactions, performances and general behaviour patterns.

The number of unemployed fathers or guardians is significant: 3 out of 22. One was deceased and the other four blank responses could mean that the breadwinner at home is either the mother or some other relative. Alternatively the blanks could suggest an inadequate understanding of the questionnaire, this is, however, unlikely from the number of accurate responses. Also School A is a school which makes considerable financial demands on the parents of pupils, therefore the blanks could be interpreted as indicating an alternative source of income not catered for in the questionnaire, e.g. support from grandparents, or scholarships and loans, etc.
Question 4(b)

If you answered 'Yes' to 4(a), what is his occupation?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TYPE OF EMPLOYMENT</th>
<th>NUMBER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Artisan</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Businessman</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clerk</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Director-General (Senior Govt. Official)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreman</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head of Finance (Senior Govt. Official)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labourer</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurse</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personnel Officer</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Worker</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>14</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4b

Comment
The 14 fathers/guardians were employed as per table. The table indicates that the 14 pupils, with perhaps one or two from homes like the clerk and labourer, come from fairly affluent backgrounds. Consequently it could be assumed that reading material, the frequent use and exposure to good models of written and spoken English would be within the pupils' experience. These homes could provide an ambience conducive to learning and enough encouragement and motivation to the pursuits of self-improvement. A child from such a home obviously has a distinct advantage.
Comment

The number of mothers or female guardians (this is assumed) that are employed exceed that of the male counterparts. The number of mothers employed is 19 as compared with 14 fathers. There were no blanks which indicates that pupils adequately understood the questionnaire.

The significantly high number of mothers that are employed indicates that in most homes both parents are working, and hence a higher income and added financial security for the family. The educational implications being that pupils from such a home background have greater opportunities for self-improvement, enrichment, and language acquisition in both mother tongue (L1) and in English (L2).
Question 5(b)

If you answered 'Yes' to 5(a), what is her occupation?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TYPE OF EMPLOYMENT</th>
<th>NUMBER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Businesswoman</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cashier</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clerk</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fashion Designer</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Advisor</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labourer</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lecturer</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Machinist</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurse</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principal (School)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretary</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Worker</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>19</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5b

Comment

The 19 mothers/guardians were employed as per table. The 19 mothers/guardians considerably enhance the socio-economic status of the pupils. Of the 19 listed the following were professional:

Health Advisor 1
Lecturer 1
Nurse 6
Principal (School) 2
Social Worker 1
Teacher 1

This gives us a total of 12 professionals out of the 19 mother/guardians employed, as compared to 2 professionals out of 14 in the father/guardian table, viz.

Nurse 1
Social Worker 1

124
Comment

The reason for asking pupils their residential address was to ascertain whether the respondents were urban or rural, as urban children have a greater exposure to both spoken and written English (L2) while rural children are largely confined to the use of mother tongue (L1). Pupils who have a greater familiarity with the language would be more comfortable trying to unravel the nuances of poetry while those with a basic functional knowledge would tend to find poetry daunting. It is interesting to note however, that eight respondents of the total of 22 gave Post Office Box addresses instead of residential addresses. Of the eight:

5 were rural P.O. Box addresses,
3 were urban P.O. Box addresses.

Understandably the rural students could not give a street address, therefore 5 out of 6 rural students gave P.O. Box addresses.
Question 6(b)

How long have you been living here?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DURATION OF RESIDENCE</th>
<th>NO. OF PUPILS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than 1 year</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 - 5 years</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 - 10 years</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 - 20 years</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+ 20 years</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>22</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6b

Comment
The duration of residence acts as a follow-up to 6(a). How long pupils have been living at a particular residence is in some way indicative of the stability of their lives. Many pupils are rural pupils who come into the townships for a high school education because such facilities do not exist in some rural areas. Other pupils were forced to move from one area to another because of the pressures exerted on them by the often violent and unpredictable political situation at that time. These factors must have an influence on the pupil's overall performance at school.
Question 6(c)
Where have you been living before this?

Previous/Alternative residence

[Figure 6c]

Urban
13

Rural
9

Comment
This question was designed to ascertain the exact place of residence. Question 6b only indicates duration of residence. Question 6c is not superfluous as families may change residences within an urban area. This question enables the researcher to determine whether the pupil was previously from a rural area and for how long the pupil has been resident in an urban area. This information is important as it indicates the length of exposure that a pupil would have had to the use of English (L2) for general communication, such as shopping, boarding a train or bus, purchasing a ticket and generally communicating with other language and racial groups, who happen to employ English as a lingua franca.
Question 7(a)

What is the main language spoken at home?

Main/Home Language

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Languages</th>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zulu</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xhosa</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swazi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Sotho</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comment

The figure 7a indicates that no pupil has either English or Afrikaans as a main/home language. The predominance of Zulu is to be expected in black schools in KwaZulu Natal. The sprinkling of other African languages is not surprising in a boarding school. Questions 4 and 5 of the questionnaire revealed that most respondents were from fairly affluent homes; the status of English and Afrikaans in the above graph indicates that high socio-economic status among blacks does not mean that they will opt for English and Afrikaans in preference to the mother tongue, in this case Zulu. From the linguistic point of view this finding has interesting implications. Firstly even though a family could afford to purchase radio, television and newspapers it does not necessarily mean that these media would promote a better or more desirable standard of English, because there are radio stations and television channels that cater for African (L1) languages. There are also many newspapers and magazines in African (L1) languages. Moreover many affluent black families could opt to use mother tongue (L1) as a statement of black pride and self-respect. The language debate is a bitter and thorny issue with serious political implications. The pupil is often thrown into a dilemma and motivation to study one or another language may be adversely affected, depending on which language enjoys favour in the eyes of political pundits. This situation is one which could make matters extremely difficult for a language teacher.
Question 7(b)
What other language/languages are spoken at home?

Other Home Languages

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
<th>[Pilot Study]</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sotho</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tsonga</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English/Other</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comment
The question is aimed at ascertaining the language versatility which the pupil encounters and is expected to cope with at home. It also tests the accepted L2 teaching principle that a child who is proficient in the L1 acquires the L2 with greater ease than a child who is not as proficient in the L1. Of the 11 respondents who speak two or more of the languages below, English emerged as the lingua franca of all 11 respondents. The combinations of the 11 were as follows:

- English and Zulu - 5
- English and Xhosa - 2
- English and Sotho - 1
- English and Tswana - 1
- English, Zulu, Sotho - 1
- English, Zulu, S. Sotho - 1

TOTAL 11

The level of proficiency of the L1 (Zulu) could not be measured but the level of the L2 (English) indicates a comparatively high degree of proficiency. Two pupils submitted poems they had written for my perusal and comment. This was an achievement for L2 pupils who generally do not exhibit such confidence in the use of L2.
Question 7(c)

What other language/languages are spoken by you?

Other languages spoken by pupils

[Pilot study]

![Diagram showing language combinations]

Figure 7c

Comment

This question ascertains whether the pupils speak a language/s other than that which is encountered in the school and home environment. This language is usually acquired through peer group interaction. For instance a Zulu speaking pupil (Zulu L1) may acquire Sotho as another language together with English. Then English which is more frequently and widely used becomes the L2 and Sotho the L3. However, to the Sotho speaking pupil Sotho is an L1, English L2, and Zulu L3. English is often a common denominator.

The language combinations of the 5 who spoke more than two of the languages mentioned were as follows:

- Sotho, Tswana, Zulu, Pedi and Swazi - 1
- Southern and Northern Sotho, and Xhosa - 1
- Northern Sotho, Zulu, English, Afrikaans and Xhosa - 1
- Xhosa, Southern Sotho, Tswana - 1
- Xhosa, Afrikaans and Tsonga - 1

TOTAL 5

The wide range of languages spoken by the five pupils indicates a high linguistic ability as well as versatility.
Question 8(a)

Please list all subjects you are taking this year.

Comment

The respondents were divided into three groups as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STD</th>
<th>GROUP</th>
<th>NO OF PUPILS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10A</td>
<td>Science</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10B</td>
<td>Commerce</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10C</td>
<td>Humanities</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8a (i)

The pupils were divided into the following groups according to subject choice, not ability. The choice was as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CORE SUBJECTS FOR ALL GROUPS</th>
<th>SCIENCE</th>
<th>COMMERCE</th>
<th>HUMANITIES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>Physical Sc.</td>
<td>Accounting</td>
<td>Biology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zulu</td>
<td>Biology</td>
<td>B. Economics</td>
<td>History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
<td>+ core</td>
<td>+ core</td>
<td>Geography</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Biblical Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(any three of the above + core)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8a (ii)
Comment

In order to ascertain the influences responsible for the choice of subject a table of subjects was provided. [See Appendix 1: Pupil Questionnaire, No. 8B.] Even though at the very outset it was the intention of this research to concentrate on English and poetry, it was not deemed wise to isolate English in this question as a more natural response would be elicited if English was seen as a subject among other subjects. Also other significant findings may arise when pupils' responses to subjects are seen in totality; for instance a significant finding was that not only English was an almost 100% own choice but most other subjects were also. Had English appeared alone an erroneous idea of the subject's importance to the pupils in relation to other subjects could have been surmised, a very misleading conclusion. Also the fact that most pupils chose subjects and subject combinations on their own indicates a high degree of independence.

Another noteworthy point revealed by this question was the omission of Zulu as a subject in 8b in the pilot questionnaire. Only when the data was being processed was it realized that Zulu had been omitted. Pupils added Zulu. The researcher, conditioned by a different system of education, had seen English and Afrikaans as a complete language package. The discovery of the third language, Zulu, also added a new dimension to the black pupils' profile as disadvantaged. Black pupils at High School had to study three languages with almost equal intensity while their counterparts of other races had only two languages to concentrate on as a compulsory requirement. Other subjects omitted were Typing, Biblical Studies and Home Economics.
Question 8(c)
Which subject/subjects do you like most?

Subjects liked best

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subjects</th>
<th>English (Eng)</th>
<th>Maths</th>
<th>Biology (Biol)</th>
<th>Business Economics (B.Econ)</th>
<th>Physics (Phys)</th>
<th>Afrikaans (Afr)</th>
<th>Accounting (Acc)</th>
<th>History (Hist)</th>
<th>Geography (Geog)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of pupils</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comment
The question was designed to test the popularity of English as a subject among other subjects. The table 8c gives the subjects and their popularity rating among pupils. The numbers in the number column indicate the number of times the subject was listed as the best liked.
### Table 8c

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUBJECT</th>
<th>POPULARITY RATING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maths</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biology</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Economics</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physics</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accounting</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comment**

English, Maths, Afrikaans and Zulu are core subjects, which means that they are compulsory for all pupils. This probably accounts for the high popularity rating of English and Maths. However, Afrikaans is ranked lower than Biology, Business Economics and Physics even though it is a core/compulsory subject. Zulu, which is also a core subject, was omitted from the table.
Question 8(d)
Why do you like the subject/s listed?

Reasons for liking English

[Figure 8d]

Comment
Although question 8(d) required pupils to say why they liked the subjects listed this discussion will only focus on the reasons for liking English as that is the major concern of this research.

It is significant that most pupils perceived the value of English as a means of communication and career advancement. It is to the credit of pupils that pragmatism rather than emotion was the deciding factor in most instances. However, some responses were vague, example Helpful which could nevertheless be classified with communication and career motives.
Question 9

Which aspect of English do you find most interesting? Put a tick in only one space then briefly give a reason.

Interest in aspects of English

[Pilot study]

![Graph showing interests in aspects of English]

**Comment**

This question helps to bring us closer to pupils' attitudes to poetry. It is significant that Oral Work ranks highest in the scale of interest as it has the most immediate functional and tangible value to an L2 pupil. Literature, in which poetry is contained is ranked second, literature possibly earned this place because of the wide range of interest it covers, enough to cater for all tastes. Language study is ranked third perhaps because it offers an insight into the mysterious working of an L2. Pupils (L2) are not always familiar with reasons for the change of tense, case, the position of the preposition and word order and its impact on meaning. These are taken for granted by L1 pupils who can then devote themselves to the more subtle nuances of meaning. Writing is last on the list, perhaps because writing is the most demanding task to an L2 pupil since it involves the mastering of all stages of language acquisition as well as the development of cognitive skills to organize and present ideas in an intelligible and coherent way.
The reasons given were as follows:

Language Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accuracy in usage</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New vocabulary</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help in speech</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9a

Oral work:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enjoyment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practice in speech</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better understanding</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9b

Literature:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Career</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insight into life</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Different ideas</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freedom of expression</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocabulary</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9c

Writing:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Means of expression</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exercise creativeness</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9d
Question 10
Which aspect of literature do you like best? Put a tick in only one space then briefly give a reason.

Aspects of literature

| Pilot study |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Genres</th>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Novel</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Play</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short story</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poetry</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 10

Comment
This question is aimed at determining the popularity of a particular genre in literature. The figure 10 indicates that the novel is obviously the most popular; followed by the play, poetry and the short story.

The reasons given by the pupils were:

Novel:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Enjoyment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insight into life</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vicarious experience</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exercise imagination</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>8</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10a
Play:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oral practice</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dramatization</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy to understand</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Active involvement</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased awareness</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>7</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10b

Short story:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No sustained concentration required</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not time consuming</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More stories read in less time</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>4</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10c

Poetry:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vicarious experience</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expand imagination</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relaxation</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>5</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10d
Question 11

Read the poems on pages 4 and 5 and then answer the questions on p. 6. Please remember there are NO INCORRECT ANSWERS, all that is needed is your OPINION. Feel free to express your likes and dislikes and opinions.

Question 11.1

Which poem did you find the easiest to understand?

Why? ...........................................................................................................................................

Easiest poems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poems</th>
<th>Easiest poems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Pilot study]

Number of pupils

![Bar chart]

Figure 11.1

Comment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>POEM</th>
<th>REASONS</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poem A</td>
<td>Simple language</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Familiar</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Easy to understand</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Clear message</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem B</td>
<td><em>Was not mentioned by any pupil</em> [See Fig. 11.1]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem C</td>
<td>Simple language</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Easy to understand</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Clear message</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Clear print and layout</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem D</td>
<td>Easy to understand</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Familiar</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

140
Question 11.2
Which poem did you find most difficult to understand?
Why?

Most difficult poems
[Pilot study]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poems</th>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Bar chart showing the number of pupils finding each poem difficult](image)

Comment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>POEM</th>
<th>REASONS</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Meaning difficult to unravel</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cannot identify with contents</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ideas many and cluttered</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Boring</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Meaning difficult to unravel</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unfamiliar vocabulary</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>Only one pupil stated that no poems were difficult. However, no reasons were given.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.2
**Question 11.3**

Which poem did you like the best?

Why? ____________________________________________

Best liked poems

[Pilot study]

**Comment**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>POEM</th>
<th>REASONS</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poem A</td>
<td>Relevance to life</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Easy to understand</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem C</td>
<td>Relevance to life</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ability to identify with poem</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem D</td>
<td>Unusual imagery</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vocabulary enrichment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Message interesting</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Print and layout attractive</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.3
Question 11.4
Which poem did you like the least?
Why? ..........................................................................

Least liked poems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poems</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 11.4

Comment
The least liked poems once again do not correspond to and are not identical with the most difficult and for that reason they were presented as two different questions. A comparison of the figures for the two is worth consideration.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>POEM</th>
<th>MOST DIFFICULT</th>
<th>LEAST LIKED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NONE</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.4

However, there does seem to be a link between Poem B and Poem D in the above table. The following reasons were given for not liking the poems:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>POEM</th>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poem A</td>
<td>Uninteresting</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem B</td>
<td>Emotionally disturbing</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Difficult</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem C</td>
<td>Not universal enough</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Too critical</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem D</td>
<td>Emotionally disturbing</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Difficult</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unattractive print and layout</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.4(a)

**Question 11.5**

Have you read any of these poems before?

**Comment**

All pupils responded positively.
Question 11.6
If 'Yes', tick which ones.

Poems previously read
[Pilot study]

![Bar chart showing number of pupils who read different poems](chart.png)

**Number of pupils**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poems</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>25</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comment**
Most pupils had read Poem A and Poem D as the poems are prescribed for the matriculation examination. However, one pupil had read Poem C at the winter school for matric pupils at the University of Natal (Durban). The figure is self-explanatory.
Question 11.7

Say where you read the poem.

Comment

The table below shows where the poems were read.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>POEM</th>
<th>AT SCHOOL</th>
<th>AT HOME</th>
<th>ELSEWHERE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.7

It is significant that even though most pupils had not read Poem B and C before (except one pupil) all pupils had strong opinions about them. More pupils found Poem D, a prescribed poem, a more difficult one than Poem B. Poem C was the best liked poem and Poem D the least liked.
Question 11.8
Which poem/s has the nicest print and layout?

**Print and layout**

[Figure 11.8]

**Number of pupils**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>No response</th>
<th>All same</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comment**
This question justified its presence even before the pupils attempted it. In question 11.1 to 11.4 (Easiest, Most Difficult, Best and Least Liked poems) some pupils gave as their reasons for choice and categorization the print and layout of the poem. It was for this reason that the original print and layout of the poems were not tampered with. The poems have exactly the same print and layout except that they have been uniformly and proportionally enlarged to suit the purposes of the questionnaire.

However, the graph does indicate that not all pupils were sensitive to print and layout as two respondents registered blanks while one felt that all poems were equally good; a charitable but undiscriminating view.
5 Conclusion of Pilot Research

5.1 Pupil responses

As the evidence from the pilot presents itself it is apparent that pupils did not feel that poetry was inaccessible. The response was fairly well-balanced and the 'likes' and 'dislikes' of the pupils revealed sufficient sensitivity to the subject of poetry. The table below indicates this:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>POEM</th>
<th>EASIEST</th>
<th>MOST DIFFICULT</th>
<th>BEST LIKED</th>
<th>LEAST LIKED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NONE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.1

The table also reveals that prior knowledge of a poem is not necessary for a definite and spirited response.

5.2 Results of Pilot Questionnaire

5.2.1 The language was found to be simple and easily understood.

5.2.2 The time was adequate.

5.2.3 The following omissions were noted in the choice of subjects:
   a. Zulu
   b. Typing
   c. Biblical Studies
   d. Home Economics

These were included in the final questionnaire.

5.2.4 The sample of 24 was found to be adequate, however the researcher felt that the sample number should not exceed 25 or drop below 20 in the main research. Even though the sample of ±20 is made up of pupils from three different matric classes it is nevertheless about 50% of the average L2 black matric class which ranges in KwaZulu Natal from 34 to 37 and 38 to 49 per class in some areas, to 50 to 58 in others, especially Northern Zululand. [See Krige & Scott (1994:30).]
SECTION C

INTERPRETATION OF MAIN RESEARCH

1 Modifications resulting from the pilot research

1.1 COMPOSITION SAMPLE
The composition sample of ±20 was considered to be adequately representative of the number of pupils per class in KwaZulu Natal. [See Krige & Scott (1994:30.)]

1.2 TABLE OF SUBJECTS
The following subjects were omitted in the Pilot and this omission was subsequently corrected in the main research questionnaire.

1.2.1 Zulu
1.2.2 Typing
1.2.3 Biblical Studies
1.2.4 Home Economics

1.3 The justification of questions and the mode of questioning will not be repeated as this has already been done in the interpretation of the pilot research.
INTERPRETATION OF MAIN RESEARCH FINDINGS

Question 1
Standard and division

Composition of sample
[School B]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard</th>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>STD 10A</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STD 10B</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STD 10C</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total: 21

Composition of sample
[School C]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard</th>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>STD 10A</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STD 10B</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STD 10D</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total: 20

Comment
SCHOOL B: The sample was divided into three as follows:

10A - Science - 8
10B - General - 7
10C - Commercial - 6
Total: 21

SCHOOL C: The sample was divided as follows: Three groups but two streams.

10A - Science - 10
10B - General - 8
10D - General - 2
Total: 20

School C did not offer the commercial stream. Nor was it possible to get the desired number of 21 pupils.

NB: The numbering follows exactly the questionnaire used for the main research.

[See Appendix 1 for pupil questionnaire.]
Question 2

Age

|School B|

Age in years

Number of pupils

16 yrs 17 yrs 18 yrs 19 yrs 20 yrs 21 yrs 22 yrs 23 yrs

|School C|

Age in years

Number of pupils

16 yrs 17 yrs 18 yrs 19 yrs 20 yrs 21 yrs 22 yrs 23 yrs

Figure 2

Comment

SCHOOL B: The ages ranged from 17-23 years. The majority of pupils being between 17-19 years. Only 2 pupils were outside this range.

1 pupil was 20 years
1 pupil was 23 years

SCHOOL C: The age ranged from 17-22 years. The majority of pupils were between 17-20 years. Only 2 pupils were outside this range.

1 pupil was 21 years
1 pupil was 22 years.

The difference in age range between the two schools is very small and it appears that both schools have pupils in the same age group. However, the average age of pupils is higher than that of the pilot school. This disparity may be partially explained by the socio-economic status of the pupils in the pilot school who generally come from more affluent homes and presumably had the advantage of starting school at an early age, or the normal age. Pupils in township schools usually come from homes of average socio-economic status and have been subject to a disrupted schooling life which has resulted in years being added to their stay at school.
Comment

SCHOOL B: The sample was almost equally divided into:

- Male: 11
- Female: 10
- Total: 21

SCHOOL C: The sample indicates an almost 50% male domination

- Male: 13
- Female: 7
- Total: 20

Gender could be a significant factor in preferences displayed as far as literary genre and the choice of poems are concerned.
Question 4a
Is your father/guardian employed?

Father/Guardian employed
[School B]

Father/Guardian employed
[School C]

Comment
SCHOOL B: The response was as follows:

- Employed: 11
- Unemployed: 9
- No response: 1

Only 11 out of 21 fathers/guardians were definitely employed. This figure already significantly reduces the socio-economic level of the pupils.

SCHOOL C:

- Employed: 11
- Unemployed: 9

School C, except for one pupil that did not respond, followed the pattern of employment found in School B.
Question 4b
If you answered 'yes' to 4(a) what is his occupation?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Employment</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Type of Employment</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Labourer</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Driver</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Company Representative</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Labourer</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic Worker</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Assistant Worker</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Salesman</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bricklayer</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Seaman</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Driver</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Machinist</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carpenter</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurse</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occ. not stated</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>11</strong></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>11</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4b

Comment
SCHOOL B: Of the 11 fathers employed only three appear to be professional i.e. 2 policemen and a nurse. The rest would be considered of average socio-economic status.

SCHOOL C: Of the 11 fathers employed not one is professional as per table. The socio-economic status of pupils at both schools i.e. B and C would be very similar.
Question 5a
Is your mother/guardian employed?

**Mother/Guardian employed**

**[School B]**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passed away</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Mother/Guardian employed**

**[School C]**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Died</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comment**

**SCHOOL B:** The 21 respondents answered as follows:

- Employed: 10
- Unemployed: 9
- Blank: 1
- Spoilt paper: 1
- Total: 21

The number of mothers employed, 10, is almost equal to the number of fathers employed (11). The number unemployed is significantly the same, viz. 9. The no response is perhaps due to a lack of understanding of the type of response required or perhaps the questionnaire did not cater for the response the pupil intended to give. The equal number also indicates that there should be a balance between the male and female influence in the home.

**SCHOOL C:** The mothers employed in school C are significantly lower than the number of fathers:

- Employed: 6
- Unemployed: 13
- No response: 1
- Total: 20
The number of fathers employed is eleven, about twice the number of mothers. The significantly larger number of unemployed mothers could be more a result of the economic recession rather than adherence to traditional African values which restricts women to the home. Nevertheless the primary significance is that it reduces the socio-economic position of the pupils. Significantly in the pilot school the number of mothers or female guardians that are employed exceeded that of the fathers or male guardians.
Question 5b
If you answered 'yes' to 5(a), what is her occupation?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Employment</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Type of Employment</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Domestic Worker</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Labourer</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clerk</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Domestic Worker</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waitress</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labourer</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Dressmaker</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dressmaker</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Typist</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factory Worker</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>10</strong></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>6</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5b

**Comment**

SCHOOL B: Most of the 10 mothers or female guardians are employed in jobs that do not enjoy high socio-economic status.

SCHOOL C: Of the small number of mothers or female guardians that are employed it is significant that one is a professional, viz. teacher.
Question 6a

Please write your residential/home address.

Comment

SCHOOL B: All respondents are urban. This indicates that the researcher could assume a reasonably high exposure to English.

SCHOOL C: 17 out of the 20 respondents were urban, which means that the majority of pupils are urban.

Whether the pupil is urban or rural is determined by the residential address. If an urban address is given and the respondent has been living there for five years or less than five years and the previous place of residence is rural then the respondent is considered rural. It is assumed that urban pupils have greater exposure to English and greater confidence in its use, even though the English is usually not standard English.
Question 6b
How long have you been living here?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Duration of Residence</th>
<th>SCHOOL B</th>
<th></th>
<th>SCHOOL C</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. of Pupils</td>
<td>No. of Pupils</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 - 5 years</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1 - 9 years</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 - 10 years</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6 - 10 years</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 - 20 years</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11 - 20 years</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 years +</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20 years +</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6b

Comment
SCHOOL B: The table indicating duration of residence shows a reasonably stable home situation.
SCHOOL C: The table shows a similar pattern to School B.
It is significant that most of the respondents from both schools have been living at their place of residence for roughly 11 - 20 years. This means that in relation to their ages most pupils have been living at one residence nearly all their lives. This indicates a high degree of stability. However, this stability can be deceptive and is being accepted at face value for purposes of this research.
Comment

SCHOOL B: The response to this question showed that although all pupils indicated that their present residence is urban at least 6 now definitely indicated that their previous residence was rural. This indicates that their families either recently moved to the city or that they, the pupils, reside in the city for schooling. The blanks perhaps indicate that the pupils knew of no other residence.

SCHOOL C: The number of pupils who were previously resident in rural areas coincides with those who have always been resident in the urban area.

How long a pupil has lived in an urban area gives the researcher an indication of the probable exposure the pupil may have to English usage. Unlike the pilot school both schools are day schools, so the previous alternative residence will not be easily confused with the home address.
Question 7a
What is the main language spoken at home?

Main/Home language

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zulu</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xhosa</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Main/Home language

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zulu</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xhosa</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comment**

SCHOOL B: The main language spoken at home is obviously Zulu with one speaking Xhosa. European languages are significantly absent.

SCHOOL C: Zulu is the main language with one speaking Xhosa and another English. The preponderance of Zulu is significant.

As KwaZulu Natal is predominantly Zulu speaking the finding is to be expected. However, the degree of exposure to English usage that pupils encountered in urban areas could be overrated by the researcher and other language specialists who assume that urban residence necessarily indicates a higher degree of interaction with English or Afrikaans.
Question 7b
What other language/languages are spoken at home?

Other home languages
[School B]

Other home languages
[School C]

Comment
SCHOOL B: Thirteen pupils spoke English, while one pupil mentioned that both English and Zulu were spoken at home. This effectively makes 14 who speak English at home. There were three pupils who apparently did not understand the question or could not make up their minds and left a blank. Significantly four pupils indicated that only Zulu was spoken. This means that the four pupils would be at a disadvantage in an English medium school.

SCHOOL C: English appears as the most popular other language spoken at home with seven respondents. Zulu was presumably chosen by those who spoke either English or Xhosa as a home language (two respondents had so indicated), four spoke English in combination with Zulu, Sotho, Afrikaans or Xhosa. One respondent indicated Xhosa and Sotho. However, five pupils did not respond. It is assumed that the pupils thought it unnecessary as no other language except Zulu was spoken at home.

When School B and C are compared it is apparent that more pupils at School B tend to use English at home than at School C, viz:

School B - 13
School C - 7

However, the combination of languages spoken at School C homes indicate a greater linguistic diversity and versatility. This it is hoped the pupils found enriching.
Question 7c
What other language/languages are spoken by you?

Other languages spoken by pupils

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English only</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zulu &amp; English</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xhosa &amp; English</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xhosa, English, Zulu</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English &amp; Afrikaans</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English, Afrikaans</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total: 17

SCHOOL B: It is not unusual for pupils to speak a language that is not encountered in either the home or school environment. English was the only other language spoken by 12 pupils. English as a lingua franca was spoken by seven pupils.

Pupils Combination

- 3 pupils spoke English/Zulu
- 1 pupil spoke English/Xhosa
- 2 pupils spoke English/Zulu/Xhosa
- 1 pupil spoke English/Afrikaans

Total: 7

There were two blanks - these pupils apparently spoke only Zulu and no other language.

SCHOOL C: The diversity of languages spoken by pupils at School C is far more complex than at School B. In some ways the complexity resembles that of the pilot school. However, the diversity found at the pilot school is easily explained as it is a boarding school. However, the diversity found at School C can only be explained in terms of a multilingual society developing in the townships. A significant feature of this development is that English was the most common other language spoken by pupils at School C viz. 16 out of 20 pupils establishing English as the lingua franca of the emerging multilingual society.
Question 8a
Please list all subjects you are taking this year.

Comment

SCHOOL B: The respondents were divided into three groups as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STD</th>
<th>GROUP</th>
<th>NO. OF PUPILS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10A</td>
<td>Science</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10B</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10C</td>
<td>Commerce</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8a (i)

STD 10A - SCIENCE
Pupils could choose any six:
- Maths
- Physical Science
- Biology
- Geography
- Zulu
- English
- History
- Biblical Studies

STD 10B - GENERAL
- Zulu
- English
- Biology
- Geography
- History
- Home Economics
- Biblical Studies

STD 10C - COMMERCE - All six subjects:
- English
- Zulu
- Maths
- Accountancy
- Economics
- Business Economics

English and Afrikaans were studied by all 21 students.

SCHOOL C: In this school there were only two groups or divisions:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STD</th>
<th>GROUP</th>
<th>NO. OF PUPILS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10A</td>
<td>Science</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10B</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10D</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8a (ii)

164
STD 10A - SCIENCE
Any six subjects:

Physics          English          History
Maths            Zulu
Biology          Afrikaans

STD 10B and 10D - GENERAL
All six subjects:

English          History
Zulu             Geography
Afrikaans        Biology

The following subjects were taken by all pupils: English and Zulu
Question 8b
Who helped you to choose these subjects?

Comment

SCHOOL B:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOICE</th>
<th>PUPILS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Own</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher/Counsellor</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8b (i)

SCHOOL C:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOICE</th>
<th>PUPILS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Own</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher/Counsellor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8b (ii)

The minimal parental or outside influence in the choice of subjects is a significant pointer to the extent to which schooling and subject choice is regarded as a pupil and school affair. It could also articulate the inability of the parents or ‘others’ in society to help pupils in matters pertaining to school.
Question 8c
Which subject/subjects do you like most?

Comment

SCHOOL B:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUBJECT</th>
<th>POPULARITY RATING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maths</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biology</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Economics</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physics</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accountancy</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biblical Studies</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Economics</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economics</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zulu</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8c (i)

SCHOOL C:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUBJECT</th>
<th>POPULARITY RATING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zulu</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physics</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maths</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biology</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8c (ii)

English and Zulu are core subjects for all groups and streams in both schools. However, School C does not have a commercial stream but the core is still common. It is significant that English has the highest popularity rating (see tables). This cannot be attributed to its being a core subject because the other core subject (Zulu) ranks far below other subjects that are not core subjects.
Question 8d
Why do you like the subject/s listed?

Subjects liked best

[School B]

Subjects liked best

[School C]

Figure 8d

Comment
Although question 8d required pupils to say why they liked the subjects listed, this discussion will only focus on the reasons for liking English as that is the main concern of this research.
The reasons for liking English were all related to its value as a means of making communication easier and of career advancement. It is significant that no pupils chose English for aesthetic or emotional reasons. The choice was purely utilitarian.

Reasons for liking English

[School B]

Reasons

Interesting
Easy to understand
Communication
Career motives
Natural aptitude
Good teacher
Official language
International language

Number of pupils

Figure 8d(i)

Reasons for liking English

[School C]

Reasons

Interesting
Easy to understand
Communication
Career motives
International lang

Number of pupils

168
Question 9
Which aspect of English do you find most interesting?

**Interest in aspects of English**  
[School B]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aspects</th>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Language study</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral work</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literature</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Interest in aspects of English**  
[School C]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aspects</th>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Language study</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral work</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literature</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 9

**Comment**

SCHOOL B: The popularity rating is given on the graph above and the reasons given as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Language Study</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learn about structures of language</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can be used generally</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Oral Work</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helps understanding</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to practice</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Literature</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Familiarity with language use</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helps improve language</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enjoy literature</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase knowledge</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ambitions of becoming an author</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Writing</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enables one to be creative</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not good at speaking</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9a
**SCHOOL C:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Language Study</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To get knowledge and communicate</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Oral Work</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practice in use of language</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aptitude for oral work</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Literature</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improves standard of English</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thought provoking</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy to understand</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increases knowledge - vicarious experience</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Writing</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job prospects that require writing</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9b
Question 10
Which aspect of literature do you like best?

Aspects of literature
School B
Genres
- Novel
- Play
- Short story
- Poetry

Number of pupils

Aspects of literature
School C
Genres
- Novel
- Play
- Short story
- Poetry

Number of pupils

Comment
SCHOOL B: The figure indicates that the novel is the most popular, followed by both the short story and poetry. The play is the least popular. The reasons given for the choice were as follows:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Novel</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy to understand</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enjoyment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuity</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevance</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Play</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can be practised/dramatised</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short story</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy to understand</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short/thus easily/quickly read</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poetry</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information/knowledge</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thought provoking</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exercise imagination</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vicarious experience</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10a

SCHOOL C: The figure indicates that poetry is the most popular followed by the play and short story in that order. The novel is surprisingly the least popular. The reasons were:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Novel</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practice in good English</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Play</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy to understand</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enjoyable</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication practice</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short story</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poetry</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thought provoking</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scope for interpretation</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase knowledge</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appreciate life deeply</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Different</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unintelligible reason</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10b
Question 11 [See Pilot Research p. 140 for instructions]

Question 11.1
Which poem did you find the easiest to understand?

Easiest poem
[School B]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poems</th>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Easiest poem
[School C]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poems</th>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

No response

Number of pupils

Figure 11.1

Comment

SCHOOL B: Pupils found that Poem C was the easiest to understand although it was not a prescribed poem. The rest of the pupils opted for Poem A. No pupil found either Poem B or D easy to understand and one pupil returned a blank. The reasons for the choice were:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poem A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simple language</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Previous knowledge</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant message</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simple language</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy to understand</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant message</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.1 (a)
SCHOOL C: Poem A emerged as the most popular followed by Poem C. Both Poem B and D were jointly a third choice. The reasons given were:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem A</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior knowledge</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant theme</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy to understand</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem B</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant to South Africa</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy to understand</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem C</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant to South Africa</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy to understand</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simple language</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem D</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant theme</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.1 (b)
QUESTION 11.2
Which poem did you find most difficult to understand?

Most difficult poems

[School B]

A

B

C

D

No response

Number of pupils

Most difficult poems

[School C]

A

B

C

D

None

Number of pupils

Figure 11.2

Comment

SCHOOL B: Poem D emerged as the most difficult poem followed by Poem B and A in that order. Two pupils returned blanks. All pupils ostensibly found Poem C the least difficult. The reasons given were:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem A</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Message not clear</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem B</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult vocabulary</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boring</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Message unclear</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No previous knowledge</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem D</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult words</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Style</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unclear message</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.2 (a)
SCHOOL C: Poem B emerged as the most difficult followed by D, C and A in that order. One pupil found no poems difficult. The reasons were:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem A</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uncommon theme</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem B</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult to understand</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No prior knowledge</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sad theme</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not attractive (layout, etc.)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult language</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem C</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited information and vision, not universal, only limited to South Africa</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nonsensical reason</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem D</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult language</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uninteresting</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None. No reason given</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.2 (b)
QUESTION 11.3
Which poem did you like the best?

Best liked poems
[School B]

Best liked poems
[School C]

Figure 11.3

Comment
SCHOOL B: Poem C was the best liked poem followed by A and B. No pupils liked Poem D and one pupil returned a blank. The reasons given were:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poem A</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy to understand</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant message</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior knowledge</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem B</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant message</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem C</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant message</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional appeal</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.3 (a)
SCHOOL C: Poems A and C were equally the best liked, followed by Poem D. No pupils liked Poem B and one pupil liked none of the poems. The reasons given were:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem A</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant theme</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy to understand</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem C</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant theme</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem D</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appealing theme</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior knowledge</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None. No reason given.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.3 (b)
QUESTION 11.4
Which poem did you like the least?

Least liked poems

[School B]

[School C]

No response

Figure 11.4

*Comment*

SCHOOL B: Poem D was the least liked followed by Poem A, B and C in that order. It is significant that both Poem A and D, the two least liked, are both prescribed poems. It was apparent from the responses that some pupils did not understand the meaning of 'least'. From the responses given it appears that pupils understood least to be a synonym for best. This was especially applicable to Poem A. All responses which interpreted 'least' as 'best' were ignored for the purposes of this research. However the problem of accessing the meaning of 'least' did not surface in the pilot, otherwise the question would have been phrased in more accessible language. The reasons given for the choice of poems were:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem A</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult style</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unclear message</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult to understand</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem B</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boring</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unpleasant content/message</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem C</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unappealing content</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem D</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No useful message</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not easily understood</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boring</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.4 (a)
SCHOOL C: Poem B was the least liked, followed by both Poem D and Poem A in second place. Poem C came last in the ranking of least liked poems. An interesting finding is that, like in School B, some pupils apparently did not understand the meaning of 'least'. Once again, like in School B, 'least' was interpreted as meaning the 'best'. As more pupils in School C made this error the researcher thought it fit to include the reasons given as 'nonsensical reasons'. Reasons listed as nonsensical are actually reasons for liking the poem.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem A</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nonsensical reason</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No reason</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem B</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nonsensical reason</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No useful information/lesson</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult to understand</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not universal enough</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult language</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem C</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nonsensical reason</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poem D</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not interesting</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No lesson</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language difficult</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nonsensical</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.4 (b)
QUESTION 11.5
Have you read any of these poems before?

Comment
SCHOOL B: Eighteen pupils responded positively. Three pupils had not read any of the poems.
   Yes - 18
   No - 3

SCHOOL C: Nineteen pupils responded positively. One pupil had not read any of the poems.
   Yes - 19
   No - 1

QUESTION 11.6
If Yes, tick which ones.

Poems previously read
[School B]

Poems previously read
[School C]
Comment

SCHOOL B:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>POEM</th>
<th>READ BY NO. OF PUPILS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blank</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.6 (a)

One pupil read both A and B (at home) hence 22 although 21 pupils

SCHOOL C:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>POEM</th>
<th>READ BY NO. OF PUPILS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.6 (b)

The total number of poems read will not correspond to the number of pupils, because pupils chose more than one poem.

QUESTION 11.7

Say where you read the poem.

**Where read [School B]**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poems</th>
<th>at school</th>
<th>at home</th>
<th>elsewhere</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.7 (a)

**Where read [School C]**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poems</th>
<th>at school</th>
<th>at home</th>
<th>elsewhere</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.7 (b)
Comment
SCHOOL B: Eighteen pupils read Poem A at school and 1 pupil read Poem B at home. Poem C and Poem D were not listed as read.

SCHOOL C:
Eighteen pupils read Poem A at school and one pupil read Poem B at school. Two pupils read Poem C at school and one pupil read Poem C at home. This is indeed a revelation and a hopeful sign as Poem C is not a prescribed poem. Seventeen pupils read Poem D at school.

QUESTION 11.8
Which poem/s has the nicest print and layout?

Print and layout
[School B]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poems</th>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Print and layout
[School C]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poems</th>
<th>Number of pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 11.8

Comment
SCHOOL B: The choice of Poem A by 12 pupils as having the nicest print and layout indicates that pupils were discriminating and detached because Poem C was the most popular poem but as far as print and layout is concerned the pupils rated it second. Poems B and D were both rated third.

SCHOOL C: As the figure indicates Poem C emerged as the most popular followed by Poem A and B. Poem D was rated as the least pleasing, and two pupils returned blanks. The blanks could mean that pupils felt that all were equally good or bad; or they may not have fully comprehended the question.
SECTION D

CONCLUSION OF CHAPTER 3 (MAIN RESEARCH)

A brief analysis of the responses indicates a slight swing in favour of poetry. There were more pupils who found the poems easier and the 'likes' and 'dislikes' were somewhat evenly balanced. This indicates a fairly average response to the genre ± 50% popularity rating. However, the choices indicate that prior knowledge of a poem was not necessary for the pupils to respond to a poem. Poems B and C were not prescribed but the pupils responded with the same sensitivity and confidence as they did to Poem A and D. Also the dislikes and difficulties do not necessarily imply that poetry is unpopular but that a particular type of poem may elicit a negative response.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>POEM</th>
<th>EASIEST</th>
<th>MOST DIFFICULT</th>
<th>BEST LIKED</th>
<th>LEAST LIKED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NONE</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1

[Composite table for Schools B and C - 41 pupils - 100%]

184
CHAPTER 4

INTRODUCTION
This chapter attempts to place in perspective the research findings in Chapter 3 and to explore their implications. This perspective is obtained by relating the research findings to the following.

SECTION A: - Language Policy
SECTION B: - The Multilingual and Multicultural classroom
SECTION C: - Syllabus design
SECTION D: - Prescribed poems
SECTION E: - Methodology
SECTION F: - Assessment
SECTION G: - Conclusion of Chapter 4

SECTION A
LANGUAGE POLICY
This section gives attention to the new Language in Education Policy. The Language in Education Policy is geared to adapt the National Language Policy to educational needs and to make it workable in an educational context, which is particularly sensitive to language issues.

1. Ideological standpoints
All language policies are informed or shaped to a lesser or greater degree by one or other or combinations of the following ideological standpoints:

1.1 Assimilation - absorption into the dominant language which eventually leads to monolingualism.
1.2 Indigenisation - the development of an indigenous language into a national language.
1.3 Internationalism - the choice of an international language as the national language over and above indigenous languages.
1.4 Multilingualism/Pluralism - the development of most major languages in a country in an equal and parallel fashion without any language being given dominance over the other.

South Africa, under the ANC-led government has opted for multilingualism as a solution to its language problems:

South Africa has a high degree of individual and societal multilingualism. The Constitution reflects this, and places a responsibility on government departments to
promote multilingualism. [Towards a Language Policy in Education (1995: 23)]

Therefore the Language Policy will be directed to making multilingualism the end rather than the means of its policy:

In the multilingual policy envisaged by the Department, no language should be introduced at the expense of another. The language(s) which the learners have brought to the school must rather be consciously maintained; these languages, as well as the languages which learners wish to acquire, should all form part of a dual process of self-affirmation and cognitive development. [Towards a Language Policy in Education (1995: 25)]

A plurality of languages is looked upon as a resource to be nurtured rather than a starting point which would eventually lead to a monolingual society of one chosen language, in the assimilation mode.

2. Pupil research sample.

However, the research findings in Chapter 3 were obtained just before the new Language in Education Policy was implemented and it indicates the extent to which L2 black matriculants were handicapped by the old language policy. The old policy required a pupil to pass either English or Afrikaans Higher Grade to obtain a matriculation exemption. This policy increased the failure rate among black pupils as African languages were not recognised as sufficient in themselves to get pupils university entrance. This, however, has been corrected in the new Language Policy. [See Towards a Language Policy in Education (1995: 5-8).] Table 2 is a summary of the research findings from No 7-9 of the pupil questionnaire. The summary is an average percentage of:

School A - Pilot Research.

School B and C - Main Research.

The average of the three is expressed in the following table as a percentage and is collectively referred to hereafter as the pupil research sample. Often the percentages tabled do not add up to a neat 100% because of dual responses especially where choices have to be made. Nevertheless they indicate the weight of the factors tabled, as well as pupil attitudes to English.
As would be expected in KwaZulu-Natal the majority of black matriculants are Zulu speaking.

* Main Home Language

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Home Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>73% Zulu; 27% Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>95% Zulu; 5% Xhosa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>90% Zulu; 5% Eng.; 5% Xhosa</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

School A recorded a comparatively lower rating of Zulu as a main home language because it is a boarding school and some pupils are from other provinces, where Zulu is not the mother tongue. However, the average of the three schools is 86% with Zulu as the main language.

The unfairness of the old language policy is only too apparent. These pupils would not have benefited from the new language policy unless they repeated the matriculation examination. The real benefit will only be felt by those entering school in Grade 1. The main home language, viz. Zulu, is now, in the terminology of the new language policy, "... part of a dual process of self-affirmation and cognitive development." However, the rigidity of the old language policy left a positive spin-off in the legacy of other languages that pupils were often forced to acquire. The table indicates that pupils speak not only Zulu at home but use English as one of the OTHER HOME LANGUAGES with a surprising high frequency:

* Other Home Languages

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Other Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>73% English</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

School A recorded a comparatively lower rating of Zulu as a main home language because it is a boarding school and some pupils are from other provinces, where Zulu is not the mother tongue. However, the average of the three schools is 86% with Zulu as the main language.

The unfairness of the old language policy is only too apparent. These pupils would not have benefited from the new language policy unless they repeated the matriculation examination. The real benefit will only be felt by those entering school in Grade 1. The main home language, viz. Zulu, is now, in the terminology of the new language policy, "... part of a dual process of self-affirmation and cognitive development." However, the rigidity of the old language policy left a positive spin-off in the legacy of other languages that pupils were often forced to acquire. The table indicates that pupils speak not only Zulu at home but use English as one of the OTHER HOME LANGUAGES with a surprising high frequency:

* Other Home Languages

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Other Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>73% English</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
An average of 65% of pupils sampled used English as an additional Home Language. This percentage gives considerable credence to the policy of Additive Bilingualism or the study of an additional language, preferably English. [See Luckett (1992:51) for further discussion.]

One could predict with a reasonable amount of certainty that the policy of promoting Additive Bilingualism and the importance of English as an international language, a language of learning and of commerce, would lead to a high level of bilingualism among our pupils in future. This is further corroborated by the fact that pupils indicated English as one of the languages most used by them outside the home.

*Other languages used

School A  -  36%
School B  -  90%
School C  -  65%

Average %  191 + 3 = 63% English

The low percentage of pupils using English in School A can be attributed to the fact that School A is a boarding school. School B and C are day schools and immediately pupils leave school they are forced to use English, especially in urban areas. This imperative would not apply to a boarding school in which pupils are confined to the school premises.

In all schools the languages studied were the same, viz. English, Zulu and Afrikaans. The range of languages offered covers sufficiently the major languages used by pupils, except for Afrikaans, which is seldom used by L2 black pupils in KwaZulu-Natal as a language of communication. Therefore the range of languages used would be sufficiently broad to cover pupils' needs. However, before the introduction of the new language policy Zulu was not given the status of a language, but was designated a vernacular, and as such was not sufficient to accord a pupil the matriculation exemption. The exemption could only be obtained by passing either English or Afrikaans at the higher grade level. The new language policy, and the language in education policy in particular has elevated Zulu, as well as other African languages, to the status of languages with the right to be used where necessary as a language of learning.

A surprising feature of the old language policy and its range of languages was that it included languages that pupils actually chose as their BEST LIKED SUBJECT. Most pupils in the sample chose English as their BEST LIKED SUBJECT. This was a surprising choice as 86% of pupils recorded Zulu as the MAIN HOME LANGUAGE. One would have assumed that
from the emotional, historical and cultural point of view Zulu would have emerged as the BEST LIKED SUBJECT. However, pupils chose English as the BEST LIKED SUBJECT, and the reasons given indicate that practical considerations took precedence over all else.

* Best Liked Subject

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Average %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>School A</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School B</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School C</td>
<td>75%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

224 \div 3 = 75\% in favour of English

The near uniformity in the percentages at the three schools is noticeable. The main reasons given were:

2.1 Career advancement
2.2 Easy to understand.

It seems that practical and utilitarian considerations determined pupils' choice. This statement is further corroborated by the aspects of English that pupils found to be most interesting, viz. Oral Work and Literature. Oral work would mean practice in the ability to communicate and literature would provide critical insight into the problems of life.

3. Research findings and the New Language Policy

3.1 Pupils are likely to display a more positive attitude to the languages offered as the New Language Policy accords all three major languages, viz. Zulu, English and Afrikaans equal status. This should remove any residual negative attitudes to English as an imposed language, even though in the past English was regarded as a somewhat neutral language.

3.2 The replacement of the subtractive bilingualism of the past, in which Zulu though taught and used was relegated to the status of a vernacular has now been corrected and replaced by a policy of Additive Bilingualism. This should significantly improve pupils' overall scholastic performance as 86% of the pupils indicated that Zulu was the main language; yet 65% of the pupils indicated that English was the most frequently used Other Home Language. This makes the Zulu/English combination an extremely strong and viable additive bilingual package which is already deeply rooted in practice.

3.3 Black pupils so long disadvantaged by the language policy of the past will tend to benefit by both the old and the new language policy. The old language policy forced black pupils into acquiring a high degree of bilingualism, even though the level of English may not have always conformed to those of Standard English; nevertheless they have an ability to communicate sufficiently in English and effectively in Zulu. Pupils from other communities like the white and Indian communities have a high degree of competence in English but little or no competence
in Zulu and are therefore linguistically disadvantaged. Hence the New Language Policy is likely to receive a warm reception by black pupils as it gives recognition to their language versatility. This coupled with the fact that English was their BEST LIKED SUBJECT, even before the new language policy was implemented, assures an ongoing positive attitude to the subject, and presumably also to poetry.

To ensure that this attitude continues and improves the New Language Policy will have to impact on the following:

- Multilingual/Multicultural classroom
- Syllabus Design
- Prescribed Poems
- Methodology
- Assessment.

Consideration will now be given to the multilingual/multicultural classroom.
SECTION B

THE MULTILINGUAL/MULTICULTURAL CLASSROOM

The research findings, especially the linguistic diversity exhibited by the pupils in all schools making up the sample (see graphs below) necessitate a brief discussion as these research findings anticipated the multilingual/multicultural classroom.

Multilingualism and multiculturalism are so closely intertwined as to appear almost inextricable. However, in the interests of clarity, relevance and focus, the phenomena of multilingualism and multiculturalism will be treated as separate and discreet, acknowledging as stated earlier their interrelatedness.

1. The multilingual classroom

Wolfson (1989:257) explains:

There are majority languages and minority languages, dominant languages and oppressed languages, but there is hardly a country in the world in which only one language is spoken. Far from being a deviant phenomenon, multilingualism is, in actuality, the norm.

South Africa's multilingualism gives equal status to eleven of the majority languages, with a pledge to support the continuance and growth of minority languages at a community and regional level. The language policy is a form of articulation of the already existing language practices and patterns; it is not a conceptual imposition on a real situation. The language diversity catered for had long been in existence. The research findings of this dissertation also vindicate this, as per graphs:

Question: 7(c) What other language/s are spoken by you?

Other languages spoken by pupils

[Pilot Study]

Fig. 1
Other languages spoken by pupils

[School B]  
- English only: 12
- Zulu & English: 2
- Xhosa & English: 1
- English, Zulu: 1

[School C]  
- English & Zulu: 2
- English & Afrikaans: 1
- English & Sotho: 1
- English, Xhosa, Afrikaans: 1

Fig. 2

Given the linguistic capability and versatility demonstrated by pupils (as per graphs), it is obvious that South Africa in the past did not fully utilize its linguistic potential; even though the same languages were taught in the past in KwaZulu-Natal, viz: English, Zulu and Afrikaans. The future scenario remains identical, viz. Zulu, English and Afrikaans for these are the three official languages that qualify for inclusion into the language curriculum. The question that naturally arises is, what then is the difference between the past and the present? Perhaps the difference can be found in the philosophical underpinnings and the attitude to the languages, especially the black languages, in this particular instance, Zulu.

The 'language classroom' of the past was based on the concept of subtractive bilingualism. It is explained as follows:

Subtractive bilingualism occurs when a second language is learned at the expense of the child’s first language. This often occurs when the first language is not valued and supported by the education system. It is likewise generally agreed that subtractive bilingualism has a negative effect on a child’s social and cognitive development.

Luckett (1992:75)

The present system as proposed by the new language in education policy also still offers the same three major languages, viz: Afrikaans, Zulu and English as well as other languages that the communities may request for cultural and religious reasons. However, the philosophical underpinning is one of additive bilingualism. Luckett (1992:75) explains this concept as follows:

Additive bilingualism means the gaining of competence in a second language while the first language is maintained. This form of bilingualism can only develop in social contexts where both languages (and their cultures) are valued and reinforced.
In order to achieve the aims of Additive Bilingualism the new language in education policy has also promised to ensure that previously neglected languages be given additional resources to facilitate their development. For KwaZulu-Natal this means that Zulu, a previously neglected language, designated a vernacular rather than a language by the past governments, will enjoy additional resources and a higher status than before. Within the classroom this should change the perception of pupils and teachers alike to Zulu.

Many black parents and teachers still favour English as a MOL (Medium of Learning). This is not surprising as nearly 75% of the pupils sampled indicated English as the BEST LIKED SUBJECT. One of the reasons advanced was that it was a medium of learning. This gives support to the standpoint of subtractive bilingualism advocated by NEPI and the Threshold Project. Many black parents feel that if their children are taught through the medium of Zulu it would be a reversion to apartheid style education. The reasons forwarded are:

- There are insufficient school books in Zulu especially textbooks in the different subjects offered.
- Zulu has as yet not developed a sufficiently large vocabulary of scientific and technological terms.
- Most, if not all, the great works of arts, science and literature of all the different languages of the world have been translated into English.
- To translate textbooks, works of literature, arts and science and to develop a scientific and technological vocabulary requires time. This would mean that students would suffer in the interim.

Those in favour of Additive Bilingualism argue from the following standpoints:

- Every language has the potential to develop.
- While Zulu (for instance) is being developed the second language can provide the knowledge that has as yet not been translated into the mother tongue.
- All languages borrow, so can Zulu for instance. Agnihotri (1995:3-7) eloquently argues this point.
- Afrikaans was developed because of the material support it received from the state. The same can be done for Zulu or any other language.
- The psychological and educational benefits of Additive Bilingualism are extremely attractive. [See Luckett (1992:28-34), for a detailed discussion.]

Arguments for both subtractive and additive bilingualism are convincing and have merit within certain contexts and parameters. Whatever the final philosophical standpoint will be is uncertain. One thing is certain however, in the short term English will still maintain its place as a medium of learning.
This situation obtains because full implementation of the new language policy with a view to a multilingual classroom will still be determined by the following:

1.1 Pace of implementation.
1.2 Teacher competencies and resources.
1.3 Text books and cost.
1.4 Proposed models.

1.1 PACE OF IMPLEMENTATION

The implementation of a multilingual policy in education will vary from:

1.1.1 province to province
1.1.2 community to community
1.1.3 school to school.

Therefore uniform implementation will not be possible because of the varying receptions and degrees of readiness in different provinces, communities and schools.

Also teachers and educational authorities are not agreed as to exactly at which point in the pupils' career it would be best to implement the new language policy. At this stage of implementation the Secondary School presents a problem in that pupils would have passed through the old system for at least six to eight years and the prospect of a multilingual/multicultural classroom could be just as threatening to them as it may be to their parents and even teachers. For those in the pre-primary and primary phase it becomes more a matter of adjustment to a linguistic and cultural environment different from that encountered in the home and neighbourhood. There are other more complex problems related to implementation that are rooted in the linguistic background of pupils, Luckett (1992:66) has proposed a transitional model to cope with this and has called for more research in this direction. Perhaps schools should indicate their readiness to cope with this service as they have to provide teachers with the necessary competencies required for the multilingual classroom as well as appropriate resources such as textbooks.

1.2 TEACHER COMPETENCIES AND RESOURCES

The Language in Education Policy Document Paragraph 10.8.1 affirms the Department of Education's commitment to multilingualism in future, viz:

... the strategic vision of the Department with regard to additive bilingualism and multilingualism in education. [Towards a Language Policy in Education (1995:21)]

However, implementation brings challenges and revelations of its own. These have been anticipated in broad outline by the Policy document especially in regard to teacher training and the deployment of resources. Paragraph 10.9 states:

10.9 The Department will in consultation with the provincial departments of education, give urgent attention to the structures, systems, programmes and resources which will be required for the effective implementation of the
proposed language policy framework, and in particular the following:

10.9.1 the planning of teacher recruitment and deployment policies in such a way that multilingual capabilities among teachers in any given institution match as closely as possible the language needs of learners;

10.9.2 material resource requirements;

10.9.3 pre-service and in-service teacher education programmes;

10.9.4 capacity building for democratic governance in language policy.

[Towards a Language Policy in Education (1995:21)]

As stated earlier implementation brings demands of its own, for instance resource material for the multilingual classroom is very scant if not in some cases non-existent. This immediate requirement may not be adequately met at present. However, future preparations could include:

1.2.1 A research centre for the co-ordination of research into multilingual education which could encourage, co-ordinate and collate, edit and publish useful, local resource material.

1.2.2 Assist teachers to be researchers through in-service training, especially in action research, and to encourage teachers to submit their findings to the research centre.

1.2.3 Offer incentives to those teachers who submit useful research regularly.

1.2.4 Publish research in a quarterly or bi-annual bulletin and make this available to all language teachers.

This necessity arises as most of the available literature on multilingual education is contextualized outside South Africa, especially the English speaking countries, Britain, the United States, Canada and Australia. However useful the body of literature in multilingual education from these countries may be, its value is limited because the context which generated that literature is different viz:

a. In Britain, the USA, and Australia, English is the language of the majority.

b. Anglo-Saxon culture is dominant.

c. The historical, cultural, socio-economic and political contexts differ.

d. The English language and Anglo-Saxon culture do not have to compete with other languages and cultures - their hegemony is total except for Canada which has a large French speaking population.

South African teachers can profit from the experience of their colleagues in other countries but it would not be possible to transpose the wisdom distilled from the experiences abroad to local conditions. Some of the major reasons why material on multilingual education from abroad
should not be applied without appropriate modification are:

(i) In South Africa English is not the language of the majority.

(ii) African culture rather than Anglo-Saxon culture is dominant with the exception of the major cities.

(iii) English and to an extent Afrikaans are viewed by the majority as languages of commerce, learning and government, rather than as vehicles of culture and heritage, as in countries where Anglo-Saxon culture is dominant.

(iv) English and Afrikaans have to share resources equally with other major languages. English does not enjoy total hegemony as in Anglo-Saxon countries. Afrikaans does not have the favoured status it enjoyed under National Party rule.

For reasons stated above teachers should be cautioned about depending on resource material from outside South Africa; especially as such material could be based on assumptions of language, culture and race that may not always be in the best interests of South Africa’s multilingual education programmes. Resource material should therefore be assessed and modified to suit local conditions because:

- Theories on multilingual/bilingual education abound, but no generally accepted principles have emerged. Teachers have to exercise discrimination and choose wisely.

- Real needs should determine choice of methodology.

- Improvisation, creativity and ingenuity should take precedence over dependence on authoritative resource material. The teacher should lead rather than follow slavishly. However, expert advice could be applied creatively.

- Teachers should record their own worthwhile experiences to help develop a resource pool and body of literature dealing with multilingual education within the local context.


However, guidance of a general nature may not prove sufficient to give teachers already in service the confidence to handle a classroom for which no formal training was received. Teachers already in service should therefore be offered a course designed to provide competency in handling the multilingual/multicultural classroom. This course or courses could be offered as In-Service, Correspondence or Distance Education courses. Each of the above categories have merits of their own, but what they have in common is that they can help prevent an exodus of experienced teachers from the classroom to full-time training centres. To have experienced teachers leave the classroom in large numbers is not to be encouraged.

Also, multilingualism includes African languages. In the case of KwaZulu-Natal it is Zulu. There are an insufficient number of trained teachers in Zulu to service schools in areas that are predominantly Indian, coloured and white. Also resources in teaching Zulu as a second language in a multilingual context are scant. [See Dowling & Maseko (1995:100-106).]
1.3 TEXTBOOKS AND COSTS

Immediate implementation of multilingual education would mean the immediate availability of books. All books required, however, may not be ready for use at the required time. Added to the time factor is the factor of cost. McCallum (1994:127-139) discusses this point in some detail, albeit from a perspective other than that of a language teacher. Her article does raise some important points about the availability of relevant printed material for immediate implementation of the new language policy. Not all the difficulties and problems mentioned and highlighted should be regarded as insurmountable especially the cost factor. It should be borne in mind that apartheid cost the taxpayer more than the implementation of multilingual education ever will. As far as the time factor is concerned printed material should be available in the medium and long term. The problems highlighted by McCullum belong to the short term. The necessity of translating all school material into the eleven official languages falls away when we look at the various provincial language options.

The language combination in KwaZulu-Natal remains exactly as it was before the implementation of the new language policy, except for the change in status of Zulu. However, this does not alleviate the problem of books, cost and time as the materials used in the old subtractive bilingual classroom will no longer be appropriate and will need replacement, implying cost and time.

1.4 MULTILINGUAL MODELS

Teachers now await direction in the form of models for the multilingual school. As multilingualism is still in its infancy none of the models are tried and tested. Alexander (1995:80-82) proposed three models. The three models are:

1.4.1 The Multi-medium school
1.4.2 L1 (or Mother Tongue) Learning
1.4.3 The Immersion Model

These three models will be briefly explained.

1.4.1 The Multi-medium school

In this model the medium of learning is decided upon by pupils, parents and teachers who act as advisors in the choice of the medium. Pupils will also have, ceteris paribus, the privilege of choosing the medium through which they wish to learn a subject.

1.4.2 L1 as a medium of learning

Alexander (1995:80) sees this as a medium term option in which the African languages which are disadvantaged in the short term would have developed sufficiently to function as a medium of learning and English would be learnt as a second language (L2) as in any other country, e.g. Japan. This is in keeping with the official policy of additive bilingualism and the commitment to develop hitherto neglected languages. However, in the short term this is not a viable option because of the lack of resources in African languages and African language teachers in...
1.4.3 The Immersion Model

According to the model proposed by Alexander (1995:81) all teaching except the teaching of the L1 as a subject, will take place in the L2. If the L2 is Zulu in a predominantly English speaking community then all teaching and learning will take place in the L2. The implementation of this model will also be a medium term project as resources in African languages are not sufficiently developed or immediately available. This option is recommended for the senior primary or junior secondary phase upwards after the L1 has been consolidated.

No models have been advanced specifically for provinces as language options and combinations vary. However, that is not crucial as models can be created and modified to accommodate the needs as they arise. One factor that does emerge is the need for policy governing the choice and implementation of language models. Policy is necessary in order to prevent:

a. linguicism - i.e. language prejudice;
b. racial prejudice using language options as a screen;
c. model options that hinder pupil’s mobility. For instance a pupil transfers because parents have moved to another town, the language options may be different from the previous school;
d. the protection and development of minority languages and languages for religious purposes.

Lastly, it must be borne in mind that no options, models or policy can cater for all possible situations and that pupils and their communities will have to adjust although this should be reduced to a minimum.

2. The multicultural classroom

2.1 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND:

The following definition of multicultural education is the definition which underpins the ensuing discourse.

... multicultural education is an education in freedom - freedom from inherited biases and narrow feelings and sentiments, as well as freedom to explore other cultures and perspectives ... it does not cut off children from their own culture. Rather it enables them to enrich, refine and take a broader view of it without losing their roots.

Parekh (1985:22)

[See also Banks & Lynch (1986:201), and Goodey (1989:477-483.)]

The cultural diversity of countries varies and even within countries, different states, provinces and regions have different cultural admixtures. In South Africa, for instance, the common core
provincial cultures of the Cape, the Orange Free State, the Transvaal and Natal are markedly different. The old provincial demarcations are used for it is within those boundaries that the characteristic cultures emerged.

In KwaZulu-Natal the cultural diversity is constituted as follows:

2.1.1 Zulus, who are the majority.

2.1.2 Whites, who are predominantly English speaking and Anglo-Saxon in cultural orientation.

2.1.3 Indians, who are English speaking but Indian in cultural orientation in comparison to whites.

2.1.4 Coloureds, who are English speaking, exhibiting predominantly white Christian culture and sometimes manifesting cultural features of other cultural groups.

2.1.5 All cultural groups exhibit features of the common core culture of KwaZulu-Natal and the common core culture of South Africa. [See Thembla (1992:10-13).]

In South Africa, as elsewhere, varying responses emerged to cultural diversity. The most common responses to the phenomenon of cultural diversity are:

(a) Monoculturalism in which all minority cultures are assimilated. Often called assimilation. A policy followed in the United States, Britain, Australia and Canada until the mid 1960s. Resistance was experienced from minority groups thrown into the ‘melting pot’ [See Ravitch (1992:39).]

(b) Cultural pluralism is a paradigm in which diverse cultures co-exist in harmony without cultural hegemony of any culture. In practice this seldom obtains. India is a fairly good example of cultural pluralism. South Africa of the Apartheid era is an example of cultural pluralism used to serve political ends. Rather than unity, cultural exclusivity and cultural differences were emphasized. Also Anglo-Boer culture exercised cultural hegemony as contributions from other cultures were largely ignored.

(c) Multiculturalism. This concept as defined earlier regards cultural diversity as a resource and encourages the retention of one's culture without denigration of another. Different cultures are regarded as tributaries that feed and enrich the main core culture. The United States, Britain, Australia and Canada have now opted for the multicultural paradigm. The latest country to adopt the multicultural paradigm is South Africa.

2.2 THE PRESENT SCENARIO:

Cultural diversity is the starting point of multicultural education. In South Africa resources in this field are scant as multicultural education is still in its infancy. The South African penchant
to rely on ‘overseas’ authorities may not pay dividend as resource and research material from countries like the United States, Britain, Australia and Canada may not have direct relevance. Mention is made of these countries repeatedly because material is accessible. Experiments in cultural diversity have also been made in the former Soviet Union and the former Yugoslavia but language barriers prevent use and interchange. The positive spin-off from other countries lies in the lessons South African educators can learn from the experiments and experiences of others. Finally we will have to test the theories ourselves, and arrive at our own conclusions and principles. We cannot adopt the multicultural programmes of the United States, Britain, Australia and Canada because in South Africa we have:

2.2.1 An indigenous majority - therefore African culture rather than any other culture predominates, especially in rural areas.

2.2.2 Racism which was enforced and entrenched by law and geographical separation is still almost intact. Unlike in other countries where it existed and operated in a more subtle way.

2.2.3 Cultural diversity in South Africa because Apartheid left us with more sub-cultures than any other country in the world with perhaps the exception of India. Foreign multicultural education programmes could not have envisaged such diversity and psychological baggage, viz. racism, sexism, sectionalism, linguicism and many other -isms.

2.2.4 The educational system of South Africa until April 1994 was directed at training teachers to teach in a monocultural context within a culturally plural society. Teachers of different racial and ethnic groups only taught within their own racial and ethnic groups, sometimes even narrowing it down to religious and cultural groups. Thus nearly all the teachers in the field at present were trained for monocultural schools rather than multicultural schools. These teachers will have to undergo a re-orientation through in-service programmes that will focus on attitudes, values, learning skills and cultural content of the different cultural groups. The teachers should also be informed as to why a commitment to multicultural education is more beneficial than other alternative paradigms.

2.2.5 Apartheid left South Africa the legacy of a highly polarized society. This makes multicultural education new, strange and unacceptable to some, therefore resistance should not be confined to any racial group, community or organization. Even pupils themselves could form a resistance, being reared in a racially and culturally segregated society, they could easily exhibit unacceptable stereotypical behaviour. Therefore highly trained teachers for the multicultural classroom is our most immediate need if
multicultural education is to be seriously implemented.

2.3 RESOURCES FOR THE MULTICULTURAL CLASSROOM

Teachers: The main resource is highly trained teachers. Van Zijl (1987:189) talks of a programme to 'train the teachers' which in effect would require an overhaul from the ministerial level down to the classroom making the basic principles of multiculturalism second nature. This is especially important as the South African classroom has always been teacher centred. The teacher-centred orientation had its origin in the ideology of Apartheid. The teacher was seen as the transmitter of culture, especially Christian National culture and values, and this together with Fundamental Pedagogics formed the philosophical basis for teacher education. The opposite is true of the multicultural classroom. Each pupil is seen as a custodian of the culture from which she/he originates and is accepted as a transmitter of that culture. The pupil is also allowed within the parameters of the classroom to transmit that culture. Hence each pupil is a transmitter and creator of culture, not only the teacher, and they collectively form the multicultural classroom, which unlike the teacher-centred perspective is conducive to interactive and collaborative approaches to learning.

The multicultural classroom does not imply the abdication of teacher responsibility or uselessness of teacher competencies, it implies the development of new competencies and skills. Tomlinson (1981:55-72) enumerates them:

2.3.1 to analyse one’s own roots;
2.3.2 to analyse the nature and quality of and interaction in multicultural settings;
2.3.3 to foster interaction among pupils from different cultural groups;
2.3.4 to teach cultural content which deals with value-laden issues of power, racism, injustice and discrimination.

2.4 INFRASTRUCTURE AND MATERIAL

As relevant material is scant it is necessary to build a resource pool. The Education Department could implement the following:

2.4.1 Establishment of research centres preferably to collate, edit and publish research by teachers. This could be combined with multilingualism and published in a bi-monthly or quarterly bulletin that is made available to all schools. The bulletin could also provide among many other demands, channels for a network system, in conjunction with computer networking.

2.4.2 Textbooks should reflect the cultural diversity, especially at provincial level. This diversity is then more easily recognized and appreciated by pupils. Sensitivity to cultural diversity can be shown in the use of names, colours, religious symbols, and festivals,
pictures and other graphic illustrations. [See Blacquière (1995:84-125), for a detailed discussion.]

2.5 POETRY IN THE MULTICULTURAL CLASSROOM

The poetry selection should reflect the aims of multiculturalism, viz:

2.5.1 Multicultural education is intended to de-condition the child as much as possible in order that he can go into the world free from bias and prejudice [See Modgil (1986:26).]

2.5.2 Provide exposure to a plurality of cultures.

2.5.3 Encourage a re-appraisal of one's own culture in relation to that of others.

2.5.4 Lead to an intelligent and creative absorption, adoption and modification of what is best in other cultures. Sowell (1992:29) encapsulates it: 'The history of human progress is marked by transfers of culture from one group to another'.

Poetry through the ages has tended to expose the most exalted aspect of the human psyche. In the twentieth century the eclecticism of the great poets became obvious as with Yeats and Eliot. This awareness of diversity and its value is also reflected in our local poetry. Therefore poetry becomes a potent vehicle for forging a common culture. For these aims to be realized changes will have to be affected in the following:

- Syllabus design
- Prescribed poems
- Teaching Methodologies
- Assessment.

SECTION C:

SYLLABUS DESIGN

The discussion sustains the division and difference between the syllabus and curriculum as outlined in Chapter 2. However, it should be recorded that the re-designing of the syllabus is stressed rather than curriculum reform, because in South Africa the syllabus has always been accepted as an authoritative policy document. This has given rise to various perceptions of the syllabus ranging from that of an instrument of oppression, stagnation and now to one of change.

While the syllabus embodies the Education Policy, the curriculum on the other hand involves the entire education process within which are many variables that cannot be quantified,
accounted for, or even anticipated, for instance the ‘Hidden Curriculum’. Therefore the syllabus rather than the curriculum was chosen as a starting point for change as the syllabus is a document, and as such tangible proof of a statement of intent. The following aspects of the syllabus will be discussed:

1  Research findings and the syllabus.
2  The D.E.T. syllabus.
3  The Interim Core syllabus
4  The Interim Core Syllabus in relation to the research findings.

1  Research findings and the syllabus

Pupils’ responses to the syllabus were not directly sought in the questionnaire for the following reasons:

1.1 Few, if any, pupils would have access to the syllabus as even teachers at that time could seldom secure one for their own use. Walters and England (1988:245): ‘The project leader encountered between 400 and 500 black Std 9 and 10 teachers on in-service courses over the past seven years, not one, in his estimation, had any detailed knowledge of the contents of the syllabus (the set works are published as a separate list) : between 1% and 2% had ready or easy access to a syllabus (in, say, a headmaster’s office).’

1.2 The D.E.T. syllabus itself would be of little value to pupils as far as poetry is concerned as the syllabus dispenses with poetry in a few lines:

‘Pupils are required to study ONE work from each of any two sections. TWO works in all.

Section 1 : Drama
Section 2 : Poetry (Approximately 20 poems or 400 lines)
Section 3 : Novel
Section 4 : Open (this could include short stories, relevant prose)

[D.E.T. Syllabus (1985:5)]

The poetry option was usually ignored by most teachers. The researcher found difficulty in securing schools that offered poetry. ‘Less than half the questionnaire teachers had chosen the poetry option in the last three years and, looking at it, I am surprised that any did.’

[Reid (1982:336)]

1.3 As the syllabus is a very general policy guideline and few pupils had access to it, it was thought prudent to seek their responses to the prescribed works, with which they would be better acquainted.
1.4 Lastly pupils’ responses will inevitably cast light and judgement on the syllabus whether or not directly questioned. The pupil response to the BEST LIKED POEM is proof of this:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poem</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>Not prescribed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>Prescribed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>Prescribed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>Not prescribed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The best liked poem is not prescribed, yet pupils in three schools understood the poem sufficiently enough to uniformly appreciate the poem and show a preference for it over and above the prescribed poems. The syllabus does not indicate how the selection of literary works is made. Some indication should be made in future syllabi about the criteria for the selection of prescribed set works and poems.

2 The D.E.T. syllabus [See Appendix 2A]

The rapidity with which the D.E.T. syllabus was replaced by the Interim Core Syllabus highlights the importance of the syllabus issue. The implementation dates as stated in the Interim Core syllabus are:

- Std 8 and 9 : 1995
- Std 10 : Jan 1996

At the time of printing the new syllabus grades had not officially replaced the use of standard. Some reasons that can be forwarded for this rapid replacement are:

2.1 The D.E.T. syllabus did not serve the ideological aims of the new democratic government in South Africa, as it was based on the ideology underpinning apartheid.

2.2 Multilingualism became the official language policy of the new democratic South Africa in which eleven major languages were given official status. The D.E.T. syllabus promoted only two official languages - English and Afrikaans.

2.3 The D.E.T. syllabus functioned within the context of subtractive bilingualism in which African languages were regarded as vernaculars rather than languages.

2.4 It is a narrow syllabus in that it separates content and methodology. This seems contrary to its stated aim of communicative competence. As Nunan (1989:5) pointed out in communicative language teaching it is difficult to sustain a clear distinction between content and methodology. The syllabus needed to adjust. The D.E.T. syllabus was a final product syllabus in that it was examination oriented. However, the limited means at the disposal of the Education Department under the old government and the logistical
problems concerning staffing, mainly through a lack of funds made a product syllabus perhaps the only syllabus that could function in such a context. As a process syllabus would require highly trained staff and in numbers that were not readily available at that time.

3 The Interim Core Syllabus [See Appendix 2B]

Some important features of this syllabus are:

3.1 A lack of finality, the opening lines of the preamble state: 'At no stage should this syllabus be considered a final product.' [Interim Core Syllabus (1995, Preamble.)] This openness and flexibility is a welcome change.

3.2 The importance of English is emphasized in spite of the multilingual policy in education. However, the syllabus is explicit that the stress on the importance of English is an interim and pragmatic consideration:

... in the present situation therefore, and until new language in education policies are in place, the ability to understand and to use English effectively is important. [Interim Core Syllabus (1995, Preamble.)]

3.3 It is a syllabus that hopes to promote multilingualism and multiculturalism in keeping with the linguistic and cultural diversity in South Africa. [Interim Core Syllabus (1995, Preamble)]

3.4 A syllabus that acknowledges the connection between language and cognitive development. [Interim Core Syllabus (1995, Preamble)]

3.5 It sees language learning as a process rather than product.

3.6 This syllabus encourages communicative language teaching.

4. The Interim Core Syllabus in relation to research findings

As in the D.E.T. syllabus, poetry in the Interim Core Syllabus is classified under Literature and literature in turn is classified as part of reading. [See Interim Core Syllabus (1995:5).] Literature is therefore thought of as a strategy to encourage reading. The success of this strategy in the past has been anything but spectacular and it is unlikely to change in the future unless sufficient attention is given to the majority in the target group who happen to be black pupils. The majority of black pupils come from a background of oral literacy, not one which has a deeply rooted culture of reading. [See Mawasha (1982:17.)] A definite and aggressive attempt should be made countrywide to cultivate and encourage a culture of reading, if literature learning and teaching as part of the reading programme at school is to have any meaning at all.
However, it should be noted that what were formerly black schools had ill-equipped libraries with few books, the nature and relevance of which will also be in question. [See Walters & England (1988:224.)] This factor is further aggravated by the low socio-economic status of the majority of black pupils as the research findings for School B and C indicate:

**QUESTION 4(a): FATHER/GUARDIAN EMPLOYED**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCHOOL B</th>
<th>SCHOOL C</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>Employed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52%</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4a

The average unemployment rate is 44% for both schools. Of those fathers and guardians employed in both schools B and C only three appear to be professional, two policemen and one male nurse. The rest are ordinary labourers or tradesmen. There are no businessmen. [See Chapter 3, p. 154 for table.]
A similar situation obtains for the question on mother/guardian employed.

**QUESTION 5(a): MOTHER/GUARDIAN EMPLOYED.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCHOOL B</th>
<th>SCHOOL C</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>Employed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43%</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>No response</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4b

The average rate of unemployment for mothers/guardians in School B and C = 54%. This means that pupils would lack the socio-economic ambience which allows for the luxury of purchasing books and other audio-visual media like television, radio and magazines.

If getting pupils to read is problematic, getting them to read poetry is even more problematic. Drama and prose have had strong support from the audio-visual media viz. television, radio, video tapes, cinema, newspapers and magazines. Pupils and the public generally consider the information and entertainment received from the audio-visual media sufficient in itself and do not consider it necessary to read the play or novel on which the film or drama serial is based. If such a situation obtains for drama and prose (viz. The play, novel and short story) which have at least the advantage of exposure, the predicament of genres like poetry that have almost no exposure can be imagined.

Since poetry does not enjoy the support of the audio-visual media to the extent that genres like the novel and play do, steps should be taken to popularize it:

- Poetry competitions could be sponsored by big business, scholarship foundations or educational magazines. [See Stanford M. (Editor 1996) *Upbeat* No 5 (August 1996:29.)]
- Television programmes and comics based on epic South African poetry that would be of historical and personal interest, e.g. *Shaka the Great* by Mazizi Kunene, with English subtitles or in English translation.
- Dramatization by *imbongis* on television programmes of important historical events from the African perspective with English subtitles or subsequent explanations in English. These would be seen as a genuine attempt to use the black pupils’ background of oral literacy.

The use of the oral tradition of blacks should not be seen or construed as condescension by
those who have a history of a written tradition. Simply because oral traditions existed everywhere, in Eastern countries the oral and written traditions co-existed. The great epics of India were transmitted orally for hundreds of years before being committed to writing. As the incentives to read poetry are fewer in comparison to other genres poetry teachers should find innovative ways to encourage its revival. Rather than depend only on pupils reading poetry, pupils could be exposed to renditions of dramatic poetry, poetry recitals, competitions, impromptu compositions and so on. This would be preferable to completely transposing the oral tradition to a written one. Means could be devised whereby the oral and written tradition complement and support each other. The imbongi can now record his composition - the case of Dr Matabela mentioned in Chapter 1, p38, is an example. [See Cope (1986:158)]

Oral traditions of the different groups making up the cultural admixture of KwaZulu-Natal could be appropriated to form the basis of material for the multicultural poetry class. The advent of writing in India and the Middle East did not lead to the demise of the oral traditions. Even to this day numerous stanzas, if not the entire Gita and the Koran or the Ramayana and the Vedas are committed to memory, even though they have been in writing for thousands of years. This practice of memorization is usually done in early childhood from about 4 years when the child is eager to learn and the memory receptive. The rationale given is that when the verses are memorized they become structured within the psyche of the child, who can then claim it as knowledge, even though the child may not understand the subtle and sublime nature of the verses. However, as the child grows the significance of the verses become apparent, almost through an osmotic process, as if the period of growth were a gestation period necessary for meaning to take birth. This is a piece of eastern wisdom worth verifying in the interest of poetry revival.

Changes in the syllabus per se are not sufficient and should be translated into effects that are felt in the following:

Prescribed poems
Methodology
Assessment.

The prescribed poems will now be considered in the light of the preceding discussion.
SECTION D

PRESCRIBED POEMS

The following were considered important implications in regard to prescribed poems:

1 Syllabus design
2 A balanced selection
3 Relevance and interest
4 Accessible language
5 The multi-classroom

1 Syllabus design

The design of the literature syllabus should not allow such latitude of choice that poetry can be excluded. Rather latitude should be allowed within genres, as to the range of poems, short stories or novels that could be chosen for study. Wider choice does have its problems, especially if teachers lack confidence; more detailed syllabi or curriculum programmes can be implemented to address that problem.

However, the syllabus and curriculum are complex issues tied to education policy, prescribed books and the availability of books and suitable teaching personnel. The ‘correct’ education policy is not a guarantee of correct practice, though it is indeed a good starting point. Such a policy starting point could be built into a syllabus that makes the study of poetry compulsory rather than an avoidable option.

2 Balanced selection

The past policy of subtractive bilingualism surfaced clearly in the D.E.T. prescribed poems, the imbalance between Eurocentric poems and poems of other cultures, especially African, is evidence of such a policy. The following percentages corroborate this by offering a quantitative perspective:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nov. 1990 - June 1993</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>(Eurocentric) D.E.T. selection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov. 1993 - June 1996</td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>(Eurocentric) D.E.T. selection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov 1996 - June 1999</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>(Eurocentric) Ex N.E.D./KwaZulu Natal selection</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2a

(The analysis of the D.E.T. poems will be found in Chapter 2, p 96-101, and the analysis of the Ex N.E.D./KwaZulu-Natal selection can be found in Appendix IIIIB.)
The D.E.T. was replaced in KwaZulu-Natal by the ex Natal Education Department. The new dispensation was unable to make radical changes immediately, in accordance with its new policy of additive bilingualism, hence 76% of the poems for Nov. 1996 - June 1999 are Eurocentric. However, in terms of poems by South African poets, irrespective of race or colour, a significant increase was noted:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Percentage of South African Poets</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nov. 1990 - June 1993</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov. 1993 - June 1996</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov 1996 - June 1999</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

of the 47% (Nov. 1996 - June 1999):

- 63% were white South Africans
- 37% were black South Africans

It would be a reasonable surmise to say that 63% of white South African poets would still uphold the Eurocentric view of life. However, the selectors could have felt that too radical a shift from the nature of poems previously prescribed could be disadvantageous to the present matriculants who have spent at least eight to nine years studying poetry of a predominantly Eurocentric type. A radical change could make both teacher and pupil feel threatened or disoriented; this could change pupils' attitudes and response to poetry and affect pupil performance in the matriculation examination. However, this is only an assumption and an attempt to find a rationale for the N.E.D. selection of Nov. 1996 - June 1999.

3 Relevance and interest

The inclusion of contemporary poems with appeal would mean the inclusion of a larger number of poems in non-standard English, often called 'People's English'. Though poems in non-standard English have been generally the domain of black poets, some white South African poets have also used it successfully. Jeremy Cronin's *To learn how to speak* is an example. The acceptance of poems, with literary merit in non-standard English would mean that more literature would be available. The call for the acceptance of literary work with merit in non-standard English started in the early 1970s with William Labov and Paolo Friere who viewed purist obsessions in language as an oppressive and hegemonic practice designed to entrench the power of the elite. [See Labov (1969, 22:1-31); Friere (1971:122); Ngugi (1993:6-7).]

1. Natal Education Department hereafter referred to as N.E.D.
The pupil's choice of the LEAST LIKED and MOST DIFFICULT POEM, viz:

Poem B  *Faraway City*  (Most difficult)
Poem D  *The Gamblers*  (Least liked)

indicates that the use of language could have been one of the deciding factors in the choice. Making the target language easy to access is one of the cardinal principles of effective L2 teaching/learning practice. Within South Africa calls for the inclusion of works in non-standard English, Peoples' English, have also come from academics and educationists. [See Harley (1991: 19) and Chapman (1990:39-45).]

### 4 Accessible language

Pupil response to the BEST LIKED POEM viz. Poem C - *Sea and Sand* together with the choice of the EASIEST POEM viz. *The Hermit* indicate that pupils preferred contemporary poems with simple diction and style. Related to this is pupil response to PRINT AND LAYOUT, pupils once again chose:

Poem A  *The Hermit*  -  47%
Poem C  *Sea and Sand*  -  45%

Pupil preference could be summarized as follows:

4.1 Contemporary South African poetry was a first preference, not necessarily black as indicated in preference for Poem A as first choice.

4.2 Themes relevant to South Africa and set in South Africa also appealed to pupils. The choice of Poem C corroborates this.

4.3 Simplicity of style and diction as a criteria of choice is vindicated in the choice of Poem A and C as first and second choice.

4.4 Pupils' preference in PRINT AND LAYOUT indicated that familiar and uncomplicated stanza arrangement and appearance had the greatest appeal.

Unfortunately a large percentage of the poems prescribed from 1990 until 1999 do not always conform to the above criteria. For pedagogical reasons it would be necessary to strike an optimum balance between lexically simple and lexically complicated poems. Research is required in this direction.

### 5 Poetry in the ‘multi-classroom’

Cultural diversity in South Africa is regionalised. Different regions having different cultural diversities. In KwaZulu-Natal for instance the diversity comprises Indians, blacks (predominantly Zulus) and whites who are predominantly English speaking. The National Party government tackled the phenomenon of diversity from the standpoint of racial and
cultural exclusivity and separation. The African National Congress government has embarked on a multilingual and multicultural policy rather than one of linguistic and cultural separation. We are now entering an era which the United States, Canada, Australia and Britain entered in the late 1960s and early 1970s. These countries have the advantage of experience in the handling of the ‘multi-classroom’. However much we may learn from the experiences of other countries, real progress will depend on how willing and bold we are in experimenting with our own situation, using our own resources, and learning from our own experience. The emphasis on our own is made bearing in mind the South African obsession of doing what ‘overseas countries’ are doing regardless of its applicability.

An innovative and creative teacher can find inexhaustible resources for poetry teaching in the ‘multi-classroom’ in KwaZulu-Natal. One such resource would be the oral traditions of poetry. The oral traditions were chosen because they are a common denominator in all poetic traditions. The oral traditions of the different cultural groups in KwaZulu-Natal are discussed below as an example:

5.1 Poetry could be introduced as early as possible, as poetic verses of scripture are taught to Indian children even at pre-primary level. Limericks and tongue-twisters are found in most European oral traditions. In traditional African society poetry was used as a pedagogical tool and poetry, song and dance all served that purpose. [See Weinberg (1984:vi-vii.)]

5.2 The indigenous oral tradition plus the imported Indian and white oral traditions form a basis for a worthwhile cultural interchange, giving added value to the ‘multi-classroom’.

5.3 The recognition of the value of oral traditions and the reintroduction of oral renditions of poetry should be interpreted as an advance in the direction of teaching poetry rather than poems. The feeling for poetry and an awareness of the possibilities of language is easily inculcated in children as living traditions are still found in African and Indian culture. In Indian culture children are expected to memorize large chunks of scripture, the poetic value of which is almost immediately apparent to them; the literary and spiritual value it is purported will grow on the child with the passage of time, as part of the maturation process.

5.4 The oral tradition in poetry should not be misconstrued as a ‘sing-song pastime’ confined to the primary school, but rather seen as an activity that starts at the earliest possible level in primary school and continues to the highest level in secondary school. Improvisation and interpretation are important facets of the oral tradition usually associated with intellectual maturity. Though the ability to create and improvise is not expected of everyone, the ability to interpret is, as interpretation forms the basis of communication in
most oral traditions. The following are examples:

5.4.1 The subtle nuances of the *imbongi* - such as sarcasm, innuendoes, exaggeration, etc.

5.4.2 Mantras, Sutras and Stotras require interpretation as meaning is extremely condensed using symbols and sound codes.

5.4.3 Riddles and sometimes limericks often require high level cognitive activity to unravel.

All these facets of the oral traditions could be further enlivened by inviting an *imbongi*, or priests / scholars of the Muslim, Christian, Hindu, Jewish and other religious faiths to explain the significance of their scripture which usually has a poetic form. The sheer novelty of the experience for high school pupils will add a new dimension to poetry teaching and learning.

However, appropriate material can only produce the desired outcome if informed by the appropriate methodology and manner of assessment. With that in mind the following will be discussed:

Methodology
Assessment

**SECTION E**

**METHODOLOGY**

This section assesses the research findings of chapter 3 against the historical background of classroom methodology as discussed in chapter 2. The manner in which this is done is as follows:

1. The questionnaire and classroom methodology.
2. The research findings.
3. The future scenario.

1 **The questionnaire and classroom methodology**

The questionnaire deliberately omitted direct questions on classroom methodology for the following reasons:

1.1 Teachers were interviewed briefly at each school before pupils attempted the questionnaire. At no stage did the researcher want the teachers to feel that their teaching practices were the subject of scrutiny. The purpose of the research was to ascertain black matriculants' attitudes to poetry. If classroom methodology was a major determining
factor in this attitude then the questionnaire afforded enough scope without the necessity of a direct question. This oblique method provided an opportunity for a more spontaneous response from pupils as neither pupil nor teacher felt threatened.

1.2 At the time the research was conducted the pupil/teacher ratio in black schools ranged from: 34 to 59:1 in different areas [See Krige & Scott (1994:30).] With a high pupil teacher ratio, a history of inadequate and unequal teacher training, and a lack of proper facilities and infrastructure at black schools unfair comparisons may have resulted.

1.3 Pupil/teacher relationships were sensitive at that time and still are; therefore a direct question on methodology was unlikely to draw approval from teachers or an unbiased response from pupils. The questionnaire attempted to depersonalize pupil response in the interest of objectivity in a subject like English that could have been viewed as an imposition among predominantly Zulu speaking pupils. The research findings indicated that 86% of pupils used Zulu as their first language. However, pupil response to English was positive.

1.4 The D.E.T. syllabus, the nature of the prescribed poems, the pupil/teacher ratio and lack of proper facilities and infrastructure often did not lend itself to the successful application of communicative and interactive classes and creative responses from pupils. Therefore a direct question to pupils on classroom methodology may have drawn a response that is unmindful of the constraints under which the teachers in black schools have to function. Thus the pupil response could be a distorted one.

1.5 Also expectations of the teacher by parents, pupils and the teaching fraternity militated in favour of the transmission mode. Many parents were products of a transmission mode of tuition and knew no better. Pupils often considered communicative and interactive methods of teaching as a ploy by the teacher to avoid work and have them (the pupils) work instead. Also the teaching fraternity starting with pre-service training was such that the teacher's role was determined as one of an authority figure within the social context by such philosophies as Christian Nationalism and Fundamental Pedagogics. This gave rise to the perception by pupils of the teacher as an authority who would lead them, rather than viewing learning as a collaborative effort. Hence the expectation of a transmission mode of teaching by almost all stakeholders at that time.

1.6 Lastly, all reasons given above were precautionary measures to avoid misunderstandings. Although faced with seemingly insurmountable problems many teachers in the KwaZulu-Natal black schools have employed and devised effective methods of teaching. The responses discussed in the research findings, particularly the discriminating and critical insight of pupils, is a vindication of this claim.
2 Research findings

The questions that provided information considered to be relevant to methodology are the following:

Questionnaire questions: 8c - Best liked subject
11.1 - Easiest poem
11.2 - Most difficult poem
11.3 - Best liked poem
11.4 - Least liked poem
11.5 - Poems previously read
11.8 - Print and layout

2.1 BEST LIKED SUBJECT

75% of the pupil sample indicated that English was their best liked subject. Whatever the reasons for the popularity of English as a subject some credit must be given to the teachers and classroom methodology.

2.2 THE EASIEST POEM

The choice indicated by the pupil sample was as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poem A</th>
<th>Poem B</th>
<th>Poem C</th>
<th>Poem D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>41%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The 12% discrepancy is accounted for in dual responses or no response.

However, Poem A - *The Hermit* by Alan Paton - was chosen as the easiest poem. Here again some credit has to be given to the methodologies employed in teaching poetry, as this statement is made on the strength of the pupil’s choice of the second easiest poem - *Sea and Sand* - which was not a prescribed poem. Had both the easiest and the second easiest been prescribed poems one could surmise that the choice was based on familiarity alone and not on understanding. Therefore it is reasonable to conclude that teaching methodology had been effective enough to cultivate a discerning mentality.

2.3 MOST DIFFICULT POEM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poem A</th>
<th>Poem B</th>
<th>Poem C</th>
<th>Poem D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>111%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The discrepancy of 11% is accounted for by dual responses. Poem B - *Faraway City* by Jeremy Cronin - was chosen as the most difficult poem. However, the most significant finding was the pupils' choice of Poem A - *The Hermit*, a prescribed poem - as more difficult than Poem C - *Sea and Sand* - a poem not prescribed. This indicates that pupils made an independent judgement, free from the influence of the teacher. This phenomenon reflects positively on the teachers and their methodological practices which had sufficiently cultivated an independent and discriminating mentality. This perception is further corroborated in pupil responses to the BEST LIKED and LEAST LIKED poems.

### 2.4 BEST LIKED POEM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poem</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poem A</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem B</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem C</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem D</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The discrepancy of 6% is accounted for in dual/no response. Poem C was chosen as BEST LIKED POEM, yet it was not chosen as the EASIEST POEM, that choice fell to Poem A, a prescribed poem. Pupils realized within the limited time given for answering the questionnaire that understanding did not necessarily imply preference, though they considered Poem A the easiest poem to understand they liked Poem C the best. That this was not a fluke or random choice is confirmed by the pattern that emerged from the least liked poem.

### 2.5 LEAST LIKED POEM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poem</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poem A</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem B</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem C</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem D</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The discrepancy of 2% is accounted for in dual/no response. Poem D was chosen as the least liked, but Poem B was the most difficult. Once again pupils manifested sufficient discrimination; some credit has to be given to the mediation process which must have been fairly adequate for pupils to respond in this manner without prior knowledge or tuition and within a limited time.

### 2.6 POEMS PREVIOUSLY READ

The value of this question as an indicator of methodological practices lies in the fact that effective poetry mediation should encourage independent reading of poetry. The pattern that emerged from pupils' responses was predictable to an extent, in that the prescribed poems
were previously read by a large percentage of pupils.

Poem A read by 89%
Poem B read by 2%
Poem C read by 5%
Poem D read by 60%
No response 3%
159%

The nature of the question and the dual nature (sometimes triple) of the response is responsible for the fact that the total percentage does not add up to a neat 100%. However, from the statistics available it is uncertain whether the reading of poems that were not prescribed were inspired by exciting methodological practices or other factors. The fact that poems not prescribed were read even by a small percentage is an achievement worth noting, especially in black schools that usually avoided the poetry option.

2.7 PRINT AND LAYOUT

Pupils preferred poems with the simplest print and layout patterns. Pupil preference for the familiar and simple patterns indicated a limited exposure to the reading of poetry in which they might not have encountered more complex and creative stanza patterns. This observation has to be understood in the context of poetry teaching/learning in black schools at that time. A vigorous poetry programme informed by appropriate methodology, at the earliest convenient point in a pupil’s career would perhaps encourage a wider reading of poetry with more varied patterns of print and layout.

3 The future scenario

The future scenario is likely to be strongly influenced by Outcomes-Based Education. This approach and its impact on the future will be discussed in the following sequence.

3.1 Definition
3.2 Characteristics
3.3 Positive aspects
3.4 Challenges facing implementation
3.5 Possibilities for poetry learning/teaching.
3.1 DEFINITION OF THE APPROACH

Like any approach, there are many different definitions to it, arising from the interpretation of the approach. Generally Outcomes-Based Education is one which gives direction to educational intention and makes explicit the means by which that intention will be brought to fruition. Killen (1996:1) defines it as follows:

It is this link between intentions and results that is at the heart of Outcomes-Based Education. Statements of intent or statements of desired educational outcomes focus attention on the purpose of interaction, rather than on the content or learning experiences that are vehicles for instruction.

[More background information about Outcomes-Based Education can be found in the work of Block (Ed) (1971), Franc (1978), Mager (1962) Masters & Evans (1986), and Killen 1996.]

3.2 CHARACTERISTICS OF OUTCOME BASED EDUCATION

It is a broad based approach that is driven by purpose and intention, and is flexible enough to incorporate, co-opt or use any other approach or combination of approaches to achieve the desired outcome. In this sense Outcomes-Based Education is an eclectic and selective approach. The focus on outcomes or purpose has its origin in the major concerns of this approach, viz:

3.2.1 It is pupil-centred and optimistic about pupils' abilities to learn and succeed.

3.2.2 The approach acknowledges that all pupils have different rates of learning and that provisions for the same should be made.

3.2.3 Pupils should only be exposed to success. Pupils fail if teachers fail to recognise that the pupils are capable of succeeding. This presupposes drastic changes to the education and schooling system.

3.2.4 Pupils should be taught that each person is unique and for that reason competition is sterile whereas co-operation and collaboration enable pupils to enrich themselves as well as other pupils.

3.2.5 Since every pupil has a unique contribution to make it is a challenge for the educational system, school and teacher to actualize that unique talent.

3.2.6 Finally the relationship between teacher and pupil should be one of trust and friendship rather than authority and fear.
However, the success of Outcomes-Based Education is dependent on:

3.2.7 How focused, appropriate, practical and useful the programme is to pupils, in order for it to provide an incentive and excite pupils to learn and succeed.

3.2.8 Whether or not pupil differences will be accommodated especially in regard to time and assessment.

3.2.9 Whether or not pupils could be motivated to take responsibility for their learning.

3.2.10 How assessment and the process of learning should be integrated.

3.2.11 The outcomes and the materials selected to achieve those outcomes should have excellence and success in mind.

3.2.12 Pupil uniqueness should be interpreted as a call for excellence or maximum development of talent rather than an excuse for laziness or mediocrity.

3.3 POSITIVE ASPECTS

3.3.1 As the approach is defined in broad terms and is not prescriptive as to the methodology employed in class to achieve the outcome, the teacher is free to choose from the range of methods available, and is not constrained to employ the method that currently enjoys popularity. Simply the outcome is more important than the approach.

3.3.2 Teachers are expected to interpret the curriculum and draw up their own work programmes with their own aims and objectives, showing how these aims and objectives achieve the desired outcome. Responsibility is given to the teacher with flexibility and freedom.

3.3.3 The approach is pupil-centred and is holistic, in the sense that it sees the final outcome as the pupil’s placement and value in society as the goal. Therefore no pupil is lesser or greater than another in as much as no piece of the jigsaw puzzle that makes up the picture of society is unimportant. All pieces are necessary for a complete picture, all pupils are equally valuable because they are different for the reason that they have different roles to perform in society. Outcomes-based education should prepare the pupil for his/her role in society. Therefore motivation has to be based on self-interest as well as reason:

... students need to know why they are learning whatever they are learning and they need to see value in this learning. [Killen (1996:5)]

3.3.4 The emphasis on pupil-centredness and learning for oneself by oneself, changes the traditional roles played by teacher and pupil in our classrooms. The transmission mode of teaching, in which the teacher transmitted knowledge to the pupil, is
replaced by a learning process in which pupils play an active role in order to claim knowledge as their own.

3.3.5 As the approach is based on real outcomes, real life or true to life situations can be used as practice, thus allowing for learning through activity.

3.3.6 Time is used as a resource to accomplish an outcome. If it can be demonstrated that the outcomes that were supposed to be achieved have in fact been achieved by pupils then learning/teaching is said to have occurred. It is the outcome, rather than the finishing of the syllabus, as in content-based education, which is important.

3.3.7 Relationships and attitudes are regarded as important, creating an atmosphere conducive to learning.

3.3.8 Assessment is part of the process of learning and should be continuous, innovative and designed to cater for pupil differences. Assessment should be used positively.

3.3.9 The approach is based on the maxim that ‘Success breeds success’. It regards all pupils as potential for success.

3.3.10 Lastly, it is considered an holistic approach to education, in which neither teacher, subject nor pupil is considered a fragment. The pupil is considered a valuable person who is to be prepared for a role in society hence the different subjects are to be seen as parts of a whole scenario, and ideally a teacher using Outcomes-Based Education should emphasize the integrated nature of knowledge by showing the interrelatedness of all subjects. Only then does knowledge become useful enough for the pupil to face the final outcome, viz: the challenges of everyday life.

3.4 CHALLENGES FACING IMPLEMENTATION OF OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION

The following challenges are considered to be of immediate importance. They will be discussed in detail hereafter.

3.4.1 Consensus and appropriate outcomes.

3.4.2 Teacher awareness.

3.4.3 Time as a resource

3.4.4 Freedom and responsibility.

3.4.5 Accountability.

3.4.6 Assessment procedures.

3.4.7 Outcomes and politics.

3.4.8 Cost of implementation.
3.4.1 Consensus and appropriate outcomes
The arriving at consensus as to what are appropriate and attainable outcomes in a racially, ethnically and culturally diverse society such as South Africa is indeed a challenge. The Department of National Education has selected twelve appropriate outcomes of which seven are regarded as essential and critical outcomes. These outcomes are listed and discussed in the next section with direct reference to poetry learning/teaching. A new curriculum based on the Outcomes Approach is soon to be implemented.

3.4.2 Teacher awareness
The creation of an awareness among teachers already in service about the advantages of Outcomes-Based Education in the ‘multi-classroom’ is a challenge to in-service trainers. Also motivating pre-service teacher trainees to implement the approach when they enter service is what pre-service trainers have to seriously address.

3.4.3 Time as a resource
The ability of the education system to utilize administration, time and educational content to facilitate rather than hinder the realization of the essential/critical outcomes.

3.4.4 Freedom and responsibility
Outcomes-Based Education strongly advocates freedom. How teachers and pupils balance freedom with responsibility will determine the extent to which the approach will succeed.

3.4.5 Accountability
Accountability to society is one rationale often advanced for the choice of Outcomes-Based Education. Accountability to society means that parents and the community have a right to know what outcomes to expect in order to assess. However, the general outcomes take a long time to become visible and measurable in society. And this form of accountability remains nebulous at present. However, measurable outcomes within the classroom context are realizable but should not be emphasized at the expense of the more enlightened principles of Outcomes-Based Education.

3.4.6 Assessment procedures
To establish appropriate and practical procedures which ideally should cater for each pupil’s needs in keeping with Outcomes-Based assessment principles may require a considerably larger and adequately trained staff, as well as infra-structure, than is presently found in most schools.

3.4.7 Outcomes and politics
Outcomes-Based Education is potentially a political instrument in the hands of the party
that controls government. Outcomes could be selected to serve the purpose of political propaganda and indoctrination. Educators and society in general should regard it as a challenge to create appropriate mechanisms to prevent political interference in the designing and implementation of educational curricula.

3.4.8 Cost of implementation

Lastly, the cost of implementation will be considerable. The additional money required will have to come from taxation hence the accountability of government and educators to parents and society.

3.5 POSSIBILITIES FOR POETRY LEARNING/TEACHING

The Department of National Education has isolated twelve important outcomes in education, of which the first seven are regarded as essential or critical outcomes. The outcomes are the ability to:

3.5.1. Pose and solve problems using critical and creative thinking.
3.5.2. Interact effectively and to acknowledge diversity.
3.5.3. Make informed choices for healthy and responsible living.
3.5.4. Collect, organize and critically evaluate information.
3.5.5. Learn ways of more meaningful and effective communication.
3.5.6. Use science and technology critically, showing responsibility towards the environment and health of others.
3.5.7. Understand the world and function as a global citizen.
3.5.8. Act in a manner which reflects human dignity, justice and democratic values (*Ubuntu*).
3.5.9. Produce and appreciate culture/arts across a range of contexts.
3.5.10. Learn about education and training opportunities and career choices.
3.5.11. Learn how to learn.
3.5.12. Participate in political, social, economic and cultural processes.

Poetry learning/teaching has to be linked to the essential and other worthwhile outcomes. For instance:

3.5.1 Pose and solve problems

The ability to pose and solve problems using critical and creative thinking. Poets have been preoccupied with the problems and mysteries of life since earliest times. The poetry produced is testimony to the fact that it was done critically and creatively with the
fullest knowledge of its problematic nature. From childhood limericks, to riddles, mystic mantras and paradoxical Haikus, poetry interpretation has revealed the poetic spirit as critical and creative.

3.5.2 Interact effectively

The ability to interact effectively and to acknowledge diversity. Poets have always been the most effective and lasting spokespersons for their people. Hence their poetic utterances would help different peoples to interact effectively in diversity as they would be exposed to the best and most eloquent thoughts of other peoples. Diversity would then become a source of enrichment.

3.5.3 Make important choices

The ability to make choices for healthy and responsible living. This outcome could be used effectively in the fight against drugs, aids, child abuse, violence, cruelty to animals, environmental destruction, racism and sexism. Contemporary poetry abounds in poems with relevant themes that can be used to ensure the desired outcome.

3.5.4 Collect, organise and critically evaluate

The ability to collect, organise and critically evaluate information. Every poem could be used as an example of how the creation of poetry involves collection, organization and evaluation. One classic example for instance of the above is Wordsworth’s famous Daffodils, which was written long after the experience.

3.5.5 Learn ways of effective communication

The ability to learn ways of more meaningful and effective communication. Poetic language has proved to be the most lasting form of communication. In the hands of an innovative and creative teacher it could also prove to be one of the most meaningful and effective. In fact the more widespread use of poetry can also be propagated, for instance in advertising, as the commercial world wields immense power.

3.5.6 The science and technology

The ability to use science and technology critically, showing responsibility towards the environment and health of others. This outcome addresses an immediate need and concern. Poets have been concerned with human relationships and the environment since earliest times. The Roman poet Horace considered sailing the seas an abuse of the environment. Oil pollution by oil tankers may prove his objections to be more wise rather than naive. Much has been written on this subject as poets are sensitive to the environment.
and relevant and appropriate material can be easily selected.

3.5.7 Understand the world and function as a global citizen

The ability to understand the world and function as a global citizen. Poets are by nature global citizens as most acclaimed poetry generally embodies universal truths. Therefore poetry could be a good means to ensure the outcome of making global citizens. Richard Rive (1980:5-8) suggested the three concentric circles formula for the choice of prescribed poetry which if applied with due modification to the context (educational, cultural, racial, ethnic) should prove an effective starting point.

Outcomes not listed as essential/critical outcomes could also be considered for purposes of poetry learning/teaching. For instance the following two outcomes would form a worthwhile inclusion.

3.5.8 Act in a manner which reflects human dignity etc. (Ubuntu)

The ability to act in a manner which reflects human dignity, justice and democratic values (Ubuntu). The concept of Ubuntu forms the philosophical basis of the African oral poetic tradition, and written renditions of this oral tradition can now be used to further the cause of Ubuntu. This concept could be particularly useful in the process of creating a unified vision of a future South Africa, especially as it is completely indigenous yet compatible with the best in poetic traditions of other cultures. This concept is dealt with in detail in Chapter 1 p 40.

3.5.9 Produce and appreciate culture/arts across a range of contexts

The ability to produce and appreciate culture/art across a range of contexts. Poetry can be considered and is an art form as well as a cultural activity and to hold it out as a possible outcome of poetry learning/teaching is to turn the learning experience into a productive one. Once again the role of poets and their significance during the struggle for freedom in South Africa can be cited as an inspiration. However, the realization of the outcomes listed and discussed implies a total change in the manner in which poetry learning/teaching has been conducted in the past. The change would affect:

The Poetry curriculum
Selection of prescribed poems
Methodology
Assessment

Assessment will now be discussed as the curriculum, prescribed poems and methodology have
SECTION F

ASSESSMENT

As discussed in Chapter 2 p 94-95, the most entrenched form of assessment in South Africa is the written examination. Possible reasons for this form of assessment were also advanced. However, the situation is about to change with the introduction of the new Outcomes-Based Curriculum, which views learning as a process that requires continuous and individual assessment. When this research was conducted the D.E.T. syllabus was still in use and the examination was a taken for granted form of assessment.

1 The research questionnaire and assessment

A direct question/s on assessment was avoided for the following reasons:

1.1 An assessment question would have inevitably to be related to the examination, as the only form of assessment that most pupils would have encountered at that stage would have been the traditional, written examination. Such a question would have been counterproductive because it would have reaffirmed the aims of a product type syllabus, like the D.E.T. syllabus, that the final product of poetry appreciation is estimated by performance in the examination. However, as shown in the analysis of the examiner's reports (see p.96-101) the examination consists of an analysis of poems rather than the pupil's engagement with poetry.

1.2 Association of the questionnaire with the examination could have inhibited 'gut responses' to the questionnaire poems by matric pupils, conditioned by the examination system for at least nine years. Responses could have been tailored to fulfil requirements presupposed by pupils.

1.3 A direct question intended to elicit pupil responses to the examination system as a form of assessment could easily have led to their attitudes to the examination overshadowing their attitudes to poetry.

2 Outcomes-Based assessment and research findings
2.1 OUTCOMES-BASED ASSESSMENT

Some important facets of the research findings will be discussed in relation to the broad, general principles of Outcomes-Based Assessment. Below are some important, broad, general principles.

2.1.1 Assessment is necessary to determine whether or not the desired outcomes have
2.1.2 Assessment is part of the curriculum programme and therefore should be continuous.

2.1.3 Standards of assessment are predetermined but applied to pupils on an individual basis.

2.1.4 Assessment being done on an individual basis allows the assessor to include pupils’ prior knowledge, skills, attitudes and cultural and other preconceptions especially in the ‘multi-classroom’.

2.1.5 Although applied individually, assessment procedure should be flexible, equitable and impartial.

2.1.6 Individual assessment should make provision for the different language levels in a multilingual classroom.

2.1.7 Teachers should interpret and assess their own ability to help pupils achieve the outcomes, and take into account the results of their introspection in assessment of pupils.

2.1.8 Lastly, resources and infrastructure such as adequate staff, teaching equipment and teaching aids also determine whether or not the appropriate assessment procedure is possible.


3 Research findings
The research findings will be discussed in the following order in relation to outcomes-based assessment.

3.1 Language policy and multilingualism
3.2 Multiculturalism
3.3 Prescribed poems
3.4 Methodology and syllabus design.

3.1 LANGUAGE POLICY AND MULTILINGUALISM
The language ability of pupils is one of the most important facets of prior knowledge that needs to be considered in individual and equitable assessment. Most of the pupil sample used Zulu as a first language. The percentages for the pupil sample were:

86% Zulu as Main Home Language
Although English was the pupil’s second language the pupils chose English as the BEST LIKED SUBJECT. This indicates an extremely positive attitude to English. This finding is further enhanced by the fact that pupils displayed this attitude even before the new Language Policy in Education was implemented. The old Language Policy did not give pupils an opportunity to use the linguistic and cultural knowledge acquired through Zulu, the first language. The exclusion occurred because most of the prescribed poems were Eurocentric, allowing pupils little scope for use of their own prior knowledge. The new Language Policy elevated Zulu from the status of a vernacular to that of a fully-fledged language. This change in status should allow for the inclusion of more prescribed poems that give Zulu speaking pupils an opportunity to use some aspects of their prior knowledge, especially the cultural aspect. The cultural aspect, rather than the linguistic aspect is emphasised because the inclusion of material from Zulu literature would have to be in English translations. However, the cultural and historical contexts should not be affected by the translations, which should be in simple, accessible English.

Pupils have indicated a preference for poems using simple, accessible English, with a simple stanza pattern as well as print and layout. This is corroborated by the choice of the BEST LIKED POEM which was *Sea and Sand* first choice (not prescribed) *The Hermit* second choice (prescribed). Both poems use simple idiom and style. That simplicity and style was the deciding factor is determined by pupils’ choice of the most pleasing PRINT and LAYOUT. The same two poems were chosen in a different order:

First choice *The Hermit* with 47%
Second choice *Sea and Sand* with 45%.

Second Language pupils obviously prefer simple modern English. The prescribed poems (see p. 83-87 for analysis) were not only Eurocentric but also belonged to earlier periods that used archaic English that first language pupils and even teachers found difficult. [See Mkhize (1991:5).]

Assessment of pupils on such material using the inflexible standards of a written examination could have only been unfair, as the prescribed poems did not match the linguistic abilities of the pupils. For instance, the pupils’ response to the questionnaire poems was excellent, yet the response came without tuition, or prior knowledge of the poems and within the time limit of an hour. This indicates that poems with appropriate language and content can elicit a positive response from pupils. Assessment of pupils on material that is linguistically or otherwise inappropriate is not only unfair, it hinders success, which is an important outcome; but it also
results in a negative attitude to poetry.

3.2 MULTICULTURALISM

The cultural diversity of KwaZulu-Natal contains many unique features. One among them is the fact that we have a large English-speaking population that is Indian in cultural orientation. From the cultural point of view this is a welcome enrichment, especially as black pupils in KwaZulu-Natal have had little or no exposure to Indian culture, as Indian pupils have had no real exposure to Zulu culture. Whatever cultural interchange occurred was not part of a deliberate programme of cultural interchange and awareness. Poetry would offer a suitable vehicle for cultural interchange as poetic traditions usually reflect the essence of the cultures from which they emerge. It would be in the best interest of all pupils to be exposed to the poetic traditions of all major cultural groups in the province. A formula would have to be found to make an equitable selection that would offer pupils of all cultural groups an opportunity to make use of their prior knowledge and skills so that assessment may be just and equitable.

3.3 PRESCRIBED POEMS

Fair assessment will mean that the prescribed poems give pupils the highest chance of success as well as the strongest incentive to learn and appreciate poetry. The inappropriateness of the prescribed poems should in some way account for the generally negative perception black matriculants have of poetry as well as their poor performance in the poetry examination. Below are figures for the prescribed poems from 1990 to date.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nov. 1990 - June 1993</td>
<td>85% Eurocentric</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov. 1993 - June 1996</td>
<td>95% Eurocentric</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov. 1996 - June 1999</td>
<td>76% Eurocentric</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Eurocentric nature of the poems is not what makes it unsuitable, it merely adds to the difficulty. Most of the poems selected are from the earliest period of English literature to the nineteenth century. (See Chapter 2 p. 83-87 for a detailed analysis). Poems of earlier periods add the dimension of linguistic difficulty to cultural alienation. To reinforce this argument and to emphasize the alienation that black matriculants must have felt over the years one could look at the poets making up the selection.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nov. 1990 - June 1993</td>
<td>2% South African poets</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov. 1993 - June 1996</td>
<td>19% South African poets</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov. 1996 - June 1999</td>
<td>47% South African poets</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

of the 47% of the Nov. 1996 selection the black and white ratio was:

63% white South Africans
Once again the balance of race and gender may not always be possible in a poetry or literary selection. However, a new and transparent criterion for the selection of poems that strives for an equitable balance is desirable. Prescribed poems of the future should have an internal as well as an external balance. Rive (1980:5-8) suggested that we employ the three circles criterion for the selection of literature, the first circle being South African, the second African and the third cosmopolitan. One could apply this for a start, simplistic though it may appear.

In order to give such a selection more unity and force other criteria like similarity of themes and appropriateness to age groups and context, contemporary relevance and so on can be used. The Sached Anthology called *Poetry of the People*, from which two of the questionnaire poems were taken, is an example of such a cosmopolitan selection being put together by common themes. In as much as fairness of assessment requires prior knowledge be taken into account, the teacher and the Department of Education is accountable for the expansion of knowledge and holistic development of the pupil. This requires that pupils be exposed to a plurality of cultures in an appropriate and understandable context. Poetry of different peoples, albeit in translation, offers a splendid opportunity for such exposure. The holistic development of the pupil will constitute the final criterion of assessment for the success of the poetry curriculum.

### 3.4 SYLLABUS DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

Syllabus design strongly influences methodology. The D.E.T. syllabus was proof of this, it was a product type syllabus, the final product being the examination, which was the chosen form of assessment. Teachers taught for the examination which necessitated the transmission of information relevant to it. Hence the transmission mode of teaching and the examination form of assessment became deeply entrenched. Walters and England (1988:247) observed:

> In essence, then, the teaching of English in black high schools suffers, along with South African pedagogy in general, from the pervasive and endemic malaise of examinitis, or, in other words, an inversion of educational ends and means so long established that by now it has become the norm.

The obsession with the examination form of assessment determined the purpose and style of reading poetry. Protherough (1983:5) in his investigations into reading found the value of the pupil’s personal response to be one of the most important factors motivating the pupil. Protherough’s work still offers useful insight into the formulating of a curriculum that gives emphasis to the affective dimension of pupil understanding. Reading only for the examination Protherough calls ‘Impoverished reading’. By reading literature or poetry in such a fashion pupils are made to feel that their own responses are of no value. The table below is a summary

---

229
of the type of questions asked in the Nov. 92/93/94 poetry examination. (See Chapter 2 p. 96-101 for a detailed analysis.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of question</th>
<th>Nov. 92</th>
<th>Nov. 93</th>
<th>Nov. 94</th>
<th>AVE. %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lexical questions</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figures &amp; Speech</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contextual questions</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal response</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total %</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.4

In order to fulfill the examination requirements pupils resorted to notes and study aids. This led to the establishment of a thriving study aids industry. A curriculum which does not allow for personal response Protherough called ‘the broken-back curriculum’. This is characterized by:

3.4.1 Failure to recognize different modes of response according to age and maturity.

3.4.2 Failure to provide scope for personal response defeating the aim of enjoyment and personal development.

These shortcomings of the D.E.T. syllabus and the damage done by the type of methodology and assessment it unwittingly generated must have been a matter of prime concern for the new democratic government of South Africa because the D.E.T. syllabus was almost immediately replaced by the Core Interim Syllabus. However, this syllabus will be soon replaced when Outcomes-Based Education is implemented. The new curriculum promises a great deal to both teachers and pupils, ceteris paribus, some of the general advantages are:

a. Teachers will have a great amount of freedom in adapting the curriculum to suit their local circumstances.

b. Teachers are expected to view outcomes as a process rather than a product, and to consider themselves as part of the process which leads pupils to achieving the desired outcomes.

c. The process of learning is continuous therefore assessment is continuous as every step forward to the attainment of the desired outcome is regarded as an achievement.

d. Continuous assessment would allow for individual assessment as the learning rate varies from pupil to pupil. And response to literature and poetry in particular should be an
individual or personal response.

e. Continuous assessment is a broad general term. Teachers could employ a number of assessment procedures over the academic year as well as employ a variety of methodologies to achieve the outcomes.

f. Lastly the freedom given to the teacher, and the confidence and trust placed in the teacher, gives them a sense of ownership over the curriculum not experienced before.

The challenge for teachers, particularly of English literature and poetry, is to find out what it is that their pupils enjoy and can succeed at, and to consider its inclusion in the curriculum in terms of the outcomes expected. The implementation of the outcomes based curriculum in theory means a total revolution of the education system, methodology as well as assessment. Its success is still to be seen as only short term outcomes can be assessed at school.

SECTION G

CONCLUSION OF CHAPTER 4

The research findings within the changed and changing educational contexts in South Africa lend themselves to the following conclusions.

1. Black pupils generally, and L2 black matriculants who made up the pupil sample, were handicapped by the subtractive bilingualism of the past, which did not acknowledge the language versatility of black pupils.

2. L2 black matriculants (as evidenced in the pupil sample) exhibited a positive attitude to English and its various aspects including poetry.

3. That the prescribed poems were not only Eurocentric but used archaic English that even first language pupils and some teachers found difficult. [See Mkhize (1991:5).] In contradiction, however, pupils indicated a preference for local contemporary poems, regardless of race, as shown in the choice of Alan Paton's Poem A as the EASIEST POEM and Don Mattera's Poem C as the BEST LIKED POEM. They also chose Poem C for the BEST PRINT AND LAYOUT indicating a preference for poems that can be easily accessed because of simple style and diction.

The positive attitude displayed in the research findings therefore leads one to conclude that L2 black matriculants' attitudes to an unjust educational system should not be confused with their attitudes to English and English poetry specifically. Their attitude to the prescribed poems must be seen as separate from their attitude to poetry. The research findings have shown this in the positive response of the pupil sample to poetry.
CONCLUSION OF DISSERTATION

INTRODUCTION

L2 Black matriculants' attitudes to poetry were shaped by influences exerted by both positive and negative forces. The conclusion assesses the extent of those influences and the outcome of the struggle between them. Therefore the conclusion is divided into the following:

SECTION A - Negative Influences
SECTION B - Positive Influences
SECTION C - Summary of Conclusion

SECTION A

NEGATIVE INFLUENCES

The negative influences are discussed first so that it can be seen how they were counterbalanced by the positive. The education system and the social, political and economic milieu in which it functioned in South Africa until April 1994 was seen by black pupils as most inimical to them. This perception was prompted by:

1. The language policy of subtractive bilingualism.
2. Prescribed poems.
3. The learning environment.

1 The language policy of subtractive bilingualism

1.1 The education system for black people was shaped by the Bantu Education Act of 1956 which was not calculated to give proficiency in any language except African languages, which it called vernaculars. Most teachers in black schools were products of the Bantu Education system which did not offer them opportunities to acquire a high degree of proficiency in English. These teachers in turn were unable to offer their pupils the inspiration necessary to appreciate poetry as they themselves lacked the necessary background and training. This resulted in teachers usually avoiding the poetry option in favour of the novel for the D.E.T. matriculation examination. [See Reid (1982:336.).]

1.2 Subtractive bilingualism militated against a deep appreciation of English literature generally and poetry in particular, because it generated resentment and a negative attitude. English, the second language, was accorded the status of a language, while Zulu, the mother tongue of 86% of the pupil research sample, was designated a vernacular. Proficiency in the mother tongue was also not valued as a language of
learning. This indicated the extent to which black pupils were disadvantaged by the old language policy.

1.3 As different racial groups attended separate schools black pupils did not have a chance to practice the second language, i.e. English, as most black pupils in KwaZulu-Natal (86%) indicated Zulu as the main language. Therefore there was very little opportunity to use and grasp the subtle nuances and idiomatic peculiarities of the second language through interaction with first language speakers. As poetry is a highly condensed and concentrated form of language, to access meaning requires a high degree of language acquisition as well as an understanding of historical and cultural allusions so often found in poetry. Most black pupils were denied the opportunity to acquire such a background and proficiency and were thus disadvantaged.

One of the justifications often advanced for the old language policy was that Zulu was taught to Zulu speaking people in order to preserve and advance the Zulu culture and language, yet it was not accorded the status of a language. It was not a language of learning, especially in tertiary institutions, nor was it sufficiently valued in the commercial world, even within KwaZulu-Natal. Therefore it is not surprising that the pupil research sample indicated that 75% of pupils opted for English as their favourite subject, one suspects more for utilitarian reasons rather than any other. This attitude was hardly conducive to a genuine appreciation of poetry and literature in general.

2 Prescribed poems
The prescribed poems were another factor that discouraged black pupils, and even some teachers from poetry learning and teaching. (See Chapter 2 pp. 79-88 for a detailed discussion on the prescribed poems.) However, some of the major characteristics of the prescribed poems that exercised a negative influence were:

2.1 The prescribed poems did not reflect a sensitivity to the needs of second language black pupils. As discussed in Chapter 3 p. 114 the difference between the prescribed poems for first and second language was one of quantity rather than linguistic quality or cultural and historical suitability. L2 black matriculants did fewer poems from the same list of poems prescribed for the L1 pupils. Presumably the selectors left out poems they felt would present difficulty to L2 black pupils. However, even with the exclusion of those poems the selectors felt were difficult for L2 black matriculants, the prescribed poems were still largely unsuitable. [See Appendix IIIID for English First Language poems, 1993-1996, as compared to English Second Language poems.]

2.2 Even teachers in black schools complained that the prescribed poems were not only difficult for the pupils but presented problems for them as well. [See Mkhize (1991:26).]
This situation was aggravated by the spectre of the examination which forced teachers to use the transmission mode of teaching and created a heavy dependence on study aids and prepared notes.

2.3 Lastly, assessment in the form of the final examination ignored pupils' personal response to poems. All questions were related to content or figures of speech or were questions that tested pupils' lexical knowledge of the poems. This form of assessment entrenched rote learning and 'copying' as answers were either right or wrong. It also reinforced the erroneous belief that poetry has no relevance in daily life. [See Chapter 2 p. 99-101 for a detailed analysis of the D.E.T. examination questions on poetry for 1992/3/4.]

3. The learning environment
The general schooling conditions for black pupils in South Africa was extremely poor in comparison to that of other race groups, especially the white race group. This lack seriously affected black pupils' scholastic performance. The most obvious factors were:

3.1 The general lack of proper facilities as government expenditure on black pupils per capita was the lowest. It resulted in the following:

3.1.1 Insufficient classrooms
3.1.2 No electricity and water, especially in rural and semi-rural areas.
3.1.3 Lack of audio-visual aids.
3.1.4 No libraries or ill-equipped libraries.

3.2 Within such poor facilities teaching and learning had to proceed and in KwaZulu-Natal the pupil/teacher ratio was high.

34 to 37:1; 38 to 49:1 and 50 to 59:1 over different areas [See Krige & Scott (1994:30)]

The high pupil teacher ratio prevented the use of more interactive methods of teaching poetry as space was limited and discipline problems could easily arise. Individual attention was not possible. In desperation and out of a sense of duty most teachers taught poetry primarily for the examination which hardly inspired love for it.

3.3 Finally, many schools lacked adequately qualified teachers and pupils were subjected to the best efforts of these teachers. Many unqualified teachers undoubtedly excelled, however, the education system should provide pupils with highly qualified teachers as this is an invaluable resource. The figures for qualified and unqualified teachers in KwaZulu-Natal were:

Qualified 6,5%; Unqualified 19,2%; Underqualified 74,3%
[See Krige & Scott (1994:98)]
SECTION B

POSITIVE INFLUENCES

Despite the strength of negative influences on black pupils insofar as literature, poetry and education in general is concerned, a strong positive influence also existed in the form of:

1. The oral tradition
2. Contemporary Black Poetry.

1. The oral tradition

The oral tradition survived among the black people of South Africa even though it received little recognition and no encouragement from successive colonial governments and Christian missionaries. However, the oral tradition of black people, in this instance the Zulus, is so deeply embedded and functional a form of daily communication that no effort to ignore or eradicate it was successful. Poetry informed every aspect of life, from the lullabies (imilolozelo) in the cradle to the izihayo which are chants to the ancestral spirits or amadhlozi. Poetry was used in all facets and phases of life, for example:

1.1 The imilolozelo or lullaby was known to every mother.

1.2 Amaculo or songs which are joyful and often accompanied by dance was used as a pedagogic tool to teach children. [See Weinberg (1984:vii-xvii.)] The playful form of instruction was also accompanied by:

1.2.1 izisho - idioms
1.2.2 iziphicuphicwano - riddles
1.2.3 izinganekwane - folktales/myths/legends

Idioms often used the poetic form, and riddles, folktales, myths and legends employ poetic devices.

1.3 Inkondlo zothando or love songs were usually composed by young girls and sung while doing household chores like fetching water or grinding grain.

1.4 Ingoma - chants with a strong rhythmic beat were sung by youths during dances for entertainment or encouragement while doing strenuous work.

1.5 Amahubo or solemn chants were usually sung by regiments of impis (warriors) while going into battle. The solemnity of this form of poetry is felt in the most famous ihubo, Santonga's Nkosi Sikalele 'l-Africa. Missionaries also put the poetic form of the amahubo to good use by using its form for hymns.

1.6 Izithakazelo or the clan praises are used daily as a polite form of address. It is also used
to show appreciation or give recognition and comfort. *Izithakazelo* also formed an important part of marriage negotiations as it revealed the lineage of the bride and groom.

1.7 *Izibongo zamakhosi*. These are praises of kings and chiefs recited by *imbongis* or ‘professional poets’. Much of our historical knowledge of famous kings such as Shaka and Dingane are derived from their praises. The *izibongo zamakhosi* or epic poem is the most highly developed genre in Zulu oral literature.

1.8 *Izaga* or proverbs - unlike in English, proverbs in Zulu always use the poetic form. Proverbs are used to embellish daily discourse with wisdom and are a yardstick of one’s maturity.

1.9 *Izikondlo zezililo*. These are elegiac poems expressing sorrow at the loss of a loved one or a precious possession. Carey Slater’s famous *A Xhosa’s Lament for Wetu, their Cow* finds its inspiration in this poetic form common to the Nguni people, i.e. both Xhosa and Zulus.

1.10 *Izihayo*. These are chants to the ancestral spirits (*amadlozi*). *Izihayo* are chanted on ceremonial occasions in commemoration of the *amadlozi* and also as a means of communicating with them.

Thus it can be seen that poetry was an integral part of the daily life of black people, in this instance the Zulu people of KwaZulu-Natal. All the above mentioned genres have survived to this day and some have even been adapted to suit an urban lifestyle. The best known example is *Izingoma zomsobenzi* or the rhythmic work chant. It is usually made up of a few lines which are repeated with varying pitch and rhythm. It is usually chanted when lifting heavy objects or doing strenuous work. It also forms part of entertainment, and is most popularly known as entertainment in the form of ‘gum-boot dancing’.

The adaptability and resilience indicates that the oral tradition is alive. This life and strength of the oral tradition among black people is derived from the following characteristics.

a. Oral literature uses the mother tongue (L1) therefore understanding is immediate.

b. No formal education is necessary, it is designed for the orally literate.

c. It is contemporary and spontaneous using familiar, concrete imagery and makes references to recent well-known events to project its message.

d. It is community based and supports the hierarchy of society. The *izibongo zamakhosi* or praises of the kings and chiefs exemplifies this.

e. Oral literature is adaptable and flexible like the *izingoma zomsobenzi* or work chants or the *amahubo* or hymns.
f. It embodies the collective wisdom of the people; their philosophy, culture, history and customs. The imbongi or ‘professional poet’ is regarded as a repository of this collective wisdom.

g. Finally, oral literature was not the exclusive property of any writer or poet, as in the written tradition, it belonged to the people. It was regarded as a communal and cumulative achievement. (See Chapter 1 - Characteristics of Oral Literature for a detailed discussion.)

2. Contemporary Black Poetry
Poetry of the contemporary period traces its roots to the transition period, when real cultural interchange between black and white people began. Contemporary poetry is therefore a hybrid of the black oral tradition and the written European tradition. Contact with European civilization led to the following transformations in the black oral tradition:

2.1 Writing replaced the dependence on memory as the only repository of knowledge.

2.2 Christianity challenged the traditional beliefs and world-view of black people as embodied in the oral tradition. However, leading black religious and cultural figures of the transition period tried to reconcile the Christian religion with the traditional beliefs and culture of black people as contained in the oral tradition. Two of the most famous such personages are Ntsikana among the Xhosa and Shembe among the Zulus.

2.3 European civilization led to the development of an urban lifestyle which meant the adaptation of the oral tradition to new circumstances.

2.4 Writing, Christianity and urbanization did not value oral literacy and the oral tradition as well as the role of the imbongi declined in importance.

2.5 Individual freedom replaced the traditional belief of the communal good as being of primary importance; urbanization was responsible for this as it uprooted the individual from tribal society.

2.6 Christianity, an urban life and European values also led to the emancipation of women from fixed roles within tribal society.

2.7 The concept of nationhood as identified with geographical space rather than tribal loyalties began to emerge.

These characteristics existed in a rudimentary form and were not highly developed, as colonial authorities during the transition period did not encourage serious literature. Writing of this period was largely to either propagate Christianity or to entertain.

The kernel ideas of the transitional period became highly developed during the contemporary period, as literacy became more widespread. Prominence was given to the following themes:

a. Condemnation of racial discrimination.
b. Pride in black culture as manifested in the Black Consciousness Movement.
c. The rise of Black Nationalism and the seizure of power.
d. Individual freedom and equality.

As poetry of this period challenged the status quo it appealed especially to the young black intelligentsia. It was considered relevant literature to all who were oppressed at the time, both black and white; but especially people of colour. Poetry became the most popular genre for black writers during this period because:

(i) Poetry was subject to interpretation, therefore decreasing the chances of being banned.
(ii) Condensed language made it easy to commit to memory.
(iii) Poetry was familiar to the masses as the oral tradition is still a living tradition among black people.
(iv) Poetry and song were not separate in the oral tradition and poets of this period could easily turn their poems into revolutionary songs and rallying calls. Sontonga's *Nkosi Sikulela I-Africa* is an example.
(v) Poetry can be shared and appreciated by many people at once while a novel or a play cannot. The Sached Anthology from which two of the questionnaire poems are taken is accompanied by a video recording of the poets themselves reading or reciting their compositions at rallies, or with appropriate settings as a backdrop. The video was made before 1994 and may no longer have as much appeal.

It is therefore not surprising that in the poetry of this period that the following themes recur:

- Police brutality and harassment.
- Forced removals.
- Pain and cruelty suffered by the oppressed.
- Snobbery and betrayal among the oppressed.
- Frustration, anger and revenge.
- Exhortation and encouragement.
- Prayer and hope.
- Forgiveness.

These themes were often repeated as poets considered it their responsibility to change society rather than be changed by it. Therefore the poems are forceful and graphic in their portrayal so as to highlight the suffering of the underprivileged people, who were predominantly black. To achieve its purpose of liberation the poems of this period were characterized by the following literary styles:

- They used simple People's English, language understood by ordinary people, as espoused
by Paolo Freire, William Labov, Berthold Brecht, Pablo Neruda, and Ngugi wa Thiong’o.

- The choice of imagery followed the *imbongi* tradition; images were concrete and drawn from the immediate environment.
- Poetry was supposed to shape events and not to be shaped by them.
- The message of the poem was more important than its artistry.
- Historical references, myths and legends had to be African to instil Black pride.
- Misrepresentations of black leaders like Shaka and Makanna had to be corrected and their roles in history recast as those of heroes.
- Lastly, the philosophical basis of poetry had to be sought in *ubuntu* or African Humanism, Black Theology, and Marxism rather than in Christianity and the liberal humanist tradition.

**SECTION C**

**SUMMARY OF CONCLUSION**

Finally, the evidence in this dissertation leads one to conclude:

1. L2 black matriculants have a positive attitude to poetry and the study of English as a subject in general. Pupils indicated that poetry was their favourite genre, this is understandable from the perspective of the oral tradition which was predominantly poetic.

2. They displayed an awareness of social and political events and did not succumb to the negative influences of an unjust education system. In spite of the racial tensions at the time of this research, pupils did not display any racial prejudice when making choices from the questionnaire poems. Pupils chose Alan Paton’s *The Hermit* as the EASIEST POEM and Don Mattera’s poem of reconciliation, *Sea and Sand* as the BEST LIKED POEM. The choice of Mattera’s poem validates the words of Joseph Brodsky quoted by Gordimer (1982:232): ‘The people know what to do, before the leaders.’ Pupils had already grasped that the black and white dichotomy or what Ndebele (1991:60) called the ‘them’ and ‘us’ stimulus for the writing and relevance of literature had run its course and that a new era was on the horizon. The future literature had already taken hold of the new generation.

3. The prescribed poems were not suitable and led to poor performance in the examination. The evidence in this dissertation indicates that black matriculants’ performance in the poetry examination is not a valid estimate of their attitude to poetry. It would, however, be proper to say that it indicated their attitude to the D.E.T. prescribed poems. The poems were unsuitable from the historical, cultural and linguistic point of view, especially as most of the prescribed poems ranged from the sixteenth to the nineteenth century. This unsuitability was further aggravated by a lack of adequate facilities, and of resources like...
teaching aids and adequate libraries, as well as a lack of sufficiently qualified teachers.

Such a situation within the unjust political, social, economic and educational system in South Africa was unlikely to create a positive attitude to the education system in general, and poetry in particular. Poetry presented difficulty to the L2 black matriculants especially as most of the poetry was written in archaic language and embellished with historical and cultural allusions that were completely alien.

On the other hand, pupils indicated they liked poetry that was local and contemporary, that used simple language, style and diction.

4. Finally, it is ironical that the system of apartheid, which was so inimical to the free poetic spirit, was responsible for the proliferation of black poets writing in English during the freedom struggle in South Africa. Not only were the poems concerned with protest, resistance, action and the seizure of power but they often displayed great poetic talent and artistry. Apartheid led to the Pavlovian stimulus and response of the ‘us and them’ spoken of by Ndebele (1991:60). However, in one’s tendency to be analytical one should not forget to see in this proliferation of black poets writing in English at that time a triumph of the poetic spirit which is common to all people black and white. The recognition of the use and resilience of that spirit is what determines the future literature. As Ndebele (1991:65) points out in Redefining Relevance, the poetic spirit will have to free itself from the ‘social imagination’ of the past and be applied to solving new and different problems.
RECOMMENDATIONS

INTRODUCTION

The recommendations are arranged as follows:
SECTION A - Language policy
SECTION B - Poetry Syllabus/Curriculum
SECTION C - Prescribed Poems
SECTION D - Methodology
SECTION E - Assessment
SECTION F - General

SECTION A

LANGUAGE POLICY

1. The new language in education policy anticipated the recommendations below, which are now official policy:
   1.1 Additive bilingualism has replaced subtractive bilingualism.
   1.2 African languages are now rightful languages and not vernaculars.
   1.3 The multilingual capabilities of black (L2) pupils are now acknowledged and valued.
   1.4 The mother tongue (L1) of black (L2) pupils can now be developed as a language of learning.
2. These changes are indeed welcome. However, the new language policy should guard against slipping into an assimilationist mode, meaning that now, all things being equal, the emergent African languages and culture, may be overshadowed by English. This would hamper the development of African languages. A balance has to be sought. In South Africa, the majority of people speak African languages and the culture is African yet the overarching importance of English cannot be denied. Therefore planners of language policy and language curricula should guard against:
   2.1 Making English dominant to the extent that the other local languages do not develop. This has to be done without undervaluing the importance of English.
   2.2 A balance in the value of languages has to be sought so that pupils do not undervalue their experiences in the mother tongue (L1). Imbalances could lead to linguistic and cultural impoverishment and affect the cognitive development of the child.
3. Lastly, the dominance of English in South Africa can be tempered by the acceptance of Peoples' English as a local language and giving it the same opportunity to develop as the indigenous African languages. People's English should be developed because:
   3.1 Purist obsessions with Standard English should be discarded as a hegemonic practice of
the colonial past. South Africa is far removed geographically and otherwise from England and the necessity for the use of Standard English is not crucial.

3.2 People’s English is the lingua franca of South Africa, an Esperanto that evolved naturally, and that contains in its lexis words from nearly every language used in South Africa. Its use and growth will strengthen the core culture which has already opted to use People’s English as its medium of expression, ranging from daily discourse to poetry. A body of literature in People’s English has already emerged.

3.3 A dictionary of People’s English should be compiled and its use in schools highly recommended. The new dictionary should help to standardize People’s English in South Africa. This advent would obviate the necessity for most pupils to use two registers of English, one ‘fairly standard’ for the teacher and classroom and People’s English outside.

SECTION B

POETRY CURRICULUM/SYLLABUS

1. With the change of government in South Africa the following changes have been made:
   1.1 The D.E.T. syllabus has been replaced by the Interim Core Syllabus for matriculants.
   1.2 The Interim Core Syllabus will be soon replaced by the Outcomes Based Curriculum.

2. However, the following suggestions may prove useful to curriculum planners:
   2.1 All genres of literature should be given equal attention and importance. The possibility of excluding any genre for assessment purpose could lead to the neglect of the genre. This is what occurred with the D.E.T. syllabus, in which poetry was an avoidable option. The literature curriculum should be so designed that the exclusion of any genre for assessment purpose is prevented. The new curriculum is a process type curriculum that is outcomes based rather than examination based. It would be possible to prevent the exclusion of poetry while at the same time ensuring that it does not become a distasteful compulsion.
   2.2 The inclusion of poetry as an unavoidable option should prove relatively easy as oral poetic traditions underpin all literary traditions, European, African and Asian. This commonality can be utilized for the ‘multi-classroom’.
   2.3 The curriculum should be sensitive to the ‘multi-classroom’. However, if local literature is lacking, material from abroad can be utilized with modification as multilingualism and multiculturalism is a universal phenomenon which was recognized by nearly all countries except South Africa. Yet in South Africa we have an almost perfect paradigm of multilingualism and multiculturalism, as well as the emergence of a core cosmopolitan culture made of European, African and Asian
cultures. Although black pupils will always form the majority in any ‘multi-classroom’ we find a significant proportion of European and Asian pupils. In South Africa, African, Asian (i.e. Indian) and European communities have actively preserved their languages and culture as a result of the racially and culturally exclusive policy of Apartheid. This phenomenon makes the cultural interchange real and dynamic in the ‘multi-classroom’.

2.4 Besides the general needs of the ‘multi-classroom’ there are also individual needs. These needs will arise from:

2.4.1 Different racial and cultural backgrounds
2.4.2 Different linguistic backgrounds and different language competencies, especially in English.

2.5 Socio-economic disparities. The new Outcomes Based Curriculum makes provisions for individual needs. Special attention should be given to English as its importance in the short term hardly needs to be stressed.

2.6 The re-structuring of the poetry curriculum should seriously consider the introduction of the oral aspect of poetry, from pre-primary to matriculation level. Oral poetry is not only for the primary phase. It could and should be continued into secondary school up to matriculation with increasing levels of cognitive sophistication. Memorization, recitation and dramatization alone do not exhaust the oral aspect of poetry as interpretation played an important part in oral traditions. Therefore the oral aspect of poetry should be made part of the poetry curriculum because:

2.6.1 Orality indicates that poetry is alive and relevant, that it is purposeful, functional and communicative.

2.6.2 A tremendous wealth of cultural interchange is possible in the future ‘multi-classroom’ in Indian, African and European cultures, which form the major cultural groups in KwaZulu Natal.

2.6.3 Sufficient material is also available for the secondary school in the religious and cultural heritage of South Africa. The subtleties and sarcasm of the imbongi required careful interpretation, so do the mantras, sutras and stotras of Hindu scripture. The same applies to the verses of the Bible and the Koran as well as paradoxes of Zen Buddhist haikus. [See Ngugi (1993:12-24) and White and Cousins (1984:9-22).

2.7 Finally, the inclusion of the oral aspects of poetry will be beneficial to the majority of pupils, i.e. black (L2) pupils. The reason being that the oral tradition is more alive among black South Africans than it is among any other group. Its inclusion in the curriculum will help bridge the gap between home and school as well as give black (L2) pupils a chance to
use their background knowledge, which the Outcomes Based Curriculum promises to do.

SECTION C

PRESCRIBED POEMS

1. As the research findings in Chapter 3 and 4 have indicated the prescribed poems, more than any other single issue, has been the deciding factor in black (L2) matriculants’ attitudes to poetry. It is with this in mind, as well as the future ‘multi-classroom’, that the following recommendations are made:

1.2 The prescribed poems should interest the pupil, satisfy the community, as well as possess the highest possible educative value for the level or grade that they are prescribed. Rive (1980:5) suggested the three concentric circles formula for selection of literature generally, each circle representing a third portion. Rive suggests one third South African, one third African and one third Cosmopolitan. The formula is now inadequate to accommodate the newly acknowledged linguistic and cultural diversity in South Africa. This diversity received official recognition in the acceptance of eleven official languages and the division of the country into nine regions roughly corresponding with linguistic and cultural boundaries. Therefore a new formula has to be sought, as community based and outcomes based education have been designed to accommodate a diversity that always existed but was never fully acknowledged.

1.3 The following percentage formula is suggested as a starting point to contribute to the process of finding an equitable and educationally sound formula for the choice of prescribed poems. The formula is suggested with the full awareness that it can only be applied at best as an approximation and not with the total percentages indicated below. The table is a guideline.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Origin of poem</th>
<th>Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25%</td>
<td>Core S. African</td>
<td>English/People’s English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15%</td>
<td>Black South African</td>
<td>Zulu/Xhosa/Other (Translation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15%</td>
<td>White/Coloured</td>
<td>Afrikaans/Portuguese/Other (Translation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15%</td>
<td>Asian/Coloured</td>
<td>English/Indian Lang./Arabic (Translation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30%</td>
<td>Cosmopolitan</td>
<td>English/Choice pending other criteria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100%</td>
<td>Core S. African</td>
<td>English/People’s English</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1

244
N.B. Except where English or People's English is indicated the rest would be English translations of poems from the languages indicated.

The options decided upon will depend upon the region, community and outcomes of the poetry curriculum. In KwaZulu-Natal the formula could be applied as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Origin of Poem</th>
<th>Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25%</td>
<td>Core S. African</td>
<td>English/People's English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15%</td>
<td>White S. African</td>
<td>Afrikaans/Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15%</td>
<td>Black S. African</td>
<td>Zulu/Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15%</td>
<td>Asian/Coloured</td>
<td>English/Indian lang./Arabic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30%</td>
<td>Cosmopolitan</td>
<td>Choice pending other criteria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1.3 (b)

1.4 The attempt to encompass the best poetic traditions of all communities should not be a cosmetic, political ploy, but should have a genuine educative basis. Such a formula for the selection of poems could lead to the following:

1.4.1 Worthwhile cultural interchange and classroom activity, especially through the use of translations. Zulu speaking pupils for instance could elaborate on an English translation of a Zulu poem. Other pupils will find such an elaboration enriching.

1.4.2 Comparisons can be drawn from poems of different language and cultural groups ranging from poetic devices to themes and content.

1.4.3 Pupils will be more participative if their language and culture is represented in the anthology, albeit in translation, as this gives pupils an opportunity to use their background knowledge in keeping with outcomes based education.

1.4.4 A large dose of cosmopolitan poetry (30%) should help prevent narrowness and a parochial mentality arising from over consciousness of racial and linguistic differences emphasized by apartheid.

1.4.5 Both similarities and differences should be dispassionately discussed as arising from different contexts as well as from the idiosyncrasies of human nature. Differences should be seen as new perspectives into reality. The enrichment provided should make the differences and strangeness welcome.

1.4.6 English translations of poems from other languages should have the following effect:

a. Balance the English speaking or Anglo-Saxon world-view with that of other world-views.

b. Create wider interest in other peoples of the world by exposure to their best and most
sublime thoughts as found in their poetry. The enrichment thereof fulfills a sound, basic educative principle.

c. Translations of poems from local African languages such as Zulu and Xhosa will promote the development of these neglected languages by creating greater interest in their poetic traditions.

d. Ensure that languages used for religious purposes are valued and appreciated through the use of translations of poetic scripture found in such classical languages as Arabic, Greek, Hebrew, Latin and Sanskrit. It also has great potential for classroom interaction and discussion as religious roots run deep in South Africa.

e. Finally, translations as indicated above will promote the policy of multilingualism and multiculturalism, enrich the core South African culture, and ensure the success of the pupil and the success of the future ‘multi-classroom’.

1.5 All prescribed poetry anthologies should have detailed introductions and glossaries explaining African and foreign poetic terminology, as the use of translations may sometimes necessitate the retention of words from the original language. This information should prove useful to both teacher and pupil.

1.6 Poetry anthologies should always include contemporary South African poetry, as this represents the emerging core culture. Also most contemporary poetry is either written in simple Standard English or People’s English. Pupils have indicated a preference for poems with simple style, diction and language that can be easily accessed.

SECTION D

METHODOLOGY

1. The following recommendations should prove helpful.

1.1 Special training should be made available to teachers from pre-service through to in-service for the changed and changing classroom in South Africa. Attention should be given to language teachers and the teaching of English as a second language, because black (L2) pupils will always constitute the majority in any future classroom. However, teachers should also be trained to cope with an encourage a small number of first language pupils within the same language classroom. This small number of first language pupils will usually come from the white, Indian and coloured communities. The first and second language pupils could be welded together by the teacher in a co-operative learning venture. The new outcomes based curriculum makes provision for individual needs and progress. Finally multilingualism should be encouraged among teachers and pupils, and proficiency rewarded.
1.2 Literature learning/teaching and that of poetry specifically could benefit from the wider utilization of the comic book, as a pedagogical tool. The comic book is recommended for the following reasons:

1.2.1 It arouses interest, especially because it uses bold, colourful, and picturesque illustrations that tell a story in themselves, without much necessity for the written word. It gives the story in a nutshell with realistic and strong visual reinforcement.

1.2.2 The comic book being generally short removes the apprehension and laziness usually experienced by poor readers when reading long literary works. The comic allows pupils to familiarize themselves in a short time with the most important characters and events. The reading of the original work is facilitated as the comic book provides the broad framework into which the finer details, found in the original, are fitted in.

1.2.3 The use of simple prose instead of poetic language allows the poorest language pupil to access meaning and get a broad outline of the original poem, novel or play, thus giving the poorest reader and language pupil confidence enough to participate in any discussion.

1.2.4 The simple language and graphic illustrations in the comic make the characters and events come alive in an enjoyable and interesting manner. This should encourage the most reluctant reader to read it without pressure from the teacher or parent.

1.2.5 The comic book can be used by the teacher as a starting point for discussion instead of the actual epic poem, novel etc. This could excite enough interest in pupils to attempt the original on their own.

1.2.6 Language exercises, 'games', crosswords, topics for debates and discussions could be included in the comic book, leading to pupil activity in class as well as encouraging them to read initially.

1.2.7 The comic book could be used as a basis for dramatisation, improvisation, mime and creative writing.

1.2.8 The historical associations of the comic book is one of literature that is not serious. This association as well as its familiarity and popularity among children should make it non-threatening to pupils.

1.2.9 Lastly, the call for more widespread use of the comic book in the teaching of literature is based on an already proven record of success. Sached has had great success with the comic book versions of Sol Plaatjies Mhudi and Es’kia Mphahlele’s Down Second Avenue. Epic poems like Mazizi Kunene’a Emperor Shaka and H.I.E. Dhlomo’s
A Valley of a thousand Hills could be re-cast into comic book versions with a brief prose synopsis as an introduction. The epic poem was chosen as an example because it is the most highly developed genre in the African oral tradition; and in keeping with the outcomes based approach the use of our epic poems would be taking into account the background knowledge of black (L2) pupils.

1.3 All anthologies prescribed for schools should be accompanied by a video version in which the poems are read preferably by the poets themselves or by eminent literary persons to emphasize the relevance of poetry. The readings could be contextualized by providing appropriate backdrops. The Sached anthology called Poetry of the People is an example of such an anthology. An anthology accompanied by a video version has the following advantages:

1.3.1 It emphasizes the universality of poetry by showing how poetry can be transposed from different languages and lands into similar situations elsewhere, that space and time do not interfere or lessen its universal message.

1.3.2 Audio-visual accompaniment gives life to the poetic descriptions: subtle nuances of meaning are made visible and audible through expert reading and appropriate backdrops. Expert readers could also convey meaning through emphasis, tone, eye movement and contact, and facial expression generally. This is a great help, especially to second language pupils.

1.3.3 Finally, the video is considered a form of entertainment, and if poetry can be considered as entertainment it would facilitate the learning/teaching process considerably.

1.4 The following activities could be used with greater frequency:

1.4.1 Read, dramatize and even compose, if possible, in the traditional imbongi style. Pupils from other racial and cultural groups will find it exciting and could do similar such activities related to poetry in their own culture to enliven the poetry class. The reading of modern poetry in the imbongi style could be done by all pupils as it is written in English.

1.4.2 Recite and dramatize lullabies, work chants, hymns and love songs. This could take the form of song and dance. Pupils from other cultural groups could be asked to give similar performances.

1.4.3 List ways in which poetry can still be used today and write simple poems as an example of such use. Also to find appropriate illustrations or alternative illustrations for prescribed poems and justify the choice of the illustration.

1.4.4 Pupils could be asked to find appropriate lines of poetry to accompany advertisement pictures. These lines of poetry could be restricted to the prescribed poems, hence
encouraging pupils to read the prescribed poems with greater care. Assessment could be based on the reason for the choice of the lines more than on the appropriateness of the lines itself. The underlying purpose is obviously to ascertain the extent to which pupils understand the lines of poetry they have chosen and whether or not they can give it a new context.

1.4.5 More extensive use could be made of poetry competitions and the publishing of pupils’ efforts to encourage the writing of poetry. The poet Van Wyk (1994: 40) presented a television programme called Let’s Write Poetry, which appeared as an article in *Upbeat Magazine*. The interest in the writing of poetry should also lead to interest in reading poetry.

1.4.6 Lastly, no matter how innovative the teaching/learning methodology may be black (L2) pupils will have to cultivate the habit of reading as the written tradition has replaced the oral tradition in modern times. Extensive and intensive reading programmes will have to be implemented. Priority should be given to ways and means of creating a consciousness of the value of the written word, particularly as the written word is more enduring. It is hoped that the new curriculum will attempt to revolutionize the attitude to reading and make it one of the most pleasurable and sought after pastimes. All education programmes on television or video should be accompanied by simple written summaries, in the fashion of sub-titles, at the bottom of the screen. The frequent use of writing should help reinforce oral literacy with the value of the written word. However, research into factors that could provide motivation to read should be seriously considered. There is no substitute for the inner motivation to read and improve.

**SECTION E**

**ASSESSMENT**

1. Assessment should be guided by the appropriate use of the broad principles of Outcomes Based Education. These broad principles of assessment are discussed in Chapter 4 p. 225-226. However, the outcomes will have to be modified and adjusted to short term outcomes which the teacher will decide upon.

**SECTION F**

**GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS**

1. The new policy of multilingualism and multiculturalism was implemented in spite of a lack of adequate teaching material. The shortage could be addressed by the establishment of a permanent research unit or department administered and controlled by the Department of National Education. It could, among other services, provide the following:
1.1 Establish contact and encourage research in all schools, technikons, teacher training institutions and universities.

1.2 Collect relevant research from all educational institutions listed above and build a resource pool of multicultural and multilingual education.

1.3 Use the research findings in an on-going needs analysis to improve the curriculum and teaching/learning in the “multi-classroom”. This could be region specific as mentioned earlier.

1.4 Avenues should be made available for parents, pupils, teachers, lecturers, professors and interested members of the community to make suggestions to the research unit especially in regard to:

1.4.1 prescribed literature
1.4.2 syllabus or curriculum design
1.4.3 incidents of linguicism (i.e. discrimination based on language).

1.5 The research findings of this unit should be freely available to anyone who wishes to use them.

1.6 Local and relevant research from abroad should be published bi-annually and copies should be sent to all educational institutions ranging from schools to universities. This research could help teachers and lecturers adjust their methodology and short term outcomes or formulate bridging programmes for second language pupils who may still have problems with English, especially in the immediate future.

1.7 This research unit should have a branch in every major city.

2. Education and the business and commercial world should liaise with each other about the more extensive use of literature (especially poetry) in the world of business and commerce. Sponsorships should be made available as well as money for the purchase of media space in newspapers and magazines and time on radio and television. This partnership between the world of education, specifically language and literature, and commerce could take the form of:

2.1 appropriate lines of poetry for advertisements
2.2 poetry competitions
2.3 reading of poetry on radio and television
2.4 television programmes of epic and narrative poetry.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


251


22. CANONICI, N.N. *Orality: The Quest For Patterns*. Paper delivered at the University of Natal Winter School, 1993.


77. MAWASHA, A. Teaching English Poetry and Drama to E.S.L. Learners. Paper presented at the Cordtek Conference on Language and Community Colleges at the University of Durban-Westville, 10 August 1990.


257


**LIST OF APPENDICES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix I</td>
<td>Pupil Questionnaire.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix IIA</td>
<td>Syllabus, Dept. of Education &amp; Culture (Referred to as the D E T Syllabus).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix IIB</td>
<td>Syllabus, Dept. of Education - Interim Core Syllabus.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix IIIA</td>
<td>Prescribed Poems Nov. 1990 - June 1993 (From The Wind At Dawn).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix IIIB</td>
<td>Prescribed Poems June 1996 - November 1999 (From Mosaic).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix IIIC</td>
<td>List of Poems in the Sached Anthology (From Poetry Of The People).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix IIID</td>
<td>Comparison of L1 and L2 poems prescribed for the period Nov. 1993 to June 1996.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix IVA</td>
<td>Questions on poetry Nov. 1992 Matriculation Examination.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix IVB</td>
<td>Questions on poetry Nov. 1993 Matriculation Examination.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix IVC</td>
<td>Questions on poetry Nov. 1994 Matriculation Examination.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX - I

PUPIL QUESTIONNAIRE
UNIVERSITY OF NATAL - FACULTY OF EDUCATION

M.Ed RESEARCH FOR DISSERTATION 1993

This is a research exercise for the M. Ed Course. All information will be regarded as confidential. Your cooperation in completing this questionnaire is greatly appreciated. Your contribution will help us understand (to some extent) the attitudes of English Second Language (E.S.L.) Black matriculants, to the appreciation of poetry and the study of poems prescribed for the Dept. Of Education and Training, (D.E.T) matriculation examination, in schools using the D.E.T. prescribed list of poems for Nov. 1993 to June 1996.

INSTRUCTIONS
1. Please complete this questionnaire on your own.
2. Please answer all questions.
3. Fill in your answers in the space provided.
4. You are given an hour to complete this questionnaire.
   Please take your time and read the questions with care.
5. This questionnaire consists of 6 pages. Please check.

QUESTIONS
1. Standard and Division : ( e.g. 10.A) .................

2. Age: .................

3. Sex: (Please tick) Male [ ] Female [ ]

4. a) Is your father/guardian employed? Yes [ ] No [ ]

   b) If you answered 'Yes' to 4 (a), what is his occupation?

   ........................

5. a) Is your mother/guardian employed? Yes [ ] No [ ]

   b) If you answered 'yes' to 5 (a), what is her occupation?

   ........................

6. a) Please write your residential/home address.

   ........................

   b) How long have you been living here ?

   ........................

   c) Where have you been living before this?

   ........................
7. **Language Spoken:**
   
   a) What is the main language spoken at home? .................
   
   b) What other language / languages are spoken at home?                      
   
   c) What other language / languages are spoken by you?                      

8. **Subjects:**
   
   a) Please list all subjects you are taking this year:

   ........................................

   ........................................

   ........................................

   b) Who helped you to choose these subjects?

   Please tick the appropriate box.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUBJECT</th>
<th>CHOICE</th>
<th>Own Choice</th>
<th>Parent</th>
<th>Teacher/Counsellor</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ENGLISH</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MATHS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCIENCE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HISTORY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEOGRAPHY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFRIKAANS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIOLOGY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BUSINESS ECONOMICS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECONOMICS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOME ECONOMICS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACCOUNTING</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACCOUNTING</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZULU</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TYPING</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLICAL STUDIES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANY OTHER SUBJECT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
c) Which subject / subjects do you like most? .....................

........................................................................

d) Why do you like the subject/s listed on page 2 (c)? .......

........................................................................

9. Which aspect of English do you find most interesting.
Put a tick in only one space then briefly give a reason.

| Language Study | Oral Work | Literature | Writing |

Reason: ........................................................................

10. Which aspect of literature do you like best. Put a tick
in only one space then briefly give a reason.

| Novel | Play | Short Story | Poetry |

Reason: ........................................................................
11. Read the poems on page 4 and 5 and then answer the questions on p. 6. Please remember there are NO CORRECT ANSWERS, all that is needed is your OPINION. Feel free to express your likes and dislikes and opinions.

A.
I have barred the doors
Of the place where I bide,
I am old and afraid
Of the world outside.

How the poor souls cry
In the cold and the rain,
I have blocked my ears,
They shall call me in vain.

If I peer through the cracks
Hardly daring draw breath,
They are waiting there still
Patient as death.

The maimed and the sick
The tortured of soul,
Arms outstretched as if
I could help them be whole.

No shaft of the sun
My hiding shall find,
Go tell them outside
I am deaf, I am blind.

Who will drive them away,
Who will ease me my dread,
Who will shout to the fools
'He is dead! he is dead'?

Sometimes they knock
At the place where I hide,
I am old, and afraid
Of the world outside.

Do they think, do they dream
I will open the door?
Let the world in
And know peace no more?

B.
Faraway city, there
with salt in its stones,
under its windswept dock,

There in our Cape Town where
they're smashing down homes
of the hungry, labouring people
- will you wait for me, my love?

In that most beautiful,
desolate city of my heart
where if staying on were passive
life wouldn't be what it is.

Not least for those rebuilding
yet again their demolished homes

with bits of plastic, port jackson saplings,
anything to hand - unshakeably

Defiant, frightened, broken,
and unbreakable are the people of our city.

-Will you wait for me, my love?
C.

Sea and sand
My love, my land
God bless Africa, but more
The South of Africa, where we live

Bless the angry mountains
And the smiling hills
Where the cool waters spill
To heal the earth’s heated brow

Bless the children of South Africa
The white children and the black children
But more, the black children
They lost the sea. They lost the sand
That they may not lose love for the white child
Whose father raped the land

Sea and sand
My love, my land
God bless Africa
But more the South of Africa

D.

The Coloured long-shore fishermen unfurl their nets beside the chilly and unrested sea, and in their heads the little dawn-winds whirl some scraps of gambling, drink and lechery.

Barefoot on withered kelp and broken shell, they toss big baskets on the bitter turf, then with a gambler’s bitter patience still slap down their wagering boat upon the surf.

Day flips a golden coin — but they mock it. With calloused, careless hands they reach deep down into the sea’s capacious pocket and pile their silver chips upon the beach.
QUESTIONS ON POEMS

11.1 Which poem did you find the easiest to understand?
Why? .................................................................
.................................................................

11.2 Which poem did you find most difficult to understand?
Why? .................................................................
.................................................................

11.3 Which poem did you like the best?
Why? .................................................................
.................................................................

11.4 Which poem did you like the least?
Why? .................................................................
.................................................................

11.5 Have you read any of these poems before?

Yes [ ] No [ ]

11.6 If yes tick which ones

A [ ] B [ ] C [ ] D [ ]

11.7 Say where you read the poem.
EXAMPLE: If you read Poem C you would say C at home

A .................................................................
B .................................................................
C .................................................................
D .................................................................

11.8 Which poem/s has the nicest print and layout?
.................................................................................................
APPENDIX - IIA

SYLLABUS, DEPT. OF EDUCATION AND CULTURE
(REFERRED TO AS THE D.E.T. SYLLABUS)
SYLLABUS
FOR
ENGLISH SECOND LANGUAGE
HIGHER GRADE
STANDARDS 9 AND 10
REVISED 1985

IMPLEMENTATION
FIRST EXAMINATION

STANDARD 9: JANUARY 1987
STANDARD 10: JANUARY 1988

NOVEMBER 1987
NOVEMBER 1988
1. Perspectives .......................................................... 1
2. Aims .......................................................................... 2
3. Policy and Objectives .................................................. 2
3.1 Aural ....................................................................... 2
3.2 Oral ........................................................................ 3
3.3 Reading ..................................................................... 4
3.4 Writing ..................................................................... 6
3.5 Language structures and usage .................................... 7
4. English across the Curriculum ....................................... 7
5. Assessment ................................................................... 7
6. Aural and Oral .............................................................. 8
7. Examination Requirements ............................................. 8

SYLLABUS

ENGLISH SECOND LANGUAGE (HIGHER GRADE) Phase 4 - Stds 9 and 10

1. Perspectives

1.1 This syllabus is concerned with English as a means of communication in our multilingual society. Pupils whose mother tongue is not English may fall into one or more of the following groups:
those for whom English is a second language, because it is used frequently in their social environment

- those for whom English is virtually a foreign language because they have very little contact with it in their daily life

- those for whom English is a medium of instruction.

It is obvious, then, that pupils' needs and the strategies available to teachers may vary greatly from area to area; but in all cases the English programme must witness to the usefulness of the language, making pupils aware of its importance for their personal, social and intellectual development.

1.2 Language learning is a complex process, usually involving the interplay of listening, speaking, reading and writing, and sometimes of deliberate investigation of the structure of the language. This syllabus is detailed under various heads, but it should be read as encouraging an appropriately integrated and interactive approach to language teaching.

2. Aims

As the over-riding concern of this syllabus is communicative competence for personal, social, educational and occupational purposes, it aims:

2.1 to foster a desire to learn English, and to assist pupils to meet the challenge of living in a multilingual environment

2.2 to help pupils listen with accuracy, sensitivity, and critical discrimination

2.3 to help pupils speak fluent and acceptable English clearly, confidently, and with a sensitive awareness of audience

2.4 to guide pupils towards reading with increasing comprehension, enjoyment, and discrimination

2.5 to develop pupils' ability to write English appropriate to their purposes

2.6 to promote pupils' control of English through a knowledge of its structure and usage.

3. Policy and Objectives

Teachers must create a climate within which pupils can use English with interest, purpose, and enjoyment.

However language is used, it should be seen in relation to context: i.e. to purpose, audience, and circumstance.

Teachers should use the opportunities which come their way to foster their pupils' awareness of the many kinds of language and ways of using them, even though these may not be specified in the syllabus. Furthermore, they should encourage them to experiment across the range, correcting them only when their choice or use of language is inappropriate.

It is only for convenience that the objectives which follow are listed under aural, oral, reading and writing and are placed in a particular order. Teachers are encouraged to design activities in which they work towards realising several objectives, perhaps from different sections, at the same time.

3.1 Aural

Throughout Phase 3 considerable stress is laid on an ability to understand the native speaker of English and to speak the language so that communication is effective. These objectives should be developed in Phase 4. Pupils' awareness of context and purpose should be sharpened so that they can cope with situations of greater complexity.
3.1.1 to discriminate between words which sound similar in fluent spoken English
3.1.2 to follow instructions, commands, and requests so as to be able to carry them out
3.1.3 to recognise the ways in which the voice is used (stress, intonation, etc.) to express subtleties of meaning
3.1.4 to recognise how speakers, or people reading aloud, are
- introducing or developing an idea
- emphasising a point
- illustrating a point
- explaining or clarifying a point
- changing a line of thought
- anticipating an objection or contrary view
- drawing a conclusion
3.1.5 to listen to oral presentations (e.g. lessons, talks, newscasts, interviews) so as to be able to distinguish main ideas, arguments and facts, and so to take notes, or to discuss the speaker’s presentation
3.1.6 to follow the argument in conversations, small group discussions and debates, so as to be able to participate in them
3.1.7 to recognise different social situations and relationships suggested by different choice of words, idiom and register
3.1.8 to interpret character and comment on performance in dramatisations.

3.2 Oral

Oral and aural work must be closely integrated. Accordingly, oral work should include exercises arising from aural activities.

The minimum objectives of oral work are that pupils should be able:

3.2.1 to speak English at an appropriate level of fluency, articulating and pronouncing words in an acceptable manner
3.2.2 to read a text aloud, accurately, and with appropriate use of pause, stress and phrasing to convey nuances of meaning
3.2.3 to speak English in ways appropriate to circumstances and situation, especially by apt organisation and choice of words, idiom, register and intonation. Pupils should be able to use the language in:

- basic social interaction with people to whom they relate in various ways (seniors, peers, older people, juniors)
- initiating, conducting and closing a conversation
- greeting and responding to greetings
- introducing someone and responding to being introduced
- taking leave
- making and cancelling an appointment
3.2.4 to appreciate the function of tone, attitude and body language in spoken English.

3.3 Reading

The importance of reading needs to be reaffirmed. Unless pupils have both a desire to read (reading for enjoyment and information) and the ability to do so (reading skills), they will not be able to cope adequately in the classroom, nor will they later be able to use to the full the many opportunities for career advancement in a literate society. Although enjoyment of reading is essentially a private experience, teachers should aim to foster the reading habit in their pupils.

The minimum objective of reading is that pupils should be able to comprehend and enjoy a variety of texts. They should be able:

3.3.1 to use an English dictionary to find the appropriate meaning of words encountered in their reading.

3.3.2 to see the function, in books, newspapers and journals, of:
- layout
- title and contents pages
- the index
- chapter and paragraph headings
- sub-headings
- indentation, italics, and bold print
3.3.3 to respond to the features which show that a writer is:
- introducing or developing an idea
- emphasising a point
- explaining or clarifying an idea
- illustrating a point
- changing a line of thought
- anticipating an objection or contrary view
- drawing a conclusion

3.3.4 to distinguish
- main points from supporting argument
- statements from examples

3.3.5 to skim a text to get the gist of it

3.3.6 to scan a text to extract information on a particular topic

3.3.7 to distinguish between fact and opinion and factual and emotive language

3.3.8 to distinguish between, and respond to, literal and figurative language, as it occurs in their reading

3.3.9 to recognise when techniques of persuasion are being used, especially in the mass media

3.3.10 to infer meaning expressed through implication and figurative language

3.3.11 to recognise the differences in the demands made on them by the style and organisation of the texts they have to read (e.g. fiction, non-fiction, drama, poetry, varieties of newspaper writing, advertisements, textbooks, cartoons, diagrams, flowcharts, application forms)

3.3.12 to respond to and appreciate the texts in the reading programme

3.3.13 to follow and extend their individual interests by reading a variety of texts of their own choice

3.3.14 Reading Programme

In addition to the encouragement of private reading by pupils (1.1.13 above), teachers should actively support this process by providing many opportunities for discussions of books read by pupils in a teacher-assisted private reading programme.

The following prescribed reading programme must also be implemented each year of the course:

3.3.14.1 At least one work will be set in each of the following sections. Pupils are required to study ONE work from each of any two sections, i.e. TWO works in all.

Section 1: Drama
Section 2: Poetry (approximately 20 poems or 400 lines)
Section 3: Novel
Section 4: Open (This could include short stories, relevant prose
3.4 Writing

Work arising from other sections of the syllabus often leads naturally to writing.

The minimum objectives of written work are that pupils should be able:

3.4.1 to use reference works for finding words or phrases appropriate to specific contexts and purposes

3.4.2 to punctuate skilfully and consistently in order to clarify meaning. Pupils should know how and for what purpose to use:
- the full stop
- the colon
- the semicolon
- quotation marks
- the exclamation mark
- the question mark
- the apostrophe
- brackets
- the dash

3.4.3 to express themselves comfortably in the writing of diaries, informal letters, dialogue, and descriptive or narrative composition

3.4.4 to express themselves in a more formally ordered way in sustained discursive writing as required in a given context for a specific purpose and audience, with due attention to:
- choice of word and idiom
- sentence construction: variation in sentence length and structure
- interpretation of the topic to give direction to the writing early on
- basic methods of developing the argument (topic sentences and paragraphing, transitional words and phrases)
- other persuasive (rhetorical) techniques
- methods of drawing the writing to a close

3.4.5 to apply the conventions appropriate to:
- telegrams
- notices
- formal letters
- letters of application
- minutes
- reports

3.4.6 to plan, draft, revise and polish their work
3.5 Language structures and usage

This syllabus is concerned with developing pupils' communicative competence. Accordingly, all parts of it involve the study of language. A formal programme of work on language structures and usage is neither required nor appropriate; but teachers should be alert to the needs of individual pupils to, inter alia, the programme of reading and writing. Teachers should be alert to individual pupils' needs in regard to the idiomatic and functional use of:

- parts of speech/word classes
- tense
- concord
- mood
- voice (active and passive)
- direct and reported speech
- word order
- forms of negation
- forms of emphasis
- interrogative forms
- parts of a sentence
- punctuation

and to knowledge of word-formation and spelling. Detailed attention should only be given to such items in class when a careful analysis of the class's performance has revealed the need for it. In any case it should not occupy the focus of the lesson for longer than is necessary.

4. English across the Curriculum

Where pupils have English as a medium of instruction, it is highly desirable that schools should adopt an English across the curriculum policy. As one feature of this, the English teacher should be invited to use material from other subjects in developing comprehension, note-taking and writing skills.

5. Assessment

5.1 The requirements for the Std 9 and 10 examination are specified below. All tests and examinations must be designed to assess how far the stated objectives of the course have been attained.

5.2 The communicative aims of the syllabus imply positive marking, and a concern with what is successfully communicated. The pupils who actively engage with a subject and are adventurous in their use of language are likely, to learn more than those who keep to simple, prosaic structures; yet they are also likely to make more mistakes. They should be given full credit for what they have achieved, taking into account both the sophistication and vigour of their work, and the extent to which their errors impede communication or distract the reader.

5.3 Continuous assessment should be used where possible:

- in aural and oral work, because the teacher can observe the pupil in normal classwork and speech situations: "doing an oral" in isolation should be avoided
5.4 Tests of listening and reading should engage a range of the pupils' skills, and should give substantial weight to inferential comprehension.

5.5 Pupils' knowledge of language structures should be tested only insofar as it is useful in communication (i.e. functional contexts).

5.6 Teachers are encouraged to adopt an integrative approach to evaluation.

6. Aural and Oral (Stds 9 and 10)

The final oral mark (full-time candidates only) is a cumulative mark. Pupils should be tested regularly in regard to aural, speaking, reading and comprehension skills and also be judged on their oral response to their private reading. Continuous assessment of components such as the following must be done during the course of the year:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component</th>
<th>Std 9 and 10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reading aloud</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short talks, reading, discussions</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conversations, interviews</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. Examination Requirements:

7.1 Standard 9 (Second language HG)

Paper 1 - Creative writing, Comprehension and Language (3 hours 190 marks)

Section A - A narrative, descriptive or discursive composition of approximately 300 words on one of at least six topics (70 marks)

Another piece of writing of approximately 120-150 words directed to a specific purpose and with the context clearly outlined (e.g. formal or informal letter, report, minutes). A choice of at least three questions will be given (30 marks)

Section B - A comprehension test based on a passage of approximately 400 words (30 marks)

A question requiring the summarizing of a passage (not the same passage as for comprehension) (20 marks)

Language questions which should be functionally based and should aim at furthering communicative competence (40 marks)

25 of the marks for language study will be based on the comprehension passage and on a further passage printed in the paper. (Total length of all passages should not exceed 1,000 words).

15 of the marks for language need not be based on passages printed in the paper but should relate intrinsically to the teaching context of the course.

Paper 2: Literature (1 1/2 hours 60 marks)

- Poetry will be examined by means of two or three contextual questions only (30 marks)

- Both contextual and essay questions will be set on each of the other works. Questions will be of equal value (30 marks)

Candidates are required to answer any one question on each of two works studied - one of which must be a contextual question.
## Final Examination (Std 9 Second Language HG)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paper 1</th>
<th>Creative Writing, Comprehension and Writing</th>
<th>190</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Paper 2</td>
<td>Literature</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral Assessment - Continuous</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Year mark (excluding oral)</strong></td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Promotion mark</strong></td>
<td>400</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 7.2 Standard 10 (Second Language HG) (External - Part-time and Full-time candidates)

**Paper 1** - Creative Writing, Comprehension and Language (3 hours 200 marks)

- **Section A** - A narrative, descriptive or discursive composition of approximately 350 words on one of at least six topics (70 marks)
- Another piece of writing of approximately 150 words directed to a specific purpose and with the context clearly outlined (e.g. formal or informal letter, report, minutes). A choice of at least three questions will be given (30 marks)

- **Section B** - A comprehension test based on a passage of approximately 400 words (40 marks)
- A question requiring the summarizing of a passage (not the same passage as for comprehension) (15 marks)
- Language questions which should be functionally based and should aim at furthering communicative competence (45 marks)

**Paper 2** - Literature (1 1/2 hours 100 marks)

- Candidates are required to answer any one question on each of the two works studied
- Poetry will be examined by means of two or three contextual questions only (50 marks)
- A contextual question (50 marks) and an essay question (50 marks) will be set on each other work
- Only one question may be answered on any one work - one of which must be a contextual question.

## Final Examination (Std 10 Second Language HG)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paper 1</th>
<th>Creative Writing, Comprehension and Language</th>
<th>200</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Paper 2</td>
<td>Literature</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral* (full-time candidates only)</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong>: Full-time candidates</td>
<td>350</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Part-time candidates</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

INTERIM CORE SYLLABUS

FOR

ENGLISH SECOND LANGUAGE

HIGHER, STANDARD AND LOWER GRADE

STANDARDS 8, 9 AND 10

IMPLEMENTATION DATE: STANDARDS 8 AND 9: JANUARY 1995

STANDARD 10: JANUARY 1996
PREAMBLE

The status and function of this syllabus

At no stage should this syllabus be considered a final product. Rather, it should be regarded as an interim measure which, hopefully, will address some of the more urgent problems currently experienced in the teaching and learning of English in schools. Its implementation in January 1995 should be regarded as a preliminary to the eventual transformation and restructuring of the entire education system in general and to the development of a new curriculum framework for languages in particular.

Contextualisation of the syllabus

In terms of the interim Constitution South Africa is now a democratic country in which all people are guaranteed equality, non-discrimination, cultural freedom and diversity, the right to basic education and equal access to all educational institutions.

English, as one of many languages in South Africa, has an important role to play in the development of a nation which honours and abides by these principles. As English is currently a medium of instruction for a large part of the population, many of whom do not have it as a home language, English is of central importance to the whole learning process. Nevertheless, pupils’ proficiency in their home language(s) should be acknowledged and teachers should draw on this resource (also by allowing pupils to code-switch) with a view to enhancing pupils’ comprehension, clarification and acquisition of the target language.

English is also a language of access to a vast range of cultural, scientific, political and economic activities and resources, both nationally and internationally. Moreover, in South Africa thus far, a sound knowledge of English has ensured wider educational and employment opportunities. In the present situation therefore, and until new language in education policies are in place, the ability to understand and to use English effectively is important.

Bearing in mind the role currently played by English in South Africa, the teaching and learning of the language should contribute towards enabling pupils to use it for effective communication in a variety of contexts and for a variety of purposes. Pupils’ progressive mastery of English should therefore facilitate their using it for practical purposes as well as for their own personal, educational social and imaginative and aesthetic development.
It may well be that certain textbooks and readers which cannot be replaced immediately, contain contentious or objectionable matter. Wherever this occurs, teachers should attempt to place this in context and to mediate it where necessary.
SYLLABUS

1. PRINCIPLES

1.1 This syllabus is concerned with English as a means of communication in our multi-lingual society. Pupils whose mother tongue is not English may fall into one or more of the following groups:

(a) those for whom English is a second language, because it is used frequently in their social environment
(b) those for whom English is virtually a foreign language because they have very little contact with it in their daily life
(c) those for whom English is a medium of instruction.

It is obvious, then, that pupils' needs and the strategies available to teachers may vary greatly from area to area.

1.2 Communicative language teaching uses the language skills which pupils already possess as the basis for further development. Consequently, teachers will need to assess with care what kinds of preparatory work their pupils will need in their learning of English as a second language. The focus should be on the pupil as learner: starting from where pupils are, rather than from an idealistic notion of where they ought to be.

1.3 The multilingual nature of South African society has led to variation in English vocabulary, syntax, accent, stress and intonation patterns. Such variations should be acknowledged in the teaching and assessment of English as a subject. Using language effectively (that is, language which is appropriate in terms of context, audience and purpose) should be valued more highly than the correct use of a single standard variety of the language.
1.4 The development of language and thinking skills are inextricably linked. It has been postulated that it is through the use of language that children take control of their thinking and create their own universe of understanding. Language, both the home language(s) and any additional language(s), therefore, has a fundamental role to play in the whole process of cognitive development. This role has to be acknowledged not only by the language teacher but also by all other teachers, irrespective of which subject(s) they teach. The adoption of a language-across-the-curriculum policy is of great benefit in this regard.

1.5 Language learning is a complex process, usually involving the interplay of listening, speaking, reading and writing, and sometimes of deliberate investigation of the structure of the language. In communicative language teaching, these four skills are integrated in purposeful activities, for example, pupils are asked to listen in order to speak or write; they are asked to speak in order to clarify and comprehend something heard or read, and so to respond to it in writing. Therefore, although this syllabus is detailed under various headings, it should be read as encouraging an appropriately integrated and interactive approach to language teaching. Every English lesson should, therefore, aim to involve the interplay of more than one skill in the performance of tasks required wherever this is possible.

2. GENERAL TEACHING APPROACH

The approach recommended in this syllabus is based on the principles informing communicative language teaching. The extent to which this approach is adopted will depend on the varied circumstances and target groups. However, the following features of communicative language teaching are offered as a general guide.

Teachers should create a climate within which pupils can use English with interest, purpose, and enjoyment. In addition, language should always be seen in relation to context: i.e. to purpose, audience, and circumstance.

Teachers should use the opportunities which come their way to foster their pupils' awareness of the many kinds of language and ways of using them, even though these may not be specified in the syllabus. Furthermore, they should encourage them to experiment across the range, correcting them only when their choice or use of language is inappropriate.
3. **GENERAL AIMS**

The purpose of this syllabus is to enable pupils to communicate successfully for personal, social, educational and occupational purposes. It aims, therefore,

3.1 to foster in pupils a desire to learn English, and to assist them to meet the challenge of living in a multilingual environment

3.2 to help pupils listen with accuracy, sensitivity and critical discrimination

3.3 to help pupils speak English clearly, fluently, with confidence and with sensitive awareness of audience in a variety of situations and for a variety of purposes

3.4 to guide pupils towards reading with increasing comprehension, enjoyment and discrimination.

3.5 to develop pupils' ability to write English appropriate to their purposes

3.6 to promote pupils' control of English through a knowledge of its structure and usage

3.7 to develop pupils' ability to process information in different ways, depending on the type of discourse and the context in which it occurs, with a view to improving their learning in all subjects across the curriculum

4. **SPECIFIC AIMS AND ACTIVITIES**

For convenience the language content which follows is listed under separate headings, namely listening, speaking, reading and writing. However, teachers are encouraged at all times to design activities in which they work towards integrating as many of these skills as possible.

4.1 **Listening**

Listening skills cannot be developed in isolation. Rather, they should be developed in conjunction with the other skills, e.g. listening to what is being said, read or broadcast.

Throughout the junior secondary phase considerable stress should have been laid on an ability to understand the native speaker of English and to speak the language in such a way that communication is effective. These objectives should be developed even further in the senior secondary phase. Pupils' awareness of context and
purpose should be sharpened so that they can cope with situations of greater complexity.

Listening activities should enable the pupils at least

4.1.1 to discriminate between words which sound similar in fluent spoken English

4.1.2 to follow instructions

4.1.3 to recognise the way in which the voice is used (e.g. stress, intonation) to express subtleties of meaning

4.1.4 to recognise or anticipate when
   - a point is being made, emphasised, developed or illustrated
   - an objection or contrary view is about to be raised
   - a line of thought is being changed
   - a conclusion is being drawn

4.1.5 to listen to oral presentations (e.g. lessons, talks, newscasts, interviews), to be able to distinguish main ideas, arguments and facts, to take notes or to discuss a speaker's presentation

4.1.6 to follow the argument in conversations, small group discussions and debates, to be able to participate in them

4.1.7 to recognise different social situations and relationships suggested by different choices of words, idiom and register.

4.1.8 to interpret character and comment on performance in dramatisations

4.2 Speaking

Listening, speaking, reading and writing activities must be closely interlinked. Accordingly, speaking activities should ideally arise from listening to what others have to say, talking about what has been read and discussing their own and others' writing.

Speaking activities should enable the pupils at least

4.2.1 to speak English at an appropriate level of fluency with acceptable articulation and pronunciation

4.2.2 to read a text aloud, with appropriate use of pause, stress and phrasing to convey meaning
4.2.3 to speak English in ways appropriate to circumstance and situation (context), e.g. by choosing appropriate words, style and register, by organising content effectively and logically and by using appropriate intonation and stress. This implies that pupils should be able to use language in

- **basic social interaction** with people to whom they relate in various ways, e.g.
  - initiating, conducting and closing a conversation
  - greeting and responding to greetings
  - introducing someone and responding to being introduced
  - paying and responding to a compliment
  - taking leave
  - apologising
  - offering condolences
  - reacting to a request for information
  - commenting informally on a film, event or incident
  - giving and responding to instructions
  - asking for help, information, directions
  - chairing a meeting
  - participating in an interview

- **group discussions and debates** when
  - presenting or challenging a point of view
  - disagreeing
  - arguing a point, arranging their thoughts while speaking
  - asking questions to resolve uncertainty or to clarify an issue

- **presenting short talks** (prepared and unprepared) clearly and coherently

- **enhancing their own knowledge and understanding of a subject** by
  - asking questions/enquiring
  - rephrasing statements and questions for clarification
  - offering explanations or alternatives to peer/s or teacher

4.2.4 to appreciate the role which tone, attitude and body language could play in communication.

4.3 Reading

The importance of reading needs to be reaffirmed. Unless pupils have both a desire to read (reading for enjoyment and information) and the ability to do so (reading
skills) they will not be able to cope adequately in the classroom, nor will they later be able to use to the full the many opportunities for career advancement in a literate society.

Nevertheless reading, and the study of literature especially, should not be seen as discrete activities in themselves. Rather, the act of reading should contribute to pupils overall communicative ability (listening, speaking, reading and writing). As such, pupils should be exposed to a variety of texts, e.g. letters, short stories, poems, advertisements, newspaper articles, reports, minutes, notices etc.

The works of literature chosen must be appropriate and relevant to the age, background and interests of the pupils. These works, chosen over the three years of Phase 3, should allow pupils to see literature in English in the context of both South Africa and the wider world.

Should text books or setworks contain material which is contentious, sensitive or stereotypical, teachers should deal with such material in a way which will contribute to the development in pupils of a critical awareness and will help to equip them with strategies for dealing sensitively with diverse opinions on a variety of issues.

Reading activities should enable the pupils at least to

4.3.1 to use an English dictionary to find the appropriate meaning of words encountered in their reading

4.3.2 to see the function and purpose of:
- title and contents pages
- the index
- chapter, paragraph and sub-headings
- indentation, italics and bold print
- footnotes, cross-references, and the abbreviations used in them

4.3.3 to respond to the features which show that a writer is:
- introducing or developing an idea
- emphasising a point
- explaining or clarifying an idea
- illustrating a point
- changing a line of thought
- anticipating an objection or contrary view
- drawing a conclusion

4.3.4 to read critically with a view to distinguishing
- main points from supporting argument
- statements from examples
- bias and stereotyping
4.3.5 to skim a text to get the gist of it
4.3.6 to scan a text to extract information on a particular topic
4.3.7 to distinguish between fact and opinion and factual and emotive language
4.3.8 to distinguish between and respond to literal and figurative language, as it occurs in their reading and to infer meaning expressed through implication and figurative language
4.3.9 to recognise that texts differ with respect to their purpose, context and style and to take cognizance of these differences in their reading, also in relation to textual demands made by other subjects
4.3.10 to recognise and respond to techniques of persuasion, especially those employed in the mass media (e.g. radio, television, newspapers and magazines)
4.3.11 to follow and extend their individual interests by reading a variety of texts of their own choice
4.3.12 to respond to and appreciate the texts in the reading programme
4.3.13 to read intensively and in-depth at least two, but preferably more, suitable texts each year

4.4 Writing

As is the case with the development of all the other skills, writing skills cannot and should not be developed in isolation from the other skills or in a decontextualised way. Just as listening, speaking and reading are often useful preparation for writing, writing should contribute towards the development of listening, speaking and reading skills.

Apart from the value that writing has as an activity in its own right, it also contributes to enabling pupils to clarify and structure their own thinking and enables them to communicate with a wider audience than the one with which they are in daily contact. As such, writing should be regarded not only as a product but also as a process, one which includes planning, developing, reviewing, editing and presenting.

Writing activities should, therefore, enable the pupils at least
4.4.1 to express themselves comfortably in such writing activities as the keeping of diaries, informal letters, descriptive or narrative composition, recording, note-taking, describing a process and other forms of writing required by the needs of other content areas

4.4.2 to use quotations and references correctly in their own writing

4.4.3 to express themselves in more formal ways as required by a given context for a specific purpose and audience, with due attention to:
   - choice of word and expression
   - variation in sentence length and structure
   - interpretation of the topic to give direction to the development of the writing activity from its beginning
   - basic methods of developing the argument
     (topic sentences and paragraphing, connectives)
   - methods of drawing the writing to a close

4.4.4 to apply the conventions appropriate to practical or functional writing relevant to their daily needs and the demands of the work place in, for example, the writing of
   - telegrams
   - notices
   - informal letters
   - formal letters, including letters of application
   - minutes
   - reports

4.4.5 to punctuate correctly and consistently in order to clarify meaning. Pupils should know how and for what purpose to use:
   - the full stop
   - the comma
   - the colon
   - the semi-colon
   - quotation marks
   - the exclamation mark
   - the question mark
   - the apostrophe
   - brackets
   - the dash

4.4.6 to plan, draft, edit, revise and polish their work (individually and in groups) before presenting it.
4.5 Language-in-action

This syllabus is concerned with developing pupils' communicative competence. Accordingly, it assumes that some understanding of how language works is essential for all communication, whether this involves listening, speaking, reading or writing. Consequently, where specific aspects of grammar are taught they will normally arise from pupils' reactions to, inter alia, the work done in listening, speaking, reading and writing.

Pupils, therefore, need some knowledge of language structures to enable them to use these in different contexts and for different purposes. For example,

- an understanding of how words are formed and the ability to apply this knowledge (e.g. how to change an adjective into a noun)
- a reasonable control of spelling and punctuation
- a knowledge of word classes (parts of speech) and their use
- an understanding of and reasonable accuracy in the use of tense (e.g. past, present future) and mood (i.e. active/passive), concord and word order, especially as these enable effective communication

This language knowledge and the ability to apply it should be developed in an integrated way, that is by showing pupils how language works in context and by encouraging them to apply what they have learnt in a variety of situations rather than by drilling discrete items. Detailed attention to such items might occasionally be necessary in cases where a careful analysis has revealed the need for it. In any case it should not occupy the focus of the lesson for longer than is necessary.

5. Assessment

5.1 Examination boards may decide for themselves what form the examinations and tests will take. However, these must be designed to assess how far the stated objectives of the syllabi have been attained. Both the objectives of the examination paper and the type of questions asked MUST be in line with the objectives of the core syllabus and the marking must follow those criteria. (Note: Although the same syllabus can be used for all three grades - HG, SG and LG - different examination papers may still be set for those pupils during the interim period.) Suggested requirements for the Standard 10 examination are specified below.
APPENDIX - IIIA

PRESCRIBED POEMS (DEPT. OF EDUCATION AND TRAINING)
NOV. 1990 - JUNE 1993 FROM THE WIND AT DAWN
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poet</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Nationality</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Length</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>John Keats</td>
<td>1795-1821</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>The Human Seasons</td>
<td>14 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herman Charles Bosman</td>
<td>1905-1951</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Seed</td>
<td>16 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alan Paton</td>
<td>1903-1988</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>The Hermit</td>
<td>32 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert Frost</td>
<td>1875-1963</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Mending Wall</td>
<td>45 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thomas Hardy</td>
<td>1840-1928</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Throwing a Tree</td>
<td>17 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stanley Snith</td>
<td>1903-</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Pylons</td>
<td>20 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William Blake</td>
<td>1757-1827</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>The Schoolboy</td>
<td>30 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gabriel Okara</td>
<td>1921-</td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Piano and Drums</td>
<td>29 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Wilburg</td>
<td>1921-</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Boy at the Window</td>
<td>16 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DH Lawrence</td>
<td>1885-1930</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Piano</td>
<td>12 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shepistone Seseko</td>
<td>20th Century</td>
<td>African</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Python</td>
<td>8 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Douglas Livingstone</td>
<td>1932-</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Sunstrike</td>
<td>16 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephen Spender</td>
<td>1909-</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>The Express</td>
<td>27 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TS Eliot</td>
<td>1888-1965</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>The Journey of the Magi</td>
<td>43 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guy Butler</td>
<td>1918-</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Pieta</td>
<td>14 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leonard Flemming</td>
<td>1880-1946</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>The Wind at Dawn</td>
<td>16 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pius Oleghe</td>
<td>20th Century</td>
<td>African</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>A Sudden Storm</td>
<td>19 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W Wordsworth</td>
<td>1770-1850</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>To Sleep</td>
<td>14 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PB Shelley</td>
<td>1792-1834</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Ozymandias</td>
<td>14 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Donne</td>
<td>1573-1631</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Death be not Proud</td>
<td>14 lines</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Analysis - D.E.T. Prescribed Poems Nov. 1990 - June 1993 from The Wind at Dawn**

(i) Nationality of poets
- 20% South African
- 80% Cosmopolitan

(ii) Chronology/Period
- 5% seventeenth century
- 20% nineteenth century
- 75% twentieth century

(iii) Race
- 85% white
- 15% black

(iv) Gender
- 100% male

(v) Length
- Longest poem: 43 lines (*Journey of the Magi* by TS Eliot)
- Shortest poem: 8 lines (*Python* by Shepistone Seseko)
APPENDIX - IIIB

PRESCRIBED POEMS
(ex NED/KWAZULU NATAL
JUNE 1996 – NOV. 1999
FROM MOSAIC
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poet</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Nationality</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Length</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shakespeare</td>
<td>1564-1616</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>My Mistress’s Eyes</td>
<td>14 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tennyson</td>
<td>1809-1903</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>The Eagle</td>
<td>6 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frost</td>
<td>1875-1963</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>“Out, Out”</td>
<td>34 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fairbridge</td>
<td>1885-1924</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>The Puff-Adder</td>
<td>24 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Campbell</td>
<td>1902-1957</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>The Serf</td>
<td>14 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tessimond</td>
<td>1902-</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Attack on the Ad-man</td>
<td>38 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Day Lewis</td>
<td>1904-1972</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Walking Away</td>
<td>20 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auden</td>
<td>1907-1968</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>The Unknown Citizen</td>
<td>31 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Okara</td>
<td>1921-</td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Moon in the bucket</td>
<td>12 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kirkup</td>
<td>1923-</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>No more Hiroshimmas</td>
<td>62 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horn</td>
<td>1934-</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>I’m getting famous sort of</td>
<td>30 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ibrahim</td>
<td>1934-</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>blues for district six</td>
<td>18 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somhlalo</td>
<td>1935-</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Who wants to be mothered</td>
<td>28 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heaney</td>
<td>1939-</td>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Follower</td>
<td>24 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couzyn</td>
<td>1942-</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>We found him amid stones</td>
<td>50 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clayton</td>
<td>1943</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Untitled poem for Jean</td>
<td>20 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serote</td>
<td>1944</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Alexandra</td>
<td>41 lines</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Analysis:** ex NED/KwaZulu Natal Selection from *Mosaic* by Gilfillan L and Scheffler B

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nationality</th>
<th>South African</th>
<th>Cosmopolitan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Race</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length</td>
<td>Longest poem 50 lines (<em>We found him amid stones</em> by Jeni Couzyn)</td>
<td>Shortest poem 6 lines (<em>The Eagle</em> by Tennyson)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX - IIIC

LIST OF POEMS IN THE
SACHED ANTHOLOGY FROM
POETRY OF THE PEOPLE
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poet</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Nationality</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Length</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Berthold Brecht</td>
<td>1898-1956</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>And in the Darkness</td>
<td>3 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Berthold Brecht</td>
<td>1989-1956</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>To be Sure</td>
<td>8 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farouk Asvat</td>
<td>1952-</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>It is the Season of Dying</td>
<td>13 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chris van Wyk</td>
<td>1957-</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Coloured</td>
<td>A Riot Policeman</td>
<td>32 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pablo Neruda</td>
<td>1904-1973</td>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>And you will ask</td>
<td>7 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mzwakhe Mbuli</td>
<td>1954-</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Now is the time</td>
<td>20 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grace Nichols</td>
<td>1950-</td>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>This Kingdom</td>
<td>26 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EE Cummings</td>
<td>1894-1962</td>
<td>America</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>I thank you God for most</td>
<td>14 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mafika Pascal Gwala</td>
<td>1946-</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>There is</td>
<td>34 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yevgeny Yevtushenko</td>
<td>1923-</td>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>People</td>
<td>30 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeremy Cronin</td>
<td>1949-</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Faraway City</td>
<td>18 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeremy Cronin</td>
<td>1949-</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>I saw your mother</td>
<td>22 lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don Mattera</td>
<td>1935-</td>
<td>S Africa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Coloured</td>
<td>Sea and Sand</td>
<td>18 lines</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Analysis – SACHED Anthology (Poetry of the People)**

(i) Nationality of poets: 53% South African  
47% Cosmopolitan

(ii) Chronology/Period: 100% Twentieth century/contemporary

(iii) Race: 53% White  
8% Asian  
16% Coloured  
23% Black

(iv) Gender: 92% Male  
8% Female

(v) Length variation: Longest poem – 34 lines (*There is* by Mafika Gwala)  
Shortest poem – 3 lines (*And in the Darkness*) by Berthold Brecht
APPENDIX - JJID

COMPARISON OF L1 AND L2 POEMS
PRESCRIBED BY THE DEPT OF
EDUCATION & TRAINING FOR THE
PERIOD NOV. 1993 - JUNE 1996
The following poems are to be studied:

Preludes - T S Eliot
Deaf-and-Dumb School - Anthony Delius
The Hermit - Alan Paton
Mending Wall - Robert Frost
There is a Pleasure - Lord George Byron
Portrait of a Machine - Louis Untermeyer
Pylons - Stanley Snaith
The Road Not Taken - Robert Frost
Mushrooms - Sylvia Plath
The Thought-Fox - Ted Hughes
Piano and Drums - Gabriel Okara
Sonnet 116 - William Shakespeare
Meeting at Night - Robert Browning
Jigsaw III - Louis Macneice
Snake - Emily Dickinson
The Hawk in the Rain - Ted Hughes
Lake Morning in Autumn - Douglas Livingstone
Sunstrike - Douglas Livingstone
The Train - Emily Dickinson
The Express - Stephen Spender
Love - George Herbert
Dover Beach - Matthew Arnold
The Send-off - Wilfred Owen
Anthem for Doomed Youth - Wilfred Owen
Futility - Wilfred Owen
Wind - Ted Hughes
Thunder and Lightning - James Kirkup
Do Not Go Gentle - Dylan Thomas
Ozymandias - Percy Bysshe Shelley
Death be not Proud - John Donne

(For the period Nov. 1993 to June 1996)

COMMENT

All the poems in the second language selection appear in the list of poems for first language pupils, except those underlined.

The difference in the prescribed poems is largely one of quantity.
APPENDIX - IVA

QUESTIONS ON POETRY NOV. 1992
DEPT OF EDUCATION AND
TRAINING MATRICULATION
EXAMINATION
ENGLISH
SECOND LANGUAGE HG
PAPER III
SECTION B: THE WIND AT DAWN - SMYTH AND SWACINA

Read the following poem.

DEATH BE NOT PROUD

Death be not proud, though some have called thee
Mighty and dreadful, for thou art not so:
For those whom thou think' st thou dost overthrow
Die not, poor Death; nor yet canst thou kill me.
From Rest and Sleep, which but thy pictures be,
Much pleasure; then from thee, much more must flow;
And soonest our best men with thee do go -
Rest of their bones, and souls' delivery!
Thou'rt slave to Fate, Chance, Kings, and desperate men,
And dost with poison, war, and sickness dwell;
And poppy or charms can make us sleep as well
And better than thy stroke. Why swell' st thou then?
One short sleep past, we wake eternally,
And Death shall be no more: Death, thou shalt die!

John Donne

1. What word does the poet use later in the poem with a meaning similar to proud?

2. Quote the phrase to which so in line 2 refers.

3. Quote the line from further on in the poem which explains why the poet says in line 3 that Death's victims 'Die not'.

4. In this context yet in line 4 means
   a) up to now
   b) until later
   c) even
   d) a) and b)

5. Fill in the "understood" words in lines 5 and 6 below. (Understood: They are missing but we know what they are)
From Rest and Sleep, which but thy pictures be, (a) 
Much pleasure: then from thee, much more (b) must flow. (4)

6. Rewrite 'which but thy pictures be' in modern English. (2)

7. The reason the poet says the best men go soonest with Death is probably that
   a) it's mainly young men that fight in wars.
   b) the bravest soldiers go to the front in a battle where the risk of death is greatest.
   c) people are more aware of the deaths of young men than of deaths in other sections of the population.
   d) a) and b) (2)

8. The implication of line 7 is that Death is therefore
   a) attractive/unfrightening.
   b) mighty and dreadful.
   c) random/indiscriminate.
   d) stupid and wasteful. (2)

9. What word scorns Death for being unable to act on its own? (2)

10. What Fate, Chance, Kings and desperate men have in common is that they
    a) are all good
    b) are all bad
    c) all cause death
    d) are all caused by death (2)

11. Dwelling with poison, war and sickness (line 10) is obviously
    a) very unpleasant
    b) very difficult
    c) likely to cause death
    d) nothing to be proud of (2)
12. What word is used here to mean heroin (the drug)?

13. The last four words of the poem mean that Death will die because
   a) his bubble of pride has been pricked
   b) nobody will die any more
   c) life after death is no longer threatened by death
   d) we wake up after sleeping

14. Donne’s purpose in this poem is to
   a) warn us against evils such as desperate men and poison.
   b) inform Death that he has no reason to feel proud.
   c) reassure us that death is not to be feared.
   d) urge us to save our souls so as to enjoy eternal life.

Now read Throwing a Tree by Thomas Hardy before answering the remaining questions.

THROWING A TREE

The two executioners stalk along over the knolls,
Bearing two axes with heavy heads shining and wide,
And a long limp two-handled saw toothed for cutting great boles.
And so they approach the proud tree that bears the death-mark on its side.

Jackets doffed they swing axes and chop away just above ground.
And the chips fly about and lie white on the moss and fallen leaves;
Till a broad deep gash in the bark is hewn all the way round,
And one of them tries to hook upward a rope, which at last he achieves.

The saw then begins, till the top of the tall giant shivers:
The shivers are seen to grow greater each cut than before:
They edge out the saw, tug the rope; but the tree only quivers,
And kneeling and sawing again, they step back to try pulling once more.
Then, lastly, the living mast sways, further sways:
with a shout
Job and Ike rush aside. Reached the end of its long staying powers
The tree crashes downward: it shakes all its neighbours throughout,
And two hundred years' steady growth has been ended in less than two hours.

Thomas Hardy

15. In this context throwing actually means
a) tossing
b) chopping down
c) executing
d) growing

16. List five words from different parts of the poem which do most to suggest that the poet feels that a living tree is a near-human thing.

17. Line 3 means that
a) the saw is so long that it bends when carried
b) it has large teeth and a handle at both ends
c) one of the woodcutters needs to go to the dentist
d) a) and b)

18. Find synonyms in the poem for the following words or phrases
a) walk (grimly)  b) hills  c) carrying
d) has/shows  c) removed
19. The men use ____ (a) ____ to clear away the ____ (b) ____
    a ____ (c) ____ to cut through the hard wood and a
    ____ (d) ____ to unbalance the tree.
Select the four missing words from the following:
chips axes boles mast saw rope bark

20. In the context of this poem the final line implies
    that the men have
    a) worked very quickly
    b) triumphed over the stubborn tree
    c) interfered with one of nature's great achievements
    d) a) and b)
5.2 The communicative aims of the syllabus imply that assessment should be concerned with what is successfully communicated rather than with what has been memorised and mechanically reproduced. Pupils who engage actively with a subject and are adventurous in their use of language are likely to learn more than those who keep to simple, prosaic structures; nevertheless, they are also more likely to make mistakes. They should, therefore, be given full credit for what they have achieved, taking into account both the sophistication and vigour of their work, and the extent to which their errors impede communication.

5.3 Continuous assessment should be used where possible. This implies that

(a) Listening and Speaking should be assessed while pupils are engaged in normal class work and speech situations rather than during a formal 'oral'

(b) progress in reading ability, and comprehension of reading matter rather than a one-off reading 'performance', should form the basis for assessment

(c) the writing process, a variety of writing tasks, progress in writing ability, etc. need to be considered when pupils' writing competence is assessed rather than the final product only.

Marks arrived at in this way may be used to supplement the examination up to a maximum of 50%.

5.4 In arriving at the marks for each section, considerable attention should be given to the aspects detailed below:

(a) Assessment of Listening and Speaking skills should give substantial weight to inferential comprehension and should take cognizance of pupils'

- proficiency in understanding and speaking English
- ability to read aloud (prepared and unprepared)
- ability to understand and respond appropriately to what has been said or read, also with respect to discussions of works in the reading programme.

In all standards in this phase, the oral mark (Listening and Speaking) should account for 15% to 20% of the final mark. The remaining marks should be allocated in approximately equal proportions to composition, reading, comprehension and language-in-action.
(b) **Assessment of Reading and Written Work** should include assessment of

- descriptive or narrative composition
- writing for specific purposes (e.g. formal and informal letters, or the type of writing required by other content areas)
- specific skills (e.g., spelling, punctuation, paragraphing)
- comprehension and critical appreciation of works in the reading programme as well as comprehension of non-literary texts (such as the type of texts encountered in other content areas). Comprehension tests should go beyond testing literal understanding to testing pupils' ability to infer, extrapolate and evaluate.

(c) **Knowledge of language structures** should be assessed only in terms of the extent to which such knowledge and structures assist or impede effective communication.

5.5 The following requirements relate specifically to the Standard 10 examination but could also be used as a guideline for setting Standard 8 and 9 examinations.

(a) The total marks for the subject will be 300.

(b) In the section on the reading programme, candidates will be required to answer two contextual comprehension questions. Both may be based on the prescribed works, or one on a prescribed work and one on an unseen literary text. The two questions taken together must test a range of kinds and levels of comprehension.

Alternatively, the prescribed works may be examined internally by oral or written means. If that is done, at least one comprehension question on a literary text must be included in the final examination. It must test a range of kinds and levels of comprehension.

(c) The final examination will normally be 40 hours in length, and still be made up of three 10 hour papers of approximately equal weight.
Paper 1: Composition

This paper should include at least

- a narrative, descriptive or discursive composition of approximately 300-400 words on one of at least six subjects (± 2/3 of the marks)

- Another piece of writing directed to a specific purpose and with the context clearly outlined (e.g. formal or informal letter, report, minutes). The candidate should have a choice of at least three questions (± 1/3 of the marks).

Paper 2: Literature/Setworks

Two options could be considered in setting this paper, viz.:

- two contextual comprehension questions on prescribed texts

  OR

- one contextual question on a prescribed text and one on an unseen literary text.

Paper 3: Comprehension and usage

This paper should consist of at least

- a comprehension question on a non-literary text in contemporary English (± 1/3 -1/2 of the marks)

- a question requiring a summary of a non-literary text (± 1/4 of the marks)

- a question or questions testing pupils' ability to use language (no less than 1/4 of the marks).

Examining bodies may distribute the content of the syllabus differently in their evaluation systems, provided that marks are allocate in the same approximate proportions as in these papers.

In view of the integrative aims of the course, teachers may find it useful to adopt an integrative approach to evaluation. If they do, marks should still be allocated in the proportions indicated above.
APPENDIX IVB

QUESTIONS ON POETRY NOV. 1993
DEPT OF EDUCATION AND
TRAINING MATRICULATION
EXAMINATION
ANTHEM FOR DOOMED YOUTH

What passing-bells for these who die as cattle?
Only the monstrous anger of the guns.
Only the stuttering rifles' rapid rattle
Can patter out their hasty orisons.
No mockeries for them; no prayers nor bells,
Nor any voice of mourning save the choirs,
The shrill, demented choirs of wailing shells;
And bugles calling for them from sad shires.

What candles may be held to speed them all?
Not in the hands of boys, but in their eyes
Shall shine the holy glimmers of good-byes.
The pallor of girls' brows shall be their pall;
Their flowers the tenderness of patient minds,
And each slow dusk a drawing-down of blinds.

Wilfred Owen

1. In what war were these soldiers doomed to die? 
2. By calling the soldiers cattle the poet draws attention to things these soldiers have in common with cattle. Which of the following do the soldiers and cattle not share?
   a) they have no choice about being killed
   b) they are serving the purposes of others
   c) their identity is of no importance
   d) they are killed to be eaten
3. In the context of the rest of the poem the tone of the opening question (what passing-bells .... cattle) can be described as

a) curious  
b) triumphant  
c) bitter  
d) baffled

(2)

4.1 Which two-word phrase personifies the guns? (1)

4.2 Which word personifies the rifles? (1)

5. Quote an example of alliteration (three words at most) from the first stanza. (2)

6. The word (a) emphasises the idea that if you treat young men like (b) you cannot at the same time give them a normal funeral.

Choose two words from the first stanza to make sense of this sentence. (4)

7. The words at A are elements of a traditional funeral service referred to in the poem and those at B are elements or aspects of war which the poet links with such a service.

A: passing-bells; prayers; choir song; candles; cloth (for covering the coffin); flowers

B: the wailing of shells; the noise of big guns; tear­drops; automatic rifle fire; feelings of love; pale foreheads.

(6)

The words in A are listed on your answer sheet. Write the matching words from B in the spaces provided there.
8. Judging from the word *shire*, in which country are the bugles being blown?  

9. Find synonyms in the octave for  
   a) grief and  
   b) insane  

10. The octave deals with _[a]_ whereas  
    the sestet deals with _[b]_.  

Choose two of the following for the gaps in the statement above:  

- the problems of cattle farming  
- the conditions under which the young men die  
- the causes of the war  
- the departure of the train taking the young men away  
- the grief of those who loved them  

Now read the following poem and then answer the remaining questions.  

**THE THOUGHT FOX**  

I imagine this midnight moment's forest:  
Something else is alive  
Besides the clock's loneliness  
And this blank page where my fingers move.  

Through the window I see no star:  
Something more near  
Though deeper within darkness  
Is entering the loneliness:  

Cold, delicately as the dark snow  
A fox's nose touches twig, leaf;  
Two eyes serve a movement, that now  
And again now, and now, and now.
Sets neat prints into the snow
Between trees and warily a lame
Shadow lags by stump and in hollow
Of a body that is bold to come

Across clearings, an eye,
A widening deepening greenness,
Brilliantly, concentratedly,
Coming about its own business

Till, with a sudden sharp hot stink of fox
It enters the dark hole of the head.
The window is starless still; the clock ticks,
The page is printed.

Ted Hughes

11. What word tells us that there is no real forest? (2)

12. The things that are 'alive' (line 2) are
   a) the clock
   b) the page
   c) the approaching thought fox
   d) a), b) and c) (2)

13. The 'something' of line 6 is nearer than what? (2)

14. The word cold in line 9 refers to
   a) the dark snow
   b) A fox's nose
   c) the twig and the leaf
   d) a), b) and c) (2)

15. Write down the line number of four lines in the first three stanzas which contribute to the idea of darkness. (4)
16. Quote the line that suggests most clearly that the movement in lines 11 and 12 is walking.

17. What word tells us

(a) that the fox's shadow appears to be cautious and;

(b) that the shadow appears to be slowed down by irregularities it passes over?

18. To what does greenness in line 18 refer?

19. Quote the line in which the poet achieves the greatest physical reality for his thought-fox.

20. The dark hole that the fox enters is

(a) a hole in the snow
(b) its own cave
(c) the mind of the poet or the reader
(d) the open window

21. How many lines are on the page that is printed?
APPENDIX - iVC

QUESTIONS ON POETRY NOV. 1994
DEPT OF EDUCATION AND
TRAINING MATRICULATION
EXAMINATION
SECTION B: THE WIND AT DAWN - SMYTH AND SWACINA

Read the following poem before answering the questions that follow it.

**FUTILITY**

Move him into the sun -
Gently its touch awoke him once,
At home, whispering of fields unsown.
Always it woke him, even in France,
Until this morning and this snow.
If anything might rouse him now
The kind old sun will know.

Think how it wakes the seeds, -
Woke, once, the clays of a cold star.
Are limbs, so dear achieved, are sides,
Full-nerved - still warm - too hard to stir?
Was it for this the clay grew tall?
- O what made fatuous sunbeams toil
To break earth’s sleep at all?

Wilfred Owen

1. In order to understand this poem it is important to know that Wilfred Owen's poetry deals with his experiences ...
   a) while he was studying in France.
   b) as a medical doctor.
   c) during World War I.
   d) as a farmer. (2)

2. Give the numbers of the two lines which give the clearest reason for moving the dead man into the sun. (2)

3. Quote a phrase of three words which means 'gave him life'. (2)
4. Quote a phrase which might refer to the things that the man would do during his life.

5. Which word is used here to mean 'every morning'?

6. What we know of Wilfred Owen's background suggests that the phrase 'even in France' is a reference to ...
   a) how boring it was being at a French university.
   b) the high death rate in France from disease.
   c) the likelihood of being killed in battle.
   d) the dangers of farming in France.

7. Which word can be understood here to mean 'bring back to life'?

8. In this context it is most likely that the word once in line 9 refers to ...
   a) the sowing of the seed.
   b) the birth of the dead man.
   c) the beginning of life on earth.
   d) the big bang that established the universe.

9. What is the 'cold star' of line 9?

10. It is most likely that dear-achieved in this context refers to ...
    a) man as the high point of the process of evolution.
    b) the dead man's loved ones.
    c) the high costs of farming.
    d) both b) and c).

11. Quote a phrase of four words which confirms that the man is dead.
12. The phrase 'the clay grew tall' refers to ...
   a) hills and mountains.
   b) the human race as a product of evolution.
   c) seeded crops.
   d) the exceptional height of the dead man. (2)

13. Find synonyms in the second stanza for the following words:
   a) arms and legs   b) foolish   c) labour (3)

14. In the context of Wilfred Owen’s life and his other poems
   Futility can be understood as a protest against the
   pointlessness of ...
   a) life as such.
   b) the wartime deaths of young men.
   c) trying to get things to grow.
   d) expecting the sun to produce life. (2)

Now read the following poem and then answer the questions that follow.

**MEETING AT NIGHT**

The gray sea and the long black land;
And the yellow half-moon large and low;
And the startled little waves that leap
In fiery ringlets from their sleep,
As I gain the cove with pushing prow,
And quench its speed in the slushy sand.

Then a mile of warm sea-scented beach;
Three fields to cross till a farm appears;
A tap at the pane, the quick sharp scratch
And blue spurt of a lighted match.
And a voice less loud, thro’ its joys and fears,
Than the two hearts beating each to each!

Robert Browning
15. Three of the following bits of information from the first two lines confirm that it is night time. The one exception is ... 
   a) the sea is grey.
   b) the land is black.
   c) the moon is yellow.
   d) the moon is low.

16. Let's assume that the speaker is a young man. Which word in the first stanza hints that there is danger in what he is doing?

17. Which word tells us that the moonlight is reflected off the water?

18. Find synonyms in the first stanza for the following:
   a) reach  
   b) small bay  
   c) front of the boat
   d) stop  
   e) watery

19. Quote one or two words for each of the following four senses that are involved in the second stanza:
   a) touch
   b) smell
   c) hearing
   d) sight

20. Four sounds are mentioned in the second stanza. Which of them ...
   a) does the man make?
   b) does his girlfriend make?
   c) is the louder of the remaining two sounds?

21. Question 16 above mentions the danger in what the young man is doing. Quote one word from the second stanza which confirms this.