Architecture and Identity

The perception and reflection of identity through architectural expression:
A Case Study of Wentworth

JODI DAVIDS

Document completed in partial fulfillment of the academic requirements for the
degree of Master of Architecture in the School of Architecture, Housing and
Planning, University of KwaZulu -Natal.

March 2007
DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this dissertation is my own unaided work. It is being submitted to the School of Architecture, Town Planning and Housing, University of KwaZulu-Natal, Durban, for the degree of Master in Architecture, and has not been submitted before for any degree or examination at any other university.

Signed by me on this 15th day of March 2007
“If we fail to nourish our souls, they wither, and without soul, life ceases to have meaning. The creative process shrivels in the absence of continual dialogue with the soul. And creativity is what makes life worth living.”

Marion Woodman, 1996
ABSTRACT

South Africa like many countries in the non-Western world has a long history of conflict stemming back to the spread of Colonialism. Various events through the years have contributed to the solidification of European and Western dominance over all that is “African”. However the move to the new South Africa has facilitated renewed interaction and understanding through the celebration of peoples' differences. Differences which although unique have also contributed to the confused state of identity that exists.

Current debate in South Africa centers greatly on the issue of “South African Identity”, its existence, how it is created, and what constitutes it. South Africa’s transition to the new democratic order has brought with it major shifts in the order and nature of peoples’ identities as well as a “new” language that represents the collective identity of the society.

This study focuses on the role of identity in architecture and examines the transformation and development of South African architectural expression and reflection as seen through the window of identity. The study seeks to question how the built environment can begin to respond to and reflect the concerns and aspirations of its inhabitants and also highlights the existence of the mutually constitutive link between identity, space and the built form.

Key principles are set out in the study and are further examined through the critical analysis of both local and international precedents that serve to highlight the expressive nature of architecture, as well as the reflection of the multitude of influences on built form. The aim of the study is to identity existing perceptions within the built environment and in so doing begin to analyse how these become manifest in the built form. The case study looks in particular at the area of Wentworth, situated south of Durban, and how architecture can be used to create public space which contributes to the formation of a collective and heterogeneous community identity. An identity which celebrates the diversity of its inhabitants while giving dignity and a sense of place to the environment.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to thank the following people for their willing assistance, support and encouragement.

With thanks to the School of Architecture at UKZN and my fellow colleagues for making my studies during the past six and a half years a rich and rewarding experience, one which has proved most valuable and will certainly remain memorable.

To the academic staff, as well as the architectural library and LAN staff who have assisted me over the years. Special thanks to my dissertation supervisor’s Professor Adebayo and Professor Frescura who guided me through the Masters Programme, your contribution to my knowledge and education as well as your assistance in the research process is invaluable. Special thanks to my design mentor Kevin Bingham who provided the encouragement and support, your commitment is most appreciated.

Special thanks to all the community members who so willingly participated in the case study and to the community of Wentworth at large who provided the inspiration and focus for this project.

Last but by no means least; thank you to my parents, family and friends, especially Mom and Hayden, who have patiently encouraged, supported and motivated me through the most trying times.

Jodi Davids
Durban, 2007
CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1

1.1 Background 1
1.2 Research Questions 5
1.3 Hypothesis 6
1.4 Aims and Objectives 6
1.5 Definition of concepts 8

CHAPTER 2: Methodology

2.1 Introduction and Literature Review 11
2.2 The Study Area and setting 12
2.3 Research Design 19
2.4 Data Sources:
   a) Secondary Data 19
   b) Primary Data 19
   c) Other Supplementary Data 20
2.5 Sampling Frame 20
2.6 Limitations of the study 21
2.7 Structure of the thesis 22
2.8 Conclusion 23

CHAPTER 3: Theoretical and Conceptual framework

3.1 Introduction 24
3.2 Historical and political background 24
3.3 Political Transformation 28
3.4 Political Identity and social change 30
3.5 National Identity 32
3.6 Conclusion 38

CHAPTER 4: Vernacular/contemporary divide

4.1 Introduction 41
4.2 Influence of vernacular architecture on contemporary identity 41
4.3 Context, Culture and Identity 47
4.4 Aesthetics and spatial ordering 54
4.5 Conclusion 55

CHAPTER 5: Urban and Suburban Conceptions of Space

5.1 Introduction 57
5.2 Political Liberalization and Space 57
5.3 New Conceptions of Space 60
5.4 Community Space 63
CHAPTER 1

1.1 Background

It has long been argued by architects and planners alike (Lipman 1961, Le Grange 1983, Noero 1985), that South African architecture lacks a distinct national identity due to the country's diversity of cultures, a turbulent political past and a borrowed Western identity. Despite moves since 1994 towards developing a South African identity, actual progress on the subject appears to be limited. A large component of this involves an understanding of existing perceptions of identity within South Africa and how it is interpreted by various social groups. Historical precedent shows that, within most societies, architecture has played a critical role in the creation of their national image. The question of how to overcome differences in order to build a national identity is complex. The process of creating a South African national identity needs to be approached with wisdom and sensitivity. Therefore a study of "Architecture" and "Identity" is necessary to understand what relationships exist between built form and its human context, the perceptions of identity, and how this constitutes to the built environment within the South African context. Many previous studies on the topic of identity have often dealt with the issue at the scale of South Africa as a whole but few have looked at the effects of this identity in architecture within the context of a suburban community in Durban. Through field research in the area of Wentworth, this study will examine the effects of identity on the architecture and place making of a small, low income community, in order to evaluate the value of place and space in creating architectural identity.

A more appropriate understanding of identity for South Africa was given by Williams who stated that

"...identities are constructed, are continually changing, and are moulded by a continually changing matrix of historical, cultural and social factors" (De Jager 2005: 2).
It is impossible when discussing South Africa in the context of development and national identity, to ignore the country’s political and social past. The form of cities and their architectural expression are closely connected with the nature of the political order and of political power. To understand the history of South Africa in terms of the tensions arising among “ethnic” groupings that were constructed under colonialism and apartheid would be to eradicate a complex political culture. One that has proved itself to be much more resilient than either colonialism or apartheid and through which alliances and negotiations across “ethnic” and colour divides have immeasurably complicated the complexion of the “new” nation. (Freuh, 2003) Despite local awareness of the ways in which colonialism and apartheid contributed to both the artificial construction of apparently homogeneous ethnic constituencies and the distribution of other forms of viable community, the focus still lies in the search for an ideal of “community”. This ideal can be reflected through a national identity expressed socially, politically and in the built environment. Much effort has been put into discussion about South African identity and this study will begin to debate whether there is in fact a universal identity for the new South Africa or whether this is just an idealistic notion.

A multitude of variables can shape the identity of a nation, including history, culture, religion and language. The underlying question is: how does one define a “common identity” or “national identity” in a pluralistic society?

South Africa is a land of extreme richness and diversity. Accompanied with such richness are major challenges, and the extremity of this accentuates the enormity of the challenge. To a large degree architecture in South Africa does not reflect or respond to the growing concerns of its inhabitants, but rather disproportionately represents the preferences of architects, planners and administrators.

The moral simplicity and practical complexity of the rise and fall of Apartheid captured the imagination of individuals around the world, making it a global issue. Through the system of apartheid the majority of South Africans were
denied their identity as human beings. This which created fixed stereotypes thus limiting individual's choices.

What changed in South Africa, and continues to change, are the identities of its people. Onuf stated that,

"South Africa was a large society whose most conspicuous foundations consisted of an extraordinary arrangement of collective identities. Racial identities extensively developed and formally defined, relentlessly imposed, notoriously instrumental in distributing privilege of all sorts, passionately defended at home, and overwhelmingly deplored everywhere else in the world. Foundations crumbled when large numbers of ordinary people rejected the identity labels that others had assigned them. As an act of resistance, they changed their identities". (Onuf in Freuh, 2003: 17)

With the rise of colonialism and then apartheid came the destruction of indigenous identity that exists within traditional norms. The search for a new South African identity and the attempts of social reconciliation are welcomed after the years of segregation. However the result of the multitude of diverse influences which African society has been subjected to has produced a confused and ambiguous identity. This conflicted group identity has no distinct and recognizable architectural expression that speaks of the complex, heterogeneous culture that is the nature of South Africa.

The question of identity has since the beginning of recorded time been deeply imbedded in the foundation of virtually every single society known to us. In almost every case the forms of palaces, dwellings, places of worship and places of burial are marked with an identity, which gives them a firm location in both time and place. The thesis draws on a range of theories. The approach adopted for the most part thus tends to be eclectic. Concepts and theories from a variety of sources have been combined when considered appropriate. Thus there is no universal philosophical or theoretical 'metanarrative' employed as a guiding framework for explanation. Rather a loose collective of related ideas of relevance to the research question are
employed. It is the author’s opinion that there cannot be a universal theory applied when dealing with a study of such diverse nature, which includes society, culture and architectural influence.

It is unavoidable that any study that seeks to give built form meaning in terms of a series of text, subtext and silences must by its very nature be defined by Post Structuralist and Post Modern terms. However in order to understand fully the culture of modern architecture as a text we also need to read its ‘historical text’ in terms of its original structuralist and modernist philosophies.

It is important in the politically charged environment of South Africa to recognise Marxist ideology that holds that art and architecture actually reflects on its society politically, socially and in all other respects. An understanding of the ‘historical text’ of architecture helps to ground one in the origins and foundations of the philosophies of that era while by comparison an understanding of Marxist ideology is needed in order to understand and read the society in its present state. Built form of any kind is invariably related in some way to its human context and the theory of Existentialism therefore becomes necessary to the understanding of this symbiotic relationship between man and built form, while Perceptual theories are necessary to the ‘reading’ of those relationships. Due to the human context of this study being located in Africa, any interpretation of architecture as identity will also have to find meaning in terms of Africanist philosophies.

The challenge for this dissertation will therefore be to contribute to current debates around identity and its reflection in architectural expression within the context of South Africa and in particular the area of Wentworth. It will subsequently be argued that perceptions of identity and identity formation have undergone a similar, if not parallel, progression in-order to establish the mutually constitutive link between identity, space and built form (Keith & Pile, 1993). Derrida’s (1974) notion of the ‘constitutive outside’ will be used to highlight the fact that the creation and existence of an identity is reliant on the establishment and affirmation of a difference, which is the very notion that has
been used to define apartheid identity for individuals and as a collective entity through the creation of an ‘us’ and a ‘them’.

1.2 Research Questions

The main question that emerges, therefore is:
1) To what extents do perceptions of identity exist and how is that identity reflected through the architectural expression of the built environment of South Africa?

This leads to a number of other important questions, such as:
2) Is architecture an appropriate means to express the identity of a people?

For those of us actively involved in the creation and development of the built environment it might very well appear to be an appropriate means to express identity. But how the public understands identity and what their connection is to the built environment may be more informative in understanding what perceptions exist.

3) How can perceptions of and reflections in architecture express the identity of South Africa?

It is the authors’ belief that architecture is grounded in the experiences of its makers and users. Despite this much of South Africa’s architectural past is grounded in the experience of its “makers” and expresses a language that is often hurtful and painful to many of its users. The question of what constitutes a South African identity is highly contested, but if one is to align architecture to the transition of South African society, then how does one reflect and express the diversity, democracy and freedom of our society through the built form.

4) How can the ideals of balance and independence also find expression in South African architecture?
Like society, architecture is constantly undergoing transformation. It therefore becomes necessary to determine how this transformation is reflected and expressed through architecture.

5) How have changes in the identity structure of the social order of South Africans affected the spatial structure of the built environment?

With the fall of apartheid came the freedom to express individual identities and to abandon those imposed by the regime. However, as a result of the transition toward a non-racial democratic social order, many of the structures of everyday life remain in a state of flux that has affected the spatial structure of the built environment.

6) How has architecture in South Africa influenced or affected the society/community?

Apartheid planning had dire effects on the social structure of South Africa and in turn this affected its communities. The initiative should now be to eradicate the evidence of apartheid from our built environment and promote the development of inclusive community structures.

1.3 Hypothesis

The question that emerges is to what extent architecture can be considered to be a reflection of community and individual identity. The built environment can be perceived as a reflection of the identity of its inhabitants and society.

1.4 Aims and Objectives

It becomes important therefore to define the culture of 'identity' in order to find its meaning at any given time. The subject has been dealt with extensively in previous research but its definitions have been arrived at predominantly in the context of white males (De Kiewiel 1937, Kultermann 1969, Podro 1972, Britz 1982). Given my identity as a black South African woman it is my belief that the
historical analysis suffers from serious shortcomings which in turn have had serious repercussions upon the relationship between the built form and its human context.

Architecture is integrally identified with human activity, experience, and expression. During the course of this research project the author will seek to analyse architecture as a text through which the identity, beliefs, historical consciousness, and societal concerns of its architects and inhabitants can be read. By exploring these aspects of: 1) the political importance of architecture, 2) the influence of architecture on family and society, 3) the psychological dimensions of buildings, 4) the sign systems associated with architecture, as well as 5) the role of historical paradigms in the identity of the built environment, it is intended to identify existing perceptions of identity within the built environment and how these become to manifest in building form. In the process of highlighting the importance of the perceptions of identity the author aims to accentuate rather than obscure its power to shape South African society and the built environment. In focusing on a specific community, the goal of the research is to interpret the symbolic meaning of the residing culture through architectural intervention. It is assumed that it is in the engagement with specific localities that social groups and communities create symbolic meanings invested in place.

Furthermore, the aim is that this study will initiate a debate, which will contribute to a better understanding of the challenges of the developing world. This debate will begin to answer how we can create a new national identity through architectural expression in a free and democratic South Africa or perhaps argue that no one particular style, order or identity is sufficient to reflect the diverse nature of South Africa. In addition, the author will examine the transformation and development of South African architectural expression and reflection as seen through the reality of identity.
1.5 Definition of Concepts

In the context of this dissertation it became important to create clarity in a number of important concepts:

Revitalization: This involves the revival of vigor to an area in decline. Through the resurgence of indigenous or traditional religious cultures; revindication and reinvention of culture, the emergence of cultures that were oppressed and syncretized and providing the scope for new movements and cultural activism among marginal or minority cultures. (Soanes, 2004)

Identity Labels: The specific medium by which individuals acquire identities. (Freuh, 2003)

Community Development: This concept is viewed as a range of endeavors carried out in a community context aimed at improving the collective circumstances of people suffering various forms of material, social or civic disadvantage. It is more than just economic development (although economic development is included). Community development is the process or effort of building communities on a local level with emphasis on building the economy. It can forge and strengthen social ties, and develop the non-profit sector. By engaging the community, access to resources and information can be given by demonstrating how to access and use those resources.

Lost Spaces: In many of the former non-white Group Areas territorial gang warfare has contributed to the demise of communities. These spaces are a direct and intended purpose of apartheid planning and were often used as buffer strips between areas. Despite the eradication of apartheid boundaries these spaces of ‘left over’ land, have not been allocated a function or are not being used for their intended function. (Relph, 1990, Coombes, 2003)

Quality Environments: South African architecture should be expressed and reflected through the creation and maintenance of healthy, stimulating environments that create a positive emotional response in its users. It should
promote both physical and psychological health, and be in harmony with its physical and social environment. (Hayden, 1994)

_Palimpsest_: The notion of exposing and erasing layers of expression. It involves concepts of transparency, layering, tracing, collage and scribing. (Soanes, 2004)

_Apartheid_: Apartheid was first and foremost a systematic legal structure that divided South Africans into racial groups, legitimated the uneven distribution of South African economic, social and political goods according to those racial categories, and systemized White exploitation of those South Africans labeled Black, Indian or Coloured. (Soanes, 2004)

_Coloured_: The term 'Coloured' is a meaningless apartheid term formerly used to classify a minority community of individuals of mixed race. However, it is used in the context of this dissertation to celebrate the diverse heterogeneous origins and colourful make-up of this community.

_Transformation_: A term used extensively in the context of the new South Africa to describe the changes in condition and structure. Transformation is necessary as part of healing in South Africa lies in the changing outward form or appearance of our cities and built environment in the hope that these acts of process will lead to positive end results. (Soanes, 2004)

_Perception_: The representation of what is perceived is a basic component in the formation of a concept. Perceptions are representations to the mind in the form of an idea or image and it is these very images that are important to the development of identity. (Soanes, 2004)

_Reflection_: The term can be understood and defined as a calm, lengthy, intent consideration. A manifestation or result, which leads to expression without words. Expression which in this study takes its place in form, space and place. (Soanes, 2004)
Richness: The diverse nature of people, culture and place as well as the abounding natural resources constitute the richness of South Africa. These elements have great value and are meaningful and significant and are therefore important factors in identity formation and creation in South Africa. (Marschall & Kearney, 2000)

Art: In this study the term is used in a broad sense to refer to the various areas of life, which can be seen as aesthetic in modern society. (Mongwe, 1996)
CHAPTER 2

Methodology

2.1 Introduction

The methodology employed in the research process aimed to establish to what extents do perceptions of identity exist within the community of Wentworth and how if at all that identity is reflected in the built environment. The measurement of the extent of the effects of identity on place is somewhat hampered by inadequate data and the studies which have been completed are not comprehensive. This section therefore presents some of the limited information available and draws some of its conclusions from the experiences and knowledge of the people living in or involved with the community.

Due to the limited time frame of the study, intensive research, which uses predominantly qualitative techniques such as one on one interviews, was deemed the most appropriate method for the collection of primary data and in particular, discourse analysis.

It is difficult to give a single definition of discourse analysis as a research method. Indeed, rather than providing a particular method, Discourse Analysis can be characterized as a way of approaching and thinking about a problem. In this sense, discourse analysis is neither a qualitative nor a quantitative research method, but a manner of questioning the basic assumptions of quantitative and qualitative research methods. Discourse analysis does not provide a tangible answer to problems based on scientific research rather it will enables one to reveal the hidden motivations behind a text or behind the choice of a particular method of research to interpret that text. It is the deconstructive reading and interpretation of a problem or text.

It is noted by the researcher that this choice of research method will not provide absolute answers to the specific problem but will however enable the understanding of the conditions behind those problems and in so doing
enables a higher awareness of the problems which will in turn lead to better solutions.

The topic of architecture and identity is vast and therefore can only be covered in short in this dissertation. It must also be noted that this study presents a particular interpretation of empirical research data that will not necessarily be representative of the entire South African community.

2.2 The Study Area and setting

Wentworth consists of three distinct areas created in the apartheid era by Group Areas proclamation numbers. The three areas include Austerville, Merewent and Treasure Beach, which for the purposes of this study will be viewed as one area. The area is a former Coloured Group Area situated approximately 11 kilometres south of Durban's city centre. (Illustration 1) It is one of five small areas in the greater Durban area that was demarcated for occupation by coloured people. With a population of 35,000 crammed into an area of 212 hectares, Wentworth is one of the smallest and most densely populated urban townships in Durban with an average of 165 persons per hectare (SIB Statistics, 2004). Unemployment estimates of 58% subject residents to the debilitating combination of environmental pollution, degrading socio-economic challenges and is at worst, collateral for profit. (SIB Statistics, 2004)
Illustration 1, Detailed map of the study area and its surrounding context
Illustration 2, Location Map of the five former Coloured Group Areas of Durban
The area was formally designated a Coloured area from 1961 and was part formed as a part of the state's mass public housing building programme of the 1960's and 1970's (Rankin, 1982). Quality Street and Bluff Nature Reserve to the north, Badulla Road to the south, Tara Road bounds the study area to the east and Jacobs industrial to the west. (refer to illustration 1)

As part of the South Industrial Basin the area is ideally situated in terms of access to the city which is predominantly via bus and minibus taxi. However, in terms of the health and well being of the residents, the location of the area is particularly hazardous. It is home to some of the worst industrial pollution committed by multinational companies and environmental damage seen the world over. Surrounded by heavy industry, a paper mill, sewerage recycling plants, the Durban International Airport, major transport corridors and two of South Africa's largest oil refineries the impacts of air and noise pollution has detrimental effects on the health of residents and has resulted in major conflict between local communities and industry.

Initial plans by the local authority in the 1930's to create a 'productive zone' south of Durban (Scott, 1994) combined with apartheid legislation in later years, aimed to racially cleanse the city. Racial segregation and the development of distinct racial zones was achieved though 'slum clearance schemes' and industrial development. (illustration 5) The industrial areas acted as 'buffer strips' between different racial/group areas, while the predominantly Black and South Asian residents of the racially zones housing schemes provided the labour reservoir for the surrounding industry.
Illustration 5. Map showing the location of the Durban "Slum" zones declared in 1939.
The Austerville area served a military camp during the Second World War. These disused military barracks were converted into dwelling units for residents of the area when it was converted into a Coloured area in 1963. This was after the national housing commission took control (CORA, 1985). In later years two and three storey walk-up flats as well as one bedroom semi-detached single storey houses were erected in Austerville and Merewent by the Department of Community Development (Rankin, 1982). These flats and semi detached homes still forms the majority component of housing stock in the area. So-called 'middle class' residents were allocated two and three bedroom houses while the low-income earners of the community were allocated flat-roofed, two-roomed houses known as the "Rainbow Chickens".

Illustration 6, Dwelling units which were formerly military barracks now forming a large part of the housing stock

Illustration 7, Panax Place flats

Illustration 8, "Rainbow Chickens"

Illustration 9, Semi-detached double storey housing

Illustration 5, 6, 7, 8 illustrating some of the common housing typologies in Wentworth built to accommodate middle to low income earners.

The more affluent section of the community resides on large privately owned dwellings on the elevated Bluff Ridge, overlooking the Indian ocean.
Separated from the 'white area' by a buffer strip, which though covered by a rare species of dune grass was and still is seen by the local community as a means of ensuring racial segregation.

2.3 Research Design

The intensive research procedure was undertaken to collect qualitative data after a full search and analysis of relevant literature was completed. This research was achieved through interactive, semi-structured interviews, which were conceived as informal discussions. These discussions were intended to provide the researcher with a foundation to creating a brief for a building that would best serve the needs of the community as well as to better understand how the community views the issue of identity and the role of architecture in identity creation. Discussions with the respondents from Group A was structured as a workshop rather than one on one interviews. The workshop was run at a local high school, Fairvale Secondary School. Girls and boys from grade 8 to 12 were randomly selected to form part of the discussion. This approached was successful in that it was able to elicit much more information, as the respondents were more relaxed and participated freely cheered on by their peers.

The researcher was able to fully participate and interact with respondents due to the electronic recording of interviews, which were later transcribed. The fact that the researcher was from the community contributed to the easy nature of the conversation despite the complex issues being discussed, while
the use of discourse analysis enabled the researcher to extract the meaning and content of each respondent with limited bias. The views of the respondents were used to establish common lines of interest and concerns within the community among all age groups. This aided the design process as it communicated to the researcher the most appropriate architectural intervention needed, the best location in terms of accessibility as well as the primary facilities required. By responding to the common interests of community members the resulting building is intended to reflect these interests rather than obscure the residing culture and identity by imposing a facility onto the area.

2.4 Data Sources

a) Secondary Data

During the course of this thesis information was drawn from research already done on the subjects of identity and architecture. A review of the relevant literature was also conducted in order to develop a better understanding of the subject.

Secondary data included an extensive literature review, which was conducted in order to establish links between theory and the primary research. Historical data of the area was collected to establish the development of the area while maps and aerial photographs obtained from the local municipality were used to facilitate the primary study of the architectural identity of the area. These maps and photographs were also used to aid in identifying possible sites to locate an architectural intervention in the area, one that could reflect the identity of the community and create a place for community interaction.

b) Primary Data

The main source of data for this research was a focus group study. Due to the sensitive subject matter the collection and interpretation of the primary, qualitative data obtained by means of informal, semi-structured and open-ended interviews was deemed most appropriate. The interviews conducted
within different focus groups were informal conversations as opposed to a written questionnaires or surveys, in order to maximise the interaction between interviewer and respondent. The design and format of the questionnaire (Appendix a) was influenced by the aims and objectives of this study. However discussion about the role of architecture in revitalization stemmed naturally from questions about the area and the respondents views of their surroundings. The inclusion of structured questions was necessary to facilitate the codification of demographic information however the majority of questions asked in the discussions made provision for open-ended responses.

c) Other Supplementary Data

The use of key informants was necessary to establish and attain various statistical data of Wentworth and to provide contextual background data for this study. Further data has also been obtained by accessing archival records of the Ethekwini Municipality and the South Industrial Basin. In addition, wherever possible, interviews have been arranged with officials of the local authority involved in the redevelopment projects in the area to establish the vision which has driven the upgrading of Wentworth and to obtain input on what architectural interventions are most appropriate and beneficial to the area.

2.5 Sampling frame

Due to the fact that a representative sample was not sought, a total of twenty respondents was randomly selected based on the following criteria: respondents had to be current residents of Wentworth residing in one of the three sub-areas and fall into one of three focus groups of residents aged 14-25 (Group A), 25-45 (Group B) and a third group aged 45+ (Group C).
These three groups consist of residents from all three areas of Wentworth and also equally reflect both males and females. Careful attention was paid to ensure that the groups reflected age and gender stratification of the community however it must be noted that females outnumber males at a ratio of 3:1 and therefore constituted the larger number of focus group respondents.

A third of the respondents were selected by the researcher based on her established network in the community while another third of the overall group consisted of individuals specifically targeted, via a system of networking and referrals. The remaining third of the group was randomly selected and consisted mostly of youth.

### 2.6 Limitations of the study

The major limitation encountered during the research was the lack of documentary evidence recorded after the area was declared a ‘Slum’ Zone in 1939 (see illustration 5). Due to the origin of the area as a former non-white group area, no formal town planning scheme or proposal was made of the area. The documentation that does exist at the local municipality is very outdated and little development has occurred in the area over the last decade.

Although no major problems were encountered during the fieldwork, the following problems are of interest:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AGE GROUP</th>
<th>MEREWENT</th>
<th>AUSTERVILLE</th>
<th>TREASURE BEACH</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Group A 14-25</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group B 25-45</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group C 45+</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Illustration 12. Illustrates the residential and gender distribution of the three focus groups of respondents.
Due to the limited time frame in which to complete the empirical research only a limited amount of interviews were carried out, as the process took longer than originally expected.

Although the confidential and academic nature of the study was emphasized prior and during the interview, it was found that some respondents were still hesitant to provide certain information.

It was also found that the process of discussion was extended due to the amount of explanation required on the subject of identity and in particular how it relates to architecture. The youth group in particular found it quite difficult to understand the relevance of one's identity in relation to space and place.

As the bulk of the empirical research was carried out over the festive season it proved difficult at times to schedule a time in which to conduct the interviews despite the enthusiasm of respondents to participate in the study.

2.7 Structure of the thesis

The findings of the research have been structured into eight chapters, the first of which provides the background and introduction to the subject of Architecture and Identity. Part three presents the conceptual and theoretical framework for this study. The broad literature review outlines the various ideologies and processes generic to architecture and identity, as well as the social, political and psychological dimensions of identity. The literature review also intends to provide a background to the existing perceptions of identity and the consequent effects of that identity on the built environment, as it is understood. Chapter four and five follow with a discussion on the vernacular contemporary divide in architecture as well the founding concepts behind urban and suburban space as it relates to community architecture. The sixth part of the research follows with a critical analysis of precedent studies in order to inform the research as well as the proposed architectural intervention. The case study, chapter seven, focuses on the Durban south community of Wentworth. The analysis of the results in chapter seven will draw links between the primary research and literature reviewed in order to explore the
issue of architecture and identity in Wentworth. Finally, the concluding chapter summarizes the main issues emanating from the research and provides suitable recommendations.

2.8 Conclusion

Despite the interpretive nature of discourse analysis on which the majority of the empirical data is analyzed, all attempts have been made to remove bias and preconception. The study was undertaken with rigor in an attempt to meet the aims and objectives of this thesis and presented in a manner that the researcher's interpretations can be clearly read.
CHAPTER 3

Theoretical and conceptual Framework

3.1 Introduction

This thesis will use contemporary theories in-order to understand and define the relationship between identity and architectural expression in post-apartheid South Africa. The post-structuralist approach is central to the way identity is viewed in this thesis as it offers a useful way of conceptualizing the relationship between built form, space and human identity. Unlike the essentialist proposals of apartheid, it emphasizes that the relationship between built form, space and identity are never solid, are never fixed, and are always unstable or changing. Architecture is not a neutral activity, but rather a dynamic process, which reflects the society from which it emerges in terms of values, economic life, politics and every other field of life. Their relationship is a dynamic one that represents the nature of South African society. The chapter will therefore begin with an analysis of how identity has historically been perceived so that the post-structuralist approach can be placed in its proper context. It will also be necessary to provide an overview of the changing perceptions of identity through time. It will be shown why this discourse is useful for understanding identity construction in South Africa. Finally the chapter will conclude with an exploration of qualities suitable for the creation of an architectural identity in South Africa.

3.2 Historical and political background

The land that is now the Republic of South Africa has a long history of the same types of conflict that were indicative of the spread of colonialism elsewhere in the non-Western world. Colonialism, however, did not overpower all contexts uniformly. South Africa's transition to a new democratic order has brought with it a 'new' language. Apartheid discourses were characterized by words such as: segregation, oppression, and socialism, whereas the discourses of the new order seem to be characterized by words
such as freedom, unity, democracy and reconciliation. What has made the South African case interesting is the particular racial adaptations that capitalism made as it confronted the circumstances of the South African context. Of interest is the tenacity with which the ruling elites held on to their distinctive institutional inventions as the dominant tenor of global social and cultural norms turned against them.

What we today might call racial diversity was prevalent even before 1652 when the Europeans first settled at the Cape. The hunter-gatherer San, the herder Khoikhoi, and the Bantu speaking farmers had occupied southern Africa since the Iron Age. Clashes between European settlers and indigenous groups dominated the region's history as Europeans edged inland. This continued after 1806, when the area known as the Cape became a colony of the British Empire. In the first half of the century, a major disruption in the traditional governance patterns of the Bantu people, brought on by the imperial aspirations of Shaka Zulu, coincided with a precipitous invasion of the interior by the Dutch and other settlers unhappy with British rule. Meanwhile, British imperial expansion to the north and east in search of both land and labour resulted in a series of wars against both the Xhosa in the Eastern Cape and Zulu in Natal. (De Kiewiet, 1937)

All of these events slowly solidified European dominance. As diamonds and gold were discovered in the interior, British colonialists moved to take control of the land, the mines, and the people. These expansive drives also sparked two 'inter-European' wars between the British and the two Boer Republics, entities established after the Great Trek by Whites whose national identity was based mostly on animosity toward the British, a rejection of the early liberalism, and a fiercely independent and strict attitude towards governance. The British defeat of the Transvaal and Orange Free State republics resulted in the Union of South Africa and the consolidation of discriminatory White rule.

After another thirty-five years of sometimes tense power sharing between predominantly English-speaking and a variety of Afrikaner nationalist parties, the narrow parliamentary victory by the Afrikaner-based National Party (NP) in
1949 shifted power to Afrikaners who constituted just over ten percent of the national population. This victory resulted in the implementation of policies designed to benefit the party’s Afrikaner constituency. Policies which later led to the creation of apartheid. (De Kiewiet, 1937)

From the late 1940’s until the middle of the 1990’s apartheid was the dominant social order in South Africa. Apartheid was first and foremost a systematic legal structure that divided South Africans into racial groups, legitimised the uneven distribution of South African economic, social and political goods according to those racial categories, and systemised White exploitation of those South African labeled Africa, Indian or Coloured. Apartheid laws socially engineered the importance of racial groups, for predicting the qualities, abilities and behaviour of individuals, thereby prohibiting their individual identity. Because art can be a very important weapon of affirming social norms as well as changing them, the state also embarked on a process of effective engineering to confine the development of non-western art and expression with intention to undermine and exterminate it altogether where possible (Mongwe, 1996). Through the control over education, employment, housing and mobility, apartheid successfully organized and ordered racist society.

The cornerstone of apartheid was the Population Registration Act of 1950, according to which each person was labeled, either, White, Coloured, Native or Asian. These categories served as the foundation for a system of laws that allocated social advantage according to racial difference. The Group Areas Act (1950) and the Natives Resettlement Act (1954) systemized the practice of racial segregation of residential areas and were the justification of the wholesale movement of African, Coloured and Indian neighbourhoods. The Reservation of Separate Amenities Act of 1953 enforced segregation of public facilities. The Suppression of Communism Act (1950) gave the government sweeping police and detention authority. A series of laws in the early 1950s established ‘Bantu education’, which emphasised racial and ethnic difference and purposefully trained African students for little more than manual labour. Mixed marriages were prohibited, as was all sexual contact between Whites
and other South Africans, through the Immorality Act. (Freuh, 2003). Separation was enforced through the creation of the “Native” as “other” by removing people’s individual identity and replacing it with numbers.

One of the most enduring legacies of apartheid is our fragmented, dysfunctional and segregated city structure. Apartheid planning was essentially a spatial enterprise; the centrality of space in social theory is therefore most appropriate in the context of South Africa. The notion of separate and essential identities was created and reinforced through the creation of the Group Areas Act in which space was seen as a container where people of different racial groupings could be put into absolute spaces. It sought to exploit the difference between groups in the interests of capital accumulation, white domination and racial segregation.

While apartheid was a particular set of racist laws, a master racist, Nazi ideal, it was also a vision of reality that influenced what people noticed about the world and how they behaved in it. The propagation of apartheid ideology was not only confined to laws and blatantly oppressive measures. Architecture and urban planning as well as art were also utilized to reinforce political aims. Though many urban planners and architects claim their work to be a-political, an argument is made that the political always overrides the artistic because it is the political, which organizes society and determines the role of distribution of space for any social activity (Mongwe, 1996). Whatever the political origins, the categorical scheme of Apartheid became a naturalised part of the South African reality, because South Africans of all races used these generalisations in their daily lives. Apartheid claimed that every aspect of society, human activity, politics and built environment was predictable on the basis of a single variable—race. Apartheid domination was imposed through the single manifestation of identity that overpowered all other identities and in so doing created the illusion of human and institutional control over social interaction.

While the structure of apartheid tried to fix racial identities to specific spaces through separate development, Marxist critique argues that identity is a function of capital (Soni, 1992). According to Robert Mongwe,
"Marxism emphasizes the role of economic relations by arguing that art in capitalist society is the domain of the ruling capitalist class and is therefore used by them to oppress the working classes culturally and install in them values which indoctrinates them to accept the status quo, and remain in subordination as a class." (Mongwe, 1996: 28)

As both approaches attempt to relate identity either to capitalist processes or territorial space, they are both seen to be typically modernist. These approaches postulate essentialist, overarching and deterministic links between space and identity. Racial and ethnic identities solidified over time as capitalism and the state structure emerged. Apartheid as social order sought to remove racial and ethnic divisions from the realm of consciousness and turn them into an unquestionable assumption about reality. In most social interactions, the most important characteristic of a person was race or ethnicity.

3.3 Political transformation

As more and more South Africans began to reject apartheid’s racist and unjust ideal of the world, the justifications that made such racial violence acceptable began to melt away, and was replaced by attitudes of resistance. People began to reject the social rules that had previously helped them avoid and resolve everyday types of conflicts because they considered these rules to be part of the oppressive system. It must however be conceded that apartheid planning was not completely unsuccessful in that many people did take up these artificial identities. The new democratic order has, however, resulted in people questioning these previously fixed categories of identity. The disorder caused as a result of the abolishment of apartheid and the move to a new democratic-order served to negate the principal benefit of apartheid-order and created incentives for people to find other ways to organize their ideas about their interactions and about the world in general. Opponents of the state used art to express themselves and act as a vehicle for their goal of liberation. As the legitimacy of apartheid’s order declined, no single alternative set of rules immediately rose to take its place. The result was a
gap of social legitimacy. South Africans rejected Apartheid for varying reasons, and so their visions of how society should be different also varied significantly. According to Freuh,

"each person adapted apartheid’s rules and patterns, or created new ones, in order to align their behaviour with their understanding of the world, both as it was and as it should be. This variety meant that there was no widespread, stable set of social rules that all South Africans could call upon as mutually accepted standards for behaviour in their interactions." (Freuh, 2003: 14)

On February 3, 1997, a new constitution was inaugurated and became the country’s official standard of political justice and equity. The new constitution was also a symbol or representation of the successful transition of South Africa’s political activity and structures of governance. The right to vote also solidified the country as a free and fair democracy. These changes to institutionalized political identity are indicative of broader changes to the in South Africa’s social order. However, as the transition toward a non-racial democratic social order continues, many of the rules and patterns of everyday life remain in a state of flux. Despite its effects the identity of South Africans cannot be seen merely as the result of apartheid social engineering. It would therefore be foolish to propose that a mere repealing of apartheid legislation would lead to a concomitant disintegration of the categories defined, albeit that the boundaries of these categories are blurred.

Like society, architecture is constantly undergoing transformation. Contrary to the modernist notion of the building as an autonomous object, ideal end product and perfect solution to an existing set of functional problems, if architecture is to be relevant and reflective then it needs to be seen as a process, a gradually evolving and constantly changing organism. It has been said that if the building is the result of an extensive process of community participation, architecture can be evaluated not only in terms of its satisfaction of the functional needs specified in the brief but also in term of its satisfaction of social needs of the relevant community, such as their need for employment, capacity building, and cultural expression. (Marshall & Kearney, 2000)
3.4 Political Identity and social change

“To some degree every study of South Africa must confront the idea of identity. Most the work that has dealt with it tangibly has tended to equate identity with either race or ethnicity, or sometimes even class. By reducing identity to merely one of its manifestations, one fails to appreciate the full diversity, both structurally and temporally, that constitutes the complex of identity for South Africans.” (Freuh, 2003: 42)

Great changes in the world at large and particularly apartheid in South Africa, gave many observers a mandate to reconsider the liberal conception of the individual in society. According to Frueh, for liberal observers, the term identity opens an appropriate conceptual domain, or container, for talking about ethnic differences-and for recognizing in others what we see in ourselves. This illustrated through the notion of the ‘constitutive outside’ where identity is constructed almost entirely out of ‘othering’ (Derrida, 1974). As such every identity is therefore relational and the affirmation of a difference is a pre-condition for the existence of any identity. Collective identity is a consequence of the creation of an ‘us’ and a ‘them’. According to Mouffe, “The existence of other becomes a condition of the possibility of my identity since, without the other, I could not have an identity. Therefore, every identity is irremediably established by its exterior and the interior appears as something always contingent” (Mouffe, 1995: 264).

Popular discourse has long linked personal identity and the normal development of the autonomous individual. At the same time, individuals are linked and connected to society by identity through the various entities in which they identify themselves both individually and collectively (Freuh, 2003). Even if, in liberal terms, identity is perceived as personal, it is also always social and spatial.

De Jager states that “Going back to Homer, the Greeks believed that identity was only conferred unto people by membership and participation in a
community. Thus the rituals and traditions of the community gave people their values, established bonds between one another, and imparted meaning and purpose to their lives. This approach to identity assumes that the freedom to shape one's identity, whether it is individual or national, is to acknowledge pre-determined parameters as set by one's community or state. Such a concept of identity during South Africa's apartheid years would have meant that over eighty percent of South Africans would have had to accede to being 'second-rate citizens'- the so-called non-Europeans." (De Jager, 2005: 2)

The crisis of apartheid and the entrenchment of non-racialism as a governing ideology are incomplete because it is indeterminate. There has been a distinct de-articulation and re-articulation of identities. Identity labels as conceptualised by Freuh are a specific medium by which individuals acquire identities. Identity labels are codes that define how people behave with each other (Freuh, 2003). These labels are like a set of rules that form part of a larger set of rules that make society what it is.

A Post-Structuralist approach questions essentialist conceptions of identity and foreclosed attempts to conclusively define identity. Identity cannot, therefore belong to one person alone, and no one belongs to a single identity. All identities are as a result of a constituting process, one that must be of permanent hybridization, for there are no 'natural' or 'original' identities. Identity is, in effect, the result of a multitude of interactions, which take place inside a space, the outlines of which are not clearly defined (Mouffe, 1995).

Much previous research has focused on why apartheid transformation occurred, it is the intention in this paper to rather ask how the transformation of apartheid society happened and interm how the identity of the built environment has changed due to this. This is a study of the power of South Africans' identity labels and the resultant effects on the architectural expression. It is important to remember that large scale social transformations are very complex phenomena and the transition from
apartheid to post-apartheid South Africa is not the sole cause for changes to identity.

The perception that a need for changes in architectural design is imperative is neither new nor unique to South Africa. Architecture always reflects the society it serves. Many of the social, economic and political problems associated with township life and the segregation of South African society, were in a very material sense sustained and even initiated through architecture during the apartheid era and still exists today. Architecture is a powerful tool which when used positively can reflect and redress the paradigms and changing value systems of South Africa’s transforming society (Marschall & Kearney, 2000). A common culture forms the basis on which a national identity can be built.

3.5 National identity

National identity is not a natural attribute that precedes statehood but a process that must be cultivated for a long time after a regime has gained political power. National identity is not something architects or urban designers have complete control over or something that they can firmly mould, as all architecture and the symbolism expressed in it is subject to interpretation. Architects and Urban Designers cannot control the propagation of symbols however they can express the societal meanings of such symbols. Often the representation of national identity is really only a representation of the architect’s own ideas or perhaps those of the specific client or representing body. However if national identity is to be a valuable concept, it has be centered around and idea which percolates throughout the general populace, a populace which may have little understanding of the intricacies of either architectural design, or government institution.
Public statements of collective identity take many forms and make use of many different kind of symbols for support and expression. The visible symbols of national identity (illustration), which first come to mind, are flags, the images on local currency depicting indigenous fauna and flora. These, in turn are often associated with political party emblems and other accepted logos and slogans of national government.

Symbolic associations are a powerful constituent of the built environment. Architecture and urban design assume a peculiar place in this assemblage of national symbols and can contribute extensively to the expression and reflection of identity. As noted by Vale,

"not long after the Lincoln Memorial was built in Washington DC, its image displaced the words one cent from the centre of the American penny. Likewise, on the nickel the head of Thomas Jefferson is backed by the image of his home, Monticello. These two buildings and a few others in and around Washington DC, not only are associated with individual statesmen but have become infused with the symbolism of American democratic government." (Vale, 1992: 48)

It has been argued, that in-order to create an architectural identity, which is reflective of all cultures one must resort to some kind of abstraction. Yet if a building is too far abstracted from any known reference points, it may be resisted, resented, or even ignored. According to Marschall,

"the challenge is to abstract in a way that contributes to the existing nation that builds upon what is there without exacerbating interethnic tensions. The task is to develop a rich ambiguity, so that the building
neither seems to serve one faction nor seems so neutral that it could exist anywhere." (Marschall & Kearney, 2000:154)

In essence the architecture can only be accepted and appreciated by society if its identity is not relegated to the background. Successful architecture is that which relates to the context of that society and expresses the identity of all who constitute it.

The Legislature for the Northern Cape Provincial Government (Luis Ferreira da Silva Architects, Kimberly) is an example of architecture expressing a new national identity. The site for the building was strategically positioned to merge the fabric of the 'black' township of Galeshewe and the main 'white' town of Kimberly. The building was designed to be representative of all histories and integrated artwork by local artists into the architecture as a device to relate the buildings to the context and its people. This element also enables multiple readings of the building and lends an identity which reflects diverse cultures.

The plan of the building is influenced by traditional South African village layouts. (Illustration 15) A series of buildings are grouped around a gathering space marked by an embellished conical landmark tower (Illustration 14) which
also acts as a sundial, marking the passage of time and paying homage to the sun as a defining force in local life. (Deckler et al, 2006) Unlike the formal planning of government buildings in the past, the organic forms, shapes and imagery of the design are derived from the many diverse cultures, industries and influences of Kimberly.

Illustration 16, Legislature for the Northern Cape Provincial Government, showing the local artwork, landscape and detailing of the building

Though complex in appearance each building was designed in such a way that it was simple to build, thereby empowering local contractors to participate in the construction. The entire complex of buildings forming the legislature attests to the skill and ingenuity of local design and technology. The building is a sensitive response to the climate and environment and a prime example of architecture reflecting the identity of diverse cultures and the values of a nation.

Through an architecture expressing cultural diversity, Post-modernism during the early 1980's attempted to celebrate diversity, however this only served to reinforce architecturally the repressive social order established by apartheid. Despite criticism of the reactionary nature of Post-modernism the European derived colonial architectural heritage of South Africa's white minority continues to be dominated by Post-modernist-inspired historicism. This type of culturally unambiguous architecture is also often transplanted into purely white contexts where there is no understanding of or connection to it. (Marschall & Kearney, 2000)

Post-Structuralism raises important questions about the regimes of power, representations and identity (Simonsen, 1996). It is therefore appropriate to the
context of South Africa as it challenges traditional divisions and representation of identity and the way that this has historically been viewed but instead argues for a fusion of the horizons between architecture, space, culture and identity.

Many believe that a culturally neutral approach to architectural design and expression can rectify the situation. However it is the very experiences between an artist or architect and his or her social background that are used in order to communicate his/her understanding and sense of consciousness about himself and everything around him/her. It is therefore important to remember that a truly ‘culturally neutral’ architecture is a utopian idea as “architecture shapes society and society shapes architecture.” (Foucault, 1993:169)

What remains a critical issue is the power of architecture to reflect a particular culture through the projection of specific imagery and symbolic representation. A recent trend in the attempts to express identity in South African architecture, particularly in community work, is the use of exuberant colour to uplift and inspire buildings and their contexts. It has been suggested that bold hues in new South African work mark the first steps to a new indigenous style. Brightly coloured architecture is truly African, according to CS Studio in Cape Town “colour is as much a part of the African culture as the beating of drums.” (Marschall & Kearney, 2000:132)

Illustration 17, Traditional Ndebele homestead illustrating the use of vibrant colour and motif
However one must note that the response to colour is not always depicted in architecture of the traditional African context. Buildings are not always colourfully painted and imbued with decoration, and when they are the colours used have symbolic meaning relating to that specific culture, which may not be fully understood by the average person today. It is important to rethink and critically examine the power of architecture, not only with respect to the articulation of building facades though colour and motif, but starting with typology and basic patterns of space making (Marschall & Kearney, 2000). Due to their contingent nature discussions of identity cannot be separated from discussions of time and space as buildings often outlive the culture and society by which they are produced. Because all identities are contingent, differentiated and relational they therefore do not last a lifetime. According to Vale,

"Only if the building is able to change along with the rapidly changing society around it can it avoid being the projection of some frozen moment in political and cultural history, associated with a single stage in an institutions growth and a single regimes iconographical preferences" (Vale, 1992: 279).

Architects and planners often attempt to inject local identity into their work. They may reproduce the forms, colours, textures and scales of what they see as 'local character', and may produce something, which has every appearance of being successful, but is little more than architectural jargon. (Schaug, 1998) Environmental designers have to do more than merely reproduce or reinterpret existing visual elements. If they wish to create local and national identity, the meanings of those elements, individually and in combination need to be understood.

Given the sensitivity of the issue of racial or ethnic differentiation in the light of South Africa’s recent past, architects should take up the challenge to respond to cultural pluralism. Pluralism, as defined by the Concise Oxford Dictionary is a system that recognizes more than one ultimate principle, identifies no single or dominant culture, belief structure or lifestyle. Apartheid glorified the
concept of regionalism, which it equated to ethnic identity. On the one hand plurality should be celebrated and encouraged, while at the same time national and regional identity should be built on a common culture relative to a specific context and in so doing encourage multi-culturalism.

In addressing the question, how does one define a common identity or national identity in a pluralistic society? One requires knowledge of the theory of Pluralism, which is inseparable from a democratic environment, and is, therefore, of particular significance in a South African context. Pluralism as described by Norberg-Schulz is “a togetherness of interacting cultures” (Melvin 1988:101). As with democracy, pluralism is a social construct that celebrates diversity through its basis of interaction, understanding and the harmonious existence of people with varied identities.

“E pluribus unum, ‘out of many one’. Is no longer quite adequate, since this unity has all-too-often meant the values and tastes of the dominant culture” (Jencks, 1993:104).

The new South Africa has facilitated renewed interaction and understanding through the celebration of peoples’ differences. According to Jencks a positive identity is moulded through a mutual dialogue where every individual recognizes every other’s distinctive voice (Jencks, 1993). The understanding of difference, similarity and conversation contributes to peoples knowledge and respect for each other.

Jencks’s concept of hetero-architecture is one that challenges modern dominance as it entails the acceptance of

“the different voices that create a city, suppresses none of them, and makes from their interaction some kind of great dialogue” (Jencks, 1993: 75).

3.6 Conclusion

Though apartheid based its planning structure on a set of racist laws, it also became a vision of reality in South Africa, a reality that still permeates the society today. A vision that emphasizes the notion of ‘us’ and ‘them’ and
allows some elements of separation to still persist. Even after eleven years of
democracy South Africa still bears the scars of a recent past of separation,
discrimination and isolation.

Illustration 18 & 19. Examples of the degree of separation both spatially and economically,
which still exist in South African cities today. The former white area of Glenwood, Manning
Road (left) and the black township of Cato Manor (right) situated just two kilometers away.

Architects and planners alike need to make a concerted effort to understand
and connect with the society that they serve and strive to eradicate every sign
of oppression and segregation that lies in the path of development and transition. The power of architecture to shape society and the built
environment must be used to contribute positively to the lives of all people.

This understanding begins to answer the question of how architecture can be
considered to be a reflection of community and individual identity and to what
extent. It is the researchers opinion that the built environment can be used to
heal and transform not only physical environments but the people who inhabit
those environments. The built environment for many years was used to
separate and divide but in a transforming society the power of architecture
can be used to uplift and empower communities. This applies greatly to the
case study as the area is one which the residents feel has long been
forgotten. I believe however that architecture can be used as a tool to renew
hope and possibility within the community. The design will contribute to
reconciliation and the identity of both the individual and community will have
the freedom to be expressed.
In a changing society architecture can play an active role in promoting new paradigms and value systems, such as equality, redress, promote multiculturalism, anti-elitism, accessibility, and general humanitarian values. Architecture must however serve society’s needs and society must intern be ready for that change. (Marschall & Kearney, 2000)
Chapter 4

VERNACULAR/CONTEMPORARY DIVIDE

4.1 Introduction

It is through architecture that important cultural and social elements are given clearest expression. As noted before, due to our location on the African continent, no interpretation or reflection of identity in architecture can be void of Africanist philosophies, trends and influence. However the nineteenth century saw an abundance of new architectural idioms and a quick succession of eclectic stylistic fashions. Following European models, many of these styles were reliant on materials imported from overseas and their adaptation to local conditions remained marginal. Much of this can be attributed to the forceful suppression of vernacular art and architecture. In South Africa, the apartheid state, in their realization of the importance and influence of arts and culture, sought to confine the development of non-western art. This was achieved by serious control over the growth and distribution of art material through the oppression of vernacular expression considered ‘black art’ (Mongwe, 1996). The state to a large degree succeeded in entrenching a euro-centric art while at the same time making non-white people to believe that they had no art of their own. The system successfully negated the value of vernacular expression in the creation of identity.

4.2 Influence of vernacular architecture on identity

The perception of African architecture is that it has not been previously viewed as a ‘grand’ architecture and as a result a Western identity prevails. However calls for a more Afro-centric design approach have strongly increased since the early 1990’s. While the new democratic order of the country presents ground for free experimentation, it is important that one recognizes the potential of African vernacular to inform future architecture, without romanticizing or mimicking traditional African culture.
Durban's Ushaka Marine and Entertainment World is one such example which romanticizes Zulu culture, tradition and form making. In the creation of a themed architecture, the development, now a premier tourist destination perpetuates the stereotypes of 'African' architecture.

Developments such as this, due to their scale, popularity and resultant profitability for the developers make it increasingly harder to change the false perceptions of African culture as expressed through built form. As a result the identity created is one devoid of authentic meaning and symbolism.

If art and architectural traditions of the vernacular are to influence contemporary architectural expression then the value of such influences needs to be clearly defined. It is not enough to merely depict traditional design and motif through the use of modern materials and technology. Identity in South African lies between two polarizations, western and African. This involves a transformation and improvement of the vernacular through the adaptation of new 'western' materials and technology, while still retaining and preserving the inherent qualities and identity of the vernacular. According to Vale, the trick to forging a new identity is to:
"Observe the residues of past civilizations, absorb them, and try to bring forth a new generation of forms that recall the past without mimicking or trivializing it." (Vale, 1992: 282)

Traditional African architecture represents a kind of text or language system whose meaning can be understood through its orientation, form, materials, construction process, and details. African architecture similarly has a basis in history, numerology, philosophy, performance principles, therapeutic concepts, and cosmology. It is a true form of human expression that is directed towards the beliefs, material culture and traditions of that society. In the early 1980’s prompted by a surge of Post-modernist influence, with its criticism of an increasing experience of alienation and the perceived loss of meaning in architecture, its interest in genius loci and a sense of place, an interest in regional architecture re-emerged. Architecture related to place, and architecture of place.

Post-modernism’s interest in heritage and questions of identity and culture encourage a fresh look at the local vernacular, including rural African building typologies. The recognition of the significance of cultural aspects and their influence on architectural design is reflected in Amos Rapoport’s call for ‘wideranging comparative cross-cultural research’ which emphasizes the need for:

"understanding the cultures of different groups-their structures of values and symbols, their patterns of behavior in different settings, their propensity to establish domains and clusters-and the influence of these on the physical nature of their environment" (Rapoport, 1983: 34)

Architecture’s significance is grounded in the experiences and intellectual explanations of its makers and users. It is a reflection of the mode of life of the
people, however the question lies in whether or not this identity can be maintained despite the many external influences. Architecture like history is anthropocentric. Architecture is concerned with the various categories of human thought and expression but also with all aspects of human life. In this respect architecture takes human activity to another plane. When architecture borrows its imagery from human experience, it encourages those who move within it to reaffirm essential features of human identity and activity.

Contrary to this belief, Rem Koolhaas (1996) in his address to architects at a Singapore conference expressed the opinion that the loss of cultural identity can free the architectural imagination and provide designers with a 'blank page' to work with thereby liberating the design process.

"Perhaps we have to shed our identities. Perhaps identity is constricting us. What is left after identity is lost?" asked Koolhass. "The generic" (Pearson, 1996:19).

However this is an almost impossible modernist notion, as architects cannot ignore any aspect of the society, which they serve because they are inherently part of it. It is the author's opinion that architectural imagination is fed by people and the places they inhabit and if one ignores the essence of cultural identity then the architecture created cannot relate to its context.

Instead of exhorting his listeners to resist the forces of homogenisation, or preserve historic structures, or devise ingenious ways of infusing local character into modern buildings, Koolhaas argued that such a battle was hopeless. The driving forces behind the globalisation of cities were just too big for architects to resist in any meaningful way. (Pearson,1996:19). Globalisation and time-space compression has increasingly resulted in space being torn away from place. This has resulted in an increasingly hybrid nature of all localities and a simultaneous erosion of the once unproblematic link between identity and place (Yaeger, 1996). Despite this notion, I believe that architectural imagination can in-fact be better stirred by responding to existing conditions and historic fabric than by wiping the slate clean. As Abel explains, it should not be:
"some mere substitution of local culture-forms for imported forms, but a new and original product, which is not exactly like any of the previously existing elements, but presents to us an...innovation." (Abel, 2000:160)

Like many Third World countries South Africa has inherited from our past and further adopted a wholesale modernist approach in-order to try and solve the increasing architectural needs caused by growing population pressure as a result the architecture reflected is one, which straddles the regionalism-internationalism divide and is most unsuitable. The pursuit of national identity involves not purely some neutral revival of the past. It is in reality the consequence of a new form of social organization. For many developing countries, identity in the eyes of the international and particularly Western audience is of far greater importance than national identity, resulting in gradual globalization and the proliferation of diluted versions of the so-called international style. Therefore buildings are designed to be in keeping with the pre-existing image of the country. Buildings thus confirm and perpetuate prevailing stereotypes while cultural richness is negated by international modernism. (Vale, 1992)

Architects like Hassan Fathy in Egypt (illustration 26 & 27), Charles Correa in India (illustration 24 & 25) and Francesco Manosa in the Philippines have explored the local vernacular and established building tradition, as well as the cultural customs and values of local people, to develop an architectural expression appropriate to local conditions, always with an emphasis on continuity and evolution instead of radical modernization. In many African countries, the attainment of political independence encouraged an anti Euro-centric, regionalist architecture as part of the establishment of a new post-colonial cultural or national identity. (Marschall & Kearney, 2000)
Illustration 24 & 25, Kanchaunung Apartments (Charles Correa, 1970-1983, Bombay, India) responds to the local conditions and maintains a sense of simplicity despite the playful form.

Illustration 26 & 27, Gourna Mosque (Hassan Fathy, 1949, Egypt). The design is indicative of the local vernacular architecture and responds well to the desert climate while using a play of light to bring the architecture to life.

The move towards a more international ideal of identity has resulted in globalization, which has brought a great deal of uniformity in architecture. However the diversity and uniqueness of people from different cultures or ethnic groups is evident in the way they work and live in buildings in different ways. Nothing is without value and all architecture is a product of social and cultural conditions. Therefore even if buildings start out the same, the generic quickly becomes specific. Winston Churchill said, "We shape our buildings, thereafter they shape us." (www.churchill.com)
In order to create a relevant identity, essential design principles of African vernacular architecture need to be extracted, analysed and understood through the development of effective theoretical models and appropriate methodologies that avoid cultural bias and a narrow focus on imagery. (Marschall & Kearney, 2000)

According to Catherine Slessor (1995),

"South Africa has the potential to become a model for Africa, not only in terms of political, economic and social development, but also with respect to architecture, addressing such issues as conservation of heritage, transformation and evolution of indigenous vernacular, developing technologies appropriate to local condition, and creating architectural models for more Afro-centric paradigms. The significance of finding a new genuinely South African architectural language that grows out of the existing conditions and is truly relevant can hardly be overemphasized in the present context of the country's transformation. Architecture presents unique opportunities for relevance. It can serve as a catalyst, express the dynamic of a new society, establish a national and cultural identity and thus contribute to the process of transformation and nation building." (Marschall & Kearney, 2000: 13)

4.3 Context, culture and identity

Many will agree that architecture is intrinsically linked to contextualism. The concept of parallelism, which argues that things happen at different times, in different places, in the same way further, enforces this notion. The main forces that bring about regional and local identity are often thought to be climate, topography and local building materials. However different regions with the same climate, typography and building materials frequently produce identities that are very unsimilar. Other forces are clearly of greater importance, and those that seem to be the most influential are social, cultural and religious. (Rapoport, 1969)
According to Daniel O’Hare (2003),

“the cultural landscape is a constantly evolving, humanized landscape. It consists of a dialect between the natural physical setting, the human modifications to that setting, and the meanings of the resulting landscape constantly evolving over time...The concept of cultural landscape therefore embodies a dynamic understanding of history, in which past, present and future are seamlessly connected.”

(www.bee.qut.edu.au)

Post-modern theory and existential theory has always strongly affirmed the significance of context in achieving a meaningful architectural expression. No building actually constructed “can avoid being a product of its place and its producers” (Vale, 1992:55). In-order for architecture to be meaningful and reflective of the identity of its context it should be appropriate to and determined by the local climate, landscape, vegetation as well as the man made elements of its surroundings. Context is a dynamic, active and living entity. It is composed of various layers, people, place and meaning and forms a lattice to the city.

Context- being the space- includes the element of time, however in the past natural responses to context were often stifled by apartheid planning principles as a result much of the built environment of South Africa does not relate to its context, instead the architecture that has emerged is pieced together from imitated architectural forms predominating in the surroundings. Kevin Lynch explains that:

"just as each locality should seem continuous with the recent past, so should it seem continuous with the near future. Every place should be made to be seen as developing, charged with predictions and intentions...Space and time, however conceived, is the great framework within which we order our experience. We live in time places.” (Trancik, 1986:115)
Context can more easily determine the aesthetic of a building when the project is relatively small and surrounded by an inspiring environment. However architects addressing the new priorities in a changing South Africa are frequently confronted with the task of providing facilities in depressingly under-serviced rural areas, monotone African townships and dismal informal settlements. Apart from the problems posed by a lack of infrastructure and resources, the context of such visually impoverished environments rarely supplies the architect with reference points worth relating to. The emphasis thus shifts from inspiration by context to provision of upliftment, that is, the need for building to brighten and enliven its drab depressing surrounding. (Marschall & Kearney, 2000)

Lilani Hot Springs Health Hydro (CNN Architects, 2002), near Greytown in central KwaZulu-Natal is an inspiring example of architecture which responds to its environment as well as the rural community in which it is located. Built around a series of natural hot springs rich in sulphur and radium and known by locals to have healing powers, the series of buildings were phased to accommodate incremental growth based on the success of the hydro. The phasing of the project also facilitated the training of local residents who made up the majority of the workforce during construction.
The identity of the development lies in its unique response to its context. The buildings utilize natural materials which found on site such as stone. The design itself was largely responsive to the typography of the site. (illus 14) It is a sensitive design that treads softly on the ground and blends seamlessly into the surrounding vegetation. The project is also very sustainable as it was designed to adapt and change as necessary and has positively influenced the future of surrounding communities through the provision of employment and infrastructure to the area. The architecture engages the cultural energies of the region in creating a synthesis of past and present, of cultural pride and identity.

Whilst local and national identity relies on being rooted in regional spirit, culture and history, participation in international discourse requires involvement in global exploration; and as philosopher Hans Gadamer points out, there must be continuous dialogue between both tradition and innovation. Quite often when dealing with visually impoverished environments, the emphasis shifts from inspiration by context to the provision of upliftment of the context.

Frampton’s strategy of critical regionalism places emphasis on the contextual aspects of a particular place that makes reference to international tendencies. It encourages an architecture of resistance to uniformity that is grounded in its place whilst responding to regional aspects by being expressive and offering the user a tactile range of experiences. He describes critical regionalism as an

“inscription which arises out of in-laying the building into the site, and has many levels of significance, for it has a capacity to embody, in built form, the prehistory of the place, its archaeological past and its subsequent cultivation and transformation across time. Through this layering into the site the idiosyncrasies of place find their expression”

(Frampton, 2002: 87)

The challenge is to create an architecture that responds to both local and global stimuli but still retains a unique South African identity. In-order to achieve this one must ensure to fully explore the specific qualities of a given
should aim to induce in its users a general feeling of well-being.

"Architecture that creates a positive emotional response in its users, promotes both physical and psychological health, and is in harmony with its physical and psychological health." (Marschall & Kearney, 2000:140)

Place refers to more than just physical locality. Relph (1990: 3) states that place involves an “integration of elements of nature and culture” in which each place has its own order and special ensemble which disguises it from the next place. Globalization has increasingly challenged the meaning of place and the centrality of place in identity formation. The apartheid barriers created through the Group Areas Act has further contributed or perhaps inhibited the creation of collective space. As a result, places must be seen as having permeable boundaries across which things are always moving (Rose, 1995).

A move towards preserving places of meaning and value to society in-order to achieve a sense of continuity should begin with a respect of the past through the conservation and recycling of historic buildings as well as the application of historical architectural language to new buildings. However new forms of architecture must also contribute and aid in the process of transformation. The power of place is a vital component in the creation of identity as architecture plays an important role in the way that society operates. Architectural expression in the new South Africa should work towards the creation of places of healing, freedom and integration as opposed to the oppression and segregation of places characterizes by apartheid planning.

Only extensive participation and involvement of the local community can lead to an authentic expression of local identity and culturally relevant architecture. Schaug (1998: 50) explores the notion that

"It is unwise to underestimate the ability of the ‘ordinary’ people to grapple successfully with such complex issues as local identity. Very often it is precisely the lack of formal education in architecture and planning which leads to astonishingly apt solutions to problems."
It is often seen here in South Africa, where ‘ordinary’ people, frequently called squatters, can contrive wonderfully ingenious examples of local identity from the most unlikely recycled materials.

### 4.4 Aesthetics and Spatial Ordering

It has been agreed by architects and critics alike on the issue of aesthetics in contemporary architecture, that there exists more consensus on how architecture in South Africa should not look like than how it should. Admittedly, no architect can free her/himself completely from preconceived images. Identity cannot be positively reflected through the creation of an architectural expression devoid of authenticity and meaning. Meaning can be created through aesthetic, which should flow naturally out of the use of material and technology, the structural expression, the functional aspects of the building, its response to the requirements of the specific site, topography, and the climate. This meaning and symbolism is integral to the progression of society and the revitalization of the built environment.

Modernist epistemologies involved essentialist concepts of space; Post-structuralism however challenges this old approach to theorising about space. Whereas modernist approaches provided singular and universal explanations, Post-structuralism adopts a non-essentialist approach in that it stresses the multiplicity and indeterminacy of the interpretative process. Post-structuralists argue in favour of a mutually constitutive relationship between society/identity and space (Natter & Jones, 1995). A Post-structuralist approach to space must be commensurate with a similar conception and understanding of identity. The challenge for professionals is to disprove the Apartheid misconception that space and identity can be divided into discrete entities but instead attempt to link space and identity in a way in which both are seen as fluid, changing and mutually constitutive.
The South African realm is becoming increasingly entrenched in works of meaning. According to Shutte (1993)

"In Western tradition, the house serves as an expression of self, a symbol of individual identity, with a high emphasis on privacy and uniqueness, while perhaps the most important and universal concept in all traditional African societies is expressed by the untranslatable word 'ubuntu', which communicates the thought that an individual is defined not by natural properties or material achievements, but by his/her relationship to other people." (Marschall & Kearney, 2000:170)

This meaning and symbolism is integral to the progression of society and the revitalization of the built environment. Much of the built evidence in South Africa represents imported stylistic fashions, imitation of international models, banal postmodern pastiches and general design with preconceived ideas. A cursory glance at contemporary architecture in South Africa confirms that the obsession with the striking image bemoaned by critics still defines much of what is being built today. (Marschall & Kearney, 2000) Hence, the architecture of this democratic society should aim for the freedom and individuality of all people, within the harmonious co-existence of a rich pluralistic society.

4.5 Conclusion

Extracting the principles from the African vernacular and applying them in a re-interpreted form in contemporary South African architecture can establish a sense of continuity, a synthesis between past and present, African and Western whilst contributing to the expression of a unique national identity that incorporates and synthesizes the country's diverse African and European heritages.

"We should not leave this place to fall victim to the perils that might overwhelm it. We should claim it; claim it for peace, for harmony, for order, for cleanliness and for all the other desirable features that could go with the maturing of the new South Africa" (Becket, 1994).
The information revealed in this chapter has highlighted the importance of the recognition of African design principles in the creation of a South African architectural identity. This had greatly influenced the design process as it has also revealed that community architecture need not reflect African vernacular architecture in a literal sense. Rather than being a passive themed reflection of African vernacular the design proposal for the Wentworth is intended to become a prompt for renewal and redevelopment in the area without compromising the respect that the past deserves.

Architecture in the post apartheid society must reject negative values of the past while euro-centricism must give way to African influences. Though apartheid attempted to suppress and distort identity South Africa remains a nation committed to recognizing the varied identities of its citizens. Architecture in turn should manifest itself in the expression of the individual and society, and be inspired by and celebrate the local context and all its diversity and in turn reflect on the aspirations and values of post-apartheid society in South Africa.
CHAPTER 5

Neighbourhood planning and community dialogue

5.1 Introduction

Far-reaching changes since 1994 have been felt most intensely in the urban areas of South Africa, but particularly in the large metropolitan areas of Johannesburg, Cape Town and Durban. Many cities have become a field of violent contestation between various extremes such as wealth and poverty, luxury and subsistence, excess and need as a result communities on the fringe of these major cities are often ignored. The barrier to smart growth and development lies in the prevailing lack of understanding of how to balance the needs of suburban and urban communities.

5.2 Political liberalization and space

Many who were formally confined by apartheid to townships and rural areas have, converged on the streets of South African cities to claim their promises of a better life. The face of South African cities is changing as urban governance in the period since 1994 has undergone major internal restructuring. Boundaries have been redrawn, administrations redeployed, and powers and functions redistributed while public space is being occupied in new ways.

Previously uncluttered, sanitized urban parks and open spaces are now dotted with braziers and campfires, and used for storing goods overnight or conducting commercial transactions; pavements have become crowded with hawkers, tailors and hairdressers; streets are congested with taxis. (Aedes, 2005)

Although there does appear to be a move towards new development the few proposals that have been put forward for confronting the spatial separations of apartheid have met with serious resistance and been abandoned.
The Johannesburg Redevelopment Project is one example of successful inner city redevelopment. Within the larger framework of the Johannesburg Redevelopment Project emerged proposals such as the Metro Mail Transport Facility (see illustration 36) and Traders Market (Urban Solutions Architects and Urban Designers, Johannesburg). The Metro Mall as it is commonly known occupies one of the busiest streets in the inner city, Bree Street. This new building type takes cognizance of the needs of the taxi industry and the informal street traders who operate across the inner city. Metro Mall represents a significant shift in the approach to dealing with public buildings, providing for a sector of our society previously marginalized and has addressed the challenge of making public building a place of civic pride. (Deckler et al, 2006)

The project was identified as an important catalyst to the redevelopment of other areas of the city. The design is grounded around the urban principles that informed the original development framework: “making connections with the surrounding city fabric; completing the street grid to enable continuity of movement, supporting public mobility via various transport modes, promoting mixed use urban opportunities; reinforcing street boundaries by the construction of perimeter buildings with active street edges; acknowledging the street as a public space; and allowing equal opportunity of access and freedom of movement.” (Deckler et al, 2006:28)

**Urban Design Framework Plan**

1. Building C: Traders market/taxi & bus rank
2. Building B: Traders market & taxi rank
3. Bree Street
4. Proposed residential
5. Proposed commercial

[Image of Urban Design Framework Plan]

Illustration 35, Urban Design Framework Plan

The urban design framework makes provision for a mixed used building which will regenerate the city. The proposal includes commercial and residential facilities as well as a traders market and taxi and bus rank.
To date the only discourse that has tried to provide logic for reconceptualizing urban development in apartheid's wake has been that of 'participative governance.' It is however questionable as to what extent this has been implemented and achieved. In many circumstances state planners are not always aware of what is being done at the local level, and sometimes state laws inadvertently diminish the ability of local officials to act. Of even greater concern is that particular regions citizens may not understand what is happening around them and may again have things forced on them by governing bodies.

The process of participative governance is intended to underpin a number of discursive and institutional practices, such as community policing, land development objectives and public-private partnerships. These involve statutory joint decision making, monitoring and implementation processes between the state, local authorities and citizens on every aspect of urban life, from safety and security to service provision, road-making, and health and leisure. While these processes remain new and need time to develop, one wonders to what extent they will exacerbate apartheid's divisions. According to Aedes, the system is based:
"on the neo-liberal model of 'community' as a grouping of empowered individuals who voice their opinions, offer their expertise and take responsibility for their actions, the citizens participating are those who already have the skills to do so. The poor, the marginalized, the uneducated, the 'illegal' are further excluded and resources channeled towards those with the voices to claim them." (Aedes, 2005: 3)

South African architecture is predominantly eclectic in the cities built by whites, and vernacular in the former homelands where the black majority resides. Many large-scale monumental state projects testify to the Afrikaner the white, nationalistic class. (illustration 37 & 38) The attempts by the apartheid government to establish a national idiom only succeeded in manifesting the rapidly progressing segregation measures. The concern therefore lies in how the new democratic order will succeed in representing the identity of a nation and steer clear from merely expressing the supremacy of a single segment of the population.

5.3 New conceptions of space

Despite the demise of apartheid it is clear when surveying South African cities today that neither spatial separation nor demarcation via formal design resources has entirely disappeared. Only their forms of expression have
noticeably altered. In the meantime there are now thousands of gated communities around the country. With restricted access and high surveillance they are reserved exclusively for a small privileged contingent, offering people the promise of a safer, secure and no- threatening environment when in reality all that they do is shut out reality. Even the names given to these developments are intended to summon images other than those present in South Africa but are particularly inclined to euro-centric themes and identities. (Aedes, 2005)

Suburban growth and revitalization is of vital importance to the overall development of South Africa and its citizens. Many have been made to feel like second-class citizens due to the lack of concern for disadvantaged communities. Suburban growth can create and maintain a sense of place, enhanced by architecture and design in which density is a natural and acceptable outcome. In a transforming society solutions are required that will facilitate flexible development and allow communities to evolve on their own. A diverse housing mix, the provision of infrastructure and community resources as well as the preservation of recreational and environmental resources will contribute to economically viable and sustainable community development.

Despite the overwhelming move towards euro-centric architectural models there also exists a strong tendency aimed toward 'authenticity', which should be encouraged and supported. Increasingly, local African handicraft traditions are being integrated into the design of private residences, restaurants and shops. More decisive still is the confrontation with the ways in which planning and construction processes can contribute to the reconstruction of the society and its urban realm as a democratic order. For arguably, in no other country does architecture and urban planning bear such vivid witness to history, to politics, and to social division. And these deeply embedded traces of apartheid remain ubiquitous in South Africa today. (Aedes, 2005)

"The collective spatial experience was that of segregation, the collective psyche was marked by fear and violence. For generations, through Colonialism, and especially since the horrifically systematic
architectural manifestations of the apartheid system, the greater part of the population was scarred by experiences of dispossession, of expulsion, of impermanence and provisionality; by the impossibility of planning for the future, the impossibility of freely choosing one's place of residence.” (Aedes, 2005)

Such experiences of space may be replaced by new ones based on equal rights and freedom. This common use of space if used to its full potential may represent a decisive step towards a new social order and in so doing help to eradicate the physical traces of apartheid.

One such example is the Red Location Museum (illustration 39), designed by Noero Wolf Architects. Situated in the township of Red Location near Port Elizabeth in the Eastern Cape, the museum is designed deliberately to confront conventional views of museum design. The museum portrays South Africa’s tumultuous history and the fight for freedom by various groups. Designed around the concept of a memory box, each representing a different group, the boxes are “decorated in different ways to represent the diverse cultural, religious and other readings of life in South Africa.” (Deckler et al, 2006:43)
This building is particularly significant due to its location within a township and the inclusive nature with which the built form relates to its context. Materials are used in their raw state and reflect those used in the surrounding areas. Standard elements such as windows are used in unconventional ways and creates a tactile playful expression of form.

Illustration 40 & 41, The Apartheid Museum (Gapp Architects and Urban Designers)

Much like the Apartheid Museum (Gapp Architects and Urban Designers, Johannesburg) (illustration 40 & 41) the design avoids any literal reference to 'african' architecture. Rather it prefers to “rely on suggestive and conceptual manipulation of form, colour and texture to achieve its presence and identity.” (Deckler. T et al, 2006:43) Materials such as rusted corrugated sheeting are not used to romanticise the township architecture, but rather is recognition of the suffering and a celebration of the ingenuity of the people. The architecture responds to the nature of africa and relies on the drama of light and space for its architectural expression and identity. (Illustration 39) The museum bears vivid witness to history but also stands as a positive symbol to the reconstruction of society.

5.3 Community Space

Communities and the people who constitute them make up the heart of any society. Often communities that have a shared vision are among the most desirable and economically sound in a nation. Shaping vision requires the power of imagination, leadership, and choices which for many South Africans is a completely new concept. However it is noted that these visions are required to be realistic and must recognize social, political, economic and
environmental constraints while the implementation of these visions require consistent and disciplined public policy and participation over extended periods of time.

Building appealing communities means ensuring a convenient mix of the things that meet people's daily lives. A concentration of mixed uses provides a critical mass that gives communities a strong identity and sense of place. However without adequate public policy urban sprawl will continue to threaten the South African landscape. The dynamic forces of place, time and culture can work to create site specific design solutions which avoid the placelessness typical of apartheid planning and in so doing also promote vernacular architecture. In all of these endeavors the people themselves are the deciding factor in the success of any vision. Conflicting community perceptions may cause barriers to effective development and it is therefore important to encourage community participation and transparency.

5.5 Conclusion

The above discussion has highlighted the need for community participation in development and the creation of architectural identity. It is vital in all communities that architectural projects are shaped principally by the researchers and the involvement of users and not solely by the design objectives of their architects. Communities must be integrated into the design process, both through extensive research into spatial typologies and the ways of life in the township, and through construction projects that provided new local employment opportunities (Aedes, 2005).

As a result of the far-reaching changes to the country at large new and much needed conceptions of public space and a new urban culture have been established. By superimposing these new conceptions on the apartheid and colonial past what has emerged is the opportunity for even greater change. Change that encourages transparency, communication and freedom of expression, while challenging existing perceptions and in so doing
contributing to the formation of an identity that reflects the aspirations and embodies the values of the new South Africa.
CHAPTER 6

Precedent Studies

6.1 Introduction

It is necessary in the context of this study to understand how identity has been reflected in architectural expression through the critical analysis of precedent. The following studies are intended to support and explain elements explored in the discussion of architecture and identity. It is the intention that by identifying and drawing on the positive qualities of each design, it will positively inform the design process. This critical analysis also involves the study of any negative aspects of the designs, how these manifest in building form and how they affect the overall performance of the building. The precedent studies selected include local and international work ranging from small public buildings to larger government buildings as well as art institutions. Though this thesis is specific to the study of architecture and identity in South Africa it is useful to recognize that this issue has been explored by many societies across the globe and can inform such development in South Africa.

The critical examination of precedent has been used to inform the empirical case study in order to determine the importance of identity in architecture and how it has been created. The response of the architecture to its context and the transformation of space and place through architectural intervention have been carefully considered.
Sited in the northeast sector of Durban harbour next to the tug basin the BAT Centre is a creative arts centre built in 1996 at a cost of 2.3 million rands around the SAS Inkonkoni, a solid land bound naval training establishment. The building holds its place amongst the ships, cranes, trains and trucks on the edge of the harbour as well as the backdrop of the Esplanade which forms a barrier to the city.
A large part of the building's identity is its relationship to the context. (Illustration 42) Rather than negate the apparent difficulties of such a site, the design team of Architects Collaborative and RAP Studios chose to accept and even celebrate its difficult access from the Victoria embankment. It was the intention that the centre would kick start development in the area and serve both Esplanade residents and harbour workers. (Claude, 1996)

The façade treatment depicts the playful nature of identity associated with the city of Durban. The principle façade of the building brightly decorated with murals and portrait busts stepping up the façade, is directed towards the harbour while the elevation facing the city is reserved for servicing. (Illustration 45 & 46) The building is designed to be very accessible both in terms of its physical access as well as the form and ambience. It is divided into two levels with a row of openings at ground level that give entry to shops, a resource centre and a photographic unit. The upper south and north levels consist of administration offices and a restaurant which opens onto a terrace overlooking the bay. The enclosed volume of the old Inkonkoni Hall has been converted into a performance venue provided with adaptable bleacher seating.

Illustration 45, Mural wall

Illustration 46 right, Portrait busts at entrance

A small courtyard at the centre of the building leads to a series of interlinked and overlapping ceramics, sculpture, graphics and movement studios. (Illustration 47 & 48) All barriers within these studio spaces are eradicated thereby allowing free interaction between artists and consumers. (Illustration 49) This element of transparency and freedom is indicative of the ideals and aspirations of the
new South Africa. The succession of loose yet controlled layers of masonry space draws the eye upward. (Illustration 50 & 51)

The form is contained and contrasted by the elegant swoop of corrugated iron roofs on the bowstring trusses of the old hall. The defining element that contributes greatly to the identity of the building is the use of contrasts in space,
surface, form, light and function. The spatial enclosure of the courtyard (illus 27) is in contrast to the openness of the bay. (Illustration 43) The architecture heightens the senses as one is always aware of the changing environments from a precarious shutter board gangway leading to an airborne grid of open industrial steel grating to climbing a tight staircase which opens out to the harbour. The inner court walls with teak framed glazing juxtaposed with industrial steel windows of different scale and design. (Illustration 55) The rough yet simple detailing of the centre contrasts with the slickly designed conference centre to the rear of the building. (Claude, 1996)

This building is of particular reference to the context of Durban as it responds to the hot humid climate through the use of open spaces, high volumes and overhangs for sun control. Like the squatter settlements surrounding the city, recycled materials are used extensively throughout the building from reject table tops on the floors to laminated beams, creosoted gum-poles, corrugated iron, old telegraph poles, teak doors and steel window frames.

According to Dennis Claude (1996) the BAT Centre is a "model showing that good buildings need not be excessive or expensive but can use the simplest, cheapest and recycled materials and be built by unskilled labourers without affecting the quality of the experience."

(Claude 1996: 2)
The building is not without its problems. Due to its proximity to the sea the materials are susceptible to the marine environment. Some spaces function more adequately than others and noise from the passing trains results in acoustic problems. However it is these very elements that add to the character and charm of the building and are an integral part of its identity. Nothing is fixed or solid about the building and it therefore exudes an active and dynamic quality. Things are meant to change and adapt as necessary and the design allows for this to happen. It is an architectural intervention that has become very much a part of the culture and identity of Durban. A place that is all-inclusive and responds to a diverse nature of society.

The Bat Centre is particularly relevant to this study as it is an example of a building that responds to the needs of its users and outwardly expresses the functions that occur within the building. The design responds to the Durban climate by allowing for open courtyards and large internal volumes with natural ventilation and lighting. These elements reduce the running costs of the centre, a major concern in an institution of this nature, which relies on external funding and donations to survive. The BAT Centre responded to an existing community of artists and provides them with an environment where their art is celebrated and exposed. The building is an example of the skill of local craftsmen, labourers and artists. It is an artwork in itself and expresses the colourful and vibrant identity of the city of Durban.

The BAT Centre is a unique creative and cultural resource that has continued to grow and respond to its users but more importantly it has demonstrated the possibilities of a multi-cultural society.
The Constitutional Court of South Africa is one of the country's most important public buildings intended as a symbol of the democracy and freedom of South Africa's new constitution.

With the passing into law of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa in 1996 came the need for a building that would house the Constitutional Courts. The intention of the open design competition launched by the Department of Public Works in 1997 was to search for an "appropriate architectural expression to reflect this new democratic institution" (Peters, 2004: 2)

The submission by OMM Design Workshop was said by the competition assessors' to have an image that was most appropriate to the aspirations of the competition brief. The 12.5ha site lies on the northern slope of Braamfontein Ridge in Johannesburg. It was selected due to its physical proximity to the city, and its potential to help revitalize its immediate neighbourhood. The context in which the court is situated is important in achieving meaningful architecture. Most importantly though was the power of the site as a symbol.
The Constitutional Court forms the focal point of a design surrounded by buildings of historic importance. The Old Fort was initially built in 1882 as a prison to control the British Uitlanders but was remodeled as a fort in 1899 and later reverted to its prison function to incarcerate Boer Rebels, white mineworkers and various political prisoners including Mahatma Ghandi and Nelson Mandela (Peters 2004: 2, Sachs 1998: 29). The site had the potential to become a place of national memory and a place of daily public use (illus 35). This is of particular importance as this example perfectly contests Koolhaas’s (Pearson, 1996) notion of designing from a blank page by losing all connection to cultural identity. South Africa’s past is integrally connected to the development of its future and it therefore cannot be ignored. The design of the Constitutional Court on the very site that harboured freedom fighters has converted a very painful public memory into a place of significant democratic power and meaning and thereby changing the negative identity associated with it. According to Judge Albie Sachs,

"A new generation Court rising there would physically dramatize the transformation of South Africa from a racist, authoritarian society to a constitutional democracy." (Sachs, 1998: 29)
As per the brief the entire precinct was to become a public space for the city emanating the symbols of democracy for the nation. 'Constitutional Hill' as it is known would include the Human Rights Commission, the Constitutional Court,
a public square and museums. OMM Design workshop chose to seek ‘the power of a pre-eminent building without the monumentality.’ The objective of the design team was to integrate the existing and new built forms into the “evolving greater Johannesburg urban spatial, textural, experiential and cultural system” (Schaug, 1998: 46)

The resulting design is said to be a conscious response to its context. The fragmented nature of the design de-segregates the built form to the scale of the surrounding buildings. (illustration 58 & 59) Constitution Square was created by partially demolishing the Awaiting Trial Block north of the Old Fort. (illustration 57) In the attempt to weave past and future parts of the former prison building such as the stair towers have been retained and incorporated into the new complex. These towers are topped with lanterns as landmarks on the Johannesburg skyline. Context is a dynamic, active and living entity and though the design is a conscious response to its context in terms of siting and the general footprint of the development, it is the authors’ belief that the precinct lacks a “living” entity. As mentioned earlier the power of place is a vital component in the creation of identity as architecture plays an important role in the way that society operates. However this also involves integrating elements of nature and culture. The designers have tried to create a ‘South African’ identity by infusing local character into modern buildings through the use of aesthetics. If used appropriately meaning can be created through aesthetic, however the aesthetic used to express the South African identity in the court buildings is in many ways only applied and lacks the depth of meaning and symbolism.
There has been an attempt to eradicate the long standing perception that African architecture is not a 'grand' architecture through the design of the Great African Steps, which are a series of terraces tapering down the site that ascends to the main public foyer and court. Parallel to the Great African Steps (Illustration 60 61) is an art gallery housing the art collection of the court. Administrative offices are accessed off a circulation route linking the court chamber on the south and the library on the north. The judge's chambers to the east are housed in five triple storey blocks that stand within a reflecting pool and are traversed within the triple storey volume by means of narrow bridges.

The 9m high timber doors that are made up of 27 carved panels representing the 27 basic human rights of the Constitution mark entrance to the main foyer. Access to the building is deliberately clear and direct which is intended to give evidence of the struggle for open democracy. Though South Africa's new democratic order presents grounds for free experimentation it is important to recognize the potential of African vernacular to inform future architecture without romanticizing or mimicking it. The designers have attempted to create a building with an identity that is informed by vernacular and contextual indicators but the intentions are sometimes lost in the design. The main foyer space for example is an outside room of great volume. Thin rectangular slits in the concrete roof or 'tree canopy' create patterns on the floor and a rich, textured quality of light. The emblem of the court, a tree, is a recurring image throughout the building both in the artwork and the structure but this emblem is not always understood or 'read' as a tree. (Illustration 65 & 66)

Continuing with the concepts of past and future, bricks from the demolished awaiting trial block have been cleaned and used to construct the hall of the Constitutional Court. It is simply articulated with the loosely staked bricks floating above a glass strip.

"It is symbolically open or can be seemingly readily be broken apart, again in stark contrast with the surrounding solid walls of the prison."

(Du Toit & Le Roux, 2004: 67)
The public space has a high lightweight roof and public spaces outside are open and clear enhancing the feeling of being under a tree. These elements contribute to the creation of an identity of freedom and democracy, as they are simple, non-threatening and accessible to all.

Competitors in this competition were asked, "to examine an approach to the question of what might constitute an appropriate public architecture for the new South African democracy." In the words of Mr. Jeff Radebe, the minister of public works,

"distinctly South African buildings would have to acknowledge local human needs and social values; respond to local climate and environmental factors; achieve excellence with limited means; and employ technology appropriately to make best use of local labour resources" (Radebe in Japha V & Japha D, 1998: 26)

Despite the conscious response to context and the great attention paid to passive environmental control (illustration 62 & 63) and landscaping, the design still induces some reservations. The court chamber is intended as the urban
and site landmark but in the author’s opinion is not significantly treated, except for the scale, to stand out as such. One of the primary objectives of the architects was to make a public building of empowering architectural form, however I am not convinced that this has been completely achieved. The planning of the new complex has enabled its use to be understood by association creating a legible whole and successfully integrating new and old, past and present.

The design exhibits a variable play of solid and void (illustration 64) as well as volume and light, elements that are intrinsically part of african identity. This play is described by the architects as African grandeur, grandeur of space to be physically experienced and not just seen from a distance (OMM Design Workshop, 1998: 33). This results from the building of grand voids, rather than Eurocentric grand solids; not grand form, but grand space. Sadly though the building is intended as a public space and national expression of identity the major perception of such spaces is that they are reserved for high-powered individuals and decision makers due to their scale and ‘grandeur’.

A very literal interpretation of the building as a tree has been used in both the form making and in the idea of its use. The author believes that there has been an appropriate interpretation of the use and understanding of ‘space’ in Africa but finds the use of colour rather arbitrary and devoid of meaning. Colour in african tradition is embedded in tradition, culture and meaning much of which has been lost in this design.
The design team sought to elevate the status of informal and alternative building technologies and materials as well as the integration of urban and rural building practice in-order to contribute to an african identity. However these forms of expression have been applied onto the finished product in the form of traditional motif, colour and pattern, and not coherently integrated into every aspect of the design.

It is the author's opinion that in order to create architecture that speaks of the identity of a people, then the people must be involved in every aspect of its creation and expression. It is not enough to merely allude to a South African ambience through the involvement of local artists, and craftsmen as these elements become purely aesthetic, superficial and devoid of a deeper meaning.

The Constitutional Court is significant as it is the first major post-apartheid building. It commemorates the past but celebrates the future and though not without reservations its image is most appropriate to the aspirations of a South African architectural expression, and perhaps it will serve as a catalyst for unleashing fresh thoughts about architecture and contribute to a creative, vibrant and dynamic identity in this country.

The Laban Centre for Dance and Movement is a prime example of how a single building has brought about new life and vigour to an area in decline by injecting a new dynamic character and distinct identity to the surrounding context.

Situated in the Post-Industrial suburb of Deptford in southeast London, a most unlikely location for a renowned dance school, the Laban Centre for Movement and Dance was the result of an architectural competition, won in 1997 by Herzog & de Meuron.

Like society architecture is constantly undergoing transformation. The transformation of modern dance is reflected and expressed through the architecture of the various ‘spaces’, which have housed the Laban Centre. Named after Rudolf Laban (1879-1958) ‘the father of modern dance’, who developed important theories of choreography and dance notation called Labanotation, and of ergonomics in the industrial workplace, the centre made its first appearance in Surrey in 1953 then in the 1990’s Laban’s school moved to New Cross in South London. By 1995 with the growth of the student body more space was required but it was concluded that the scope for extension on the New Cross site was virtually non-existent. (Ryan, 2003)
Funded by the British Arts Lottery, a new site (illustration 68) in the same area was purchased. Creekside, a forlorn and polluted quarter of decaying industry in a notably poor and rundown corner of London was and still is in the throes of regeneration. Despite this however the attraction to the site was the ability of regeneration funding to support that from the Arts Lottery Fund.

Illustration 68, Site Plan

Care was taken by the architects to understand how the centre operates.

"Its informality, the corridors and stairs where chance encounters took place, the mix of activities, the slightly anarchic air of the place" (Powell, 2003: 40).

The architecture is grounded in the experience of both its makers and users. It is a human centred design that induces a feeling of well-being and therefore elicits positive emotional responses from its users. Practical issues that were of great importance in the design include security. There had to be a controlled entry point and a compact design resolution in the gritty inner city area.

Completed in autumn of 2002 the 8203 square metre building in form could be described as an inflected box with a curved face masking the entry hall on the western elevation. (illustration 67) It could also be read as a rather sophisticated

The new site for the Laban Centre for Movement and dance, at New Cross situated along the river within a gritty industrial area.
shed, a symbol of regeneration for its context of low-value industrial sheds. Within this ‘shed’ are three internal courts made necessary by the depth of the plan. These courts act as visual connectors and channel daylight into the building.

The buildings’ structured design relates directly to the practicality of its use yet the freedom of expression can be seen in the use of form, material and colour. The building contains two levels of accommodation plus a mezzanine. Arranged around the perimeter of the building the 13 dance studios each with its own size and shape all benefit from natural light. (illustration 69, 70, 71) The studio space and the activity within them spills out into the circulation spaces as a result of the visual connections but from the outside they remain private domains. This element enables the studios to function as ‘stages’ as there is always a connection to an ‘audience’.
The internal design of the centre demonstrates the intrinsic link between space and identity. The relation of solid and void to each other create the unique environment within the building. Within the box is a network of ‘streets’, or corridors and chambers on two full stories with an interstitial mezzanine. At the heart of the building is an enclosed 300-seat dance theatre that is used both for teaching and public events. Folded floors and transverse views instigate an internal dynamic to the entry hall, where the:

“floor splits around a dramatic spiral stair of black-lacquered concrete. On one side, the black resin ground plan descends to a public café, overlooking the creek; while on the other, it ramps up, edged by a wavy birch handrail that plays on the rigidity of a classical dancers training barre” (Powell, 2003: 42).

The attention to minute details and that play on traditional elements adds a touch of wit and informality to an institution that could be otherwise.
The extraordinary mix of delicacy and toughness is closely related and in tune with the art form of contemporary dance and therefore contributes to the identity of the building. The building is also highly practical: it has two distinct faces. Interiorly Laban is a large concrete structure that focuses on three colour-coded corridor spaces or wedges while the characteristic translucent skin (illustration 74) of multi-coloured polycarbonate sheeting on the exterior gives the building a sense of dynamism and enigma in its uninspiring surroundings. This aspect is also a security measure as two distinct but connected environments are created internally and externally. The element of colour forms a link between the two environments and is a distinct contributor to the identity of both the building itself as well as its context.

The Laban presents an agglomeration of sounds and voids within a light permeable membrane. Externally the buildings' facades are punctuated with occasional planes of flush, mullionless glass in the over-cladding of translucent polycarbonate sheeting. The materials used, though age old do not merely depict traditional methods through the use of modern materials and technology. Rather there has been an improvement and adaptation of traditional methods while still retaining the inherent qualities and identity of the materials. By day the façade glazing reflects the immediate context of offices, retail outlets and housing developments, as well as the romantic sight
of barges and tugboats. After dark the building emerges as coloured light box, revealing the luminous interiors, a beacon of renewal. (illus 54)

"The exterior skin hovers just above the ground plane, accentuating the form's visual lightness and separating sheath from structure. The building thus appears to float" (Ryan, 2003:132).

The extensive use of translucent polycarbonate sheeting is both cost effective and environmentally responsive but also relates to the aesthetic of the surrounding warehouse buildings. The sheeting forms a protective shield for the glazed inner facades and is cheap and tough. An environmental buffer is created by air circulation between the two facade layers. Meaning is created through aesthetic and flows naturally out of the use of material and technology, structural expression, functional aspects, the response to site, typography and climate.

The use of colour is carried through from concept to building form and has always been an important element in Herzog & de Meuron's architecture and the work of artist Craig-Martin. The sheeting as well as the broad corridor spaces is treated in vivid hues of lime, turquoise and magenta paint.

"A colour range that creates an effect that Herzog & de Meuron describe as 'watery'." (Powel, 2003: 43) "Intense colour provides a means of heightening the interior's streetwise vitality, prompting even the sedentary to move" (Ryan, 2003: 133)
The success of the centre is not only in vivid colour and strong form but also in a really committed response to the needs of its users. It is an environment in which to nurture artists but is unassuming in doing so. The building is a sensual and stimulating environment that combines enjoyment of training and learning while exhibiting a unique sense of identity. It invites the element of motion with its ramping floors, spiraling stairs and dynamic curves. The building itself becomes a dance and a physical expression of identity. At night the view of the dancers' bodies appear as participants in a contemporary shadow play.

The legacy of the centres' Rudolf Laban lives on and is enshrined by a luminous vessel in a gritty urban setting. It responds to local and global stimuli but still maintains it identity. Human movement becomes its own advertisement, the constantly changing and moving element of expression as the architecture recedes into lime, turquoise and magenta light.

The Laban Centre for Dance and Movement is an excellent example of how a single building can begin to change the dynamic of an entire area. The building does so by connecting to and celebrating the identity of its immediate context. The use of reflective facades ensures that the appearance of the building is constantly changing relative to its environment. The building forms are strong and direct and its simplicity and elegance makes the architecture accessible to people from all walks of life as it is easy to understand. This is an important aspect in South Africa where it is necessary to eradicate the exclusivity associated with architecture. Though tough in appearance due to its strong monolithic form, the building is nonetheless characterized by robustness, resilience, serenity and ambiguity.
6.5 The Roland Petit National Ballet School, 2003, Roland Simounet, Marseilles, France

Situated in the Parc Gabe's, Marseilles, France, Roland Simounet's building for the Ecole Nationale Superieure de Danse, presents a balanced and controlled composition indicative of the balletic art it shelters. Simounet's building houses both the Ecole National Superieure and the Roland Petit National Ballet, two of the country's most important dance schools.

In earlier discussion the author has said that a number of variables such as history, culture, religion and language play a significant role in shaping identity. Simounet's North African influence finds presence in the Parc Gabe's where the external tectonic form of the building- compact, inscrutable to the outside eye and monolithic suggests the Kasbah. (Illustration 79) The form of the building expresses a multitude of diverse influences. Despite this the building has a distinct and recognizable architectural expression.
The 7000 square metre two-storey building faces west with its back against a long stand of trees. The sculptural form and exotic presence gives shape and meaning to the flat green expanse of Public Park. Though quite monolithic the play of built form relates strongly to its human and environmental context and provides visual interest and spatial depth to an otherwise uniform expanse of land. While the strong identity created by the form and monochrome colour gives the building a firm location within time and place thereby reaffirming the mutually constitutive link between identity, space and built form.

A very strong aspect of the design is the relationship of the building to its site and natural context, which is treated as equally significant as the relationship to the people inhabiting, passing through and passing, by the building. The building is laid out around a central courtyard and circulation is used as an organizational devise, so that the two schools are accommodated in distinct but related parts. One enters the building on the west via a long gently sloping ramp (illustration 80). The building exhibits a strong concern for its inhabitants and there is a visible expression of function in architectural form. The elevated courtyard and reception hall also accommodates a communal café and terrace. Users of the building are thus able to enjoy the Mediterranean sunshine. Two separate administration departments are distributed over two levels. (Illustration 81 & 82)

"The ingenuity and logic of the circulation system, and its tectonic expression, are finally revealed on the ground floor, where the two parts of the establishment are autonomous, but share access to medical facilities and the Ballet's two, nearly triple-height, rehearsal studios" (McGuire 2003: 63)
KEY
a inclined ramp
b elevated courtyard
c entrance hall
d Ecole quarters
e Ballet quarters
f rehearsal studio
g service entrance
h flytower

Illustration 81, Ground Floor Plan

Illustration 82, First Floor Plan

Illustration 83, Second Floor Plan

Illustration 84. East-west section

Natural daylight from clerestory windows and skylight illuminates the studio and massive structure

Illustration 85. North-south section
Another unique quality of the building that greatly contributes to its identity is the level of choice that the design allows for. Space does not limit choice. The studios can either be used as one large rehearsal space or when divided by a metal curtain which is lowered from the fly-tower can form two separate studios.

The strong Mediterranean light is used extensively both externally to dramatically define and enhance the structure and internally to do the same to different spaces. Clearstory windows and deep skylights illuminate the massive overhead beams within the rehearsal rooms while an evenly diffused light illuminates the lower part of the walls. (Illustration 86 & 87) The play of light throughout the building is like a dance therefore the building becomes a metaphor for dance and movement. The art of ballet is very structured but it is herein that the beauty of this age-old art is found similarly the building expresses its identity through its defined structure. And like a ballet dancers’ body plays out emotion and expression through structured movement, so too does the play of structure allow the building to “dance” with light and shadow.

Two symmetrical flights of stairs from within the main reception hall, lead to the north and west of the building, which house double height studios illuminated by skylights and wall slots, as well as intimate changing, and dressing rooms, which open onto private patios. The south end of the
building split over three levels houses the Ballet’s quarters, which include changing and dressing rooms, washrooms and terraces.

Simounet has allowed for a constant interaction between inside and outside while still maintaining a balance of cultural tradition and modern technology. Rather than a myriad of materials, colours or textures to express the buildings identity he creates these qualities by using uniform colour, light and structure. It is not only a visual experience but also a sensory one. One ‘feels’ the space and is constantly aware of the external environment. In spite of its manifold parts, this is a homogenous structure, uniformly composed of reinforced concrete.

Forms are pure and bold but distorted and softened with changes in light. Both interior and exterior surfaces are simply articulated and detailed with geometric form and white paint. The building does not rely on frills and theatrics to express its identity and it is this very simplicity that is beautiful.

6.6 Conclusion

Despite the unique expression and identity of each of these buildings and their varied geographic locations it can be concluded that the most appropriate examples respond to their context and the needs of its users and are intrinsically linked to the site. The synthesis of a building to its site is a vital and often defining factor in the development of identity. The context and people within it provides the clues to expression. The scale and treatment of buildings also determines how people will relate to it and function within it.

If architecture in the new South Africa is to turn against apartheid ideology and express the concerns and aspirations of it society then it must be all-inclusive and accessible. It must engage cultural energies and create a synthesis of past and present, vernacular and contemporary, of pride and identity. An appropriate South African identity can find its expression in architecture, which interprets culture, society and landscape.
CHAPTER 7

Case Study

7.1 Introduction

The discussion that follows is based on the empirical data carried out in Wentworth, the former coloured area south of Durban. The study area was selected in part due to the author's knowledge of the area as well as the connection to her place of birth and its need for revitalization. The common and most important thread underpinning the themes to be explored in this chapter is identity and the role of space and place in identity formation, and in particular the connection or link between architecture and identity. This study seeks to examine the extent to which space coincides with place in Wentworth. It also seeks to identify the factors that contribute to the social identity of this community and how that is expressed architecturally.

7.2 Data processing

A detailed analysis of the interview responses was carried out in order to identify and examine complex links and connections between subjects in the construction of identity. Due to the lack of documentary evidence with regard to the subject of architecture and identity in Wentworth the type of research employed (discourse analysis) deemed most suitable. Discourse analysis involves the rules and practices by which we give meaning to the world around us it is a broad theoretical framework as it allows for new interpretations of meaning to be developed. It is therefore acknowledged that this study will present a particular interpretation of the research data. Since discourse analysis is basically an interpretative and deconstructing reading, there are no specific guidelines to follow. Again, the purpose of discourse analysis is not to provide definite answers, but to expand our personal horizons and make us realize our own shortcomings and unacknowledged agendas/motivations - as well as that of others. It is also acknowledged that the findings of this research are not necessarily representative of the entire
community of Wentworth. Though discourse analysis does not impose an exact procedure to follow it does however require the researcher to critically examine his or her own presuppositions and unexamined techniques of place making (Barnes & Duncan, 1991:3).

The interviews are viewed as a conversational encounter and as a result the research questions asked focus not on the consistency of the interviewees responses, as is the goal of traditional interviews. Rather the focus is on how ‘talk’ is constructed and what it achieves rather than whether it is accurate. The interview process was an interactive one where the interviewer was willing to adapt the set of prescribed questions during the course of the interview. This examination of the interviews will focus on how people talk about themselves how they perceive their environment in an attempt to piece together a discussion on architecture and identity within the area of Wentworth.

7.3 Data analysis and discussion

The author has studied the area at large through the analysis of photographs, maps and sketches. It was also necessary to map the unique growth patterns that the area has experienced in order to determine how these changes have affected the living conditions of the residents and their emotional connections to the spaces that they inhabit. Mapping of the area was used to determine the physical nature of the area but also set out to establish the demographic profile of the community, with a view to establish the predominant perceived identity of the area. This analysis revealed that very little development has occurred in the area since 1963, except for the Austerville Redevelopment Project (1986-1994) (C.O.R.A, 1985).

Architecture is intrinsically linked to people and place and the data gathered was therefore vital to this study as it is based on the views, relationships and meanings that the respondents attribute to their sense of place, culture and identity. A detailed analysis of the interview responses was carried out in order to identify and examine complex links and connections that exist.
between subjects in the construction of identity. An intense study of the area through the use of photographs and drawings was carried out by the researcher in order to establish the physical and architectural identity of the area and how this is expressed.

7.4 Coloured identity

In examining the issues of architecture and identity in Wentworth as well as the role of space and place in identity formation it becomes necessary to understand the roots of “coloured” identity and the social aspects which constitute this identity. Wentworth is home to 40% of Durban’s coloured population, and, as such, it contains a complete spectrum of coloured social groups. The debates surrounding the validity of the terms and expressions of coloured and culture illustrate the extent to which apartheid classification policies as defined in the Population Registration Act of 1950 have impacted upon all aspects of social life and been interiorised by South Africans. (Jones, 1998)

The term coloured was used more to designate a heterogeneous community from a distinctive community of people according to race. People adopted the appellation ‘coloured’ that was originally imposed on them by others.

The intention of studying three distinct focus groups was to determine the changing perceptions of identity across the three groups and as well as the resultant factors leading to these perceptions. It was also important to determine similarities across the groups in order to establish the common ground that exists among the various generations coming from the same community.

Among coloureds, visions of South Africa, and of their place in the country, were and still are to an extent very complex. It is against this contrasted background that indecisions as to whether to accept and support a coloured identitarian discourse or not, to recognize or reject the existence of a coloured culture must be understood. In answer to the question “What does it mean to
be coloured”, and “What is coloured identity”, many of the respondents particularly those in Group C, though still quite sensitive to the classification “coloured” have come to accept the category. Many believe that acceptance of the category was necessary in-order to find a place in which to locate one’s self and find belonging in apartheid South Africa. But it has also been acknowledged that coloured identity has no “pure” definition. However it could be argued that coloured identity, like any other racially constituted identity is characterized by a complete absence of “purity” (Jones, 1998). It is impossible to create a distinction between coloureds and other South Africans composed of groups who have diverse physical, social, religious, phenotypic and linguistic features. “Colouredness” as a supposedly distinct identity, merely served the interests of the apartheid regime. The construction of difference, “us” and “them”, became a key feature and precondition in the creation and sustenance of apartheid and was the basis of all identities and cultures.

Though this study is particular to the context of Wentworth, the boundaries of the category “coloured” is not limited to Wentworth or South Africa. People still identify with the label coloured even if it somewhat politically incorrect to do so. In response to the question, Do you still consider yourself a coloured? Milicia, one of the Group B respondents (Appendix A), responded as follows:

‘Yes I am proud to consider myself coloured. But my idea of coloured is different. I am proud to be part of so many cultures, races and even religions and the term coloured expresses that.’

Her unique opinion of the politically loaded term was devoid of all negative connotation associated with it. The author found her to be very conscious of her identity and also very proud of her heritage and background, which is perhaps a much healthier and positive way at looking at the issue of ‘colouredness’.

The above discussion has pointed out the impossibility of giving closure to the content of coloured identity. It could be said that an overarching coloured identity is merely a myth and that it is more appropriate to refer to the multiplicity of coloured identities. Similarly in the context of the built
environment of South Africa at large it is almost impossible to clearly define one particular style, genre, or culture that can truly represent the entire nation.

For many South Africans, like myself, the view of the term “coloured” is more of a recognition of the diverse mix or genetic make-up of a people, which lends itself to a mix of cultures and the expression of an eclectic identity. People are reclaiming and re-identifying with the appellation coloured, albeit in the absence of clearly defined boundaries or homogenizing characteristics. As the boundaries of the category are so blurred, perhaps invisible and somewhat impossible to define, it is the authors’ belief that it best represents the diverse “mix” of South African society and the diverse forms of expression within the built environment.

7.5 Community, culture and identity

Despite the hardships that many residents have endured, the community remains closely connected to the area which they call home. Though they were forcibly placed, many respondents, particularly Group C who have spent the later years of their lives in Wentworth, cannot contemplate leaving. Like Dick, a 72 year old male who has lived in Wentworth for 58 years.

‘Ag, even with all the problems, I would never leave Wentworth. This is my home. My family, children and friends are all here and an old man like me needs those things in his life to keep him happy.’ (Appendix A)

Recent discussions around expansion of the oil refinery and proposals to relocate residents, has been met with public outcry and resistance. One particular respondent expressed the opinion that coloured people, being a minority group, are still perceived as political pawns in the new South Africa as they were during Apartheid. In response to the question “How do you feel about the New South Africa?” some respondents expressed feelings of ambivalence and frustration coupled with the belief that they are once again within a political system that marginalizes them.
Many respondents stress the contribution of coloured people to South African culture as a whole and therefore insist that they are fully South African. Though difficult to define many believe that coloureds did create a unique culture whose manifestations are obvious, a culture they have the right to claim and be proud of. The social perils which disadvantaged groups face makes it all the more important to strengthen communities. According to Martin:

“To many, festivals and celebrations are a great help in this respect and the idea of a culture does not mean more than living on and keeping traditions alive, but activities showing the reality of this culture are essential: it is not so much talked about, elaborated upon, as enacted.” (Martin, 2001:261)

There exists an extremely diverse nature of the manifestations which embody coloured culture, in the broadest sense. Spending New Year’s Eve and the morning of New Year’s Day in the streets of the Bo-Kaap, watching the Malay Choirs and the Coons march and sing; analysing body languages, musical repertoires, costumes and make-up, etc. is enough to convince anyone of the conclusion that it can only be defined as a culture of the heterogeneous (Martin, 2001). The “content” of coloured identity is neither based around a common sense of culture nor a common sense of place while observations indicate the effect of globalisation is creating hybrid spatiality within all localities and a simultaneous erosion of the once unproblematic link between identity and place (Yaeger, 1996).
As with the coloured community of the Cape in the process of community formation, music did occupy a central place. Though it did borrow from other types of music it was unique and distinct from any other types of music heard in South Africa at the end of nineteenth century. The music was a tool that unified the community and provided entertainment and expression during religious festivals and family gatherings. The existence of their members as creative human beings was proclaimed through the originality of their music, their dances and their dress. To the coloured elite these celebrations were considered obstacles in the process of political conscientisation. The sub-culture was seen as degrading and as a form of escapism. This criticism was perceived as an acceptance of the classification imposed by the apartheid system while to the disadvantaged members of the community it was an occasion where they could demonstrate their creativity, have fun and make light of their daily sufferings. (Martin, 2001)

Among all focus groups in the study cultural activities such as drama, music and dance play a major role in identity creation. For many, disappearing into the fantasy of music and drama helps people to make light of their difficult situations and allows them to freely express themselves. Dance groups are a common phenomenon and have been in existence for many years and have surpassed many generations. It is a highly competitive sport which helps keep children occupied and off the streets. Due to the lack of place in which to practice and perform, competitions are often held informally on street corners or in nightclubs in the city. These forms of expression are unique to the coloured community of Durban in the same way as the Coon Carnivals are to the Cape coloureds.

Most interview respondents conceded that their identity is closely connected to their environment and the expressions of self within that environment. Peoples' identity is very closely and passionately attached to physical place. Though there are different identities which result from people belonging to different groupings within the community, discussion has revealed that there is a broader attachment to the place Wentworth.
7.6 Social problems

The content of identity in Wentworth is temporarily and contingently created out of everyday life, social practices, beliefs and interactions. The area has a long history of crime, violence, drug abuse and vandalism, which collectively constitute a serious threat to the social well-being of the majority of the community. The social environment of the area has evolved under the influences of national political and racial policies, combined with other influences of economic conditions, cultural heritage, family structures, physical and urban environment, education and socialization pressures. As such, when one examines the social conditions and related social problems of the area, not only is it difficult to identify simple cause-and-effect relationships, but also it is a daunting task to develop meaningful and practical solutions to the social ills. (C.O.R.A, 1985)

In prior studies on the area of Wentworth and other coloured areas in Durban, it has been revealed that pre-school and school-going youth form the largest percentage of the population. This highlights the heavy demand for facilities for the younger age groups. During interviews many of the youth in Group A expressed the opinion that the crime and violence stems from boredom among idle youth as a result of the lack of facilities for after school and weekend activities. As stated by Jaleel (Appendix A), a 16 year old high school student in one of the interviews:

'There is nothing for us young people to do in Wentworth and everything that does open eventually just closes down again. Like the indoor sports centre at the Blue Roof. We used to go there after school to play indoor soccer and now its closed and they use it as a tavern. Even our schools don't have any extramural activities because they say there is no money for it. It just seems like no one really cares.'

‘Instead of just going to youth at church one day a week, there should be a place where we can go everyday to get off the street and get help with homework and problems at home, to learn things that we don't learn at school and just have fun.’(Jaleel, 2006)
It is difficult to pinpoint a relationship between such social problems and the physical environment but it is to be expected that the 'public' character of the spaces and the lack of defensible space are all physical factors that facilitate criminal activity.

As many of the social problems are related to the physical conditions in the area it is therefore proposed that physical improvements to the area could aid in alleviating some of the social problems while encouraging community spirit and action. However physical action can only be effective if accompanied by programmes that address social problems.

7.7 Housing and infrastructure

Though housing provision in the area is still inadequate the effects of home ownership as a result of the project, are visible in the improved maintenance of houses and gardens. By contrast, the quality of the housing environment in the areas developed with flats is depressingly poor. Developed in attempts to accommodate large numbers of people on limited land and with minimal cost, no attention was paid to the actual living environment of the inhabitants. Noise and lack of privacy due to the close grouping of blocks, poor structural, environmental and social conditions characterise these developments and, as noted by the residents, are the feeding grounds for vandalism and gang activity. There has been a move to change this by converting the publicly owned blocks to sectional title developments, however there still exist the bleak and sterile spaces that separate blocks of flats.
In interviews with residents, it is apparent that home-owners have more pride in their property than do tenants, and this is reflected in general in the better standards of maintenance of these dwellings and their surrounds. The effects of secure tenure have resulted in a visible improvement in the appearance of the neighbourhood as well as the general maintenance of dwellings and has also stimulated a significant degree of extension and renovation to houses and boundary walls.
Illustration 93, Many residents have marked their permanence in the area through the elaborate extension and renovation of very small three bedroom houses along Austerville Drive.

In general the high density of housing in the area has contributed greatly to the way in which people live and socialized. The close proximity of semi-detached housing and the small yards provide little privacy and as a result life in Wentworth is very much about community. The streets are the playgrounds, meeting places and car parks. The streets are active and in some cases dangerous as they are places for both people and cars. The streets in essence have become an extension of people's yards and the hub of all social activity.

Illustration 94, Richard Winn Road active and alive
Many of the interview respondents expressed the opinion that despite individual efforts by residents to improve their environment, there is an apparent lack of concern and participation by the local authority. It is believed by many respondents that the perception of Wentworth as a "slum" has perpetuated stereotypes about the coloured community and has inhibited development and improvement.

For many years development and maintenance of the area was inhibited by politics. Responsibility for the maintenance of the service infrastructure was shared between the City and the Government Departments. In general underground services not maintained by the City were old and subject to period failure, while roads formally owned by the City are well below the standards required. All service infrastructures have since been transferred to the City but many still require upgrading.

Inadequate lighting especially around public buildings holds the inherent danger of crime, while respondents expressed the concern that there is very little effort made by the city to maintain the public areas.
Litter, overgrown verges and unkempt open spaces continue to contribute to the unsightly character of Wentworth. With grass cutting occurring only three times a year many public open spaces such as parks are left unkempt, facilities such as children’s’ playgrounds are left in disrepair and often unsafe and the vast spaces often become grounds for illegal activity. The lack of appropriate planning has resulted in the formation of pockets of unused land or "lost space" that either become dumping grounds or, as was the case in the past, the centre of territorial gang warfare.

Residents are dissatisfied with the lack of community facilities and believe that they have been made to feel grateful for the basic services that the area does have. There is only one major supermarket in the area (Spar), yet in the neighbouring suburb of the Bluff there are two major shopping centers less than 1km apart, one of which is under extensive expansion. Though the Bluff is reasonably close there is no public transport between the two suburbs and with 58% of Wentworth’s population being unemployed, private transport is a luxury. Many “community” facilities remain under lock and key and are poorly maintained.
It is desirable from a planning point of view, to encourage the grouping of many public and community facilities in a selected centralized location. This encourages the development of a multi-functional community centre which acts as a focus for community based activities and which encourages the establishment by private enterprise of shops and services. With careful planning such a centre can develop as a vibrant social and recreational focus of community life. In Wentworth the area around the shopping centre at Clinic road is best located to serve the whole area and has potential for development as a dynamic focus. (see Appendix C)

As noted in the analysis of conditions of the area by the Committee for the Redevelopment of Austervile (C.O.R.A.) and which still applies at present, the need for venues for crèches, community organizations, religious groups, play classes, markets, dances, etc., might be best served by the development of multi-functional buildings and spaces maintained by a public body and hired
out for use. This would ensure maximum utilization of the facilities. (C.O.R.A., 1985)

Coloured identity seems to be contingent on the absence of homogenizing characteristics, however the architecture of the area is quite homogeneous due to its origins as army barracks and mass low cost housing. However the ways in which people have chosen to embellish their dwellings differ considerably. Different architectural expressions that stem from, economic, social and cultural differences are evident in the ways that people have extended and renovated their houses. Unlike the homogeneity of gated communities with their often-impossible development restrictions, the unique character and identity of Wentworth stems from the individual and varied forms of architectural expression of the everyday man. This is not an attempt to glamorize the harsh environment of Wentworth but rather to celebrate its very nature which is colourful, bold, proud, sometimes kitsch and experimental but most importantly refreshingly real.

7.9 Conclusion

Despite the complex nature of the discussion, respondents were found to be sincere and frank about their perceptions of identity, the creation of a South African identity and the role of architecture and identity in revitalization.

Residents expressed their perceptions and view, relationships and meanings that they attributed to their sense of place, culture and identity. By identifying the existing perceptions of identity within the environment one can develop effective strategies in order to sensitively and accurately reflect the identity of that area and the people who inhabit it through the architectural expression of the built environment.

The analysis of Wentworth highlights the large number of problems in the area. Environmental conditions are particularly poor, especially in respect of public areas. Public housing conditions vary from indifferent to very poor, social problems are deep rooted, and the inadequacy of community facilities
is of major concern. A particular concern from many respondents is the lack of recreational facilities for the youth and a community space.

With all these problems, a common theme appears that, in the past, Wentworth has received minimal inputs by the appropriate authorities in respect of development and maintenance of the community facilities. It has suffered from inadequate or inappropriate planning, and the community has been largely powerless to influence the extent and course of investment, development and social control. Despite this however the residents remain hopeful and positive about the future of the coloured community at large and their role in the creation of a South African identity. They are also committed to changing existing perceptions, which hinder development and progress in Wentworth in the hope that this can positively affect the space and place that they inhabit.

This has led to the design of a brief for a proposed Art Centre for the Wentworth community that will facilitate in youth development, provide skills development and also be a platform for community activity. The design is centred on community activity, accessibility and participation. The form has developed in response to the chosen site along the main road but also the energy, movement and activity of the area. (see Appendix D) The concepts centre on issues of transparency and visibility, while the various techniques and textures applied to the facades are representative of the heterogeneous community.

The centre is conceived as a beacon of hope for the community, a place that the community can take ownership of but also an architectural intervention that will reflect the identity and aspirations of the people while becoming a landmark that celebrates that identity.
CHAPTER 8

Conclusions and recommendations

This study has covered a range of theories and concepts surrounding the formation of identity and the expression and reflection of identity through architectural expression. It was an aim at the outset of the study to identify existing perceptions of identity within the built environment and how these manifest in building form. This has been achieved by analysing the changing perceptions of identity through time as well as the way in which society has found its expression in architecture. The research also aimed to accentuate rather than obscure the power of identity to shape South African society and the built environment. By interpreting the symbolic meaning of the resident culture through architectural intervention this study has achieved its objective in beginning to answer how we can create a new national identity through architectural expression in a free and democratic South Africa.

This research has found that South Africa has historically been characterised by oppressive definitions of identity. It has been argued here that all boundaries of difference, as prescribed by apartheid are in fact very permeable. The discussion on coloured identity is inseparable from discussing the nation as a whole and has pointed out the impossibility of giving closure to, or clearly defining, the "content" of coloured identity. Similarly it is the authors' opinion that an overarching and totalizing South African identity is a myth.

“This highlights the dilemma of the new South Africa in general: how to define and recognize communities without perpetuating apartheid categories, attitudes and behaviours; how to support communal cultures in a way that will bring communities together instead of setting them apart or even pitting them against one another” (Martin, 2001).

In light of this it is perhaps more appropriate to refer to the multiplicity of South African identities as no one particular style, order or identity is sufficient to reflect the diverse nature of South Africa.
It is recommended that architects and planners use the power of architecture to positively shape society and the environments in which they live, work and play and in so doing promote the aspirations and values of the new democratic order. By doing so one can begin to contribute to the eradication of every sign of oppression and segregation that lies in the path of development and transition. Architecture of the new South Africa must promote African influence but also express a synthesis of the country’s diverse African, Asian and European heritage. It must aim to undo the old spatial order and heals parts of the city so as to render them accessible, safe, amenable and dignified environments designed for the benefit of all people.

The challenge lies for individuals to centre their interest on the expressive role of architecture rather than on its strictly aesthetic, structural or functional aspects. Interest must be centered on the complex and overlapping ways in which groups define themselves, and on the translation of these self-images into built form. Buildings silent and abstract have the power to communicate information about the communities that erect them. The hybrid nature of all South African contexts are of particular importance to the forms of expression as relevant architecture should ideally respond to and convey the complex, heterogeneous group identity that characterises South African society.

The case study has highlighted the need for community participation in development and the creation of architectural identity. The quality of public space is of great importance to the positive performance of urban and suburban environments because they are places within which people experience and engage in collective life. Very little effort has been made to emphasize the importance of public space in Wentworth. However, if public spaces are properly made and celebrated they will give dignity and a sense of permanence to the environment. And in the process become a place of collective social and cultural experiences as well an extension of community identity.

In the area of Wentworth it has been argued that the identity of the people living in the area is a result of local dynamics as well as national dynamics.
People have created their own sense of place and culture within the place of Wentworth. This culture has been identified as expressive and has reiterated the discussion of identity as a fluid and constantly changing process. What has remained constant however is the way in which people of the area express their culture and identity. Dance, music and art are elements, which unite all generations and all social groups within the community. In these elements there is a shared identity however the development of these forms of expression are hindered by the lack of facilities to support them. It is therefore recommended that suitable architectural intervention, in particular the proposed Art Centre (see Appendix D) could promote and facilitate such activity and in so doing help to strengthen and celebrate the diverse nature of identity within the area of Wentworth.

The research has shown how identity must be reflected in the built environment in order for the people who inhabit those environments to connect to them. This has impacted greatly on the design proposal for an Art Centre for Wentworth. It is clear to the author that the design must respond positively to the energy of the area and must also reflect the collective identity of a heterogeneous community. The design must however also allow for the celebration and expression of individual identities within a collective identity. This design is intended as a symbol which will represent the diversity, resilience, and resident culture of the Wentworth community. The design therefore must be accessible to all, be inclusive of all. As identities are never fixed and are continuously changing the design process must examine these changes and their outcomes. There can be no perfect or exact representation of a group identity through the built form. It is therefore vital that the building allows for change and adaptation in line with that if the community so that over time it will continue to centre on the expressive role of architecture and become the heart and proud symbol of the community.

In conclusion an appropriate South African identity can find its expression in architecture which interprets culture, society and landscape while adapting to the changing social context and in turn express and reflect the eclectic identity of the society which it serves.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Primary data-List of interview respondents

Group A (15/02/06),
Christi-Ann, Grade 10 student, 15yrs
Cleavon, Grade 10 student, 15yrs
Jaleel, Grade 12 student, 16yrs
Kerri-Anne, Grade 11 student, 16yrs
Lenise, Grade 12 student, 17yrs
Randi, Grade 9 student, 14yrs
Nadia, Grade 9 student, 14yrs
Natalie, Grade 8 student, 15yrs
Ryan, Grade 8 student, 13yrs
Shauntane, Grade 11 student, 16 yrs

Group B
Hayden (21/12/05), Policeman, 30yrs
Imelda (23/12/05), Pre-Primary School teacher and mother of three, 39yrs
Milicia (12/01/06), Technikon student with a young daughter, 22yrs
Quincy (15/11/05), Performing artist and active community worker, 28yrs
Vernon (04/02/06), Construction worker and father of four, 40 yrs

Group C
Carol, (21/12/05), Self employed mother of four, 54yrs
Desmond, (15/11/05), Community worker and director, 48yrs
Dick, (15/11/05), Retired printer and father of three, 72yrs
Eric, (23/12/05), Retired Construction worker and father of four, 65yrs
Paul, (03/02/06), High School Principle and father of two, 52yrs

Key informants

Choromanski, R, (27/11/05), CNN Architects
Timakia, T, (12/03/2006), Ethekwini Municipality
Desar, D, (12/01/06), Wentworth Community Leader

Secondary data


**Correa, C.** 2000. *Housing and urbanism*. London: Thames and Hudson


Jencks, C. 1993. Heteropolis: Los Angeles, the riots and the strange beauty of Hetero-architecture. Great Britain. Academy editions
Lewis, G. 1987. Between the Wire and the Wall, A History of South Africa’s ‘Coloured’ Politics. Cape Town: David Philip
Mikula, P. 1996. The Bat Centre. Some Inside Information. KZ-NIA Nov: 3

Websites

O’Hare, D. 2003. [www.bee.qut.edu.au](http://www.bee.qut.edu.au) [17/05/06]
Woodman, M. 1996. *Quotes by Marion Woodman*. [www.mwoodman.org](http://www.mwoodman.org) [23/01/1006]
Author Unknown. 2006. The Voortrekker Monument. [www.voortrekker.org](http://www.voortrekker.org) [27/12/06]
Author Unknown. 2006. Kwa-Zulu Natal. [www.tourism.co.za](http://www.tourism.co.za) [03/01/07]
Newspaper Articles


Unpublished Papers


* Austerville Redevelopment Project: report 1: analysis of conditions.*

Durban: CORA (Unpublished)
Appendix A

INTERVIEW QUESTIONARE

Introduction

The respondents were given a short background to the study and made to feel at ease about the confidentiality of their responses. It must be noted that although a prescribed set of questions was drawn up, due to the conversational manner in which the interviews were run certain aspects of the discussion were allowed to adapt and change somewhat according to the respondents. A brief profile of the respondent was established before commencing the interview, i.e. name, age, sex, occupation, place of residence, etc.

1. How long have you lived in Wentworth?
2. What do you think are the perceptions of the area?
3. What perception do you think people have of you as a result of living in Wentworth?
4. Do you think that your identity is directly linked to the place in which you live?
5. How has living in Wentworth affected your identity?
6. How do you feel about the area in which you live? What are the negatives and what are the positives?
7. Wentworth was created as a Coloured area and in the past we were considered Coloureds, do you still consider yourself as a Coloured?
8. What are your feelings about the new South Africa and your place in it?
9. What do you believe is lacking in the community and to what extent can revitalization of the area affect the community?
10. Given a choice would you leave Wentworth to live in another area in Durban or the rest of South Africa? If so, which area would you like to live in and why?
Below are transcriptions of three interviews, one from each group of respondents which where thought by the author to be most informative and revealing.

Group A respondent: Jaleel, Male grade 12 student, 16yrs, Merewent

How long have you lived in Wentworth?
'I was born here.'

What do you think are the perceptions of the area?
'That it's dangerous and like a township.'

What perception do you think people have of you as a result of living in Wentworth?
'People think that because you come from a certain place that you must be in a gang or doing drugs or something like that.'

Do you think that you identity is directly linked to the place in which you live?
'I'm not really sure if I understand, but I do think that most of us dress alike, talk the same way, do the same things and maybe even think the same because we come from the same place. But we are all still different.'

How has living in Wentworth affected your identity?
'It's not like I have a choice to live here or not. Its where my mother brought us up so I guess it's home whether I like it or not.'

Wentworth was created as a coloured area and in the past we were considered coloureds, do you still consider yourself as a coloured?
'Yes I am coloured because my family come from black, white and indian.'

What are your feelings about the new South Africa and your place in it?
'I don't think that I really have a place here because we are always just the people in between and there is nothing in our country that recognizes or reflects coloured people.'

How do you feel about the area in which you live? What are the negatives and what are the positives?
'There is nothing for us young people to do in Wentworth and everything that does open eventually just closes down again. Like the indoor sports centre at the Blue Roof. We used to go there after school to play indoor soccer and now its closed and they use it as a tavern. Even our schools don't have any
extramural activities because they say there is no money for it. It just seems like no one really cares.'

What do you believe is lacking in the community and to what extent can revitalization of the area affect the community?

'Instead of just going to youth at church one day a week, there should be a place where we can go everyday to get off the street and get help with homework and problems at home, to learn things that we don't learn at school and just have fun.'

Given a choice would you leave Wentworth to live in another area in Durban or the rest of South Africa? If so, which area would you like to live in and why?

'Ya, I'm going to try and get a bursary to study when I finish Matric and when I'm done studying I want to go overseas because there are more jobs and I can make money to help my family.'

Group B respondent: Milicia, (12/01/06), Female technikon student with a young daughter, 22yrs, Austerville

How long have you lived in Wentworth?

'All my life, I was born soon after my parents moved here.'

What do you think are the perceptions of the area?

'I think that people from outside this area think of it as a poor coloured community ravaged by crime and danger.'

What perception do you think people have of you as a result of living in Wentworth?

'Many people when hearing that I come from Wentworth expect me to fit into the stereotypes that they have of some coloured people. That we are unapproachable, not well educated and maybe even violent.'

Do you think that your identity is directly linked to the place in which you live?

'I think it is affected by the place you live in but I don't think that it shapes your entire identity. Your experiences outside of the place that you live in also form part of the make-up of your identity.'

How has living in Wentworth affected your identity?

'I think it has exposed me to all kinds of people as the community is so mixed, but I think that its also provided a comfort zone to only interact with people of
the same race and background. That’s not so much the case now that I’m and Technikon because I’m exposed to many different people and challenges but it still doesn’t change who I am.’

Wentworth was created as a coloured area and in the past we were considered coloureds, do you still consider yourself as a coloured?

‘Yes I am proud to consider myself coloured. But my idea of coloured is different. I am proud to be part of so many cultures, races and even religions and the term coloured expresses that.’

What are your feelings about the new South Africa and your place in it?

‘I am optimistic about my own future because I know that I’m studying and working hard to make sure that it will be good. I am trying to access all the opportunities that are out there but its sometimes frustrating to always be stuck in the middle between black and white and to be used to just fill quotas. I love this country because it’s home but I don’t feel safe here and I fear for my young daughter life because of all the crime.’

How do you feel about the area in which you live? What are the negatives and what are the positives?

‘What I love most about the area is the energy of the people and the sense of community. Children still play in the streets and neighbour’s stand and chat at their gates. But a big negative is that there are very few community facilities in the area, especially for the youth. I think that drugs, teenage pregnancy, alcohol abuse and gangsterism are only there because there is nothing else for the youth to get involved in. There are places that they can go for help or guidance.’

What do you believe is lacking in the community and to what extent can revitalization of the area affect the community?

‘I think Wentworth needs some kind of youth centre, decent sports fields and parks for children to play and also shopping centres with things like banks and supermarkets.’

Do you think that architecture can play a role in revitalization of the area?

Yes I think it can if it is used to better the life of the people and not just to make money for people who are building. It can revitalize the area if its used to better peoples living conditions or even just to create something for the community that they can be proud of.
Given a choice would you leave Wentworth to live in another area in Durban or the rest of South Africa? If so, which area would you like to live in and why?

'Yes I would move elsewhere. I have a daughter to think about and I want her to go to better schools than I did and live in a better area. I would move to the Bluff because it is still close enough to Wentworth and my family but the area is more racially diverse and closer to amenities and good schools. If I had the money I would love to immigrate to Australia as my sisters are there and life is better there.'

**Group C respondent: Dick, (15/11/05), Retired printer and father of three, 72yrs, Treasure Beach**

How long have you lived in Wentworth?

'58 yrs'

What do you think are the perceptions of the area?

'I think that *most* people are scared of Wentworth because they think of how it used to be when the gangs were still busy, but it's much better now. The young boys still get up to plenty of mischief but the community is learning to stand up and fight against negative things. Also people think Wentworth is only for coloured's but the area is very mixed since the new government took over.'

How do you feel about that?

'Ag well! These things will happen anyway so you just have to accept it and try to make it work but it sometimes very hard to understand your neighbours culture if it's different to yours.'

What perception do you think people have of you as a result of living in Wentworth?

'At my age my dear you don't worry too much about what other people think. You young people have to learn that. We suffered for too long because of who we were in the past, so know I just enjoy life being me.'

Do you think that you identity is directly linked to the place in which you live?

'Definitely, for a long time this (Wentworth,) was the only place we knew. It was our whole world. Many of us have grown together and struggled together. We had very little and had to work hard to make ends meet, but you
could rely on the people around you. Sometimes you were forced to be close to people. You know, before they built these houses (large freestanding units in Treasure Beach), we lived in the old army barracks, sometimes two and three families per house, so yes, all my stories are in this place.’

How has living in Wentworth affected your identity?
‘I’m not really certain, because I’ve never really thought about it, but I reckon it made us tough, sometimes even hard and that’s why many of us find it hard to accept the changes in the country even though many are good.’

Wentworth was created as a coloured area and in the past we were considered coloureds, do you still consider yourself as a coloured?
‘Yes I am coloured and proud to be one. My parents came from the Cape so they were Cape coloured, but we started a community of Durban coloured’s.’

What are your feelings about the new South Africa and your place in it?
‘Oh, what can I say? Things have changed but they have also stayed the same for us.
Us?
‘Yes us coloureds. First we were not white enough, know we are not black enough, but there are a lot of opportunities for you young people that we didn’t have like education and travel, but not in this area.

How do you feel about the area in which you live? What are the negatives and what are the positives?
‘Many people are still suffering, with no jobs and money or even decent houses. Like the flats at Major Calvert, those building haven’t been cleaned up and made decent for the people since they were built. Some house still have outside toilets. For us pensioners there is only one pension collection point at the Post Office. We all have to line up from early in the morning to collect our pension, sometimes standing in the queue and the sun for hours. I have very bad asthma, so the pollution from the oil refinery is also very bad, especially in the morning, I wake some days and can barely breath.’

What do you believe is lacking in the community and to what extent can revitalization of the area affect the community?
‘There is so much that Wentworth needs. You just have to drive 5 minutes to the Bluff and see all the shopping centres, schools and even bowling clubs for
elderly people. I think the government needs to have a hard look at our community and also give our children a chance of a better life.'

Do you think that architecture can play a role in revitalization of the area?

'Yes but these buildings they put up are only good for a little while and then they are vandalized and not even available for the community to use. I took my granddaughter to the library the other day and I couldn't believe the state it is in. It smells damp and musty, the paint is peeling off the walls, and the grass around fence of the community hall was waist high!'

Given a choice would you leave Wentworth to live in another area in Durban or the rest of South Africa? If so, which area would you like to live in and why?

'Ag, even with all the problems, I would never leave Wentworth. This is my home. My family, children and friends are all here and an old man like me needs those things in his life to keep him happy.'
Appendix B

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

Illustration 1: By author. 2006. Detailed map of the study area.
Illustration 2: By author. 2006. Location Map of the former Coloured Group Areas in Durban
Illustration 3: By author. 2006. View of the Engen Refinery forming a backdrop to the houses
Illustration 4: By author. 2006. View of the Engen Refinery from Treasure Beach
Illustration 6: By author. 2006. Dwelling units which were formerly military barracks
Illustration 7: By author. 2006. Panax Place flats
Illustration 8: By author. 2006. “Rainbow Chickens”
Illustration 9: By author. 2006. Semi-detached double storey
Illustration 10: By author. 2006. Large, privately owned dwellings on the landward slope of Treasure Beach
Illustration 11: By author. 2006. Large, privately owned seaward facing dwelling of Treasure Beach
Illustration 12: By author. 2006. Illustrates the residential and gender distribution of the three focus groups of respondents
Illustration 14: Deckler et al. 2006. Legislature for the Northern Cape Provincial Government
Illustration 15: Deckler et al. 2006. Legislature for the Northern Cape Provincial Government
Illustration 16: Deckler et al. 2006. Legislature for the Northern Cape Provincial Government- Artwork, landscape and detailing
Illustration 18: By author. 2007. Manning Road, Glenwood,
Illustration 19: By author. 2007. Cato Manor Township
Illustration 20: By author. 2006. Ushaka Marine World thatched dome shaped roofs and gumpole balustrades
Illustration 21: By author. 2006. Ushaka Island ornate detailing
Illustration 22: www.tourism.co.za. [03/01/07]Traditional Zulu homestead
Illustration 26: Richards et al. 1985. Gourna Mosque


Illustration 33: Leviton, R. 2001. Guga S’Thebe Art, Culture and Heritage Village - Main façade 52

Illustration 34: Leviton, R. 2001. Guga S’Thebe Art, Culture and Heritage Village - Amphitheatre performance area 52


Illustration 36: Deckler et al. 2006. Metro Mail Transport facility and Traders Market – Views of the building and surrounding context. 59

Illustration 37: Elleh. N. 1997. The University of Pretoria’s Administration Building 60

Illustration 38: www.voortrekker.org. [27/12/06]. The Voortrekker Monument 60

Illustration 39: Deckler et al. 2006. Red Location Museum 62

Illustration 40: Deckler et al. 2006. The Apartheid Museum 63

Illustration 41: Deckler et al. 2006. The Apartheid Museum 63

Illustration 42: Claude, D. 1996. BAT Centre – Site Plan 67

Illustration 43: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - View of the harbour from the centre 67

Illustration 44: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - Principle façade 67

Illustration 45: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - Mural wall 67

Illustration 46: By author. 2005. BAT Centre- Portrait busts at entrance 67

Illustration 47: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - View to the upper terrace from the courtyard 67

Illustration 48: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - View of the courtyard from the first floor terrace 67

Illustration 49: By author. 2005. BAT Centre-Graphic and Sculpture Studio 67

Illustration 50: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - Studio roof Detail 67

Illustration 51: By author. 2005. BAT Centre Transparency of space both horizontally and vertically 67

Illustration 52: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - View of the curved corrugated iron roof 67

Illustration 53: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - Floor detail 67

Illustration 54: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - Detailed view of the mural wall 67

Illustration 55: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - Graphic and Sculpture Studio 67

Illustration 56: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - Studio roof Detail 67

Illustration 57: By author. 2005. BAT Centre Transparency of space both horizontally and vertically 67

Illustration 58: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - View of the curved corrugated iron roof 67

Illustration 59: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - Floor detail 67

Illustration 60: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - Detailed view of the mural wall 67

Illustration 61: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - Graphic and Sculpture Studio 67

Illustration 62: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - Studio roof Detail 67

Illustration 63: By author. 2005. BAT Centre Transparency of space both horizontally and vertically 67

Illustration 64: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - View of the curved corrugated iron roof 67

Illustration 65: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - Floor detail 67
Illustration 54: By author. 2005. BAT Centre – Restroom mosaic detail
Illustration 55: By author. 2005. BAT Centre - Contrast of Georgian door with steel window
Illustration 56: OMM Design Workshop. 2004. Constitutional Court - View of the Constitutional Court from the city
Illustration 61: Constitutional Court - Exhibition Stairs
Illustration 64: OMM Design Workshop. 2004. Constitutional Court - Court Entrance
Illustration 67: Ryan, R. 2003. Laban Centre for Movement and Dance - Photograph illustrating the curved façade
Illustration 68: Powell, K. 2003. Laban Centre for Movement and Dance - Site Plan
Illustration 69: Powell, K. 2003. Laban Centre for Movement and Dance - Ground Floor Plan
Illustration 70: Powell, K. 2003. Laban Centre for Movement and Dance - First Floor Plan
Illustration 71: Powell, K. 2003. Laban Centre for Movement and Dance - Mezzanine Floor Plan
Illustration 72: Powell, K. 2003. Laban Centre for Movement and Dance - Cross Section
Illustration 73: Powell, K. 2003. Laban Centre for Movement and Dance - Longitudinal Section
Illustration 74: Ryan, R. 2003. Laban Centre for Movement and Dance - View of Laban from across the river
Illustration 75: Ryan, R. 2003. Laban Centre for Movement and Dance - Photograph illustrating the luminous interior at night
Illustration 76: Ryan, R. 2003. Laban Centre for Movement and Dance - Photograph illustrating the interior view of the first floor gallery
Illustration 77: Ryan, R. 2003. Laban Centre for Movement and Dance - Photograph illustrating the view from the gallery into the library and treatment rooms
Illustration 78: Ryan, R. 2003. Laban Centre for Movement and


Illustration 87: McGuire, P. 1995. Roland Petit National Ballet School - Photograph illustrating natural daylight illuminating the studio and massive structure

Illustration 88: By author. 2007. Cape Town Coon Carnival

Illustration 89: By author. 2007. Cape Town Coon Carnival

Illustration 90: By author. 2006. Reiger Road flats commonly known as "Destroyer flats" erected by the Department of Community Development

Illustration 91: By author. 2006. Major Calvert Road flats which are in a state of disrepair and within a bleak environment

Illustration 92: By author. 2006. Semi-detached single storey houses which have been extended

Illustration 93: By author. 2006. Illustrating how many residents have marked their permanence in the area through the elaborate extension and renovation of very small three bedroom houses along Austerville Drive

Illustration 94: By author. 2006. Richard Winn Road active and alive

Illustration 95: By author. 2006. Illustrating the housing layout of typical semi-detached dwelling units which make up a large portion of the housing stock of Wentworth

Illustration 96: By author. 2006. Unkempt open lots along Austerville Drive

Illustration 97: By author. 2006. Illustrating the over grown verges and lost spaces typical of the environment

Illustration 98: By author. 2006. Illustrating run-down buildings which house the areas main commercial zone
Illustration 99: **By author.** 2006. Commercial activity along Clinic Road 105

Illustration 100: **By author.** 2006. The community hall and surrounds 105

Illustration 101: **By author.** 2006. David Beare Family Welfare society housed in a converted military barrack 105
Appendix C

DESIGN TREATISE REPORT
If we fail to nourish our souls, they wither; and without soul, life ceases to have meaning. The creative process shrivels in the absence of continual dialogue with the soul. And creativity is what makes life worth living.

Marion Woodman, 1990
I wish to thank the following people for their willing assistance, support and encouragement.

With thanks to the School of Architecture at UKZN and my fellow colleagues for making my studies during the past six and a half years a rich and rewarding experience, one which has proved most valuable and will certainly remain memorable.

To the academic staff as well as the architectural library and Jan staff who have assisted me over the years. Special thanks to my mentor Kevin Brogham who provided the encouragement and support as well as important guidance throughout the design and process. Your commitment is much appreciated.

Special thanks to the community of Wentworth who provided the inspiration and focus for this project.

Last but by no means least thank you to my parents, family and friends, who have patiently encouraged, supported and motivated me through my studies.

Jodi Davids
Durban, 2006
PROJECT REPORT

1) Aim of the project
2) Client and Funders
3) Brief
4) Concept and Design Generation
5) Key Recommendations
6) Problem Aslying

APPENDICES

Appendix A: Site Selection and Analysis
Appendix B: Environmental Technical Report
Appendix C: Accommodation Schedule
The Wentworth Art Centre is to operate as a facility responding to the demands and needs of a changing creative community. The project aims:

With the closure and downsizing of many art facilities throughout the city as well as the lack of cultural facilities in the area of Wentworth, where the arts is very much a part of the expression of identity, research has revealed the high demand for new facilities which provide art, culture, music and cultural enhancement and expression.

The youth in particular require facilities and incentive to make active decisions about their lives. The intention of this proposal is to create a building which houses an organization dedicated to youth development and the cultural and economic revitalization of the Wentworth community. An arts centre and neighbourhood market place that runs programmes which encourage and celebrate both artistry and entrepreneurship among its participants.

The intent is to engage young people as active agents of change by building competencies in the visual and performing arts, furnishing hands-on business training, and fostering environmental stewardship, all of which illustrate viable educational and career options. By deeply engaging young people in programmes led by practising professionals, the centre will help the youth of Wentworth articulate personal aspirations and apply their ambitions to the process of community renewal under the guidance of adult mentors.

The community of Wentworth has traditionally been defined solely in terms of its poverty, crime rate, poor schools, and substandard housing. Indeed although a large percentage of the families live at or below the poverty level, this initiative will consider the talents, skills, and aspirations of the people as its greatest asset and in so doing use the architecture to reflect the nature of the diverse context. Utilizing the arts and entrepreneurship, the center will work to address personal and community wide problems of declining investment and unrealized aspirations among the residents and particularly the youth. The project is to encourage the arts, local enterprise and self investment in the Wentworth community through the creation of an architectural landmark that recognizes the diverse nature of the community and in so doing reflects the identity of the people that it will serve.

RT CENTRE - WENTWORTH

Jodi Davids

DESIGN TREATIS REPORT

2006
The Arts and Culture Trust as well as the National Lottery Fund will fund the project. However, due to the educational and cultural facilities included, attempts will be made to secure funding from the Department of Education as well as the Department of Arts and Culture. In addition, private investors and entrepreneurs will provide added capital. Multi-national oil company, Engen, in their attempts at community and youth education and development, will provide a set amount of funding each year to subsidise the arts programmes run by the centre. It is also anticipated that the centre will generate an own income through the rental of studio space to resident and visiting artists. The studio apartments will generate further income for the general running of the centre. Areas such as the drama, dance and music studies will also be available for hire to the community at a small fee which will cover the general maintenance of the studios as well as provide a small profit.

1.3) BRIEF

The multi-functional nature of the centre is intended to promote diverse activities and become a hub of communal and social activity. It is intended to house facilities that will promote the development of performing and creative arts in the area. The design should not include office facilities as well as residential and retail facilities. The facilities offered are required to be accessible to a broad audience and help to express the collective identity. The building is also required to be adaptable for cultural uses. Careful consideration is needed for the hierarchy of spaces as well as the treatment of public/private interfaces.

It is to be designed as a low-rise building to accommodate functional variations as well as to promote experimentation within a non-conventional structure. Despite its location within a residential community, the project will be profit driven. It is intended that the letting office, retail and studio space will provide income to cover running costs. To ensure sustainability, the centre will form part of the larger arts network and will participate in various arts and music festivals such as Red Eve, Jozi-Rock Dance Festival, SA Music Week, Durban Poets, and Film festivals, as well as Arts and Culture Week.

Residential accommodation will be available for rental by artists who wish to work and live at the centre. In exchange for a nominal rental fee, artists will provide their skills to the community by teaching and running workshops.

The project is to provide a catalyst for artistic and cultural development and celebration as well as for the revitalization and development of the area. The project must be recognised for its potential to create a public landmark that draws people into a node of social interaction and promotes civic pride. Most importantly, the building must be permeable and accessible to all and reflect the collective identity of a culturally diverse society.
The concept came about largely in response to the existing patterns and movement on and around the site. The design was
guided by the needs of the community and the response to its site. It was of vital importance that any proposed
architectural intervention respond to the existing nature of the site and its surroundings as well as promote further
development and revitalization of the area.

Though various proposals were initially explored they were all driven by an overall design concept which in turn was
inspired by an overall design concept.

COMMUNITY: Communities and the people who constitute them make up the heart of any society. Only extensive
participation and involvement of the local community can lead to an authentic expression of local identity and culturally
relevant architecture contributing to the formation of an identity that reflects the aspirations and embodies the values of
the new South Africa. It is important to create a sense of space, of community ownership and pride within an inclusive
community structure.

IDENTITY: Identity cannot be positively reflected through the creation of an architectural expression devoid of
authenticity and meaning. The built form must reflect the nature and aspirations of the community that it serves. The
design attempts to highlight the fluid and mutually constitutive link between identity, space and built form.

LINKAGE: Parks created by people across the site were used to generate the main concept. The relation
ship of the building to its built and natural context is equally significant as the relationship to the people inhabiting, passing
through and passing by the building.

FRAGMENTATION: The unique identity of the architecture lies in the fragmentation. Represented by a series of
vertical and horizontal planes, this fragmentation is symbolic of the multitude of individual identities which when
recognized and celebrated link to form a dynamic collective identity that is the building in its entirety.

TRANSFORMATION: In a transforming society solutions are required that will facilitate flexible development and
allow communities to evolve on their own. The building is able to accommodate functional variation over time and
adapt to the needs and requirements of the community. This transformation is also representative of the dynamic nature of
identities that are continually changing.

TRANSPARENCY: The forms and spaces created drive people in and do not intimidate them. It is a place where
people can learn, celebrate, commemorate and express their culture and identity. In order to encourage the creation of
collective space, the proposal uses existing permeable boundaries across which things are always moving. The physical
transparency symbolizes openness of the institution and the accessibility to all but also aims to address practical issues such
as safety, security and equality.

ART CENTRE - WENTWORTH

ODI DAVIÉB

DESIGN TREATISE REPORT

2006
Due to the importance of the existing paths, they were formalized into walkways that traverse the site and link the existing residential and commercial areas to the centre. The two major paths allow free access through the site and terminate at the west of the site adjacent to an existing bus stop. The intersection of these paths forms the apex of the site and is marked by a landmark sculpture that also defines the public plaza as a courtyard.

The public includes an amphitheatre for informal performances and rituals and is intended as the heart of the centre, where people will gather. The site is wide and various other community events can be staged. Balconies on the upper levels frame the courtyard and provide a sense of continuity and fluidity of form and also allow for activity at all levels within the courtyard space.

The fragmented forms of which the building is constituted indicate around the site and respond to each other in a different manner. The edges of the site are intended to relate more to the human scale and are treated with smaller forms and softer treatment. The connection of the activity within in the building and that outside of the building is achieved through the high level of transparency and permeability of the facades.

The new development will incorporate the revitalisation of existing public and civic amenities such as the existing Community Hall to the north of the site, which will be used as a theatre/performance space if required. The extensive parking lot of the Community Hall will be used for the Art Centre.

1.6) PROBLEMS ARISING

Due to the sinuous form of the building, it became apparent that the edges of the site would have to be carefully treated in order to maintain a high level of activity. The north end of the public plaza will be shaded in the late afternoon and could become unpleasant in summer. It therefore appeared appropriate to open the restaurant to the east and west side so that the benefits of both these orientations could be exploited. Much of the central courtyard faces south-east and could result in major heat gain in the early mornings; however, this has been treated with interior shading devices which allow light in but reduce the amount of heat gain within the indoor spaces and still allow a level of transparency into the space.

As a result of the nature of the design issues of security and privacy arose, particularly at the building includes a residential component. The design had to allow for restricted access to certain areas and the complete closure of some areas at night without jeopardising the fluidity of the concept of the design. As a public building it was also of great importance to simplify aspects such as circulation, universal access and legibility of the buildings. The more objective in the resolution and attention to all of these problems arising was to ensure that the building still maintained an authentic expression of local identity whose meaning can be understood through its orientation, form, materials, construction processes and details.
LOT NO: 1269 OF AUSTERVILLE
AREA: 3400sqm
FAR: NONE
ZONING: INDETERMINATE ZONE

LOCATION
- Situated on the main road.
- Adjacent to the existing community hall and library.
- The site is a vacant open lot requiring an Environmental Assessment Report prior to any proposal development.
- It is at the hub of activity close to retail and commercial and institutional facilities.
- Situated close to existing infrastructure and can help to further improve the immediate area by encouraging the formalization of the area into a commercial and educational precinct.

ACCESS
- Easily accessible from all four sides with the longest facade facing Austerville Drive which is the main road.
- It is on the public transport route and within walking distance from surrounding schools and housing making it an ideal location for a building which could facilitate after school programs in the arts.
- The ease of access and variety of the site will also facilitate the use of the centre by groups or individuals from other areas.
- High traffic volumes are experienced along the main road, with medium traffic volume on Percy Jonston Road, and very low volumes on other roads.

TYPOGRAPHY
The site is reasonably flat due to its length but drops have a 3m drop from the south east corner of the site to the north west corner.

ORIENTATION
The site is almost directly north south facing with the two longest facades facing east and west.
- The east facade bounds the main road while the west facade bounds Stopper Road.

VISIBILITY
The site is clearly visible from all four sides but particularly from Austerville Drive.
- It is easy to locate due to its proximity to other landmark points such as the Community Hall and Engen Garage.

SITE ANALYSIS AND SELECTION

Design Treatise Report

JDI DAVIDS

2006
Views across the site to the existing Community Hall and barrack housing, as well as the shoe aling.

Existing commercial and retail facilities directly oppose the site on the main road.

Views of the site from Austerville Drive.

Diagram showing the analysis of the site and its existing context.

RT Centre - Wentworth

ODI Davids

Design Treatise Report

2006
Appendix D

ACCOMODATION SCHEDULE
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DESCRIPTION</th>
<th>FUNCTION</th>
<th>REQUIREMENTS</th>
<th>AREA SQM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ADMINISTRATION</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive Manager/ Director</td>
<td>In charge of the general running of the Centre. Co-ordinator of projects and workshops.</td>
<td>Must be private and secure, easily accessible and directly related to other staff offices and generous size for meetings.</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accountant</td>
<td>Bookkeeping and accounting for the Centre</td>
<td>General office with computer facilities and safe</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Relations Officer</td>
<td>All promotions and advertising for the Centre</td>
<td>Office space related to the manager and secretary</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Out Reach Co-ordinator</td>
<td>Initiates and co-ordinates outreach programmes generated by the Centre</td>
<td>Office space related to secretary and general admin</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretary/Reception and General Administration</td>
<td>Receptionist and general secretary for the administration of the Centre. Reception of guest, provision of facilities such as fax machines, photocopiers etc.</td>
<td>Large central space relating to all offices, located at the entrance to the admin area, waiting area for minimum of four people</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental Office Space</td>
<td>Office space rented out to other organisation or business for income</td>
<td>Access to general admin area, separate storeroom and general office space</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conference Room</td>
<td>For meetings of the Trustees and Advisory Board and any other meetings concerned with the operation of the Centre</td>
<td>Located within the admin area but easily accessible from the reception. Must accommodate at least ten people with adequate circulation. Provision for slide presentations. Well</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facility</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Ventilation, preferably air-conditioned. Access or view outside to the activity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Storeroom</th>
<th>General storage of stationary and filling</th>
<th>Must be secure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Staff Room</td>
<td>Informal meetings and refreshment facilities for admin area</td>
<td>Natural ventilation and light. Comfortable and relaxing environment. Close to tea kitchen. Accommodate about ten people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kitchenette</td>
<td>Preparation of drinks and light snacks for general staff and for meetings</td>
<td>Provision of sink, fridge and worktop. Related to staff and conference room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff Ablutions</td>
<td></td>
<td>Female: 1wc, 1whb Male: 1wc, 1urinal, 1whb</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**RETAIL**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Line shops (x6)</th>
<th>Facility for rental to small business or for artists to rent and sell their works</th>
<th>Accessible and visible to the public. Flexible arrangement to vary according to need and demand. Secure with independent access and service were possible</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cafeteria</td>
<td>To be run by external management. Drinks, light meals and snacks will be served to visitors as well as staff and learners. Will operate as a cafeteria by day and a Jazz Club by night, hosting supper theatre performances</td>
<td>Should be easily accessible to the public and artists. Well connected to major public spaces. Must have access to an outdoor area. Option of controlled access, point as payment will be required for</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
performs. Changes in level. To accommodate 120 people sitting and standing. Requires an effective public image for use as a social venue. Provision of ablutions: Female: 2wc, 2whb Male: 1wc, 1urinal, 1whb

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kitchen</th>
<th>Preparation of food and refreshments for the cafeteria</th>
<th>Direct access to cafeteria as well as loading and refuse area. Provision of associated stores and extraction system</th>
<th>40</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Internet Café</td>
<td>To be rented out and run by external management to provide computer, internet access, faxing, scanning and photocopying facilities to the community</td>
<td>Accessible from public areas. Secure and preferably air-conditioned</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>490</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**EXHIBITION SPACE**

| Interior Exhibition and Sculpture Garden | For the display of work produced in the centre | Should be accessible from all public spaces. Related to an outdoor exhibition space. Space needs to be flexible | 150 |
| Total                                   |                                             |                                                                                                               | 150|

**PERFORMING ART STUDIOS**

<p>| Dance Studio                  | To used on a daily basis for teaching purposes and as an informal performance and rehearsal venue | Large preferably square room with sprung timber flooring, sufficient height for jumping, mirrors along | 120 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Room Type</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Capacity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Drama Studio</td>
<td>To used on a daily basis for teaching purposes and as a rehearsal venue of any group up to a maximum of 40 people requiring such space. To be used at night as classrooms for adult education.</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group Music Room</td>
<td>For daily teaching purposes as well as use by groups requiring practice space such as local bands and choirs. To accommodate up to 40 people at a time</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Music Practice Rooms (x3)</td>
<td>Private, individual practice room for use by individual artists or small groups</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change Rooms(2)</td>
<td>Change rooms and ablutions for artists and students</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- of any group up to a maximum of 40 people requiring such space. May also be hired out for community functions, meetings etc.
- one wall to a height of two meters. Natural ventilation and daylighting preferably from above to avoid glare. Related to change rooms and prop store-room. Sound absorbent material on walls. Must allow for the space to be divisible into two rooms of equal size.
- Large well ventilated and lit space with mirrors on at least one wall. Must be related to change rooms and prop storage.
- Walls should not be parallel and must either be covered in sound absorbing material or sound-absorbing panels must be placed on them. Preferably air-conditioned. Provision for chalk-board and plug-points for amp or hi-fi.
- Requirements as for group music room.
| Storage(3) | Storage for props, musical equipment and instruments etc. | 60 |
| Total | | 500 |

**VISUAL ART STUDIOS**

<p>| Sculpture Studio | For metal work, woodwork and general sculpting, casting and moulding | Natural ventilation and light as well as a relationship to outside space. Activities to be grouped and separated around a common working space. Sinks required for every activity except woodwork. Metal work area to be designed around metal sheet lengths of 6m. | 200 |
| Photography Studio | For individual use or for group workshops and courses. | General space to be used as a classroom or as a studio with artificial lighting. | 70 |
| Dark Room | Developing and printing of photographs | General darkroom as well as individual darkroom booths require forced ventilation, specialised artificial lighting and a cold water supply. Safe storage is required for chemicals and equipment. | 30 |
| Ceramic Studio | For individual use or for group workshops | Natural ventilation and light as well as wide | 80 |
| <strong>General Studio Space</strong> | Provided for any of the following functions: painting, drawing, sewing, stagecraft, fabric painting and silk screening, relief printing, weaving and paper work. | Each area requires storage facilities and stainless steel sinks. Divisions between areas should be flexible to accommodate varying numbers of people for any activity. Where possible all studios should relate to an outside space. | 200 |
| <strong>Store Rooms(3)</strong> | Separate storage is required for the sculpture, photography and ceramic studios for general storage of equipment and artwork. | 3 secure store rooms with adequate space for equipment and art storage. To be easily accessible from studios. | 45 |
| <strong>Kitchen</strong> | Although the main public cafeteria is available artists should be provided with facilities to prepare their own refreshments and gather together. | Accessible from studios. Provision of sink, fridge, storage and worktop. Related to outdoor gathering/eating space. | 50 |
| <strong>Artists Ablutions</strong> | For the use of artists and students using the visual art studios. | Female: 3ws, 3whb Male: 3wc, 2, urinals, 3whb | 30 |
| <strong>Total</strong> | | | 705 |
| <strong>RESIDENTIAL</strong> | | | |
| <strong>Communal Accommodation</strong> | To provide accommodation for artists using the facilities in the centre and who require short term accommodation. | Requires communal facilities such as kitchens, dining area lounge, ablutions and storage. Accommodation including single and double rooms as well | 220 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Private Studio Apartments(4)</th>
<th>For use by resident and visiting artists, on a rental basis, who require semi-permanent residential facilities, self contained bachelor units are provided.</th>
<th>4 units each 40 sqm with general sleeping and living area as well as kitchenette and bathroom with wc, shwr and whb.</th>
<th>160</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Caretaker’s Flat</td>
<td>Accommodation for resident caretaker who is to stay on the premises permanently.</td>
<td>Requirements as for the studio apartments</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SERVICE AND MAINTENANCE</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance Office and store</td>
<td>General running and management of the maintenance aspects of the Centre and repairs to furniture and equipment which are to be carried out in the metal and wood working studios.</td>
<td>This office should be accessible from a service entrance.</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refuse Area</td>
<td>For the storage and collection of all refuse from the building including kitchen waste.</td>
<td>Needs to be accessible to the service entrance for easy removal. Secure and enclosed area with hose and floor drainage for cleaning as well as bins with wheels.</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Circulation 15%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>397.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL AREA</td>
<td>3044.05</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parking</td>
<td>For 30 cars. Additional parking available at Community Hall</td>
<td>Safe, secure parking on site for staff and visitors</td>
<td>450</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>