



**UNIVERSITY OF  
KWAZULU-NATAL**

---

**INYUVESI  
YAKWAZULU-NATALI**

**An examination of how *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* reported on Operation Dudula and foreign nationals: January to June 2022**

By	Luyanda Randy Xulu
Student Number	218085309
Protocol Reference Number	00004852
Supervisor	Prof Lauren Dyll

Submitted to the School of Applied Human Sciences, College of Humanities, University of Kwazulu-Natal in fulfilment of the requirements of a Masters' Degree in the Centre for Communication, Media and Society (CCMS).

December 2023

# COLLEGE OF HUMANITIES

## DECLARATION - PLAGIARISM

I, Luyanda Randy Xulu, declare that,

1. The research reported in this thesis, except where otherwise indicated, is my original research.
2. This thesis has not been submitted for any degree or examination at any other university.
3. This thesis does not contain other persons' data, pictures, graphs or other information, unless specifically acknowledged as being sourced from other persons.
4. This thesis does not contain other persons' writing, unless specifically acknowledged as being sourced from other researchers. Where other written sources have been quoted, then:
  - a. Their words have been re-written, but the general information attributed to them has been referenced
  - b. Where their exact words have been used, then their writing has been placed in italics and inside quotation marks and referenced.
5. This thesis does not contain text, graphics or tables copied and pasted from the Internet, unless specifically acknowledged, and the source being detailed in the thesis and in the References sections.

Signed

Luyanda Randy Xulu - 218085309

## **Dedication**

I dedicate this dissertation to my family, as I am the first person in my family to graduate at university. I hope this will inspire the upcoming generation in my family.

A special dedication goes to my mother Ntombifuthi Shabalala, who made it possible for me to further my studies at a tertiary institution. You have supported me throughout the journey and motivated me to always to put my best foot forward and to not give up no matter how hard it gets. I will always be grateful for your love, support, and encouragement.

I dedicate this work to my son Lukhanyiso Sydney Mseleku as God gifted me with him while I was working on my dissertation. Having him during this period of my life motivated me to focus on my end goal and gave me a reason to work tirelessly to make sure I complete this research.

## **Acknowledgements**

Firstly, I would like to thank God for his blessings and guidance, I would not have been able to gather the strength and resources to complete this research if he was not by my side. My sincere gratitude and appreciation is extended to my supervisor Prof Lauren Dyll for her contribution in completing this research. It would not have been possible for this study to happen without her support and vigorous supervision that kept me grounded and focused on completing the research.

I would also like to acknowledge Dr Quatro Mgogo for his knowledge and contribution as my mentor, I have acquired great knowledge and writing skills from his feedback on the study. My sincere gratitude goes to Ms Shannon Landers for her contribution as a mentor at the proposal stage.

I would like to thank my family and friends for their support and encouragement during my studies at University of Kwazulu-Natal.

## Abstract

The rise in xenophobic attacks in 2022 motivated this research. Black African migrants move to other countries in search of employment opportunities and greener pastures (Obiora *et al*, 2023). However, upon arrival they are often the victims of xenophobia. This study is particularly concerned with the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to black African migrants in the press. Operation Dudula is an organisation that has been accused to violently target black African immigrants, but it denies connection to xenophobic motives, insisting they are a crime-fighting group.

It explores how two South African based online publications *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* reported on Operation Dudula and foreign nationals and if their reporting supports or critiques xenophobic/Afrophobic attitudes and behaviours. A total of 31 articles published from January 2022 to June 2022 are studied using qualitative content analysis and discourse analysis to examine the language used by these newspaper articles to investigate how Operation Dudula is portrayed in relation to foreign nationals. The resulting themes are interpreted through the lens of Cultural Studies Representation Theory and the associated concepts of stereotyping, and othering that assists in understanding how certain representations connect language and meaning to culture.

The themes that are generated and dominant in this research are *accusations of non-compliance with South African law, Operation Dudula members believe South Africa is under attack and needs protection, and immigrants are accused of living in South Africa without proper documentation*. These themes assist the study to investigate how Operation Dudula was represented in both selected newspapers *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* and if these representations promote or demote xenophobic/Afrophobic attitudes and behaviours.

This study found that the subject positions of Operation Dudula and local South African citizens are often foregrounded in the articles, including quotes from both of these groups. However, foreign nationals are not (or seldom) afforded the same opportunity to voice their opinions or concerns. The reporting language often frames Operation Dudula as the protector of South African citizens, seeking social justice through marches and activism. In comparison, the reporting language used to describe the foreign nationals portrays them as helpless and fearful.

**Keywords:** Afrophobia, foreign nationals, representation, immigrant, South African newspapers, xenophobia.

## **List of Acronyms and Abbreviations**

CCMS	Centre for Communication, Media, and Society
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
SAMP	South African Migration Project
DoH	Department of Health
ACMS	African Centre for Migration and Society
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
SA	South Africa

## **List of Tables**

Table 1a: Blunt search for the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to foreign nationals in *Sowetan Live*

Table 1b: Blunt search for the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to foreign nationals in *Daily Sun*

Table 2a: Identifying sub-themes/categories for the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to foreign nationals (*Sowetan Live*)

Table 2b: Identifying sub-themes/categories for the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to foreign nationals (*Daily Sun*)

Table 3a: Identifying themes for the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to foreign nationals (*Sowetan Live*)

Table 3b: Identifying themes for the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to foreign nationals (*Daily Sun*)

Table 4.1 Sample size

## Table of Contents

DECLARATION – PLAGIARISM.....	ii
Dedication.....	iii
Acknowledgements.....	iv
Abstract .....	v
List of Acronyms and Abbreviations.....	vi
List of Tables .....	vii
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND.....	1
Introduction .....	1
Problem Statement .....	2
Background to the Study .....	5
Study Objectives .....	6
Study and Significance .....	7
Representation Theory .....	9
<i>Stereotyping</i> .....	10
<i>Othering</i> .....	11
Methodological Approach .....	12
<i>Research Paradigm</i> .....	12
<i>Research Approach</i> .....	13
<i>Research Design</i> .....	13
<i>Data Collection</i> .....	14
<i>Purposive Sampling</i> .....	15
Methods of Analysis.....	17



<i>Qualitative Content Analysis</i> .....	17
<i>Discourse Analysis</i> .....	18
Structure of the Study .....	19
CHAPTER TWO LITERATURE REVIEW .....	20
Introduction .....	20
Conceptualising Xenophobia, Racism and Afrophobia .....	21
<i>Xenophobia</i> .....	22
<i>Racism</i> .....	22
<i>Afrophobia</i> .....	23
The reporting of Xenophobia in South African print media .....	25
Xenophobia in South Africa .....	30
<i>Criminalisation of black African migrants</i> .....	31
<i>Burden to healthcare facilities</i> .....	32
<i>Taking women from local men</i> .....	34
The Overview of Black African Migration to South Africa .....	35
<i>Push factors</i> .....	36
<i>Socio-economic push factors</i> .....	37
<i>Socio-political push factors</i> .....	37
<i>Pull factors</i> .....	37
<i>Socio-economic pull factors</i> .....	38
<i>Socio-political pull factors</i> .....	38
South African migration policies and Governmental interventions .....	38
Operation Dudula: A background... ..	39
Media's coverage of Operation Dudula .....	40

Conclusion.....	41
CHAPTER THREE: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK .....	43
Introduction .....	43
Representation theory.....	44
<i>Representation and language</i> .....	46
<i>Representation and identity</i> .....	47
<i>Media representation</i> .....	49
<i>Stereotypical representation</i> .....	51
<i>Othering</i> .....	54
Conclusion.....	57
CHAPTER FOUR RESEARCH METHODOLOGY ... ..	58
Introduction .....	58
<i>Research Paradigm</i> .....	58
<i>Qualitative Research Approach</i> .....	59
<i>Research Design: Hermeneutics</i> .....	61
Data Collection .....	62
<i>Purposive Sampling</i> .....	62
<i>Temporal Sampling</i> .....	64
Methods of Analysis.....	65
<i>Qualitative Content Analysis</i> .....	65
<i>Discourse Analysis</i> .....	67
Validity and Reliability .....	69
Limitations.....	70
Conclusion.....	70

CHAPTER FIVE: DATA PRESENTATION .....	71
Introduction .....	71
Table 1a: Blunt search for the representation of foreigners ( <i>Sowetan Live</i> ) .....	72
Table 1b: Blunt search for the representation of foreigners ( <i>Daily Sun</i> ) .....	74
Table 2a: Identifying codes for representation of foreigners ( <i>Sowetan Live</i> ).....	75
Table 2b: Identifying codes for representation of foreigners ( <i>Daily Sun</i> ) .....	76
Table 3a: Identifying themes for representation of foreigners ( <i>Sowetan Live</i> ).....	78
Table 3b: Identifying themes for representation of foreigners ( <i>Daily Sun</i> ) .....	81
Conclusion .....	84
CHAPTER SIX: ANALYTICAL DISCUSSION .....	85
Introduction .....	85
Discussion of themes.....	85
<i>Accusations of non-compliance with the South African Law</i> .....	86
<i>Immigrants are accused of living in South Africa without proper documentation</i> .....	88
<i>Taking the birthright of South Africans</i> .....	89
<i>The South African government is accused of not dealing with illegal migration</i> .....	89
<i>Operation Dudula members believe South Africa needs to be protected</i> .....	90
<i>Foreign nationals are suffering as SA's rage increases</i> .....	90
<i>Immigrants should be treated as human beings with rights</i> .....	91
<i>South African men losing their women to foreign nationals</i> .....	92
<i>Foreign nationals are perceived to be well equipped with business skills</i> .....	92
<i>Operation Dudula members target foreign nationals who live in township areas</i> .....	92
<i>Analysis and discussion of identified themes</i> .....	93
Conclusion .....	97

CHAPTER SEVEN: CONCLUSION.....	99
Introduction .....	99
Summary and Synthesis of Findings.....	100
Narratives that dominate the reporting of Operation Dudula .....	101
Evidence in terms of reporting language that support xenophobia .....	102
Evidence in terms of reporting language that critiques xenophobia.....	103
Contributions to the field of the study.....	104
Suggestions for Further Research.....	104
Bibliography .....	106

# **Chapter One**

## **Introduction**

Broadly speaking this study explores the role of media in society. The media is not only a source of information and entertainment for society through various channels such as radio, television, and newspapers, it also produces ideas and discourses that support power relations (Smith, 2009). In other words, it plays a significant role in constructing, disseminating, and even challenging certain representations.

This study is particularly concerned with the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to black African migrants in the press. Operation Dudula is an organisation that became a political party in South Africa. It has been accused of violently targeting black African immigrants, but it denies connection to xenophobic motives, insisting they are a crime-fighting group (Bornman, 2021; Bhengu, 2022).

It is evident from the two sources referred to in the previous sentence, and as will be shown in this chapter and the literature review chapter, that the press report on Operation Dudula as xenophobic, and also provides a space for Operation Dudula to deny such claims. This study's broad aim is therefore to examine how two South African newspapers, promote or demote xenophobic or Afrophobic ideas and thinking through their reporting language. With the popularity of online news sources, this study is based on selected online news articles from *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* that were published from January 2022 to June 2022. Online technologies are growing and moving ahead of traditional journalism as the internet has become cheaper and provides new opportunities for both the readers and the journalism sector with regard to "instantaneity, access, consumption, and interactivity (Karaaslan, 2019: 1).

This chapter outlines the problem statement, placing the study within debates around the broader societal issue of xenophobia and moves to present the precise issue in terms of the study objectives and research questions. A background to the study is provided including a description of Operation Dudula. The chapter also includes an explanation of the study's significance. It provides a brief account of the study's theoretical and methodological approaches, concluding with an outline of the structure of the study.

## Problem Statement

Previous research has been conducted on the interaction between newspaper stories and dominating groups, as well as how meanings are created and portrayed (Tomaselli, 2012:16). Additionally, previous research examines how foreign nationals are represented in the press. However, there is a gap in how organised groups/organisations associated with xenophobia are represented. This study, in particular, examines how *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* reported on the organisation of Operation Dudula and foreign nationals. The proposed study aims to develop on previous research from the Centre for Communication, Media, and Society (CCMS) on media reporting of xenophobia in South Africa (Jani, 2018; Khwebulana, 2021). However, the new focus of this study reflects on current instances of xenophobic-related matters as it centres on the reporting of Operation Dudula news stories to examine how the selected publications, *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* promote or demote xenophobic or Afrophobic ideas and thinking through their reporting language.

Movements and organisations blame foreign nationals for problems that exist in South Africa (Fetheka, 2022). Over the years an increase in xenophobic attacks has been evident in South Africa (Solomon and Kosaka, 2013). As the distinction between xenophobia and Afrophobia is not an objective of this study, the terms will be used interchangeably, as other scholars tend to do (Kgari Masondo & Masondo, 2019). However, the study is cognizant of the difference between the two terms. Xenophobia more generally refers to “a fear and hatred of foreigners often reflected in harassment of minority ethnic groups” (Bealey, 1999: 344). Afrophobia more specifically refers to the phenomenon that describes the “specificities of racism and discrimination that target people of African descent on the basis of a socially constructed idea of race. As the most recent report on Afrophobia describes” (Butticci, 2020: 171).

African nationals across various African countries migrate to South Africa with dreams of improving their lives or residing in the country as asylum seekers, students, and skilled workers (Solomon and Kosaka, 2013). Foreign nationals who are labelled ‘immigrants’ in South Africa maintain a permanent position in the country as they intend on staying in the country for longer periods and some with no intentions of leaving unlike migrants who are considered to be on a temporary stay (The International Organization for Migration, 2011). A refugee is defined as someone who has fled his country of birth due to the fear of being persecuted for various reasons and seeks protection by migrating to another country (Harris, 2001). An asylum seeker is a person

who is still waiting for his/her asylum claims to be examined to distinguish whether his/her fear of persecution is well-founded (United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, 1998: 2). Migrants or refugees could be granted permanent status in the country under certain conditions for example, after five years of temporary legal employment in the country may become a permanent resident (White Paper on International Migration, 1999). Another way to obtain permanent residence is through application with regards to receiving a permanent offer of employment without the requirement of prior temporary work for five years within the country (White Paper on International Migration, 1999). In the case of a refugee who intends on extending their stay and not returning to their respective countries, if the refugee is granted asylum, they may apply for naturalisation after a period of five years (The International Organization for Migration, 2011).

The influx of foreign nationals migrating into South Africa has brought about turmoil and conflicts as many South African citizens believe that some immigrants do not have legal permits to allow them to reside in the country (Solomon and Kosaka, 2013) and feel that the limited resources and employment opportunities will take further strain. Several words in local languages are used to describe foreign nationals for example, in IsiZulu immigrants are referred to as “*Amakwerekwere*” and “*Abantu bokufika*” by South African locals (Hickel, 2014:14). *Amakwerekere* is a derogatory term that is used to describe a person who speaks illiterately or just “blabbers” (Hickel, 2014: 1). This is mostly directed to black migrants who come from other African countries and not to white immigrants who come from all across the world. The idea behind the term “*Amakwerekwere*” explains the sense of belonging and non-belonging in South Africa as African immigrants are imagined and treated as despicable ‘others’ who should return to their original countries (Amusan and Mchunu, 2017: 9).

In April 2015, the late Zulu King, Goodwill Zwelithini delivered a speech to a crowd about removing foreign nationals in our country (Misago and Landau, 2022). He compared foreign nationals to bed bugs as he stated that they needed to lay bare in the sun. He requested that all foreign nationals should take all their belongings and be sent back to their countries (Misago and Landau, 2022). After the late King Zwelithini’s speech, reported on by a variety of newspapers, the streets of Durban and Johannesburg were filled with violence as people looted and destroyed immigrant-owned shops (Misago and Landau, 2022).

The Refugee Act No. 138 (1998: 20) states that refugees have the right to seek, live and study in South Africa, they have a right to education, and access to essential services just like the citizens of the country. South Africa is known to pride itself in being a rainbow nation and has a well-known phrase which is “*umuntu ngumuntu ngabantu*” in Isizulu and “*motho ke motho kabatho babang*” in Setswana (Kgari-Masondo and Masondo, 2019: 89). This phrase is encapsulated in the concept of *Ubuntu* which basically means that a person cannot become without the presence of another (Kgari-Masondo and Masondo, 2019). *Ubuntu* is a principle that encourages unity and humanity among every individual (Amusan and Mchunu, 2017). However, the notion of South Africa being a rainbow nation is complicated as it is gradually becoming unstable (Hickel, 2014). Due to the competition of limited resources between local residents of South Africa and foreign natives, the concept of ubuntu in South Africa seems to be distorted. Dehumanising the ‘other’ is a state of disruption that hinders a person from becoming (Kgari-Masondo and Masondo, 2019). It is a state of instability and disorder which infers anti-social actions that may encompass violence or discrimination which acts as a factor in hindering the other from becoming (Kgari-Masondo and Masondo, 2019). Arguably instrumental in this othering is Operation Dudula as will be discussed below.

### *Operation Dudula*

Operation Dudula is a splinter group from a faction in the Put South Africans First movement. Operation Dudula claims that its mission is to have only undocumented immigrants returned to their respective countries and not immigrants who are here legally (Myeni, 2022). They believe that it is unfair for South Africans to share the limited resources they have with undocumented immigrants as this causes problems for South African locals. Moreover, Operation Dudula was developed as a patriotic campaign to address issues of crime, lack of jobs and poor health services which they believe are caused by the influx of undocumented immigrants residing in South Africa (Mthombeni, 2022). Dudula which is an IsiZulu word meaning “to force out or knock down” alludes to the objective of the organisation of expelling immigrants (Mthombeni, 2022). This organisation gained popularity as an anti-immigrant campaign, engaging in activities that target foreign nationals residing in foreign nationals staying in South Africa (Khau, 2022).

Operation Dudula led their first march throughout Soweto on the 16th of June 2021 with a focus on informal traders who were black African immigrants and those believed to be involved in international drug operations (Mthombeni, 2022). Operation Dudula began in Gauteng province but later expanded to KwaZulu Natal, Northern Cape and the Western Cape provinces (Mthombeni, 2022). This initiative shut down food stalls maintained by foreign nationals who



were unable to produce the necessary paperwork for conducting business or a current passport (Sibanda, 2022).

Operation Dudula has been labelled as a xenophobic vigilante group by online news stories (Mthombeni, 2022). However, it is vital to note that the actions of the Operation Dudula movement may be perceived as Afrophobic rather than xenophobic as it targets black African immigrants rather than white immigrants (Myeni, 2022). Operation Dudula is perceived to only target foreign nationals who are from disadvantaged backgrounds, who are employed in precarious jobs, who rent shacks, or who live in informal settlements (Myeni, 2022). They do not target foreign nationals who reside in luxury or decent settlements in places like Sandton as they may also be involved in some sort of criminal act (Khau & Sibanda, 2022). However, the members of Operation Dudula dispute these allegations claiming that the movement aims to improve the conditions of the township communities by removing undocumented foreign nationals and providing opportunities for marginalised South Africans (Khau, Sibanda & Mthombeni, 2022). Operation Dudula members claim that the movement is a ‘peaceful-loving’ movement which is aimed at creating a better South Africa that is free from undocumented immigrants (Khau, Sibanda, & Mthombeni, 2022).

Foreign nationals from other African countries migrate to South Africa in high numbers under the perception that South Africa has a favourable economic, political, and social climate (Mthombeni, 2022). Moreover, when this happens most foreign nationals migrate in numbers to places around South Africa and end up competing for resources with locals (Mthombeni, 2022). This causes tension between foreign nationals and South African locals as they believe they are obligated to protect South Africa for its citizens before its resources deplete (Mthombeni, 2022).

Operation Dudula is thus a controversial group. The study’s precise issue is therefore premised on the idea that identifying it as the central focus of newspaper reporting, will reveal new nuances and understandings of their perceived relations with black African migrants. This focus is concretised in the study’s research questions and objectives.

### **Background to the Study**

This study examines two online newspapers, *Sowetan Live* and the *Daily Sun*. *Sowetan Live* is published by Arena Holdings in Johannesburg, Gauteng province (Sowetan Live, 2022). *Daily Sun* is published by Media24 owned by Naspers in Johannesburg, Gauteng province (Media24, 2022).

There is a purposeful selection of two publications *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* as they cover daily political, social, entertainment and sports news. *Daily Sun* is South Africa's largest daily paper with a readership of 3,821,000 (Media24, 2022). It was launched by Media24 in 2002 and is owned by Naspers which is a multinational internet and media company (Els, 2013). Naspers operates in over 130 countries and owns major brands like OLX, and MWeb. Media24, Multichoice, PayU, Supersport, DSTV and Mnet (Els, 2013). *Daily Sun* targets black readers who are English literate with a minimum high school education and the working class in the townships (Steenveld and Strelitz, 2010).

*Daily Sun* is a tabloid with a sensational style of writing, it aims to validate the identity of its readers by reporting in a colloquial style and it relates to the everyday struggles and frustrations of the readers (Media24, 2022). *Daily Sun* is currently the most-read newspaper with a readership of 4.3 million (Media24, 2022). *Sowetan Live* is published by Arena Holdings in 1981 (Sowetan Live, 2022). *Sowetan Live* has a circulation of 124,000 in sales with an audience of 1.5 million readers per month (Sowetan Live, 2022). *Sowetan Live* is also a tabloid that takes on a journalistic formal style of writing. *Sowetan Live* is a daily newspaper that is published in English and also targets English-literate black readers (Mokwena, 2014).

These publications were sampled because they are both available in print and online newspapers, they both use English to cover news stories and are interested in targeting the black audience in townships. These features show that the stories they produce would possibly reach a large audience. They are both affordable as they offer free online subscriptions to the readership.

### **Study Objectives**

To explore the narratives that dominate the reporting of Operation Dudula and their treatment of foreign nationals in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* between January 2022 and June 2022.

To do so, this study seeks:

1. To identify what evidence there may be in the reporting that supports Afrophobic/xenophobic thinking (othering, negative stereotypes) in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*.
2. To identify what evidence there may be in the reporting language that may critique Afrophobic/xenophobic thinking.

To operationalise these objectives the study is guided by the following key research questions:

1. What narratives dominate the reporting of Operation Dudula and their treatment of foreign nationals in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*?
  1. What evidence is there, in terms of reporting language, to support that reporting may be viewed or labelled as Afrophobic/xenophobic?
  - b. What evidence is there, in terms of reporting language, to support that the reporting critiques Afrophobic/xenophobic thinking?

### **Study Significance**

Newspapers play a significant role in communicating information about migrants to South African communities and they offer space for people to discuss and debate issues (Smith, 2009:18). This study is important because; newspapers are powerful media actors, and a reliable resource for studying a phenomenon over some time (Tanacković *et al*, 2014: 2- 3). Nonetheless, newspapers can also be either sensationalist or subscribe to and promote certain ideologies, be they detrimental to certain (marginalised groups) within society or not (Tanackovic *et al*, 2014). In their reporting they can also directly influence society (Danso and McDonald, 2000). For example, in the context of this broader topic, Quatro Mgogo and Oluyinka Osunkunle (2020) studied headlines from five South African newspapers over a period of almost ten years. Through the use of derogatory terms in the reporting of black African migrants, Mgogo and Osunkunle found that the reporting was manipulative and arguably incited more xenophobic-related violence. Further discussion will be provided in Chapter Two as the Literature Review.

“While a significant amount of research has been conducted on xenophobia, little has been written about how it has been mediated, particularly in the mainstream and social/alternative media in the Global South (Moyo and Mpofu, 2020: 4). This study subscribes to the definition of mediation as, “the process by which everyday practices and social relations are historically shaped by mediating technologies and media organisations, as opposed to its general publications about processes of ‘conciliation, intervention, or negotiation” (Livingstone, 2009: ix-x). Language is central in this process of mediation.

It is vital to study the language of newspapers, as they reflect the language structure of the majority of readers or audience (Tanacković *et al.*, 2014). The discourse is, therefore, informed by the

targeted readership (Abalu, 2017). Since the 1990s the South African media has produced language that carries stereotypical phrases (Smith, 2008: 10) and discourse that associates irregular migration with illegality (Mawadza and Crush, 2010: 367). The study therefore seeks to analyse the words and metaphors and the thematic patterns of these in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*.

The issue of discrimination against foreign nationals is a global issue as people migrate to other countries in search of a better life or to seek refuge. The matter of migrants is relevant today given the migration crises in Africa and Europe (Carballo *et al*, 2017). “The 2016 United Nations (UN) high-level summit for refugees and migrants held in New York put the number of displaced people worldwide at 65 million, the UN estimates that one in every 30 people in the world meets the definition of a migrant” (Carballo *et al*, 2017: 252). Furthermore, with such high numbers of migrants in the world, South African citizens worry about migration as they fear it limits their chances of getting opportunities and employment (Crush, 2008). South Africans tend to possess a negative attitude towards migrants as they perceive black African migrants as undesirable people (Pineteh, 2017). This contrasts the idea of ubuntu that South Africa supposedly possesses.

In 1994, South Africa was declared to be a democratic country, and everyone was intended to have equal rights as apartheid was buried. The people of South Africa commemorated the different cultures and languages that existed in the country.

However, the notion that South Africa is a Rainbow Nation is rather confusing now as this concept has become increasingly and alarmingly unstable (Hickel, 2014). The concept of multiculturalism has dismally failed, the notion that people from different cultures may co-exist has not entirely worked (Auestad, 2014). This is evident as South Africa still engages in xenophobic attacks against black African immigrants. This can be illustrated in two ways, the first one being derived from the Marxist or political economy approaches which claims that the neoliberal policy and structural adjustment undermine societies and evoke violence as people compete over limited resources such as jobs and housing (Hickel, 2014). The second process focuses on the politics of identity, it explains that the “cultural flows” signify globalisation as a process that induces a state of “hybridity, flux and moral anomie” which in turn triggers the impulse to reconstruct social boundaries in a violent manner (Hickel, 2014: 104). This study seeks to investigate and discuss how South Africans perceive foreign nationals.

There seems to be a misconception in the media that there are too many migrants in South Africa and most of them are undocumented (Kariithi *et al*, 2017). A popular discourse in the media is that ‘migrant steals jobs’ (Thompson, 2014). However, it is often unrealised that migration brings huge benefits, fueling growth, innovation, and entrepreneurship in both the countries the migrants come from and in those they move to (Kariithi *et al*, 2017). There is an apparent interconnectedness between society and the media therefore, it is important to understand how migrants are represented in the media and how this influences the opinion of the society (Fine and Bird, 2002). This study assumes that a balanced and fair representation of black African migrants in the media may result in quashing the xenophobia that is witnessed in South Africa.

### **Representation Theory**

To achieve its objectives, this study is conceptually guided by Representation Theory (Hall, 1997 & 2013) as this study takes on a constructionist stance in understanding the newspaper, as media representation is a construction. Representation means “using language to say something meaningful about or to represent the world meaningfully to other people” (Hall, 2013: 1). Representation through language is vital and central to the ways and processes by which ideas are shaped and formed in a particular society and culture (Mbetga, 2014).

Representation plays an important role in the process whereby meaning is produced and exchanged between members of a certain culture (Hall, 1997). Culture is concerned with the production and exchange of meanings, the giving and taking of meaning between members of a society or group (Hall, 2013). Representation is a cognitive practice that enables people in society to be social beings and situate themselves in a manner that will allow them to affirm their identities and defend themselves when attacked by others (Howarth, 2002). It encompasses the use of language, signs, and images to represent or symbolise things (Hall, 1997). To perceive knowledge people should understand the concept of representation and the linkage between the Self and Other objects that allows for its existence in the society (Jovchelovitch, 2007). Representation presents experiences, voices, and people that are constantly interpreted and represented to constitute their realities (Howarth, 2002). In the context of this study, the focus is on how newspapers use specific language to report on Operation Dudula, in the wider socio-cultural context of xenophobia. It will conduct a textual analysis to explore how Operation Dudula is represented, or encoded (Hall, 1980/2001). While this study is aware that meaning is only made when a reader decodes or interprets the reporting, based on their own frameworks of knowledge (Hall, 1980/2001), this study does not conduct a reception analysis in order to identify these readings.

The participants in culture give meaning to people, objects, and events (Hall, 1997). Members of the same culture typically share “sets of concepts, images and ideas” allowing them to view and interpret the world in a similar way (Hall, 1997: 4). In this manner the way they think and feel forms part of the “systems of representation” in which our concepts, images and emotions represent our mental life and other things present in the outside world (Hall, 1997: 4). They give meaning to people, objects, and events through frameworks of interpretation and how they integrate them into their daily practices (Hall, 2013).

Meaning is fluid, changing over time and people tend to interpret the world differently regarding their frames of reference and in order to communicate efficiently there is a need for a common understanding (Foucault, 1980). Foucault (1980) argues that discourse produces the object of knowledge and that nothing meaningful exists outside discourse. Discourse is a system of representation (Wetherell et al, 2001). It can be viewed as a group of statements that provides language, a way of representing knowledge about a topic or moment (Wetherell et al, 2001). According to Wetherell et al (2001), discourse produces knowledge through language. However, all practices that are social have meaning and meaning enhances and influences our conduct hence all practices entail a discursive aspect (Hall, 1997). The idea behind discourse is not about whether things are real or not but about where meaning comes from (Foucault, 1980).

### *Stereotyping*

Stereotyping can be defined as a socially constructed grouping of particular groups and people as often highly simplified and generalised signs which implicitly or explicitly represent a set of values, judgements and assumptions concerning their behaviour, characteristics, or history (O’Sullivan et al, 1994). Stereotypes are included in the representation theory with regards to social representation and identity construction. Stereotyping reduces people to a few, simple and essential characteristics which are fixed by nature (Hall, 2013: 5). Stereotypes grapple the few simple, vivid memorable characteristics of a person that are easily grasped and widely recognised, they then reduce everything about the person to those traits (Hall, 2013). Stereotypes deploys the strategy of “splitting” (Hall, 2013: 6).

The mutual stereotyping of foreigners by South Africans and of South Africans by foreigners essentialises and exaggerates perceived cultural differences and gives rise to prejudice and antagonism (Harris, 2002). Othering expands to different areas of knowledge that alludes, in

addition to other things, to separating discourse that develop to social and political decisions of predominance and inferiority among the people who share the same values and out-groups (Us and them) (Dervin, 2015: 1).

News stories that indicate that foreign nationals are criminal and drug lords based on police arrest or the assumptions made in the society are classified as stereotypes (Danso and McDonald, 2001: 126). Stereotypes are an outrageous type of representation as they are developed by a procedure of choice (Dervin, 2015). Stereotyping sets up a “representational border between normal and the pathological, the acceptable and the unacceptable, what belongs and what does not or is others, between insiders and outsiders, us and them” (Hall, 2013: 246). Stereotyping in newspapers separates South Africans from foreigners by grouping all South Africans in one imagined community while casting foreigners outside of the group. Foreigners find it difficult to integrate due to the differences in language, dressing and culture and these the key sources of exclusion of foreigners (Pineteh, 2017). The media uses stereotypes to maintain the status-quo, to differentiate between the wanted and the unwanted to define us (locals/South Africans) and (them/foreign nationals) (Hall, 2013).

### *Othering*

Othering can be defined as modifying a dissimilarity into otherness by establishing an in-group (a group where a speaker belongs to) and an out-group (a group where a speaker does not belong to) (Staszak, 2008). Othering can be perceived as another form of representation. Othering is the outcome of a discursive process that forms through stigmatising a difference that is real or imagined caused by dominant in-group to the dominated out-group (Staszak, 2008). Othering incorporates a principle that enables individuals to be organised into two groups of ranking: us, the self and them, the other (Staszak, 2008). It consists of classification of the other person or group by setting aside and ignoring the involvement and individualism of a person (Clifford and Marcus, 1986).

Othering is the construction of the self/in-group and the other/out-group through identification of some desirable characteristics that the self/in-group has that the other/out-group lacks (Brons, 2015) The in-group is made up of one or more groups and sets itself apart by giving itself an identity whereas the outgroup is a group that lacks identity due to stereotypes that are greatly stigmatising (Staszak, 2008).



The outgroup are the others as they are prone to categories and customs of the dominant in-group as they cannot impose their own norms (Staszak, 2008). The outgroup (foreign nationals) is often grouped in lower categories in the hierarchy along with stigmatisations while the in-group (South Africans) rank themselves high in the hierarchy and setting themselves as different to the outgroup. The unevenness in the relations of power is focal to the construction otherness (Staszak, 2008). The dominant group positions itself to prescribe the value of its identity and to devalue the identity of others while enforcing corresponding discriminatory procedures (Staszak, 2008). Otherness is vital in providing an understanding as to how identities are constructed, power guides the representation of different groups (Hall, 1997).

Newspapers present and offer diverse representations of immigrants through language used and in use. Hall (1997:1) states that “in language we use signs and symbols to stand for or represent to other people our concepts and ideas and feelings. Language is one of the ‘mediums’ through which thoughts, ideas and feeling are represented in a culture”. This study seeks to investigate how certain representations of black foreign nationals in the *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* are constructed. Stereotypes that are mostly negative are evident on the media representation of the other ‘black African immigrants’ and these are widely accepted by the society (Mbetga, 2014). Representation plays a significant role in the process whereby meaning is produced and exchanged between members of a certain culture (Hall, 1997). The society share ideas and meanings about how they view black foreigners and they perception is sometimes linked to the media representations of the black foreigners in South Africa.

## **Methodological Approach**

### *Research Paradigm*

This study adopts a constructionist paradigm as it is interested in understanding how meaning is constructed through language. This study seeks to examine the language used in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* when reporting on Operation Dudula and if the language promoted or critiqued Afrophobic/xenophobic behaviour. Identity construction in media does not necessarily take place in isolation but also relates to other social, political and economic factors (Fourie, 2008). It is vital to recognise that the construction of identities exist as a result of contestations and power struggles and is influenced by material circumstances and forces.

(Fourie, 2008.) Identities can be perceived as stories that circulates throughout cultures in the processes of production consumption, regulation and representation (Champ, 2008). Champ



(2008: 87) states that “It is believed that the way a message is structured may influence how meanings are interpreted”. The media is able to influence the society and alter its opinion about a certain phenomenon through the choice of the headlines and words they use (Danso and McDonald, 2000). Additionally, the media may somewhat be responsible for promoting xenophobic/Afrophobic attitudes and behaviours. This will be done by investigating how *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* reported on Operation Dudula and their treatment of foreign nationals.

### *Research Approach*

This research is carried out using a *qualitative research* approach which is useful when collecting and analysing data that is written, seen, or heard. Qualitative research entails acquiring and analysing data in the form of written or spoken words, as well as data that is textual (Neuman, 2014). Similarly, the qualitative research method entails collecting and analysing non-numerical data, such as data in the form of words, films, and sounds (Neuman, 2014). Qualitative research integrates a “set of interpretive material practices that make the world visible” (Denzin and Lincoln, 2018: 45). Following this, the qualitative approach is useful for the purposes of this study as it aims to identify or ‘make visible’ the ways in which newspapers report on Operation Dudula and if/how the reporting may support and/or critique xenophobia. It focuses on transforming the world into a succession of representations (Denzin and Lincoln, 2018). Qualitative research uses language to understand the views surrounding the experiences of people and it creates a perception of a bigger realm of social relationships (Brennen, 2013).

### *Research Design: Hermeneutics*

Hermeneutics is the science of interpretation (Crotty, 1998). In this study the intent is to identify the main narratives that are used by *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* when reporting on Operation Dudula and their treatment of black African migrants residing in South Africa. The language used in this reporting is studied to determine if the two selected newspapers are arguably critical and/or supportive of xenophobic sentiments. This study encompasses news stories that are written, these are collected from *Sowetan Live*, and *Daily Sun* and the data collected will be coded and organised into themes. Hermeneutics is about interpreting meaning.

This study will investigate the meanings found in the selected newspapers *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* by identifying dominant narratives from these publications.

## *Data Collection*

Data collection is the process of acquiring qualitative data in such a way that the researcher can examine and assess the information or variables obtained is referred to as data collection (Johnston, 2014). Qualitative content analysis will be used for collecting data from *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* online publications. Language is a basic element of our human interactions and meanings of social realities are constructed through language (Brennen, 2013). This study uses content analysis to aid in this process as texts are known to provide traces of socially constructed reality and this may be understood by considering words, concepts, ideas, themes and issues and issues that reside in texts as they are considered within cultural context (Atkinson and Coffey, 2011).

Internet journalism and news has progressed to the point where it can be accessible at any time and from anywhere with an internet connection (Nguyen, 2010: 225). As a result, the researcher subscribed to two online news sites; the *Sowetan Live* and the *Daily Sun* will be used in this investigation. The two online news sites are chosen for the accessibility and the facility of availability to find all data catalogued by date and headline. The material used was acquired from the *Sowetan Live* [www.Sowetanlive.co.za](http://www.Sowetanlive.co.za) and the *Daily Sun* [www.dailysun.co.za](http://www.dailysun.co.za).

This study uses both these newspapers to gather and provide a substantial number of examples with the aim to include more than just one publication for some measure of representativity of the issues of representation of Operation Dudula and foreign nationals by online newspapers that targets locals residing in the townships (Mokwena, 2014; Steenveld and Strelitz, 2010).

## *Purposive sampling*

Purposive sampling will be employed in this research as a method used in qualitative research for recognition and arrangement of a variety of data cases for the effective operation of restricted resources (Patton, 2002). This sampling technique selects the most productive sample to answer the research question. Purposive sampling enables the researcher to make his or her own judgement when picking members in a population to participate in the investigation (Bernard, 2000). Furthermore, it is a method of deducing information about a whole population from a limited number of units (khan, 2014). However, no human participants were sampled in this study, this section explains the sampling procedure for *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* from January 2022 to June 2022.

This study incorporated 31 news articles obtained from January 2022 to June 2022 as the severity of the protests were most prominent during this time period (Teer-Tomaselli, 2021). Eighteen from the *Sowetan Live* and thirteen from the *Daily Sun*.

The search words to be used when conducting a blunt search are; Operation Dudula, xenophobia, foreigners, xenophobic attacks. This assisted the study to investigate the reporting of Operation Dudula using the most recent sample.

This study examines two online newspapers, *Sowetan Live* and the *Daily Sun*. *Sowetan Live* is published by Arena Holdings in Johannesburg, Gauteng province (Sowetan Live, 2022). *Daily Sun* is published by Media24 owned by Naspers in Johannesburg, Gauteng province (Media24, 2022).

There is a purposeful selection of two publications *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* as they cover daily political, social, entertainment and sport news. *Daily Sun* is South Africa 's largest daily paper with a readership of 3 821 000 (Media24, 2022). It was Launched by Media24 in 2002 which is owned by Naspers which is a multinational internet and media company (Els, 2013). Naspers operates in over 130 countries and owns major brands like OLX, MWeb. Media24, Multichoice, PayU, Supersport, DSTV and Mnet (Els, 2013). *Daily Sun* targets black readers who are English literate with a minimum high school education and the working class in the townships (Steenveld and Strelitz, 2010).

*Daily Sun* is a tabloid with a sensational style of writing, it aims to validate the identity of its readers by reporting in their colloquial style and it relates to the everyday struggles and frustrations of the readers (Media24, 2022). *Daily Sun* is currently the most read newspaper with a readership of 4.3 million (Media24, 2022). *Sowetan Live* is published by Arena Holdings in 1981 (Sowetan Live, 2022). *Sowetan Live* has a circulation of 124 000 in sales with an audience of 1.5 million readers per month (Sowetan Live, 2022). *Sowetan Live* is also a tabloid that takes on a journalistic formal style of writing. *Sowetan Live* is a daily newspaper that is published in English and also targets English literate black readership (Mokwena, 2014).

These publications were sampled because they are both available in print and as online newspapers, they both use English to cover news stories and are interested in targeting the black audience in townships. These features show that the stories they produce would possibly reach a large audience. They are both affordable as they offer free online subscription to the readership.

*Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* hold a degree of power in manufacturing and disseminating discourses on black African migrants. Both newspapers dwell much on local stories and both newspapers are relevant to the South African community as local news is reported in an engaging manner. Most South Africans read news on their cell phones and computers.

Purposive sampling will be employed in this research as a method used in qualitative research for recognition and arrangement of a variety of data cases for the effective operation of restricted resources (Patton, 2002).

The temporal sampling is influenced by Operation Dudula's activities. Operation Dudula emerged during the year 2021 with the state as the aim of freeing South Africans from illegal immigrants (Ntuli, 2022). Their protests and activities to raise awareness of the foreign nationals residing in South Africa without proper documents peaked in January 2022 (Ntuli, 2022). Therefore, this study sampled data from news articles published between January 2022 to June 2022 as the severity of protests were most prominent during this time period (Teer- Tomaselli, 2021).

### *Methods of Analysis*

This study identifies and analyses the data using qualitative content analysis (Schreier, 2014) and the subsequent establishment of themes. These themes will then be analysed discursively in the light of Representation Theory to answer the study's research questions.

### *Qualitative Content Analysis*

Qualitative content analysis is relevant in a study that wants to identify forms of representation in newspaper content over a period of time (Deacon, 1999). It is used in order to identify specific "words, ideas, or concepts" within qualitative data (Teer-Tomaselli, 2021: 65). "Qualitative content analysis is a method for systematically describing the meaning of qualitative data" (Mayring and Schreier, 2012:172). Qualitative content analysis can be defined as a method that is used for systematically describing the meaning of qualitative data (Schreier, 2014). This can be accomplished by allocating consecutive chunks of the data to coding frame groupings (Schreier, 2014). Using content analysis allows the researcher to quantify and analyse the presence, meanings and relationships of such certain words, themes, or concepts (Patton, 2005).

This study examines the news stories in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* to identify either positive or negative reporting through the representation of foreign migrants in online tabloids. The researcher examines the representation of immigrants and Operation Dudula in *Sowetan*

*Live* and *Daily Sun* by examining the language used in the news articles and its headlines from January 2022 to June 2022.

In the qualitative content analysis process the study will incorporate coding tables that will include deductive codes which refer to information gathered from previous studies, terms and concepts from research on xenophobia and the representation of black African immigrants as criminals, Afrophobia, the difference between xenophobia and racism and the push and pull factors of black African immigrants to South Africa and inductive codes from data gathered in the *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* news articles.

The first phase includes a blunt search for suitable news stories. The search words to be used when conducting a random search are; Operation Dudula, xenophobia, foreigners, xenophobic attacks, Afrophobia. However, no news articles were found when conducting a search using the word Afrophobia.

The second phase includes a table with the second sets of tables that develops the second iteration by purposeful sampling from the first sets of tables by identifying sub- themes/categories. Sub-themes, otherwise known as categories, are ideas that are directly expressed in the text (Ravindran, 2019).

The last phase presents information on theme identification. These themes will assist in directly addressing what narratives dominate the reporting of Operation Dudula and their treatment of foreign nationals in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*, and whether that reflect or critique xenophobia. Themes are “patterns of shared meaning, united by a central concept or idea (Braun and Clarke 2013; Braun et al. 2014). This means themes might draw together data that on the surface appear rather disparate. Braun and Clarke (2020: 14) like to think of themes as stories “– stories we tell about our data” (Braun and Clarke, 2020:14).

This analytical process guided by representation theory will allow the identification and interpretation of the dominant stories associated with Operation Dudula and black foreign nationals.

### *Discourse Analysis*

Discourses are broad systems of meaning and can be found in various forms such as texts, conversations, images, writing and videos (Waitt, 2005). Discourses are ways of representing (Fairclough, 2003). Discourse is a “group of statements which provides a language for talking about a way of representing the knowledge about a particular topic at a particular historical moment, discourse is about the production of knowledge through language. However, since all

social practices entail meaning and meanings shape and influence what we do our conducts all practices have a discursive aspect” (Hall, 1992: 291).

The use of language is affected by ideologies of people which may be referred to as ‘belief systems or foundational social beliefs of a general or abstract nature’ (Els, 2013). The media is responsible for not only relaying information to the public but also to distributes notions and discourses to support specific power relations (Smith, 2009: 18). Fairclough (2001: 2) states that ‘the ideological workings of language realise the exercise of power’. Struggles associated to power find their battleground in the body of texts as texts reinforce or change ideological perceptions (Els, 2013). Ideologies such as dominance and inequality are recognised within the social dimension. Positive and negative ideologies such as racist versus antiracist ideologies may refer to either positive or negative connotations. (Els, 2013). Negative ideologies are problematic as they may incur inequalities (Els, 2013).

Representation theory is employed in this study to expose how certain aspects, people (African migrants) and cultures of the world are represented and portrayed through discourse practices (Fairclough, 2003). Many ideologies develop as a result of legitimatising or management of group conflicts, power relationships and dominance (Els, 2013). This study seeks to investigate the underlying negative and positive ideologies that are embedded within the discourse of the *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*.

This study examines the discourses emerging from the language used by *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* when reporting on how Operation Dudula and foreigners are represented. Representation means using language to relay meaningful information about, or to represent the world to others (Hall, 2013). It encompasses the use of language, signs, and images to represent or symbolise things (Hall, 1997). Discourse analysis assists this study in examining the language (including metaphors) in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* to reveal how it constructs certain representations that either reflect or critique xenophobic sentiments.

### **Structure of the Study**

The first chapter includes the introduction, problem statement, background to the study, research question objectives, rationale and significance of the study, theoretical and methodological approaches, and the structure of the study.

The second chapter presents the literature review which encompasses past studies and sources which lay the contextual and scholarly foundation for this research. It discusses the representation of migrants in newspapers particularly the representation of black African migrants by investigating previous studies guided by these scholars (Solomon and Kosaka, 2013; Mgogo and Osunkunle, 2020; Neocosmos, 2006; Dube, 2018; Tafira, 2018; Tshishonga, 2015; Akinola, 2018 and Hickel, 2014).

Chapter three is the theoretical framework of the study. This chapter describes Stuart Hall's (1997 and 2013) theory of representation. This theory explains how language is used to create meaning how it links to culture. This chapter also reviews notions of stereotype (Hall 1997;2013; Dervin, 2011), representation (Hall, 1997 and 2013; Howarth, 2002; Jovchelovitch, 2007; Foucault, 1980 and Wetherell, 2001) and Othering (Staszak, 2008; Brons, 2015; Clifford and Marcus, 1986).

Chapter four presents the methodology of the research including the constructionist paradigm, hermeneutic design as a qualitative textual analysis. It discusses how data gathered from *Sowetan live* and *Daily sun* online newspapers from January 2022- June 2022 using content analysis. The thematic and discursive approach is also explained. It also accounts for the ethical considerations of the study.

Chapter five presents the collected data from Sowetan Live and Daily Sun. It mainly comprises of coding tables, as part of the content analysis, that demonstrates the results of the blunt search, the categories and finally the significant themes that the study generates to elucidate the relationship between Operation Dudula and foreign nationals in the two newspapers.

Chapter six discusses the themes generated from the content analysis, in light of Representation Theory, in order to interpret the data to address the study objectives.

Chapter seven entails the synthesised of the study's main findings, in direct relation to the study objectives. It outlines areas of further research with regards to issues of representation of foreigners in the South African media.

## **Chapter Two**

### **Literature Review**

#### **Introduction**

The previous chapter laid the introductory foundations of this study. It provides the problem statement on the role newspapers play in constructing and disseminating representations. This chapter aims to present an examination of previous scholarship on the representation of black African migrants in the press, as well as research on the phenomenon of xenophobia today (Dube, 2018, Smith, 2009, Solomon and Kosaka, 2013, Pineteh, 2017 and Kariithi *et al*, 2017). The selected literature contextualises this study by placing it in an existing body of scholarship to which this study will contribute. This review is therefore, structured according to the following themes: Defining Key Terms: Xenophobia, Racism and Afrophobia; Xenophobia in South Africa: Criminalising black African nationals and the Government's response and the Migration of black African nationals in South Africa.

This chapter reviews relevant literature that encompasses the representation of black African migrants in South African newspapers. Relevant studies were reviewed to understand how black African migrants are portrayed (Danso and McDonald. 2001; Mawadza and Crush, 2010; Fine and Bird, 2003; Mgogo & Osunkunle, 2021). Based on this past scholarship, this study argues that negative stereotypical representations are indeed evident in the South African press. Black African migrants are represented and linked with themes such as 'illegals, undocumented people, drug lords, criminals, and job stealers' (Danso and McDonald, 2001). Thus, these insights assist the study to formulate and answer the fundamental research questions.

The media plays an important role in message publications transmission and is a potent tool for conveying developmental, educational, and political ideas (Danso and McDonald, 2000:1). The media refers to channels of mass communication (Mgogo, 2019). The media is responsible for not only relaying information to the public but also propagating discourses that can either support or challenge specific power relations (Smith, 2009: 18). The South African media is accused of publishing xenophobic related stories that are not consistent, lack balance and



use language that is offensive and discriminatory in their description of foreign nationals, particularly black African migrants (Mgogo & Osunkunle, 2021). This latter focus of discrimination and violence towards black African nationals known as Afrophobia, which will be discussed in this chapter. In this particular case the Afrophobia is felt by South African locals towards black African nationals, as an '*us vs them*' relationship (Moyo and Mpofo, 2020). Some reports have identified that Operation Dudula has spurred on this Othering. The relationship and the frequency of bias and unbiased reporting of migrants in the press is discussed as this further clarifies the role of the media in creating migrant identities in the press and this can contribute to altering the public opinion. Thus, this study will discuss newspaper discourses that are used to describe black African migrants. As the focus is on Operation Dudula, this chapter includes a section that discusses previous press reporting of Operation Dudula.

This study is situated within cultural and media studies that investigates the relationship of language, discourse, and power. Furthermore, this attempts to analyse the relationship between texts (newspaper articles), contexts (society, dominant groups) and how meanings are produced and represented (Tomaselli, 2012: 16). The proposed study aims to develop on previous research from the Centre for Communication, Media, and Society on media coverage of xenophobia and Afrophobia in South Africa (Jani, 2018; Khwebulana, 2021). However, on the other hand, the study reflects on current instances of xenophobic-related matters as it examines the reporting of Operation Dudula news stories to understand how the selected publications, *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*, may promote or question xenophobic or Afrophobic ideas. Based on these views, below is the definition of key terms that form the definitional context of this study.

### **Conceptualising Xenophobia, Racism and Afrophobia**

#### *Xenophobia*

The term xenophobia has its origins on the Greek terms xeno which stands for stranger and phobia which stands for flight or fear (Mthombeni, 2022). Xenophobia refers to the fear or hatred of foreign immigrants or strangers (Solomon and Kosaka, 2013) by the nationals of the host state (Akinola, 2018). It encompasses behaviours and attitudes that show discrimination which often occurs in the form of violence, abuse and in other various forms that exhibit hatred (Solomon and Kosaka, 2013). The term illustrates the aversion towards different races, ancestries, and skin tones (Mthombeni, 2022). Xenophobia is founded in colonialism, and it is

primarily situated in the social and political system (Obiora *et al*, 2023) because colonialism enforced oppressive and malfunctioning separation tactics of boundaries of communities around Africa. This caused detachment amongst communities and states which thus created the differentiation between groups demarcation and disunity (Obiora *et al*, 2023).

Xenophobia is a global issue that affects most countries across the world as foreign nationals migrate from their country of birth to another in search of a better life. However, when this happens undocumented immigrants are perceived as a threat to the identity or individual rights of the country's citizens. This perceived threat is closely related to the idea of nationalism and is evident where poverty and unemployment are unchecked (Solomon and Kosaka, 2013). For example, in Africa, in Post colonial African regions have been short of viable harmony and unity along with reciprocal coexistence hence, there is xenophobia and communal clashes which compromises development of the economy and the stability of politics (Obiora *et al*, 2023).

Immigration is perceived as a controversial issue as there has been a migration surge taking place globally from the year 2015 (Kim, 2020). Refugees migrate in large numbers from the Middle East and Africa to seek asylum in Western European countries (Kim, 2020). As immigration is increasing xenophobia is seemingly increasing too (Kim, 2020). Xenophobia as a type of exclusion and discrimination is a global phenomenon, it is especially prevalent in contemporary whereby groups of South Africans discriminate against foreign nationals (Neocosmos, 2010). South Africans construct negative stereotypes about migrants (Pineteh, 2017). Additionally, South Africans perceive migrants as a threat, they are under the impression that some migrants migrate to South Africa unlawfully to cause problems (Pineteh, 2017). Black African migrants are viewed as criminals, job stealers and women snatchers (Danso & McDonald, 2001; Pineteh, 2017, Tafira, 2018). Xenophobia is a form of discrimination that is closely associated to racism and is "liable to affect anyone or any group that is considered non-indigenous" (Neocosmos, 2010: 1).

### *Racism*

Racism can be viewed as a branch of xenophobia as it is conceived as discrimination that is linked to biological traits or the pigmentation of the skin (Tafira, 2018). However, xenophobia involves all sorts of discriminations against people considered to be different and non-national (Akinola, 2018).

“Racism” as a term is seldom defined in an operational way (Tomaselli, 2000: 158), as it is a noun describing the state of being racist. In other words, subscribing to the belief that the people can or should be classified into races with different abilities and dispositions, which results in the motivation of a political ideology in which rights and privileges are unequally distributed based on racial categories (Webster, 1983). With the study’s focus on reporting language, it is guided by French historian and philosopher, Michael Foucault’s (2003) idea that an early conception of racism emerged in the Early Modern (Between the 15<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup> centuries) as the historical and political discourse of race struggle”. Foucault (2003) argues that this struggle is prevalent today as modern forms of racism emerge from a discourse of war that emanates from long held relationships of division and competition, a confrontational system that leads to particular ways of knowing others and the world (Sonu, 2020; Binkley, 2016). This is directly relevant to the research questions that seek to identify and explore the dominant narratives and discourses that are used in the *Daily Sun* and *Sowetan*’s reporting of Operation Dudula.

In the South African context, racism emerged with colonialism. South Africa was colonised just like most African countries by Western countries. The people who suffered the most upon the arrival of the colonisers were darker people as they were exploited and exterminated (Tafira, 2018). The colonisers enforced the logic of “elimination, extermination, and genocide” by practicing acts such as “murder, rape, plunder, enslavement, racialised labour, theft, dispossession, deceit, trickery, chivalry etc.” (Tafira, 2018, :4). Crush *et al* (2008) argue that since African countries gained their independence, discrimination was not only based on skin colour but also on the notion of being ‘nonnative’. The xenophobia experienced in South Africa has leaned towards Afrophobia as it is directed at black African migrants and is not directed towards white immigrants who come from, for example, America or Europe (Solomon and Kosaka, 2013).

### *Afrophobia*

Afrophobia is the term used to describe prejudice directed at a specific ethnic group (Gqola, 2009). However, Afrophobia is the term used to express the fear of the African other, the hatred directed towards Africans (Dube, 2018). Afrophobia stems from “fear, aggression, and hatred of the perceived strangers” within a community along with the feeling of insecurity (Amusan and Mchunu, 2017: 3). It presents itself in a variety of ways, including verbal abuse, spatial segregation, and physical assaults, as well as systematic racial discrimination (Michael, 2015).

Afrophobic beliefs and behaviour that stem from these beliefs often deprives immigrants and refugees of their humanity, dignity, and individuality (Michael, 2015).

The colonial legacy is considered to have brought Afrophobia to Africa, which was then used by the apartheid state in South Africa to separate and rule black Africans (Dlamini et al, 2020). The separation tactics introduced by apartheid government instilled discrimination against the other and enforced the ‘us’ vs ‘them’ narrative. This narrative is now present in South Africa whereby the locals are against black African migrants. Black foreign nationals are regarded as ‘illegal’ immigrants or aliens even before they cross the border (Nyamnjoh, 2006). Black South Africans use derogative terms to call black African immigrants such as ‘amakwerekwere, amagrigamba and amagweja’. This is despite the fact that South Africa is home to a diverse range of nations, including a sizable Chinese population (Dlamini et al, 2020). As a result, it has been determined that South Africa has a problem with other Africans, this is not xenophobia, but rather Afrophobia (Dlamini et al, 2020). Black foreign nationals experience a lot of difficulties in integrating into South Africa due to cultural and linguistic differences between them and the black locals in neighbourhoods (Dube, 2018).

Obiora *et al* (2003) argue that white people, Chinese and Indian people migrating into the country face little or no discrimination from the South African locals. This is partly because South Africa allied with other countries based on labour agreements, people from India and China migrated in numbers into the country during the 1800s (Obiora *et al*, 2023). In addition, upon the forming of the Union of South Africa in 1910, rules of the racial discriminatory were founded which allowed only white immigration in the country (Obiora *et al*, 2023). Obiora *et al* (2003) argue that it is because of these rules that the discriminatory foundation of immigration was developed and is still present in the day.

Previous scholarship shows that South Africa prefers immigrants from Europe and North America than those that come from Africa (Dube, 2018; Dlamini, 2020; Amusan and Mchunu, 2017). White Europeans and Americans are treated as global citizens, free to integrate any space they to impose and are not discriminated against (Nyamnjoh, 2006). South Africa is perceived as a country “that has a lot of wealth when compared to its neighbouring countries, it has a well-developed infrastructure, a free enterprise market, stable government and an image of a multi-cultural society open to all” (Amusan and Mchunu, 2017: 4). These factors attract the large number of immigrants from the neighbouring African countries that hope to live in a place that has great chances of prosperity for them and their children (Amusan and Mchunu,

2017). The perpetrators of Afrophobia in South Africa then feel the need to protect their economy as they fear they may lose their jobs or formal/informal businesses to the immigrants, and this results in Afrophobic attacks and violence towards the African immigrants.

Black African immigrants are viewed as a threat to South African homes, jobs, education, healthcare, and other economic benefits in South Africa (Dlamini et al, 2020). It appears as if the locals prefer white European and American migrants as they do not have to compete with them for the scarce resources such employment and healthcare facilities. Millions of South Africans remain impoverished and unemployed (Muchiri, 2016). The insecurities of the local citizens are perpetrated by the belief that outsiders or black immigrants are going to steal or take away the limited resources that are yet to receive or utilise themselves (Amusan and Mchunu, 2017).

In the townships, the residents fear for their economic state as they cannot be employed or get a dignified wage if foreign nationals can just come work for a least amount of wage (Misago and Landau, 2022). This serves as an example of economic exclusion as the black foreign nationals that are targeted by the Operation Dudula live on the societies periphery and most of them are really disadvantaged (Khau, 2022). Black foreign nationals live in townships as these are the only places, they can find refuge in whereas those that least disadvantaged live in the suburbs and cannot be reached by Operation Dudula members. Over the decades several studies have been conducted on Xenophobia and Afrophobia in South Africa and the factors linked to it such as the economy, unemployment, competition for limited resources, crime, globalisation etc. (Amusan and Mchunu, 2017). Members of the Operation Dudula have expressed their concerns to the media, and they claim that they only encourage for illegal immigrants to be removed from the South African and not those that are here lawfully (Khau, 2022). The following section presents the key findings regarding the reporting of xenophobia in South Africa from previous scholars.

### **The reporting of Xenophobia in South African print media: Key Findings from Previous Scholarship**

Despite the fact that South Africa has been a popular migration destination since the end of apartheid, the country's economic woes and psychosocial issues have led some locals to construct negative stereotypes about migrants from other areas of the continent (Pineteh, 2017). Photographs and analogies from the media demonise and attempt to justify violence against

African migrants are frequently used in these narratives (Pineteh, 2017). Crush *et al.* (2008: 42) claim that the print media has contributed to the spread of xenophobic attitudes among its audience of readers. This is due to the press media's publication of news that has been xenophobic and anti-immigrant for more than ten years (Smith, 2009). Political news stories were also a focal point of the print media from the beginning of the printing era (Steenveld 2007: 108).

A contrasting model of political journalism began to develop in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century in which journalism was seen as a neutral arbiter of political communication (Steenveld, 2007: 108). The concept of political parallelism was used to describe “the extent to which different media outlets are associated with different political parties or political tendencies” (Steenveld, 2007: 109). The media began to report immensely on political tendencies since the beginning of the print media period (Steenveld, 2008). Development is inevitable in the media as different media platforms have expanded to innovate various changes in the journalism sector. This study uses online news articles selected from *Daily Sun* and *Sowetan Live* news to examine the representations of black African migrants in the media. The presence of black African migrants is frequently linked to all post-apartheid atrocities in many news stories (Danso and McDonald, 2001). These stories, however, lack thorough examination of the topics covered and frequently highlight xenophobic and racially biased acts (Smith, 2009).

The print media has been blamed for the capacity to incite widespread violence in previous studies (Asakitipi and Gadzikwa, 2015; Hadland, 2010) because of their "careless" language, tabloids have come under fire. In addition, Hadland (2010:124) emphasizes that print media is a "combination of diverse components language, text, ideology, and culture" in order to further elucidate this. The primary driver is the recurrence of derogatory metaphors and prejudices about foreigners in the media. Furthermore, because of this, stories or metaphors of illegality, crime, or the idea of the "alien" connected with African migrants have long been the focus of headlines in both international and white and black popular print and mass media.

Local newspapers like the *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*, which have sizably large readerships are selected for this study, have published news stories with themes like illegal immigrants stealing jobs from South Africans, illegal immigrants being involved in crime and police assisting with the arrest of undocumented immigrants. In South Africa, these periodicals are readily available in areas with a high poverty rate. This is due to the existence of their market niche (Jani, 2018). Due to the harmful stereotypes about immigrants that quickly spread in

townships with high rates of crime and unemployment, locals were forced to immediately attribute their socioeconomic problems to the African immigrants who ran the businesses in these areas (Pineteh, 2017). According to a review of these earlier studies, news stories about xenophobic attacks continue to perpetuate polarisation. For instance, the "Us vs. Them" narrative.

Newspapers hold a crucial responsibility in the way in which individuals see and comprehend migrants and minorities (Happer and Philo, 2013). South African print media have been criticised for their coverage of the violence in townships as sensationalistic and blamed it for reinforcing negative stereotypes about immigrants and ultimately leading to more violence (Pineteh, 2017). Newspapers were doing this by portraying foreigners in their reporting as other people, despite the fact that foreigners were the targets of these attacks. Newspapers create a sense of not belonging through stories with sources, statistics and headlines that lead to discrimination against foreigners (especially black African foreigners) (Jani, 2018: 111). The mocking comments made by the press possibly illustrate the "lack of understanding of media methodology and media theory on the part of sections of the media" (Tomaselli, 2000: 159). Therefore, the manner in which media represents African immigrants is important as it shapes the reality for the general public. has been done by looking at previous research that revealed the othering narrative persisted in reports of xenophobic attacks.

Three ethnic presses developed 'English, Afrikaans and Black' and they each began to develop a political voice in which they represented various news stories (Steenveld, 2007). The press nowadays has developed to ridicule most social matters without considering feelings involved (Tomaselli, 2000). The mocking comments made by the press possibly illustrate the "lack of understanding of media methodology and media theory on the part of sections of the media" (Tomaselli, 2000: 159). News reports were often found to be one dimensional (Tomaselli, 2000). Newspapers create a sense of not belonging through stories with sources, statistics and headlines that lead to discrimination against foreigners (especially black African foreigners)" (Jani, 2018:111). Even though, newspapers hold a crucial responsibility in the way in which individuals see and comprehend migrants and minorities (Happer and Philo, 2013). Therefore, the manner in which media represents African immigrants is important as it shapes the reality for the general public.

The influx of African immigrants in search of greener pastures is linked to the rising acts of xenophobia in South Africa (Mthombeni, 2022). Foreign nationals from other African

countries migrate into South Africa in high numbers under the perception that South Africa has favourable economic, political, and social climate (Mthombeni, 2022). Immigrants find the country to be quite alluring however, various forms of discrimination against foreign nationals migrating into the country has become evident over the years (Harris, 2001). South Africans are not entirely comfortable with the presence of African immigrants, as a result insidious and violent attacks towards foreign nationals have been witnessed (Mthombeni, 2022).

Xenophobia is a global issue as it affects various countries across the world (Roche et al, 2021). Bird, Smith, and Findlay conducted a study comparing the newspaper coverage of migration between the countries; Zimbabwe, South Africa, and Kenya (Moyo and Mpofu, 2020). Findings from the study outlines that representations in Zimbabwe are polarised and it appears that attention towards xenophobia is decreasing in the South African media which is a worrying transition (Moyo and Mpofu, 2020). Discrimination and marginalisation that is based on xenophobia is reported to ‘threaten the health, social and economic well-being of immigrants, asylum seekers and refugees’ (Roche et al, 2021).

Xenophobic hostility seems to be increasing and is directed towards those who are non-citizens and is usually expressed through stereotypes and prejudice available in print media (Neocosmos, 2010). Post-apartheid South Africa experienced an influx of immigrants, and this was influenced by economic hardships and political instability (Tshishonga, 2015). Akinola (2018: 59), states that South Africa is known to accommodate the largest number of asylum-seekers in the world. This has resulted in competition for scarce resources and limited job opportunities between South Africans and non-South Africans (Tshishonga, 2015). Mawadza (2012:110) states that “in South Africa, locals fear that immigrants will take their jobs or put additional strain on social infrastructure and on social service delivery.

The heightened concern and popular belief that illegal Zimbabwean immigrants are placing undue strain on South Africa’s resource reflect moral panic”. Black African immigrants in large cities of South Africa such as Cape Town, Johannesburg, and Durban along with others from small cities and towns experience terrible xenophobic violence attacks from the local settlers residing in these areas and this leads to the killing of many black African migrants that are situated in those areas (Obiora *et al*, 2023). Thus, this study investigates the movement of Operation Dudula and the events that took place during the period by analysing news articles from *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*.



Existing literature shows that minorities are generally excluded from media coverage and when they were covered, it is usually in a negative light as they are associated with acts of being parasites and running of illegal brothels (Kariithi, *et al*, 2017). South African media is accused of generalising and publishing stories with negative portrayals of black foreigners (Crush, 2008 and Pineteh, 2017). Thus, South African press does create an othering narrative in their stories by negative coverage of foreigners. South Africans are involved in criminal activities as well, but they are not always represented by the kind of crimes that are prevalent in South Africa. The researcher argues that polarisation in the media, for instance, the *us and them* narrative, is created when South Africans are reported in media for what they did compared to what they are known for.

However, there are explanations of the negative news trend. Firstly, negativity is not unique to migration coverage only. Journalists tend to emphasise on problems across most topics (Allen, Blinder, and McNeil, 2017). Secondly, bad news is prominent compared to good news. Also, there has been a move towards more positive or neutral coverage of migration issues across different countries (Allen *et al*, 2017). There are positive stereotypes as well, despite research showing that negative stereotypes predominate in the media. Foreigners, in Meintjies' view (1998:20), do not simply take from their hosts; rather, they also contribute to the economy and benefit the host nation as a whole. Foreigners who own small to medium-sized retail businesses must pay taxes. They are typically in good health and have higher levels of education and skill than citizens of the country they are visiting (Meintjies, 1998). Additionally, there are policies that limit the financial impact on public finances by prohibiting foreigners from receiving social services like social grants (Landau, Ramjathan-Keogh, and Singh, 2005). Moreso, there has been a shift toward more unbiased or favorable coverage of migration-related issues across nations (Allen *et al*, 2017).

As a result, there is a growing trend in the South African press to identify foreigners from Zimbabwe as the most educated group of people. The *Times Live* article "To this day, top universities send their marketing personnel to Zimbabwe to recruit talented students" makes this clear (Allen *et al*, 2017). South African township and rural schools benefit greatly from the work of Zimbabwean teachers in the sciences and mathematics. Their students frequently achieve distinction in addition to graduating from our universities. However, South Africans tend to focus on the negatives about African immigrants rather than the positives, which in turn

can lead to xenophobic attitudes and behaviours. The section that follows highlights how black African migrants are perceived to be involved in criminal activities.

### **Xenophobia in South Africa: Criminalising black African migrants**

Since South Africa transitioned to democracy in 1994, there has been a rise in xenophobic violence (Mthombeni, 2022). The influx of African immigrants in search of greener pastures is linked to the rising acts of xenophobia in South Africa (Mthombeni, 2022; Tshishonga, 2015). Foreign nationals from other African countries migrate into South Africa in high numbers under the perception that South Africa has favourable economic, political, and social climate (Mthombeni, 2022). Akinola (2018: 59), states that South Africa is known to accommodate the largest number of immigrants in the world. As a result, various forms of discrimination against foreign nationals migrating into the country has become evident over the years (Harris, 2001).

South Africans are not entirely comfortable with the presence of African immigrants, as a result insidious and violent attacks towards foreign nationals have been witnessed (Mthombeni, 2022). Over the years violent attacks towards immigrants across South Africa have left immigrants brutally injured and also led to the death of many (Hickel, 2014; Obiora *et al*, 2023).

The increased hostility towards black African migrants, as well as the government's slow or inadequate response, have harmed South Africa's image towards other African states, which, in turn, has hampered the formation and consolidation of friendly relations (Dlamini *et al*, 2020). The Southern African Development Community (SADC) (2021) has developed an action plan, which was approved by the Region's Employment and Labour Sector, is in line with Article 19 of the SADC Protocol on Employment and Labour, which aims to protect and safeguard migrant workers' rights and welfare in order to provide them with better opportunities to contribute to their countries of origin and destination.

Mawadza (2012:110) explains that this fear of 'job theft', and additional strains on failing South African infrastructure and service delivery in poor areas can be termed a moral panic. Part of this moral panic is the criminalisation of foreign nationals. It is apparent that there is a continuous negative association of migrants with terms like "criminality" and "undesirability",

adding to the current popularity of the terms “foreign” or “foreign nationals” (Moyo and Mpofu, 2020: 460). Black foreign nationals are blamed for increasing the rate of crime in South Africa and media has played a role in perpetuating the blame (Pineteh, 2017; Danso and McDonald, 2000). The stereotypical criminalisation of foreign nationals is not unique to South Africa as it is a global issue. It commenced as the ‘criminalisation of black youth’ (Hall, 1978). This resulted in moral panic from the society and has led to race and crime news being converged (Hall, 1978). The media’s treatment of black people was organised around the idea of the ‘outsider within’ (Troyna, 1981). Moreover, this impression was negative, and the media’s representation of reality and cultural differences are disparaged (Troyna, 1978). In South Africa most newspaper stories produce racial and national stereotypes about black African migrants portraying them in a negative light for instance, Nigerians are represented as drug lords (Danso and McDonald, 2001:1). However, Croucher (1998) explained that linking unfounded claims and beliefs that illegal black African migrants are responsible for drugs and crime in South Africa has lent legitimacy to unsubstantiated media reports. The local press has become a source of contestation and tends to cover certain migrants in a stereotypical way (Valji, 2003). African immigrants are reported to be involved in criminal activities in South Africa.

The following sub-sections present the predominant narratives believed of foreign nationals from previous research.

#### *Criminalisation of black African migrants*

Black African foreigners are blamed for increasing the crime rate in South Africa, and the media has played a role in perpetuating the blame (Pineteh, 2017; Danso and McDonald, 2001). The media coverage of criminal activities in South Africa gives the sense that foreigners from African countries are to blame for the rising level of criminal activities (Bird, 2006). Their first crime is entering South Africa without proper documents or no documentation. Since the 1990s the media, politicians and government institutions have been reinforcing the discourse that black African migrants contribute to crime (Graham and Böhmke, 2013:23). Furthermore, any individual identified as a foreigner is automatically categorised in the negative, bearing characteristics of black African migrants (Jani, 2018).

The South African press tends to be hostile towards black African migrants and crime has been used as a category to describe them (Peberdy, 1997). The high statistics of crime, robbery, violence, and gun running has all been associated with black African migrants by the media (Danso and McDonald, 2001:126). News stories essentially connected black African migrants

to criminal exercises by referring to them in a similar sentence “*20 illegal immigrants nabbed in early morning raid, during high density crime operations, Operation Dudula aims to create a better SA.*” (Danso and McDonald, 2001:126). These representations have continued to persist, despite the fact that foreigners are not always involved in criminal activities.

Often foreigners are accused of being responsible for some of the crimes that take place in the country. Nigerians, Congolese, and Mozambicans in particular have been presented in South African media as criminals and threats to the country's economic and security (Pineteh, 2017). The media's coverage of black African migrant's criminality has contributed greatly to public perceptions of immigrants as being negative for the South African community and economy (Solomon and Kosaka, 2013). The media portrays black immigrants as people who create problems in the country, they are represented as illegally residing in South Africa as they are blamed for some of the criminal activities that occur in the country. African immigrants tend to be associated with crime, drugs, human trafficking along with other bad tendencies (Danso and McDonald, 2001). South Africans also discriminate against African immigrants as they believe that they are responsible for the unemployment of many South Africans (Danso and McDonald, 2001). This is because African immigrants are exploited to work for long hours and earn minimum wages.

Xenophobia extensively focuses on African nationals from other African countries, yet the media tends to link some nationalities for example Nigerians and Mozambicans as being associated with illegal activities such as “drugs and illegal immigration” (Neocosmos, 2010: 1). The locals in South Africa have expressed their anger towards black African nationals as they accuse them of stealing their jobs and labeling them as drug lords and human traffickers. Over the years violent attacks towards immigrants across South Africa have left immigrants brutally injured but has also led to death of many (Hickel, 2014). Local residents attack immigrants coming from African neighbouring countries like “Zimbabwe, Somalia, Mozambique” and immigrants from Nigeria and these immigrants are called *Makwerekwere* which is derogatory term used to describe a person who speaks illiterately (Hickel, 2014: 103). Violence in the form of pure crime has taken place between African immigrants and South Africans (Harris, 2001). Black African immigrants stereotypically reported to be competing for the limited healthcare resources with South African locals.

### *Burden to healthcare facilities*

South Africa has been facing serious health challenges for decades now, in 2002, the World Health Organisation (WHO) reported that Southern Africa was facing extreme health challenges. The South African health sector was losing its clinicians to countries with a stable economy and high pay (Zihindula *et al*, 2015). This challenge has unfortunately persisted (Khwebulana, 2019). Another challenge the country is facing is having limited healthcare resources in local clinics and hospitals (Zihindula *et al*, 2015). South African locals are reported in news articles to be having concerns that they have to share their healthcare facilities with immigrants when these facilities cannot even accommodate locals solely. As a result, immigrants were accused of overcrowding maternity wards, in particular adding to the woes of the already overwhelmed public health sector (Mkize, 2019: 1). An example of this was evident in 2022 when a video trended of the health MEC in Limpopo, Dr Phophi Ramathuba, when she called on a hospital for admitting a foreign national for treatment, expressed that it is only in South Africa that people come into the country and expect treatment.

It is apparent that this is a concurrent matter as previously, the South African former Department of Health (DoH) Minister, Doctor Aaron Motsoaledi was quoted blaming foreigners for problems faced by the country's department of health (DoH). The DoH in South Africa needs more clinics and hospitals to accommodate foreign and local patients (Mkize, 2019). Hevens and Brand (1997) and Hathaway (2001) argued that South Africa lacked capacity to meet the needs of its entire population, therefore it has no responsibility for ensuring an acceptable level of health and health care for refugee communities.

In addition to these challenges, there is an anti-foreign attitude in South Africa that has resulted in a structural exclusion, the impact of which has not been analysed in the healthcare system. All these situations mask the harsh reality of worsening health care facilities for migrants, yet barriers to the healthcare system continue to persist (Crisp and Kiragu, 2010). The 2017 review of African Centre for Migration and Society (ACMS) at the University of Witwatersrand indicated that access to healthcare is problematic for foreigners and internal immigrants living on the urban periphery. The access to healthcare challenges is not unique to foreigners to South Africa; they are experienced by foreigners in other host countries.

Challenges faced by the country's health system due to xenophobia amongst medical staff was examined in a study conducted by South African Migration Project (SAMP) in 2011. Medical xenophobia can be defined as negative practices faced by foreigners from South Africa

healthcare workers, these practices include denying foreign nationals' medical access and care (Vanyoro, 2019). The study found that medical xenophobia existed and manifested itself through different ways namely: foreign patients were required to produce identification documentation and proof of residence before receiving treatment, health professionals refused to communicate with patients in English or use translators, treatment is sometimes accompanied by xenophobic statements, insults and other forms of verbal abuse, non-South African patients are required to wait until all South African patients have been attended to, foreign nationals have difficulty accessing ARVs for HIV in public hospitals and clinics and have forced many to rely on Non-Government Organisation (NGO) treatment programmes (Crush and Tawodzera, 2014; Odhiambo, 2012; SAMP, 2011). In contrast to this, the following subsection entails discussions on how South Africans believe that African migrants male are responsible for ending their relationships with their partners.

#### *Taking women from local men*

In townships, some South African women would rather date foreigners than South African men (Tafira, 2014). Different women have different motivations for these preferences. This subsection, however, will focus on the explanations provided by participants in a study by Morris (1998) and Tafira (2014). Findings from Tafira (2014) explores the dynamics of the relationships between South African women and foreigners as local men accuse foreigners of "stealing our women". These offenses, along with others, are displayed during xenophobic attacks.

South African women preferred foreign men (Congolese), according to a study by Morris (1998:1127), because they are compassionate, devoted, and generous. In addition, South African men were seen as uncaring, immoral, adulterous, and abusive to their partners. Nigerians and Congolese, on the other hand, presented themselves as diligent and compassionate. Women in the study thus felt more secure in the arms of foreigners than in those of South African men.

According to Tafira (2014), South African men from the Township of Alexandra (South Africa) are perceived to be lazy as they do not think about looking for work and they spend most of their time drinking. Then, as they accept any job with lower pay, they complain that foreigners are stealing their jobs (Tafira, 2014). South African men, according to South African women and foreigners, are indolent and do not make much effort to make their relationships work. South African women do not always want to be in a romantic relationship with local

men because of their history. Participants in the study by Tafira (2014: 220), described unemployed men as "loafers and are thick headed men" who fail to provide.

The way in which foreigners and South African men "jostle" and compete for women is explained by the connection between poverty, unemployment, and competition for women (Tafira, 2014). This is because they are compelled in some unfathomable way by poverty and other social ills to engage in romantic relationships with men who can support them and their families. Cross-border romantic relationships, according to Tafira (2014:2), cause racial and sexual jealousies between the two sets of manhood: black foreigners and South Africans. As a result, some South African men believe that non-wealthy foreigners from Mozambique and Zimbabwe use love charms to attract the women that all kinds of men want. The following section looks at the different reasons that cause black African migrants migrate to South Africa.

### **An Overview of Black Africans Migration to South Africa: Push and Pull factors**

This section provides an introductory context for the reasons as to why the migration of black African migrants to South Africa is so prevalent. Furthermore, it discusses critical information related to reasons for migrations, with some of these reasons evident on print media reportage of Operation Dudula.

In light of these views, migration dates back to the era of the migration of white settlers in 1942 during the period of Jan van Reibeck (Obiora *et al*, 2023). Black African migrants began migrating to other countries long before in search of employment opportunities and greener pastures (Obiora *et al*, 2023). Approximately 2.9 million migrants were reported to be residing in South Africa at mid-year 2020 (Migration Data in the Southern African Development Community, 2023). The heightened economic disparities between rich and poor countries have fueled worldwide migration and xenophobia toward foreign nationals (Danso and McDonald, 2000).

The influx of foreign nationals migrating into South Africa, has brought about turmoil and conflicts as many South African citizens believe that some immigrants do not have legal permits to allow them to reside in the country (Solomon and Kosaka, 2013) and feel that the limited resources and employment opportunities will take further strain. African nationals coming from countries all across Africa migrate to South Africa in quest for a better life. In reality they discover that South Africans are not so welcoming as they too may feel threatened

by their presence. Nigerians and Zimbabweans are the largest groups of African migrants present in South Africa and the number continues to grow despite the xenophobic violence attacks that affects foreign nationals (Enigbokan et al, 2015:1).

African nationals across various African countries migrate to South Africa with dreams to improve their lives or reside in the country for a long-term asylum seekers, students, and skilled workers (Solomon and Kosaka, 2013). Foreign nationals who are labelled 'immigrants' in South Africa maintain a permanent position in the country as they intend on staying in the country for longer periods and some with no intentions for leaving unlike migrants who are considered to be on a temporary stay (The International Organisation for Migration, 2011). A refugee is defined as someone who has fled his country of birth due to the fear of being persecuted for various reasons and seeks for protection by migrating into another country (Harris, 2001). The Refugee Act No. 138 (1998: 20) states that refugees have the right to seek, live and study in South Africa, they have a right to education, and access to essential services just like the citizens of the country.

An asylum seeker is a person that is still waiting for his/her asylum claims to be examined to distinguish whether his/her fear of persecution is well-founded (United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), 1998: 2). Migrants or refugees could be granted a permanent status in the country under certain conditions for example, after five years of temporary legal employment in the country may become a permanent resident (White Paper on International Migration, 1999). Another way to obtain permanent residence is through application with regards to receiving a permanent offer of employment without the requirement of prior temporary work for five years within the country (White Paper on International Migration, 1999).

In the case of a refugee who intend on extending their stay and not return to their respective countries, if the refugee was granted asylum, they may apply for naturalisation after the period of five years (The International Organisation for Migration, 2011).

The Refugee Act No. 138 (1998: 20) states that refugees have the right to seek, live and study in South Africa, they have a right to education, and access to essential services just like the citizens of the country. Immigrants are pushed to migrate or seek refuge in other countries for a number of factors which will be discussed in the following subsection.



### *Push factors*

Push factors are factors that force people to migrate to other countries. This may be due to reasons of migrants trying to secure a better life for themselves and their families. Factors such as unemployment, scarce skills, poverty, political and economic factors are driving forces for migrants and these factors push them to leave their country of birth to immigrate to South Africa (Mlambo, 2010).

#### Socio-economic push factors

African migrants from other African countries migrate to South Africa to better their economic status. African migrants are pushed to leave their host countries as they have become failed states due to the high levels of poverty and unemployment in comparison to South Africa (Solomon and Kosaka, 2013: 11). Zimbabweans and Nigerians migrate to South Africa in large numbers to South Africa due to economic hardships, poor standards of living and inadequate education (Crush and Tevera, 2010). As economic activity continues to decrease in African countries there is a chance that African nationals from other African countries may be pushed to migrate to South Africa. Therefore, acts of xenophobia may still continue to rise in South Africa.

#### Socio-political push factors

Political conflict, war and economic instability are key reasons why migrants flee their countries as refugees and asylum seekers (Harris, 2001). Despite coming from violent contexts many foreigners seem to be surprised by the high levels of violence in South Africa itself (Harris, 2001). Ethiopians, Somalians, and Congolese migrate to South Africa to seek for safety and security as their countries have been at war for decades (McDonald and Crush, 2000).

One hundred and twenty-one Nigerians were approximately slain between 2016 and 2018 in South Africa because of xenophobia and prejudice and discrimination (Mthombeni, 2022). Numerous acts of xenophobia have been witnessed since the 1990s and in 2018 more than 60 foreigners were killed in the nation making the situation worse (Mthombeni, 2022). Push factors push migrants to leave their host countries while pull factors pull migrants to migrate to South Africa.

### *Pull factors*

South Africa is viewed as an attractive country, it is perceived as a country “that has a lot of wealth when compared to its neighbouring countries, it has a well-developed infrastructure, a

free enterprise market, stable government and an image of a multi-cultural society open to all” (Amusan and Mchunu, 2017: 4). These pull factors attract the large number of immigrants from the neighbouring African countries that hope to live in a place that has great chances of prosperity for them and their children (Amusan and Mchunu, 2017).

#### Socio-economic pull factors

Various African countries have become failed states as poverty and unemployment is high in comparison to South Africa (Solomon and Kosaka, 2013: 11). African immigrants perceive South Africa to have better employment opportunities than their host countries.

#### Socio-political pull factors

Another focal pull factor is South Africa’s international image of freedom and democracy, and migrants expect to find protection, tolerance, and opportunities in the country (Harris, 2001).

These push and pull factors open a scene for xenophobic attitudes and violence. To minimise the fear or hatred South Africans have for black African migrants, the government to intervene to control and ensure legal migration and protection for foreigners.

#### *South African migration policies and Government interventions*

There are several of migration policies that are place in to control migration in South Africa, dating back from the 1991 Aliens Control Act termed the ‘apartheid last act’ (Obiora *et al*, 2023: 57). A number of migration policies were established throughout the years and in 2016, the Department of Home Affairs released a new “Green paper on International Migration as well as White Paper in 2017” (Obiora *et al*, 2023: 57). These papers established rights to readjust international migration to be favourable and were maintained with the “provisions of the Constitution and the 2030 National Development Plan (Obiora *et al*, 2023: 57).

To control the cross-border migration in the country, a Border Management Authority Bill was enforced in 2017 (Obiora *et al*, 2023). However, despite all this, borders are porous in South Africa, which is one of the main reasons for the country's xenophobic problem (Dlamini *et al*, 2020). Borders are critical in minimising xenophobic attacks by guaranteeing effective border policing and operations to minimise the number of people entering the nation illegally, which will likely lessen tensions within communities (Crush and Tevera, 2010). However, for this to happen, borders must be managed by skilled and competent individuals, and borders must be given appropriate funding to ensure that illegal migration is reduced (Dlamini *et al*, 2020;

Crush, 2009; Danso and McDonald, 2000). The section that follows provides the contextual discussion of Operation Dudula.

### **Operation Dudula: A background**

Operation Dudula is a splinter group from a faction in the Put South Africans First movement. Operation Dudula was developed as a patriotic campaign to address issues of crime, lack of jobs and poor health services which they believe is caused by the influx of the illegal immigrants staying in South Africa (Mthombeni, 2022). *Dudula* which is an Isizulu word meaning to force out or knock down alludes to the objective of the movement of expelling immigrants (Mthombeni, 2022). This movement gained popularity as an anti-immigrant campaign as it engaged in activities that target foreign nationals residing in South Africa (Khau, 2022).

Operation Dudula has been labelled as a xenophobic vigilante group by online news stories (Mthombeni, 2022). However, it is vital to note that the actions of the Operation Dudula movement may be perceived as Afrophobic rather than xenophobic as it targets black African immigrants rather than white immigrants. Operation Dudula is reported to targets drug traffickers and businesses that allegedly hire illegal foreigners for work at lower wages (Sibanda, 2022). However, the members of Operation Dudula dispute these allegations claiming that the movement aims on improving the conditions of the township communities by removing undocumented foreign nationals and providing opportunities for marginalised South Africans (Khau, Sibanda & Mthombeni, 2022). Operation Dudula members claim that the movement is a ‘peaceful-loving’ movement that is aimed at creating a better South Africa that is free from undocumented immigrants (Khau, Sibanda, & Mthombeni, 2022). Operation Dudula claims that their mission is to have only undocumented immigrants returned to their respective countries and not immigrants who are here lawfully (Myeni, 2022).

Operation Dudula led their first march in Soweto on the 16<sup>th</sup> of June 2021 with a focus on immigrant informal traders and those believed to be involved in international drug operations (Mthombeni, 2022). The movement of Operation Dudula expanded to Durban in April 2022 and expanded out to other provinces as well (Mthombeni, 2022). This initiative shut down all food stalls maintained by foreign nationals who were unable to produce the necessary paperwork for conducting business or a current passport (Sibanda, 2022). Operation Dudula

was intensely recognized as a campaign to force out undocumented immigrants of informal trading in townships around South Africa (Khau, 2022).

Operation Dudula is perceived to only target foreign nationals who are from disadvantaged backgrounds, who are employed in precarious jobs, who rent shacks, or who live in informal settlements (Myeni, 2022). They do not target foreign nationals who reside in luxury or decent settlements in places like Sandton as they may also be involved in some sort of criminal act (Khau & Sibanda, 2022). Foreign nationals from other African countries migrate into South Africa in high numbers under the perception that South Africa has a favourable economic, political, and social climate (Mthombeni, 2022). The following section entails discussions on the media's coverage of Operation Dudula.

### **Media's coverage of Operation Dudula: Findings from the previous studies**

This study seeks to examine the language used by the selected online newspapers sourced from *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* that report on foreign nationals during Operation Dudula, that is recognised as being xenophobic. Operation Dudula is reported to promote xenophobic behaviours as it was represented that the organisation allegedly set up conflicts with black African immigrants who are undocumented and forced them to leave the country (Fetheka, 2022). The media represented Operation Dudula as an organisation of good cause that worked hand in hand with the South African Police Services to remove undocumented foreign nationals from the country (Mthombeni, 2022). According to a news article published by *Sowetan Live* on the 28<sup>th</sup> of April 2022 “20 illegal foreigners nabbed in early morning raid”. The news article reported that the early morning raid was conducted by the police and Operation Dudula where 20 undocumented people were arrested at Soweto (Koka, 2022).

The South African media uses discriminatory and provocative language when reporting about black African migrants as in another online article *Sowetan Live* published a headline “Go back to your respective countries”, come back with well documented papers” (Tshikalange, 2022). The language in news articles, therefore, influences the audience and in turn incite or increase the xenophobic violence directed towards black African nationals. Movements and organisations in South Africa are reported to blame foreign nationals for problems that exist in the country (Fetheka, 2022). The Operation Dudula movement has been linked to violence as it has been perceived to target African immigrants with threats to remove them from South Africa (Mthombeni, 2022).

Online technologies are growing and moving ahead of traditional journalism as the internet has become cheaper and provides new opportunities for both the readers and the journalism sector with regards to “instantaneity, access, consumption and interactivity” (Karaaslan, 2019: 1). Hence, this study will discuss and compare how the selected online publications cover news pertaining foreigners and how the news coverage leads to an othering narrative (Smith, 2008). Newspaper articles frequently emphasise negative narratives with regards to foreigners while disregarding good news (Crush, 2008). In its opinions toward foreigners (particularly African Black foreigners), the media can be biased and at times outright racist (Jetten et al, 2001).

South African media reports on black African nationals as people that reside in the country illegally. According to Mawadza (2012), regardless of their diverse courses and trajectories, these migrants are frequently depicted in a negative light by locals, who accuse them of being job snatchers, drug traffickers, scam artists, and career criminals. Stereotypes like these simplify and flatten the true intricacies of disempowered and marginalised people (Mawadza, 2012). This study will investigate how migrants are represented in newspapers *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* throughout the onset of the campaign of Operation Dudula.

However, it should be noted that the media also represents foreign nationals in a positive manner. Foreigners do not simply take from the host country; they also contribute to the economy and benefit the country as a whole as they own small to medium trading stores, foreigners pay taxes (Meintjies, 1998). There has been a shift towards a more favourable or neutral coverage of migration issues in several countries (Allen et al, 2017). Although it is still noticeable that in South Africa, policies exist that prevent foreigners from getting social services such as social grants, so limiting the financial burden on public finances (Landau, Ramjathan-Keogh, and Singh, 2005).

## **Conclusion**

This chapter includes a brief explanation of the pull and push factors of migration to South Africa. Through a discussion of previous scholarship, this chapter highlights how news stories have led to an othering narrative *us vs them* as South Africans believe they have to protect their country and its resources from undocumented migrants (Smith, 2008; Solomon & Kosaka, 2018; Pineteh, 2017; Danso and McDonald, 2001).

Black African immigrants are blamed for the criminal activities that take place in the country, they are blamed for burdening the South African healthcare services and police services, and they are blamed for taking women from South African men. The organisation of Operation Dudula claims that they started their organisation in order to protect South Africa from the above-mentioned problems that they believe are caused by black African migrants.

This chapter presents the key terms of xenophobia, Afrophobia and racism in order to provide a definitional framework of key terms. The media has been thought to play a role in perpetuating the xenophobic attitudes and attacks by publishing news stories that reinforce negative stereotypes about immigrants (Pineteh, 2017). However, it is vital to note that the actions of the Operation Dudula movement may be perceived as Afrophobic rather than xenophobic as it targets black African immigrants rather than white immigrants. The hostility of Afrophobia tends to lean more towards black rather than white nationals and this may result from competition for scarce resources and jobs between the black locals and black non-nationals (Tshishonga, 2015). Chapter Three discusses the theoretical framework that informs this study.

## **Chapter Three**

### **Theoretical Framework**

#### **Introduction**

The previous chapter presented an examination of previous scholarship on the representation of black African migrants in the press, with a specific focus on Operation Dudula, media representations, xenophobia, and Afrophobia. This study aims to examine the representation of foreign nationals with regard to the organisation known as Operation Dudula. More specifically, it will investigate how *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* reported on foreign nationals during the protest held by Operation Dudula from January 2022 to June 2022. This is achieved through the use of theoretical fundamentals of the research topics highlighting representation, stereotyping and othering theories and how they relate to this study.

In this chapter, these theories are discussed in relation to the research questions and objectives of the study. The main theory that frames the research is the representation theory (Hall, 1997; 2013; 2016) as it is valuable in examining the representation of Operation Dudula and foreign nationals in the selected publications. This study examines representation as a theory that links meaning and language to culture (Hall, 1997). Representation means “using language to say something meaningful about or to represent the world meaningfully to other people” (Hall, 2013: 1). This study takes on a constructionist stance in understanding the newspaper as media representation is a construction (Hall, 2013). It is important to understand that representation through language is vital and central to the ways and processes by which ideas are shaped and formed in a particular society and culture (Mbetga, 2014).

Furthermore, this study discusses stereotyping with lessons from the ideologies of (Hall, 2013; O’Sullivan, 1994; Harris, 2002; Pineteh, 2017; Dervin, 2015; Danso and McDonald, 2001). This is discussed in relation to the findings from the literature review that illustrate how foreign nationals are represented stereotypically by the selected online newspapers. The concept of

othering is also focal to the study (Hall, 1997; Clifford and Marcus, 1986; Brons, 2015; Staszak, 2008) as it explains how the selected online newspapers represented foreign nationals and how they were classified by South African locals and members of the Operation Dudula movement.

### **Representation theory**

Representation plays an important role in the process whereby meaning is produced and exchanged between members of a certain culture (Hall, 1997). Culture is concerned with the production and exchange of meanings, the giving and taking of meaning between members of a society or group (Hall, 2013). The representation concept within cultural studies was developed by Stuart Hall in the 1960s (Jani, 2019). Hall extended the concept of representation on social portrayals of race, ethnicity, and sexual orientation; hence he is regarded as a significant scholar in the field (Jani, 2019). Representation links “meaning and language to culture” (Hall, 2013: 1). Representation means using language to relay meaningful information about, or to represent the world to others (Hall, 2013). Representation is a cognitive practice that enables people in the society to be social beings and situate themselves in a manner that will allow them to affirm their identities and defend themselves when attacked by others (Howarth, 2002). It encompasses the use of language, signs, and images to represent or symbolise things (Hall, 1997). In order to perceive knowledge people should understand the concept of representation and the linkage between the self and other objects that allows for its existence in the society (Jovchelovitch, 2007). Representation presents experiences, voices, people that are constantly interpreted and represented to constitute their realities (Howarth, 2002).

People can also be represented in term of their ethnicity. However, when attempting to identify and investigate “how ethnic identities are constructed, negotiated and maintained in any given context, it is important to define satisfactorily what is meant by ethnicity as a conceptual tool for dismantling and understanding of societies” (Dlamini, 1998: 2). Ethnicity refers to the way on which persons classify themselves or are classified by other people collectively and according to those identities (Dlamini, 1998). People belonging to the same ethnicity group may identify themselves as one and do things in a similar way as a cultural group. The participants in a culture give meaning to people, objects, and events (Hall, 1997). For example, the Zulu ethnic group do most things in a similar way, they perform similar rituals and customs, they attend Zulu cultural events like the Umhlanga Reed Dance hosted by the Zulu royal family



to celebrate virgin maidens. Moreso, the Zulu people once attended an event at Pongolo in the year 2015 when the late King Goodwill Zwelithini delivered a speech addressing Zulu people (Ngwane, 2014). During his speech, the late King Goodwill Zwelithini compared foreign nationals to bed bugs that needed to be laid bare in the sun (Ngwane, 2014). The press represented the King's speech as the perpetrator of xenophobic attacks that took place in 2015 and how the Zulu people were misguided because of the respect and value they had for their King (Ngwane, 2014).

Members of the same culture should share "sets of concepts, images and ideas" this allows them to view and interpret the world in similar way (Hall, 1997: 4). In this manner the way they think and feel forms part of the "systems of representation" in which our concepts, images and emotions represent our mental life and other things present in the outside world (Hall, 1997:4). Members of the same culture may also speak the same language and interpret body language and facial expressions the same way (Hall, 1997). They give meaning to people, objects, and events through frameworks of interpretation and how they integrate them into their daily practices (Hall, 2013). The society shares ideas and meanings about how they view black foreign nationals, and their perception is sometimes linked to the media representations of foreigners in South Africa. For instance, the perception of Nigerians as drug dealers, Zimbabweans as criminals, and Somalis as spaza shop owners selling expired items are linked to the how the print media represents foreign nationals.

The issue with representation is the instability, hybridity and multiplicity of representation that competes with each other (Howarth, 2002). In a similar manner, there is a problem with meaning as it not constant but fluid, meaning changes over time and people tend to interpret the world differently regarding their frames of reference and in order to communicate efficiently there is a need for a common understanding (Foucault, 1980). Foucault (1980) argues that discourse produces the object of knowledge and that nothing meaningful exists outside discourse. Discourse is a system of representation (Wetherell et al, 2001). It can be viewed as a group of statements that provide language, a way of representing knowledge about a topic or moment (Wetherell et al, 2001). According to Wetherell et al (2001), discourse produces knowledge through language. However, all practices that are social have meaning and meaning enhance and influence our conduct hence all practices entail a discursive aspect (Hall, 1997). The idea behind discourse is not about whether things are real or not but about where meaning comes from (Foucault, 1980). Social practices have meaning and therefore entail discourse as discourse provides object of knowledge as everything that exists involves

meaning. Discourse is a system of representation as representation links “meaning and language to culture” (Hall, 2013: 1). Culture is concerned with the production and exchange of meanings, the giving and taking of meaning between members of a society or group (Hall, 2013).

### *Representation and language*

Language is frequently associated to the process of the construction of meaning. In order for messages to be shared or communicated it must be translated into common language, so that we can link our concepts and ideas with written words, spoken sounds or visual images which we carry as signs (Hall *et al*, 2013). These signs represent the concepts and the conceptual relations between them which we carry around in our heads and combined they make up the meaning systems of our culture. The process that links these elements together is called representation. Signs are organised into languages and the existence of common language allows people to translate their thoughts and concepts into words, sounds and images and in turn they use language to express meanings and communicate their thoughts to other people (Hall *et al*, 2013). The language used in the newspapers/tabloids reflects the language structure of the majority readers (Tanackovic *et al*, 2014: 2). Hence, language serves an essential role to this study.

Representation includes the use of language, signs, and pictures to represent certain things (Hall *et al*, 2013). For instance, this study investigates the language used by the two online newspapers *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* to represent Operation Dudula and foreign nationals. In similar studies, it has been found that *Sowetan live* and *Daily Sun* represented foreign nationals as troublemakers, people who commit crime by selling drugs, murdering people, associated with human trafficking and living in South Africa unlawfully (Nokwe, 2018; Nyamjoh, 2010). Jovchelovitch (2007) argues that the relationship between things, concepts and signs is embedded at the source of the production of meaning in language.

According to Brubaker (2006: 79), “the reality of the human world is totally made of representation: in fact, there is no sense of reality for our human world without the work of representation”. Representations are dependent on humans therefore, they are perceived and interpreted as “perspectives on the world that are not ontological but epistemological realities” (Brubaker, 2006: 79). This is because representations are dependent on humans, they need people, language, and culture in order to exist.

Representations enable people to understand sociality and the world, they also assist people to interact with other people (Gillespie, 2006). Representation that is shared is also constructed with others, it represents “what reality is inter-subjectively agreed to be (Howarth, 2006: 8). Representations of black African migrants as *Amakwerekere/Amagrigamba* by the South African media is extensively negative and “extremely un-analytical in nature”, as majority of the media has inclined to reproduce “problematic research and anti-immigrant terminology uncritically” (Kariithi *et al*, 2017: 120). It appears to be a reoccurring issue, as there have been no change on how the media represents foreign nationals in South Africa. The mesSage publicationss constructed by *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* insinuate that foreigners from African must evacuate the country, in order for the south Africa to reach its full potential (Pineteh, 2017). Therefore, the target audience read about the representation of foreign nationals that has fixed by the elite groups which is the media houses.

### *Representation and identity*

Representation includes signifying practices and symbolic systems. Representations produce meanings through which we can make sense of who we are (Hall, 1997). Representation is regarded as a vital tool in building and maintaining identities (Sen, 2006). Representation as a cultural process establishes individual and collective identities (Hall 1997; Hall, 2013). This can be noticed during globalisation, where people move around the world rapidly. Representation ushers a way towards the pluralisation of identities in the era of globalisation, where national identity competes with social identity (Bauman, 2004). Globalisation has profoundly influenced the establishment of identities through the media and also in post-apartheid South Africa (Wasserman, 2008). As South Africa moved into globalised financial markets and opened up to international competition, there appeared to be an increase in non-local residents migrating into the country and even participating in the domestic financial markets (Mboweni, 2002).

Identity is socially constructed and can be constructed by media. Identity should be viewed as a production that is never complete, always in progress, and always in process, and always constituted within representation (Hall, 2016). In a similar manner, identity should therefore, not be considered as fixed. Furthermore, identities are always constructed through and against representation (Howarth, 2002). Identity construction through media should not be recognised as something that occurs only on text or on a symbolic level that does not include daily practices

of people (Wasserman, 2008). We should rather view the construction of representation as something that occurs within the everyday experiences of people (Wasserman, 2008: 244). However, according to Wasserman (2008), “a media-centered approach ignores the broad range of experiences and social networks in relation to which people shape their identities and world views”. The construction of identities transpires as a product of controversy and fight for power and is influenced by substantial forces and conditions (Wasserman, 2008). The construction of identity by the media is part of extensive networks of meaning and is implanted in social and material contexts (Wasserman, 2008). Textual representation of identity should be placed in its “social, political, economic and cultural contexts since media constructions of identity are linked to these contexts and have implications across broader sphere” (Wasserman, 2008: 247). Representation then comes into play when identities are compared with relations of difference. This means that some identities are represented in the media as powerful while others are represented as inferior.

The representation of each group depends on the dominant identity. However, what is constituted within representation is subject to being serialised, deferred, and staggered (Hall, 2016). To claim one’s identity as a member of an oppressed or marginalised group is a political point of departure (Woodward, 2004: 24). In South African media, foreigners are represented as creating social problems and a threat to the locals by migrating into the country through their illegalities (Danso and McDonald, 2001). In the South African media, more especially in print media, it is common for black African migrants to be represented as criminals (Nyamnjoh, 2010).

In addition, black African migrants are stereotyped in the media as job stealers and illegal occupants of the land (Nokwe, 2018). Nyamnjoh (2010) states that “there is almost a complete blackout of references to crime and illegality on the part of Western Europeans and North Americans in South Africa, despite the fact that nationals from these regions also commit crimes and many are in the country illegally”. This means that an exercise of power is always present in representations especially representations of foreigners as the other (Duncan, 2003). Representations emerge from the interrelations between self, other and the object world (Jovchelovitch, 2007). Furthermore, they are arbitrary means of placing meaning on people’s ideas. Power is a constitutive element in our own identities (Hall, 2016). Hegemonic representations are constructed and maintained often by the powerful in-group (Howarth, 2006). In the case of South Africans and the black African foreign nationals, the in-group that holds the power is the locals whereas the out-group are the black African foreign nationals.

The black African migrants are represented as inferior in the media as they are associated to negative stereotypes.

### *Media representation*

Media representation is the way in which news stories represented by media manage and present people's democracy, social issues and events to the audience or consumers (Stewart and Kowaltze, 2005: 35). Hall (1997: 19) states that representation is the manner in which media contributes to the production of ideologies that guide how people think. Media representation plays a role in shaping ideas of people, social groups, or events. According to (Hall, 1997: 16) "what media representation delivers are unequivocal, portrayals of the social world, pictures, depictions, clarifications and edges for comprehension". News articles have the power to influence and contribute to the reader's comprehension of migration, xenophobia, terrorism and so forth. It is impossible to live and interact in a social environment and not be influenced (Tedeschi, 2017) just as it is not common to read daily news articles or headlines and be influenced. This study seeks to understand how media influences the discrimination of black African immigrants and the commencement of the organisation of Operation Dudula.

Media in South Africa tends to stray from the principle of fairness, accurate and objective representation to the circulation of political and tabloid-like news articles which has the potential to stimulate protests and violence (Hadland, 2020: 124). The media creates representations as focal signifying practices for producing shared meanings (Hall, 1997). People share ideologies presented by media to them and may be influenced to act. To further explain the media incited the othering of foreign nationals (us vs them) as it has previously portrayed black African immigrants as problematic "aliens" who tend to destroy everything that belongs to South Africans (Nyamnjoh, 2010, Landau, 2011, Pineteh, 2017). These sentiments are reverberated by local South African residents during protests and xenophobic attacks. Representations are constructed and frequently communicated to ensure that they do not lose their value. Media representations repeat elements in news articles from tabloids when they report on foreign nationals from other African countries, certain words are often repeated like 'alien, illegal, undocumented' (Kariithi *et al*, 2017, Pineteh, 2017). In addition, representations are entrenched in the daily media and develop norms and common sense about people, groups, and institutions in society (Howarth, 2020). The media uses language in the

form of words and phrases to represent news stories about foreign nationals. In a similar manner, the media uses language to represent thoughts, feelings, and ideas about issues like migration, poverty, and food security (Bhat and Mehraj, 2014: 56).

Representation through the language used in media is essential in understanding other different cultures (Zou, 2012: 465-6). This study is central in investigating how black African migrants are represented in South African publications. The media language used as representation in the newspapers are words and phrases meant to say something (Wiley and Sons, 2001). “Words and phrases are like vehicles that transport meaning because they operate as symbols which the media wish to convey” (Hall, 1997). Words are part of our everyday normal life. However, their significance for language is not what they are but what they do (Hall, 1997: 5). Words interpret and communicate what the word the producer of the text wants to communicate. The media constructs their own meanings and qualities through connotating rehearse (Hall, 2013). Words are used in newspapers to describe black African migrants are fundamental in describing what black African migrants do. Phrases such as ‘job snatchers’ ‘job stealers’ are used to describe black African migrant’s actions (McDonald and Jacobs, 2005: 305). Representation does not only focus on reporting and scattering but it is also a ground for procured news through interpretative frameworks (Poole, 2005). In South Africa white-owned press associates European migrants with modernity, civilisation, and sophistication (Lubbe, 2009: 10). Whereas black African migrants are associated with, crime, diseases, and poverty (Crymble, 2010: 10). This illustrates that the way the South African media depict both black African migrants and European migrants play an important role in the way they are perceived. This study evaluates how the South African media represent black African migrants.

Representation allows people to comprehend with them in certain favoured ways (Stewart and Kowaltzke, 2007). However, different interpretations may rise depending on the audience. The legitimacy of what is represented depend on how often elements are repeated (Stewart and Kowaltzke, 2007). The media provides classifications of individuals, occasions or thoughts and categories for example “the job stealer, illegal migrant or undocumented” (Pineteh, 2017: 6). Representations are generalisations about categories which become part of our ideas and thoughts (Stewart and kowaltzke, 2007). “The meaning found in media will carefully be chosen, created and conveyed, already having built-in judgements” (Stewart and kowaltzke, 2007: 36). Black African migrants are portrayed as criminals and illegal migrants (Pineteh, 2017; Crush and Tevera, 2010) and these portrayals contain the perspective of the general population who made them (Stewart and Kowaltzke, 2007). Representation requires an in-

depth investigation of social structures while still focusing on why and how the media represents black African migrants. To understand the fundamental idea of representation and give connection to the ideological surges of thought, stereotype will also be examined in this study.

### *Stereotypical representation*

Stereotyping can be defined as a socially constructed grouping of particular groups and people as often highly simplified and generalised signs which implicitly or explicitly represent a set of values, judgements and assumptions concerning their behaviour, characteristics, or history (O'Sullivan et al, 1994). Stereotypes are another comprehensive form of representation (Stewart and Kowaltzke, 2007). Stereotypes are included in the representation theory with regards to social representation and identity construction. Stereotypes are arranged in terms of beliefs about the attributes of the social classification of individuals which are “personal traits, attributions, intentions, behavioural descriptions” (Allport, 1954: 191). Stereotyping reduces people to a few, simple and essential characteristics which are fixed by nature (Hall, 2013: 5). Stereotypes grapple with the few simple, vivid memorable characteristics of a person that are easily grasped and widely recognised, they then reduce everything about the person to those traits (Hall, 2013). Stereotypes deploy the strategy of “splitting” (Hall, 2013: 6). In addition, stereotypes reinforce the image of “us” and “them”, they can also be created and highlighted through the media (Luhmann, 1995).

The mutual stereotyping of foreigners by South Africans and of South Africans by foreigners essentialises and exaggerates perceived cultural differences and gives rise to prejudice and antagonism (Harris, 2002). Othering expands to different areas of knowledge that alludes, in addition to other things, to separating discourse that develops to social and political decisions of predominance and inferiority among the people who share the same values and out-groups (Us and them) (Dervin, 2015: 1). News stories that indicate that foreign nationals are criminal and drug lords based on police arrest or the assumptions made in the society are classified as stereotypes (Danso and McDonald, 2001: 126). Stereotypes are an outrageous type of representation as they are developed by a procedure of choice (Dervin, 2015).

The term stereotype refers to the typical image that comes to mind when thinking about a certain social category or group of people (Lipmann, 1922). Stereotypes can also be regarded as cognitive schemas used by people to process information about others (Hamilton and Sherman, 2014). Stereotypes convey information about different characteristics of group

members such as social roles and the level to which certain members share qualities (Dovidio *et al*, 2010). However, stereotypes can be expressed differently. Some groups may be stereotypically perceived as weak/inferior and useless whereas some may be perceived as strong/superior (Fiske *et al*, 2002). The media constructs influential news stories that negatively represent black African migrants as they may be represented as ‘criminals or drug dealers’. This focal point creates stereotypes that are usually untruthful (Wood and King, 2001). These stereotypes can influence the audience, as people read and familiarise themselves with stereotypes learnt from the media.

Stereotyping sets up a “representational border between normal and the pathological, the acceptable and the unacceptable, what belongs and what does not or is others, between insiders and outsiders, us and them” (Hall, 2013: 246). Stereotypes are made up of the basic characteristics of an individual that are recognised and define the person according to those traits (Van Dijk, 1993). Stereotypes minimise, essentialise, normalise and fix difference (Hall, 2013: 247). Furthermore, stereotypes stir a division between the normal and acceptable from the abnormal and unacceptable and in turn excludes everything else that is different (Hall, 2013: 247). Stereotypes enable the practice of closure and exclusion among people (Hall, 2013: 248). Stereotypes are perceived as a natural circumstance but should not be allowed to cripple our societies. Stereotyping in newspapers separates South Africans from foreigners by grouping all South Africans in one imagined community while casting foreigners outside of the group. Foreigners find it difficult to integrate due to the differences in language, dressing and culture and these the key sources of exclusion of foreigners (Pineteh, 2017). The media uses stereotypes to maintain the status-quo, to differentiate between the wanted and the unwanted to define us (locals/South Africans) and (them/foreign nationals) (Hall, 2013). In order for the majority of the population to understand other social groups such as the black African migrants, they need to see accurate representations of these groups (Kidd, 2016: 28).

Stereotypes are prompted by how we classify what we see in the world we live in with the attempt to better position ourselves (Christoph, 2012: 99). This enables people to define one society in contrast to the other this symbolises the ingroup versus the outgroup and introduces the notion of differentiation by one group from the other (Christoph, 2012). In addition, there are generally two types of stereotypes: the “auto stereotypes, which regard people in group and hetero stereotypes which are related to an out group” (the other) (Dervin, 2011: 186). Traits that are undesirable are frequently linked with the out-group (Fiske *et al*, 2002). Stereotypes allocate power to the in group ‘us’ and demean the out-group ‘them’ (Luhmann, 1995).



Stereotypes represent the positioning of the mental portrayals of the world (Gilman, 1991). They prolong the needed sense of the difference between the self and the object, which becomes the other. However, since there is no actual line between the self and the other, an imaginary line must be drawn so that the illusion of an absolute difference self and the other is not disturbed (Jani, 2018). This line is effective in its potential to change itself as is the self (Gilman, 1991). A line between the citizens and the migrants should be drawn (Jani, 2018).

Stereotypes are developed through the ethnocentric perspectives of social orders and are in this manner characterised socially (Lipmann, 1922). Stereotypes are not static as they transform over time with the winds of social pressure (Fiske *et al*, 2002). Stereotypes between African Americans were subtle back in the day during 1950s however, nowadays stereotypes have grown to be intense as black African migrants are stereotyped as gangsters and drug lords (Entman, 1990).

Stereotypes strengthen the characterisation of us and them, they are developed and communicated through media (Luhman, 1995). Stereotypes exist to fill in the gap as they give support against the fears that we have (Gilman, 1991). Stereotypes are indeed tools of power (Shaw, 2010). Moreover, they emerge when self-incorporation is undermined. Stereotypes are fundamental as the world would not function without them (Gilman, 1991). People learn of stereotypes from the media and movies (Wood, 1994). Research studies have shown that newspaper stories, films, advertisements, and other forms of media are heavily dominated by migrant, gender, and racial stereotypes (Wood, 1994; Entman and Rojecki, 2000). The high magnitude of advertising in the media suggests that millions of readers and audiences are reading or watching stereotypical narratives on a daily basis as adverts dominate about more than half of newspaper space, fifty-two percent of magazines and eighteen percent of radio time (Collins and Skover, 1993: 628). Newspapers provide descriptions and images of people and social groups (Dervin, 2011). Newspapers use stereotypical words such as “animals, waves, floods, streams and tides” some of these are routinely applied to migrants (Van Dijk, 1997: 47). Social groups of black African migrants are often stereotyped by the South African media particularly, Nigerians, Zimbabweans, Kenyans, Basotho, Swazi, Mozambicans, and Congolese (Kariithi *et al*, 2017; Danso and McDonald, 2001). The arrival of foreigners has been represented as problematic as most social ills are blamed on black African migrants (Njamnjoh, 2010).

The media uses stereotypes to maintain status quo, to differentiate the wanted and the unwanted defining ‘us’ and ‘them’ (Hall, 2013). Stereotypes need to be constantly repeated and reaffirmed through media texts and social discourses to maintain their hold on the social imaginary (Shaw, 2010). Stereotypes have been critiqued for lacking to recognise people for who they are, instead they are reduced to simple characteristics which are represented as fixed in nature (Hall, 1997). Stereotypes get hold of the basic characteristics of a person and define the person according to those traits (Van Dijk, 1993). The minor knowledge that is gathered from a certain social group by stereotypes is then used to identify the group. Moreover, this is done without verifying whether the information about that group is true or false (Van Dijk, 1993). Newspapers produce a negative stereotypical representation/image of migrants as ‘the other’ (Van Dijk, 1997). The reporting of black foreign nationals as criminals can easily add to the preexisting stereotypes about foreigners as ‘aliens’ (Warmer, 2015: 62).

The theory of stereotyping was selected for this study because there is evidence that the South African media covers news stories about foreign nationals particularly black African migrants based on stereotypes. Negative stereotypes have been used repeatedly in the media (Danso and McDonald, 2000). This study seeks to investigate whether and how the two online publications *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* also used negative stereotypes when reporting on foreign nationals and Operation Dudula.

### *Othering*

Othering as a concept, can be understood in how Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak theorised how the specialists of colonisation in India used and explained the differences between people to Subject the Other (Spivak, 1985). Othering is embedded in the postcolonial theory that examines the relationship between the colonisers and the colonised from the earliest days of exploration and colonisation (Ambesange, 2016). Othering is a view of qualities that are not characterising for the homogenous in group, to the group of a non-western out group (Barnett, 2006). The Western countries held more power than the Eastern countries, the press represented the Eastern countries based on stereotypes. In addition, the Western countries were represented as civilised and rational whereas the Eastern countries were represented as illogical and superstitious (Ambesange, 2016). Therefore, the postcolonial theory is used in this study to examine the relationship between ‘Us’ (South Africans) and ‘Them’ (foreigners).

Othering is a term that includes various views of preference based on aggregate characters (Fairclough, 2003). Foucault (1994: 318) argues that the “relations with others in turn always

occupy relations with oneself and vice versa”. The notion of otherness is key to understanding how identities are constructed (Hall, 1997). In addition, those with political power in a society control how other groups are represented (Hall, 1997). The discourse of otherness is set up as normal and obvious where particular groups are built up as being better than other, citizens are regarded as better than foreigners (Zevallos, 2011). Othering can be perceived as a political tool of imperialism (Said, 1991). In South Africa, asylum seekers, refugees and migrants are currently stereotyped as the other who are claimed to be problematic (Haynes et al, 2006: 10).

Othering is the construction of the self/in-group and the other/out-group through identification of some desirable characteristics that the self/in-group has that the other/out-group lacks (Brons, 2015). The in-group is made up of one or more groups and sets itself apart by giving itself an identity whereas the outgroup is a group that lacks identity due to stereotypes that are greatly stigmatising (Staszak, 2008). The outgroup are the others as they are prone to categories and customs of the dominant in-group as they cannot impose their own norms (Staszak, 2008). The outgroup (foreign nationals) is often grouped in lower categories in the hierarchy along with stigmatisations while the in-group (South Africans) rank themselves high in the hierarchy and setting themselves as different to the outgroup. The unevenness in the relations of power is focal to the construction otherness (Staszak, 2008). The dominant group positions itself to prescribe the value of its identity and to devalue the identity of others while enforcing corresponding discriminatory procedures (Staszak, 2008). Otherness is vital in providing an understanding as to how identities are constructed, power guides the representation of different groups (Hall, 1997).

Otherness is an important term used in the establishment of identities (Hall, 2013). Identities are perceived to be natural although this view is opposed by sociologists (Jani, 2018). Social identities are established through regular communications with numerous other individuals thus, identities are created through agreement and disagreement and transaction with other individuals (Mead, 1934). The ideas of similarity and difference are integral to the manner by which we achieve a feeling of identity and social belonging (Zevallos, 2011).

Othering can be defined as modifying a dissimilarity into otherness by establishing an in-group (a group where a speaker belongs to) and an out-group (a group where a speaker does not belong to) (Staszak, 2008). Othering can be perceived as another form of representation. Moreover, it forms as “result of a discursive process by which dominant in group (Us/the self) constructs one or many dominated out groups (them/other)” by stigmatising a difference real

or imagined presented as a contradiction of identity and thus a motive for potential discrimination (Staszak, 2008: 1). Othering is the outcome of a discursive process that forms through stigmatising a difference that is real or imagined caused by dominant in-group to the dominated out-group (Staszak, 2008). Othering incorporates a principle that enables individuals to be organised into two groups of ranking: us, the self and them, the other (Staszak, 2008). It consists of classification of the other person or group by setting aside and ignoring the involvement and individualism of a person (Clifford and Marcus, 1986). The outer group is coherent as a group as a result of its opposition to the in group and its lack of identity. This lack is based on stereotypes that are largely stigmatised and simplistic (Staszak, 2008).

Othering is an alternative to speaking racism, sexism, class, rather it is a way of addressing a phenomenon (Wren, 2001). Othering is embedded within the consequences of racism, sexism, class, or combination of the three in terms of degradation as well as processes of identity formation that is linked to this degradation (Jensen, 2011). Research has shown that popular press indulges in sometimes blatant “attacking foreigners” and the reproduction and affirmation of racist prejudices (Mbetga, 2015). However, the problem with othering is that it produces difference and problematize it, in the sense that the group which is othered is also in the process defined as morally and intellectually inferior (Shwalbe *et al*, 2000).

The unevenness in power relationships is focal to the construction of otherness (Staszak, 2008). This means that only the dominant groups are in a position to enforce the value of its values and to devalue the values of the others while imposing corresponding discriminatory measures (Staszak, 2008). For example, black groups (minority groups) were not represented as part of the British society or any society but as outsiders who preferably should be kept out (Mbetga, 2015).

Otherness forms as a result of discursive process by which dominant in group (Us/the Self) constructs one or many dominant out groups (Them/the Other) by stigmatising a difference real or imagined presented as a negation of identity and thus a motive for possible discrimination (Staszak, 2008). However, the paradigm can shift from being hated to being glorified and become part of ‘us’ (Hall, 2013). The theory of othering expresses how the press produces texts that include and exclude people based on their, class, ethnic and social difference, and their nationalities as well (Hall, 2013). The othering theory is mobilised in this study as analytical lens in order to establish if the othering narrative was conducted from the news stories published by Sowetan Live and Daily Sun from January 2022 to June 2022. This

is because this study investigates how foreign nationals were represented as Operation Dudula swept through the cities and townships of South Africa during this period.

## **Conclusion**

This chapter has presented the representation theory as the theoretical framework for this study. The theory is relevant in that it highlights how discourses are formed, maintained, and disseminated through language. Newspapers present and offer diverse representations of immigrants through language. Hall (1997:1) states that “in language we use signs and symbols to stand for or represent to other people our concepts and ideas and feelings. Language is one of the ‘mediums’ through which thoughts, ideas and feeling are represented in a culture”. Representation plays a significant role in the process whereby meaning is produced and exchanged between members of a certain culture (Hall, 1997). The society share ideas and meanings about how they view black foreigners, and their perception is sometimes linked to the media representations of the black foreigners in South Africa. It has been found that language is often used to create and maintain stereotypes about other people who are considered different, or Other, from the majority (Mbetga, 2014).

Representation emerges between the Self, Other and the Object world (Jovchelovitch, 2017). Stereotyping refers to the typical image that comes to mind when a person is thinking about a certain social group (Lipmann, 1922). This study will mobilise the theoretical concepts to examine how the selected news sources position Operation Dudula in relation to foreign nationals in their reporting. In other words, in their reporting, who is the Other and who is the Same/Subject? The following chapter explains the methodological approach that is adopted to address this, and other key questions.

## **Chapter Four**

### **Research Methodology**

#### **Introduction**

Methodology is defined as a plan, strategy or design that relates to the choice of methods to the desired outcomes (Creswell, 2003). It also refers to the techniques used in research to evaluate and analyse the research topic (Neuman, 2014). The study falls within the constructionist paradigm to examine how meanings are constructed. Hermeneutics was employed as the research design of the study. This chapter describes the qualitative research method as research data was collected and illustrated in the form of words and texts that provides analytical descriptions of how this study was conducted (Neuman, 2014). The data collected was sampled using purposive and temporal sampling. Additionally, the data used in this study will be analysed using content analysis and discourse analysis, guided by representation theory.

#### **Research Paradigm**

This study is situated within constructionist paradigm as it is interested in understanding how meanings are constructed through language. This paradigm views the society as constructed as it is interested in understanding how people live in their daily regular lives and how they communicate with each other (Irene, 2014). Moreso, people construct reality in their day-by-day exercises or practices. Similarly, individuals construct and create their own understanding of the world (Ritchie *et al*, 2013). This study is interested in understanding how the media produces identity constructions. Identity construction in media does not necessarily take place in isolation but also relates to other social, political, and economic factors (Fourie, 2008). It is vital to recognise that the construction of identities exist as a result of contestations and power struggles and is influenced by material circumstances and forces (Fourie, 2008.)

The constructionist paradigm seeks to understand values, constructions, and meanings of the social setting to acquire vital and ideal comprehension of cultural activities and encounters within the social world (Creswell, 2007). Champ (2008: 87) states that “It is believed that the way a message is structured may influence how meanings are interpreted”. Identities can be perceived as stories that circulate throughout cultures in the processes of production

consumption, regulation and representation (Champ, 2008). The study aims to examine how *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* reported on Operation Dudula and their treatment of black African migrants and if this supports or critiques xenophobic attitudes and behaviours.

Moreover, this approach was utilised in this study to attempt and comprehend the way newspapers depict Operation Dudula in relation to black African migrants. This study seeks to discuss the data gathered from *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* to scan for meaning through direct interpretation of what is perceived and what is reported. The constructionist paradigm serves a profound role in understanding the context of how research is conducted and socially constructed. In addition, this is to understand how the meanings of the depictions of black African migrants are constructed through the language, or discourses used in the *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*. The constructionist paradigm seeks to comprehend the phenomenon the study is investigating through the sharing of meaning with the study population considering their; language, association, correspondence, communication, and environment of the studied context (Walsham, 2006). In this study, the language used in the *Sowetan Live* and the *Daily Sun* news stories and headlines is analysed to evaluate the portrayal of black African migrants when the protests of Operation Dudula were most prominent from January 2022 to June 2022.

### **Qualitative Research Approach**

This research will be carried out using a qualitative research approach which is very useful when collecting and analysing data that is written, seen, or heard. Qualitative research entails acquiring and analysing data in the form of written or spoken words, as well as data that is textual (Neuman, 2014). Similarly, the qualitative research method entails collecting and analysing non-numerical data, such as data in the form of words, films, and sounds (Neuman, 2014). Qualitative research integrates a “set of interpretive material practices that make the world visible” (Denzin and Lincoln, 2018: 45). According to Myers (2009), a qualitative research approach is designed to help researchers understand people, and the social and cultural contexts within which they live. This allows for studies to use various complex data of the phenomenon to be explored and represented (Strauss & Corbin, 1998). Following this, the qualitative approach is useful for the purposes of this study as it aims to identify, or ‘make visible’ how newspapers report on Operation Dudula and if/how the reporting may support and/or critique xenophobia. It focuses on transforming the world into a succession of

representations (Denzin and Lincoln, 2018). Qualitative research uses language to understand the views surrounding the experiences of people and it creates a perception of a bigger realm of social relationships (Brennen, 2013). The purpose of this study is to understand the events surrounding the xenophobic/Afrophobic attacks in South Africa by developing causal explanations.

A qualitative research approach is suitable for this study because it is the aim of the study to explore the 'human side' of the global challenge of xenophobia. More specifically it examines how news stories represented black African nationals in the context of the Operation Dudula protests which became prominent in January 2022. The study uses this approach as it reflects the views of representation by Stuart Hall (1997 and 2013). People use language to communicate their visual, mental images with people they share the same culture with (Hall, 2013). The language in the *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* news stories represents the Operation Dudula campaign and their mission to have illegal foreign nationals removed from South Africa. This will be employed through analysing the language used in news articles and headlines from the *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* and if their reporting promoted or demoted xenophobic sentiments.

Qualitative research is a technique or process of inquiry that is employed to collect a comprehensive understanding of attitudes and the reasons beyond of these attitudes. This method is appropriate for collecting subjective data that focuses on attitudes, meanings, and representations. It is also useful when writing about social issues such as health and socio-economic issues, to convey people's perceptions about a specific event (Jansen and Warren, 2020). The qualitative research approach links with the research paradigm of the study as they both perceive reality as socially constructed. Qualitative research is a systematic and subjective approach to highlight and explain daily life experiences and to further provide them meaning (Burns and Grove, 2009). This study investigates the reporting of the events linked to Operation Dudula to understand the textual representation of foreign nationals and representation of Operation Dudula in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* and if these representations promote or demote xenophobic attitudes and behaviours.

Furthermore, qualitative studies usually use the inductive methodology technique which takes place by gathering data first and then analysing the data gathered afterwards to try and find meaning, solutions, or answers from the data (Denzin and Lincoln, 2011). Similarly, the news articles reporting on Operation Dudula, and black African migrants were first gathered in this



study and then analysed to identify how they are portrayed in these news stories. Qualitative research tends to be increasingly exploratory in nature, providing information of how individuals or groups forms part of the universe in their social contexts. A qualitative methodological approach was therefore used in this study to enable the study to illustrate themes and the categorisation of black African migrants in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* news articles.

In qualitative research, the researcher does not need to formulate a hypothesis to begin the research. It employs inductive data analysis to provide better understanding of the interaction of “mutually shaping influences” and to explicate the interacting realities and experiences of experiences of researcher and participant, this means that qualitative research is deductive (Lincoln and Guba, 1998: 200). Qualitative research allows for a design to evolve rather than having a complete design in the beginning as it is difficult to predict the outcome of interactions. Qualitative research is used to explore the potential backgrounds and factors about which little has been known and explored (Strauss & Corbin, 1998). An inductive method can be used with deductive methods to formulate the best results. An inductive method is used to support and challenge theoretical assumption (Merriam, 1998). In addition, data is analysed and interpreted in the light of the concepts of a particular theoretical orientation and the findings are discussed in relation to existing knowledge with the aim of demonstrating how the present study has contributed to expanding the knowledge base (Merriam, 1998). Therefore, this study uses both deductive and inductive methods.

### **Research Design: Hermeneutics**

A research design is a structure within which research is conducted, it involves the methodology for gathering, estimation and analysis of data (Kothan, 2004: 31). This study comprises of the hermeneutics research design. Hermeneutics is the science of interpretation (Crotty, 1998). In this study the intent is to identify the main narratives that are used by *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* when reporting on Operation Dudula and their treatment of black African migrants residing in South Africa. The language used in this reporting is studied to determine how and if the two selected newspapers are arguably critical and/or supportive of xenophobic sentiments. Hermeneutics is about interpreting meaning. This study will investigate the meanings found in the selected newspapers *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* by identifying dominant narratives from these two selected publications.

## Data Collection

Data collection is the process of acquiring qualitative data in such a way that the researcher can examine and assess the information or variables obtained is referred to as data collection (Johnston, 2014). Language is a basic element of our human interactions and meanings of social realities are constructed through language (Brennen, 2013). This study uses content analysis to aid in the process of selecting texts, in this case headlines and newspaper stories, that are known to provide traces of socially constructed reality, and this may be understood by considering words, concepts, ideas, themes and issues and issues that reside in texts as they are reconsidered within cultural context (Atkinson and Coffey, 2011).

Internet journalism and news has progressed to the point where it can be accessible at any time and from anywhere with an internet connection (Nguyen, 2010: 225). The internet has become cheaper and provides new opportunities for both the readers and the journalism sector with regards to “instantaneity, access, consumption and interactivity” (Karaaslan, 2019: 1). The circulation of print media newspapers has declined as online versions are available for free (Isyaku et al, 2015). As a result, the online editions of the *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* will be used in this investigation. The two online news sites are chosen for their accessibility and the facility of availability to find all the material catalogued by date and headline. The material used was acquired from *Sowetan Live* ([www.Sowetanlive.co.za](http://www.Sowetanlive.co.za)) and *Daily Sun* ([www.dailysun.co.za](http://www.dailysun.co.za)).

This study uses both these newspapers to gather and provide a substantial number of examples with the aim to include more than just one publication for some measure of representativity of the issues of representation of Operation Dudula and foreign nationals by online newspapers with a readership that predominantly comprises locals residing in the townships (Mokwena, 2014; Steenveld and Strelitz, 2010).

### *Purposive sampling*

Purposive sampling was employed in this research as a method used in qualitative research for recognition and arrangement of a variety of data cases for the effective operation of restricted resources (Patton, 2002). This sampling technique selects the most productive sample to answer the research question. Purposive sampling enables the researcher to make his or her own judgement when picking members in a population to participate in the investigation

(Bernard, 2000). Furthermore, it is a method of deducing information about a whole population from a limited number of units (Khan, 2014). However, no human participants were sampled in this study, this section explains the sampling procedure for *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* from January 2022 to June 2022.

This study incorporated 31 news articles obtained from January 2022 to June 2022 as the severity of the protests were most prominent during this time period (Teer-Tomaselli, 2021). The search words used when conducting a blunt search are; Operation Dudula, xenophobia, foreigners, xenophobic attacks, Afrophobia. However, no news articles were discovered when Afrophobia was used as a search word in the two selected publications.

There is a purposeful selection of two publications *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* as they cover daily political, social, entertainment and sport news. *Sowetan Live* is published by Arena Holdings in Johannesburg, Gauteng province (Sowetan Live, 2022). *Daily Sun* is published by Media24 owned by Naspers in Johannesburg, Gauteng province (Media24, 2022). *Daily Sun* is South Africa's largest daily paper with a readership of 3 821 000 (Media24, 2022). It was launched by Media24 in 2002 which is owned by Naspers which is a multinational internet and media company (Els, 2013). Naspers operates in over 130 countries and owns major brands like OLX, MWeb, Media24, Multichoice, PayU, Supersport, DSTV and Mnet (Els, 2013). *Daily Sun* targets black readers who are English literate with a minimum high school education and the working class in the townships (Steenveld and Strelitz, 2010).

*Daily Sun* is a tabloid with a sensational style of writing, it aims to validate the identity of its readers by reporting in their colloquial style and it relates to the everyday struggles and frustrations of the readers (Media24, 2022). *Daily Sun* is currently the most read newspaper with a readership of 4.3 million (Media24, 2022). *Sowetan Live* is published by Arena Holdings in 1981 (Sowetan Live, 2022). *Sowetan Live* has a circulation of 124 000 in sales with an audience of 1.5 million readers per month (Sowetan Live, 2022). *Sowetan Live* is a publication that takes on a journalistic formal style of writing. *Sowetan Live* is a daily newspaper that is published in English and also targets English literate black readership (Mokwena, 2018).

These publications were sampled because they are both available in print and as online newspapers, they both use English to cover news stories and have a large readership by South Africans living in townships. These features show that the stories they produce would possibly

reach a large audience. They are both affordable as they offer free online subscriptions to the readership.

*Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* hold a degree of power in manufacturing and disseminating discourses on black African migrants. Both newspapers dwell much on local stories and both newspapers are relevant to the South African community as local news is reported in an engaging manner. Most South Africans read news on their cell phones and computers. As of February 2018, there were around 43.9 million unique South African browsers of which 71 percent were mobile users. The daily average unique browser figure reached 5.1 million, while over 1.2 billion page views were taken in by local users (Narrative, 2018). In 2017, there were 22 daily and 25 weekly major urban newspapers in South Africa, most published in English and controlled by private players (South African Audience Research Foundation, 2017).

Purposive sampling will be employed in this research as a method used in qualitative research for recognition and arrangement of a variety of data cases for the effective operation of restricted resources (Patton, 2002).

#### *Temporal sampling*

The temporal sampling is influenced by Operation Dudula's activities. Operation Dudula emerged during the year 2021 with the reported aim to free South Africans from illegal immigrants (Ntuli, 2022). Their protests and activities, to raise awareness of the foreign nationals residing in South Africa without proper documents, peaked in January 2022 (Ntuli, 2022). Therefore, this study sampled data from news articles published between January 2022 to June 2022 as the severity of protests were most prominent during this time period (Teer-Tomaselli, 2021).

In terms of sample size, 31 articles were selected in total. 18 from the *Sowetan Live* and 13 from the *Daily Sun*.

Table 4.1 Sample size

Newspaper	Number of News Articles
<a href="http://www.Sowetanlive.co.za">www.Sowetanlive.co.za</a>	18
<a href="http://www.dailysun.co.za">www.dailysun.co.za</a>	13
<b>Total</b>	31

### Methods of data analysis

This study will identify and analyse the data using qualitative content analysis (Schreier, 2014), and the subsequent establishment of themes. These themes will then be analysed discursively in the light of representation theory to answer the study's research questions.

#### *Qualitative Content Analysis*

Qualitative content analysis is relevant in a study that aims to identify forms of representation in newspaper content over a period of time (Deacon, 1999). It will be used in order to identify specific “words, ideas, or concepts” within qualitative data that relate to the topic (teer-Tomaselli, 2021: 65). “Qualitative content analysis is a method for systematically describing the meaning of qualitative data” (Mayring and Schreier, 2012:172). Qualitative content analysis can be defined as a method that is used for systematically describing the meaning of qualitative data (Schreier, 2014). This can be accomplished by allocating consecutive chunks of the data to coding frame groupings (Schreier, 2014). “Qualitative content analysis includes repeated and extensive engagement with a text and investigates the material utilised to identify discourses and frames” (Connolly Ahern and Broadway, 2008: 369). Content analysis is an adaptable research method that enabled this investigation to use a wide scope of expository systems to produce discoveries and place them into context (White and Marsh, 2006). Using content analysis allows the researcher to start the process of identity the presence, meanings and relationships of such certain words, themes, or concepts (Patton, 2005).

Content analysis can be used to provide a great deal of information, it is helpful in revealing patterns in communication content (Mayring, 2010). The words that will be used to describe migrants in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* will be examined and explained in detail to outline the

significance of the employed discourses. This study seeks to analyse content involving Operation Dudula in the press. Content analysis can assist the study by enabling a systematic procedure of what is relatively constant and the changes that may occur across representation of Operation Dudula and foreigners in the *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* (Deacon et al, 1999). Content analysis guarantees the level of meticulousness, accuracy, and dependability for subsequent resulting data (Deacon et al, 1999: 139). This study examines the news stories in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* to identify either positive or negative reporting through the representation of foreign migrants and Operation Dudula and if these reports appear to support or criticise xenophobic attitudes and behaviours.

Content analysis is an exploration device used to decide the presence of specific words or texts or sets of writings (Elo & Kyngas, 2007). There are two general classifications of content analysis: conceptual analysis and relational analysis. Conceptual analysis is the setting up of the presence and recurrence of ideas frequently spoken to by words or expressions in a content (Busch *et al*, 2012). A concept is utilised for examination and the investigation involves evaluating and counting its essence (Busch *et al*, 2012: 3). As this study is not a quantitative study it will not count the number of times a term appears. Rather, due to its qualitative approach it uses selected search words as influenced by the study objectives, to select content for further discursive analysis that will be grouped together as themes. The search words are Operation Dudula, xenophobia, foreigners, xenophobic attacks, Afrophobia. The focal point of this investigation is to observe the occurrence of selected terms within a text or texts, although the terms may be implicit as well as explicit (Busch *et al*, 2012).

Relational analysis further analyses the relationships among concepts in a text (Busch *et al*, 2012). In relational analysis, one can identify what other words or phrases ‘foreigners’ or ‘migrant’ appear next to and then determine what different meanings emerge as a result of these groupings. The focus of relational analysis is to search for semantic or meaningful connections (Carley and Palmquist, 1992). Individual concepts are seen as having no inherent meaning. Meaning is a result of the connections among ideas in a text (Jani, 2018). According to Carley and Palmquist (1992), ideas are ‘ideational kernels’, these kernels can be thought of as symbols that obtain meaning through their associations and connections with different symbols. This relational analysis will be mobilised in a discourse analysis presented in Chapter Six.

In the qualitative content analysis process the study incorporates coding tables that include deductive codes, or search words, devised based on information gathered from previous

studies, terms, and concepts from research on xenophobia and the representation of black African immigrants as criminals, Afrophobia, the difference between xenophobia and racism and the push and pull factors of black African immigrants to South Africa. Using these search words certain articles were selected, and then these articles are inductively analysed.

The first phase, as presented in the first set of tables in the following chapter, will include a blunt search (first iteration) for suitable news stories. The search words used when conducting the search are; Operation Dudula, xenophobia, foreigners, xenophobic attacks, and Afrophobia. However, no news articles were found when Afrophobia was used as a search word. The second phase, as presented in the second set of tables in the following chapter, develops the second iteration by purposeful sampling from the first sets of tables by identifying sub-themes/categories. Sub-themes, otherwise known as categories, are ideas that are directly expressed in the text (Ravindran, 2019). The last section, as presented in the third set of tables in the following chapter, will include information on theme identification. Themes are more than categories, they are “like multi-faceted crystals – they capture multiple observations of facets” (Braun and Clarke, 2020: 13) that are reflexively generated by the researcher, knowing the study’s objectives and theoretical inclinations.

These themes will assist in addressing what narratives dominate the reporting of Operation Dudula and their treatment of foreign nationals in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*, and whether that reflect or critique xenophobia. Themes are “patterns of shared meaning, united by a central concept or idea (Braun and Clarke, 2013; Braun *et al.*, 2014). This means themes might draw together data that on the surface appear rather disparate. Braun and Clarke think of “themes as stories – stories we tell about our data” (Braun and Clarke, 2020: 14). In other words, this analytical process guided by representation theory will allow the identification and interpretation of the dominant discourses associated with Operation Dudula and black foreign nationals.

### *Discourse Analysis*

Discourses are broad systems of meaning and can be found in various forms such as texts, conversations, images, writing and videos (Waite, 2005). Discourses are ways of representing (Fairclough, 2003). Discourse is a “group of statements which provides a language for talking about – a way of representing the knowledge about a particular topic at a particular historical moment, discourse is about the production of knowledge through language. However, since all social practices entail meaning and meanings shape and influence what we do – our conducts

– all practices have a discursive aspect” (Hall, 1992: 291). Discourse can be used in two ways: as an abstract noun, with regards to language and as a type of semiosis involving elements of the social life as a count noun, this refers to certain ways of representing parts of the world (Fairclough, 2003). The use of language is affected by ideologies of people which may be referred to as ‘belief systems’ or foundational social beliefs of a general or ‘abstract nature’ (Els, 2013). Representation theory is employed in this study to expose how certain aspects, people (African migrants) and cultures of the world are represented and portrayed through discourse practices (Fairclough, 2003).

Discourses reveal how the mutual relationships between a group of statements within different cultural texts produce the meaning of a particular item that is seen to construct ‘truths’ about the social worlds to inform practice (Waitt, 2005). They are perceived to alter people’s views on all things. A discourse is considered to be an institutionalised way of thinking, it is a social limit that defines what can be said about a certain phenomenon (Antaki *et al*, 2003). Many ideologies develop as a result of legitimising or management of group conflicts, power relationships and dominance (Els, 2013). This study seeks to investigate the underlying negative and positive ideologies regarding how black African migrants are reportedly treated by Operation Dudula members. These ideologies are embedded within the discourse of the *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*.

Discourse analysis aims to discover the results of discourse with regards to actions, perceptions, or attitudes rather than simply the analysis of statements and texts (Waitt, 2005). In discourse analysis language is viewed as a social activity. Discourse can be differentiated in two ways with regards to communication technologies: two-way versus one-way communication and mediated versus non-mediated communication (Fairclough, 2003). This study will examine the discourses emerging from the language used by *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* when reporting on how Operation Dudula and black African migrants are represented.

The use of language is affected by the ideologies of people (Els, 2013). The media is responsible for not only relaying information to the public but also to distributes notions and discourses to support specific power relations (Smith, 2009: 18). Fairclough (2001: 2) states that ‘the ideological workings of language realise the exercise of power’. Struggles associated to power find their battleground in the body of texts as texts reinforce or change ideological perceptions (Els, 2013). Ideologies such as dominance and inequality are recognised within the social dimension. Positive and negative ideologies such as racist versus antiracist ideologies



may refer to either positive or negative connotations (Els, 2013). Negative ideologies are problematic as they may incur inequalities (Els, 2013).

Representation means using language to relay meaningful information about, or to represent the world to others (Hall, 2013). It encompasses the use of language, signs, and images to represent or symbolise things (Hall, 1997). Discourse analysis is a methodology that allows a vigorous assessment of what is meant when language is used and explain, focusing primarily on how African migrants were described in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* during the period when the Operation Dudula protests became prominent. Discourse analysis assists this study in examining the language (including metaphors) in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* to reveal how it constructs certain representations that either reflect or critique xenophobic sentiments.

### **Validity and Reliability**

This study was approved as an ethical exemption by the HSSREC under this protocol reference number HSSREC/00004852/2022

“Content analysis involves replicable and valid methods for making inferences from observed communications to their context” (Krippendorff, 1980: 69). Validity is the exactness which the findings precisely mirror the data (Noble and Smith, 2015: 34). On the other hand, reliability is the consistency of the scientific methods that accounts for individual and research strategy biases that may have influenced the findings (Noble and Smith, 2015: 34). It is vital to evaluate the quality of research if findings are to be used in practice (Spielberger, 1985: 9). Validity and reliability should be considered in this study as the precision, constancy and validity of the data rely upon it (Simon, 2011).

“Validity and reliability are perceived when the researcher is able to answer if the study plainly accesses the encounters of those in the setting of the study and if there was exactness in how sense was produced using crude data toward the end of data analysis” (Quillan, 2006: 302-6). Validity is verified when the research instruments fit the aim of the study and reliability is set to decide if the research design is equipped for wiping out presumptions and the impact of unessential factors. Furthermore, reliability refers to a measurement that supplies consistent

results with equal values (Blumberg *et al*, 2005). To summarise the above validity and reliability are used in this study to ensure accuracy (Haradhan, 2017).

Selecting news articles from *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* assisted with the thoroughness of this study by providing answers to the aim of the research. The credibility of the study was guaranteed in data analysis where discourse analysis was implemented (Kvale, 1991). News stories from the two newspapers were presented without any modification or alteration in this study. Enough time was assigned to the researcher to gather data, examine, and illustrate the data used in the study.

### **Limitations**

This study focuses on two daily newspapers, providing a deliberately selected sample that may or may not reveal generalisability across all South African newspapers. But it does provide the study data that is within the scope of a Master's study. This study also analysed news articles from only January 2022 till June 2022 which limits and fails to analyse news articles from other years of xenophobia/Afrophobia violence as it has been prominent in South Africa over the decades. However, the reason for this sample has been provided above.

### **Conclusion**

This chapter delineated the study's methodology. Placing it in a constructive paradigm, the study adopts a qualitative approach, and hermeneutic textual analysis design to elucidate the meaning and making of the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to black African migrants. It introduces the qualitative content analysis employed to purposively select the 31 newspaper articles from *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*, and how themes are generated from the content analysis that are discursively analysed in Chapter Six. It included an acknowledgment of the limitations of the study, and the data reliability and validity. The collected data will be presented in the next chapter.

## Chapter Five

### Data presentation

#### Introduction

This chapter presents the data from the content analysis to examine the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to black African migrants in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*. Moreover, this study focuses on analysing how and if these publications produced any stereotypes based on the differences amongst black African migrants.

This chapter presents the results of the study in accordance with the objectives of this study. Data used in this study was obtained from 31 news articles that were gathered from January 2022 to June 2022 from Sowetan Live and Daily Sun as the severity of the protests were most prominent during this time (Teer-Tomaselli, 2021).

There are different ways to conduct a content analysis. The coding instruments and process presented here is adapted from Jacob Nyarko (2015), Teer-Tomaselli (2018 ) and Elizabeth McDade-Montez *et al.* (2017) by Ruth Teer-Tomaselli (2021) who was the Principal Investigator for the Research project, “ Reporting of the South African COVID-19 pandemic experience: A content analysis of news values in the selection of coverage on two online based news sites, 23 March – 17 August 2020”. I was part of the second cohort of students to base their Honours study on this wider project, which has now been operational for the past three years. This method is thus founded on an established process, both by the scholars cited above and through its existence as a longitudinal research project within CCMS. This Master’s study does differ from my Honours as I have devised with an entirely new topic and research questions (focused on xenophobia and not COVID-19 reporting).

The first set of two tables shows the outcomes of the initial blunt search (first iteration), which started the data collection. The second sets of tables develop the second iteration by purposeful sampling from the first sets of tables by identifying sub-themes/categories. Sub-themes, otherwise known as categories, are ideas that are directly expressed in the text (Ravindran, 2019). The third sets of tables identify themes that will be discursively analysed in Chapter six. Themes are more than categories, they are “like multi-faceted crystals – they capture multiple

observations of facets” (Braun and Clarke, 2020: 13) that are reflexively generated by the researcher, knowing the study’s objectives and theoretical inclinations.

**Table 1a: Blunt search for the representation Operation Dudula in relation to foreign nationals in *Sowetan Live***

The purpose of this study is to examine the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to foreign nationals from January 2022 to June 2022. Table 1a shows that there are 19 news articles found in *Sowetan Live*. These articles were selected using the search words: Operation Dudula, foreigners and xenophobia and Afrophobia. However, no news articles were discovered when Afrophobia was used as the search word. The paragraphs for the selected stories ranged from 5 – 18 paragraphs.

*Table 1a: Blunt Search in Sowetan Live*

No.	Search word	Date	Headline of the online news article	Length in paragraphs
1	Xenophobia	28 April 2022.	20 illegal foreigners nabbed in early morning raid.	15
2	Xenophobia	27 March 2022	Anti-xenophobia and Operation Dudula protesters meet in Johannesburg.	5
3	Operation Dudula	03 March 2022.	Dudula takes on ‘Lux’ after vigilante raid.	13
4	Operation Dudula	07 April 2022.	Dudula takes of SA’s lax laws.	6
5	Operation Dudula	01 April 2022	Dudula Movement must deal with immigrants legally.	7
6	Operation Dudula	14 May 2022.	Dudula sends in its marchers to launch campaign in Western Cape.	12
7	Operation Dudula	22 March 2022.	EFF to take on Dudula over raid for drugs at its member’s home.	13
8	Operation Dudula	13 March 2022	‘We cannot treat refugees like animals’: Thulas Nxesi	18

			condemns Dudula campaign.	
9	Operation Dudula	30 March 2022.	How come Operation Dudula avoids wealthy areas like Sandton?	11
10	Operation Dudula	22 March 2022.	MPs slam Operation Dudula: 'Immigrants have rights too'.	10
11	Operation Dudula	18 April 2022.	One person dead, another wounded in clash between Operation Dudula and informal settlements residents.	5
12	Operation Dudula	10 March 2022.	Operation Dudula aims to create a better SA.	5
13	Operation Dudula	27 March 2022.	Operation Dudula backers turned away after event is halted in KZN.	15
14	Operation Dudula	16 February 2022.	Operation Dudula group come under fire in Alex.	17
15	Operation Dudula	06 April 2022.	Operation Dudula member appears in court over voice note that allegedly incites violence in KZN.	10
16	Operation Dudula	03 April 2022.	Operation Dudula-backed march over student's death stalls in Durban.	16
17	Foreigners	26 May 2022.	Public violence case over 'Dudula clash' with foreigners postponed to get footage.	6
18	Foreigners	29 March 2022	Legal immigrants can be 'acknowledged': Tshwane Dudula group.	8

19	Foreigners	14 February 2022	Fear grips foreign nationals as Dudula wave rages.	16
----	------------	------------------	--	----

**Table 1b: Blunt search for the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to foreign nationals in *Daily Sun***

Table 1b illustrates that there are twelve news articles found in *Daily Sun*. These news articles covered stories from January – June 2022 to gather information on how Operation Dudula is portrayed in relation to foreign nationals. These articles were selected using the search words: Operation Dudula, xenophobia, Afrophobia and foreigners. However, no news articles were discovered when Afrophobia was used as the search word. Table 1b show that 12 articles were found in the *Daily Sun*. The paragraphs for the selected stories range from 6 – 15 paragraphs.

*Table 1b : Blunt search in Daily Sun*

No.	Search Word	Date	Headline of the online news article	Length in Paragraphs
1	Operation Dudula	15 March 2022.	Fake DUDULA poster created to stir trouble.	14
2	Operation Dudula	24 March 2022.	Cops dudula Nhlanhla Lux!	9
3	Operation Dudula	13 March 2022.	Cops: We will deal with Operation Dudula.	8
4	Operation Dudula	19 April 2022.	Dudula march: One killed, five hurt.	7
5	Operation Dudula	28 March 2022.	Nhlanhla Lux- I'll be the happiest dead man!	13
6	Operation Dudula	29 March 2022.	Operation Dudula – Enough is enough!	8
7	Operation Dudula	10 April 2022.	Operation Dudula march in Durban.	14
8	Operation Dudula	20 April 2022.	Operation Dudula sets record straight!	14

9	Operation Dudula	17 February 2022.	Why Operation Dudula undermines the constitution!	6
10	Operation Dudula	24 April 2022	Nhlanhla 'Lux': Lesotho has apologized	17
11	Xenophobia	17 June 2022.	SUNSAYS: Don't get used by violent leaders!	11
12	Foreigners	17 June 2022	Dudula sweeps through Soweto!	15

**Table 2a: Identifying sub-themes/categories for the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to foreign nationals (*Sowetan Live*)**

Table 2a presents the 14 news stories selected from the 19 news stories found in the first table in *Sowetan Live*. Table 2a illustrates the sub-themes/categories. There are two sets of sub-themes identified for this study. The first deductive set (from previous studies) include *Criminals, illegal immigrants, and xenophobic attacks*. The second set of sub-themes are inductive (themes found in the newspaper articles): *Protecting SA from foreign invasion, foreign nationals have rights too, targeting foreigners from townships, foreigner's businesses thriving, and government has failed SA*.

*Table 2a: Identifying sub-themes/categories in Sowetan Live*

No.	Article Headline	Date	Deductive sub-themes/categories from previous studies	Inductive sub-themes/categories from articles
1	20 Illegal foreigners nabbed in early morning raid	28 April 2022	Illegal immigrants Criminals	Protecting SA from foreign invasion
2	Dudula 'victim' takes on 'Lux' after vigilante raid	22 March 2022	Illegal immigrants Xenophobic attacks	Government has failed SA
3	Dudula a result of SA's lax laws	07 April 2022	Criminals	Government has failed SA
4	Dudula movement must deal with immigrants legally	01 April 2022	Illegal immigrants	Foreign nationals have rights too
5	Dudula sends its marchers to launch Campaign in Western Cape	14 May 2022	Illegal Immigrants	Protecting SA from foreign invasion

6	Fear grips foreign nationals as Dudula wave rages	14 February 2022	Xenophobic attacks Illegal immigrants	Protecting SA from foreign invasion  Foreigner's businesses thriving
7	How come Operation Dudula avoids wealthy areas like Sandton?	30 March 2022	Criminals	Targeting foreigners in townships
8	Legal immigrants can be acknowledged	24 March 2022	Illegal immigrants	Foreigners have rights too
9	MPs slam Operation Dudula: immigrants have rights too	22 March 2022	Illegal immigrants	Foreign nationals have rights too
10	One person dead another wounded in clash between Operation Dudula and informal settlement residents	18 April 2022	Xenophobic attacks	Protecting SA from foreign invasion Targeting foreigners in townships
11	Operation Dudula aims to create a better SA	10 March 2022	Illegal immigrants	Protecting SA from foreign invasion  Government has failed SA
12	Operation Dudula comes under fire in Alex	16 February 2022	Xenophobic attacks	Targeting foreigners in townships
13	Operation Dudula backed march over students death stalls in Durban	03 April 2022	Illegal immigrants Criminals	Protecting SA from foreign invasion
14	We cannot treat foreigners like animals: Thulas Nxesi condemns Operation Dudula	13 March 2022	Illegal immigrants	Foreign nationals have rights too

**Table 2b: Identifying sub-themes/categories for the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to foreign nationals (*Daily Sun*)**

Table 2b presents 9 news stories selected from the 12 news stories discovered from *Daily Sun* during the blunt search. Table 2b illustrates the sub-themes/categories. There are two sets sub-themes identified for this study. The first deductive set (from previous studies) include: *Xenophobic attacks, illegal immigrants, stealing jobs and criminals, taking women from South*



*African men.* The second set of sub–themes are inductive themes (themes found in newspaper articles): *protecting SA from foreign invasion, targeting foreigners in townships and foreigners desperate and scared.*

*Table 2b: Identifying sub-themes/categories in Daily Sun*

	<b>Article Headline</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Deductive sub-themes/categories from previous studies</b>	<b>Inductive sub-themes/categories from articles</b>
1	Cops: We will deal with Operation Dudula	13 March 2022	Illegal immigrants	Protecting SA from foreign invasion
2	Dudula sweeps through Soweto	17 June 2022	Criminals Illegal immigrants Taking women from local men	Foreigners desperate and scared Targeting foreigners from townships
3	Dudula March: One killed, five hurt	19 April 2022	Xenophobic attacks	Targeting foreigners from townships
4	No to jobs for illegal foreigners!	20 February 2022	Stealing jobs	Protecting SA from foreign invasion
5	Operation Dudula – Enough is Enough!	30 March 2022	Illegal immigrants Stealing jobs	Protecting SA from foreign invasion
6	Operation Dudula march in Durban!	10 April 2022	Illegal immigrants	Protecting SA from foreign invasion
7	Operation Dudula sets the record straight!	20 April 2022	Criminals Illegal immigrants	Foreigners desperate and scared
8	SUNSAAYS: Don't get used by violent leaders	17 June 2022	Xenophobic attacks	Targeting foreigners from townships
9	Why Operation Dudula undermines the constitution!	17 February 2022	Xenophobic attacks	Protecting SA from foreign invasion

**Table 3a: Identifying themes for the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to foreign nationals (*Sowetan Live*)**

Table 3a illustrates the eight themes on representation that have been generated from *Sowetan Live*. An elaboration column and additional self-notes column is provided for purposes of later discussion. These eight-themes are : *accusations of non-compliance with South African law, Operation Dudula members believe South Africa is under attack and needs protection, foreign nationals are perceived to be better business people than locals, Operation Dudula members target foreign nationals living in townships, foreign nationals suffer from xenophobic attacks as the Operation Dudula organisation progresses, immigrants should be treated as human beings with rights, the South African government is accused of not dealing with illegal immigration, and immigrants are accused of living in South Africa without proper documentation*. These themes answer the research question: What narratives dominate the reporting of Operation Dudula and their treatment of foreign nationals in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*?

*Table 3a: Identifying themes in Sowetan Live*

	Main theme	Sub-themes	Elaborations	References to article	Additional self-notes
1.	Accusations of non-compliance with South African Law.	Criminals	Foreign nationals are accused of selling drugs, assault, murder, and trafficking people.	<p><i>20 Illegal foreigners nabbed in early morning raid.</i></p> <p><i>Operation Dudula aims to create a better SA.</i></p> <p><i>Operation Dudula comes under fire in Alex.</i></p> <p><i>Operation Dudula backed march over students death stalls in Durban.</i></p>	Most of the crimes foreign nationals are accused of committing have not been backed up by convictions.

				<p><i>EFF to take on Dudula over raid for drugs at its members home</i></p> <p><i>One person dead, another wounded in clash between Operation Dudula and informal settlement residents</i></p>	
2.	Immigrants are accused of living in South Africa without proper documentation.	Illegal immigrants	Foreign nationals are accused of migrating to South Africa unlawfully. They are accused of crossing borders without proper documents or extending their stays even after their permits have expired.	<p><i>Fear grips foreign nationals as Dudula wave rages.</i></p> <p><i>20 Illegal foreigners nabbed in early morning raid.</i></p> <p><i>Dudula sends its marchers to launch Campaign in Western Cape.</i></p>	This narrative is based on people's opinions and the street level narratives found in some of the articles.
3.	The South African government is accused of not dealing with illegal immigration.	Government has failed SA.	The government is expected to enforce measures to minimise illegal immigration.	<i>Dudula a result of SA's lax laws.</i>	The locals are worried that the government is failing to handle immigrants migrating to South Africa. They are worried the numbers will

					keep increasing and hence become a threat to the limited resources available. They believe forcing migrants to return their respective will help create a better country.
4.	Immigrants should be treated as human beings with rights.	Foreigners have rights too.	Foreign nationals are viewed as human beings too and they should be treated as humans with the right to live too.	<i>We cannot treat foreigners like animals: Thulas Nxesi condemns Operation Dudula.</i>  <i>Dudula movement must deal with immigrants legally.</i>	In some articles it is apparent that xenophobic acts are not supported and viewed as inhumane.
5.	Operation Dudula members believe South Africa is under attack and needs to be protected.	Protecting South Africa against foreign invasion.	There is a panic that foreigners are taking over South Africa. It is believed South Africans must fight back to save their country.	<i>Operation Dudula aims to create a better SA.</i>  <i>Dudula sends its marchers to launch Campaign in Western Cape</i>	South Africans are fearful and believe they need to protect the limited resources they have. They believe if they share the limited resources they have, they will have problems.
6.	Foreign nationals are	Xenophobic attacks.	Foreigners' lives have	<i>20 Illegal foreigners</i>	South Africa has been

	suffering as South African's rage increases.		changed due to the attacks, they have had to live in fear. Their human rights were violated continually.	<i>nabbed in early morning raid.</i>  <i>Fear grips foreign nationals as Dudula wave rages.</i>	continually facing xenophobic attacks over the years. In 2021 these attacks resurfaced as Operation Dudula was established.
7.	Foreign nationals are perceived to be well-equipped with business skills compared to locals.	Foreign owned businesses are thriving.	South Africans claim that starting a business is hard as illegal foreigners sell goods at a cheaper price.	<i>Fear grips foreign nationals as Dudula wave rages.</i>	In this article, foreign nationals express their anger as their businesses are destroyed. They do not understand how owning making a living for themselves affects South African residents.
8.	Operation Dudula members target foreign nationals living in township areas.	Targeting foreign nationals in townships.	The South African locals are accused of only targeting foreign nationals from townships and avoiding the ones in urban, suburban locations.	<i>How come Operation Dudula avoids wealthy areas like Sandton?</i>	

**Table 3b: Identifying themes for representation of foreigners (*Daily Sun*)**

Table 3b illustrates the seven themes on representation that have been gathered from *Daily Sun*. An elaboration column and additional 'self-notes' column is provided for the purposes of later discussion. The seven themes are as follows: *accusations of non-compliance with South African law, immigrants are accused of living in South Africa without proper documentation, accusations of taking the birth-right of South Africans, Operation Dudula members believe*

*South Africa is under attack and needs to be protected, foreign nationals are suffering as South African's rage increases, Operation Dudula members target locals living in township areas and South African men losing their women to foreign nationals.*

*Table 3b: Identifying themes in Daily Sun*

	<b>Main theme</b>	<b>Sub-themes</b>	<b>Elaborations</b>	<b>References to article</b>	<b>Additional self-notes</b>
1.	Accusations of non-compliance with the law of South Africa	Criminals	A case of murder and five counts of attempted murder have been registered for investigation. All the victims are reported to be South Africans.	<i>Dudula March: One killed, five hurt.</i>  <i>Operation Dudula – Enough is Enough!</i>	Members of Operation Dudula and Pimville residents in Soweto marched to chicken farm squatter camp in Kliptown against cable theft and a clash ensued.
2.	Immigrants are accused of living in South Africa without proper documentation.	Illegal immigrants	Foreign nationals are accused of residing in South Africa illegally.	<i>Operation Dudula – Enough is Enough!</i>	South Africans believe that most foreign nationals in the country do not have the proper documents that permits their stay.
3.	Accusations of taking the birth-right of South Africans.	Stealing jobs.	South Africans believe that companies offer foreigners low wages as they are desperate, leading to locals being forced to settle for less.	<i>No to jobs for illegal foreigners!</i>  <i>Operation Dudula – Enough is Enough!</i>	South Africans believe they are losing the battle over employment to foreign nationals as they are often overlooked by companies hiring unlike foreign nationals who are preferred.
4.	Operation Dudula	Protecting SA from	Since foreign nationals are	<i>Operation Dudula</i>	South African residents

	members believe South Africa is under attack and needs to be protected.	foreign invasion.	fighting back, South Africans are prepared to also fight for their country.	<i>march in Durban!</i>  <i>Dudula sweeps through Soweto.</i>	think illegal foreign nationals are responsible for the problems the country is facing.
5.	Foreign nationals are suffering as South African's rage increases.	Foreign nationals are helpless and desperate.	Foreign nationals have had to live in fear due to the xenophobic attacks.	<i>Operation Dudula – Enough is Enough!</i>  <i>Operation Dudula march in Durban!</i>	Foreign nationals have nowhere to turn to when they are attacked. The South African Police Services and Health Facilities are resources that can only be attained by South African citizens
6.	Operation Dudula members target foreign nationals living in township areas.	Targeting foreign nationals in townships.	The South African locals are accused of only targeting foreign nationals from townships and avoiding the ones in urban, suburban locations.	<i>Dudula sweeps through Soweto.</i>	
7.	South African men losing their women to foreign nationals.	Taking women from South African women.	Some locals have joined the Operation Dudula march as they want foreign nationals to be punished with for taking their women.	<i>Dudula sweeps through Soweto.</i>	South African men claim that foreigners attract women with their money and assets.

## **Conclusion**

This chapter was structured according to three sets of coding tables. The first set of tables included the first iteration (blunt search) which began the data collection. The second set of tables developed the second iteration by selecting articles from the first set of tables, that were most applicable to take into the coding stages for categories that were presented in the last two columns (both deductive and inductive). The third set of tables presents themes that will be discursively analysed in the following chapter and in the light of representation theory and the literature previously presented.



## Chapter Six

### Analytical Discussion

#### Introduction

This chapter presents the interpretation of the themes that were presented in the preceding chapter in the third set of tables. This analysis is generated from a discussion of the findings by applying a discursive analysis as influenced by the theory of representation (Hall, 1997; 2013), and the associated concepts of stereotyping and othering (Hall, 2013). Analysis will also be provided in reading the findings against the literature that was presented in Chapter Two. This is done in order to elucidate the representation of Operation Dudula in relation to foreign nationals.

The news articles selected in this study are analysed according to the headline, and the content of the news story and the subject positions. In other words, the kinds of categories or types of people and activities, and how they are characterised, along with discursive techniques. In discursive analysis it is important to be aware of the ‘action’ of words, in what they suggest has been ‘done’ and the words used to describe these actions or activities. The use of ‘colourful’ emotive, or descriptive language can indicate a strong discourse. Additionally, ideological leanings and relations of power, particularly in how the reporting reveals the power holder and those on whom power is being exercised, will be included in the analysis. Discourses are embedded in institutions that can reveal these relations (for example, medical, legal, or social justice discourses), and so these links will also be identified.

#### Discursive Discussion of Themes

The eight main themes emerged from *Sowetan Live* are *accusations of non-compliance with South African law, Operation Dudula members believe South Africa is under attack and needs protection, foreign nationals are perceived to be better business people than locals, Operation Dudula members target foreign nationals living in townships, foreign nationals suffer from xenophobic attacks as the Operation Dudula organisation progresses, immigrants should be treated as human beings with rights, the South African government is accused of not dealing*

*with illegal immigration, and immigrants are accused of living in South Africa without proper documentation.*

The seven main themes that emerged from *Daily Sun* are *accusations of non-compliance with South African law, immigrants are accused of living in South Africa without proper documentation, accusations of taking the birth-right of South Africans, Operation Dudula members believe South Africa is under attack and needs to be protected, foreign nationals are suffering as South African's rage increases, Operation Dudula members target locals living in township areas and South African men losing their women to foreign nationals.*

Some themes are common across both news sources. Therefore, the below will be structured according to selected themes for the discourse analysis, where examples from both sources will be analysed.

#### *Theme 1: Accusations of non-compliance with the South African Law*

The majority of the news articles in *Sowetan Live* reported on foreign national's non-compliance to South African law. The articles stated that the foreigners were criminals because they were selling drugs, involved in human trafficking, murdering South Africans, and selling counterfeit products. However, the crimes committed by foreigners were all based on allegations as there were no statements from police or statistics to prove these allegations. Some of the news articles from *Sowetan Live* cited South Africans who expressed that they do not want foreigners in South Africa because they commit crimes. According to Pineteh (2017), describing foreigners as 'criminals' is a contemporary street narrative created by daily press publications and public opinions. These street narratives act as instigators of xenophobic behaviours and attitudes as people believe they are true (Akinola, 2018). The section below presents a discursive analysis to substantiate this point, with a close engagement of selected headlines and extracts from the news story:

From *The Sowetan Live*, four articles present this theme:

*Operation Dudula backed march over student's death stalls in Durban (03 April 2022).* In this news article, foreign nationals were accused of murdering a student in Durban. The use of the word "backed" suggest that Operation Dudula members supported the general public. In the context of the march, it connotes a discourse of activism and social justice. The action included is Operation Dudula's demand in Operation Dudula's insistence that undocumented foreigners vacate South Africa.

*20 Illegal foreigners nabbed in early morning raid (28 April 2022).* The police conducted a raid in Soweto around the informal settlements in search for drugs, illegal firearms, illegal immigrants, and criminals. One person reported an illegal immigrant was arrested for being in possession of several bags of dagga/marijuana. Twenty undocumented people were arrested. The reporting suggests that an element of surprise was necessary for conducting an early morning raid, and the use of the slang word “nabbed” embeds the reporting in colloquial policing discourses, as it means to catch or arrest someone in wrongdoing.

*EFF to take on Dudula over raid for drugs at its members home (22 March 2022).* Operation Dudula members were accused of falsely barging in into a foreign national’s house, searching for drugs and assaulting him. Associating the political party, the Economic Freedom Fighters (EFF) in support of a falsely accused foreign national, suggests that the EFF does not tolerate false accusations. This arguably sets Operation Dudula up on contradistinction with the EFF, connotating that their activities involve unsubstantiated violence.

*One person dead, another wounded in clash between Operation Dudula and informal settlement residents (18 April 2022).* A clash between the Operation Dudula members and informal settlement residents was reported in this news article. Furthermore, it was reported that one person died, and one was wounded. The people reported to have been attacked which led to the death of one, was South Africans. The word “clash” not only sets Operation Dudula and informal residents up as opposites or in conflict but connotes a degree of violence.

From *Daily Sun*, the following two examples are selected to represent this theme:

*Dudula March: One killed, five hurt (19 April 2022).* South Africans were reported to have “clashed” with foreign nationals over accusations of cable theft against foreign nationals. The use of the word “clashed” in the article’s opening sentence may have been deliberately used to evoke not only the sense of opposition between the two groups but also the violence of the encounter. It was reported that one person died on the scene and five were taken to hospitals with gunshot wounds for medical treatment. The victims that were attacked were reported to be South Africans. The severity of the word “clash” highlights that the result of those actions was death.

*Nhlanhla ‘Lux’: Lesotho has apologized (24 April 2022).* Family, friends, and members of Operation Dudula attended the funeral of Kgomotso Diale who was shot and killed during protest the cable theft protest. It is reported that foreign nationals from Lesotho were allegedly accused of cable theft and when confronted shots were fired. The report highlights the subject

position of Operation Dudula's leader and the action that foreign nationals "apologised". This suggests that Operation Dudula feels vindicated in their involvement in the violence. Therefore, comparatively the foreign nationals are positioned as the perpetrators.

*Theme 2: Immigrants are accused of living in South Africa without proper documentation*

This theme illustrates that foreign nationals were represented as illegal immigrants in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*.

An example of this in *Sowetan Live* is:

*Dudula sends its marchers to launch Campaign in Western Cape (14 May 2022)*. The Operation Dudula members were reported to send their followers to raise awareness of the undocumented foreign nationals living in South Africa, by means of a march and a campaign in Cape Town. Moreover, Operation Dudula addressed that the dysfunctionality in the border control system in Cape Town has caused an influx of illegal immigrants. There is a sense of power and authority afforded to Operation Dudula in how they are reported to have the ability to "send" citizens to do their bidding. The use of the word campaign links to political activities, connoting a sense of organisation and strategic action.

In *Daily Sun* two articles are selected to represent this theme:

*Operation Dudula –Enough is Enough! (30 March 2022)*. In this news article, Operation Dudula members are reported to be protesting against undocumented foreigners as they believe they have to be stopped for causing crime and problems in South Africa. The emotive "Enough is Enough!" and the inclusion of the exclamation mark is deliberately used to suggest that Operation Dudula has run out of patience with undocumented foreigners. It is authoritative in its presentation possibly assigning power to Operation Dudula.

*Operation Dudula march in Durban! (10 April 2022)*. Operation Dudula members protested around the Durban CBD to hand over their memorandum to the police and to an official from Home Affairs. An excerpt reads, "They were in Durban, KZN on Sunday to launch the movement in the province and also to embark on a march aimed at spreading the message publications that illegal immigrants should go back to their home". The protest intended to have foreign nationals vacate the country immediately. The inclusion of the exclamation mark as a rhetorical device indicates it as a forceful command.

### *Theme 3: Taking the birth right of South Africans*

Foreign nationals are accused by many South Africans cited in these news stories that they steal jobs meant for South Africans. This theme was covered by *Daily Sun* in the following articles.

*No to jobs for illegal foreigners! (20 February 2022).* In this news article, Operation Dudula members are reported to have held a march in the streets of Johannesburg, the aim of the protest was to emphasise that most South African locals are unemployed because of foreign nationals. “On Sunday 20 February, they marched in the streets of Jozi from Gandhi Square, where they gathered in large numbers”. Various marchers were quoted to express their frustrations as they believe employment opportunities are scarce to South Africans due to the presence of foreigners that reside in the country. One quote positions Operation Dudula as the savior or protector of local people, “We hope our government can hear our cries. With Operation Dudula we want government to hear us and understand our position.” In this news article, foreign nationals are believed to accept work for minimum wages, and this affects the likelihood for South Africans to be employed. The inclusion of quotes from the South African marchers positions them as the subject of the article, while the foreign national’s views are not presented.

### *Theme 4: The South African government is accused of not dealing with illegal migration*

From the reporting, it appears as if Operation Dudula members are blaming the South African government for failing to deal with illegal immigrants migrating to South Africa. An example of this from *Sowetan Live* is:

*Dudula a result of SA’s lax laws.* Operation Dudula member (and former leader) Nhlanhla Lux addressed the supporters and members of Operation Dudula. He expressed that if the South African government had taken care of the borders there would not be a need for the Dudula organisation. He proclaimed that there is not a single government that can accommodate documented or undocumented foreign nationals. “Our laws governing the influx of either refugees or immigrants must be activated. Now we have accommodated fugitives, human trafficking syndicates, drug smugglers and all kind of criminals because of the state’s lax approach to immigration”. In this news article, Nhlanhla lux was afforded the power to demand for change with regards to how the South African government handles immigration issues. Moreso, he further accused the government of enabling South Africa to accommodate foreigners although they are the responsible for criminal activities and other problems the country has.

*Theme 5: Operation Dudula members believe South Africa is under attack and needs to be protected*

Operation Dudula members and other South African locals are reported as believing that South Africa should be protected from foreign nationals as they are accused of causing most of the country problems. An example of this from *Sowetan Live* is:

*Operation Dudula aims to create a better SA (10 March 2022).* Operation Dudula is reported to be a harmonious organisation that is aimed at creating a better country for all South Africans. They believe that by removing all undocumented foreign nationals from the country they would have met their goal as most of the problems the country has will decrease. The use of the words “better South Africa” aligns with an aspirational discourse, of something that can be achieved in the future and the power and action in doing so is assigned to Operation Dudula.

An example from *Daily Sun* is:

*Dudula sweeps through Soweto (17 June 2022).* In this news article, Operation Dudula members and supporters claim that most of the problems South Africa has are a result of undocumented foreign nationals. Operation Dudula members believe protesting and shutting down businesses of foreign nationals is a way of fighting and will have foreign nationals removed from the country. The use of the metaphoric “to sweep” through and close foreigner’s businesses signals that it is done with force, yet also carries the meaning ‘to clean up’. Hence, cleaning Soweto of foreign nationals.

*Theme 6: Foreign nationals are suffering as South African’s rage increases.*

In *Sowetan Live* foreign nationals are reported to be under attack as South Africans want them removed from their country. Foreign nationals are reported to be helpless and desperate. An example is:

*Fear grips foreign nationals as Dudula wave rages (14 february 2022).* Operation Dudula was reported in this article to lead a campaign to force undocumented foreign nationals out of their informal trading stalls in Johannesburg CBD, Alexandra, and Orange Grove. This article appears to be written from a sympathetic position, showing that foreign nationals are afraid. With a deeper consideration of the use of words, “fear grips” suggests that their fear is taking hold or controlling them. In the context of the “raging wave”, this insinuates that Operation Dudula is in a powerful position to act with great force or violence. Although reported as being

in a position of power, the article also mobilises a xenophobic discourse showing Operation Dudula to be unfair and forceful.

In the *Daily Sun* as xenophobic attacks and protests persist, reporting represents foreign nationals as fearful:

*Operation Dudula march in Durban! (10 April 2022).* In this news article, Operation Dudula members are reported to be protesting to have foreign nationals removed from the country. “As they marched singing and shouting that foreigners must leave immediately, the streets were empty and many shops were closed”, this may have been because foreigners were in fear of being attacked and in fear of their businesses being attacked. However, the protests intensified “when the marchers got to the corner of Dr Pixley ka Isaka Seme and Mahatma Gandhi roads, chaos broke out as some people threw stones and bottles from the flats, almost hitting and injuring the marchers”.

*Theme 7: Immigrants should be treated as human beings with rights*

Foreign nationals are represented as human beings with rights. *Sowetan Live* published two news articles that covered this theme:

*We cannot treat foreigners like animals: Thulas Nxesi condemns Operation Dudula (13 March 2022).* The Minister of Employment and Labour, Thulas Nxesi expressed that the Operation Dudula approach creates confrontation and can lead to violence. He proclaimed that foreign nationals have rights too and should not be treated like animals. This article proclaims a distance between the South African government and Operation Dudula through the use of the word “condemns”. It shows the Minister to be concerned about the social justice afforded to foreigners and calls to end their mistreatment where they are often unfairly treated as “the Other” (or as animals).

*Dudula movement must deal with immigrants legally (01 April 2022).* This news article argues that foreign nationals are not responsible for the economic problems South Africa has. It states that South Africans are divided over the Operation Dudula organisation as not everyone supports it. By calling for Operation Dudula to deal with immigrants “legally” it connects to institution of law as the fair correct. What is therefore implied is that Operation Dudula’s treatment of foreign nationals is usually unlawful.

*Theme 8: South African men losing their women to foreign nationals*

Foreign nationals are accused of “taking” women from South African men in this news article covered by *Daily Sun*:

*Dudula sweeps through Soweto (17 June 2022)*. A group of Operation Dudula members protested across Soweto to force foreign nationals to leave South Africa. This article has been referred to as an example above, but it is included again as it speaks to the issue of “taking women”. People joined the protest for different personal reasons, a local confessed that he joined because a foreign national had taken his women from him. This example portrays that local South African men perceive foreign nationals to be a personal threat in that local women are being “taken” by foreign nationals. The use of the word “taken” suggests that the man who is a source in this article views women as his property. This proprietary discourse connects to South Africa as a patriarchal society. This patriarchy may therefore be seen to be part of the intolerance towards foreign nationals..

*Theme 9: Foreign nationals are perceived to be well-equipped with business skills compared to locals*

*Sowetan Live* reported in this news article that foreign nationals are perceived to possess better business acumen when compared to South African locals.

*Fear grips foreign nationals as Dudula wave rages (14 February 2022)*. Operation Dudula members were reported in this news article to be furious as they protested for foreign nationals to leave the country, they accused foreign nationals of closing down many South African businesses as they sold items at a lower cost. When the journalist interviewed a foreign national Dube he said, “*In a few days I was back I has managed to make R770*”. After the situation had returned to normal after the protests, foreign nationals were able to return to their respective trading stalls. Dube further expressed that his life depended on him selling outside the mall and if the protests continued he feared that he might become homeless. Many foreign nationals take their businesses seriously as they depend on them to earn a decent living.

*Theme 10: Operation Dudula members target foreign nationals who live in township areas*

Operation Dudula members are reported to only target foreign nationals in townships and not the people who reside in suburbs. An example from *Sowetan Live* covered this theme in one of their articles:

*How come Operation Dudula avoids wealthy areas like Sandton? (30 March 2022)*. This news article reported that Operation Dudula and other South African members that support



xenophobic attitudes and behaviours as “xenophobes” target poor working-class foreign nationals who are extremely vulnerable and live under the most difficult circumstances as some sleep on the floors of their spaza shops while others rent shacks in informal settlements. *“Though they claim to be wanting to rid the country of drugs and human trafficking, which they claim foreign nationals are responsible for, they don’t seem to have the appetite to attend issues in Sandton”*. This article explains the unfortunate contradiction of events as it reports that *“Operation Dudula members doesn’t see rich foreign nationals, even the undocumented and criminal ones, as the problem. They are shielded by the privilege that living in Sandton affords them”*. It is reported that foreigners living in the richest areas of South Africa are spared the indignity and dehumanisation that is suffered by the poor working-class immigrants. The direct use of the word “xenophobes” in relation to Operation Dudula situates their actions in the discourse of xenophobia. The question posed by the headline is a rhetorical device that encourages the reader to think about why only poorer foreign nationals are targeted, thus appearing to foreground a sympathetic tone for the poorer groups of foreign nationals and referring to class discrimination.

### **Analysis of the identified themes and discourses in relation to the literature and theory of the study**

This section will analyse the identified themes and their associated discourses by linking them to the literature and theory of the study. This study aims to analyse how *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* represented news stories surrounding Operation Dudula and foreign nationals.

#### *Stereotypes*

South African locals are reported to ascribe to xenophobic behaviours and attitudes to foreign nationals as they blame them for most of the problems the country faces. News articles from *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* represented foreign nationals in a negative light. The themes *non-compliance with the South African law, being in South Africa without proper documentation, being in South Africa without proper documentation and taking the birthright of South Africans* define that foreign nationals in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* were represented through the use of negative stereotypes during the Operation Dudula protests that took place from January 2022 to June 2022.

Criminality is the predominant stereotype; thus, supporting previous studies that have found that foreign nationals have been positioned as criminals in news reporting (Lakeoff and Ferguson, 2006). In the two selected sources criminality is reported in terms of theft, drug

smuggling, human trafficking syndicates and selling counterfeits/expired goods. Additionally, the word illegal does not highlight criminality, but highlights otherness (Kariithi et al, 2017).

Foreign nationals are also stereotyped to burden the healthcare facilities of South Africa. Immigrants are accused of overcrowding maternity wards, in particular adding to the woes of the already overwhelmed public health sector (Mkize, 2019: 1). Hevens and Brand (1997) and Hathaway (2001) argued that South Africa could not meet the needs of its entire population, therefore it has no responsibility for ensuring an acceptable level of health and health care for refugee communities.

Another significant negative stereotype is that foreign nationals ‘take women from South African men’. Foreign nationals are perceived to attract South African women with money (Tafira, 2014). Whereas South African men believe that non-wealthy foreigners from Mozambique and Zimbabwe use love charms to attract the women that all kinds of men want (Tafira, 2014).

Foreign nationals are also stereotyped as invaders (parasites) (Kariithi *et al*, 2017) in the theme *Operation Dudula members believe South Africa is under attack and needs to be protected*. This theme was covered in both *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*. South African locals and Operation Dudula members insinuate that foreign nationals are “taking over” South Africa, leading to instances where more people will want to attack foreign nationals because they feel threatened, and they also want to protect their land. The media is accused of inciting violence because of exaggerating and reinforcing stereotypes about foreign nationals and provoking more violence in the process (Pineteh, 2017; Mgogo & Osunkunle, 2021).

Dominant ‘stereotypes’ or representations of Operation Dudula allude that the intention of the organisation is have foreign nationals removed from South Africa, and by means of force, through the use of words like “sweep”, “rage”, “wave”, “raid”. The dominant representations of Operation Dudula illustrate how the power and assertiveness is assigned to the Operation Dudula organization in much of the reporting. Newspaper articles from *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* uses authoritative language in their representation possibly assigning power to Operation Dudula as these representations suggest Operation Dudula has the power to have foreign nationals removed from the country. Additionally, the subject position of both Operation Dudula Members and South African supporters are included in the reporting as direct quotes as sources, yet foreign national’s views are not included in these same news articles.

## *Othering*

In addition to stereotypes, the term “illegal immigrant” does not necessarily highlight criminality but highlights otherness (Karitthi et al, 2017), as found in news stories published in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*. This concept illustrates the ‘us vs them’ relationship between the South African locals and foreign nationals (Moyo and Mpofu, 2020). Operation Dudula can be viewed as the perpetrator for this othering narrative, as South Africans believe that foreign nationals hinder the development of their country and should thus return to their host countries. Operation Dudula members associate foreign nationals with negative stereotypes, they are perceived to be involved in criminal activities and to be responsible for problems existing in the country. Foreign nationals are represented to be ‘the Other’ as South Africans (the Self) perceive them as people that cause most of their problems and should therefore leave the country so that South Africans (the Self) will live peacefully in their country.

Articles in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* reported that foreign nationals were not welcomed in South Africa “*being in South Africa without proper documentation*”. This was done by quoting people in the news articles saying that they want them to leave the country. The headlines of news articles from *Sowetan Live* that reported on this were, *Fear grips foreign nationals as Dudula wave rages, and 20 Illegal foreigners nabbed in early morning raid*. They further elaborated through quoting various individuals who compare the differences between South Africans and foreign nationals. This was one of the ways newspapers created a sense of non-belonging through stories with sources and headlines that lead to discrimination against foreign nationals.

Newspapers hold a crucial responsibility in the way in which individuals see and comprehend migrants (Happer and Philo, 2013). Therefore, the way in which the media represents foreigners in South Africa builds a narrative that differentiates Us (South Africans) from Them (foreign nationals) (Pineteh, 2017).

Identity is formed as a result of comparing two groups. The idea of otherness is key in understanding how identities are constructed, because those in power in society control the representation of different groups (Hall, 1997). *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* represented foreign nationals based on mainly negative stereotypes that lead to differentiating between South Africans and foreign nationals. Otherness is all about differentiating between us and them (Staszak, 2008). Otherness is due to the difference of the other than to the point of view and the discourse of the person who perceives the other as such. Opposing Us, the self and them,

the Other, is to choose a criterion that allows humanity to be divided into two groups: one that embodies the norm (South Africans) whose identity is valued and the other that is defined by its faults, devalued and susceptible to discrimination (foreign nationals) (Staszak, 2008). South Africans perceive foreign nationals as migrants that have unlawfully migrated into their country to cause problems. Foreign nationals are linked to negative activities that happen in the country, they are accused of conducting criminal activities, stealing jobs from South Africans, being in the country without proper documents, and taking women from South African men.

### *Sympathy in the context of power*

Newspaper articles frequently emphasise negative narratives with regards to foreigners while disregarding good news (Crush, 2008). In its opinions toward foreigners (particularly African Black foreigners), the media can be biased and at times outright racist (Jetten et al, 2001). According to Mawadza (2012), regardless of their diverse courses and trajectories, these migrants are frequently depicted in a negative light by locals, who accuse them of being job snatchers, drug traffickers, scam artists, and career criminals. However, it should be noted that the media can, at times, represent foreign nationals in a positive manner. Foreigners do not simply take from the host country; they also contribute to the economy and benefit the country as a whole as they own small to medium trading stores, foreigners pay taxes (Meintjies, 1998). There has been a shift towards a more favourable or neutral coverage of migration issues in several countries (Allen et al, 2017). Additionally, not all news articles represented foreign nationals negatively as some news articles from *Sowetan Live* acknowledged foreign nationals as human beings deserving of rights too, drawing on social justice and legal discourses.

Some news articles from *Sowetan Live* are balanced with positive stereotypes unlike news articles from *Daily Sun* that represented foreign nationals using negative stereotypes. The theme *immigrants should be treated as human beings with rights* were represented in two news articles in *Sowetan Live*: *We cannot treat foreigners like animals: Thulas Nxesi condemns Operation Dudula and Dudula movement must deal with immigrants legally*. The positive stereotypes in *Sowetan Live* try to change the dominant and negative stereotypes. This is known as counter-stereotype. A counter-stereotype is a portrayal that purposely sets out to change the dominant and negative stereotypes (Stewart and Kowaltz, 2007). However, positive stereotypes are slow to circulate therefore, positive stereotypes are oppositional representations due to how slow they are circulated (Howarth, 2006). The sympathetic tone of some of the

reporting, identified in the discussion section above, insinuates that the violence levelled at poor foreign nationals by Operation Dudula is unfair. This may also add to the counter-narrative.

Although a sympathetic tone or narrative is evident in some reporting, articles like *fear grips foreign nationals as Dudula wave rages*, still locates much of the power with Operation Dudula. This study examines the manner in which Operation Dudula is represented as the study uses the representation theory to investigate this. Representation means using language to relay meaningful information about, or to represent the world to others (Hall, 2013). Hence, language serves an essential role to this study. The language used to represent Operation Dudula assigns power and authority to the organisation as news articles from *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* suggest that Operation Dudula has the power to remove foreign nationals from South Africa. Although a sympathetic or supportive narrative is used, this type of reporting gives credence to the power of Operation Dudula by showing how foreign nationals are almost ‘immobilised’ or gripped by their fear.

## **Conclusion**

This chapter provided a discursive analysis of news article headlines and excerpts as a way in which to interpret the dominant representations of both Operation Dudula and foreign nationals in the *Daily Sun* and *Sowetan Live*.

Operation Dudula is commonly known as a xenophobic vigilante group (Mthombeni, 2022). However, it is vital to note that the actions of the Operation Dudula movement may be perceived as Afrophobic rather than xenophobic as it targets black African immigrants rather than white immigrants. Operation Dudula is reported to targets drug traffickers and businesses that allegedly hire illegal foreigners for work at lower wages (Sibanda, 2022). However, the members of Operation Dudula dispute these allegations claiming that the movement aims on improving the conditions of the township communities by removing undocumented foreign nationals and providing opportunities for marginalised South Africans (Khau, Sibanda & Mthombeni, 2022). Operation Dudula members claim that the movement is a ‘peaceful-loving’ movement that is aimed at creating a better South Africa that is free from undocumented immigrants (Khau, Sibanda, & Mthombeni, 2022). Operation Dudula claims that their mission is to have only undocumented immigrants returned to their respective countries and not immigrants who are here lawfully (Myeni, 2022). Despite these claims Operation Dudula uses unlawful tactics and force to remove foreign nationals. News articles like: *Fear grips foreign*

*nationals as Operation Dudula wave rages* report on foreigners as being surrounded with fear as their trading stalls were destroyed and they were forced to vacate their premises.

This chapter illustrates that *Daily Sun* has mostly negative representations of foreign nationals, while *Sowetan Live* has a balance of negative and positive (or sympathetic) representations of foreign nationals. Both these publications use negative stereotypes to represent foreign nationals while the representations of Operation Dudula, may not necessarily be positive, as much of what is reported shows them to be violent and forceful, and therefore Afrophobic. Yet the majority of the news articles do position them as powerful, organised and with the best interests of South Africans at heart, to “sweep out” the ills supposedly cause by foreign nationals. The way in which both publications reported on Operation Dudula and xenophobic/Afrophobic attitudes and behaviours exposed how the media represents foreign nationals as the Other by highlighting the differences between South Africans and foreign nationals.

## Chapter Seven

### Conclusion and

### Recommendations

#### Introduction

This study explored the examination of Operation Dudula in relation to black African migrants in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* from January to June 2022. The study utilised qualitative data from the news stories available from the selected publications online. Additionally, the study identified if the representation of black African migrants supported or critiqued xenophobic/Afrophobic attitudes and behaviours in their reporting language. This was conducted with the intention to establish the narratives associated with Operation Dudula in relation to black African migrants and the discourses that serve as ‘evidence’ for these narratives found in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*.

Representation theory (Hall, 1997 & 2013) and the associated concepts of othering (Hall, 1997 & 2013; Said, 1978; Spivak, 1988), and stereotyping (Staszak, 2008; O’Sullivan *et al*, 1994; Hall, 1997 & 2013) guided this study, assisting with an in-depth analysis of the news stories. The language used in newspapers is important to analyse as it contributes to the everyday discourse of different societies. Language influences how people perceive those they read about in the press, in this case language influences how South Africans perceive both Operation Dudula and black African migrants.

#### Summary and Synthesis of Findings

*Main themes that emerged from the reporting of Operation Dudula and foreign nationals in Sowetan Live and Daily Sun from January 2022 to June 2022*

The study’s findings on the representation of foreign nationals were organised under these themes: *accusations of non-compliance with South African law, Operation Dudula members believe South Africa is under attack and needs protection, foreign nationals are perceived to be better business people than locals, Operation Dudula members target foreign nationals living in townships, foreign nationals suffer from xenophobic attacks as the Operation Dudula organisation progresses, immigrants should be treated as human beings with rights, the South*

*African government is accused of not dealing with illegal immigration, and immigrants are accused of living in South Africa without proper documentation, foreign nationals are suffering as South African's rage increases, Operation Dudula members target locals living in township areas and South African men losing their women to foreign nationals.* Many of these themes highlight the othering between 'us' as South Africans and 'them' as foreign nationals. Seven articles from the 19 news articles selected from *Sowetan Live* covered the theme; *accusations of non-compliance with South African law* which represented foreign nationals as criminals whereas, two news articles from the 12 news articles selected in *Daily Sun* covered the theme. Based on this, it is evident that biased reporting towards foreign nationals still dominate the press through the use of negative stereotypes and prejudice.

The following section synthesises and summarises the study's findings in direct relation to its research objective which was to identify and examine the narratives that dominate the reporting of Operation Dudula and their treatment of foreign nationals in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun*? To do so, the section will also include responses to the two main research questions that guided this investigation: 1.) What evidence is there, in terms of reporting language, to support that reporting may be viewed or labelled as Afrophobic/xenophobic? 2.) What evidence is there, in terms of reporting language, to support that the reporting critiques Afrophobic/xenophobic thinking?

#### *Narratives that dominate the reporting of Operation Dudula and their treatment of foreign nationals in Sowetan Live and Daily Sun*

Most of the themes discovered from the data collected in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* contain narratives that expose foreign nationals as a problem to South Africa and highlight how Operation Dudula members and other South African locals believed that if foreign nationals returned to their host countries, things would improve. Such themes represented foreign nationals particularly black African migrants in a negative light. The press constructs messages that depict black African migrants as the 'Other'.

This confirms what the previous research has found that indeed newspapers in South Africa tend to represent migration stories and foreign nationals in a negative light (Danso and McDonald, 2001, Pineteh, 2017, Khwebulana, 2021 and Jani, 2018). A lot of negative themes merged from previous studies where foreign nationals were represented by the stereotypes; drug lords, job stealers, illegal immigrants, women snatchers etc. (Nyamjoh, 2010 and Kariithi et al, 2017).



From this study's discursive analysis, the following was found:

Evidence, in terms of reporting language, to support reporting is aligned to Afrophobic/xenophobic sentiments

The predominant narrative aligns to xenophobic sentiments. This argument is based on the following evidence from the discursive analysis.

The subject positions of Operation Dudula and local South African citizens are often foregrounded in the articles, including quotes from both of these groups. However, foreign nationals are not (or seldom) afforded the same opportunity to voice their opinions or concerns. An article that highlights foreign nationals as apologising for a clash, suggests that Operation Dudula feels vindicated in their involvement in the violence. Therefore, comparatively foreign nationals are positioned as the perpetrators.

The reporting language often frames Operation Dudula as the protector of South African citizens, seeking social justice through marches and activism. These marches are often explained as a means to achieving a "better South Africa" which aligns to an aspirational discourse, of something that can be achieved in the future and the power and action in doing so is assigned to Operation Dudula.

On the other hand, the news stories often include reporting where Operation Dudula and South African citizens (stereotypically and) consistently refer to foreign national as criminals. They are labeled drug smugglers and human traffickers. They are also labeled as thieves, both of South African jobs and of South African women. While previous research has stated that the portrayal of foreign nationals as possessing good business acumen is a positive representation (Pineteh, 2017; Jani, 2018), the sources for this study framed it negatively as stealing jobs. This proprietary discourse connects to South Africa as a patriarchal society. This patriarchy may, therefore, be seen to be part of the intolerance towards foreign nationals. The criminal stereotype is also reinforced with reference to policing discourses.

A sense of non-belonging and othering is set up on the reporting language. Not only are these discourses of difference, but also great force. The word "clash" is used frequently, and it not only sets Operation Dudula and foreign nationals up as opposites or in conflict but connotes a degree of violence. The use of the metaphoric "to sweep" through and close foreigner's businesses signals that it is done with force, yet also carries the meaning 'to clean up'. Hence, cleaning Soweto of unwanted foreign nationals.

This leads to the next main finding that Operation Dudula is portrayed as possessing great authority, power, and organisation.

In many of the headlines that accompany a quote from Operation Dudula, the inclusion of the exclamation mark as a rhetorical device indicates a forceful command, possibly assigning power to Operation Dudula. There is a sense of power and authority afforded to Operation Dudula in how they are reported to have the ability to “send” citizens to do their bidding. The use of the word campaign links to political activities, connoting a sense of organisation and strategic action. In one article, former Operation Dudula leader is represented as demanding change from the South African Government, accusing the government of enabling South Africa to accommodate foreigners although they are responsible for criminal activities.

In comparison, the reporting language used to describe the foreign nationals portrays them as helpless and fearful, who run away. Although there is an element of sympathy in this reporting, it can also (possibly even inadvertently) give credence to the power of Operation Dudula by showing how foreign nationals are almost ‘immobilised’ or gripped by their fear.

#### Evidence, in terms of reporting language, that critiques Afrophobic/xenophobic

While this study did not find any articles that were an overt critique of Afrophobic/xenophobic, there is evidence that a sympathetic narrative, supportive of foreign national rights and safety were published, although to a lesser degree.

An article reports that Operation Dudula’s “raging wave” against the foreign nationals was unfair and unnecessarily forceful, causing fear. Similarly, another article highlights some of Operation Dudula’s violent actions as unsubstantiated and unlawful. This is particularly evident in how the Economic Freedom Fighters (EFF) is reported as being in support of a falsely accused foreign national, suggesting that the EFF does not tolerate false accusations. This arguably sets Operation Dudula up on contradistinction with the EFF, connotating that their activities involve unsubstantiated violence.

Similarly, the article that reports Minister of Employment and Labour, Thulas Nxesi, as “condemning” Operation Dudula for mistreating foreign nationals distances the South African government from Operation Dudula. By calling for Operation Dudula to deal with immigrants “legally” it connects to the institution of law as fair and correct. What is, therefore, implied is that Operation Dudula’s treatment of foreign nationals is usually unlawful. That the Minister is reported as stating “*We cannot treat foreigners like animals*” and that “*immigrants should*

*be treated as human beings with rights*”, counters the othering narratives that typically dominate reporting, by appealing for empathy and social justice. This report could be considered as including a counter-stereotype, as a portrayal that deliberately sets out to change an earlier representation or seeks to portray a group in a positive light (Stewart and Kowaltzke, 2007).

Another article highlights how Operation Dudula appears to only confront poor foreign nationals. The question posed in the headline, “*How come Operation Dudula avoids wealthy areas like Sandton? (30 March 2022)*”, is a rhetorical device that encourages the reader to think about why only poorer foreign nationals are targeted, thus appearing to foreground a sympathetic tone for the poorer groups of foreign nationals and referring to class discrimination.

### **Contributions to the field of the study**

This research has contributed to the study of print media and xenophobic discourses. This study advances from studies that focus on media representation of only foreign nationals during xenophobic attacks. This was accomplished by analysing how *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* represented news stories pertaining to Operation Dudula, who are usually considered the perpetrators of xenophobia and their treatment of foreign nationals, and if their reporting supports or critiques xenophobic/Afrophobic attitudes and behaviours in their reporting language.

### **Recommendations for Further Research**

This is a crucial area of research as foreign nationals continue to be attacked by South Africans over one and the same reason every year. This study recommends more research to be conducted on Operation Dudula as this study only investigated news articles that reported on Operation Dudula from January 2022 to June 2022 in *Sowetan Live* and *Daily Sun* when the protests by the organisation became prominent. More research could still be conducted on the events surrounding Operation Dudula that took place after June 2022 to present times. Research should not be limited to print media but also include broadcast media, social media, and online media. Moreover, broadcast media should be included in research as most people in South Africa still listen to radios and to them they are the only way to access information about what is happening around the world. Broadcast media should also be included as it is accessible to everyone, including people who cannot read and write. Additionally, a more focused study on the ways in which representations of foreigners in the media contributes on intensifying

xenophobic/Afrophobic attacks could be studied further, therefore extending the line of enquiry into the media versus society discourses (Danso and McDonald, 2001; Pineteh, 2017).

This study recommends more research to be conducted on Afrophobia as hostility by South Africans is mostly directed to black African migrants rather than white European migrants. This will assist in understanding and distinguishing whether South Africa is prone to xenophobic attacks or Afrophobic attacks. Gender representation of migrants should be researched diligently as women constitute nearly half of the migrants in the world. It will be important to highlight how migrant women are portrayed in the media.

## Bibliography

Akinola, A.O. 2018. Introduction: *Understanding xenophobia in Africa*. In *The political economy of Xenophobia in Africa*. New York: Springer. pp. 1-7.

Allport, G. W. 1954. *The Nature of Prejudice*. Cambridge, MA: Addison-Wesley.

Allen, W., Blinder, S., and McNeil, R. 2017. Media reporting of migrants and migration, *World Migration Report 2018*. 1 (1): pp. 191-207.

Amusan, L. and Mchunu, S. 2017. An Assessment of Xenophobic/Afrophobic Attacks in South Africa (2008–2015): Whither Batho Pele and Ubuntu Principles? *South African Review of Sociology*. 48(4): pp. 1-18.

Ambesange, P.V. 2016. Post-colonialism: Edward Said and Gayatri Spivak. *Research Journal of Recent Sciences*. 5(8): pp. 47-50.

Atkinson, P. and Coffey, A. 2004. *Qualitative research*. 3<sup>rd</sup> edition. London: Sage publications.

Auestad, L., 2018. *Nationalism and the body politic*. New York: Routledge.

Barnett, C. 2006. *Approaches to human geography*. London: Sage publications.

Bealey, F. and Johnson, A.G. 1999. *The Blackwell dictionary of political science*. New Jersey: Wiley.

Berger, A. A. 2011. *Media and Communication Research Methods: an introduction to qualitative and quantitative approaches*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage publications.

Berelson, B. 1952. *Content Analysis in Communication Research*. New York: Free Press.

Bernard, H.R. 2002. *Research Methods in Anthropology: Qualitative and quantitative methods*. 3rd edition. California: Altamira Press, Walnut Creek.

Bernard, R, H. 2000. *Social Research Methods*. London: Sage publications.

Bhengu, C. 2022. “*Illegal immigration is a crime*”- ‘Lux’ Dlamini denies Operation Dudula is xenophobic, Sunday Times, 11 April 2022. Available at: <https://www.timeslive.co.za/news/south-africa/2022-04-11-illegal-immigration-is-a-crime-lux-dlamini-denies-operation-dudula-is-xenophobic/> Accessed on (14 November 2023).

Bird, W. 2006. *Does the pandering perpetuate the xenophobia?* Rhodes Journalism Review. Volume 28, Issue 2008, pp. 18-19. Available at: <http://journals.co.za/content/rujr/2008/28/EJC140108>. Accessed on: (20 January 2017).

Bornman, J. 2021. “Operation Dudula pushes ahead with hateful politics”. The AfricanMirror, 28 June. Available at: <https://theafricanmirror.africa/news/operation-dudula-pushes-ahead-with-hateful-politics/?fbclid=IwAR19lstsanYPvz4MT57wzPq3IgpYXEA5H0Pb5jhsKKVPJQCFzxEKvoQjWzo> Accessed on: (14 November 2023).

Braun, V. and Clarke, V. 2006. *Qualitative research in psychology*. Using thematic analysis in psychology. London: Sage publications: pp. 77-101.

Braun, V. and Clarke, V., 2014. *International journal of qualitative studies on health and well-being*. London: Sage publications.

Braun, V. and Clarke, V., 2021. Can I use TA? Should I use TA? Should I not use TA? Comparing reflexive thematic analysis and other pattern-based qualitative analytic approaches. *Counselling and psychotherapy research*. London: Sage publications.

Brennen, S. 2013. *Qualitative research methods for media studies*. New York: Routledge: pp. 193-238.

Brons, L. 2015. Othering, an analysis, *Transcience* 6, (1): pp. 69-89.

Burnard P. 1996. *Teaching the analysis of textual data: an experiential approach*. Nurse Education Today 16: pp. 278–281.

Busch, B., 2012. The linguistic repertoire revisited. *Applied linguistics*, 33(5): pp. 503-523.

Butticci, A., 2020. *Digesting Difference: Migrant Incorporation and Mutual Belonging in Europe*. The power of the bowels: A visceral Afro-Pentecostal critique of Italian Afrophobia. Princeton University: Macmillan: pp.167-184.

Carley, K. and Palmquist, M., 1992. Extracting, representing, and analyzing mental models. *Social forces*. 70(3): pp. 601-636.

Cavanagh S. 1997. Content analysis: concepts, methods, and applications. *Nurse Researcher* 4: pp 5–16.

Clifford, J and Marcus, G. E. 1986. Writing Culture. *The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*: A School of American Research Advanced Seminar: University of California Press.

Champ, J.G., 2008. *Popular Communication*. Horizontal power, vertical weakness: enhancing the “Circuit of Culture”., 6(2): pp.85-102.

Christoph, V. 2012. *The role of the mass media in the integration of migrants*, *International Mind, Brain, and Education Society*. 6 (2): pp 97-107.

Conboy, M. 2006. *Tabloid Britain: Constructing a community through language*. London: Routledge.

Connolly-Ahern, C and Broadway C, T. 2008. *The Role of Indigenous Peoples in Guatemalan Political Advertisements: An Ethnographic Content Analysis*. Penn State University: State College USA: pp.369.

Connolly, P. 1998. *Racism, gender identities and young children*. London: Routledge.

Corbin, J.M. and Strauss, A., 1990. *Grounded theory research: Procedures, canons, and evaluative criteria*. *Qualitative sociology*, 13(1): pp. 3-21.

Cresswell, J.W 2007. *Five qualitative approaches to enquiry*. In J.W. Cresswell inquiry and research design: choosing among five approaches. Thousand oaks: Sage publications: pp. 53-84.

Creswell, JW. 2003. *Research Design: Qualitative and Quantitative and Mixed- Method Approaches*, Thousand Oaks, California: Sage publications.

Creswell, J. W. 2009. *Research design: Qualitative and mixed methods approaches*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. California: Sage publications.

Crotty, M. 2003. *The Foundations of Social Research: Meaning and Perspectives in the Research Process*. 3<sup>rd</sup> edition. London: Sage publications.

Crotty, M. 1998. *The Foundations of Social Research: Meaning and Perspective in the Research Process*. St Leonards: Allen & Unwin.

Crush, J.D., McDonald, V., Williams, K., Lefko-Everett, D., Dorey, D., Taylor, and R. la Sablonnière. 2008. *The perfect storm: The realities of xenophobia in contemporary South Africa*. Southern African Migration Project, Migration Policy Series, 50. Cape Town, Idasa, and Kingston Ontario: Southern African Research Centre.

Crush, J. 2008. *The perfect storm: The realities of xenophobia in contemporary South Africa*. Southern African Migration Project, Migration Policy Series, 50. Cape Town, Idasa, and Kingston Ontario: Southern African Research Centre.



Crush, J. and Tevera, D. 2010. Zimbabwe's exodus. *Southern African Migration*. Cape Town: 131 programme.

Crymble, L. 2010. *Textual representations of migrants and the process of migration in selected South African media: a combined critical discourse analysis and corpus linguistics study* (Doctoral dissertation, Rhodes University).

Danso, R., and McDonald, D. A. 2000. Evaluating South African Immigration Policy after Apartheid, *Africa Today*, 48, (3): pp. 115-137.

Danso, R and McDonald, D. 2001. Writing xenophobia: *Immigration and the print in post-apartheid South Africa*, Canada: SAMP.

Deacon, D., Murdock, G. Pickering M. and Golding, P. 1999. *Researching communications*. London: Arnold Publishers.

Deacon, D., Murdock, G. Pickering M. and Golding, P. 1999. *Researching communications*. London: Arnold Publishers.

Deacon, D, et al. 2007. *Researching Communications: A practical Guide to Methods in Media and Cultural Analysis*, 2nd edition. *Unpacking News*. Great Britain, Hodder Arnold: pp. 170-192.

Denzin, N.K. and Lincoln, Y.S. 2011. *The Sage publications handbook of qualitative research*. London: Sage publications.

Dervin, F. 2011. *Handbook of Intercultural Communication*. Cultural identity, representation, and Othering. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. London and New York: Routledge.

de Vaus, D. 2001. *Research design in social research*, London: Sage publications.

Dlamini, N.P., Adetiba, T.C., Enaifoghe, A.O. and Mlambo, V.H., 2020. Afrophobia and South Africa's image on the continent: implications for inter-state relations and diplomacy. *African Renaissance*, 17(3): pp. 9.

Dovidio, J. F., Kawakami, K., and Gaertner, S. L. 2000. *Reducing contemporary prejudice: Combating explicit and implicit bias at the individual and intergroup level*. Reducing prejudice and discrimination. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum: pp. 137-163.

Dube, G. 2018. Afrophobia in Mzansi? Evidence from the 2013 South African social attitudes survey. *Journal of Southern African studies*. Routledge: Taylor and Francis Group: pp. 1-17.

Duncan, N. 2003. 'Race' Talk: Discourses on 'Race' and Racial Difference, *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 27, (2): pp. 135-156.

du Plooy, G.M. 2008. *Communication research: techniques, methods, and applications*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Durban: Juta and Co.

du Plooy, G.M. 2009. *Communication research: techniques, methods, and applications*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Durban: Juta and Co.

Enigbokan, O, Edkins, B and Ogundele, O. (2015) Relevance of Migration Theories in the identification of influencing factors for Nigerian and Zimbabwean migrants in South Africa. Paper presented at the Economic Society of South Africa (ESSA) conference, Cape Town. Available from [June, 2018] <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/319102105>

Entman, R. M., and Rojecki, A. 2000. *The Black Image in the White Mind: Media and Race in America*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Elo, S. and Kyngäs, H. 2008. The qualitative content analysis process. *Journal of advanced nursing*, 62(1): pp. 107-115.

Els, C., 2013. Constructing xenophobic discourses: The case of the Daily Sun. *Language Matters*, 44(2): pp. 47-67.

Fairclough, N. 2003. *Analyzing Discourse: Textual analysis for social research*. New York and London: Routledge.

Fetheka, S. 2022. Operation Dudula group come under fire in Alex.

Available [February, 2022] <https://www.sowetanlive.co.za/news/south-africa/2022-02-16-operation-dudula-group-come-under-fire-in-alex/>

Foucault, M. 1980. *Power/ knowledge*. Harvester: Brighton.

Fourie, J.P. 2007. *Media Studies: Media history, Media and Society*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Cape Town: Juta: pp. 255-264.

Fine, J. and Bird, W. 2002. Shades of prejudice: An investigation into the South African's media coverage of racial and xenophobic violence. Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation.

Gilman, S. 2013. *The deep structure of stereotypes in Representation*. 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition. London: Sage publications.

Gqola, P.M. 2009. "Brutal inheritances: echoes, negrophobia and masculinist violence." In *go home or die here: violence, xenophobia, and the reinvention of difference in South Africa*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Johannesburg: Wits University Press.

Grove, S.K., Burns, N. and Gray, J., 2012. *The practice of nursing research: Appraisal, synthesis, and generation of evidence*. Elsevier Health Sciences.

Hadland, A. 2010. Shooting the messenger: *Mediating the public and the role of the media in South Africa's xenophobic violence*. Africa Development. xxxv (3): pp. 119-143.

Hall, S. 2013. *The Work of Representation. In Representation*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Los Angeles: Sage publications.

Hall, S. (ed.) 1997. *Representation: Cultural Representations and Signifying Practices*. London: Sage publications.

Hall, S. [1980] 2001. *Encoding/Decoding*. Media and cultural studies. Durham: Blackwell Publishing. (2): pp. 164-173.

Hall, S., Evans, J. and Nixon, S. 2013. *Representation*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Los Angeles: Sage publications.

Happer, C. and Philo, G. 2013. The Role of the Media in the Construction of Public Belief and Social Change. *Journal of Social and Political Psychology*. 1(1): pp. 321-336.

Haradhan, K. M., 2017. Two criteria for good measurements in research: Validity and reliability. *Annals of Spiru Haret University. Economic Series*, 17(4): pp.59-82.

Harris, B. 2001. 'A Foreign Experience: Violence, crime and xenophobia during South Africa's transition', CSVr.

Herman, E.S. and Chomsky, N. 1988. *Manufacturing consent: The political economy of the mass media*. New York: Pantheon Books.

Hickel, J. 2014. Xenophobia' in South Africa: Order, chaos, and the moral economy of witchcraft. *Cultural Anthropology*, 29 (1): pp 103–127.

Howarth, C. 2002. Using the theory of social representations to explore difference in the research relationship. *Qualitative research*, 2 (1): pp. 21-34.

Irene, D. 2014. The ontological and epistemological foundations of qualitative and quantitative approaches to research with particular reference to content and discourse analysis of textbooks, *International Journal of Economics, Commerce and Management* (10): pp 1-17.

Isyaku, S., Hafeez, H.Y., and Ndikilar., C.E. 2015. Analytical study of the van der pol equation in the autonomous regime. *Progress*, 11: pp.252-262.

Jani, C. 2018. *The Good, the Bad and the Balanced: A critical analysis of the representation of the black African migrants in the South Africa Daily Sun and Daily News newspapers, 2016-2017*. Masters' Dissertation. Centre for Communication, Media, and Society. University of KwaZulu-Natal.

Jensen, S. Q. 2011. Othering, identity formation and agency. *Qualitative Studies*, 2(2): pp. 63-78.

Jetten, J., Branscombe, N.R., Schmitt, M.T. and Spears, R., 2001. Rebels with a cause: Group identification as a response to perceived discrimination from the mainstream. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*. 27(9): pp. 1204-1213.

Johnstone, N. 1999. Accessing the SADC amnesty: the rural experience. In J. Crush & V. Williams (Eds.), *the New South Africans? Immigration amnesties and their aftermath*: pp 45-55.

Jovchelovitch, S. 2007. *Knowledge in context: Representations, Community and Culture*. London: Routledge.

Karaaslan, İ.A., 2019. Importance of web-based education in the adaptation process of professional journalists to digital news production conditions. *Social Science*.

Kariithi, N., Mawadza, A and Carciotto, S. 2017. *Media Portrayal of Immigration in the South African Media, 2011–2015*. Cape Town: The Scalabrini Institute for Human Mobility in Africa.

Kgari-Masondo, M.C. and Masondo, S., 2019. " For Peace Sake": African Language and Xenophobia in South Africa. *Journal of African Foreign Affairs*. 6(3).

Khau, M., 2022. Editorial Special Issue April 2022-Breaking Free: Addressing Gender and Sexual Diversity in Communities Through Transdisciplinary Education. *Educational Research for Social Change*: 1(1), pp. vi-ix.

Khwebulana, C., 2021. Inviting Xenophobia? An examination of Ilanga and Isolezwe's coverage of the 2015 xenophobic attacks in Kwazulu Natal, South Africa.

Kim, H.H.S., 2023. Globalization, contextual threat perception, and nativist backlash: A cross-national examination of ethnic nationalism and anti-immigrant prejudice. *International Journal of Comparative Sociology*: p.00207152231173307.

Kidd, A, M. 2016. Archetypes, stereotypes and media representation in a multi-cultural society. *Procedia - Social and Behavioural Sciences*. 236: pp 25-28.

Kirsch, G. 2016. *Who 'We' Are: Otherness, Nationalism and the Media*. London: University of London.

Koka, M. 2022. 20 illegal foreigners nabbed in early morning raid. Available (April, 2022) <https://new.timeslive.co.za/articles/news/south-africa/2022-04-28-20-illegal-foreigners-nabbed-in-early-morning-raid-in-chicken-farm>

Krippendorff, K. 2004. *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage publications.

Kvale, S. 1996. *Interviews: An introduction to qualitative research interviewing*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage publications.

Landau, L. B. 2011. *Exorcising the demons within: Xenophobia, violence, and statecraft in contemporary South Africa*. Johannesburg: Wits University Press.

Lippmann, W. 1922. *Public Opinion*. New York: Harcourt, Brace.

Lubbe, G. 2009. Victims of Xenophobia: African Immigrants in South Africa. [Online]. Available at: <http://desmondtutudiversitytrust.org.za/xenophobia.pdf>. Accessed (12 May 2018).

Luhmann, N. 2004. *The reality of the mass media*. Wiesbaden, Germany: VS Verlag.

Mawadza, A. 2012. *The Zimbabwean Threat: Media representations of immigrants in the South African media*. Cape Town: University of the Western Cape.

Maxwell, J.A., 1998. Generalization in and from qualitative analysis. *The SAGE PUBLICATIONS handbook of qualitative data analysis*, 7(37): pp. 540-553.

Mayring, P., 2010. Qualitative content analysis. *A companion to qualitative research*, 1(2): pp. 159-176.

Mbetga, M.D., 2014. Xenophobia and the media: an investigation into the textual representation of black 'foreigners' in the daily sun, a South Africa tabloid (February 2008-December 2008).

Mboweni, T, T. 2002. Globalisation and implications for monetary policy in South Africa. Speech by Mr T.T Mboweni, Governor of the South African Reserve Bank, at the Gala Banquet of the Independent News & Media International Advisory Board, Cape town, (6 February 2002).

McDade-Montez, E., Wallander, J. and Cameron, L., 2017. Sexualization in US Latina and White girls' preferred children's television programs. *Sex Roles*, 77 (1): pp. 1-15.

Meintjies, F. 1998. "Immigrants are People Like Us" Sunday Times Business Times, 20 (20 September 1998).

Merriam, S.B., 1998. *Qualitative Research and Case Study Applications in Education. Revised and Expanded from " Case Study Research in Education."*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Migration Data Portal. 2023. Migration Data in the Southern African Development Community (SADC). Available from: (May, 2023) <https://www.migrationdataportal.org/regional-data-overview/southern-africa>

Mlambo, S, A. 2010. A history of Zimbabwean migration to 1990 Cape Town–Ottawa: Southern African Migration Programme–IDRC: pp. 53-76.

Moyo, D. and Mpofu, S. eds. 2020. Mediating xenophobia in Africa: unpacking discourses of migration, belonging and othering. *Springer Nature*.

Mokwena, D.D. 2018. Exploring the social responsibility of tabloid journalism in South Africa: Views from the Daily Sun and Sunday Sun. Doctoral dissertation, Stellenbosch: Stellenbosch University.

Mthombeni, Z., 2022. Xenophobia in South Africa: Problematising Ubuntu as an Ethical Response. *The Thinker*. 93(4): pp. 63-73.

Muchiri, G.R. 2016. Xenophobia: A critical study of the phenomenon and pragmatic solutions for South Africa (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pretoria).

Myeni, T. 2022. What is Operation Dudula, South Africa's anti-migration vigilante. *AlJazeera*, 8.

Myers, H.F. 2009. Race, racism and health: disparities, mechanisms, and interventions. *Journal of behavioral medicine*, 32: pp.1-8.

Narrative Audience Measurement. 2018. *Sub-Saharan Africa*. [online] Available at: <https://www.narratiive.com/market-insights/category/sub-saharan-africa>. Accessed (20 Sep. 2018).



Neocosmos, M., 2010. From foreign natives to native foreigners. Explaining xenophobia in post-apartheid South Africa: Citizenship and Nationalism, Identity and Politics. African Books Collective.

Neuman, W. 2014. *Workbook for Neumann Social research methods*. 7<sup>th</sup> edition. Edinburgh: Pearson.

Nguyen, A. 2010. Harnessing the potential of online news: Suggestions from a study on the relationship between online news advantages and its post-adoption consequences. *Journalism: Theory, Practice & Criticism*. 11(2): 223-241. DOI: 10.1177/1464884909355910.

Ngwane, S. B. M. 2014. Kwashuba, kwabhalwa, kwaphola? A Study of mediated perceptions of the Alexandra xenophobic riots. University of the Witwatersrand.

Noble, H. and Smith, J. 2014. Issues of validity and reliability in qualitative research, *Evident Based Nursing*. 18 (2): pp 34-35.

Nyamnjoh, F.B., 2006. Insiders and outsiders: Citizenship and xenophobia in contemporary Southern Africa. Zed Books.

Nyarko, J. and Teer-Tomaselli, R.E. 2018. The interface between media funding and agenda setting: The conduit for media independence. *Journal of Creative Communications*, 13 (1): 34-53.

Obiora, C. A., Nwanolue, B. O. G and Anyiam, M. M., 2023. South Africa's Xenophobic Violence against Nigerian immigrants and Bilateral Trade and Economic Cooperation with Nigeria. *Socialscientia: Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 8(1).

O'Sullivan, T. Hartley, J, Saunders, D. Montgomery, M and Fiske, J. 1994. *Key concepts in communications and cultural studies*. London: Routledge.

Patton, M.Q. 2002. *Qualitative Research & Evaluation Methods*. 3rd edition. London: Sage publications

Pineteh, E. A. 2017. Illegal aliens and demons that must be exorcised from South Africa: Framing African migrants and xenophobia in post-apartheid narratives. *Cogent Social Sciences*, 3(1): 1391158. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2017.1391158>

Quillian, L. 2006. New approaches to understanding racial prejudice and discrimination. *Annual Review of Sociology*. 32: 299-328.

Ravindran, V., 2019. Data analysis in qualitative research. *Indian Journal of Continuing Nursing Education*, 20(1): pp.40-45.

Roche, K.M., Walsdorf, A.A., Jordan, L.S. and Falusi, O.O. 2021. The contemporary anti-immigrant environment and Latin American-origin adolescents' perceived futures: a phenomenographic content analysis. *Journal of Child and Family Studies*, 30: pp. 2328-2339.

Ritchie, J., Lewis, J., Mcnaughton, C. and Ormston, N, R. 2013. *Qualitative research practices a guide for social science students and researchers*, London: Sage publications.

Said, E. 1981. *Covering Islam: How the media and the experts determine how we see the rest of the world*. New York: Pantheon Books.

Sanson, A., Duck, J., Cupit, G and Ungerer J. 2000. Media responsibilities and representations: Psychological perspectives, *The Australian Psychological society*.

Schreier, M. 2014. *Qualitative Content Analysis*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. London: Sage publications.

Schindler, P.S. 2011. *Business Research Methods*. 3<sup>rd</sup> edition. Berkshire: McGraw-Hill Higher Education.

Schwalbe, M.S, Godwin, D, Shrock,S, Thompson, M, and Wolkomir, C. 2000. Generic processes in reproduction of inequality: an interactionist analysis. *Social forces*. 79(2): pp. 419-452.

Shaw, A. 2010. Identity, identification, and media representation in video game play: Audience reception study. A dissertation in Communication Presented to the Faculties of the University of Pennsylvania.

Sibanda, N., 2022. OPINION| Operation Dudula Is a Symptom of Unresolved Colonial and Political Issues. *The Mail & Guardian*, 12.

Smith. J. 2008. Synthesis report: The media's coverage of xenophobia and the xenophobic violence prior to and including May 2008.

Smith, J.M. 2009. Synthesis report: The media's coverage of xenophobia and the xenophobic violence prior to and including May 2008.

Spielberger, C. D. 1985. Assessment of state and trait anxiety: Conceptual and methodological issues. *The Southern Psychologist*, 2: 6-16.

Spivak, G. C. 1988. Can the subaltern speak? in Nelson C and Grossberg L eds *Marxism and the interpretation of culture* University of Illinois Press, Urbana IL. pp.271-313.

Solomon, H. and Kosaka, H., 2013. Xenophobia in South Africa: Reflections, narratives, and recommendations. *Southern African peace and security studies*. 2(2): pp. 5-30.

Steenveld, L., 2007. The SAHRC's enquiry into racism in the media: Problematising state-media relationships. *Ecquid Novi*, 28. 1(2): pp.106-126.

Stewart, C and Kowaltzke, A. 2007. *Media new ways and meanings*. Sydney: John Wiley & Sons.

Tafira, H.K., 2018. *Inside the Mind of a Xenophobe: In Xenophobia in South Africa*. Palgrave: Macmillan, Cham. pp. 35-53.

Tanacković, F, S., Krtalić, M. and Lacović, D., 2014. Newspapers as a Research Source: Information Needs and Information Seeking of Humanities Scholars, Croatia: University of Osijek.

The International Organisation of Migration. 2011. *Int'l Lab. Rev.* 21: p.202.

Tomaselli, K., 2000. Faulting Faultlines: racism in the South African media. *Ecquid Novi*: 21(2): pp. 157-174.

Tomaselli, G, K. 2012. Alter-egos: cultural and media studies, *Critical Arts: South-North Cultural and Media Studies*, 26 (1): pp 14-38.

Troya, B., 1981. *Public Awareness and the Media: A Study of Reporting on Race*. London: Commission for Racial Equality.

Tshishonga, N., 2015. The impact of xenophobia-Afrophobia on the informal economy in Durban CBD, South Africa. TD: *The Journal for Transdisciplinary Research in Southern Africa*. 11(4): pp. 163-179.

Tshikalange, S. 2022. Legal immigrants can be 'acknowledged': Tshwane Dudula group. 'Go back to your respective countries, come back with well documented papers' Available from [March 2022]

United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. 1998. Accessed (November 2022) [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/United\\_Nations\\_High\\_Commissioner\\_for\\_Refugees](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/United_Nations_High_Commissioner_for_Refugees)

Valji, N., 2003. Creating the nation: The rise of Violent Xenophobia in the new South Africa. New York University.

van Dijk, T.A., 1993. Principles of discourse analysis. *Discourse and Society*. 4(2): pp, 249-283.

van Dijk, T.A., 1998. *Ideology: A Multidisciplinary Approach*. London: Sage publications.

van Dijk, T. A. 1987. *Communicating racism. Ethnic prejudice in thought and talk*. London: Sage publications.

van Dijk, T. A. 1998. *Opinions and ideologies in the press*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Oxford: Blackwell

van Dijk, T. A. 2002. *Critical Discourse Studies: A Socio-cognitive Approach*. Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. London: Sage publications.

van Dijk, T, A. 2008. *Discourse and Context: A Social cognitive approach*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Vanyoro, K. 2019. *Telling the complex story of 'medical xenophobia' in South Africa*. University of the Witwatersrand. Available on: <https://theconversation.com/telling-the-complex-story-of-medical-xenophobia-in-south-africa-127040>. Accessed on (17 January 2021).

Waitt, G.R., 2005. *Doing discourse analysis*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. London: Oxford University Press.

Walsham, G., 2006. Doing interpretive research. *European journal of information systems*. 15(3): pp.320-330.

Wasserman, H.J. and Du Bois, M. 2006. New kids on the block: Tabloids' entrance into the print media market. *Critical Arts*. 22(1): pp. 1-20.

Wetherell, M., Taylor, S., and Yates, S.J. 2001. *Discourse theory and practice*. London: Sage publications.

White, M. and Marsh, E. (2006). Content Analysis: A flexible methodology. [online] Hdl.handle.net. Available at: <http://hdl.handle.net/2142/3670>. Accessed (21 August 2018).

White, H., 1998. British aid and the White Paper on International Development: dressing a wolf in sheep's clothing in the emperor's new clothes?. *Journal of International Development: The Journal of the Development Studies Association*. 10(2): pp.151-166.

Wood, T, J. 1994. Gendered Media: The Influence of Media on Views of Gender, Communication, Gender, and Culture. (9): pp 231-244.

Woods, N. and King, R. 2001. *Media and Migration*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. London: Routledge.

Worstell T. 2017. Congratulations to Robert Mugabe - Zimbabwe's unemployment.

Wren, K. 2001. Cultural racism: something rotten in Denmark? Social and cultural geography, 2.

Yakushko, O. 2009. Xenophobia: Understanding the Roots and Consequences of Negative Attitudes towards Immigrants. *The Counselling Psychologist*. 37(1): pp. 36-66.

Zevallos, Z. 2011. What is Otherness? [Online] Available at: <https://othersociologist.com/otherness-resources/>. Accessed (15 August 2018).

Zihindula, G, Meyer-Weitz, A and Akintola, O. 2015. Access to Healthcare Services by refugees in Southern Africa: A review of Literature. *Southern African Journal of Demography*, 16(1), (June 2015). University of KwaZulu-Natal. <https://www.researchgate.net/publications/295858553>.

Zou, H. 2012. Language Identity and Cultural Difference, *International Journal of Social Science and Humanity*. 2 (6): pp. 465-46.

