UNIVERSITY OF KWAZULU-NATAL

MANAGERIAL PROFESSIONALISM:

OPPORTUNITIES AND CHALLENGES

FOR VISUAL ARTS TEACHERS

P.P. GOVENDER

2010

UNIVERSITY OF KWAZULU-NATAL

MANAGERIAL PROFESSIONALISM:
OPPORTUNITIES AND CHALLENGES FOR VISUAL ARTS
TEACHERS

ETHICAL CLEARANCE NUMBER
HSS/0874/2009

PURSARAMAN PALAYAM GOVENDER
2010

MANAGERIAL PROFESSIONALISM:
OPPORTUNITIES AND CHALLENGES FOR VISUAL ARTS TEACHERS

By

PURSARAMAN PALAYAM GOVENDER

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Education (Teacher Education and Professional Development) in the Faculty of Education
University of KwaZulu-Natal

Supervisor: Dr. P. Ramrathan

05 December 2009

Mr P P Govender
10 Walter Perfect Road
Malvern
QUEENSBURG
4093

Dear Mr Govender

**PROTOCOL: Managerial Professionalism: Opportunities & Challenges for Visual Arts
Teachers**
ETHICAL APPROVAL NUMBER: HSS/0874/2009: Faculty of Education

In response to your application dated 05 November 2009, Student Number: **205524510** the
Humanities & Social Sciences Ethics Committee has considered the abovementioned
application and the protocol has been given **FULL APPROVAL.**

PLEASE NOTE: Research data should be securely stored in the school/department for a
period of 5 years.

I take this opportunity of wishing you everything of the best with your study.

Yours faithfully

Professor Steve Collings (Chair)
HUMANITIES & SOCIAL SCIENCES ETHICS COMMITTEE

SC/sn

cc: Prof. L Ramrathan
cc: Ms Rishandhani Govender

DECLARATION

I, Pursaraman Palayam Govender, declare that this dissertation is my own original work and that all the sources I have used are acknowledged by means of appropriate references.

This work has not been presented previously for any other degree.

_____   _____   _____

    P P Govender   Dr P Ramrathan   Date

<u>ABSTRACT</u>

The introduction of Curriculum 2005 brought about fundamental changes to our education system. Apartheid education was replaced by a new democratic education. Although the changes in education were necessary to redress the imbalances of the past, the implementation became a mammoth task for the department of education.

To meet the deadline dates for delivery of the new curriculum the department of education engaged itself in professional development activities for teachers to ensure that all teachers were familiar with the new curriculum. Due to time constraints, the cascading model under the umbrella of Managerial Professionalism became the most popular model for teacher development.

The intention of the Department of Education was to see changes taking place in education that benefited the teachers in their development and this in turn will have a positive impact on the learners they teach. The purpose of this study is to explore the teacher development experiences of Visual Arts teachers through managerial professionalism teacher development processes.

Through semi-structured interviews and questionnaires Visual Art teachers saw little benefit in one day one-off Professional Development Activities (PDAs). The findings showed that there was no interaction between teachers at these PDAs and that their needs were not being met. The approach in the one day one-off PDAs were more information meetings and did not meet the needs for teacher development.

However they did mention that they preferred the three day and five day PDAs because there was time for PDAs to take place. They also preferred to work in a contrived collegial environment because of the scarcity of Visual Arts teachers in the province.

In most of these state-driven PDAs the teacher's voice is not heard. There is no time for teacher reflection. The duration of these state-driven PDAs only allows for information dissemination and teacher's contexts, culture and language is not given consideration. The 'one size fits all approach' is being employed. Teachers want to have a greater say in how their development is being constructed. They are happy to work with the department of education on teacher development but it must be a negotiated and combined effort and not a top-down approach.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS   PAGE

Chapter 1

Chapter 2: Review of Literature

Chapter 3: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

Chapter 4: ANALYSIS OF DATA

Chapter 5: A SYNTHESIS, FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.

CHAPTER ONE
AN OVERVIEW OF THE STUDY

1.1. Introduction

As a Visual Arts teacher I experienced teacher development during the Apartheid era and into the new democratic order. My experiences during these two distinct political periods allowed me to reflect on what it means to be a professional teacher. During the Apartheid period, my experience of being a teacher was characterized by heavy bureaucratic and race based control. Bureaucratic accountability was ensured through a stringent system of school inspections that required certain performativity regimes that often left one feeling less of a professional. These included punitive measures (like being deployed to areas that were less favourable to live in and teach in schools that were not conducive to effective teaching and learning) against teachers who defied authority and strict determination of what to teach and how to teach. The aim of the state was to instill a culture of submissiveness on the part of teachers. Teachers were not allowed to exercise their professional autonomy. The state's control of teachers' work did not only result in teachers losing their autonomy but it also resulted in teachers relying on outside accountability regimes. In other words teachers came to rely more and more on bureaucratic accountability as opposed to professional accountability. Teachers became suspicious of the state's control of education and began to resist the Apartheid state.

During this period from 1984 to 1993, South African teachers were divided along racial lines and were only allowed to teach in their group areas. The state also favoured White education over Indian, Coloured and Black education. Black education was the most oppressed compared to the Indian and Coloured education departments.

In 1994 South Africans experienced their first democratic elections and this had far reaching consequences for education and teacher professionalism. The formation of bodies like the South African Council of Educators (SACE) and Education Labour Relations Council (ELRC) were established to represent teachers in policy-making. In addition, a number of policies that have a bearing on teacher professionalism were put in place by the post-apartheid government. The policies include the Norms and Standards for Educators (NSE), the Revised National Curriculum Statement (Curriculum 2005), and the Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS), which integrates, Performance Management System, Developmental Appraisal System (DAS) and Whole School Evaluation (WSE).

Although my experience of teaching within a new political dispensation of democratic rule and acknowledging that progressive policies were in place that was friendlier to teachers' work and teacher professionalism, teachers were dealing with a different kind of de-professionalism. Our work is still highly bureaucratically controlled through the Norms and Standards for Educators (Department of Education, 2000) and through the job descriptions developed through the bargaining chamber of the Education Labour Relations Council (ELRC). Further, with the implementation of the Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS), our professionalism is being regulated through pay incentives. New curriculum policies introduced within the school system meant that teachers had to learn new things like new content, new forms of assessment and new teaching methodologies.   The process of learning and implementing these new ways of teaching and learning were highly bureaucratically controlled and regulated with a kind of "one-size-fits-all" approach. Teachers' professionalism was lost in this new system and process of school education.

These experiences of mine are the stimuli for the conceptualization of this study as it explores the process of teacher professionalism through the highly bureaucratically controlled process. It attempts to understand the nature and experience of state initiated teacher professional development specifically focussing on Visual Arts teachers.

The policy overload over the last ten years has manifested itself through the proliferation of workshops and increased changes that teachers have to deal with. The political and socio-economic context in which the policies were formulated and implemented adds further complexities to a transforming education system. The most significant change in school education was the introduction of National Curriculum Statement (NCS) 2003 as it culminated the curriculum reform agenda of school transformation. The NCS visualizes teachers as qualified, competent, dedicated and caring and the expectations are that the teachers will fulfill the various roles outlined in the Norms and Standards for Educators. These include being mediators of learning, interpreters and designers of learning programmes and materials, leaders, administrators and managers, scholars, researchers and lifelong learners, community members, citizens and pastors, assessors, and subject specialists.' It is within this NCS context that the study will be confined as it is an appropriate space that requires initiatives from both the state and from teachers in order to work within this newly conceptualized curriculum.

In keeping with the vision the state had for teachers, state driven professional development activities were initiated to familiarize teachers with the reforms in education. Visual Arts

teachers were also involved in department sanctioned professional development activities (PDAs). Since the inception of C2005 (the precursor to NCS), visual arts teachers have been attending state-driven PDAs for a day, three-day and five-day periods. Thereafter, teachers are expected to return to their classes to implement the new curriculum. How useful and what one gains from these PDAs is the subject of exploration in this study.

In February 2008, I attended a professional development workshop within the new curriculum framework for Visual Arts teachers initiated by the Department of Education. The workshop was attended by teachers from the greater Durban area. The overriding aim of this state-driven workshop was in keeping with the National Framework for Teacher Education (NFTE) in South Africa (Department of Education, 2007), that is 'to properly equip teachers to undertake their essential and demanding tasks, to enable them to continually enhance their professional competence, and to raise the esteem in which they are held by the people of South Africa'.

The core purposes of teacher professional development, as established in the abundant literature on teacher professional development, including the policy framework for continuous professional development and training in KwaZulu-Natal (Provincial Department of Education, 2005) are, amongst others:

- Personal development of advancing educators knowledge and skills,
- Career development by supporting the professional advancement of educators to jobs at higher levels in the school, and
- Organizational development by improving the performances to benefit the whole school through the promotion and attainment of quality teaching and learning.

This policy framework (NFTE) is underpinned by the belief that teachers are the essential drivers of a good quality education system. It is therefore imperative that the national and provincial education departments are obliged to provide an enabling environment for such preparation and development of teachers to take place.

The aim of the workshop that I attended in February 2008 was to prepare teachers for the grade 12 Visual Arts programme according to the new National Curriculum Statement (NCS). From my observation and from the discussions held, many teachers were still very confused about what they were required to do. This led me to question whether this form of professional development initiated by the state was an appropriate form of teacher

development in terms of capacity building and professional training for a new curriculum. This type of professionalism is, according to Day and Sachs (2004), referred to as Managerial Professionalism. The state is the employer and their primary concern would be to provide opportunities for teachers to meet their performativity goal rather than teacher professional development which requires academic and skills training. Hence, this study attempts to understand how teachers experience such training opportunities that target their core responsibilities of being a professional teacher.

1.2 Purpose

The purpose, then, of this study is to explore the teacher development experiences of Visual Arts teachers through managerial professionalism teacher development processes.

1.3 Critical Questions

How do visual arts educators experience managerial professionalism?
Sub-questions:

- What role and purpose does managerial professionalism play in teachers' professional development?
- What challenges and opportunities were presented to teachers of visual arts through managerial professionalism?
- What are the attitudes of teachers towards managerial professionalism?

1.4   Rationale for the Study

I am a teacher of visual arts at a secondary school in KwaZulu-Natal. The new National Curriculum Statement (NCS) curriculum that we as teachers need to implement in our teaching activities has far reaching consequences. It requires a new understanding of curriculum conceptualization, planning, development and implementation to our traditional ingrained teaching practices of the past. Further, there are skills and new knowledge that are required to enable me to effectively mediate learning within this subject. Our introduction to this new curriculum was through the state's effort of training using the cascading model of teacher development. Through this state intervention, I have developed very little knowledge and skills to enable me to effectively teach within the new paradigm. In order to assist me as a teacher to understand the extent and limitations of state initiated professional development activities, and to plan for my self-initiated professional development, this study will provide me with an understanding of what is possible, what is not possible and what can one expect

to learn from state initiated professional development activities. This will then guide me in planning my own self-initiated professional development programmes.

Contextually, the NCS was introduced into the school system through a process of teacher development using a cascading model that was conceptualized and implemented by the state. Subject advisors in each province were trained by the National Department of Education and they in turn transferred this information to the level one specialist educators. The main aim of this professional development activity was to introduce the new NCS programme into the school education in response to the paradigmatic shift in school education curriculum. This study will therefore provide an insight into the success, challenges and opportunities that this state –driven form of professional development activities have on teacher development.

1.5 Research Methodology

My study involved a collection of a variety of empirical material – personal experience; interviews; observation and visual texts – that described routine and problematic moments in the individual teachers' experiences through a survey and case study design methodology.

As a qualitative researcher, I wanted to find out how teachers experienced state-driven PDAs, what the benefits of state-driven PDAs were and what impact it had on them in terms of teacher learning.

Being a visual arts teacher, I decided that as part of being a qualitative researcher my approach would be similar to the workmanship of a quilt maker (bricoleur). As an interpretive bricoleur producing a bricolage - that is, a pierced-together set of representations that are fitted to the specifics of a complex situation; I began to unravel the experiences of teachers that were evident in the interviews and questionnaires. Using the analogy of a bricoleur, I believe I have brought more insight to the positive and negative effects of state-driven PDAs. Using different tools, methods, and techniques of representation I have revealed different perspectives to the often biased and stereotypical views of state-driven PDAs.

As a methodological bricoleur is adept at performing a large number of diverse tasks, I engaged myself in interviewing teachers and getting them to become fully involved in intensive self-reflection and introspection through filling in questionnaires. As an interpretive bricoleur I understood that research is an interactive process shaped by each person's

history, biography, gender, social class, race, and ethnicity, and by their setting. As a political bricoleur I know that science is power and all research findings have political implications.

The result of my approach as an interpretive bricoleurs was a complex, quilt-like bricolage, a reflexive collage – a set of fluid interconnected images and representations. This interpretive structure is like a quilt, a performance text, a sequence of representations connecting the parts to the whole.

This approach assisted me to interpret how teachers construct meanings in the context of the ideas, thoughts, beliefs and values provided by the social and school environment in which they live and these ideas, thoughts and beliefs and values can only be made meaningful to teachers to the extent that they make sense of them (Finnan & Levin, 2000: 89-90).

My study therefore took on an interpretivist stance within an interpretivist paradigm. A fuller elaboration on the methodology is presented in chapter three of this dissertation.

1.6   Limitations of the study

Firstly, I am a visual arts educator and my subjectivity concerning managerial professionalism may cause me to interpret the data in a biased manner. I need to constantly confront my own opinions and prejudices with the data. Secondly, the participants are people that I have had some contact with in my teaching career because of visual arts related issues. If you treat people as 'research subjects' they will act as research subjects, which are different from how they will usually act. Qualitative researchers are interested in how people act and think in their own settings. Thirdly, data collection in many semi-structured interviews will be very time consuming.

1.7   Ethical Issues

Visual Art is a very small subject field in the department of education in KZN province. Most educators know each other by name. It is important that those that participate in this research study are protected from harm or victimization. I will be working with adults but they must be assured that no information will be printed without their permission. No personal names and schools will be mentioned in any public publication. Subjects will enter the research projects voluntarily, understanding the nature of the study and the dangers and obligations that are involved. Subjects are not exposed to risks that are greater than the gains they might derive.

1.8   Preview of the Chapters to follow

Chapter Two

This chapter begins with the analysis of the literature on research conducted on state-driven PDAs and the impact it has on teacher learning or development. It also provides oppositional literature to state-driven professional development. Both discourses on professional development are used as a solid foundation for comparison with regards to teachers' experiences of being exposed to state-driven PDAS.

Chapter Three

This chapter focuses on the methodological framework used in this research study. A discussion of the qualitative design used to conduct research and ethical considerations are provided.

Chapter Four

This chapter provides presentation and analysis of findings based on the research questions. It begins by providing a thick description of the empirical field and a brief background to Visual Arts teachers who attend state-driven PDAS. This is meant to give an understanding of the context of state-driven PDAs as this is likely to impact on how teachers experience learning. It then presents data that addresses the critical questions which are the backbone of this study. The conclusions deal with an overview of the data gathered.

Chapter Five

The synthesis of the arguments and recommendations are dealt with in this chapter. It concludes by highlighting areas of that I as a visual arts teacher and researcher would like to see happening in future PDAs.

1.9   Conclusion

The purpose, scope, rationale and methodology of this research study are outlined in this chapter. It concludes with an overview of the research study and provides a preview to the chapters to follow. The next chapter presents a review of relevant literature that informs the data production process.

CHAPTER TWO
REVIEW OF LITERATURE

2.1   Introduction

Having identified the focus and purpose of the study in the first chapter, it would be appropriate to explore the literature that has been published in this focus area. Hence, this chapter provides a critical analysis of the literature revolving centrally around managerial professionalism but also including literature on teacher professional development (TPD) that frames state-initiated activities geared to improve the efficiency of teaching and learning. This chapter, therefore, maps the terrain of teacher professional development and will include the current discourses in TPD and the activities and processes in promoting TPD within South Africa. The literature review will then focus more specifically on state-driven TPD. Finally, the chapter will conclude with a discussion on the theoretical framework that will guide this research data production and analysis.

2.2   Discourses on Teacher Professionalism

2.2.1 What is CPTD?

CPTD is a term used to describe all the activities in which teachers engage in during the course of a career which is designed to enhance their work. In terms of this study CPTD covers all forms of learning undertaken by experienced teachers and those who have completed their initial training (Craft, 1996). CPTD is a complex intellectual and emotional activity which is at the heart of raising and maintaining standards of teaching, learning and achievements in a range of schools, each of which poses its own set of special challenges (Day & Sachs, 2004).

It is a formal, systematic programme designed to promote personal and professional growth. CPTD is the process through which the leadership and management skills of educational leaders and the teaching and classroom management skills of teachers are developed and perfected. The term CPTD is an umbrella term that includes concepts such as staff development, personal development and in-service training (Shruder & Landey, 2001). To be effective and successful, CPTD must be of high quality and relevant to teachers' needs. CPTD is the tool by which policymakers convey broad visions, disseminate critical information, and provide guidance for our teachers. Effective CPTD begins with an understanding of teachers' needs and their work environments- schools and classrooms. CPTD then combines a range of techniques to promote learning; provides teachers with the

support they need; engages school leadership; and makes evaluation to increase its impact. Essential techniques include mentoring, teamwork, observation, reflection and assessment. CPTD workshops/programs should engage teachers as learners – typically involving the process of 'modelling' (Anonymous, 2000).

The notion of professional autonomy, accountability, knowledge and professional ethics are central elements of teacher professionalism. The notion of autonomy is tied to the notion of accountability. Professional accountability treats teachers as professionals who are able to make autonomous professional decisions about what to teach and how to teach, bureaucratic accountability tends to treat teachers as mere state employees who must follow policies and procedures even where the policies impinge on the space of teachers to make professional decisions. Autonomy is seen as an ability to make professional decisions balanced against the needs of those served by the profession. Teacher professionalism suggests that one of the central features of teacher professionalism is autonomy in that most teachers are motivated by their ability to make professional decisions and to see learners develop rather than monetary rewards. The importance of autonomy lies in teachers being able to make judgments informed by knowledge and ethical conduct (SACE, 2006).

How would one determine whether one is involved in a profession? According to Pierce (2000: 25) "A profession may be said to meet the following criteria:

1. it depends on a body of knowledge, skills, and understandings essential to the practice of the profession;
2. it provides services to society which utilize that body of knowledge, skills and understandings;
3. it provides practitioners with the autonomy to make their own decisions regarding applications of that body of knowledge, skills and understandings; and
4. it is responsible for determining and enforcing standards to be met by those who enter and remain in the profession."

2.2.2 Kinds of Professional Development Activities

The literature on professional development activities suggests a broad range of personal, institutional, profession and employer driven activities. While the literature is expansive in this area, a limited number of professional development activities related to the focus of the study will be presented. The most common activities, as well as those specified in the draft continuous professional development policy that is being shaped and developed in South

Africa relate to the teacher priority professional development, school priority professional development and profession priority professional development activities (Department of Education, 2008). These three broad forms of professional development activities will be elaborated upon, viz:

a. Teacher Priority Activities

These are those chosen by teachers themselves for their own development and the improvement of their own professional practice. As a visual arts teacher I attended many private art courses like pottery, mould making and painting to develop my skills. I paid for these courses. Many visual arts teachers are involved in their own development to improve their skills and also to add to their existing skills they possess. The self development of teachers is optional.

b. School Priority Activities

These are undertaken by the school leadership and staff collectively, focused on whole school development and institutional conditions for the improvement of learning. The school that I work in have a staff development workshop every two weeks. Every two weeks members of management hold meetings to discuss school related issues like examinations, selection of prefects and timetable issues. Once every year a staff development workshop is held on team building. Integrated Quality Management Systems (IQMS) is an example of a school priority activity because management and staff are involved collectively in this process.

According to The National Policy Framework for Teacher Education and Development (Department of Education, 2006:16) "the underlying principle is that teachers individually and collectively will have a high degree of responsibility for their own professional development. Employers will mandate some compulsory CPTD activities, including those related to Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS) processes, but others will be self-selected."

The Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS) integrated the performance management system, Developmental Appraisal System (DAS) and Whole School Evaluation (WSE) into one. This policy was a result from negotiations between teacher organizations and the government.

The purpose of IQMS is to identify specific needs of educators, schools and district offices for support and development and provide support for continued growth. IQMS includes the

assessment of the strengths of teachers and opportunities for development in areas the teacher has a short comings, support will be provided. This is to ensure the continued growth of teachers (ELRC, 2003).

It requires schools to have a staff development team (SDT) which coordinates staff development programmes (ELRC, 2003). The senior management team also has an important role to play in the development of teachers, as the principal is the compulsory member of the staff development team. It allows for collaboration amongst teachers, and also for schools to become places where teachers learn.

However, IQMS does little to help visual arts teachers in terms of collaboration because of the scarcity of visual arts teachers in the province. If teachers need to collaborate with other visual arts teachers they have to network with teachers from other schools, which is problematic because of work intensity and time constraints.

c. Profession Priority Activities

These have directly to do with enhancing of the professional status, practices and commitments of teachers in areas of greatest need, as defined by the department of Education, SACE, National teachers' union or other national professional bodies.

The NPFTED acknowledges that (Department of Education, 2006:12)

> "school-based teachers are at the heart of the schooling system and the quality of their professional practices is at the root of the quality of schooling. It is now widely accepted that the initial professional education of teachers (IPET) is, at best, only the start of their professional education. CPTD is required not because IPET typically fails in its task but because the development of professional practices, in a dynamic and complex policy, institutional and community environment such as schooling, is a continuing process that lasts for the duration of the career of a professional teacher. CPTD is not merely about upgrading, and it is not based on a deficit model of teachers. The CPTD system should be conceived as an essential component of a comprehensive teacher education system. The vision of the CPTD system is to support and facilitate the process of continuing professional development, to revitalize the teaching profession and reward those who commit themselves to these goals."

CPTD is a collaborative effort by the Department of Education the South African Council of Educators (SACE:2006)). SACE was tasked to manage and administer this system of professional development. The ACE programme is one such example of how SACE has become involved in the professional development of teachers with regards to the radical curriculum reforms taking place in the country. This programme is presently being offered to teachers via the Department of Education.

2.3   Site-Based CPTD

Location and purpose of professional development is crucial if teacher learning is to be fostered. It is therefore important to recognize the importance of sites for CTPD. For its managerial professional activities the sites are chosen mainly by managers depending on the nature of the activity.

2.3.1 Off-site Professional Development (Inset: In-service Education and Training)

The state has also initiated its own PD activities to meet its implementation targets dates. Many off-site professional development training has taken place as in the case for Visual Arts. Here teachers from a number of schools come together for varying lengths of time for a training course. Such courses have ranged from short courses of one day or less to longer, award-bearing courses with accreditation. INSET means all types of professional learning undertaken by teachers beyond the point of initial training. Faced with rapid change, demands for high standards and calls for improving quality, teachers now have a need, as never before, to update and improve their skills through in-service learning. However, according to Craft (1996) INSET programmes can cause tension amongst teachers.

> 'On the one hand, there are pressures at national and school levels to implement the National Curriculum Statement and on the other hand, there are the individual needs of teachers, who may see in-service learning in terms of job satisfaction and personal or professional growth. In effect, responding to external calls for greater accountability has to be reconciled with the development needs of the individual teachers, who may wish to act as far as possible as autonomous professionals. At school level, there is a tension between the needs of the school as a whole for in-service learning and the needs of individual teachers' (Craft, 1996).

Weaknesses of the off-site approach to professional learning include personal gap between theory and practice and the lack of supporting culture in valuing individuals' off-site experiences for the team. Nevertheless, teachers have often found that such courses were

stimulating both in terms of acquiring new ideas and in exchanging experiences with those from other schools.

2. 3.2 School-Based Professional Development

Moves towards school-based INSET and professional development arose out of concerns with the limitations of the course led model of delivery. One form of school-based professional development is the in-service course, provided within the school and targeted at a group of staff. Two sets of aims underpin this approach. One is about achieving a better match of an INSET course to the needs and culture of a particular group of professionals. The second is about having some direct impact on practice (Craft 1996).

The drawback in the school-based approach to professional development can be that it becomes rather insular, whether it is facilitated by someone within the school or from outside. The perspective changes when school-based work is seen as comprising of a wide range of professional development opportunities. Such thinking has led to the development of a range of learning opportunities in schools (Craft 1996).

2.3.3 SCHOOL FOCUSSED PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT

School-centred or school focused professional development is similar to school-based professional development, insofar as the target group is some or all the staff of the particular school and the programme of study is related to the needs of the particular group or school. The location is, outside the school itself. The distractions of receiving training in school are avoided (Craft 1996).

Linking Locations for professional development: The 'Cascade' Approach

One frequent strategy for linking off-site and school based training is the 'cascade' approach. Here one or two key people from a school are trained at off site courses and charged with replicating the training for colleagues back in school. Dissemination is built into the initial learning process. Cascade training tends to involve the dissemination of a central 'message' or 'approach' and this approach was used extensively in both England and Wales in 1991(Craft, 1996: 17).
.

In South Africa, the cascade approach is the most common approach used by managers (state or employer) to develop their employees (teachers). Here one or two key people from a school are trained at off-site courses and charged with replicating the training for colleagues back in school, in ways which are appropriate there. In the context of visual arts,

the subject advisor disseminates information from national education and provincial education down to the teachers. In other words, dissemination is built into the initial learning process. The cascade model envisages a series of consecutive training processes, each occurring as a result of the previous, and designed to impart an agreed and consistent body of knowledge, skills and attitudes. Flexibility in training methods is an integral part of this model. In theory and in practice the successful implementation of the model requires that (Craft, 1996: 17):

- "The audiences are well defined and their particular needs carefully targeted;
- Clear training objectives are set and the training materials are of high quality, well structured, logical, credible and consistent. Detailed and comprehensive training notes, common to all involved are used;
- The trainers are carefully selected for their support of the aims of the programme, the match between their experience and expertise and particular stages of the training programme; their competence as trainers; and their understanding of the knowledge and skills to be imparted.
- Each stage of the programme provides time for trainers to prepare thoroughly and for trainers to absorb and reflect on the training;
- The risk of idiosyncratic personal interpretations of the training objectives is minimized by setting each stage of the whole process within a firm structure and removing ambiguity in the objectives and the training materials."

The cascade approach is not the only or always appropriate way of linking locations for professional development. Where there is a central message to convey it can be useful. However, the model would be less appropriate for a more developmental focus for professional learning (Craft 1996).

2.4   Curriculum Reforms and Implementation

This study is aimed at understanding how teachers learn in state-driven PDAs and how such learning affect Visual Arts teachers' abilities to develop and implement the reforms envisaged by the state and embedded in the NCS. In the discussion that follows, I will focus on the role of state driven professional development in terms of curriculum reforms and what impact it has on teacher learning with regards to teachers changing the way they traditionally do things to meeting the state's agenda for change.

Recent and radical curriculum reforms have had a major impact on Visual Arts teachers. The changes to the curriculum have impacted on how teachers need to understand all the assessment standards in the four learning outcomes before planning a lesson programme. The NCS (2003) for Grades 10, 11 and 12 'lays the foundation for the achievement of these goals by stipulating Learning Outcomes and Assessment Standards, and by spelling out the key principles and values that underpin the curriculum.' If this was not a major challenge for Visual Arts teachers, Learning Outcome Four (Visual Culture Studies) was reconceptualised by the national government. In a sweeping move curriculum organizers replaced the old theory syllabus with an almost new syllabus. To compound matters, in the past teachers used to produce one practical work a term. Teachers now have to produce a practical work plus a source book that shows the entire process of how learners arrived at their final product. This source book has an equal weighting as the final art product. All these changes took place without any involvement of educators. Those that were going to implement this curriculum were not involved in the change processes in education.

There are myriads of other challenges but these were the major challenges faced by visual arts teachers in terms of curriculum reforms. This required teachers to make adjustments to the traditional way in which they performed their practice. Teachers of Visual Arts suddenly found themselves in a 'deficit' situation with regards to the new curriculum.

To fast forward the radical changes the state decided to reprofessionalize teachers to meet the challenges of the new curriculum. The 'reprofesionalization' of teachers by the state has become the focus of this study and the findings of this study will reveal the extent to which state-driven PDAs actually meet the demands of the state in terms of 'high skills and high knowledge.' 'The NCS (2003) grades 10-12 aims to develop a high level of knowledge and skills in learners. It sets up high expectations of what all South African learners can achieve. Social justice requires the empowerment of those sections of the population previously disempowered by the lack of knowledge and skills. The NCS specifies the minimum standards of knowledge and skills to be achieved at each grade and sets high, achievable standards in all subjects.'

In an attempt to treat all citizens as equal, the Government of South Africa introduced a common, unifying curriculum, 'Curriculum 2005' designed on the lines of outcomes based education, as its commitment to educational reform. The White Paper for Education published in 1996 (DOE, 1996), set broad policy guidelines for educational change. This was

followed by numerous educational policies. In keeping with the rapid educational reforms, teachers of visual arts had to be reprofessionalized in accordance with requirements for the National Curriculum Statement.

The kind of teacher envisaged in the NCS(2003) takes for granted that 'all teachers are qualified, competent, dedicated and caring and that they will fulfill all the roles outlined in the Norms and Standards for Educators.' It is under this fallacy that the state has initiated its roll out plan to reprofessionalize teachers using a cascading model.

2. 5   State-Driven Professionalism as a preferred form of CPTD

This version of professionalism currently informing various policy documents and now mandated by the state is what is described as 'state-driven' professionalism. Brennan as cited in Day & Sachs (2004:6) describes state-driven professionalism as a 'corporate who clearly meets corporate goals set elsewhere, manages a range of students well and documents their achievement and problems for public accountability purposes. The criteria of a successful professional in this corporate model is of one who works efficiently and effectively in meeting the standardized criteria set for the accomplishment of both students and teachers, as well as contributing to the school's formal accountability processes.'

State-driven professionalism is the dominant discourse in South Africa considering the impact it has on the work of teachers. It currently informs various policy documents. Clarke and Newman (1997:92-3 as cited in Day & Sachs, 2004) argue that 'managerial professionalism discourses create the possibility within which individuals construct new roles and identities from which they derive ideas about the logic of institutional change'. It is an approach that is advocated by employers and favours systems.

State-driven professionalism is system driven. It promotes or propagates the ideology of the state. External regulations are often in place to drive education and in our particular case the agenda of reform in education. It has massive political implications and generally its subjects who are the educators are required to be compliant. To show the power of the state and that it has control over its subordinates (the educators), a top down approach is generally used. The cascading model of teacher development is often used because it is synonymous with the state's democratization policy.

Performativity issues seem to be a priority for the state rather than the development of the teacher to impact learners in the classroom. However much of what we anticipate in state-

driven professionalism, it does not lend itself to skills training, because it is not readily expressed in terms of specific, transferable skills and practices. Rather, the present reforms require that persons in local situations grapple with what broad principles look like in practice. Teachers are not treated as intellectuals but as technicians.

According to Ramrathan (2007) performativity issues impact on teachers on an on-going basis and teachers are expected to respond to these demands on an on-going basis. This means that teachers have to continually learn new things related to their jobs as teachers, unlearn old ways of doing things and adapt continually on changing contexts for teachers. Performativity issues seem to be a priority for the state rather than the development of the teacher to impact learners in the classroom.

According to Day & Sachs (2004) what students learn, what they must achieve as the outcome of learning and what standards apply are explicitly controlled by the state. The state has intervened more actively to improve the system of schooling because of their concern with the need to raise standards of achievement. Continuous Professional Teacher Development (CPTD) is taking place in South Africa within the contexts of increasing governmental interventions for the purpose of 'accountability' and 'performativity'. These political purposes are embedded in both CPTD content – the targeting of resources towards particular programmes designed to support the implementation of government curricula, teaching or assessment agendas-and CPTD forms (Day & Sachs, 2004).

2.6   Criticisms of State-Driven Professional Development

Criticism related to state-driven professionalism is that reform demands exacerbated by the pressure to radically change the Apartheid educational order and the punishing time frames for developing and implementing new curricula has produced overwhelming challenges for teacher education and development (Adler& Read, 2002).

McCulloch, Helsby and Knight (2000, p.118) make the point that:

> 'Educational improvement depends on teachers wanting to make a difference. It depends upon their feeling professional. Neither raising standards by regulation nor professionalizing by prescription will work. Teachers have power in the sense that they have to want improvement for improvement to happen.'

Teachers respond differently to 'imposed' changes, ranging from 'compliance' to empowerment and 'pro-activism' (McCulloch et al, 2000, p.118).

> "For at the end of the day, teacher professionalism is what teachers and others experience it as being, not what policy makers and others assert it should become. The experience of professionalism and of its denial is to be found by studying the everyday work of teaching." (Goodson & Hargreaves, 1996: 22-23).

For instance in the Portuguese context, Flores (2005) found that uncertainty, ambiguity and tension were recurring words in defining Portuguese teachers' sense of professionalism in times of change, stressing the dilemmas and challenges teachers have been confronted with and the ways in which they are responding to them. This changing nature of teachers' work requires teachers to be professionals and proactive in order to respond adequately to the ambiguity, uncertainty and increasing complexity which characterize the educational settings in which they are expected to operate. At the same time, they experience increased bureaucracy, public scrutiny and accountability, which are often associated with new forms of state-driven initiatives within a market-oriented view of education. As Flores and Shiroma (2003:16) argue, it is essential to "go beyond the recognition of teachers' role in society and to provide them with real conditions (including adequate and meaningful training opportunities) to redefine and challenge their professionalism".

As a result, teaching practice, educational research and educational policy need to be developed in interaction. This gives a responsibility to policy makers (to involve researchers and practitioners in the process of policy development and implementation), to researchers (to communicate with practitioners and policy makers and to focus on their needs and questions) and for teachers as practitioners (to be willing to engage in discussions on policy and to be involved in educational research and its translation to practice). ((Goodson & Hargreaves, 1996).

As governments invest more money into public education the more involved they want to become because of accountability issues. The teacher who is a state employee will have to bear the brunt of bureaucratic control. The contestation will always exist between managerial and democratic professionalism because on the one hand governments are investing more money into public education so they want to control education and teachers' work is becoming too routinized, work intensive and technical, so they are looking for an alternative.

I have come to realize that it is impossible to locate this study in managerial professionalism or democratic professionalism. I am not looking for a gap. For me, teacher professionalism is placed on a continuum with managerial professionalism i on one end and democratic professionalism on the other end. There has to be an assimilation of both managerial and democratic professionalism principles for development to take place.

2.6.1 Teacher's are 'Deficit'

Another flaw of state-driven professionalism is that employers or the state attempt to prescribe prescriptive national standards as if all teachers' circumstances are the same or as if there is a simple and direct cause and effect relation between learning and pupil progress. This is referred to as the deficit model (Day & Sachs, 2004).

According to Phillip Jackson (as cited in Day & Sachs, 2004) the deficit model means that teachers needed to be provided with something (knowledge, skills) they did not already have. They do not reflect what they think. Their voices are silenced.

2. 6.2 Teachers as Reflective Practitioners

Professional development requires that "teachers and others with whom they work enjoy the latitude to invent local solutions to discover and develop practices that embody central values and principles, rather than to implement or adopt or demonstrate practices thought to be universally effective. This assertion acknowledges both the uncertainty surrounding best practice and the complexity of local contexts." (Little, 1994:9).

2. 6.3 Teaching as Intellectual Work

According to Giroux (1988) 'In order to function as intellectuals, teachers must create the ideology and structural conditions necessary for them to write, research, and work with each other in producing curricula and sharing power… as intellectuals, they will combine reflection and action in the interest of empowering students with the skills and knowledge needed to address injustices and to be critical actors committed to developing a world free of oppression and exploitation.'

According to Ashcroft and Alluwalia (2000:72). "All that we now have, he says, is a missing generation which has been replaced by buttoned-up, impossible to understand classroom technicians, hired by committee, anxious to please various patrons and agencies, bristling with academic credentials and a social authority that does not promote debate…"

He goes on to say:

> "everything about the system is aboveboard and, as I have said, is acceptable according to the standards of competition and market response that govern behaviour under advanced capitalism in a liberal and democratic society. But in spending a lot of time worrying about restrictions on thought and intellectual freedom under totalitarian systems of government we have not been as fastidious in considering the threats to the individual intellectual of a system that rewards intellectual conformity, as well as willing participation in goals that have been set not by science but by governments; accordingly, research and accreditation are controlled in order to get and keep a larger share of the market." (Ashcroft and Alluwalia 2002:72).

In essence, if teachers are to develop learners who are critical thinkers, they need to engage themselves in critical thinking themselves. Reflecting on practice, writing, debating about their practice is all part of the intellectual process. Due to the intensification of work, teachers have become compliant to the needs of the state and no one challenges or question the validity of anything that goes on in meetings. Performativity issues seem to be the key to success in the classroom. This is impacting on teacher learning.

2. 6.4 Teachers as Lifelong Learners

According to Johnson, Monk and Hodges (2000: 3), 'the bricks and mortar of the places in which the curriculum is to be delivered cannot be transformed as easily as one can change the ink on a draft of a curriculum document.' Recent research and programme descriptions are now talking about teacher learning, rather than teacher change. This is an important discursive shift, particularly when it is framed within a wider education context of lifelong learning, as is the case in South Africa. All professionals are assumed to be on a journey of lifelong learning. Talking about teacher learning then allows for descriptions of what is learned, and how it is learned, rather than trying determining whether or not teachers have changed in the intended directions. The underlying conviction was that teachers shape their professional development and are not only shaped by it. At the same time we needed to be able to talk about the constraints on their practice (Ashcroft and Alluwalia, 2000).

2.6.5 Intensification

The new policies have also resulted in policy overload and intensification of teachers' work. Curriculum 2005, for instance, has resulted in more paper work for teachers. The intensification of teachers' work has in turn resulted in low morale among teachers and loss

of confidence in their abilities. There is overwhelming evidence that teachers' work in South Africa is increasingly characterised by intensification. The policy overload has manifested itself through the proliferation of workshops and increased changes that teachers have to deal with. This has caused confusion and in some cases loss of confidence by some teachers. The impressive policy framework that has been put in place has not been backed by support and a comprehensive plan of how the policies are going to be implemented (Hargreaves,1994).

The intensification of teachers' work has in turn resulted in low morale among teachers and loss of confidence in their abilities. There is overwhelming evidence that teachers' work in South Africa is increasingly characterized by intensification. The policy overload has manifested itself through the proliferation of workshops and increased changes that teachers have to deal with. This has caused confusion and in some cases loss of confidence by some teachers. The impressive policy framework that has been put in place has not been backed by support and a comprehensive plan of how the policies are going to be implemented.
In most countries the work of teachers has been more intensified as a result of cost-cutting and diversification of the nature of teachers' work (Hargreaves, 1994). Increasingly, teachers find themselves having to do more and more with limited resources. Teachers are expected to perform duties beyond the classroom. The accountability systems have also increased teachers' administrative responsibilities and increased paper work- which also causes intensification (Hargreaves, 1994). Intensification of teachers work is associated with deprofessionalisation because as a result of heavy workloads teachers do not get time to develop their skills and to keep up with developments in their fields.
Innovations multiply as change accelerates creating senses of overload among teachers responsible for implementing them. The result is what some analysts have called the intensification of teachers work.

Curriculum programs are constantly changing, as innovations multiply and the pressures for reform increase. Assessment strategies are more diverse. Teachers' responsibilities are more extensive. Teachers work is getting more routinized and deskilled. Teachers are depicted as being increasingly controlled by prescribed programs, mandated curricula and step by step methods of instruction. A more than this, it is claimed, teachers work has become increasingly intensified, with teachers expected to respond to greater pressures and comply with multiple innovations under conditions that are at best stable and at worst deteriorating. Under this view, extended professionalism is a rhetorical ruse, a strategy for

getting teachers to collaborate in their own exploitation as more and more effort is extracted from them.

In the work of Michael Apple, for instance, intensification, is particularly evidenced in teachers work in the growing dependence on an externally produced and imposed apparatus of behavioural objectives., in class assessments and accountability instruments and classroom management technologies.

2.7   State-Driven Professionalism: A Discourse and a Theorectical Lens

Le Grand as cited by Hartley and Whitehead (2006) suggests that in England from 1944 to the mid-1970s, parents in state schools were expected to trust the professionals and accept what was best for their children. However a view emerged in the 1970s that teachers had abused this licensed autonomy to the detriment of their pupils and society. Many professional groups (teachers) came to be regarded as ill-adapted to be either agents of the state or entrepreneurial service providers in a marketized civil society. This supported the shift involving a move away from the notion that the teaching profession should have a professional mandate to act on behalf of the state in the best interests of its citizens to a view that teachers needed to be subjected to the rigours of the market and/or greater control and surveillance on the part of the reformed state.

Thus, we see that state-driven professionalism emanates from outside the teaching profession and it is often imposed by employers to control teachers' work. It often means more bureaucratic control of teachers' work and it is driven by bureaucratic needs rather than the needs of teachers. The state-driven discourse gives rise to an entrepreneurial identity in which the market and issues of accountability, economy, efficiency and effectiveness shape how teachers individually and collectively construct their professional identities.

However, Fullan (2004:56) believes imposition from governments or cultural systems which are based in hierarchies often does not result in the desired improvement. Fullan suggests that change can be successfully introduced and initiated if the people involved are engaged with the problems they face. Fullan's criticism of governments 'interference' in education is enhanced when he talks about the pointlessness of organizing for an innovation which is not itself worthwhile or of established quality. He attributes the failure of the post-sputnik reforms in science education in the United States to the fact that the innovations were driven by

politicians and had not been established as educationally sound (Fullan & Stiegelbauer as cited by Adey et al, 2004:165).

Smyth & Shacklock (1998:62) who is agreement with Fullan, looked beyond the states control of education. They suggest that marketization of education has its roots in the World Bank and International Monetary Fund (IMF). Countries like Australia are being driven by the ideologies and philosophies of the World Bank and IMF which inadvertently due to globalization impacts education in South Africa. Outcomes in both the workplace and school are being driven to satisfy marketization needs. Even the language used to describe outcomes-based education is very similar to the rhetoric used in the corporate sector, business and economist world.

Under state-driven discourses the market will play an important part in how teachers constitute their professional identity collectively and individually. Competition for reduced resources between schools will give rise to a competitive ethos, rather than a collaborative one. The efficient operation of the market is fostered through the combination of legislative controls and internal, institutional mechanisms, notably performance indicators and inspections, which ostensibly provide consumers with a basis for selection but more importantly provide managerial imperatives (Marginson, 1997: 67).

New Zealand is a case in point where state-driven professionalism and marketization characterized education policy and practice during the late 1980s until the present. Standardized measures of performance enabled schools to be ranked by their customers, market competition penalized non-conformity in teaching and learning and the national curriculum functioned as a system of cultural control, 'a standardized language, a narrative history of national destiny, so a normative, mono-cultural definition of community claiming the legitimacy of familiar values and an external identity (Marginson, 1997: 197).

Smyth & Shacklock (1998) question the revamping of the teacher's image by configuring the work of teaching as being about the delivery of knowledge, the testing of learning and the finessing of pedagogical technique. Reality is that the work of teaching is increasingly routinized and proletarianized as teachers are subjected to the discourses as well as the practices of managerialism - tighter control by outsiders, better forms of accountability, more sophisticated surveillance of outcomes, and greater reliance on measures of competence and performance.

Darling-Hammond (2000) also criticizes the state's control of education. According to Darling-Hammond (2000) bureaucratic accountability is not necessarily geared towards the needs of the teacher, learners and their parents, but more towards the needs of the bureaucracy. This form of accountability seems to reduce accountability to mere following of standard procedures and the implementation of policies (Darling-Hammond, 2000). Here accountability is equated with monitoring and compliance to rules rather than as a means to ensure that the needs of those served by the profession are fulfilled. Bureaucratic accountability does not see the basis of making professional decisions as knowledge and the interests of those served by the profession; it sees the basis for decisions as compliance to bureaucratic standards. This undermines the notion of professionalism as the freedom for making autonomous decisions which might be severely curtailed by the bureaucratic accountability regimes.

State-driven professionalism is the dominant discourse in South Africa considering the impact it has on the work of teachers. It currently informs various policy documents. Clarke and Newman (1997:92 as cited in Day & Sachs, 2004) argue that 'managerial professionalism discourses create the possibility within which individuals construct new roles and identities from which they derive ideas about the logic of institutional change'. It is an approach that is advocated by employers and favours systems.

2.8 Conclusion

My literature review gives insight into whether the roll out plan using the state-driven professionalism approach is the most successful approach to bring about effective change to teacher and student learning. By focusing my lens on what researchers said about state-driven professionalism and critiquing whether this model of CPTD actually reprofessionalizes teachers, informed conclusions can be drawn. I used the review to debate whether state-driven professionalism as an instrument is either being used to empower teachers or is it an instrument that's being used to control teachers' work.

Summary of the literature review

A vision was designed for an education that would lift South Africa into the globalised world, and at the same time redress our apartheid past. Curriculum (content, pedagogy and assessment) was to shift from fragmentation to integration, from lower-order to higher-order knowledge and skills, and from rote learning to active, critical engagement. Teachers were identified as key agents of change, pointing to significant and necessary roles for continuous

professional teacher development (CPTD) in the new orientations to knowledge and pedagogy (The new White Paper for Education published in 1996, DOE).

The literature reviewed suggests that managerial professionalism, as a theoretical construct, is the most appropriate mechanism to facilitate education reforms and process changes rather than academic and professional development. Yet, states continue to use this form of professionalism to facilitate academic and professional changes to education. This study, therefore attempts to understand why such approaches are most favoured by the employers and what benefits teachers derive professionally from these activities. This study will contribute to the discourses on professional development within the context of large scale educational reforms.

Chapter Three
Research Methodology

3.1 Introduction

This study focuses on how teachers experience managerial professionalism and this chapter gives a comprehensive discussion on the methodological orientation and research design, data collection and sampling procedures for attaining access to participants and acceptance.

3.2 Research Design

My choice for this research design was due to me not getting time off from work to do my studies. I had to choose a design that took my personal circumstances into account and also the purpose of my study. When one plans a design, one is involved in a thoughtful process. This thoughtful process led me to use the survey design. The final product is the result of this thoughtful and intellectual process. This process revolves around data. How this data is collected and analysed will determine whether the research design had been the correct choice.

3.3 The Purpose of the Research

The primary aim of the research was to find out whether managerial professionalism is the appropriate development tool for teachers. Living in a neo-liberal age makes one want to question the state's agenda and what is best suited for teacher development.
Teachers' experiences needed to be captured to help us unpack the aims for this study.
The aim of the study was to collect data from Visual Arts Educators through questionnaires and semi-structured interviews.

3.4. Research Methods

McMillan and Schumacher as cited in Maree (2007: 155) define a survey research as "the assessment of the current status, opinions, beliefs, and attitudes by questionnaires or interviews from a known population". Cohen as cited in Maree (2007: 155) assert that surveys "set out to describe and to interpret what is". Although surveys are usually conducted by means of questionnaires, information can be obtained in a number of other ways, including interviews, telephone calls and observation.

I used the survey method because I wanted to establish the current status of state-driven teacher professional development activities as it relates to teacher professional development

for Visual Arts teachers. Further, to establish in detail the experiences of teacher learning through state-initiated professional development activities for Visual Arts teachers, I selected three Visual Arts teachers from the surveyed sample for in-depth interviews in order to capture the intricate and complex experiences of these teachers.

3.5   Participants included in the study

The survey was conducted amongst the Visual Arts teachers teaching in secondary schools in the Greater Durban area. This delimitation of the survey sampling was determined by access as well as the geographical area that had a critical mass of Visual Arts teachers. Visual Arts is not a popular subject in the secondary school curriculum. Hence, there are relatively few schools that offer these subjects, most occur in urban settings. The three participants chosen for the in-depth interviews were selected through the survey questionnaire. The reasons for this process of choices of participants included the richness of information that the participants could offer and the kinds of learning that the participants experienced. One participant from the survey sample indicated that s/he benefited from the state-driven workshop, another indicated that she did not benefit and the third person indicated that she had mixed feelings about the workshops.

3.6   Instruments used in the study

3.6.1   Questionnaire

A questionnaire was used for the collection of data from educators. The questionnaire method is appropriate for the collection of data which would be easily quantifiable and suitable for analysis. It was decided to keep the questionnaires anonymous. Questionnaires were drawn up to support the semi-structured interviews to find out whether a pattern existed.

When I designed the questionnaire, I had to keep in mind the type of data I wanted to generate. The questionnaire went through a series of changes and adjustments. I also received help from my supervisor for the following (Maree, 2007):

- Appearance of the questionnaire in terms of its neatness both in presentation and printing
- Question sequence that showed cohesion
- Wording of questions showed clarity and
- The questionnaire was not lengthy and was user friendly.

I had to ensure that the instructions were simple, clear and concise. I also took into consideration the amount of time a teacher would have to take to complete a questionnaire. I estimated between twenty to thirty minutes. Furthermore, I attached a small paragraph with the questionnaire explaining the purpose of my study.

The questionnaire had standardized questions that related to the questions asked in the semi-structured interviews. The researcher distributed the questionnaires and collected them with the help of a few visual arts teachers. Help was required because visual arts teachers lived long distances from where I lived and I was not given time off from work to carry out the research while teachers were at their places of employment (schools).

Biographical questions were asked such as qualifications and experience and this information was important to the study. Confidentiality of the responses was assured from the outset.

The questionnaire was designed to explore how Visual Arts teachers experienced Managerial Professionalism and the opportunities and challenges they faced after attending these activities. It also explored the strengths and weaknesses of Managerial Professionalism.

3.6.2   Semi-Structured Interviews

An interview is a two-way conversation in which the interviewer asks the participant questions to collect data and to learn about the ideas, beliefs, views, opinions and behaviours of the participants. The aim of the qualitative interview is to see the world through the eyes of the participant, and they can be a valuable source of information, provided they are used correctly. The aim is always to obtain rich descriptive data that will help you understand the participant's construction of knowledge and social reality (Maree 2007: 87).

My study focused on Visual Arts teachers and their personal experiences. The teachers I interviewed are colleagues with whom I often mark external examination papers at the end of each year. I am not a stranger to these teachers. There is an element of trust that exists between us because we do chat informally during our breaks. The information gathered in the semi-structured way was very valuable indeed.

I used the semi-structured interview to corroborate data emerging from the questionnaires. I had a set of predetermined questions which helped me keep the focus. The discussion did meander at times but the questions I had preplanned helped bring us back to the topic. As I probed, new emerging lines of inquiry was discovered. For example, I did not realize the extent to which teachers engage with their learners in Isizulu instead of English. Learners could comprehend the lesson in Isizulu but not in English. This information did not surface in the questionnaire.

Two of the teachers requested that I interview them in their homes and one teacher wanted me to interview her at my residence. Before starting the interviews, these teachers had filled in the questionnaires which mentioned the possibility of a tape recording being involved in the research. I selected the three participants from the questionnaires for the interviews. I chose three participants from three different school set-ups. I chose one teacher from an ex-model C school, one teacher from an ex-DET school and one from an ex-HOD school. I did this to see whether the data would vary. Confidentiality clauses were built into the initial questionnaire forms and there was no reason to fill in new forms. However, I did verbally explain to them the issues of confidentiality.

Two of the interviews tape recording was audible. One interview had to be repeated because of distortions in the recording. We were not close enough to the tape recorder for it to capture our voices. The duration of each interview took between 25 to 45 minutes.

3.7   Sampling

Visual Arts as mentioned previously is not a popular learning area in the province. I had to choose teachers who lived in the greater Durban area for my studies. These teachers were easily accessible after school hours.

I chose twenty visual arts teachers for my research study using questionnaires. I received 18 replies. The questionnaire method was a quantitative approach. I recorded in pencil the names of the participants' responses as I received their questionnaires. The semi-structured interview method was a qualitative approach and I wanted the sampling to be purposive and non-probable in order to provide me with the information that I would need for the study. The recording of the participants' names on the questionnaire was specifically used for the identification of the three individuals that would participate in the in-depth interview process. Once the individuals were identified and contacted for their willingness to participate, the

names recorded in the questionnaire were erased, thus re-establishing anonymity of the participants for the survey questionnaire.

I perused through the questionnaires and decided on the three visual arts teachers that I identified as holders of rich data that would suit the needs of my study. Three participants were adequate to obtain the data I required for the research. The interviewees were allowed to deviate a little during the interview process. I also allowed my participants time for their responses.

I used the stratified purposive sampling because I had to select teachers who firstly taught visual arts; secondly were teachers in the FET phase and lastly; teachers who attended the state driven PDAs.

The three teachers chosen all taught in public schools but they differed in that each taught in an ex-Model C school, ex-DET school and an ex-HOD school. The teacher from the ex-DET school taught in a rural school.

My aim in using purposive sampling was to see how each teacher experienced managerial professionalism and to what extent historical imbalances influenced how teachers experience Managerial Professionalism.

3.8   Data Collection

The collection of data for the questionnaires proved challenging because I had to visit teachers in their homes for the first time and I had no other reason than to complete a study that could be perceived as benefiting me alone. Teachers were busy so I had to collect the data according to the availability of participants. I often drove to the same area on different occasions because I had to accommodate the participants.

The semi-structured interviews posed the greatest challenge for me as a researcher and a visual arts teacher. I had to use two hats and I had to constantly remind myself through reflection that when I am interviewing the participant, I am a researcher and not a visual art teacher. When teachers answered questions during the interview process, I was tempted to 'correct' them because I attended the managerial professional PDAs. Sometimes, I was tempted to answer the questions myself or to preempt what the participants were going to say. It was difficult to be an outsider when the participants recognize you as a fellow

colleague who was involved with them in the PDAs. I tried my very best to be objective and not to allow my subjectivities to compromise the data collection.

Before the formal interviews were held, we spoke informally about school and examinations etc. To suddenly adapt to the interviewing process which was very formal was a strange experience. However as the interview progressed both the participants and myself became more relaxed and the conversations became more spontaneous.

3.9   Transcription

This was a very tedious task because I had to listen to the tape, rewind and type the responses on the computer. Prior to the interviews the sentence structure in the questions was correct. When I listened to the tape recording and transcribed the questions, it lacked spontaneity. I also ended the interviews very abruptly. There was no proper conclusion to all three interviews. I had not piloted this technique and was found wanting in this area.

3.10   Data Analysis

As mentioned in the previous chapter, the constructs of the managerial model of professional development was used as apriori categories to interpret and analyse the data. Further, the interviews provided some grounded categories for analysis.

3.11   Validity

How would I react if the department of education requested to use my research study to implement a policy on teacher professionalism and visual arts educators? Would I feel secure or insecure? I do not think that I have found the ultimate truth. The truth that I have discovered was looked at from my lens and my lens is very limited in terms of research knowledge. The interpretation of the findings is purely from my perspective. I have read other theses on professional development and the findings and approaches are completely different to my findings. It is valid from my point of view. However, what strengthens my point of view is that I have literature to support my studies. From a literature point of view, I would say that the research is valid. Anyone contesting this point of view will have to use research to refute the validity of what I have stated.

Laurel Richardson as cited by Denzin and Lincoln (2003: 279) draws an analogy with a crystal to emphasize the importance of validity. He proposes the crystal. He says

" I propose that the central imaginary for 'validity' for post modernist texts is not the triangle-a rigid, fixed , two dimensional object. Rather the central imaginary is the crystal, which combines symmetry and substance with an infinite variety of shapes, substances, transmutations, multidimensionalities, and angles of approach. Crystals grow, change, alter, but are not amorphous. Crystals are prisms that reflect externalities and refract within themselves, creating different colours, patterns, arrays, casting off in different directions. What we see depends upon our angle of repose. Not triangulation, crystallization. In post-modern mixed genre texts, we have moved from plane geometry to light theory, where light can be both waves and particles. Crystallization, without losing structure, deconstructs the traditional idea of 'validity' (we feel how there is no single truth, we see how texts validate themselves); and crystallization provides us with a deepened, complex, thoroughly partial understanding of the topic. Paradoxically, we know more and doubt what we know."

3.12   Reliability

From a research perspective, any other researcher doing the same study with exactly the same instruments is unlikely to arrive at exactly the same conclusions as I have. The researcher may have some similarity or may be totally in opposition to my findings. This is what qualitative research is all about. This allows for findings to be debated.

Furthermore, the subjectivities of researchers impact on studies. When I started the research, I had some preconceived notions about what the study should reveal. To my amazement the contrary was 'true'. The data is an external source that researchers use to make certain assumptions? The inner mind of each researcher is not known and this may or may not influence the direction a study may take.

I must also acknowledge the fact that I am a novice researcher. I have tried to keep the study simple so that I could understand the language of research.

I would say that as a novice qualitative researcher the study shows consistency in terms of the following:
- Questionnaires issued to participants
- Participants response.
- Semi-structured interviews
- The use of literature to analyse the data.

I do hope that visual arts teachers reading this dissertation would be able to look at it critically and not accept the findings as truth although it was based on research.

3.13   Limitations

Most of the participants used in the study were Indian visual arts teachers. I issued out questionnaires to teachers of all race groups but only one white teacher and one black teacher responded.

The other limitation was wearing a hat as a researcher and a visual arts teacher. I had to change from one reality to the next and sometimes these realities became blurred. For example before I could interview the teachers we were conversing informally but when the interview began you could sense a tension and a diference because everything became very formal.

3. 14   Ethical Issues

Permission was obtained from all stakeholders in terms of research requirements by the ethics committee of the university. Permission was granted by the department of education, the principals of schools and participants involved in the research. When selecting and involving participants, as a researcher I had to ensure that full information about the purpose and uses of participants' contribution was given. I was honest from the start and kept my participants' informed. During the interview I did not pressurize participants to speak which I knew would compromise both the research and the faith the participants' had in me. The names of participants were not declared, pseudonyms were used.

3.15   Conclusion

As a researcher I had to make certain choices about how to realize my research design. The tools, instruments, analysis, etc was limited to the time and resources I had available.
The research design is open for debate and it is important for people reading this dissertation to be critical because then we realize that people are engaging with the research in an intellectual way.

The next chapter deals with the research findings.

CHAPTER FOUR
ANALYSIS OF DATA

4.1   Introduction

The previous chapter presented a detailed account of the methodological decisions taken in the production of the data for this study. Having produced the data through the methodological design, this chapter presents the data and the analysis thereof. The analysis of the data is guided by the research questions, literature review and theoretical framework that were presented in the previous chapters. To re-iterate, the research questions that this study attempted to answer are:

How do visual arts educators experience managerial professionalism?
Through the following sub-questions:
- *What role and purpose does managerial professionalism play in teachers' professional development?*
- *What challenges and opportunities were presented to teachers of visual arts through managerial professionalism?*
- *What are the attitudes of teachers towards managerial professionalism?*

The chapter begins by giving some insight into the research context that presents the biographical details of the participants and Visual Arts educators in KZN province as well as the type and duration of the professional development activities that these teachers engage in. This will help understand the context in which state-driven Professional Development Activity (PDA) take place and how this context impacts on teacher learning. The analysis of the data through the following emerging themes is then presented:

- **Duration of Professional development activities experienced by Visual Arts teachers**
- **Spatial distance as a barrier to meaningful collaboration amongst Visual Arts teachers.**
- **The value of Learner and Teacher Support Materials (LTSM) handed out to teachers at PD meetings**
- **PDAs facilitated by Teachers.**
- **State initiated PD activities act as stimulus for on-going professional learning**

These emerging themes have been extracted from the data produced and have been informed by categories influenced through the literature review.

4.2   Research Context

		Indian	White	Black	Coloured
Number involved in study	Male	10	-	-	-
	Female	6	1	1	-
Qualifications	M + 3	1		1	-
	M+4 & above	15	1		
Teaching experience	Under 10 years	2		1	-
	Over 10 years	14	1		-

Visual Arts Teachers involved in Questionnaire Survey

Of the 18 research participants, the majority were qualified teachers with in excess of 10 years of teaching experience. There is an equitable balance between male and female Visual Arts teachers. All the participants are academically qualified.

Once a year all Visual Arts teachers in KZN attend a 4 hour once-off PDA in Durban. This workshop is more of a report back meeting concerning grade 12 learner performance in the previous year's NCS examination.

During the July vacation an optional three day PDA on practical work is held with special focus on crafts like bead-making and basketry. This is organized by the subject advisor who contracts professional crafts people to develop teachers who are interested in these mediums. It is not a PDA that allows for teacher interaction or reflection concerning the strengths and weakness of their profession. I have attended two of these vacation workshops and found that the attendance at these workshops is very poor.

During the course of the year it is compulsory for teachers to attend one cluster meeting per term arranged by the department of education. The main purpose of this meeting is for teachers to moderate their learner's Continuous Assessment (CASS) marks. The cluster coordinators are the mediators between the subject advisors and the teachers. Although it is

mentioned at the beginning of the year that cluster coordinators will assist teachers in their professional development, this is hardly the case.

The biographical evidence reveals that over 90% of the Visuals Arts teachers are highly qualified academics and most of them have been teaching for more than ten years. Most of Visual Arts teachers have taught under the previous Apartheid education system. The general feedback from the questionnaires and the interviews conducted reveals that teachers are very much involved in reflection on their practice. Their responses are very critical with regards to their professional development. However, this reflective activity is not evident in the PDAs that teachers attend. They were very observant and critical in their interviews and questionnaires and this study aims to find out why teachers are not allowed this intellectual space and opportunities to air their views in their PDAs.

4.3 Duration of Professional development activities experienced by Visual Arts teachers

Perusing through the data produced through the interviews and the questionnaires, it was evident that teachers were exposed to two types of state-driven PDAs related to Visual Arts professional development. One being a three day PDA held in 2006, and since then teachers have been attending a one-day once off workshop, annually. The evidence from the teachers' experiences suggest that longer duration PDAs are more favourable for deep professional learning related to their subject teaching competences and that one-day PDAs are only useful for transfer of information and building network connections.

Deep professional learning, according to Samuel (2008), is when professional development of teachers leads to intellectual growth and a transfer of new knowledge and skills into their teaching activities or practices. Teachers interviewed indicated that their experience of the three day professional development activity in 2006 resulted in positive feelings of professional achievement. Although contrived teachers preferred a sustained programme where they can interact and reflect with other teachers.

The following responses from teachers showed that they favoured this particular form and duration of PDA than a one day format. Most teachers enjoyed the interaction they had with other teachers in the three day PDA workshops they attended in 2006 which was organized by the Department of Education to familiarize teachers with OBE in their respective learning areas. Teachers were put into groups and given specific tasks to perform and they had to

give feedback to the larger group. Information was exchanged amongst teachers and departmental officials (facilitators).

> According to Daehir (not his real name) he **"worked in groups, shared and discussed matters concerning OBE/FET. They brainstormed ideas and concepts with other colleagues and they had to report back to the larger group concerning their discussions. Although all this was done under a contrived atmosphere it allowed teachers to meet and discuss issues that concerned them."**

> Saraniya (not her real name) got to meet new teachers and discussed common problems: **"the workshop gave me more clarity with some of the matric themes. I was able to learn from my mistakes I made last year. Also the sharing of information with other teachers… experienced teachers as well, helped me getting my practical activities. I have more of a variety to do than I did before. I was also encouraged to sharing of materials and exposed to places where I could get stuff."**

> Saraniya reflected on her practice. She was **"comfortable to discuss her problems because everyone was faced with the same reforms in education. This is an example of teachers involved in intellectual activity."**

> According to Mischka (not her real name) **"Educators in Visual Arts do not cover the same things from school to school because of the open interpretation of the syllabus. The time is valuable to connect and also share ideas."**

In their responses the three day workshops, although organized under contrived conditions, was preferred and teachers were disappointed that this form of PDA s was not repeated. The teachers felt that these types of workshops should **"be happening more"** because the **"workshop was meaningful in terms of sharing ideas".** It created spaces for intellectualizing amongst teachers who had similar interests. Further, it promoted a sense of

collegiality amongst the Visual Arts teachers. Teachers were afforded opportunities to discuss the varied interpretations of the curriculum. These varied interpretations required high level of intellectualizing through sharing of individual experiences. By having more frequent, long duration workshops facilitated by the state would mean developing longer term relationships amongst the Visual Arts teachers as evident from their dissatisfaction with short one-day programmes.

The responses from teachers attending the one day PDA reveal that very little teacher development took place at these meetings. It was more an information feedback meeting focusing on the previous year's performance of grade 12 learners in the National Curriculum Statement (NCS) examinations. Teachers stated that they sat and listened while the presenters of these PDAs gave generic feedback on the performance of previous grade 12 learners in the NCS external examinations.

> According to Mischka (not his real name*)* " **the one day workshops is a mere formality.. it is something that has to be done by the subject advisor as part of the educational departmental structure- I feel he should go beyond that…"**

Furthermore Mischka explained that these meetings only benefited her in terms of changes in the marking structure of the grade 12 Examination paper. She wanted to develop her skills as a teacher but this was not the forum for it. This is what she had to say about the one day one off PDA….

> **"It benefits and also not a benefit. I will say it is a benefit because it will tell me how much work is expected of from the learners so I can prepare them for that but not benefitting.. There are no workshops where people are teaching about new medium and what the new mediums the learners should use. Doing workshops like the craft section …would help us."** She goes on further to explain the purpose of the workshop**. "They will discuss about the sections and whether it would be 10 marks or 20 marks…. they would say you have to cover six themes.. and you need to consider these when you answering the questions and those kind of things. And for practicals you have**

to mark the learners out of 50…. I think the main intention of the workshop is to inform the teachers of performance of previous matrics and how they supposed to answer some of the questions. For the teachers to explain to the learners update the changes in criteria of marking… Teaching new themes…"

It is evident from the teachers' responses that these meetings are not PDA but information feedback meetings. Although teachers attend these PDAs from all parts of the KZN province, the benefits are very limited. One teacher suggested that this information could be typed and passed onto teachers to be read instead of calling teachers from the entire province to be involved in such a futile exercise.

4.4 Spatial distance a barrier to meaningful collaboration amongst Visual Arts teachers

According to **(**Anonymous 1998: 47**)** "there is universal condemnation in the research literature on professional development for one-shot PDAs as a method of bringing about any real change in teaching practice." The inadequacies of state driven one day and three day workshops for meaningful teacher learning is further exacerbated by the spatial distances amongst Visual Arts teachers. This is because of the low numbers of Visual Arts teachers employed in secondary schools as this subject is not offered on a wide scale across the secondary schools. It is, therefore, difficult for teachers to form collaborative groups on professional issues because of the low numbers of Visual Arts teachers over a geographic area.

Although some teachers indicated that they meet with their colleagues to discuss subject related issues, it is not common and if done, it is very informally.

As Zizi mentions **"Living in isolated areas makes it difficult, Thus it is important to attend and empower yourself at these meetings."**

Where teachers are located and the distances the schools are from each other impacts on whether teachers learn in a collegial or collaborative environment. Unlike other learning areas where there is more than one teacher in a particular learning area in one school, Visual Arts as a learning area is not offered by most schools, therefore there are too few Visual Arts teachers in a certain area and as you move away from the urban area and into

the rural area the span between Visual Arts teachers increases, which in turn increases their isolation from each other.

When asked about 'what keeps you going' in terms of professional development in the aftermath of these once a year once-off PDAs the response from Nonhlanhla was

> **"I look for books in the library.. I consult with my cluster coordinator and she is also finding her own way of doing things…"**
>
> Interviewer: "and if there are things you don't understand?"
>
> **Nonhlanhla's response was: "I leave it like that. I do not do the themes that I am not sure off."**

Asking cluster coordinators to assist in PDAs is futile for Nonhlanhla because,according to her, the cluster coordinator is also having difficulty interpreting the curriculum. Hence being located and teaching in a context where there are too few teachers to consult or collaborate, as in the case of Visual Arts teachers, make teachers the custodian of their own professional development, especially with respect to subject teaching. This means that the state driven, once off, PDAs can only be a stimulus for teacher professional development and not the development itself.

4.5 Cluster Meetings: A Lost Opportunity for PDA

Due to the limited exposure for professional development at the one-off one-day state driven professional development activity, districts are encouraged to hold cluster meetings for additional professional development. It is compulsory for teachers to attend these cluster meetings. At the cluster meeting each term's work gets moderated and signed by their respective cluster coordinators The cluster coordinators for Visual Arts are appointed by the subject advisor. Hence, this meeting is also an opportunity where information for teachers is cascaded from the subject advisor via the cluster coordinators to the teachers. Since the inception of C2005 teachers only attend these cluster meetings to have their work checked. No professional development activity takes place at these meetings. It is generally accepted by teachers that the meetings are only for CASS moderation.

According to Sanele "At these moderation teachers are just coming to get their books moderated…. not much time is spent with them and they leave."

No constructive PDA takes place because teachers attend these meetings anytime between 9.00 and 13.00. Their attendance is dependant on what time of the day their respective

schools release their Visual Arts teachers to attend this PDA. Teachers do not come together as a group at any one specific time. Hence the groups of Visual Arts teachers who belong to a cluster do meet as a group to engage with and amongst each other.

Performativity becomes the focus of these cluster meetings. The schools are given specific documents by the department of education. These documents must be signed by the cluster coordinators and brought back to the respective schools for filing. The cluster coordinator sends a copy of this form to the subject advisor indicating that the respective schools presented their work for checking. The coordinators do not have time to engage with teachers in capacity building. Forms are filled and signed and teachers leave.

For the past few years teachers have seen no value in these cluster meetings except that it is a meeting to have their record books and portfolios checked. The cluster meetings could have been used to develop teachers and improve their learning; however this is not the situation.

According to Sanele (a visual art teacher) the CASS moderation does not serve any purpose in terms of teacher development because "**teachers bring in their books for the CASS moderator to check and sign and record their attendance.**" Sanele who was willing to assist the CASS moderator felt frustrated when teachers rushed in and out of their CASS moderation meeting.

> **Sanele: I feel at the CASS moderation there isn't enough time to impart knowledge to teachers.. to show them skills.. to develop them… to provide assistance… for them.. because they are there with time constraints themselves. …but what I feel is at these moderation all these Visual Arts teachers need to arrive there at once .. at this meeting before the moderation.. we can address problems and give assistance to teachers who have problems with resources, content , curriculum development… practical skills. they come in during the course of the day .. some because of factors in school where the management will not release them during teaching time.**

What is evident is that all visual arts teachers attend these CASS moderation meetings because it is compulsory. However, they do not attend the CASS moderation meetings as a

collective unit. It is virtually impossible to compare and exchange information with other educators because teachers are rushing in and out of the moderation process because they are needed back at school.

It is reasonable to assume that school principals are complying with this compulsory routinized activity which has its origins in the bureaucratic hierarchies of education. Teachers attend these cluster meetings as a formality because they have to, and not as a matter of choice. The purpose of the meeting is to get your terms work checked. Teachers sign a departmental form confirming their attendance which they have to present to their school principals and a copy of their attendance is sent to the subject advisor by the cass coordinator.

The only constructive work that takes place is that learner portfolios are checked and signed off. Cluster coordinators feel inadequate to deal with issues where schools are presenting sub-standard or mediocre work. As Sanele mentions : **"You are a level one teacher .. I find it difficult to bring it to the notice of another teacher that their work with is not up to standard.. that's why subject advisors should handle situations like that.. where you find that inadequate work is being done in the classroom .. injustices are done to the learners.**

**It is difficult to address the problem with the teacher there. That is why if you have small workshops.. before the moderation begins you can provide assistance generally to teachers. I cannot go up to a teacher and say what you are doing is absolutely wrong…. Which is totally not in keeping with the curriculum…
There is not enough time to do that.. in terms of professional ethics.. it is not my job to approach a teacher and tell him that what you are doing is wrong."**

The evidence reveals that there is nothing intellectual taking place at these cluster meetings. Time constraints, intensification and increased workloads at schools do not make it possible for teachers to stay for long periods of time to discuss relevant issues.

Except for the bureaucratic control of teachers Continuous Assessment (CASS) marks no other meaningful activity takes place at cluster meetings. (Hargreaves, 1994: 11). Instead of

empowering teachers the cluster meetings are being used as an instrument to control teachers' work (Sachs, 1999).

The cluster meeting concept is a perfect example of how state-initiated professionalism emanates from outside the teaching profession and it is often imposed by employers to control teachers' work. It often means more bureaucratic control of teachers' work and it is driven by bureaucratic needs rather than the needs of teachers. Its link with attempts to limit teacher autonomy is seen as an attempt to deprofessionalise teaching. This form of professionalism often sees teachers as service providers or merely state employees rather thanprofessionals with autonomy to determine the nature of their work. (Hargreaves and Goodson, 1996).

According to Giroux (1988) 'the excessive control of teachers' work results in teachers losing their autonomy which results in teachers relying on outside accountability regimes.' It is not surprising to find that teachers walk in and out of cluster meetings only to sign the register. The state wants to control every aspect of the teacher's work which disillusions and demotivates teachers. Experienced teachers have been pushed to behave like clerks and technicians.

The control of teacher work through cluster coordinators is very similar to the heavy control mechanisms that were enforced under Apartheid to inspect and control teacher's work. Attending moderation sessions once a term was a form of 'surveillance' very similar to the bureaucracy of Apartheid. This definitely affected the professionalism of teachers and denied them the autonomy to decide what was educationally sound for their learners in the context in which they operated (Chisholm, 1999).

Research shows that when teachers' work is controlled not only do they become suspicious of the state's agenda and resist but it resulted in dependence amongst teachers. Instead of being creative in what they do, they come to rely on outside agency (state) to direct them in performing their duties. These accountability regimes not only undermine teacher autonomy but they have resulted in teachers losing confidence in their own ability to be creative.

This results in double jeopardy for visual arts teachers. They cannot gain skills at the one off meetings at the beginning of the year and the cluster meetings do not provide much support for their professional development. In the absence of any formal teacher development,

teachers consult with their colleagues for assistance. It is important that visual arts teachers get assistance from colleagues that understand the curriculum; otherwise you will have a case of the blind leading the blind.

Mischka: …" not really. It does not help me a lot. Because I have a good background in theory. I am okay in that way, then I will find help in other colleagues. Then in theory in some parts I will need help then I will go ..in some parts I will need help I will go and find out."

While some teachers try to work in a collegial environment, there are those like Sanele who prefers to work independently. **" I fell I have to be self-sufficient. I cannot be reliant on the workshops.. I believe that self –development is important."** In the absence of professional development, teachers are engaging in survival tactics to help come to terms with the new curriculum. However, this shows the fractured nature of the visuals arts department.

4.6   The value of Learner and Teacher Support Materials (LTSM) handed out to teachers at PD meetings

Unlike other learning areas, Visual Arts does not prescribed any text books. Teachers and learners must select and develop their teaching and learning resources. Some of the books that are necessary for the subject cannot be purchased through the government catalogue. These books can only be purchased from bookstores or accessed through main public libraries. The books the teachers need are relatively expensive because they have colour illustrations of artworks. Most of the former House of Delegates (ex-HOD) schools and former Department of Education and Training (ex-DET) schools do not have the finances to purchase these LTSMs. Teachers can also use the electronic media like the internet to access information.

Many of the resourced schools have computers, data projectors and smart boards to assist them with their teaching of visual culture studies. A visit to art galleries is also a means of accessing information about South African Artists. An important fact to note is that the Visual Arts external examination paper in visual culture studies is printed in colour and learners have to analyse unseen works that are produced in colour. However to help teachers and learners from under-resourced schools the subject advisor put together a book. The book

which is referred to as the 'yellow book' by most Visual Arts teachers is a compilation of photocopied notes, which is in black and white.

The data revealed that most under-resourced schools received the 'yellow book'. Photocopied material contained in this book is either notes from teachers that have been photocopied or photocopies from reference books. It covered some of the themes required for the teaching of grade 12 learners in Visual Culture Studies which is the theory component of Visual Arts. No LTSMs was provided for grades ten and eleven curriculum. The teachers' response to this resource material was anything but favourable.

Mischka teaches Visual Arts in a rural school. She expresses the challenges she faces concerning the lack of resources when it comes to delivering the new curriculum in the classroom. Mischka cannot teach the subject without source material because the under-resourced schools do not have funds to buy textbooks, let alone data projectors and computers. According to Mischka the government has provided funds for the purchase of textbooks but Visual Arts do not have a prescribed textbook. This poses difficult challenges for the teachers in schools that are under-resourced because many of them are using poor quality black and white copies to teach. Teachers themselves do not have access to coloured copies.

Daehir affirms this when questioned about textbooks.

> Daehir: **There are no textbooks in visual arts.**
>
> Mischka mentions that she has **"not seen the works we study in colour."**

Mischka explains the challenges she faces in terms of delivering the new curriculum and how the PDAs are not assisting in improving her situation.

> **Mischka: We supposed to do about ten themes but in the workbook there are three themes. Also the notes are very long and not user friendly.. not easy to understand and they are in black and white and the learners must know it in colour.**
>
> **What I learnt is just that..mmm looking at the curriculum now it has changed…from the old time curriculum but we no longer working with the**

European movements the students should learn.. the learners must participate.. the learners don't understand the curriculum as it is also still difficult myself ..I just find my way .. cause it is not enough what I found in the workshop...and also they don't tell you which images to use.. other than the yellow book which is in black and white.

Mischka reiterated that: we do not have reference books. I do not know who should provide reference books on South African Artists. The department is only paying for those books that are prescribed on the catalogue. And you don't find the reference books under the catalogue.

Mischka elaborated further on other challenges related to resources : **the other challenges are that the learners need to know the work in colour.. The teacher will need a computer in class for the learners to see the images... I am working far off from where there are exhibitions, where there are contemporary artist and new medium the learners could be exposed to. This lack of connection results in learners not being enthusiastic about art because they don't know what's going on in the art world.**

Two issues emerge from this account on resources that relate to state driven teacher professional development. The first is that there is no formal basis for TPD at these professional development meetings because of a lack of a common reference book that could be prescribed. Hence teachers are at the mercy of the interpretation of the compilers of the "yellow book". The second relates to disjuncture between what is expected of students and what teachers are given as resources to teach. The students are expected to engage with detail (through colour) yet they are expected to learn about details through monochromatic photocopied versions interpreted by teachers that have attended these state driven professional development activities.

Daehir is a teacher in an ex-HOD school and he has resources to teach the subject. He is an experienced teacher teaching for 25 years. He has a data projector in his room and a

computer. He was assisting the cluster coordinator moderate teachers CASS work and these are the observations he made concerning LTSMs.

> **Daehir: "if you look at the content given in the workbooks (yellow book).. the language is still too far-fetched for the black learners. It needs to be really simplified for them. When these teachers come to the CASS moderation I gave them some of my notes which is much simpler for them to understand.. with sub headings, point form paragraphs .. working with essays."**

This comment suggests that language plays a major factor in the professional development of teachers and therefore state driven TPD activities should be sensitive to this issue. Inaccessible language thus becomes a barrier to teachers who have English as a second language as their interpretation at these state driven workshops may impact negatively in their professional growth as well as their teaching of Visual Arts. The reality in the majority of South African schools is that while the language of teaching and learning, post foundation phase, is English, most teaching and learning takes place in indigenous mother tongue language. Hence teachers of Visual Arts are expected to engage in professional development in English while they teach in their usual common language dictated by their location.

Llike any other specialist subjects (like Mathematics), Visual Arts does have technical terms that have meanings different from our daily exposure to the English language. The nuances and variations in meaning are extremely important in Visual Arts, both in teaching and learning.

> Daehir futher commented that: **I even saw this when the teachers were taking content directly from the subject advisors workbook(yellow book). You can see the learners are delivering this content without any understanding or delivering the content in the wrong context. They were trying to rote learn and you can see there is no particular understanding because the notes were not conducive to these learners. The notes may be conducive to learners in the ex-model C schools –In the black schools language is a barrier.**

He goes on further to explain how teachers are photocopying from photocopies and each time you photocopy from a photocopy the images become less conspicuous. The clarity of the image is lost.

> **Daehir: "… in one of the workshops I saw a teacher photocopy from the workbook for the learners.. the pictures were totally black.. I cannot fathom how the learners had any knowledge of what was going on let alone looking at it in colour."**

Professional development activities at these state driven workshops thus becomes a point where resources are duplicated for transmission on to the learner. No real engagement with the resources occurs at these meetings. The availability of some resources to assist teachers becomes the focus of the meeting.

Saraniya is an experienced teacher with more than 15 years of experience as a visual arts teacher. She teaches in an ex-model C school. She does not have problems with resources because her school can afford to purchase books she needs through her school library. Finance is not an issue for her. She feels that these workshops are beneficial to underprivileged schools because they receive LTSMs. Even though the quality of the material given to these teachers are not of a good quality, she feels the material received will be of some help to the teachers teaching in under-resourced schools rather than no help at all.

For her the one-day workshops have little benefit as the focus is largely on supporting teachers from resource-deprived school contexts. This suggests that the state-driven workshops are not inclusive and are mainly focused on supporting schools and teachers from disadvantaged school backgrounds. It is premised on a one-size-fits-all conception – a lost opportunity for learning from experiences of teachers from a diverse school background. All these mitigating factors show that the teachers especially in under-resourced schools cannot deliver the type of curriculum required by the state. No matter what measures the state has in place to control teacher's work, they are not supporting the teacher in development. The purpose of these PDAs is for teachers to develop to produce quality education but because of a lack of resource material teachers' work has been intensified and if your school is further away from the city your challenges are compounded.

Most of the material passed onto teachers of disadvantaged schools is of sub-standard quality. Teachers have no choice but to use this support material. Furthermore, all effort and energy to support teachers are limited to grade 12 work only. There is no mention of PDAs to develop teachers outside the ambit of grade 12 work. The state is only responsible about performativity exercises that make them accountable to the public therefore there is no concentration of effort in the lower grades.

These materials promote a deskilling of teachers. It is evident from the learners' responses in tests moderated at cluster meetings that teachers are not using the LTSMs wisely. It is evident that many teachers who received these notes do not know how to interpret them. They do not understand these notes. Therefore, they cannot meet the intellectual and cultural needs of their learners because the LTSMs have many flaws in terms of quality teaching. Teachers are not exercising reasoned judgment when using the LTSM. Teachers are duplicating these notes and giving it to their learners. Thus, teachers are reduced to the role of obedient technicians, carrying out the dictates of this sub-standard curriculum package.

Policies on teacher development conceptualize teachers as researchers and knowledge creators. This is very profound because it implies that teachers are autonomous. Teacher autonomy is central to teacher professionalism. Their ability to decide on the materials used in the class means that they are not mere technicians implementing a curriculum decided elsewhere. The result of this is a highly skilled, accountable and independent teacher.

However, evidence from the data shows that the PDAs attended to by teachers do not contribute to their development. According to Fullan and Stiegelbauer(1991) as cited in Adeu,Hewitt and Landau (2004: 44) 'curriculum activities alone, presented in however a sophisticated mixture of print, visual and software resources, will never bring about educational change. We have continually emphasized that real change lies not in materials but in people. All the same we need to recognize the need for supportive material of adequate quality and accessibility. New practice needs all of those things but it also needs to be supported with materials to which the teacher can refer when she or he is on their own. Learning to change requires a continual iterative process between references to the academic, written, materials and the trialing of new pedagogies both alone with reflection and with support from peers or a tutor.'

Schools that are well resourced seem to be well represented at these PDAs to the detriment of those that are under-resourced. Only certain views get to be represented, sustained and maintained while others are relegated to the category of being subservient, unworthy, unimportant or irrelevant. According to Christie (1999), historically advantaged schools were flourishing with C2005 and those that were disadvantaged appeared to be floundering. Citing a range of studies, Christie suggests that the sophistication of new policies has actually widened the gap between the historically advantaged and disadvantaged schools. Indeed: 'Former Model C schools appear to have been able to implement Curriculum 2005 with greater ease than the majority of schools largely because of being better resourced' (DoE 2000:24).

Lack of resources, cited in a host of case studies, is certainly the most obvious difficulty for historically disadvantaged schools. Inherited disadvantage may be compounded by shortcomings in teacher's and learners' command of English. What has always been a problem for second language speakers of English has been exacerbated by the complex terminology in which C2005 was introduced (Harvey 1999; Le Grange & Reddy 2000; Reeves1999)as cited in Christie (1999).

Knowing the centrality of resources in teacher teaching and learning, the state-driven workshops should have attempted to be better organized to support teachers with appropriate resources. Instead they perpetuate the status quo at the expense of effective teaching and learning. Performativity has become the order of the day at most of these PDAs. The department of education needs feedback from the subject advisors as to what they are doing in terms of PDAs. Whether these PDAs are aiding teachers in their development is highly questionable. Accountability regimes ensures that PDAs are constantly taking place. There is no feedback from teachers on whether these PDAs are benefiting them.

4.7   Facilitators of state-driven PDAs

The facilitators of workshops organized by the state are usually selected by the organizers of the workshop. The data revealed that at times the facilitators chosen are in-appropriate to the purpose of the workshop, at times they are out of sinc with the reality of the school situation, and at times are there to promote their own interests.

This is what teachers had to say about the PDA presenters and what they would like to see excluded from future PDAs.

Mahen : "Unsuitable presenters. Exclude advertising of short course/degrees/diplomas in a workshop. Irrelevant and too long."

Bronwyn: " unprepared facilitators. Only educator driven discussions."

Dylan : " bring in outside educational agencies to deliver workshops."

Daehir: "a major part of the time was devoted to advertising and marketing of tertiary institutions. The important part of this workshop was hurriedly attended to. Get more experienced educators involved in the content, curriculum development and assessment."

Saraniya: " exclude DUT lecturers and talks by artists selling their workshops."

Renu: "Exclude tertiary institutions advertising themselves."

ravi: "Exclude teachers who do not know the curriculum to address teachers."

Mischka: "maybe discover new facilitators…"

Mischka: "the facilitators are the same people that are marking for the matrics at the end of the year and I believe when they are marking they can report the findings of the performance of the learners. They know where is the problem-who have the problem.. write down the names of the school and who the teachers from the school and find out if they need assistance."

Saraniya: some were very confusing in their approach…their approach. They could not make it easier for the teacher to understand, difficult words, difficult ways of approaching a theme… is too high for some of them.. the approach was too high… their aim was to target educators.. but the way

they approached it the way they tackled some of the issues were a bit too far fetched.

The selection of facilitators by the organizers of state-driven workshops is equally problematic thereby compromising the quality of engagement at these workshops. Lack of consultation with teachers of Visual Arts, dominant choice of facilitators from particular race and school contexts and lack of recognition of potential of teachers are some of the concerns raised by teachers of Visual Arts in the choice of facilitators for the workshops.

> **Daehir: the subject advisor selects them. He does not consult widely.. he consults with those he favours. I feel that sometimes he does not have much faith from teachers from black and Indian schools. Totally reliant on teachers from ex-model C schools.. mainly white teachers.**

Daehir further indicated that: barrier between the have and have nots.. there are a lot of teachers in black schools who are doing quite well, tremendous potential and great skills in what they are doing in the classrooms. They should get across to black teachers who are having problems. Although teachers from Model C school may be good teachers but they cannot provide PD for teachers in black schools.

Teachers are not opposed to teachers delivering PDAs. What they are requesting is quality and those facilitators to be knowledgeable concerning what they are delivering. 'Over the top' presentations are meaningless and valueless if teachers do not understand what is being said.

4.8   Conclusion

This is the challenge that lies ahead. If we are as concerned about education as we say we are, then we need to do more to change the conditions faced by teachers, especially those who work in underfinanced and largely abandoned urban schools.
According to Nieto (2003: 45)

> 'We need to support those teachers, who love their students and find creative ways to teach, and who do so under difficult circumstances. We need to celebrate teachers who are as excited about their own learning as they are about the learning of their students. And we need to champion those teachers who value their students' families

and find respectful ways to work with them. Above all, we need to expect all teachers to do these things. The children in our public schools deserve no less.'

This chapter created a picture of the contexts and race of Visual Arts teachers in KZN province. The data gathered from the questionnaires and interviews gave an indication on how teachers experience state-driven PDAs. The three day PDA was preferred to the one-day per annum PDAs because teachers had an opportunity to work in a collegial environment. They were given space to get involved in adult conversations concerning their profession. They were able to discuss issues and work together as a team. Although teachers were forced to work under contrived conditions it was a foundation on which future PDAs could be built. They were disappointed that the three day PDA was replaced by the four hour once-off per annum PDAs which was more an information feedback meeting rather than a PDA. To compound the problems concerning PDAs, the cluster meetings were not regarded as valuable in terms of teacher development. It was regarded as an accountability regime where teachers were being monitored by the state to steamroll their action plan, C2005. Although contexts amongst teachers differed, Visual Arts teachers did not mind leaving their context to learn outside. They realize that there is a sparse shortage of visual arts teachers in the province. Their priority is skills training. The two main areas of concern for visual arts teachers that needs highlighting are as follows:

1. Assessments: how marks are broken up, what are the percentages for Performance Assessment Tasks 1. These change all the time and teachers are left in abeyance as to what to do. They do not see any light at the end of the tunnel concerning this issue.
2. Visual Culture Studies is a very important issue for visual arts teachers. The syllabus has gone through radical changes and teachers do not have the skills nor the resources to improve their learning or the learning of their learners if constructive measures are not taken to address how teachers are re-skilled.

There are worrying issues revolving around language, knowledge, teachers without visual arts qualifications and experienced teachers who needed re-training. The gap may not be closed but it can be narrowed if value ridden PDAs are organized that address teacher generated issues. The teachers believe that although they are academically qualified they need on going professional development, not only to come to grips with the new curriculum but to keep them updated in a constantly changing environment.

CHAPTER FIVE
A SYNTHESIS, FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1   Introduction

In this chapter I will provide a synthesis of the study, outline the findings of the study, make recommendations based on the findings and reflect on the limitations and highlight areas of research that need further investigation.

5.2   Synthesis of the study

This study sought to understand the nature of state-driven PDAs and whether teacher learning took place. The literature review laid the foundation for the study by exploring state-driven professional development in schools in both the South African and international context. Various factors have surfaced from this literature review. It revealed that there is a gap between the state's interpretation of PDAs and the teachers view on PDAs. The literature reveals that changing the policy and providing the materials will not help reform. It is the people that should be the focus. Using the top down approach will only turn teachers into technicians and education will suffer, especially in majority of the under-resourced schools. Although the literature favours a collaborative teacher learning situation, the data has revealed that teachers can make changes to their practice. Teachers are prepared to work in a contrived environment provided the agenda is negotiated and benefits both state and teachers. Furthermore the PDAs must not be a one-off meeting but must be a sustained endeavour to promote PDA in terms of skills training. The one-off PDA that is held at the beginning of the year is an information meeting which probably be given to teachers on a CD and the time could be used more profitably.

Although the literature makes a strong case for situated learning and collaborative learning the data has shown that this is workable if there is more than one visual arts teacher in a school. Visual Arts teachers seem to be a rare commodity because it is not a popular subject..

The review of literature revealed that with the radical educational reforms, teachers of Visual Arts had to be reprofessionalised and the three day state-driven approach was the most successful for effective change to teacher learning and student learning. Since 2006, what has emerged from the data is that in the guise of professional development and

reprofessionalizing teachers, teachers are being monitored more than being developed through the PDAs. Although teachers are meeting departmental deadlines and are producing their portfolios on a regular basis in accordance with departmental requirements, this does not necessarily mean that teachers are being developed.

Autonomy in terms of collaboration which most researchers consider as one of the defining criteria for teacher professional development was never raised amongst teachers in the Visual Arts because it is not practical for visual arts teachers to meet considering so few schools offer Visual Arts as a learning area. Teachers do not have time to meet to discuss professional issues accept when they meet at PD meetings.

The other extreme is when the state believes that teachers must be subjected to the rigours of the market in terms of greater control and surveillance. What emerged from the data is a compromise can be forged between both extremes. Teachers preferred a contrived collegial environment where state and teachers negotiate their agendas to improve their positions. Both the state and teachers should benefit from this symbiotic relationship. Teachers cannot mobilize teachers because of the demographics and the state can provide time and space for teacher collaboration to take place. While the state takes care of issues of a political nature, educators will deal with issues related to their learning area.

I agree with Fullan (2004) when he talks about the 'pointlessness for an innovation which is not itself worthwhile or of established quality.' The cluster meetings and one day once-off PDAs have proved to be valueless and pointless because it does not deal with issues that bring about meaningful change to practice.

Furthermore the literature speaks of how outcomes in the workplace and schools are being driven to satisfy a marketization need which has led to a competitive ethos amongst schools rather than a collaborative one. The divide between the have and have nots are conspicuous in the Visual Arts PDAs and nothing is being done to encourage a collaborative ethos where schools adopt each other to develop each other.

These PDAs propagate a national curriculum by which everyone must comply with a standardized format. The idea that one size fits all does not take into consideration teachers' context, environments, language barriers, qualifications and the schools financial status.

The research correctly points to Darling-Hammond's (2001) criticism of the state when she mentions that bureaucratic accountability is not necessarily geared towards the needs of the teacher, but more towards the needs of the bureaucracy… this form of accountability seems to reduce accountability to mere following of standard procedures and implementation of policies. From 2007 onwards almost all of the PDAs arranged for Visual Arts teachers had little to do with their development to help them be better teachers in the classroom. The PDAs were biased towards the state's requirements to control teacher's work by monitoring teachers work on a term by term basis. Teachers have become conditioned to what the state requires and they are producing this information to the state in a mechanical manner without making much change to their curriculum needs. There is evidence that after three years of PDAs by the state, learners' portfolios show little or no change. The PDAs do not provide the opportunity in terms of space and time to change that if the state continues to operate in the way they are currently doing.

McCulloch, Helsby and Knight (2000: 173) affirm what teachers need and what the 'state must refrain from doing when they mentioned educational improvement depends on teachers wanting to make a difference. Neither raising standards by regulation nor professionalizing by prescription will work.' The voices that have come through this research prove that teachers want value intensive PDAs. They also want a forum where they can reflect on their practice to make the improvements they need. Not a single PDA, be it one day or three days, did teachers have a say in the agenda, nor did they get to democratically appoint a cluster coordinator. Everything is controlled by the subject advisor and many teachers felt that the judgment of the subject advisor in terms of his selection of presenters is highly questionable.

The teachers are providing their portfolios and marks on a term by term basis. This is what the state is interested in. No one is perusing through these marks and identifying schools that need assistance to go out and help these teachers and learners there. The paper work is used for record purposes. Even at the feedback meetings on examinations, schools that are performing badly are not given added assistance in terms of PDAs.

Cathy sums up this point by saying

> **"the facilitators are the same people that are marking for the matrics at the end of the year and I believe when they are marking they can do some report on the findings of the performance of the learners. They know where is the problem who have the problem.. write down the names of the school and who the teachers from the school and find out if they need assistance."**

This indicates that the PDAs in this form are not improving teacher's practice. This research reveals that PDAs must go beyond the recognition of the teachers' role in society and must provide them with real conditions which include adequate and meaningful training opportunities (Flores and Shiloma, 2003). There is nothing that defines and challenges teachers at these PDAs.

Although the intention of the state was to scrap Apartheid education and replace it with OBE, the curriculum changes have done little in professionalizing teachers. The schools and teachers who were marginalized under the Apartheid system are still being marginalized under the new education system. What makes it even more disempowering is that the state made radical changes to the curriculum and has not done anything to re-train teachers and provide the resources to help in teacher and pupil leaning. Therefore those schools that are affluent have gone ahead and purchased the necessary materials to adjust to the demands of the new curriculum and those who are poor were left out in the cold to perish. The opportunity to address some of these issues at PDAs has not materialized because there has been no opportunity to do so. It is possible for the gap between the haves and have nots to be narrowed because it is evident in the research that many teachers sympathized with their colleagues from under-resourced schools. It is obvious from the research that the type of support required from the state to professionalise teachers are not being met but the state's agenda is definitely being met because teachers' expectations of PDAs only centres around marks and assessments. Teachers faithfully provide these to appease the state.

The transformation of teachers' thinking to appease the state compromises their own intellectualism and this is a dangerous position for teachers to be in because once intellectual activity is suppressed teachers' work will become routinized which in turn will not develop critical learners.

The study does not only affirm what researchers have said about the value of state-driven PDAs but it also affirms my views on state-driven PDAs because as a Visual arts teacher I have been experiencing what teachers have voiced. If the reforms envisaged by the state is to be realized, they need to make a dramatic paradigm shift in the way they conceive of PDAs. In the current state, state-driven PDAs only reveal the disparities and the inequalities that are prevalent. For most teachers from underprivileged schools no meaningful change has taken place since the advent of our democracy and the scrapping of Apartheid education. When teachers do not collaborate they go back to their same context unchanged

and unable to make much impact on their learners. We seem to be caught in a cycle of mediocrity and the danger is that we may settle for less. This is because we become immune to thinking. PDAs must not be forums to propagate the state's agenda, but it must be a forum to challenge teacher thinking about their practice, provide opportunities for teachers to be accountable for their own learning and provide support material so that the playing fields can be leveled. It will take time but if the current form of PDAs continues then there is little hope for the divide in visual arts between schools to actually close.

5.3   Summary of the key Findings

In the light of the critical questions these are the key findings that emerged from the data analysis.

5.3.1 Three day PDAs is the most popular choice for teacher development.

Teachers acknowledged the fact that working under contrived conditions is the most productive for visual arts teachers given the distances teachers are situated from each other. Furthermore there are too few Visual Arts teachers and collaboration with teachers is impractical given the distances they are from each other and also the rarity of Visual Arts teachers. Therefore, teachers wanting to meet and work in a contrived collegial environment is a realistic request. The state driven PDAs are well attended by Visual Arts teachers, so this is another positive for teacher professional development. Although it is a compulsory endeavour contrived collegiality it is a pragmatic option if compared to collaborative professional development where teachers meet on their own terms whenever they need to meet.

Although contrived collegiality is the best of all the options it is also fraught with problems as the study proves. The following aspects must be resolved before meaningful PDAs are to benefit teachers:

- Too much control exerted by the state.
- No year plan for professional development
- Domination and subordination of teachers.
- Intensification
- Autonomy of teachers

5.3.2 Relaxation of State Control

The state must not dictate the agenda for PDAs. It must be a negotiated agreement between the state and teachers as to what takes priority in PDA meetings. The state has an agenda and teachers have an agenda and these agendas must be engaged with so as to indentify what takes priority in PDAs and the amount of time allocated for each aspect. It is compulsory for teachers to get their portfolios checked once a term, so the PDA will address these state controlled issues but teachers also want quality training and they want to determine the programme and course leaders for this professional teacher development programme.

The state cannot interfere by being dictatorial to teachers because it results in teachers withdrawing their intellectual activity from the process. So instead of developing quality teachers the state will be training technicians. Therefore the state cannot act as the dominant voice and the teachers having a subordinate voice. Although collegial cooperation was closely bound up with administrative cooptation, it is welcomed by teachers because it is an opportunity to meet and work with teachers as they feel that this is more important than working in isolation.

The issue of working with lengthened but fixed time frame will benefit teachers greatly because then there is time for intellectual activity which is absent in most PDAs. Teachers were not allowed to ask questions because of time constraints. Applying their intellectual capacity is what gives teachers autonomy in decision making. The current PDA which is held for four hours on a Saturday is too short for PDAs.

5.3.3 Three day PDAs preferred to one day PDAs

The four hour one day once off PDA was considered to be more an information meeting rather than a PDA that developed teachers. Although under contrived conditions, teachers were in favour of a three day PDA meeting because it involved interaction with other teachers and teacher talk. Teachers were not afraid to discuss the difficulties they were experiencing concerning the new curriculum. Creating space and time for teachers to engage in intellectual activity is crucial to their development. Engaging in intellectual activity was not allowed in the one day once-off PDA.

In a three day workshop teachers have time to reflect on the workshop in the evening and return the following day to give immediate feedback that would reinvigorate discussions and find solutions to their challenges.

Networking between teachers can be organized so that teachers can mentor and coach other teachers. Mentoring can be initiated in these meetings for on going support and development. Teachers do not mind being coached by other teachers. They have acknowledged that there are more qualified personnel who can render quality assistance to teachers.

Three day PDAs afford teachers the opportunity to be reskilled in the areas of their choice. One-off PDAs do not allow for time to engage in skills development. A three day PDA can be used profitably for skills development. Teachers will obtain their training through the PDAs.

 It is also an ideal place to reflect on practice. Reflection in a collegial environment makes you realize that you are not the only teacher facing difficulties implementing the state's policies. Instead of facing your tails towards each other like horse and kicking and moving in different directions, teachers can now put their heads together and find solutions to their problems in an intelligent way.

5.3.4 LTSMs is the State's responsibility

The political and socio-economic context in which the policies are formulated and implemented is also influenced by the dominant global discourse of cost-cutting and state driven professionalism. This limits the amount of resources available to teachers to provide quality education. It is the state's responsibility to provide the LTSMs if quality education is to be provided. Teacher decisions about what should be taught, how it might meet the intellectual and cultural needs of students and how it might be evaluated are rendered unimportant in the LTSMs provided at PDAs. The sub-standard LTSMs without colour copies give the teachers no choice but to use this limited resource in the classroom. The materials control teachers' and learner's performance. Thus, teachers are reduced to the role of obedient technicians, carrying out the dictates of this sub-standard curriculum package. These curriculum packages determine how learners experience visual culture studies in their under-resourced schools as compared to resourced schools (Chisholm, 2004: 253).

The state needs to make special provisions for visuals arts in terms of purchasing resources, like books, computers, data projectors etc. These motivations can become issues discussed in PDAs. The state does fund prescribed books but Visual Arts does not have a prescribed book. This is the sole reason why the school's learners do not have support material. The state is not the only culprit to blame for no LTSMs but it is the Visual Arts department that does not make recommendations to resource these schools.

Three day PDAs can start the ball rolling so that under resourced schools get assistance. The findings have shown the intellectual capacity of teachers. This intellectual capacity can be used so that teachers can support one another in the interest of the learners. Solutions can be found if teachers are allowed to think laterally instead of the linear thinking of the state.

Three day PDAs allow opportunities for teachers to bring materials for teachers to engage with. Teachers can decide what is important and what is not. The process of selecting material amongst educators will help struggling teachers to learn from the process. When experiences are shared at these PDAs, alliances can be formed to assist teachers who lack resources. Teachers will be able to find solutions for the problems. Teachers no longer have to work in isolation.

5.3.5 Visual Arts in resourced and under-resourced schools

Curriculum 2005 treats all teachers as equals. Curriculum 2005 gives teachers some level of autonomy. One of the issues raised under the discussion of teacher professionalism under apartheid was that the education system under apartheid created differentiated status for black and white teachers. White teachers were portrayed as professionals whereas black teachers were portrayed as workers. In theory, Curriculum 2005 aimed to equalise black and white teachers and to reprofessionalise teaching (Carrim, 2003) but there are many contradictions in the policies as discussed in the findings. The divide is evident in the research between under-resourced and resourced schools. The schools that are struggling to meet the challenges of the new curriculum are the very same schools that struggled under Apartheid. For many of the schools that equality of teachers is just a camouflage to say that changes are taking place but the teachers do not have resources and support to make a difference. The PDAs deprofesionalise teachers because it is the under-resourced schools who have predominantly black learners and black teachers that under-perform. The PDA should be concentrating more effort on these schools. The one-day PDA does absolutely

nothing in focusing their attention on how to improve schools that are struggling. For the status quo to change, the way PDAs are currently done must change.

All this could be done under contrived conditions. Compulsory attendance is only possible if these PDAs are held on school days. The state must be convinced about the value of this because a well-trained teacher can give off more to learners than teachers that are unskilled.

5.4 Recommendations

5.4.1 How do teachers see themselves?

In certain policies teachers are portrayed as autonomous and highly skilled professionals, but in certain policies they are portrayed as merely employees of the state who need to be monitored. One of the teacher organization representatives pointed out that if we are to achieve professionalism in South Africa, teachers themselves need to change how they view themselves. Teachers need to see themselves as autonomous and to act as professionals. However, in an employer led training system the pressure always exist for training to meet the employer's specific and immediate needs. The consequence is that such a training system is likely to be too narrowly focused to meet rapidly changing demand conditions (Ball, 2004: 9).

In the political rush to bring about reform, teacher's voices have been largely neglected, their opinions overridden and their concerns dismissed. Change has been developed and imposed in a context where teachers have been given little credit or recognition for changing themselves and for possessing their own wisdom to distinguish between what reasonably can be changed and what cannot (Hargreaves, 1994:6).

It is an interesting question, therefore as to the extent to which the view of teaching currently being constructed through various educational reforms worldwide actually provides the opportunity for hearing voices, without closing down the spaces or the frontier for discussion. The state must try to manage the work of teaching, without being impositional, using the top down approach.

Providing spaces from within which teachers can be constructed as participatory carriers of information is important to the reforms the state wants to implement. The state is afraid that if they give teachers space then teachers will undermine the ideology of the state. This might be true if the state policy continues to undermine education. However, Visual Arts teachers'

preference to work under contrived situations means that the state and teachers negotiate the agenda for PDAs. Education is better served if teachers are critical but work in a constructive manner to uplift education. Educators who conform to the state and become dependent on the state operate as technicians and not as intellectual beings.

5.4.2 Reflection

Since 2006, Visual Arts teachers have been involved in PDAs that have added very little or no value to their development. The department needs to rethink professional development if they want to see changes in teacher's practice. It is important to change the conditions in which teachers learn. Given the dynamics of their work and the reforms in education, teachers need to continually rediscover who they are and what they stand for through their dialogue and collaboration with peers, and through deep reflection of their craft (Nieto, 2003: 125).

Not to offer teachers some insight into the rationale underlying an innovation is to treat teachers as technicians rather than professionals. As we had said earlier, the power of the professional lies in the ability to be flexible, to change details of the practice in changing circumstances, because the practice is rooted in understanding of purpose and is far deeper than the blind following of given procedures.

The innovation being introduced by the professional development programme must be one for which there is evidence, or at least good reason for believing that it will in fact have a positive effect on teaching and learning (Adeu, Hewiit & Landau, 2004).

5.5 Conclusion

The purpose of the study was to understand how Visual Arts teachers experience state-driven PDAs. Conclusions drawn from the findings reveal that careful planning needs to take place with teachers determining the path they want for teacher development. This must be followed by a joint three day PDA for all teachers in the province and several one day PDAs in their regions. The agenda for the PDAs should be negotiated by the state and teachers so that curriculum needs and implementation needs are realized. Further to this teachers preferred to work under contrived collegial conditions where the state provides time and space for this activity to take place. Weekends and school holidays are not a viable solution because these are poorly attended. Teachers feel that with the intensification of work under

the new curriculum a rest is important to recuperate. The state has to rethink its policy of not using teaching time to train teachers. If curriculum reform is to be implemented then re-skilling teachers is very important.

References

Adey, P., Hewitt, G and Landau, N. (2004). *The professional development of teachers: practice and theory.* Dortrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers.

Adler,J. and Read, Y. (2002). *Challenges of teacher development.* Pretoria: Van Shaik

Adler, J. (2000). *Social practice theory and mathematics teacher education: a conversation between theory and practice.* Nordic Mathematics Education Journal, 8(3), 31-53.

Aronowitz, S. and Giroux, H. (1986). *Education under siege. The conservative, liberal and radical debate over schooling.* London: Routledgeand Kegan Paul.

Ashcroft,B. and Alluwalia, P. (1999). *Edward Said*. New York. Routledge

Baker, M. B. and Heyning, K. E. (2004). *Dangerous coagulations. New York: Peter Lang Publishers.*

Bolam, R. and McMahon,A. (2004). *Literature, definitions and models: towards a conceptual map. In day,C and Sachs, J. (EDS). International handbook on continuing professional development of teachers.* Maidenhead: Open University press, pp 33-63.

Bridges, D. (2002). *The ethics of educational research.* Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.

Campbell, A., McNamara, O. and Gilroy, P. (2004). *Practitioner research and professional development in education.* London: Paul Chapman Publishing.

Carrim, N. (2003). *Teacher identity: tension between rules.* Johannesburg: Heinemann.

Chisholm, L., (1997). *Changing class: education and social change in post-apartheid South Africa.* Pretoria: HSRC Press.

Chisholm, L., Motala, S., and Vally, S. (2003). *South African education policy review*. Sandown: Heinemann Publishers.

Craft, A. (1996). *Continuing professional development: A practical guide for teachers and schools.* London: Routledge.

Christie, P. (1998). *Schools as (dis)organization. The breakdown of the culture of 'learning and teaching' in south african schools.* Cambridge Journal of Education,28: 283-300.

Day, C. and Sachs, J. (2004). *International handbook on the continuing professional development of teachers.* Maidenhead, UK: Open University Press.

Day, C. Flores, M. A. & Viana, I. (2007). Effects of national policies on teachers' sense of professionalism: findings from an empirical study in Portugal and in England. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 30 (3), pp. 249-266

Darling-Hammond, L. (2000). Teacher quality and student achievement: *A review of state policy evidence.* Education policy archives.8(1)

Denzin, N. and Lincoln, Y. (2003). *The landscape of qualitative research.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Department of Education (2006). *National framework for teacher education*. Pretoria: Dapartment of Education.

Department of Education (2007). *National framework for teacher education*. Pretoria: Dapartment of Education.

Department of Education (2008). *National framework for teacher education*. Pretoria: Dapartment of Education.

Department of Education. (1996). *White paper on education*. Pretoria

Department of Education. (2000). *Norms and standards for educators*. Pretoria: Department of Education.

Department of Education. (2003). *National curriculum statement (NCS)*. Pretoria: Department of Education.

Department of Education. (2000). ELRC. *Educator workload in South Africa*. Capetown: HSRC Press.

Department of Education. (2003). ELRC. *Educator workload in South Africa*. Capetown: HSRC Press.

Flores, S. (2005). *Classrooms as cultures from a principal's perspective. Primary Voices K-6,* 7(3), pp. 54.

Flores, S. (1999). Classrooms as cultures from a principal's perspective. *Primary Voices K-6,* 7(3), pp. 54.

Flores,M.A. & Shiroma, E. (2003). *Teacher Professionalisation and professionalism in Portugal and Brazil: What do the policy documents tell? Journal of education for teaching,* 29 (1), pp. 5-18).

Fullan,M. (2004). *The new meaning of educational change*, 3rd edition. New York: Teachers College Press.

Fullan,M. (2007). *The new meaning of educational change*, edition. New York: Teachers College Press.

Giroux,H. (1998). *Teachers as intellectuals; towards a critical pedagogy of learning.* London: Bergin and Garvey

Goodson, I.F & Hargreaves, A. (1996). *Teachers' professional lives.* London: Falmer Press.

Goolam, F. & Khumalo, L. (1997). *Perspectives on outcomes –based education.* Durban: University of Durban-Westville.

Griffiths, M. (1998). *Educational research for social justice.* Philadelphia: open University Press.

Hargreaves, A. (1994). *Changing teachers, changing times.* London:Cassell.

Hartley, D. & Whitehead, M. (Ed). (2006). *Teacher education. Major themes in education. Volume V.Globalisation, standards and teacher education.* London: Routledge.

Jackson, A.Y. (2009). *Voice in qualitative inquiry. Challenging conventional, interpretive and critical conception in qualitative research.* New York: Routledge.

Johnson, S.; Monk, M & Hodges, M, (2000). *Teacher development and change in South Africa: a critique of the appropriateness of transfer of northern/southern practice: compare 30, 179-192.*

Lang, P. (2007). *Identity, Diversity and teaching for social justice.* Bern: International Academic Publishers.

Little, J.W. (2004). *"Looking at student work" in the united states: countervailing impulses in professional development. in Day,C and Sachs,J. (Eds). International handbook on continuing professional development of teachers.* Maidenhead: Open University Press.

Maree, K. (2007). *First steps in research.* Pretoria: Van Schalk Publishers.

Marginson, S. (1997). Markets in Education.Sydney: Allen and Unwin.

Menter,I. Muschamp,Y. Nicholls & P. Ozga, J. (2007). *Work and identity in the primary school.* Buchingham: OpenUniversity Press.

McCulloch,G. Helsby, G & Knight, P. (2000). *The politics of professionalism. Teachers and the curriculum.* London: Continuum.

Nasson, B. & Samuel, J. (1990). *Education from poverty to liberty.* Cape Town: David Philip.

Nieto, S. (2003). *What keeps teachers going*? New York: Teachers College Press.

Ramrathan, L. and Walters, B. (2002). *Way of knowing: teacher attrition and demands in Kwazulu-natal in the context of HIV/Aids pandemic.* Durban: university of Durban Westville.

Radnor, H. (2002). *Researching your professional practice.* Philadelphia: Open University Press.

SACE. (2006). The State of Teacher Professionalism in South Africa. .dev@sace.org.

Said, E. (2000).

Salter, B. & Tapper, T. (1985). *Power and policy in education: the case of independent schooling.* Philadelphia: The Farmer Press.

Samuel, M. (2002). *Changing patterns of teacher education in South Africa: policy, practice and prospects.* Durban: University of Durban-Westville.

Shreuder, J. and Landey,V. (2001). *Compass for school-based management.*

Smyth, J. and Shacklock, G. (1998). *Re-making teaching. Ideology, policy and practice.* London: Routledge.

Shulman, L.S. (1997) *Professional Development: Learning from Experience. In common schools, uncommon futures: a working consensus for school renewal*: New York: Teachers Press reprinted in 2004. (The wisdom of practice: essays on teaching, learning and learning to teach. Jossey-Bass: California).

Usher, R. (1996). *Understanding educational research*. London: Routledge.

 Walford, G. (2001). *Doing qualitative educational research: A personal guide to the research process.* London: Routledge.

APPENDIX A

QUESTIONNAIRE

Questionnaire for Teachers who are teaching Visual Arts

For Teachers Teaching Visual Arts

The purpose of this questionnaire is to obtain information from Visual Arts teachers on their experience of **state–driven teacher professional development activities**. The data generated through this questionnaire will be used to inform a Masters in Education study on teacher professional development.

The information presented by you will be treated with confidentiality. No names and places will be mentioned. Results will be generally presented in broad trends. You are free to withdraw from participation in the project at any point in the research progress.

Kindly select one professional development activity (PDA) presented by the state in the FET phase that you attended and then answer the questions on the chosen activity you attended. The purpose of the questionnaire is to obtain information from Visual Arts teachers in the FET phase regarding their experience of a state-initiated PDA.

Where required place a tick against the appropriate response/s.

SECTION A

Biographical Qualification

1. Gender

Male	Female

2. Qualification

M+2 & below	M+3	M+4 & above

3. Years of teaching experience (general)

Under 5 years	6 - 10 years	Above 10 years

4. Years of teaching experience in Visual Arts.

Under 5 years	6 - 10 years	Above 10 years

SECTION B

5. Who organized the professional development activity?

Curriculum Specialist in Visual Arts	
School	
Subject Advisor	
Provincial Department of Education	
National Department of Education	

6. What was your understanding of the purpose of this activity?

Provide new knowledge on curriculum.	
Provide new knowledge on assessment.	
Identify areas that need development.	
Provide insight into teaching methodologies.	
Provide insight into learning materials.	
Other	

7. Provide a description of the PD activity on Visual Arts that you attended.

_____
_____
_____
_____
_____
_____
_____

8. What were your expectations of this state-driven Visual Arts activity?

_____
_____
_____
_____
_____
_____
_____

9. Did the PDA meet your expectations?

Yes	No

Provide an explanation for your response.

_____
_____
_____
_____
_____
_____
_____
_____

SECTION C

10.1. List three things that were most important to you in this state-driven PDA.

_____
_____
_____
_____

10.2. Why do you consider them to be most important?

_____
_____
_____

11.1. What are the three things you would like to see happening in a state-driven PDA?

_____
_____
_____
_____
_____

11.2. Why would you want such things to happen?

_____
_____
_____
_____
_____

12.1. What do you think would make a state-driven PDA useful to you?

_____
_____
_____
_____
_____

12.2. Do you think that state-driven PDA are useful to you?

_____
_____
_____
_____
_____

13.1. Do you consider state driven PDAs valuable to you?

Yes	No

13.2. If yes, how did it add value to you?

_____
_____
_____
_____

13.3. If no, what will make them add value to you?

_____
_____
_____
_____
_____

14.1. If you had to attend another state-driven workshop, list three aspects you would like to see being included.

_____
_____

_____
_____
_____

14.2. If you had to attend another state-driven workshop, list three aspects you would like to see being excluded.

_____
_____
_____
_____
_____

Thank you

P P Govender (Lucky)

Student: P P Govender (Lucky)
Telephone: 031 463 1923   Cell: 083 783 1923

Supervisor: Prof Labby Ramrathan
Telephone: 031 260 8065   Cell: 082 674 9829

Address: University of Kwazulu-Natal
                Faculty of Education
                School of Education and Development
                Edgewood Campus

APPENDIX B

CORRESPONDENCE

PRIVATE BAG XO3
ASHWOOD
3605

The Principal

Dear Sir/Madam

RE: PERMISSION TO USE TEACHERS

Teacher's name: _____
Persal number: _____
School: _____
Principals' Signature: _____

I kindly request your permission for your visual arts teacher to fill in a questionnaire concerning state-driven professional development workshops they have attended. The research may involve interviewing and tape recording teachers concerning state driven professional development activities.

The purpose of this interview is to explore the impact of state-driven teacher development activities in visual arts education. Through this exploration, the study hopes to understand teacher learning with specific reference to visual arts education.

Yours faithfully

_____
Mr P P Govender

I am currently teaching Visual Arts at Durban Girls High School

Contact details: Telephone   031 463 1923 (Home)
                                   031 205 2275 (School)
                      Cell   083 783 1923

Supervisor
Prof Labby Ramrathan
Faculty of Education
Telephone   031 260 8065
Email ramrathan@ukzn.ac.za

UNIVERSITY OF KWAZULU-NATAL
PRIVATE BAG XO3
ASHWOOD

3605

Dear Colleague

Teacher's name: _____
Persal number: _____
School: _____
Teachers' Signature: _____

Your permission is requested for research purposes. The research will involve interviewing and tape recording visual arts teachers concerning state driven professional development activities.

The purpose of this interview is to explore the impact of state-driven teacher development activities in visual arts education. Through this exploration, the study hopes to understand teacher learning with specific reference to visual arts education.

All information will be kept confidential and will be reported in an anonymous fashion.

Yours faithfully

_____
Mr P P Govender

I am a teacher of Visual Arts at Durban Girls High School

Contact details: Telephone   031 463 1923 (Home)
                                   031 205 2275 (School)
                      Cell   083 783 1923

Supervisor
Prof Labby Ramrathan
Faculty of Education
Telephone   031 260 8065
Email ramrathan@ukzn.ac.za